

ECONOMIC

U. S. DEPARTMENT OF LABOR
BUREAU OF LABOR STATISTICS

ROYAL MEEKER, Commissioner DEPT. OF ECONOMICS

BULLETIN OF THE UNITED STATES } ... { WHOLE NUMBER 212
BUREAU OF LABOR STATISTICS }

WORKMEN'S INSURANCE AND COMPENSATION SERIES: NO. 10

PROCEEDINGS OF THE CONFERENCE ON SOCIAL INSURANCE

CALLED BY THE

INTERNATIONAL ASSOCIATION OF
INDUSTRIAL ACCIDENT BOARDS
AND COMMISSIONS. WASHINGTON,
D. C., DECEMBER 5 TO 9, 1916



JUNE, 1917

WASHINGTON
GOVERNMENT PRINTING OFFICE

1917

**ADDITIONAL COPIES
OF THIS PUBLICATION MAY BE PROCURED FROM
THE SUPERINTENDENT OF DOCUMENTS
GOVERNMENT PRINTING OFFICE
WASHINGTON, D. C.
AT
60 CENTS PER COPY**

CONTENTS.

Introduction	Page. 13-15
--------------------	----------------

TUESDAY, DECEMBER 5, 1916—MORNING SESSION.

WORKMEN'S COMPENSATION.

I. Merits and demerits of different forms of administration.

Address by the chairman, Dudley M. Holman, president, I. A. I. A. B. C.	16-19
Industrial accident board system, by Frank J. Donahue, chairman, Massachusetts Industrial Accident Board.....	20-25
District system, by George B. Chandler, member, Workmen's Compensation Commission of Connecticut.....	26-31
Pennsylvania system, by Harry A. Mackey, chairman, Workmen's Compensation Board of Pennsylvania.....	32-46
Merits and demerits of the Ontario system, by George A. Kingston, commissioner, Workmen's Compensation Board of Ontario	47-61
Discussion:	
Miss Gertrude Beeks, director welfare department, National Civic Federation	62
T. J. Duffy, member, Ohio Industrial Commission.....	62-65
George A. Kingston, commissioner, Workmen's Compensation Board of Ontario.....	62, 65

TUESDAY, DECEMBER 5, 1916—AFTERNOON SESSION.

WORKMEN'S COMPENSATION—Continued.

II. Merits and demerits of different methods of carrying workmen's compensation insurance.

Merits and demerits of the different forms of writing workmen's compensation insurance, by J. Scofield Rowe, vice president, Etna Life Insurance Co., Hartford, Conn.....	66-93
Different methods of workmen's compensation insurance, by Edson S. Lott, president, United States Casualty Co., New York.....	94-104
Self-insurance, by Dudley R. Kennedy, director, labor department, B. F. Goodrich Co., Akron, Ohio.....	105-110
Employers' mutual associations, by Walter S. Bucklin, president, Massachusetts Employees' Insurance Association.....	111-122
Discussion: Mr. Davis, Mr. Beyer, Dr. Baldwin, and Mr. Lott....	122-124
Competitive State funds, by F. Spencer Baldwin, manager, New York State Insurance Fund.....	125-140
State monopoly of compensation insurance, by T. J. Duffy, member, Industrial Commission of Ohio	141-145
State monopoly of compensation insurance, by William A. Marshall, chairman, Industrial Accident Commission of Oregon.....	146-148
Competitive plan of workmen's compensation insurance, by W. W. Greene, actuary and insurance manager, Industrial Commission of Colorado.....	149-160

II. Merits and demerits of different methods of carrying workmen's compensation insurance—Concluded.

Discussion:

Albert L. Allen, assistant manager, Pennsylvania Workmen's Insurance Fund.....	Page. 161-164
John W. Mapel, Pfister & Vogel Leather Co., Milwaukee, Wis....	164-168
Samuel Davis, attorney at law, Boston, Mass.....	168, 169, 171
T. H. Carrow, Pennsylvania Railroad Co.....	169
W. G. Wilson (of Cleveland, Ohio), Aetna Life Insurance Co.....	170
David S. Beyer, manager, accident-prevention department, Massachusetts Employees' Insurance Association.....	170, 171
T. J. Duffy, member, Industrial Commission of Ohio.....	171-173
S. Herbert Wolfe, consulting actuary, New York City.....	172, 173
Harry A. Mackey, chairman, Workmen's Compensation Board of Pennsylvania.....	172, 173

TUESDAY, DECEMBER 5, 1916—NIGHT SESSION.

