

APPENDIX TO THE REPORT
 OF
 THE COMMISSIONERS.

VOLUME XVIII.

MINUTES OF EVIDENCE
 RELATING TO THE
 BENGAL PILOT SERVICE

Taken at Calcutta,

WITH
 APPENDICES.

CONTENTS.

	PAGE
LIST OF WITNESSES EXAMINED BEFORE THE ROYAL COMMISSION - - - - -	138
MINUTES OF EVIDENCE - - - - -	139
APPENDICES - - - - -	154
INDEX - - - - -	160

List of Witnesses examined before the Royal Commission.

AT CALCUTTA, WEDNESDAY, 21st JANUARY 1914.

	PAGE
Commander G. N. FORTEATH, R.I.M., Acting Port Officer of Calcutta - - - - -	139
Messrs. C. G. BUDGE and G. F. THORPE, Branch Pilots, Bengal Pilot Service - - - - -	141
C. J. KERR, Esq., Representative of the Port Commissioners, Calcutta - - - - -	150

MINUTES OF EVIDENCE

TAKEN BEFORE THE

ROYAL COMMISSION

ON THE

PUBLIC SERVICES IN INDIA

RELATING TO THE

BENGAL PILOT SERVICE.

At Calcutta, Wednesday, 21st January 1914.

PRESENT:

THE RIGHT HON. THE LORD ISLINGTON, G.C.M.G., D.S.O. (*Chairman*).

SIR VALENTINE CHIROL.

WALTER CULLEY MADGE, Esq., C.I.E.

And the following Assistant Commissioner:—

FRANK GEORGE SLY, Esq., C.S.I.

HERBERT ALBERT LAURENS FISHER, Esq.

J. H. LINDQUIST, Esq., Branch Pilot.

R. R. SCOTT, Esq. (*Joint Secretary*).

Commander G. N. FORTEATH, R.I.M., Acting Port Officer of Calcutta.

Written Statement relating to the Bengal Pilot Service.

79,744. (i) **Method of Recruitment**—The present system of recruitment is not very satisfactory from my point of view, or, I gather, from that of the Bengal Pilot Service. The officers are appointed to the service after having just completed a four years' apprenticeship, and are required to put in what is practically equivalent to another five years before attaining the position of mate pilot. The consequence is they get stale and lose interest, also on entrance they are already young men, and are not very amenable to the influence of the pilots who in their turn take no interest in them. They are at once too old for the above reason and too young to appreciate the necessity of working and passing their examinations as soon as their time is in. Two officers have lately been failed finally and had to leave the service after five years' training. It is, however, difficult to improve matters. There are only two alternatives—(1) That suggested by the pilots themselves, *i.e.*, a reversion to the old system of bringing cadets out direct from the training ships. I do not approve of this under present conditions. In the days of the brigs it was an excellent school for young officers, and, if it still existed, I would strongly recommend the reversion, but now the station is served by steamers. The Commander's time is fully occupied in serving vessels, and the Chief Officer is too often a junior himself and incapable of properly instructing the youngsters. Again, from my experience of the laxity of discipline exhibited on these vessels, I cannot recommend the reversion suggested. On the other hand, I would go further in the other direction, and suggest the appointment of officers up to 25 years of age who are fully qualified master mariners; a probation from two to two and half years would be sufficient for such men, who would enter with a purpose and complete their probationary service as soon as possible and would then commence as mate pilots and work up. Should any change be made, the details of pay and officering the vessels, &c., could be

entered into, but the Commander must always be a senior pilot and should get an average of the earnings of his grade for the year of his tenure.

79,745. (ii) **Systems of Training and Probation**.—Officers should be appointed as at present by Secretary of State through the training vessels. The leadsman grade would be abolished, and probationary pilots would accompany qualified pilots, as is done in other places, and in due course qualify. The watches should be kept by pilots and probationers themselves on turn.

79,746. (iii) **Conditions of Service**.—No change, except perhaps compulsory retirement at 55. I see no objection to a pilot being in office on similar conditions to the Senior Harbour Master with the Commissioners, but such an appointment should, if approved, be additional. The nature of the Deputy Port Officer's duties makes the appointment of a pilot for those duties out of the question, as pilots are not qualified.

79,747. (iv) **Conditions of Salary**.—No change, except perhaps in the case of the Commanders of the steam pilot vessels.

79,748. (v) **Conditions of Leave**.—The leave rules are not sufficiently elastic; ten years for first leave is too long, also the eight years to next leave.

79,749. (vi) **Conditions of Pension**.—I consider this requires alteration, that men after long service may have a competency to look forward to. No pilot (if married) can really begin to save until he has about 20 years' service.

79,750. (vii) **Employment of Non-Europeans**.—All members of the Service, however recruited, should have equal training and under similar conditions. I see no reason why Anglo-Indians or others should not enter the service, but they should have the same training as covenanted officers.

79,751. (ix) **Any other points**.—In short, I am very much in favour of the Pension and Leave Rules being made more favourable, but have no suggestion to offer as to the method.

21 January 1914.]

Commander G. N. FORTEATH.

[Continued.]

Commander G. N. FORTEATH called and examined.

79,752. (*Chairman.*) In his capacity of Acting Port Officer he was in control of the Pilot Service in Calcutta. He had occupied his present position for two years.

79,753. The Pilot Service as now constituted consisted of 18 branch pilots, 30 master pilots, 10 mate pilots, and 16 apprentices. The branch pilot took charge of the biggest ships; the senior master pilot took charge of the next biggest; and so on. If it happened that there was no branch pilot on the station, a senior master pilot would take charge. It required a great deal more skill to pilot a deep ship than to pilot a shallow draught ship. A big ship in the Hughli needed a man with great experience to bring her up, but all of the senior master pilots were capable of taking charge of the largest vessels.

79,754. Prior to 1894 pilots were taken straight from the training ships "Conway" and "Worcester." They subsequently entered at a later age after having served an apprenticeship at sea; the qualification for entrance being a second mate's Board of Trade certificate. At present officers entered the service at about the age of 22.

79,755. He shared the Port Officer's view that recruitment should be from men with a master's certificate. It was very difficult at present to train a boy for the service in India; a boy had many things to contend with when he was in India, especially when he was off duty.

79,756. An officer would be about 25 years old if he came out to India with a master's certificate. In order to obtain a Master's certificate, a man had to serve an extra three years at sea. His suggestion as to recruitment was not put forward on the ground that a man with a master's certificate would arrive older, and would be therefore less liable to get into trouble.

79,757. To train a man in the service was not so easy as it used to be, and indeed, there was no method of training at present. The present pilot vessels were steamships, whereas in the old days they were sailing brigs, on which apprentices got a very fine training. Nowadays, an apprentice simply kept a monotonous watch on a vessel week in and week out. It had always been recognised that the training on a sailing brig was the finest training a man could receive, even although he went straight into steam afterwards.

79,758. He did not know what the system of recruitment for pilots in the Thames and Mersey was.

79,759. There would be no difficulty in getting a sufficient number of candidates to enter the service under his scheme, but the pay would have to be revised to meet the altered conditions.

79,760. He did not know how the Secretary of State decided whether vacancies should be filled in England or locally. People who were known in Calcutta would very likely have a good chance of getting their sons into the service if they applied to the Local Government.

79,761. He had never heard of Indians desiring to enter the Pilot Service. All ships were piloted by Europeans.

79,762. He did not think insistence on a master's certificate would in any way tend to reduce the number of vacancies that might be filled locally. He knew of two boys who had gone to England to training ships there.

79,763. One matter of great importance was to get an officer out to India immediately he obtained his master's certificate, to study the local conditions. He would be in training 2½ years and during that period would be acquiring local knowledge. Whether 2½ years was sufficient might be open to discussion.

79,764. There was no advantage in retaining the present system of examinations for promotion. At present pilots had their Board of Trade mates' certificates, and a good deal of the promotion examinations did not, and never would, have any bearing on a pilot's work. He wanted to see the examination modified so that it would really be applicable to the actual work pilots had to perform.

79,765. The Port Officer had no objection to the proposal made by the pilots, that a senior pilot should be placed in administrative control of the service under him. Although the Hughli Pilot Service was administered by the Port Office, the Port Office had many other things to do. If a pilot was brought in to assist the Port Officer, he should be given a separate billet, and should not be allowed to interfere with the outside work of the Port Office. Under those conditions the Port Officer would be glad to have a pilot to assist him, but such pilot would be under the Port Officer who would remain the supreme head of the Pilot Service. It was not necessary for the service to have that extra post. The Port Officer did not do anything without consulting the senior pilots in every way.

79,766. He did not recommend any change of salaries, except in the case of the Commanders of the two steam pilot vessels. The latter officer's work was very arduous. At present they were paid Rupees 1,000 a month. The two men now in command of the vessels were licensed pilots, and their time would soon be up. Branch pilots would then have to be appointed to the command of those ships, and it would mean a very considerable loss of salary to them. The command of those ships was looked upon as a punishment. It meant a direct sacrifice of more than half the earnings. He thought if junior officers, whose salaries more or less corresponded with the salary of the Commanders, were appointed to command the ships it would cause a great deal of trouble.

79,767. With regard to the pay of the service, there was great disparity between the emoluments of the several grades, and also between pay and pension. On the surface it seemed a reasonable solution of the difficulty if some system of pooling the whole fees could be instituted, but such a scheme had been tried on several occasions by the pilots themselves and trouble had always arisen after a time.

79,768. He thought the emoluments as a whole—taking pay into account as well as pension—were adequate.

79,769. The pilotage fees did not fluctuate very much; they worked out at a very fair average.

79,770. (*Mr. Madge.*) He could suggest no remedy for the disabilities under which boys of the Anglo-Indian community suffered in regard to recruitment to the Pilot Service.

79,771. (*Mr. Fisher.*) On an average there were three or four recruits every year. When a man first came out to India he was appointed to one of the pilot vessels for training. The present commanders were branch pilots. They received no special allowance for instructing the apprentices. An apprentice remained on the ship until the commander reported him as efficient; then he was put on the river for a considerable time in order to learn the navigation. It was difficult to say how long it would take a man to really know the river, as the apprentices varied very much in capacity. They were generally five years on the river before they knew much about it; after that they would be competent to take small ships up and down.

79,772. There were no great inequalities between the earnings of different branch pilots, but there was a great difference between the branch pilot's earnings and the senior master pilot's earnings; and the same remark applied to the earnings of the senior masters and the junior masters.

79,773. With the average tonnage of ships constantly on the increase, there was a constant tendency in the direction of further inequality. Undoubtedly, the tendency should be checked, and it therefore became more and more necessary every year to introduce a pooling system.

79,774. (*Mr. Sly.*) He had never known of a competitive examination for the service taking place in India.

79,775. He put in a return* showing the average number of years a pilot would spend in the different grades of his service.

* Vide Appendix I.

21 January 1914.]

Commander G. N. FORTEATH.

[Continued.]

79,776. Pilots in Calcutta worked under the Port Officer, who had nothing to do with the Port Trust; he was an officer of the Local Government and was directly responsible to the Governor in Council. The Harbour Master was under the Port Trust.

79,777. The cost to a pilot of providing his own vessel on joining and leaving his ship might be Rs. 3 each time he joined and each time he left a ship.

79,778. The system in regard to punishment in the shape of fines was that a pilot could be suspended altogether or put on half earnings, which was a very heavy punishment. A pilot was tried by a special court of his own men. No fines were inflicted without trial. He did not know to whom the fines went.

79,779. Members of the Pilot Service and members of the Royal Indian Marine served the same apprenticeship as boys at sea. and for both services a second mate's certificate was an essential qualification. Appointments to the Royal Indian Marine were made only by the Secretary of State, and were mostly given to sons of officers who had done good service for Government in India. The educational qualifications for both services were exactly the same.

79,780. (Sir Valentine Chirol.) He had not considered the possibility of getting over the difficulty

(The witness withdrew.)

Messrs. C. G. BUDGE and G. F. THORPE, Branch Pilots, were examined together upon the following corporate and individual written statements.

Written Statement relating to the Bengal Pilot Service, being the corporate opinion of certain officers of the Bengal Pilot Service.*

79,786. (i) **Method of Recruitment.**—From the year 1877 to 1894 the service was recruited direct from the training ships "Worcester" and "Conway." The appointments being much coveted were conferred in the nature of a prize, thereby ensuring the best material available. The senior grade at the present moment consists only of officers thus selected, who as records will show, have proved an unqualified success. During the tenure of Captain Creagh's Port Officership a radical change was proposed and accepted by Government without consulting the opinion of any member of the service. This was an unnecessary change involving a loss of at least three years, which would otherwise have been employed in learning the work of a pilot. In the near future it will become practically impossible to obtain recruits possessing a square-rigged Board of Trade certificate as required by the above resolution, on account of the disappearance of the sailing ship; the natural consequence will be that Government must so alter their conditions as to either revert to former method of recruitment or accept officers who have been trained wholly in steamers, thus abolishing the very object for which these rules were framed. It must be remembered that the work of a Bengal pilot is that of a specialist, and its recruits cannot be admitted too young, and, like the Royal Navy, the younger the officer, the more the handling of vessels becomes a part of his nature. This same argument applies with greater force to the tentative proposal made by the Port Commissioners to admit recruits with master mariners' certificates. The introduction of locally appointed recruits we consider unnecessary; there is no reason why all the local candidates at present belonging to the service should not have competed for their appointments in the same manner as the senior officers of the service were compelled to do previous to 1887. There is no objection to Anglo-Indians provided they obtain their appointments by fair competition with the rest of His Majesty's subjects.

79,787. (ii) **System of Training and Probation.**—Should be conducted on the lines laid down by the former regulations, which were then strictly adhered to. No officer be appointed to any office until duly qualified. The probation necessary for a leadsman should under no circumstances be reduced below five years, mate pilot four years, junior master three years.

79,788. (iii) **Conditions of Service.**—A senior pilot should be appointed to the Port Office to administer

in regard to the two pilot vessels by giving the command of those vessels to Indian Marine officers, but it would be difficult for a man to command a ship which was not in his own service.

79,781. When a pilot fell sick, he went on sick leave after 15 days, and this very much interfered with his taking the leave otherwise due to him.

79,782. (Mr. Madge.) After the two Commanders retired, it would be necessary to reintroduce the rule under which each branch pilot had to take command for a year of the steam pilot vessels.

79,783. (Chairman.) Allowances to officers on sick leave came out of general funds. Only the actual earnings were paid out of the pilotage fees; all other expenses of the service were paid by Government.

79,784. (Mr. Lindquist.) In present circumstances it would be impossible for any man possessing a master's certificate to join the Pilot Service, as he would be out of pocket by so doing. If the service was recruited from master mariners the whole scale of pay for probationary pilots would have to be revised and accommodation would have to be given them on shore.

79,785. (Chairman.) He did not suggest this new form of recruitment because the standard of recruits to the service had deteriorated of recent years.

the Pilot Service. This is necessary on account of the special nature of the work, which requires an officer who has done this work to properly understand its nature. This appointment would relieve the Port Officer of a considerable amount of work with which he cannot be familiar and make the appointment of a deputy port officer superfluous. This would also be of great assistance to the shipping community. In all other ports it is considered necessary to provide an official vessel by which a pilot joins and leaves his charge. In Calcutta nothing of this sort is provided. At present a pilot has to make his own arrangements, and it sometimes becomes a matter of uncertainty whether he can join his vessel or not.

