

> REPORT
> on
> REVISION OF SCALES OF PAY
> and

IMPROVEMENT OF SERVICE CONDITIONS
of
MUNICIPAL EMPLOYEES

## by

Rao Bahadur D. V. Nadkarni
Special Officer

BOMBAY
MUNICIPAL PRINTING PRESS
1945


## REPORT

on

## REVISION OF SCALES OF PAY

and

# IMPROVEMENT OF SERVICE CONDITIONS <br> of 

## MUNICIPAL EMPLOYEES

by<br>Rao Bahadur D. V. Nadkarni

Special Officer

BOMBAY
MUNICIPAL PRINTING PRESS
1945


## TABLE OF CONTENTS <br> PART I

| Chapter I |  |
| :---: | :---: |
| Introduction. | Page |
| $1-8$ |  |

Origin of the enquiry and terms of reference $\quad \therefore 1$
Sabsequent references from the Corporation and the Standing Committee
References from the Executive $\quad .$.
Scope of the references ... 4
Period set for the enquiry .... 4
Representations from Municipal Labour Unions . ... 5
Propriety of holding the enquiry at the present moment .... 6
Cost of the enquiry ... ... ... 7
Acknowledgments . ... ... ... 8

## Chapter II

A Living Wage Standard. 9-14
Methods of ascertaining living wage standard ... 9
Estimate of the minimum cost of diet per head ... ... 10
Working class family budget ... ... ... II
Middle class family budgets. ... ... ... 12
Changes in the cost of living due to the rise in prices ... 12
Dr. Engle's Axioms on family budgets ... ... 13
Mr. H. Shankar Rau's study of family budgets ..... 13
What determines the standard of life ... ... 14
Chapter III
Minimum wage for men and women. $\quad 15-19$
How to fix a minimum wage ... ..... .15
Difficulty of applying the standard suggested by the Textile
Labour Inquiry Committee
16:17
Demand for equal wage for men and women .... .... 18
Practice in Factories and Mills ... . . ... ... 18
Practice in force elsewhere . ... ... ... 18
Equality of pay when justified ... .... ... 19

## Chapter IV

Cost of living and wage-levels. : 20-22
Adjustment of wage levels to the cost of living . . ... 20
The cost of living and wages in the Municipality ... 20
The cost of living and wages in the United Kingdom ... 21
The effect of the rise in prices on fixed incomes . ... 21
Should the relief be substantive or temporary ... ... 22

iii
Chapter X ..... Page
The Accounts Department. ..... 38-41
Functions and strength ..... 38
The Chief Accountant ..... 38
The Deputy Accountant ..... 39
The Test Audit Officer ..... 40
The Assistant Accountants, Ist and 2nd grades ..... 40
Financial effect ... ..... 41
Chapter XI
The Assessment and Collection Department. ..... 42-48
Functions and strength ..... 42
The Assessor and Collector ..... 42
The Deputy Assessor .....  43
The Assistant Assessors ..... 44
Cashier ..... 45
Surveyors ..... 45
Ward Superintendents, 1st grade ..... 46
Ward Superintendents, 2nd grade ..... 46
Deputy Superintendents ..... 46
Assistant Superintendents ..... 47
Ward Inspectors .....  ... ..... 47
Chief Motor Inspector ..... 47
Financial effect ..... 48
Chapter XII
The Town Duty Refund and Election Department. ..... 49-53
Functions and strength ..... 49
The Election and Town Duty Officer ..... 49-51
Checking Inspector ..... 5
Supervising Inspectors ..... 52
Export and Import Inspectors ..... 52
Sub-Inspectors ..... 52
Marking Clerks ..... 52
Enumerators ..... 53
Financial effect ..... 53
Chapter XIII
The General Stores. ..... 54-57
Functions and strength ..... 54
The Controller of Stores ..... 54
The Deputy Controller of Stores ..... 55
The Assistant Controller of Stores ..... 56
Yard Foreman ..... 56
Financial effect ..... 57

v

## Chapter XVIII

Page$73-85$
Functions and strength ..... 73
(a) General Supervision-
The Executive Health Officer ..... 73
The Deputy Executive Health Officer ..... 74
The Assistant Health Officers ..... 74
The Epidemiologist ..... 75
Senior and Junior Medical Inspectors, Medical Assistants and Assistant Sanitary Inspectors ..... 76
Health Visitors ..... 77
(b) Municipal Laboratory-
Municipal Analyst ..... 77
Asstt. Analyst, Asstt. Chemist and Asstt. Bacteriologist ..... 78
Junior Laboratory Chemist ..... 79
(c) Vaccination-
Superintendert of Vaccination ..... 79
(d) Medical Inspection of Schools- Medical Inspector ..... 79
(e) Propaganda in Public Health- Propaganda Officer ..... 79
(f) Insfectious-Diseases Hospitals- Medical Superintendert ... ... ... 80Arthur Road Hospital ... ... ... 80Maratha Hospital - ... ... ... 80
(g) Moternity Homes ..... 81
(h) Arti-Tuberculosis Dispensaries and Turner Sanatorium at Bhoiwada ..... 81
(i) Anti-Venereal Measures-
Dispensary for Combating Venereal Diseases .....  81
Lady Physician
Lady Physician ..... 82 ..... 82
Clinical Attendannts
(j) Compounders ..... 82
(k) Street Cleansing and Conservancy- Head Supervisor ..... 83
Supervisors $\cdots$ .....  83
Overseers ..... 83
(l) Veterinary Branch- $P_{\text {age }}$
Senior Veterinary Inspector ... -... ... ` 84
Junior Veterinary Inspectors ... ... ... 84
Veterinary Assistants ... .... ... 84
( m ) Welfare work-
Welfare Organizer - ... ... ... 84
Financial effect ... ... ... 85
Chapter XIX
The King Edward VII Memorial Hospital. $86-89$
Functions and strength , ... ... .... 86
The Dean ... .... ... 86
The Vice-Dean ... ... . ... 87
The Assistant Dean ... ... ... 87
X-Ray Medical Assistant and Asstt. Medical Officers - ... 88
Chief Dispenser ... ... ... 88
$\begin{array}{lllll}\text { Matron ard Nursing staff } & \text {.... } & \text {... } & \text {... } & 88 \\ \text { Ergincer-in-charge } & \text {... } & \text {... } & \text {... } & 89 \\ & & & \end{array}$
Financial effect ... ... .... 89
Chapter XX

| The Seth Gordhandas Sunderdas |
| :---: |
| Medical College. |$\quad 90-93$

Functions and strength . ... ... ... 90
Professors ... ... ... 90
Assistant Professors .. . ... ... . ... 90
Tutors ... ... .... 91
Laboratory Assistants , ... ... ..... 92
Chief Clerk and Head Clerk ... ... ... 92
Chapter XXI

- The Engineering Department. $94-100$
Functions and strength . ... ... ... 94
City Engineer ... ... ... 94
Deputy City Engineer … .... ... 95
Assistant Engineer, 1st grade, Mechanical Branch ... 95
Assistant Enigineer, 1st grade, Architectural Branch .... 96
Assistant Engineers, 2nd grade ... ... ... 97
Assistart Engineers, 3rd grade ... .... . ... 97
Inspectors (Sub-Engineers) ... ... ..... 97
Sub-Overseers (Overseers) ... ... ... 97


## vii

|  |  |  |  | Page |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Draftsmen | $\ldots$ | $\ldots$ | $\ldots$ | 98 |
| Tracers | $\ldots$ | $\ldots$ | $\ldots$ | 99 |
| Chernist (Dadar Purification Works) | $\ldots$ | $\ldots$ | 99 |  |
| Inspector (Electrical) | $\ldots$ | $\ldots$ | $\ldots$ | 99 |
| Temporary Sub-Overseers | $\ldots$ | $\ldots$ | $\ldots$ | 100 |
| Financial effect | $\ldots$ | $\ldots$ | $\ldots$ | 100 |

## Chapter XXII

The Fire Brigade.
101-103

| Functions and strength |  |  |  |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| The Officer Commanding Fire Services | $\ldots$ | $\ldots$ | 101 |  |
| The Deputy Chief Officer | $\ldots$ | $\ldots$ | 101 |  |
| The Aspistant Officer Commanding Fire Services | $\ldots$ | 102 |  |  |
| The 2nd and 3rd Officers | $\ldots$ | $\ldots$ | $\ldots$ | 102 |
| Station Officers | $\ldots$ | $\ldots$ | $\ldots$ | 102 |
| Sub-Officer | $\ldots$ | $\ldots$ | $\ldots$ | 102 |
| Financial effect | $\ldots$ | $\ldots$ | $\ldots$ | 102 |
|  |  | $\ldots$ | $\ldots$ | 103 |

## Chapter XXIII

The Licence Department.
104-108
Functions and strength - ... ... ... 104
The Superintendent of Licences, Shops and Establishments... 104
The Assistant Superintendent of Licences . ... ... . 105
Cashier ... ... ... 105

The Senior Inspectors (Licences) ... ... ... 105
The Junior Inspectors (Licences) ... . ... : ... 106
The Senior Supervisor (Encroachments) ... ... 106
Supervisors (Encroachments) ... ... ... 107
The Chief Inspector (Shops and Establishments) .. 107
The Senior Inspectors (Shops and Establishments) ... 107
The Junior Inspectors (Shops and Establishments) . ... 108
Financial effect ... ..t .... 108
Chapter XXIV
The Gardens Department
109-110

| Functions and strength | $\ldots$ | $\ldots$ | $\ldots$ | 109 |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| The Superintendent of Cardens | $\ldots$ | $\ldots$ | $\ldots$ | 109 |
| The Assistant Superintendent of Cardens | $\ldots$ | $\ldots$ | $\ldots$ | $\ldots$ |
| The Senior Overseer | $\ldots$ | $\ldots$ | $\ldots$ | 110 |
| The Junior Overseer | $\ldots$ | $\ldots$ | $\ldots$ | 110 |
| Financial effect | $\ldots$ | $\ldots$ | $\ldots$ | 110 |





PART IV
Chapter XXXIV
Service conditions.
162-197
What sorvice conditions imply ...) ... ... ... 162
(1) Wages- ..... Page
Demands of the Unions ..... 162
Minimum wage and grades ..... 162
(2) Hours of Work-
Demands of the Unions ..... 163
Hours of work prescribed under the Factories Act ..... 163
Hours of work in operation ..... 163
Hours of work prescribed under the Shops and Establish- ments Act ... ... ... 164
Recommendations ..... 165
Financial effect ..... 165
(3) Over-time-
Demands of the Unions ..... 165
Existing rates of over-time ..... 166
Commissioner's views ..... 166
Labour Commission's recommendation ..... 166
Over time to be restricted ..... 167
(4) Weekly Off-
Demands of the Unions ..... 168
Existing practice ..... 168
Commissioner's views ..... 168
Provisions under different Enactments ..... 169
Recommendations ..... 169
Financial effect ..... 169
(5) Conduct and Discipline-
Importance of discipline in administration ..... 170
Complaints against the system of fines ..... 170
Procedure followed by the departments ..... 170
Difficulties of applying provisions of the Payment of Wages Act ..... 171
System of fines is unavoidable.. ..... 171
Labour Commission's views on the system ..... 172
Constitution of the Fines Fund under the Municipal Act ..... 172
Suspensions and dismissals ..... 173
Procedure followed by the departments ..... 173
Commissioner's views ..... 173
Labour Commission's views on Suspensions and dismissals ..... 174
Appointment of a Labour Officer ..... 174
(6) Leave and Holidays
Leave of different kinds ..... 175

- Scale of Casual leave in the Municipality ..... 175
Demands of the Unions ..... 176
Scale of Casual leave in the Bombay Port Trust and Railways ..... 176

Page
Amenities to be provided near workers' dwellings ..... 197
Welfare Centres ..... 197
Chaptér XXXV
Miscellaneous demands. ..... 199-202
Payment of travelling expenses ..... 199
Payment of gharry or coolie hire ..... 199
Preference in employment to relatives ..... 199
Badli system ..... 199
Pali system ..... 200
Transport facilities ..... 201
Women Mukadams and Labour officers ..... 201
Collection of Union fees on Municipal premises ..... 202
PART V
Chapter XXXVIFinance.203-209
Axiom of Local Government expenditure ..... 203
Incidence of General tax ..... 203
Sources of revenue claimed from Covernment .....  204
Betting tax ..... 204
Entertainment tax ..... 204
Tax on Transfer of Properties.. ..... 205
Duty on Petrol ... ..... 205
Duty on Electricity .....  .....  205
Registration and Licence fees.. ..... 206
Profession tax addtional Town duties ..... 206
Government grants ..... 206
Profits from Municipal undertakings ..... 207
Objections to the application of such profits to the relief of rates answered ..... 207
Undertakings run and proposed to be run by the Municipality ..... 208
Instances of Public utility undertakings acquired or started in England by Municipalities ..... 209
Chapter XXXVII
How to secure Efficient Executive. ..... 210-224
Various methods of securing efficiency ..... 210
Methods of recruitment ..... 210
Manchester, Leeds \& Clasgow practice ..... $210-211$
Methods of recruitment for clerical posts followed in the Bombay
Municipality in the past ..... 211
Present method of recruitment in the Bombay Municipality ..... 212
War time changes in the method ..... 212
Recruitment to Head Clerks and Chief Clerks by Departmental tests ..... 212
Page
Grievances of Graduates ..... 213
Recruitment to subordinate technical service ..... 213
Recruitment to higher administrative and technical appointments ..... 213
Hadow Committee's recommendations ..... 214
Disadvantages of appointing rank outsiders to fill highest administrative posts ..... 214
Service to be made attractive by progressive promotion ..... 215
Leave Reserves ..... 215
Increase in administrative work of the Commissioner ..... 216
Need for enabling the Deputy Commissioner to take part in the deliberations of the Corporation and Standing Committee ..... 216
Administration to be reorganized ..... 218
All the Departments to be divided equally between the two Deputy Commissioners ..... 218
Delegation of larger powers to the Heads of Departments ..... 218
Executive Committees ..... 219
Ward Committees .....  219
Hospitals and dispensaries to be put in charge of one Offcer ..... 219
The Executive Health Officer to be made responsible for preven- tion of diseases only ..... 220
Appointment of a Principal for the Cordhandas Sunderdas Medical College ..... 220
The Superintendent of Licences, etc., to be relieved of the work of administering the Shops and Establishments Act ..... 220
The Municipal Printing Press to be placed in charge of an independent Officer ..... 221
The Election and Town Duty Department to be amalgamated
with the Assessment Department
with the Assessment Department ..... 221 ..... 221
Centralization of Despatch ..... 222 ..... 222
Centralization of Ward Officee. ..... 222
Municipal Research Bureau ..... 223
Civic Institute ..... 224
Municipal Central Library ..... 224
PART VI
Chapter XXXVIII
Conclusion and Summary of Recommendations. ..... 225-235
Additional cost involved under the proposed revision ..... 225
Additional cost involved in respect of other recommendations ..... 225
How revision proposals may be given effect to ..... 226
Existing seniority of employees inter se should be maintained ..... 227 ..... 227
Qualifications to be prescribed for posts where the minimum is now raised to Rs. 500 or more ..... 227
No discrimination should be made in granting relief ..... 227
Summary of Ceneral Recommendations ..... 228


## xy

## APPENDICES.

Page
Appendix A.-Table showing the Cost of Living Index Nos.from August 1914 to June 1945.236-237
Do. B.-Statement showing the total Income and Ex-penditure and cost of Establishment andLabour from 1933-34 to 1945-46.238-240
Do. C.-Statement showing proposals for revision of grades, the average cost and immediate cost. ... ..... $241-338$
Do. D.-Abstract showing the financial effect of the revision of grades according to Service Heads. ..... 339-344
Do. E.-Statement showing the revised grades and theclass of employees to whom they are appli-cable.345-354
Do. F.-Statement showing the posts the minimumpay of which has been raised' to Rs. 500 ormore.355

## PART I.

## CHAPTER I

## Introduction.

> By Corporation Resolution No. 32, dated the 19th April 1945, I was appointed as a Special Officer
> Origin of the enquiry to make a comprehensive examination of and terms of reference the existing grades, allowances, other service conditions, etc., of all classes of Municipal employees. This appointment was made in pursuance of Corporation Resolution No. 906, dated the Ilth January 1945, passed at the instance of Mr. S. K. Patil, m.L.A., which reads as follows:-
> "That the Corporation are of opinion that a Special Officer should be appointed to make a comprehensive examination of the existing grades, allowances, etc., and other service conditions of all classes' of Municipal employees and to suggest suitable changes therein having regard to the duties and responsibilities attached to their respective posts and the scales of pay for similar posts obtaining in Covernment and other public bodies, particularly giving further relief to the lowest paid members of the Municipal service, and to remove the various anomalies and disparities at present existing and to secure an efficient Municipal executive in all ranks.
2. That a copy of this Resolution be forwarded to the Commissioner for information with a request to submit necessary proposals at an early date for the appointment of a Special Officer and the salary, etc., to be paid to thim during his appointment ".
The foregoing Resolution sets out in brief the original terms of reference.
2. Subsequently, the following references were sent to me

Subsequent the Refer
Cemes from the Corporation and the Standing poration and the Standing Committee.

Committee from time to time:-

| Corporation Resolution or <br> Serial Standing ComNo. mittee Resolution No. and date. | Date of receipt. | Subject matter. |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $\begin{aligned} & \text { S.C.R. No. } 174 \\ & \text { of } 9.5-1945 . \end{aligned}$ | 1-6.1945 | Revision of the grade of Senior Clerks in the Corporation and Standing Committee's Office from Rs. 150-5-190 to Rs. 150-10200. |
| $2 \underset{3-5-1945 .}{\text { C.R. }} \underset{\substack{\text { No. } \\ \hline}}{ }$ | 6.6-1945 | Revision of the grades of Peons, Havaldars, Jarnadars and other menial staff in Manicipal serpice. |
| $\begin{aligned} & \text { S.C.R. No. } 169 \\ & \text { of } 9-5-1945 \text {. } \end{aligned}$ |  | Reजिsion of the grades of certain staff in the Municipal Liboratory. |
| $\begin{aligned} & \text { CR. No. } 64 \text { of } \\ & 30-4.1945 . \end{aligned}$ | 12.6-1945 | Interim Report of the Committee of the Corporation appointed to consider the question of improving the conditions of the lower paid employees of the Corporation. |
| C.R. No. 66 of 30-4-1945. | 13-6-1945 | Advisability of improving the scales of pay applicable to the Inspectors and Head Inspectors in the Markets and Slaughter Houses Department and of increasing the conveyance allowance paid to them. |
| $\begin{aligned} & \text { S.C.R. No. } 122 \\ & \text { of } 25-4.1945 \\ & \text { C.R. No. } 140 \text { of } \\ & 14.6 .1945 \text {. } \end{aligned}$ | 14-6-1945 | Proposal regarding grant of benefit of the old service regulations to the Municipal employees who joined service before 1-9-1936. |
| $\underset{5.7 .1945}{\text { C.R. No. } 245} \text { of }$ | 9-7-1945 | Second Report of the Committec of the Corporation appointed to consider the question of improving the conditions of the lower paid employees. |
|  | 9-8-1945 | Proposals for the revision of grades, service conditions etc., of Municipal employees, from the President Bombay Municipal Officials Association. |

3. The following references were also received by me from the Municipal Commissioner and the Heads References from the
Executive.

| Serial Case No. No. and date. | From whom received. | Date of receipt. | Subject matter. |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 Estt. 1564 of 1.5.1945. | Municipal Commissioner. | 1.5-1945 | Pay of quablified Draftsmen. Higher starting pay. |
| $2^{\prime} \mathrm{S} . \underset{12 \cdot 5 \cdot 1945}{\mathrm{R} .} 20378 \text { of }$ | Do. | 16-5-1945 | Anonymous representation of praduates employed in the Bombay Municipality re : recruitment in the Municipalify. |


| Serial No. | Case No. and date. | From whom received. | Date of receipt. | f. Subject matter. |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 3 | $\begin{array}{ll}\cdots \\ & \\ & \\ \end{array}$ | 1fon. Secretary, Munl. Schools, Committee's Peon Asiociation. | $22-5 m 1945$ | Resolutions passed at the Anmual General Meeting of the Municipal Schools Committee's Peons Association, Bombay, re: Destness Allowance, House rent, Uniform, Minimum wages, etc. |
| 4 | ... | D. N. Shinde and others. | $29.51945$ | Representation from temporary employees in A. \& C's Department on Urban Immovable Property Tax Establishment for giving them leave, etc., benefits of permanent employees. |
| 5 | L. A. 46 of 28-5-1945. | M. C. | 29-5-1945 | Proposal to revise the grade of the Assistant to the Legal Assistant who is an advocate. |
| 6 | E. H. 315 C of 126-1945. | Do. | 12-6.1945 | Leave to the Dispensary Attendants and Developing Attendants-m Amendments to Municipal Service Regulations. |
| 7 | S. R. 5286 of 22-6-1945 | D. M. C. | $22-6 \cdot 1945$ | Recommendations of the Board of Examiners regarding the raising of the proportion of supervisory posts in the clerical cadre etc. |
| 8 | $\underset{4-7.1945 .}{\text { E.H. of }}$ | Dean | 4.7.1945 | Amendment to the Municipal Service Regulations, Rule 112Leave to probationer Nurses and the question of treating the period of Training of the Probationer Nurses in the College of Nursing. |
| 9 | $\underset{10-7-1945}{\text { C.E.S.R. } 506} \text { of }$ | M. C. | 10-7.1945 | Revision of the grade of the Chernist at the Dadar Purificam tion Works. |
| 10 | W. O. 2098 of 21-7-1945 | Do. | 21-7-1945 | Revision of the grade of the Welfare Organizer under the Health Officer. |
| 11 | $\underset{23.7-1945}{\text { C.E.S.R. } 3718 \text { of }}$ | Do. | 24-7-1945 | Allocation of the Architectural staff and fixing their grades and status. |
| 12 | $\begin{gathered} \text { L. A. } 83 \text { of } \\ 28.7 .1945 \end{gathered}$ | Do. | 28-7-1945 | Revision of the grade of the Court Clerk in the Legal Assistant's Department. |
| 13 | $\underset{2-8.1945}{\text { H. } 1206 \text { of }}$ | Do. | 3-8.1945 | Revision of the grade of the com* pounders in the Health Department. |
| 14 | $\begin{array}{r} \text { M/8360 } \\ 8.8 .1945 \end{array}$ | Do. | 9-8.1945 R | Revision of the grade of the post of (Dawan) Clerk at Bandra Slaughter House. |
| 15 | $\underset{13 \times 8-1945}{\mathrm{HSB} / 218 / \mathrm{SR}}$ | Do. | 13-8-1945 R | Revision of grades of the Veterinary Graduates employed in the Health Departinent. |

4. All these terms of reference contemplate merely the revision

Scope of the references. of the grades and improvement of service conditions and not the reform and reorganization of the departments or increase or decrease in the staff, which will require a different kind of enquiry.
5. The Resolution of the Corporation regarding my Period set for the appointment was communicated to me by enquiry. set for the Commissioner by his letter No. S.R.17833, dated the 27th April 1943, in which he informed me that the Corporation desired that "the work should be completed within 4 months" of my taking up the appointment. I assumed charge of the appointment on 1st May 1945,
6. The enquiry required collection of information not only Difficulty of Collecting from Municipal departments but also Information from out- from Covernment and other public bodies. side bodies. Foreseeing the delay that would occur in this process, the Commissioner was good enough to call for in advance from the Heads of Departments their proposals for revising the grades, allowances, etc. and also for improving other service conditions of Municipal employees (including daily paid staff) working under them. He also asked for relevant information from Government and other public bodies. However, when I took charge of my office, I found that information from some of the departments and public bodies had not been received. My efforts to obtain the information from outside bodies have not been quite successful. Some of them furnished the information, a few readily and others reluctantly after reminders and personal visits, while the rest did not even condescend to acknowjedge the letters. I mention this not to complain, but only to explain how difficult it was for me to obtain material for comparison within the limited time at my disposal.
7. On assuming charge, I had to call for from the Heads of Departments further information in the
Information from the form of the following statements :-
(1) Statement showing service conditions, etc., of Municipal employees not amenable to service regulations.
(2) Statement showing the Divisions, Sub-divisions, Sections into which the City has been divided and the employees put in charge of them together with their pay and allowances.
(3) Statement showing the number of employees who retired, resigned or died and the number of persons newly employed during the last 5 years.
(4) Statement showing the number of employees in receipt of House Rent allowance or in occupation of Quarters in lieu thereof either free or at concessional rent.
(5) Maximum number of the daily paid staff engaged in any month with the designation and the rates of wages allowed.
(6) Temporary staff on daily wages who have worked for at least 26 days in a month for more than a year who could be brought on permanent Schedule.
8. The above statements required collection of many details, which must necessarily have entailed con-

Difficulties in obtaining information from departments in time. siderable time and labour on the Heads of Departments. The statements were, therefore, received late, and consequently, I was hard pressed for time to collate them and base my conclusions thereon. I have, therefore, dealt only with the most important points therein. The rest can be considered departmentally in due course.
9. The references sent to me by the Corporation under their Representations from Resolutions Nos. 64 and 245 , dated the 30 th the Municipal Labour April 1945, and 5th July 1945, respectively, Unions. set out in the main the demands of the lower paid employees. However, I requested the following Unions and Associations representing the Municipal employees to send me their further suggestions, if any, and depute their representatives to discuss the various proposals made by them with me: -
(I) The Bombay Municipal Officials Association.
(2) The Bombay Municipal Executive Staff Union.
(3) The Bombay Municipal Peons and Lascars Union.
(4) The Bombay Municipal Workers' Union.
(5) The Bombay Municipal Kamgar Sangh.
(6) The K. E. M. Hospital and G.S.M. College employees' Union.
Of these, Nos. 1 and 2 sent their representations as requested. The following Unions also sent their representations:-
(7) The Bombay Municipal Employees' Union.
(8) The Bombay Municipal Peons' Union (which was fommerly known as the Bombay Municipal Peons and Lascars Union).
10. Representatives of the Unions and Associations Nos. I. 2, 7 and 8 noted above were good enough to meet me and clarify the demands made in their representations. I have dealt with their submissions at the appropriate places in this Report. I take this opportunity of thanking these bodies and their representatives for their co-operation.
11. The propriety of revising the salaries at the present moPropriety of holding the ment, when economic conditions are fluid and enquiry at the present fluctuating, may be questioned. But it will moment. be seen from the cost of living index (vide Appendix A.) prepared by the Bombay Labour Office that it took nearly 18 years after the outbreak of the last Great War for things to get normal. As the devastation and dislocation of life in the present War has been far greater, it may take much longer for conditions to return to normal. There has been for a considerable time incessant demand from the lower paid staff, which is particularly hard hit, for higher wages and betterment of service conditions. Prices usually rise faster than wages and any lag between the two causes inevitably much hardship and discontent. - Wages are by far the most important factor in the economic welfare of a people. They need, therefore, to be adjusted from time to time to the purchasing power of the rupee, which has now fallen considerably. Apart from this, the cost of living has also increased on account of the rise in the standard of living of the wage earners, which consists objectively in the satisfaction of certain physiological and psychological needs, and subjectively in a certain measure of well-being or enjoyment of additional amenities*. These considerations appear to have weighed with the Corporation in setting up this enquiry at the present moment. It is understood that similar enquiries have already been started or are being contemplated by Govemment, the Port Trust and the Railways.
12. Obviously, the work of an individual, however assiduous, cannot even remotely stand comparison Enquiry by anindividual either in resources or results, with that of a Committee of public men or experts with a full-fledged Secretariat. I have, however, drawn abundantly and gratefully from the various publications, which I have acknowledged at the appropriate places. I have also had the benefit of suggestions from the various Heads of departments and of personal discussions with them in regard to the proposals made therein.
13. I might add that although, as a retired Municipal Officer, my leanings will naturally be expected to be towards the employees with whom I have laboured for years and whose difficulties in eking out a life in this City I have fully shared and can easily understand, as an outsider I have endeavoured to maintain a detached outlook and arrive at conclusions as impartially as possible.
14. Having also worked for a pretty long time in the atmosphere

Diffculties of the of close scrutiny and helpful criticisms of authorities considering executive proposals, I am not unaware of the proposals. the difficulties of the authorities who have ultimately to pass judgment on my proposals, in that while they have full sympathy with the grievances and aspirations of the employees who are serving this great City unsparingly, they have also zealously to watch and safeguard the interests of the constituencies whom they represent.
15. The cost of the enquiry amounted to Rs. 12,000 Cont of the enquiry. as follows:-
(a) Remuneration of the Special Officer ... 5,000
(b) Salaries of the Staff ... 4,004*
(c) Stationery and Contingencies Cost of printing and miscellaneous, expenditure (estimated) ... 2.996

Total 12,000

[^0]16. I am grateful to the Municipal Corporation for giving. Acknowledgments. me this opportunity of rendering it a little further service. I must also express my thanks to the Municipal Commissioner, Mr. U. M. Mirchandani, i.c.s., and to all the Heads of Departments for their hearty co-operation in my work. I must particularly thank the Chief Pccountant Mr. J. K. Daruwala, for sparing the services of some of his able assistants and placing at my disposal his office records and at a later stage of the enquiry some additional staff, but for which it would not have been possible for me to complete 'my work within the period of 4 months. I should also like to place on record my warm appreciation of the work done by my Assistant Mr. J. V. Oka, the Head Clerk Mr. Y. S. Phadnis, the Stenographer Mr. D. K. Cokhale and other members of the staff. Mr. Oka's knowledge and experience were of invaluable help to me. Mr. Phadnis was helpful in collecting the necessary information and collating it. My thanks are also due to Mr. D. R. Vaidya, and Mr. S. G. Kulkarni who helped me at the later stage in checking the statements and notes already prepared and in making fresh ones, Finally, I have to thank the Municipal Printing Press, and particularly Mr. T. V. Doraiswamy, Test Audit Officer, under whose supervision the Press is working, for printing this Report in a presentable form.

## CHAPTER II

## A Living Wage Standard.


#### Abstract

17. Any inquiry into the adequacy or otherwise of the present A moral minimum wages or scales of pay will not be satisfactory wage. unless they are considered in relation to what is known as a Living Wage Standard. "Living wage" has been defined as " a sum sufficient for the normal and reasonable needs of the average employee living in the locality where the work under consideration is done or is to be done '".* An equally interesting definition of the term "basic wage", which is sometimes synonymously used with the term "living wage", will be found in the Harvester Case (Commonwealth Arbitration Court). The standard of basic wage laid down in this case is that required to meet the "normal needs of the average employee regarded as a human being living in a civilised society ". A more elaborate definition will be found in the Queensland Industrial Conciliation Arbitration Act. This Act provides that the basic wage paid to an adult male empioyee shall not be less than what is " sufficient to maintain a well-conducted employee of average health, strength and competence and his wife and a family of three children in a fair and average standard of comfort, having regard to the conditions of living prevailing among employees in the calling in respect of which such basic wage is fixed, provided that in fixing such a basic wage the eamings of the children or wife of such employees shall not be taken into account ". $\ddagger$


18. There are two methods of ascertaining a Living Wage Methods of ascertaining Standard. One is "by way of norms a Living Wage Standard. elaborated by physiologists, hygienists, housing specialists and others" and the other is by "setting up standard budgetsfor population groups of different levels of income." The former method is found to be difficult, elaborate and slow; the latter is easy, popular and more widely used. But a combination of the two methods is regarded as an ideal one. The living wage standard must be considered in terms of a unit of consumption. The unit universally adopted is the family. The Textile Labour Inquiry Committee after examining various data consider a family of four persons, viz., a man, wife and two dependents (ordinarily

[^1]children under 14 years of age) as the fairest standard to work on.** The consumption of all persons in "this working class " family unit is not alike. The Health Bulletin No. 23 published by the Indian Research Fund Association puts down the following scale :-


| Comefficient. |  |
| :---: | :---: |
| $\ldots$ | 10 |
| $\cdots$ | 0.8 |
| $\cdots$ | 0.8 |
| $\cdots$ | 0.7 |
| $\cdots$ | 0.6 |
| $\cdots$ | 0.5 |
| $\cdots$ | 0.4 |

On the basis of these figures, the Textile Labour Inquiry Committee have taken the mean of the co-efficients for the two dependents and calculated the total consumption units for an average family of four members at 3 as follows:-one male $=1$, a wife $=0.8$, two children (at 0.6 each) $=1.2$-Total $3 . \dagger$
19. It is estimated that each adult requires a minimum of

Estimate of the mini- 2,600 calories per day. On these calculations mam cost of diet per head. Dr. Aykroyd estimates the cost of a well balanced diet in South India at Rs. 5 to Rs. 6 per month per head. In the cass of Municipal labour staff no data is available regarding suitable diet in order to ensure the requisite caloric value. The Textile Labour Inquiry Committee estimate a minimum of Rs. 6 per head for the Province of Bombay. This estimate does not include " extras" like sugar. Adding 25 per cent. for the "extras", the total cost of a family of four members ( 3 consumption units) is estimated at $6 \times 3=18+4-8-0=$ Rs. 22-8-0 per month $\ddagger$. Other authorities examined by the Committee estimate the figure at Rs. 23 per month. As against these estimates, Mr. M. R. Masani estimates the cost of food per adult from Rs. 4 to Rs. 6 per month and the food bill of a family at pre-war rates from Rs. 16 to Rs. 24. He adds that workers in the City of Bombay spend 50 to 60 per cent of their income on food and that half their struggle for life is a struggle for their food.§ Profs. P. A. Wadia and K. T. Merchant point out that " diet charts recently prepared for the working class lay down a minimum expenditure of Rs. 7 per month on food alone, whether vegetarian or non-vegetarian IT " and add that studies made

[^2]by the Bombay Labour Office show that "the average adult male worker consumes less of almost every commodity than is prescribed for the inmates of Bombay jails". They further point out that according to the figures of Family Budgets compiled for the Geneva Report, if the average income of a worker is Rs. 40 , his expenditure on food alone comes to 55 per cent. They estimate 4 consumption units and not 3, as is done by the Textile Labour Inquiry Committee. According to these calculations, the minimum requirements of a family on food alone would be Rs. $7 \times 4=$ Rs. 28 , and if this amount forms 55 per cent. of the total family budget, the total would be about Rs. 50 per mensem.
20. Almost the same figure is arrived at by the Textile Labour Inquiry Committee who estimate the Working Class Family Budget.
family budget as under:-
Rs. a. p.

| Food |  | Re. $22-8-0$ | or | 23 | 0 |
| :--- | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |

This expenditure, however, does not take account of payment of interest on debt, occasional expenditure on festivals, marriages, etc. The Committee, therefore, observe that they would be justified in placing the minimum expenditure on items other than food and rent between Rs. 15 and Rs. 20 and the total cost of a typical family of a husband, wife and 2 children between Rs. 50 and Rs. 55*. The Working Class Family Budget enquiry conducted by the Labour Office in 1932-33 puts down the family expenditure at about Rs. 46 per month and the average number of workers in a family at 1.53 . Thus the share of a full earner is calculated at Rs. 30.1. Family in this enquiry has been taken at 3.70 persons. Similar statistical data with regard to Municipal workers exclusively is wanting. It is not clear whether 1.53 persons constitute the earning members in a typical Municipal worker's family. This may perhaps be so in the case of sweepers and halalkhores, but in the case of other classes of employees the head of the family may have to bear the major part of the burden with the help occa-sionally from a few boarders and lodgers or earnings of his wife.
*Textile Labour Inquiry Committee Report. Vol. II, p. 78.
21. The Bombay Labour Office conducted an inquiry into Middle Class Family the middle class family budgets between Budgets. the years 1922 and 1924 and published its report in 1928. According to its findings the average size of a middle class family is 5.09 members and its distribution of expenditure as compared with that in the working class family budgets is as follows:-

22. These figures would require alteration as the cost of Changes in the cast of living has risen enormously since 1922, i.e., living due to xise in the from 164 (base 100 in July 1914) to 235 in prices. June 1945. Since the War the cost of food has gone up by 200 per cent. and of clothing by 500 per cent.* The cost of living indices are based on the cost of food, fuel and lighting, clothing and house rent for the working classes. : The indices of these groups in June 1945 stood as follows:-

| Food | - | - | 271 |
| :--- | :---: | ---: | :--- |
| Fuel and Lighting | - | - | 238 |
| Clothing - | - | - | 100 |
| House rent - | - | - |  |

23. These indices do not include Miscellaneous expenditure, which forms not an inconsiderable item, nor do they take account of the change in the standard of living, which has taken place since 1922. They do not also provide for special contingencies, for example, marriages, thread ceremonies, prolonged illnesses, serious accidents, thefts or losses not covered by insurance, purchases of jewellery or conveyances, all of which have to be met either from past savings or from ad hoc borrowings or from both. Dr. Engel, who was Chief of the Royal Bureau of Statistics in Prussia, has

[^3]laid down certain axioms regarding the relationship between the income and percentage of expenditure under various groups of iterns in the family budget. They are briefly as follows*:
(1) The greater the income, the smaller the percentage of outlay on subsistence.
(2) Whatever the income, the percentage of outlay on clothing is approximately the same.
(3) Whatever the income, the percentage of outlay on rent, fuel and lighting is invariably the same.
(4) The greater the income, the greater the percentage of outlay on sundries.
24. The Labour Office investigations confirm these axioms except in regard to rent, the disparity in regard to which is due to the fact that the housing conditions in Bombay are not normal, and families with comparatively small incomes have often to spend proportionately more on rent than they can afford.
25. No two families are alike in their needs or tastes, in environment or temperament or in their outlook on life. Each is likely to lay emphasis on some particular item in the family budget,' which it considers most important. In his study of family budgets made in 1934, Mr. H. Shanker Rau, c.i.e., Retired Budget Officer to the Covernment of India and at one time Acting Controller of Currency, gives the following typical budgets of the families of the same size but of different stations in life:-

| Group. |  | Poor (Lower middle class). | Middle class. | Rich. |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Gross manthly incorme | $\ldots$ | Rs. 70 | $\begin{aligned} & \mathrm{Rs}_{\mathrm{s}} \\ & 175 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \mathrm{Rs} \\ & 1,050 \end{aligned}$ |
| Expenditure |  |  |  |  |
| Food Fuel \& Lighting | $\ldots$ | 35 37 $(50 \%)$ | $\begin{aligned} & 60(34 \%) \\ & 87 \end{aligned}$ | $210 \text { (20\%) }$ |
| Clothing | ... | $5\}(13 \%)$ | $12\}(14 \%)$ | $75\}(13 \%)$ |
| Bedding | $\ldots$ | $1)$ | 3 | 25. |
| House rent | ... | 17 (25\%) | $35(20 \%)$ | 160 (15\%) |
| Miscellancous | ... . | 9 (12\%). | 57 (32\%) | 540 (52\%) |

- Quoted from Family Budgets by H. Shankar Rau. p. 18

26. The terms poor, middle class and rich used in the above statement are only relative. The foregoing
What determines the figures show that greater the income the Standard of life. greater is the percentage of expenditure on the "miscellaneous" items (which includes among other things education of children, medical aid and income tax, and the smaller on food and rent. In other words, the standard of life in a family can be determined by the percentage of expenditure on miscellaneous items.
27. Every rise in the cost of living affects the "poor and the Effects of the rise in the working classes more seriously than those cont of living on the who, are more favourably situated in life. various classes. When incomes are fixed, it further brings about a change in the position of the various groups, namely, the rich become middle class, the middle class become poor and the poor become very poor. While the poor are hit by the increase in the cost of living, the middle classes and the rich are hit both by the increase in the cost of living and a substantial increase in the income tax.

## CHAPTER -III

## Minimum wage for men and women.

28. A minimum wage in its legal sense is the minimum rate

How to fix a mini. of wages fixed by some authority other than mum wage. the employers and workers concerned and enforceable in law. It may be established either by collective bargaining by Trade Unions or by arbitration through Trade Boards or Wages Boards or by legislation by the State. The machinery and method of enforcement" may vary. "First, different minima may be fixed for different industries by ad hoc boards appointed to deal with each industry alone. Secondly, a National Commission may fix the minima for various industries, using its discretion as to how far to vary the minima in different cases. Thirdly, an actual figure may be laid down in an Act of Parliament as a minimum to apply over the whole country "." The first of these methods is adopted in England under the Trade Board system and in certain States of Australia, viz., Victoria and Tasmania. The second method is found adopted in certain parts of Canada and U.S.A. and in New South Wales, Queensland, West Australia and New Zealand. An example of the third is to be found in the Minimum Wage Act of New South Wales of 1908. Similar legislation has been introduced in South Australia and a few States of U.S.A. There is no wage regulation in India, but for wages to be paid in the Textile mills in Bombay the Mill Owners'Association have prepared a schedule of wages below which they have advised their members not to go. In Ahmedabad, the minimum wage of a mill operative has been fixed by means of collective agreements between the employers and the workers. The Bombay Municipality is perhaps the first public body, which has fixed a minimum wage of Rs. 25 for its male employees and thus led the way to the improvement of the standard of living of its low-paid employees. In fixing a minimum wage, three elements have to be taken into consideration(1) the living wage standard or what is called the moral minimum wage. (2) the capacity of the employers to pay, and (3) the relation to wages in other employments.
29. The last one is helpful only by way of comparison and adjustment. The real determining factors are, therefore, the living wage and the capacity of the employer to pay. The living wage is based on theoretical calculations, which, however, must yield
to practical considerations. In other words, the concept of the minimum living wage must stand qualified by the ability of the employer to pay. "A living wage basis for fixing the minimum wage is explicitly adopted chiefly in those countries where the normal wage level most closely approaches a living standard. Elsewhere, such a basis is not laid down for the direction of the wage-fixing authority".* The Textile Labour Inquiry Committee find that "it is not possible to lay down'in any well defined terms a basis for the fixation of the minimum wage. The standard of living and the conditions of the industry will always remain the guiding considerations". $t$ The living wage must vary with the incornes of the community, standards of living and of the desires and aspirations of the workers. The fixation of a general minimum wage is thus difficult. According to the "Eastern. Economist" it is inapplicable to our conditions $\$$.
30. The question as to how far the Textile Labour Inquiry Committee's findings about the living wage Difficulty of applying standard of a typical family of husband, wife by The textile Labour and 2 children being between Rs. 50 and Inquiry Committee. Rs. 55 should guide us in determining the wages in any given case has been well answered in a series of awards given in recent labour disputes in the City. In the trade dispute between the General Motors (India) Ltd., and its employees the Hon'ble Mr. Justice M. C. Chagla, the Arbitrator, said: "I think that the Bombay Textile Labour Inquiry Committee laid down the ideal which labour legislation in India should ultimately attain to. It should also be an ideal at which model employers should aim, but I do not think it would be right on my part to compel any particular employer to conform to this ideal. The wages paid in the City of Bombay are still very far from this standard. All that I can do in giving my award is to see how far I can legitimately prevail upon the employer to come as near the standard as possible " $\%$. In the Lever Brothers (India) Ltd., case, the Hon'ble Mr. Justice Divatia (who was the Chairman of the Textile Labour Inquiry Committee) who was appointed as an Arbitrator says :" whether the Company should or should not pay a living wage on the standards found to be equitable by the Textile Labour Inquiry Committee is a matter which cannot

[^4]be decided by one individual concern alone*". In still another wage dispute, namely, between the B.E.S.T. Company and its employees, the Arbitrator, Mr. E. M. Nanavutty, I.c.s. (Retd.) observes: "It is not for me as an Adjudicator to raise the level of the wages of the employees of the Company up to the living wage standard prescribed by the Divatia Committee ". $\dagger$ He quotes with approval the following remarks of Lord Amulree, at one time President of the Industrial Court, London, and Chairman of the National Wages Board for Railways:-" They (Industrial Courts) are concerned not with what the workers 'ought' in a moral sense to receive but what it is proper that they should receive in view of the state of the industry, if more good than harm, is to result from the Court's decision ". These remarks apply with equal force to wages to be given by local bodies, where the conditions of service, like leave and other privileges are more favourable than in industrial establishments. It would thus appear that the living wage standard set out by the Textile Labour Inquiry Committee is only an ideal to be attained by progressive and concerted action by all employers. The Bombay Provincial Trade Union Congress did not urge for the immediate adoption of this standard before the Textile Labour Inquiry Committee. It merely asked for a minimum of Rs. 25 for unskilled and Rs. 30 for semi-skilled workers $\ddagger$.

Mr.S. K. Gupte in his commentary on the Shops and Establishments Act points out that about 66 per cent. of the Shop Assistants are in receipt of minimum wages of Rs. 15 to Rs. 45 while the figures for the Textile and other Industrial Workers are Rs. 15 to Rs. 33 and for the Engineering Factories from $\cdot$ Rs. 16 to Rs. $35 . \S$ The average wage of a textile worker in Bombay in 1944 is reported to be Rs. 32-8.09.

The K. E. M. Hospital and G. S. M. College Employees Union have asked for a minimum wage of Rs. 30 and the Municipal Kamgar Sangh for a minimum of Rs. 30 for employees doing clean work, and Rs. 35 for those doing unclean work. The Municipal Workers' Union, the Bombay Municipal Peons' Union and the Bombay Municipal Employees Union have asked on the other hand for a minimum wage of Rs. 35. Some of these Unions have asked for equal wages for both male

[^5]and female workers. The danger of fixing a high minimum is that it leads inevitably to a large volume of unemployment ${ }^{*}$. In determining the living wage for the Municipal staf, the supply of amenities such as free education, medical aid, concessional rent, clothing, Municipal contribution to Provident Fund, should also be taken into consideration.
31. The question whether the minimum wage for men and women should be the same has raised
 some controversy. It forms one of the terms of reference to me. It will be readily agreed that if the work assigned to them both is similar in nature and turnover the rates of pay for both should be the same. But there are few occupations in which men and women have to perform quite similar functions. Should then the minimum wage for both be the same, whatever be the nature of their duties? The report of the Labour Office Enquiry into the Working Class Family Budgets answers the question as follows:-
> " The controversy regarding the demand for equal pay for equal work is an old one, but even to this day statistical proof is wanting, at least so far as the Indian working class is concerned, as regards the extent to which woman workers have to support dependants, especially children of 14 years of age. During the present enquiry information was specially gathered on this point and separately tabulated. It discloses that in only 9 cases had a female worker any children under 14 years of age to support and imno case was the number of dependants mare than $2, " t$
32. It adds that "when women are employed in Factories they are employed either as coolies or in
Practice in Factories such departments as winding and reeling. and Mills. Female coolies are the lowest paid among, mill operatives and in the schedule of minimum wages recently prescribed by the Bombay Mill Owners' Association, the wage laid down for a female coolie is only Rs. 12-3-0t".
33. The Textile Labour Inquiry Committee also answer this question almost in the same terms.
Practice in force else- They observe "they (rates of pay) will have where, to be different. A considerable gap in fact exists to-day between the lowest wages earned by men and wormen in the (textile) industry. Any violent disturbance of the existing differentiation is bound to affect the proportion in the employment offered to the two classes of workers. We have already noticed that in countries where the living wage basis is adopted for fixing a

[^6]minimum wage the standard of responsibility for the calculation of a woman's wage is defined in a different manner from that of an adult male"*. Thus where the work performed by, or the productivity of, each class differs a sex differential is inevitable. Any attempt to standardize wages among the two sexes in spite of these considerations is likely to affect materially the sex ratio in employment. For, every employer is interested in getting the maximum of work for the wages paid by him. - It is of course true that in certain occupations women are superior to men, as for example, in cotton spinning, winding, reeling, teaching small children and nursing, while for more hardy and muscular operations they are less suited. Generally speaking, women are paid all over the world less than men. "The average difference between the level of men's and women's wages is in most countries nearly as much as 50 per cent. " 4 . This is due to the following reasons:-
(1) Women are more liable to illness and to apply themselves temporarily to an employment and as such they are less useful to an employer.
(2) Custom excludes women from ernployment in certain kinds of work.
(3) A number of women who seek employment belong to families in straitened circumstances through low earnings, unemployment, illness or death of the male bread winner. These women being driven to work under pressure of poverty are willing to work for anything they can get. Other women, who seek employment, do so to supplement their family income and do not much care what they get, as they do not carry the responsibility of the prime bread wimer of the family.
34. Equality of pay for the two sexes may be justified where payment is according to "piece rates" and

Equality of pay when justified. not according to " time rates ", unless women are found equal in efficiency in any particular occupation. But if the slogan is pushed too far, there is a chance of the male labour displacing the female labour in competitive occupations. The Textile Labour Inquiry Committee recommend a differential minimum wage for males and females in the lowest paid employment, namely, that of sweepers. They suggest a minimum wage of Rs. 20 for women and of Rs. 24 for men sweepers and Rs. 25 for semi-skilled labourers. As against this the present wage levels for corresponding class of workers in the Bombay Municipality are Rs. 21 for females and Rs. 25 for males. As fernale labour is employed in the Municipality for specified jobs, in which it is found suitable, I am of opinion that no differentiation should be made in the basic minimum wage of the two classes of workers.

[^7]
## CHAPTER IV

## Cost of Living and Wage-levels.

35. It is said that wage-levels should be adjusted from time to time to the cost of living if labour discontent

Adjustment of wagelevels to the cost of living. is to be avoided. Prices " react on wages and particularly so in India where a much larger percentage of wages is spent on food stuffs than in Western countries."* It is, therefore, necessary to adjust wages to the price of food stuffs. While there is much to be said in favour of this proposition, in practice it is more difficult to bring about such an elasticity of adjustment in public service than in private service. The movement of wages in public service is usually slower and less fluctuating than in private service. A private individual is less bound by tradition, public opinion or " the moral minimum." The condition of his trade or industry and his capacity to pay are his sole criteria. In public service, no cuts are made in the existing salaries, except where employees voluntarily submit to them as was done by Municipal employees in 1933. Reduction in salaries is made only in respect of new entrants. At the time of the last war, the salaries in the Municipality were not revised till about the year 1920, although the cost of living according to index numbers prepared by the Bombay Labour Office had advanced, in the meanwhile, from 100 to 190 (see Appendix A)
36. The following table will show how the wages in the Municipality advanced first, in relation to the increase in the cost of living and secondly in relation to the increase in the wages in the Textile industry which is the staple industry of Bombay.

|  | Year. | Cost of living Index No. |  | Index No. of wages of Scavengering men in Municipal service. | Index No. of Wages of Municipal | Index No. of minimum Wages of Municipal service. |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| May | 1914 | 100 | 100 | 100 | 100 | 100 |
| May | 1921 | 167 | 187 | 164 | 128 | 160 |

* From the report of the Hilton Young Commission 1926 (quoted in the History of Indian Currency and Exchange by B. E. Dadachanii. p. 171.)
t Figures supplied by the Mill Owners' Association, Bornbay (inclusive of Dear Food Allowance).

| Yeer. |  |  | Cost of living Index No | Index No. of wages in Bombay Cotton Mills. | Inder No. of wages of Scavengeringmen in Municipal service. | Index No. of o wages of poons in Municipal service. | Inder No. <br> of minimum <br> wages of <br> clerks in Municipal service. |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| July | 1926 | $\ldots$ | 157 | 211 | 164 | 128 | 240 |
| October | 1934 | ... | 100 | 168 | 209 | 152 | 220 |
| December | 1939 | ... | 113 | 216 | 227 | 200 | 220 |
| August | 1941 | ... | 131 | 233 | 227 245* | * $2000216^{\circ}$ | 220 |
| July | 1942 | ... | 168 | 288 | 227 273* | * $200.240^{\circ}$ | $220240^{\circ}$ |
| July | 1943 | $\ldots$ | 236. | 387 | $277355 *$ | - 200 312** | $220{ }^{276}$ |
| Juty | 1944 | ... | 241 | 387 | 277, 391* | - $200344^{\circ}$ | $22029{ }^{*}$ |
| June | 1945 | ... | 235 | 377 | $227427 *$ | * $200376{ }^{*}$ | $220308{ }^{\circ}$ |

37. As against this, it is reported $\dagger$ that in the United Kingdom, The cost of living and while the cost of living has increased since mages in the United 1938 by about 50 per cent, the average increase Kingdona in wages is somewhere between Prof. Bowley's estimate of 44.5 per cent. and the estimate of 74 per cent. shown in the Ministry of Labour Census. The largest increase recorded is in the manufacturing industries i.e. 91 per cent. and the smallest increase is in the public utility companies i.e. 42 per cent. It is obvious that remuneration for public work can seldom, if ever, approach the highest earnings for similar work in private enterprise. Nor is it necessary even on economic grounds that it should do so, since the advantages of public employment in terms of prestige security, superannuation, leisure, interest, social purpose and satisfaction often out-weigh the relative advantages of higher income in private enterprise.

- 38. It must be noted that the actual price that one pays in The effect of the riee most cases in these days is higher than the in prices on fixed recorded price (on which the cost of living incomen. index is based) which is the controlled price usually not in operation. Every rise in prices
- Irdusive of Dearneas Allowauec.
$\dagger$ The Entern Ecovomist, 6th April 1945, p. 433.
brings down the value of the rupee. By 1943, the rupee is reported to have fallen by more than half.* Its present value is estimated to be lower than annas 6. When the rupse value falls, those persons who have fixed incomes, like salaries, wages, etc., find their incomes intrinsically reduced. When the currency falls, the first casualty is the poor and the middle classes. Organised labour may succeed in getting some relief to compensate it for the loss in the value of their incomes; but it is the unorganised labour which suffers most. It is true that their case received a somewhat belated recognition in the grant of a Dearness Allowance. But this allowance according to Mr. C. N. Vakil has " no relation to the rise in prices' ; in most cases it is a meagre acknowledgment of a difficult situation."*

39. The question for consideration is, therefore, whether having Should the relief be regard to the living wage standard set out substantive or temporary. in Chapter II, the minimum wage-levels elsewhere and the rise in the cost of living, the Municipal staff should be given a substantive relief, or whether the relief to be granted should be merely a palliative and of a temporary nature to tide over the present difficult times. I have already stated elsewhere that it took 18 years after the outbreak of the last war for the cost of living to come to normal (pre-war level) and this "normal" has again been so rudely shaken and upset by the conditions of the present war that a return to it seems out of the question for a long time to come.
40. Apart from this the salaries of Municipal servants were revised adversely from time to time in the past
Revision of the basic salary essential. culminating in the revision of 1935 , and the reduced grades have continued even to this day inspite of a material increase in the income of the Municipality. The statement in Appendix B shows the ratio of the cost of establishment to the total income and the expenditüre. This ratio has fallen from 21.51 in the year 1933.34 to 19.98 in the year $1943-44$ and from $20 \%$ in the year 1933.34 to 20.64 in the year $1943-44$ respectively.
[^8]
## CHAPTER V.

## General Revisions and Reorganizations in the past.

41. Before proceeding to make prôposals for the revision of salaries, it would be convenient to review in History of General Revisions. brief past revisions and re-organizations.
(a) Revisions.
42. Broadly speaking, there were five general revisions and

## Firpt Revision.

 various minor revisions affecting particular grades or departments. The earliest general revision took place in the year 1897-98, Prior to that year, no regular Establishment Schedule was being prepared as required by Section 79 of the Municipal Act. .The Corporation, therefore, requested the Commissioner, under their Resolution No. 7681, dated the 21 st October 1895, to prepare and submit such a schedule to the Standing Committee. Accordingly, in 1896-97, he submitted a revised schedule for the year 1897-98, in which he proposed a general revision of salaries. The additional cost on account of increases in salaries, allowances and the strength of the staff estimated under this revision was Rs. 29,436 per annum. The most important change made was that the Conveyance Allowance hitherto consolidated with pay was separated resulting in savings in Pension charges and leave allowances. Then followed three minor revisions increasing the salary only of the clerical and similar grades (vide Standing Committee Resolution No. 6168, dated the 23rd March 1906, Standing Committee Resolution No. 4967, dated the 13th November 1907, and Standing Committee Resolution No. 5553 , dated the 3rd December 1915, respectively) the first involving an extra cost of Rs. 3,216 per annum, the second Rs. 44,904 per annum and the third Rs. 48,036 per annum.43. The second general revision took place in 1918, whereby the staff of the different departments was re-graded (vide Standing Committee Resolution No. 7652, dated the 22nd February 1918, Corporation Resolution No. 8252, dated the 14th March 1918, and Corporation Resolution No. 8375, dated the 18th March 1918). Concurrently, a minor revision up-grading the clerical posts was effected (vide Standing Committee Resolution No. 7177, dated the 7th February 1918). This was followed by a further revision of the same grade in 1920, by partially absorbing the War allowance (vide Standing Committee Resolution No. 13342, dated the 20th February 1920),
which involved an additional cost of Rs. 1,62,000 per annum and of those in receipt of a salary of Rs. 200 and above (vide Corporation Resolution No. 9631, dated the 30th January 1922.)
44. The third general revision took place in the year 1922, (vide Standing Committee Resolution No. 6333, dated the 17th October 1922, and Corporation Resolution No. 7019, dated the 9th November 1922). The additional cost estimated was Rs. $2,50,488$ per annum.
45. The fourth general revision followed in the year 1926, when the balance of the War allowance was Fourth Revision. walgamated with pay, (vide Corporation Resolution No. 15696, dated the 29th March 1926). Upto this stage, the revisions were undertaken for scaling up the grades. Then the depression years followed and with it acute financial stringency and the process of reducing the salaries. By Standing Committee Resolutions No. 10763, dated the 17th February 1932, and No. 9104, dated the 2nd January 1932, and No. 3923, dated the 17th August 1932, the grades of clerks, motor drivers, lift attendants, etc., were reduced resulting in a saving of Rs. 99,852 per annum.
46. The fifth general revision took place in the year 1935. Fifth Revision. after a spell of ten years. In this revision, all grades were severely reduced resulting in an annual saving of Rs. $3,69,276$, the net percentage of reduction varying from 8.4 to 22.8 according to the class of employees (vide Corporation Resolution No. 819, dated the 4th March 1935). (b) Re-organizations.
47. Quite apart from the general revisions noted above, there Reorganizations of imwere re-organizations combined with revision portant Departranents. of grades in certain departments, viz. :-
(1) Water Department.-Vide Corporation Resolution No. 8136, dated the 19th March 1908, creating the post of Water Engineer ; vide Corporation Resolution No. 3991, dated the 9th October 1911, which sanctioned subordinate posts; vide Corporation Resolution No. 10727, dated the 8th February 1919, which sanctioned the cadre of Assistant and Deputy Engineers and Engineering Superintendents; vide Corporation Resolution No.14104, dated the 11th March 1920, which re-graded and strengthened the subordinate staff and vide Corporation Resolution No. 10232, dated the 23rd March 1931, which sanctioned the re-organization of the Department.
(2) City Engineer's Department.-Vide Corporation Resolution No. 10727, dated the 8th December 1919, which sanctioned the cadre of Assistant and Deputy Engineers and Engineering Superintendents; and vide Corporation Resolution No. 14104, dated the 11 th March 1920, which re-graded and strengthencd the subordinate staff; vide Corporation Resolution No. 9631, dated the 30th January 1922, which revised the salaries of the employees drawing Rs. 200 and above; vide Corporation Resolution No. 817, dated the 27th April 1922, which sanctioned the revision of the grades of the subordinate staff ; vide Corporation Resolution No. 15698, dated the 29th March 1926, which revised the grades of the Engineering staff and abolished the post of the Special Engineer, Development Works; and vide Corporation Resolution No. 6504, dated the 21 st October 1929, which re-organized the Department.
(3) Health Department.-Vide Corporation Resolution No. 10431, dated the 31st January 1898, which re-organized the whole staff so as to bring it in harmony with the growing sanitary requirements of the City ; vide Corporation Resolution No. 14422, dated the 19th March 1903, which sanctioned proposals for the re-organization of the staff ; vide Corporation Resolution No. 2539, dated the 25th July 1907, which sanctioned the permanent constitution of the department; vide Corporation Resolution No. 4534, dated the 19th October 1908, which sanctioned the re-organization of the subordinate staff and vide Corporation Resolution No. 13364, dated the lst March 1920, which sanctioned reorganization of the staff in the Medical, Sanitary and Conservancy Branches.
The general revisions and re-organizations of only the most important departments have been referred to here. Outside these major changes, there have been minor variations in the Establishment Schedules of each department from time to time according to the exigencies and expediencies of each department.,
(c) Sir M. Visvesvaraya's inquiry into Municipal Retrenchment and Reform.
48. All the revisions and re-organizations referred to above were undertaken without the aid of any - Sir M. Visvesvaraya's outside agency except the one undertaken inquiry. in the year 1924. In that year, the Corporation appointed under their Resolution No. 556, dated 4
the 14th April 1924, Sir M. Visvesvaraya K.c.I.E., D.Sc., M.I.C.E., for suggesting retrenchments and reforms in all the Municipal Departments. He was assisted by two assistants viz. Mr. N. D. Mehta on a salary of Rs. 1,400 plus leave and pension contribution (vide Corporation Resolution No. 5015, dated the 13th August 1924,) and Mr. C. M. Correa on a salary of Rs 1,500 per month for 3 months with the use of Municipal Motor Car when available for outside work plus leave and pension contribution to Government (vide Corporation Resolution No. 4791, dated the 8th August 1924.). Mr. Correa joined on the 19th August 1924. His period of appointment was later extended to 15th December 1924, (vide Corporation Resolution No. 9020, dated the 8th December 1924,). Mr. T. H. Bird assisted Sir M. Visvesvaraya as Secretary on Rs. 1,000 together with other office staff. Sir M. Visvesvaraya submitted a preliminary report on 25th June 1924, and the final report on 31st January 1925. These reports were more or less of a general character. The detailed inquiries into the working of each department were continued for a long time thereafter by Mr. N. D. Mehta and Mr. T. H. Bird. The cost of these inquiries was Rs. 98,972 . The total financial effect of these inquiries was a saving of Rs. 12 to 13 lakhs per annum. The only other inquiry which has been entrusted to an independent Officer is the present one, but it differs from that of Sir M. Visvesvaraya in two respects-first, it is more limited in scope and time, and secondly it is an inquiry for the consideration of up-grading the salaries rather than retrenchment.

## PART.II

CHAPTER VI.

## Broad features of the Proposals.

49. From the foregoing chapters it would appear that a revision of salaries is called for even on a long view.
Broad outhines. In this connection, I have had the benefit of suggestions made by the Heads of Departments and of representations made by several organizations of the Municipal employees and of discussions with some of their representatives. They are all unanimous about the inadequacy of the existing grades or salaries and urge that a liberal revision of the grades and salaries is called for. After carefully considering their submissions, I have formulated my own proposals. It must be obvious that any recommendations that I may make cannot go the full way of the departmental proposals or of the demands of employees' organizations. They are, however, as liberal, in my view, as they could possibly bewithin the limits of expediency and finance. The broad features of my proposals may be set out as follows. First, wherever the salaries were depressed in the revision of 1935, they have been restored and in some cases advanced where necessary. Secondly, where the grades have remained unaltered for a long time and the work, responsibilities and importance of the posts have increased the grades have been suitably improved. Thirdly, posts have been graded and efficiency bars suggested to be abolished to remove stagnation. Fourthly, a regular hierarchy of grades has been suggested to remove blocks in promotion. Fifthly, the existing conerence and co-relation between the grades inter se has been maintained as far as possible. Sixthly, the claims of the staff have as far as practicable been met consistently with the obligations and commitments of the Corporation.
50. I have embodied my detailed recommendations aboui the

Details revision of grades, conveyance allowances, messing charges, etc., in respect of each department in the accompanying statement marked "C". History of the revision of the salaries of some of the important posts, the duties and responsibilities attached to them, reasons for revising the grades now and the grades of corresponding posts in Covernment and other public bodies have been dealt with in the following Chapters.

