

Report of the
Reforms Enquiry Committee

1924

Government of India Publications are obtainable from the Government of India Central Publication Branch, 8, Hastings Street, Calcutta, and from the following Agents:-

EUROPE.

OFFICE OF THE HIGH COMMISSIONER FOR INDIA,
42, GROSVENOR GARDENS, LONDON, S.W. 1.

Constable & Co., 10, Orange Street, Leicester Square, London, W.C.
Kegan Paul, Trench, Trübner & Co., 68-74, Carter Lane, E.C., and 39, New Oxford Street, London, W.C.
Bernard Quaritch, 11, Grafton Street, New Bond Street, London, W.
P. S. King & Sons, 2 & 4, Great Smith Street, Westminster, London, S.W.
Grindlay & Co., 54, Parliament Street, London, S.W.
Luzac & Co., 46, Great Russell Street, London, W.C.
W. Thacker & Co., 2, Creed Lane, London, E.C.
T. Fisher Unwin, Ltd., 1, Adelphi Terrace, London, W.C.

Wheldon and Wesley, Ltd., 2, 3 & 4, Arthur Street, New Oxford Street, London, W.C. 2.
East and West Ltd., 3, Victoria Street, London, S.W.1.
B. H. Blackwell, 50 & 51, Broad Street, Oxford.
Deighton Bell & Co., Ltd., Cambridge.
Oliver and Boyd, Tweeddale Court, Edinburgh.
Ernest Leroux, 28, Rue Bonaparte, Paris.
Martinus Nijhoff, The Hague, Holland.
Otto Harrassowitz, Leipzig.
Friedländer und Sohn, Berlin.

INDIA AND CEYLON.

Provincial Book Depôts:

MADRAS:—Office of the Superintendent, Government Press, Mount Road, Madras.
BOMBAY:—Office of the Manager, Government Central Press, Bombay.
SIND:—Library attached to the Office of the Commissioner in Sind, Karachi.
BENGAL:—Office of the Bengal Secretariat Book Depôt, Writers' Buildings, Room No. 1, Ground Floor, Calcutta.
UNITED PROVINCES OF AGRA AND OUDH:—Office of the Superintendent of Government Press, United Provinces of Agra and Oudh, Allahabad.
PUNJAB:—Office of the Government of Punjab, Lahore.
BURMA:—Office of the Superintendent, Government Printing, Burma, Rangoon.
CENTRAL PROVINCES AND BERAR:—Office of the Central Provinces Secretariat, Nagpur.
ASSAM:—Office of the Superintendent, Assam Secretariat Press.
BIHAR AND ORISSA:—Office of the Superintendent, Government Printing, Bihar and Orissa, P. O. Gulzarbagh, Patna.
COORG:—Office of the Chief Commissioner of Coorg, Bangalore.
NORTH-WEST FRONTIER PROVINCE:—Government Press, Peshawar.

Thacker, Spink & Co., Calcutta and Simla.
W. Newman & Co., Ltd., Calcutta.
R. Cambray & Co., Calcutta.
S. K. Lahiri & Co., Calcutta.
The Indian School Supply Depôt, 309, Bow Bazar Street, Calcutta, and 226, Nawabpur, Dacca.
Butterworth & Co. (India), Ltd., Calcutta.
Rai M. C. Sarcar Bahadur & Sons, 90-2A, Harrison Road, Calcutta.
The Weidon Library, 17, Park Street, Calcutta.
Standard Literature Company, Limited, Calcutta.
Association Press, Calcutta.
Chukerverty, Chatterjee & Co., Ltd., 13, College Square, Calcutta.
Higginbotham & Co., Madras.
V. Kalyanarama Iyer & Co., Madras.
P. R. Rama Iyer & Co., Madras.
Rochouse and Sons, Madras.
Bright & Co., Trivandrum.
V. S. Swaminathan, Bookseller, West Tower Street, Madras.
Thacker & Co., Ltd., Bombay.
D. B. Taraporevala, Sons & Co., Bombay.
Sunder Pandurang, Bombay.
Ram Chandra Govind & Sons, Kalbadevi Bombay.
N. M. Tripathi & Co., Booksellers, Princess Street, Kalbadevi Road, Bombay.
Proprietor, New Kitabkhana, Poona.
The Manager, Oriental Book Supplying Agency, 15, Shukrawar, Poona City.
R. S. Gondhalekar's Book Depôt, Publisher and Bookseller, Budhwar Chawk, Poona City.
Managing Director, Co-operative Bookstall, Booksellers and Publishers, Poona City.
The Standard Bookstall, Karachi, Rawalpindi, Murree, Lahore, Peshawar and Quetta.