79,789. (iv) **Conditions of Salary.**—The present covenanted remuneration, *i.e.*, 50 per cent. of the pilotage, is a fair one and has for many years proved satisfactory; this, as a rule, has worked out at about the following rates:—

	Rs.
Branch pilot - - - - -	2,000
Senior master - - - - -	1,200
Junior master - - - - -	800
Mate pilot - - - - -	600

which has been accepted by the Chamber of Commerce (Bengal). These amounts should be taken for the purpose of calculating leave and deputation allowances.

Fees payable to Pilots when carried off to Sea and detained in the River on board a Vessel which is neaped or delayed.—The present scale was calculated on the average earnings of a pilot prior to 1877 and is now out of date, as it is an anomaly to grant an officer furlough or other leave on a sum nominally half pay, but which in reality is only a quarter. The service should be placed on the same footing as all other Government service regarding casual leave, which should be that of full pay; at present the leave is available, but no pay is granted.

* The statement was signed by Messrs. W. Bryant, C. G. Budge and G. F. Thorpe on behalf of the following:— Messrs. C. G. Stock, H. Bent, H. S. Tozer, W. Bryant, C. G. Budge, G. F. Thorpe, J. H. Lindquist, S. J. K. Chase and R. S. Smyth, Branch Pilots; H. D. Lindquist, Acting Branch Pilot; J. F. Fox, E. P. Bryant, P. J. Wilson, A. F. Paull, S. A. Glauley, H. A. Cooper and F. Lungley, Senior Master Pilots; V. Cooper, Junior Master Pilot; F. T. Hart, Acting Junior Master; G. S. Scoby, D. Ingram-Halford and A. H. Dove, Masters

21 January 1914.]

Messrs. C. G. BUDGE and G. F. THORPE.

[Continued.]

79,790. (v) Conditions of Leave.—The present system is antiquated and not in line with any other Government service. The Pilot Service should be brought into line with the rest of Government services in India.

79,791. (vi) Conditions of Pension.—There is a memorial, signed by every member of the Bengal Pilot Service, now before Government on this subject, praying that their pension may be brought into line with other Government services, as at present it is totally inadequate. The scale of pension now in force was fixed in 1823. The text of the petition now before Government is annexed. But it would be as well to emphasize one or two points of particular hardship that press upon the service in this matter of pensions. In no other public service in India is a man so liable to be retired under compulsion as an invalid as the Bengal Pilot Service. The deterioration of eyesight at the age of forty, which is common to all men of civilised races, may cause compulsory retirement. And as it is notorious that men in this service do not reap their reward until they reach their senior grade, it is easy to see how a man may lose his occupation through no fault of his own, and be compelled to retire on a pension which nobody could pretend to be sufficient to support him, particularly if he happened to be married. Numerous petitions have been made to Government on the question without success, and no reason has ever been given for these refusals. At the same time it is difficult to see what grounds there can be for refusing the extremely moderate requests made by the Service. It must be borne in mind that while on duty the pilot gets no pay but what he earns. His fees are 50 per cent. of the pilotage dues paid by the ship he navigates. In the middle of the last century he received 60 per cent., but when the reduction was made he received no *quid pro quo*. The Government shorn off 20 per cent. of his earnings, but gave him nothing in return. The position taken up by the Government of India with regard to this question of pensions is hard to understand. While other sections of the public service have had their position improved, the pilots have had their privileges and emoluments curtailed.

79,792. (vii) Employment of non-Europeans.—The subject of Anglo-Indian recruitment has been dealt with elsewhere. The introduction of Indians into the service would not be practicable; the class of Indians who might possibly at the present time be qualified by educational tests for admission into the service are not of the seafaring races of India, and from a physical as well as a temperamental standpoint are unsuited for the work. In any case, there has been no disposition shown on the part of Indians to enter the service, and the subject need not be seriously considered.

79,793. (viii) Relation of the Service to Indian Civil Service and other Services.—Being an Imperial Service appointment made by the Secretary of State, it naturally follows that this service is an Imperial Government service, and in every respect should be brought into line with the I.C.S. and other superior services. The Secretary of State insists on the committee of the training ships selecting for appointment only those of the highest education and abilities.

79,794 (ix) Any other Points, &c.—Two senior branch pilots should be appointed on the Port Commission, where their experience would be of the greatest benefit to the Port. At present their advice is only requisitioned when matters are desperate.

Carried off to Sea.—The Commission of 1903 relieved the ships of the expense of carrying the pilot away in stress of weather, under which conditions it has become a common practice for a master to proceed on his voyage without allowing a reasonable time for the sea to resume a condition to allow the pilot to leave his charge in safety. This frequently depletes the service, and makes it possible for inward-bound vessels to be detained for want of officers at the Sandheads. The present system is unsatisfactory, and is not only liable to abuse, but has so frequently been misused by the mercantile marine that a return to previous conditions is strongly indicated, and all the expense of carrying away a pilot should be borne by the shipowners.

79,795. Annexure to above.

To His Excellency THE RIGHT HON. THOMAS DAVID
BARON CARMICHAEL OF SKIRLING, G.C.I.E.,
K.C.M.G., Governor of Bengal.

The Humble Petition of

an Officer of the Covenanted
Bengal Pilot Service.

RESPECTFULLY SHOWETH:—

(1) That your memorialist is a member of the Bengal Pilot Service and humbly prays that Your Excellency will be pleased to take into consideration the Pension Rules and Regulations of that service and order the scale of pensions to be enhanced.

(2) That your memorialist would respectfully put before Your Excellency the following facts relating to the pensions allowed to pilots:—

(a) The rates of pension were fixed in the year 1821, and the highest rate, namely, that allowed to branch pilots, was *Sicca* Rs. 200 per mensem, then equal to 300*l.* sterling a year.

(b) In 1835 this pension was changed to *Sonat* or Company's Rs. 200 per mensem, then equal to 240*l.* sterling a year.

(c) In 1877 what was known as the "new service" was formed, and the rate of exchange at which the pension of this service was to be paid was fixed at 1*s.* 11*d.* per rupee. In 1882 the rate was further reduced to 1*s.* 9*d.* per rupee, at which it now stands, excepting for those officers who joined prior to that year.

(d) The reduction in the sterling value of the pension granted to branch pilots amounts to 90*l.* a year, equal to 30 per cent. of the original pension.

(e) The pensions allowed to the officers in the other grades of the service have been proportionately reduced.

(3) That the following tabular statement shows the decrease in the sterling equivalent of the pension granted to the officers of each grade:—

PILOTS' PENSIONS.

Grade.	1822.		1835.		1913.		Decrease in 1835 in £ Sterling per annum.	Decrease in 1913 in £ Sterling per annum.	Total decrease in £ Sterling.	Per cent- age at total decrease.
	<i>Sicca</i> Rupees per mensem.	Sterling equivalent per annum.	<i>Sonat</i> Rupees per mensem.	Sterling equivalent per annum.	Rupees per mensem.	Sterling equivalent at 1 <i>s.</i> 9 <i>d.</i> per Rupee.				
Branch pilot	Rs. 200	£ 300	Rs. 200	£ 240	Rs. 200	£ 210	£ 60	£ 30	£ 90	} 30
Master pilot	100	150	100	120	100	105	30	15	45	
First mate	60	90	72	72	60	63	18	9	27	
Second mate and volunteer.	30	45	30	36			Abolished in 1909.			100

21 January 1914.]

Messrs. C. G. BUDGE and G. F. THORPE.

[Continued.]

(4) That from time to time memorials have been submitted on the same subject, unfortunately with no beneficial result, although in the year 1906, when a deputation of officers of the Bengal Pilot Service was received by the then Lieutenant-Governor, Sir Andrew Fraser, His Honour expressed his opinion that the pension was quite inadequate.

(5) That there are several strong points in favour of an increased pension, which might have been lost sight of when the subject was under the consideration of the Government of Bengal in the past, and in consequence of this, your memorialist hereby submits for the consideration of Your Excellency a rather lengthy statement explaining in detail his reasons for petitioning for an enhanced pension.

(6) That the pensions of other services have been improved and certain allowances for travelling, house rent, &c., have been granted to them. The pension of the Bengal Pilot Service has decreased in value from 300l. sterling to 210l. sterling. In addition to this pilots now receive only 50 per cent. of the pilotage against 60 per cent. as granted formerly, nothing whatever being granted in the form of allowances, although expenses in Calcutta, where house rent and living are exceedingly high, have increased enormously. Even the boon of the exchange compensation allowance granted to other services has been withheld from the Bengal Pilot Service except when on leave. It has been stated, as a reason for not increasing the pensions of the Bengal Pilot Service, that the earnings of the senior grade are sufficiently large to enable officers to supplement their pensions from their savings. In other services this is not considered a deterrent to a fair pension, for in their case the higher the salary of the officer the larger is the amount of pension he is entitled to, and your memorialist can see no reason why the pension of the Bengal Pilot Service (a covenanted service) should be 60 per cent. lower than other Government services. An officer of the Bengal Pilot Service does not at present reach a position which enables him to save money until he has served upwards of 23 to 25 years, and in some cases pilots have served for 30 years and even more before attaining to the senior grade. The following are cases of pilots having served over 30 years before being promoted to the senior grade:—

Mr. W. R. Williams	- 32	Mr. F. T. Rayner	- 32
" G. M. Anderson	- 30½	" G. Burn, retired	
" J. Christie	- 33	after 30 years'	
" E. F. Hudson	- 31½	service as se-	
" W. O. B. West	- 30½	nior master.	
" S. Ransom	- 31½	" C. Collingwood	- 30½
" R. C. Rust	- 30½		

These officers were all men with a good record, and the delay in their promotion to the rank of branch pilot was solely due to the congestion of the service. It is quite possible that after 24 years' service an officer may be invalidated before attaining the rank of branch pilot, and in the case of Mr. G. Burn it was 30 years, in which case he would retire on a pension of Rs. 100 per mensem, with no savings to fall back

upon, a possibility not at all remote, owing to a rule recently introduced which makes it compulsory for all pilots to undergo a medical examination every three years after reaching the age of 40. It is only after an officer has worked hard as a branch pilot for 10 or 15 years that he can expect to have saved sufficient money to provide himself with an income large enough to support himself and his family on retirement. Were he compelled to retire before this, his position would be one of extreme poverty. Three years ago Mr. I. S. Wells, a branch pilot, at the age of 46 and with 27 years' service, was compelled to retire from the service under this rule on account of defective eyesight.

(7) That if a comparison is made between the comparatively light and comfortable work of a senior officer of the Royal Indian Marine and the strenuous and onerous duties of a senior pilot, the pension of the Bengal Pilot Service will be found to be out of all proportion to the work done.

(8) That from the year 1877 to the year 1894 appointments to the Bengal Pilot Service, by the Secretary of State for India, were held out as prizes on board H.M.S. "Conway" and "Worcester," and were, in the majority of cases, secured by the most capable and successful cadets on those training ships. Since the year 1894, candidates have been selected in exactly the same manner as candidates for the Royal Indian Marine. The qualifications of candidates recruited from England, for the two services, are now identically the same, there being no difference in either their education or training. Yet as regards social position, leave rules, and pension rules, the officers of the Royal Indian Marine are far better off than officers of the Bengal Pilot Service. It may be urged as an argument against this statement that the Bengal Pilot Service officer is better paid than the officer of the Royal Indian Marine. It may appear at first sight to be so, but when all facts are considered it will be found that there is not a great difference in the pay and emoluments of the two services. For example, comparing the senior officers of the Royal Indian Marine with the officers of the Bengal Pilot Service, it will be found that the Royal Indian Marine officer holds various shore appointments, viz., one deputy directorship and five first-grade port officerships, one assistant directorship (and several other appointments on shore), whose pay, with allowances, &c., compares favourably with that of the senior officers of the Bengal Pilot Service, especially when taking into consideration that houses for the Royal Indian Marine officers are provided free, or at favourable Government rates, and that officers of the Bengal Pilot Service have many expenses incidental to their work, and are also at the mercy of the Calcutta landlord. These appointments for the Royal Indian Marine come to them when they are advancing in years, consequently they, in contradistinction to the senior officers of the Bengal Pilot Service, live a life free from the anxieties, dangers, and discomforts of a life at sea. The following is a comparative statement showing the pay of senior officers in the Royal Indian Marine and in the Bengal Pilot Service:—

COMPARATIVE STATEMENT showing PAY of SENIOR OFFICERS in ROYAL INDIAN MARINE and BENGAL PILOT SERVICE.

Royal Indian Marine.

Length of Service.	Rank, Pay, and Emoluments.	Remarks.
	<i>Deputy Director, Calcutta.</i>	
25-30 years	Rs. 500 Pay	} Free house allowed. Equivalent to Rs. 600 per mensem. Pension of Rs. 6,000 per annum.
	" 1,000 Staff allowance	
	" 120 Port Commissioner fees	
	" 1,620 Total pay per mensem	

21 January 1914.]

Messrs. C. G. BUDGE and G. F. THORPE.

[Continued.]

Length of Service.	Rank, Pay, and Emoluments.	Remarks.
	<i>Port Officer, Calcutta.</i>	
25-30 years	Rs. 500 Pay - - - - -	Flat allowed (free of rent). Equivalent to Rs. 200 per mensem. Pension Rs. 5,880 per annum.
	" 870 Staff allowance - - - - -	
	" 75 (about) Examination fees, &c. - - - - -	
	<u>1,445</u> Total pay (about) - - - - -	
	<i>Port Officer, Karachi.</i>	
25-30 years	Rs. 500 Pay - - - - -	Pays house rent at rate of 10 per cent. of pay, less Rs. 40 allowed for office. Equivalent to about Rs. 90 for house rent. Pension Rs. 5,880 per annum.
	" 870 Staff allowance - - - - -	
	" 75 (about) Examination fees, &c. - - - - -	
	<u>1,445</u> Total pay - - - - -	
	<i>Port Officer, Bombay.</i>	
25-30 years	Rs. 500 Pay - - - - -	10 per cent. of pay deducted for house rent. Pension Rs. 5,880 per annum.
	" 870 Staff allowance - - - - -	
	" 380 Local allowance - - - - -	
	" 100 (more or less) Examination fees, &c. - - - - -	
	<i>Port Officer, Rangoon.</i>	
25-30 years	Rs. 500 Pay - - - - -	10 per cent. of pay deducted for house rent. Pension Rs. 5,880 per annum.
	" 870 Staff allowance - - - - -	
	" 150 Fees for Ex. Officer's Member, Port Trust, - - - - -	
	<u>1,520</u> Total pay - - - - -	
	<i>Port Officer, Madras.</i>	
25-30 years	Rs. 500 Pay - - - - -	10 per cent. of pay deducted for house rent. Pension Rs. 5,880 per annum.
	" 870 Staff allowance - - - - -	
	" 150 Fees for inspecting lightships, &c. (about). - - - - -	
	<u>1,520</u> Total pay - - - - -	

Bengal Pilot Service.

Length of Service.	Rank and Average Earnings.	Remarks.
	<i>Branch Pilot.</i>	
25-30 years	Rs. 2,000-2,200 per mensem - - - - -	No allowances. Travelling expenses to be paid by officer. Pension, Rs. 2,400 per annum. Full pay for leave allowances and when in command of pilot steamer, Rs. 1,000.
25-30 years	Rs. 2,000-2,200 per mensem - - - - -	As above.
25-30 years	Rs. 2,000-2,200 per mensem - - - - -	As above.
25-30 years	Rs. 2,000-2,200 per mensem - - - - -	As above.
25-30 years	Rs. 2,000-2,200 per mensem - - - - -	As above.