## CHAPTER VII.

## Corporation and Standing Committee Office.

51. This office is in charge of all the secretarial work and records of the Corporation and its various
Functions and Strength Committees. It is under the control of the Standing Committee. The superior staff consists of a Secretary, a Deputy Secretary, and 2 Assistant Secretaries. The total strength of the staff is 46 and the total establishment cost is Rs. 72,486. per annum.
52. The Municipal Secretary.-This post appears to have been Municipal Secretary. created as far back as 1872. It was then designated "Secretary to the Town Council". and it carried a salary of Rs. $500 \mathrm{m00}$ (Section 26 of Bombay Act III of 1872, and IV of 1878). In 1888, the designation was changed to Municipal Secretary (Section 77(2)(d) of the Municipal Act 1888), and the salary was fixed at Rs. 700-1,000. By Act V of 1905 (Section 7) his salary was fixed at Rs. 700-1,000-1,200, subject to a proviso that the pay shall not be increased to Rs. 1,200 unless the incumbent has put in not less than 7 years' approved service in that post. By Corporation Resolution No. 7227, dated the 14th November 1929, the post was graded into Rs. $700-75-1,000-100-1200$, subject to the condition that the first increment after reaching Rs. 1,000 will be granted after 7 years of approved service by a special Resolution of the Corporation. There has been no change since then. There are no posts elsewhere exactly comparable to this post. The Secretary of the Board in the Port Trust, whose grade is Rs. 1,400-752,000, combines in him the functions of both the Municipal Secretary and the Deputy Municipal Commissioner. Nor can the duties of the Secretary to the Indian Merchants Chamber or of the Secretary to the Mill-owners' Association be said to be quite similar to those of the Municipal Secretary. He is required to have a thorough knowledge of procedure to be able to advise His Worship the Mayor, who is elected annually, on points of order or rules of procedure. Having regard to the importance of the post, I consider that the grade should be revised to Rs. 1,000-50-1200-75-1,500. This proposal will, however, require an amendment of Section 77(2)(d) of the Municipal Act.
53. Deputy Secretary.-The history of this post has many changes to record. Originally, the post was designated "Office Manager" and its grade was fixed at Rs. 150-10-200 (vide Corporation Resolution No. 5633; dated the

9th January 1889). In the re-organization of 1907-08, the designation was changed to Assistant Secretary and the grade was fixed at Rs. 200-10-300. In 1918, the grade was revised to Rs. 300-20-400 (vide Standing Committee Resolution No. 824, dated the lst May 1918). In 1922, the pay was further revised to Rs. $400-20-500$ (vide Standing Committee Resolution No. 11296, dated the 29th March 1922). From Ist April 1929, the grade was again revised to Rs. $450-30-600$ (vide Standing Committee Rasolution 6399, dated the 16th October 1929). In 1936, the designation was changed into Deputy Secretary (vide Standing Committee Resolution No. 1479, datedthe 18th March 1936). He is in charge of the work in connection with the meetings of the Corporation and of the Consultative Committees. He is besides required to attend to His Worship the Mayor, whose official and public duties have, in recent times, considerably increased. I, therefore, ${ }^{*}$ consider that the grade of this post should be revised to Rs. 500-40-700.
54. Assistant Secretary (Senior).-He is in charge of the work of Assistant Secretary (Sr.) the Standing Committee and the Improvements Committee. The post was originally designated "Office Superintendent" and its grade was fixed at Rs. $300-20-400$. In the re-organization of this office in 1936, the post was designated as Assistant Secretary, the grade, however, continuing: the same. (vide S. C. R. No. 1479, dated the 18th March 1936.) I suggest that in the present revision his grade should be fixed at Rs. $350-20-450$.

## 55. Assistant Secretary (Junior).-He is in charge of the work in connection with the Special Committees. The post was originally designated "Senior Chief

 Clerk" and the grade was fixed at Rs. 200-10-275. In the reorganization of 1936, the post was designated "Assistant Secretary (Junior)" and the grade was fixed at Rs. 275-15-350. I consider that in the present revision his grade should be fixed at Rs. 300-20-400.[^9]57. Clerical and subordinate service.-The grades of these posts are dealt with in separate chapters as the posts Clerical and Sub. are more or less common to all the departments.

Financial effect.
58. The financial effect of the proposals made in respect of this Department is an increase of Rs. 10,572 per annum in the cost of Establishment and of Rs. 2,203 per annum on Leave and Providënt Fund.

## CHAPTER VIII.

## The Audit Department

59. This department was established in 1938, under the control

Audit Department. of and responsible to the Standing Committee, to audit the accounts of the Municipal Corporation (including those of the Schools Committee).
60. Prior to this year, the Municipal accounts were being audited by two Statutory Auditors appointed for each official year. Audit is chiefly a corrective of the Administration.
61. The work done by this Department consists of-
(1) The audit of receipts;
(2) The audit of expenditure;
(3) The audit of stores, stock and other materials of the departments.
(1) The detailed audit of receipts, which was, prior to 1938, being attended to by the Revenue Audit Section of the Chief Accountant's Department under the supervision of the Test Audit Officer, was for some time transferred to this department. It was found, however, that the financial transactions of the Corporation should be directly under the control of the Municipal Commissioner, who was under the Act responsible for the maintenance of accounts, The work was, therefore, re-transferred to the Chief Accountant in 1939. The Audit Department, however, continues to exercise a check on the revenue transactions of all departments.
(2) The expenditure audit conducted by this department is mainly a post-audit and is confined to (i) examination of vouchers passed for payment with the corresponding items in the Main Ledgers, (ii) to questions involving finance in all matters and (iii) to checking of the original accounts pertaining to Provident Fund, Pensions, Leave, Banking, Investments and Loans.
(3) Periodical visits are paid by the Audit Staff to the different departments to see that the requirements of audit are carried out.

The audit conducted by the department is slightly more detailed compared with the audit carried out by the former Statutory Auditors, who confined themselves mainly to the work of
checking vouchers, day-books, subsidiary ledgers and the weekly accounts. It is not, however, complete and is carried out on a percentage basis and is thus of the nature of a test audit.
62. The remuneration that was being paid to the former Statutory Auditors was a sum not exceeding Rs. 10,000 under Section 136(3) of Bombay Act III of 1888. The remuneration was raised to Rs. 15,000 in 1922, and finally to Rs. 17,000 including Rs. 2,000 for the audit of the Schools Committee Accounts (vide Bombay Act VI of 1931).
63. The personnel of the department consists of (1) the Municipal Chief Auditor, (2) the Deputy Municipal Chief Auditor, (3) the Chief Audit Clerk, and (4) other staff numbering 33. The cost of the Establishment is Rs. 61,135. per annum

## 64. The Municipal Chief Auditor.-He is the Head of the Audit Municipal Chief Auditor. Department and is appointed by the Corporation under Section 78-A of the Municipal

 Act. Section 78-A(1)(c) of the Act provided that he shall receive such monthly salary not exceeding Rs. 1,000 as the Corporation from time to time might determine. The pay was graded at Rs. 700-50-1,000 under Corporation Resolution No. 827, dated the 10th February 1938. The scale has been revised this year to Rs. 1,200-1,500 by carrying out an amendment to Section 78-A(I)(c) of the Municipal Act (vide Bombay Act XII of 1945).As the pay of the post has been revised only this year with due regard to the importance of the post and the work required to be done by the Municipal Chief Auditor, the question of revising his salary again does not arise.
65. The Deputy Mumicipal Chief Auditor.-The original designaDepury Municipal Chief tion of the post was "Assistant Auditor " and Auditor. has since been changed to " Deputy Municipal Chief Auditor" and the grade revised to Rs. 350-25-600 (vide Standing Committee Resolution No. 1708, dated the 31st January 1945). All papers to be submitted to the Municipal Chief Auditor are required to be scrutinized by the Deputy Municipal Chief Auditor. I recommend that the minimum pay of this post be raised to Rs. 450 and that he may be allowed a grade of Rs. 450-25-600 to be in keeping with the grades suggested by me for similar posts in other departments.
66. Chief Audit Clerk.-Formerly the designation of this post was Chief Clerk and the grade was Rs. 180-10-240. The designation has since

## Chief Andit Clerk.

 been changed into "Chief Audit Clerk" and the grade raised to Rs. 200-15-300. The Chief Audit Clerk is in charge of the expenditure audit and office routine. The grade of this post has been revised very recently and does not call for any increase. I do not, therefore, propose any further change in the grade already sanctioned. It may, however, be mentioned that 1 have proposed an increment of Rs. 10 for chief clerks in other departmants, whose revised grade is suggested to be fixed at Rs. 200-10-300.67. Head Clerks and Clerks.-The grades fixed by Standing Head Clerke and Clerks. Committee Resolution No. 1708, dated the 31st January, 1945,for Head Clerks and Clerks are Rs. 150-10-200 and Rs. $75-5-100-10-150$, respectively. As I have proposed a minimum of Rs. 160 for the Head Clerks' posts in other departments, I recommend that the same minimum be fixed for these posts. As regards clerks, I recommend that the maximum of the grade be raised to Rs. 160 and that it be provided that in case double graduates are appointed, they be given a start of Rs. 85. The grades will thus be Rs. 160-10-200 and Rs. 75-5-100-10-160. respectively.
68. Peons efc.-The grades of these posts are dealt with in a separate chapter, as they are common to all the departments.

## Financial effect.

69. The financial effect of the proposals made in respect of this department is an increase of Rs. 2,832 per annum in the cost of Establishment and of Rs. 590 per annum on Leave and Provident Fund.

## CHAPTER IX

Municipal Commissioner's Office.
70. This is the central administrative office, which supervises, controls and guides all executive depart-
Functions and Strength ments. It is presided over by the Municipal Commissioner, who is assisted by a Deputy Commissioner, a Personal Assistant and other staff. The total strength of the staff is 47, including two part-time posts of Municipal Medical Examiners, and the total cost of the Establishment is Rs. 1,03,283.
71. The Municipal Commissioner.-He is the Chief Executive Municipal Commissioner. of departments".* While the direction of policies vests in the Corporation, the power of carrying them into effect vests in him. He is a co-ordinate authority and within certain limits independent of other authorities. He is the soul of municipal government. The material achievements of the Municipality depend in no small measure upon his initiative or imaginative effort and informed drive. The history of this post dates as far back as 1865. Section 12 of Bombay Act II of 1865 provided that his pay shall not be less than Rs. 3,000 per month. Seven years later, his pay was fixed at Rs. 2,000-2,500 (Section 43(a) of Bombay Municipal Acts 1872 and 1878). In 1888; his pay was fixed at Rs. 2,000-2,500-3,000. (Section 57(1) of the Municipal Act 1888). It was provided that the monthly salary might be raised to Rs. 3,000 after three years of service. In 1922, when the salaries of several posts were revised, it was proposed that the appointment of the Commissioner should be for a period of five years in the first instance and thereafter for a renewable period of three years, that the salary of the Commissioner for the first year should be Rs. 2,500, for the next two years Rs. 3,000, for the subsequent period of two years it should be Rs. 3,500 and thereafter if his term was renewed, the salary should be raised to Rs. 4,000. This proposal amongst others was approved by Corporation Resolution No. 9631, dated the 30th January 1922, but the legislation that followed (Section 15 of Bombay Act I of 1925), fixed his monthly pay at Rs. 3,000 and provided that it might be raised to a sum not exceeding Rs. 3,500 after three years of service. The question of

[^10]his salary was raised again at the time of 1935 general revision, but the Sub-Committee of the Standing Committee did not recommend any reduction on the ground that "a capable i.c.s. officer possessing not less than 20 years' experience in Government service, which is quite necessary for an officer holding the high office of the Municipal Commissioner of Bombay to enable him to discharge satisfactorily the very onerous duties of his office, will not be tempted to take up that office if the salary is not placed somewhat higher than what he gets in Covernment service."* The position was, however, changed in 1938, when by Section 26(1) of Bombay Act III of 1938, his minimum was fixed at Rs. 2,000 and maximum at Rs. 3,000 . It will be conceded that the salary of this officer must be at least equal to the salaries of officers of like status elsewhere. The Commissioner has often to represent the Corporation in negotiations with Covernment and other public bodies and public utility concerns. As status in this country is often determined by the salary drawn by on officer, the pay of this post has to be fixed having regard to the pay of Secretaries to Government, who are sometimes junior to him in Government service, and the salaries of the Heads of public bodies like the Port. Trust and the Railways and of Public Utility concerns like the B. E. S. \& T. Company and the Cas Company. So long as the salaries of these posts remain what they are, it is not desirable to place his salary below their level. The salary of the Chairman of the Port Trust is Rs. $3,000-100-3,500$ with a rent free bungalow. The salary of the General Managers of the two Railways in the City is Rs. 3,500. Having regard to all these considerations, I suggest that the minimum salary of the Commissioner should be Rs. 3,000 and, if his term is renewed, it should be increased to Rs. 3,500 as previously provided in Bombay Act I of 1925. This proposal will require an amendment of Section 57 of the Municipal Act.
72. Deputy Municipal Commissioner (Municipal).-This post was created as a temporary measure for 3 months Depaty Mamicipal Comminainemer. by Bombay Act III of 1885, and the salary of the post was fixed at Rs. 1,500 per month. The post was made permanent by Bombay Act III of 1888, after much debate and a great deal of argument. Its pay was then fixed at

[^11]Rs. $1,200-1,500$. The Deputy Commissioner is required to assist the Commissioner in routine matters. Certain departments are placed under his direct supervision and control, namely, the Health Department, the Assessment Department, the Markets Department, the License, the Stores, the Gardens, the Election and Town Duty and the Victoria and Albert Museum. But papers relating to important matters, such as questions of policy or higher appointments are required to be submitted to the Commissioner. In 1922 revision, the Commissioner recommended that the maximum pay of this post should be raised • to Rs. 2,000, especially as the Secretary of the Port Trust, who held a similar position was then paid Rs, $1,800-100-2,300$. The Standing Committee recommended a salary of Rs. $1,500-2,000$ and the latter proposal, amongst others, was approved by the Corporation under their Resolution No. 9631, dated the 30th January 1922. In the Bill for the Amending Act I of 1925, the proposal was incorporated, but it was deleted in the subsequent passage of the Bill. In 1935, the salary of the post was graded into Rs. 1,200-50-1,500 (vide Corporation Resolution No. 819, dated the 4th March 1935). In view of the immense increase in the work of this post and the desirability of keeping his grade on a level with that of officers of like status in other public bodies, I suggest that his grade be fixed at Rs. $1,500-75-1,800$. This will require an amendment of Section 58 of the Municipal Act.

## 73. Personal Assistant to the Commissioner.-This post was

 originally designated "Office Assistant to the Municipal Commissioner" and it carried a salary of Rs. 300 in 1882-83, which was raised to Rs. 500 in 1891-92. In the general revision of 1897-98, the post was designated "Assistant to the Municipal Commissioner and Superintendent of Printing and Stationery" and graded at Rs. 300-40-500. By Corporation Resolution No. 8375, dated the 18th March 1918, the grade was placed on a level with that of the Assistant Assessors and Assistant Accountants, viz., Rs. 300-20400. In 1926, the pay was revised to Rs. $350-25-500$ (pide Corporation Resolution No. 15696, dated the 29th March 1926) In 1942, the designation of the post was changed into " Personal Assistant to the Commissioner', buit the grade of Rs. 350-25-500 was continued. The Deputy Municipal Commissioner has recommended that his grade should be revised to Rs. 450-25-650, as in his view the existing grade is not adequate, considering the status
of the office and responsibilities of the post. I, however, recommend that his grade be revised to Rs. 450-25-600.

Financial effect.
74. The financial effect of the proposals made in respect of this Financial effect. department is a net increase of Rs. 13,500 per annum in the annual cost of Establishment, and of Rs. 2,813 per annum on Leave and Provident Fund.

Rs. $1,200-1,500$. The Deputy Commissioner is required to assist the Commissioner in routine matiers. Certain departments are placed under his direct supervision and control, namely, the Health Department, the Assessment Department, the Markets Department, the License, the Stores, the Gardens, the Election and Town Duty and the Victoria and Albert Museum. But papers relating to important matters, such as questions of policy or higher appointments are required to be submitted to the Commissioner. In 1922 revision, the Commissioner recommended that the maximum pay of this post should be raised to Rs. 2,000, especially as the Secretary of the Port Trust, who held a similar position was then paid Rs, $1,800-100-2,300$. The Standing Committee recommended a salary of Rs. 1,500-2,000 and the latter proposal, armongst others, was approved by the Corporation under their Resolution No. 9631, dated the 30th January 1922. In the Bill for the Amending Act I of 1925, the proposal was incorporated, but it was deleted in the subsequent passage of the Bill. In 1935, the salary of the post was graded into Rs. $1,200-50-1,500$ (vide Corporation Resolution No. 819; dated the 4th March 1935). In view of the immense increase in the work of this post and the desirability of keeping his grade on a level with that of officers of like status in other public bodies, I suggest that his grade be fixed at Rs. $1,500-75-1,800$. This will require an amendment of Section 58 of the Municipal Act.
73. Personal Assistant to the Commissioner.-This post was originally designated " Office Assistant to the Municipal Commissioner" and it carried a salary of Rs. 300 in 1882-83, which was raised to Rs. 500 in 1891-92. In the general revision of 1897-98, the post was designated "Assistant to the Municipal Commissioner and Superintendent of Printing and Stationery" and graded at Rs. 300-40-500. By Corporation Resolution No. 8375, dated the 18th March 1918, the grade was placed on a level with that of the Assistant Assessors and Assistant Accountants, viz., Rs. 300-20400. In 1926, the pay was revised to Rs. $350-25-500$. (vide Corporation Resolution No. 15696, dated the 29th March 1926) In 1942, the designation of the post was changed into " Personal Assistant to the Commissioner', but the grade of Rs. 350-25--500 was continued. The Deputy Municipal Commissioner has recommended that his grade should be revised to Rs. 450-25-650, as in his view the existing grade is not adequate, considering the status

## 37

of the office and responsibilities of the post. I, however, recommend that his grade be revised to Rs. 450-25-600.

Financial effect.
74. The financial effect of the proposals made in respect of this Financial effoct. department is a net increase of Rs. 13,500 per annum in the annual cost of Establishment, and of Rs. 2,813 per annum on Leave and Provident Fund.

## CHAPTER X

## Audit and Accounts Department.

75. This Department is in charge of the Chief Accountant, who acts as the Financial Adviser to the Municipal
Functionsand Streagth Commissioner. It prepares the Annual Budget and keeps accounts of receipts and expenditure except the accounts of the Schools Committee. It also exercises control over the departmental expenditure by means of pre-audit. It is in charge of Municipal Funds and consequently attends to investments and questions like the raising and amortization of loans. Economy in the Municipal administration depends to a very large extent upon its vigilance. The strength of the department is 191 and the cost of the Establishment is Rs. 2,81, 484 per annum.
76. The Chief Accountant.-Few posts in the Municipality have Chief Accountant. undergone such changes in the matter of both designation and pay as this post. The post was created in 1871. It was then designated as "Controller of Municipal Accounts" and carried a salary of Rs. 1,500 a month. In the year 1873, the salary was reduced to Rs. 1,000 and the designation changed to "Auditor and Accountant". In the year 1874, the salary was further reduced to Rs. 850. - In 1875, the designation was changed to "Chief Accountant and Auditor" and the salary was fixed at Rs. 900. In 1876, the post was graded and the pay fixed at Rs. $450-50-$ 700. In the year 1881, the designation was changed to "Controller of Municipal Accounts " and a personal allowance of Rs. 100 was granted to the incumbent. The following year, the pay was revised to Rs. 700-50-1,200. After the enactment of the Municipal Act of 1888, the designation was changed to " Chief Accountan: " and the salary was fixed at Rs. 1,200 in the grade of Rs. 700-50-1,200. In the general revision of 1897-98, the grade was revised to Rs. $800-50-1,200$ and the then Chief Accountant was granted under Corporation Resolution No. 10922, dated the 18th January 1897, a personal allowance of Rs. 250, which, however, was abolished (on the death of the incumbent) in the year 1898-99. Under Corporation Resolution No. 6333, dated the 16th January 1908, a personal'allowance of Rs. 300 was sanctioned to the then Chief Accountant. In 1916-17, the grade was revised to Rs. 1,000-100-1,500. Under Corporation Resolution No. 9631, dated the 30th January 1922, the personal allowance of Rs. 300 was increased to Rs. 600. The grade was further revised to Rs. 1,200-75-1,800
under Corporation Resolution No. 10538, dated the 29th January 1925. In 1934-35, the grade was reduced to Rs. 1,200-50-1,500, under Corporation Resolution No. 819, dated the 4th March 1935. This grade is still in force. The pay of the post of the Chief Accountant in the Bombay Port Trust is Rs. $1,400-75-2,000$. The pay of the post of the Financial Advisor and Chief Accounts Officer in the G. I. P. Railway is Rs. $2,200-100-2,500$. Having regard to the importance of the post, I recommend a grade of Rs. 1,500-75-1,800.
77. The Deputy Accountant.- In the year 1871, there was a post of "Head Accountant and Assistant Controller" Depoty Accountant. on Rs. 450 . From 1873 to 1880, the post was designated as "Assistant Accountant" in the grade of Rs. 230-30 -350 . In the year 1883-84, the designation was changed to "Assistant to the Controller" and the grade was revised to Rs. 250-25-500. After the enactment of the Municipal Act of 1888 , the designation of the post was changed to "Assistant Accountant ". In 1890.91, the designation was changed to "Deputy Accountant". In the gencral revisioń of 1897-98, the grade was revised to Rs. 300-25-500. In 1898-99, a Personal Allowance of Rs. 100 was granted to the then incumbent. In the year 1909-10, the grade was revised to Rs. 500-40-700 and the Personal Allowance was discontinued. In the year 1916-17, the increment was increased to Rs. 50, the grade otherwise continuing as before. In the year 1918, it was further revised to Rs. 600-30-900 under Corporation Resolution No. 8375, dated the 18th March 1918. In 1922, it was further revised to Rs. $700-50-1,000$ under Corporation Resolution No. 9631, dated the 30th January 1922. In the year 1924, the then Deputy Accountant was granted a Personal Allowance of Rs. 200 under Corporation Resolution No. 11575, dated the 6th March 1924. In the general revision of 1934-35, the grade was reduced to Rs. $660-40-900$ under Corporation Resolution No. 819, dated 4th March 1935. This grade is still in force. The present grade of the post of the Deputy Chief Accountant in the Bombay Port Trust is Rs. $900-50-1,250$ and that of the Senior Assistant Accountant is Rs. $700-40-900$. It will thus be seen that the minimum of the present grade of the Deputy Accountant in the Bombay Municipality is less than even that of the Senior Assistant Accountant in the Port Trust and the maximum is equal to the minimum of the grade of the Deputy Chief Accountant in the Port Trust. The pay of the post of the Deputy

Chief Accounts Officer of the G. I. P. Railway is Rs.. 1,300 . In the circumstances, I think it is desirable to revise the grade suitably and fix it at Rs: $700-50-1,000$.
78. The Test Audit Officer. - The post of the Test Audit Officer was created in the year 1922-23, in the grade of Rs. $600-50-800$, under Corporation

## Test Audit Officer.

 grade of Rs. $600-50-800$, under Corporation Resolution No. 972, dated the 1st May 1922. The maximum of the grade was raised to Rs. 1,000 in the same year, under Corporation Resolution No. I1392, dated the 28thMarch 1923. In the general revision of salaries of 1934-35, thegrade was revised to Rs. $660-40-900$ under Corporation Resolution No. 819, dated the 4th March 1935. This Officer is in charge of Revenue Audit. He is often required to conduct inquiries into cases of fraud, defalcation, bribery and corruption. . He is also in charge of the Municipal Printing Press. There is no corresponding post in the Bombay Port Trust or any other Public body. I suggest that his grade be fixed on a par with that of the Deputy Accountant at Rs. 700-50-1,000.79. Assistant Accountants (Ist Grade and 2nd Grade).-There are two posts of Assistant Accountants, Assistant Accountants,
st grade and 2nd grade. (First Grade), in the scale of Rs. 350-20-450 and two posts of Assistant Accountants, (Second grade), in the scale of Rs. 275-15-350. Prior to the revision of 1934-35, the grades of these posts were Rs. $350-25-500$ and Rs. $300-20-400$, respectively. The Assistant Accountants form a link between the Chief Accountant and the Deputy Accountant on the one hand and the subordinate staff on the other. All work relating to Budget, Establishment Schedule, Administration Report, Leave, and Provident Fund passes through them. In the Port Trust, there are two posts of Senior Assistant Accountants in the grade of Rs. 700-40-900, four posts of Assistant Accountants in the grade of Rs. $500-25-700$ and five posts of Junior Assistant Accountants in the grade of Rs. 375-20-475. Thus, there are 11 posts of Assistant Accountants, as against 4 in the Bombay Municipality. In the G. I. P. Railway, there are two posts of Senior Accounts Officers, Grade I, Rs. 950, Grade II, Rs. 850, and Grade III, Rs. 750, 4 posts of Junior Accounts Officers in the grade of Rs. 300-25-400-450 (seventh year) Rs. 500 (tenth year and after) and 5 posts of Assistant Accounts Officers in the grade of Rs. $500-25-525-550-600$. The existing grades of the Assistant Accountants in the Bombay Municipality are far below these levels and thus appear to be inadequate.

I, therefore, recommend that the scale of the First Grade Assistant Accountants be revised to Rs. 450-25-600 and that of the Second Grade Assistant Accountants to Rs. 350-20-450.
80. Shorthand-Typist.-The post was created as a temporary

## Shorthand Typist.

 measure in the year 1921-22, and brought on the permanent schedule from 1922-23, in the grade of Rs. $100-5-125$. The grade was revised to Rs. $90-5-150$ (vide Standing Committee Resolution No. 6333, dated the 17 th October 1922). In the general revision of 1934-35, the grade was reduced to Rs. 75-4-115-5-140 (vide Standing Committee Resolution No. 879, dated the 28th November 1934). The Chief Accountant has proposed the conversion of the post into that of "Stenographer and Head Typist" in the grade of Rs. 180-10-240. The work of the post has considerably increased and is also responsible. I, therefore, recommend that the post of the "Shorthand Typist" should be converted into that of "Senior Stenographer "in the grade of Rs. 160-8-200.81. Stock Verifiers.-Prior to the year 1929-30, there was no Stock Verifiers. post of a Stock Verifier on the permanent Establishment. In the Establishment Schedule of the year 1929-30, a post of a Stock Verifier in the grade of Rs. $90-5-150$ was included. In the general revision of 1934-35, the grade was reduced to Rs. 75-4-115-5-140. This grade is still in force. In the Establishment Schedule for the year 1945-46, there are four posts of Stock Verifiers. Out of these four posts, the Chief Accountant has proposed that two posts be designated as "Senior Stock Verifiers" and their grade fixed at Rs. 120-10-200, and the other two posts be designated as "Junior Stock Verifiers" and their grade fixed at Rs 80-5-140-8-180. In my opinion, it will be enough if only one post is converted as "Senior Stock Verifier" and his grade fixed equivalent to that of a "Head Clerk" at Rs. 160-8-200. The other three posts may be designated as "Junior Stock Verifiers" in the grade' of Rs. 80-5-100-6-160.
82. Subordinate and Inferior services.-I have dealt with their grados in separate chapters.

## Financial Effect.

83. The financial effect of the proposals made in respect of this department is a net increase of Rs. 43,200
Financial effect. in the cost of Establishment per annum and of Rs. 9,000 per annum on Leave and Provident Fund.

## CHAPTER XI.

## Assessment and Collection Department.

84. 'This Department is charged with the assessment of properties and collection of Municipal taxes.
Functions and Surength. The total number of properties in the City is 49,631 and the total amount collected by way of taxes is Rs. $4,22,70,975$. This Department is also required to recoverr the Riot Tax whenever imposed, and the Urban Immovable Tax which amounted to Rs. $86,02,931$ during 1944-45. The total strength of the Department is 448 and the total cost of Establishment is Rs. $6,31,405$ per annum. The cost of collection in the year $1905-06$ was 2.81 per cent of the total demand and 2.87 per cent of the total collection. This percentage has gone down to 1.41 and 1.56 in 1944-45 respectively, which will show that the strength and the salaries of the staff have not kept pace with the increase in the revenue. Rates form the sinews of local government ; and on the industry, ability and integrity of this staff a great deal depends.
85. The Assessor and Collector.-He is the Chief Revenue Officer. It is his duty to see that all the proAssessor and Collector. perties in the City are adequately assessed and the taxes thereon are duly collected. All complicated cases of assessment are dealt with by him personally. He supervises and guides the work of the entire staff both indoor and outdoor. The pay of the post in 1884 was Rs. 900 . In 1889-90, the post was graded into Rs. $800-50-1,200$. In 1924, the Corporation sanctioned a personal allowance of Rs. 200 to the then incumbent (vide Corporation Resolution No. 2575, dated the 12th June 1924). In 1.925, the Commissioner proposed that the grade of the post be revised to Rs. $1,000-75-1,500$. But the question of the revision of the grade was postponed pending a report from the Commissioner on the reform and reorganization of the department and the desirability or otherwise of separating the Assessment from the Collection work (vide Municipal Commissioner's letter underlying Standing Committee Resolution No. 12327, dated the 10th March 1925). By Standing Committee Resolution No. 2497, dated the Ilth June 1924, the Commissioner was requested to submit proposals for separating the Assessment and Collection Branches under the Assessor and

Collector. ' The Commissioner's report, on the subject, to the effect that such separation was not feasible unless the Municipal Act was amended was recorded by the Standing Committee (vide their Resolution No. 13071, dated the 25th March 1925). The question was again dealt with by Mr. Bird in his report, dated the 19th December 1925, but such separation was not considered advisable (vide Corporation Resolution No. 9322, dated the 20th January 1930). The grade of the post, however, still remained to be revised. In 1934, a change was effected but adversely by reducing the annual increment from Rs. 50 to Rs. 40. The present grade is thus Rs. $800-40-1,200$. In Calcutta, where the Municipal revenue is only 2.60 crores (1942-43), the Assessment work is separated from the Collection work. The Assessor's grade is Rs. 750-25-1,000-50-1,250 and the Collector's grade is Rs: $750-25-1,000$. The duties of these two posts are combined in one officer in Bombay. Having regard to the fact that the grade of the post has remained practically unchanged for now nearly 55 years, although the duties and responsibilities of the office have vastly increased on account of the growth of the City and its industrial development, I am of opinion that the grade should be revised to Rs. 1,000-50-1,200-75-1,500 and the Conveyance Allowance increased from Rs. 120 to Rs. 150.
86. Deputy Assessor.-The duties of this post are: (1) to attend to routine correspondence, (2) to dispose of simple cases of assessment (3) to sign refund cases, refund certificates and Ward Superintendents' remittance reports (4) to scrutinize budget estimates, revised estimates and the annual report and (5) to supervise the work of the in-door staff at the Head Office. This post was created in 1919 (vide Cor~ poration Resolution No. 1210, dated the 12th May 1919). The grade then was Rs. 500-40-700. The question of revising this grade was considered twice but without effect (Corporation Resolution No. 327, dated the 14th April 1927, and Corporation Resolution No. 7081, dated the llth November 1929). The work and responsibility of this post have increased pari passu with those of the Assessor and ${ }^{\prime}$ Collector. He is also now required to hear complaints against rateable volues, which work having enormously increased is now being shared by the Deputy Assessor with the Assessor and Collector. The grade of the post was revised adversely in 1934 to Rs. 400-25-700. In Calcutta, there is a Deputy Assessor on Rs. 400-20-600 and a Deputy Collector in the same grade. The duties of these
two posts are combined in one here. Having regard to these considerations and the increase in work and responsibilities of the post, I consider that its grade should be revised to Rs. $600-40-800$ and a Conveyance Allowance of Rs. 100 for maintaining a motor car or otherwise of Rs. 75 should be attached to it, as he is now required to do out-door duties.
87. Assistant Assessors.-The duties of these posts include (1)

Assistant Assessors. inspection of properties with"a view to test. ing the correctness of assessment proposed by the ward staff, (2) inspection of vacancies every half-year with a view to certifying refund and dealing with all routine correspondence in regard to refunds or draw-backs, (3) defending with the help of Municipal Solicitors or the Legal Assistant all appeals against assessment filed in the Small Causes Court, (4) supervising the collection of Property Taxes and the Urban Immovable Property Tax and conducting routine correspondence in connection therewith, and taking such steps as are found necessary for recovery of the taxes; (5) conducting fortnightly examination of books and accounts of the Ward Office staff, and (6) scrutiny of Drawback claims. One of the Assistant Assessors attends exclusively to Wheel Tax work. Prior to 1919, there were three Assistant Assessors on different grades, namely, (1) Rs. 250-10-300 (2) Rs. 300-10-350 and (3) Rs. 350-10-400, but all of them were placed in a uniform grade of Rs. $300-20-400$ in 1919-20. This grade was raised to Rs. $350-25-500$ (vide Corporation Resolution No. 156\%, dated the 29th March 1926). It was, however, reduced to Rs. 350-20-450 in the revision of 1935. In view of the growing complexity of their work and their increased responsibilities, the Assessor and Collector has proposed that their grade should be revised to Rs. $450-$ 25-650 and their Conveyance Allowance from Rs. 60 to Rs. 90. I, however, consider that a grade of Rs. 450-25-600 plus a Conveyance Allowance of Rs. 100 for maintaining a motor car, otherwise Rs. 75, would be adequate.

[^12]89. Cashier and a Clerk working as Assistant Cashier.-The Assessor and Collector points out that the existCanhier and Assistant ing grade of the Cashier, namely, Rs. 140-5Cashier.

180 is quite inadequate, having regard to the vast sums he has to handle and a security of Rs. 3,000 required to be furnished by him and proposes that the grade should be revised to Rs. 250-10-300. For the clerk working as Assistant Cashier in the grade of Rs. 60-5-150, he proposes a grade of Rs. 170-7-240. I consider that the grade of the Cashier should be Rs. 200-10-250 and that of the clerk working as Assistant Cashier Rs. 160-8-200.
90. Record clerk and Transfer clerk.-The Assessor and Collector points out that the Chief Record
Record Clerk and keeper in his office is required to maintain Transfer Clerk. records from 1860 or so and make important searches and furnish certificates for which a fee is charged to the public. As regards the Transfer clerk, he points out that he is required to scrutinize documents in regard to the transfer of properties and changes in ownership and to see that all legal formalities have been observed before a change is effected in the name of the owner in the Assessment Book. The Assessor and Collector suggests that the grades of these posts should be revised to Rs. 170-7-240. Ir recommend that both the posts be converted into those of Head clerks and their grade be fixed at Rs. $160-8-200$.
91. Survey Branch.-There are 4 posts of Surveyors in

## Surveyorm,

 this Branch. One of them is the Super vising Surveyor. He advises the Assessment Department in matters of valuation of Government, Port Trust and Mill properties. His present grade is Rs. 200-10-300 plus Rs. 20 Conveyance Allowance. The Assessor and Collector suggests that he should be designated as the Chief Rating Surveyor and his grade should be revised to Rs. 275-15-375 plus Rs. 60 Conveyance Allowance. I consider that a grade of Rs. 250-10-350 plus Rs. 40 Conveyance Allowance would be adequate. There are three other Surveyors who are required to deal with other special classes of properties, factories and owner-occupied buildings. Their present grade is (1) Rs. 140-8-220 (2) Rs. 140-5-180 and (3) Rs. 100-5-140. All of them are allowed a Conveyance Allowance of Rs. 20 each. The Assessor and Collector suggests that the first two posts should be designated as Senior Rating Surveyors andthe third as Junior Rating Surveyor and that both the Senior Rating Surveyors be placed in the grade of Rs. 180-10-250 plas Rs, 40 Conveyance Allowance and the Junior on Rs. $100-5-135-8-175$ plus Rs. 30 Conveyance Allowance. I consider that the grade for the two Senior Rating Surveyors should be Rs. 180-10-250 plus Rs. 30 Conveyance Allowance and that for the Junior Rating Surveyor Rs. 100-5-170 plus Rs. 25 Conveyance Allowance.
92. Ward Superintendents (I Grade.)-There are three posts Ward Superintendents, in this grade, each in charge of a heavy 1st grade. ward, namely, A, C, \& D. They supervise the work of the ward staff and see that all properties in their ward are fairly assessed and the taxes duly collected. The Assessor and Collector states that the-Ward Superintendents are the mainstay of his department and that their grades are inadequate for men of the requisite qualifications and ability. He recommends that their grades should be revised from Rs. 275-15-350 plus Rs. 60 Conveyance Allowance to Rs. 350-20-450 plus Rs. 75 Conveyance Allowance. I consider a grade of Rs. 350-20-450 plus Rs. 75 Conveyance Allowance as proper.
93. Ward Superintendents (II Grade).-There are 4 posts in this
Ward Superintendents, grade each in charge of less heavy wards,
2nd Grade.
posts are otherwise namely, B, E, F and. G .. The duties of these
I. Crade. Their those of the Superintendents of
Conveyance Allowance. The Assessor. and Collector recommends
that the grade should be revised to Rs. $275-15-350$ plus R. 75
Conveyance Allowance. I consider a grade of Rs. $275-15-350$
plus R. 75 Conveyance Allowsince as proper plus Rs. 75 Conveyance Allowance as proper.
94. Deputy Superintendents.-These officials assist the Ward Superintendents in assessment of properties Deputy Superintenm and collection of taxes. Their present grade dents. is Rs. $150-5-190$ plus Rs. 15 Conveyance Allowance. The Assessor and Collector recommends that their grade be revised to Rs. 180-10-250 plus Rs. 25 Conveyance Allowance (or Rs. 40 if a motor cycle is maintained). I recommend a grade of Rs. 180-10-260 plus Rs. 25 Conveyance Allowance (or Rs. 40 if a motor cycle is maintained) to be in keeping with the grades recommended for similar appointments in other Departments.
95. Assistant Superintendents:-They are in charge of bills and accounts in Ward offices. Their duties Assistant Superintenv are as responsible as those of Head Clerks and dents. the present grade is also identical with theirs, but the Assistant Superintendents have to furnish a security unlike most Head Clerks. The Assessor and Collector proposes that their grade should be revised to Rs. $170-7-240$. I have proposed elsewhere that the grade of the Head Clerks should be revised to Rs. $160-8-200$ and I suggest that the same be adopted in this case.
96. Ward Inspectors:-Their duties are to inspect properties for assessment purposes, and garages and stables for levy of the tax on vehicles and animals, and to collect property and wheel taxes in their sections and to take action as provided by law viz. serving notices, executing warrants of distress etc. for recovering the taxes from the rate-payers. Their work is unpopular and unpleasant. They come in day-to-day contact with various classes of people and temperament and on their tact and resourcefulness much of the smooth working and efficiency of the department depends. Their work being out-door, they are exposed to the inclemencies of weather. It is thus more difficult and strenuous than that of clerks in whose grade they have been placed. The Assessor and Collector suggests that their grade should be revised from Rs. 55-4-115-5-140 plus Rs. 10 Conveyance Allowance to Rs. 75-5-175 plus Rs. 15 Conveyance Allowance. I consider a grade of Rs. 75-5-100-7-170 plus Rs. 15 Conveyance Allowance as adequate, pass graduates being given a start of Rs. 85 Honours Graduates Rs. 90 and Double Graduates Rs. 95.

[^13]Inspector succeeded in taxing a number of such vehicles. The Assessor and Collector states that at present the work of the Motor Inspectors is not supervised by anybodyas there is no post of a senior Inspector on the establishment. He has, therefore, suggested the conversion of one post of Motor Inspector in the grade of Rs. 60-5150 plus Conveyance Allowance Rs. 10 plus extra Conveyance Allowance Rs. 30 into a post of "Chief Motor Inspector" in the grade of Rs. 160-8-200 plus Conveyance Allowance Rs. 50 for maintaining a motor cycle. The duties of this post will be (1) to supervise the work of the other Motor Inspectors, (2) to tax vehicles hired by Motor Companies to the Military and Naval Authorities and kept on plots scattered in the City, (3) to test-check garages in the City and tax motor vehicles which have remained untaxed, and (4) to tax vehicles registered outside Bombay but found kept or running in the City. This arrangement would be in modification of that sanctioned by Standing Committee Resolution No. 318, dated the 7th June 1944. I agree with the Assessor and Collector and recommend the conversion of one post of Motor Inspector into that of Chief Motor Inspector in the grade of Rs. $160-8-200$ plus Conveyance Allowance Rs. 50 for maintaining a motor cycle.
-98. Havaldars and Peons:-As these posts are common to all Havaldare and Peons. the departments they have been dealt with in a separate chapter.

## Financial Effect.

99. The financial effect of the proposals made in respect of this department is a net increase of Rs. 1,18,908 per annum in the cost of Establishment and of Rs. 24,772 per annum on Leave and Provident Fund.

## CHAPTER XII

## Town Duty Refund and Election Department.

100. This Department is charged with the work in connection with the levy and refund of Town Duties and conduct of elections when they fall due. Town Duty is levied on certain consumable articles brought into the City. If the articles are exported within 6 months of the import the duty is refunded. The duty on the articles imported by rail is collected at the Railway stations through the Railway administrations and on those imported by sea is collected at the docks through the Port Trust. The duty on imports by road via Mahim, Sion and Chembur Causeways was being collected through the Port Trust till the year 1940, when the out-posts were taken over by this department. The Port Trust and the Railways are thus the main agencies of collection and they are paid 3 per cent. commission on the collection. The principal function of this department is, therefore, to certify refunds in the case of dutiable goods exported within 6 months of their import, when claims are lodged within one month of the date of export.
101. The department is also charged with the preparation of the Election Roll and the conduct of elections when they fall due. For the latter, however, ad hoc staff is sanctioned. The election work was entrusted to the Assessment Department when there was the Rate-payers franchise. In 1922, when the elections came to be held on a tenancy franchise, the work was transferred to the Town Duty Refund Department. When the franchise was reduced to a rental of Rs. 5, the election work was separated and placed under an independent officer (vide Standing Committee Resolution No. 1042, dated the 25th November 1936 and Corporation Resolution No. 757, dated the 17th December 1936). In 1938, the two departments were again amalgamated (vide Corporation Resolution No. 154, dated the 20th June 1938). The department is in charge of the Election and Town Duty Refund Officer. The total strength of the staff is 174 and the total cost of the establishment is Rs. $1,69,749$. per annum.
102. The Election and Town Duty Officer.-In 1918-19, there

Election and Town Duty was a post of Revenue and Refund Audit officer. Officer in the grade of Rs. 600-25-800. By Corporation Resolution No. 8375, dated the 18th March 1918, the
designation was changed to Deputy Assessor and Town Duty Refund Officer, the grade being revised to Rs. $500-40-700$. The grade was further revised to Rs. 700-50-1,000 in 1922 (vide Corporation Resolution No. 6331, dated the 30th January 1922). The grade was reduced to Rs. 500-50-700 by Corporation Resolution No. 4128, dated the 6th August 1928. In 1935 revision; the grade was further reduced to Rs. 400-25-700 (vide Standing Committee Resolution No. 879, dated the 28th November 1934, and Corporation Resolution No. 819, dated the 4th March 1935). Thereafter, certain permutations and combinations of duties took place. On the introduction of the five rupee franchise, the election work was separated as aforesaid and placed under an independent officer, called the Election Officer, from 1st March 1937, in the grade of Rs. 250-10-350 plus Rs. 40 Conveyance Allowance (vide Corporation Resolution No. 757, dated the 17th December 1936.) Brief experience showed that neither the Town Duty Refund Officer nor the Election Officer was fully occupied. The Commissioner, therefore, proposed that the post of the Town Duty Refund Officer on Rs. 400-25-700 be held in abeyance and the work transferred with effect from 25th June 1938 to the Election Officer, which post, he suggested, should be designated as Election and Town Duty Officer and placed in the grade of the Assistant Assessors viz., Rs. $350-20-450$ plus Rs. 120 Conveyance Allowance and given assistance of a Chief clerk in lieu of a Head clerk. He added that, if the experiment succeeded, the post of the Town Duty Refund Officer would be abolished with effect from 25th October 1938 and observed that when the election would be held on adult franchise, the Election Officer would have to be relieved of Town Duty work or the old arrangement might have to be restored or some alternative arrangement made. This proposal was approved by Standing Committee Resolution No. 231, dated the 25th May 1938, and Corporation Resolution No. 154 dated the 20th. June 1938.
'103. After some experience of the amalgamation of the two offices, the Commissioner reported that the arrangement had worked successfully and should be made permanent. As regards relieving the Election Officer of the Town Duty work at the time of General elections under the Adult franchise, he observed that looking to the normal volume of work to be attended to by the Election and Town Duty Officer, he should be able to cope with the preparation of the Election Roll on the adult franchise basis if an assistant wereg iven to him temporarily at the time. This was approved by Law Revenue
and General Purposes Committee Resolution No. 212, dated the Ist March 1939, and Corporation Resolution No. 22, dated the 13th April 1939. In 1942, in order to help this officer in test checking export notes, the post of a Checking Inspector on Rs. 140-5-180 was created in lieu of a post in the clerical grade. The existing arrangement whereby the Election and Town Duty Officer has been relieved much of his routine in-door duties by the appointment of a Chief clerk and of routine out-door duties by the appointment of a Checking Inspector leaving him to exercise general supervision and control over the staff, has worked fairly well. No election has so far been held under a system of adult franchise. When the time for holding such election comes it will be desirable to give the Election and Town Duty Officer a temporary allowance of Rs. 150 per month for the duration of the work in addition to an assistant suggested by the Commissioner.
104. The Election and Town Duty Officer represents that his grade should be placed on a par with that of the Superintendent of Licences, Shops and Establishments. The duties of the two posts are not comparable either in volume or in variety. The latter has four distinct Branches under him viz., Licensing of Trades and Storages and of Factories, control over hawkers and removal of encroachments, control over advertisements, and the administration of the Shops and Establishments Act., Having carefully considered the relative importance and the volume of work to be done by the Election and Town Duty Officer in normal times, I think a grade of Rs. 450 -25-600 plus Conveyance Allowance Rs. 150 should be adequate.
105. Checking Inspector.-This post was created underStanding Committee Resolution No. 908, dated the
Checking Inspector. 30th September 1942, for post-auditing townduty refund claims and to perform such other duties as may be entrusted to him by the Election and Town Duty Officer. The existing grade of this post is Rs. 140-5-180 plus Rs. 15 Conveyance Allowance. The Election and Town Duty Officer proposes a grade of Rs. 180-10-240. I consider that a grade of Rs. $160-8-200$ plus Rs. 20 Conveyance Allowance would be adequate.
106. Supervising Inspectors.- They are in charge of exporting stations, and supervise the work of examination of dutiable goods at the time of export, and levy of town duty at the Causeways. Their present grade is Rs. $150-5-190$ plus Rs. 15 per month Duty Allowance to one Supervising Inspector for part time attendance on Sundays and Holidays in connection with the levy of town duties at the Causeways and Conveyance Allowance Rs. 15 per month to two Supervising Inspectors. The Election and Town Duty Officer recommends a grade of Rs. 180-10-240 plus Rs. 15 Duty Allowance. He adds that the grade of these posts should be placed on a par with that of Deputy Superintendents in the Assessment and Collection Department. The duties of the two are not comparable. However, I recommend that the grade in the case of these Inspectors be fixed at Rs. 160-8-200 with Duty Allowance of Rs. 15 to one and Conveyance Allowance of Rs. 20 to two.
107. Export and Import Inspectors.-The duty of the Export Inspectors is to examine dutiable goods at

Export and Import Inspectors. the time of export and that of the Import Inspectors is to levy town duties on goods imported by road. The grade of these posts was Rs. $60-5-150$ until the revision of 1935 , when it was reduced to Rs. 55-4-115-5-140. The Import Inspectors are paid extra (a day's wage) for attendance on Sundays and holidays or for double shift. The Election and Town Duty Officer recommends a grade of Rs. 65-5-100-6-180. I consider that a grade of Rs. $60-5-100-6-160$ would be fair and reasonable.
108. Sub-Inspectors.-These posts were created in 1940-41 to levy town duties on goods imported via Sub-inspectors. Chembur Causeway. Their present grade is Rs. 40-3-55. The Election and Town Duty Officer recommends a grade of Rs. 50-5-100 saying that the duties of the Inspectors and Sub-Inspectors are similar but they. are less onerous in the case of the latter. I recommend a grade of Rs. 50-5-100.
109. Marking Clerks.-Their duty is to supervise the marking of sugar bags and ghee tins and cases. Their old grade was Rs. 50-5-80. In 1935 revision, it was reduced to Rs. $50-4-80$. The Election and Town Duty Officer recommends a grade of Rs. 50-5-100. I recommend a grade of Rs. 50-5-100 and changing the designation to Sub-Inspectors.

## 110. Enumerators.-Their duty is to enumerate voters for the Election Roll and keep it upto date. Each enumer- <br> Enumeratora : ator is in charge of a Municipal Ward. These posts were created in 1937, when the Election

 Department was created as a separate unit. Their grade is Rs. 55-4-115 plus Rs. 10 Conveyance Allowance. The Election and Town Duty Officer recommends a grade of Rs. 65-5-100-6-180, saying that there is no reason why their grade should be lower thanthat of clerks or of Import and Export Inspectors in his Department, as they are equally qualified, while their work is more arduous and responsible. I recommend that their grade be fixed at Rs. $60-5-$ 100-6-160 plus Rs. 15 Conveyance Allowance.111. Chief Clerks, 'Clerks and other posts.-As there are Clerical and other sub- common to all the departments, I have dealt ordinate staff. $\quad$ with them in a separate chapter.

Financial effect.
112. The financial effect of the proposals made in respect of this department is a net increase of Financial effect. Rs. 24,264 per annum in the cost of Establishment and of Rs. 5,055 per annum on Leave and Provident Fund.

## CHAPTER XIII.

General Stores.
113. This department is the central purchasing authority of the Municipality. Stores worth about Rs. $18 \frac{1}{2}$ lakhs are purchased by it annually for the different departments. The number of indents cleared every year is about 25,000 . By a close scrutiny of indents, and interrogations, it acts as a " sentinel of economy" and endeavours to keep a wholesome check on the consumption of materials by departments. The work of this department has increased in complexity on account of war-time controls and restrictions. The department is in charge of the Controller of Stores. The total strength of the staff is 87 and the total cost of the Establishment is Rs. 78,240 per annum.
 the grade was revised to Rs. $350-20-450$ and free quarters were provided (vide Corporation Resolution No. 4922, dated the 27th November 1911, and Budget for 1912-13). In the general revision of 1920 , the Commissioner recommended that the grade be revised to Rs. $550-50-750$. The Committee, which considered the proposal, did not approve of this recommendation and suggested instead that the incumbent be given the maximum of the then existing grade, viz., Rs. 450 (vide Corporation Resolution No. 9631 , dated the 30th January 1922). In 1927, the designation of the post was changed into "Chief Store-keeper" (vide Standing Committee Proceedings of Ith November 1927 p. 1051). Shortly thereafter, the grade was revised to Rs. 400-25-600 with effect from 1st April - 1928 (vide Corporation Resolution No. 3238, dated the 12th July 1928). In 1933, the Chief Store-keeper came to be charged 5 per cent. of his salary for the quarters provided for him (vide Standing Committee Resolution No. 3679, dated the 2nd August 1933). In the general revision of 1935, the grade was slightly altered to Rs. 350-25-600 (vide Corporation Resolution No. 819, dated the 4th March 1935). The designation was further changed into " Controller of Stores" by Corporation Resolution No. 1040, dated the 11th February 1943, to accord with the designation of similar posts inother public bodies. In the Bombay Port Trust, the grade of the Controller of Stores is Rs. 1;100-50-1,400plus Rs. 125 H.R. and that of the First Assistant Controller of Stores Rs. 500-25-700 plus Rs. 100 H.R.

The total purchases made by this body amount to Rs. 35 lakhs including the cost of coal, coke and petrol, which comes to about Rs. 16 lakhs. In the Calcutta Municipality the grade of the Controller of Stores is Rs. 600-20-800 plus Rs. 100 C.A. plus quarters at 10 per cent. of the salary. The total purchases made by the Calcutta Municipality come to Rs. 30 lakhs of which the cost of road metal, coal and fodder comes to Rs. 12 lakhs or so. The Controller of Stores of the Bombay Municipality suggests that his grade should be revised from Rs. 350-25-600 plus Rs. 60 C.A. to Rs. $900-50-1,100$ plus Rs. 120 C.A. When the present incumbent of the post had represented last year that the grade of his post and that of the Assistant Controller of Stores should be revised, the then Commissioner Mr. M. D. Bhat had observed that the existing grades of the Controller of Stores and the Assistant Controller of Stores were not commensurate with their duties and responsibilities but that he could not single out only these posts for revision. I agree with Mr. Bhat and suggest that the grade of this post be revised to Rs. $600-40-800$ plus Rs. 100 C.A.
115. Assistant Controller of Stores (Ist).-This post was created Deputy Controller of in the year 1904-05 on a grade of Rs. 175-10 Stores.
225. The designation of the post then was. Assistant to the Store-keeper. The grade was revised to. Rs. 200-10-250 in the general revision of 1915 (vide Corporation Resolution No. 6423, dated the 13th January 1916). In 1922, the Commissioner proposed that the grade be revised to Rs. 250-10 300. The Sub-Committee appointed by the Committee of the Corporation to consider the revision proposals recommended that the grade be revised to Rs. 250-15-350. This was approved by the Committee and the Corporation (vide Corporation Resolution No. 9631, dated the 30th January 1922). The grade was reduced to Rs. 180-10-240 plus Rs. 15 C.A. in the 1935 revision. (vide Standing Committee Resolution No. 879, dated the 28th November 1934, and Corporation Resolution No. 819, dated the 4th March 1935). This officer is in charge of the "Issue and Accounts sections. The Controller of Stores points out that the grades of the First and Second Assistant Controllers in the Port Trust are Rs. $500-25-700$ plus Rs. 100 H. R. and Rs. $375-20-450$ plus Rs. 75 H.R. and recommends that the post of his First Assistant be designated as Deputy Controller of Stores and the grade revised to Rs. 350-25-600 plus Rs. 60 C.A. The
proposed change in the designation is in order as the present designation does not fit in with the change already effected in the designation of the Chief Store-keeper into "Controller of Stores ". As regards' the grade, I think the equities of the case will be met by fixing it at Rs. 300-20-400 plus Rs. 30 C.A.
116. Assistant Controller of Stores (Second).-This post was created as a temporary measure for one Asst. Controller of year only in the Budget for 1943-44, to cope Stores. with war time emergent work on a grade of Rs. 180-10-240 plus Rs. 15 C.A. (vide Standing Committee Resolution No. 1158, dated the 17th November 1942). In 1944-45, it was continued for another year. It was subsequently brought on the permanent schedule from 1st December 1944 (vide Corporation Resolution No. 827, dated the 14th December 1944). This officer is in charge of Receipts Section. The Controller of Stores has proposed that the grade of this post should be revised to Rs. $300-20-400$ plus Rs. 60 C.A. 1 consider a grade of Rs. 200-10-300 plus Rs. 25 C.A. adequate in this case.
117. Yard Foreman.-He is in charge of samples received from tenderers and departments for verification of stores. He also supervises the work of the Issue and Receipt Clerks. Thus his duties seem to fall partly under the proposed Deputy Controller of Stores, who is in charge of the Issue and Accounts section, and partly under the Assistant Controller of Stores, who is in charge of Receipts Section. The grade of the post prior to 1935 was Rs. 150-5-190. In 1935, it was revised to Rs. 140-5-180. The Controller of Stores proposes a grade of Rs. $180-10-220$ plus Rs. 20 C.A. He suggests the grant of a Conveyance Allowance in this case on the ground that "he is required to go every now and then to take delivery of materials or articles at shops or godowns of the suppliers". I consider that a grade of Rs. 160-8-200 would be adequate and that it is not necessary to attach a C.A. to this post as the designation clearly shows that he is to be in charge of the Stores Yard and has not to go out.

[^14]
## 57

Rs. 40-4-60. The Controller of Stores proposes a grade of Rs. $40.5-80$. I consider a grade of Rs. $40-5-80$ as fair and. reasonable.

## Financial effect.

119. The financial effect of the proposals made in respect of Finencinal Effect. this Departiment is a net increase of Rs. 14,604 per annum in the cost of the Establishment and of Rs. 3,043 per annum on Leave and Provident Fund.

## 58 <br> CHAPTER XIV. <br> Legal Department.

120. This Department was created in 1931, to deal with the less Functions and Strength. important legal work of the Municipality, the more important work being entrusted to the Municipal Solicitors, viz., Messrs. Crawford Bayley \& Co. The functions were gradually extended to cover assessment suits, appeals, suits regarding recovery of rents and ejectments, defending suits filed against the Municipality, conveyancing, including leases, agreements, etc. The Department is in charge of an officer who is designated "Legal Assistant ". The strength of the staff is 20. The total cost of the Establishment is Rs. 34,550. per annum
121. The Legal Assistant.-This post was created in 1931, on a grade of Rs. $400-50-500$ (vide Corporation Resolution No. 2556, dated the 22nd June 1931). In 1934, the pay of the post was fixed at Rs. 1,000 and it was made personal to the incumbent with effect from 1st July 1934 (vide Corporation Resolution No. 146, dated the 28th June 1934). In 1935, the grade was revised to Rs. 500-25-750 for new holders of the post (vide Corporation Resolution No. 819, dated the 4th March 1935). The duties of the post comprise conveyancing, drafting, giving opinions on documents or interpretation of statutes and administrative work of the department. The department has vast potentialities if it is properly enlarged, manned and equipped. The Legal Assistant suggests that his grade should be revised to Rs. $650-40-1,000$. The grade of the Solicitor to Covernment is Rs. $600-20-800-25-900$. I recommend that the grade of this post be revised to Rs. 600-25-800.
122. Junior Legal Assistant.-This post was created in 1944, in the grade of Rs. 450-25-725, with 2 view
Jonior Logal Assistant. to specially attending to suits in regard to property taxes, assessment appeals etc., (vide Corporation Resolution No. 1216, dated the 13th March 1944). Since then, his duties have been extended to a wide variety of matters by orders of the Commissioner. The incumbent of the post is required to be a Solicitor. The Legal Assistant does not recommend any revision of the grade on the ground that the post was created recently. The salary of the
post was fixed at the time of his appointmenthaving regard to the general salary structure then in existence. As this structure is being reconstructed, the grade of this post should be revised and fixed at Rs. 550-25-750.
123. Assistant to the Legal Assistant (First).-This post was first created in 1937-38 on a grade of Rs. 200-20First Ancisistant to the
created
400 (vide Corporation Resolution No. $925, ~$ dated the 19th February 1937). The post is intended for a Solicitor. He is required to attend to drafting declarations, indemnities, agreements, conveyances, and to undertake execution proceedings. The post is shortly to fall vacant and the Commissioner has recommended that the grade of the post should be revised to Rs. 300-20-550 in order to make it attractive, as it is difficult to get a Solicitor to fill the post on the existing scale (vide Standing Committee Resolution No. 445, dated the IIth July 1945. I agree with him and consider that the grade should be fixed at Rs. 300-20-550.
124. Assistant to the Legal Assistant (Second).-The' grade of. this post was Rs. 120-10-200. It was revised to Second Ascistant to the Rs. 200-10-300 by Corporation Resolution No. 680, dated the 6th November 1944. The post is intended for an Advocate. The duties consist of conducting all suits in the Small Causes Court, except appeals from the Assessment Department, and proceedings in the Police Courts and cases under the Workmen's Compensation Act. Besides this, he is required to give opinions on matters referred to him by the departments. One cannot expect a competent Advocate to do all this work on the present scale. On the representation made by the present holder of the post for a revision of the grade, the Junior Legal Assistant has expressed the view that the two posts of Assistants to the Legal Assistant are of equal responsibility and both the posts should have the same grade. The grade of the First Assistant has recently been fixed at Rs. 300-20-550 (vide Standing Committee Resolution No. 445, dated the Ilth July 1945.) I find that the present incumbent has completed 10 years of practice as an Advocate in the High Court. An Advocate who puts in 3 years practice is qualified to be appointed as a CivilJudge in the grade of Rs. 250-275-15-380 and an Advocate who has put in 10 years practice is qualified to be appointed as an Assistant Judge in the grade of Rs. $440-40-800$. The present grade of Rs. 200 10-300 does not seem to be adequate for the responsibilities attached
to the post. I therefore guggest that the grade be revised to Rs. 300-20-550.
125. Search Clerk.-The grade of this post is

Search Clerk. Rs. 55-4-1 15-5-140 The Legal Assistant proposes a grade of Rs. 65-7-191. I consider that a grade of Rs. 60-5 100-6-160 would be adequate.
126. Assistant clerk.-The grade of this post is Rs. 45-3.-80. Assistant Clerk This grade is similar to the posto existing in the Municipal Secretary's Office, which has been recently revised by the Standing Committee to Rs. 50-4-110. The Legal Assistant has recommended a grade of Rs. 55-4-115-5-140 for this post, but $l$ consider that the grade fixed by the Standing Committee, viz., Rs. 50-4-110, would be adequate.

## Financial effect.

127. The financial effect of the proposals made in respect of Finencialloffect. this Department is a net increase of Rs. 7,992 per annum in the cost of Establishment and of Rs. 1,665 per amum on Leave and Provident Fund.

