

**150**

HEALTH SERVICES AND THEIR IMPACT  
ON HEALTH IN INDIA

MRS. SANJEEVANEE MULAY

OCTOBER 1982

# HEALTH SERVICES AND THEIR IMPACT ON HEALTH IN INDIA

A THESIS  
SUBMITTED TO THE  
**UNIVERSITY OF POONA**  
  
FOR THE DEGREE OF  
**DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY**



BY  
**MRS. SANJEEVANE MULAY**

GOKHALE INSTITUTE OF POLITICS AND ECONOMICS  
PUNE 411004

OCTOBER 1982

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The present study covers a wide range of aspects of health services in relation to their impact on health in India. It would not have been possible for me to complete this study without the able guidance of Mrs. Kumudini Dandekar. I would first like to thank her for her valuable suggestions, constant encouragement and the unfailing patience with which she read my manuscript.

I wish to express my gratitude to Prof. Nilakantha Rath and other Institute authorities for providing me the facilities for completing the study.

My sincere thanks are also due to Prof. K.S. Srikantan and Mrs. Vaijayanti Bhate for their suggestions.

I take this opportunity to thank all my friends and colleagues, whose encouragement and cooperation helped me to complete the study. I would like to mention, specially, Mrs. Surekha Nikam for her kind help.

For the study on Malaria Programme, I could get immense help from the staff of the Department of Malaria of the Government of Maharashtra. I was greatly benefited by the discussions with Dr. M.R. Bhate, the then Director of the Department of Malaria. The discussions have enriched my knowledge regarding the malaria problem. I am highly obliged to Dr. Bhate and his staff for their kind cooperation in

(ii)

providing me the relevant information and helping me to solve my difficulties.

I sincerely thank Shri V.M. Inamdar for his efficient and graceful typing.

It would be too formal to thank my family members, especially, my husband and my daughters. However, I cannot forget the cooperation they have offered me in completing my thesis.

Gokhale Institute of  
Politics and Economics,  
Pune-411 004

Mrs. Sanjeevane Mulay

October 1982

## CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS.....	(i)
LIST OF TABLES.....	(x)
LIST OF GRAPHS.....	(xv)

### Chapter

<b>1</b>	<b>HISTORICAL REVIEW OF HEALTH SERVICES AND MEASUREMENT OF HEALTH.....</b>	<b>1</b>
	<b>1.1 History of Health Administration in India Prior to 1946.....</b>	<b>2</b>
	<b>1.1.1 The Appointment of a Royal Commission to Enquire into the Health of the Army in India in 1859.....</b>	<b>3</b>
	<b>1.1.2 Report of the Plague Commission in 1904.....</b>	<b>4</b>
	<b>1.1.3 Reforms Introduced by the Government of India Act of 1919.....</b>	<b>5</b>
	<b>1.1.4 Reforms Introduced by the 1935 Government of India Act.....</b>	<b>5</b>
	<b>1.2 Comments on the Health Administration upto 1945.....</b>	<b>6</b>
	<b>1.3 Report of the Bhoré Committee, 1946.</b>	<b>7</b>
	<b>1.3.1 Medical Care.....</b>	<b>7</b>
	<b>1.3.2 Public Health.....</b>	<b>9</b>
	<b>1.4 Progress Made (upto 1961) in the Implementation of the Recommendations of the Bhoré Committee.....</b>	<b>10</b>
	<b>1.5 Mudliar Committee Report.....</b>	<b>11</b>

<u>Chapter</u>	<u>Page</u>
1.6 Committees Set up During 1961-81.....	13
1.7 Report of the Working Group, 1981...	15
1.8 Core Sectors of Health Services in the Past and Present.....	16
1.9 Measurement of Health.....	20
1.9.1 Data on Morbidity of Health in India	21
1.9.2 The Data on Causes of Death in India	25
1.9.3 Data on Mortality in India.....	27
<b>2 CONTROL AND ERADICATION OF MALARIA IN INDIA..</b>	<b>31</b>
2.1 History of Anti-malarial Measures in India.....	32
2.2 National Malaria Control Programme (NMCP): Its Nature and Coverage.....	33
2.3 Impact of the NMCP.....	34
2.4 Monetary Gain due to NMCP.....	35
2.5 Towards National Malaria Eradication Programme (NMEP).....	35
2.6 National Malaria Eradication Pro- gramme (NMEP): Its Nature and Coverage.....	36
2.7 Rising Incidence of Malaria.....	39
2.8 Modified Plan of Operations.....	42
2.9 Likely Reasons Behind the Failure of the Programme.....	45
2.9.1 Temporary Nature of the Programme...	47
2.9.2 Lack of Differential Policies for Regions with Varying Malaria Prevalence.....	51
2.9.3 Improper Application of the Criteria for Withdrawal of Spraying.....	58

