

GOVERNMENT OF INDIA  
MINISTRY OF TRANSPORT

REPORT  
OF THE  
Motor Vehicle Taxation Enquiry  
Committee  
1950

PRINTED IN INDIA BY THE MANAGER  
INDIA PRESS, NEW DELHI AND PUBLISHED BY  
THE MANAGER OF PUBLICATIONS

P. OF  
BY  
1950

Price Rs. 2 As. 8 or 4

CONTENTS

Paragraph No.	Page No.
<b>CHAPTER I.—INTRODUCTORY</b>	
1. Appointment of the Committee . . . . .	1
2. Terms of Reference . . . . .	1
3. Composition of the Committee . . . . .	1
4. Procedure . . . . .	2
5. Representative nature of evidence received . . . . .	2
6. Plan of the Report . . . . .	3
7. Other Committees and Commissions . . . . .	3
8. Acknowledgements . . . . .	4
<b>CHAPTER II.—A SURVEY OF THE EXISTING TAXES PAID BY THE MOTOR VEHICLE USER IN INDIA.</b>	
9. Scope of Chapter II . . . . .	5
<b>A.—CENTRAL TAXES</b>	
10. The history and nature of Central Taxation . . . . .	5
3. Motor vehicles classed as luxuries . . . . .	5
5. Increase in the duty on motor spirit . . . . .	6
11. Allocation of the sources and proceeds of taxation . . . . .	6
4. Reduction of import duties advised in 1924-25 . . . . .	7
12. The Central Road Fund . . . . .	7
13. Responsibility for roads . . . . .	8
14. Finance Commission . . . . .	8
15. Growth of Central taxation . . . . .	8
2. Comparison with other countries . . . . .	10
3. Wide field for development . . . . .	10
16. Recent duties . . . . .	10
17. Protective tariffs . . . . .	10
18. Duties on motor spirit . . . . .	13
19. Present duties largely of the nature of luxury taxes . . . . .	13
2. Because of their unrequited character . . . . .	13
3. Bad roads are in effect another tax on the motorist . . . . .	13
<b>B.—STATES TAXES</b>	
20. The history and nature of State Taxation . . . . .	14
21. The Vehicle tax . . . . .	14
2. Varying bases of assessment . . . . .	15
22. Other State taxes and levies . . . . .	15
23. Extent of State taxation . . . . .	18
24. Growth of State taxation . . . . .	19
2. Recent increases . . . . .	19
<i>Reciprocity</i>	
25. Buses and lorries . . . . .	20
2. Private cars . . . . .	20
3. Reciprocity in taxation . . . . .	20
5. Aim should be complete reciprocity . . . . .	21

## C.—LOCAL TAXATION

26. The history and nature of local taxation . . . . .	21
27. Efforts made to control local taxes on transport . . . . .	22
2. Evils of local taxes on trade . . . . .	22
28. Local taxes still very high in some areas . . . . .	22
2. Examples of octroi and terminal tax dues . . . . .	22
3. Octroi brokers . . . . .	23
4. Delays more harmful than the taxes themselves . . . . .	23
5. Evasions common . . . . .	23
29. Justification for local taxes . . . . .	23
30. Burdens on trade . . . . .	24
31. The demoralising effect of certain forms of local taxes . . . . .	25

## D.—THE TOTAL BURDEN OF MOTOR VEHICLE TAXATION

32. Contribution of the motor vehicle to general revenue . . . . .	25
2. And towards the cost of road maintenance . . . . .	25
33. Comparative figures . . . . .	25
2. Large contributions to Central Revenues . . . . .	26
34. Fair contribution based on SALTER COMMITTEE'S recommendations . . . . .	26
35. Criticism of "diversion" of proceeds of road taxes to other purposes . . . . .	26
36. Criticism met . . . . .	27
3. Assessment of tax burden . . . . .	27