## CHAPTER XV

## The Hydraulic Engineer's Department.

128. This department was established as a separate unit in 1911. Prior to that year, it was a branch of the

FunctionandStrength. Executive Engineer's department. It is in charge of Municipal water works and is responsible for a proper and regular distribution of water to the different parts of the City and outside it. It is also in charge of the Sir Pherozeshah Mehta Cardens on the Malabar Hill Reservoir (including the garden on the slope of the hill) and the Joseph Baptista Cardens on the Bhandarwada Reservoir. Its work, of late, has enormously increased owing to the large influx of population into the City, which has put a severe strain on the distribution system. The existing sources of water supply are 3 lakes viz., Tansa, Vehar and Tulsi. The fourth lake viz., Powai, is in disuse. The total quantity of water supplied to the City and the Suburbs, during the last year, amounted to 41,802 million gallons or an average of 114.52 million gallons per day. Of this, 4.98 million gallons were supplied to the Suburbs and 109.54 million gallons to the City per day. The total quantity used purely for domestic purposes was 26045.14 million gallons, which works out to 47.89 gallons per head per day as per Census figure of 1941 and 28.52 Gallons per head per day as per present estimated population of 25 lacs. As the present supply is found to be inadequate to meet the growing demands of the City, the Corporation have sanctioned the survey of a new scheme known as the Bhivpuri scheme. This survey is now in progress. It has added to the work and responsibilities of the department. As the work progresses it may be found necessary to create a special department to look after it. The department is in charge of the Hydraulic Engineer. The totalstrength of the staff is 1,724 and the total cost of the Establishment is Rs. $9,56,837$ per annum.
129. The Hydraulic Engineer.-This post was created by Bombay Act 11 of 1911. In 1886-87, the first Engineer in charge of the Water Works was designated "Resident Engineer, Water Works" and his salary was fixed at Rs. 800. In 1887-88, the designation was changed to "Deputy Executive Engineer, Water

Works.:" In 1893-94, the designation was further changed to "Water Engineer" and the salary was fixed at Rs. 1,000 . In 1895-96, the grade was fixed at Rs. $800-50-1,200$. In 1896-97, the designation was again changed to "Deputy Executive Engineer, Water Works", and in the 1897.98 general revision, the grade was revised to Rs. $800-66 \frac{2}{3}-1,000$ including Rs. 100 Conveyance Allowance. By Corporation Resolution No. 6060, dated the 15th March 1906, the grade was made exclusive of the Conveyance Allowance and a separate conveyance allowance of Rs. 100 was sanctioned. In 1908, the Corporation decided to place the department under a qualified Hydraulic Engineer and approached Covernment to amend the Municipal Act so as to empower them to appoint a Hydraulic Engineer (vide Corporation Resolution No. 8136, dated the 19th March 1908). Although, Covernment agreed to undertake the necessary legislation, it took some time to give effect to the proposal. Meanwhile, the Corporation created a post of "Water Engineer" in the grade of Rs. 1,200-150-1,800 (vide Corporation Resolution No. 3096, dated the 1lth August 1910). When the Bombay Act II of 1911 was passed, the designation of the post was changed to "Hydraulic Engineer.". The grade of the post, however, continued undisturbed. In 1922, the Commissioner recommended that he be given a Personal Allowance of not less than Rs. 300 per month (vide Municipal Commissioner's letter No. 41-B, dated the 27th October 1920; underlying Corporation Resolution No. 9631, dated the 30th January 1922). This recommendation was approved by the Corporation. In 1934, the Commissioner xecormmended that the grade should be reduced to Rs. $1,000-50-1,250$, but the SubCommittee of the Standing Committee recommended that it should be fixed at Rs. 1,000-40-1,200 (vide Standing Committee Resolution No. 879, dated the 28th November 1934). This recommendation was approved by the Corporation under their Resolution No. 819 dated the 4th March 1935. In 1937, the Corporation reconsidered the grade and decided that it should be retained at Rs. $1,200-$ 1,800 (vide Corporation Resolution No. 1792 dated the 21 st June 1937). By Corporation Resolution No. 533, dated the 18th October 1937, the grade of the post was fixed at Rs. $1,200-75-1,800$. It was, however, reduced to Rs. 1,200-1,500 by Bombay Act XIII of 1938, with the proviso that this reduction should not apply to the then incumbent for the period of 5 years for which he was appointed. By Bombay Act VI of 1943, this concession has been extended to him so long as he continues to hold the office. The Hydraulic Engineer points out that the duties and responsibilities of his post
are more or less similar to those of the Superintending Engineer in the P.W.D. and the Chief Engineers of the Railways and the Bombay Port Trust. The scale of pay of the Chief Engineer in the Bombay Port Trust is Rs. 2,000-75-2,300 and that of the Superintending Engineer in the P. W. D. is Rs. $1,450-75-1,750$ (old grade) and Rs. 1,100-50-1,300 (new grade) and the pay of the Chief Engineer, G. I. P. Railway is Rs. 2,250 (new scale) and Rs. 2,750-125-3,000 (old scale) plus Bombay Allowance of Rs. 100 plus House Rent Allowance. The present grade of the Hydraulic Engineer is Rs. $1,200-1,500$. I consider that this grade is quite inadequate and recommend that it should be revised to Rs. 1,500-75-1,800 plus Conveyance Allowance Rs. I75. I further recommend that after the incumbent of the post has been on the maximum for some time, if the Corporation feel that some further increase should be given to him, it should be in the form of a Personal Allowance of Rs. 200 to be given in two stages of Rs. 100 each, This would, however, require an amendment of Sec. 74 of the Municipal Act.
130. Assistont Engineer, Ist Grade.-This post was created in 1893-94, on a fixed salary of Rs. 500 and Aust, Engineer, Lst designated as "Assistant Engineer, Water srade. Works". In the general revision of 1897-98, the grade was revised to Rs. $400-20-500$ and in 1912-13 to Rs. 500-40-700. By Corporation Resolution No. 10727, dated the 8th December 1919, it was further revised to Rs. 350-25-450-50-600. In 1922, the designation was changed to "Senior Assistant Engineer" and the grade was fixed at Rs. 650-50-1,200 with an efficiency bar at Rs. 800. The designation was again changed to "Assistant Engineer, First Grade" by Corporation Resolution No. 10232, dated the 23 rd March 1931, and the grade was revised to Rs. 850-50-1,100. In the general revision of 1935, the grade was reduced to Rs. 660-40-900 (vide Corporation Resolution No. 819, dated the 4th March 1935). The Hydraulic Engineer states that the duties and responsibilities attached to this post are similar to those of the Executive Engineer, Port Trust, whose grade is Rs. 1,100-501,350, or the Executive Engineer, lst Grade, in the P. W. D., who draws a maximurn of Rs. 900 per month. He also points out that the grade of the Executive Engineer in the G. I. P. Railway is Rs. 750-100-950 plus Rs. 75, Bombay Allowance plus House Rent Allowance. Having regard to the fact that the Water Works Department has grown tremendously during the last decade and the duties and responsibilities of this post have correspondingly increased, the Hydrau-
lic Engineer proposes that the grade of the post should be revised to Rs. 800-50-1,200. I, however, consider that a grade of Rs. 700 -50-1,000 plus Conveyance Allowance Rs. 150 would be adequate.
131. Assistant Engineers, 2nd grade.-At present there are four posts of this grade in this Department (1) Maintenance Branch (Bombay City); (2) Asst. Engineers, 2nd Maintenance Branch (Outside Bornbay) (3) Inspection Branch, and (4) Loan Works. The first of these posts was created in 1919, for Inspection and Distribution, in the grade of Rs. 350-25-450--50-600 (vide Corporation Resolution No. 10717, dated the 8th December 1919). The grade was changed to Rs. $250-25-400-50-600$ by Corporation Resolution No.817, dated the 27th April 1922, and Corporation Resolution No. 15698, dated the 29th March 1926. In 1931, the grade was revised to Rs. $400-40-800$. In the general revision of 1935, the grade was revised to Rs. $350-25-600$ (vide Corporation Resolution No. 819, dated the 4th March 1935). The second post was created in 1931 and the grade was fixed at Rs. 200-25-500 (vide Corporation Resolution No. 10232, dated the 23rd March 1931). This post was originally designated as Sub-Engineer in the grade of Rs. $250-25-500$. But its designation was changed to Assistant Engineer, 3rd grade, the grade having been revised to Rs. 200-25-500. In the general revision of 1935, the grade was further revised to Rs. 200-20-400 and in 1943 the post was converted into 2 nd grade and the scale was fixed at Rs. $350-25-600$, (vide Corporation Resolution No. 691, dated the 15th November 1943). The third post was created by conversion of the post of the Chief Inspector on Rs. 200-10-250, and it was graded at Rs. 250-25-400-50-600 (vide Corporation Resolutions No. 817, dated the 27th April 1922 and No. 15698, dated the 29th March 1926). The grade was revised to Rs. 400-40-800 by Corporation Resolution No. 10232, dated the 23rd March 1931. In the general revision of 1935, the grade was revised to Rs. 350-25-600 (vide Corporation Resolution No. 819, dated the 4th March 1935). The fourth post was created in 1939-40, on a fixed salary of Rs. 350 and in 1943 it was graded into Rs. 350-25-600 (vide Corporation Resolution No. 205 dated the 14th June 1943). The Hydraulic Engineer states that the Officers holding these posts have to shoulder considerable responsibilities. The existing scale in the Bombay Port Trust for Officers of like status and responsibilities is Rs. 750-50-1,000. The grade of the Assistant Engineers or the Resi-
dent Engineers in the G. I. P. Railway is Rs. $350-25-500$ (new) and Rs. 375-50-975 (old) plus Rs. 50 Bombay Allowance plus House Rent Allowance. The Hydraulic Engineer, therefore, suggests that this grade should be revised to Rs. 600-40-800. 1 recommend that the grade be fixed at Rs. 450-25-700.
132. Assistant Engineers, 3rd Grade.-There are three posts in this grade viz., one for Survey, one for' Asett. Engineers, 3rd Waste Prevention and one for Meter Section. The Hydraulic Engineer states that the duties and responsibilities of these posts are similar to those of a Junior Assistant Engineer in the Bombay Port Trust, whose grade is Rs. 500-25-650, or those of an Assistant Engineer in the P. W. D. whose grade is Rs. 200-500. The scale of pay in the lower gazetted service in the G. I. P. Railway is Rs. 250-25-550-50-600 (new) and Rs. $350-30-800$ (old) plus Rs. 50 Bombay Allowance plus House Rent. The Hydraulic Engineer suggests that the grade of these posts should be Rs. 350-25-600. I recommend that it be fixed at Rs. 275-25-450.

## 133. Inspectors-The grade of these posts is Rs. 150-10-250 for B.Es. and Rs. $140-8-220$ for NonB.E.s The Hydraulic Engineer considers

 that the designation "Inspector", so far as the Engineering Departments are concerned is not suitable and suggests that the proper designation should be "Sub-Engineers." If the change is not likely to carry a higher conception of the duties than those now actually performed by these persons, I see no objection to the acceptance of the suggestion. In the Bombay Port Trust, the starting salary of the Sub-Engineers is Rs. 200 and the maximum is Rs. 450, which is reached by three stages. The grade of the Permanent Way Inspectors in the G. I. P. Railway is Rs. 200-400 (new) and Rs. 170-600 (old) plus Bombay Allowance and House Rent Allowance. The Bombay Municipal Officials' Association suggest that the grade of these posts should be fixed at Rs. 200-15-350 with a Conveyance Allowance of Rs. 30 per month. The Hydraulic Engineer suggests that the grade should be revised to Rs. 200-15-350 for B.Es and to Rs. 150-10-250 for Non-B.Es. I recommend that it be fixed at Rs. 180-10-270 for B.Es. and at Rs. 160-10-250 for Non-B.E.s.134. Sub-overseers and Sub-Inspector-The present grade Sub-Overseers and of the Sub-overseers is Rs. 55-5-100Subslospectors. 10-150 and that of Sub-Inspectors is Rs. 55-4-115-5-140. The Hydraulic Engineer suggests that both the grades should be revised to Rs. 65-5-100-. 10-200 and that qualified Sub-overseers should be given a higherstart of Rs. 90 in the same scale. He points out that in the P. W. D. the qualified Diploma holders are given an initial salary of Rs. 120. The Bombay MunicipalOfficials' Associationrepresent ${ }^{*}$ that the qualification prescribed for and the nature of duties performed by the Sub-overseers in the Municipality are similar to those of the Overseers and Surveyors in the subordinate service of Covernment and that Government have sanctioned for the latter a grade of Rs. 70-5-110-E. B. 10-180 E.B. 10-250; the Association suggest that the Sub-Overseers should be given a grade of Rs. $90-5-100-10-200$ with a Conveyance Allowance of Rs. 20 per mensem, the qualified Sub-overseers being given a higher starting salary of Rs. 100 per month. They also suggest that the designation "Sub-Overseer" is antiquated and obsolete and should be changed to "Overseer" or "Junior Inspector". There is no objection to the designation being changed to "Overseer." As regards the grade for Sub-overseers, I recommend that it be fixed at Rs. 75-5-110-10-160, those holding. Diplomas being started on Rs. 85 as in the case of Double Graduates in the Clerical grade, and as regards the grade for Sub-Inspectors, it may be fixed at Rs. $60-5$ $-100-6-160$.

## Financial effect.

135. The financial effect of the proposals made by me in respect of this department is a net increase of Financialeffect: Rs. 1,56,072 per annum in the cost of Establishment and of Rs. 32,515 per annum on Leave and Provident Fund.

## CHAPTER XVI.

## Schools Committee's Establishment.

136. Primary Education was formerly under the control of a Functions and Strength. Joint Schools Committee consisting of the representatives of Government and of the Municipal Corporation. By Bombay Act III of 1907, the responsibility for Primary Education was transferred by Government to the Municipality. The administration of the Schools is now under the control of the "Schools Committee." There are at present 398 Municipal Schools and Classes directly under the Committee, and 200 Aided Schools, to which the Committee give grants. The total number of pupils in all the Primary Schools in the City on 31 st December 1944 was $1,62,266$, out of which $1,18,646$ were in Municipal Schools and 43,620 in Aided Schools. The Corporation's grant to the Committee in respect of Primary Education amounted to Rs. $48,56,788$ ' in the year 1943-44 including Covernment Contribution of Rs. $9,45,000$. Unlike the Standing Committee or the Improvements Committee, the Schools Committee is an executive body. The Committee is assisted by the Secretary, who is, its Chief Executive Officer. The Secretary is again assisted by Superintendents and Assistant Superintendents in the supervision of schools. The cost of the Schools Committee'sestablishment is borne by the Municipal fund, while that of the supervising staff, teachers, etc., is met out of the contribution made by the Corporation from year to year. The total strength of the Office staff is 40 and the total cost of the Establishment is Rs. 65,484 per annum.
137. The Secretary, Schools Committee.-When Primary The Secretary, Schools Education was in charge of the Joint Schools Committee. Committee, the pay of the Secretary, Schools Committee, was Rs. 250. In 1897-98, the post was graded into Rs. 250-25-500. By Corporation Resolution No. 2723, dated the 23rd July 1914, the minimum of the grade was raised to Rs. 350. By Corporation Resolution No. 3882, dated the 10th July 1924, the grade was revised to Rs. $500-50-800$, with a view to getting the services of a competent educationist. The grade was, however, revised to Rs. 500 -25-750 by Corporation Resolution No. 819, dated the 4th March 1935. The Corporation have already, by their Resolution No. 1089 , dated the 30th March 1937, approved of a scheme to revise the constitution,
powers, functions, etc., of the Schools Committee. A draft Bill to carry out the scheme has been approved under Corporation Resolution No. 385, dated the 17th August 1939, and submitted to Covernment. In that scheme, it is proposed to create a post of Municipal Education Officer, to whom it is proposed to delegate some of the powers, - which are now iexercised by the Schools Committee. With the imcrease in the number of schools and in the number of meetings of the Schools Committee and its Sub-Committees, the work of the Secretary, Schools Committee, has enormously increased. I am, therefore, of opinion that the present grade is inadequate and recommend that the grade be revised to Rs. 700-50-1,000 and the Conveyance Allowance from Rs. 160 to Rs. 175.

## 138. Office Superintendent.-This post was created in the year 1928-29 under Corporation Resolution No. 13632, dated the 12th March 1928, and

 the grade was fixed at Rs. $300-20-400$. In the general revision of 1935, the grade was modified to Rs. 275-15-350. With the increase in the work of the Schools Committee the responsibilities of this post have correspondingly increased. The Superintendent has to attend not only to office work but also the meetings of the Schools Committee and the Sub-Committees. The designation of " Office Superintendent" does not therefore fit in. I would, aecordingly suggest that it be changed to "Deputy Secretary " and the grade fixed at Rs. $450-25-600$.139. Superintendent of Accounts.-In the year 1922-23, there Superintendent, of was a post of "Accountant and Cashier" Accounts. in the grade of Rs. 150-10-200. The pay of the post was revised to Rs. 180-10-250 with effect from 1st April 1922 (vide Corporation Resolution No. 11481, dated the 29th March 1923). The designation was changed to "Superintendent of Accounts" (vide Corporation Resolution No. 11138 dated the 7th January 1926). The pay of the post was revised to Rs. 250-10-400 with effect from 1 st December 1926 (vide Corpora tion Resolution No. 9806 of 21st December 1929). In the general revision of 1935, the grade was reduced, to Rs. 250-10-350 (vide Corporation Resolution No. 819, of 4th March 1935). I recommend that it be increased to Rs. 300-20-400.

- 140. Other clerical staff.-There is one post of Committee Clerk, one post of Pay and Audit Clerk,


## Clerical Staft.

 one post of Cashier and Cash Book Writer, one . post of Record and File Clerk, and two posts of HeadClerks, all in the grade of Rs. 140-5-180. I recommend that their grade be revised to Rs. 160-8-200, as in the case of Head Clerks in the other departments. There are 21 Clerks, of whom 13 are in the grade of Rs. $60-5-150$ and 8 in the grade of Rs. 55-4-115-5-140. I recommend that these grades be revised uniformly to Rs. 60-5-100-6-160 to correspond with the grade of clerks in other departments. There is one post of Typist in the grade of Rs. $60-5-150$. 1 suggest that the designation be changed to Junior Steno grapher and his grade be fixed at Rs. 80-5-100-6-160.
141. Peons etc.-I recommend that the grade of the Havaldar be revised from: Rs. $30-1$ - 34 plus Rs. 10 P.A.C. to Rs. $35-1-40$ plus Rs. 10 P.A.C. The Naik's grade is Rs. 25-1/3-27 plus Rs. 10 P.A.C. I have suggested elsewhere the conversion of the posts of Naiks into those of Havaldars. I, therefore, recommend that this post be also converted into that of Havaldar and his grade fixed at Rs, 35-1.40 plus Rs. 10 P.A.C. There are 7 peons on Rs. 25 each, plus Rs. 10 as P.A.C. I recommend that the grade of these peons be fixed at Rs. 25-1-35, plus Rs. 10 P.A.C.

Financial effect.
142. The financial effect of the proposals made in respect of this department is a net increase of Rs. 10,332 per annum in the cost of Establishment and of Rs. 2,152 per annum on Leave and Provident Fund,

## CHAPTER XVII

## Victoria and Albert Museum.

(a) Museum.
143. The Museum building was constructed by raising public subscriptions as a mark of respect for Queen Functions and Strength. Victoria in 1862. In the year 1868, after the demise of H. R. H. the Prince Consort, the Museum was renamed as Victoria and Albert Müseum. It was thrown open to the public on 22nd May 1872 and was transferred to the care of the Municipality on Ist October 1885. The Museum contains exhibits of indigenous industrial products, agricultural, mythological and ethnological specimens and artistic pieces of ivory and sandalwood. The most important section of this Museum is the Old Bombay Room, which contains some rare photographs and maps of Bombay, showing the development of the City from a congeries of fishermen's villages into the first City in the Orient. The total strength of the staff is 20 and the cost of Establishment is Rs. 12,756 per annum.
144. Curator.-The Museum is in charge of a Curator. This post was created by the Town Council's Resolution No. 1247, dated the 30th May 1888, and the salary was fixed at Rs. 200 per month. The grade was revised to Rs. 250 -10- 300 by Corporation Resolution No. 7974, dated the '5th December 1929. Before the last general revision, the grade of the post was Rs. 250-10-300. In the revision of 1935, it was reduced to Rs. 200-10-250. The Curator is responsible for the selection, purchase, maintenance, and display of specimens. He helps research students by giving them general guidance in Art, Archaeology, History, etc., and gives short instructive talks and general- information to school children. The Curator points out that the grades of Curators in other Indian Museums are as follows:-
(1) Jodhpur
$\therefore$ Rs. 250-10-400.
(2) Delhi (C.A.A.) Museum
... Rs. 320-20-600.
(3) Lahore
... Rs. 350-25-750.
(4) Lucknow
... Rs. 200-10-380-15-500.
(5) Calcutta
... Rs. $350-25-600-40-800-50$

## 71

(6) Hyderabad ( Dr ) : ; Rs. 300-20-500.
(7) Prince of Wilses Museum.

Bombay, (Archaeological Rs. 300-25-500. Section)
(8) Prince of Wales Museum, Rs. 300-25-500. Bombay (Art Section)
He suggests that his grade be fixed at Rs. 300-25-500. I recommend that the grade be fixed at Rs. $250-10-350$.
145. Museum Assistant (Clerk), Museum Artist and Assistant Museum Assistant Museum Artist.-The grade of the Museum (Clerk) Museum Attist Assistant (Clerk) is Rs. $60-5-150$, that of the and Astistant Museum Museum Artist is Rs, $60-5-100$ and that
Artist of the Assistant Museum Artist is Rs. 50-4-50. The Curator has recommended a grade of Rs. 60-5-100-5-150 for the Museum Artist. Having regárd, however, to the revision of similar grades in other departments, I recommend that the grades of the Museum Assistant (Clerk), the Museum Artist, and the Assistant Museum Artist, be fixed at Rs. $60-5-100-6-160$, Rs. $60-5-120$ and Rs. $50-5-100$ respectively.
(b) Reading Rooms and Libraries.

- 146. Originally, there were 9 libraries for males and 2 for females, at different places in the City.
Reading Rooms and They were conducted by the Schools Committee and located in Municipal School Buildings. The HeadMasters were in charge of them. They were, however, subsequently placed under the control of the Commissioner by Corporation Resolution No. 934, dated the 7th January 1943. It was proposed to place them directly in charge of a Chief Librarian with necessary staff under him. As a tentative arrangement, the post of the Chief Librarian has been held in abeyance and the work entrusted to the Curator, who holds a Librarianship Diploma of the Bombay University, and for which he is paid a special pay of Rs. 100 plus Rs. 25 Conveyance Allowance. There are now 14 Libraries. The total strength of the staff is 31 and the cost of Establishment is Rs. 17,076 per annum.

> 147. Chief Librarian. - The existing grade of the post is Rs. $120-10-200$ plus Rs. 50 Conveyance Allowance. I recommend that it be revised to Chief Librarian.  Rs. $160-8-200$ plus Rs. 60 Conveyance

Allowance. The Conveyance Allowance of Rs. 25 at present paid to the Curator may be increased to Rs. 30, the special pay of Rs. 100 being allowed to stand till the post of the Chief Librarian is filled.
148. Librarians.-One Librarian is, in the grade of Rs. 60-2-100 and 12 Librarians are in the grade of Rs. 50-3-80. I recommend that their grades be revised to a uniform grade of Rs. 60-4-100.

## Financial effect.

149. The financial effect of the proposals made in respect of the Victoria and Albert Museum will be a net increase of Rs, 2,556 per annum in the cost of Establishment and of Rs. 532 per annum on Leave and Provident Fund, and that in respect of proposols made with regard to Municipal Reading Rooms and Libraries, is a net increase of Rs. 2,604 per annum in the cost of Establishment and of Rs. 542. per annum on Leave and Provident Fund.

## CHAPTER XVIII

## Public Health Department.

150. There is no activity of the Municipality, which affects the health, happiness and life of the community
Functions and Strength. so vitally and intimately as its public health activity. The Public Health Department is the guardian of public health. It looks after (1) Conservancy, (2) Sanitation, and (3) Medical Relief of the City. It maintains a Laboratory for bacteriological and chemical examination of well water, ghee, butter and other articles of food. It further carries on prevention and treatment of tuberculosis and venereal diseases, enforcement of the provisions of the Prevention of Adulteration Act, propaganda about personal hygiene and sanitation among the masses, medical inspection of school children, welfare work among the labour staff etc. The health of the City depends largely on the efficiency and vigilance of this department. The department is under the Executive Health Officer. The total strength of the staff is 8,450 and the total cost of the Establishment is Rs. 34,08,958 per annum.
(a) General Supervision.
151. The Executive Health Officer.-Under Section 15 of Bombay Exocutive Health Act II of 1865, a part time post styled as Officer. to give advice to the Municipal Commissioner in regard to sanitary improvement of the City. He was not precluded from holding any other appointment or office, which might not interfere with the performance of his duty. He was to receive a salary of not less than Rs. 500 a month. This post was, however, made whole-time under Section 45 of the Bombay Municipal Acts 1872 and 1878 and its salary was fixed at Rs. $1,200-1,500$, the designation being changed to "Executive Officer of Health". This designation was further changed to "Executive Health Officer" under Section 74 of Bombay Act III of 1888. The grade was revised from Rs. 1,500 to Rs. 2,000 by Section I of Bombay Act II of 1900 and a Personal Allowance of Rs. 250 was granted to the then holder of the appointment under Section 3 of Bombay Act VI of 1916. The grade was revised in the general revision of 1935 and fixed at Rs. 1,200-50-1,500 (vide Corporation Resolution No. 819, dated the 4th March 1935) and the

Municipal Act was amended accordingly by Bombay Act XIII of 1938. The grade of the Health Officer of the Madras Municipality is Rs. 800-50-1,000. The grade of the Director of Public Health to the Covernment of. Bombay, is Rs. 1,700-1,950 (old), Rs. 1,500-1,700 (new). The grade of the Public Health Officer, of the G. I. P. Railway is Rs. 2,000-125-2,500 plus' S.O.P. £ 13-6-8 (old scale), and under the new scale Grade I Rs. 1,750 after 5 years, Grade II Rs. 1,950 plus S. O. P. \& 13-6-8. The Executive Health Officer has suggested the revision of the grade to Rs. 2,000-100-3,000. The work and responsibilities of this post have increased enormously partly owing to the rapid expansion of the City and partly owing to the department having undertaken fresh public health activities. The Executive Health Officer is in receipt of Rs. 100 per month as Honorarium for working as Honorary Lecturer in Hygiene and Medical Junisprudence at the Seth G. S. Medical College and of Rs. 100 per month as Lecturer at the Grant Medical College, Bombay. For administration of the Covernment Subsidized Milk Scheme he is granted a Special Pay of Rs. 200 per month (vide Corporation Resolution No. 114, of 7th May - 1945). He also receives some allowance out of the Funds of the Bombay Sanitary Institute for conducting the Sanitary Inspectors. Classes. I recommend that the grade of the post be revised to Rs. 1,500-75-1,800, and that on reaching the maximum the Corporation may, if they deem fit, grant a Personal Allowance of Rs. 200 to the incumbent by two stages of Rs. 100 each per month. This will, however, require an amendrnent of Section 74 of the Municipal Act.
152. Deputy Executive Health Officer.-The Executive Health Officer has proposed the creation of a post of the Deputy Executive Health Officer

## Deputy Executive Health Officer.

 in the grade of Rs. $1,000-50 \mathrm{~N}, 200$ plus Rs. 200 Conveyance Allowance. As creation of new appointments does not fall within the terms of my reference, I do not propose to deal with the suggestion here. I have suggested to the Executive Health Officer that he should submit this proposal to the Municipal Conmissioner in the ordinary course.[^15]and sanitation of the Wards. They have to inspect houses, stables, dairies, milk shops, factories, workshops where offensive and dangerous trades are carried on, recommend licences and permits and launch and conduct prosecutions for breaches of law in connection therewith. They have also to supervise the work of Municipal dispensaries, Maternity Homes, Registration of Births and Deaths, inquire into and report on cases of dangerous and infectious diseases occurring in their Wards. They have also to scrutinize and report on plans for sanitary arrangements of buildings etc. Prior to 1919, these posts were designated as "Deputy Health Officers" two in the First Grade of Rs. 500 and two in the Second grade of Rs. 350 (vide Corporation Resolution No. 2539, dated the 25th July 1907). The two posts in the First Grade were converted into "Assistant Health Officers" with a fixed salary of Rs. 750 and the other two with a salary of Rs. 600 per month: These grades were further revised to Rs. $600-30-750$ (First Grade) and Rs. $500-20-600$ (Second Grade). In the general revision of 1935, the grade of all the four posts was fixed at Rs. 400-25-700 (vide Corporation Resolution No. 819, dated the 4th March 1935). The Executive Health Officer observes that the pay of these posts is very low and is not such as to attract the right stamp of men. He proposes that the grade should be revised to Rs. $660-40-900$ plus Rs. 160 Conveyance Allowance and that every Assistant Health Officer should be provided with a Telephone at his residence. The grade of the Assistant Directors of Public Health under Government is Rs. 450-1,200 (old grade) and Rs. $400-1,050$ (new grade) and that of the District Medical Officer in the G. I. P. Railway is Rs. $500-25-600-50-1,500$ plus S.O.P. £ 15-25-30 (old scale) and Rs. $400-25-500-550-650$, Grade II Rs. 800 , Grade I Rs. 1,000 plus S.O.P. £ 15-25-30 (new scale). The grades of the Assistant Health Officers compare unfavourably with those of the Assistant Engineers having similar jurisdiction and responsibilities. I, therefore, recommend that their grade should be revised to Rs. $600-40-800$. As regards the provision of a telephone at the residence of the Assistant Health Officers, I would suggest that this question be examined by the Commissioner on merits..

diseases and conducting investigations with regard to deaths from communicable diseases, etc., and to take prompt and effective measures to deal with such cases. The Executive Health Officer has proposed revision of this grade on the same grounds as those advanced by hirn for the revision of the grade of the Assistant Health Officers. He has suggested that the grade should be revised to Rs. 400-25-650. I recommend that, if the period of this post is extended or if the post is made permanent, the grade be fixed at Rs, 400-25-600 plus Rs. 125 Conveyance Allowance.
155. Senior Medical Inspectors, Junior Medical Inspectors, Senior Medicallnspe. Medical Assistants and Assistant Sanitary tors, Junior Medical Insm Inspectors-In the year 1919, when the pectors, Medical Assistants and Assistant Ṣanitary Inspecters. Health Department staff in the Medical and was re-organized, the posts of District Registrars, Sub-Registrars, Sanitary Inspectors and Assistant Sanitary Inspectors were abolished and the posts of Medical Inspectors and Medical Assistants were created (vide Corporation Resolution No. 13364, dated the Ist March 1920). The grades then fixed were-Senior Medical Inspectors Rs. 300-10-350, Junior Medical Inspectors Rs. 200-10-300 and Medical Assistants Rs. 100-225 (increments being regulated by the number of years put in). Medical Assistants in charge of Dispensaries were to be paid a charge allowance of Rs. 10 per month. It was also laid down that if Medical graduates were available for the posts of Medical Assistants they should be given preference. In 1921, the Commissioner reported that considerable difficulties were experienced in filling the posts of Medical Assistants, chiefly because the nature of the work was non-medical, the pay was insufficient and the salaries of Sub-Assistant Surgeons were being revised by Government to Rs. $150-300$ with private practice and travelling allowance. He, therefore, suggested that the condition as to the possessionof a Medical Diploma for Medical Assistants should be withdrawn, and that the posts should be thrown open to non-medical men, who possessed qualifications prescribed for the Overseers on the Conservancy side with 10 years' previous service etc., and that a new grade of Assistant Sanitary Inspectors on Rs. 75-5-150 should be created for men fulfilling conditions prescribed for Overseers. These suggestions were approved (vide Corporation Resolution No. 10976, dated the 16th March 1922). It was laid down that in filling the vacancies of Medical Assistants, preference should begiven to candidates who were qualified medical practitioners. At present.
there are 7 Senior Medical Inspectors in the grade of Rs. 250-10-350 and 17 Junior Medical Inspectors, out of whom two are in the grade of Rs. 200-10-300 (old scale) and 15 in the grade of Rs. 150-10-250 (new scale). There are 49 Medical Assistants in the grade of 125-10-225. Of these, 33 are Medical Graduates and 16 are those who have passed L.C.P.S. examination. There are 22 Medical Assistants, called Assistant Sanitary Inspectors, in the grade of Rs. 75-5-150. There are 19 Municipal dispensaries, two of which are attended by one Medical Assistant. Of the 18 Medical Assistants, who are in charge of the dispensaries, 7 are Medical graduates and 11 are those who have passed L.C.P.S. examination. The Executive Health Officer says that the Medical Assistants, who are Medical Graduates, are very useful to him especially when there are epidemics in the City, and in order to attract Medical Graduates to these posts in future he suggests that their grade should be revised to Rs. 200-10-300 and that the grade of the Junior Medical Inspectors improved to Rs.250-10-350 and that of the Senior Medical Inspectors to Rs. 400-30-550. There is overlapping in the grade of the Medical Assistants and of the Junior Medical Inspectors. As the latter have to supervise the work of the former, it does not seem desirable that this should be allowed. I, therefore, recommend that the grade of Senior Medical Inspectors be revised to Rs. 350-20-450, that of the Junior Medical Inspectors to Rs. 275-15-350 and that of the Medical Assistants to Rs. 180-10-270. The Executive Health Officer suggests that the grade of the Assistant Sanitary Inspectors should be revised to Rs. 100-10-200, but I recommend that it be fixed at Rs. 75-5-100-10-170 and their designation changed to Sanitary Inspectors, the qualifications now prescribed for Assistant Sanitary Inspectors being made applicable to Sanitary Inspectors.
156. Health Visitors.-There are three Health Visitors in the Health Visitors. grade of Rs. 100-5-150, one working in the Welfare Centre at Chembur, the second at Dharavi, and the third working in connection with the measures for controlling Leprosy in the City in co-operation with the Acworth Leper Home Authorities. The Executive Health Officer suggests that it should be revised to Rs. 150-5-175. I recommend that it be fixed at Rs. 125-5-170.
(b) Municipal Laboratory.
157. The Municipal Analyst.- The Municipal Laboratory was
Municipal Analyot. started in the year 1903 , for carrying on Bacte
riological and Chemical investigation and
analysis of food and drugs. The salary of the Analyst then fixed was Rs. 300 . The grade was revised to Rs. 500 in the year 1905-06 and to Rs. 600 in 1908-09. It was further raised to Rs. 750 by Corporation Resolution No. 1042, dated the Ist December 1919. The post was graded at Rs. $600-30-750$ by Corporation Resolution No. 5452-C, dated the 28th August 1924. In the general revision of 1935, the grade was revised to Rs. 400-25-700. The Executive Health Officer suggests that it should be revised to Rs: $500-30-800$, The Municipal Analyst gets a moiety of the laboratory fees. The a mount of the moiety of the fees paid to him turing 1944-45 amounted to about Rs. 2,578. I recommend that the pay of the post be fixed at Rs. 500-25-750.
158. The question regarding the revision of the grades of the posts of the Assistant Analyst, the Assistant

Assistant Analyst, Asm sistant Chemist, and Assistant Bacteriologists. Chemist, the Assistant Bacteriologists, and the Junior Laboratory Chemists, has been referred to me for consideration (vide Municipal Commissioner's letter No. H. 256, dated the 30th April 1945, underlying Standing Committee Resolution No. 169, dated the 9th May 1945). In the general revision of 1935, the grade of the Senior Laboratory Assistant, which was Rs. 200-10-250, was revised to Rs. 150-10-200. In the Establishment Schedule for the year 1938-39, the designation was changed to "Assistant Analyst". The Executive Health Officer suggests that the grade of the post should be revised to Rs. 200-10-300. I agree with him and suggest that the grade be fixed at Rs. 200-10-300. Prior to 1935, the grade of one post of Junior Assistant was Rs. 90-5-150. In the general revision of 1935, the grade was revised to Rs. 75-4-115-5.140. In the Establishment Schedule for the year 1938-39, the designation was changed to: "Assistant Chemist". The Executive Health Officer suggests that the grade of the post should be revised to Rs. $100-10-200$. I recommend a grade of Rs. 80-5-100-6-160. The grade of the second post of Junior Assistant was Rs. 80-5-130. In the general revision of 1935, the grade was revised to Rs. 75-4-115-5-140. In the Establishment Schedule of 1938-39, the designation was changed to "Assistant Bacteriolgist". In the year 1940-41, one additional post of Assistant Bacteriologist was sanctioned. The Executive Health Officer suggests that the grade should be revised to Rs. $100-10$ 200. I recommend that it may be fixed at Rs. 80-5-100-6-160.
159. Prior to 1935, there were two posts of Attendants in the Junior Laboratory grade of Rs. 50-5-80. In the general Assistant. revision of 1935, the grade was revised to Rs. 50-4-80. In the Establishment Schedule for the year 1940-41, the designation was changed to "Junior Laboratory Chemist." Under Standing Committee Resolution No. 613, dated the 22nd July 1942, the grade was revised to Rs. 65-4-115-5-140. The Executive Health Officer suggests that the grade should be revised to Rs. $100-10-200$. I recommend that it may be fixed at Rs. 80-5-100-6-160.
(c) Vaccination.
160. Superintendent of Vaccination.-The vaccination work was

Superintendent of originally carried on by Government. It was Vaccination. transferred to the Municipality under the Police Charges Act (Bombay Act III of 1907). It appears that the department was in charge of the Superintendent of Vaccination in the grade of Rs. 250-20-350 in the year 1910-11, which was revised to Rs. 300-10-350. This grade was further revised to Rs, 250-10350 in the 1935 general revision (vide Standing Committee Resolution No. 879, dated the 28th November 1934 and Corporation Resolution No. 819, dated the 4th March 1935). The Executive Health Officer proposes that the grade should be revised to Rs, 400-30 550. I consider that a grade of Rs. $350-20-450$ would be adequate.

## (d) Medical Inspeciion of Schools.

161. Medical Inspector.-The work of Medical Inspection of school children was originally carried on

Medical Inspector. under the supervision of the Schools Committee. It was, subsequently, transferred to the Executive Health Officer by Standing Committee Resolution No. 1052, dated the 30th November 1937 and Corporation Resolution No. 841, dated the 14th February 1938. The present incumbent of the post is in the grade of Rs. 270-10-380 (Revised grade Rs. 225-10-300). The Executive Health Officer suggests that it should be revised to Rs. $350-25-500$. I recommend that it may be fixed at Rs. 300-25-450 plus Rs. 75 C.A.
(e) Propaganda in Public Health.
162. Propaganda Officer.- The Propaganda branch was started in the year 1942-43 (vide Standing Committee Resolution No. 224, dated the 13th May 1942 and Corporation Resolution No. 208, dated the 18th June 1942.)
and was placed under the Propaganda Officer in the grade of Rs. 150-10-250. The Executive Health Officer suggests that it should be revised to Rs. 400-30-550. I recommend that it be fixed at Rs. $250-10$ - 350 plus Rs. 100 C.A.

## (f) Infectious Diseases Hospitals.

163. Medical Superintendent.-The Arthur Road Infectious Diseases Hospital was started in the year Medical Superinten- 1892, on the outbreak of an epidemic of dent. Small-pox. On the outbreak of plague in 1896, a post of Extra Assistant Health Officer was created in the grade of Rs. $700-100 / 2-900$ and he was put in charge of the Hospital, (vide Corporation Resolution No. 14093, dated the 15th March 1897). The salary was raised to Rs. 1,000 by Corporation Resolution No. 13364, dated the 1st March 1920, with a view to obtaining a trained Bacteriological and Medical Officer of the first rate knowledge and experience in infectious diseases. The grade was, however, revised to Rs. $700-50-1,000$ (whole-time and without right of private practice) but with free quarters. The Executive Health Officer suggests that the grade should be revised to Rs. $1,000-50-1,200$. I recommend that this proposal be accepted.
164. The salaries of the staff at the Arthur Road Hospital, Arthur Road Hospital. except the salary of the Medical Superintendent, have been recently revised as per Standing Committee Resolutions No. 78, dated the 19th April 1944 and No. 206, dated the 10th May 1944, confirmed by Corporation Resolution No. 732, dated the 16th November 1944. The Executive Health Officer suggests that an increase of 20 per cent over the present grades may be given to those who are not provided with free mess and that the Nursing staff which is provided with free mess, may be allowed an increase of Rs. 5 each per month in the Uniform Allowance. As the grades of the staff have been recently revised, I do not recommend any change in the grades of the Medical and Nursing staff as well as in the rate of uniform allowance.' I have recommended revised grades for the lower staff at the Hospital.
165. As regards the Maratha Hospital, the Executive Health

Maratha Hoapital. Officer has not suggested a revision of the grades of the posts of the Matron and Nurses. He states that if the Nursing staff is provided with free mess the present grades may remain unchanged. I agree with him and recommend that the Nursing staff at the Hospital may be
provided with free mess. I have recommended revised grades for the other staff at the Hospital.
(g) Maternity Homes.
166. There are 5 Maternity Homes at (1) Bellasis Maternity Homes, Road, (2) Victoria Road, (3) Imamwada, (4) Mahim (Cadell Road) and (5) Khetwadi. These are in charge of Lady Doctors, whose grade is Rs. 200-10-400. The Executive Health Officer suggests that the grade should be revised to Rs. 300-15-450. I recommend that the grade be fixed at Rs. 250-15-430 plus Rs. 50 C.A.
(h) Anti-Tuberculosis Dispensaries and Turner Sanatorium at Bhoiwada.
167. These dispensaries were started by the King George V Anti-Tuberculosis League of Medical Officer in-charge Borge in 1912. They were taken over $b$ the pansaries and Turner Municipality in 1923 (vide C.R. No. 7142, Sanatorium dated the 13th November 1922). Two dispensaries at Princess Street and Kamatipura were in charge of Medical Officers in the grade of Rs. $350-15-500$. The grade was revised to Rs. 300-15-450 in the general revision of 1935 (vide C. R. No. 819, dated the 4th March 1935). It was further revised to Rs. 400-20-600 by Corporation Resolution No. 671, dated the 7th October 1940 (without the right of private practice). The Executive Health Officer suggests that it should be revised to Rs.450-30750. I recommend that it be fixed at Rs. 450-25-700. The Turner Sanatorium is under the Medical Officer in charge of the Princess Street Dispensary, who is granted a Personal Allowance of Rs. 100 (consolidated.)

## (i) Anti-Venereal Measures.

168. Dispensary for Combating Venereal Diseases.-This DisMedical Officer in-charge pensary was started by the League for Comof Dispensary for Com- bating Venereal Diseases in 1917. This was bating Venereal Disea- taken over by the Municipality in 1925 (vide Corporation Resolution No. 1468, dated the 7th May 1924). The grade of the Medical Officer in-charge was Rs. 350-15-500. It was revised to Rs. 300-15-450 (vide Corporation Resolution No. 819, dated the 4th March 1935). It was further revised to Rs. 400-20-600 (without the right of private practice) by Corporation Resolution No. 671, dated the 7th October 1940. The Executive Health Officer
suggests that the grade be revised to Rs. 450 -30-750. I recommend that it be fixed at Rs. 450-25-700.
169. Lady Physician.-There is also a Lady Physician attached to this Dispensary. Her salary was Rs. 200, which was revised to Rs. 200-10-300-15-375 (vide Corporation Resolution No. 809, dated the 8th January 1942). The Executive Health Officer suggests that it should be further revised to Rs. 300-25-450. I recommend that it be fixed at Rs. 300-20-400.
170. Clinical Áttendants at the Dispensary for Combating Venereal Diseases. .-There are three posts of Clinical Clinical Attendants. Attendants-one post of Senior Clinical Attendant in the grade of Rs. 45-5-100 and two posts of Junior Clinical Attendants in the grade of Rs, 45-5-80. The Bombay Municipal Officials' Association have represented that the grades of these posts should be suitably revised. The Executive Health Officer has suggested that the grades may be fixed at Rs. $60-5-150$ and Rs. $60-5-120$ respectively. I recommend a grade of Rs. 60-5-120 for the Senior Clinical Attendant and a grade of Rs. 55-5-100 for the Junior Clinical Attendants.

## (j) Compounders.

171. There are 32 posts of Compounders under the Executive Health Officer-3 posts in thegrade Compounders. of Rs. $45-5-100$ (old scale), 28 posts in the grade of Rs. 45-5-80 (new scale) and 1 post in the Veterinary Branch in the grade of Rs. $40-4-60$. The Bombay Municipal Officials' Association have suggested that the grade should be revised so as to bring it on par with the clerical grade and that the Compounders should be provided with rent-free quarters or should be granted a house rent allowance of Rs. 15 per month in lieu thereof. The Executive Health Officer has suggested a grade of Rs. 60-5-120. I recommend a grade of Rs. 55-5-100. As regards rent-free quarters or house rent allowance in lieu thereof, the Executive Health Officer states that the Compounders working in the hospitals are provided with quarters as their attendance is required at any time of the day. The Compounders attending the general dispensaries have to attend the dispensaries during the scheduled working hours and not throughout the day. He has not, therefore, recommended the provision of free quarters or the grant of house rent allowance in lien thereof to such Compounders. I agree with him.

## (k) Street Cleansing and Conservancy.

172. The Head Supervisor, (Conservancy)-Street Cleansing and Conservancy, Road Watering

Head Supervisor, and Halalkhore Service, were looked after by the $A_{\text {ssistant }}$ Health Officers of different wards under the Supervision of the Executive
Health Officer. In 1920, it was decided that it should be placed independently in charge of an Officer styled "Conservancy Assistant" in the grade of Rs. 450-30-600. The grade was revised to Rs. $500-50-700$ by Corporation Resolution No. 9606 , dated the 5th February 1923, and to Rs. 400-20-500 changing the designation to "Head Supervisor, Conservancy", by Corporation Resolution No. 9577, dated the 9th December 1926. In the general revision of 1935, the grade was reduced to Rs. 340-20-500 (vide Corporation Resolution No. 819, dated the 4th March 1935). The Executive Health Officer suggests that the grade should be revised to Rs. 450-25. 650 . I recommend that it be fixed at Rs. $450-25-600$,plus Rs. 150 C.A.
173. Supervisors-There are 3 Supervisors in the Ist grade, and 6 Supervisors in the 2nd grade. Prior to the
Supervisors. general revision of 1935, the scale of the 1st grade Supervisors was Rs. 250-10-350 and that of 2 nd grade Supervisors Rs. $150-10-250$. In the revision of that year the scale of the 1 st grade Supervisors was reduced to Rs. 200-10-300, while the scale of the 2nd grade Supervisors remained the same. The Executive Health Officer suggests that these should be revised to Rs. $300-10-400$ (1st grade) and Rs. 200-10-300 (2nd grade). I recommend that they be fixed at Rs. 275-15-350 and Rs. 160-10-260 respectively.
174. Overseers-There are 70 verseers (Senior) and 54 Overseers (Junior). Prior to the revision of 1935, Overserrs. the pay of the Senior Overseers was Rs. 125. which was graded to Rs. 100-5-125. (vide Standing Committee Resolution No. 879, dated the 28th November 1934). The Executive Health Officer suggests that the grade should be fixed at Rs. 150-10-200. I recommend that it be fixed at Rs. 125-5-150.

Prior to the revision of 1935 , the grade of the Junior Overseers was Rs. 50-5-100, which was revised to Rs. $50-4-90$ for new entrants. Those who were recruited prior to 20th August 1925, were given the grade of Rs. 50-5-120. There are at present 8 Overseers (Junior)
in the grade of Rs. 50-5-120, 12 Over-seers (Junior) in the grade of Rs. 50-5-100 and 34 Overseers (Junior) in the grade of Rs. 50-4-90.

The Executive Health Officer recommends that a uniform grade of Rs. 60-5-150 should be fixed for all these Junior Overseers. I suggest that it should be fixed at Rs. 60-5-125.

## (l) Veterinary Branch.

175. Serior Veterinary Inspector.-This officer is the head of the Veterinary Branch and is in charge of the
Senior Veterinary Bullock Hospital. He is also responsible for Inspector. the treatment of animals sent to the BullockHospital, declared to be an Infirmary, under the Prevention of Cruelty to the Animals Act. Prior to the revision of 1935, his grade was Rs. 200-10-250. It was revised to Rs. 150-10-250 (wide Corporation Resolution No. 819, dated the 4th March 1935) which grade still continues. The Executive Health Officer suggests that the grade be revised to Rs. $300-10-400$. I recommend that it be fixed at Rs. 200-10-300 plus Rs. 50 C.A.
176. Junior Veterinary Inspectors.-The grade of the Junior Veterinary Inspectors was Rs. 150-5-225.
Junior Veterinary Ins- In the general revision of 1935 , it was pectors. revised to Rs. 125-5-175. The Executive Health Officer suggests that it be revised to Rs. 200-10-300, but I recommend that it be fixed at Rs. $160-8-200$ plus Rs. 25 C.A.
177. Veterinary Assistants.-There are 4 Veterinary Assistants in the old grade of Rs. 100-5-150 and 5 in the new grade of Rs. 80-4-120. The Executive Health Officer suggests that all the posts be placed in one uniform grade of Rs. 120-8-200. I recommend that the grade be fixed at Rs. $100-6-160$.
( $m$ ) Welfare Work.
178. Welfare Organiser,-By Standing Committee Resolution

No. 147, dated the 4th May 1938, a post of
"Welfare Organiser" was created in the grade of Rs. $150-10-200$ plus Rs. 50 Conveyance Allowance. The Conveyance allowance of Rs. 50 was increased to Rs. 100 (vide Corporation Resolution No. 810, dated the 8th January 1942). The Welfare Organiser has represented that the grade of the post should be revised to at least Rs. 400-25-700 with a motor car
allowance of Rs. 160 in view of the increase in activities carried on. The Executive Health Officer has suggested that the grade may be revised to Rs. $400-20-500$ plas Rs. 160 Conveyance Allowance. I have elsewhere suggested that a Labour Officer should be appointed to supervise the activities carried on at the different Welfare Centres and thst the existing staff should be placed under his control. In view of this, l'recommend that the grade of the post of the Welfare Organiser may be fixed at Rs. 200-10-300 plus Rs. 125 Conveyance Allowance.
(n) Clerical and Menial staff.
179. As this staff is common to all the departments, I have Clerical and Menial dealt with it separately. Staff.
(o) Halalkhors, Scavengers, etc.
180. I have dealt with this staff also in a separate Halalkhors, Scavengers, chapter. etc.
(p) Financial effect.
181. The financial effect of the proposals made in respect of this Department is a net increase of Financial effect. Rs. 7,98,432 per annumn in the cost of Establishment and of Rs. 1,66,340 per annum on Leave and Provident Fund.

CHAPTER XIX.

## The King Edward VII Memorial Hospital.

182. This is one of the largest and magnificent hospitals in India; The number of beds in the hospital has increasFunctions and Strength, ed from 334 in 1927 to 510 in 1944. The number of in-patients has increased from 5,923 in 1927 to 14,804 in 1943. The number of out-patients has increased from 31,774 in 1927 to $1,32,639$ in 1943. The Hospital Extension Scheme will shortly be completed and there will be a further rise in the number of patients admitted into the Wards. The Hospital has built up an enviable reputation as one of the best managed hospitals with highly qualified, and experienced medical men and staff. The Head of this organization is the Dean. The total strength of the staff, including the staff paid out of the G. S. Medical College and the K. E. M. Hospital Research Fund and the staff at the Hospital for clinical treatment of School Children is 703 and the cost of Establishment is Rs. $4,61,798$ p. a.
183. The Dean.-This Officer is the chief administrative head of this Hospital as well as of the G. S. Medical College. Both these institutions have rapidly

## The Dean.

 expanded and the process is continuing and there has, therefore, been a great increase in the work of the Dean. The post of the Dean was created by Corporation Resolution No. 12471, dated the 12th March 1925, and the grade was fixed at Rs. 2,000-125-2,500. It was revised to Rs. 1,750-50-2,000 in the general revision of 1935,(vide Corporation Resolution No. 819, dated the 4th March 1935). The Principal of the Grant Medical College and the Superintendent of the J. J. Group of Hospitals draws a salary in the I.M.S. Grade and receives several kinds of allowances. The maximum of the I.M.S. grade is Rs. 1,850 and the allowances amount to Rs. 650 (Rs. 250 as Superintendent of J. J. Group of Hospitals, Rs. 150 as Principal of the Grant Medical College and Rs. 250 in lieu of private practice). The maximum pay drawn by the Principal, Grant Medical College, is Rs. 1,850 plus Rs. $650=$ Rs. 2,500 . I. M. S. Officers are also entitled to Overseas pay of Rs. 400 per month. The total amount drawn by the Principal of the Grant Medical College thus comes to Rs. 2,900 per month. He is besides allowed rent free quarters. The Deansuggests that the grade of the post should be revised to Rs. 2,000-125 2,500 with free quarters. Although, I feel that there is full justification for the restoration of the old grade, viz., Rs. 2,000-125-2,500, I refrain from recommending the revision of the grade in view of the fact that the post has been advertised with reduced salary. I, therefore, recommend that for the present the grade should remain as it is, viz., Rs. $1,750-50-2,000$. As regards the suggestion that the quarters should be given free, as in the case of the Superintendent of the J. J. Group of Hospitals, I am of opinion that there is a strong case for giving the Dean rent free residence as his staying near the Hospital and College is bound to be of distinct advantage to the institutions, both in regard to close supervision and attention to cases of emergency, which are bound to be frequent in institutions of such size and magnitude. I would, however, leave this question to be dealt with by the Commissioner along with the general question as to which of the Officers should be given free quarters and which of them charged rent on a percentage basis, as suggested by me elsewhere.
184. The Vice-Dean-The Corporation under their Resolution 811, dated the 13th December 1944, sanctioned the creation of a post of Vice-Dean and the appointment of one of the Professors at the Seth G. S. Medical College to that post on payment of a special pay of Rs. $200 /$ - per month. The Vice-Dean is to do most of the work of the College under the guidance and control of the Dean in addition to his duties as Professor.

## 185. The Assistant Dean.-A post styled as Vice-Dean and Warden was created in the year 1924 and the

 grade was fixed at Rs. 300-20-500 (vide Corporation Resolution No. 6575, dated the 6th October 1924). In the Budget of 1926-27, the designation was changed to "Assistant Dean and Warden " and in 1927-28 Budget, the designation was further changed to " Assistant Dean ". In the general revision of 1935, the grade was revised to Rs. 400-25-750 (vide Corporation Resolution No. 819, dated the 4th March 1935). The Assistant Dean is provided with free quarters and lights. Besides this, he gets an Honorariun of Rs. 100 as Honorary Lecturer in Medical Jurisprudence, and Rs. 100 as Fire Brigade Surgeon. He looks after the administrative duties of the Hospital. The Dean has suggested that the grade should be revised to Rs. $500-25-1,000$ with free quarters. As the Assistant Dean is getting Rs. 200 extra over and above his salary, his total emoluments compare favourably withthe grades of posts carrying similar reponsibilities. I do not, therefore, recommend any change in his grade-especially as a post of Vice-Dean has since been created by Corporation Resolution No. 811 , dated the 13th December 1945.
186. X-Ray Medical Assistant and Assistant Medical Officers.The present grade of the X-Ray Medical X.Ray Medical Assiss Assistant is Rs. $120-10-250$ and that of the MedicalOfficers. Assistant Medical Officers is Rs. 230-15-350. The Dean suggests that as the X-Ray Medical Assistant has responsibilities similar to those of the Assistant Medical Officers and as he is required to stay on the premises, his pay should be brought in line with that of Assistant Medical Officers. I recommend that it be fixed at Rs. 230-15-350.
187. The Chief Dispenser.-The duty of this post is supervision of the Dispensing staff. The Chief Dispenser is also in charge of Medical Stores. His grade was Rs. 100-5-125, but it was revised to Rs. 100-10-150 (vide Standing Committee Resolution No. 1163, dated the 22nd November 1944). Having regard to the responsibilities of this post, the Dean suggests that the grade should be fixed at Rs. $120-10-180$. I agree with him and recommend that it be fixed at Rs. 120-10-180.
188. The Matron and the Nursing Staff.-The Dean points out Matron and the Nurging that the salaries paid to the Nursing staff are Staff. quite inadequate compared with the salaries paid to similar staff in the J. J. Group of Hospitals. He accordingly suggests that the grade of the Matron, should be revised from Rs. 275-10-375 to Rs. $350-25-450$, that of the Senior Assistant Matron from Rs. 175-10-225 to Rs. 250-10-350 and that of the Junior Assistant Matron from Rs. 140-10-180 to Rs. 200-5-250, respectively. I recommend that the grades be fixed as follows:-

| Matron | ... | Rs. $300-10-400$. |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Sr. Asstt. Matron | ... | Rs. $200-10-250$. |
| Jr. Asstt. Matron | ... | Rs. $160-10-200$. |

The grade of 1 Senior Sister is Rs. 115-5-140 and of 7 Senior Sisters is Rs. 110-5-135. The Dean suggests that they should have a uniform grade of Rs. 140-5-175. I recommend that it be fixed at Rs. 125-5-160.

## 89

189. The Engineer-in-charge.-The present grade of this post is Rs. $120-10-150$. The Dean suggests that the maximum of the post should be raised to Rs. 200. I agree with him, and recommend that the grade be fixed at Rs. 120-10-200.

Financial effect.
190. The financial effect of the proposals made by me in Financial Effect. respect of this Department is a net increase of Rs. $60,144 \mathrm{per}$ annum in the cost of Establishment and of Rs. 12,530 per annum on Leave and Provident Fund.

## CHAPTER XX:

## The Seth Gordhandas Sunderdas Medical College.

191. The Dean is in charge of this College. Like the K.E.M. Functions and Strength. Hospital, this institution also is fast expandhas increased from 46 in 1925 to 553 in 1944. The total strength of the staff is 177 and the cost of Establishment is R. $2,24,190$ p. a.
192. The Dean, Vice-Dean and the Assistant Dean.-Their cases have been dealt with in Chapter XIX. Dean, Vice-Dean and Asstt. Dean.
193. Professors-The Professors are whole-time and without

## Profesabrs.

 the right of private practice. The original grade of Rs. 700-50-1,200 was fixed by Corporation Resolution No. 965 , dated the 30th April 1925. One of the Professors viz., Professor of Pathology was paid Rs. 500 P.A.C. per month by Corporation Resolution No. 1297, dated the (lth May 1925. The grade' was revised to Rs. $600-25-850-50-1,000$ by Corporation Resolution No. 819, dated the 4th March 1935. Three of the Professors in the Grant Medical College belong to the Bombay Medical Service, Class I, the maximum salary of which is Rs. 1,000 in the old scale and Rs. 850 in the revised scale with an allowance of Rs. 100 per month in lieu of private practice and the Bombay Compensatory allowance varying from Rs. 32 to Rs. 45 per month. For the fourth post of Professor of Pharmacology, there is an Honorary Teacher getting an honorarium of Rs. 275 with the right of private practice. On the retirement of the incumbent of the post, the same is to be held by a whole-time officer. (Vide Municipal Commissioner's letters No. E.H. 2958-S.R, dated the 28th July 1941 and No. C. 1049-S.R., dated the Ist October 1941, underlying Corporation Resolution No. 811, dated the 13th December 1944). The Dean points out that the present grade is not attractive enough to induce highly qualified persons to work as Professors as they can earn a much better income in private consulting work, and suggests that the grade be revised to Rs, 800-50-1,500. I recommend that the grade be fixed at Rs. $700-50-1,200$.194. Assistant Professors-There were originally four posts styled as "Associate Professors " and their salary was fixed at Rs. 300, by Corporation Assintant Profeesors. Resolution No. 6575, dated the 6th October 1924, and Corporation

Resolution No. 3982, dated the 16th July 1925. They were part-time Professors. In the Budget for 1928-29, 1 post of Associate Professor was converted into 1 post of Assistant Professor on Rs. 250, whole time, and with the right of private practice. In the general revision of 1935,the remaining three posts of "Associate Professors" were converted into three posts of Assistant Professors and the pay of the four posts of Assistant Professors was fixed at Rs. 225-10-275, whole-time with the right of private practice (vide Corporation Reso. lution No. 819, dated the 4th March 1935). A new post of Assistant Professor, Bio-Chemistry, was created by Corporation Resolution No. 480, dated the 1st November 1934, and the grade was fixed at Rs. 250-15-400. The grade of these 5 Assistant Professors was revised to Rs. 300-15-420-20-500 whole-time and without the right of private practice by Corporation Resolution No. 671, dated the 7th October 1940. There are at present 4 posts of Assistant Professors in the grade of Rs. 300-15-420-20-500 and I post of Assistant Professor, Bio-Chemistry in the grade of Rs. 250-15-400. In the case of the latter, it has been laid down by Corporation Resolution No. 671, dated the 7th October 1940, that for those who are reappointed the grade. should be Rs. 300-15-420-20-500, whole-time and without the right of private practice. The grade for the Assistant Professors in the Grant MedicalCollegeis Rs. 200-40/3-400-E.B. at Rs. 240 and Rs. 320 (Probationers Rs. 150 for 1st year and Rs. 180 for 2nd year) plus Compensatory allowance from Rs. 20 to Rs. 50 per month according to the scale of salary plus a special allowance of Rs. 50 in lieu of private practice. The Dean points out that the Assistant Professors were formerly allowed the right of-private practice outside their duty hours. While revising their grade, it was laid down that they should not carry on private practice. The Professors and Assistant Professors must possess Post-Graduate qualifications in their respective subjects according to the rules of the University. The lure of private practice results in frequent changes in the staff as the present grade is not sufficiently attractive. He, therefore, suggests that the grade should be revised to Rs. 400-25-750, without the right of private practice. I recommend that it should be fixed at Rs. 400-25-600 without the right of private practice.

[^16]B.S. students in the Anatomy Department, and (4) Tutor in Bio-Physics for teaching his subject to the 1st M.B., B.S. students in the Physiology Department. Their grade is Rs. 110-5-120. The Dean points out that the 2 Tutors who work in the Anatomy and Physiology Departments and hold Post-Graduate qualification in the Faculty of Science, are whole-time workers and have no further prospects in the service. The Dean, therefore, suggests that their grade should be revised to Rs. $110-10-200$, or in the alternative their pay should be fixed at Rs. 100 per month and the posts converted into part-time ones so that the incumbents can take up other remunerative work outside their duty hours. He, however, considers that it is better to have whole-time tutors so that they may be able to devote more time to research work. 1 recommend that the grade of these 2 Tutors be fixed at Rs. $110-6-170$ and that of the remaining 2 be retained at Rs. 110-5. 120 and that they all should be whole-time.
196. Laboratory Assistants.-There are two Laboratory Assistants in the grade of Rs. 75-5/2-90, three in the grade of Rs. 50-3-80 and seven in the grade of Rs. 45-3-75. The grade of the Laboratory Assistants was Rs. 50-3-80 before the last general revision. The Dean suggests that the grade of all the 12 be 6xed at Rs. 50-4-110. I recommend that it be fixed at Rs. 55-4-95.
197. Head Clerks.-The Dean says that one Head Clerk is in charge of the College office. He
Chief Clerk and Head Clert. works as a Personal Assistant to the Dean. He considers this post to be a technical one in the sense that the holder of the post has not only to study Municipal Rules and Regulations but must also be well conversant with the Rules and Regulations of the University, the College of Physicians and Surgeons and other teaching institutions. The Medical curriculum is a very complicated one and there should be no frequent changes in the incumbent of this post in the interest of efficiency. The Head Clerk has also to deal with the outside public at the time of annual admission of students to thisCollege and to supply information on various points. The Dean, therefore, suggests that a new post of Personal Assistant in the grade of Rs. 250-10-350 may be created, and only graduates who have passed the Head Clerk's examination should be entitled to get this post. I recommend that the Head Clerk's post be converted into that of a Chief Clerk and the grade be fixed at Rs. 200-10-300. As

## 93

regards the 2nd Head Clerk, who is in charge of the Accounts and Cash transactions, and who also looks after the Stores of the College, his grade may be fixed at Rs. 160-8-200, as in the case of Head Clerks in other departments.

## Financial effect.

198. The financial effect of the proposals made in respect of Financial effect. this Department is a net increase of Rs. 24,780 per annum in the cost of Establishment and of Rs. 5,163 per annum on Leave and Provident Fund.

## CHAPTER XXI

The Engineering Department.
199. This department deals with the Engineering problems of the City including (1) Construction and Functions and Strength. Maintenance of Roads, (2) Lighting, (3) Inspection of Buildings in the City (4) Drainage and Sewerage problems, (5) Disposal of refuse in the City, and (6) Constructing and maintaining buildings and chawls for the Municipality. For this purpose the department is divided into several branches, the chief of which are :-
(I) Works Branch.
(2) Mechanical Branch,
(3) Building Branch, and
(4) Architectural Branch.