<u>Chapter</u>	<u>Page</u>
2.9.4 Reliability of the Measures of Malaria Incidence.....	58
2.10 Suggestions for Improving the Quality of Malariametric Indices....	73
APPENDIX 2.1 : FACTORS DETERMINING THE MALARIA ENDEMICITY.....	76
APPENDIX 2.2 : DIFFERENCE BETWEEN CONTROL PROGRAMME AND ERADICATION PROGRAMME.....	78
APPENDIX 2.3 : CRITERIA FOR TRANSITION FROM ONE PHASE TO NEXT PHASE IN NMEP	79
APPENDIX 2.4 : A DESCRIPTION OF MALARIOUS REGIONS AS GIVEN IN THE ANNUAL REPORT OF THE PUBLIC HEALTH COMMISSIONER TO GOVERNMENT OF INDIA, 1939.....	81
<b>3</b> MALARIA CONTROL AND ITS EFFECT ON POPULATION GROWTH.....	<b>83</b>
3.1 Problems in Measuring the Effect of Malaria Control on Morbidity and Mortality.....	83
3.2 Review of Literature .....	84
3.3 Methodology of Assessing the Effect of Malaria Control Programme on Mortality and Morbidity in India....	88
3.4 Methodology Used in the Present Study	89
3.4.1 Fixation of the Area and Unit of Analysis.....	90
3.4.2 Choice of the Index of Natural Increase.....	91
3.4.3 Delimitation of the Pre-Control Period and Control Period.....	93
3.4.4 Classification of Districts according to Malaria-endemicity.....	94

<u>Chapter</u>	<u>Page</u>
3.4.5 Classification of Districts according to the Existence of the Anti-malarial Operations during the Control Period.....	97
3.4.6 Estimation of the Growth Rates for Malarious and Non-malarious Districts during the Pre-control and Control Periods.....	99
3.5 Implications of the Results.....	102
APPENDIX 3.1 : TEST OF THE ASSUMPTIONS REGARDING THE AUTONOMOUS FACTORS OF GROWTH IN MALARIOUS AND NON-MALARIOUS AREAS.....	106
 4	
MEDICAL AND PARAMEDICAL MANPOWER AND ITS DISTRIBUTION IN VARIOUS REGIONS OF INDIA IN 1961 AND 1971.....	109
4.1 Review of Literature on the Subject.	109
4.1.1 Routine Studies.....	109
4.1.2 Analytical Studies.....	110
4.2 Objectives of the Present Study.....	111
4.2.1 Data-base for Assessing Medical and Paramedical Personnel in India.....	113
4.2.2 Availability and Growth of Medical and Paramedical Personnel in India during 1961-76.....	118
4.2.3 Inter-State Distribution of Medical Personnel in 1961, 1971 and 1976....	122
4.2.4 Policies regarding Development of Medical and Paramedical Personnel and Implications of the Policies....	138
4.2.5 Relationship between the Availability of Medical Personnel and the Mortality Rates.....	156
APPENDIX 4.1: COMPARABILITY OF THE CLASSIFICATIONS OF THE MEDICAL AND PARAMEDICAL PERSONNEL IN 1961 AND 1971 CENSUSES.....	158



