

CYCLICAL FLUCTUATIONS

*Retail and Wholesale Trade
United States, 1919-1925*

BY

SIMON S. KUZNETS, PH.D.

Prefatory Note by

WESLEY C. MITCHELL

NEW YORK
ADELPHI COMPANY

1926

**COPYRIGHT, 1926,
ADELPHI COMPANY**

PREFATORY NOTE

FROM the beginning of their efforts to explain business crises men have speculated much about the rôle played by "consumption." In the early nineteenth century, when the factory system was spreading from one industry to another, many investigators held that "power to consume" was expanding less rapidly than "power to produce." For this reason, they said, markets became "glutted" every few years with goods which people had made, but could not buy. Whether they diagnosed the trouble as "under-consumption" or as "over-production" was a matter of phrase making.

This problem has not lost its interest in the hundred years since Sismondi and Malthus discussed it. In modern theories of business cycles one of the critical points is to account for the recurrent development of paradoxical conditions in which the community seems to suffer want because it has produced superabundant wealth. Many explanations have been offered. Oversaving, ill-balanced investments, the long period required for the building of industrial equipment, changes in the purchasing power of different classes produced by the expansion of bank credit, "competitive illusion," the diminishing utility of additions to the supply of consumers' goods, a deficiency of incomes disbursed in comparison with the value of goods sent to market—these catchwords may suggest some of the hypotheses which, singly or in combination, have their advocates at present.

All of these explanations are plausible, and perhaps no two are incompatible with each other. But our knowledge of business cycles is most unsatisfactory so long as it consists of an unsystematized collection of hypotheses which are plausi-

ble rather than proven. The present need is for testing every explanation to find how well it accords with the relevant facts. Such testing requires close study of the inter-relations among the fluctuations of all the processes involved. To study these inter-relations closely, we must have measured observations, covering a wide range of activities, made at brief intervals, and continued for periods long in proportion to business cycles.

Hence the theoretical significance of the recent progress in compiling and analyzing economic statistics. A decade ago we could compare the fluctuations of prices of commodities at retail and wholesale, of raw materials, producers' and consumers' goods, of stocks, and of labor; we had statistics concerning the output of certain staples; our data relating to railway transportation, imports and exports, the currency, banking, clearings, discount rates, bond yields and bankruptcies were relatively abundant, and we had fragmentary returns regarding numerous other processes. But concerning the process which is supposed to control all business operations in the last resort—the process of distributing goods to consumers—we had scarcely any reliable data. And at that time the technique of analyzing time series in such fashion as to segregate cyclical fluctuations from secular trends and seasonal variations, and of measuring the relations among the cyclical fluctuations of different processes, had been applied to but few series.

Within the past ten years, this technique has been improved in various ways and used widely. Not less important are the accessions to the list of economic processes covered by statistics. We now have index numbers not only of prices, but also of physical production and volume of trade; data concerning employment have been substituted for percentages of men out of work, and supplemented by pay-roll disbursements; our manufacturing censuses are taken every two instead of every five years; we have gained our first dependable

knowledge of the turnover of deposits subject to check; we have better estimates of annual income. This list is far from complete; but it is safe to say that among all the accessions none is more valuable to men of affairs and economists than the data concerning volume of sales at retail and wholesale, which the Federal Reserve Banks have been gathering month by month since 1919.

Supplied with all these new data, and equipped with a more powerful technique, the students of business cycles can attack their old problems with better chances of success than their predecessors enjoyed. But such work calls for a combination of interests and of skills which is rare. A few writers upon the theory of business cycles have made statistical inquiry an organic part of their work—notably Professors Henry L. Moore and Alvin H. Hansen—; but most theorists content themselves with occasional citations of simple tables and charts. Few of the business-cycle statisticians, on the other hand, exhibit an interest in theoretical issues. There is need of workers like Dr. Kuznets, who uses analytical methods to make an especially significant body of new data yield insight into a problem which has been debated with little gain for more than a hundred years.

The data concerning the sales of department stores, chain stores of various kinds, mail-order houses, and wholesale establishments, which the Federal Reserve Banks began to collect in 1919, were interesting to business men from the first month of publication. But the reports had to accumulate for several years before they could show much about business cycles. Even now that they cover two cycles, the conclusions which they suggest must be regarded as tentative. Yet the process to which they relate is so fundamental that we should inquire without more delay what they can teach us.

Dr. Kuznets is the first to essay this task at large. He has eliminated the secular trends and seasonal variations of his series as best he could with materials covering but a few years.

He has divided the dollar-volume of sales by appropriate index numbers to approximate changes in the physical quantities of goods distributed. He has compared retail sales with wholesale, and both with manufacturing output, so far as the data permit. He has gone back to the disbursement of incomes of various types to consumers. And he has faced the difficult problem of accounting for the differences in the cyclical fluctuations which seem to be characteristic of these several processes—the flow of incomes to individuals, the manufacture of consumers' goods, purchasing by retailers, and purchasing by consumers.