From the day the selected candidate joins the Bengal Pilot Service he is obliged to live in Calcutta, admittedly the most expensive town in India, his life is a hard and hazardous one, attended with many discomforts, which the Indian Marine Officer can never be subjected to. A pilot in the execution of his duty is obliged to put up with bad food, irregular meals, long hours (sometimes being on duty for 36 hours at a time without rest), and many other discomforts and hardships, amongst which may be mentioned boating at sea in the roughest of weather when boarding or leaving

vessels at the Sandheads. The duties of an officer in the Royal Indian Marine are much less onerous than those of an officer in the Bengal Pilot Service. The Royal Indian Marine officer lives on board his vessel from the time he joins the service, and his expenses need not be nearly as large as those of the Bengal pilot, who is forced to live on shore in Calcutta. The Royal Indian Marine Officer has several well-paid shore appointments to look forward to, whereas the Bengal pilot must continue his work, piloting vessels up and down the river, until he retires. In addition to this,

21 January 1914.]

Messrs. C. G. BUDGE and G. F. THORPE.

[Continued.]

the Bengal pilot, during his later years, is obliged to work at high pressure all the time, in order to maintain his average earnings, and also in the hope that he may, if he can keep going for many years, add a sufficient amount to his pension to enable him to live with any degree of comfort when he retires. Any

falling-off in energy means a loss to him financially, as he is paid by the work he does, and receives no salary except when on leave. The disparity between the pensions of the two services may be seen at a glance from the table below:—

	Royal Indian Marine.	Bengal Pilot Service.
After 15 years, if invalidated . . .	Rs. 180 per mensem at 1s. 9d. . . .	Rs. 100 per mensem.
After 20 years	Rs. 190 per mensem at 1s. 9d. . . .	Rs. 100 per mensem at 1s. 9d.
After 25 years	Rs. 330 per mensem at 1s. 9d. . . .	*Rs. 200 per mensem at 1s. 9d.
After 30 years	Rs. 490 per mensem at 1s. 9d. . . .	Rs. 200 per mensem at 1s. 9d.

* If a branch pilot.

The Bengal Pilot Service is a self-supporting service, the Government deducting 50 per cent. of the pilotage fees paid by vessels, whereas it is well known that the Royal Indian Marine is a direct charge on the State.

(9) That the officers of the Harbour Master's Department in the port of Calcutta have had their pensions improved, and they are able to retire after 25 years' service on a pension of Rs. 5,000 a year. In addition to this the senior men have three or four shore appointments open to them towards the end of their service.

(10) That during the last few years nearly all the large steamship companies have found it necessary to grant pensions to officers of long service. In fact, throughout the Merchant Service the scale of pay has been increased and the prospects of the officers improved. While the pensions of other Government services have been enhanced from time to time, that of the Bengal Pilot Service has not been altered for 92 years, and its sterling value has deteriorated by 30 per cent.

(11) That your memorialist, in the execution of his duties, is put to much expense in joining and leaving vessels; also in travelling, as a passenger, to and from the Sandheads. When in Calcutta he is obliged to

attend at the Port Office daily, which also entails expense. He receives no allowance whatever except in the case of joining a vessel at Budge Budge, and even when leaving a ship at Budge Budge he receives no allowance for his journey to Calcutta. All outside expenses are borne by him, no arrangements being made for his joining or leaving vessels, and these expenses are never taken into calculation when the question of his average earnings is under discussion with regard to an increase of pension, &c.

(12) That your memorialist humbly submits that there is no reason why members of the Bengal Pilot Service should be placed under more unfavourable rules as to pension than are members of the unconvicted services, or officers of the Royal Indian Marine.

Your memorialist therefore humbly prays that Your Excellency may be pleased to order that the pension may be increased to the same amount as that granted to the Royal Indian Marine, at the present rate of 1s. 9d. per rupee, and that the Bengal Pilot Service may participate in the forthcoming improved proportionate pension rules that the Royal Indian Marine hope will very shortly come into force.

And your memorialist as is in duty bound will ever pray.

Written Statement relating to the Bengal Pilot Service by Mr. C. G. Budge, Branch Pilot.

79,796. (i) **Methods of Recruitment.**—Appointment to the Bengal Pilot Service should be competitive to cadets of the "Worcester" and "Conway" only, immediately on completion of at least two years on either of those training ships. Local appointments to be abolished. I consider the three years that recruits have now to serve at sea a waste of time and a Board of Trade second mate's certificate unnecessary—local examinations for the different grades of leadsman and pilot can always be arranged to suit all requirements.

79,797. (ii) **System of Training and Probation.**—Should the above system of recruiting be adopted the length of probation and training might be extended to six years with the proviso that no leadsman be promoted to the mate pilot grade before he has attained the age of 23 years. This I suggest as I understand that in the year 1896 the Chamber of Commerce represented that in their opinion some of the mate pilots were promoted to that grade at too early an age, although they overlooked the fact that the Board of Trade regulations allow a seaman to obtain his master's certificate at 21, and thereby acknowledge his competency to command a vessel of any tonnage, whilst the tonnage and draft of a mate pilot is limited. Mr. Thorpe, branch pilot, has shown in his letter how the time service may be employed and as I am of the same opinion I will not here repeat the same.

79,798. (iii) **Conditions of Service.**—I am of opinion that under all conditions the service of a pilot should terminate at 55 years of age, as after that age the efficiency necessary to the proper performance of

his duties has become considerably impaired, and statistics prove that in many cases the only serious accidents which have occurred in a careful officer's career took place after his service had been extended. In the public interest I would propose that a branch pilot be appointed to direct and control both the Pilot Service and River Survey; the officer selected to be nominally under the Port Officer, but directly responsible to Government for the proper administration of these departments. This was done with success, I understand, in former years. Now, as formerly, the constant change of Port Officers and the intricate nature of our work and rules often conduce to inefficient administration. In my opinion, which is that of most members of my service, the work of the River Survey is often unsatisfactory, which is not remarkable when it is remembered that its head is neither a surveyor nor a pilot. Much of the work done is unnecessary, and the publication of innumerable charts is no criterion of their usefulness. Necessary work is often neglected until "asked for by the pilots," whilst friction and discontent is constantly the order of the day.

79,799. (iv) **Conditions of Salary.**—I am of the same opinion as the rest of my service whose views are expressed in the former papers submitted, but would add that I consider the salary of a Commander of a pilot vessel quite inadequate and out of all proportion to the salaries of the rest of the Service. His pay of Rs. 1,000 per mensem is less by Rs. 250 than that given to the senior masters appointed to the British India Company's Rangoon mail steamers and lower than the average of the senior masters generally.

21 January 1914.]

Messrs. C. G. BUDGE and G. F. THORPE.

[Continued.]

consider that the Commander of a pilot vessel should receive a salary equal to the average made by the branch pilots month by month, for reasons which are given elsewhere.

79,800. (v) Conditions of leave.—As before stated the Pilot Service leave rules are antiquated and, like the pension rules, have not been altered materially to suit the requirements of modern times. They, with very little modification, were framed in the days when sailing vessels were the only mode of transit. Every other Service in India has had its rules altered to suit modern requirements, and I see no reason why the Pilot Service should not, in like manner, have the benefit of these alterations. The Civil Service rules could be submitted with advantage.

79,801. (vi) Conditions of pension.—The smallness of the pension granted to the service in the year 1822 and the repeated attempts by its members to improve the same, but without success, have constituted a real and bitter grievance for many years. The numerous memorials submitted to Government within the last 30 years are sufficient indication that the service has been ungenerously treated in this respect. A pension of 210*l.* per annum offered to a pilot with 30 years of good service to his credit shows little appreciation of his work and practically condemns him to a struggle for existence at a time of life when he might reasonably expect to be free from such worries. Sir Andrew Fraser, when approached by a deputation of the service, expressed his surprise at the minuteness of the pension and was willing to assist in its improvement until over-persuaded by the then Secretary to Government, who, in collaboration with the Accountant General of Bengal, formulated a scheme for enhancing the pension which was to cost Government nothing and prove less advantageous than could be obtained from any insurance company. Naturally this was not accepted by the service, and the matter remained in obeyance until another memorial was submitted. The answer to this was to the effect that as the pension formed one of the subjects for consideration by the Public Service Commissioners nothing would be done by Government until their report has been received. We were content to leave our case thus, and have been considerably surprised at receiving from the Government a proposal that we should accept a scheme similar to that formerly rejected by the Service, and can only suppose this was done with the object of excluding pensions from the consideration of your Commission. No answer, accepting or refusing this scheme, has been given by the Service, nor are we in any way in treaty with the Government in this respect. The strongest opponents to the improvement of pension appear to be the Secretaries to Government, members of the Public Works Department, and it is strange to find that the Public Works Department, whilst considering their own pension of 430*l.* per annum insufficient, are of opinion that less than half that amount is adequate for a Bengal pilot. Pensions should be earned by time service alone and not be dependent on the good luck or otherwise of a member attaining to certain rank. Being a seniority service, with its age-limit extended to 60 years, it follows that blocks in promotion must periodically occur, and members will find in the near future, as in the past, that with many years of good service to their credit they have little chance of retiring on full pension before reaching the age-limit. As the memorial which is attached to the papers submitted clearly points out, the pension when originally granted was based on the value of the Sicca Rupee and represented a sterling value of 300*l.* per annum. In 1835 the Sonat rupee was substituted, reducing our pension to 240*l.* per annum, since when it has varied according to the rate of exchange, until fixed by Lord Curzon at 1*s.* 9*d.*, below which no pensions were to be paid. This brings our pension down ultimately to an equivalent of 210*l.* per annum, a reduction of 30 per cent. on the original amount. If it be allowed that the original pension was fair and adequate at the time that it was granted on the present scale, how much more must it be recognised that in the present times, with the cost of living admittedly 100 per cent. greater, a

depreciated pension of 210*l.* per annum is totally inadequate. A cursory glance at Chapter XXXII. of our rules, consisting of two pages only, which comprises the whole of our pension rules, must be a convincing factor that we being a sea service, with no powerful and influential friends ashore to further our interests, have been allowed to slide down into the state which I am now representing; and unlike every other Service in India, our pension has been persistently reduced whilst others have been increased, until now, after 30 years' service in a tropical climate, we find ourselves in receipt of what is insufficient to provide even the common decencies of life either in India or any other country in the world. The lighting of the river Hooghly for the purpose of navigation at night being so strongly pushed by the Port Commissioners and so favourably approved by Government in opposition to the expressed opinion of all but two members of the Pilot Service, clearly indicates that sooner or later this responsible work will be forced upon the pilots. Night and day work will soon tell on the constitutions of the strongest, eyesight will become impaired through constant nervous strain, and bodily health ruined. Will this pension of 210*l.* per annum be sufficient compensation for all that has been sacrificed or 105*l.* per annum if he has to retire as a master pilot? Government requires that every pilot over the age of 40 shall periodically undergo a medical examination and eyesight test. As a number of master pilots are already of this age and there will be more in the near future, it follows that each will constantly run the risk of being condemned medically and forcibly retired on a pension of 105*l.* per annum. The imposition of the medical examination referred to is unwarranted and not in accordance with the conditions under which recruits consented to join the Service. Had the pension been adequate it is doubtful whether such would ever have been sanctioned, as it would have involved "too great an expense on the State," but, as the individual becomes the only sufferer, it was considered an expedient measure. I find on consulting old records that in a plan submitted by the Secretary to Government, No. 378, dated August 1822, which was adopted by the Marquis of Hastings, pilots were allowed to retire after a service of 22 years only on a pension of 300*l.* per annum and that "those who after 18, 17 or even 16 years' service might be reported by the Medical Officer of the establishment as likely, although still fit for duty, to suffer greatly in their health by continuing to service of 22 years, might be permitted to retire on the pensions of their ranks respectively." This as compared with the present rules requiring 30 years' service and then getting a pension of 210*l.* per annum only shows how in the present day a pilot is less advantageously placed than in the year 1822. In the same document it goes on to say—"it should not be forgotten on this head that the Pilots themselves who after considerable periods of service performed with the greatest credit, find any of their faculties beginning to be impaired, would be saved by having the option to retire, from much disagreeable apprehension and solicitude which they could scarcely otherwise fail to experience, under the idea that the decay of nature might subject them in the further performance of their duties to the occurrence of accidents leading to great loss of property on the part of the mercantile public, to the manifest injury to their own hard earned professional reputation and perhaps to the wreck of their prospects in the decline of life." Again, to continue from the same document. Since 1798 (to 1822) the mean average age of branch pilots retiring was 44 years and 4 months. In a reply to the Service memorial dated 26th May 1884, Marine No. 483-T.G., Mr. A. P. MacDonnel, Secretary to Government, says: "It seems to me that all the service can claim is, that the same measure of justice be dealt out to them as to the uncovenanted members of the Public Works, the Telegraph, the Geological Survey and the Forest Department who are recruited from home." This has not been done! Continuing: "I think some changes are desirable and might well take the shape of making a service of not less than 15 years, but less than 25 years,

21 January 1914.]

Messrs. C. G. BUDGE and G. F. THORPE.

[Continued.]

“ entitled to a pension of Rs. 100 per mensem, whilst “ after a service of not less than 25 years a pension of “ Ra. 200 per mensem. This would do away with “ pension by grade and introduce (what the pilots ask “ for) principle of pension by time or service.” From the above it will be seen that what was sought for 30 years and more ago is what to-day we ask you to help us to secure; our requests are moderate and just when we ask Government to grant us, for the few years that we are likely to live to enjoy it, a pension commensurate with our long service and arduous duties. It would almost appear as though Government traded upon the loyalty of this Service, who, having the power to compel their just demands, have for more than 30 years memorialised for a recognition of their grievances in preference to resorting to unconstitutional methods. Government has always contended, in answer to the many memorials submitted, that a branch pilot is earning such an income as should enable him to make his own enhanced pension through the medium of insurance, &c., to compensate him for the admittedly small pension granted. This would, in a measure, be possible if a pilot could be certain of getting his promotion to that grade within a reasonable time of service and if, from the time of entry, he had been adequately paid or allowed to make a sufficient income, but such has seldom been the case, and my experience, together with that of all present branch pilots, is that we were unable as mate and junior master pilots to earn sufficient to support ourselves, and some were obliged to live on at the leadmen's quarters until compelled to leave to make room for new comers. Had I known before joining the Service the struggle for existence before attaining a position that would insure me a livelihood I would never have joined. It was only the hope that in the future such an income would be forthcoming to compensate me for my hard times that encouraged me to continue my service. As our last memorial points out, there have in the past been many cases in which a pilot has had to serve from 30 to 32 years before being promoted to the highest grade, so in the future it is a matter of possibility, if not of certainty, that the same state of things will occur; what provision can, in such cases, a pilot make for the future?

79,802. (ix) Other Points.—*Punishments.*—In the opinion of the Service the system of cutting a pilot's earnings is immoral and should be discontinued. With the exception of being proved careless, intoxicated, or in the event of violation of specific rules, a pilot must be considered to be doing his best for his charge, and should an error of judgment occur or the pilot, on enquiry, be proved insufficiently experienced, the case can always be met by reduction in grade, consequently in pay also, until found competent. The above-mentioned exceptions can be punished by suspension. It does not seem right that Government should appropriate monies, the proceeds of misdeeds of their servants.

In a resolution dated 18th June 1868, the Lieutenant Governor of Bengal approved of pilots being appointed to offices in the Marine Department and brought it especially to the notice of the Government of India. The senior branch pilot was formerly appointed an honorary magistrate and sat on the Judicial Bench in the trial of cases. Formerly a branch pilot was appointed Deputy Master Attendant, and, in the absence of the Master Attendant, carried on the current duties of the Port Office.