<u>Chapter</u>	<u>Page</u>
APPENDIX 4.2 : ESTIMATION OF THE NUMBER OF ALLOPATHIC DOCTORS IN 1971 ON THE BASIS OF THE INSTITUTIONAL OUTFURN OF ALLOPATHIC GRADUATES TILL 1971.....	163
APPENDIX 4.3 : DATA ON INSTITUTIONAL OUTFURN FOR NON-ALLOPATHIC DOCTORS AND THE RELATED PROBLEMS.....	166
APPENDIX 4.4 : ESTIMATION OF THE NUMBER OF 'NURSES, MIDWIVES AND HEALTH VISITORS' IN 1961 AND 1971 ON THE BASIS OF INSTITUTIONAL OUTFURN.....	167
APPENDIX 4.5 : TEST OF RELIABILITY OF THE NUMBER OF 'NURSES, MIDWIVES AND HEALTH VISITORS' AS REPORTED IN THE CENSUS OF INDIA, 1961.....	170
<b>5</b> BUDGETARY EXPENDITURES ON HEALTH AND MEDICINE IN INDIA.....	173
5.1 Comparison of Public and Private Expenditures on Health in India....	173
5.2 Levels of Public or Budgetary Expenditure on Health and Medicine in India.....	175
5.2.1 Assessment of the Quality of Available Data on Budgetary Expenditures on Health and Medicine in Different States of India.....	178
5.2.2 Level and Trend of PEHM in Different States of India over the Period 1960-75.....	180
5.2.3 Allocation of Resources for Curative and Preventive Health Services.....	198
5.2.4 Allocation of Resources into Sub-Items Under 'Medical' and 'Public Health'.....	206
5.2.5 Allocation of Expenditure on Schemes Under Five Year Plans.....	213

<u>Chapter</u>		<u>Page</u>
	5.2.6 Allocation of Expenditure Towards Wages and Salaries.....	217
	5.2.7 Allocation of Expenditure Towards the Non-Wage Component.....	219
	5.2.8 Allocation of Expenditure Towards 'Rural Health'.....	221
	5.2.9 Relation between Levels of Expenditure on Health and Medicine and the Prevalent Mortality Rates.....	224
	APPENDIX 5.1 : AN EVALUATION OF THE DATA ON BUDGETARY EXPENDITURES ON HEALTH AND MEDICINE IN INDIA..	232
	APPENDIX 5.2 : PERCENTAGE OF EXPENDITURE ON FAMILY PLANNING PROGRAMME TO TOTAL EXPENDITURE ON 'HEALTH AND MEDICINE' IN 1969-70 IN DIFFERENT STATES OF INDIA.....	241
	APPENDIX 5.3 : CAUSES OF MORTALITY DECLINE IN DEVELOPING COUNTRIES.....	244
	APPENDIX 5.4 : ESTIMATES OF MORTALITY RATES FOR VARIOUS STATES OF INDIA AT DIFFERENT POINTS OF TIME.....	245
6	AVAILABILITY AND UTILIZATION OF HEALTH-SERVICES IN RURAL AREAS OF INDIA.....	246
	6.1 Availability of Health Services in Rural Areas: Data at Hand.....	246
	6.2 Approaches to Construction of New Indices of Coverage, Inaccessibility and Utilization of Health Services.	251
	6.2.1 Coverage of Rural Areas by Health Facilities.....	252
	6.2.2 Differentials in Operational Efficiency of the Health Facilities in Rural Areas.....	267
	6.2.3 Utilization of Health Services in Rural Areas.....	281

(ix)

<u>Chapter</u>		<u>Page</u>
	APPENDIX 6.1 : INDICATORS OF HEALTH FACILITIES IN RURAL AREAS: BIHAR, MAHARASHTRA, PUNJAB, RAJASTHAN AND WEST BENGAL.....	296
7	SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS.....	301
	7.1 Nature of the Relationship between Provision of Health Services and Level of Health.....	301
	7.2 The Health Services in Relation to Their Impact on the Death Rates in India in the Past and Present.....	303
	7.3 The Level of Health Services in Individual States in Relation to the Decline in Mortality.....	308
	BIBLIOGRAPHY.....	318

## LIST OF TABLES

<u>Table No.</u>		<u>Page</u>
1.1	Health Indicators, Targets, Phased Planwise for Achievement of Health for All by 2000 A.D. ....	17
1.2	Incidence and Prevalence Rates Per 1000 Persons for NSS Rounds: All India Rural and Urban Households.....	23
1.3	Prevalence Rates in Rural and Urban Areas of Different States, 1973-74.....	24
1.4	Estimates of Crude Death Rates for Different States in India, 1951-61 to 1978.....	29
2.1	Incidence of Malaria, 1961-77.....	40
2.2	National Malaria Eradication Programme, India: Phasing of Units from 1961-62 to 1975-76.....	48
2.3	Allotment of NMEP Units in Different States With Their Spleen-rates (as Measures of Malaria Incidence), 1958.....	53
2.4	Year of Establishment of Anti-Malarial Activities in Districts of Maharashtra.....	54
2.5	Talukas Persistently in Attack Phase and Talukas Reverted to Attack Phase, 1975.....	57
2.6	Malariametric Indices for States in India, 1976.....	69
2.7	Malariametric Indices for India, 1961-76.....	71
3.1	Classification of Talukas in Districts according to Malaria-endemicity Before Malaria-Control.....	96
3.2	Year of Establishment of Anti-malarial Activities in Districts of Maharashtra.....	98