## CHAPTER III.—INLAND TRANSPORT CO-ORDINATION AND REGULATION.

37. Principles of inland transport co-ordination . . . . .	29
38. Regulation of motor vehicle transport . . . . .	30
2. Non-existent at first . . . . .	30
3. But ultimately provided on an all-India scale by the 1939 Act . . . . .	30
39. Independence of Transport Authorities . . . . .	31
40. The working of the Motor Vehicles Act of 1939 . . . . .	31
2. High Court judgement . . . . .	31
3. Power of review to be delegated to a judicial authority . . . . .	31
4. Subservience of some Transport Authorities . . . . .	32
5. Encouraging example of enlightened public opinion . . . . .	32
41. Road-Rail co-ordination . . . . .	32
2. Extreme views on restriction of goods transport by road . . . . .	32
3. At present little or no road-rail competition . . . . .	33
4. Increase in railway running . . . . .	33
42. Road-rail Code of Principles and Practice . . . . .	33
2. "Regions" . . . . .	34
3. And "Zones" . . . . .	34
4. Distance restrictions . . . . .	34
43. Road-rail competition . . . . .	34
2. Cannot at present affect railway revenues appreciably . . . . .	35
3. But in the worst case . . . . .	36
4. Could be compensated for by increase in certain railway rates . . . . .	36
6. Railway potential has not increased in recent years while population, industry and living standards have grown . . . . .	36
7. Extent of road rail competition distinctly limited . . . . .	37

Paragraph No.	Page No.
44. State Transport Undertakings . . . . .	37
2. Impressions generally favourable . . . . .	38
3. Except in the matter of cost . . . . .	38
4. Management not everywhere sufficiently independent . . . . .	38
5. Balance sheets . . . . .	38
6. Not a gold mine if rates are kept reasonable . . . . .	38
7. Efficiency . . . . .	39
8. Bus fares . . . . .	39
9. Increase in rates require justification . . . . .	40
45. Development of "cross traffic" . . . . .	40
2. State governments should encourage cross traffic . . . . .	40
3. Tax concessions . . . . .	41
46. Minimum Fares . . . . .	41
47. The role of private enterprise . . . . .	41
48. Regulation . . . . .	42
49. Enforcement . . . . .	42
2. Trained staff necessary . . . . .	42
50. Special road-rail regulation . . . . .	42
3. The railways are taking steps in the right direction . . . . .	43
<b>CHAPTER IV.—OTHER COGNATE MATTERS.</b>	
51. Scope of Chapter IV . . . . .	45
52. Protection of the Indian Motor Vehicle Manufacturing industry . . . . .	45
2. The entire burden of which is falling on the Motor Vehicle User . . . . .	45
53. The new industry would be better helped by subsidies . . . . .	45
2. The virtues of subsidies . . . . .	46
3. Objections to subsidies . . . . .	46
4. The cost whether met by subsidies or protective tariffs will be high . . . . .	47
54. Assembly plants . . . . .	47
55. Diesel engines . . . . .	47
56. Taxation of bullock carts . . . . .	48
2. The cultivator's cart should not be separately taxed . . . . .	48
3. But taxation of carts used as public-carriers recommended . . . . .	48
4. Use of rubber tyres to be encouraged . . . . .	49
57. Municipal roads . . . . .	49
2. Give access to property and should be paid for by property owners . . . . .	49
3. Local taxes on the motor vehicle user as such should be abolished . . . . .	50
58. Size of bus fleets . . . . .	50
2. Governed by economic laws . . . . .	51
3. Control a matter for the Transport Authorities . . . . .	51
4. Who may be trusted to use their discretion properly . . . . .	52
59. Association of remunerative and unremunerative bus service routes . . . . .	52
60. The method of collecting taxes is not always convenient to the taxpayer . . . . .	53
2. Delays, the chief cause of complaint . . . . .	53
3. Remedies suggested . . . . .	53
61. Other difficulties . . . . .	54
62. Weights of vehicles . . . . .	54
<i>Transport Statistics</i>	
63. Statistics in the U. K. and the U. S. A. . . . .	54
2. And in India . . . . .	55
3. Recommendations . . . . .	55

Paragraph  
No.