The two pilot vessels, by reason of their tonnage being Imperial and not Local Government vessels, should be commanded by branch pilots as formerly. The appointment to be for one year only. At present, on account of the smallness of the salary, these commands are considered as punishment rather than, as we should like to see them, an honour. Also the appointment is an anomalous one, as it does not carry

with it His Majesty's Commission; the absence of such commission not only belittles the appointment but impairs discipline. I am of opinion that this important post should be recognised and dignified by Government with a commission bearing the rank of “Commander. Bengal Pilot Service,” to be used only whilst in actual command and after retirement.

The cost of living and standard of comfort has risen throughout Europe. This is admitted by every statesman worthy of the name, and legislation on these lines is going on and extends to the labouring classes.

I have not previously raised the question of class, but should this be brought forward the Bengal Pilot Service claims to belong to the same class as those of the other superior services in India whose members are appointed by the Secretary of State for India, though the educational qualifications required of us are not so high as those of some of the Services, yet, as regards the Service under whom we are placed, the Royal Indian Marine, they at any rate can lay no claim to superiority in that respect. As I understand that an influential member of the Anglo-Indian Association will sit with the members of your Committee to watch the interests of the “Local Candidate,” I think it not out of place to bring to your notice that out of 21 who have been appointed since 1887, four have been dismissed before becoming pilots as being “undesirable,” one on account of incompetency and one left of his own accord for reasons best known to himself; this is a big average, nearly one-third. This, I consider, was the result of want of competition and has been characteristic of this class of appointment since its first inception. This has been the strongest argument in favour of its abolition. It now has come to this, that any youngster, whether he comes from the slums of Calcutta or the more deserving “Home” at Kalimpong, can claim to enter the Bengal Pilot Service without competition provided that he can prove that his parents are “respectable,” can pass a very elementary educational test and produce a 2nd mate's Board of Trade square-rigged ticket. Did the real necessity for this appointment exist and the domiciled community send their sons to sea in such numbers as to prove that a healthy competition really existed, this question would never have been raised, but at present they are unwilling to comply with the conditions laid down, and the consequence is that the Society, who control these matters, must confess that only with the greatest difficulty can they produce even one candidate a year. I hope my remarks will not be construed to mean that the members of the Service from home have any ill-feeling towards the locally appointed officers, quite to the contrary, for the Service has, in years gone by, been fortunate enough to secure, through this appointment, officers whom they like and of whom any service might well be proud. It has often been contended by those having an interest in the refusal to increase our pension that the education necessary for an appointment to the Bengal Pilot Service by the Secretary of State for India is much less costly than that of other Services in India, consequently we should not expect either the same pay or pensions of those other Services. This I contend is, in the present day, incorrect, for as the home appointed Bengal pilot must gain his appointment through one of the training ships, which are by no means cheap institutions, there is nothing to prevent every appointment to the Civil Service, or any other Indian Government Service whose recruits are appointed after public competition, being given to sons of working men who, with more brains than those who are called their “betters,” have risen from Board or National School to Grammar School, from Grammar School to University, where their scholarship has placed them at the head of the examination list at practically no cost to their parents and only through the medium of bursaries.

Written Statement relating to the Bengal Pilot Service by Mr. G. F. Thorpe, Branch Pilot.

79,803. (i) *Methods of Recruitment.*—I am fully in agreement with the expressed opinion of my service in the original document submitted and consider, as

therein contained, that the best interests of Government and mercantile community would be preserved by the appointment of recruits being exclusively confined

21 January 1914.]

Messrs. C. G. BUDGE and G. F. THORPE.

[Continued.]

to the training ships "Worcester" and "Conway" without the necessity of serving three years at sea.

79,804. (ii) **System of Training and Probation.**—I am of opinion that, should the above method of recruiting be adopted, the length of probation and training might be profitably extended to six years with the proviso that no leadsman be promoted to be a mate pilot before he has attained the age of 23 years. The period of a leadsman's training to be arranged as follows:—The first two years of service to be devoted to an apprenticeship, during which period he be attached to a pilot vessel under the sole training and direction of the Commander and officers of the vessel, under conditions identical with the former system. He then should present himself for the examination of 2nd mate leadsman, on passing which and a vacancy occurring he should be appointed for one year as 3rd Officer of a pilot vessel. He should then be placed on the leadsman's senior running list, waiting a vacancy as 2nd Officer, in which capacity he shall serve for one year also. After five years' full service he be allowed to present himself for examination as 1st mate leadsman, on passing which and a vacancy occurring he be appointed Chief Officer for one year, then he be permitted to pass for mate pilot, on promotion to which grade he shall serve not less than four years, then on passing for master he shall serve the full term of three years as junior master. He then should present himself for his branch pilot's examination which would entitle him to promotion to the senior master's grade as vacancy occurs.

79,805. (iii) **Conditions of Service.**—Whilst fully concurring with the views expressed by my service I would add that under all conditions the service of a pilot should terminate at the age of 55, as it has been my experience that after that age the efficiency of a pilot has become considerably impaired, and statistics will prove that in many cases the only serious accidents which have occurred in a careful officer's career happened after an extension of his service. Also I am of the opinion that the public interest would be best served by the appointment of one branch pilot to direct and control both the Pilot Service and River Survey, the officer selected, though nominally subjective to the Port Officer, to be directly responsible to Government for the administration of these Depart-

ments. That in the best interests of discipline (after the retirement of the present Commanders) the command of pilot vessels should devolve on branch pilots in turn for the term of one year as was formerly done, and this arrangement rigidly adhered to. That in the same interests the Government should dignify the appointments of such Commanders of Imperial vessels by conferring on them the commission of Commander, Bengal Pilot Service; the absence of such commission has, in many cases, occasioned an attempted belittlement of their important and responsible appointment, such rank to be assumed only during his year of command and on retirement from the service.

79,806. (iv) **Conditions of Salary.**—I am of the same opinion as expressed by my service on this matter as regards running pilots which is fully contained under that heading in the original corporate note submitted. But I would wish to bring to your notice the inadequate pay which for so many years has been drawn by Commanders of pilot vessels, viz., Rs. 1,000 per mensem, a salary which is considered to be, and actually is, considerably less than that made by a senior master pilot and Rs. 250 less than the fixed pay drawn by senior masters appointed to the Rangoon Mail Service. In my opinion the salary of a Commander of a pilot vessel should be raised to at least Rs. 1,500 per mensem.

79,807. (v) **Conditions of Leave.**—I am of the same opinion as that expressed by my service.

79,808. (vi) **Conditions of Pension.**—I am of the same opinion as that of my service, with this addition—that I consider that my service for many reasons should not be treated less generously than the Uncovenanted Service under this heading.

79,809. (vii) **Employment of non-Europeans.**—As stated in the papers submitted, there is no likelihood of Indians raising the question of employment as pilots in the river Hooghly, nor in my opinion would the public generally approve of such an innovation.

79,810. (viii) **Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.**—My views are fully contained in the papers originally submitted.

79,811. (ix) **Other Points.**—These points are also contained in the papers originally submitted.

Messrs. C. G. BUDGE and G. F. THORPE called and examined.

79,812. (Chairman.) Mr. BUDGE was a branch pilot of 27½ years' service. Mr. THORPE was also a branch pilot, with the same number of years service.

79,813. Mr. BUDGE said that until 1894 the service was recruited direct from the two training ships "Conway" and "Worcester" with the exception of those appointed locally. In 1894 it was decided that the age for admission should be raised from 15 to 18, and that a candidate for appointment should hold at least a second mate's certificate of competency, which required either four years at sea or three years' sea service and two years in a training ship. That change to his knowledge was not made on account of the altered conditions of the trade of the port; there was apparently no need for the alteration. The only reason he could give was the reason given to him by the Port Officer. When he asked the Port Officer why the alteration was made, he said the Indian marine officer had to go to sea and get his second mate's certificate, and he did not see why the Pilot Service should not do the same.

79,814. He considered the old system of recruitment was infinitely superior to the present system. The old system produced a pilot more used to discipline, and one who required less training in discipline. He agreed that the ultimate product of the two systems would be the same, but the recruits who came straight from the "Worcester" and "Conway" were more amenable to discipline and control than men who had been to sea for three years. He could not understand the criticism put before the Commission by the Acting Port Officer

that if the old system were reverted to, it would not be suitable to present conditions. Training in a square-rigged ship was not at all essential, provided two years was served in a training ship.

Mr. THORPE considered that three years on a sailing ship was an entire waste of time. The three years could be employed very much more profitably inside the service.

79,815. Mr. BUDGE said the present system of appointing officers to the different positions on the pilot vessels was not in accordance with what used to obtain when he joined the service. Then there was a regular apprenticeship to start with, of two years spent partly on the river under pilots and partly in pilot vessels. Then officers passed their examination for second mate, and as a vacancy occurred obtained their promotion. Then they went on the river for a year, and having passed for a first mate, were employed on a vacancy occurring in that capacity. By that time they were pretty senior and they had the junior men under them well in hand and were in a position to teach them considerably more than was possible under the present system, which admitted of a youngster being appointed as Chief Officer before he even understood the language. At present there was no regular system of appointment to the pilot vessels. Appointments were made to suit the convenience of the pilot vessel and not of the individual and service.

79,816. He regarded the prolonged training of a young officer coming out to India straight from a training vessel as very important. If there was a laxity

21 January 1914.]

Messrs. C. G. BUDGE and G. F. THORPE.

[Continued.]

of discipline, it was generally due to the too early appointment of junior men to be Chief Officers. Under his scheme the training would turn out a disciplined officer at the proper time, who in his turn would look after the young officer joining the service.

79,817. Although a training on a sailing ship would absolutely fit a man for the handling of a sailing ship, it would not necessarily fit him for the handling of a steamer. For the purposes of the pilotage of steamships, he was quite content with a training on a steamship under the guidance of a Bengal pilot.

79,818. His main objection to the proposal made by the Port Commissioners in 1903, and enunciated by the last witness, that candidates should have a master mariner's qualification, was that it involved a waste of time. In former days the service was open to that class of officer, but the experiment did not prove a success. A master mariner who would ordinarily be attracted to the service would probably be a very young man, or one too old for Government service. A very young man would probably be able to obtain his master mariner's certificate in the capacity of a second mate of a steamer, in which capacity he had no training whatever in handling a steamer, and was no better off in that respect than the youngster who came out from England.

79,819. It would be difficult to say how his proposal for recruitment to the service would affect the supply of Anglo-Indian candidates. He would suggest, however, that each year successful boys of different Indian schools should present themselves before a selection committee consisting, amongst others, of at least two members of the Pilot Service. On selection, successful candidates should be provided either by the Government, or by any philanthropic society willing to do so, with the means of joining either the "Conway" or the "Worcester" and finally of entering into competition with other candidates for appointment to the Pilot Service. Several Anglo-Indians, during his 27 years' experience, had reached the rank of branch pilots.

79,820. He considered it necessary to appoint a senior pilot to administer the service, because of the benefit which would accrue to the service by having an experienced man to look after their interests. At present the Port Officer had to enquire into accidents which occurred on the river, and to settle differences between pilots, and nobody but a pilot with a complete knowledge of every rule and custom of the service could satisfactorily perform those duties.

79,821. Promotion examinations for pilots and branch pilots were undoubtedly necessary, and he would not suggest any alteration in the present form of examination.

79,822. In the Thames, pilots comprised choice pilots, and ordinary turn pilots. He could not say what their pay was, as it varied from year to year, according to the amount of work they did, but a choice pilot would compare very favourably with a branch pilot in Calcutta, from the point of view either of salary or of conditions of service, cost of living being taken into consideration. He himself would sooner earn 1,000*l.* a year in England than Rs. 2,000 a month in India.

79,823. With the exception of the Rangoon mail steamers, every ship applied for its pilot either to the pilot vessel at the Sandheads or to the Port Office in Calcutta. The Rangoon mail service were allowed by Government to have their own Bengal pilots, and these pilots did not compete for their living with the other pilots.

79,824. There was a considerable disparity in the pay of the different grades of the service. Sometimes the average pay of the branch pilot was much in excess of the average pay of the master pilot. It was impossible to say whether that state of things was likely to continue. Early in 1913 the senior master's tonnage was raised by 300 tons and no great disparity now existed between branch and senior master pilots' earnings. There were very violent fluctuations. He had evidence of that from the statistics which had been prepared by the Port Officer, and which he desired to submit.* The fluctuations occurred both within the

grades, and as between the grades. A good deal of a pilot's income was dependent on luck, and not necessarily on the volume of shipping trade. One might have a big volume of trade coming to the port, but an individual pilot's earnings might be very small on account of his getting ballast ships, which paid a very much smaller fee than deep ships. A branch pilot had to deal with a very large number of ballast ships—quite as many as any other grade in the service.

79,825. The fluctuations of pay showed that in some years the master pilot's pay came to within a reasonable amount of a branch pilot's pay. He thought that the calculations which had been made by the Government of Bengal for 1911, and which showed that a branch pilot's pay was Rs. 2,318 and a master pilot's pay Rs. 1,337, had been framed without regard to the number of branch pilots on leave. The average number of branch pilots running in 1911 was 14.74. This grade consisted of 18 pilots. Of late, junior masters had been unfortunate; they had not had their due proportion of the pilotage.

79,826. With the increased volume of shipping trade in the Hughli, the tendency was for an increase in the proportion of larger ships. Every year the smaller ships became less numerous. He agreed, therefore, that the tendency in the future must be in the direction of even greater disparities, unless the scale of tonnage was regulated from time to time, as indeed it was. The pay of the various grades was determined by tonnage, and in order to keep the pay of each grade at a reasonable amount, the tonnage scale had periodically to be adjusted. Sometimes actual results did not fulfil expectations, and probably one grade or other suffered. It was a very difficult problem to solve.

79,827. It would be possible to formulate a scheme by which the whole of the fees could be pooled, but if such a scheme were attempted, the service would have to be very considerably increased, because men were not going to work as hard for a fixed salary as they would under competitive conditions. Pilots did certain things under present conditions which, if he were given a fixed salary, he would never think of doing. Payment by fees for work done acted as an incentive. As a means of getting over the present difficulty he would suggest a reduction in the number of pilots. He thought there were too many pilots at present. If the number of pilots was reduced, the branch's grade would still consist of 18 officers, and the reduction would be in the lower grades with the result that the pilots in those grades would individually get more pay.

79,828. Ordinarily the commanders of the pilot vessels were branch pilots, who, by reason of commanding such ships, sacrificed a very considerable sum, but at present that was not the case, because one commander had no inclination for pilotage and the other one was not allowed by Government to pilot.

79,829. There was a great disparity as between pension and pay. If the pension were to be increased, and if it were considered inadvisable to increase the charges for the service, he thought the pilots in his service would be prepared to forego a certain amount of their salary in order to have a higher pension. They were not, however, prepared to bear the whole charge of an increased pension or hand over to Government a large sum in back payments as former schemes had suggested.

79,830. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) When he said that his service was competitive, he meant that the emoluments of each individual member of the service depended very largely upon his own efforts.

79,831. His service would undoubtedly see grave objections to conferring the command of pilot steamers on officers of the Indian Marine. There were already three Port Officers at one end, and they did not want another Indian Marine officer at the other end. He objected to the appointment of an Indian Marine officer on the ground of his absolute want of competency for dealing with pilot affairs.

79,832. At present the Port Officer was the officer responsible for deciding all questions regarding the roster. He would like to see those questions dealt with by an officer of his own service. It was well known

* *Vide* Appendix II.

21 January 1914.]

Messrs. C. G. BUDGE and G. F. THORPE.

[Continued.]

that in many cases a Port Officer was not competent to decide matters connected with the Pilot Service, simply because he lacked the necessary experience of the pilotage of the river Hughli and the rules and customs of the service.