WORKMEN'S COMPENSATION—Continued.

III. Compensation schedules of awards.

Schedule rating for permanent disabilities, by A. J. Pillsbury, chairman, Industrial Accident Commission of California.....	175-183
Basis of compensation, by P. Tecumseh Sherman, attorney, New York City.....	184-192

Compensation schedules of awards, by Albert W. Whitney, general manager, National Workmen's Compensation Service Bureau..... 193-197

Discussion:

S. Herbert Wolfe, consulting actuary, New York City.....	198-201, 216, 217
G. F. Michelbacher, National Workmen's Compensation Service Bureau, New York City.....	201-205
Dudley M. Holman, president, I. A. I. A. B. C.....	205-211, 216, 217
Edson S. Lott, president, United States Casualty Co., New York.....	208, 209, 219
Capt. Wm. P. White, United States Navy, retired, treasurer and general manager, Lowell Paper Tube Corporation.....	209-211, 217
L. D. Clark, United States Bureau of Labor Statistics.....	211-214
George A. Kingston, commissioner, Workmen's Compensation Board of Ontario.....	214
Ralph H. Blanchard, University of Pennsylvania.....	215, 216
S. W. Ashe, General Electric Co., Pittsfield, Mass.....	216, 217
Albert W. Whitney, general manager, National Workmen's Compensation Service Bureau.....	217, 218
T. H. McGregor, chairman, Industrial Accident Board of Texas, Austin, Tex.....	218, 219

IV. Lump-sum settlements.

Lump-sum settlements, by William C. Archer, deputy industrial commissioner, in charge of the Bureau of Workmen's Compensation of New York.....	220-225
Lump-sum settlements, by Robert E. Grandfield, secretary, Industrial Accident Board of Massachusetts.....	226-230

WEDNESDAY, DECEMBER 6, 1916—MORNING SESSION.

WORKMEN'S COMPENSATION—Continued.

V. Basic principles of rate making.	Page.
Basic principles of rate making, by Walter G. Cowles, vice president, The Travelers Insurance Co., Hartford, Conn.	231-237
Principles and methods of rating compensation risks, by Leon S. Senior, manager, New York Compensation Inspection Rating Board.....	238-248
Experience rating versus schedule rating, by David S. Beyer, Massachusetts Employees' Insurance Association	249-260
Discussion:	
Ralph H. Blanchard, University of Pennsylvania.....	261, 262
James Higgins, Industrial Accident Commission of Maryland...	262, 263
Prof. Willard C. Fisher, New York University	263
David S. Beyer, Massachusetts Employees' Insurance Association	263, 266
Herbert M. Wilson, director, department of inspection and safety, the Associated Companies, Pittsburgh, Pa	263, 264
T. H. Carrow, Pennsylvania Railroad Co.....	264
Walter G. Cowles, vice president, The Travelers Insurance Co., Hartford, Conn.....	264, 265
Prof. Walter M. Adriaance, Princeton University	265
VI. Accident prevention in connection with workmen's compensation.	
Accident prevention in California, by Will J. French, member, Industrial Accident Commission of California.....	267-272
Inspection and schedule rating of coal mines as a means of preventing mine accidents, by Herbert M. Wilson, director, department of inspection and safety, the Associated Companies, Pittsburgh, Pa.....	273-282
Discussion:	
Lewis T. Bryant, commissioner of labor, New Jersey... 283-285, 290, 291	
Alfred W. Donovan, chairman, Board of Labor and Industries of Massachusetts	285-290
Miss Gertrude Beeks, director, welfare department, National Civic Federation	287, 288
Prof. Willard C. Fisher, New York University	288
S. W. Ashe, General Electric Co., Pittsfield, Mass.....	289
Royal Meeker, United States Commissioner of Labor Statistics... 289	

WEDNESDAY, DECEMBER 6, 1916—AFTERNOON SESSION.