CHAPTER V.—THE PRESENT POSITION IN RESPECT TO ROAD  
MAINTENANCE AND DEVELOPMENT IN INDIA

64. Scope of Chapter V . . . . .	57
65. Indian roads in the past . . . . .	57
66. The advent of the railway . . . . .	57
2. Resulted generally in devolution of responsibility for roads to local bodies . . . . .	58
67. The advent of the motor vehicle . . . . .	58
2. Called for a reversal of the devolutionary process . . . . .	58
3. Leading first to a Central tax for road development . . . . .	58
4. And later, to acceptance of Central responsibility for national highways . . . . .	58
68. Comparison with some other countries ; road mileages . . . . .	59
2. And road expenditure . . . . .	59

*Central Expenditure on Roads*

69. Expenditure from the Central Road Fund . . . . .	59
2. Expenditure on national highways . . . . .	60
3. Other Central expenditure on roads . . . . .	60

*States Expenditure on Roads*

70. The States have no funds of the nature of the Central Road Fund . . . . .	60
2. Expenditure chargeable to " Block Grants " . . . . .	60
3. Expenditure from States' revenues . . . . .	60
71. Upgrading of road surfaces required . . . . .	61
2. Excessive repair bills caused by neglect of road maintenance . . . . .	61
3. Are in effect still another tax on the motor vehicle user . . . . .	62

*Planned Development*

72. The Nagpur Plan . . . . .	62
73. Application of the principles advocated in the Nagpur Plan . . . . .	63
2. Three years' progress on road development . . . . .	63
3. Road development a continuous process . . . . .	63
74. Difficulties in implementing planned road development . . . . .	64
75. India's road needs during the next twenty years . . . . .	64
2. Can be met by raising loans for road development . . . . .	65
76. The Road Board . . . . .	65
2. And the National Highways Act . . . . .	66

CHAPTER VI.—TAXATION OF MOTOR TRANSPORT IN FOREIGN COUNTRIES

77. Scope of Chapter VI . . . . .	67
78. Comparison of motor vehicle taxation in various countries . . . . .	67

*The United Kingdom : Taxation*

79. Taxation of motor vehicles in the United Kingdom . . . . .	68
2. Classification of motor vehicles . . . . .	68
3. Details of taxes . . . . .	

*The United Kingdom : Regulation*

80. Regulation of motor vehicles . . . . .	69
--	----

81.	Road-rail competition . . . . .	
82.	The Salter Committee . . . . .	
83.	The Road and Rail Traffic Act of 1933 . . . . .	
84.	Restrictive conditions for licences . . . . .	
85.	The 1934 and 1938 Acts . . . . .	
86.	Tendencies since the 1930 Act was passed . . . . .	
87.	The Rate Structure . . . . .	
88.	Transport during the war . . . . .	
89.	The Transport Act of 1947 . . . . .	
90.	Statement of policy of the British Transport . . . . .	
	2. Conditions under which rail transport is specially suitable . . . . .	73
	3. Conditions under which road transport is specially suitable . . . . .	73
91.	Statement of policy on traffic in general . . . . .	74
<i>The United Kingdom : Roads</i>		
92.	Road problems created by the motor vehicle . . . . .	74
	2. The Roads Act of 1920 . . . . .	74
93.	Raids on the Road Fund . . . . .	75
<i>The United States of America : Taxation</i>		
94.	Taxation of motor vehicles in the United States of America . . . . .	75
95.	Federal taxation . . . . .	76
96.	State taxation : The States motor vehicle tax . . . . .	76
	2. And the States fuel tax . . . . .	76
	3. Property tax on motor vehicles . . . . .	77
<i>The United States of America : Regulation</i>		
97.	Regulation . . . . .	77
	2. The Federal Motor Carrier Act of 1935 . . . . .	77
98.	Types of goods carriers . . . . .	77
	2. Common carriers . . . . .	77
	3. Contract carriers . . . . .	78
	4. Private carriers . . . . .	78
	5. Certificates for common carriers . . . . .	78
	6. Permits for contract carriers . . . . .	79
<i>The United States of America : Road-Rail Co-ordination</i>		
99.	Road-rail co-ordination . . . . .	79
	2. Control of motor carrier services by railways . . . . .	79
<i>The United States of America : Roads</i>		
100.	Roads prior to 1916 . . . . .	80
	2. States' responsibility for roads . . . . .	80
101.	The Federal Aid Road Act of 1916 . . . . .	80
	2. The Federal Highway Act of 1921 . . . . .	80
102.	Subsequent history of Federal aid . . . . .	80
	2. Changes in policy brought about by the 1930 depression . . . . .	81
	3. The Hayden-Cartwright Acts of 1934 and 1936 . . . . .	81