79,833. The surveying of the river channels was not in the hands of the Port Officer, but in the hands of the Port Commissioners, and his service complained that they were not sufficiently consulted in regard to surveys. They were only approached as a last resource.

79,834. Mr. THORPE explained that the pilotage funds were used for many objects other than pilotage, and that if they were devoted solely to pilotage there would probably be an ample margin for increased charges on account of pensions, &c.

79,835. (Mr. Sly.) Mr. BUDGE said that in 1904 the number of pilots was increased from 52 to 58 as the result of an inquiry into the shipping of the port. He disagreed with the findings of that committee.

79,836. There was no conflict of interests between the pilot and the vessels waiting for a pilot. Vessels were all registered in their turn, and they were supplied with pilots in turn. Ships had sometimes to wait owing to the new rule by which commanders of vessels were allowed to take pilots off at their own discretion in bad weather without giving them a chance of getting off. Mr. THORPE said that some delay in taking vessels up and down the river was inevitable under certain conditions, no matter how many pilots there were in the service.

79,837. Mr. BUDGE said that in his opinion the training which could be given on the steam pilot vessel was just as good as that given in former days on the pilot brig on account of the disappearance of the sailing ship. Mr. THORPE pointed out that the three years which he wanted to give the young entrant into the service would not be spent on the steamer, but would be spent in running up and down the river with the pilot in steamers of all classes. That was the way the old pilots gained their experience. They did not gain it on the pilot brig.

79,838. Mr. BUDGE said that he objected to the pooling system because it would result in a certain proportion of lazy men slacking. He did not know whether the pooling system was in force at Bombay.

79,839. With regard to his complaint as to pilots being carried off to sea he mentioned that since the steamship companies had been relieved of the charges incurred by doing this, a greater number had been carried off—13 pilots were carried off in one week. Such a thing had never occurred before. The remedy was to make the steamship companies pay.

79,840. He did not wish to see the periodical

medical examination abolished, provided that some equivalent was given in the shape of a better pension.

79,841. With regard to the complaint about fines in cases of misdemeanour it had often been the system to cut a man's pay by half. That meant that Government was securing a certain amount of money as the result of their misdeeds of their servants, which hardly seemed right. It also meant that there was another man on the list who was competing equally with his colleagues in the service, but the service was not getting the benefit of more than 50 per cent. of his energies.

79,842. The recommendation that there should be a compulsory rule for retirement at 55 was not agreed to by some members of the service who were near that age. The junior members were in favour of it.

79,843. (Mr. Fisher.) The periodical readjustment of tonnage was carried out by the Secretary to Government, in consultation with members of the Pilot Service, and the Port Officer. It gave satisfaction for a time.

79,844. The leave rules of the service were very antiquated and ungenerous. Men now had to serve 10 years before any furlough was due to them, and then they were allowed two years' leave, which was a great deal too much at one time.

79,845. There was no place in India where members of the domiciled community could receive a training for the Pilot Service. It was not merely the small details of a nautical training that were required. A training on the "Worcester" and "Conway" taught boys to become officers, and that was the essential objects for which those two ships were instituted.

79,846. (Mr. Madge.) The necessary reduction in the number of pilots could be effected if vacancies were not filled up for a time. He could imagine no objection to that on the part of the Government or of the service.

79,847. (Mr. Lindquist.) If he were on a fixed salary he would give the ship he was piloting a much larger margin of draft in crossing a bar; he would not be in such a hurry. Therefore ships would take longer to get up and down in the river.

79,848. (Chairman.) There were bars in the river which might be saved by a little extra pluck, or by starting a little earlier at the other end. Pilots were not called upon to do that sort of thing, but they did it in order to earn more money and the ship also benefited by a quicker passage.

79,849. (Mr. Lindquist.) Under present conditions he very frequently invited an engineer to go a little faster, but it would not be within his province to do this if he were not competing with his brother officers, but was on a fixed salary.

The witnesses withdrew.

C. J. KERR, Esq., representative of the Port Commissioners, Calcutta.

Written Statement relating to the Bengal Pilot Service by the Commissioners for the Port of Calcutta.

79,850. In 1903 the Marine Committee of the Commissioners, in connection with an enquiry instituted by Government into certain matters relating to the Bengal Pilot Service, made a report to the Commissioners in which various questions relating to the methods of recruitment and training for the Service, and conditions of service, were dealt with. This report, being appended to the report of the Government Committee, is presumably in your hands, and it is not necessary to recapitulate the views then expressed. The Commissioners, in dealing with the present reference, have now reconsidered the recommendations made and the opinions expressed by their Marine Committee in 1903. The most important of these was the recommendation that the administration of the Pilot Service should be transferred to the Port Commissioners. This is a question which they do not regard as coming within the scope of this enquiry, and they do not therefore propose to deal with it in the present connection. They would state, however,

their belief that the Service as at present administered gives entire satisfaction to the shipping of the port, and it has still to be shown that the transfer would result in actual practical benefits, either in the reduction of the cost of pilotage or in increased efficiency. On the other points enumerated in your letter I am desired by the Commissioners to reply as follows.

79,851. (i) Method of Recruitment and (ii) System of Training.—While there would seem to be force in the views expressed by the Committee of 1903 on these two matters, it appears to the Commissioners that if, with these views before them, Government have adhered to the old system, there must be sufficient reasons for doing so, and that Government consider service as leadsmen apprentices for a period of five years to be still the best method of training for the Pilot Service. Possibly, also, the reason may be found either in the difficulty of obtaining probationers holding master's certificates or in the financial effect of the

21 January 1914.]

Mr. C. J. KERR.

[Continued.]

change. The Committee of 1903 apparently contemplated that under the change they recommended the probationary pay should remain the same, which would be impossible if the probationers were older men holding master's certificates. Here again, the Commissioners are not satisfied that the altered system which they previously suggested would actually result in economy or increased efficiency.

79,852. (iii) to (vi) **Conditions of Service, Salary, Leave and Pension.**—So long as the Service is administered by Government the Commissioners consider that these are questions to be dealt with by Government, and they do not feel themselves called upon to express any views in regard to them. It is true that their Committee in 1903 did express opinions on these points, but the Commissioners conclude that those suggestions have been considered by the Authorities possessing a more intimate knowledge of the working of the Service and of the interests of the pilots themselves, and that, as in the foregoing case, there were good reasons for not accepting them.

79,853. (vii) **Limitations in the Employment of non-Europeans.**—The Service is already open to Anglo-Indians as well as to Europeans, the number of vacancies available for local candidates being at the discretion of the Local Government. There is no demand on the part of natives of India for admission to the Pilot Service nor, so far as can be seen, is such a demand ever likely to arise. That no native of India with sufficient education to enable him to pass the examinations for the Mercantile Marine and the Pilot Service aspires to a seafaring life, is shown by the fact that even vessels under Indian ownership are commanded, officered and engineered by Europeans, indicating that Indians themselves are unable to find countrymen of their own qualified to take responsible positions on board ships. This was pointed out by the representatives of the Chamber of Commerce before the Royal Commission in 1887, and the position has not altered in any way since their evidence was given.

79,854. ANNEXURE.

THE COMMISSIONERS FOR THE PORT OF CALCUTTA.

Report of the Marine Committee on the Bengal Pilot Service, dated 22nd July 1903.

(1) The Vice-Chairman, who has been deputed by the Port Commissioners to be their representative on the Committee appointed by Government to enquire into various questions connected with the Bengal Pilot Service, has asked for an expression of the views of the Commissioners on the subject, in order that they may be laid before the Committee. The Marine Committee have accordingly, at three meetings held specially to consider the subject, gone very fully into the various questions affecting the constitution and administration of the Bengal Pilot Service, which are hereinafter referred to.

Recruitment of Pilot Service.

(2) The first question requiring to be noticed is the manner of recruiting the service. At present the service is recruited from the following two sources:—

(a) By nomination by the Secretary of State from the training ships "Conway" and "Worcester." The nomination is considered the highest prize obtainable, and the young men appointed are generally those who have secured the King's medal. These young men, after passing out to the training ships, are required to go to sea and obtain a second mate's certificate, after which they join in Calcutta as leadsmen apprentices.

(b) The second source of recruitment is from locally selected candidates who are required to appear at a competitive examination in Calcutta. This was a concession made by Government in favour of the domiciled community. These candidates must not be less than 18 nor more than 22 years of age, and they also must produce a certificate of second mate at least.

(3) The nominees from the training ships and the locally selected candidates draw the same salaries, enjoy

the same privileges, and serve the same period of training as leadsmen apprentices. The leadsmen apprentices are divided into the following four classes:—

- | | |
|--------------------------|--------------------------|
| (a) First mates, | (c) Second mates, |
| (b) Senior running list, | (d) Junior running list, |

and are attached to the three pilot brigs and the R.I.M. steamship "Guide." Under present arrangements they are partly trained as officers on board the pilot brigs, partly as officers of the R.I.M. "Guide" and partly in running up and down the river as leadsmen. They may not, however, as implied by the name, be necessarily occupied in heaving the lead. In actual practice they are at times on the bridge with the pilot or otherwise employed. The course of training usually extends to about five years, when they are eligible for examination as mate pilots and are promoted when vacancies occur, their average age being then about 27 years. One point to which attention is invited is that during the term of apprenticeship the salaries and messing allowances of apprentices are a charge on the pilotage dues. Another point is that no higher qualification is required than that of a second mate's certificate.

(4) The Committee are unanimously of opinion that, instead of service being recruited as heretofore, it would be better to recruit it uniformly from officers of the Mercantile Marine holding master's certificates. That such men are obtainable at a suitable age, say from 26 to 27, has been proved by the fact that the Commissioners' Service of Assistant Harbour Masters is now successfully recruited in this way. The greater attractiveness of the Bengal Pilot Service would give the Government a wide selection of the very best men in the Mercantile Marine, men already possessing as qualified masters the skill and experience required in the handling of large vessels and only needing training in local knowledge to qualify as pilots. A probation of a year or so would be sufficient to enable them to appear for examination. This has also been proved in the past when the service was partly recruited by licensed pilots, of whom there are now six in the branch pilot grade.

(5) The conditions, moreover, under which the river is navigated have greatly changed in recent years, vessels being now navigated at a high rate of speed with the assistance of the river charts and other hydrographic information, which from day to day are made available by the River Survey Department. Under these changed conditions the training of leadsmen has lost its value, and it would be better that, instead of this training, the apprentices should serve some months on the survey vessels, as in that way the probationers would learn more of the bed of the river, the tides, the limits of the channels, &c., than they ever could learn on board vessels running at a high rate of speed up and down the river. The financial advantage would be that the charge on the pilotage dues for maintenance of the apprentices would be reduced from five to one or two years, a limit being placed on the period of probation.

Constitution of Service.

(6) The Committee are of opinion that the Bengal Pilot Service should be constituted on much the same lines as other departments in the Public Service, and with the same privileges in regard to leave, allowances and pensions as are enjoyed by other officers of Government. There are two reasons for this proposal. The first is that the public will have a greater confidence in a service of this character than in an open service of licensed pilots. Another reason is that Government would have a better control. It would mean that the pensions to which pilots would be entitled on their retirement would be greatly increased. At present the pensions are as follows:—

	Rs.
Branch pilots	200 per mensem.
Other	100 "

21 January 1914.]

Mr. C. J. KEER.

[Continued.]

Scale of Remuneration.

(7) Only two of the pilots now remaining in the service are entitled to 60 per cent. of the pilotage dues on the ships piloted by them. The others receive only 50 per cent. Excluding the two above mentioned, whose monthly earnings in 1902 amounted to Rs. 2,717, the average earnings of the several grades were as follows:—

	Branch Pilots.	Senior Masters.	Junior Masters.	Mate Pilots.
	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.
For five years, 1893-97.	1,457	975	710	429
For five years, 1898-1902.	1,923	1,245	835	593
For one year, 1902	2,107	1,159	743	625

(8) The fact that the pilots have been in receipt of these incomes of recent years must be taken into consideration in determining what income should be assured to the service in future. On the other hand, allowance must be made for the better pensions that will accrue to them under the present proposals. The conditions as to the pilotage of the Hooghly are of so special a character that no comparison can be made between this Pilot Service and the Pilot Services in other large ports of the British Empire. It may, however, be generally stated that the earnings of the Bengal Pilot Service are very greatly in excess of the salaries of the captains of the Royal Navy and Royal Indian Marine, and also of the captains of the best lines of steamers in the Mercantile Marine. The Committee accordingly are of opinion that salaries on the following scale should attract to the service the very best class of officers from the last-mentioned service, namely:—

	Rs.
First grade or branch pilots	1,500 per mensem.
Second „	1,000 „
Third „	750 „

Probationary pilots to receive the same salaries and allowances as are now paid to leadsmen apprentices. It will be observed that these proposals reduce the difference in salaries between the branch pilots and the next grade, and also reduce the number of grades from 4 to 3.

Numerical Strength.

(9) The Committee wish to lay stress upon the necessity that the numerical strength of the service should be sufficiently high to preclude the possibility of detention to the shipping as has sometimes happened in the past.

Steam Pilot Vessels.

(10) An important improvement is the substitution of steam pilot vessels for the existing sailing brigs. The arguments in favour of the change are obvious and need not be repeated. The Committee are informed that the Government have this question under consideration and have indeed called for an estimate of cost, but the matter should nevertheless be pressed upon the attention of Government.

Application for Pilots.

(11) The existing practice with regard to applications for pilots would appear to require amendment. The master or agent of a vessel may under present arrangements apply for the same pilot to take his vessel down the river as brought her up, provided he is in a grade eligible to pilot vessels of that tonnage.

(12) At one time the master or agent of a vessel was allowed to choose the pilot who should pilot the vessel to sea, but this gave rise to so much dissatisfaction amongst the pilots that they memorialised the Government (Sir Ashley Eden being then the Lieu-

tenant Governor) to abolish such system, and the privilege of selection allowed to the agents and masters was thereupon restricted to that now existing of allowing them to give preference only to the pilot that brought the vessel up. It is claimed in favour of this arrangement that the pilot being interested in the vessel, makes it his business to help the agent or master with advice as to the draft to which his vessel may be loaded. It is further claimed that in bringing the vessel up the river the pilot has an opportunity of acquiring a knowledge of the special qualities of that vessel, which will be helpful to him in afterwards taking her to sea. The first argument has little value and need not be noticed. To the second, it may be replied that the majority of the vessels trading to Calcutta come and go at such regular intervals that the special qualities of the vessel become well known; besides the master or officers of the vessel are always at hand to advise the pilots on this point.

(13) On the other hand, there are strong objections to the practice. In the first place, it continues, although in a diminished degree, the making of an invidious distinction between one individual and another, and in a service where the men are all competent there is no reason for such a distinction to be made. Secondly, the master of the vessel may be put to considerable difficulty and loss in respect to the loading of his vessel should the exigencies of the service have taken a pilot away from Calcutta, because the master would in such case be put about to get the exact information he required as to the allowable draft and the most suitable day for sailing. Thirdly, the practice implies that the allowable draft is variable, according to the opinions of individual pilots, one being prepared to allow a certain draft and others some inches more or less. This does not seem to be a question that should be left for settlement according to the views of each individual pilot. The allowable draft for a particular day should be authoritatively fixed some days ahead for each vessel according to her speed and build, and modified from day to day as may be necessitated by altered conditions of the river bars and tides, such information being exhibited on a board for public reference in the Port Office.

Trial of Pilots.