<u>Table No.</u>		<u>Page</u>
3.3	Estimation of the Effect of Malaria Control on Population Growth in Maharashtra.....	100
3.4	Estimates of Birth Rate, Death Rate and Growth Rate for Maharashtra.....	104
4.1	Population Per Doctor in Different Developing Countries.....	112
4.2	Estimates of Number of Allopathic Doctors in 1961 and 1971.....	115
4.3	Estimates of Number of Non-Allopathic Doctors, 1961 and 1971.....	116
4.4	Estimates of Number of Nurses, Midwives and Health Visitors in 1961 and 1971.....	118
4.5	Indices of Availability of Medical/Para-medical Personnel in 1961, 1971 and 1976 for India.....	120
4.6	Estimation of Number of Doctors of All Systems in Various States Using Method I.....	124
4.7	Estimation of the Number of Doctors in Various States Using Method II.....	125
4.8	Population Per Doctor of All Systems Put Together, 1961 and 1971.....	126
4.9	Population Per Doctor (All Systems Taken Together) in Rural and Urban Areas of Various States in India, 1961.....	127
4.10	Distribution of Doctors Practising Various Systems of Medicine, 1961.....	129
4.11	Estimation of Stock of Allopathic Doctors in 1971.....	131
4.12	Percentage of Allopathic Doctors in 1961 and 1971 in Various States of India.....	132
4.13	Population Per Allopathic Doctor, 1961 and 1971.....	133
4.14	Number of Allopathic Doctors Registered with State Medical Councils in 1961, 1971 and 1976	135

<u>Table No.</u>		<u>Page</u>
4.15	Percentage of Workers Among Medical Degree-holders in Urban Areas of Various States in India, 1961 and 1971.....	137
4.16	Sex Ratio (Females Per 1,000 Males) of Doctors in 1961 and 1971.....	139
4.17	Percentage of PHCs Functioning with Only One Doctor, 1976.....	148
4.18	Number of MPWs and CHVs in Position and Future Requirements, 1980-95.....	153
5.1	Per Capita Per Month Expenditure on Medicine/Medical Services, in Rural and Urban Areas of India, 1951,1952,1954,1955,1956 and 1964-65..	174
5.2	Government Expenditures on 'Health and Medicine' in Selected Countries.....	176
5.3	Per Capita Expenditure (in Rs.) on Health and Medicine, in the Years 1959-60, 1964-65, 1969-70 and 1974-75.....	182
5.4	Per Capita Expenditures on Health and Medicine Deflated by the Consumer Price Index for Urban Non-manual Employees.....	185
5.5	PEHM for Different States and India (including Central Finance) in 1959-60, 1964-65, 1969-70 and 1974-75.....	187
5.6	Percentage Share of Expenditure on Health and Medicine in the Total Revenue Expenditure, 1959-60, 1964-65, 1969-70 and 1974-75.....	189
5.7	Percentage Growth of Per Capita Expenditure on All Services (PEAS) and Per Capita Expenditure on Health and Medicine (PEHM) for States in India: 1959-60 to 1964-65, 1964-65 to 1969-70 and 1969-70 to 1974-75.....	191
5.8	Percentage of Expenditures on Social and Developmental Services Under the Revenue Account, in 1964-65 and 1969-70.....	197
5.9	Percentage of Expenditure on Public Health to Total Expenditure on Health and Medicine in 1964-65 and 1974-75.....	205