Karsandas Narandas & Sons, Surat.
A. H. Wheeler & Co., Allahabad, Calcutta and Bombay.
N. B. Mathur, Supdt., Nazir Kanun Hind Press, Allahabad.
The North India Christian Tract and Book Society, 18, Clive Road, Allahabad.
Ram Dayal Agarwala, 184, Katra, Allahabad.
Manager, Newal Kishore Press, Lucknow.
The Upper India Publishing House, Ltd., 41, Aminahad Park, Lucknow.
Munshi Seeta Ram, Managing Proprietor, Indian Army Book Depôt, Juhl, Cawnpore.
Rai Sahib M. Gulab Singh & Sons, Mufid-i-Am Press, Lahore and Allahabad.
Rama Krishna & Sons, Booksellers, Anarkali, Lahore.
Puri Brothers, Booksellers and Publishers, Katcheri Road, Lahore.
Manager of the Imperial Book Depôt, 63, Chandney Chawk Street, Delhi.
Oxford Book and Stationery Company, Delhi, Supdt., American Baptist Mission Press, Rangoon.
Proprietor, Rangoon Times Press, Rangoon.
The Modern Publishing House, Ltd., 30, Phayre Street, Rangoon.
The International Buddhist Book Depôt, Post Box No. 971, Rangoon.
Manager, the "Hitavada," Nagpur.
S. C. Talukdar, Proprietor, Students & Co., Cooch Behar.
Times of Ceylon Co., Ltd.
The Manager, Ceylon Observer, Colombo.
The Manager, The Indian Book Shop, Benares City.
B. C. Basak, Esq., Proprietor, Albert Library, Dacca.

TABLE OF CONTENTS.

	PAGE
List of Members	v
Introduction	1
PART I.—EVIDENCE.	
Atmosphere	2—3
Views of the Madras Government	3—4
Views of the Bombay Government	4—5
Views of the Bengal Government	5—6
Views of the United Provinces Government	6—8
Views of the Punjab Government	8—11
Views of the Burma Government	11—12
Views of the Bihar and Orissa Government	12—13
Views of the Central Provinces Government	13—14
Views of the Assam Government	14—15
Views of dissenting Members of Executive Council and Ministers	15—22
Witnesses before the Committee	22—26
Impinging of the administration of reserved upon the administration of transferred subjects and <i>vice versa</i>	26—27
Failure of permanent officials to co-operate with Ministers	27—31
Control over Ministers by the Governor	31—33
Control over Ministers by the Government of India and the Secretary of State	33—34
Evidence to the effect that dyarchy has failed	34—36
Conclusions in regard to evidence as to the working of dyarchy	37
Other evidence	37—40
The permanent services	40—42
PART II.	
Provincial Autonomy	43—45
PART III.—DIFFICULTIES ARISING FROM THE WORKING OF THE CONSTITUTION.	
Finance	46—48
Electorate	49
Responsible government flourishes in small homogeneous communities	49—51
Communal differences	51—52
Difficulty arising from elected majorities in the Indian Legislature and in the provincial legislative councils	52
PART IV.—RECOMMENDATIONS.	
<i>A.—The Electorate.</i>	
Franchise	53—54
Representation of the depressed classes and of factory labour	54—56
Rural franchise in the Punjab	56
Women's franchise	56—57
Eligibility of women to be members of the legislature	57—58

B.—The Provincial Legislative Councils.

Constitution of the provincial councils	58—60
Communal representation	60—61
Plural constituencies	61
Qualifications for being a candidate for election	61—62
Disqualification from being a candidate for election	62—63
Appointment of nominated members	63—64
The official bloc,	64
Miscellaneous suggestions regarding elections, election offences, and the like	64—66
The President	66—67
Questions	67
Resolutions	68
Other motions	68—69
Formal motions	69
Previous sanction to provincial legislation	69—71
Reservation of provincial legislation	71—72
Miscellaneous suggestions regarding legislation	73
Powers of appropriation	73—74
Life of the Councils	74
Powers, privileges and immunities	75—77

C.—Division of Functions.

Detailed recommendations for the transfer of subjects	77—80
Subjects which are subject to legislation by the Indian legislature	80
Central subjects	80

D.—Provincial Executive Governments.

Working of Dyarchy	80—82
Joint responsibility of Ministers	82—83
Choice of Ministers	83
Salary of Ministers	83—84
Control of the Governor	84—85
Rules of Executive Business	85—86
Temporary administration of transferred subjects in an emergency	86—87
Control over the services	87—88
Council Secretaries	88—89

E.—Finances of the provincial governments.