Paragraph No.		Page No.
	4. The Federal Aid Highway Act of 1944 . . . . .	81
	<i>Canada</i>	
103.	Federal Taxation . . . . .	82
	2. Provincial taxation . . . . .	82
104.	Regulation . . . . .	82
	<i>Australia</i>	
105.	Motor vehicle taxation . . . . .	82
	2. The fuel tax . . . . .	82
106.	Federal financial assistance for roads . . . . .	84
	2. The Commonwealth Aid Roads and Works Act 1947 . . . . .	84
	<i>Turkey</i>	
107.	The road tax . . . . .	84
108.	The fuel tax . . . . .	85
109.	Tax revenue . . . . .	85
110.	Road milages . . . . .	8

#### CHAPTER VII.—RECOMMENDATIONS : INLAND TRANSPORT POLICY

111.	The problem set the Committee . . . . .	87
112.	The system and extent of motor vehicle taxation dependent on transport policy . . . . .	87
113.	The functions and obligations of the Centre . . . . .	88
114.	The functions and obligations of the States . . . . .	88
115.	Transport Policy . . . . .	89
	<i>Fundamental Principles of Inland Transport Co-ordination</i>	
116.	Two sides to transport : production and distribution . . . . .	89
	2. "Production" to be associated with motor transport regulation . . . . .	89
117.	Freedom of choice . . . . .	90
	2. Restrictions on goods transport exist . . . . .	90
	3. Railways should discourage short-haul traffic . . . . .	90
	5. There should be no restriction on the carriage of goods by road . . . . .	90
	6. The Code of Principles and Practice restrictions to be held over for three years . . . . .	91
	7. And the Motor Vehicles Act amended . . . . .	91
118.	Private Carriers . . . . .	91
	2. Should not be restricted . . . . .	91
	3. But permits given on considerations of merit only . . . . .	92
	4. This will have a regulatory and beneficial effect . . . . .	92
119.	Healthy competition . . . . .	93
	2. Certain statutory obligations on the railways should be eased . . . . .	93
	3. State Undertakings . . . . .	93
	4. Defence and National Welfare . . . . .	94

Paragraph No.		Page No.
<i>Transport policy in other countries</i>		
120.	Policy in the U.S.A. and the U.K. contrasted . . . . .	94
	2. Policy recommended by the Committee . . . . .	95
	3. Railway milage in India generally sufficient for the present . . . . .	95
<i>Recommended transport policy for India</i>		
121.	The conclusions of the Committee regarding policy . . . . .	96
CHAPTER VIII—RECOMMENDATIONS : MOTOR VEHICLE TAXATION		
122.	Scope of Chapter VIII . . . . .	97
123.	Comment on the existing taxes . . . . .	97
124.	Taxation must be based on an agreed transport policy . . . . .	97
125.	A "fair basis" of taxation . . . . .	98
<i>States' Taxes</i>		
126.	Only two taxes to be levied by States . . . . .	98
<i>The States' Fuel Tax</i>		
127.	The fuel tax the best form of road user tax . . . . .	98
	2. And should replace many miscellaneous taxes . . . . .	98
	3. The object being to simplify the present taxing system . . . . .	99
128.	Effect of abolition of certain local taxes . . . . .	99
	2. Assistance to be given to local bodies where justified . . . . .	99
	3. As measured by applying the ability principle . . . . .	101
	4. The property tax in various States compared . . . . .	103
	5. Property taxes should replace octrois and terminal taxes . . . . .	103
129.	Fees to be restricted to cover the cost of services rendered . . . . .	103
130.	Method of allocating the States' fuel tax . . . . .	104
<i>The States' Motor Vehicle Tax</i>		
131.	Basis of assessment of the States' motor vehicle tax . . . . .	104
	2. And level of assessment . . . . .	105
<i>The Practical Effects of the Recommended Taxes</i>		
132.	Matters for consideration . . . . .	105
<i>Expenditure on Roads</i>		
	2. State versus Central expenditure on roads . . . . .	105
	3. Criticism of the existing allocation of the proceeds of taxation . . . . .	106
	4. The Constitutional position . . . . .	107
<i>Rent for use of Roads</i>		
133.	Government provides the roads and is therefore a partner in motor transport . . . . .	107
	2. Community use of roads . . . . .	107
	3. The motor vehicle user, after paying all transport charges, to be taxed the same as the railway user . . . . .	108
<i>Lapse of Grants</i>		
134.	The system of "lapse" . . . . .	108
	2 No true economy . . . . .	108