WORKMEN'S COMPENSATION—Continued.

VII. Medical services and medical and hospital fees under workmen's compensation.	
Medical services and medical and hospital fees under workmen's compensation, by F. M. Williams, chairman, Workmen's Compensation Commission of Connecticut.....	292-304
Medical services and medical and hospital fees under workmen's compensation, by Dr. Francis D. Donoghue, medical adviser, Industrial Accident Board of Massachusetts.....	305-313
VIII. Physical examination and medical supervision of employees.	
Compulsory physical examination, by John P. White, president, United Mine Workers of America.....	314-316
Informal remarks by William Green, secretary-treasurer, United Mine Workers of America.....	316

VIII. Physical examination and medical supervision of employees—Concluded.	Page.
Physical examination and medical supervision of factory employees, by W. Irving Clark, M. D., medical director, Norton Co., Worcester, Mass.	317-326
Physical examination and medical supervision of employees, by W. H. White, M. D., chief medical examiner, Industrial Commission of Ohio.	327-334
Discussion:	
Dr. J. W. Schereschewsky, surgeon, United States Public Health Service.....	335-337
Dr. David L. Edsall, Massachusetts General Hospital, Boston, Mass.....	337, 338
Dr. Otto P. Geier, director, employees' service department, Cincinnati Milling Machine Co.....	338, 339
Dr. S. M. McCurdy, Youngstown Sheet & Tube Co.....	339-341
Arthur E. Holder, American Federation of Labor.....	341, 342
Capt. Wm. P. White, United States Navy, retired, treasurer and general manager, Lowell Paper Tube Corporation.....	342-346
Dudley R. Kennedy, director, labor department, B. F. Goodrich Co., Akron, Ohio.....	345-347
Dr. George M. Price, director, Joint Board of Sanitary Control in Dress and Waist industry.....	347
IX. Permanently disabled workers.	
Problem of the handicapped man, by Dudley M. Holman, president, I. A. I. A. B. C.....	348-357
WEDNESDAY, DECEMBER 6, 1916—NIGHT SESSION.	
WORKMEN'S COMPENSATION—Concluded.	
X. Defects and suggested changes in workmen's compensation laws.	
Some defects and suggested changes in workmen's compensation laws, by Prof. Willard C. Fisher, New York University.....	359-377
Omission of occupational diseases as a defect in workmen's compensation laws, by Frederick L. Hoffman, statistician, Prudential Insurance Co.	378-397
Discussion:	
Prof. John R. Commons, University of Wisconsin.....	398-400
F. H. Bohlen, consulting attorney, Pennsylvania Bureau of Workmen's Compensation, Department of Labor and Industry....	400-402
H. B. Bradbury, counselor at law, New York City.....	402-405
Chas. H. Verrill, expert, United States Bureau of Labor Statistics.	405-409
Hal H. Smith, counsel, Michigan Workmen's Compensation Mutual, Detroit, Mich.....	409-413
G. E. Beers, member, Workmen's Compensation Commission of Connecticut.....	413, 414
Ralph H. Blanchard, University of Pennsylvania.....	414, 415
Nathan B. Williams, associate editor, The Lawyer and Banker, Washington, D. C.....	415, 416
Capt. Wm. P. White, United States Navy, retired, treasurer and general manager, Lowell Paper Tube Corporation.....	416, 417
Frederick L. Hoffman, statistician, Prudential Insurance Co.....	417

THURSDAY, DECEMBER 7, 1916—MORNING SESSION.

SICKNESS (HEALTH) BENEFITS AND INSURANCE.