(14) The question is asked by Government as to whether it is necessary or desirable to revise Act XII. of 1859 in order to bring it more into accordance with the present conditions and requirements. The Port Commissioners have really no concern at present with the revision of this Act, as it refers to matters connected with the maintenance of discipline and the trial of pilots. Government having the control of the Pilotage Department, it is for Government to make such rules as they may think proper; and although the Act question lays down a special procedure for the trial of pilots, it is but very rarely that such procedure is brought into operation. The pilots would appear, however, to be commonly dealt with under section 21 of that Act, which provides as follows:—

“Nothing contained in this Act shall be held to restrict the Marine authorities of the Government from passing such orders as may be deemed proper upon any charge of breach of duty preferred against any person employed in the said Pilot Service, when it shall not be deemed necessary that such person should be brought to trial for such breach of duty under the provisions of this Act.”

(15) But, taking a broad view of the question, there appears to be no reason why the regulation in respect to the trial of pilots should be in any way different to those respecting the trial of masters and officers of the Mercantile Marine. The Merchant Shipping Act, however, does not include pilots, but only masters, mates and engineers. The Court of Enquiry in regard to which the Commissioners lately offered suggestions is the Court assembled under the Merchant Shipping Act not to try pilots but to elucidate the causes of the accident. The trial of pilot comes after that if the finding of such Court of Enquiry should implicate him.

21 January 1914.]

Mr. C. J. KERE.

[Continued.]

Administration of the Pilot Service.

(16) The Committee lastly would urge that the administration of the Pilot Service should be transferred to the Port Commissioners. The circumstances all point to the advisability of this change. To the Commissioners are entrusted the conservation of the river and its approaches and their improvement, the improvement of the conditions and facilities required for the commerce of the port and its future needs, and the study of the economical advantages of the locality and of the best methods for ensuring the despatch of vessels as well as the handling of their cargoes. The Commissioners, therefore, are in close touch with all the requirements of the shipping, and all the resources of the port are theirs. The Pilot Service is but an integral part of the general operations of the port, and

it is an anomaly that it should be under separate management; and it would seem to follow that the Port Trust of Calcutta should administer all the affairs of the port, and, as at Liverpool and other large ports in the United Kingdom and in India, be the controlling authority in regard to all matters connected with the pilotage of vessels. It is a change that would also be likely to result in considerable economy in administration.

C. E. BUCKLAND, *Chairman.*
 F. G. DUMAYNE, *Vice-Chairman.*
 W. CHANDLER,
 A. A. APCAR,
 JAMES TURNER,
 RIVERS G. CURRIE, } *Members*

Mr. C. J. KERE called and examined.

79,855. (*Chairman.*) The Port Commissioners as now constituted differed from the view taken by the Committee of the Port Commissioners, 1903, on the question of recruitment and training for the Pilot Service. The present Commissioners were not of the opinion that the proposals then made would result in economic or increased efficiency. They were satisfied with the present system. The general opinion of the Port Commissioners was that the present training produced a very fine body of men, and they did not see how it could be improved upon. Notwithstanding an increased volume of shipping up the Hughli, there had been a decrease of serious accidents.

79,856. The statement made in 1903 that the earnings obtainable by the Bengal Pilot Service were considerably higher than those which could be earned by captains in the Royal Navy or the Royal Indian Marine, or by officers in charge of ordinary merchants vessels, still held good at the present day.

79,857. The pay of a branch pilot was very high in comparison with the pension, and it would be an advantage to the service to make some attempt to adjust the disproportion. It would be a fairer division if the pension were a little higher, and the pay not quite so high. He spoke particularly with regard to branch pilots.

79,858. The disparities of pay as between the grades of the services could, to a certain extent, be removed by a readjustment of the tonnage dues. In his opinion the time was due for a readjustment. His opinion was that the junior pilots received too little and the senior men too much. The pooling system which had been suggested required some consideration, but it seemed a sound suggestion. He certainly thought there might be something in the system and suggested that a scheme should be worked out by financial experts. A fixed salary system should not affect either the safety or the rapidity with which ships were taken down the Hughli, and under proper regulations and discipline it would not.

79,859. It might be advisable definitely to earmark a number of vacancies in the Pilot Service for the domiciled community if the members of that community had the necessary qualifications. He would not go so far as to say that it was absolutely necessary for men selected in India to go to England and have the same training on the training ships as the officer recruited in Europe, but there was no doubt that a training in England on the "Conway" or "Worcester"

helped to build up the character of a man and to give him a sense of discipline.

79,860. (*Mr. Madge.*) He approved of the present system of five years' training. He would not include in those five years four years' experience in a sailing vessel, as he did not think it was necessary. Recruits obtained sufficient deep sea training in the "Conway" and "Worcester," where they spent three years.

79,861. It was the fact that four years' training in a sailing vessel was demanded, and that this was an impossible condition for Anglo-Indians to fulfil. The only remedy for the difficulty would be to send Anglo-Indians to England.

79,862. If appointments at the top of the Pilot Service were abolished as they were vacated, and the fees now payable were distributed amongst a smaller number of officers, the prospects of the service would be improved, and some of the present discontent would be removed; but the question was one which would require very careful consideration, because the Port of Calcutta must not be left with too few pilots. Fifty per cent. of the pilotage fees was put into the general revenue of Government. It was possible that a proportion of that might be devoted to the service, so as to improve its prospects, but it was a question of getting Government to agree to it. Such a scheme would not affect the port charges at all.

79,863. He was not prepared to say whether he would approve of a member of the Pilot Service being taken into the Port Office to advise on questions relating to the Pilot Service. The opinion of the Port Commissioners was that the present system had worked satisfactorily.

79,864. (*Mr. Fisher.*) He agreed with the view that the leave rules of the Pilot Service were antiquated, and ought to be thoroughly remodelled.

79,865. The Port Commissioners were satisfied with the present position of the Survey Service, but it was very important that the Survey and the Pilot Services should be in close co-ordination. At present the Pilot Service was under the Port Officer, and the Survey was under the Port Commissioners. It might be better to have them both under one head.

79,866-80,043. (*Mr. Sly.*) He had no reason to suppose that the present number of pilots was excessive. Speaking from the steamship companies' point of view, he thought that the present staff of pilots was sufficient for the work of the port.

The witness withdrew.

APPENDIX I.

LIST OF APPENDICES.

- I.—STATEMENT showing the PERIODS spent in each GRADE by SIX BRANCH PILOTS on the LIST.
 II.—STATEMENT showing the AVERAGE EARNINGS of PILOTS.
 III.—MEMORANDUM prepared by the GOVERNMENT of BENGAL relating to the BENGAL PILOT SERVICE.
 IV.—STATEMENT of the CIVIL APPOINTMENTS on Rs. 200 a month and over held by EUROPEANS, ANGLO-INDIANS, and INDIANS on the 1st April 1913, in the BENGAL PILOT SERVICE.
 V.—REGULATIONS relating to APPOINTMENTS by the SECRETARY OF STATE FOR INDIA to the BENGAL COVENANTED PILOT SERVICE.

APPENDIX I.

(Referred to in paragraph 79,775—Commander Forteach's evidence.)

STATEMENT showing the PERIODS spent in each GRADE by SIX BRANCH PILOTS on the LIST.

Names.	Leadsman Apprentice.	Second Mate Leadsman.	First Mate Leadsman.	Mate Pilot.	Junior Master Pilot.	Senior Master Pilot.	Branch Pilot.
C. G. Stock	28th Oct. 1877 to 17th Oct. 1879.	18th Oct. 1879 to 17th Oct. 1881.	18th Oct. 1881 to 8th Oct. 1882.	9th Oct. 1882 to 18th Oct. 1886.	19th Oct. 1886 to 13th June 1891.	14th June 1891 to 13th June 1897.	14th June 1897.
A. W. J. Turner	31st Oct. 1879 to 26th Jan. 1882.	27th Jan. 1882 to 29th June 1885.	30th June 1885 to 5th May 1886.	6th May 1886 to 24th June 1890.	25th June 1890 to 4th July 1895.	5th July 1895 to 12th Nov. 1902.	13th Nov. 1902.
E. W. J. Bartlett	10th Jan. 1878 to 22nd May 1881.	23rd May 1881 to 1st Mar. 1887.	2nd Mar. 1887 to 24th Mar. 1888.	25th Mar. 1888 to 3rd June 1894.	4th June 1894 to 5th Mar. 1897.	6th Mar. 1897 to 27th Mar. 1904.	28th Mar. 1904.
J. Sherman	28th Oct. 1883 to 29th Oct. 1885.	30th Oct. 1885 to 24th June 1888.	25th June 1888 to 3rd Sept. 1890.	4th Sept. 1890 to 23rd Aug. 1894.	24th Aug. 1894 to 22nd July 1899.	23rd July 1899 to 3rd July 1904.	4th July 1904.
G. U. Mellard	27th Oct. 1884 to 31st Oct. 1886.	1st Nov. 1886 to 27th Mar. 1889.	28th Mar. 1889 to 2nd Feb. 1891.	3rd Feb. 1891 to 6th Apr. 1895.	7th Apr. 1895 to 9th Jan. 1900.	10th Jan. 1900 to 14th Feb. 1905.	15th Feb. 1905.
H. S. Tozer	27th Oct. 1884 to 31st Oct. 1886.	1st Nov. 1886 to 24th June 1889.	25th June 1889 to 22nd Aug. 1891.	23rd Aug. 1891 to 18th June 1895.	19th June 1895 to 20th July 1900.	21st July 1900 to 2nd Feb. 1906.	3rd Feb. 1906.

APPENDIX II.

(Referred to in paragraph 79,824—evidence of Messrs. Budge and Thorpe.)

STATEMENT showing the AVERAGE EARNINGS of PILOTS.

Year.	Branch Pilots.		Senior Master Pilots.		Junior Master Pilots.		Mate Pilot.	
	Number of Running Pilots.	Average Earnings of each Pilot.	Number of Running Pilots.	Average Earnings of each Pilot.	Number of Running Pilots.	Average Earnings of each Pilot.	Number of Running Pilots.	Average Earnings of each Pilot.
1900	10.55	Rs. 1,986	9.57	Rs. 1,535	6.77	Rs. 938	7	Rs. 731
1901	12	2,057	11.97	1,183	4.84	798	5	600
1902	12	2,101	11	1,159	5.64	743	5	625
1903	12	2,173	10	1,227	6	743	5	517
1904	14	2,175	10	1,305	5	865	7	507
1905	14	2,137	8	1,507	6	1,013	8	725
1906	14	2,112	10	1,657	5	989	7	641
1907	15	2,096	10	1,556	5	936	5	795
1908	15	2,201	12	1,265	5	848	6	540
1909	*15	2,096	*12.73	1,212	*5.83	785	*6.58	515
1910	15	2,154	13	1,255	5	784	7	553
1911	14.74	2,318	12.66	1,337	4	764	7	582

* The figures for running pilots are for nine months, viz., from 1st April to 31st December 1909.

APPENDIX III.

MEMORANDUM prepared by the GOVERNMENT OF BENGAL relating to the BENGAL PILOT SERVICE.

(1) *Present Regulations as to Recruitment, Training, and Probation, and whether they are satisfactory.*

The service is recruited both in England and in India. Entry to the service is confined to Europeans or the descendants of European or Eurasian parents domiciled in India of between 18 and 22 years of age. Candidates are required to possess a Board of Trade or Colonial certificates of competency as 2nd mate or any higher grade and evidence of having served at sea for not less than three years in a square-rigged sailing vessel of over 300 tons. Candidates appointed in England are usually recruited from the training ships "Conway" and "Worcester," and are granted a free second-class passage to India and an outfit allowance of 20*l*. There is no differentiation in the terms of service between the candidates appointed in England and those appointed in India. In India candidates are appointed by the Government of Bengal after a competitive examination held at Calcutta, usually in the month of April, and the number of vacancies allotted to such candidates is left to the discretion of the Local Government.

All candidates are required to serve an apprenticeship of 5 years in the leadsmen apprentice grade, which period may, in exceptional circumstances, be reduced to 4½ years with the sanction of the Local Government; whilst in this grade candidates are required to undergo a course of training in the duties of a pilot and pass periodical examinations; failure for the third time usually results in the removal of the leadsmen.

These regulations have generally worked satisfactorily so far as can be observed from the results.

(2) *Rates of Pay and Allowances in force in 1890 and 1900 and at the present time, and whether the present Rates of Pay and Allowances are satisfactory.*

Pilots are remunerated by a share of the pilotage fees, paid by the ships piloted by them, as fixed by the Government of Bengal, the present rate being 50 per cent. When on leave or special duty, pilots receive allowances according to the rates fixed for their rank; the subjoined figures show the rates of grade allowances and average earnings per mensem of pilots during the years 1890, 1900, and 1912:—

	Grade Allowances. (1890, 1900 and 1912).	Average Earnings.		
		1890.	1900.	1912.
Branch Pilots -	Rs. 1,000	Rs. 1,225	Rs. 1,986	Rs. 2,364
Senior Master Pilots.	700	818	1,535	1,165
Junior Master Pilots.	700	536	938	580
Mate Pilots -	400	301	731	601

The above figures show a considerable drop in the average earnings by junior master pilots and mate pilots since the year 1900, and efforts have been made recently to readjust the tonnage regulations so as to secure a more equitable distribution of the pilots' earnings. The general increase in the earnings of pilots since 1890 appears to require a readjustment of the rates fixed for the calculation of leave and special duty allowance, and the Governor in Council is of opinion that these might be taken in future at Rs. 2,000 for branch pilots, Rs. 1,200 for senior

master pilots, Rs. 700 for junior master pilots and Rs. 500 for mate pilots.

(3) *The number of Pilots in each Grade and the provision made in the Cadre for Leave and Training.*

The sanctioned number of pilots of all grades is 58, of which 18 are branch pilots, 30 master pilots and 10 mate pilots, and the sanctioned number of leadsmen apprentices is 16. Of the total number of pilots 9 are allowed to be on long leave at one and the same time and 3 on privilege leave. These limits are sometimes exceeded when the condition of trade permits of it.

(4) *What Appointments outside the authorised Cadre are held temporarily, or otherwise, by Officers of various services.*

None.

(5) *Whether any addition is required to the present Cadre.*

No circumstances have arisen to warrant an increase in the cadre.

6. *Pensions.*—The question of the pensions granted to members of this service has not been referred by the Commission for the opinion of this Government, but in view of its special importance and the representations made by the pilots on the subject, the Governor in Council desires to make a brief reference to it. The rates of retiring pensions were fixed in the year 1821, when the salaries earned by pilots were much smaller than those earned by them at the present time, while the value of the rupee was much higher and the cost of living in Calcutta was but a fraction of its cost to-day.

The rates of retiring pensions after a service of 30 years, are (as they were in 1821) for—

Branch Pilots	-	Rs. 200 per mensem.
Any lower rank	-	" 100 "

Invalid Pension.

Branch Pilot	-	Rs. 200 per mensem.
Master	"	" 100 "
Mate Pilot	"	" 60 "
Leadsmen Apprentices if appointed after 3rd October 1909.	A	gratuity under article 479 (a) of the Civil Service Regulations.

Superannuation Pensions.

The same as invalid pensions.

These pensions are governed by Articles 678, 679, and 682 of the Civil Service Regulations.

Contributions are made towards pensions for widows and children as follows:—

	Contribution.	PENSIONS.			
		Widows.	Children.		
Branch Pilots	Rs. 40	Rs. 100	Daughter until the age of 10.	Daughter over 10 years and until marriage.	Son until the age of 15.
Master	" 20	50	—	—	—
Mate	" 10	30	Rs. 14	Rs. 20	Rs. 12

APPENDIX III. (continued).

These contributions have been calculated as amounting to half the liabilities.