Paragraph No.		Page No.
<i>The Central Road Fund</i>		
135.	Grants from the Central Road Fund do not lapse . . . . .	109
	2. But are now relatively small . . . . .	109
	3. The present form of the Fund . . . . .	109
<i>The Practical Effects of Taxation Measures</i>		
136.	Road transport problems not peculiar to India . . . . .	110
	2. But still to be solved in India . . . . .	110
	3. The difference between tariffs at the standard rate and at higher rates to be credited to the Central Road Fund . . . . .	110
<i>Detailed Tax Recommendations</i>		
137.	Tax recommendations based on acceptance of the recommended transport policy . . . . .	111
<i>Central Taxes</i>		
138.	Changes to be made in Central taxes . . . . .	111
	1. The Central tax on motor spirit . . . . .	111
	2. Central Customs and Excise Duties . . . . .	111
	3. Duties on Diesel and other fuels . . . . .	111
139.	The Centre should support liberally plans of road development . . . . .	112
	2. And should consider equalising customs tariffs on railway and road imports . . . . .	112
<i>State Taxes</i>		
140.	Changes to be made in States' taxes . . . . .	112
	(1) The States' Fuel Tax . . . . .	112
	(2) The States' Motor Vehicle Tax . . . . .	112
	(3) The States' Motor Vehicle fees . . . . .	114
141.	Countervailing tax on motor vehicles using fuels other than motor spirit . . . . .	114
	2. Basis of the proposed tax . . . . .	115
	3. Not to be levied on existing vehicles using producer gas . . . . .	115
<i>Taxes on other users of Road Transport</i>		
142.	The Cultivator's Cart . . . . .	115
	2. A road cess on land revenue . . . . .	115
	3. Tax not excessive . . . . .	116
	4. Carts plying for hire or reward . . . . .	116
<i>Distribution of the Proceeds of Taxes on the Motor Vehicle User</i>		
143.	Money for road development should be voted into non-lapsing funds . . . . .	116
	2. Part of which the Centre should match . . . . .	116
144.	Final distribution of the proceeds of taxes on the motor vehicle user . . . . .	116
	1. Central Taxes—	
	(1) Fuel tax . . . . .	116
	(2) Customs and excise duties . . . . .	117
	2. State Taxes—	
	(1) The States' fuel tax . . . . .	117
	(2) The States' motor vehicle tax . . . . .	117
	3. Municipal and local taxes . . . . .	117

*Various matters affecting taxation*

145.	Uniformity of motor vehicle taxes desirable . . . . .	117
	2. But there should be no double taxation even if uniformity in taxation is not immediately achieved . . . . .	117
	3. A large measure of uniformity already exists in working costs . . . . .	118
	4. Payment of transport costs of motor spirit from a transport cess recommended . . . . .	118
146.	Taxation measures should not deny the country the benefits of technical progress . . . . .	119
147.	Summary of Recommendations relating to Tax Revenue and the Distribution of the Proceeds . . . . .	119
148.	The proceeds of such taxes as are ear-marked for expenditure on roads should be paid into non-lapsing road funds . . . . .	124
	2. Contributions from general revenues for road upkeep should also be paid into these funds . . . . .	124
	3. And capital grants should also be non-lapsing . . . . .	124
149.	Legislation necessary . . . . .	124