I. Existing agencies.	Page.
Address by chairman, Dr. William J. Kerby, professor of sociology, Catholic University, Washington, D. C.....	419, 420
Group insurance, by William A. Day, president, Equitable Life Assurance Society.....	421-429
Existing agencies for health insurance in the United States, by Edgar Sydenstricker, public health statistician, United States Public Health Service.....	430-475
Trade-union sickness insurance, by G. W. Perkins, president, Oigar Makers' International Union of America.....	476-481
Employees' Benefit Association of the International Harvester Co., by George A. Ranney, secretary and treasurer, International Harvester Co.....	482-490
Pennsylvania Railroad voluntary relief department, by E. B. Hunt, of the Pennsylvania Railroad Co.....	491-496
Mutual benefit funds, by Abb Landis, National Fraternal Congress...	497-504
Students' health insurance at the University of California, by Robert T. Legge, M. D., professor of hygiene and university physician, University of California.....	505-511
Joint-stock company health insurance, by Rufus M. Potts, insurance superintendent, Illinois.....	512-518
Discussion:	
Charles F. Nesbit, superintendent of insurance, District of Columbia.....	519-521
Analey K. Salz, advisory member, Social Insurance Commission of California.....	521-524, 546, 547
Royal Meeker, United States Commissioner of Labor Statistics.....	524, 533, 534
Edward F. McSweeney, former member, Industrial Accident Board of Massachusetts.....	524-530, 533, 534
Miss Gertrude Beeks, director, labor department, National Civic Federation.....	530-533, 543
John B. Andrews, Ph. D., secretary, American Association for Labor Legislation.....	533
John S. Kennedy, secretary, employees' benefit fund committee, eastern group of companies of the Bell system.....	535-537
Capt. Wm. P. White, United States Navy, retired, treasurer and general manager, Lowell Paper Tube Corporation.....	536, 537
T. H. Carrow, Pennsylvania Railroad Co.....	536, 537
F. W. Boswell, secretary, Flint (Mich.) Factories Mutual Benefit Association.....	537-539
Miles M. Dawson, consulting actuary, and member of the social insurance committee of the American Association for Labor Legislation.....	539-541, 546
J. P. Chamberlain, of the legislative fund of Columbia University.....	541-543
Dr. Otto P. Geier, director, employees' service department, Cincinnati Milling Machine Co.....	543
Harry A. Mackey, chairman, Workmen's Compensation Board of Pennsylvania.....	543, 544
Alfred W. Donovan, chairman, Board of Labor and Industries of Massachusetts.....	544, 545
S. W. Ashe, General Electric Co., Pittsfield, Mass.....	545, 546

THURSDAY, DECEMBER 7, 1916—AFTERNOON SESSION.

SICKNESS (HEALTH) BENEFITS AND INSURANCE—Continued.

II. Proposed legislation for health insurance.	Page.
Proposed legislation for health insurance, by John B. Andrews, Ph. D., secretary, American Association for Labor Legislation.....	549-558
Proposed legislation for health insurance, by Grant Hamilton, member, legislative committee of American Federation of Labor.....	559-571
Assurance of health versus sickness insurance, by Frank F. Dresser, member, rating committees of National Association of Manufacturers and National Association of Machine-Tool Builders.....	572-588
III. Some problems of sickness insurance for women.	
Some problems of sickness insurance for women, by Miss Mary Van Kleeck, director, division of industrial studies, Russell Sage Foundation.....	589-597
IV. Some fundamental considerations in health insurance.	
Some fundamental considerations in health insurance, by Lee K. Frankel, third vice president, Metropolitan Life Insurance Co., New York... ..	598-606
Discussion:	
J. P. Chamberlain, of the legislative fund of Columbia University.....	606-608
Mrs. Florence Kelley, general secretary, National Consumers' League.....	608-610
Dr. Otto P. Geier, director, employees' service department, Cincinnati Milling Machine Co.....	610-612
Edward B. Saunders, Associated Industries of Massachusetts... ..	612, 613
Royal Meeker, United States Commissioner of Labor Statistics....	613
A. P. Nevin, counsel, National Association of Manufacturers... ..	613, 614
Ansley K. Salz, advisory member, Social Insurance Commission of California.....	614-616
Richard G. Williams, special investigator, Norton Co., Worcester, Mass.....	616, 617
Miss Olga Halsey, special investigator, American Association for Labor Legislation.....	617-619
Miles M. Dawson, consulting actuary, New York City.	619, 620, 636-641
Dr. Alice Hamilton, special investigator, United States Bureau of Labor Statistics.....	620, 621
Dr. Eden V. Delphey, West Side Physicians' Economic League, New York City.....	621, 622
John McF. Eaton, Cadillac Motor Car Co.....	623
Frederick L. Hoffman, statistician, Prudential Insurance Co.	623-633, 636
Hal H. Smith, counsel, Michigan Workmen's Compensation Mutual, Detroit, Mich	633, 634
R. B. Stearns, vice president, Milwaukee Electric Railway & Light Co.....	634, 635
J. W. Magruder, general secretary, Federated Charities, Baltimore, Md.....	635, 636
Frank F. Dresser.....	641, 642
Lee K. Frankel, third vice president, Metropolitan Life Insurance Co., New York.....	642-644