This question of pensions has formed the subject of memorials to Government on several occasions during the last 30 years, but it has not been found possible hitherto to take any action favourable to the memorialists. The recent drop in the earnings of the pilots in the lower ranks of the service, combined with the great increase in the cost of living in Calcutta, has, however, undoubtedly strengthened the case for the reconsideration of the rates set out above, as it has become increasingly difficult for the members of the service to make any provision for their retirement, especially if they are married, until they reach the grade of branch pilot, while slowness of promotion and the arduous nature of a pilot's duties, with the risk of a failure in health and eyesight, which might unfit him for those duties, render more imminent the possibility of retirement becoming necessary before the rank of branch pilot has been reached.

In 1907 a Committee was appointed to enquire (*inter alia*) into the subject of the pension of the Pilot Service, and on this Committee were three members of that service.

At the instance of this Committee, calculations were made by the Deputy Comptroller-General, to see what would be the additional expenditure involved if pensions based on the rules applicable to Uncovenanted Officers were given instead of the existing scale. The result of the calculations made showed that it would be tantamount to an addition of Rs. 281 a year to the salary earned by each pilot throughout the period of service. It was agreed that, if it was decided to levy

this contribution from the members of the service, a fair contribution would be—

Branch Pilots - - - -	Rs. 50
Senior Master Pilots - - -	„ 40
Junior „ „ - - - -	„ 25
Mate Pilot - - - -	„ 20

The members of the Pilot Service were, however, unwilling to contribute the whole cost of the improvement of their pensions or to consent to the establishment of a Provident Fund to which Government would not contribute. They have invariably claimed that some share of the cost should be borne by Government, out of the surplus revenue, which annually accrues to Government from pilotage fees.

In all the circumstances of the case, the Governor in Council is inclined to the view that this question of the improvement of pensions in this service requires further consideration, on the lines that have been suggested, and His Excellency is having enquiries made as to the actual expenditure incurred under all heads on the work of pilotage and the proportion it bears to the share of the fees received by Government. The high average earnings of branch pilots, as compared with the salaries given to officers of Government in other branches of the Government service, suggest that a scheme for contributory pensions is suitable for this service, and while the above enquiries are being conducted an attempt will be made to devise a scheme of this kind, which will meet the reasonable requirements of the case without imposing any undue burden upon the resources of Government. In the meantime it is hoped that the Royal Commission will see fit to take this question up and to include it within the scope of their report.

APPENDIX IV.

STATEMENT of the CIVIL APPOINTMENTS on Rs. 200 a Month and over held by EUROPEANS, ANGLO-INDIANS, and INDIANS on the 1st April 1913, in the BENGAL PILOT SERVICE.

Pay.	Number of Employés in each Grade or Class.															
	Total.	Europeans.	Anglo-Indians.	Hindus (including Sikhs and Parsis).										Indian Christians.	Buddhists	
				Brahmans (including Shenvis).	Kshatryas.	Kaiyasthas (including Prabhus).	Baniyas and Vaisyas.	Sudras.	Other Hindus (i.e., other than those shown in cols. 5 to 9).	Total Hindus (cols. 5 to 10).	Sikhs.	Parsis.	Total Hindus, Sikhs, and Parsis (cols. 11 to 13).			
1.	2.	3.	4.	5.	6.	7.	8.	9.	10.	11.	12.	13.	14.	15.	16.	17.
Rs.																
300—400	4	2	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
400—500	5	5	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
500—600	2	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
600—700	2	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
700—800	11	9	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
800—900	3	1	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,000—1,200	9	4	5	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,200—1,400	4	2	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,600—1,800	3	3	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,800—2,000	1	—	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
2,000—2,500	8	7	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
2,500—3,000	2	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
3,000—3,500	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Total -	55	39	16	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—

NOTE.—The scales of pay shown in this statement are based on the earnings of the officers concerned for March 1913.

APPENDIX V.

REGULATIONS relating to APPOINTMENTS by the SECRETARY OF STATE FOR INDIA to the BENGAL COVENANTED PILOT SERVICE.

Conditions of Admission.

1. Appointments to the Bengal Pilot Service are made by the Secretary of State for India and by the Government of Bengal; the latter appointments are limited to Anglo-Indians and Eurasians and are made under separate regulations. In the case of appointments made by the Secretary of State, preference will be given, *ceteris paribus*, to candidates who have passed through one of the training ships "Worcester" and "Conway."

2. Candidates for the Secretary of State's appointments must be not less than 18 and not more than 22 years of age. They must produce a Board of Trade or Colonial Certificate of Competency as a Second Mate, or any higher grade, for a foreign-going ship, and evidence of having served at sea not less than two years in a square-rigged sailing vessel of over 300 tons.

3. Every candidate must produce satisfactory evidence as to age and character, and selected candidates are required to appear before the Medical Board at the India Office for examination as to their physical fitness for the work of a Pilot in a tropical climate.

Regulations.

4. A selected candidate, if passed by the Medical Board, will receive a second-class passage to Calcutta and an allowance of 20*l.* for outfit. If he resigns or leaves the service before he has served five years he will be required to refund the cost of his passage to India and the outfit allowance, unless his resignation is due to ill-health certified in the manner prescribed by the Government of India. He will have to give an undertaking with two sureties for such refund.

5. A Leadsman Apprentice, on arriving at Calcutta, will report himself to the Port Officer, and will receive Rs. 107 a month from the date of his arrival, to enable him to support himself in Calcutta and to pay his mess money when on board the pilot brigs.

6. A Leadsman Apprentice will go through such a course of training and pass such examinations as the Government of Bengal may from time to time prescribe. The rates of pay and allowances of Leadsman Apprentices while on duty are as follows, without exchange compensation allowance:—

When on the running list:—

	Rs. a month.	
Junior Leadmen	107	* Plus 50 per cent. of the lead money collected from the ships on which they do duty.
Second Mate Leadsman	135	
First Mate Leadsman	160	

When employed as Chief and Second Officer:—

	Rs. a month.	
Chief Officers of pilot vessels	160	* Plus a mess allowance of Rs. 40 a month.
As Second Officers of pilot vessels	135	

7. After five years' service as a Leadsman Apprentice he will be allowed to appear at an examination to qualify for appointment as Mate Pilot, but if he shows exceptional ability, and has passed each previous examination on his first attempt, bears a very good character, and is otherwise well reported on, this period may, with the special sanction of Government, be reduced to 4½ years, when, if successful in the examination, he will be promoted to the grade of Mate

Pilot on the occurrence of a vacancy. While remaining as a Leadsman Apprentice, after passing this examination, he will receive a salary of Rs. 175 a month.

8. After three years' service as Mate Pilot he will be permitted to go up for an examination to qualify for appointment as Master Pilot, and, if successful, he will be promoted to that grade on the occurrence of a vacancy.

9. Vacancies which occur in the grade of Branch Pilot will be filled up by promotion, from the Master Pilots' Grade, of men who have passed the Branch Pilots' examination.

10. Branch Pilots and Pilots who have passed the Branch Pilots' examination, on attaining the age of 40, will, while under 55 years of age, be examined at intervals of three years by the Marine Surgeon with respect to their eyesight and general physical fitness for the performance of their duties. All pilots who continue in the service after attaining the age of 55 years will be similarly examined every year.

11. If the Local Government has reason to believe that a pilot is, owing to physical unfitness of any kind, incapable of discharging his duties properly, it shall arrange for his medical examination, and shall take such action as may seem desirable when the results of that examination are communicated. In particular, Pilots shall be medically examined after the occurrence of any accident to the vessel in their pilotage charge, if the circumstances tend to show that the accident was in any way attributable to physical unfitness on the part of the Pilot.

12. Pilots are not entitled to any salary while on pilotage duty, but receive as their remuneration a share, at present 50 per cent., but liable to alteration at the discretion of the Government of Bengal, of the pilotage dues paid by ships piloted by them.

13. The Government of Bengal reserves to itself the right to require all pilots to obtain a Home Trade Master Mariner's certificate before they are promoted to be Senior Master Pilots.

14. Every member of the Pilot Service is subject to such rules as the Government of India, or as the Government of Bengal, under the control of the Government of India, may from time to time respectively make in regard to discipline, leave, leave allowances, number of officers in the Service, distribution into grades, tonnage of ships to be allotted to the several grades, &c., and in all respects he is amenable to such orders as may be passed by the Government of Bengal, and is liable to degradation, suspension, and dismissal by the Government of Bengal for any breach of such rules or orders, or for misconduct.

15. The principal leave and pension rules at present in force are contained in Chapter XXXIII. of the Civil Service Regulations, fifth edition, and are summarised below; but it is to be understood that the rules are subject to alteration at the discretion of the Government of India. Pilots are required to contribute towards the cost of pensions for their widows and orphans under rules which will be found on pages 5-6 of this memorandum.

Principal Rules relating to the Pay, Leave, and Pensions of the Bengal Covenanted Pilot Service.

(Notice.—This memorandum is merely intended to show the principal leave and pension rules in the Civil Service Regulations applicable to the Bengal Pilot Service without going into minute details, and does not profess to deal with every case that may arise. Any disputed question must be decided with reference to

* The percentage of the lead money collections payable to Leadsman Apprentices is liable to alteration at the discretion of the Government of Bengal.

APPENDIX V. (continued).

the authorised text of the Civil Service Regulations for the time being, and the memorandum should not be quoted in official correspondence.)

SECTION I.—Pay and Leave Rules.

Pay of Grades.

For the purposes of the leave rules the pay of the several grades of the Service shall be taken to be as follows:—

	A Month.
Branch Pilot	Rs. 1,000
Master Pilot	700
Mate Pilot	400
1st Mate Leadsman passed as Mate Pilot	Rs. 175
1st Mate Leadsman	160*
2nd Mate Leadsman	135*
Leadsman Apprentice	107*

* Without exchange compensation allowance.

Certain allowances are given to pilots while on special duty and for certain journeys to join vessels.

Furlough.

Furlough may be taken to the extent of four years during the entire period of service, in the following instalments, viz. :—After ten years' service, two years; and after every subsequent eight years, one year, on an allowance of half the average pay for the last three years. Provided that no furlough can be granted to an officer who has taken leave on medical certificate until three years after his return from leave on medical certificate, or to an officer who has taken privilege leave of over six weeks' duration until 18 months have elapsed between last return from such leave, and the furlough or privilege leave, if any, with which the furlough is combined. If a portion of an instalment is taken, the remainder may be added to any later instalment; provided that not more than two years' furlough may be taken at one time.

Leave on Medical Certificate.

Leave on medical certificate may be taken to the extent of three years during the whole period of service, but not for more than two years at a time, and not more than twice out of India. Such leave cannot be taken for more than one year, except after three years' continuous service immediately preceding. Leave on medical certificate cannot be counted as service for furlough, and no leave on medical certificate can be taken while any furlough is due. An officer on leave under this article is entitled to half his average pay for the first 15 months of each period of such leave, but not for more than 30 months in all. For the rest of his leave under this article he is entitled to a quarter of his average pay. The minimum furlough allowance during leave on medical certificate to an officer to whom any allowance is due shall be—

	A Month.
In the case of a Branch Pilot, Master Pilot, and Mate Pilot	Rs. 100
In the case of a Mate Leadsman, and Leadsman Apprentice	50

Special Leave.

Special leave on urgent private affairs may be granted at any time for not more than six months, provided that an officer who has had special leave must render six years' active service before he can again have such leave.

For the first six months for which an officer is on special leave, whether the six months be included in the same leave or not, he is entitled to a leave allowance of half his average pay for the last three years.

Thereafter he is entitled to no leave allowance.

In the case of an officer compelled owing to ill-health to take leave out of India under the foregoing

rules, half average pay and quarter average pay are subject to the following minimum rates:—

	Minimum.
<i>Half average pay—</i>	
If paid in England	200l. a year, or three-fourths of the pay last drawn on duty, whichever is less.
If paid in India	Rs. 166½ a month, or three-fourths of the pay last drawn on duty, whichever is less.
<i>Quarter average pay—</i>	
If paid in England	100l. a year, or 37½ per cent. of the pay last drawn on duty, whichever is less.
If paid in India	Rs. 83½ a month, or 37½ per cent. of the pay last drawn on duty, whichever is less.

Subsidiary Leave.

Subsidiary leave is given to an officer quitting India to enable him to break up his domestic establishment and travel to the port of embarkation, and to an officer returning to India to enable him to travel from the port of debarkation and reorganize his establishment.

Such leave may be prefixed and affixed to furlough, leave on medical certificate, and special leave on urgent private affairs taken out of India.

Privilege Leave.

Privilege leave may be granted—

- (1) Without medical certificate, on full pay, to the extent of one calendar month in twelve. Such leave may be accumulated to a maximum amount of three months, and may be prefixed to other kinds of leave.
- (2) On a medical certificate, on half pay, for two months in twelve. Such leave cannot be accumulated, or combined with other kinds of leave; but it may be granted in extension of other privilege leave, in which case the whole period is treated as leave on half pay.

Extraordinary Leave.

Subject to certain limitations, extraordinary leave without pay may be granted in case of necessity, and when no other kind of leave is by rule admissible.

Leave after the Age of 55.

A pilot, after he attains the age of 55 years, may be granted privilege leave and any special leave on urgent private affairs to which he may be otherwise entitled. Except in the case of an officer who, after the age of 54 years, has been refused leave owing to the exigencies of the public service, the grant of the above leave is subject to the condition that, if required, the officer returns to duty at the end of the leave. No other leave granted to a pilot before his fifty-fifth birthday has effect after that date.

SECTION II.—Pension Rules.

Retiring Pension.

After an actual service of 30 years in India, a pilot is entitled to a retiring pension according to his rank, as follows:—

Rank of Retiring Officer—	Monthly Pension.
Branch Pilot	Rs. 200
Any lower rank	100

Invalid Pension.

A Pilot whom the Medical Board of the India Office, or the Administrative Medical Officer at Calcutta or a Medical Committee over which the Administrative Medical Officer should, when practicable

APPENDIX V. (continued).

preside, duly certifies to be incapacitated for further service is entitled to an invalid pension, varying according to his rank, as follows:—

Rank of Retiring Officer:—	Monthly Pension.
Branch Pilot - - -	Rs. 200
Master Pilot - - -	" 100
Mate Pilot - - -	" 60

Note.—If a Leadsman Apprentice is certified under the above circumstances to be incapacitated for further service, he shall be eligible, after a service of less than ten years, for a gratuity not exceeding (except in special circumstances, and under the orders of the Government of India) one month's emoluments for each completed year of service.

A Pilot retiring on an invalid pension while absent on leave in England or in the Colonies will receive the pension of the rank which he held when his leave began, unless he has been promoted within 12 months from that date, in which case he will receive the pension of the rank to which he has been thus promoted.

Superannuation Pension.

A Pilot who has attained the age of 55 years may be required to retire on a superannuation pension on the same scale as that laid down for invalid pensions, unless the Local Government considers him efficient and permits him to remain in the Service; but he may not so retire without the consent of the Local Government.

SECTION III.—Family Pension Rules.

Contributions.

Members of the Bengal Covenanted Pilot Service must make the following monthly contributions towards the cost of pensions for their widows and orphans:—

	Monthly Contribution.
Branch Pilot - - -	Rs. 40
Master Pilot - - -	" 20
Mate Pilot - - -	" 10
Leadsman Apprentice - - -	" 4

Rates of Pension.