Explorations of new territory, conducted with spirit and skill, are fascinating ventures, whether the areas covered be barren or promising. Any one who follows Dr. Kuznets' trail will gain for himself some of the pleasures of discovery. For those concerned with retail or wholesale trade, there must be much in this record which an economist sees but dimly. For men interested in the study of business cycles I can speak more confidently. Dr. Kuznets' investigation is the type of work which stimulates scientific activity:—it shows us how to deal more efficiently with a fundamental problem.

WESLEY C. MITCHELL.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	PAGE
INTRODUCTION—A BRIEF RECITAL OF THE PECULIAR FEATURES OF THE CYCLES WHICH TOOK PLACE IN THE U. S. DURING 1919-1925	xvii
 CHAPTER	
I CYCLICAL MOVEMENTS IN THE DOLLAR VOLUME OF SALES BY RETAILERS AND WHOLESALERS. U. S. 1919-1925	1
<p>Introductory—Groceries—Department Stores—Dry Goods—Shoes—Drugs—Candies—Tobacco and Cigar Chain Stores—Musical Instruments Chain Stores—Mail Order Houses—General conclusions: movement in retail sales—correlation of retail sales in different branches—variability of the different series of retail sales—movements in wholesale sales—correlation of wholesale sales in different branches—variability of wholesale sales—Reliability of data used—Some bearings of the data—Movements of stocks—Movements in the volume of loans and discounts. <i>Appendix.</i> The Statistical Analysis of the Dollar Volume of Sales Indices.</p>	
 II CYCLICAL MOVEMENTS IN THE COMMODITY VOLUME OF SALES AND OF OUTPUT. U. S. 1919-1925	 60
<p>Groceries: retail sales—wholesale sales—production—stocks—conclusions. Department Stores: retail sales—wholesale—drygoods wholesale sales—production: finished cotton goods—fine cotton goods—knit underwear—consumption of wool and cotton—conclusions. Shoes: retail sales—wholesale sales—production. Drug Chain Stores—Sales and Cigar Chain Stores' sales. Correlation of retail sales in different branches—same for wholesale sales. Sales by hardware wholesalers—drug wholesalers—meat wholesalers—combined wholesalers. Variability of the indices of money and commodity volume of sales—Reliability of the data—Summary of conclusions. <i>Appendix</i>—The methods of deflation used and other details concerning the series and indices compiled.</p>	

CHAPTER	PAGE
III CYCLICAL FLUCTUATIONS IN THE DISTRIBUTION OF INCOMES. U. S. 1919-1925	129
<p>Introductory—Flow of wages (factory), volume of manufacturing production, and retail sales (all dollar volume)—Savings deposits and their movements—Flow of factory wages, volume of production, and retail sales (all commodity volume)—Other wages and salaries—Interest and dividends—Disbursements—Profits—The causes of the even distribution of wages: total pay rolls and average earnings—The stability of average earnings—Labor a peculiar commodity.</p>	
IV DIFFERENCE IN THE AMPLITUDE OF CYCLICAL FLUCTUATIONS IN VARIOUS BRANCHES OF BUSINESS ACTIVITY EXPLAINED	162
<p>Part I. Introductory—The connection of primary demand with derived demand for equipment—Merchants' stocks as equipment—Limitations of the assumption. The different influence of an expected price change on: (1) retailers' purchases as compared with retailers' sales—(2) Wholesalers' purchases as compared with retailers' sales—(3) Manufacturers' production as compared with wholesalers' sales. Other factors: (1) credit with accommodation—(2) fluctuations in psychological attitude.</p> <p>Part II. The weaving of the factors above into a schematic sequence—The assumption of the initial change—The perpetuation of the change—The checking of the change—The development of depression—On the necessity of initial change—The partial character of the scheme—Its peculiar feature.</p>	

