DYARCHY IN PRACTICE
DYARCHY IN PRACTICE

BY

A. APPADORAI, M.A., PH.D.
LOYOLA COLLEGE, MADRAS
MEMBER, INSTITUTE OF PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION

WITH A FOREWORD BY

PROF. A. B. KEITH, D.C.L., D.LITT., F.B.A.

LONGMANS, GREEN AND CO., LTD.
39, PATERNOSTER ROW, LONDON, E. C. 4
MADRAS, BOMBAY, CALCUTTA
NEW YORK AND TORONTO
1937
First Published 1937

All rights reserved

PRINTED IN INDIA AT C. S. PRESS, MADRAS.
TO THE MEMORY OF
M. A. CANDETH
FOREWORD

Only the progress of events under the new constitution of the provinces of India will enable the making of a just estimate of the value to India of the system of dyarchy. Those of us who criticised the scheme as suggested by Mr. Montagu and Lord Chelmsford, on the score that its safeguards must prevent the effective evolution of ministerial responsibility even within the sphere assigned to ministers, are probably inclined to hold that events have justified our doubts. But it is essential to remember that the idea of relaxing control of Indian affairs was strange to the House of Commons in 1919, and it may well be that nothing more revolutionary than the Act of 1919 could have received acceptance. Certainly in England at that time the prevailing feeling in political circles was not that too little was being conceded, but that grave risks were involved in the extent of the grant.

In any case the history of dyarchy presents the highest interest for all students of politics and history. The materials are abundant and indeed almost embarrassing in their copiousness. To master the evidence and to make effective use of it is a task demanding not merely great industry, but soundness of judgment and the power to discriminate between essentials and minor details. Dr. Appadorai in this study shows these qualities in a marked degree. He has included all that is necessary for a full understanding of the genesis of the system and of its operation. His judgments are sober and well balanced, and it is improbable that anything
can be adduced seriously to affect his summing up of the merits and demerits of the system. The University of Madras deserves warm congratulations on so successful a study in the difficult field of contemporary history by a former Research Fellow in its Department of Indian History.

UNIVERSITY OF EDINBURGH, 14-11-36. A. BERRIEDALE KEITH
PREFACE

Every new scheme of government is a valuable addition to the political experience of mankind. Dyarchy is a novel experiment in government on a large scale. It was introduced in the Indian provinces in 1921. The system has been at work for well-nigh sixteen years, and is now passing into history. This Essay is an attempt to study the working of dyarchy and estimate its value as a political system. The writer hopes that it may be of some use to students of government and in particular of Indian constitutional history.

The material on which the study is based falls into two well-defined classes. We have, first, the theoretical discussions beginning with 'The Duke Memorandum' which led up to the Government of India Act, 1919. These discussions enable the student to trace the genesis of the system and explain its theoretical foundations. Secondly, there are the records of the practical working of dyarchy in the several provinces—the memoranda of provincial governments, the proceedings of legislative councils and the evidence given by ministers and Executive Councillors before the Reforms Enquiry Committee (1924) and the Indian Statutory Commission (1927). These documents give us some insight into the many complex problems which arose in the working of dyarchy—the relations between the Reserved Half and the Transferred Half of government, the place of joint deliberation and a joint purse, the attitude of the legislature to the two sides of government and the position of the Governor in the constitution.
A list of the relevant documents is given in the appendix.

The writer desires to express his gratitude to Prof. K. A. Nilakanta Sastri, M.A., and Dr. P. S. Lokanathan, M.A., D.Sc., (London), of the University of Madras for willing help rendered in the preparation and publication of the thesis. Prof. Sastri not only suggested the subject of the thesis, but helped in the elucidation of various points that arose in the course of the work and helped in arranging for its publication. Dr. Lokanathan likewise was always ready to discuss the points referred to him; he also kindly read the proofs and offered valuable suggestions.

The writer is deeply grateful to Prof. Arthur Berriedale Keith, D.C.L., D.Litt., F.B.A., who so kindly read the manuscript and wrote the Foreword.

