

# RAILROAD SOCIAL INSURANCE

FAVORED TREATMENT  
*versus*  
UNIFORM SOCIAL INSURANCE

By  
RAINARD B. ROBBINS

*Price 50 cents*

AMERICAN ENTERPRISE ASSOCIATION  
*Incorporated*

4 East 41st Street  
New York 17, N. Y.

1409 I. Street, N.W.  
Washington 5, D.C.

**AMERICAN ENTERPRISE ASSOCIATION**  
*A non-profit organization devoted to the study  
of current economic problems.*

**THE ADVISORY BOARD**

<b>CHARLES C. ABBOTT</b> <i>Chairman</i>	Associate Professor of Business Economics, Harvard University Graduate School of Business Administration
<b>HENRY HAZLITT</b>	Editorial Staff <i>The New York Times</i>
<b>R. A. HOHAUS</b>	Associate Actuary Metropolitan Life Insurance Company
<b>JAMES E. McCARTHY</b>	Dean, School of Commerce Notre Dame University
<b>WILLIAM L. MYERS</b>	Dean, New York State College of Agriculture Cornell University
<b>ROSCOE POUND</b>	University Professor, Harvard University
<b>EDGAR W. SMITH</b>	General Motors Overseas Operations
<b>JOHN V. VAN SICKLE</b>	Professor of Economics Vanderbilt University
<b>LEO WOLMAN</b>	Professor of Economics Columbia University

# Railroad Social Insurance

Favored Treatment *versus* Uniform Social Insurance

By

RAINARD B. ROBBINS

*Vice-President, Teachers Insurance and Annuity Association*

AMERICAN ENTERPRISE ASSOCIATION  
*Incorporated*

4 East 41st Street  
New York 17, N. Y.

1409 L Street, N.W.  
Washington 5, D.C.

## AMERICAN ENTERPRISE ASSOCIATION

*A non-profit organization devoted to the study  
of current economic problems.*

### THE ADVISORY BOARD

CHARLES C. ABBOTT <i>Chairman</i>	Associate Professor of Business Economics, Harvard University Graduate School of Business Administration
HENRY HAZLITT	Editorial Staff <i>The New York Times</i>
R. A. HOHAUS	Associate Actuary Metropolitan Life Insurance Company
JAMES E. McCARTHY	Dean, School of Commerce Notre Dame University
WILLIAM I. MYERS	Dean, New York State College of Agriculture Cornell University
ROSCOE POUND	University Professor, Harvard University
EDGAR W. SMITH	General Motors Overseas Operations
JOHN V. VAN SICKLE	Professor of Economics Vanderbilt University
LEO WOLMAN	Professor of Economics Columbia University

# Railroad Social Insurance

Favored Treatment *versus* Uniform Social Insurance

By

RAINARD B. ROBBINS

*Vice-President, Teachers Insurance and Annuity Association*

AMERICAN ENTERPRISE ASSOCIATION

*Incorporated*

4 East 41st Street  
New York 17, N. Y.

1409 L Street, N.W.  
Washington 5, D.C.

## AMERICAN ENTERPRISE ASSOCIATION

*A non-profit organization devoted to the study  
of current economic problems.*

### THE ADVISORY BOARD

<b>CHARLES C. ABBOTT</b> <i>Chairman</i>	Associate Professor of Business Economics, Harvard University Graduate School of Business Administration
<b>HENRY HAZLITT</b>	Editorial Staff <i>The New York Times</i>
<b>R. A. HOHAUS</b>	Associate Actuary Metropolitan Life Insurance Company
<b>JAMES E. McCARTHY</b>	Dean, School of Commerce Notre Dame University
<b>WILLIAM I. MYERS</b>	Dean, New York State College of Agriculture Cornell University
<b>ROSCOE POUND</b>	University Professor, Harvard University
<b>EDGAR W. SMITH</b>	General Motors Overseas Operations
<b>JOHN V. VAN SICKLE</b>	Professor of Economics Vanderbilt University
<b>LEO WOLMAN</b>	Professor of Economics Columbia University

# Railroad Social Insurance

Favored Treatment *versus* Uniform Social Insurance

By

RAINARD B. ROBBINS

*Vice-President, Teachers Insurance and Annuity Association*

AMERICAN ENTERPRISE ASSOCIATION

*Incorporated*

4 East 41st Street  
New York 17, N. Y.

1409 L Street, N.W.  
Washington 5, D.C.

## PUBLICATION POLICY

### NATIONAL ECONOMIC PROBLEMS SERIES

*The purpose of the American Enterprise Association is to inquire into and appraise current economic and social questions as they bear on public policy, and to disseminate its findings, so as to further public understanding of such matters. As an educational and nonpartisan body, the Association endeavors to be completely impartial and objective in its work. The Association takes no stand either in favor of or against any proposed legislative measures.*