LIST OF TABLES

	PAGE
1. Sales in 28 Grocery Chain Systems (Dollar Volume), Monthly Index, 1919-25	4
2. Sales by Wholesale Grocers (Dollar Volume), Monthly Index, 1919-25	5
3. Sales by 359 Department Stores (Dollar Volume), Monthly Index, 1919-25	6
4. Sales by Wholesalers in 4 Branches of Trade (Dollar Volume), Monthly Index, 1919-25	8
5. Sales in Dry Goods Chain Stores (Dollar Volume), Monthly Index, 1919-25	9
6. Sales by Dry Goods Wholesalers (Dollar Volume), Monthly Index, 1919-25	10
7. Sales in Shoe Chain Stores (Dollar Volume), Monthly Index, 1919-25	12
8. Sales by Shoe Wholesalers (Dollar Volume), Monthly Index, 1919-25	13
9. Sales by Drug Chain Stores (Dollar Volume), Monthly Index, 1919-25	15
10. Sales by Drug Wholesalers (Dollar Volume), Monthly Index, 1919-25	17
11. Sales in Candy Chain Stores (Dollar Volume), Monthly Index, 1919-25	18
12. Sales by Candy Manufacturers (Dollar Volume), Monthly Index, 1919-24	20
13. Sales by Tobacco & Cigar Chain Stores (Dollar Volume), Monthly Index, 1919-25	22
14. Sales by 5 & 10¢ Chain Stores (Dollar Volume), Monthly Index, 1919-25	24
15. Sales by Music Chains (Dollar Volume), Monthly Index, 1919-25	26
16. Sales by Mail Order Houses (Dollar Volume), Monthly Index, 1919-25	28

	PAGE
17. Correlation of Cyclical Movements in the Dollar Volume of Sales in 10 Branches of Retail Trade	34
18. Standard Deviations of the Adjusted Indices of Dollar Sales in Different Branches of Retail Trade	37
19. Sales by Combined Wholesalers, Dollar Volume, Monthly Index, 1919-25	38
20. Correlation of Cyclical Movements in the Dollar Volume of Sales by Wholesalers in Different Branches of Trade	40
21. Standard Deviations of Indices of Retail and Wholesale Sales Compared	41
22. Value of Stocks in Department Stores, Monthly Index, 1919-25	49
23. Cumulative Differences Between Retailers' Purchases and Retailers' Sales, Department Stores, Monthly, 1919-25	49
24. Volume of Loans and Discounts, Reporting Member Banks, Monthly, 1919-25	52
25. Secular Trends in Series of Retail Sales	57
26. Secular Trends in Series of Wholesale Sales	57
27. Seasonal Variations in Retail Sales	58
28. Seasonal Variations in Wholesale Sales	59
29. Sales by Grocery Chain Stores (Commodity Volume), Monthly, 1919-25	61
30. Sales by Wholesale Grocers (Commodity Volume), Monthly, 1919-25	63
31. Production of Five Grocery Goods (Commodity Volume), Monthly, 1919-25	68
32. Stocks of Four Grocery Products (Commodity Volume), Monthly, 1919-25	71
33. Sales by Department Stores (Commodity Volume), Monthly, 1919-25	77
34. Sales by Combined Wholesalers (Commodity Volume), Monthly, 1919-25	81
35. Sales by Dry Goods Wholesalers (Commodity Volume), Monthly, 1919-25	85

LIST OF TABLES

xi

	PAGE
36. Billings (Output) of Finished Cotton Goods, Monthly, 1921-25	86
37. Production of Fine Cotton Goods, Monthly, 1920-	88
38. Production of Knit Underwear, Monthly, 1920-24	90
39. Consumption of Cotton and Wool, Monthly, 1919-	91
40. Sales by Shoe Chain Stores (In Number of Pairs), Monthly, 1919-25	95
41. Sales by Shoe Wholesalers (Commodity Volume), Monthly, 1919-25	97
42. Production of Boots and Shoes, Monthly, U. S., 1921-25	101
43. Production of Boots and Shoes, Monthly, 8 New England Factories, 1919-23	101
44. Sales by Wholesale Druggists, Commodity Volume, 1919-25	109
45. Sales by Hardware Wholesalers, Commodity Volume, 1919-25	110
46. Sales by Meat Wholesalers, Commodity Volume, 1919-25	111
47. Sales by Combined Wholesalers, Commodity Volume, 1919-25	111
48. Index of Retail Prices of 30 Grocery Products, Monthly, 1919-25	118
49. Index of Wholesale Prices of 23 Grocery Products, Monthly, 1919-25	120
50. Index of Retail Prices of Clothing and of Sundries, Monthly, 1919-25	123
51. Index of Wholesale Prices of Commodities Sold by Dry Goods Wholesalers, Monthly, 1919-25	124
52. Index of Wholesale Prices of Drugs and Pharmaceuticals, Monthly, 1919-25	126
53. Index of Wholesale Prices of Hardware Goods, Monthly, 1919-25	127
54. Index of Pay Rolls in Manufacturing Industries, Monthly, 1919-25	131
55. Dollar Volume of Manufacturing Production, Monthly Index, 1919-25	133

	PAGE
56. Savings Deposits, Monthly Index, 1920-25	136
57. Cumulative Differences Between Wage Disbursements and Grocery Sales	137
58. Purchasing Power of Factory Pay Rolls, Monthly, 1919-25	139
59. Index of Manufacturing Output, Commodities, 1919-25	140
60. Total Interest and Dividends Disbursements, Monthly Index, 1919-25	144
61. Wages and Salaries, Number of Employees, and Hours Worked in "All Industries" and "All Factories" in the U. S., 1920-22, by Quarters	155
62. Total Pay Rolls and Average Earnings Per Week in the Factories in the State of New York. Annually, 1914-23	156
63. Total Pay Rolls and Average Earnings in Wisconsin Factories. Annually, 1915-23	157
64. Connection Between Primary and Derived Demand in Retail Sales and Purchases. Illustrated	165

LIST OF CHARTS

NOTE: Unless otherwise stated present monthly indices adjusted for the trend and the seasonal variations.