Pensions are granted to the widows of Pilots married before their husbands retired on pension at the following rates:—

	Monthly Pension.
To the widow of a Branch Pilot -	Rs. 100
" " Master Pilot -	" 50
" " Mate Pilot -	" 30
" " Leadsman Apprentice -	" 15

To the children of Pilots of all ranks by wives married before their husbands retired on pension from the Service, pensions are granted at the following rates:—

	Monthly Pension.
To each son until the age of 15 years -	Rs. 12
" daughter until the age of 10 years -	" 14
" daughter over the age of 10 years until marriage -	" 20

A wife married to a Pilot after his retirement on pension from active service and her children are entitled to no pension.

Births, Deaths and Marriages.

To entitle widows and orphans to pensions under these regulations, Pilots must forward to the Port Officer certificates of their marriage, and of the births of their children and their baptisms, within one month after the occurrence thereof. Notices of death are in like manner to be forwarded to the Port Officer.

Effect of Resignation or Dismissal.

Subscriptions by a Pilot for the purpose of securing pensions for his wife and children are refunded in the event of his resignation or dismissal.

Declarations.

Widows and female orphans above the age of 15 years are required to forward to the office of the Accountant-General, Bengal, declarations half-yearly, in May and November, that they are not married, and that they have not been married at any intervening period. The declarations are to be countersigned by the executor to the estate of the deceased member of the Pilot Service, or pensioner, or by the guardian of an orphan, and by a member of the Pilot Service, or a person exercising any of the powers of a magistrate, or of a minister of religion, certifying to the truth of the declaration to the best of their knowledge and belief. Forms of declaration will be furnished on application to the Accountant-General, Bengal.

Re-marriage.

If a widow pensioner marries, her pension ceases during her coverture; but in the event of her again becoming a widow, she is re-admitted to the pension to which she was entitled during her first widowhood, unless her second husband was a member of the Pilot Service, and at his death of higher grade than her first husband, in which case she is entitled to the pension of the higher rank.

Forfeitures.

No widow who may have been legally divorced or separated from her husband for adultery, or who, at the period of her husband's demise, may have quitted his protection and been living in a state of notorious adultery, although not divorced or separated from him by law, or who, after her husband's decease, may be living in a notorious state of incontinence, and no female orphan living in such state shall be entitled to receive, or continue to receive, any pension.

SECTION IV.—Rate of Exchange for Leave Allowances and Pensions.

When leave allowance is issued in England, or in a colony where the standard of currency is gold, rupees are converted into sterling at 1s. 6d. the rupee, or any higher rate of exchange fixed for the time being for the adjustment of financial transactions between the Imperial and the Indian Treasuries.

Pensioners residing in a country in which gold is the standard of currency are entitled to receive their pensions at the minimum rate of 1s. 9d. to the rupee.

INDIA OFFICE,
October 1909.

INDEX.

(The numbers refer to paragraphs.)

BENGAL PILOT SERVICE.

- A.**
- Allowances (see under Leave and Pay).
- Anglo-Indians :
- as Branch pilots, *Budge* - - - - 79,819
- Civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over held by, 1st April 1913 - - - - p. 156
- RECRUITMENT OF :
- Disabilities as regards, no remedy suggested, *Forteach* - - - - 79,770
- no Objection to, if recruited by fair competition with Europeans - - - - 79,786
- no Reasons against, but training should be same as for other members, *Forteach* - - - - 79,750
- Suggestions *re*, *Budge* - - - - 79,819
- Service already open to, *Kerr* - - - - 79,853
- Unable to fulfil conditions of four years' training in sailing vessel, *Kerr* - - - - 79,861
- (see also Domiciled Community.)
- B.**
- Bengal Government, memorandum by - p. 155-6
- Branch pilots :
- Anglo-Indians as, *Budge* - - - - 79,819
- Average number of, running in 1911, and number in grade, *Budge* - - - - 79,825
- Periods spent in each grade by, *Forteach* - p. 154
- Budge*, C. G., evidence of 79,786-79,802, 79,812-79,849
- C.**
- Cadre :
- no Increase needed - - - - p. 155
- Numerical strength, report of Marine Committee of Port of Calcutta Commissioners on, 1903 - 79,854
- Calcutta Port Commissioners :
- Report of Marine Committee on the Bengal Pilot Service 1903 - - - - 79,854
- Transfers of administration of Pilot Service to, not advocated, *Kerr* - - - - 79,850
- Written statement - - - - 79,850-3
- Civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over held by Europeans and Anglo-Indians, 1st April 1913 p. 156
- Commander of pilot vessels :
- must Always be a Senior pilot, and get average earnings of grade for year of tenure, *Forteach* 79,744
- Anomalous position and recommendation *re* conferring commission of Commander, Bengal Pilot Service on, *Budge*, 79,802; *Thorpe*, 79,803.
- Appointment of junior officers as, would cause trouble, *Forteach* - - - - 79,767
- BRANCH PILOTS AS :
- should be Appointed for one year, *Budge*, 79,802; *Thorpe*, 79,805.
- Ordinarily, but not at present, *Budge* - 79,828
- Inadequacy of pay, recommendation *re*, and salary, *Forteach*, 79,766; *Budge*, 79,799; *Thorpe*, 79,806.
- INDIAN MARINE OFFICERS AS :
- Difficulty, *Forteach* - - - - 79,786
- would be Objected to, *Budge* - - - - 79,831
- Commander of pilot vessels—*continued*.
- on Retirement of, reintroduction of rule under which each branch pilot had to take command for a year of S.P. vessels necessary, *Forteach* - - 79,782
- Cost of living, increase, *Budge* - - - - 79,802
- D.**
- Domiciled community, ear-marking of number of vacancies for, suggestion, *Kerr* - - - - 79,859
- (see also Anglo-Indians.)
- E.**
- Europeans, civil appointments for Rs. 200 a month and over, 1st April 1913 - - - - p. 156
- F.**
- Forteach*, Commander G. N., R.I.M., evidence of 79,744-79,785
- H.**
- Harbour Master, under Port Trust, *Forteach* - 79,776
- I.**
- Indian Marine officers, appointment as Commanders of pilot vessels (see under Commanders of pilot vessels).
- Indians :
- no Desire to enter service heard, *Forteach* - 79,761
- Impracticability of employment, and no desire shown by, 79,792; *Thorpe*, 79,809; *Kerr*, 79,853.
- no Reasons against employment, but training should be same as for other members, *Forteach* - 79,750
- K.**
- Kerr*, C. J., evidence of - - - - 79,850-79,866
- L.**
- Leave :
- ALLOWANCES :
- Rate of exchange - - - - p. 159
- Recommendation, *Budge* and *Thorpe* - - 79,789
- Provision for - - - - p. 155
- Rates of pay for purposes of leave rules - p. 158
- RULES :
- Antiquated and should be remodelled, *Forteach*, 79,748; *Budge*, 79,790, 79,800, 79,884; *Thorpe*, 79,807; *Kerr*, 79,864.
- Particulars - - - - p. 158
- Sick, *Forteach* - - - - 79,781, 79,783
- M.**
- Medical examination, periodical, abolition not advocated if equivalent given in shape of better pension, *Budge* - - - - 79,840

P.

P.	
y:	
Average earnings of pilots, 1900-11, <i>Budge</i> and <i>Thorpe</i>	p. 154
no Change advocated except in case of commanders of steam pilot vessels, <i>Forteach</i>	79,747
Comparative statement showing pay of senior officers in Royal Indian Marine and Bengal Pilot Service	p. 143-4
Comparison with England, <i>Budge</i>	79,822
Comparison with Royal Navy, Royal Indian Marine, and officers in charge of ordinary merchant vessels, <i>Kerr</i>	79,856
Disparity between different grades, <i>Forteach</i> , 79,772-3; <i>Budge</i> , 79,824-6; <i>Kerr</i> , 79,858.	
Disparity between Pensions and (see under Pensions).	
Fees to pilot when carried off to sea and detained in river, scale out of date, <i>Budge</i> and <i>Thorpe</i>	79,789
Fixed, and effect, <i>Budge</i>	79,847-9
Length of service, rank and average earnings p. 144	
Payment by fees preferred to pooling system and fixed salary, but reduction in number of pilots suggested, <i>Budge</i>	79,827, 79,838, 79,847-9
Pooling system and fixed salary might be satisfactory, <i>Kerr</i>	79,858
Rates of grade allowances and average earnings, 1890, 1900, 1912	p. 155
Rates, and proportion considered fair, <i>Budge</i> and <i>Thorpe</i>	79,789
Readjustment of rates fixed for calculation of leave and special duty allowance, proposed by Government	p. 155
Report of Marine Committee of Port of Calcutta Commissioners on, 1903	79,854
System	p. 155
nsions:	
Comparison with Royal Indian Marine	p. 145
Decrease in sterling equivalent, 1882-1913	79,795
DISPARITY BETWEEN PAY AND:	
Increase of pension and decrease of pay, suggested, <i>Kerr</i>	79,857
if Pensions increased pilots might be prepared to forego certain amount of salary, <i>Budge</i>	79,829
FAMILY:	
Contributions towards	p. 155-6
Rules	p. 159
Governed by Civil Service Regulations	p. 155
Hardships of present conditions, and claim to improvement, <i>Budge</i> , 79,791, 79,795; <i>Thorpe</i> , 79,808.	
Improvement considered necessary by Government, and matter under consideration	p. 156
Increase desirable, <i>Forteach</i>	79,749
Petition to Government <i>re</i>	79,795
Rate of exchange	p. 159
Rates, 1821	p. 155
Rules	p. 158-9
Scheme in 1907, but unwillingness of members of service to contribute whole cost of improvement or consent to Provident Fund	p. 156
(see also Retirement)	
ilot Service:	
ADMINISTRATION:	
Report of Marine Committee of Port of Calcutta Commissioners on, 1903	79,854
Satisfactory, and transfer to Port Commissioners not advocated, <i>Kerr</i>	79,850
Branch pilot should be appointed to direct and control, <i>Budge</i> , 79,798; <i>Thorpe</i> , 79,805.	
should be Brought into line with I.C.S. and other superior services	79,793
Constitution, report of Marine Committee of Port of Calcutta Commissioners on, 1903	79,854
Organisation, <i>Forteach</i>	79,753
no Posts held outside authorised cadre	p. 155
(see also Conditions of Service, Leave, Pay, &c.)	
ilotage fees:	
Actual earnings only, paid from, <i>Forteach</i>	79,783
no Great fluctuation, and work out at fair average, <i>Forteach</i>	79,769
Used only for pilotage would give ample margin for increased pensions, &c., <i>Thorpe</i>	79,834

Pilots:

Appointment to offices in Marine Department formerly, <i>Budge</i>	79,802
Branch (see that title).	
Carried off to sea, unsatisfactoriness of system, and expense of, should be borne by shipowners, <i>Budge</i>	79,794, 79,839
Cost of providing vessel on joining and leaving ship, <i>Forteach</i>	79,777
NUMBER:	
not Believed to be excessive, <i>Kerr</i>	79,866
in Each grade	p. 155
Increase in, 1904, <i>Budge</i>	79,835
Reduction:	
Advocated, <i>Budge</i>	79,827, 79,838, 79,846
Question of, <i>Kerr</i>	79,862
no Objection to pilot being in office on similar conditions to Senior Harbour Master with Commissioners, but appointment should be additional, <i>Forteach</i>	79,746
SUPPLYING SHIPS WITH:	
Arrangements <i>re</i> , <i>Budge</i> and <i>Thorpe</i>	79,836
Report of Marine Committee of Port of Calcutta Commissioners on, 1903	79,854
Trial of, report of Marine Committee of Port of Calcutta Commissioners on, 1903	79,854
Work under port officers, <i>Forteach</i>	79,776
Port Commission, two senior pilots should be appointed on, <i>Budge</i>	79,794
Port Officer:	
Deputy, duties, appointment of pilot for, impossible, <i>Forteach</i>	79,746
Position of, <i>Forteach</i>	79,776
Port Office, appointment of senior pilot to, to administer service:	
Advocated, <i>Budge</i>	79,788; 79,820, 79,832
no Objection by port officers to proposal, <i>Forteach</i>	79,765
no Opinion expressed, but present system satisfactory, <i>Kerr</i>	79,863
Probation and Training:	
in England, advantage of, though not absolutely necessary, <i>Kerr</i>	79,859
Importance of, <i>Budge</i>	79,816
no regular Method, <i>Forteach</i>	79,757
Recommendation and scheme, <i>Budge</i> , 78,816-7, 79,787, 79,797; <i>Thorpe</i> , 79,804, 79,837.	
Regulations considered satisfactory by Government	p. 155
on Steam vessel as good as on sailing ship, <i>Budge</i>	79,837
System, <i>Forteach</i>	79,771, p. 155
present System approved, and inclusion of experience in sailing vessel not considered necessary, <i>Kerr</i>	79,868
Promotion, examinations for:	
Necessary and no alteration in form of, suggested, <i>Budge</i>	79,821
Retention of present system of, not necessary, <i>Forteach</i>	79,764
Punishment:	
Fines, objection to, <i>Budge</i>	79,802, 79,841
System, <i>Forteach</i>	79,778
B.	
Recruitment:	
Age, <i>Forteach</i>	79,754
of Boys from Indian schools, suggestions <i>re</i> , <i>Budge</i>	79,819
OF CADETS FROM TRAINING SHIPS:	
Advocated on completion of at least two years on <i>Budge</i> , 79,796, 79,802, 79,814, 79,845; <i>Thorpe</i> , 79,803, 79,814.	

Recruitment—continued.

OF CADETS FROM TRAINING SHIPS—continued.
 would not be Approved under present conditions,
Forteach - - - - - 79,744
 Change, question of reason, *Budge* - - - 79,813
 Competitive examination in India never known of,
Forteach - - - - - 79,774

OF FULLY QUALIFIED MASTER MARINERS WITH
 PROBATION FROM TWO TO TWO AND A HALF
 YEARS:

Objections to proposal, *Budge* - 79,786, 79,818
 Proposal, *Forteach* - 79,744-5, 79,755-6, 79,759,
 79,762-3, 79,784-5

LOCAL APPOINTMENTS:

Abolition advocated, *Budge* - 79,796, 79,802
 Unnecessary, *Budge* - - - - - 79,786
 Number of recruits every year, *Forteach* - 79,771
 People known in Calcutta would probably have good
 chance of getting sons into service on application
 to Local Government, *Forteach* - - - 79,760
 Proposals by Commissioners of Port of Calcutta,
 1903, not agreed with by present Commissioners,
 and present system approved, *Kerr* - - 79,855
 Qualifications, *Forteach* - - - - - 79,779
 Regulations *re* appointments - - - p. 157-9
 Regulations considered satisfactory by Government
 p. 153
 Report of Marine Committee of Port of Calcutta
 Commissioners on, 1903 - - - - - 79,485

Recruitment—continued.

Retention of system, possible reasons, *Kerr* - 79,851
 System - - - - - p. 155
 System, unsatisfactoriness of, *Forteach*, 79,744,
 79,786; *Budge*, 79,796, 79,815.
 former Systems, *Forteach*, 79,754, 79,786; *Budge*,
 79,813-4.

Retirement, compulsory, at 55, proposed, *Forteach*,
 79,746; *Budge*, 79,798; *Thorpe*, 79,805.

Recommendation not agreed to, by some members
 near 55, but junior members in favour of, *Budge*
 79,842

River Survey:

Branch pilot should be appointed to direct and
 control, and complaint *re* present arrangements,
Budge, 79,798, 79,833; *Thorpe*, 79,805.

Port Commissioners satisfied, but might be better to
 have pilot service under one head, *Kerr* - 79,865

Royal Indian Marine, method of appointment,
Forteach - - - - - 79,779

T.

Thorpe, G. F., evidence of, 79,786-79,795, 79,803-79,849

Tonnage, periodical readjustment, *Budge* - - 79,843

Training (*see* Probation and Training).