



Report

of the

Legal Education Committee,
Bombay
1949



BOMBAY
GOVERNMENT CENTRAL PRESS
Government Printing and Stationery,
Commissioner for India, India House,
through any recognized Bookseller
Prices 7 or 8d.

1949

**REPORT OF THE LEGAL EDUCATION COMMITTEE, BOMBAY,
1949.**

CHAPTER.	CONTENTS.	PAGES.
1. Introduction		1
2. Historical Review		7
3. General		17
4. Stage of Admission		23
5. Duration of the Course		36
6. Law Courses		38
7. Council of Legal Education		46
8. Diploma Courses in Law		50
9. Post-Graduate Course		52
10. Methods of the Teaching of Law		62
11. Qualifications, etc., of Teachers of Law		71
12. Summary of Committee's Recommendations		77
13. Conclusion		83
14. Minute of Dissent by Mahamahopadhyaya Dr. P. V. Kane, M.A., LL.M., D.Litt		84
15. Minute of Dissent by the Hon'ble Mr. Justice N. H. Bhagwati		87
16. Note by Principal J. R. Gharpure, B.A., LL.B.		103
17. APPENDIX "A"—Questionnaire		105
18. APPENDIX "B"—List of individuals, etc., who have given replies to Questionnaire		109
19. APPENDIX "C"—List of individuals, who have given evidence		112
20. APPENDIX "D"—Bibliography		118

APPENDIX " A ".

LEGAL EDUCATION COMMITTEE, GOVERNMENT OF BOMBAY.

QUESTIONNAIRE.

A. *INTRODUCTORY* :

1. Is the scheme of Legal Education introduced in 1938 satisfactory in your opinion ? If not, in what respects ?

B. *PRE-LEGAL EDUCATION* :

2. What should be the stage of admission to the law course—Intermediate Examination of the University, as at present, or Graduation ?
3. If the former, do you think that a student who has passed any Intermediate Examination of the University should be admitted to the law course, e.g., Inter-Science, Inter-Commerce, etc. ? If not, what modifications would you suggest ?
4. If Graduation, do you think any graduate should be admitted to the law course, e.g., B.A. with Languages, B.Sc., B.Ag., etc. ? If not, what modifications would you suggest ?
5. Is in your opinion any minimum pre-legal education necessary for admission to the law courses ? If so, what ?
6. Do the Intermediate Examinations of the University, or Graduation satisfy this minimum ?
7. If the answer to the above question is in the negative, what subjects ought, in your opinion, to be included in such a pre-legal course ? What should be its duration ? What should be the stage of admission to the said course ?
8. Do you think it desirable that this pre-legal course should be taught in a Law College ?

C. *LL.B. COURSES* :

9. Do you approve of the subjects included at present in the two LL.B. examination courses of the Bombay University ? If not, what alterations would you suggest ? Do you think that a student should have a certain amount of choice of subjects ? If yes, what options would you suggest ?

10. What should be the duration of the LL.B. courses? Do you suggest any minimum age being prescribed for admission to the LL.B. courses?
11. Are you in favour of a student getting his LL.B. degree after passing two examinations, as at present, or would you have the number of examinations increased?
12. Do you think that the University law course should be confined to the cultural aspect of law and not the professional? If the latter, what other agency, such as the Bar Council, etc., should be entrusted with the practical and professional training of a law student?
13. What should be the duration of such a professional and practical training? What course, ways and methods would you suggest for such training? Should a student be entitled in your opinion to appear for the professional examination as an external student without keeping any terms in a recognized Law College?

D. POST-GRADUATE COURSE :

14. Are you satisfied with the present Post-Graduate, i.e., the LL.M., courses in law? If not, what modifications and alterations would you suggest? What should be the duration of the course?
15. Do you think that there should be greater specialization in law at the Post-Graduate stage, e.g., Criminology, Land Law, Constitutional Law, International Law, Labour Legislation, etc.?
16. Do you think it desirable that at the Post-Graduate stage, a law subject should be combined with the study of an appropriate social science, e.g., Constitutional Law with Political Theory, Criminology with Psychology, etc.?
17. Do you think that a separate Degree should be instituted for research in law, such as Ph.D., or LL.D.? If yes, what should be the minimum qualification for admission to such a course? What should be its duration?
18. What ways and means would you suggest for encouraging research in law among students of law?

19. What ways and means would you suggest for the improvement of the teaching of Post-Graduate courses?
20. Do you think that the facilities afforded by the Law Colleges in the Province for the study of Post-Graduate courses in law are adequate? If not, would you favour the establishment of a separate Institute for Advanced Studies in Law, either by Government or by the Universities?