MADRAS, 31-3-1937. A A.
# CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Foreword</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Preface</td>
<td>ix</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## PART I

## THE INTRODUCTION OF DYARCHY

### CHAPTER I.

**The Background**

1. The Term 'Dyarchy'  
2. Origin and Development of The Idea  
3. Alternative Schemes  
4. Hopes and Fears  
5. Final Adoption

### CHAPTER II.

**The Essentials of Dyarchy**

1. The Basic Principle  
2. The Transfer of Subjects  
3. Dualism in the Executive  
4. Mutual Co-operation  
5. Progress by Stages  
6. Checks and Balances

### CHAPTER III.

**Some Considerations**

1. Social Foundations  
2. Communalism  
3. Financial Stringency
(4) The Political Factor ........................................ 65
(5) A Bird's-eye View ........................................ 69

PART II

THE WORKING OF DYARCHY

CHAPTER IV.

THE RESERVED HALF ........................................ 77
(1) The Governor ........................................ 77
(2) The Reserved Side of Government .................. 78
(3) Attitude of the Legislature ......................... 80
(4) How the Executive Reacts ............................ 95
(5) Some Conclusions ..................................... 112

CHAPTER V.

THE RESERVED HALF VIS-A-VIS THE TRANSFERRED

HALF ..................................................... 117
(1) Points of Contact .................................... 117
(2) Joint Deliberation .................................. 127
(3) In The Legislature ................................... 151

CHAPTER VI.

FINANCE UNDER DYARCHY ................................ 161
(1) Joint Purse vs. Separate Purse .................... 161
(2) Financial Arrangements ............................. 173
(3) The Practice .......................................... 183

CHAPTER VII.

THE TRANSFERRED SIDE OF GOVERNMENT ............ 204
(1) Appointment of Ministers ......................... 204
(2) Joint Responsibility ................................ 208
CONTENTS

(3) Governor vis-a-vis Ministers ........................................ 223
(4) The Services ................................................................ 240

CHAPTER VIII.

ATTITUDE OF THE LEGISLATURE TOWARDS THE TRANSFERRED HALF ........................................ 253
(1) Two Factors .................................................................. 258
(2) Parties ......................................................................... 266
(3) General Attitude ........................................................ 283
(4) Enforcing Responsibility ............................................ 294
(5) Wrecking the Constitution .......................................... 305
(6) Temporary Administration .......................................... 315
(7) The Council and the Governor .................................... 318

CHAPTER IX.

CONTROL FROM ABOVE ......................................................... 320
(1) The General Principle ................................................ 320
(2) Reserved Subjects ...................................................... 321
(3) Transferred Subjects .................................................. 334

PART III

SOME CONCLUSIONS

CHAPTER X

AN ESTIMATE ................................................................. 347
(1) Introductory ............................................................... 347
(2) Defects ....................................................................... 349
(3) Training in Responsibility ....................................... 365
(4) Achievements ............................................................ 375
## APPENDICES

**A. Statutory Provisions Relating to Dyarchy in the Government of India Act, 1919** .. 385

**B. List of Transferred Subjects** .. 391

## NOTES AND REFERENCES

.. 399

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

.. 419

## INDEX

.. 427
INDEX

Abdur Rahim, Sir, 214  
Adjournment motions, 82  
Aristotle, 229  
Asquith, 273  
Assam, joint deliberation in, 133-4  

Balfour, Lord, 56  
Basu, the Hon. Babu Bhupendranath, 3, 15  
Bengal—  
deadlocks in, 67  
Diwani in, 4-5  
joint deliberation in, 135-42  
joint responsibility in, 214-5  
reduction of grants in, 83-6  
standing committees in, 97  
working of the Constitution in, 310-8  

Bihar—  
joint deliberation in, 135-42  
the Reserved Half and the legislature in, 81  

Bombay—  
attitude of the legislature to the Reserved Half in, 88-90  
parties in, 267  
standing committees in, 97  

Burma—  
attitude of the legislature to the Reserved Half in, 88-90  
joint deliberation in, 133-4  
parties in, 267  

Butler, Sir Harcourt, 101  

Carmichael, Lord, 103-4, 248  
Central Provinces, the—  
deadlocks in, 67  
joint deliberation in, 133-4  
joint responsibility in, 215  
reduction of grants in, 83-6  
standing committees in, 97  
the legislature and ministers in, 286  
working of the Constitution in, 310-8  

Certification, 44, 107, 109  
Chakravarti, Mr., 214, 222  
Checks and balances, see dyarchy  
Chelmsford, Lord, 11, 15  
Chintamani, Mr., 214, 232  
Civil disobedience, 67-8  
Committee on Division of Functions, the, 39, 41, 329  
Communalism, 57-60  

Congress—League scheme, the 25  

Council Secretaries, 293-4  
Cromer, the Earl of, 7, 113  
Curtis, Mr. Lionel, 3, 6, 9, 13, 15, 17, 166, 209, 379  
Curzon, Lord, 349  