*This study is published in the Association's NATIONAL ECONOMIC PROBLEMS SERIES. Studies in this series are intended to place in perspective, and to analyze, matters of major importance that either are the subject of pending legislation or seem likely to become so in the near future. The Advisory Board selects the subjects of the publications in this series. In the study of the subjects selected, the Board seeks to utilize the services of the most competent available experts, without regard to the political or economic views held by them.*

*Many of the subjects in this series, by their nature, permit of different approaches and viewpoints. In particular instances and as warranted by circumstances, the Board contemplates giving expression to different views by publishing more than one study dealing with the same subject.*

*The Association and the Advisory Board assume no responsibility for opinions expressed in studies published in this series.*

Copyright 1945 by the American Enterprise Association, Inc.,  
4 East 41st Street, New York 17, N. Y. All rights reserved.  
Manufactured in the United States of America by  
The Academy Press, New York.



## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	PAGE
INTRODUCTION—by Leo Wolman .....	5
<b>RAILROAD SOCIAL INSURANCE: FAVORED TREATMENT <i>versus</i> UNIFORM SOCIAL INSURANCE</b> .....	<b>9</b>
Purpose .....	9
Present Railroad Retirement Plan .....	9
Benefit Provisions .....	10
<i>Annuities</i> .....	10
<i>Death Benefits</i> .....	14
<i>Pensions</i> .....	14
<i>Absence of Survivors' Benefits</i> .....	14
Sources of Revenue .....	15
Administration .....	15
Railroad Retirement Account .....	15
<b>PRESENT RAILROAD UNEMPLOYMENT INSURANCE PROGRAM</b> .....	<b>16</b>
<b>THE PROPOSED BILL FOR AMENDMENTS</b> .....	<b>17</b>
Benefit Provisions of H.R. 1362 .....	17
<i>Coverage</i> .....	17
<i>Annuities for Employees</i> .....	18
<i>Pensions</i> .....	20
<i>Survivors' Benefits</i> .....	20
<i>Examples</i> .....	21
<i>Benefits for Widows of Annuitants and Pensioners</i> .....	22
<i>Lump Sum Death Benefit</i> .....	22
<i>No Dependents' Benefits</i> .....	22
<i>Unemployment and Sickness Benefits</i> .....	22
Taxes .....	23
<b>COMMENTS AND COMPARISONS</b> .....	<b>24</b>
Effects of Earlier Ideas .....	24
Absence of Legislative Convictions .....	25
Survivors' Benefits Popular .....	25
Difficulties Met by Framers of the Legislation .....	28
<i>Interest in Eligibility</i> .....	29
<i>Importance of Pension Payments</i> .....	30
Combination of Social Security and Railroad Credits .....	31

	PAGE
<b>FINANCING THE BENEFITS OF THE PRESENT ACTS AND THE NEW BILL</b>	<b>36</b>
The Retirement Plan .....	36
<i>Change of Attitude Toward Reserves</i> .....	39
<i>Actuarial Report</i> .....	39
The Unemployment Compensation Plan .....	42
The New Bill .....	42
The Confused Financial Picture .....	43
<b>GENERAL DISCUSSION</b> .....	<b>45</b>
Administration .....	45
Why Social Benefits for a Particular Industry? .....	46
How the Railroad Retirement Plan Came About .....	46
Public Interest in Special Class Legislation .....	48
<i>Shifting Employment</i> .....	48
<i>Sources of Support</i> .....	49
Other Special Classes .....	51
No Conflict with Private Plans .....	53
Objectives of Public and Private Plans .....	55
National Favor for the Railroad Industry .....	55
<b>SOCIAL SECURITY COVERAGE FOR ALL</b> .....	<b>57</b>
An Accepted Objective .....	57
Insurance Nature of Survivors' Annuities .....	60
Magnitude of Shifting Employment .....	64
Why Vary Benefits with Occupation? .....	67
Why Substantial Omissions? .....	69
A Fresh Approach .....	70
<b>SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS</b> .....	<b>73</b>
How Far Should We Go? .....	79
Changes We Should Make .....	81
Conclusions in Brief .....	82