The department is in charge of the City Engineer, who is assisted by a Deputy City Engineer, 2 Assistant Engineers (1st grade), 7 Assistant Engineers (2nd grade) and other sub-ordinate staff. The total strength of the department is 3,145 and the cost of the Establishment is Rs. 21,31,900 p. a.
200. The City Engineer-This post was created by Bormbay Act The City Engineor. Il of 1865 and was designated as "Executive Engineex." It carried a salary of not less than Rs. 2,000 a month. The salary was reduced to Rs. 1,200-1,500 by Bombay Acts 1872 and 1878 (Section 44). By Bombay Act V of 1903, the salary was revised to Rs. $1,200-2,000$. The designation of "Executive Engineer" was changed to "City Engineer" and the then incumbent was granted a personal allowance of Rs. 250 per mensem rising by annual increments of Rs. 50 per month upto Rs. 500 per month in addition to his maximum monthly salary with effect from 1st April 1929 (vide Bombay Act XIX of 1930). The grade of Rs.1.400-75-2,000, personal to the present City Engineer, without the grant of personal allowance was sanctioned under Corporation Resolutions No.819, dated the 4th March 1935, and No.84, dated the 3rd May 1935. The present City Engineer was being paid a conveyance Allowance of Rs. 200 per month. The Corporation have by their Resolution No. 212, dated the 3rd July 1945, allowed the City Engineer free use of a Municipal motor car instead of a monthly Conveyance Allowance. The present pay of the City Engineer is fixed at not exceeding Rs. 2,000 per month and not less than Rs. 1,200
per month (vide Bombay Act XIII of 1938). The pay of the post of the Chief Engineer in the Bombay Port Trust is Rs. 2.000-752,300, and that of the Chief Engineer, in the G.I.P. Railway Rs.2,750-$125-3,000$ (old scale) plus Bombay Allowance Rs. 100 plus House Rent Allowance. The City Engineer has suggested a scale of Rs. 1,600-200-2,000. Having regard to the importance of the post and considering the pay of similar posts in other public bodies, I recommend a grade of Rs. $1,500-100-2,000$. I also recommend that on his reaching the maximum, the Corporation may grant a Personal Allowance of Rs. 300 to the incumbent by three stages of Rs. $1 C 0$ each. This will require an amendment of Section 74 of the Municipal Act.
201. The Deputy City Engineer-This post was created in the reorganization of the Engineering DepartThe Depuly City Enci-
neer.
reorganization or or or or
ment dated the 21 st October 1929; on a salary of
Rs. $1,250-50-1,500$. The grade was revised to Rs. 1,200-50-1,500 in the general revision sanctioned under Corporation Resolution No. 819, dated the 4th March 1935. The same was further revised to Rs. $800-50-1,100$ under Standing Committee Resolution No. 1253, dated the 27 th November 1940 and Corporation Resolution No. 1214, dated the 25th February 1941. The pay of the post of the Deputy Chief Engineer in the Bombay Port Trust is Rs. 1,400-75-2,000 and that of the Deputy Chief Engineer in the C. I. P. Railway is Rs. $1,750-100-2,150$ plus S. O. P. £ 13-6-8. The City Engineer has suggested a grade of Rs. 1, 150-75-1,400 for this post. I recommend that the grade be fixed at Rs. $1,000-50-1,200$.
202. Assistant Engineers (I Grade)-There are at present two Assistant Engineens, posts of Assistant Engineers, I Grade one lat Grade. for the Mechanical Branch and the other for the Architectural Branch.
203. Assistant Engineer, 1st Grade, Mechanical Branch-He Aasistant Ensineer, is in charge of Municipal Workshops, Pump${ }^{13 t}$ Grade, Machanical ing and Purification Works, Mechanical Tranbrench. sport and Drainage Work. The post was created in the year 1890-91 on Rs. 500 and designated "Superintendent. Workshops and Machinery." The designation was changed to "Assistant Engineer, Mechanical Branch" in 1895-96, and the pay revised to Rs. $400-20-500$ in 1897-98 and to Rs. $600-50-800$ in $1900-01$, in consideration of the additional work of supervision of
the Air Compressor Station, Fire Brigade, and other Engines and Machinery. The grade was further revised to Rs. 700-50-1,000 and the designation changed to "Deputy Executive Engineer, Mechanical Branch" in the year 1909-10. A Personal Allowance of Rs. 200 was granted in 1912-13, for approved and efficient service. The grade was further revised to Rs. $650-50-800-50-1,200$ under Corporation Resolution No.10727, dated the 8th December 1919, and the designation changed in the revision to "Senior Assistant Engineer". The grade was again revised to Rs. 1,200-50-1,500 under Corporation Resolution No. 817, dated the 27th April 1922, and the designation altered to "Deputy Engineer." In the reorganization of the Engineering Department sanctioned under Corporation Resolution No. 6504, dated the 21 st October 1929, the grade was reduced to Rs. 850-50-1100 and the designation changed to "Assistant Engineer, Ist grade". In the general revision of 1935 , sanctioned under Corporation Resolution No. 819, dated the 4th March 1935, the grade was reduced to Rs. $660-40-900$. This grade is still in force The City Engineer has recommended a grade of Rs. 750-50-1,000 due to the increase in the number of Pumping and Compressor Stations and expansion of the Dadar Purification, Works. The pay of the posts of the Chief Mechanical Engineer, the Deputy Chief Mechanical Engineer, and the Mechanical Engineer, senior scale, in the G. I: P. Railway is Rs. 2,250 plus £ 13-6-8 S.O.P., Rs. 1,300 plus $£ 30$ S.O.P., and Rs. $750-850-950$ plus £ $15-30$ S.O.P. respectively and that of the Mechanical Superintendent and Senior Assistant Mechanical Superintendents in the Bombay Port Trust is Rs. 1,450-75-1,750 and Rs. 1,000-50-1,250, respectively, with free quarters. The City Engineer has recommended a grade of Rs. 750-50-1,000. Taking all the facts into account, I recommend a grade of Rs. $700-50-1,000$ for the post plus Rs. 150 C.A.

[^17]205. dssistant Engineers, 2nd grade.-The present grade of these posts is Rs. 350-25-600. They are
Asistant Engineers, directly responsible to the City Engineer and the Deputy City Engineer and are in charge of Maintenance, Construction, Slum-improvements and Buildings Branchcs. Prior to the gencral revision of 1935, sanctioned under Corporation Resolution No. 819, dated the 4th March 1935, the grade of the Assistant Engineers II Grade was Rs. 400-40-800, as sanctioned in the re-organization of the Engineering Department (vide Corporation Resolution No. 6504, dated the 21st October 1929). The City Engineer has suggested a grade of Rs. 500-40-700. I suggest a grade of Rs. $450-25-700$.
206. Assistant Engineers, 3rd Grade.-The present grade of these posts is Rs. 200-20-400. The City
Asuistant Engineers, Engineer has suggested a grade of Rs. 275-253rd grade.
450. As the holders of these posts are in charge of responsible work, I recommend the grade suggested by him.
207. Inspectors.-The present grade of these posts is Rs. $150-10-250$ for B.E.s and Rs. $140-8-220$ luspectors. for Non-B.E.s. The City Engineer has suggested a scale of Rs. 180-10-250 for all. The Inspectors are directiy responsible to the Assistant Engineers. The Municipal Officials' Association suggest that the grade be fixed at Rs. $200-15-350$ plus Rs. 30 C. A. I recommend that their designation be altered to "Sub-Engineers" and the grade fixed at Rs. 180-10-270 for B. E.s and Rs. 160-10-250 for Non-B.E.s.
208. Sub-overseers-The holders of these posts are responsible to the Assistant Engineers and are also placed
Sub-Overseors. in charge of works where labour is engaged. Their present grade is Rs. 55-5-100-10-150 with a starting salary of Rs. 65 for Diploma holders from the Victoria Jubilee Technical Institute or the Poona Engineering College and the Karachi Engineering College and other similar Institutions whose standard of the Diploma Examination is recognised to be as high as that of the three Institutions (vide Municipal Commissioner's letter No. C.E.S.R. No. 4399 of 21-7-1943 underlying S.C.R. No. 635 of 11-8-1943). The course of study and training for the above examinations extends over a period of 3 years and admission to the course is
difficult and can be secured only by students of high calibre. The 'Bombay Municipal Officials' Association' have suggested a grade of Rs. 90-5-100-10-180 to Rs. 250 with a starting salary of Rs. 105 to qualified persons or in the alternative a grade of Rs. 95-5-100-10-200 with a reservation of 60 per cent of the posts for them in the Inspectorial cadre leaving 40 per cent for direct recruitment without making any difference, as between B. Es. and Non-B. Es. They have also represented that the designation "Sub-overseer" given to Diploma holders in Municipal service should be changed to "Overseer". The former designation is obsolete and does not exist either in the Public Works Department or in any Engineer. ing service of a local-body. The scale of the Overseers in the Public Works Department has been recently revised to Rs. 70-5-1 10-E.B.-10 180 E.B. $10-250$ with Rs 275 as Selection grade for 3 per cent of the cadre (with a starting salary for a Graduate in Engineering of Rs. 120 after I year's probation on Rs. 70). The City Engineer has suggested a scale of Rs. 70-5-100-10-170 with a starting salary of Rs. 80 to qualified persons. Taking into account all the factors, I recommend a grade of Rs. $75-5-110-10-160$ with a starting pay of Rs. 85 to qualified persons. I also recommend that the designation of the post of "Sub-overseers" be changed to "Overseers."
209. Draftsmen.-The present grade for Draftsmen is

$\begin{array}{ll}\text { Rs. } 55-4,115-5-140 \text {. The Bombay Municipal } \\ \text { Draftsmen. } & \begin{array}{l}\text { Officials' Association have suggested a grade } \\ \text { of Rs. } 150-10-300 \text { for Draftsmen if they are }\end{array}\end{array} \ggg l$ G.D. Arch. They have also represented that they should be placed on a level with B. E.s. Similarly, they have suggested a grade of Rs. $400-25-600$ for an officer with A. R. I. B. A. qualification, who according to them should be given a suitable designation such as "Architect". The City Engineer has suggested a grade of Rs. $70-5 \cdot 100 \mathrm{~m} 10-170$ for ordinary Draftsmen. The scale of pay for Draftsmen in the Bombay Port Trust is Rs. 180-10-250 for 1st grade, Rs. 125-5-160 for 2nd grade, Rs. $95-5-125$ for 3 rd grade and Rs. $60-5-90$ for 4 th grade. The scales of pay in the G. I. P. Railway are Rs. 200, Rs. 160 , Rs. 120 and those in the B. B. \& C. I. Railway are Rs. 120 and Rs. 100. Taking all the factors into account, I recommend a grade of Rs. 75-5-160 for ordinary Draftsmen. Those possessing G. D. Arch qualification may be given a grade of Rs. 160-8-200 and those with A. R. I. B. A. qualification, a grade of Rs. 275-25-450.
210. Tracers. - The present grade of the Tracers is Rs. 50-3-65 4-85-5-100. The Bombay Municipal Officials' Tracers. Association have represented that the present grade is inadequate and should be improved. The City Engineer has suggested a grade of Rs. $60-5-110-8$-150. Prior to the general revision of 1935, the grade for Tracers and Draftsmen was the same viz., Rs. 60-5-150. In the revision of that year, it was reduced to Rs. 55-4-115-5-140. Under Standing Committee Resolution No. 972, dated the 7th October 1942, the grade of the Tracers was further reduced to Rs. 50-3-65-4-85-5-100. After due consideration of all the suggestions, I recommend a grade of Rs. 60-5-150.

> 21I. Dadar Purification Works. - The present grade of the Chemist at the Dadar Purification Works Cheaist, Dadar Puri is Rs. 200-10-350 plus Rs. 25 Conveyance fication Works. Plant for the disposal of sewage in the northern part of the City. The sludge gas produced at the Purification W'orks is at present supplied to five hospitals. The duties attached to the post are onerous and the City Engineer has suggested a revision of the scale to Rs. $350-25-500$ plus Rs. 25 Conveyance Allowance and the Municipal Commissioner has also strongly supported the proposal. After considering all the facts, I agree with the City Engineer and suggest a grade of Rs. 350-25-500. The City Engineer has recommended that the designation "Chemist" should be changed to "Superintendent and Chemist ". I agree with this recommendation.

[^18]
## 100

213. Temporary Sub-overseers.-There are at present 36 posts

Temporary Sub-Over of Temporary Sub-overseers under the City seers,
2 For Construction work.
3 " Subvention work.
4 ". Drainage work.
$11^{3}$ " Licensing of StallEngineer as shown in the margin. Out of these, 7 posts are in existence since 1930-31, 3 since $1933-34,3$ since $1934-35,1$ since 1935-36, 11 since 1938-39, 3 since 1939-40 and 8 since 1941-42. It will be seen that the posts have been in existence for a
4 . Special Repairs Im provements.
3 " Capital Works, Ar- long time and may be required hereafter. chitectural Branch, I, therefore, recommend, that these posts
6 .Works Branch. Im- be brought on the permanent schedule so as provements. to enable the holders thereof to enjoy the
36. Total same concessions with regard to leave etc., as are enjoyed by the permanent employees.

## Financial effect.

214. The financial effect of the proposals made in respect of this

Financial effect. department is a net increase of . Rs. $3,30,804$ per annum in the cost of Establishment and of Rs. 70,793 per annum on account of Leave and Provident Fund.

## CHAPTER XXII

## Fire Brigade.

215. Under Section $61(k)$ of the Municipal Act, it is obligatory Functions and Strength. on the Corporation to make provision for a Fire-Brigade and the protection of life and property in case of fire. Accordingly, the Corporation maintains a force of Officers and firemen, equipped with the most up-to-date fire fighting apparata, fire escapes, motor ladders etc. This department is under the "Chief Officer, Commanding Fire Services." He is assisted by a Deputy Chief Officer, an Assistant Officer Commanding, Fire Services, a 2nd Officer, a 3rd Officer, and 10 Station Officers. There are 10 Stations, located in different parts of the City each in charge of a Station Officer. The total strength of the Brigade is 292 and the cost of the Establishment is Rs. 1,98, 162 per annum.
216. The Officer Commanding, Fire Services.-Originally, the Fire

The Officer Command. Brigade was under the control of the Police. ing, Fire Services. In 1888, it was taken over by the Municipality and placed under a "Superintendent and Head Engineer, ", whose salary was fixed at Rs. 350. By Corporation Resolution No. 8361, dated the 17th November 1890, the salary of the post was raised to Rs. 500 and the designation was changed to "Chief Officer." In 1892-93,the salary of the post was raised to Rs. 600 in appreciation of the services of the then incumbent of the post. In 1895-96, the post was graded into Rs. $500-50-800$, and in 1908-09, the incumbent of the post was granted a personal allowance of Rs. 100 for approved service. This personal allowance, however, ceased in 1913-14, on the retirement of the then incumbent of the post. By Corporation Resolution No. 12337, dated the 29th January 1920, the grade was revised to Rs. 600-50 800-50/2-1,000. It was further revised to Rs. 1,000-50-$-1,200$ by Corporation Resolution No. 9631, dated the 30th January 1922. In the general revision of 1935 , the grade was reduced to Rs. 700-40-980 (vide Corporation Resolution No. 819, dated the 4th March 1935). The designation of the post was temporarily changed to "Officer Commanding Fire Services" due to the fact that the Auxiliary Fire Services were placed under him (vide Corporation Resolution No. 19, dated the 9th April 1942). The Officer Commanding Fire Services states that the grade of the present incumbent (old grade Rs. 1,000-50-1,200) is reasonable and should continue. I agree with him and recommend accordingly.
217. The Depuly Chief Officer.-This post was created by CorThe Deputy Chief poration Resolution No. 851, dated the 11 th Officer. December 1940, for 3 years only, and the grade was fixed at Rs. $400-25-500$. The post was continued for a further period of 3 years from 1st January 1944,(vide Corporation Resolution No. 457, dated the 16th August 1943). I propose that the minimum of the grade be raised to Rs. 450, as the maximum of the grade of "Assistant Officer, Commanding Fire Services" has been suggested to be raised to Rs. 450 , and that the grade be fixed at Rs. 450-25-500.
218. The Assistant Officer Commanding, Fire Services:-Prior to the revision of 1935, the grade of the post

The Asstt. Officer Coma manding Fire Service. was Rs. 350-10-450. In the revision of that year, it was reduced to Rs. $300-10-400$. The Officer Commanding Fire Services suggests that the grade should be revised to Rs, $350-20-450$. I agree with him and recommend accordingly.
219. 2nd and $3 r d$ Officers.- The present grade of these officers 2nd and 3rd Officers. is Rs. 200-10-300. The Officer Commanding Fire Services suggests that it be revised to Rs. 300-10-350. I agree with him and recommend accordingly.
220. Station Officers.-1 Station Officer is in the grade of Rs. 200-10-250-10-350, 3 Station Officers are in the grade of Rs. 200-10-300 and 6 Station Officers in the grade of Rs. 150-5-190. The Officer Com manding Fire Services states that this staff is on continuous duty for 24 hours a day ready to attend any call. They do not enjoy the benefits of evenings, week ends or public holidays, off duty, like the staff in other departments. He considers that the existing scales do not compare favourably with these in other Fire Brigades. He, therefore, suggests thata uniform grade of Rs. $150-10-300$ be fixed for all the 10 Station Officers. I agree with him and suggest that their grade be fixed at Rs. $150-10-300$.
221. Mechanic:-The grade of this post is Rs. 105-5-150. As suggested by the Officer Commanding Fire Services I recommend that it be revised to Rs. 125-5-175.

- 222. Sub-Officer:-The grade of the Sub-Officer was Rs. 95

Sub-Officer. $2 \frac{1}{2}-100$. In the last revision of 1935, it was reduced to Rs. 85-2 -95. As suggested by the

Officer Commanding Fire Services, I recommend that the grade be fixed at Rs. 85-3-100.

## Financial effect.

223. The financial effect of the proposals made in respect of Financial effect. this Department is a net increase of Rs. 20,808 per anum in the cost of Establishment and of Rs. 4,335 per annum on Leave and Provident Fund.

## CHAPTER XXIII

## Licence Department.


#### Abstract

224. This department was constituted in the year 1890. Till then, the work was carried on by the Health Department. But on account of the growing volume and importance of the work, it was transferred, in that year, to a new Department. Since then, new functions have been entrusted to it viz., (1) control of advertisements in the year 1923, (2) control of Hawkers and removal of encroachments in the year 1926, and (3) administration of the Bombay Shops and Establishments Act in 1940. The work of this department cannot and is not to be measured in terms of revenue as the Corporation have affirmed that it is primarily a controlling and not a revenue earning department, the most difficult part of its duties being the control over Hawkers, a heterogenous and intractable lot and the administration of the Shops and Establishments Act. The Department is under the control of the Superintendent of Licences, Shops and Establishments. The total strength of the staff is 193 and the total cost of the Establish ment is Rs. 1,92,366 per annum.


(a) Licensing.
225. The Superintendent of Licences, Shops and Establishments.

The Superintendent of The post was created in $1890-91$, on a pay Licences, Shops and of Rs. 350 . when the Licence Department Establishments. was constituted. In 1897-98, the salary was revised and graded into Rs. $300-30-450$. In 1922, the grade was further revised to Rs. $500-50-700$ (vide Corporation Resolution No. 9631 , dated the 30th January 1922). In 1928, the grade was again revised to Rs. 700-50-1,000 (vide Corporation Resolution No. 4128, dated the 6th August 1928). In 1935, the grade 'was reduced to Rs. $400-25-700$, making the minimum of the old grade the maximum of the new one. An allowance of Rs. 100 was attached to the post when the administration of the Shops and Establishments Act was entrusted to it. (vide Corporation Resolution No. 621, dated the 3rd November 1941). The duties of the post have steadily increased, both in volume and complexity. The Superintendent of Licences, Shops and Establishments suggests that the grade should be revised to Rs. $800-50-1,200$ plus Rs. 150 Conveyance Allowance.

He compares his post with that of a Deputy Commissioner of Police, Bombay City, whose grade is Rs. $650-25-1,000$ E.B. $50-1,450$ plus Bombay Allowance of Rs. 200 and Conveyance Allowance of Rs. 150 per month. Having regard to all these considerations, it seems to me that a grade of Rs. 600-40-800 plus Rs. 150 Conveyance Allowance would be adequate. He should, however, continue to draw the allowance of Rs. 100 per month so long as the work of administering the Shops and Establishments Act remains with him.
226. Assistant Superintendent of Licences.-The duties of this post are onerous, and include supervision,

- Assistant Superintendent of Licenses. correspondence and inspection. He is also the Prosecuting Officer of the department. Most of the licensing work is attended to by him. His grade was R. 200-10-275 prior to 1935. In the revision of that year, it was reduced to Rs. $180-10-240$ plus Rs. 30 Conveyance Allowance. In 1938, his grade was proposed to be revised to Rs. 200-10-300, in view of the increasein and importance of his work. The Standing Committee and the Corporation, however, sanctioned a Personal Allowance of Rs. 50 to the then incumbent of the post (vide Standing Committee Resolution No. 1431, dated the 18th January 1939, and Corporation Resolution No. 968, dated the 16th February 1939). The duties of this post are far more responsible and heavy than those of the Chief Clerk in whose grade he is now placed. In addition to indoor and outdoor duties, he has to attend to Court work for which he must possess some court craft in addition to general ability and tact. The Superintendent of Licences, Shops and Establishments recommends that his grade be fixed at Rs. $400-25-700$ plas Rs. 50 Conveyance Allowance. I consider that a grade of Rs. $300-20-400$ plus Rs. 40 Conveyance Allowance would be adequate.

227. Cashier.-This post was created in 1937-38. His duties are to receive and remit fees and supervise the work of Fee Clerks. The grade of the post is Rs. 140-5-180. The Superintendent of Licences, Shops and Establishments recommends a grade of Rs. 180-10-250. I consider a grade of Rs. 160-8-200 to be fair and reasonable.
228. Senior Inspectors (Licences)-They are in charge of heavy wards. Their duties comprise visiting
Senior
Licencer.

They move from street to street and keep a record of licensed premises with all relevant particulars and detect and report breaches of licence conditions and assist prosecutions. Their grade was Rs. 150-5-190 prior to 1935. In the revision of that year, it was reduced to Rs. 140-5. 180 olus Rs. 15 Conveyance Allowance. The Superintendent of Licences, Shops and Establishments recommends a grade of Rs. 180-10-250 plus Rs. 20 Conveyance Allowance. I agree with him and recommend that the grade be fixed at Rs. 180-10-250 plus Rs. 20 Conveyance Allowance.
229. Junior Inspectors (Licences).-Their duties are the same as Junior Inspectors, those of the Senior Inspectors, but they are Licences. in charge of less heavy wards. Their grade was Rs. $60-5-150$ prior to 1935 and it was reduced in that year to Rs. 55-4-115-5-140 plus Rs. 15 Conveyance Allowance. The Superintendent of Licences, Shops \& Establishments recommends that their grade should be revised to Rs. 110-6-175 plus Rs. 20 Conveyance Allowance. I consider a grade of Rs. 75-5.100-7-170 plus Rs. 20 Conveyance Allowance to be adequate.
(b) Licensing of Hawkers and Removal of Encroachments.
230. Senior Supervisor (Encroachments).-The Senior Super-

Senior Supervisor, visor is the head of the Encroachment branch Encroachments. and attends to the licensing of Hawkers and removal of encroachments, and is answerable to the Superintendent of Licences, Shops \& Establishments for the efficient management of this branch. He is also placed in charge of one of the 3 lorries employed for removing encroachments. He is required to supervise the work of the Supervisors below him. The genesis of this post is as follows. A post of the Deputy Chief Supervisor in the grade of Rs. 150-5-200 was created by Standing Committee Resolution No. 9315, dated the 8th December 1927. The designation was changed to "Senior Supervisor" under Standing Committee Resolution No. 11278, dated the 28th March 1934, and Corporation Resolution No. 23. dated the 23th April 1934. In 1935, it came to be reduced to Rs. $140-5-180$. The Superintendent of Licences, Shops \& Establishments recommends that this grade should be revised to Rs. 200-15-275 plus Rs. 50 Conveyance Allowance. He further suggests that he should be relieved of lorry work and a Conveyance Allowance should be attached to the post. I do not think that such an arrangement is at all necessary. His being in charge of a lorry is likely to make his supervision more effective. I do not
see the necessity of attaching a Conveyance Allowance to this post when he is placed in charge of a lorry. I, therefore, recommend that the existing arrangement should be continued, but the grade of the post should be revised to Rs. 180-10-250.
231. Supervisors.-Their function is to supervise squatter areas, Supervisorn, Encroach- known as Reserved Areas, in each Ward, ments. collect fees and remit the amount to the Head Ofice and to detect unauthorized hawkers and squatters and take action against them with the assistance of the Encroachment Removal lorries. Their grade was Rs. 80-5-125. In 1935, it was reduced to Rs. 80-4-120. The Superintendent of Licences, Shops \& Establishments recommends revision of the grade to Rs. 100-5-150 plus Rs. 15 Conveyance Allowance. I consider a grade of Rs. 80-5 150 to be adequate. The Conveyance Allowance to 7 Supervisors should be fixed at Rs. 15 each.
(c) Administration of the Shops and Establishments Act.
232. The Chief Inspector.-This post was created in 1940, on a Chief Inspector, Shops grade of Rs. 200-10-300, under Corporation * Establishments Resolution No. 355, dated the 11th July 1940. This Officer is in charge of the work in connection with the administration of the Shops \& Establishments Act subject to the general supervision, guidance and control of the Superintendent of Licences, Shops \& Establishments. He supervises the work of all the Inspectors under him and guides them in all routine matters of inspection of Registers and Musters in shops and establishments and of prosecution for breaches of the provisions of the Act. The Superintendent of Licences, Shops \& Establishments compares this post to that of the Chief Inspector of Factories, whose grade is Rs. $900-50-1,150$ plus Rs. 100 Conveyance Allowance. This comparison is misleading, as the jurisdiction of the Chief Inspector of Factories extends over the whole Province, while that of the Chief Inspector is limited to the City. He recommends a grade of Rs. $400-25$ - 700 plus Rs. 100 Conveyance Allowance. I consider a grade of Rs. 300-20-400 plus Rs. 50 Conveyance Allowance to be adequate.
233. Senior Inspectors.-Their duties are to supervise the work Senior Inapectors, Shops of Junior Inspectors, and to see that the \& Establishments provisions of the Act are complied with by personal visits to the establishmerts at any hour of the day and
night and to conduct prosecutions in the Court for breaches of the provisions. Their present grade is Rs. 150-5-200 plus Rs. 20 Conveyance Allowance. The Superintendent of Licences, Shops \& Establishments compares these posts to that of Senior Inspector of Factories, which analogy is again inappropriate. He recommends a grade of Rs. 200-15-300. plus Rs. 40 Conveyance Allowance. I consider a grade of Rs. $200-10-250$ plus Rs. 40 Conveyance Allowance to be adequate.
234. Junior Inspectors.-Their duties are the same as those of Junior Inspectors. Shops the Senior Inspectors (except supervision and Establishments. over Juniors) i.e. to detect offences against the Act by frequent visits and to institute and carry on prosecutions for infringements. Their present grade is Rs. 100-5-150 plus Rs. 20 Conveyance Allowance. The Superintendent of Licences, Shops \& Establishments recommends a grade of Rs. 140-10-190 plus Rs. 30 Conveyance Allowance. I consider a grade of Rs. 100-6-160 plus Rs. 30 Conveyance Allowance to be adequate.

Financial effect.
235. The financial effect of the proposals made in respect of this department is a net increase of of Rs. 36,360 per annum in the cost of Establishment and Rs, 7,575 per annum on Leave and Provident Fund.

## CHAPTER XXIV

## The Gardens Department.

236. The Victoria Gardens were originally laid out in 1861 and stocked with plants from the Agri-Horticul- . tural Society's Garden at Sewri. In 1873, they came into the possession of the Municipality. They contain ornamental ferneries, miniature lakes, and choice and rare species of tropical plants and trees. There is also a zoological collection of birds and rare animals. There are several other gardens, some of them having been taken over from the Ex-City Improvement Trust. These are located in different parts of the City and are in charge of the Superintendent of Cardens, who is assisted by an Assistant Superintendent and 2 Overseers. The total strength of the staff is 350 and the total cost of Establishment is Rs. $1,25,126$. p.a.
237. The Superintendent of Gardens.-This post was created in The Superintendent of the year 1886 and the salary was fixed at Gardens. $\quad$ Rs. 250 (vide Corporation Resolution No. 701 dated the 20th August 1886). In 1890-91, the salary was raised to Rs. 500. In the general revision of 1897-98, the post was graded at Rs. 250-25-450. By Corporation Resolution No. 6425, dated the 13th January 1916, the grade was further revised to Rs. 350-20-450. In 1922, this grade was improved to Rs. $500-50-700$ (vide Corporation Resolution No. 9631, dated the 30th January 1922). In the general revision of 1935 , the grade was fixed at Rs. $400-25-700$. The Superintendent of Gardens has to supervise not only the Victoria Gardens, but also 79 other garden sites, recreation grounds etc., spread over the City. He has besides to supervise Directed Playgrounds, Horticultural shows, etc. The Superintendent of Gardens suggests that the grade of the post should be revised to Rs. 660-40-900. I recommend that it be fixed at Rs. 600-40-800 plus Conveyance Allowance of Rs. 125.
238. The Assistant Superintendent of Gardens.-The Assistant

The Ascistant Superin. Superintendent is in charge of the Zoological tondent of Gardens. Section in the Victoria Gardens. The grade of the post was Rs. 250-20-400. In the general revision of 1935, it was reduced to Rs. 250-10-350. The Superintendent of Gardens suggests that it should be revised to Rs. 275-25-400. I recommend that it be fixed at Rs. 250-15-400.
239. Senior Overseer.-The duties of the Senior Overseer are to look after the Victoria Gardens. Senior Overseer. The grade of the post was Rs. 150-5-190. In the general revision of 1935, it was reduced to Rs. 140-5-180. The Superintendent of Gardens recommends that the grade should be revised to Rs. 160-10-260. I consider that a grade of Rs. 160 -8 -200 to be adequate. The designation of the post should be changed to " Overseer (Victoria Gardens)."
240. Junior Overseer.-The incumbent of this post has to look after gardens other than Victoria Gardens, Juniox Overseer. recreation grounds in the City numbering in all 79. This post was created in the year 1944-45 and the grade was fixed at Rs. 100-5-140 plus Rs. 40 Conveyance Allowance. The Superintendent of Gardens recommends that the designation should be changed to Overseer (Public Gardens), and the grade be fixed at Rs. 160-10-260 plus Rs. 40 Conveyance Allowance. I recommend that it be fixed at Rs. 160-8-200 plus Rs. 50 Conveyance Allowance and the designation changed to "Overseer (Public Cardens)."

## Financial effect.

241. The financial effect of the proposals made in respect Financial effect. of this Department is a net increase of Rs. 29,340 per annum in the cost ${ }^{\text {' }}$ of Establishment and of Rs. 6,112 per annum on Leave and Provident Fund.

## CHAPTER XXV.

## The Markets and Slaughter Houses.

242. There are 39 Markets in the City, out of which 17 are owned by the Municipality and 22 by private
Functions \& Strength. parties but licensed by the Municipality. Foodstuffs and meat kept for sale are examined by the Markets Department and unwholesome food and contraband meat are destroyed. The Municipality maintains the Bandra Slaughter House and the Pork Slaughter House at Arthur Road. There are besides two private slaughter houses, one licensed for slaughter by Zatka process for Sikhs at Arthur Road and the other for Military Authorities at Colaba. These Markets and Slaughter Houses are in charge of the "Superintendent", who is assisted by the "Senior Assistant to Superintendent" and the "Chief Inspector". The total strength of the staff is 369 and the cost of Establishment is Rs. 2,07,451 per annum.
243. The Superintendent of Markets-The post of the
"Superintendent" was created in 1871-72
The Superinte adent of and the grade was fixed at Rs. $400-500$. In Markets. 1885-86, the maximum was raised to. Rs. 600 . In the general revision of $1897-98$, the grade was revised to Rs. $400-25-600$ and an allowance of Rs. 50 was granted to the incumbent of the post for the work done by him in connection with Weights and Measures. In 1916-17, the post was regraded after amalgamating the allowance and the pay fixed at Rs. $500-30-650$. In 1922, the grade was further revised to Rs. 700-50-1,000 (vide Corporation Resolution No. 8253, dated the 14th December 1922). In the general revision of 1935 , the grade was revised to Rs. $660-40-900$. The Superintendent of Markets states that the grade is inadequate compared with the nature and volume of the work and suggests that it be revised to Rs. 750-50-1,000 plus Rs. 150 Conveyance allowance. I recommend that it be revised to Rs. $700-50-1,000$ plus Conveyance allowance of Rs. 150 .
(a) Markets.
244. The Chief Inspector.-The grade of the Chief Inspector was Rs.250-10-300 before 1935. In the general
The Chiof 1nspector. revision of that year, it was revised to Rs. 275-15-350 plus Rs. 40 Conveyance Allowance. The Superintendent of Markets suggests that it be revised to Rs. 300-20-400
plus Rs. 60 Conveyance Allowance. I recommend that the suggestion be accepted and the grade be fixed at Rs. $300-20-400$ plus Rs. 50 Conveyance Allowance, if a motor cycle is maintained ; otherwise the Conveyance Allowance should be Rs. 30.
245. Head Inspectors.-There are 4 Head Inspectors in the grade of Rs. 140-5-180. The Superintendent Head Inspectors. $\quad$ of Markets suggests that the grade should be revised to Rs. 200-10-250. I recommend that it be fixed at Rs. $160-8-200$ plus Rs. 25 Conveyance Allowance.
246. Meat Inspector.-The grade of the post was Rs. 150-5-225 before 1935. In the general revision of that year, it was reduced to Rs. 125-5-175. The Superintendent of Markets suggests that it be revised to Rs. 150-10-250. 1 recommend that it be fixed at Rs. 160-8-200 plus Rs. 25 Conveyance Allowance plus a further Conveyance Allowance of Rs. 25 for inspecting the meat supplied to the Military at Colaba.
247. Inspectors.-There are 4 Inspectors in the grade of Rs. $60.5-150$, and 34 in the grade of RRs. 55-4-115-5-140. The Superintendent of Markets suggests that their grade be fixed at Rs. 75-5-110-10-190. I recommend that it be fixed at Rs. 75.5-100-6-160.
248. Veferinary Inspector.-The grade of the post was Rs. 100 , Veterinary Inspector. 5-150, before 1935. In the general revision of that year, it was reduced to Rs. 80-4-120. The Superintendent of Markets points out that unless the grade of Inspectors is revised it would not be possible to attract veterinary graduates to these posts as there is a great demand for them in Government Service and suggests that the grade be revised to Rs. 125-5-200. I recommend that it be fixed at Rs. 100-6-160.

By Corporation Resolution No. 66, dated the 30th April 1945, the question of revising the grades of Inspectors and Head Inspectors in the Markets and Slaughter Houses Department and increasing their Conveyance Allowance has been referred to me. I have taken into consideration this Resolution while making my above recommendations.

[^19]be given a grade of Rs. 35 to 45 . The Superintendent of Markets proposes that their salary be raised to Rs. 28 per month. I recommend that they be given a grade of Rs. 25-1-35.
(b) Slaughter Houses.
250. Senior Assistant to Superintendent.-The grade of this post is Rs. $300-10-350$. The Superintendent

Seaior Accitant to Superintendent of Markets suggests that it should be fixed at Rs. 350-25-500. I agree and recommend that it be fixed at Rs. 350-25-500.
251. Clerk (Dawan).-A post of a Dawan clerk was created in the grade of Rs. $40-5-60$ in the year 1927-28, Dewan Clerk. $\quad$ for keeping a register of live animals in the yard of the Bandra Slaughter House each day (videStanding Committee's sanction of 21 st November 1926). In the general revision of 1935, the grade was revised to Rs. 40-4-60. The Superintendent of Markets states that the clerk is now entrusted with certain other duties in addition to the work mentioned above and that his work is more or less of a clerical nature. The incumbent of this post is recruited from amongst the candidates for Inspectorial appointments in the Markets Department. He, therefore, suggests that the grade be brought on par with that of Inspectors viz., Rs. 55-4-115-5--140. As he is not a full-fledged Inspector, I do not agree with the recommendation and suggest that the designation be changed to "Assistant Clerk" and his grade be fixed at Rs. 50-4-110.

Financial effect.
252. The financial effect of the proposals made in respect of this Department is a net increase of Rs. 44,064 per annum in the cost of Establishment and of Rs. 9,180 per annum on account of Leave and Provident Fund.

## CHAPTER XXVI

## The Municipal Printing Press.

253. The Municipal Printing Press, was started on 1st March 1935, as an experimental measure. It has progressed rapidly and is now one of the front Functions and Strength. rank presses in Bombay. The entire printing work of the Municipality is carried out in this Press. The Press is in charge of a Superintendent under the supervision of the Test Audit Officer, in consideration of which a sum of Rs. 2000 out of the latter's salary is annually charged to the Printing Press. He has to devote considerable time to this work. The Superintendent is assisted by a Deputy Superintendent and an Assistant Superintendent. The total strength of the Municipal Printing Press is 131 and the cost of the Establishment is Rs. $1,10,220$ per annum.
254. Superintendent-The Press was originally in charge of a Manager, whose grade was Rs. 100-5-125 plus Rs. 10 Conveyance Allowance (vide Standing Committee Resolution No. 585, dated the 3rd September 1934). A new post of Superintendent in the grade of Rs. 200-10-300 plus Rs. 10 Conveyance Allowance was created under Corporation Resolution No. 1107, dated the 24th March 1938. The Test Audit Officer suggests that the grade should be further revised to Rs. 300-20-400. Having regard to the fact that the work of the Superintendent has enormously increased, I recommend that his grade be fixed at Rs. $300-20-400$ plus Rs. 10 Conveyance Allowance as suggested by the Test Audit Officer.
255. Deputy Superintendent.-In 1940-41 Budget, the post of a
"Deputy Superintendent" was created on
Rs. 150-5-200 (vide Standing Committee Resolution No. 1120, dated the 27th November 1939). The Test Audit Officer suggests that the grade be revised to Rs.200-10.250. I agree with him and recommend that the grade be fixed at Rs. 200-10-250.
256. Assistant Superintendent-The post of the Manager was Assitant Superinten. converted into that of " Assistant Superintendent. dent ", the grade of Rs. 100-5-125 remaining unchanged (vide Standing Committee Resolution No. 1693, dated the 30th March 1938). The Test Audit Officer suggests that the
grade be revised to Rs. 160-8-200. I recommend that it be fixed at Rs. 160-8-200.
257. Clerks, Proof-Readers, etc.-There are 3 clerks in the grade of Rs. 55-4-115 in the Press. As Clerks. Proof Remders all of them are qualified, I recommend that their. grade be fixed at Rs. $60-5100-6-160$. There are at present four proof readers in the grade of Rs. 55-4-115: The Test Audit Officer proposes the conversion of these posts into (I) one post of Head Proof Reader in the grade of Rs. 120-5-160, (2) two posts of Senior Proof Readers in the grade of Rs. 65-5-120 and (3) one post of Estimator in the grade of Rs. 65-5-120. Having regard to the nature of the work done by these persons, I agree to the change in the designations proposed by the Test Audit Officer and recommend grades of (1) Rs. 120-5-160, (2) and (3) Rs. 65-5-120, respectively. There are also 8 posts of proof-readers in the grade of Rs: 55-3-85, 4 posts of Assistant clerks in the grade of Rs. 45-3-80 and 6 posts of copyholders in the grade of Rs. 35-1-45. The Test Audit Officer bas proposed a re-allocation of these 18 posts as under:-

7 posts of Junior Proof Readers in the grade of Rs. 50-4-1 10 .
7 posts of Assistant Clerks, and 4 posts of Copy Holders in the grade of Rs. 40-2-60.

He has not proposed a revised grade for the Assistant Clerks. 1 agree to the re-allocation of posts and recommend a grade of Rs. 50-4-110 for Junior Proof Readers, a grade of Rs. 50-4-110 for Assistant Clerks, as recently sanctioned by Standing Committee Resolution No. 214, dated the 21st May 1945, for similar posts in the Municipal Secretary's Office, and a grade of Rs. 40-2.60 for Copy-holders.
258. Press Workers:-The workers in the Municipal Printing Press were originally engaged on daily wages and were classed as temporary. They were made permanent under Standing Committee Resolution No. 1916, dated the 26th February 1941, and allowed a graded scale of pay under Standing Committee Resolution No. 1150, dated the IIth November 1942. As, however, the workers were
not satisfied with the grades, the grades were kept in abeyance and a fixed pay was sanctioned, until the cessation of hostilities and one year thereafter (vide Standing Committee Resolution No. 241, dated the 22nd May 1944). In view of the general revision of all the grades in the Municipality, the Test Audit Officer proposes a revision of the grades of these workers also. I have carefully gone through the grades proposed and have made my recommendations in Appendix C under the heading "Printing Press. "

Financial effect.
259. The financial effect of the proposals made in respect of Financial effect. this Department is a net increase of Rinancal efect. Rs. 19,032 per annum in the cost of Esta-. blishment and of Rs. 3,965 per annum on Leave and Provident Fund.

## CHAPTER XXVII

## The City Improvement Schemes Department.

260. By Bombay Act XIII of 1933, the City Improvement Trust was amalgamated with the Municipality. Since
Functiont and Strength. then, the work has been entrusted to a separate Department under the Deputy Municipal Commissioner (Improvements), who has been assisted by the Estate Agent and Land Manager. The work of this department comprises formulation of improvement, development and special road schemes, disposal of land by sale or lease, collection of rents and compensation for occupation of Municipal, ex-Trust lands and buildings and rights in connection with land etc., and any other work incidental thereto.
261. The Depity-Municipal Commissioner (Improvements),The Depaty Municipal This post was created by Section 58(a) Commintioner (Improve- of the Municipal Act as amended by Bombay ments). Act XIII of 1933. The holder of this post, who was originally the Chief Officer of the Bombay Improvement Trust, was receiving a salary of Rs. 2500 until he was appointed as Deputy Commissioner (Improvements). The grade of this post under the Amending Act was fixed at Rs. $1,200-1,500$, but it was provided that if the Chief Officer of the Trust was appointed as Deputy Municipal Commissioner (Improvements), he should receive "such monthly salary not exceeding Rs. 2,000 as the Corporation shall from time to time determine." Mr. H. B. Shivdasani, who was the Chief Officer, was appointed as Deputy Commissioner on Rs. 1,750 per month with effect from 1st October 1933, by Corporation Resolution No. 10641, dated the 9 th March 1934. His salary was raised to Rs. 2,000 with with effect from 1st April 1935 by Corporation Resolution No. 420, dated the 16th September 1935. Mr. Shivdasani is due to retire on lst September 1946 and the Corporation will have to appoint his successor in the grade of Rs. 1,200-1,500 as laid down in the Municipal Act. I have suggested the revision of the grade of the Deputy Municipal Commissioner (Municipal) to Rs. 1,500-75-1,800. I recommend that the grade of this post be also revised to Rs. $1,500-$ 75-1,800. This will, however, require an amendment of section 58 (a) of the Municipal Act.
262. The Estate Agent and Land Manager.-This officer is enThe Estate Agent and trusted with the work of management and disLand Manager. posal of the Municipal and ex-Trust estates, including vacant lands, acquired buildings, housing accommodation, recovery of revenue by way of sale proceeds, premia, commutation, rent compensation etc., from Municipal and ex-Trust buildings, vacant lands and land rights, framing Improvement and Development schemes and ácquisition of properties in connection therewith. The post was created in 1933, on the amalgamation of the City Improvement Trust with, the Municipality and the grade was fixed at Rs. 700-40-900 (vide Corporation Resolution Nc. 6990, dated the 13th November 1933). In the revision of 1935, the grade was revised to Rs. $660-40-900$ (vide Corporation Resolution No. 18, dated the 1 th April 1935). The Deputy Commissioner (Improvements) is of opinion that the work of this Officer can be fairly compared with that of the Assessor and Collector and that therefore his salary should be the same as that of the Assessor and Collector. The Estate Agent suggests that the salary of the grade should be Rs. $1,150-75-1,400$. I agree with the view of the Deputy Commissioner, but it appears to me that when the Corporation fixed a lower grade for this post than the one in existence in the lmprove-ment Trust, they did so having regard to the fact that this Offirer would not be solely responsible for the administration of the department, especially as a separate Deputy Commissioner (Improveo ements) had been appointed exclusively to supervise the administration of this department. I have suggested elsewhere that the Deputy Commissioner (Improvements) should be given the supervision of some other departments as well. Mr. Shivdasani with whom I discussed this question is, however, of opinion that the present arrangement should continue, in the interest of efficiency. So long as the Deputy Municipal Commissioner (Improvements). continues to be in sole charge of this department, it will not be necessary to raise the grade of the Estate Agent and Land Manager to the level of that of the Assessor and Collector. : I, therefore, recommend that the grade be fixed at Rs. $1,000-50-1,200$.

## 263. The Deputy Estate Agent and Land Manager. -This Officer

 assists the Estate Agent and Land Manager The Deputy Estate assists he ment. His grade was Rs. $400-40-800$ prior to the revision of 1935. In that year, it was fixed at Rs. 500 -25-750 (vide Corporation Resolution Na. 189, dated the 11th April1935). The Estate Agent and Land Manager suggests that the grade be revised to Rs. $800-50-1,100$. I recommend that it be fixed at Rs. 700-50-1,000.
264. Assistant Estate Agents (Senior) and Assistant Estate Agents (Jumior).-These officers are in
Asuistant Estate Agents Senior and Jumior. charge of divisions. The grade of the Senior Assistant Estate Agent was Rs. $350-30-650$ prior to the revision of 1935, when it was fixed at Rs. 350-25-600, (vide Corporation Resolution No. 18, dated the 1lth April 1935). The Estate Agent suggests that the grade be revised to Rs. $600-40-800$. I recommend that it be revised to Rs. 450-25-700. The grade of the Junior Assistant Estate Agents was Rs. 200-25-500 before the 1935 revision, when it was reduced to Rs. 200-20-400. The Estate Agent suggests that it be revised to Rs. 350-25-600. I recommend that it be fixed at Rs. 275-25-450.
265. Inspectors-Before 1935, the grade of these posts

Inopectorf. was Rs. 150-10-250-10-300 for B.E.s and Rs. 150-10-250 for Non-B.E.s In the revision of 1935, the grade was revised to Rs. 150-10-250 for B.E.s and Rs. $140-8-220$ for Non-B.E.s. The Bombay Municipal Officials' Association suggest that the grade be fixed at Rs. 200-15-350, and the differentiation between B.E.s and Non-B.E.s be done away with. The Estate Agent suggests that the grade of these Inspectors be revised to Rs. 180-10-250. I recommend that it be fixed at .Rs. 180-10-270, for B.E.s and Rs. 160-10-250 for Non-B.E.s.
266. Sub-Overseer--Prior to the revision of 1935 , the grade of these Sub-overseers was Rs. $60-5$-150. In the revision of that year it was reduced to Rs. 55 -4-115-5-140 for new entrants. The grade was revised again to Rs. 55-5-100-10-150 (vide Standing Committee Resolution No. 635, dated the llth August 1943). 7 Sub-overseers are in the grade of Rs. 60-5-150 (old grade) and 9 in the revised grade of Rs. 55-5-100-10-150. - The Estate Agent suggests that the grade of all the Sub-overseers be fixed at Rs. $70-5 \cdot 100-10-170$ with a start of Rs. 80 for Diploma Holders. The Bombay Municipal Officials' Association have suggested that the grade should be revised to Rs. $90-5-100-10-180-10-250$ with a start of Rs. 105 for qualified Suboverseers and that the designation of the "Sub-overseer" should be:
changed into "Overseer." I recommend that the grade be fixed at Rs. 75-5-110-10-160, the Diploma holders being given a start of Rs. 85 , and that the designation be changed to "Overseer."

## 267. Chawl "Superintendents-These persons are responsible

 for the collection of rent and supervision Chawl Superintendents. of sanitary conditions of the Trust Chawls. Prior to the revision of 1935, the grade was Rs. $90-5-150$ for the then existing staff and Rs. $60-5-90$ for new entrants with benefit of commission and bonus. In the case of certain Rent Collectors, who were subsequently appointed as Chawl Superintendents, the grade of Rs. $60-5-90$ was revised to Rs. 60-5-120 without the benefit of commission or bonus. In the revision of 1935, the grades of Rs. $90-5-150$ and Rs. 60-5-120 were revised to Rs. 55-4-115-5-140 and Rs. 60-3-90 respectively. The Estate Agent recommends that those who are at present in the grade of Rs. $90.5-150$ should be placed in a grade of Rs. 90.5 -100-10.170 and the others in a grade of Rs. 70-5-120 with the benefit of commission and bonus. I recommend that the grades be fixed at Rs. $90-5-100-6 \times 160$ and Rs. $70-5-120$ respectively with the benefit of commission and bonus.268. Rent Collector-The work of these employees is to collect rents from the tenants in the acquired properties, semi-permanent sheds etc. Prior to the revision of 1935, the grades of the Rent Collectors were Rs. 60-5.120 for Trust employees in service prior to 14th October 1930 and Rs. $60-5-90$ for those appointed after 14th October 1930 plus commission and bonus. In the revision of 1935, the grades of Rs. $60-5-120$ and Rs. $60-5-90$ were revised to Rs. $60-3-90$ (vide Corporation Resolution No. 18, dated the 11th April 1935). At present, there are 4 Rent Collectors in the grade of Rs. 60-5-120, 3 in the grade of Rs. $60-5-90$ and 15 in the grade of Rs. $60-3-90$. The Estate Agent suggests that a grade of Rs. 70-5-120 with the benefit of commission and bonus be fixed for all the Rent Collectors. I agree with him and recommend that the grade should be fixed at Rs. 70.5 . 120 with the benefit of commission and bonus.
269. Accountant. -The Accountant is responsible for maintaining the accounts of rents and other revenue

## Accountant.

 of the department. The grade of the post, prior to the revision of 1935, was Rs. 250-20-350. In 1935, the grade was revised to Rs. 250-10-350. It was again revised toRs. $300-20-400$, with effect from 13th February 1945 (vide Corporation Resolution No. I101, dated the 12th February 1945). The Estate Agent recommends that it should be further revised to Rs. +00-25-600. I recommend that it should be fixed at Rs. 350-20-450.
270. Legal Officer, Lease Branch.-A post of Superintendent Superintendent, Lease was created by Corporation Resolution No. Branch. 16. dated the 23rd April 1936, on Rs. $275-$ $15-350$ after abolishing the post of Chief Clerk. The Estate Agent suggests that it be graded at Rs. 400-25-600. I recommend that the post be graded like that of the Accountant at Rs. 350-20-450.

As the nature of the work requires that the holder of the post should possess legal knowledge 1 recommend that the designation be changed into "Legal Officer."
271. Clerks, Head Clerks and Chief Clerks.-As these are Clerks, Heed Clerks common to all the departments of the and Chief Clerks. Municipality. I have dealt with them in a separate Chapter.

## Financial effect.

272. The financial effect of the proposals made in respect Financialeffect. of this department is a net increase of Rs. 77,220 per annum in the cost of Establishment and of Rs. 16,088 per annum on Leave and Provident Fund.

## CHAPTER XXVIII

## Clerks, Head Clerks, Chief Clerks, and Office Superintendents.

273. These posts are more orless common to all the departStrength and Ratio. Thents and call for common treatment. Strength and Ratio. Thents and call for common treatment. pyramid with the Head Clerk, the Chief Clerk and the Office Superintendent coming on top in order of promotion. Except for technical or specialised posts, recruitment to a Junior Officer's post is made from this source. There are 1071 Clerks, 110 Head Clerks, 26 Chief Clerks and 8 Office Superintendents in Municipal service. The ratio of superior posts to clerical posts in the subordinate service is thus 1:7.4. This position detracts from the attractiveness, which Municipal service is expected to possess. During the last 5 years, a large number of clerks is reported to have left Municipal service for better pay, promotion and prospects elsewhere.
274. The history of the clerical grade is long and eventful. History of the Clerical Prior to 1905, there were clerks on fixed grade.
(non-incremental) salaries varying from Rs. 15 to Rs. 24-8-0 per month. In that year, the Standing Committee appointed a Sub-Committee to consider what minimum salary should be fixed for clerical appointments (vide Standing Committee Resolution No. 4278, dated the 13th December 1905). The Sub-Committee reported that, looking to the conditions then prevailing, the minimum salary of clerks in Municipal service should be fixed at Rs. 25 per month. This recommendation was approved by the Standing Committee under their Resolution No.6168, dated the 26th March 1906. In 1907, a grade of Rs. 25-3-40 was sanctioned for these posts (vide Standing Committee Resolution No. 4967, dated the 13th November 1907, and Corporation Resolution No. 5470, dated the 2nd December 1907). This grade was revised to Rs. 30-3-45, by amalgamating the local allowance of Rs. 5 attached to the old grade, subject to the proviso that if any clerk received no increase in salary for three years after reaching the maximum of the grade, namelyRs. 45 , he should, unless considered unfit for promotion, be given a personal allowance of Rs. 5 per month until promoted to a higher appointment, and that in cases in which the personal allowance was drawn for 5 years, it might at the end of that period
be consolidated with the salary so as to count for pension. (Vide Standing Committee Resolution No. 5553, dated the 3rd December 1915, and Corporation Resolution No. 6423, dated the 13th January 1916). By Standing Committee Resolution No. 7177, dated the 7th February 1918, the minimum salary of these posts was fixed at Rs. 30 per month with effect from Ist October 1915 and the grade was revised to Rs. 30-3-45-5/2-50. (See also Corporation Resolution No. 8046, dated the 7th March 1918). In 1917, on account of the rise in prices, as a result of the Great War, a war allowance of Rs. 10 was sanctioned by Standing Committee Resolution No. 4994, dated the 7th November 1917, and Corporation Resolution No. 5686, dated the 6th December 1917. This allowance was later increased to Rs. 20 and Rs. 25 as the case may be by Standing Committee Resolution No. 4607, dated the 9th Oetober 1918, and Corporation Resolution No. 6189, dated the 9th December 1918. The clerical grade was further revised to Rs. 40-5-125 with effect from Ist April 1920, by Standing Committee Resolution No. 13342, dated the 20th February 1920, and Corporation Resolution No. 14104, dated the Ith March 1920, and Standing Committee Resolution No. 5078, dated the 24th August 1920, the rate of war allowance being reduced to Rs. 10 per month and the excess over Rs. 10 being merged in the pay of the revised grade. This step was merely emergent and tentative; for about the same time the Corporation under their Resolution No. 4681, dated the 13th August 1920, appointed a Committee to consider the question of further revising the pay. This Committee reported that the clerical grade should be fixed at Rs. $60-5-150$ with Efficiency Bar at Rs. 80 and 110. The report of the Committee was forwarded to the Standing Committee under Corporation Resolution No. 9845, dated the 6th February 1922. The Standing Committee under their Resolution No. 10083, dated the 15th February 1922, forwarded the report to the Commissioner for submitting a revised schedule. The Municipal Secretary was also requested to submit proposals with regard to his staff. The latter suggested that the clerical grade should be revised to Rs. $60-5-150$ with E.B. at Rs. 80 and Rs. 110. graduates and those specially qualified being started on Rs. 90 and that of the Senior Clerks to Rs. 150-5-190. This proposal was approved by Standing Committee Resolution No. 112\%, dated the 29th March 1922, and was given effect to from Ist January 1922. The grades recommended by the Commissioner were similar to those approved by the Standing Committee for the Municipal

Secretary's Office, except that those in the grade of Rs. 150-5-190 were designated as "Head Clerks" instead of as "Senior Clerks". These proposals were approved by Corporation Resolution No. 6333, dated the 17th October 1922. The revised grades were brought into effect from 1st April 1922, and the clerical staff was given an increase of Rs. 10 per month over the previous emoluments exclusive of the increments falling due on 1st April 1922. This was approved by Corporation Resolution No. 7019, dated the 9th November 1922. The grade of the Marking Clerks was retained at Rs. 50-5-80 and that of Ward Clerks and Rat Destruction Clerks was retained at Rs. $60-5-100$. The grade of Rs. $60-5-100$ for Ward Office Clerks was revised to Rs. 60-5-150 from lst April 1930 (Vide Standing Committee Resolution No. 901, dated the 6th November 1929). The clerical grade of Rs. $60-5-150$ was reduced to Rs. $55-4$ -115-5-140 and the starting salaries for Honours Graduates and Pass Graduates were fixed at Rs. 75 and Rs. 65, respectively (vide Standing Committee Resolution No. 10763, dated the 17th February 1932).
275. It would be of interest to see how far this grade
 compares with the salaries of clerks generally in the City. Prof. Ghurye of the University School of Economics and Sociology conducted an inquiry into the subject in 1936-37. In his monograph* he observes that on an average the Clerk started with a monthly salary of Rs. 40.8 and earned at the time of his inquiry Rs. 76.7 per month; that the highest : average salary of a clerk at the start was Rs. $55.8 \mathrm{\dagger}$ and the lowest was Rs. 32.8, the former being an employee of the Government of Bombay and the latter of the Railways ; that in regard to the average annual increment, the Clerks ranked in the descending order according to employers as follows:-

Government of India, Public Utility concerns, Bombay Municipality, the Port Trust, Non-Indian Commercial and Industrial concerns, Banks, Insurance companies, Railways, Indian Commercial concerns, Government of Bombay, Solicitors' firms and lastly, Textile mills; that as regards regular grades (time-scale), while there were grades in the Government and semi-Government bodies like the Municipality and the Port Trust, there were no such

[^20]grades in the Textile mills, Solicitors' firms, some of the Banks, non-Indian commercial firms, Indian commercial concerns and Insurance companies; that on the whole clerks serving not with Government, semi-Government bodies, Railways and Public Utility concerns, cannot look forward to regular promotions and that whatever promotions they got they must have got irregularly both as regards time as well as the amount. Dr. Ghurye then goes on to deal with three types of cases revealed in his inquiry, namely, dark, average and bright. In the first category, he mentions cases of small starts and slow promotions, e.g., a Clerk starting on Rs. 20 and reaching Rs. 100 in thirty years time ; in the second category, he deals with cases of reasonable starts and average promotions, e.g., a Clerk starting on Rs. 70 and reaching Rs. 140 in seventeen years' time ; in the third category, he deals with cases of fairly rapid promotions, e.g., a Clerk starting on Rs. 55 and reaching Rs. 335 in twenty-two years' time. As regards the average hours of work per day, Dr. Ghurye says that his survey discloses an average of 7.86 hours per day; as regards leave, he says, employees in private concerns are not at all as well provided as Government employees.


#### Abstract

276. From this brief survey, made by Prof. Churye, it would Changes in their condi- appear that the clerks in the Bombay Munici- tions as a result of the pality are better off than their confreres in Lions as a result of the War. private service. These conditions have since changed on account of the War, which has made a great demand on industries, which consequently are obliged to develop and absorb a large number of persons on fairly attractive pay and such perquisites as bonuses, overtimes etc. The conditions of Municipal service have, however, remained static, but for the grant of a Dearness allowance to partially off-set the rise in the cost of living. This has given the clerks in Municipal service a sense of grievance. The Bombay Municipal Officials' Association have represented to me that the grade of the clerks should be revised to Rs. 100-200. In this representation, they have drawn up a farnily budget. for a husband, wife and 3 children, of Rs. 150, per month. Normally, a new entrant is not married. He thinks of marriage only after a year or two of his service, and by the time the size of the family grows upto the dimensions noted above, it may be about 10 to 12 years since he joined the service. He may then be drawing near about the figure of family expenditure quoted by the Association. The Associations' estimate of family expenditure is framed on existing prices, which are not likely to continue at the present level after 15 years, although they may not


reach absolute normal. The grades at present prevailing in Government areRs. 50-3-95 and Rs. 100-5-160, in Port Trust Rs. 60-3-90 and Rs. 60-5-150, in the B. E. S. \& T. Company Rs. 85-5-110 and Rs. $50-5-80$, in the Railways Rs. $30-4-50-580$, in the Reserve Bank of India, Rs. 50-3-95-E.B.-3-125 (Routine Clerks; Clerks/Note Examiners) and in the University of Bombay, Rs. 75-5-115-(E.B.)-5-160 for graduates and Rs. 50-5-115. (E.B.) $5-160$ for non-graduates. It is understood that some of these

Clerical grades in othex bodies have been contemplating revision of public bodies and the grade grades of their staff. The Heads of Departpal clerks. ments have suggested varying grades e.g. Rs. $\quad 60-5-160$, Rs. $60-5-100-6-175$, Rs. $60-5-100-6-180$, Rs. 65-7-191, 70-5-90-8-170, Rs. 75-5-100-10-150, Rs. 75-5 120-10-180, Rs. $75-5-100-10-190$, Rs. $80-180$, Rs. $80-5$ 140-8-180. One officer has suggested the splitting up of the grade into two-junior and senior-the scales being fixed at Rs. $60-5-125$ for junior clerks and Rs. 130-8-170 for senior clerks. Having regard to all these considerations, I think the equities of the case would be met by revising the grade to Rs. $60-5-100-6-160$, Pass graduates starting on Rs. 75. Honours graduates and Stenographers on Rs. 80 and Double graduates on Rs. 85.