	PAGE
1. Sales by Retail Grocery Chain Stores and by Grocery Wholesalers, dollar volume, 1919-25	4
2. Sales by 359 Department Stores and by Wholesalers in 4 Branches of Trade, dollar volume, 1919-25	7
3. Sales by Dry Goods Chain Stores and by Dry Goods Wholesalers, dollar volume, 1919-25	10
4. Sales by Shoe Chain Stores and by Shoe Wholesalers, dollar volume, 1919-25	13
5. Sales by Drug Chain Stores and by Drug Wholesalers, dollar volume, 1919-25	16
6. Sales by Candy Chain Stores and by Candy Manufacturers, dollar volume, 1919-25	19
7. Sales by Tobacco Chain Stores, dollar volume, 1919-25	22
8. Sales by 5 & 10 Cent Chain Stores, dollar volume, 1919-25	25
9. Sales by Music Chain Stores, dollar volume, 1919-25	26
10. Sales by Mail Order Houses, dollar volume, 1919-25	28
11. Sales by Combined Wholesalers, dollar volume, 1919-25	38
12. Index of Stocks in 318 Department Stores, dollar value, 1919-25	50
13. Volume of Loans and Discounts (member banks), Monthly Index, 1919-25	53
14. Commodity and Dollar Volume of Sales by Grocery Chain Stores, 1919-25	61
15. Commodity and Dollar Volume of Sales by Wholesale Grocers, 1919-25	63

	PAGE
16. Commodity Sales by Grocery Chain Stores and by Wholesale Grocers, 1919-25	65
17. Commodity Sales by Wholesale Grocers and Production of Five Grocery Products, 1919-25	68
18. Index of Stocks of Four Grocery Products, commodity volume, 1919-25	72
19. Commodity and Dollar Volume of Sales by Department Stores, 1919-25	78
20. Commodity Sales by Department Stores, Two Indices, Quarterly and Semi-annually, 1919-25	79
21. Commodity Sales by Department Stores and by Wholesalers in Four Branches of Trade, 1919-	82
22. Commodity and Dollar Volume of Sales by Wholesalers in Four Branches of Trade, 1919-25	83
23. Commodity Sales by Dry Goods Wholesalers and Output Finished Cotton Goods, 1920-25	87
24. Commodity Sales by Dry Goods Wholesalers and Production of True Cotton Goods, 1920-25	89
25. Commodity Sales by Dry Goods Wholesalers and Production of Knit Underwear, 1919-24	90
26. Commodity Sales by Dry Goods Wholesalers and Cotton-Wool Consumption, 1919-25	92
27. Commodity and Dollar Sales by Shoe Chain Stores, 1919-25	96
28. Commodity Sales by Shoe Chain Stores and by Shoe Wholesalers, 1919-25	97
29. Commodity Sales by Shoe Wholesalers and Indices of Boot and Shoe Production, 1919-25	102
30. Commodity and Dollar Volume of Sales by Three Groups of Wholesalers, 1919-25	103
31. Commodity Sales by Grocery, Dry Goods, and Shoe Wholesalers, 1919-25	108
32. Commodity Sales by Drug, Hardware and Meat Wholesalers, 1919-25	111
33. Commodity and Dollar Sales, by Combined Wholesalers, 1919-25	112
34. Factory Pay Rolls (in Dollars) and Dollar Volume of Manufacturing Output, 1919-25	131

LIST OF CHARTS

xv

	PAGE
35. Factory Pay Rolls (Dollars), Dollar Sales by Grocery Chain Stores, and Dollar Sales by Department Stores, 1919-25	134
36. Savings, Deposits, 1919-25	136
37. Purchasing Power of Factory Pay Rolls and Commodity Volume of Manufacturing Output, 1919-25	140
38. Purchasing Power of Factory Pay Rolls and Commodity Sales by Grocery Chain Stores, 1919-25	141
39. Total Interest and Dividends Payments, 1919-25	144
40. Total Factory Pay Rolls and Average Earnings, N. Y. State, Annually, Adjusted Indices, 1919-	156
41. Total Factory Pay Rolls and Average Earnings, Annually, Adjusted Indices, 1915-23	158