<u>Table No.</u>		<u>Page</u>
5.10	Comparative Chart of the Classification of Expenditure Under 'Public Health' Used in 1959-60 and 1974-75.....	208
5.11	Allocation of Resources into Sub-Items of 'Public Health' for Different States, 1959-60 and 1974-75.....	209
5.12	Percentage of Plan Outlay to Total Expenditure on Health and Medicine in India, 1959-60, 1964-65, 1969-70 and 1974-75.....	213
5.13	Health Plan Outlays Under Various Programmes (First to Sixth Plan).....	215
5.14	Allocation (Percentage) of Total Resources and Resources Under Plan, on Various Items of Health Services, 1976-77.....	216
5.15	Percentage of Expenses on Wages Under 'Medical', 'Public Health and Sanitation' and 'Water Supply and Sewerage Schemes', Maharashtra, 1959-60 and 1975-76.....	218
5.16	Plan Outlays on Different Items Under Health and Medicine, 1979-84.....	224
5.17	Indicators of Mortality Selected for Different Points of Time.....	226
5.18	Coefficients of Correlation between Budgetary Expenditure on Health (Adjusted for Price Rise) for Various States, 1965, 1970 and 1975	229
6.1	OPD Cases in a PHC by Distance of Villages from the PHC in Haryana.....	248
6.2	PHV in Selected States, 1971.....	254
6.3	Factors Leading to Differentials in the Level of PHV for Bihar, Maharashtra, Punjab, Rajasthan and West Bengal.....	256
6.4	Range in PHV for Districts Within the Selected States, 1971.....	257
6.5	Coefficients of Correlation between Average Size of Village and PHV for Districts Within the Selected States.....	267

<u>Table No.</u>		<u>Page</u>
6.6	Number of PHCs, Sub-centres and Dispensaries in Rural Areas of Various States, 1976.....	269
6.7	Population Per PHC and Population Per Sub-Centre in Different States, 1976.....	271
6.8	Area Per PHC in Different States, 1976.....	273
6.9	Road Length Per 100 sq.km of Area in Different States, 1975-76.....	274
6.10	Proportion of PHCs Functioning With Two Doctors, 1976.....	277
6.11	Ranking of States according to Various Indicators of Operational Efficiency of PHCs, 1975-76.....	279
6.12	Classification of States according to the Level of Accessibility to a PHC and Level of Emphasis on the Provision of Health Services.	281
6.13	Classification of Respondents according to Level of Literacy and Utilization of Health Services in a Rural Area.....	283
6.14	Classification of Respondents according to the Availability of Health Services and Their Utilization in a Rural Area.....	283
6.15	Percentage of Births and Deaths Attended by Medical or Paramedical Professionals in Various States, 1964-65.....	288
6.16	Percentage of Births and Deaths with Medical Attention, 1975.....	289
6.17	Levels of Rural Literacy (Percentage of Literates to Total Population) in Various States, 1971.....	290
6.18	Classification of States according to Indices of (i) Accessibility, (ii) Emphasis on Provision of Health Services and (iii) Health-Consciousness Indicated by Level of Literacy.	292
7.1	Decline in Crude Death Rate during 1956-75 and 1966-75 for Different States of India....	315



## LIST OF GRAPHS

<u>Graph No.</u>		<u>Page</u>
5.1	Growth Rates of PEAS (---) and PEHM (—) during the Quinquennia 1959-60 to 1964-65, 1964-65 to 1969-70 and 1969-70 to 1974-75...	194
6.1	The Frequency of Annual Attendance of Out-patients for Different Health Facilities in Uganda, related to the Distance, They Live from the Source of Medical Care Compared with That for the Indian Dispensary.....	250
6.2	Average Size of a Village and PHV in Districts, 1971 : BIHAR.....	260
6.3	Average Size of a Village and PHV in Districts, 1971 : MAHARASHTRA.....	261
6.4	Average Size of a Village and PHV in Districts, 1971 : PUNJAB.....	262
6.5	Average Size of a Village and VHF in Districts, 1971 : RAJASTHAN.....	263
6.6	Average Size of a Village and PHV in Districts, 1971 : WEST BENGAL.....	264
7.1	Trend in Crude Death Rates, 1956-76; MYSORE, MAHARASHTRA, PUNJAB and KERALA.....	311
7.2	Trend in Crude Death Rates, 1956-76: ASSAM and GUJARAT.....	312
7.3	Trend in Crude Death Rates, 1956-76: ORISSA, ANDHRA PRADESH and TAMILNADU.....	313
7.4	Trend in Crude Death Rates, 1956-76: UTTAR PRADESH, MADHYA PRADESH and RAJASTHAN.....	314