## 277. Head clerks.-These posts were originally designated as Head Clerks. Senior clerks and their grade was fixed at

 Rs. 100-5-125. In 1919-20, the Commissioner proposed a revision of the grade to Rs. 125-5-175 and re-designation of the posts as Head clerks as -in the Improvement Trust. The proposal was approved by Standing Committee Resolution No. 13342, dated the 20th February 1920, and Corporation Resolution No. 14104, dated the 11th Maxch 1920. The grade was revised to Rs. $150-5-190$ by Standing Committee Resolution No.6333, dated the 17th October 1922, and Corporation Resolution No. 7019 , dated the 9 th November 1922. The grade was further revised to Rs. $140-5-180$ by Standing Committee Resolution No. 879, dated the 28th November 1934, and Corporation Resolution No. 819, dated the 4th March 1935. The position of Head clerks is one of responsibility. Clerks attain to these posts after a fairly long service and experience and after passing a qualifying examination. In minor departments, they hold a pivotal position. The Head clerk's grade in the Port Trust is Rs. 150-5.190. In Government it is Rs. 100-5-120-10-220, and in the Railways Rs. 160-10-200. The Municipal Officials' Association havesuggested a grade of 225-10-275. The Heads of Departments have suggested varying grades, namely, Rs. 150-10-200, Rs. 170-7-240, Rs. $180-10-250$, Rs. $170-10-250$, Rs. $175-10-225$, Rs. $180-10-220$, Rs. 180-10-240, Rs. 200-10-250. I consider that the grade of these posts should be revised to Rs. 160-8-200.
278. Chief Clerks.-These posts were originally known as Head clerks on a grade of Rs. 200-10-250. In 1919-20, their designation was changed into Chief Clerks, borrowing a terminology from the City Improvement Trust. The grade of the post was retained at Rs. 200-10-250 (vide S. C. R. No. 13342 of 20-2-1920 and C. R. No. 14104 of 11-3-1920). The grade underwent a change to Rs. 200-10-275 (vide S. C. R. No. 6333 of 17-10-1922 and C. R. No. 7019 of 9-11-1922). It was again modified to Rs. 180-10-240 (vide S. C. R. No. 879 of 28-11-1934 and C. R. No. 819 of 4-3-1935). In the major, departments, they hold quite a responsible position and are charged with the work of putting up drafts, notes and maintaining accounts. The grade of the Chief Clerks in the Port Trust is Rs. 200-10-270, in Covernment Rs. $180-10-200-15-260$, and in Railways Rs. 325. The Municipal Officials' Association have suggested a grade of Rs. 300-15-400. The Heads of Departments have suggested varying grades, namely, Rs. 225-15-330, Rs. 240-15-315, Rs. 250-10-300, Rs. $250-15-340$ and Rs. $300-10-400$. I am of opinion that the grade of these posts should be revised to Rs. 200-10-300.
279. Office Superintendents.-The first post in this grade was created in the Municipal Secretary's office on Rs. 300-20-400 (vide S. C. R. No. 11296 of 29-3-1922) Similar posts in some of the departments under the Municipal Commissioner were created with effect from Ist April 1924 with the object of improving supervision and efficiency (vide C. R. No. 12521 of 27-3-1924). The grade was revised to Rs. 275-15-350 by S. C. R. No. 879 of 28-11-1934 and C.R.No. 819 of 4-3-1935. The grade of the Office Superintendents in Covernment is Rs. 280-20-460. The Municipal Officials' Association have suggested a grade of Rs. $400-20-500$. The Heads of Departments have suggested varying grades namely, Rs. 275-15-300, Rs. 300-20-400, Rs. 350-20-450, and Rs. 400-25-600. The Office Superintendent's past forms normally the summit of an average clerk's ambition, but only very few reach this height. I think the grade of this post should be revised to Rs. 300-20-400.
280. I have noted at the beginning of this Chapter that the percentage of higher posts to clerical Ratio of higher grades posts is low. It has made the Municipal
to be increased. service to the intelligent and ambitious far from attractive. This position has also militated against efficiency. The question of increasing the ratio of higher posts was discussed by the Board of Examinors. They recommended that the proportion of Head Clerks to clerks in every department should be at least 1 to 7 , and that each important section or branch should be in charge of a Chief Clerk and each important department should be in charge of an Office Superintendent. I agree with this recommendation and recommend that the higher posts in the subordinate service should be increased as under:-

1 Head clerk for 7 clerks,
1 Chief clerk for 3 Head clerks or for each important Section or Branch containing one or more Head clerks.
1 Office Superintendent for each important Department.

## Financial effect.

281. The financial effect of the proposals made by me in this Financial effect. Chapter is shown under each department in which these posts exist. The cost of additional staff proposed in para 280 comes to about Rs. 2,31,444 including Provident Fund and Leave charges amounting to Rs. 39,904.

## CHAPTER XXIX

## Peons, Naiks, Havaldars and Jamadars.

282. These posts being more or less common to all the departments have been treated here in a separate Chapter. The total number of peons is 724 , of Naiks 18, of Havaldars 28 and of Jamadars 3.

The Corporation by their Resolution No. 76, dated the 3rd May 1945, have referred to me for consideration and report the question of revising the pay, grades, etc., of Peons,, Havaldars, etc., I have given due consideration to the question in making the following recommendations.

## (a) Peons.

283. The peon is an "errand boy" of the Administration. His duties range from doing odd jobs in office or waiting upon the Officer to delivering of despatch or accompanying his Officer during his out-door inspection. He is a handy man. The Naik, the Havaldar and the Jamadar rank above him in order of seniority. By Standing Committee Resolution No. 5103, dated the 14th November 1906, his minimum pay was fixed at Rs. 11 per month with effect from Ist April 1907. In 1911, the peons were paid a salary at the rates of Rs. 11, Rs. 12, and Rs. 13 (vide Municipal Commissioner's letter No. 5313, dated the 5th June 1911, underlying Standing Committee Resolution No. 1342, dated the 7th June 1911). In 1912-13, the peons were paid a salary of Rs. 12-8-0, Rs. 13. Rs. 14 and Rs. 15. In 1917, the salary at the rates of Rs. $12-8-0$ and Rs. 13 was revised to Rs. $13-8$ (vide Standing Committee Resolution No.6106, dated the 27th December 1917). These salaries were further revised from Rs. 13-8-0 and Rs. 14 to Rs. 15 , from Rs. 15 to Rs. 16 , and from Rs. 16 to Rs. 17 with effect from Ist June 1918, (vide Standing Committee Resolution No. 1741, dated the 12th June 1918). Their salary was further revised and graded into Rs. 16-1/5-18 plus Rs. 4 House Rent plus Rs. 3 Extraordinary allowance with effect from 1st August 1920, (vide Standing Committee Resolution No. 6133, dated the 20th September 1920). This grade was again revised to Rs. 19-1/5-21 by Standing Committee Resolution No. 5606, dated the 25th August 1926, and further revised to Rs. 19-1/3-21 (vide Standing Committee Resolution No. 6798, dated the 30th October 1929). In 1938.
consequent upon the decision of the Corporation to fix the minimum salary of all male employees at not less than Rs. 25 , the salary of the peons was fixed at Rs. 25 (vide Standing Committee Resolution No. 1373, dated the 26th January 1938). It must be noted that this salary is exclusive of various allowances and perquisites.
284. The aggregate emoluments in the case of peons work Total Emoluments of out as follows :a peon.

|  | Peons staying in rent free quarters. Rs. a. p: | Peons staying outside. <br> Rs. a. p. |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Pay | 250 | 2500 |
| Dearness Allowance | 2200 | 2200 |
| Money value of rent free quarters | 800 |  |
| House Rent ... |  | 600 |
| Money value of Railway Pass | 140 |  |
| Money value of Uniform, and Umbrella | 1100 | 1100 |
| Washing charges at As 8. per month | 080 | 080 |
| Total | 5860 | 55. 20 |

285. It is reported that the average wage of a Mill-hand in Peon's wages compa Bombay is Rs. 32-8-0, which is exclusive of xed with those of Mill Dearness allowance. The latter varies Operatives. according to the cost of Living Index and is reported to have been fixed for June 1945 at Rs. 30-13m. The minimum emoluments of a Municipal peon staying outside come to Rs. 33-2-0 exclusive of Dearness allowance. It is true that the Mill operatives get a Bonus equivalent to 2 months' salary. As against this, the Municipal Peon gets his Provident Fund contribution, which is equivalent to a month's salary and his service and working conditions are better. The number of hours put in by a Peon is 8 as against 9 by the Mill operative. The Municipal peon enjoys all Bank holidays, while the Mill opeartive does not get any. Old Municipal Peons get 1 month's. leave on full pay and new peons get 15 days' leave on full pay at the end of 11 months' service and 20 days casual leave in a year, while the Mill-hand does not get any leave
with pay, but the Factories Act has just been amended so as to allow 10 days' leave with pay, with effect from 1st January 1946. The Municipal peon is, however, discontented because he suffers from stagnation as the pay is fixed and not graded. Such stagnation militates against interest and efficiency in work. Heads of departments have proposed various grades for peons viz., Rs. $25-$ 1/2-30, Rs. 25-1-30, Rs. 28, Rs. 28-1-33, Rs. 30-1-35, Rs. 30-1-40, Rs. 30-2-50, Rs. 35-1-40. The University of Bombay has recently sanctioned a scale of Rs. 25-1-40; The scale for peons in the Reserve Bank of India is Rs. $24-\frac{1}{2}-30$. The Bombay Municipal Peons' Union ask for a grade of Rs. 35-1-50. I recommend that the pay should be graded at Rs. 25-1-35. Further I suggest that the present ratio of higher posts to which the Peons can aspire should be increased by creating more posts of Havaldars so that there may be 1 Havaldar for every 12 posts of peons.
(b) Naiks.

286 The Naik is in fact a Head Peon. His post is intended to
Naiks.
be between that of the peon and the Havaldar. In certain departments he virtually performs the duties of a Havaldar. His original grade was Rs. $18-1 / 5-20$. It was subsequently revised to Rs. 21-1/5-23 by Standing Committee Resolution No. 5606, dated the 25th August 1926. The grade was further revised to Rs. 21-1/3-23 by Standing Committee Resolution No. 6798, dated the 30th October 1929. In 1938, when the pay of the Peon was fixed at Rs. 25 , the Naik's grade was fixed at Rs. 25-1/327 by Standing Committee Resolution No. 956, dated the 15th November 1938. [ In view of the fact that I have suggested a grade of Rs. 25-1-35 for Peons, I suggest that the posts of Naiks be abolished and their posts be replaced by those of Havaldars, for whom I have suggested a grade of Rs. 35-1-40.]
(c) Havaldars.

287 [The Havaldar is usually the person in attendance on the
Havaldars. Head of the Department. He is required to be fairly intelligent? The grade of the Havaldar in the Municipal Commissioner's office, the City Engineer's Office, the Municipal Secretary's Office, and the Schools Committee's Office has been different from the grade of Havaldars in other departments, the former being treated more favourably than the latter. There is no reason why this should be so. In 1901, the grade of the Havaldar in the Municipal Commissioner's office was Rs. 14-1-16 and that of the Havaldar in all the other departments Rs. 13-1-15. In

1906-07, these grades were revised to Rs. 16-1-18 and Rs. 15-1-17 respectively. In 1912-13, the grades were further revised to Rs. 19-1-22 and Rs. 18-1-20 respectively. By Standing Committee Resolution No. 10958, dated the 17th December 1919, the grade of the Havaldars in the Municipal Commissioner's and the Municipal Secretary's Offices was revised to Rs. 23-1/5-25, and that of Havaldars in all other departments to Rs. 21-1/5-23. By Standing Committee Resolution No. 14674, dated the 24th March 1920, an extra allowance of Rs. 3 was granted to the Havaldar of the Municipal Secretary's Office. This allowance was later consolidated with pay so as to entitle the employee to get its benefit in pension and leave allowance (vide Standing Committee Resolution No. 4874, dated the 5th August 1925). In 1922-23, the grade of the Havaldar in the Schools Committee's Office was revised to Rs. 23-1/5-25 and the grade was brought on par with that of the Havaldars in the Municipal Secretary's and the Municipal Commissioner's Offices. By Standing Committee Resolution No. 5606, dated the 25th August 1926, the grade of the Havaldar in the Municipal Secretary's Office was revised to Rs. 26 1/5-28 plus Rs. 3-/P. A. C, that of the Havaldar in the Municipal Commissioner's and the Schools Committee's Offices to Rs. 26-1/5. 28 and that of Havaldars in other departments to Rs. 24-1/5-26. By Standing Committee Resolution No. 11553, dated the 15th March 1929, the personal allowance of the Havaldar in the Municipal Secretary's Office was raised from Rs. 3 to Rs. 5. Later, the grade of the Havaldar in the Municipal Commissioner's Office was revised to Rs. 28-1/2-30, and that of Havaldars in other departments to Rs. 24-1/2-28. By Standing Committee Resolution No. 6798, dated the 30th October 1929, a Duty Allowance of Rs. 3 was also sanctioned to be paid to the Havaldar in the Municipal Commissioner's Office. The Havaldar in the Secretary Schools Committee's Office was also granted a duty allowance of Rs. 3 (vide Corporation Resolution No. 7663, dated the 28th November 1929). The grade of the Havaldars in the Municipal Secretary's and the Schools Committee's Offices was revised, with effect from 1st April 1930, from Rs. 26-1/5-28 to Rs. 28-1/2-30, to accord with the grade of the Havaldar in the Municipal Commissioner's Office. The Duty Allowance of Rs. 3 granted to the Havaldar in the Municipal Commissioner's Office and the Schools Committee's Office was subsequently increased to Rs. 5 (vide Standing Committee Resolution No. 6283, dated the 9th November 1932, and Standing Committee Proceedings, dated the 8th December 1934 page No. 918 respectively). In 1938-39, the Havaldar in the City Engineer's Department came
also to be accorded a favourable treatment by revision of his grade from Rs. $24-1 / 2-28$ to Rs. 28-1/2-30 by Standing Committee Resolution No. 946, dated the 19th November 1937. When the minimum salary of the post of a peon was fixed at Rs. 25 , the grade of the Havaldars was changed to Rs. $25-1 / 2-28$ and further revised to Rs. 26-1/2-28 from 1st March 1939. By Standing Committee Resolution No. 539, dated the 30th July 1941, the grade of the Havaldar in the Municipal Commissioner's, the City Engineer's, the Municipal Secretary's and the Schools Committee's Offices was again revised from Rs. $28-1 / 2-30$ to Rs. $30-1-34$ and that of Havaldars in all other departments from Rs. 26-1/2-28 to Rs. 28-1-32. The Consolidated Personal Allowance of Rs. 5 paid to the Havaldar in the Municipal Secretary's and the Municipal Commissioner's Offices was increased to Rs. 7 by Standing Committee Resolutions No. 971, dated the 7th October 1942, and No. 1345, dated the 2nd December 1942, respectively. This allowance was again increased to Rs. 10 by Standing Committee Resolutions No. 1571, dated the 29th December 1944, and No. 79, dated the 18 th April 1945 respectively. .The allowance of R. 5 to the Havaldar in the Schools Committe's Office was also increased to Rs. 10 from 1st July 1945 (vide Standing Committee Resolution No. 489, dated the 18th July 1945). Thus the Havaldars in the Municipal Commissioner's, the Municipal Secretary's and the Schools Committee's offices receive more favourable treatment both in the matter of pay and allowances and the Havaldar in the City Engineer's Office only in the matter of pay than the Havaldars in other departments. The grades of Havaldars thus in force are :-

Havaldar (in M.S.'s M.C.'s and S. S.'s offices) Rs. 30-1-34 plus Rs. 10 P.A.C.
City Engineer's Office.-Rs. 30-1-34 and
Other Departments-Rs. 28-1-32.
288. It must be noted that this pay does not include House Total emoluments of a rent and other perquisites like Uniform and Hevaldar.

Umbrella and Railway pass (if housed in Trust Chawls beyond one mile of the office) washing charges and Dearness Allowance, which if lumped together would bring the total emoluments to about Rs. 78 in the case of the Municipal Commissioner's, the Municipal Secretary's and the Schools Committee Office Havaldars, and Rs. 68 in the case of the City Engineer's Havaldar and about Rs. 66 in the case of Havaldars
in other Departments. Heads of departments have proposed various grades for Havaldars, viz., Rs. 30-1-35, 30-2-50, 32-2-40, 35-1-40, 35-2-40, 40-1-50, 40-2-60, 45-3-60. The University of Bombay has recently sanctioned a scale of Rs. 25-1-45. The Bombay Mnnicipal Peons' Union ask for a grade of Rs. 50-3-75. I suggest a common grade for all Havaldars at Rs. 35-1-40 and do not recommend any differential grade in the case of the Havaldars of the Municipal Commissioner's, the Municipal Secretary's and the Schools Committee's offices in view of the Personal Allowance of Rs. 10 attached to these posts.
(d) Jamadars.
289. There are only 3 posts of this rank in the Municipality, one in the Municipal Secretary's Office, one
Jamadars. in the Municipal Commissioner's Office and one in the Estate Agent and Land Manager's Office. The first attends on His Worship the Mayor, the second on the Municipal Commissioner and the third is attached to the Establishment for sanit ation and conservancy of S. P. Sheds. The posts of Jamadar are more or less of recent creation. A post of Jamadar was created to attend on the President of the Corporation (now His Worship the Mayor) by Standing Cornmittee Resolution No. 4723, dated the 22nd August 1928. The grade then fixed was Rs. 30-1-35 plus Rs. 6 House rent plus Rs. 3 P.A.C. The Personal Allowance was increased to Rs. 5 by Standing Committee Resolution No. 11553. dated the 15th March 1929. A post of Jamadar was created in the Municipal Commissioner's Office by Standing Committee Resolution No. 887, dated the 20th November 1935, on Rs. $30-1-35$ plus Rs. 5 P.A.C. plus Rs. 4 House rent. The grade of both these posts was revised to Rs, 35-1-40 vide Standing Committee Resolution No. 539, dated the 30th July 1941. The Consolidated Personal Allowance was increased to Rs. 7 by Standing Committee Resolution No. 971, dated the 7th October 1942, in the case of the Jamadar in the Municipal Secretary's Office and by Standing Committee Resolution No. 1345; dated the 2nd December 1942. in the case of the Jamadar in the Municipal Commissioner's Office. This allowance was further increased to Rs. 10 by Standing Committee Resolution No. 1571, dated the 29th December 1944, and Standing Committee Resolution No. 79, dated the 18th April 1945, respectively. Thus the present pay of these posts is Rs. $35-1-40$ plus Rs. 10 P.A.C. The scale for Jamadars in the Reserve Bank of India is Rs. $30-\frac{1}{2}-35$. The Bombay Municipal Peons' Union ask for a grade of Rs. 55-3-75.
290. In addition to the pay of Rs. 35-1-40, the Jamadars get a Totsil emoluments of a Dearness Allowance of Rs. 22 plus House rent Jamadar.

Rs. 6 or rent free quarters and a Railway pass, Uniform and Umbrella and washing charges of As. 8 per month, and Rs. 10 P.A.C. which together with pay work out to Rs. 81 to Rs. 86 per month. As the Dearness Allowance is not a permanent feature, I recommend that the grade of the Jamadars be fixed at Rs. 40-1-45 plus Rs. 10 P.A.C. plus Rs. 6 House rent with other perquisites or allowances as at present.

The Post of Jamadar in Budget ' B' was on daily wages up to 1937-38. It was brought on the permanent Schedule in 1938-39 and graded into Rs. 35-1-45. The present holder is given a personal allowance of Rs. 3-12-0 on the basis of daily wages under Standing Committee Resolution No. 967, dated the 24th November 1937. This grade was revised to Rs. 35-1-40 for new incumbents by Standing Committee Resolution No. 539, dated the 30th July 1941. I recommend that his grade be fixed at Rs. $40-1-45$ as in the case of other Jamadars.

There is one post of Staff Havaldar in the K.E.M. Hospital on a fixed salary of Rs. 35. His post is really analogous to that of a Jamadar. I suggest that he be designated as Jamadar and given a grade of Rs. 40-1.45

## Financial effect.

291. The financial effect of the proposals madeabove is a net

Financial effect. increase of Rs. 63,300 per annum in the cost of Establishment and of Rs. 13,192 per annum on Leave and Provident Fund.

## CHAPTER XXX

## Scavengers and Halakhores

292. These are the humblest workers in the Municipality, yet their importance in keeping the City free from Functions and Strength. dirt, dust and disease cannot be over-estimated. In the final analysis, they are the care-takers of the health of the City. Their work is of the dirtiest, yet they are paid the lowest; that is the paradox of Municipal service and also of service all over the world. The number of Scavengers is 3,165 (men 1896 and women 1269) and Halalkhores 758 (men 457 and women 301 ).
(a) Scavengers.
293. The Scavengers sweep the roads and tidy up the streets. The men usually sweep and collect kutchra in heaps on the road side and the women remove these small heaps to the kutchra cart or lorry. In 1900-01, the pay of the Scavengering men and Drain Cleansing men was Rs. 9 and that of Scavengering and Drain Cleansing women Rs. 6. Thus from the earliest times a sex differential was maintained. The pay of these men and women was increased to Rs. 10 and Rs. $6 \frac{1}{2}$ respectively, by Corporation Resolution No. 749, dated the 2nd May 1907. In 1910-11, the Scavengering and the Drain Cleansing staff was arnalgamated and shown under " Scavengering Establishment." In 1911-12, the pay of Scavengering men and women was increased to Rs. $10 \frac{1}{2}$ and Rs. 7 respectively. In 1914-15, the pay was further increased to Rs. 11 and Rs. $7 \frac{1}{2}$ respectively, and again increased to' Rs. 12 and Rs. $8 \frac{1}{2}$ respectively from lst August 1914 (vide StandingCommittee Resolution No. 3034, dated the 6th August 1914). In 1921_22, this pay was again raised to Rs. 18 and Rs. 14 respectively. In 1929-30, the pay was further revised to Rs. 23 and Rs. 19, respectively, by merging the extra-ordinary allowance of Rs. 5 then allowed with the pay. By Standing Committee Resolutions No. 1373, dated the 26th January 1938, and No. 612, dated the 31st August 1938, the pay was further increased to Rs. 25 and Rs. 21, respectively. The Municipal Workers' Union have demanded that the pay of both the men and the women workers be increased to Rs. 35. The'Health Officer has also recommended a salary of Rs. 35 for these men. I consider that a grade of Rs. 25-1.35 for Scavengering men and a grade of Rs. 25-1-30 for Scavengering women
would be adequate. I have already stated in Chapter III that this differentiation is inevitable and even necessary in the interest of women workers themselves, but this differentiation has been mitigated by suggesting a common floor-wage for men and women.
(b) Halalkhores.
294. The duty of Halalkhores consists of removing night soil where basket privies exist and of cleaning cess-pools, public urinals, latrines, etc. They were started on a still higher pay than the scavengers, presumably, because their work was more unpleasant. In 1900-01, some Halalkhores were paid Rs. 13, some Rs. $11 \frac{1}{2}$, only, a few drawing the former salary. With the introduction of the watercloset system, their number dwindled and those drawing Rs. 13 disappeared. In 1914-15, those drawing Rs. $11 \frac{1}{2}$ were paid Rs. 12 on account of the increased cost of living. This was further increased to Rs. 121 $\frac{1}{2}$ by Standing Committee Resolution No. 3034, dated the 6th August 1914. In 1921-22, this pay was increased to Rs. $18 \frac{1}{2}$. In 1929-30, this was further revised to Rs. $23 \frac{1}{2}$ by merging the extraordinary allowance then allowed in the pay. By Standing Committee Resolution No. 1373, dated the 26th January 1938, the pay of halalkhore men was further increased to 25 per month. The pay of halalkhore women was retained at Rs. 231 $\mathbf{2}$ vide Standing Committee Resolution No. 612, dated the 31st August 1938. The Municipal Workers' Union have demanded that the pay of both the men and women workers be increased to Rs. 35. The Health Officer has also recommended a salary of Rs. 35. I suggest that the grade of halalkhore men be fixed at Rs. 25-1.35 and that of halalkhore women at Rs. 25-1-30. The reasons for keeping this difference have already been set out under the head "Scavengers,"

## Financial effect.

295. The financial effect of these proposals is a net increase of Rs. 3,07,980 per annum in the cost of Establishment and of Rs. 84,770 per annum on Leave and Provident Fund.

## 138

## PART III

CHAPTER XXXI
Housing and House Rent Allowance.

- 296. The Municipality has provided some staff with free quarters, some with quarters on rental basis
Existing provision. at a certain percentage of their salaries or at a fixed amount, and has been paying some others house-rent allowance in lieu of quarters. The number of persons falling in each category is as follows:-

No. of pergons.
Free quarters
... 1,887 (out of which 145 have been provided with free lighting and 234 with free eiectrisity for lighting and other purposes.)
Quarters at a rental of 10 per cent. of salaries ... 29
Quarters at a rental of $7 \frac{1}{2}$ per cent of salaries ... 3
Quarters at a rental of 5 per cent, of salaries ... 19
Quarters at fixed rent .. ...
Quarters at concessional rents to halalkhores. scavengers, bigaries and street boys, from annas 5 to 10

Quarters to peons etc. in C.I.T. chawls in lieu of house rent allowance.420

Number of persons to whom house-rent is allowed 649
297. It will be seen that the foregoing arrangements are somewhat illogical and inconsistent. It is not clear why Halalkhores and Scavengers, who have to do the most unsavoury work, have to pay for the quarters, be it even at concessional rates, while peons who
Holallkores and Sca. work in more healthy environment and on veagers not to be charged less strenuous jobs should get the quarters House Rent.
free, and on the top, a free Railway pass.if their place of work is more than one mile away from their quarters. I am of opinion that this class of employees should be given the same privileges and should not be charged any rent, provided they do not entertain any lodgers who are not in Municipal service.
298. No rules appear to have been framed to determine to what class of employees rent-free quarters should be provided and to
what class of employees rent at 10 per cent. or $7 \frac{1}{2}$ per cent. or 5 per cent. of the salary drawn by them should be charged. A rent concession forms in effect an addition to an employee's emoluments, and although the concession is shown in the Establishment schedule,

Principles governing the provision of rent free quarters or quar. ters at concessional rent. its value in terms of money is not shown therein. It thus escapes periodical scrutiny and criticism at the time of the Budget. No review or revision of these cases appears to have been made by any independent officer to see whether the concession was ab initio justified and whether there is any case now for its continuance. The principles which should govern the grant of free residence or of a residence at reduced rent are well enunciated in the Thomas Committee report. They are briefly as follows :-
(1) That it is necessary for the proper discharge of his duties that an employee should occupy a particular residence.
(2) That the employee suffers pecuniary loss or personal inconvenience thereby.
In the first case, the Committee state; that free quarters may be justified; in the second case, they suggest that a charge at 5 per cent. of the salary should be made. In all other cases, 10 per cent. of the salary or market rent, whichever is less, ought to be charged. The Thomas Committee add that "even where both these conditions are satisfied, it by no means follows that the full concession should be given. The reduction in rental should, as far as possible, be fixed at an amount commensurate with the loss or inconvenience suffered by the officer concemed. It has been the practice in the past to apply the first criterion without reference to the second, with the result that many officers are now living in rent-free residences the location of which is quite as convenient for themselves as it is for Government."* The latter statement appears to apply with particular force to some of the cases in the Bombay Municipality. For example the Controller of Stores is required to live in quarters provided in the Stores compound at DeLisle Road, which is out of the way and where some inconvenience is bound to be felt. However, he is charged a rent at 5
Anomalies in the existper cent. of his salary ; while the Superintendent of Markets who is provided with quarters in an important locality on Hornby Road over the A. C. Market

[^21]is charged no rent. There are also a number of posts particularly in the Hydraulic Engineer's Department where even black-sniths, painters, carpenters, masons and plumbers are provided with free quarters. It is not clear whether the grant of such concessions in their case was specifically sanctioned by the Standing Committee. It is also not clear why one officer should be charged a fixed rent for the quarters occupied by him while others are charged on a per centage of the salary drawn by them. There are several anomalies like this and I think a careful review of the whole question by the Commissioner or by an independent officer is necessary.
299. The Thomas Committee also observe that "charges for

Cases of Free supply of electricity and lights to be examined. water supplied or electricity consumed should it was disclosed that about 429 persons were enjoying free electricity or lighting. These cases should be carefully scrutinised and where the concession is not justified it should be revoked.
300. Peons are given rent-free quarters in C. I. T. chawls. Budget A contributes to Budget B Rs. 6 for Grant of Rent-free each room so occupied by a Municipal peon. quarters or House rent Those peons, who do not take advantage of this concession, are allowed a House rent allowance. House rent allowance was first granted to the Mrnicipal peons at the rate of Rs. $1-8.0$ per month in 1912 and increased toRs. 4 per month in 1920-21, to Rs. 6 per month in 1927-28 and to Rs. 7 per month in 1930-31. A house rent allowance of Rs. 5 or Rs. 6 per month was paid to menials like hamals, lascars, watchmen, ramoshis, Janitors etc., in 1932-33. In the same year, on account of heavy vacancies in the Improvement Trust Chawls, it was proposed to discontinue the payment of House rent allowance and to provide accommodation for them in the Trust Chawls. An option to accept a reduced allowance of Rs. 4 per month to peons and of Rs. 3 per month to other menials, in lieu of rent free quarters in the Trust Chawls, was given. The proposal was approved under Standing Committee Resolutions No. 10179, dated the 1st March 1933, and No. 11005 ,dated the 22nd March 1933.
301. By Corporation Resolution No. 5498, dated the 2nd OctoFree
tickets to
Railway
peons season
etc.s. $\begin{aligned} & \text { ber 1933, the Commissioner and the Standing } \\ & \text { Committee were requested to reconsider the }\end{aligned}$ reduction in the rate of house-rent allowance in the case of employees not occupying rent free quarters in the

Themas Committe Report page, 101.

Trust Chawls. By Corporation Resolution No. 5499, dated the 2nd October 1933, the Standing Committee was also requested to consider whether in appropriate cases, a consolidated monthly allowance for tram fares should not be given to employees, who were obliged to reside in the Improvement Trust Chawls beyond one mile of their place of duty. The Standing Committee referred the matter to their Establishments Sub-Committee, who reported on 6th December 1935, that they could not recommend either any increase in the house-rent allowance or grant of any allowance for tram fare. This report was approved and adopted by Standing Committee Resolution No. 1170, dated the 15th January 1936. The Corporation, however, referred the question back to the Standing Committee for further consideration (vide Corporation Resolution No. 869. dated the 3rd February 1936). This Committee again referred the matter to the Establishments Sub-Committee, who reported on the 30th June 1936, that they were not in favour of increasing the houserent allowance, but recommended the issue of railway season tickets at Municipal cost to employees occupying free quarters if the quarters were beyond two miles of their place of duty. This report was approved and adopted under Standing Committee Resolution No. 446, dated the 23rd July 1936. The question was again referred back to the Standing Committee for reconsideration (vide Corporation Resolution No. 325, dated the 14th August 1936). The Standing Committee by their Resolution No. 654, dated the 23rd September 1936, adhered to their previous decision not to allow any increase in the house-rent allowance, but agreed to the issue of railway season tickets at Municipal cost to employees occupying free quarters if the quarters were beyond one mile of their place of work. This Resolution was recorded under Corporation Resolution No. 533, dated the 8th October 1936. The House-rent allowance was subsequently increased to Rs. 6 per month by Standing Committee Resolution No. 1572, dated the 29th December 1944.
302. It is not obligatory on the part of the Municipality to provide this class of employees with free quarters. Mill-operatives, who are provided with quarters by the Mill-authorities are charged a rent
Provision of free quar- varying from Rs. 3 to Rs. 5.* The grant of tern to peons etc. wot House Rent allowance or of free quarters in abligatory. the case of Municipal peons etc., constitutes thus a real addition to their emoluments and in considering theminimum wage to be given to them the economic rent of these quarters

[^22]should be taken into account as they would have had to pay such rent had they occupied the quarters as private individuals.

Housing Accommodation Scheme.
303. The Municipal Workers' Union have demanded that all employees earning Rs. 50 or less should be
Demands of the Municipal Labour Uniona. provided with housing accommodation and where such accommodation is already provid ed, the sanitary and water supply arrangements should be improved and electric lights provided in the rooms. The Bombay Municipal Kamgar Sangh suggest that the Corporation should embark upon a five-year-programme to provide accommodation to the employees ; that the rooms to be provided should be like those provided at the Tansa Lake; that where housing accommodation has already been provided the system of recovering rent should be improved and a dependent person should be allowed to stay with the employee without charging any extra rent. The K.E.M. Hospital and G.S. Medical College Employees' Union have complained that only married workers are given a separate room and bachelors belonging to different Provinces are put together; that malies and watchmen should be provided with housing accommodation or given Rs. 3 as House Rent in lieu of quarters. The Bombay Municipal Peons and Lascars' Union have asked that housing accommodation should be provided for the inferior service: that concessional rents should be charged to all the infentor staff and season tickets given to them; that when peons go on leave for more than 4 months they should not be charged rent and if at all a charge is to be made it should be at the concessional rate; that when an employee provided with a room dies, his dependants should be allowed to stay in the room on payment of concessional rent until the settlement of the Provident Fund claim or three months, whichever is later.
304. Reporting on the question, the Commissioner, in his letter No. A.E.607, dated the 5th April 1940,
Scheme for housing
the inferior stafi. the inferior service. Out of these, 954 are housed free of rent, 5674 at concessional rent, and 437 at full rent. Out of the remaining 6,935 employees, 4927 are reported to be willing to occupy Municipal rooms if provided in suitable localities. The problem of housing all the inferior staff in Municipal Accommodation Schemes was considered in the past. It was estimated that a tenement $18^{\prime} \times 10^{\prime}$ would cost about Rs. 2,000 ;
that its economic rent would be Rs. 12-8-0; that if only a concessional rent of Rs. 3 were charged, the loss per tenement would be Rs. $9-8-0$ per month, and that if the number of peons \&c., to be provided with quarters were about 5,000 , the loss on this account would be Rs. 5.70 lakhs per annum. The Municipal Solicitors, have however, expressed the view that such a scheme is admissible only in the case of persons engaged in the performance of the obligatory duties of the Corporation enumerated in Section 61 of the Municipal Act. Enquiries since made show that the total strength of the menial staff employed in the departments performing the obligatory duties of the Corporation is 12,074 , out of which 6,377 yet remain to be housed in Municipal quarters. The capital cost of housing this number is estimated by the Commissioner at Rs. 1,28 lakhs, and the annual charges on account of interest and sinking fund, if the amount is raised by a loan, at Rs. 78,105 per annum. If the scheme is completed within 10 years and a monthly rent of Rs. 3 is charged per room the net recurring loss is estimated at Rs. 7.8 lakhs per annum. This loss may be far out-weighed by the imponderable gains by way of improved health and efficiency of the labour staff.
305. Mr. Montague Harris says* that "local authorities are under a general obligation to secure an adequate

General obligation to provide housing accommodation. standard of housing accommodation for the working class and a more specific obligation to deal with slums and defective houses and to remedy over-crowding ". The Labour Commission observes that local bodies are not only responsible for housing their own labour but also for housing labour generally, being primarily responsible for the health of the citizens, which responsibility cannot be discharged in industrial cities without a vigorous housing policyf. The Rent Enquiry Committee Report says that it is necessarye that public authorities like Government the Port Trust, the Railways and the Municipality should, immediately undertake the responsibility of housing their own employees. It further adds that it is necessary to regard housing as a "public service" and to that end draw up a housing programme for the supply of cheap and small tenements."I

[^23]The Textile Labour Enquiry Committee also suggests that Municipalities should undertake housing for labour generally and that Covernment should subsidise such schemes.*
306. The City Improvement Trust and Government have Municipality may built a large number of tenements for labour baild houses for its infe- classes. The City Improvement Trust was rior staff. amalgamated with the Municipality in 1933. Since the amalgamation, the obligation to provide housing accommodation and to clear slums has devolved on the Municicipality. If the Municipality can thus build houses for the general public, it might as well begin with the building of quarters for its inferior staff and charge them economic rent where it is not now provided with rent free quarters and earn thereby a high social dividend in the form of more wholesome conditions of life, less disease and a brighter outlook for its staff.
307. The demand of the Municipal labour to improve sanitary Demands of the Labour and water supply arrangements and to provide Unions, se lights ssni-
tary, water suply arrangement. etc. supply with housing accommodation, is legitimate and deserves attention of the Executive. The standard suggested in the matter of sanitary arrangements by the Rent Enquiry Committee is one latrine and one washing place for every four rooms and the standard recommended for the size of a room is a minimum of 180 square feet. As the Municipality usually lays down standards in these matters it would be as well it becomes a model builder. The Municipality should embark on a ten-year programme for housing its labour as suggested by that Committee. The demand of the Unions to allow a dependant to stay with the employee who is provided with rent free quarters without charging any rent for his occupation would be reasonable if the number of such dependants is limited to one and such dependant is unemployed. The K.E.M. Hospital and G. S. M. College Employees' Union demand that workers without families also should beprovided with an independent room each has little to commend it in the light of the existing circumstances. However, while clubbing them together, the Executive may see that, as far as possible, homogenous elements are put together and wherever possible the employees may be given a choice to select their own partners. Their further demand that malies and watchmen should also be provided with rent free quarters or paid Rs. 3 House Rent would have relevance only if the Corporation were finally to

[^24]accept the responsibility for housing all its inferior staff. The question of paying House Rent to such staff, in the meanwhile, does not seem to be justified unless the nature of their duties is such that they need to stay close to their place of work and are liable to be called out for duty at any time The demand in respect of a free Railway pass for all the inferior staff, who have been provided with rent-free quarters does not seem to be warranted. This concession was granted when the C.I.T. chawls had a large number of vacancies and the Municipal inierior staif who were allowed House Rent Allowance had to be persuaded by offer of such concessions to occupy the vacant rooms. Conditions in Bombay have since changed and there is a keen demand for rooms in the C. I. T. chawls from the public. The Municipality may, therefore, consider whether in addition to the Rent Free room a further concession of a Free Railway pass where the place of work is more than one mile from their residence is now justified and should be extended to all as suggested by the Union. The suggestion that employees, who have been provided with free quarters, should be allowed to occupy the rooms rent free even when they are on leave for more than four months does not commend itself as the substitutes appointed in the leave vacancies will in that case be deprived of that concession. The existing practice in this matter should, therefore, be allowed to continue. There is, however, some substance in their demand that the family of a deceased employee should be allowed to stay upto a period of three months after the employee's death or until the Provident Fund claim is settled, whichever is later, without payment of any rent. But the period suggested is somewhat too long and I think a period of two months would be adequate and reasonable.

## Advance for House Building.

308. The enlargement of the scope of housing schemes, whereby Municipal employees in the superior Housing of employees service may be enabled to construct houses for in the Superior Servict themselves by grant of advances, if necessary, by an amendment of the Municipal Act, appears to have been also considered. But the idea seems to have been given up as the Municipal Solicitors advised such a legislation would fall outside the scope of the compulsory or voluntary duties of the Corporation. But employees of this class are allowed the facility of obtaining an advance upto the maximum limit of their contribution or deposit in their Provident Fund (under an amendment carried out to the

Provident Fund Rule by Corporation Resolution No. 17, dated the 11th April 1938) to purchase or build a suitable house in Bombay or its suburbs for personal use.

Financial Effect.
309. The financial effect of my proposal not to charge any rent to Halalkhores and the Conservancy staff housed in Municipal quarters will be a loss Financial effect. rent to Hal
housed in
of about Rs. 25,500 per annum.

## CHAPTER XXXII

## Conveyance Allowance.

310 Conveyance Allowance is an allowance given for meeting travelling expenses in the performance of official duties. The amount granted in each case varies with the status of the employee, the class of conveyance he is required to maintain or use and the area he is required to cover in the course of his duties every day. When a particular conveyance is required to be maintained, the allowance is permitted to be drawn on production of a certificate that a conveyance of the required class has actually been maintained. This condition has, however, been waived during the war time in the case of employess who are in receipt of a conveyance allowance of Rs. 40 and above, but not exceeding Rs. 80 (vide Standing Committee Resolution No. 922, dated the Ist October 1942 and Corporation Resolution No. 694, dated the 2nd November 1942). The classes of conveyance usually recognised are (1) a motor car (2) a motor cycle with or without a side car (3) an animal drawn conveyance and (4) a pedal cycle. The animal drawn vehicle is now going out of vogue. If any offcer maintains a conveyance of a class higher than that allowed to him he is not allowed to draw the conveyance allowance at the higher rate. The amount of allowance in each case is based on the assumption that the vehicle will ordinarily be used by the officer concerned for official duties and for private purposes in the proportion of 2 to 1 .

311 The earliest mention of Motor Allowance in the Establishment schedule is in 1913-14, when certain officers were given an allowance of Rs. 75 for Motor Allowance. the up-keep of motor cars for the performance of their official duties. The allowance was fixed on the assumption that the cars would be used for inspection work at 300 miles per month. As the price of petrol increased, the allowance was in-
1st increave in the creased to Rs. 100 per month with effect from Motor Allowance. Ist January 1917. (vide Corporation Resolution No. 7561, dated the 21 st February 1918.). In 1919, the average
2nd incrense in the cost of maintaining a motor car for duties all Motor Allowance. over the City was estimated at Rs. 225 per month,against which an allowance of Rs. 150 per month was granted
to cover only $2 / 3$ rds of the cost of maintenance, the remaining $1 / 3 \mathrm{rd}$ representing the use of the car for private purposes (vide Corporation Resolution No. 9895, dated the 17th November 1919). In 1921, the question came for consideration again as the cost of the upkeep of a motor car had, in the meanwhile, mounted up. The cost of maintaining a car without a driver and running 500 to 600 miles per month was then estimated at Rs. 275 , against which an allowance of - Jrd increase in the Rs. 200 to cover the use of the car for official. Motor Allowance. duties only was sanctioned (vide Corporation Resolution No. 6007, dated the 6th October 1921). This allowance was given to ten officers who were required to travel all over the City, out of the 15 officers who were entitled to motor allowance, the remaining five continuing to draw Rs. 150 per month. In addition, there were 13 Municipal motor cars, which were supplied to various officials. In 1925, the question was again reviewed by the Retrenchment Officer, Mr. N. D. Mehta, and the Retrenchment Advisory Committee. On their recommendation Municipal cars for the Mumicipal Commissioner, the Executive Health Officer, 'the Executive Engineer and the Chief Officer of the Fire Brigade, the
Changes made by the Special Engineer, Development Works and Retrenchment officer and
the Retrenchment $\mathbf{C o m}$ - two cars for officials of the Water Department for inspection of works outside the City came to be maintained and the Municipal cars supplied to the Deputy Municipal Commissioner, the Hydraulic Engineer, the Deputy Engineer, the Mechanical Engineer, the Special Engineer, Tansa, and the Assistant Engineer Tansa were discontinued and they were given an allowance of Rs. 200 p . m. each. The rates of motor allowances fixed by them for other officers were as follows :-

Amount
per month
Rs.
Four seater cars used for travelling all over the
City $\quad$.. 200

> Four seater cars used for travelling within a limited area such as Wards ... 150

Two seater cars "... 100
Motor cycles, solo \& combination - ... 50
As regards the Municipal car supplied to the Secretary, Schools Committee, for the maintenance of which he was paid Rs. 200, the Committee recommended that the arrangement should be continued as the car was used not only by the Secretary but by the officials,
members of the Committee and others who have to pay official visits to Municipal Schools (vide Corporation Resolution No. 2151, dated the 11 th June 1925). The Municipal motor cars came gradually to be reduced. In 1926, the question was again raised. The Standing Committee asked its Establishments Sub-committee if the motor car allowances could be reduced (vide Standing Committee Resolution No. 8962, dated the 24th November 1926). The Commissioner reported, (vide his letter No.E.M. 1884-D, dated the 27th April 1927) after a thorough examination of the question, that circumstances had not so altered as to justify any decrease in the scale of motor allowances. The Establishments Sub-committee then asked for further report from the Commissioner. The latter recommended that out of 17 officers, who were then drawing a conveyance allowance of Rs. 200, the Deputy Municipal Commissioner, the Assessor and Collector, the City Engineer, the Mechanical Engineer, and the Secretary, Schools Committee, should be allowed a conveyance allowance at the rate of Rs. $200 \mathrm{p} . \mathrm{m}$. and that in the
Cut of $20 \%$ in the case of others the allowance should be reduced Conveyance Allowante. to Rs. 175 p. m. (vide Municipal Commissioner's letter No. M.C. 2-B, dated the 3rd April 1928). TheEstablishments Sub-Committee, however, recommended roughly a cut of 20 per cent. and reduction of the allowance from Rs. 200 to Rs. 160 , from Rs. 150 to Rs. 120 , from Rs. 100 to Rs. 80 and from Rs. 50 to Rs. 40 according to the various types of vehicles sanctioned to be maintained by officers performing out-door duties. The Sub-committee's report was approved and adopted by the Standing Committee Resolution No. 2062, dated the 7th June 1928. Later, this decision was slightly modified so far as the then Executive Engineer was concerned and he was allowed a motor allowance of Rs. 200 per month (Corporation Resolution No. 6273, dated the 11th
 October 1928). In the Budget for 1934-35, the the Conveyance Allow- Standing Committee effected a further cut of

10 per cent. This cut was, however, restored with effect from the year 1936-37. (vide Standing Committee Resolution No. 1042, dated the ith December 1935). As the cost of maintenance of cars increased during the war, a 10 per cent. increase was granted with

312. The present position is thus as under :-

1. Officers who are provided with Municipal Motor Cars:-
(1) The Municipal Commissioner, (2) The Executive officers provided with Health Officer, (3) The Officer Commanding, Municipal Motor Cars. Fire Services, and (4) The City Engineer.
(The City Engineer has been provided with a Municipal Motor Car recently by Corporation Resolution No. 212, dated the 3rd July 1945).
2. Officer who is provided with a Municipal car and allowed Officers provided with
Rs. 160 plus 10 per cent :- - anicipalCar and allowe MunicipalCar and allow
ed allowence of Rs. 160 .
(1) The Secretary, Schools Committee.
3. Offtcers who are allowed Rs. 160 plus 10 per cent: :-
(1) The Deputy Municipal Commissioner, (2) The Deputy Officers ${ }^{\text {llowed }}$ who ${ }_{160}$ are Municipal Commissioner (Improvements); (3) allowed Rs, 160 per The Hydraulic Engineer, (4) The Deputy City Engineer;
4. Officers who are ollowed Rs. 120 plus 10 per cent:-
(1) The Assessor and Collector, (2) The Election and Town Officers who axe Duty Officer, (3) The Assistant Engineer, allowed Rs. 120 per lst grade (Water Works), (4) The Assistant month. Engineer, 2nd grade, Maintenance (Water

Works), (5) The Assistant Engineer, 2nd grade, Inspection, Distribution and Waste Prevention (Water Works), (6) The Assistant Health Officer, Central Office (7) The Assistant Health Officer (Malaria), (8) The Epidemiologist, (9) The Head Supervisor, Conservancy, (10) The Assistant Engineer, 2nd grade, Maintenance (Roads), (11) The Assistant Engineer, lst grade (Mechanical Branch), (12) The Superintendent of Licences, Shops and Establishments (13) The Superintendent of Markets, (14) The Assistant Engineer, 2nd grade (Slums), (15) The Estate Agent and Land Manager, (16) The Deputy Estate Agent and Land Manager, (17) The Senior Assistant Estate Agent, (18) The Assistant Engineer, Ist grade (Architectural Branch). (19) The Assistant Engineer, 2nd grade (Works Branch).
5. Officers who are allowed Rs. 100 plus 10 per cent :-
(1) The Municipal Chief Auditor, (2) The Test Audit officers who are Officer, (3) The Assistant Engineer, 3rd allowed Rs. ${ }^{160}$ per grade,' Waste Prevention, (Water Works),
month. month. (4) The Superintendent of Gardens;, (5) The Welfare Organiser.
6. Officers who are allowed Rs. 80 plus 10 per cent:(1) The Assistant Engineer, 2nd grade, Outside officers who are Division (Water Works), (2) The Assistant $\underset{\text { month. }}{\substack{\text { allowed } \\ \text { Rs. } \\ 80}}$ per Engineer, 2nd grade, Loan Works (Water month. Works).
7. Officers who are allowed Rs. 60 plus 10 per cent :-
(1) The Assistant Assessors, (2) Superintendents, 1st grade officers who are and 2nd grade* (Assessment and Collection ${ }^{\text {allowed }}$ Rs. ${ }_{60}{ }_{\text {per }}$ Department); (3) The Controller of Stores, month.
(5) The Assistant Engineer, 2nd grade (Roads); (6) Two Assistant Engineers, 3rd grade (Roads). (7) The Assistant Engineer, 3rd grade (Drainage), (8) Four Assistant Engineers, 2nd grade (Building), (9) The Deputy Chief Officer, Fire Brigade; (10) The Assistant Engineer, 3rd grade (Asphalt Plant), (11) Three Assistant Engineers, 3rd grade. (Architectural Branch).
313. In considering a revision of motor allowance, three Factors to be consi- factors must be weighed in the balance, viz., dered in fixing a conve. (1) standing charges (2) maintenance and yance allowance. running charges and (3) the scale of motor allowance now allowed by Government and other public bodies. The first includes (a) depreciation (b) interest on capital (c) painting (d) battery, hoods and covers (e) driver (f) insurance (g) registration fee ( $h$ ) garage ( $i$ ) repairs and $(j)$ incidentals like monthly service, etc. The second includes (a) tyres and tubes (b) oil and (c) petrol. An estimate made by Mr. N. D. Mehta as far back as 1927, put the standing charges at Rs. 2209-5-0 per annum (exclusive of registra-
Mr.N.D. Mehta's osti- tion fee which was not then levied and garage mate of maintaining rent) and running charges at Rs.875-11-0 a car.
per annum (vide the Municipal Commissioner's letter No. M.C. 17-B, dated the 27th October 1930, under-

[^25]lying Standing Committee Resolution No. 5946, dated the 5th November 1930). Thus the total charges were estimated at Rs. 3,085 per annum or say about Rs. 257 per month. If garage rent of about Rs. 25 per month and registration fee of Rs. 5 to 10 were added to this, the monthly charges come to Rs. 287 to Rs. 292.
314. Last year, the Municipal Chief Auditor estimated the monthly cost of maintaining a car at Rs. 469
M.CA's. Estimate of on an entirely different basis. Out of this, he allocated Rs. $140-8-0$ for private use and Rs. 328-8-0 for office use of the car (vide his letter No. M.C.A. No. 267-I, dated the 24th August 1944, underlying Standing Committee Resolution No. 727, dated the 30th August 1944).

The cost to the Municipality of maintaining Municipal Cost of maintaining cars during the last five years was as Municipal Motor Cars. follows:-

The Mumicipal Commissioner's car.-Rs. 2,959 in 1940-41 Rs. 3,490 in 1941-42, Rs. 4,296 in 1942-43 Rs. 3,460 in 1943-44 and Rs. 3,704, in 1944-45-Total 17,909. i.e. an average - of about Rs. 298 per month.

The Executive Health Officer's car-Rs. 4,017 in 1940-41 Rs. 4,255 in 1941-42, Rs. 4,409 in 1942-43 Rs. 4,507 in 1943-44, Rs. 4,843 in $1944-45-$ Total Rs. 22,031 i.e. an average of about Rs. 367 per month.
315. It would not be proper to fix the basic motor car allow-

Revision proposed. ance on war time estimates. Any increase in the cost of maintenance as a result of war time conditions must be met by means of temporary expedients tike a 20 per cent increase and relief from Provincial and local taxation given to Government servants (vide Government Resolution F.D. No. 6182/33, dated the 3rd February 1945). As, however, the 20 per cent cut made in the basic rates in the year 1928 appears to be arbitrary and intended to meet the then financial depression, the Municipal officers are entitled to the restoration of this cut wholly or at any rate partially. I, therefore, recommend the following increase in the scale:-

Those who get Rs. 160 now, should be given Rs. 175.
Those who get Rs. 120 now, should be given Rs. 150.
Those who get Rs. 100 now,should be given Rs. 125.
Those who get Rs. 80 now, should be given Rs, 100 .

Those who get Rs. 60 now, should be given Rs. 75.
Those who get Rs. 40 and 45 now, should be given Rs. 50 .
These changes as well as the changes made in the Conveyance Allowance below Rs. 40 are shown in the Statement C attached to this report. Slight deviation from the above scale has been made in certain cases with due regard to the nature of the work to be performed and the area to be travelled by the officers concerned. The 10 per cent increase now granted should be continued till such time as Government continues to give relief to their Officers in this matter having regard to the prevailing conditions. I understand that Government have raised this 10 per cent increase to 20 per cent with effect from 1st March 1945. If similar increase is granted by the Corporation it should also be continued so that Municipal Officers may be placed on par with Government Officers in this matter.

Financial Effect.
316. The financial effect of the proposals made in respect of the increase in the Conveyance Allowance Financial effect. is a net increase of Rs. 86,724 per annum.

## CHAPTER XXXIII.

## Dearness Allowance and Grain Compensation.

317. Dearness allowance is given to employees to off-set or neutralise, to some extent at least, the fall in
What Doarness Allow- the real wages on account of the rise in the ance is intended for cost of living, and thus to prevent hardship to the wage earner who finds his purchasing power suddenly reduced. By its very nature it is provisional and variable and merely intended to meet a temporary emergency.
(a) Grain compensation and War allowance during the last Great War of 1914-18.
318. Dearness Allowance or its variants namely, grain compensation allowance or war allowance, was also

## War allowance during the last War

 given during the last Great War to compensate the employees for the increase in the cost of living. By Corporation Resolution No. 2969; dated the 13th August 1917, Grain Compensation allowance of Rs. 1-8-0 per month was given to Municipal employees drawing a salary of Rs. 16 per month, and Rs. 3 to those drawing up to Rs. 30 per month, for a period of 12 months from 1st March 1917, subject to the understanding that if the prices of food-stuffs fell in the meanwhile the allowance would be discontinued from the date Government discontinued it for their employees. Shortly thereafter, by their Resolution No. 5686, dated the 6th December 1917, the Corporation sanctioned, with effect from. Ist October 1917, a War allowance of Rs. 10 per month to all employees drawing salaries from Rs. 30 to Rs. 200 per month. In January 1918, the Corporation sanctioned a War Allowance of Rs. 10 per month in lieu of Grain Compensation Allowance (sanctioned by Corporation Resolution No. 2969, dated the 13th August 1917) to Tracers and Telephone Attendants, getting Rs. 25 per month in the Executive Engineer's, the Water Works and the Drainage departments, with effect from lst October 1917 (vide Corporation Resolution No. 6286, dated the 7th January 1918). In September 1918, the Corporation sanctioned (vide their Resolution No. 3954, dated the 12th September 1918), a War allowance of Rs. 2 per month with effect from Ist August 1918, to employees whose pay did not exceed Rs. 30 per month, in addition to the Grain Compensation Allowance sanctioned under Corporation Resolution No. 2969, dated the13th August 1917. This benefit was, however, not extended to certain malis, peons, lascars and farriers whose rates of pay were then revised or were proposed to be revised.
319. In December 1918, the Corporation (vide their Resolution No. 6189, dated the 9th December 1918),

Scale of war allowance paid doxing the last War. sanctioned an increase in the payment of War allowance from Rs. 10 to Rs. 20 per month to employees drawing Rs. 30 to Rs. 50, Rs. 75 to Rs. 100 and Rs. 100 to Rs. 200 per month and an allowance of Rs. 10 to Rs. 25 to employees drawing pay between Rs. 55 and Rs. 70 per month with effect from the lst September 1918. The reason for granting a slightly higher allowance to employees drawing pay between Rs. 55 and Rs. 70 was that the employees in this group had in most cases put in long periods of service without much increase in pay and the burden of high prices pressed more heavily on them. By Corporation Resolution No. 7991, dated the 10 th February 1919, a special War Bonus, in addition to War Allowance, at a uniform rate of Rs. 1-8-0 per month was granted to all Municipal employees on the permanent schedule drawing upto Rs. 30 per month with effect from lst January 1919. By Corporation Resolution No. 2280, dated the 23rd June 1919, the following scale of extra allowance was sanctioned in the case of all Municipal employees whose pay ranged from Rs. 200 to Rs. 600, with effect from 1st September $1918:-$

| Pay. |  | Exira Allowance. |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Rs. 200-299 |  | $\cdots$ | ${ }_{20}^{\text {Rs. }}$. |
| Rs. $300-399$ |  | ... | 30 |
| Ro. $400-499$ |  | $\cdots$ | 40 |
| Rs. $500-600$ |  | $\cdots$ | 50 |

By Corporation Resolution No. 14080, dated the lith March 1920, the War-Allowance was extended also to employees on privilege leave, furlough, and leave on medical certificate and also to those drawing acting allowances.
320. War allowance, grain compensation allowance, special

Conolidation of diffe- war bonus and local allowance were all conrent allowances inte en solidated into one allowance called "Extra-tra-ordinary allowance. ordinary Allowance" (vide Corporation Resolution No. 12426, dated the 2nd February 1920, and Standing Committee Resolution No. 1662, dated the 26th May 1920). In March 1920, when the pay of the clerical staff was revised, the War Allowance, which was paid at the rates of Rs. 20 and Rs. 25
was reduced to Rs, 10 and the balance amalgamated with pay. This allowance of Rs. 10 was further amalgamated with pay in the revision of 1922, but it was allowed to be continued in the case "of out-door staff. The Standing Committee under their Resolution No 8772, dated the 19th December 1923, resolved that excepting appointments where the total emoluments did not exceed Rs. 40 per month, the Extra-ordinary allowance should cease on promotion to higher grades or where existing grades or salaries were improved, as well as in all cases of new or newly created appointments. In the case of employees whose emoluments did not exceed Rs. 40 the grain compensation allowance, the war allowance and the local allowance were all consolidated and "called "Extra-ordinary Allowance " as the circumstances under which those allowances were originally granted had not changed.

## 321. By their Resolution No. 11092, dated the 26th February

 1924, the Corparation requested the Re trenchment Committee to report whether the Extra-ordinary allowance of 10 per cent. and the allowance granted to all Municipal employees drawing pay between Rs. 200 and Rs. 600 per month should not be disallowed with effect from 1st March 1924, in the case of new incumbents and of those who were promoted and whether in the case of the present staff it should not be merged in their pay, as far as possible, within the scale of their present grade. The question was referred to the Retrenchment Adviser under Corporation Resolution No. 5779, dated the 4th September 1924. Mr. N. D. Mehta, who was the Retrenchment Officer under him, suggested the merging of the Extra-ordinary allowance in the pay in some cases and the granting of personal allowance in other cases to prevent loss to the employees concerned. This recommendation was approved by Corporation Resolution No. 15696, dated the 29th March 1926.322. The question of discontinuing the Extra-ordinary Allowance in the case of the remaining emDiscontinuance of Estran ployees (those getting below Rs. 200) was ordinary Allowance in considered by a Sub-Committee of the
the remaining cases. Standing Committee. It recommended that the allowance drawn by all Municipal employees including labourers, but excepting peons and menials, should cease on promotion to a higher grade or on the grant of increments in the same grade, to the extent of the amount of the allowance, and that in.
cases where either by promotion or by grant of increments in the same grade the incumbents were not benefited to the extent of the allowance, the difference should be treated as Personal Allowance. The Sub-Committee further recommended that new comers should be given the substantive pay of the grade and that in the case of peons and menials, the allowances should be merged in their pay, their grades being correspondingly increased. This recommendation was approved by the Standing Committee under their Resolution No. 5606, dated the 25th August 1926.
(b) Dearness Allowance given to Municipal workers during the present War.
323. Dearness Allowance came to be given during the present War with effect from lst January 1940. Its in-

Dearnest Allowance during the preient War. crease and extension to various ranges of salaries from time to time is shown below in a tabulated statement:-

| Authority. | Limit of pay. | From which date. | Rate in the case of employees on monthly wages | Rate in the case of employees on daily wages. |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Corporation Resolution No. 1226, dated the | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Rs. } \\ & 50 \end{aligned}$ | 1.1.1940 | $\begin{gathered} \text { Rs. a. po } \\ 200 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{array}{c\|c} \text { Rs. a. } \\ 0 & 1 \\ \hline \end{array}$ |
| 26th February 1940. |  |  |  |  |
| Corporation Resolution No. 1104, dated the 5 th March 1942. | 50 | 1-1-1942 | 30 | 0110 |
| Corporation Resolution No. 518 , dated the | 100 | 1-7-1942 | 50 | 030 |
| 15th September 1942. <br> do. | 100 | 1-9-1942 | 78 | 4 |
| Corporation Resolution No. 968, dated the | 200 | 1-1-1943 | 100 | 060 . |
| 21 st January 1943. |  |  |  |  |
| Corporation Resolution No. 331, dated the | 200 | 1-5-1943 | 140 | 087 |
| Corporation Resolution No. 907, dated the | 300 | 1-12-1943 | 160 | 0.10 |
|  | 300 | 1-4.1944 | 180 | 0113 |
| Corporation Resolution Nos. 905 and 907. dated the Ilth January 1945. |  | 1.1-1945 | 220 | 013 |
| Do. do. do. | Above Rs 180 and upto Rs. 1,000 | $\{1.7 .1944\}$ |  |  |

324. The Dearness Allowance now paid thus works out to 88 percent. of the salary in the case of peons, halalPercentage of Dearnesa khores, scavengers and a number of other emAllowance to the Salary ployees whose basic salary is Rs. 25 per month and it goes on diminishing in the higher ranges of salaries until it.
reaches 10 per cent. As against this, the rise in the cost of living from the base of August 1939 has been 135 per cent. Dearmess Allowance in the Textile mills, the B. E. S. \& T. Company and the Gas Company is linked to the cost of the living index and thus it is based more scientifically.
(c) Dearness Allowance in Textile mills and the B.E.S. \& T. Company.
325. In January 1940, when the effects of the War, on the prices Girni Kamgar Union's of food stuffs began to be felt, the Cirni demand for increase in Kamgar Union demanded an increase of 40 wages. . per cent. The cost of living then stood at 114. A dispute having arisen over this demand, the Government of Bombay appointed a Conciliation Board with Sir Sajba Rangnekar kt. as Chairman. The Board could not bring about any settlement. The majority of the Board, however, held that as the cost of living had risen by about 13 per cent. over the pre-war standards a flat rate of annas 2 per day. for each worker or Rs, $3-4-0$ per month (a month being calculated at 26 working days) to cover the variations in the cost of living from 105 to 123 was called for. This allowance was to be given to all drawing wages upto Rs. 150 per month. The Mills were also asked to open cost price grain shops; the latter amenity gave a benefit of 3 per cent.
326. A similar dispute having arisen over the demand made B. E. S. T. Co's by the B. E.S. \& T. Company's employees Employees' demand for for a Dearness Allowance, Government Dearness Allowance. appointed a Board of Conciliation with Sir Govind Madgaonker Kt. as Chairman. This Board recommended in April 1940 a Dearness Allowance at a flat rate of Rs. 4 per month to employees drawing a salary upto Rs. 100 per month and at the rate of As. 2 and pies 6 to each daily wage earner. The Company did not accept this recommendation and gave instead only. Rs. 2 to allemployees drawing a salary upto Rs. 50 per month. In June 1940, this was increased to Rs. 3 and extended to salaries upto Rs. 100. A daily worker was given $1 \frac{1}{2}$ annas per day.
327. In July 1941, the cost of living index having risen to 126 , Sliding Scale adopted the Covernment of Bombay urged the Mill,
by the Mill ${ }^{2}$. Assacietion. , link it up with the rise in the cost of living. The scale adopted by the Association roughly gives an increase of
annas 3 to 4 for each rise in the Index number of the cont of living, starting from Rs. 4-8-0 with the Index No. at 124. The cost of the living index in June 1945. mas 235 and accordingly the Dearness Allowance paid for that month was Rs. 30-13-0.
328. The B.E.S.T. Company also adopted a sliding scale Sliding scale in the B.E. and linked it up with the rise S. \&T.company. in the cost-of-living index number. Their scale started with an allowance of Rs. 3-2-0 when the Index Number was 121 and increased at the rate of annas 2 to 3 with each rise in the Index Number. It further provided that if the Index Number rose above 135 no additional payment should be made and if it fell below 121 the allowance of Rs. 3 per month, which was being paid up to June 1941, should be paid until the Index Number fell below 105. In May 1942, the Index Number having risen to 142 , a demand was made by the Company's employees for further increase in the Dearness Allowance and, a dispute having arisen over this demand, Sir Robert Broomfield kt., was appointed as Adjudicator. He recommended the extension of the sliding scale then in force to cover the rise in the cost-of-living index from 135 to 143 , but held that the Company's employees were not entitled to the scale adopted by the Mill-Owners' Association for mill operatives as the Company's employees were compensated by certain amenities and welfare benefits not granted to them. A further dispute arose over the payment of Dearness allowance to daily wage earners who claimed Rs. 3 per month as against Rs. 2-7.0 got by them at the rate of $1 \frac{1}{2}$ annas per day for 26 working days and Dr. Alama Latifi was appointed to adjudicate. He upheld the demands of the employees. In 1944, the Company's servants demanded that they should be paid Dearness allowance on the Mill-Owners' Association's scale (they were then getting only two-thirds of the scale) and the dispute having been-referred to Mr. E.M. Nanavutty, I.c.s. (Retd.), he decided im favour of the Company's servants*:
329. The average wage of a textile worker in Bombay is, as How the Dearness already stated, reported to be Rs. 32-8-0 and Allowance paid by the the Dearness allowance paid to him in June Municipality comparos 1945 amounted to Rs. $30-13$ - 0 , that is, 94.8 by others.
by the Municipality to its peons, halalkhores, etc., whose

[^26]basic salary is Rs. 25, which comes to 88 per cent. of the salary. It would thus appear that the Dearness allowance paid by the Municipality to the lower staff is more or less on a level with that paid by the Mills and the B.E.S.T. Co . and the Bombay Cas Co. which are commercial and profit making concerns. It is certainly more favourable than that paid by the Government of Bombay to their employees, namely Rs. 18. To higher officers, the Bombay Covernment were paying 10 per cent. of their salaries as in the Bombay Municipality, but it is understood that Government have increased this percentage to 171 $\frac{1}{2}$ I do not propose any increase in the Dearness allowance in view of the increase in the substantive salaries that I am sug gesting in this report.
330. There is one point in this connection which needs to be considered. The Municipal Peons' Union have demanded the opening of cost price grain shops. The Bombay Gas Company has also got such shops. Such shops are reported to be conferring only 3 per cent benefit*. This demand has now lost much of its force on account of the prices of the chief commodities being controlled and the commodities being available at any Covernment or Covernment approved shop. For the Municipality now to open such shops seems to be of doubtful advantage. On the other hand, it would cause definite inconvenience to the workers especially as they are distributed all over the City and the Municipality cannot open more than a few shops-say one in each ward. The Municipal workers will thus be required to cover long distances from their place of work and much time may be wasted by them in this process to the detriment of Municipal work. Moreover, any such benefits of an indirect nature are less likely to be appreciated by the workers than any direct cash benefits in the form of Dearness allowance or increase in pay. If the demand is on the other hand for subsidized grain shops, whereby the workers can get food stuffs at less than the cost price, the cost of organising the scheme would be enormous and disproportionate to the advantages that may be derived by the Municipal workers thereunder. Further, it would not be possible for the Municipality to obtain food-stuffs at their source as in the case of the Railway administrations. It may be mentioned that the Municipality had in the year 1943 opened cheap

[^27]
## 161

grain shops when there was real difficulty in getting food-stuffs at a fair and reasonable price, but with the introduction of rationing - and price control by Covernment, the shops were discontinued, and the need for reopening the shops does not now exist.