THURSDAY, DECEMBER 7, 1916—NIGHT SESSION.**SICKNESS (HEALTH) BENEFITS AND INSURANCE—Concluded.**

V. Medical benefits and services under the proposed sickness (health) insurance system.	Page.
Organization of medical benefits and services under the proposed sickness (health) insurance system, by Alexander Lambert, M. D., chairman, social insurance committee, American Medical Association.....	645-675
Existing conditions of medical practice, forms of service under health insurance, and preventive work, by Michael M. Davis, jr., Ph. D., director, Boston Dispensary	676-682
Medical services under health insurance, by Dr. I. M. Rubinow, executive secretary, social insurance committee, American Medical Association.....	684-694
Discussion:	
Dr. Richard C. Cabot, Harvard Medical School, Cambridge, Mass.....	695-699
Dr. Frank Billings, chairman, council on health and public instruction, American Medical Association.....	699-702
B. S. Warren, surgeon, United States Public Health Service....	702-711
Dr. Louis I. Harris, Department of Health of the City of New York	711-715
Dr. Eden V. Delphey, West Side Physicians' Economic League, New York City.....	715, 717-721, 727
Miles M. Dawson, consulting actuary, New York City	715-717
Dr. Otto P. Geier, director, employees' service department, Cincinnati Milling Machine Co.....	721, 722
Dr. William C. Woodward, health officer, Washington, D. C....	722-725
Dr. Hills Cole, chairman, committee on health insurance, American Institute of Homeopathy.....	725, 726
Dr. Alexander Lambert, chairman, social insurance committee, American Medical Association.....	726-728

FRIDAY, DECEMBER 8, 1916—MORNING SESSION.**INVALIDITY AND OLD-AGE INSURANCE, PENSIONS, AND RETIREMENT ALLOWANCES.****I. Existing agencies.**

Service pensions and pension funds, by Miles M. Dawson, consulting actuary, New York City.....	729-741
United States Steel and Carnegie Pension Fund, by J. B. Erskine, manager, United States Steel and Carnegie Pension Fund	742-746
Trade-union benefit funds, by Marsden G. Scott, president, International Typographical Union.....	747-755
Discussion:	
William Green, secretary-treasurer, United Mine Workers of America.....	756-758
Rev. Father O'Grady, Catholic University, Washington, D. C....	753, 759, 762
Capt. Wm. P. White, United States Navy, retired, treasurer and general manager, Lowell Paper Tube Corporation.....	759, 760
William J. Graham, department of group insurance, Equitable Life Assurance Society.....	760-762