CHAPTER IX—SUMMARY OF THE COMMITTEE'S CONCLUSIONS  
AND RECOMMENDATIONS*Conclusions*

150.	The present taxation policies in India do not conform with the government's overall policy of developing road transport . . . . .	127
	2. The more important conclusions:	
	Central taxes . . . . .	127
	State taxes . . . . .	127
	Local taxes . . . . .	128
	The burden of taxation . . . . .	128
	Regulation and Road-Rail competition . . . . .	128
	Miscellaneous . . . . .	129
	Responsibility for roads . . . . .	129
	Transport Policy . . . . .	130

*Recommendations*

151.	Recommended transport policy to form the basis of a taxation policy . . . . .	130
	2. The more important detailed recommendations :	
	Regulation . . . . .	131
	Taxation Policy . . . . .	132
	Miscellaneous . . . . .	133
	Detailed Taxation Recommendations . . . . .	134

## APPENDICES

Appendix		
I.	Resolution . . . . .	137
II.	A. Questionnaire . . . . .	139
	B. Tour Programme of the Committee and list of persons who gave oral evidence. . . . .	144
III.	Extracts from the Report of the Indian Taxation Enquiry Committee of 1924-25 . . . . .	147
IV.	Number of motor vehicles in different countries . . . . .	149
V.	Tax payable by a 30 seater bus in Madras . . . . .	150

## Appendix

VI. A.	Taxes on typical vehicles in States . . . . .	151
B.	Annual Taxation on a light passenger car in various States . . . . .	152
C.	Annual Taxation on a medium car in various States . . . . .	153
D.	Taxation on a motor lorry of 14,500 lbs. laden weight in various States . . . . .	154
E.	Taxation on a 30 seater bus in various States . . . . .	155
F.	Taxes on the basis of recommendations . . . . .	156
VII.	Taxes and fees levied by States—	
A.	Rates of sales tax in States . . . . .	157
B.	Rates of motor vehicle taxes in States . . . . .	158
C.	Motor vehicle fees in different States . . . . .	171
VIII.	A Note on reciprocity-Private Cars . . . . .	177
IX.	Typical examples of octrois and other taxes on motor vehicles by local bodies . . . . .	178
X.	Average Tax paid by a lorry weighing 14,500 lbs. laden . . . . .	182
XI. A.	Revenue from motor vehicles and expenditure on national highways and other roads in Part A States in 1948-49 . . . . .	183
B.	Expenditure on road maintenance and repairs in 1948-49 . . . . .	184
C.	Expenditure on road construction and development original works in 1948-49 . . . . .	184
XII.	The legitimate share of motor transport towards road costs—	
A.	Extracts from the Salter Committee's Report, 1932 . . . . .	185
B.	Extracts from the Report of the Technical Sub-Committee to the Subject Committee on transport on the future of road rail relations 1943 . . . . .	186
XIII.	A summary of the transport policy recommended to the League of Nations in 1933 for adoption by all countries . . . . .	187
XIV.	Extracts from the judgments, dated 11th May 1950 of the High Court of Judicature at Allahabad on certain cases relating to road transport. . . . .	188
XV.	Code of principles and practice in the regulation of motor transport . . . . .	194
XVI.	Particulars of motor vehicle assembly plants in India . . . . .	197
XVII.	Municipal Taxes 1946-47 . . . . .	200
XVIII.	Element of excessive cost in operation caused by bad roads . . . . .	202
XIX.	A note on the statistics that it is desirable to collect on the operation of public service vehicles . . . . .	204
XX.	Fuel and annual motor vehicle taxation in foreign countries . . . . .	207