## PART IV

## CHAPTER XXXIV

## Service Conditions.

331. Service conditions are " articles of service " by which an What service condi- employee is governed during the period of tions imply. his employment. They cover a wide range and include (1) Wages, (2) Hours of work, (3) Overtime, (4) Weekly off, (5) Conduct and discipline, (6) Leave, (7) Permanency, (8) Provident Fund, (9) Housing, (10) Provision of uniforms or working suits, (11) Provision of free medical aid, (12) Sickness and Health Insurance and (13) Any other amenities that may be provided by the employer for the welfare and amelioration of the workers. Of late, the term " service conditions" has acquired a new meaning at the hands of Labour Unions. Service conditions are regarded not so much as conditions by which an employee is bound as conditions by which an employer ought to be bound. In other words, they are considered as worker's rights and master's duties.
332. In this connection, the Municipal Workers' Union, the Representations of the Bombay Municipal Kamgar Sangh, the Unions

Bombay Municipal Peons and Lascars Union and the K.E.M. Hospital and G. S. M. College Employees' Union made certain demands as far back as August and September 1939. Their representations have been referred to me. Their demands when analysed fall almost in the same catagories as those mentioned above. The Bombay Municipal Employeess Union and the Bombay Municipal Peons Union (which was originally the Bombay Municipal Peons' and Lascars' Union) have also submitted to me their representations making certain demands.
(1) Wages.
333. The Municipal Workers' Union have demanded a minimum wage of Rs. 35; the Municipal Kamgar Sangh a minimum wage of Rs. 35 for workers doing unclean work and Rs. 30 for those who do clean work. The Municipal Peons and Lascars' Union, and the K.E.M. Hospital and G.S.M. College Employees' Union ask for a minimum wage of Rs. 30. Some of these Unions have asked for graded
scales and equal pay for both men and women. As these questions have been dealt with by me in Chapter III, I do not propose to cover the same ground here.
(2) Hours of work.
334. The Bombay Municipal Kamgar Sangh have demanded that no worker should be required to work for more than 8 hours a day. The K.E.M. demanded 8 hours' work. The Bombay Municipal Employees Union and the Bombay Municipal Peons Union have asked for 8 hours day. Thus all the Unions dernand 8 hours day.

The existing hours of work for different classes of employees Hoars of work in are as under:operation
(1) Clerical and Superior staff -.. 7 hours on week days except Saturday
(2) Jemilars, Havaldars, Naika and Peons
(3) Conservancy staff
$\checkmark$ (4) Engineering Department
Asphalt plant and Crusher (governed by 9 hours on week days except Saturday Factorics Act). and 6 hours on Saturduy.
Night watchmen on works
... 15 to 16 hours
(5) Water Works Department
... 9 hours
(6) Hospitals and Maternity Homes-
... $7 \frac{1}{2}$ hours and 8 hours on altermate day.
.. 8 to 10 hours and 12 hours in some cases.
... $1 \frac{1}{1}$ hours but no contimaoualy.
... 8 hours on week days except Saturday 5 hours on Saturday.
... 8 hours on week daye, it hours on Sunday.
...' 9 hours a day.
(a) Arthur Road Houpttal
(b) Maratha Hospital
(c) K.E.M. Hoapilal-Nurres
... 8 hours.
... 8 hours.

## Labourers

(d) Maternity HomeonNuryea
... 8 to 9 hours.
$\sqrt{ } \quad$ Night duty Nurset
.. 12 hours.
(8) Municipal Printing Prem (governed by 8 hours a day Fsctocies Act.)
(b) Maratha Hospital
hours a day
... 7 hours on week days except Salurday; 4 hours on Suturday.
335. In India, legislation limiting hours of work is compara-

Hours of work pro tively recent. The first Factories Act of 1881 seribed ander the face merely limited the hours of work of children. tories Act. etc. The next Factories Act of 1891 limited the hours of work of women. The Factories Act of 1911 limited the maximum hours of work for men in Textile factories to 12 , for women in all factories to 11 , for children under 14 to 6 hours in

Textile factories and to 7 in other factories. Subsequent Factories Acts of 1922, 1923, 1926 and 1934 have further modified the hours of work. In 1931, the Royal Commission on Labour recommended 54 hours a week although Labour Unions had demanded 8 hours a day or 48 hours a week** The present position under the Factories Act is a maximum of 10 hours a day or 54 hours a week for men as well as women and 5 hours for children.
336. The Bombay Shops and Establishments Act prescribes Hours of work pre- $9 \frac{1}{2}$ hours a day for Shop Assistants, 208 hours geribed under the Shops a month (which work out to 8 hours a day and Establishments Act. taking 26 working days in a month) for employees in Commercial Establishments and 10 hours a day for workers in Restaurants and Hotels. This is a recent legislation enacted in 1939 and brought into force in 1941. The position of Shop Assistants elsewhere is slightly better. In Danzig, it is 8 hours per day or 48 hours per week, in Kenya 9 hours per day or 50 hours per week, in Tanganyika 54 hours a week, and in British Honduras 45 hours a week. In Egypt it is 9 hours a day, in Belgium, Denmark and Cuba it is 8 hours a day or 48 hours a week, in Germany, Italy and Japan during Fascist or Nazi regime it was more than 9 hours per day or 54 hours per week, and in Ceylon it is 9 hours per day or 50 hours per week.
337. In this connection it will be interesting to refer to the report published by the International Labour Reduction of hours of Office styled 'Generalisation of the reduction of Hours of Work'. A whole section has been devoted to the gradual application of the regulations. It says that the transition from the present limits of hours to those which it is proposed to include in the draft regulation, for instance, from 48 to 40 hours a week, may involve considerable difficulties if carried through suddenly and without due notice. These difficulties may be economic in character or may relate to a possible shortage of equipment, etc. These difficulties would be overcome if adequate notice were given of the change and if the reduction of hours were effected by stages. The principle is copied into the Reduction of Hours of Work Convention, 1937, which provides that the competent authority may approve of a transitional arrangement, in virtue of which reduction of hours of work to the limits referred to may be accomplished by stagest.

[^28]338. It will thus be seen that except in the case of night watch* men on works in the Engineering Departments; Night Duty Nurses in Maternity Homes and some staff in the K.E.M. Hospital and the labour staffin the Markets Department, the hours of work of the Municipal staff generally compare favourably with those provided either in the Factories Act or the Shops and Establishments Act. $I$ recommend that Nurses should be given not more than 8 hours work and they should be made to work in 3 shifts of 8 hours each during a period of 24 hours. As regards others, their hours of work should be reduced to 9. It should be borne in mind that the hours mentioned above are nominal and not actual as the Labour staff, in a number of cases, is found to be wasting its time in smoking, loitering and drinking tea frequently during this period with the result that the total number of hours actually devoted to work are often much less. It is, of course, true that International Labour Organizations have urged for the adoption of 48 hours a week. In fact Article 427 of the Treaty of Versailles mentions this as the standard to be aimed at. This standard is no doubt an ideal one, although in some countries 44 hours a week or even 40 hours a week are in operation. But in a measure like this there should be concerted action by all employers. Reduction in the hours of work if not followed by corresponding increase in efficiency is bound to lead to reduction in wages.
339. The employees affected by the limitation of the hours of '

Financial effect work to 9 hours will be the nurses on night duty, night-watchmen on works.) Markets department labour staff and the labour staff in the K.E.M. Hospital. The labour staff of the Market department has been given special pay ranging from Rs. 2 to 3 each for working beyond the normal working hours (vide Standing Committee Resolution No. 1100 , dated the 8th November 1944, and No. 1751, dated the 14th February 1945). FAs regards the other staff, the extra cost involved in giving relief as suggested will not be appreciable.
(3) Overtime.
340. The Bombay Municipal Kamgar Sangh have asked for overtime at double the ordinary rate. The Demands of the Unions. Bombay Municipal Employees' Union and the Bombay Municipal Peons' Union have asked for overtime in proportion to the work put in for extra hours. The Bombay Municipal Peons' and Lascar's Union have demanded
overtime at $1 \frac{1}{2}$ times the usual rate. The demand for payment for overtime thus ranges from the ordinary rate to double the rate.
341. Overtime is at present given to the following staff at the rates shown against them :-
Existing rates of Over-
time.

| Name of department. | Class of persons to whon Overtime is given. | Remarks. |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| (I) City Engineer and Hydraulic Engineer. | Inspectors, Sub-Overseers, Mistries, Labourers, Artisans, Motor-drivers and Cleaners. | At ordinary rates of wages. |
| (2) Hydra lic Engineer | Labour staff in Salsette, Kasheli and Mandola Division maintenance staffInspectors, Sub-Overseers and Labour staff. Inspectorial staf, Mistries, etc.. on Loan works. | At $1 \frac{1}{2}$ times. |
| (3) City Engineer- <br> (a) Works Branch | Sub-Overseers, Mistries, Mukadams, Fitters, Labourers, etc. | $1 \frac{1}{2}$ times of pay. |
| (b) Workshops ... | Overseers. Artisans such as Fitters and other Mechanics, etc. | Do. |
| (c) Kurla-Deonar Railway. | Unloading staff at Kurla-Deonar ... | $1 \frac{1}{2}$ times of pay and dearness allowance. |

The limit of overtime amount payable is not to exceed ordinary daily wages or the rate of salary usually earned on any particular day, i.e., if an employee's daily wage is Re. I, he is permitted to work overtime only to such an extent as would enable him to earn a maximum of Re. I extra per day as overtime. Attention may be invited in this connection to the Municipal Commissioner's report underlying Standing Committee Resolution No. 5606. dated the 4th October 1933.
342. Reporting on the proposal made by the Labour Unions to pay overtime at $\frac{1}{2}$ or twice the ordinary Commissioner's viewn. pay, the Commissioner in his letter No. A.E. 607, dated the 5th April 1940, states that it is not possible to adopt a uniform scale of payment for all the employees as the nature of work done and the risk and personal discomfort involved in carrying it out beyond the normal working hours are not the same in all cases. The scale of overtime has, therefore, to be fixed in accordance with these two factors.. The Commissioner thinks that the existing orders are fair and equitable and need no modification.
343. The International Convention on overtime payment

Labour Commission's provided that overtime shall be paid at $1 \frac{1}{4}$ recommendation. times of the regular rate. The Royal Commission on Labour recommended that work in excess of 54 hours
a week shouid be paid at $1 \frac{1}{4}$ rate of the ordinary pay and that in excess of 60 hours at $1 \frac{1}{2}$ times*. The Indian Factories Act also provides for payment at $1 \frac{1}{4}$ times the ordinary rate for excess hours. The Shops and Establishments Act makes a similar provision. In view of these provisions, I do not think there is any case for modifying the existing orders regarding payment for overtime.
344. It is, however, necessary to limit the duration of overtime.

Duration of overtime. All the International Conventions, on the subject, provide for an annual allowance. Some of the countries have adopted this suggestion as for example France, Poland, Austria and Norway ; in other countries an overtime not exceeding 2 hours a day is provided as in Italy, Bulgaria, Chile, Germany and Latvia. Overtime is not limited by legislation in Denmark, India, New Zealand and the Union of South P frica, It is necessary in the interest of the health of the Municipal employees to prescribe a maximum period for overtime. This may be on daily, monthly or annual basis according to the expediencies and needs of each department.
> 345. Overtime, however, should as far as possible be discouraged, except where it is absolutely necessary, as there is always a tendency on the part of labour to slacken work during regular hours in order to earn overtime. Overtime may be justified only in cases where employees after working hard during regular hours have not been able to finish the work and the nature of the unfinished work is such that it cannot be postponed to the next day. Amongst the claimants to over-tirne there are two classes-one doing field or mechanical work falling in the above category and the other doing merely indoor work in office. If the latter have to wait occasionally a little longer than the prescribed office hours, it is only because some urgent work has to be finished. I do not think that this class of employees should be given overtime, except in very special circumstances, where they have usually to wait long after the office hours. In such cases the officers responsible should meke out a case for such payment or avoid hardship, if any, to the employees concerned by asking them to attend a little late to compensate them for sitting late.

[^29](4) Weekly Off.
346. The Bombay Municipal Peons and Lascars' Union have Demands of the Unions asked that all employees should get a compulsory holiday once a week.
347. The clerks, peons and such other staff already get a Existing practice. weekly holiday. The employees engaged on the Engineering Department's works get a day of in a week as the works are closed on Sundays. Night watchmen in that department do not get a day off, but the Commissioner in his letter No. A.E.607, dated the 5th April 1940, states that arrangements can be made to relieve them once a week. The Conservancy staff is allowed a half day off on Sundays. Certain staff in the K.E.M. Hospital and the Markets Department get no weekly off.
348. As regards Conservancy staff, the Commissioner states that it is not desirable to give one day off in a week on account of the nature of the work to be done by them. Owing to the present practice of giving a half day off to this staff on Sundays, the streets, gullies and roads are not swept with the result that complaints are received regarding the insanitary condition of gullies and streets on Sunday afternoons. If the conservancy work is stopped both in the morning and in the evening on any one day in a week, the roads and streets will be practically littered with rubbish and thegullies would be a source of nuisance to public health. Moreover, the work of collecting and removing the refuge on the day following the off day would be abnormally heavy, which would entail great difficulties in cleaxing and removing it subsequently. As regards the K.E.M. Hospital and G.S. Medical College staff, the Commissioner states that the College labour staff like Liftmen, Hamals, Servants and Sweepers have to attend to their duties on Sundays and other Gazetted holidays for 3 hours in the moming, i.e., up to 10 A.M. (B.T.) to clean the premises; only one servant attends the office from 10 A.M. to 5 P.M. by turns; that a sweeper attends again in the afternoon for about an hour; that if the work of cleaning the College is finished before 10 a.m. the labour staff are allowed to go off duty before 10 A.M: (Bombay Time). In the case of the Hospital staff, like Ward Attendants, Sweepers, Hamals, Barbers, the Nurses Home staff, etc., they have to attend the Hospital on Sundays and all Public holidays. Employees like Dressers, Theatre Attendants,

Ambulance Attendants, Post-mortem Attendants and the Ice Mechanic attend their duty on Sundays, but are relieved earlier after their daily work is finished. Malies as well as the mechanical staff are allowed off duty on Sundays regularly.: 'Tailors are allowed one whole day off on Sundays. In the case of Ward Attendants and Sweepers, who have to attend to patients in the Hospital it is not possible to allow them a day off in the week. If they have to take a day off, they are granted casual leave for the day. As regards the Markets Department, the Commissioner states that the Markets are required to be kept clean at all times from early morning till late at night due to constant traffic. It is, therefore, not possible to grant one day off in a week to the labour staff.
349. The principle of giving a weekly rest was adopted by the International Labour Convention in 1921
Provisione $u$ ader and it was ratified in India in 1923. But the different emactments. long before this, the Factories Act of 1891 provided for a compulsory weekly holiday. The Bombay Shops and Establishments Act of 1939 also provides for a weekly holiday to employees covered by the Act. It would, therefore, seem anachronistic, particularly for a progressive and enlightened body like the Bombay Municipality, to continue to deny this privilege to its staff. The Royal Commission on Labour says that " a reasonable amount of spare time away from the factory is indispensable for the building up of citizenship, for the development of life, as opposed to mere existence, and for the maintenance of physical efficiency*"
350. I am, therefore, of opinion that all the Municipal staff

## Recommendations.

should be granted a weekly day off. When a common holiday for all the workers in the same department is not possible, as in the case of Conservancy staff or the staff at the Hospitals or Markets, I recommend that they should be given one day of in batches by rotation. This may necessitate employment of additional staff roughly equivalent to one-seventh of the staff that is now denied the privilege. This is a legitimate demand the grant of which should not be grudged on the ground of additional cost. This measure is sure to increase efficiency in the work of the staff concerned,
351. This proposal would involve an extra expenditure of Rs. $4,87,012$ per annum on the cost of Establishment and of Rs. 54,112 per annum on Leave and Provident Fund.

Labour Commission Keport 1931, p. 40.

## (5) Conduct and Discipline.

352 This includes regularity in attendance, working Importance of discipline according to instructions and good behaviour
in administration. towards colleagues and superiors. Discipline is the linchpin of every administration. It is essential in any labour force. Without it efficiency and timely execution of work would be impossible. Breach of regularity or discipline is visited with warning or cancellation of casual leave or punishment by way of fines, suspension or dismissal according to the gravity of the offence.

353 As regards the system of levying fines, the Bombay Complainte aguinst the Municipal Kamgar Sangh suggest that it system of finen. should be done away with. They complain that fines are imposed merely on the report of the Mukadams or the Timekeepers without verification by any proper and just method and that the system is much in vogue in the Health department. They point out that Section 8 of the Payment of Wages Act 1936 lays down certain procedure before inflicting a fine and that this procedure is not followed in the Municipality. They add that coming late up to 10 muster calls is condoned, but as there are four musters every day, it means that late coming only for $2 \frac{1}{2}$ days out of 26 working days is excused. The Sangh further complain that the system of taking muster four times a day is vexatious and must be improved.

354 . Reporting on this question, the Commissioner in his letter No. A.E.607; dated the 5th April 1940,
Proondon tollowed by states that, as a general rule, fines are inflicted in very rare cases after making full inquiry and after giving the employee an opportunity to defend himself. In a majority of cases, the fines are nominal. The employees of the Conservancy Branch being illiterate do not attend to their duties properly and sometimes disobey the orders of the Supervisors. Discipline is absolutely necessary if Conservancy work is to be carried out properly. Warnings are given from time to time to the defaulters and fines inflicted only as a last resort. The practice of inflicting fines in this Branch is as follows:-
(a) The employees are required to attend the muster at the time the roll is called out. If employees are absent at the muster time, crosses are marked in the muster against their names and action is not taken if the number of such crosses
in a month does not exceed 10 . A fine at the rate of 1 anna per cross is inflicted for every cross exceeding the above limit.
(b) A fine of annas 8 is inflicted if an employee is absent for half a day. A fine of annas 4 to Re. 1 is inflicted according to the seriousness of the offence such as leaving the beat before time, disobedience of orders, negligence of work, etc.
The Commissioner observes that the allegation that 10 to 15 per cent of the wages of the workers are sometimes taken up by fines is not correct.

355 As regards the question of applying the payment of Wages

Difficultios of applying urovisions of the Payment of Wages Act.

Act (India Act No. IV of 1936) to Municipal employes, the Commissioner points out that Sub-section (4) of Section 1 of the Act applies to payment of wages to persons employed in any factory or to persons employed (otherwise than in a factory) upon any Railway either directly or through a contractor. Under Sub-section (5) of the same Section, the Local Government has the power to extend the provisions of the Act to payment of wages to any class of persons employed in any industrial establishment. The Act is thus intended to regulate the payment of wages to certain classes of persons employed in industry and cannot be made applicable to Municipal employees. The Commissioner further points out that, under Section 5 of the Act, the employees are to be paid before the 10th of each month and under Section 8(4) the total amount of fine is not to exceed an amount equal to half an anna in the rupee of the wages payable to an employee. If the Act is made applicable to all the Municipal employees, it will be necessary to expedite the preparation of monthly pay bills for which additional staff will be required by the different departmental officers. In the Chief Accountant's Department additional staff will be necessary for auditing the pay bills and for making disbursements so as to admit of payments being made before the 10th of each month. The Commissioner is of opinion that the additional expenditure on this account will be out of proportion to the benefits to be derived and, therefore, he is not in favour of the proposed change.

356 The question, whether the system of levying fines should be abrogated or not, has been discussed by the Labour Commission. It observes that "fines constitute the commonest form of deduction (from wages), the one which is most open to abase, and
there is some justification, for the view that it should be made illegal. But the main purpose of fining, namely, the maintenance of efficiency and discipline is legitimate and if fines are abolished, other means must be employed for securing this end. It is necessary, therefore, to consider the possible alternatives. One large Company informed us that it had practically eliminated fining and we found on enquiry that the practice of suspension had taken its place. Suspension would, however, involve for the workers greater hardship than a system of fines. The main argument always adduced in favour of fines is that the worker would rather be fined than dismissed. The wider resort to dismissal and to the threat of dismissal, which follow the fines might result in a greater hardship and tend to aggravate the workers' sense of insecurity. It would also give rise to more resentment ".. The Commission, therefore, do not recommend the abolition of fines by law, but suggest that the employers should do their utmost to reduce them to a minimum. They suggest legislation for regulating Suggestions bythe Royal fines to prevent the abuse of the system on Commission on Labour. four broad principles: first, the payment of fine should not be spread over a period of more than one month; second, that the maximum amount deducted in fines should not in any month exceed half an anna in the rupee of the workers' earnings ; third that the sum received from fines should be credited to a purpose beneficial to the employees as a whole; and fourth that in order to give workers some security against arbitrary fines, employers should be required to specify the acts or omissions in respect of which a fine may be levied. These suggestions are worthy of adoption.

357 By Bombay Act VII of 1921, the Municipal Act has been Constitution of the Fines amended, whereby it is provided that fines Fund under the Municipal imposed on Municipal Officers and servants Act. shall be credited to a separate fund to be called "the Fines Fund", and that the proceeds thereof shall be expended in promoting the well-being of Municipal Officers and servants. This provision was further amended by Bombay Act XIX of 1930 so as to allow for payment of Compassionate Allowance to the widows or other relations of deceased Municipal Officers and servants from the Fund. Welfare centres have since been opened for the benefit of labour, the cost of which is met out of this Fund.

[^30]358 As regards suspension, the Sangh state that the system is Suspensiov and dismissal most prevalent in the Health Department and that men are suspended without bringing out a charge against them. They suggest that a warning should be given before suspension is resorted to. As regards dismissal, the Sangh state that suspension and dismissal are often ordered together ; that dismissal should be resorted to only in case of serious faults. They point out that in the Railway Administration a definite procedure is laid down for suspension and dismissal and that this procedure should be followed by the Municipality.

359 Reporting on this question, the Commissioner in his
Procodure followed by letter No. A.E.607, dated the 5th April 1940, the departmenta. observes that the following Standing Order has been issued by him for dealing with cases of misconduct, neglect of duty, etc. "If there is sufficient material to proceed against a subordinate an order of suspension may be passed. An enquiry should then be made without delay and charges framed against the subordinate concerned. A charge sheet should be given to him unless he happens to be a menial servant and his explanation recorded. An opportunity should invariably be given to cross-examine any of the witnesses, who have made statements against him, and to adduce evidence in his defence. An order should, thereafter, be passed after weighing the evidence both for and against him. In the case of a menial servant it is not necessary to give a charge sheet, but charges should be explained to him and he should be heard before an order is passed. Heads of Departments are requested to see that this procedure is observed by officers competent to take disciplinary or other action against their subordinates."

360 The Commissioner has no objection to the orders of Commissioner's views. of dismissal of an employee being given or by the persons to whom the power of making appointments is delegated by the Commissioner.

A person is usually discharged or dismissed in the following circumstances:-
(1) on conviction by a criminal court.
(2) serious misconduct ;
(3) neglect of duty;
(4) in particular branches--indebtedness;
(5) inefficiency or unsatisfactory service; and
(6) on reduction of establishment.

It is advisable that in the cases of discharge or dismissal the orders should be passed, by the Head of the Department or by some responsible official, to whom the power may be delegated, to safeguard against the arbitrary use of the power.
$361^{-}$The Labour Commission recommends the appointment of
Labour Commis. Labour Ófficers for investigating such sion's views. grievances and suggests that "no such employee should be engaged except by the Labour Officer personally in consultation with departmental heads and none should be dismissed without his consent except by the Manager himself after hearing what the Labour Officer has to say ". The Commission adds that " it should be the business of the Labour Officer to ensure that no employee is discharged 'without adequate cause "-."

362 I would strongly recommend the appointrment of such an
Appointment of officer in the Municipality. All big employers Labour Oficer of labour like the Mills and the Port Trust have appointed such officers. The Labour Officer to be appointed should be a person possessing integrity, personality and energy and should have the gift of understanding and linguistic facility. If he is of the right type, labour will come to regard him as a trusted friend, especially as he will be independent of the department, which proposes to take action against the worker. The Labour Officer should also be placed in charge of the welfare work so that his bonds with labour may be more closely knit and he may be considered as their benefactor. He may be entrusted with the following duties among others:-
(a) To study labour conditions in the Municipality and to suggest schemes for the welfare of labourers;
(b) to investigate into the grievances of the labourers employed by various departments and to bring them to the notice of the Administration :
(c) to establish contact with the Labour Unions and to serve as a liaison officer between the unorganized sections of the labourers and the Municipal executive;
(d) to investigate into and report on such labour questions as may be referred to him by the Cormmissioner or the Heads of Departments.
363 I understand that some of the functions of the Labour Officer are at present performed by the Welfare Organiser. The functions of the Labour Officer set out above are responsible and diverse and cannot be satisfactorily carried out by an Officer of the status of a W'elfare Organiser. I have elsewhere stated that the entire staff of the Welfare Centres should be placed under the control of the Labour Officer who will have to attend to these duties in addition to other duties attaching to his office.

## (6) Leave and Holidays.

364. Leave is of different kinds and includes (a) Casual leave,

Kinde of leave. (b) Privilege leave, (c) Sick leave, (d) Injury leave; (e) Maternity leave, (f) Leave without pay, (g)Studyleave and ( $h$ ) Badclimate leave. TheStanding Committee have framed elaborate rules in the matter, which have been approved by Corporation Resolution No. 2331, dated the 17th June 1929. Holidays include Bank Holidays and Sectional holidays.

## (a) Casual Leave.

365. Casual leave is intended to cover short absences on account of any unforeseen contingency like Coual Lave sudden and brief illness, etc. It is not intended to be taken as an annual holiday. The existing provisions in this matter are as follows:-
(1) All superior staff ... 20 days in a year, but not more than 7 days at a time and 10 days only in very special circumstances.
(2) Peons ... ... Do.
(3) Mukadams and labourers in the Markets Department ... ... Do.
(4) All permanent, temporary and daily paid labour staff ... ... 15 days.

This casual leave is exclusive of 21 days special casual leave granted for Anti-Rabic treatment.

> 366. The Municipal Workers' Union have asked for 20 days' Domands of the Unions casual leave, the Bombay Municipal Kamgar Sangh for at least 21 days' casual leave, and the K. E. M. Hospital and G. S. M. College Employees' Union for 12 days' casual leave.
367. In the Port Trust casual leave upto 20 days is allowed to Scale of Casual Loave employees in superior as well, as inferior inthe Bombay Port Trust service and upto 10 days to all monthly and and Railwaym. daily rated temporary employees, who are contributors to the Trustees' Provident Fund. In. Railways, 10 days casual leave is allowed to the staff.
368. The Factories Act and the Shops' and Establishments Provisions under the Act do not make any provision for such leave. Factories Act and the But the Standing Order No. 12 framed by the Lhopt and Estabioh ${ }^{-1}$ Industrial Court for Cotton Mills in Bombay makes the following provision :-
" An operative may be granted casual leave of absence not exceeding 10 days in the aggregate in a calendar year. Such leave shall not be for more than three days at a time except in case of sickness. Such leave is intended to meet special circumstances which cannot be foreseen. Ordinarily, the previous permission of the Head of the Department shall be obtained before such leave is taken but when this is not possible the Head of the Department shall as soon as practicable be informed in writing of the absence from work and of the probable duration of such absence."

The Textile Labour Inquiry Committee considered these provisions to be adequate. The Thomas Enquiry Committee recommended the same as the maximum standard.*
369. I am of opinion that the existing scale of casual leave Recommendations. should be allowed to continue.

[^31]
## (b) Privilege or Earned Leave.

370. The provisions with regard to this leave are follows:-

Privilege or
carned leave.
Employees in Superior Service. Employees in Inferior service such as Peons etr.


The provisions with regard to new entrants in Column (ii) (i) are more liberal than those recommended by the Thomas Committee $\dagger$ which recommended 30 days leave for 11 months' duty and accumulation of leave upto 60 days in the case of superior staff.

The Bombay Municipal Peons and Lascars Union have represented that in the Engineering Department there are 50 peons' who were originally styled as Lascars, that they were kept on the temporary establishment for years together and deprived of the benefit of leave rules. They have further represented that when they were made permanent, the new leave rules had come into force and that they were thus treated as new employees for purposes of leave; that this injustice should be removed and the Lascars who were in continuobus service from the date prior to 1931 should be given the benefit of old leave rules. As the granting of this request will create new problems and complications I do not think that this request should be granted.

[^32]371. The Municipal Workers' Union have demanded one Demands of the Uniona. month's leave with pay as in Government service. The Municipal Kamgar Sangh have demanded that men and women engaged on unclean work should be brought at least on par with clerks in regard to leave privileges, i.e., one month's leave allowed to them annually. The Municipal Peons and Lascars' Union demand that-
(a) Mistries and Mukadams on daily wages, Death and Birth Karkoons should be admitted to leave benefits.
(b) Inferior staff who now get 15 days leave should be allowed 30 days' leave.
(c) Leave Rules for the superior and the inferior staff should be the same.
The K. E. M. Hospital and C. S. M. College Employees' Union demand 15 days' leave with full pay.
372. It is further urged that no distinction should be made in

Nodistinction to be made the grant of these privileges as between the hetween the permanent
staff and the temporary staff and the temporary
staff in granting leave.
substance in this demand where the temporary staff is borne on the Establishment Schedule for years without making it permanent-say for example when the staff is employed continuously for years on Loan works or as in the case of the Assessment Department the staff employed on the U.I.P. Tax Establishment. In the case of such staff, leave with allowances is not allowed if a substitute is appointed in the leave vacancy. Relief is given in the case of the staff holding a lien on permanent posts and appointed on temporary establishment. But the benefit of such a provision is not allowed to the staff having no lien on any substantive post. It is necessary that this staff should be allowed the same privileges as the permanent staff if necessary by an amendment of the relevant rule. The Thomas Committee appointed to follow up the Retrenchment Committee's work and whose recommendations were thus expected to be less liberal recommended that temporary workers and piece workers who are continuously employed should be permitted to earn leave on average pay to the same extent as permanent servants of corresponding rank, but that in their case no accumulation should be allowed.*

[^33]373. The Shops and Establishments Act makes no provision for annual leave with pay. The Factories Act
Provisions of the Shopa and Establishments Act also contained no such provision hitherto. and the Factories Act. But the Act has been recently amended by the Factories (Amendment) Act of 1945. The amended provisions are to come into effect from Ist January 1946. They provide that every worker who has completed a period of 12 months' continuous service shall be allowed during the subsequent period of twelve months holiday with full pay for a period of ten or, if a child, fourteen consecutive days. Leave not availed of in the succeeding period of twelve months lapses*.

Standing Order No. 11 framed by the Industrial Court for Cotton Mills in Bombay City under Section 26(6) of the Bombay Industrial Disputes Act 1938 provides that service for a total period of twelve months in a mill shall qualify an operative for a total period of one month's leave with or without pay according to the terms of contract, custom or usage of the mill and that the grant of such leave shall depend on the exigencies of the mill and shall be at the discretion of the company. $\dagger$
374. Most countries of the world have now developed systems of granting holidays with pay to certain classes of workers. The Report of the International Labour Office to the Twenty-fifth Session of the International Labour Conference of 1939 states that no movement is more symbolical of the change taking place in the standard of life than the rapid extension of holidays with pay. It adds that "this movement to which the International Labour Conference gave a fresh stimulus by the adoption of the Holidays with Pay Convention of 1936, is based on a recognition of the needs of the worker as a human being and not merely an instrument of production. The fact that in some countries workers are now entitled to a fortnight's holiday with pay is one of the outstanding triumphs of social advance. The rapidity with which this movement has spread is remarkable. In 1920, only one country had adopted legislation providing paid holidays for wage earners in industry and commerce. In 1925 five countries had done so, in 1930 seven, in 1935 fourteen and in 1939 twenty three." $\S$ In most of the countries that have adopted legislation in this matter the period of leave varies from one week or less to a fortnight or more, the most common

[^34]period being one week. The qualifying period is generally a year's service.
375. Leave at periodical intervals relieves physical and mental strain to which labour is subjected while at work and leads eventually to efficiency, stability and contentment of the staff. I am, therefore, of opinion that all employees in Municipal service whether permanent or temporary, provided they are in continuous service for more than 22 months and are not likely to be discharged should be entitled to 30 days' leave with full pay for 22 months' duty.
376. Under Standing Committee Resolution No. 122, dated the 25th April 1945, and Corporation Resolution No. 140, dated the 14th June 1945, I have been asked to report on the question of giving the benefit of the old Leave Rules to

Question of giving the benefit of old leave rules to employees who joined Municipal service before 2lst June 1937. the employees who joined Municipal service before 21st June 1937 (the date on which the Revised Leave Rules were adopted by the Corporation.) This question must be viewed in its proper context. Application of new leave rules is on par with the question of application of new scales of pay. In 1930, the Corporation asked the Standing Committee to report on the question of reducing the salaries of Municipal Officers and servants. When the matter was under the consideration of the Standing Committee, the Commissioner in his letter, No. M.C. 21-B, dated the 21st May 1931, reported that the question of reduction of the scales of future recruits to all branches of the Municipal service required careful consideration and suggested that it should be considered by a small Committee in consultation with the Commissioner and Heads of the Departments concerned. At the same time, he pointed out that the Corporation had adopted, since Ist April 1929, leave rules, which were based on Covernment Fundamental Rules. It had been generally recognised that in the matter of the grant of leave to subordinates and menials these rules were far more liberal than those they replaced. In the case of Government servants, who joined service after lst June 1929, Government had reduced the maximum period of leave per year as well as in the whole service. The Municipal Service Rules required to be revised not only in this direction, but also more radically. The grant of the privilege of leave on full average salary was being ávailed of by the menials to the fullest extent and the further privilege of leave on full average salary on Medical certificate
which they did not enjoy under the old rules, was being abused by Municipal servants going to their villages and producing certificates from Vaids, Hakims, and medical practitioners, whose certificates, could not be relied on. The Commissioner, therefore, suggested that the question of the modification of the leave rules should also be considered by the Committee proposed by him. He also suggested that, in the meantime, in order to avoid the legal difficulty with which the Municipality was now faced all new recruits to all branches of the Municipal service should be taken up on the distinct understanding that their pay as well as the conditions of service were liable to be modified in a direction less favourable than those then existing, and that they should agree in writing to join the service on such understanding. This understanding was taken in the form of a Bond. This suggestion was approved by the Standing Committee Resolution No. 2660, dated the 24th June 1931, and Corporation Resolution No. 3495, dated the 16th July 1931.

## 377. This system of taking bonds was continued till 1935, Reasons for distinction. when the Corporation, by their Resolution No. 440, dated the 23rd September 1935, asked the Law, Revenue and General Purposes Committee

 to report as to whether this system should not be discontinued as the Corporation were of opinion that the phraseology and the conditions in the draft undertaking were humiliating and derogatory to the status and dignity of a public administration like the Bombay Municipal Corporation. Reporting on the question, the Commissioner in his letter, No. A.E. 4983-S.R., dated the 2nd March 1936, observed that as the grades for new entrants had been revised and the question of revising service regulations for new entrants was under consideration, he did not see the necessity of taking any bond from the employees and that, therefore, he had ordered it to be discontinued. This report was recorded by the Corporation (vide Law, Revenue and Ceneral Purposes Committee Resolution No. 233, dated the 23rd March 1936, confirmed by Corporation Resolution No. 110, dated the 4th May 1936). The revised grades of salaries were sanctioned by Corporation Resolution No. 819, dated the 4th March 1935, and the revised rules for new entrants by Corporation Resolution No. 182, dated the 21st June 1937. For the purposes of application of revised grades, a Municipal employee in continuous service even from a date prior to 16th July, 1931 is treated as a new entrant on promotion to higher grades. For purposes of Revised Leave Rules, employees who enteredMunicipal service for the first time on or after 16th July 1931, as well as those who were in Municipal service, whether in a permanent or other capacity on or before 16th July 1931, and in whose service there was a break after that date, are treated as new entrants. Thus the latter cannot have any grievance.
378. It is urged by the employees, who joined the service after the 16th July 1931, but before the date of the Corporation's sanction to the revised rules, Employees' view point. that they should be given the benefit of old leave rules in spite of the intimation to them at the time of employment that their conditions of pay and service, would be less favourable, as the Rules were not actually passed by the Corporation upto 2 Ist June 1937. This question was dealt with by the Commissioner, the Standing Committee and the Corporation on several occasions in the past and the request was tumed down.
379. Reporting on the question again, the Commissioner in his letter No.AE. 588, dated the 20th April 1945, points out that the total No. of employees affected by the proposal comes to about 890 ( 59 Superior and 361 Inferior). If this staff were brought under the old leave rules it would mean a recurring expenditure of Rs. 50,000 per annum. If the proposal were given retrospective effect from 16th July 1931 it would further involve a revision of 890 leave accounts (calculating the leave due under the old leave rules) which would show a larger credit balance on account of accumulated leave of the last 14 years, and that there would be a tendency to abuse the leave concession. He is, therefore, not in favour of the proposal.
380. This is not merely a question of granting a small con. cession to redress a grievance. Apart from the fact that this concession would involve a heavy recurring liability, it involves an important principle. Those employees who entered service after the revised leave rules came into force viz., after the 21 st June 1937 have ungrudgingly accepted the position. If the rules are harsh or severe those who entered the service after the passing of the rules would be justified in asking for their abolition and the application of old rules to them. When such a request comes, it would be difficult for the Corporation to resist it. The revised leave rules were adopted
by the Corporation on the analogy of similar rules passed by Government for their employees. To a certain extent the Municipal service regulations are more liberal than Covernment Rules. If the application of new leave rules to new entrants is a hardship, it is a still greater hardship to apply the new grades even to old employees who were treated as new entrants on promotion to higher grades and were submitted even to voluntary cuts in their old grade. The latter have suffered the loss stoically. It may be argued that if the grades proposed by me are adopted by the Corporation these employees will be sufficiently recompensed. That will be a matter for the future, but the loss suffered by them hitherto cannot be made good, whereas all the accurnulated leave according to old leave rules will be available to the employes who have applied for this concession. I do not therefore think that the Corporation would be well advised to reverse the decision taken by them after due consideration about 15 years ago.

## 381. The Bombay Municipal Peons and Lascars Union have

 demanded that new entrants in inferiorAccumulation of leave in the case of inferior staff. service should be granted the same privileges with regard to leave as are allowed to the new entrants in the superior service, viz., 30 days' leave for 11 months' service and accumulation upto 120 days. I have given careful consideration to this ouestion and think that the present distinction should be continued as peons unlike persons in superior service take fullest advantage of the Casual leave and the Privilege leave allowed to them under the Rules, especially as they can be easily spared without much inconvenience to the office, while in the case of clerical and superior staff such privileges are not fully availed of because in their case it is difficult to spare them without serious inconvenience to the office. Although, therefore, the superior staff is allowed nominally more leave, actually they enjoy much less than peons or absent themselves from duty less frequently. The present provisions are on the lines recommended by the Thomas Committee, viz., 15 dyys' leave in each calendar year, and accumulation upto 30 days.* In this connection the representatives of the Municipal Officials Association urge that the period of 30 days' accumulation should be increased to 45 days I think the request is reasonable and may be granted. This concession may be extended to temporary employees (new entrants) in superior service also.

## (c) Sick Leave.

382 The provisions with regard to sick leave (other than Sick leave. injury leave) are as follows:-
Employees in superior service. Emyloyees in inferior service.

Old Entrants
(i) One month's leave on full average pay on medical certificate for every 11 months ${ }^{\prime}$ duty; leave on average piy allowed upto 1 year during the whole period of service.

New Entrants
(i) Leave on half syerage pay on medical certificate upto a maximum of 12 months during the whole period of service.
(ii) Six months' leave on half average pay on medical certificate in addition to leave in item No. (i) in exceptional cases.

| OldEntrants | New Entrants <br> (i) Same as in the <br> case of superior <br> (i) Leave on half |
| :---: | :---: |
| staff in Col. 1. | average pay on <br> medical certi- <br> facte upto a |
|  | maximum of 12 <br> months during <br> the whole per- <br> iod of service. |
|  |  |

(ii) Six months' leave on half average pay on medical certificate in addition to leave in item No. (i) in exceptional cases.

No sick leave is allowed to other classes of employees. There is no provision for such leave either in the Factories Act or the Shops and Establishments Act. I do not, therefore, think that any extension of this privilege to the remaining staff is called for. The Representatives of the Officials' Association urged before me that the existing provisions with regard to leave on half average pay on medical certificate allowed to peons (new entrants) should be liberalised and that out of the total leave on medical certificate now allowed to an employee at least 3 months should be on full pay as it is a great hardship to an employee to be paid only half wages when he is sick and has to incur expenses for medical treatment. I have given careful consideration to this suggestion and I consider that the equities of the case would be met by allowing an employee to convert six months of the total sick leave on half pay due to him into three months on full pay, the remaining leave continuing to be on half pay. This concession may be extended to employees (new entrants) in superior service also. This proposal would not involve ary extra expenditure.

## (d) Injury Leave.

383 Injury leave is allowed to the staff under Rule 142 of the Injury leave. $\quad \begin{aligned} & \text { Municipal Service Regulations, which provides } \\ & \text { that subject to the production of a medical } \\ & \text { certificate from the Municipal Medical Examiner or the House }\end{aligned}$

Surgeon in charge of any public Hospital in Bombay, where the person has been treated, an employee belonging to inferior service (to whom the Municipal Service Regulations as a whole do not apply), whether permanent or temporary, may bé allowed, at the discretion of the Commissioner, leave of absence on the following scale on account of accident or injury received in the course of his duty, or disability due to injury or illness in the performance of any particular duty, provided it is not caused by his own neglect or disobedience of orders :-

If the length of service be less than 5 years, I months' full pay and 2 months' half pay.

If more than 5 years but not exceeding 10 years, 2 months' full pay and 2 months' half pay.

If more than 10 years but not exceeding 15 years, 3 months' full pay and 2 months' half pay.

If more than 15 years but not exceeding 20 years, 4 months' full pay and 2 months' half pay.

If more than 20 years, 4 months' full pay and 4 months' half pay.
I do not propose any change in these provisions.

## (e) Maternity Leave.

384 Maternity leave on full pay for a period not exceeding 42 consecutive days is allowed to a woman worker under Rule 108 of the Municipal Service Regulations provided she is in Municipal service for not less than 6 months immediately preceding the date of commencement of such leave. The Labour Commission recommended that the maximum maternity leave to be allowed should be 4 weeks prior to confinement and 4 weeks thereafter. They also recommended payment during this period on the average earnings of 6 previous months or annas 8 per day whichever is less.* They did not recommend these benefits for seasonal or casual labour.

Section 5 (1) of the Bombay Maternity Benefits Act of 1929 provides for 8 weeks leave to every woman worker. But the proviso to the Section lays down that a woman shall not be entitled to maternity benefit unless she has been employed for a period of not less than nine months immediately preceding the date on which she gives notice. This provision is interpreted in certain quarters to mean that the woman cannot claim the benefit unless she has put in

[^35]uninterrupted service of nine months. The Textile Labour Inquiry Committee have, therefore, recommended that the Act should be so amended as to condone breaks in continuity of service due to strikes, playing off or casual absence.* If the provisions of the Municipal Service Regulations are interpreted in the same sense as the provisions of the Bombay Maternity Benefits Act, I recommend that they should be amended on the lines suggested by the Textile Labour Inquiry Committee.
(f) Leave without pay.

385 At present, leave without pay for 30 days is allowed to the labour staff (not amenable to leave rules) for each year of duty performed. In the case of workmen (unloaders) at Kurla Deonar Railway, leave without pay to the extent of two months is allowed in a year. These provisions in addition to the provisions regarding casual leave, privilege leave, medical leave, which are with full or half allowances are quite liberal and not obtained in most employments, where even the initial absence is treated as leave without pay or on half pay. I do not, therefore, propose any changes therein.
(g) Study Leave.

386 The provisions in this matter are embodied in Municipal Study leave. Service Regulations Nos. 130 to 141A. I have no changes to propose therein.
(h) Bad Climate Leave.
387. One month's malaria leave with pay on Medical certificate is given to employees in the Water Department, who are working in the Division outside the City along the pipe line. I have no changes to propose therein.

## (l) Holidays.

388. In addition to leave admissible as aforesaid, the following Holidays. holidays with pay are allowed to the superior staff, peons, etc. :-
(a) All holidays under the Negotiable Instruments Act. These amount to about 20 in a year.
(b) Sectional holidays, i.e., religious holidays permissible to adherents of particular religions according to exigencies of work. They number for Hindus 3, for Muslims 4, for Parsis 4, for Christians 1, for Jews 5 and for Jains and Budhists 4.
[^36]These holidays are not fully allowed to all the labour staff. Reporting on this question, the Commissioner states in his letter, No. A.E.-607, dated the 5th April 1940, that workers in the Engineering Department are allowed 9 holidays with full pay; that the Conservancy staff is allowed 7 festival days, on which days they are granted leave for half day; and that the workers in the Municipal Printing Press are allowed 2 holidays, viz., the New Year's day and the King's Birth day.

It is underschood that the Press is since being given all Public Holidays and Sundays and that working on these days in case of emergency counts for overtime.

The question of granting such holidays, where the staff is not allowed the concession, is for each department to consider according to its own convenience. No general prescription can be suggested in this matter. The Labour Unions have made no complaint against the existing arrangements.
(7) Permanency.
389. The Bombay Municipal Peons and Lascars' Union have represented that Mistries and Mukadams who are now on temporary staff should be Demands of the Unions. brought on the Permanent Schedule. The Bombay Municipal Kamgar Sangh have represented that all those who are required to work all the year round should be made permanent and only those who are required for seasonal work should be continued as temporary. The Municipal Worker's Union have represented that workers on Roads, Asphalt plant, Stone crushers, in the Workshop etc., are now continued on temporary appointments and that all those who have put in three years' service should be made permanent, and those who are not required for the monsoon period in any department should be transferred to some other department. The Bombay Municipal Peons' Union and the Bombay Municipal Employees' Union have represented that no municipal employee should be kept temporary after he has put in a continuous service of one year.
390. Reporting on this question, the Commissioner states in his
 letter, No. A.E. 607, dated the 5th April 1940, that so far as the seasonal staff is concerned, it is employed from time to time on different rates of wages according to actual requirements and their number is not constant and that, therefore, it is not possible to bring them on the permanent list. He estimates the extra cost involved at Rs. 3,42,575 and does not recommend it in the circumstances stated above. As regards the other temporary staff, he states that they are allowed
the same benefits as are admissible to the Permanent staff in the matter of. casual leave, injury leave, Provindent Fund, matemity leave and accident leave, the only difference being that while the permanent staff is allowed Sundays with full pay, the temporary staff is allowed no wages on Sundays, which are non-working days.

I have touched on this point while dealing with the question of leave, where also the same distinction is reported to have been made. But the grievances under this head seem according to the Commissioner to relate not so much to leave, which, he says, is allowed as in the case of permanent employees, but to payment of wages for Sundays, which are non-working days.
391. I am of opinion that all those who are continuously in employment (authorized absence being included in this period) for two years and who have a reasonable prospect of being continued for a long period, should be brought on the Permanent Schedule forthwith. As regards others, who do not fulfil these requirements, they should be allowed a weekly holiday with pay except in the case of those who are employed on seasonal or ad hoc work or engaged on some contract work to be finished within a stipulated time.

The financial effect of this proposal will be an extra cost of Rs. 1,37,770

## (8) Provident Fund and Gratuity.

392. The Bombay Municipal Kamgar Sangh demand that Provident Fund should be made compulsory Demands of the Unions. without any distinction and the rate of contribution should be one anna and four pies in a rupee; that gratuity should be paid at the rate of one month's salary, withouit any maximum, to those who have rendered 15 year's service in the case of employees doing unclean work and 20 years' service in the case of those doing clean work with or without break. The Municipal Workers' Union demand that the graded scheme of paying gratuity, which has been stopped, should be re-introduced and that as regards Provident Fund; fresh loans should be allowed before the expiry of six months after the old loan was paid in exceptional circumstances. The Bombay Municipal Peons and Lascars' Union demand a retiring gratuity as in the Railways and the Port Trust.
393. Reporting on this question, the Commissioner in his letter, No. A.E. 607, dated the 5th April 1940, says that under Rule 6 of the Provident Fund Regulations, the labour staff are eligible to subscribe to the Provident Fund, that the advantages of joining the Fund are brought to the notice of the staff and that if contribution to the Fund is made compulsory the employees may put in a claim for higher wages.
394. The labour is apt to view any sort of compulsion-even if it be in its interest-with disfavour. It is likely

## Recommendations.

 to consider any cut made in its wages in respect of Provident fund, even when it is to be repaid with compound interest and with Municipal contribution, as a reduction in wages. Therefore, persuasion rather than coercion has been resorted to and as a result about 17,000 employees, have joined Provident Fund out of a total of about 22,000 in the Municipal service. As the benefits of Provindent Fund provisions become clearer to them, the remaining persons are also likely to fall in line. I am not, therefore, in favour of exercising any coercion; and I would prefer to leave it to persuasion, education and conviction. As regards advances from the Provident Fund, the original provisions have been relaxed, and now an advance to the extent of 60 per cent. of one's own contribution is allowed for approved cause (vide Corporation Resolution No. 1170, dated the 23rd March 1942). The repayment provisions have also been relaxed and employees are allowed to commence repayment after 6 months of the termination of the war. Further, a second advance, when the first advance is outstanding, is now permitted provided the aggregate amount of advance does not exceed the maximum limit prescribed (vide Corporation Resolution No. 198, of 18th June 1945). The employees should have, therefore, no grievance. As regards gratuity, the following rule providing for the payment of "additional Provident Fund" at the time of retirement has already been approved by the Corporation under their Resolution No. 208, dated the 3rd July 1945:-" 7A (1) By way of an addition to the Municipal contribution credited under Rule 7, a Special Municipal contribution, calculated in the manner prescribed below, shall be made to the Provident Fund of a subscriber, entitled to subscribe under Rule 6, on his retirement
or death, if his service has been continuous for not less than 5 years, subject to the following conditions :-
(a) The Municipal Officer or servant must have either
(1) completed 30 years' service, or
(2) attained the age of 55 years, or
(3) retired, or been required to retire, on account of certified permanent incapacity due to bodily or mental infirmity, such infirmity not being due to his own mis-conduct, such as, irregular or intemperate habits, or
(4) been required to retire, owing to the abolition of his appointment due to reduction or re-organization of establishment, or
(5) retired voluntarily before attaining the age of 55 years, with the consent and approval of the Stảnding Committee or the Schools Committee, as the case may be, or
(6) died, while in Municipal service.
(b) (1) The amount of Special Municipal contribution admissible shall be a sum, equal to half a month's average salary at the date of retirement or death, for each completed year of service, subject to a maximum sum equal to 15 months' average salary, or Rs. 5,000, whichever is less, provided that such sum shall not be less than Rs. 500 for service of 30 years or pro rata for service of lesser period."
In view of this, I do not think that anything remains to be done.
(9) Housing.
395. I have dealt with this question in detail in Chapter

## XXXI of this report.

(10) Uniforms and Clothing.
396. The Standing Orders with regard to the supply of clothing Uniforms \& Clothing. and uniforms, at present, are as follows:Superior Staff.

Peons.

| Old entrants. | New entrants. | ndoor (Biennial). | Outdoor (Biennial ) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Water proof coats once | Same as in the case | 2 conts drill white | 3 coats mazri long. |
| in 4 years to Inspec- | of old entrants with | long. | 3 pairs mazritrousers |
| torrial or. outdoor | ${ }^{\text {a }}$ salary limit of | 3 pairs drill white | 1 Pagree ned. |
| a salary | Rs. 140. |  | 1 umbrella. |
| of |  | 1 Pagree red. |  |

Nurses áre paid a Uniform allowance of Rs. 11-8-0 to Rs. 15 per month.
397. The Bombay Municipal Peons and Lascars Uniondemand
two suits, one cap and a woollen coat every
Demands of the Unions. year. The Municipal Workers' Union have
demanded uniform for Chowkidars and Store Attendants. They have also demanded that the whole of the Conservancy staff should be provided with uniforms. The Municipal Kamgar Sangh have demanded working suits or uniforms for every employee, and chappals, kumblies, rain coats twice a year and suggested that proper lockers should be provided for the workers at various centres of duty. The Bombay Municipal Peons' Union have demanded one woollen coat, one coloured coat, 2 white pants, one cap and one pathani chappal as uniform for peons, andin addition to this uniform, phits for Naiks, Havaldars and Jamadars. The Bombay Municipal Employees' Union have also demanded uniforms of types different from those now supplied to a number of categories of Municipal employees.
398. These demands are, somewhat, exaggerated. There is no reason, why Store Attendants should be Recommendations. provided with a uniform. As regards the Conservancy staff, I understand that overalls are supplied to male workers and aprons to female workers. I am not in favour of providing the workers with any articles of wear, which are not necessary in the performance of their duties, for that means only an indirect addition to wages, which the workers are slow to appreciate. It is also not clear why kumblies and overcoats should be supplied twice a year when they are clearly intended only for monsoon wear. At all events, on account of the present cloth restrictions and other difficulties of getting uniforms for those for whom they are already sanctioned. I should hesitate to recommend a more liberal provision of clothing or uniforms at present. This question should be left to be decided by the Commissioner in due course when the normal times return.

## (II and 12) Free Medical Relief, Sickness and <br> Health Insurance.

> 399. The Municipal Workers' Union have demanded that a scheme for sickness insurance and unemployment benefit should be formulated by the Corporation for their workers.
400. The Municipality has provided free Medical disFree Medical Relief pensaries and Hospitals in the City to which provided by the Cor the Municipal workers can resort in case poration.
of sickness. In addition, it allows sick leave on full or half pay, as the case may be, to certain staff. But what 'the Union appear to be demanding is a sickness insurance scheme on Western model. There can be no doubt about the need of such a scheme for workers in this country. "By common consent the incidence of sickness (in this country) is substantially higher than in Western countries; the medical facilities are much less adequate, and the wages generally paid make it impossible for most workers. to get through more than a very short period of illness without borrowing" ${ }^{*}$.
401. In 1927, draft conventions and recommendations, on the

Sickness Insurance Schemes suggested by the Labour Commission. subject, were adopted by the International Labour Conference. Sixteen countries have ratified the draft conventions, while legislation for compulsory sickness insurance has either been passed or is in progress in twenty other countries. In 1928, the draft Conventions were discussed in the Indian Legislative Assembly, but they were not ratified on the ground that the introduction of any comprehensive scheme on the lines of the Convention was not practicable in the then existing conditions. The Government of India, howéver, expressed their entire sympathy with the ideals underlying the sickness insurance legislation and requested the Provincial Covernments to consider how the practical difficulties in the way could be overcome. The Provincial Governments, in reply, stressed the financial burdens involved in State assistance to any scheme. The Labour Commission pointed out certain practical difficulties in following workers to their villages, arranging for proper medical treatment there and providing for medical certification, in order to enable workers to obtain extended benefits, if sickness continued. The lack of faith in modern medical methods was according to them an important factor and the administrative expenses in working out a scherme on Western lines were likely to be extremely heavy. However, the Commission suggested a tentative scheme. It was based on the assumption that responsibility for the medical and the financial benefits would be separated and the former undertaken by Covernment on a non-contributory basis and the latter by employers on the basis of contributions to be

[^37]made by themselves and the workers. Employers were to be required to deduct a certain percentage of wages, to credit this to a fund, and to add thereto contributions of an equivalent amount or rather more in the case of the more poorly paid workers, who had contributed to the fund for a minimum period of one year and who if certified as sick might be given sick leave. During the period of sickness, the worker was to be given a proportion of his wages from the fund.
402. The recommendations of the Commission were considered Government raactions by the Government of India, who addressed to the Scheme. a circular letter, in 1935, to Provincial Governments to report on the feasibility of conducting a statistical enquiry into the incidence of sickness; alternatively on the possibility of building on the actual experience gained in the operation of small experimental schemes. On receipt of Provincial Governments' replies, the Covernment of India came to the conclusion that a statistical enquiry would be too elaborate and impossible to execute; that the suggestion to build on actual experience of small schemes was sounder, but that no experience was available on which to build; that there was a real lack of demand for any experimental schemes on the part of Provinciat Governments and employers and workers if the schemes were to involve contributions from them. In August 1937, the Bombay Government announced its policy in favour of a comprehensive system of social insurance for the protection of the industrial workers. In October 1937, the Commissioner of Labour issued a circular to all employers' organizations, trade unions etc., requesting them to favour Covernment with their views on a draft scheme, which was of a composite character, having characteristics of sickness, retirement, old age and death benefits.
403. Commenting on the scheme, the Textile Labour Inquiry Committee's report (of 1940) says
Textile Labour Inquiry that the scheme cannot meet the need for Committoo's Scheme. insurance against sickness, which should claim priority over other social benefits. The Committee recommends the introduction of a sickness insurance scheme "on a contributory and compulsory basis" and suggests that it should be simple in character and restricted to permanent workers, and be under the control of a Central Board of Management consisting of representatives of Covermment, employers.
workers and the medical profession: The Committee recommends the following benefits:-
(1) Medical benefits consisting of free medical treatment and attendance and free medicines and appliances. The insured persons should be entitled to medical benefits immediately after the payment of the first insurance contribution and they should also receive free medical certificates for health insurance purposes from the Doctors appointed under the scheme.
(2) Cash benefits commencing from the fourth day of incapacity and continuing for a period or periods upto a maximum of 6 months in a year at a flat rate but not exceeding 75 per cent of the insured person's average daily wage during the preceding quarter.
(3) Additional benefits as may be decided upon by the Central Board of Management from time to time according to the availability of surplus funds.
The Committee suggests the following tentative scheme* for contributions to be made by Government, the employers and the workers.

| Insured worker. |  | Monthly Contributions. |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  | Employer. | Worker. | Governm | nent. | Total. |
| Male | ... |  | $\begin{aligned} \mathrm{Rs}_{0} \mathrm{a} \\ 0 . \mathrm{p} \\ 0 \end{aligned}$ |  |  |  | $\operatorname{Re}_{i} \operatorname{an}_{0} p_{0}$ |
| Female | ... |  | 0100 | 040 | 01 | 0 | 015 |

The Committee states that the rate of contribution by the insured person should not exceed 5 per cent of his or her average monthly wages during the preceding quarter.

The Committee proposes cash benefits as under :-
Daily cash benefit from the


The Committee estimates a sickness rate of 9 days per annum.
*Textile Labour Inguiry Committee Report p. 327-328.