E. CONTROL OF LEGAL EDUCATION :

21. Do you approve of the present system of Legal Education being controlled by different bodies, such as the University, the Bar Council and the High Court?
22. With the establishment of many Universities in the Province, do you think it desirable in the interest of Legal Education to set up a single Body such as a Council of Legal Education to control Legal Education in the Province? If yes, what should be its composition and powers?

F. DIPLOMA COURSES IN LAW :

23. A full course in law may not be necessary in many walks of life, e.g., for labour officers, social workers, jobs in banking or commercial firms, or co-operative societies, etc. But knowledge of a particular branch of law may be an essential qualification. Do you think it desirable to institute Diploma courses in Law to satisfy such demands? If yes, what Diploma courses would you suggest? What should be its duration? What should be the admission stage for such courses? What authority should control them? Please give your opinion on all aspects of the question.

G. TEACHING OF LAW :

24. What methods would you suggest for the improvement of the teaching of law? Do you think that the present methods of teaching law need any improvement? If so, in what respects?

25. Do you approve of the minimum qualification and training required by the Bombay University for appointments to the teaching staff of the Law Colleges in the Province? If not, what modifications and alterations would you suggest?
26. What method of recruitment to the teaching staff of the Law Colleges would you suggest?

H. *GENERAL :*

27. Do you think that the standard of a Degree in Law should be raised? If so, in what respects?
28. Do you approve of the existing method followed by the University of examining students in law? If not, what alterations would you suggest? Do you think it desirable that a certain percentage of marks at a law examination should be reserved for the work done by a student in the Law College?
29. What, in your opinion, should be the maximum strength of a class in a law college from the point of view of efficiency?
30. And generally.

APPENDIX "B".

List of individuals, institutions and associations who have sent in their replies to the questionnaire of the Legal Education Committee, Bombay.

Serial No.	Name.	Designation.
1	Abhyankar, Mr. S. Y.	... Advocate, Bombay.
2	Albal, Mr. V. V.	... District Judge, Satara.
3	Ankalgi, Mr. A. Y.	... Judge, Small Causes Court, Poona.
4	Badkaka, Mr. D. K.	... Deputy Secretary, Department of Labour, Saurashtra.
5	Banaji, Mr. H. D.	... Advocate, High Court, Bombay.
6	Bhat, Mr. P. C.	... District Judge, Nadiad.
7	Bhat, Mr. V. R.	... Principal, Law College, Belgaum.
8	Bhopatkar, Mr. L. B.	... Professor of Law, Law College, Poona.
9	Chavan, Mr. D. R.	... Indore.
10	Dabholkar, Mr. S. G.	... Principal, Shahaji Law College, Kolhapur.
11	Darowalla, Dr. P. N.	... Advocate, High Court, Bombay.
12	Datar, Mr. B. N.	... Pleader, Belgaum.
13	Davar, Mr. A. S.	... Advocate, Bombay.
14	Dingara, Mr. B. S.	... Judge, Labour Court, Jalgaon.
15	Dongerker, Mr. S. B.	... Registrar, University of Bombay.
16	Fyze, Mr. A. A. A.	... Member, Public Service Commission, Bombay.
17	Gujral, Mr. B. B.	Principal, School for Training of Labour Welfare Workers, Bombay.
18	Honavar, Mr. M. B.	... Principal Judge, Bombay City Civil Court.
19	Jadhav, Mr. M. K.	... Collector, Belgaum.
20	Jhaveri, Mr. K. M.	... Bombay.
21	Joshi, Mr. R. C.	... District Magistrate, Ahmednagar.
22	Kalelkar, Mr. B. S.	... Judge, Court of Small Causes, Bombay.
23	Karnik, Mr. R. R.	... District Judge, Ratnagiri.
24	Karve, Mr. D. G.	... Principal, Brihan Maharashtra College of Commerce, Poona.