The Finance Department	89—91
The Finance Member	91—92
Joint <i>versus</i> Separate Purse	92—93
Joint Financial Secretary	93—94
Reappropriation	94—95
Borrowing powers	95
Separation of provincial balances and of accounts from audit	96

F.—*The Central Government.*

European commercial representation in the Legislative Assembly ...	97
Certification of legislation	97—98
Social Legislation	98—100
Powers of Legislative Assembly in regard to appropriation of supplies	100—101

G.—*The Secretary of State in Council.*

Control of the Secretary of State in Council over transferred subjects	101
Control of the Secretary of State in Council over Central and Provincial reserved subjects	102

PART V.

Conclusion	103
Note by the Maharajadhiraja Sir Bijay Chand Mahtab, Bahadur, of Burdwan	104—105
Summary of Recommendations	106—114

APPENDICES.

No. 1.—List of Public Bodies and Individuals who have submitted written evidence to the Committee	115—129
No. 2.—Memorandum on the Legal and Constitutional possibilities of advance within the Government of India Act	121—128
No. 3.—Statement of particulars regarding the number of electors at the date of the General Election, 1923	129
No. 4.—Statement showing the monthly balances of the several Provincial Governments for the year 1922-23	130

MINORITY REPORT.

CHAPTER I.

Preliminary	131—132
--------------------	---------

CHAPTER II.—HISTORY OF THE DEMAND FOR FURTHER ADVANCE.

Government of India's attitude in 1921	133—134
Lord Peel's Despatch	134
Further Reforms under the constitution	134
Genesis of the present enquiry	134—135

CHAPTER III.—LEADING FEATURES OF THE ACT.

Elected and nominated members	136
The Governor General in Council	136—137
Powers of the legislatures	137—138
Central control	138
Dyarchy an indispensable feature	138

CHAPTER IV.—CONSTITUTIONAL RELATIONS OF GOVERNORS, MINISTERS AND EXECUTIVE COUNCILLORS.

Constitution of Local Governments	139
The Governor's position	139—140
Ministers	140
The Governor and his Ministers	140
Joint Select Committee's view	140—141

	PAGE.
CHAPTER V.—WORK OF THE LEGISLATURES.	
Finance and taxation	142—145
Law and Order	145—146
The Depressed Classes	147—150
The Development of Parties	150—151
The atmosphere	151—152
CHAPTER VI.—DEFECTS OF DYARCHY.	
The impinging of administration of reserved upon transferred subjects and <i>vice versa</i>	153—154
Joint responsibility	154—157
Joint deliberation	157—159
Conclusions	159—160
The Public Services	160—165
The Finance Department	165—166
Finance Member	166—168
Separate Purse	168
CHAPTER VII.—PROVINCIAL AUTONOMY AND CENTRAL GOVERNMENT.	
Financial autonomy	169
Legislative autonomy	169—170
Residuary power	170—171
Constitution of the Central Government	171—173
CHAPTER VIII.—CONDITIONS OF POLITICAL ADVANCE.	
Electorates and the Public	174—176
Communal Tension and Tendencies	176—179
Representation of Depressed and Working classes	180
Size and heterogeneity of the provinces	180
Internal Security and Self-Defence	180—181
CHAPTER IX.	
Possibility of advance by rules	182—184
CHAPTER X.—TRANSFER OF MORE SUBJECTS AND AMENDMENT OF THE ACT AND RULES.	
Transfer of more subjects	185—187
Amendment of the Act and the Rules	187—193
Social legislation	193
CHAPTER XI.—VIEWS OF INDIAN MEMBERS OF PROVINCIAL GOVERNMENTS REGARDING FURTHER ADVANCE.	
Madras	194
Bombay	195
United Provinces	195—196
Bihar and Orissa	196—197
Central Provinces	197
Bengal	197—198
Punjab	198
Assam	198—200
Burma	200
CHAPTER XII.	
Conclusions	201—203

REFORMS ENQUIRY COMMITTEE.

List of Members.

Chairman:

The Hon'ble Sir ALEXANDER MUDDIMAN, Kt., C.S.I., C.I.E.

Members:

The Hon'ble Dr. Mian Sir MUHAMMAD SHAFI, K.C.S.I.,
C.I.E.

Maharajadhiraja Sir BIJAY CHAND MAHTAB, Bahadur,
G.C.I.E., K.C.S.I., I.O.M., of Burdwan.

Dr. Sir TEJ BAHADUR SAPRU, K.C.S.I.

The Hon'ble Sir ARTHUR FROOM, Kt.

Sir SIVASWAMI IYER, K.C.S.I., C.I.E., M.L.A.

Sir HENRY MONCRIEFF SMITH, Kt., C.I.E., M.L.A.

Mr. M. A. JINNAH, Barrister-at-Law, M.L.A.

Dr. R. P. PARANJPYE.

Mr. H. TONKINSON, C.I.E., M.L.A. (*Secretary*).

Note.—The total expenditure incurred by the Committee, including expenditure on printing, will be about Rs. 46,000.