As regards medical benefits, which comprise free medical attendance and free supply of medicines, the Committee suggests a panel system of Doctors as in England, each Doctor being assigned a certain number of insured persons for attention and allowed Rs. 3 per annum for each such person.
404. More recently, Prof. Adarkar has prepared a Health Insurance scheme for industrial workers at Prof. Adarkar's cheme. the instance of the Government of India. The scheme covers only three major groups of industries, viz., textiles, engineering. mineral and metals. This .scheme* provides for the following cash benefits:-

| Period. | Class A worker earning Rs. 1 per day. | Class B worker carning between Ans. 8 and Rs. 1 per day. | Class C worker carning less than Ans. per day. |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Until the first six contributions are paid ... | Rs. ni. p. | $\begin{gathered} \text { Rs. a. p. p. } \end{gathered}$ | $\text { Rs. a. p. }_{\text {nil }}$ |
| After six contribations and upto the 24th... | 060 | 040 | 020 |
| After the 24th contribution | 0120 | 080 | 040 |

The basis of monthly contributions suggested per worker for the different classes of workers, in case Government does not contribute, is as follows :-

| Employer <br> Worker | ... | ... |  | A. Rs. a. 1 |  | $\underset{\text { Rs. a. p. }}{\text { C. }}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  | ... | 140 | 140 | 140 |
|  | ... | ... | ... | 0120 | 080 | 040 |
|  |  |  |  | 200 | 1120 | 180 |

This is to be alteredt as follows if the State decides to contri-bute:-

|  |  |  |  | A. | B. | C. |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |  | Rs. a. p. | R. a. | Rs. a. | p. |
| State | ... | ... | ... | 080 | 080 | 080 |  |
| Employer | ... | ... | ... | 014 | 014.0 | 014 |  |
| Worker | ... | ... | ... | 0100 | 060 | 02 |  |
|  |  |  |  | 200 | 1120 | 8 | 0 |

[^38]405. For formulating any Sickness Insurance Scheme for Municipal workers, a careful enquiry will have to be made into the incidence of Recomuramdations. sickness among various groups of the employees. Secondly, it will be necessary to secure the co-operation of Govemment, if Government aid is to be asked for, and the workers, who have to share the burden with the Municipality. It is not clear how the workers would react to such a schems to which they will have to contribute every month by a cut in wages, however small. At any rate, it would be worthubile making a, modest beginning. I understand that the Commissioner has already under his consideration a scheme which contemplates contribution by the Municipality and by the employees. The details may have to be worked out on acturial basis. At any rate the need for such a scheme is becoming increasingly clear and imperative in the interest of the health, efficiency and morale of the staff.
(13) Welfare Amenities.
0. 406. Welfare activities cover all that ": bears on the health, general well-being, safety and efficiency of the workers." Broadly speaking, they may be Demands of the Unions. classified under two heads (1) welfare activities carried on within the precincts of work, and (2) those devised to help the worker in his outside life. The former category includes provision of rest places, sanitary arrangements, creches and canteens and the latter category includes provision of healthy dwelling houses, medical relief, educational and recreation facilities. As regards (1), the Bombay Municipal "Kamgar Sangh have demanded that workérs should be provided with washing places at various places in the City and also with soap and other toilet materials for the workers. As regards (z), alt the MunicipalLabour Unions have demanded free housing accommodation.
... 407. As regards the first, there can be no two opinions about the provision of drinking water, retiring Amenities to be provi: ded at the place oq work: shelterés, sanitary arrangements, canteens, dining halls at all permanent centres of work and am of opinion that where these facilities are non-existent or are inadequate they should be provided or extended. Such facilities are pröided in a number of Mills in Bombay. In -Great Britain, a sudden impetus was given to the Canteen movement by the Factory (Canteens) Order of 1940 and as a Fa
result by the end of 1942, 98 per cent of the Mills affected by the order had canteens. The Corporation should catch up the canteen idea and provide canteens at all important labour centres. As regards mobile labour, as for example workers employed on road work etc., such facilities should be provided at the nearest Ward office or Labour Weltare Centre. As regards creches, they should be started at convenient places particularly by the Health Department which engages a large number of Halalkhor women. This requirement is reported to have been enforced under the Factories Act on factories employing 100 or more women by some of the Provincial Governments. As for the demand made by the Municipal Kamgar Sangh for provision of washing places and soap at various work centres where the workers can wash thermselves after the days' work, I urderstand that such facilities have already been provided at Paltan Road, Annesly Road and Valpakhady centres and I recommend that they should be extended to other centres as and when feasible.
408. As regards the second, I have dealt with the question of Amenities to be provi- providing healthy dwelling houses for labour ded meer workere dwell- in a separate Chapter (No. XXXI). The ings-(Welfare Centres.) other activities falling under this head are carried out of the Fines Fund by a Special Branch of the Health Department at the following eleven centres :-
(1) Palton Road; (2) Agripada; (3) Arthur Road; (4) Parbhadevi; (5) Dadar; (6) Love Grove; (7) Calicut Street; (8) Tardeo Flats; (9) The K. E. M. Hospital, Parel; (10) Umarkhadi, and (II) Chembur.

Welfare work among the Municipal labour staff is also carried on by three other agencies viz., Bhagini Samaj (Bellasis Road Centre), Hindu Sevak Samaj (Valpakhadi Centre), the Municipal Scouts Local Association (Taikalwadi Centre), who receive grant-in-aid from the Corporation for the purpose.
409. The welfare work carried on at the eleven Municipal centres consists of (1) Recreational activities

(2) Educational activities, and (3) Health work.
As regards (1), they include the following games:-Carrom, Draughts, Ludo, "Chaupat", Snakes and ladders, Hu-tu-tu, Khokho, Atya patya, Langadi, Volley ball. Foot-ball, Deck tennis, and
several other English and Indian Croup games and the following Akhada activities viz., Wrestling, Malkhamb, Lathi, Lezim, Pole drill etc.; Gymnastic exercises like Free-hand drill, Dumb-bells, Pyramids, Boxing etc., also form part of the programme.

Inter-centre matches and toumaments are arranged. The workers and their families are also taken out of Bombay occasionally for pienics. They are also shown educational and social films.

Bhajan Mandalis, Music and dramatic clubs are also organised where workers are allowed to give free expression to their artistic talents. Music is taught on harmonium and tabla. Gramophone records are played in the chawls. Folk songs and folk dances like Carba, Ras-dandya, Kathiwadi Doha, Tipris, etc., are also regular features of these clubs. Social gatherings are held to celebrate feasts and festivals.

As regards (2), literafy classes are conducted af every centre. Talks and lantern-slide lectures are arranged on current topics and social subjects of immediate interest to the employees, i.e., on elementary history, geography, cleanliness and sanitary living, domestic economy, maternity and child welfare, balanced diets, first-aid, safety first etc. Debates are organised once a week at all the centres. Story telling and reading of interesting passages from books and magazines are other features of this activity. Some of the centres issue their own magazines to which articles; stories and plays are contributed by educated boys and men. Women are taught sewing and embroidery.

As regards (3), labour chawls are visited regularly by parttime workers, who teach the occupants how to cultivate hygienic habits, cleanliness and sanitary living. Lectures are delivered on personal hygiene, care of the eyes, nose and lungs. Children are made to wash their hands, feet, face, and comb their hair at the centres. Competitions are held for the cleanest and best kept rooms and prizes are given to encourage cleanliness. Every centre is equipped with medical appliances such as hot-water bags, ice-bags, thermometers, bed-pans, iodine etc, which are supplied free whenever needed. I would suggest the opening of a free medical dispensary at each of these centres, so that labour might get medical treatment at its door and more promptly, which might help in turn to reduce absenteeism and increase efficiency.

## CHAPTER XXXV.

## Miscellaneous demands.

410 The Municipal Labour Unions have made other miscellaneous demands, most of which are dealt with below.


#### Abstract

411 The Bombay Municipal Peons and Lascars' Union demand that peons, mukadams and mistries should be Paymeat of travelling paid actual expenses of travelling on official duties. Peons sent for delivery of despatch to long distances are ordinarily paid Railway or tram fare. It is not, therefore, clear what is the exact implication of this demand. Peons who accompany officers in the course of their duties are usually carried by the officers in their cars or, where this is not possible, they are paid tram fare. If, however, the demand is for payment to a mukadam or mistri tram fare between his residence and his place of work, I do not think it is justifiable, for if such a request were granted, the concession will have to be extended to every employee whether high or low.


412 As regards their demand for payment of coolie hire or gharry hire for carrying despatch,"I understand
Peyment of gharry or that when the despatch is exceptionally heavy coolie hirro. coolie hire is allowed. For normal despatch,peons need not be given coolie or gharry hire. I would suggest the employment of cycle pcons, for carrying despatch by the departments where the despatch is normally very heavy until such time as the Central Despatch scheme suggested by me is brought into force.

## Preference in amploy.

413 The Bombay Municipal Peons and Lascars Union have also demanded that while employing persons in the inferior service preference should be given to relations of men in service. I do not consider this a wise policy. Selection must be based on suitability rather than on consanguinity. Employment of relations in the same department undermines efficiency and lends itself to the play of undesirable influences.

> 414 The Municipal Kamgar Sangh suggest that substitutes in Badi sytem. $\quad$ pointed from a waiting list and not in any manner at the sweet will of the Muccadams. The Muccadam is like
a jobber in a Mill. The Textile Labour Inguiry Committee has condemned the practice of employing labour through jobbers, who are often found corrupt. The Labour Commission has suggested that recruitment of labour should be made through Labour. Officers*: and that the Labour Officer should be given eontrol over such appointments and the badli system.
$415^{\circ}$ The Textile Labour Inquiry Committee has also advised the control of badli system through Labour Qfficers.t, The Mill Owners' Association started the control of badli system in lacal mills in 1935. According to this system, every Mill estimates each month the probable number of absentees. The number of badlis enrolled is based on the maximum number of absentees estimated. On the first day of each month, special badli cards are given to a selected number of persons, who are asked to present themselves every morning at the Mill to fill temporary vacancies, New badlis are not entertained untilt the number of badli card holders is exhausted. Permanent vacancies are filled from the senior badis. The advantages claimed for such control of the badli system are :-
(1) That it reduces the amount of casual labour employed and increases the efficiency of substitute labour.
(2) That it deprives the Mukadams of their power to employ labour and obtain illegal gratification.
(3) That it helps employers to get a stable, trained and efficient badli labour to fill casual as well as permanent vacancies.
I strongly recommend the adoption of a system of badli control in the Municipality in the departments in which labour is employed in large numbers.

416 The Bombay Municipal Kangar Sangh also arge the extension of the Pali system to the Road
Pali syatem. "Department. The Sangh point out that this system is proposed to be introduced in the case of Drivers at Love Grove Pumping station. Pali system like Badli system is likely, if not well regulated, to lend itself to abuses. There is, therefore, some justification for the demand that it should be extended and regulated.

[^39]417 The same Sangh demand that tränsport facilities should be provided free of charge to every worker Transport facilitice. from his place of residence to his place of work if the latter is more than one mile from the former. This is another way of increasing the real wage. It is true that peons are being given Railway passes if they are pro. vided with free quarters and such quarters are more than one mile away from the place of work. . This was agreed to under special circumstances to induce peons to occupy C. I. T. chawls in which there used to be a large number of vacancies. The continuance of the concession now, when there is no likelihood of any rooms remaining vacant, seems less justified. It has on the other hand tended to raise similar demand from the labour classes. At any rate, I am not in favour of extending such perquisites which go unnoticed by labour in the calculation of their real wage.

418 The Sangh also demand that wherever women coolies are Women Makadamn. employed women mukadams should be appointed to supervise their work. The Labour Commission says that "supervision of women presents special difficulties. When undertaken, as is generally the case, by male jobbers, it leads to serious abuses."* Although the system of employing women mukadams to supervise the work of women is in force in several factories, the Commission observes that the system does not always eliminate the evils arising from male supervision. It adds that too often the mukadammin has the rapacity of the jobber with even more submissive material on which to exercise it. It therefore recommends that where women are engaged in substantial number, there should invariably be at least one educated woman in charge of their welfare and supervision and that she should be responsible to the Labour Officer. The Textile Labour Inquiry Committee, however, observes that the recommendation has not been adopted by any Mill in Bombay and suggests that women jobber should be made to go through courses of training as in the case of male jobbers. $\dagger$ The Municipality may try the experiment of engaging women mukadams to supervise the work of women labourers.

419 The Municipality has already employed one woman Woman Labour officar Welfare Officer to look after the welfare to look after the welfare centres. She may also be required to look to workern. the welfare of women labour and be placed

* Labour Commission Report p. 25
$\dagger$ Taxtile Labour Inquuary Committee Report Vol. II p. 346.
under a male Labour Officer who should look after the grievances and welfare of the labour force in Municipal employ as a whole.

420 The Municipal Workers' Union demand that they should Collection of Union be allowed to collect membership fees inside teos within Manicipal the Municipal premises. I am not in favour of premisen. the suggestion, as such a practice is likely to be misunderstood or misinterpreted. If fees are allowed to be collected in Municipal premises, illiterate labour is likely to think that the fees are being collected at the pressure or at any rate under the influence of employers.

## Part V.

## CHAPTER XXXVI

## Finance.

421. The aggregate increase in the expenditure on account Lncemeto be odiasted of the recommendations made by me in to remoonable expesditure the foregoing Chapters is Rs. $35,63,481$. How to find funds to meet this additional expenditure is a natural question to ask. In this connection, it would be relevant to consider whether the expenditure should be adjusted to the income or the income should be adjusted to what the Municipality considers to be a reasonable expenditure having regard to the standard of services to be rendered in a capital city like Bombay. This question is well answered in the following paragraph of the Manchester Year Book 1937 (p. 244):-
"The approach to the financing of a Municipality is, in a sense, the reverse of that of a private concern. Whereas the private concern, generally speaking, considers its probable income first, and cuts its cloth accordingly, the Municipality must estimate the minimum cost at which its services can be run with efficiency, and only then can, it go on to consider the means whereby sufficient income to meet this expenditure can be raised.'
422. I have already pointed out that the ratio of the cost of Retio of Cort of Este- Establishment in relation to the total income blichment to the limeome was 21.51 per cent. in 1933-34, and 19.98. per cent. in 1943-44. It has also fallen relatively to the total expenditure from 20.76 per cent. in 1933-34 to 20.64 in 1943-44. In the Karachi Municipality the cost of establishment comes to about 32.7 per cent. of the total expenditure.* The Bombay Municipality would not, therefore, be unjustified in revising the salaries of its staff. Economy is dearly bought when it is at the expense of efficiency, and contentment of the staff. Slackness or listlessness on their part may cost much invisible loss.
(a) Expansion of the existing reverues.
423. At present, the Municipal rates and taxes amount only to Cemoritas and Inci. annas 3 and pie 1 in a rupee. If the Urban dence of Tanation Immovable Property Tax is included it amounts to annas 3 and pies 7 on valuations below Rs. 2,000

[^40]per annum and annas 4 and pies 2 in a rupee on valuations over Rs. 2,000 per annum. As against this, the rates in England per pound for the year 1937-38 were as follows*:-

Birmingham 15s ; Bristol, 11s. 6d. ; Hull 19s. 8d. ; Leeds, 15s. ; Liverpool 15s. ; Manchester 15 s .6 d . ; Sheffield 18s.
424. It will thus be seen that we are far behind the Western Yield of the Margin of incidence of taxation. Under the Municipal General Tas. Act, the General Tax can be raised upto 17 per cent., as against 12 per cent. now levied. If this is levied at its maximum and the Water and Halalkhore taxes at the present (maximum) rates, the incidence would come to annas 3 and pies 10 in a rupee and if the Urban Immovable Property Tax at the present rate is added, the incidence would come to annas 4 and pies 11. Even if this margin is availed of fully, we would still be far behind the rate of Municipal taxation in England. An increase of 1 per cent. of the General Tax would roughly yield about Rs. $14 \frac{1}{2}$ lakhs.
(b) Assignment of revenues by Government.
425. Apart from the above source of revenue, which, if fully Other sources of revenue exploited, may yield about Rs. $72 \frac{1}{2}$ lakhs, the clament. income which have been encroached upon by Covernment. The Municipality has already represented to Covernment that it should be given a share in the (1) Betting tax, (2) Entertainment tax, (3) Transfer of Property tax, (4) Petrol duty, (5) Electricity duty and (6) Registration and Licence fees on Motor vehicles.
426. As regards (1), namely, the Betting tax, about 88 Betting Tak. per cent, of this revenue is reported to be coming out of the City. It is thus essentially a local tax and must inure to the Municipality either wholly or partially. The Kale Committee recommendst the transfer of this : source to local bodies. If 50 per cent, of the yield as is asked for by the Corporation, is assigned to them there would in all probability be an additional revenue of about Rs. 35 lakhs.
427. As regards, (2), namely, the Entertainment tax, the Taxation Inquiry Committee reports that as this tax is mainly collected in cities, a share of the proceeds to be determined by the Provincial Government

[^41]should be made over to the local Municipalities.* The Kale Committee also recommends that this source should be made over to the local bodies. In Europe, the tax is almost universally assigned to local bodies. The yield from this source from the City alone is estimated at about Rs. 40 lakhs. If even 50 per cent. of the revenue is assigned to the Corporation, they may have an additional revenue of about Rs. 20 lakhs.
428. As regards (3), namely, the tax on the Transfer of

Tam on Trumsfor of Properties, it is assigned to the Municipality Properties in Madras. The Kale Committee $\dagger$ states that as the appreciation in the values of properties transferred are in a great measure due to the improvements carried out by local bodies, a share from the proceeds of this tax should be handed over to the local bodies. It further suggests that the duty may be increased by 25 per cent. and the proceeds thereof be given to the local bodies. If the proposal finds favour with Government, the Municipality stands to gain a substantial amount.

## 429. As regards (4), namely, the Duty on Petrol, this article is subjected to a duty by the Central GovernDuty on Petrol. ment, the proceeds of which are utilised

 for road improvement purposes. The Central Government makes a grant to the Provincial Governments. The grant made to the Government of Bombay comes to about Rs. 20 lakhs. Most of this revenue comes from the petrol consumed in the City. Besides this, the Government of Bombay has imposed a sales tax on Petrol which is reported to be yielding more than Rs. 60 lakhs. About 90 per cent. of this revenue is said to be being. contributed by the Bombay City. If 50 per cent. of the proceeds are handed over to the Municipality, as claimed by it, it might give about Rs. 27 lakhs per annum.430. As regards (5), namely, the Duty on Electricity, the Kale Committee recommends that local bodies should be given 50 per cent. of the net proceeds. The proceeds from this are roughly about Rs. 40 lakhs and it is reported that about 70 per cent. of this revenue comes from the City of Bombay. If 50 per cent. of the proceeds from the City are given to the Municipality it would give about Rs. 12 to 14 lakhs.

[^42]431. As regards (6), namely, the Registration and Licence fees Registration and on motor vehicles, the 'Taxation Inquiry Licencofoen. Committee points out that these fees exceed the cost of administration and to that extent impinge on the Municipal source of revenue from the wheel tax. If the excess is handed over to the Corporation, it would bring further relief.
(c) Additional Sources of Revenue.
432. The Corporation have approved of the levy of a Profession Tas ani Profession tax in the City of Bombay. If TownDuties the proposal materialises it is expected to yield about Rs. 8 Lacs. Further, proposals for extending the schedule of Town Duties were approved by the Corporation under their Resolution No. 745, dated the 17th November 1939, and submitted to Covernment. If they are given effect to, they are expected to yield about Rs. 15 Lacs.
(d) Government Grants.
433. The State comes to the aid of local authorities all over Government Grants. the world by grants for specific purposes like education, medical relief, public héalth, housing etc. In Bombay, the Provincial Government gives a grant of Rs. $9,45,000$ towards primary education. It further pays Rs. 25,000 in respect of tolls, which were abolished in 1919. The number of vehicles entering the City since that year has increased enormously and if the tolls were re-introduced for the benefit of the Municipality the proceeds would amount to some lakhs. The Municipality would, therefore, be justified in claiming at least Rs. 2 lakirs from Covernment on this account. The other grants received are in respect of fines levied under Acts administered by the Municipality. It will thus be seen that Covernment grants play a neglim gible part in Municipal finance. As against this, the position in England is quite the contrary. In 1935-36, the total annual expenditure of local authorities in England and Wales was about $£ 550$ millions; out of this, about $£ 135$ millions came from Government grants,* that is, about 25 per cent. The figure given by Mr. G.M. Harris for the same year for Cities with over a lakh of population is 13 per cent, $\dagger$ which shows that the grants to small Municipalities must be very high indeed. The percentage of Government grants to the total expenditure of the Bombay Municipality is only 283 per cent. This shows how exiguous is Government aid and to what

[^43]extent the Municipality is thrown on its own resources, although they are very limited. There is thus a very strong case for a substantial grant from Covernment not only in respect of Primary Education but in respect of medical relief, public health, etc:
434. The aggregate increase in revenue, if the foregoing claims Aggregate revenue of the Municipality are conceded by Governfrom proposed sources. ment and if the Municipality were to fully exploit its own sources, will amount to about Rs. 2 crores.
(e) Municipal Trading.
435. Municipal Trading can yet be another source of Profits from Municipal Municipal income. It may comprise Municiundertaking in relief of pal undertakings like water, gas, electricity,
rates. ratos.
transport, markets etc. The question whether profits on Municipal undertakings could be diverted to the relief of rates or for any other useful purpose has raised some controversies. Some hold that local bodies should not embark on trading at all; some others are not opposed to Municipal trading as such, but they are against the application of the profits of the undertakings to the relief of rates or for any purpose other than that connected with the undertakings ; there are yet others, who are not such purists and who see no objection to the transfer of the profits of Municipal undertakings to any other purpose. Mr. G. Montague Harris quotes" the following instances where the profits of Municipal undertakings were used in relief of rates in the year 1937-38, the figures in brackets showing the amount in the $£$ by which the rate was reduced.

436. Mr. Harris adds that " the objections raised to the apObjections to the appli. plication of profits on the Municipal trading cation of profits to the enterprises to the relief of rates do not seem reliof of rates answered. to have equal force as regards all services. Thus in the case of water supply, such application is practically a return of unneeded money to those who have paid it or one may say,

[^44]a reduction in the water rate, for every one uses water. A Tramway system is not on the same footing, for every one does not use trams and it may well be argued that any profits earned should be used for a reduction in fares and not handed over to the community as a whole, though it must be remembered that a tramway undertaking will have enjoyed cheap credit and other advantages from its association with the Municipality. This being the case, the class of citizens who use trams enjoy a special benefit and unless they pay to the Municipality something in return they will be a privileged class"'. Thus it seems reasonable that, in certain circumstances, a local authority could divert the profits of trading to the relief of rates subject to safeguards, like the creation of reserve funds for the benefit of the undertakings themselves. As regards Municipal water undertakings being made to contribute to the general Municipal fund Profs. Frederic A. Ogg and P. Orman Ray observe* that "it is one of the most remunerative of City's enterprises and is therefore often made to contribute to the support of other activities of the City Covernment". Mayor Hoan of Milvaukee states $\dagger$ that $"$ there are several scores of cities and towns in the United States where the entire cost of City administration is met by public utilities ".
437. Of the Municipal undertakings mentioned above, the Undertaking: run and Bombay Municipality already runs two, proposed to be run by namely, water supply and markets. As the Municipality. regards tramways, under a Deed of Concessions entered into with the B. E. S. T. Company in 1905, the Municipality has retained the option of purchasing the undertaking. This option may be exercised in 1947, 1961, 1968 and after every 7 years thereafter. The Corporation have already expressed a desire that the option should be exercised at the earliest opportunity (Vide Corporation Resolution No. 1212, dated the 8th March 1945). That would bring electric supply also under its control. The Corporation are also contemplating running its own Bus service (Vide Corporation Resolution No. 242, dated the 5th July 1945). As regards gas, there is no agreement as in the case of tramways. The Corporation may, however, acquire this undertaking in due course if they consider that it would be in the interest of the City to do so.

[^45]438. The following instances of undertakings acquired or Instances of public started in England by the Municipalities and utility undertakings ac- the years in which they were so done may quired or started in Eng- be quoted with profit:-

| Cities. | Electric supply. | Gas. | Tramway. | Motor Bua service. | Port Docks. | Airports. | Banka. | Telephones. | Restaurants. |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Birmingham | .. 1900 | 1875 | 1904 | 1913 | ... | ... | 1919 | ... | $\cdots$ |
| Bristol | ... 1893 | -. | ... | ... | $\begin{aligned} & 1848 \\ & 1877 \\ & 1884 \end{aligned}$ | 1930 | $\cdots$ | $\cdots$ | .** |
| Hull | ... 1893 | $\ldots$ | 1899 | 1921 | . | Year not available. | .. | 1902 | Year not available |
| Leeds | 1898 | 1870 | 1894 | ... | ... | Do. | ... | '.. |  |
| Liverpool | ... 1883 | ... | 1897 | 1911 | $\cdots$ | 1938 | ... | ... | ..' |
| Manchester | $\text { ... } 1893$ | $1843$ | 1902 | 1915 | ** | First year not available. Second 1938 | * ${ }^{\text {a }}$ | $\cdots$ | ** |
| Sheffield | ... 1898 | ... | 189 | 1913 | ** | *** | ... | -•• | ... |
| Westham . | ... 1900 | ... | ... | $\cdots$ | '. | $\cdots$ | $\ldots$ | ..* | ... |
| Edinburgh | ... 1895 | 1888 | 1919 | 1919 | ... | ... | $\cdots$ | ... | ... |
| Glasgow | ... . 1892 | 1869 | 1894 | 1924 | -.. | ... | ... | ... | ... |

If the Municipality ventures on some of these enterprises by acquisition of existing interests or by inaugurating new ones wherever they do not exist, it may well be able to strengthen and develop its finances without overstraining its existing limited resources.

## CHAPTER XXXVII

## How to secure Efficient Executive

439. I. have also been asked to make suggestions for securing Various methods of "efficient Municipal Executive in all ranks". securing efficiency. Efficiency can be secured, first by recruitment of the right stamp of men, secondly by paying them adequately so as to keep them above want and temptation, and thirdly by providing progressive grades and promotions, which would prove attractive to persons of talent, capacity, industry, integrity and administrative ability and sustain their interest and zeal in their work in the hope of satisfaction of their reasonable aspirations.

## Recruitment.

440. The efficiency of a service depends primarily on the method fits recruitment. The methods of selection Methods of recruit- may differ in different countries, but the object is everywhere the same, namely, to obtain an intelligent and competent personnel in as fair and impartial a manner as possible. The method of recruitment to junior and senior posts may again differ. Broadly speaking, in England " every local authority selects its Junior entrants from within its own area and usually the announcement of vacancies is made by advertisement in the local newspapers '"*, while the appointments to the higher and more responsible posts are " made sometimes by promotion from within the office, sometimes by publicly advertising the vacancy in one or more of the journals circulating among the Municipal workers; sometimes the appointments are left to the senior officers of the departments concerned, sometimes the Committee of the Council which will have most to do with the work of the particular officer makes the appointment; sometimes appointments are discussed and decided upon by the Council as a whole. A few Councils have a Special Appointments Committee which deals with all departments ".t
441. In Manchester, applications for junior posts (clerks, etc.), are invited every year by public advertisements. The applicants are required to appear for a competitive examination conducted by the

[^46]t Local Government in England by E. L. Husluck, p. 69-71:

Officers of the Education Department. The first 100 successful candidates are taken and a list of them is given to each department ; each department selects from this list such persons as it may need and the residue is carried to the next list. Persons not receiving appointment within twelve months after passing the examination and who have reached the age of 18 are informed that their chances of being employed are remote and that their names are likely to be de-listed. The higher staff is appointed by the Employing Committee subject to the approval of the Council.
442. In Leeds, juniors are recruited by means of an entrance examination in three stages-(1) General subjects; (2) Local Government subjects. and (3) Ceneral intelligence. A list of successful candidates is circulated to all departments and no department is allowed to recruit outside the list. For appointments to higher posts, applications are invited by advertisement. The Chief Officer tabulates the applications and recommends certain applicants to be interviewed. The Committee interviews the recommended candidates and sends up one name to the Council. Since 1936, recruitment to these posts is being made from officials within as follows:-
"When a vacancy occurs it is notified to every head of the department who circulates it to its juniors who are favoured for appointments up to $£ 400$ salary."
443. In Clasgow, there is a competitive entrance examination for clerical appointments; higher appointments are not necessarily advertised, but if no suitable persons are available from within, the posts are advertised. Technical appointments are made by the departments concerned.
444. Recruitment to clerical service in the Bombay Municipality used to be very simple. Any candidate, who had passed the Matriculation or any equivalent or higher examination could apply and his name was registered. Candidates

Methode of recruitment for clerical posta followed in the Bombay Manicipality in the pest. from this Register were employed in order of their rank in the Register. After a period of a year or so, they were subjected to an examination called "the Retention Bar Examination ". Candidates failing in this examination twice were discharged. This system was attacked on two grounds, First, that no choice or selection was made in the registration of
candidates in the Central register; secondly, that it was not fair to the candidates to be turned out after two or three years' service on the ground that they had failed to get through the examination. The Municipal Officials' Association represented that there should be a pre-entry examination instead of a post-entry one. Thus, Present Method of recruitment came to be made since 1939, by recruitment in the means of a competitive examination. The Bombay Municipality. Examiners are usually outsiders whose names are not disclosed. Thus impartiality in the selection is secured: This system has dispelled the suspicion that admission to Municipal service is by influence. It has also the merit of selecting the best candidates. As in Manchester, about 100 persons axe selected but according to communal proportions. After entering the service, such of them as desire higher promotions are required to pass further tests prescribed for higher grades, namely, for Head clerks and Chief clerks posts and only such of them as pass these examinations are appointed to the posts. Thus efficiency is well secured in initial recruitment and subsequent promotion to the higher grades in the clerical'service. The entrance examination has been suspended during the last few years on account of abnormal
 conditions brought about by the War and recruitment is now made by inviting applications by public advertisement and making selection on the basis of the highest percentage of marks obtained by the candidates at the Matriculation or the degree examination of the Bombay University. It is desirable that the entrance examination should be revived as early as possible.) There is a complaint that recruits to Head Clerks' and Chief Clerks' posts have not been of the right calibre with the result that the burden of work has to be mainly borne by superior

> Recruitment to Head Clerkt and Chief Clarks by Departmental terts. officers. This might perhaps be due to the fact that the initial recruitment in their case was not made on competitive basis and that the examinations they were required to pass to qualify themselves for higher appointments were not perhaps of a sufficiently high standard. Efficiency in the higher clerical grades can be improved by raising the standard of these examinations so as to make them not only a test of merit in general or departmental knowledge and experience but also of out-put, accuracy, speed and quality of work, of judgment, of general culture and power of self-expression. There is also a com-
plaint that graduates are lumped together with Matriculates
Grievances of Graduates. and non-graduates; that although a graduate is given an initial higher salary in the clerical grade, for higher promotions he has to take his chance with persons who are far less qualified and sometimes far less competent; that the work is also not allotted according to the educational status of the persons with the result that the graduates have no opportunity of proving their merit; that such a system is neither satisfactory nor conducive to efficiency. The graduates advocate the division of service into Upper and Lower grades as in the Secretariat. The nature of work in the Secretariat and the Municipality cannot, however, be considered to be very similar and the division of the clerical grade into upper and lower sections is not possible in the Municipality except perhaps to a very limited extent. The grievance of the graduates, however, is substantially met by their being allowed to appear for the Head Clerks' examination much earlier than non-graduates, i.e., at the end of 5 years service in the case of Honours and double graduates and 6 years' service in the case of pass graduates, as against 9 years' service provided for others. It could also be further met by raising the standard of the Head Clerks' examination and making it a real test of knowledge and efficiency. 'If this is done, there will be no need for holding another examination for Chief Clerks' posts except for the selection of competent persons from among those who now hold Head Clerks' posts or who have so far passed the Head Clerks' examination. The prospects of those who pass this test can be improved by providing an adequate proportion of Head Clerks and Chief Clerks in the clerical service.
445. Recruitment to subordinate technical service is made by departmental heads. No entrance or com-
Recruitment to subordinate technical service petitive examination is held. It would be desirable to recruit such persons on some definite lines as in Govemment, namely, on the basis of the highest number of marks obtained by them in their last University or Diploma examination. This would not only ensure selection on merit but make for future efficiency and provide better material for selection for higher posts in the department.
446. The higher administrative and technical posts in the Bombay Municipality are usually filled by

Recruitment to higher administrative and technical appointments.
promotions from within. When no suitable persons within the service are available, the posts are advertised and the selection is made
on the lines followed in Leeds. The system of making promotions to the officers' grade from the rank and file is criticised on the ground that such persons are usually promoted at so late a stage in their careers that they are unable to reach the higher administrative posts before they retire. Criticism is also made that the officers so selected will have become stale, lost their power of initiative, and will be finding it difficult to adapt their outlook to their new positions of responsibility after long service in an inferior position. On the other hand, the advantages of recruiting tried men are obvious, for it would be impossible to keep any inferior service contented or efficient, which has not reasonable prospects of promotion for those who have proved their merit. In dealing therefore with the problem, it would be advisable to strike a balance between the two methods.


#### Abstract

447. The Hadow Committee appointed in England about the year 1933 or 1934 to consider the question of recruitment and training of Municipal Officers recommended that-while provision should be made for internal promotions to higher grades of appointments to prevent stagnation, there should be some recruitment from outside from among University graduates so as to secure the services of some able men who with proper training can be expected to have administrative ability and broad and constructive outlook.


448. In this connection, it is worthwhile considering whether it is desirable to get a rank outsider striaghtway

Disadvantages of appainting rank outsiders to fill highest administrative posts. to fill the highest administrative or technical post in the service unless circumstances make it inevitable; for such an outsider will find himself appointed at once to the headship of a department with which he has had no previous direct contact or of which he had no personal experience, and much valuable time will be lost in his trying to know the staff and get to grips with the new problems with which he may be faced. To obviate this, outside recruitment may be made, at some earlier stage, to a lower rung of the official ladder, on the lines of recruitment to Government Provincial services through a Municipal Service Cormmission appointed on the lines of the Public Service Commission.

## Adequacy of Payment and Progressive Promotion.

449. Recruitment of competent candidates by itself is not likely Service to be made to be fruitful of desired results unless the attractive by progressive service is made attractive for them to stay on
promotion. and continue. What is necessary is that they should be paid adequately so as to keep them beyowd want and temptation. In the words of the Islington Commission, the Municipality should pay so much to its employees " as is necessary to obtain recruits of the right stamp and maintain them in such a degree of comfort and dignity as will shield them from temptation and keep them efficient for the term of their service ". Their scales of pay should not compare unfavourably with the scales of pay in Government. service or in public bodies like the Port Trust or the Railways. To prescribe any lower scales is to absorb only the leavings from the other services, as the best candidates would be attracted to the more remunerative appointments. Progressive promotions should be provided to retain attraction.

## Leave Reserves.

450. There is at present no systern of maintaining Leave Leave Reserves. Reserves in the Municipality. When candidates are recruited in leave vacancies they are not able to understand and follow the office routine or technique. Much time of the senior staff is thus wasted in training them, and in the meanwhile office work suffers. In Workshops and Factories such difficulties are got over by entertaining apprentices. In a large organization like the Municipality, hundreds go on leave every year and the aggregate hours lost in training new recruits must be not inconsiderable, so also the consequent loss of efficiency. This is not merely so in superior service, but it applies with equal force to labour. At present vacancies up to a period of one month are not filled as new recruits are not likely to be useful to maintain the continuity of work. Efficiency will be improved if a certain percentage of staff in each class based on the average number of persons who had gone on leave during the three preceding years is maintained as a Leave Reserve. No provision is made at present in the Annual Budget for acting appointments and Leave vacancies, and Budget grants are supplemented at the end of each year to meet extra expenditure on this account. This arrangement is not satisfactory. It will be
desirable to provide for permanent employment of Leave Reserves apart from the Budget provision* for acting arrangements in higher leave vacancies.

## Efficiency of Organization.

451. Th.is subject is strictly speaking outside the province of my inquiry. But as it bears closely on the

Increase in administrative work of the Commissioner. subject of efficient Executive, in that the best of the Executive may be crippled by effete organization, I touch upón it in passing, leaving the details to be worked out by the Executive. [The administrative work and routine has increased enormously but the machinery, which was devised as far back as 1888 , still continues with slight tinkering here and there.? The entire executive power and responsibility is vested in the Municipal Commissioner. Experience has fully demonstrated the wisdom of centering all authority and responsibility for executive action in a sole Commissioner. He alone is responsible for the initiation, supervision and defence of all executive action. His time is very frequently occupied in attending the meetings of the Corporation and the Standing Committee. Under the present arrangement the punctual and efficient disposal of current work is hardly within the power of one officer. To afford some relief to the Commissioner a scheme of appointing small executive sub-cornmittees of members of the Town Council with the Commissioner as ex-officio Chairman was suggested in the 1887 Bill, but it was not accepted by the Corporation. In the alternative, the post of a Deputy Municipal Commissioner was created. It was intended that the Deputy Commissioner would, in the absence of the Commissioner, take his place and exercise his powers.
452. When the post of the Deputy Commissioner was created

> Need for emabling the Dy. Commissioner to takepart in deliberations of the Corporation and Standing Committee in the absence of the Commissioner: as a temporary measure by Bombay Act, III of 1885, Mr. H. A. Acworth, who was then appointed to the post, attended the meetings of the Corporation as well as of the Town Council and took part in their deliberations. In the Bill of 1887, it was provided, on the analogy of Bombay Act III of 1885, that the Deputy Commissioner may act, in the Commissioner's stead, as a member of the Corporation or of the Town Council, or of any Committee

[^47]appointed under the Act, but the Legislative Council did not approve of this provision and enacted as follows :
> " It shall not be lawful for a Deputy Commissioner to appear in the Commissioner's stead at any meeting of the Corporation or Standing Committee or to exercise thereat any right or power of the Commissioner."

This provision was, however, repealed by Bombay Act I of 1897, and Mr. DuBoulay, who was the then Deputy Municipal Commissioner, attended the meetings of the Corporation and of the. Standing Committee and took part in their deliberations. The post of the Deputy Commissioner was not filled for a long time thereafter and there was thus no question of his attending the meetings of the Corporation and the Standing Cominittee. After it was filled in 1925, objection seems to have been taken to his taking part in the deliberations of the Corporation. When Mr. S. A. Shete, the then Deputy Commissioner, attended a meeting of the Corporation on 17th June 1933 and began to address the meeting, a point of order was raised, but Dr. M. C. Javle, the then Mayor, permitted Mr. Shete to address the meeting on the ground that the proviso prohibiting the Deputy Commissioner from taking part in the deliberations of the Corporation had been repealed. He, however, modified his. ruling at the next meeting of the Corporation held on 20th June 1933, and ob served that although the restriction had been removed, Section $36(t)$. which gave the Commissioner specific right to attend the meetings and to take part in the discussion had not been amended so as to extend that right to the Deputy Commissioner, and that if the Corporation thought that the Deputy Commissioner should be allowed to attend and take part in the discussions, when the Commissioner was absent Government should be moved to amend the Act. On several occasions, when the Commissioner was unavoidably absent, the Corporation were deprived of the privilege of obtaining information or explanation from the Executive even though the Deputy Commissioner was present at the meeting. It is, therefore, for consideration whether the Corporation should not move Government to amend the Municipal Act so as to enable the Deputy Commissioner to attend the meetings of the Corporation and the Standing Committee and to take part in their deliberations, in such contingencies.
453. There is a complaint that the Municipaladministration is

Adminuistration to be re-organized and decentraliced. matters are referred to the Commissioner or the Deputy Commissioner for sanction causing unnecessary correspondence and delay in the final disposal of work; that their time is so much occupied by the minutae of administration that it is impossible for them to give proper attention to larger problems of policies and improvements. There is much force in this complaint. The administration should therefore be reorganized and decentralised.
454. All the departments should be equally divided among the two Deputies having regard to the nature

All the Deportments to tween the two Dy. Comminsionorn. and volume of the work. If the Dy. Commissioner (Improvements) is unable to take over additional work, a third Deputy Commissioner should be appointed and placed in charge of some of the Departments. Most of the routine papers, which are now dealt with by the Commissioner, can be disposed of by them according to general instructions of the Commissioner, as also sanctioning the carrying out of works provided in the Budget subject to certain limits. Papers dealing with new policies and schemes and expenditure beyond the prescribed limits should go to the Commissioner.
455. The work as between the Deputy Commissioners and the Delogation of largex Heads of Departments can also be further Doworn to the Heade of decentralised so that the latter may be authorized to dispose of certain work subject of course to Budget provision and audit scrutiny. The Heads of Departments may also in their turn delegate certain of their powers to responsible officers under them within certain specified limits. The result of such delegation will be that much of the clerical labour that is now wasted will be saved and the Heads of Departments and the officers under them will see that their decisions are based on sound judgment and are unimpeachable. Efficiency in administration can be secured not only by obtaining efficient executive but also by providing them with proper environment and organisation where work is as evenly distributed as is possible and [no person is required to work beyond his capacity and endurance..

457. With the immediate possibility of the Greater Bombay Ward Committeea. scheme being ushered in, the responsibility of carrying on civic administration of areas beyond the present City limits will have to be faced by the Corporation. The post-war reconstruction schemes, the proposed acquisition of the B. E. S. \& T. Company and the schemes for augmenting the City's water supply will also add to their work. It will, therefore, be necessary to devise some system by which the work can be facilitated and carried on expeditiously. Apart from the Executive Committees recommended by Sir M. Visvesvaraya, the Corporation may consider the appointment of Ward Committees and delegation to them of certain powers so as to enable them to deal with matters-relating to local areas or the establishment of small Municipalities, in the City on the lines of District Municipalities as in Bandra, Kurla etc., while retaining for themselves the powers to deal with questions of policy and schemes affecting the whole of the Greater Bombay on the lines of the London County Council or the Provincial Government.
458. Efficiency can also be secured by reorganization and regrouping of certain departments, so that a better co-ordination can be attained. For seriem
charge of oooe officer. Hospitals can be placed under one Officer: At present the K.E.M. Hospital, which is a general hospital is under the Dean, while the Arthur Road Hospital, which is a hospital for infectious diseases,
the Turner Sanatorium and Maratha Hospital, which are intended for tubercular patients and the Municipal dispensaries and Maternity Homes, Venereal clinics are all under. the Executive Health Officer, who has also to attend to Public Health work like prevention of malaria, vaccination, inoculation, refuse removal, health propaganda, registration of births and deaths, prevention of adulteration of food, etc. If the Executive Health Officer is relieved of the responsibility in connection with the Hospitals and dispensaries, he will have more time to

The Executive Health Officer to be made responsible only for preven. tion of diseases. devote to sanitary work and prevention of diseases, and there would be no necessity of giving him the help of a Deputy to . relieve him of the present pressure of work. In Governm ment, the Surgeon General is in charge of all Government Hospitals and dispensaries, while the Director of Public Health attends to prevention of diseases. A similar division of work as between the Dean and the Executive Health Officer would bring greater co-ordination, efficiency and concentration of energy: In the event of such a division of work materialising, the Dean may have to be relieved of the supervision over the C.S. Medical College, which may Appointment of a be placed under an independent Principal. Principal for the G.S.M. The co-ordination of Ward Dispensaries and College- Hospitals in the City will on one hand provide better training, experience and prospects to the Medical Assistants, who are placed in charge of these dispensaries, and on the other to a better utilization of Municipal dispensaries and Hospitals by persons most deserving of free medical relief, in that the Ward Dispensaries would serve as feeders to the Hospitals. It may also help to augment the Hospital accommodation for the poor by providing a few beds in some of the Dispensaries according to the needs of particular localities. This will gradually relieve the present congestion in the K.E.M. Hospital. Such centralisation of hospital control will also lead to economy in administration and help in purchasing medicines, etc., in bulk.
459. The Superintendent of Licences, Shops and Establishments is now burdened with four branches, viz., control over hawkers, control over advertisements, licensing of storages and trades and administration of the Shops and Establishments Act. [It might lead to greater efficiency if the administration of the Shops and Establish-
ments Act is entrusted to a separate officer, 2 who might also be entrusted with the supervision of the Municipal Printing Press. The Municipal Press is now placed in charge of the Test Audit Officer. This was done as an experimental measure. [The work of the Press has so much increased that it is high time that it is placed in charge of an independent officer,

The Municipal Printing Press to be placed in charge of an independent officer. who is well conversant with the printing technique. If that is not possible, it may be put in charge of an officer, who may also look afier the work of the Shops and Establishments section as suggested above. [At any rate, I feel that the Test Audit Officer should be relieved of the supervision of the

Test Audit Officer to be releived of the Supervision of the Municipal Printing Press. Municipal Printing Press so that he may be able to devote more time and attention to his normal work, which is to supervise Revenue Audit, to test check accounts of the departments, to pay surprise visits to the works that are being carried on in the City, to carry out inquiries into any complaints of bribery and corruption on behalf of the Commissioner.]
460. Similarly, the Election and Town Duty Department may be amalgamated with the Assessment and Collection Department. In Calcutta the Revenue. Officer is in charge of the collection of Taxes as well as The Election and Town
Duty Deparmeat to be
amalgamated with the
A sersment Dopartment. collection of Town Duties or octroi. At present both the departments fall under one unit for purposes of recruitment. It should not, therefore, be difficult to combine the two departments. The amalgamation is bound to lead to efficiency in that some of the staff in the Election and Town Duty Department, which is not fully occupied all the year round, may be of some assistance to the Assessment Department. Likewise, when the Election and Town Duty Department is hardpressed during seasonal work, the Assessment Department may be able to render it help. Thus, both the Departments would stand to gain by the amalgamation. It may be noted that the Election work was originally done by the Assessment Department, but after the introduction of the tenancy franchise, the work was entrusted to a separate officer. As the work is occasional several experiments were tried by transferring the work from one department to another. According to the Municipal Act, the Electoral Roll has to be kept up to date and for that purpose some staff has been appointed. This work is not
continuous, but it is laborious at the time of General Elections. The advantage of amalgamating this department with the Assessment Department is that this work of enrolling new voters and eliminating those who have been disenfranchised by death or otherwise may be divided equally among all the members of the Ward stoff and the staff now working as enumerators, who will be relieved of this work to a great extent, can be utilised for the Assessment work. The responsibility of supervising this work may continue with the present Election and Town Duty Officer, who will continue to be of the rank of an Assistant Assessor. He may be authorised to deal directly with the Deputy Municipal Commissioner at the time of General Elections. The spare time at the disposal of this officer can very well be devoted to render some help to the Assessment Department. The Town Duty work can be transferred to one of the other Assistant Assessors or to the Deputy Assessor at the time of the Ceneral Elections.
461. Despatch work may also be centralized to some advantCentralization of des- age. At present each department arranges for patch. its despatch with the result that over a dozen peons from different departments are probably employed on delivering despatch in the Fort area alone. If this work is centralized, considerable economy can be effected. Similarly, the despatch from Ward offices to the Head Office and vice versa is sent by each department with a separate peon. If this work is arranged by a motor van by one Central Despatch department, considerable economy can be effected and the despatches may reach their destinations more quickly.
462. Ward offices can also be centralized in one Ward office Centralization of Ward building in each ward to a great advantage. Offices. At present partial centralization exists at Gowalia Tank, Babula Tank, and Sankli Street, where some of the departmental ward offices are housed together. But greater efficiency and economy can be attained by perfecting this arrangement and extending it to other Wards. Such an arrangement will undoubtedly be appreciated by the public, who have now to visit different ward offices at different places for different Municipal work. This will be a necessary corollory to the establishment of Ward Municipalities or Ward Committees. referred to in paragraph 457 above. Sir M. Visvesvaraya had advocated centralisation of ward offices in his report onNMunicipal Retrenchment and Reform in the following words:
" The first necessity of a Ward at the present time is to provide a central building and to locate in it all or as many of the Municipal ward offices as possible. In most of the wards a building can easily be constructed on land belonging to the Corporation or the existing buildings may be enlarged and improved for the purpose. A central office would further result in indirect savings by the reduction of repair costs, the closer supervision over clerical staff, better coooperation of the different offices and more efficient administration generally". The Corporation may consider this suggestion in connection with the Post-War Planning.
463. Efficiency can also be maintained and improved by a Municipal Recoarch continuous study of the conditions and Bureau. requirements of the City. In Western countries such studies are conducted either by expert staff or by civic agencies, associations or institutes. Both the forms of research constitute a synthesis of Municipal experience, and a laboratory where the needs of the City may be analysed and improvements suggested. Sir M. Visvesvaraya had suggested, as far back as 1925 , the establishment of a Research Bureau by the Bombay Municipality, especially as many American Cities had made rapid progress as a result of the labours of such research. But the idea was not pursued. It would be advisable for the Municipality to establish a Research Bureau. Its functions should be, as set out by Sir M. Visvesvaraya, as follows:-
(1) To collect and compile statistics of City life and City administration.
(2) To collect up-to-date information concerning the methods of administration and developments adopted in progressive foreign City administrations.
(3) To standardize the progress and methods of administration in the various departments by the preparation of suitable Rules, Manuals or Codes, to maintain an up-to-date library of Municipal reports and publications issued by the more progressive foreign City Administrations.
(4) To prepare and publish authoritative offcial information ' for the use of departments.
(5) To stimulate interest in the civic affairs by spreading among the: itizens useful information concerning them in brief and understandable form.

This Bureau may also undertake the publication of a Municipal Journal as in Calcutta.
464. These official labours may be supplemented by a nonCivic Institute. official organization like a Civic Institute, where civic problems may be studied and discussed without any departmental bias and where thought may fertilize thought and lead to constructive work, advice and guidance. It is said that Municipal civilization is nothing but a struggle to get conditions of civic life better planned. The tempo of this struggle can be accelerated by coneerted and constant research and study of civic problems both by official and non-official organizations. In this connection, the proposed establishment of a Civic Chair in the Bombay University is on encouraging and welcome sign of the importance and emphasis the subject of civics is now receiving.
465. Allied to the need for a Research Institute, is the need Municipal Central for a Central Library, particularly of Library. Municipal literature, with branches all over the City. The library movement in India is still in its infancy. In Bombay, there are a few public libraries. The Municipality has started 13 Libraries and Reading Rooms in the City. They are all on a small scale and are located in labour class localities. Although they are useful in a way, they do not provide information of value to the citizens. The selection of books must, therefore, be purposeful viz., intended to train an average citizen in the art of citizenship. Local Government is broadly defined as the gentle art of living together. Living together creates many problems as much for the average citizen as for the civic autharities. . It is in a synthesis of individual needs and the communal weal, that local government finds its fulfilment. This spirit of $f_{c}$ mutual adjustment can be inculcated by the education of citizens in the art of citizenship, for which purpose libraries would serve as a convenient instrument of education.

## PART VI.

CHAPTER XXXVIII.

## Conclusion and Summary of Recommendations.

466. The recommendations with regard to the revision of Additional cont involved individual grades and allowances will be found under the propoped revi- in Appendix C. A summary of the total cost involved in respect of each department will be found in Appendix D. The total additional cost under Budget A for the next year will be Rs. $7,69,298$ and on the basis of averages it will be Rs. 20,78,053. The total additional cost under Budget B for the next year will be Rs. 63,379 and on the basis of averages it will be Rs. 1,66,330.
467. This cost may briefly be analysed as under-


The immedjate additional cost shown above is worked out on the basis of two increments to employees whose graded scale is fixed with an annual increment of rupee one and of one increment to other employees over and above the existing salaries. If the recommendations made in paragraph 469 for giving additional increments according to the length of service are accepted there will be a further immedjate expenditure of about Rs. 2 lakhs.
468. The effect of my other proposals is as follows :-

Additivanal cost iavolved
in rempect of other recoun-

## mendations.

(i) One day off in a week to all those who are now alluwed only half day off or no off in a week ( 10,100 in number). Rs. 4,87,000.
(ii) Labourers on Daily wages who have worked for at ieast 26 days in a month for a continuous periord of two years to be brought on the Permanent Schedule (About 4,000 in number). Rs. 1,37,770.
(iii) Privilege leave for 15 days to persons hitherto not amenable to such leave ( 16,370 in number). Rs. 2,54,200.
(iv) Leave Reserves (Clerical establishneent, Ward Inspectors, etc.). Rs. 2,70,000
The proposals Nos. (i) to (iv) may be given effect to in the order of priority mentioned above. These proposals may involve the employment of additional staff in the departments concerned for calculation and maintenance of leave accounts of a large number of persons, who will be newly admitted to leave concessions and in the Chief Accountant's Office for verifying and checking them.
469. The proposals with regard to the revision of salaries may How revision proposals be given effect to as follows !may be given effect to.
(i) Where the difference between the salary now drawn by an employee and the minimum proposed for his revised grade is more than the amount of one increment in his existing grade, he may be started on the initial salary of the new grade, and where such difference is less than the amount of one increment, he may be started in the revised grade with one increment over the initial salary.
(2) Where an employee, not falling in clause (1), in being fixed in the new grade, gets benefit of less than one increment in his original grade he may be started on the next higher stage of the new grade.
(3) In the case of employees in inferior service, whether on fixed or incremental pay, their pay in the revised grades may be fixed as follows :-
(a) Those who have put in more than 9 months' continuous service or 31st March 1946 may be allowed '... One increment
(b) Do. do. 5 years' service on 31st March 1946 may be allowed. "Two inerements
(c) Do. do 10 years' service on 31 st March 1946 may be allowed... Three .
(d) Do. do. 15 years' service on 31st March 1946 may be allowed... Four
(e) Do do. 20 years service on 31st March 1946 may be allowed... Five
470. It have, as far as possible, attempted to standardise the Existing seniority of grades in the different departments and to fix employeen inter se should graded scales where the pay is fixed at present be maintained. in order to remove stagnation. The total number of grades at present is 221 . Under my proposals this number has decreased to 188 (vide Appendix E). If, under these proposals, or in any modifications that $r$ ay be rrade therein by the authorities that will be considering these proposals, the seniority of any employees inter se is disturbed, I suggest that it should not be considered to have affected their seniortiy for future Qaalifications to be promotions. Where the minimum of, a prescribed for posts where
the minimum is now raised
post has been raised under these proposals to Re. 500 and above to Rs. 500 or more, the Corporation will have to prescribe qualifications for it. (vide Appendix F.)
471. It is of the utmost importance that in granting selief the higher and the lower staff should be treated
No discriminition should be made in granting relief. alike. Any relief to one class of employees as distinct from or in preference to any other class would create discontent, dissatisfaction and disillusionment, and would lead to impairment of efficiency. The efficiency of Municipal administration depends as much on the organizing ability, care and vigilance of the supervising staff as on the sweat, toil and labour of the inferior staff. It is the same old problem as to whether the brain or the brawn contributes more to the success of the administration. Both form the warp and woof of the Municipal fabric. To weaken the will of one to work by disappointment and frustration, while keeping the other satisfied and strong will disturb the whole equilibrium of the administration. More hours of work of labour may be lost by slack supervision. Less economy may be effected by lack of zeal or enthusiasm on the part of the "steel frame" of the administration. It is in the perfect co-ordination of the two elements and their common contentment that an economic, efficient and vigorous administration can be built up and sustained. In my proposals, I have tried to give fair and equal treatment to all, and, I would urge that the benefits of revision be conferred on the superior, the subordinate and the inferior staff alike without distinction or discrimination

## Summary of General Recommendations.

1. No differentiation should be made in the basic wage for men and women. The Grade for Peons, Malis, Scavengering men Halalkhores etc., should be Rs. 25-1. 35 and that for Scavengering and Halalkhore women should be Rs. 25-1.30. (Paras. 34, 285, 293, 294)
2. Candidates for clerical service who are Double Graduates should be started on Rs. 85 and Honours Graduates and Stenographers on Rs. 80 and Pass Graduates on Rs. 75 in the grade of Rs. 60-5-100-6-160 and for the Ward Inspector's posts in the Assessment Department on Rs. 95, Rs. 90 and Rs. 85 , in the grade of Rs. 75-5-100-7-170, respectively. (Paras. 96 and 276)
3. The Election and Town Duty Officer should be given an allowance of Rs. 150 per month at the time of the General Election Work. (Para. 103)
4. The Hydraulic Engineer should be given, after he has been on the maximum for some time, a Personal Allowance of Rs. 200 in two stages of Rs. 100 each. (Para. 129)
5. The designation of "Inspectors" in the Hydraulic Engineer's, and the City Engineer's Department should be changed to "SubEngineers". The Sub-Engineer's grade for B.E.s should be Rs. 180-10-270 and for non-B.Es. Rs. 160-10-250. (Paras. 133 and 207)
6. The grade of the Sub-Overseers in the Hydraulic Engineer's, City Engineer's and the City Improvement Schemes Departments be fixed at Rs. 75-5-110-10-160 with a starting pay of Rs. 85 for those holding Diplomas and the designation "Sub-Overseer" bechanged to "Overseer". (Paras. 134, 208 and 266)
7. The Executive Health Officer should be given, after he has been on the maximum for some time, a Personal Allowance of Rs. 200 by two stages of Rs. 100 each. (Para. 151).
8. Provision of Telephones at the residences of Assistant Health Officers may be considered by the Municipal Commissioner on merits. (Para. 153)
9. The designation of Assistant Sanitary Inspectors should be changed to "Sanitary Inspectors". (Para, 155)
10. Free messing arrangement should be made for the Nursing staff at the Maratha Hospital. (Para,d65)
11. The City Engineer should be given, after he has been on the maximum for some time, a Personal Allowance of Rs. 300 in three stages of Rs. 100 each. (Para. 200)
12. Ordinary Draftsmen to be given a grade of Rs. 75-5-160 and those possessing G.D. Arch, qualification a grade of Rs. 160-8200 and A.R.I.B.s. Rs. 275-25-450. (Para. 209)
13. The percentage of higher posts in the clerical cadre should be fixed as follows (Para. 280):-

1 Head Clerk for every 7 Clerks.
1 Chief Clerk for every 3 Head Clerks, or important Section or Branch.
1 Office Superintendent for each important Department.
14. The ratio of higher posts to which Peons can aspire should be increased by creating more posts of Havaldars so that there might be one Havaldar for every 12 posts of Peons. (Para. 285)
15. The posts of Naiks should be converted into Havaldars. ${ }^{\text { }} \sim$ (Para 286)
16. Halalkhores and Scavengers should not be charged any rent provided they do not entertain any lodgers who are not in Municipal service. (Para. 297)
17. Anomalies in the existing provision of rent free quarters, or quarters at a percentage or fixed rent, should be reviewed by the Commissioner or by an independent officer. (Para. 298)
18. Cases where free electricity or lighting is provided should be carefully scrutinized and the concession revoked where not justified. (Para. 299)
19. The Municipality should build quarters for its inferio ${ }^{r}$ staff and charge it economic rent, where it is not now entitled to rent free quarters. (Para. 306)
20. The Municipality should provide adequate sanitary, water supply and lighting arrangements wherever it has already provided housing accommodation. (Para. 307)
21. The minimum size of a room to be provided to a Municipal servant should be 180 sq. ft.. (Para. 307)
22. The Municipality should embark on a ten years' programme for housing its labour. (Para. 307)
23. The demand of the Municipal Labour Unions to allow dependants of workers to stay with them in rent free quarters without charging' any rent therefor may be conceded, provided the number of such dependants is limited to one, and provided such person is unemployed. (Para. 307)
24. When workers without families are to be clubbed together. in one room, choice should be given to them, as far as possible, to select their own partners. (Para. 307)
25. The dernand for free railway pass, where rent free quarters are provided, is not justified and the concession, at any rate, need not be extended. (Para, 307)
26. The existing practice of charging rent to employees for the quarters occupied by them when they are on leave for more than four months should be allowed to continue. (Para. 307)
27. The family of a deceased employee, who was provided with free quarters, may be allowed to live in those quarters upto a period of 2 months after the death of the employee without payment of any rent. (Para. 307)
28. Municipal Officers should be placed on par with Covernment Offcers in the matter of percentage increase allowed over the basic rate of Conveyance Allowance (Para. 315)
29. The rate of Dearness Allowance now paid should be continued until such time as the Corporation consider that a reduction is necessary haying regard to the fall in the cost of living, (Para. 329).
30. There is no case for cost price grain shops in view of the introduction of rationing and price control by Government. (Para. 330)
31. Nurses should be given not more than 8 hours duty per day. As regards others, where the hours of work are more than 9 per day, they should be reduced to 9 . (Para. 338)
32. The existing provisions regarding payment of over-time are adequate and need no change. (Para. 343)
33. It is necessary in the interest of the health of Municipal employees to prescribe a maximum period for over-time either on daily, monthly, or yearly basis. (Para. 344)

34 Over-time should be restricted only to those, who, after workng the whole day, are unable to finish the work, which, is of such a nature that it cannot be postponed to the next day. (Para. 345)
35. Ail Municipal employees should be granted a weekly off. When a common holiday for all the workers in the same department cannot be arranged, as in the case of Conservancy, Hospital, and Market staff, they should be given a weekly of by rotation. (Para. 350)
36. The recommendations made by the Labour Commission in the matter of inflicting fines, viz., that the acts or omissions giving rise to fines should be specified, that the maximum amount of fine should not exceed half an anna in the rupee of the worker's earnings per month, etc., should be followed. (Para. 356)
37. Orders of discharge or distrissal should be passed by the Heads of Departments or by some responsible official to safeguard aginst the abuse of the power. (Fara. 360)
38. A Labour Offcer should be appointed to study labour conditions, to investigate into the grievances of labour and to maintain liaison between the labour and the executive. (Para. 362)
39. Supervision of welfare activities should be entrusted to the Labour Officer, who should be assisted by the Welfare Organizer in this matter. (Para. 363)
40. The existing provisions with regard to the grant of Casual Leave are adequate and should be continued. (Para. 369)
41. All employees in inferior service (new entrants), whether permanent or temporary, provided they are in continuous service for 22 months and are not likely to be discharged, should be entitled to 30 days' leave on full pay for 22 months' duty. (Para. 375)
42. No change is called for in the existing rules as regards leave allowed to others except that in the case of tem.porary employees (new entrants) in the superior service and temporary as well as permanent employees in inferior service, in whose case accumulation of leave may be permitted upto 45 days as against 30 days now provided. (Para. 381)
43. Out of the total Sick leave on half-pay allowed to new entrants both in the superior and inferior service, 6 months may be allowed to be converted into 3 months Sick leave on full pay, the remaining leeve continuing to be on half pay. (Para. 382)
44. For the purposes of granting Matemity Leave to female workers, casual breaks in the qualifying service should be condoned. (Para. 384)
45. The question of granting public or sectional holidays, where the staff is not allowed such concession, should be left to the consideration and convenience of the departments concerned. (Pára. 388)
46. All those, who are continuously in employment (authorised absence being included in this period) for two years and who have a reasonable prospect of being continued for a long period should be brought on the permanent schedule. (Para. 391)
47. All persons should be allowed a weekly holiday, except those who are employed on seasonal or ad hoc work or engaged on some contract work to be finished within a stipulated time. (Para. 391)
48. The labour staff should not be coerced against their will to join the Provident Fund, as any wage cut on this score is likely to be viewed by them with disfavour. It must be left to persuasion, education and conviction. (Para. 394)
49. The question of providing uniforms on a more liberal scale to those to whom they are now supplied and of providing them to others who are not now entitled to them should be left to the Commissioner for consideration after the present controls and restrictions are removed. (Para. 398)
50. A Health Insurance . Scheme should be devised in the interest of health, efficiency and morale of the staff. (Para. 405)
51. Facilities for drinking water, retiring shelters, sanitary arrangements, canteens, etc., for workers should be provided at all permanent centres of work where they are non-existent and they should be extended where they are inadequate. Creches should be opened at convenient places by the Health Department for the benefit of Halalkhore women. (Para. 407)
52. Soap and washing facilities should be provided, as and when feasible, at various work centres to enable workers to wash themselves after the day's work. (Para. 407).
53. A Free Medical dispensary should be opened at each of the Municipal Welfare Centres. (Para. 409)
54. Cycle peons for carrying despatches should be employed in the departments where the despatch is normally very heavy until a Central Despatch scheme is brought into force. (Para. 412)
55. Employment of relatives in the same department should be discouraged as it undermines efficiency and lends itself to undesirable influences. (Para. 413)
56. The system of appointing Badlis by Mukadams at their sweet will should be done away with and the badli system should be systematized, regulated and controlled. (Para. 415)
57. The Pali system should also be regulated and controlled. (Para. 416)
58. The Municipality should engage women Mukadams as an experimental measure to supervise the work of women labour. (Para. 418)
59. Collection of membership fees by Labour Unions within Municipal premises, where the labourers work, is not desirable and should be discouraged. (Para. 420)
60. The question of raising the General Tax if necessary and of requesting Covernment to grant additional sources of income to the Municipality to meet the growing expenditure should be considered. (Paras. 421-434)
61. The question of acquiring the B. E. S. T. Co. and the Gas Co., etc., and starting new public utility enterprises and utilising the profits thereof in relief of rates should be considered. (Paras. 435-438)
62. The Entrance examination for candidates to clerical posts should be revived as early as possible. (Para 444)
63. The standard of departmental examination viz., for Head Clerks' and Chief Clerks' posts should be raised to make it a real test of knowiedge and efficiency and to select men of right calibre. The present Chief Clerks' examination should be done away with except for the selection of competent persons from among those who now hold Head Clerks posts or who have so far passed the Head Clerks' examination. (Para. 444)
64. Recruitment to subordinate technical posts should be made, as in Covernment, on the number of marks obtained by candidates in their last University or Diploma examination. (Para. 445)
65. In the recruitment to higher administrative and technical appointments a fair balance should be maintained as between outside and departmental recruits. (Para. 446)
66. Outside recruitment should, instead of being made straightway at the top, be preferably made at a lower rung of the official ladder, on the lines of recruitment to Government Provincial Services through a Municipal Service Commission appointed on the lines of Public Service Commission. (Para. 448)
67. The scales of pay of Municipal Officers should not compare unfavourably with the scales of pay of Officers in Covernment service or in public bodies like the Port Trust or the Railways, and progressive promotions should be provided to retain attraction. (Para. 449)
68. Leave Reserves should be appointed in each class of appointments to minimise loss of efficiency or a break in continuity on the basis of the average number of persons who had proceeded on leave during the preceding 3 years, and provision should also be made in the Budget for acting appointments in higher leave vacancies. (Para. 450)
69. The Deputy Commissioner should be enabled, by an amendment of the Municipal Act, to attend the meetings of the Corporation and the Standing Committee and to take part in their deliberations in the unavoidable absence of the Commissioner. (Para. 452)
70. All the departments should be equally divided among the two Deputy Commissioners, having regard to the nature and volume of the work. If the Deputy Commisisioner (Improvements) is unable to take over additional work, a third Deputy Commissioner should be appointed and placed in charge of some of the departments. (Para. 454)
71. Some of the work of the Deputy Commissioners should be decentralised and the Heads of Departments should be authorised to dispose of routine work subject to budget provision and audit scrutiny. (Para. 455)
72. The Corporation should consider (i) the appointment of Ward Committees and delegation of powers to them to deal with matters relating to local areas or, (ii) the establishment of Ward Municipalities, while retaining for themselves the power to deal with questions of policy and schemes affecting the whole of Bombay. (Para. 457)
73. All Municipal dispensaries and hospitals should be placed under one Officer for better co-ordination and economy. (Para. 458)
74. The Executive Health Officer should be placed in charge of only the Sanitary and Public Health work and prevention of diseases. (Para. 458)
75. The Gordhandas Sunderdas Medical College should be placed under an independent Officer to be designated as "Principal". (Para. 458)
76. The Superintendent of Licences, Shops and Establishments should be relieved of the work in connection with the administration of the Shops and Establishments Act, which must be entrusted to a separate officer. Until such time, however, he should continue to draw the allowance of Rs. 100 p.m. now allowed to him for this work. (Paras. 225 \& 459)
77. The Test Audit Officer should be relieved of the supervision of the Municipal Printing Press and it should be placed onder an independent officer, who is well conversant with the printing technique; and if this is not possible its supervision to be entrusted to the separate officer proposed for the Administration of the Shops and Establishments Act. (Para. 459)
78. The Election and Town Duty Department may be amalgamated with the Assessor and Collector's Department. (Para. 460)
79. Despatch work may be centralised. (Para. 461)
80. All Ward Offices should be housed in ore central building in each Ward. (Para. 462)
81. A Municipal Research Bureau should be established where the conditions and requirements of the City may be studied. It should also undertake publication of a Municipal Journal. (Para. 463)
82. A non-official Civic Institute should be started where civic problems may be studied and discussed without departmental bias. (Para. 464)
83. A Municipal Central Library should be started with branches all over the City. These libraries should be utilized as an instrument of education in the art of citizenship. (Para. 465)

30th August 1945.
D. V. NADKARNI, Special Officer.