Das, Mr. C. R., 66, 269, 307  
Democracy, 229  
Devolution rules, 130-1, 177, 211, 237  
Division of subjects, 38-42, 126-7  
Duke Memorandum, the, 14-5  
Duke, Sir William, 13, 14  

Dyarchy—  
a bird's-eye view of, 69, 73  
achievements of, 375-6  
adoption of, 35-6  
basic principle, 37-8  
checks and balances, 54-5  
communalism and, 57-60  
control from above, 320-44  
defects of, 349-75  
difficult to work, 364-5  
dualism in the Executive, 42-9
essentials of, 37-5
forms of, 20-9
friction under, 363-4
hopes and fears, 30-5
introduction of, 1-73
lesson of experience, the,
meaning of the term, 2-8
mutual co-operation, 50-2
origin and development of the idea, 9-20
progress by stages, 52-4
responsibility under, 265-75
suspension and revocation of transfer, 317-8
transfer of subjects, 38-42
working of, the, 75-344
wrecking the constitution, 305-15

see also finance
parties
Electorate, 276-9, 373-5
Executive Council, the—
appointment of, 78
meetings of, 45-6, 78-9
ministers and, 152-60
tenure of office of, 78

see also Reserved Half

Finance department, the—
a reserved one, 198-9
a spending department, 199-200
constitutional position of, 175-81
examination of schemes of expenditure, 190-5
functions of, 176-81
ministers' relations with, 188-201
part of the Reserved Half, 181-3

Gandhi, Mahatma, 66, 67, 68, 307
Ghuznavi, Mr. A. K., 214
Goschen, Lord, 365
Governor, the—
attitude to joint responsibility, 215-21
a unifying agency, 50-1, 123-5
powers in respect of reserved subjects, 43-4
powers in respect of transferred subjects, 44-6
sources of his strength, 235-40
special powers of, 107-12
the legislature and, 43-5, 318-9
vis-a-vis ministers, 223-40

see also legislature
Reserved Half
Services
Governor-General, 324, 329-32
Governor-General in Council
see reserved subjects
transferred subjects
Government of India Act of 1919, clauses relating to dyarchy, 385-90
Governor in Council, see Reserved Half

Hardinge, Lord, 11
Indian Civil Service, the, 241, 247, 253
Indian Statutory Commission, the, 63, 67, 71, 334
Innes, Sir C., 249
Instrument of Instructions to the Governor, the, 45, 46, 50, 130, 156, 227, 229-30, 232, 236, 245, 299-300.
Instrument of Instructions to the Governor-General, the, 327
Irwin, Lord, 360
Islington, Lord, 29, 128
Jagat Narain, Pandit, 214
Jallianwala Bagh, the, 65
Joint Address, the, 16-7
Joint deliberation—merits of, 149-51
pitfalls, 142-8
scope of, 130-2
texts bearing on, 127-9
theory of, 51-2
the practice of local Governments, 132-42
Joint responsibility, see ministers
Joint Select Committee of 1919, the, 49, 54, 85, 99, 108, 129, 151, 158, 172, 205, 207-8, 210, 225-7, 232, 261, 300, 312, 323
Jones Law, the, 8
Justice party, the, 272
Keith, Prof., 304
Kelkar, Mr., 220
Kerr, Sir John, 234
Khilafat movement, the, 66, 307
Layton, 184
Lee Commission, see Services
Legislature, the—
and the Governor, 318-9
attitude of, to ministers, 155-60, 283-303
attitude to taxation, 237-8
attitude to the Reserved Half, 80-95
criticism by, 288-9
enforces responsibility, 294-303
no-confidence motions in, 295-6, 297-303
provision of funds for reserved subjects, 83-8
reduction of grants, 83-8
sense of responsibility of, 370-3
standing committees of, 96-8
the Services and, 255
see also nominated members
Lytton, Lord, 137, 350
Madras—
council secretaries in, 293-4
joint deliberation in, 135-42
joint responsibility in, 214
the legislature and ministers in, 286
Marr, Mr., 192
Marris, Sir William, 138, 147
Maynard, Sir John, 143
Meston settlement see finance
Meyer, Sir William, 3, 209, 248
Ministers—
appointed as Executive Councillors, 240
appointment of, 43
attitude to reserved subjects, 151-60
joint responsibility of, 208-22
legal responsibility of, 303-5
no-confidence motions against, 297-303
number of, the, 206
refusal of salary of, 312-5
responsibility of, 294-305
salary of, 206-8
status of, 206-8
tenure of office, 43
the Reserved Half and, 97-8, 117-60
DYARCHY IN PRACTICE