Serial No.	Name.	Designation.
25	Katre, Mr. G. N.	... District Judge, Dhulia (West Khandesh).
26	Khambata, Mr. K. J.	... Offg. Chief Presidency Magistrate, Bombay.
27	Kharkar, Mr. P. K.	... District Judge, Kaira.
28	Kumar, Mr. V.	... District Magistrate, Broach.
29	Muranjan, Mr. S. K.	... Principal, Sydenham College of Commerce, Bombay.
30	Naik, Mr. V. A.	... Assistant Judge, Satara.
31	Noronba, Mr. M. S.	... Chief Judge, Court of Small Causes, Bombay.
32	Pandia, Mr. N. H.	... Solicitor, Bombay.
33	Pandit, Mr. G. V.	... Professor, Law College, Poona.
34	Paranjpe, Mr. A. G.	... Registrar, High Court, Kolhapur.
35	Parkha, Mr. H. G.	... Pleader, Ahmednagar.
36	Patel, Mr. M. P.	... Broach.
37	Patil, Mr. B. L.	... Pleader, Dhulia (West Khandesh).
38	Patil, Mr. M. S.	... District Judge, Ahmedabad.
39	Phadke, Mr. B. B.	... Professor of Law, Poona.
40	Phadke, Mr. S. G.	... Pleader, Poona.
41	Phadke, Mr. V. R.	... Joint District and Sessions Judge, Sangli.
42	Phadnis, Mr. N. H.	... Pleader, Sangli.
43	Pusalkar, Mr. R. N.	... Kolhapur.
44	Sathe, Mr. V. K.	... Consulate for India, Goa.
45	Shah, Mr. H. V.	... Professor of Law, Government Law College, Bombay.
46	Shinde, Mr. R. D.	... District Judge, Dharwar.
47	Shrikhande, Mr. N. S.	... District Judge, Kanara, Karwar.
48	Thakore, Mr. M. M.	... Principal, Sir L. S. Law College, Ahmedabad.
49	Tope, Mr. T. K.	... Professor of Law, Government Law College, Bombay.
50	Vakeel, Mr. F. H.	... Solicitor, Bombay.
51	Vakil, Mr. F. A.	... Bombay.
52	Vaze, Mr. R. S.	... District Judge, Ahmednagar.
53	Vidwans, Mr. M. D.	... Advocate, Poona.
54	Bar Association	... Ahmednagar.

Serial No.	Name.	Designation.
55	Eag Association	... Belgaum.
56	Do.	... Bijapur.
57	Do.	... Dharwar.
58	Do.	... Dhulia (West Khandesh).
59	Do.	... Karwar.
60	Do.	... Jalgaon (East Khandesh).
61	Do.	... Poona.
62	Do.	... Sangli.
63	Do.	... Sholapur.
64	Do.	... Surat.
65	Do.	... Thana.
66	Bombay Advocates' Association...	Presidency Small Causes Court, Bombay.
67	Bombay Police Courts' Bar Association.	Esplanade Police Court, Bombay.
68	Bombay Presidency University Students' Association.	Bombay.
69	Bombay Press-owners' Association.	Do.
70	Educational Films of India	... Do.

APPENDIX "C".

List of persons who gave oral evidence before the Committee.

Serial No.	Names of persons who gave evidence.
1	Daphtary, Mr. C. K.
2	Dongerkery, Mr. S. R.
3	Fyzee, Mr. A. A. A.
4	Gokhale, Mr. B. N.
5	Munshi, Mr. K. M.
6	Seerwaj, Mr. H. M.
7	Vachha, Mr. P. B.

APPENDIX "D".

Bibliography.

- A
- Abbreviations—(1) JSPTL ... Journal of the Society of Public Teachers of Law.
 (2) C.B.R. ... Canadian Bar Review.
 (3) H.L.R. ... Harvard Law Review.
 (4) L.Q.R. ... Law Quarterly Review.
- Aiyer, Sir Alladi Krishnaswami ... "Legal Education in Madras" 88 Madras Law Journal.
- Ambedkar, Dr. B. R. ... "Thoughts on the Reform of Legal Education in the Bombay Presidency." Law College Magazine, 1936, Vol. VII, No. 1.
- Atkin, Rt. Hon. Lord of Aberdovey ... "Law as an Educational Subject." JSPTL, 1932.
- Brown, Esther Lucile ... "Lawyers, Law Schools and the Public Service." Russell Sage Foundation Series (1948).
- Buckland, W. W. ... "Curricula" JSPTL, 1927.
- Chitale, S. G. ... "Reorganization of Legal Education in Bombay." Law College Magazine, 1947, Vol. XVI, Nos. 1 & 2.
- Cronkite, F. C. Dean of Law, University of Saskatchewan. ... "Legal Education—Which Trend?" 13 C. B. R.
- de Zulusta, F. ... "The Recruitment of Public Teachers of Law." JSPTL, 1933.
- Dongerkerly, S. R. ... "Universities and their Problems"
- Fysee, A. A. A. ... "The Teaching of Law in Indian Universities." Law College Magazine, 1946, Vol. XV, No. 2.
- Gutteridge, H. C. ... "Advanced Legal Education." JSPTL, (1939)
- Hall, Professor Jerome ... "A 2-2-2 Plan for College Law Education," 5—H. L. R. (1942).
- Hanbury, H. G. ... "The Place of Roman Law in the Teaching of Law To-day." JSPTL, 1931.
- Hazel, A. E. W. ... "Law Teaching and Law Practice." 47—L. Q. R.
- Hazeltine, H. D. ... "Forward Tendencies in English Legal Education." JSPTL, 1924.
- Holdsworth, W. S. ... "The Vocation of a Public Teacher of Law." JSPTL, 1925.
- Holland, H. A. ... "The Revision of Courses of Legal Study at Cambridge." JSPTL (1947), No. 1 Part 2.
- Mollard, R. A. ... "Legal Education—Prospect and Retrospect." JSPTL, 1938.