II. Compulsory invalidity and old-age insurance, pensions, and retirement allowances.		Page.
Compulsory invalidity and old-age pensions, insurance, and retirement allowances, by Magnus W. Alexander, General Electric Co., West Lynn, Mass.....		763-774
Old-age pensions, by John Franklin Crowell, executive officer, Chamber of Commerce, New York State.....		774-777
Discussion:		
Miles M. Dawson, consulting actuary, New York City.....		778, 779
William J. Graham, department of group insurance, Equitable Life Assurance Society.....		779
FRIDAY, DECEMBER 3, 1916—AFTERNOON SESSION.		
MATERNITY BENEFITS AND MOTHERS' PENSIONS.		
I. Maternity benefits.		
Informal remarks by chairman, Ernest P. Bicknell, director of civilian relief, American Red Cross.....		780
Maternity insurance and benefit systems, by Henry J. Harris, Library of Congress, Washington, D. C.....		780-784
Discussion:		
Miss Julia Lathrop, Chief, United States Children's Bureau.....		785-787
Royal Meeker, United States Commissioner of Labor Statistics... ..		787
Miss Mary Conynghon, United States Bureau of Labor Statistics.....		787-792
John Franklin Crowell, executive officer, Chamber of Commerce, New York State.....		792, 793
II. Mothers' pensions.		
Theory and development of the mothers' pension movement, by Sherman C. Kinguley, director, Elizabeth McCormick Memorial Fund, Chicago, Ill.....		794-804
Experiences in administration of mothers' pensions, by Mrs. H. Otto Wittpenn, president, New Jersey State Board of Children's Guardians.....		805-810
Experiences in administration, by William H. Matthews, member, Board of Child Welfare, New York City; director of family welfare department, New York Association for Improving the Condition of the Poor.....		811-817
Administration of the Illinois funds-to-parents law, by Miss Edith Abbott, associate director, Chicago School of Civics and Philanthropy.....		818-834
Discussion:		
Miles M. Dawson, consulting actuary, New York City.....		835-837
Henry J. Harris, Library of Congress, Washington, D. C.....		836, 837
John Franklin Crowell, executive officer, Chamber of Commerce, New York State.....		837
Royal Meeker, United States Commissioner of Labor Statistics..		837, 838

FRIDAY, DECEMBER 8, 1916, 8 P. M.—MEETING IN MEMORIAL CONTINENTAL HALL.

<i>Chairman, Hon. William C. Redfield, Secretary of Commerce.</i>	Page.
Address by President Woodrow Wilson.....	839, 840
Address by Hon. William B. Wilson, Secretary of Labor.....	841-844
Address by Samuel Gompers, president, American Federation of Labor....	845-849
Address by Col. George Pope, president, National Association of Manufacturers.....	849-854

SATURDAY, DECEMBER 9, 1916—MORNING SESSION.**UNEMPLOYMENT AND SAVINGS BANK INSURANCE.****I. British national system of unemployment insurance.**

Informal remarks by the chairman, Royal Meeker, United States Commissioner of Labor Statistics.....	855
British system of national unemployment insurance in its relation to other methods of dealing with unemployment, by Bruno Lasker, assistant secretary, Mayor's Committee on Unemployment, New York City.....	855-873
British national system of unemployment insurance—its operation and effects, by Miss Olga S. Halsey, special investigator, American Association for Labor Legislation.....	874-886
Discussion:	
Miss Edna Laurence Spencer, member, Special Commission on Social Insurance, Massachusetts.....	887, 888
Ralph H. Blanchard, University of Pennsylvania.....	888, 889
Dudley R. Kennedy, director, labor department, B. F. Goodrich Co., Akron, Ohio.....	889-893
Bruno Lasker, assistant secretary, Mayor's Committee on Unemployment, New York City.....	890, 892
Prof. Walter M. Adriaance, Princeton University.....	892, 893
Royal Meeker, United States Commissioner of Labor Statistics.....	892, 893
John Franklin Crowell, executive officer, Chamber of Commerce, New York State.....	893, 894
A. G. Catheron, Massachusetts Commission on Social Insurance.....	894, 895

II. Massachusetts system of savings bank life insurance.

Massachusetts system of savings bank life insurance, by Alice H. Grady, financial secretary, Massachusetts Savings Insurance League.....	896-903
Discussion:	
Letter from S. B. Bartlett, vice president, Greater Boston Mortgage Corporation.....	904, 905
A. G. Catheron, Massachusetts Commission on Social Insurance... ..	906
H. La Rue Brown, Assistant United States Attorney General... ..	906-909
James B. Craig, assistant actuary, Metropolitan Life Insurance Co.	909, 910
M. A. Brooks, secretary and managing editor, Weekly Underwriter.....	910, 911
Royal Meeker, United States Commissioner of Labor Statistics.....	911, 912, 915
Frederick L. Hoffman, statistician, Prudential Insurance Co. . . .	912-915
Appendix A.—Industrial commission system, by Fred M. Wilcox, member of Wisconsin Industrial Commission.....	917-925
Appendix B.—List of persons who registered at Social Insurance Conference.....	926-933
Appendix C.—Delegates appointed by State Governors.....	934, 935