the Services and, 249-55
see also Executive Council
Governor
Transferred Half
Minto-Morley reforms, the, 10
Misra, Mr., 215
Mommsen, 3
Montagu-Chelmsford Report,
the, 17-20, 99, 161, 204,
209, 225-7, 260, 337, 338,
Montagu, Mr., 16, 17, 52, 88,
128, 132, 338
Morley, Lord, 249
Motilal Nehru, Pandit, 307
Nationalist Unionist party, the,
273
Nation-building departments,
95, 291
No-confidence motions, see
legislature
Nominated members—
importance of, the, 258-60
non-official, 98, 99-100, 103-5,
263-4
number of, 98
official, 98-103, 260-3
position in regard to trans­
ferred subjects, 259-65
Non-co-operation, 66, 307-8
Panagal, the Raja of, 140
Parties—
absence of organized parties,
281-3
communal, 272-3
dyarchy and, 273-30
importance of, 266
in Bombay, 267
in Burma, 267
in the Punjab, 267
organization of, 267-9, 272-80
party loyalty, 274-5
political, 272-3
Swarajya party, the, 66-7,
69-70, 240, 269, 269-71,
305-15
Philippines, the, 7-8
Pitt’s India Act, 5
Plural control, 126
Provincial Audit Resolution,
323
Provincial States, the plan of,
22-5
Punjab—
attitude of legislature to the
Reserved Half in, 88-90
joint deliberation in, 133-4
joint responsibility in, 214
parties in, 267
Questions, 82-3
Rahimtoola, Sir Ibrahim, 25
Reappropriation, 178, 197-8, 199
Reddy, Mr. C. R., 411
Reduction of salary, 295-6
Rees, Sir John, 351
Reforms Enquiry Committee,
the, 71, 138, 184, 200, 202;
218, 221, 228, 232, 295,
313
Reserved Half, the—
appointment of, 43
control by the Government
of India over, 320-34
control by the Secretary of
State over, 320-34
Governor, the, 77-9
meets the opposition of the
legislature, 95-112
tenure of office, 43
the legislature and, 43-4
vis-à-vis the Transferred
Half, 117-60
see also joint deliberation
legislature
Reserved subjects
allocation of funds for, 188
control by the Governor-
General in Council, 46-8,
320-34
control by the Secretary of
State, 46-8, 320-34
Resolutions, 82
INDEX

Responsible government, 59, 366
Restoration of grants, 44-5, 107-8, 109-11
Rieu, Sir Louis, 93
Ronaldshay, the Earl of, 84, 137
Rosebery, 273-4
Round Table Conference, the first, 61
Rowlatt Act, the, 307
Rules of executive business, 121-5, 217-9, 246
Secretary of State, the—
see reserved subjects
transferred subjects
Secretary of State in Council, the right of appeal of the Services to, 245
Selborne, the Earl of, 38
Services, the—
All-India, 241
Governor and, 236, 245-6
Lee Commission’s recommendations, 241-3
overlapping of, 255-7
problems of, under dyarchy, 240-1
protection of the rights of, 339, 341-2
rights of, the, 241-7
see also legislature ministers
Sinha, Sir Satyendra (later Lord), 11, 22, 304
Sly, Sir Frank, 167
Standing Committees, see legislature
Supplementary questions, 83
Surendranath Banerjea, 221
Swarajya party, see parties

Thirlwall, 3
Times, the, 304
Transferred Half—
appointment of ministers, 204-6
control by the Government of India, 334-44
control by the Secretary of State, 334-55
the legislature and, 44-5, 258-319
see also joint deliberation ministers
Reserved Half
transferred subjects
Transferred subjects—
allocation of funds for, 188
control by the Governor-General in Council, 46-8, 334-44
control by the Secretary of State, 46-8, 334-44
list of, 39-40, 391-7
temporary administration of, 315-7
Triarchy, 29

United Bihar party, the, 273
United Provinces, the—
attitude of legislature to the
Reserved Half, 88-90
joint deliberation in, 135-40
joint responsibility in, 214
parties in, 266-7

Veto, 107, 318-9

Wheeler, Sir Henry, 298
Wrecking the constitution, 305-15

Yate, Colonel, 3, 9