- Hughes, J. D. I. ... "Culture and Anarchy in Legal Education." JSPIL, 1932.
- Jenks, Prof. Edward ... "English Legal Education." 51 L. Q. R. (1935).
- Jelowics, H. F. ... "The Teaching of Roman Law." JSPTL, 1926.
- Karve, B. P. ... "History of the Government Law College, 1855-1935. Bombay.
- Kher, B. G. ... "Legal Education in Bombay." 12, Bombay Law Journal.
- Lawson, F. H. ... "Changes in the Law Courses at Oxford." JSPTL (1947), No. 1, Part 2.
- Parry, D. Hughes ... "The Institute of Advanced Legal Studies." JSPTL, 1948, Vol. 1, No. 2.
- Plucknett, Theodore F. T. ... "The Place of the Legal Profession in the History of English Law." 48—L. Q. R. (1932).
- Sapru, Sir Tej Bahadur ... "Purpose and Method of Law Schools." *Leader*, Allahabad, dated 18th February 1934.
- Sastry, K. R. R. ... "The Case Method of Teaching Law." *The Indian Law Review*, Vol. I (1947).
- Schweinsburg, Dr. Eric F. ... "Law Training in Continental Europe—its Principles and Public Functions." Russell Sage Foundation (1945).
- Shiv Subramaniam, L. R. ... "Legal Education in India and its Reorganization." *Journal of the Benares Hindu University*, 1939, III Part 8.
- Simpson, Sidney P. ... "The Function of the University Law School." 49 H. L. R.
- Smith, O. R. ... "Legal Education, A Manitoba View of"—13 C. B. R.
- Stallybrass, W. T. S. ... "Law in the Universities." JSPTL, 1948, Vol. 1, No. 2.
- Truscot, Bruce ... "Red Brick University."
- Vanderbilt, A. T. ... "Pre-Legal Education." *Studying Law*—Edited by A. T. Vanderbilt.
- Wade, E. G. S. ... "The Law Society's School of Law." JSPTL, 1926.
- Williams, G. L. ... "Learning the Law".
- Winfield, P. H. ... "Reforms in the Teaching of Law." JSPTL, (1930).
- Winstley, R. A. ... "Some Reflections on Legal Research." JSPTL, 1945.

B

- Report of the Calcutta University Commission, 1917-19, Vols. III and V.
- Report of the Committee of the Canadian Bar Association on Legal Education, 1923. 1923 C.B.R. Vol. I
- Report of the Director of Public Instruction, Poona, for the year 1857-58.
- Correspondence relating to the establishment of Universities in India, 1855.
- Report of the Indian Universities Commission 1902.
- Inter University Board, Hand-Book of Indian Universities, 1948.
- Report of the Committee for Opening a Law Faculty in the Andhra University (1936).
- Report of the Legal Education Committee, Bombay, 1935.
- Report of the Legal Education (Lord Atkin) Committee, England, 1934.
- Report of the Legal Education Reforms Committee, U.P. 1937-39.
- Minnesota View of Legal Education—Extract from Letter of Dean of Law, Faculty University of Minnesota, to the Law Alumni. 13 C.B.R.
- Minutes of the Provincial Board of Studies in Law—Andhra University.
- Progress of Education in India—Sixth Quinquennial Review.
- Report of the Committee on "University Reform" Bombay University 1925.
- Report of the Committee appointed by the Government for making suggestions for the improvement of the Govt. Law School, Bombay, 1916.
- Report of the Special Committee of the Benchers of the Law Society of Upper Canada on Legal Education, 13 C.B.R.
- Report of the Unemployment Committee 1935, U.P. Govt.
- Standardisation of Legal Education, Inter Universities Board.