## Appendix A

Table showing the Cost of Living Index Numbers from August 1914 to June 1945.

|  | Year. |  | January. | February. | March. | April. | May. | June. | July. | August. | September. | October. | November | December |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1914 |  | ... | ... | $\ldots$ | $\cdots$ | $\ldots$ | ... | ... | $\cdots$ | 102 | 103 | 103 | 103 | 105 |
| 1915 |  | ... | 107 | 107 | 106 | 104 | 103 | 104 | 104 | 106 | 110 | 113 | 112 | 113 |
| 1916 |  | $\cdots$ | 115 | 109 | 108 | 106 | 105 | 107 | 108 | 109 | 109 | 109 | 113 | 116 |
| 1917 |  | ... | 120 | 117 | 113 | 112 | 111 | 116 | 118 | 120 | 120 | 121 | 127 | 129 |
| 1918 |  | ... | 134 | 134 | 136 | 144 | 147 | 148 | 149 | 153 | 165 | 175 | 175 | 183 |
| 1919 |  | -.. | 182 | 176 | 172 | 167 | 168 | 174 | 186 | 179 | 172 | 174 | 173 | 174 |
| 1920 |  | -. | 183 | 181 | 177 | 172 | 173 | 181 | 190 | 191 | 192 | 193 | 186 | 181 |
| 1921 |  | ... | 169 | 162 | 160 | 160 | 167 | 173. | 177 | 180 | 185 | 183 | 182 | 179 |
| 1922 |  | "' | 173 | 165 | 165 | 162 | 163 | 163 | 165 | 164 | 165 | 162 | 160 | 161 |
| 1923 |  | ... | 156 | 155 | 154 ' | 156 | 153 | 152 | 153 | 154 | 154 | 152 | 153 | 157 |
| 1924 |  | .... | 159 | 156 | 154 | 150 | 150 | 153 | 157 | 161 | 161 | 161 | 161 | 160 |
| 1925 |  | ... | 157 | . 157 | 159 | 158 | 156 | 154 | 157 | 152 | 151 | 153 | 153 | 155 |
| 1926 |  | $\cdots$ | $\because 155$ | 154 | 155 | 153 | 153 | 155 | 157 | 155 | 155 | 155 | 154 | 156 |
| 1927 |  | ... |  | 155 | 155 | 153 |  | 154 | 156 |  | 154 | 151 | 150 | 151 |
| 1928 |  | ... | 154 | 148 | 145 | 144 | 147 | 146 | 147 | 146 | 145 | 146 | 147 | 148 |
| 1929 |  | $\ldots$ | 149 | 148 | 149 | 148 | 147 | 147 | 148 | $\begin{array}{r}149 \\ \hline\end{array}$ | 149 | 149 | 150 | 150 |
| 1930 |  | ... | 147 | 144 | 141. | 140 | 139 | 140 | 139 | - 136 | 136 | 131 | 127 | 121 |


| 1931 | ... | 117 | 113 | 111 | 111 | 110 | 109 | 108 | 108 | 108 | 108 | 108 | 109. |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1932 | ... | 110 | 110 | 111 | 108 | 107 | 107 | 109 | 109 | 109 | 109 | 110 | 110 |
| 1933 | ... | 109 | 106 | 106 | 101 | 100 | 104 | 103 | 103 | 102 | 100 | 101 | 98 |
| 1934 | ... | 96 | 96 | 94 | 93 | 94 | 95 | $\begin{array}{r} 97 \\ (97) \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 97 \\ (98) \end{array}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 100 \\ & (99) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 100 \\ (100) \end{array}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 101 \\ & (101) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 99 \\ (100) \end{array}$ |
| 1935 | ... | $\begin{array}{r} 98 \\ (99) \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 99 \\ (98) \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 98 \\ (99) \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 98 \\ (98) \end{array}$ | $\begin{gathered} 100 \\ (99) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 101 \\ (101) \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 101 \\ -(101) \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 103 \\ (102) \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 103 \\ (102) \end{array}$ | $\begin{gathered} 103 \\ (101) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 104 \\ & (101) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 105 \\ (102) \end{array}$ |
| 1936 | ... | $\begin{array}{r} 103 \\ 103) \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 102 \\ (102) \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 102 \\ (102) \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 100 \\ 1000 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 100 \\ (101) \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 100 \\ 1000 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 101 \\ (101) \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 101 \\ (101) \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 102 \\ (101) \end{array}$ | $\begin{gathered} 103 \\ (102) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 104 \\ (102) \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 103 \\ (102) \end{array}$ |
| 1937 | ." | $\begin{gathered} (103) \\ 104 \\ (104) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} (102) \\ 104 \\ (104) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} (102) \\ 104 \\ (104) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & (100) \\ & 104 \\ & (105) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} (101) \\ 104 \\ (105) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & (100) \\ & 106 \\ & (105) \end{aligned}$ | ${ }_{107}$ | (108 | ${ }_{108}$ | $\begin{array}{r}108 \\ \hline\end{array}$ | ${ }^{107}$ | (107 |
| 1938 |  | 107 | 107 | 107 | 105 | 104 | - 105 | 106 | 105 | 105 | 105 | 106 | 104 |
| 1939 | $\ldots$ | 105 | 104 | 103 | 103 | 103 | 104 | 105 | 105 | 106 | 108 | 109 | 113 |
| 1940 | $\ldots$ | 114 | 112 | 110 | 110 | 111 | 111 | 113 | 114 | 112 | 113 | 113 | 115 |
|  |  | 117 | 119 | 119 | 121 | 122 | 122 | 126 | 131 | 129 | 125 | 126 | 129 |
| 1942 | ... | 137 | 135 | 137 | 138 | 142 | 152 | 168 | 168 | 170 | 172 | 178 | 188 |
| 1943 | ... | 203 | 205 | 208 | 225 | 227 | $\begin{aligned} & 232^{*} \\ & 235 t \end{aligned}$ | 236 | 238 | 245 | 248 | 248 | 247 |
| $\begin{aligned} & 1944 \\ & 1945 \end{aligned}$ | ... | $\begin{aligned} & 238 \\ & 229 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 230 \\ & 229 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 226 \\ & 225 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2326 \\ & 226 \end{aligned}$ | 235 230 | $\begin{aligned} & 236 \\ & 235 \end{aligned}$ | 241 | 250 | 239 | 239 | 242 | 236 |

* May and Juae 1943 Index No. for period ending 15th.
+ June 1943. Index No. for Calendar Month.
- Note.-Index Nos. from August 1914 to June 1937 published in the Labour Gazette are compiled on base July 1914 equal to 100. The method adopted was the aggregate consumption method, the average and scope of the method of compilation are published in the issues of the Labour Gazette for September was the aggregate consumption method, he average and scope of the method of compliation are published in the issues or he Labour Gazette for September
1921, September 1923 and April 1929. The Index Nos. of June 1937 and onwards published in the Latour Gazette are according to revised cost of living Index number and for the purposes of comparison back Index Nos. which are given in brackets since July 1934 have also been worked out on the revised Index number and for the purposes of comparison back index Nos, which are givenin brackets since july 934 have aso been worked out on the revised
methed. Since May 1943 onwards the method of compilation of cereals of group Index Nos. has been readjusted owing to the difficulty of obtaining method, Since May 1943 onwards the meth
the price quotations for the selected varieties.


## Appendix B:

Statement showing the total income and expenditure, and cost of establishment and labour from 1933-34 to 1945-46. (000 Omitted for items Nos. 1 to 5).


|  | Agtuals |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | 1933-34. 1934-35. 1935-36. 1936-37. 1937-38. 1938-39. 1939-40. 1940-41. 1941-42. 1942-43. 1943-44. 1944-45. 1945-46. |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Percentage of Establishrnent and Labour chargee to Income. | 21.51 | 21.12 | 20.88 | 21.45 | 21.58 | 21.58 | 22.39 | 22.08 | 21.62 | 20.38 | 19.98 | 21.62 | 19.32 |
| Percentage of Establishment, Labour and Deamesa Allowance charges to Income. | ... | ** | ... | $\cdots$ | ... | $\cdots$ | $\cdots$ | 22.92 | 22.46 | 22.88 | 26.03 | 29.82 | 28.89 |
| Percentage of Establishment and Laboir charges to Expenditure. | 20.76 | 21.33 | 21.60 | 21.53 | 21.76 | 22.40 | 22.34 | 21.91 | 22.13 | 21.74 | 20.64 | 20.45 | 17.39 |
| Percentage of Establishment, Labour and Deamess Allowance charges to Expenditure. | ** | $\cdots$ | *** | ** | $\cdots$ | $\cdots$ | ** | 22.74 | 22.99 | 24.41 | 26.90 | 28.19 | 26.01 |

Percentages of Increase or Decrease in Income, Expenditure, Establishment and Labour Charges over the figures for 1933-34.

- Denotes Increase. - Denotes Decrease.

|  |  | 1934-35. | 1935-36. | 1936-37. | 1937.38. | $1938-39$. | $1939-40$. | $1940-41$. | $1941-42$. | $1942-43$. | $1943-44$. |
| :--- | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| Income | $\ldots$ | +1.65 | +3.06 | +2.05 | +5.09 | +10.66 | +10.31 | +13.42 | +17.03 | 23.83 | +28.59 |
| Expenditure | $\ldots$ | -2.87 | -3.85 | -1.91 | +0.60 | +2.86 | +6.73 | +10.34 | +10.35 | +12.02 | +20.10 |
| Establishment | $\ldots$ | +0.85 | +2.05 | +5.43 | +10.90 | +15.57 | +17.78 | +18.14 | +19.44 | +18.59 | +20.96 |
| Labour | $\ldots$ | -2.19 | -3.95 | -5.48 | -5.26 | +2.06 | +9.16 | +13.15 | +14.12 | +14.82 | +16.44 |

## Appendix C.

Statement of proposals of Revision of Grades showing the cost based on the existing average and proposed average, as also cost as per existing rates and as per immediate recommendations.


[^48]


[^49]



*Rs. 100 only if motor car is mantained other 75.












*The Conveyance Allowance of Rs. 50 was meant for the Chief Librarian. The post is kept vacant and the Curator of the Victoria and Albert Museum has been pat in charge of the Libraries with a special pay of Rs. 100 per month and a Conveyance Allowance of Rs, 25 which is now proposed to be increased to Rs. 30.

| Present Scalk |  |  |  |  |  |  | No. of posts. | Designation. | Proposmi Scale. |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| No. of posts. | Designation. | Pay or Grade. | Average fixed. | Total average cost. | Total cost as per Establish ment Schedule. | $\xrightarrow[\text { Rate. Amount. }]{\text { Allowances. }}$ |  |  | Pay or Grade. A | Average fixed. | Total average cost. | Total immediate cost as per recommende- tions. | $\overbrace{\text { Ratc. Amount. }}^{\text {Allowancea. }}$ |
|  |  | Brought over | Rs. | $\begin{gathered} \mathrm{Rg}_{8 .} \\ 5,184 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \mathrm{R}_{8} \\ 4.960 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{array}{ll} \hline \text { Rs. } & \text { Rss } \\ 540 \end{array}$ |  |  |  | Rs. | $\begin{array}{r} \mathrm{R}_{\mathrm{s}} \\ 6,428 \end{array}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Rs. } \\ 5,462 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{array}{ll} \text { Rs. } & \text { Rs. }^{7} \\ 700 \end{array}$ |
|  | V.-Public Health Department-contd. |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 9 | Head Clerks ... | R. 140-5-180 | 168 | 1,512 | 1,333 | ... | 9 | Head Clerks ... | ... Rs. 160-8-200 ... | 190 | 1,710 | 1,605 |  |
| 1 | Senior Clerk .... | Rs. 90-5-140 | 123 | 123 | $110^{\circ}$ | ... ... | 1 | Clerk | . Rs. 60-5-100-6-160. | 113 | 113 | 116 |  |
| 53 | Clerks | Rs. 60-5-150 | 108 | 5,724 | 7,901 | ... ... | 53 | Clerks | ... Rs. 60-5-100-6-160. | 113 | 6,007 | 8,219 |  |
| 55 | Clerka | Rs. 55-4-115-5-14 | . 97 | 5,362 | 4,232 | ... ... | 55 | Clerks | ... Rs. 60-5-100-6-160. | 113 | 6,233 | 4,518 | - ... ... |
| 1 | Stemographer ... . . | . Rs. 75-4-115-5. ${ }^{\text {a }}$ | 0. 112 , | 112 | 86 | ... ... | 1 | Junior Stenographer | ... Rs. 80-5-100-6-160. | 128 | 128 | 91 | ... ... |
|  | Typist | Rs. 55-4-115-5-14 | 97 | 97 | 66 | ... ... | 1 | Typist | ... Rs. 60-5-100-6-160. | 113 | 113 | 60 |  |
| 7 | Senior Medical Inapectors. | Rs. 250-10-350 | $311{ }^{\circ}$ | 2,177 | 2,265 | $\begin{array}{cc} \text { C.A. } & \text { C.A. } \\ \text { (2) } 40 \\ \text { (5) } 20 & 80 \\ \hline \end{array}$ | 7 | Senior Medical Inepectors | s. Rs. 350-20-450 ... | 417 | 2,919 | 2,450 | C.A. C.A. <br> (2) 50.100 <br> (5) 40200 |
| 2 | Junior Medical Inspectora. | Rs. $200-10-300$ | ... 261 | 522 | 600 | (1) 40 C.A. 40 | 2 | Junior Medical Inspectora | 8. Rs. 275-15.350 ... | 325 | 650 | 630 |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  | C.A. C.A |  |  |  |  |  |  | $\text { (i). } 50 .{ }^{\text {C.A. }}$ |
|  | Junior Medical Impectors. | Rs. 150-10-250 | 211 |  | 3,247 | ${ }^{\text {CA }}$ (2. C.A. | 15 | Junior Medical Inspector | s. Re. 275-15-350 |  | 4,825 | 4,125 | CAA CAA. |
| 29 | Medical Assistanta | . Rs 125-10-225 | 186 | 5,396 | 3,842 | (22) 10220 | 29 | Medical Assistants | ... Rs. 180-10-270 ... | 236 | 6,844 | 5,220 | (22) 25.550 |
| 22 | Do. $\quad$. | . Pm. 75-5-150 | 116 | 2,566 | 2,915 |  | 22 | Sanitary Inspectors | ... Rs. $75-5-100-10-170$ | 132 | 2,925 | 3,135 | ... $\cdot \cdots$ |
| 1 | Health Visitor | .. Rs. 100-5-150 | 130 | 130 | 110 | ${ }_{10}{ }_{10}$ | 1 | Health Visitor | ... Rs, 125-5-170 ... | 153 | 153 | 125 | C.A. C.A. |
| 12 | Cernetery Clerks ... | . R. 70-5/2-100 | 89 | 138 | 200 | ... ... | 2 | Cemetery Clerka | ... Rs. 75-3-90-5-120. | 104 | 208 | 210 |  |
| 7 | Do. | .. Rs. 60-3-90 | 80 | 560 | 552 |  | 7 | : Do. | ... Rs. 75-3-90-5-120. | 104 | 729 | 573 |  |
| 7 | Sub-Inspectora ... | .. Re. 50.4 .90 | ... 74 | 521 | 586 | (7) $10 \quad 70$ | 7 | Sub-Inspectors | ... Rs. 60-5-125 ... | 98 | 683 | 621 | (3) 25175 |

















[^50]


* Messing Allowance.
























| 3 D | Drivers | ... | ... Rs. 50-3.75 | ... | 65 | 197 | 207 | $\ldots$ | ... | 3 |  | Drivers | ... |  | ... Rs. 60-3-90 | $\ldots$ | 78 | 235 | 216 | $\cdots$ | $\cdots$ |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 4 | Do. | $\ldots$ | ... Re.50-2-60 | ... | 56 | 227 | 234 | $\ldots$ | ... | 4 |  | Do. | , ... |  | ... R. 5 5-2-65 | ... | 62 | 247 | 242 | ... | .. |  |
| 14 | Do. | ... | ... Ra. 50 | $\cdots$ | 50 | 700 | 700 | $\ldots$ | ... | 14 |  | Do. | ... |  | ... Rt. 55-2-65 | ... | 62 | 863 | 770 | ... | ** |  |
| 1 | Ejector Fitte |  | ... Rs. 50 | $\cdots$ | 50 | 50 | 50 | ... | ... | 1 |  | Ejector | iter |  | ... Rs.60-3-90 | ... | 78 | 78 | 68 | $\ldots$ | ... |  |
|  | Store Attend |  | ... Rs. 30-2-40 | ... | 37 | 37 | 38 | .. | $\ldots$ | 1 |  | Store Att | ndant |  | ... Rs.40-2-50 | ... | 47 | 47 | 40 | ... | ... |  |
| 3 | Peons | ... | ... Rs. 25 | $\cdots$ | 25 | 75 | 75 | ... | ... | 3 |  | Peons | $\cdots$ |  | ... Re. 25-1-35 | $\cdots$ | 31 | 95 | 81 | ... | .. |  |
| 46 | Senior Labo | urers | ... Rs. 27-1-30 | ... | 29 | 1,352 | 1,358 | .." | ... | 46 |  | Senior La | bourers |  | $\ldots$... Rs. 30.1-40 | ... | 36 | 1,661 | 1,450 | *. | $\cdots$ | . |
| 26 | Ejector Lab | ourera | ... Rs. 28 | $\ldots$ | 28 | 728 | 728 | ... | ... | 26 |  | Ejector | bourers | , | ... Rs. 25-1.35 | $\cdots$ | 31 | 809 | 780 | ... | - |  |
| 23 | Labourers | ... | ... Rs. 28 | $\cdots$ | 28 | 644 | 644 | ... | ... | 23 |  | Labourer | - ... |  | ... Rs.25-1.35 | ... | 31 | 716 | 690 | ... | $\checkmark$ |  |
| 7 | Do. | ... | ... R8. 27 | $\cdots$ | 27 | 189 | 189 | $\cdots$ | $\ldots$ | 7 |  | Do. | ... |  | ... Rs. 25-1-35 | ... | 31 | 218 | 203 | $\cdots$ | $\cdots$ |  |
| 24 | Do. | ... | ... Rs. 25 | ... | 25 | 600 | 600 | ... | $\cdots$ | 24 |  | Do. | ... |  | ... Rs. 25-1-35 | $\cdots$ | 31 | 747 | 648 | ** | $\cdots$ |  |
| 2 | 2 Watchmen | ... | ... Re. 26 | ... | 26 | 52 | 52 | ... | $\cdots$ | 2 |  | Watchme | . ... |  | ... Rs. 25-1-35 | $\ldots$ | 31 | 63 | 56 | ... | ... | ¢ |
|  | D Do. | ... | ... Rs. 25 | ... | 25 | 75 | 75 | ... | ... | 3 |  | Do. | ... |  | ... Re. 25-1-35 | '... | 31 | 93 | 81 | $\cdots$ | $\cdots$ | , |
| 3 | 3 Head Oilm |  | ... Rs. ${ }^{\text {2 }}$-1-40 | ... | 36 | 108 | 110 | $\cdots$ | ... | 3 |  | Head Oil |  |  | ... Rs. 35-1-45 | ... | 41 | 123 | 116 | $\ldots$ | $\cdots$ |  |
|  | Oilman | ... | $\therefore$ Rs.27-1-30 | $\cdots$ | 29 | 29 | 30 | ... | $\cdots$ | 1 |  | Oilman | * |  | ... Rs. 30-1-40 | ... | 36 | 36 | 32 | ... | $\cdots$ | . |
| 3 | 3 Mukadarns | ... | ... Re. 29-3-32 | ... | 31 | 93 | 91 | ... | $\cdots$ | 3 |  | Mukadarn | s |  | ... Re. $35-1.45$ | ... | 41 | 123 | 97 | ... | $\cdots$ | . |
| 12 | 2 Cleaners | ... | ... Rs. 25 | ... | 25 | 300 | 300 | $\cdots$ | ... | 12 |  | Cleaners | ... |  | ... Rs. 25-1-35 | ... | 31 | 373 | ' 324 | $\cdots$ | $\cdots$ |  |
|  | 2 Sarangs | $\cdots$ | ... Re. 30 | ... | 30 | ${ }^{1} 60$ | 60 | ... | $\cdots$ | 2 |  | Sarangs | ... |  | ... Rs. 35-1-45 | ... | 41 | 82 | 70 | ... | ... |  |
|  | 1 Sluiceman | $\ldots$ | ... Re. 25 | ... | 25 | 25 | 25 | $\cdots$ | ... | 1 |  | Shiscema | $\cdots$ |  | ... Rs. 25-1-35 | ... | 31 | 31 | 27 | ... | ... |  |
|  | 3 Laboratory | Servants | ... R8. 25 | ... | 25 | 75 | 75 | -. | ... | 3 |  | Laborator | S Servants |  | ... Re. 25-1-35 | .." | 31. | 93 | 81 | ... | ... |  |
|  | 4 Malis | $\cdots$ | ... Rs. 25 | ... | 25 | 100 | 100 | ... | ... | 4 |  | Malis | ... |  | ... Rs. 25-1.35 | ... | 31 | 125 | 108 | $\cdots$ | ... |  |
|  |  | Total | -Carried forward |  |  | 15,348 | 15,237 |  | 265 |  |  |  |  | . |  |  |  | 18,074 | 16,241 |  | 330 |  |
|  |  |  | , |  |  |  |  |  | . |  |  |  | , |  |  |  |  |  | - |  |  |  |



*Includes Soecial nav which will Continane








|  | Clerk | ... Rs.60-5-150 | ... | 108 | 108 | 150 |  | ... | 1 |  | Clerk |  | ... Rs. 60-5-100 | -6-160 | 113 | 113 | 156 | ... | ... |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 4 | Clerks | ... Rs.55-4-115-5 | -140 | 97 | 390 | 389 | ... | $\cdots$ | 4 |  | Clerks |  | ... Re.60-5-100 | -6-160 | 113 | 453 | 409 | ... | $\cdots$ |
| 1 | Label writer | ... Rs.50-3.75 | ... | 66 | 66 | 53. |  |  | 1 |  | Labelwriter |  | ... Re.50-3-9 | ... | 73 | 73 | 56 |  |  |
| 1 | Radiogram Operator | ... Rs.40-3-75 | ... | 61 | 61 | 52 | ${ }_{5}$ | ${ }_{5}$ | 1 |  | Radiogram Operator |  | ... Rs. 50-3-90 | $\cdots$ | 73 | 73 | 55 | ${ }_{6}$ | ${ }_{6}$ |
| 1 | Codown-keeper | ... Rs.30-5-50 | $\ldots$ | 45 | 45 | 50 | ... | ... | 1 |  | Godown-keeper |  | ... Rs. 45-3-60 | ... | 55 | 55 | 53 | $\ldots$ | ... |
| 1 | Naik | ... Rs. $25-\frac{1}{-27}$ | ... | 26 | 26 | 27 | ... | ... | 1 |  | Havaldar |  | ... Rs. 35-1-40 | ... | 39 | 39 | 33 | $\cdots$ | $\cdots$ |
| 2 | Peons | ... Rs. 25 | ... | 25 | 50 | 50 | ... | $\cdots$ | 2 |  | Peons |  | ... Rs. 25-1-35 | $\cdots$ | 31 | 63 | 54 | $\cdots$ | ... |
| 1 | Plumber. | ... Rs.30-1-35 | ... | 33 | 33 | 35 | ... | $\ldots$ | 1 |  | Plumber |  | ... Rs.35-1-4 | ... | 41 | 41 | 37 | ... | ... |
| 1 | Carpenter | ... Rs. 60 | ... | 60 | 60 | 60 | $\cdots$ | ... | 1 |  | Carpenter |  | ... Rs. 55-1-65 | ... | 61 | 61 | 62 | ... | $\cdots$ |
| 1 | Head meli | ... Rs. 35 | ... | 35 | 35 | 35 | ... | ... | 1 |  | Head mali |  | ... Rs. 40.1-45 | ... | 43 | 43 | 40 | ... | ... |
|  | Second mali | ... Rs. 30 | ... | 30 | 30 | 30 | ... | ... | 1 |  | Second mali |  | ... Rs. $35-1-40$ | ... | 38 | 38 | 35 | ... | $\cdots$ |
| 1 | Bouquet-maker | ... R. 28 | ... | 28 | 28 | 28 | ... | $\cdots$ | 1 |  | Bouquet-maker |  | ... Rs. 25-1-35 | ... | 31 | 31 | 30 | ... | ... |
| 1 | Propagator | ... $\mathbf{R}_{\text {s. }} 28$ | ... | 28 | 28 | 28 |  | $\cdots$ | 1 |  | Propagator |  | ... Rs. 25-1-35 | $\ldots$ | 31 | 31 | 30 | ... | ... |
| 7 | Malis | ... Rs. 27 | ... | 27 | 189 | 189 | ... | ... | 7 |  | Malis. |  | ... Re. 25-1.35 | - ... | 31 | 218 | 203 | - ... | $\cdots$ |
| 7 | Malis | ... Rs. 26 | ... | 26 | 182 | 182 | $\ldots$ | $\cdots$ | 7 |  | Malis |  | ... Rs. 25 -1-35 | ... | 31. | 218 | 196 | $\ldots$ | ... |
| 74 | Mnlis | ... Re. 25 | . ... | 25 | 1,850. | 1.850 | ... | $\cdots$ | 74 |  | Malis |  | ... Rs. 25-1-35 | $\cdots$ | 31 | 2,302 | 1,998 | ... | ... |
| 6 | Cart Drivers | ... Rs. 25 |  | 25 | 150 | 150 | ... | $\cdots$ | 6 |  | Cart Drivers |  | ... Rs. 25-1-35 | ... | 31 | 187 | 162 | ... | $\cdots$ |
| 30 | Women (sweepers, | c.) ... Rs. 21 |  | 30 | 630 | 630 | ... | $\cdots$ | 30 |  | Women (sweepers, |  | ... Rs. 25-1-30 | ... | 28 | 850 | 750 | ... | $\cdots$ |
| 14 | Watchmen | ... Rs. 25 | ... | 25 | 350 | 350 | $\cdots$ | ... | 14 |  | Watchunen |  | ... Rs. 25-1-35 | ... | 31 | 436 | 378 | $\cdots$ | $\cdots$ |
| 2 | Keepers (Park) | ... Rs. 35 | ... | 35 | 70 | 70 | ... | $\cdots$ | 2 |  | Park Keepers |  | ... Rs. 35-1-40 | ... | 38 | 77 | ,.7 74 | ... | $\cdots$ |
| , 1 | Halallchore | ... Rs. 25 ... | .. | 25 | 25. | 25 |  |  | 1 |  | Halalkhore |  | ... Rs. 25-1-35 | .. | 31 | $\ldots 31$ | 27 | ... | ... |
| ! " |  | Total Carried Forv |  |  | 5,148 | 5,228. |  | 105 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 6,353 | 5,683 | $\square$ | 131 |









Smith Section.


Carpenter Shop.



$\bullet$

















## Appendix D.

Statement showing the extra cost on account of revision of grades under each Major Budget Head.





Staff for Chlorinsting the Tulsi
Wataer Supply and for Tulsi
Filteration Plant

| Water Supply and for Tulsi Filteration Plant | 1,153 | 1,295 | 142 | 1,055 | 1,121 | 66 | ... | $\cdots$ | ... | ... | $\cdots$ |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| G.S.M. College and K.E. M̈. | 816 | 982 | 166 | 673 | 774 | 101 | ... | $\cdots$ | $\ldots$ | ... | . | .... |
| Hospital Research Fund. |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | . | ... | ... | ... |  |



General Account.
$\qquad$
 B. - Coot of Management

$\begin{array}{lllllllllll}\text { Total, B.-Cost of Management } & 47,487 & 54,375 & 6,888 & 50,149 & 52,803 & 2,654 & 2,480 & 3,290 & 810\end{array}$



## Appendix E.

LIST OF GRADES



| Serial No. | 1 Crades and Designationa. | No. | . Grades and Dexignations. |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 50 | Re. 160-10-200Head Clerks (Audit Deptt). Jr. Asstt. Matron. | 58 | R. 125-5-175Junior Sister. Senior Nurse. Nurses. |
| 51 | $\begin{gathered} \text { R. } 160-8200 \\ \text { Senior Clertss. } \end{gathered}$ |  | Mechanic (Fire Brisade) |
|  | Senior Stenographers. <br> Head Clerks(Other than Audit Deptt.) | 59 | Re. 125-5-170- |
|  | Stenographer and Personal Clerk to the Commissioner. <br> Assistant Cashier. <br> Senior Receiving Clerk. |  | Health Visitors. <br> Asstt. Welfare Organiser. <br> Woman Asstt. Welfare Officer. (Health Visitor). |
|  | Semor Stock Verinier. <br> Asstt. Superintendents (AC's Deptt.) <br> Checking Inspector. | 60 | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Rs. } 110-6-170- \\ & \text { Tutors (G.S. Medical College). } \end{aligned}$ |
|  | Supervising inspectors. <br> Yard Foreman. <br> Chief Motor Inspector. |  | Re. 100-5.170- <br> Jr. Rating Surveyor. |
|  | Committee Clerk. <br> Pay and Audit Clerk. |  | Rs. 75-5-100-10-170Sanitary Inspectors. |
|  | Cashier and Cash book wrieer. |  |  |
|  | Record and File clerk. Chief Librarian. |  | Rs. 75-5-100.7-170- |
|  | Head Vaccinator. |  | Motor Inspectors. |
|  | Lady Superintendent, Hostel |  | Ward Inspectors. |
|  | Veterinary Inspectors. ${ }^{\text {Veterinary }}$ Inspectors (Ir) |  | Inspectors (Licensing). |
|  | Sub-Engineer, Ist grade. Engineer. |  |  |
|  | Cashier. <br> Overseer |  |  |
|  | Overseer, | 65 | Rs. 120-8-160- <br> Supervisors (Dog Licensing). <br> Research Assistants. |
|  | Inspectors, (Sr.). <br> Asest, Superintendent (Ptg. Press). |  |  |
|  | Research Assistant. Engineer, Ejector. Meat Inspector. | 66 | Rs. 120-5.160- <br> Head Proof Reader. |
| 52 | Rt. 160-5.31 | 67 | Re. $100-6-160-$Laboratory Assistants.Veterinary Assistants.Engineers Pumping and Comprescor |
|  | Senior Sister. Sister-in-charge. |  |  |
|  | Nurse (T.B. Clinic, Foras Romd). |  | Engineers Pumping and Compressor Station and Dadar Purification |
|  | Re. 150-10-200- |  | Gas Engineer (Dudar Purification works). |
| 53 | Casualty Officer. Chemist. |  |  |
|  | Ro. 120-10-200- |  | Sub-Engineer, 2nd grade. <br> 2nd Engineer. |
|  | Engineer in charge (K.E.M. Hospital). |  | Ir. Inspectors (Shops \& Enta.) <br> Veterinary Inspectors. <br> Junior Inapectors. |
| 55 | Ra. 120-8-200- | 68 | Ra. 100-5-160. Composing Foreman (Pry. Press). Mono Foreman ( Do.) |
| 56 | Re, 140-10-180- <br> Senior Sister. |  |  |
| 57 | $\text { R. } 120-10-180-$ Chief Dispenser. | 69 | R. 90-5-100-6-160Chawl Superintendents. |

## $348$





## $351$




| Serial No. | Serial No. |
| :---: | :---: |
| Night Maid. <br> Pump-men. <br> Servanta. <br> Watch and Ward Peone. <br> Bigaries. <br> Patels. <br> Plunger-men. <br> Trolley-men <br> Stores Labourer. <br> Pointsmen and Watchmen. <br> Eje tor Labourer. <br> Assistant to Wagon Fitter. <br> Oilers and Greasers. <br> Motor Loaders (Men). <br> Bouquet Maker. <br> Propagator. <br> Yar for elephant. <br> Camel Keeper. <br> Girafte Keeper. <br> Durwans. <br> Butler. <br> Mess Servants. <br> Pantry Boys. <br> Bearers. <br> Stretcher Bearers. <br> Post Mortem Attendants. <br> Barber. <br> Animal Keeper. <br> Gate Watchman. <br> Dispensary Boy. <br> Laboratory Boy. <br> Dust-bin stand cleaners. <br> Junior Rulingmen. <br> Junior Binders. <br> Ballers. <br> Delivery men. <br> Calley-men. <br> Attendant for supplying water to the Stafl. <br> Watch-men. <br> Head Mali, K. E. M. Hospital. <br> Malis. <br> Hamals. <br> Night Watchmen. <br> Labourers. <br> Nowghanis. <br> Porters. <br> Cleancrs. <br> Line-men. <br> Ramoshis. <br> Oil-men. <br> Halalkhores. <br> Sluice-men. <br> Sweepers. <br> Tapkers. <br> Bhistis. | Report Bearers. <br> Ambulance Labourers. <br> Death Registration Peons. <br> Attendants. <br> Chowkidars. <br> CampRameshi. <br> Day Watchman. <br> Day and Night Watchman. <br> Sweeper Male. <br> Disinfecting Labourer. <br> Fire-men. <br> Rat Bigaries. <br> Laboratory Labourers. <br> Attendants at Burning grournds. <br> - Grave Diggers. <br> Scavengering men. <br> Cart Drivers. <br> Dog Catchers. <br> Cycle Peon. <br> Ward Attendants. <br> Ayahs. <br> Assistant Sweeper Muka Jam. <br> Cooks Mate. <br> Kitchen Attendant. <br> Cook. <br> Stable Biggari Men. <br> Line guard. <br> Cangmen. <br> Bisčurics (Unloading). <br> Gate-keeper. <br> 180 Rs. 30- <br> Compounders (Part-time). <br> Band Master. <br> Gymnasium Teacher. <br> Workers. <br> 181 Rs. 25-1.30- <br> Stable Biggari (Women). <br> Biggari (Women). <br> Female Watchman. <br> Sweeper women. <br> Women. <br> Sweeper (female). <br> Scavengering women. <br> Fermele Attendants. <br> Water carriers. <br> Mali (Women). <br> Motor Loaders (Women). <br> Sweepers (Bhangis). <br> Womea (unioading <br> Ha aliciores (Women) <br> 182 Rs. 25- <br> Cames Teacher (Part-time). <br> Probationer Nurses. <br> Part-time compounders. <br> Government Apprentices. |



## 7

## Appendix $\mathbf{F}$.

Statement showing the posts the minimum pay of which has been raised to Rs. 500 or more.

| No. o posts. | of Designations. | Grades in 1934-35. | Present grades. | Proposed grades. |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Deputy Municipal Secretary. | $\begin{aligned} & \text { 450-30-600 } \\ & \text { (Asst, Municipal } \\ & \text { Secretary). } \end{aligned}$ | 450-30-600 .. | 500-40-700. |
| 1 | Deputy Assessor | 500-40.700 ... | 400-25-700 | 600-40-800. |
| 1 | Controller of Stores | $\begin{gathered} 400-25-600 \\ \text { (Chief Storekeeper } \end{gathered}$ | $350-25-600 \ldots$ | $600-40-800$ |
| 5 | Assistant Health Officers | $\begin{aligned} & 600-30-750 \\ & 500-20.600 \end{aligned} \cdots$ | 400-25-700 ... | 600-40-800. |
| 1 | Superintendent of Licences ... | 700-50-1,000 ... | 400-25-700 | 600-40-800. |
| 1 | Superintendent of Cardens ... | 500-50-700 ... | 400-25-700 | 600-40-800. |
| 1 | Junior Legal Assistant | ... | 450-25-725 | 550-25-750 |
| 1 | Municipal Analyst | 600-30-750 ... | 400-25-700 ... | 500-25-750 |
| 12 |  |  |  |  |

## Appendix A

Table showing the Cost of Living Index Numbers from August 1914 to June 1945.

|  | Year. |  | January. | February. | March. | April. | May. | June. | July. | August. | September. | October. | November | December |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1914 |  | ... | ... | $\ldots$ | $\cdots$ | $\ldots$ | ... | ... | $\cdots$ | 102 | 103 | 103 | 103 | 105 |
| 1915 |  | ... | 107 | 107 | 106 | 104 | 103 | 104 | 104 | 106 | 110 | 113 | 112 | 113 |
| 1916 |  | $\cdots$ | 115 | 109 | 108 | 106 | 105 | 107 | 108 | 109 | 109 | 109 | 113 | 116 |
| 1917 |  | ... | 120 | 117 | 113 | 112 | 111 | 116 | 118 | 120 | 120 | 121 | 127 | 129 |
| 1918 |  | ... | 134 | 134 | 136 | 144 | 147 | 148 | 149 | 153 | 165 | 175 | 175 | 183 |
| 1919 |  | -.. | 182 | 176 | 172 | 167 | 168 | 174 | 186 | 179 | 172 | 174 | 173 | 174 |
| 1920 |  | -. | 183 | 181 | 177 | 172 | 173 | 181 | 190 | 191 | 192 | 193 | 186 | 181 |
| 1921 |  | ... | 169 | 162 | 160 | 160 | 167 | 173. | 177 | 180 | 185 | 183 | 182 | 179 |
| 1922 |  | "' | 173 | 165 | 165 | 162 | 163 | 163 | 165 | 164 | 165 | 162 | 160 | 161 |
| 1923 |  | ... | 156 | 155 | 154 ' | 156 | 153 | 152 | 153 | 154 | 154 | 152 | 153 | 157 |
| 1924 |  | .... | 159 | 156 | 154 | 150 | 150 | 153 | 157 | 161 | 161 | 161 | 161 | 160 |
| 1925 |  | ... | 157 | . 157 | 159 | 158 | 156 | 154 | 157 | 152 | 151 | 153 | 153 | 155 |
| 1926 |  | $\cdots$ | $\because 155$ | 154 | 155 | 153 | 153 | 155 | 157 | 155 | 155 | 155 | 154 | 156 |
| 1927 |  | ... |  | 155 | 155 | 153 |  | 154 | 156 |  | 154 | 151 | 150 | 151 |
| 1928 |  | ... | 154 | 148 | 145 | 144 | 147 | 146 | 147 | 146 | 145 | 146 | 147 | 148 |
| 1929 |  | $\ldots$ | 149 | 148 | 149 | 148 | 147 | 147 | 148 | $\begin{array}{r}149 \\ \hline\end{array}$ | 149 | 149 | 150 | 150 |
| 1930 |  | ... | 147 | 144 | 141. | 140 | 139 | 140 | 139 | - 136 | 136 | 131 | 127 | 121 |


| 1931 | ... | 117 | 113 | 111 | 111 | 110 | 109 | 108 | 108 | 108 | 108 | 108 | 109. |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1932 | ... | 110 | 110 | 111 | 108 | 107 | 107 | 109 | 109 | 109 | 109 | 110 | 110 |
| 1933 | ... | 109 | 106 | 106 | 101 | 100 | 104 | 103 | 103 | 102 | 100 | 101 | 98 |
| 1934 | ... | 96 | 96 | 94 | 93 | 94 | 95 | $\begin{array}{r} 97 \\ (97) \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 97 \\ (98) \end{array}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 100 \\ & (99) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 100 \\ (100) \end{array}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 101 \\ & (101) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 99 \\ (100) \end{array}$ |
| 1935 | ... | $\begin{array}{r} 98 \\ (99) \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 99 \\ (98) \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 98 \\ (99) \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 98 \\ (98) \end{array}$ | $\begin{gathered} 100 \\ (99) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 101 \\ (101) \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 101 \\ -(101) \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 103 \\ (102) \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 103 \\ (102) \end{array}$ | $\begin{gathered} 103 \\ (101) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 104 \\ & (101) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 105 \\ (102) \end{array}$ |
| 1936 | ... | $\begin{array}{r} 103 \\ 103) \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 102 \\ (102) \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 102 \\ (102) \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 100 \\ 1000 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 100 \\ (101) \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 100 \\ 1000 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 101 \\ (101) \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 101 \\ (101) \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 102 \\ (101) \end{array}$ | $\begin{gathered} 103 \\ (102) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 104 \\ (102) \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 103 \\ (102) \end{array}$ |
| 1937 | ." | $\begin{gathered} (103) \\ 104 \\ (104) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} (102) \\ 104 \\ (104) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} (102) \\ 104 \\ (104) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & (100) \\ & 104 \\ & (105) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} (101) \\ 104 \\ (105) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & (100) \\ & 106 \\ & (105) \end{aligned}$ | ${ }_{107}$ | (108 | ${ }_{108}$ | $\begin{array}{r}108 \\ \hline\end{array}$ | ${ }^{107}$ | (107 |
| 1938 |  | 107 | 107 | 107 | 105 | 104 | - 105 | 106 | 105 | 105 | 105 | 106 | 104 |
| 1939 | $\ldots$ | 105 | 104 | 103 | 103 | 103 | 104 | 105 | 105 | 106 | 108 | 109 | 113 |
| 1940 | $\ldots$ | 114 | 112 | 110 | 110 | 111 | 111 | 113 | 114 | 112 | 113 | 113 | 115 |
|  |  | 117 | 119 | 119 | 121 | 122 | 122 | 126 | 131 | 129 | 125 | 126 | 129 |
| 1942 | ... | 137 | 135 | 137 | 138 | 142 | 152 | 168 | 168 | 170 | 172 | 178 | 188 |
| 1943 | ... | 203 | 205 | 208 | 225 | 227 | $\begin{aligned} & 232^{*} \\ & 235 t \end{aligned}$ | 236 | 238 | 245 | 248 | 248 | 247 |
| $\begin{aligned} & 1944 \\ & 1945 \end{aligned}$ | ... | $\begin{aligned} & 238 \\ & 229 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 230 \\ & 229 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 226 \\ & 225 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2326 \\ & 226 \end{aligned}$ | 235 230 | $\begin{aligned} & 236 \\ & 235 \end{aligned}$ | 241 | 250 | 239 | 239 | 242 | 236 |

* May and Juae 1943 Index No. for period ending 15th.
+ June 1943. Index No. for Calendar Month.
- Note.-Index Nos. from August 1914 to June 1937 published in the Labour Gazette are compiled on base July 1914 equal to 100. The method adopted was the aggregate consumption method, the average and scope of the method of compilation are published in the issues of the Labour Gazette for September was the aggregate consumption method, he average and scope of the method of compliation are published in the issues or he Labour Gazette for September
1921, September 1923 and April 1929. The Index Nos. of June 1937 and onwards published in the Latour Gazette are according to revised cost of living Index number and for the purposes of comparison back Index Nos. which are given in brackets since July 1934 have also been worked out on the revised Index number and for the purposes of comparison back index Nos, which are givenin brackets since july 934 have aso been worked out on the revised
methed. Since May 1943 onwards the method of compilation of cereals of group Index Nos. has been readjusted owing to the difficulty of obtaining method, Since May 1943 onwards the meth
the price quotations for the selected varieties.


## Appendix B:

Statement showing the total income and expenditure, and cost of establishment and labour from 1933-34 to 1945-46. (000 Omitted for items Nos. 1 to 5).


|  | Agtuals |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | 1933-34. 1934-35. 1935-36. 1936-37. 1937-38. 1938-39. 1939-40. 1940-41. 1941-42. 1942-43. 1943-44. 1944-45. 1945-46. |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Percentage of Establishrnent and Labour chargee to Income. | 21.51 | 21.12 | 20.88 | 21.45 | 21.58 | 21.58 | 22.39 | 22.08 | 21.62 | 20.38 | 19.98 | 21.62 | 19.32 |
| Percentage of Establishment, Labour and Deamesa Allowance charges to Income. | ... | ** | ... | $\cdots$ | ... | $\cdots$ | $\cdots$ | 22.92 | 22.46 | 22.88 | 26.03 | 29.82 | 28.89 |
| Percentage of Establishment and Laboir charges to Expenditure. | 20.76 | 21.33 | 21.60 | 21.53 | 21.76 | 22.40 | 22.34 | 21.91 | 22.13 | 21.74 | 20.64 | 20.45 | 17.39 |
| Percentage of Establishment, Labour and Deamess Allowance charges to Expenditure. | ** | $\cdots$ | *** | ** | $\cdots$ | $\cdots$ | ** | 22.74 | 22.99 | 24.41 | 26.90 | 28.19 | 26.01 |

Percentages of Increase or Decrease in Income, Expenditure, Establishment and Labour Charges over the figures for 1933-34.

- Denotes Increase. - Denotes Decrease.

|  |  | 1934-35. | 1935-36. | 1936-37. | 1937.38. | $1938-39$. | $1939-40$. | $1940-41$. | $1941-42$. | $1942-43$. | $1943-44$. |
| :--- | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| Income | $\ldots$ | +1.65 | +3.06 | +2.05 | +5.09 | +10.66 | +10.31 | +13.42 | +17.03 | 23.83 | +28.59 |
| Expenditure | $\ldots$ | -2.87 | -3.85 | -1.91 | +0.60 | +2.86 | +6.73 | +10.34 | +10.35 | +12.02 | +20.10 |
| Establishment | $\ldots$ | +0.85 | +2.05 | +5.43 | +10.90 | +15.57 | +17.78 | +18.14 | +19.44 | +18.59 | +20.96 |
| Labour | $\ldots$ | -2.19 | -3.95 | -5.48 | -5.26 | +2.06 | +9.16 | +13.15 | +14.12 | +14.82 | +16.44 |

## Appendix C.

Statement of proposals of Revision of Grades showing the cost based on the existing average and proposed average, as also cost as per existing rates and as per immediate recommendations.


[^51]


[^52]



*Rs. 100 only if motor car is mantained other 75.












*The Conveyance Allowance of Rs. 50 was meant for the Chief Librarian. The post is kept vacant and the Curator of the Victoria and Albert Museum has been pat in charge of the Libraries with a special pay of Rs. 100 per month and a Conveyance Allowance of Rs, 25 which is now proposed to be increased to Rs. 30.

| Present Scalk |  |  |  |  |  |  | No. of posts. | Designation. | Proposmi Scale. |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| No. of posts. | Designation. | Pay or Grade. | Average fixed. | Total average cost. | Total cost as per Establish ment Schedule. | $\xrightarrow[\text { Rate. Amount. }]{\text { Allowances. }}$ |  |  | Pay or Grade. A | Average fixed. | Total average cost. | Total immediate cost as per recommende- tions. | $\overbrace{\text { Ratc. Amount. }}^{\text {Allowancea. }}$ |
|  |  | Brought over | Rs. | $\begin{gathered} \mathrm{Rg}_{8 .} \\ 5,184 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \mathrm{R}_{8} \\ 4.960 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{array}{ll} \hline \text { Rs. } & \text { Rss } \\ 540 \end{array}$ |  |  |  | Rs. | $\begin{array}{r} \mathrm{R}_{\mathrm{s}} \\ 6,428 \end{array}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Rs. } \\ 5,462 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{array}{ll} \text { Rs. } & \text { Rs. }^{7} \\ 700 \end{array}$ |
|  | V.-Public Health Department-contd. |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 9 | Head Clerks ... | R. 140-5-180 | 168 | 1,512 | 1,333 | ... | 9 | Head Clerks ... | ... Rs. 160-8-200 ... | 190 | 1,710 | 1,605 |  |
| 1 | Senior Clerk .... | Rs. 90-5-140 | 123 | 123 | $110^{\circ}$ | ... ... | 1 | Clerk | . Rs. 60-5-100-6-160. | 113 | 113 | 116 |  |
| 53 | Clerks | Rs. 60-5-150 | 108 | 5,724 | 7,901 | ... ... | 53 | Clerks | ... Rs. 60-5-100-6-160. | 113 | 6,007 | 8,219 |  |
| 55 | Clerka | Rs. 55-4-115-5-14 | . 97 | 5,362 | 4,232 | ... ... | 55 | Clerks | ... Rs. 60-5-100-6-160. | 113 | 6,233 | 4,518 | - ... ... |
| 1 | Stemographer ... . . | . Rs. 75-4-115-5. ${ }^{\text {a }}$ | 0. 112 , | 112 | 86 | ... ... | 1 | Junior Stenographer | ... Rs. 80-5-100-6-160. | 128 | 128 | 91 | ... ... |
|  | Typist | Rs. 55-4-115-5-14 | 97 | 97 | 66 | ... ... | 1 | Typist | ... Rs. 60-5-100-6-160. | 113 | 113 | 60 |  |
| 7 | Senior Medical Inapectors. | Rs. 250-10-350 | $311{ }^{\circ}$ | 2,177 | 2,265 | $\begin{array}{cc} \text { C.A. } & \text { C.A. } \\ \text { (2) } 40 \\ \text { (5) } 20 & 80 \\ \hline \end{array}$ | 7 | Senior Medical Inepectors | s. Rs. 350-20-450 ... | 417 | 2,919 | 2,450 | C.A. C.A. <br> (2) 50.100 <br> (5) 40200 |
| 2 | Junior Medical Inspectora. | Rs. $200-10-300$ | ... 261 | 522 | 600 | (1) 40 C.A. 40 | 2 | Junior Medical Inspectora | 8. Rs. 275-15.350 ... | 325 | 650 | 630 |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  | C.A. C.A |  |  |  |  |  |  | $\text { (i). } 50 .{ }^{\text {C.A. }}$ |
|  | Junior Medical Impectors. | Rs. 150-10-250 | 211 |  | 3,247 | ${ }^{\text {CA }}$ (2. C.A. | 15 | Junior Medical Inspector | s. Re. 275-15-350 |  | 4,825 | 4,125 | CAA CAA. |
| 29 | Medical Assistanta | . Rs 125-10-225 | 186 | 5,396 | 3,842 | (22) 10220 | 29 | Medical Assistants | ... Rs. 180-10-270 ... | 236 | 6,844 | 5,220 | (22) 25.550 |
| 22 | Do. $\quad$. | . Pm. 75-5-150 | 116 | 2,566 | 2,915 |  | 22 | Sanitary Inspectors | ... Rs. $75-5-100-10-170$ | 132 | 2,925 | 3,135 | ... $\cdot \cdots$ |
| 1 | Health Visitor | .. Rs. 100-5-150 | 130 | 130 | 110 | ${ }_{10}{ }_{10}$ | 1 | Health Visitor | ... Rs, 125-5-170 ... | 153 | 153 | 125 | C.A. C.A. |
| 12 | Cernetery Clerks ... | . R. 70-5/2-100 | 89 | 138 | 200 | ... ... | 2 | Cemetery Clerka | ... Rs. 75-3-90-5-120. | 104 | 208 | 210 |  |
| 7 | Do. | .. Rs. 60-3-90 | 80 | 560 | 552 |  | 7 | : Do. | ... Rs. 75-3-90-5-120. | 104 | 729 | 573 |  |
| 7 | Sub-Inspectora ... | .. Re. 50.4 .90 | ... 74 | 521 | 586 | (7) $10 \quad 70$ | 7 | Sub-Inspectors | ... Rs. 60-5-125 ... | 98 | 683 | 621 | (3) 25175 |

















[^53]


* Messing Allowance.
























| 3 D | Drivers | ... | ... Rs. 50-3.75 | ... | 65 | 197 | 207 | $\ldots$ | ... | 3 |  | Drivers | ... |  | ... Rs. 60-3-90 | $\ldots$ | 78 | 235 | 216 | $\cdots$ | $\cdots$ |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 4 | Do. | $\ldots$ | ... Re.50-2-60 | ... | 56 | 227 | 234 | $\ldots$ | ... | 4 |  | Do. | , ... |  | ... R. 5 5-2-65 | ... | 62 | 247 | 242 | ... | .. |  |
| 14 | Do. | ... | ... Ra. 50 | $\cdots$ | 50 | 700 | 700 | $\ldots$ | ... | 14 |  | Do. | ... |  | ... Rt. 55-2-65 | ... | 62 | 863 | 770 | ... | ** |  |
| 1 | Ejector Fitte |  | ... Rs. 50 | $\cdots$ | 50 | 50 | 50 | ... | ... | 1 |  | Ejector | iter |  | ... Rs.60-3-90 | ... | 78 | 78 | 68 | $\ldots$ | ... |  |
|  | Store Attend |  | ... Rs. 30-2-40 | ... | 37 | 37 | 38 | .. | $\ldots$ | 1 |  | Store Att | ndant |  | ... Rs.40-2-50 | ... | 47 | 47 | 40 | ... | ... |  |
| 3 | Peons | ... | ... Rs. 25 | $\cdots$ | 25 | 75 | 75 | ... | ... | 3 |  | Peons | $\cdots$ |  | ... Re. 25-1-35 | $\cdots$ | 31 | 95 | 81 | ... | .. |  |
| 46 | Senior Labo | urers | ... Rs. 27-1-30 | ... | 29 | 1,352 | 1,358 | .." | ... | 46 |  | Senior La | bourers |  | $\ldots$... Rs. 30.1-40 | ... | 36 | 1,661 | 1,450 | *. | $\cdots$ | . |
| 26 | Ejector Lab | ourera | ... Rs. 28 | $\ldots$ | 28 | 728 | 728 | ... | ... | 26 |  | Ejector | bourers | , | ... Rs. 25-1.35 | $\cdots$ | 31 | 809 | 780 | ... | - |  |
| 23 | Labourers | ... | ... Rs. 28 | $\cdots$ | 28 | 644 | 644 | ... | ... | 23 |  | Labourer | - ... |  | ... Rs.25-1.35 | ... | 31 | 716 | 690 | ... | $\checkmark$ |  |
| 7 | Do. | ... | ... R8. 27 | $\cdots$ | 27 | 189 | 189 | $\cdots$ | $\ldots$ | 7 |  | Do. | ... |  | ... Rs. 25-1-35 | ... | 31 | 218 | 203 | $\cdots$ | $\cdots$ |  |
| 24 | Do. | ... | ... Rs. 25 | ... | 25 | 600 | 600 | ... | $\cdots$ | 24 |  | Do. | ... |  | ... Rs. 25-1-35 | $\cdots$ | 31 | 747 | 648 | ** | $\cdots$ |  |
| 2 | 2 Watchmen | ... | ... Re. 26 | ... | 26 | 52 | 52 | ... | $\cdots$ | 2 |  | Watchme | . ... |  | ... Rs. 25-1-35 | $\ldots$ | 31 | 63 | 56 | ... | ... | ¢ |
|  | D Do. | ... | ... Rs. 25 | ... | 25 | 75 | 75 | ... | ... | 3 |  | Do. | ... |  | ... Re. 25-1-35 | '... | 31 | 93 | 81 | $\cdots$ | $\cdots$ | , |
| 3 | 3 Head Oilm |  | ... Rs. ${ }^{\text {2 }}$-1-40 | ... | 36 | 108 | 110 | $\cdots$ | ... | 3 |  | Head Oil |  |  | ... Rs. 35-1-45 | ... | 41 | 123 | 116 | $\ldots$ | $\cdots$ |  |
|  | Oilman | ... | $\therefore$ Rs.27-1-30 | $\cdots$ | 29 | 29 | 30 | ... | $\cdots$ | 1 |  | Oilman | * |  | ... Rs. 30-1-40 | ... | 36 | 36 | 32 | ... | $\cdots$ | . |
| 3 | 3 Mukadarns | ... | ... Re. 29-3-32 | ... | 31 | 93 | 91 | ... | $\cdots$ | 3 |  | Mukadarn | s |  | ... Re. $35-1.45$ | ... | 41 | 123 | 97 | ... | $\cdots$ | . |
| 12 | 2 Cleaners | ... | ... Rs. 25 | ... | 25 | 300 | 300 | $\cdots$ | ... | 12 |  | Cleaners | ... |  | ... Rs. 25-1-35 | ... | 31 | 373 | ' 324 | $\cdots$ | $\cdots$ |  |
|  | 2 Sarangs | $\cdots$ | ... Re. 30 | ... | 30 | ${ }^{1} 60$ | 60 | ... | $\cdots$ | 2 |  | Sarangs | ... |  | ... Rs. 35-1-45 | ... | 41 | 82 | 70 | ... | ... |  |
|  | 1 Sluiceman | $\ldots$ | ... Re. 25 | ... | 25 | 25 | 25 | $\cdots$ | ... | 1 |  | Shiscema | $\cdots$ |  | ... Rs. 25-1-35 | ... | 31 | 31 | 27 | ... | ... |  |
|  | 3 Laboratory | Servants | ... R8. 25 | ... | 25 | 75 | 75 | -. | ... | 3 |  | Laborator | S Servants |  | ... Re. 25-1-35 | .." | 31. | 93 | 81 | ... | ... |  |
|  | 4 Malis | $\cdots$ | ... Rs. 25 | ... | 25 | 100 | 100 | ... | ... | 4 |  | Malis | ... |  | ... Rs. 25-1.35 | ... | 31 | 125 | 108 | $\cdots$ | ... |  |
|  |  | Total | -Carried forward |  |  | 15,348 | 15,237 |  | 265 |  |  |  |  | . |  |  |  | 18,074 | 16,241 |  | 330 |  |
|  |  |  | , |  |  |  |  |  | . |  |  |  | , |  |  |  |  |  | - |  |  |  |



*Includes Soecial nav which will Continane








|  | Clerk | ... Rs.60-5-150 | ... | 108 | 108 | 150 |  | ... | 1 |  | Clerk |  | ... Rs. 60-5-100 | -6-160 | 113 | 113 | 156 | ... | ... |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 4 | Clerks | ... Rs.55-4-115-5 | -140 | 97 | 390 | 389 | ... | $\cdots$ | 4 |  | Clerks |  | ... Re.60-5-100 | -6-160 | 113 | 453 | 409 | ... | $\cdots$ |
| 1 | Label writer | ... Rs.50-3.75 | ... | 66 | 66 | 53. |  |  | 1 |  | Labelwriter |  | ... Re.50-3-9 | ... | 73 | 73 | 56 |  |  |
| 1 | Radiogram Operator | ... Rs.40-3-75 | ... | 61 | 61 | 52 | ${ }_{5}$ | ${ }_{5}$ | 1 |  | Radiogram Operator |  | ... Rs. 50-3-90 | $\cdots$ | 73 | 73 | 55 | ${ }_{6}$ | ${ }_{6}$ |
| 1 | Codown-keeper | ... Rs.30-5-50 | $\ldots$ | 45 | 45 | 50 | ... | ... | 1 |  | Godown-keeper |  | ... Rs. 45-3-60 | ... | 55 | 55 | 53 | $\ldots$ | ... |
| 1 | Naik | ... Rs. $25-\frac{1}{-27}$ | ... | 26 | 26 | 27 | ... | ... | 1 |  | Havaldar |  | ... Rs. 35-1-40 | ... | 39 | 39 | 33 | $\cdots$ | $\cdots$ |
| 2 | Peons | ... Rs. 25 | ... | 25 | 50 | 50 | ... | $\cdots$ | 2 |  | Peons |  | ... Rs. 25-1-35 | $\cdots$ | 31 | 63 | 54 | $\cdots$ | ... |
| 1 | Plumber. | ... Rs.30-1-35 | ... | 33 | 33 | 35 | ... | $\ldots$ | 1 |  | Plumber |  | ... Rs.35-1-4 | ... | 41 | 41 | 37 | ... | ... |
| 1 | Carpenter | ... Rs. 60 | ... | 60 | 60 | 60 | $\cdots$ | ... | 1 |  | Carpenter |  | ... Rs. 55-1-65 | ... | 61 | 61 | 62 | ... | $\cdots$ |
| 1 | Head meli | ... Rs. 35 | ... | 35 | 35 | 35 | ... | ... | 1 |  | Head mali |  | ... Rs. 40.1-45 | ... | 43 | 43 | 40 | ... | ... |
|  | Second mali | ... Rs. 30 | ... | 30 | 30 | 30 | ... | ... | 1 |  | Second mali |  | ... Rs. $35-1-40$ | ... | 38 | 38 | 35 | ... | $\cdots$ |
| 1 | Bouquet-maker | ... R. 28 | ... | 28 | 28 | 28 | ... | $\cdots$ | 1 |  | Bouquet-maker |  | ... Rs. 25-1-35 | ... | 31 | 31 | 30 | ... | ... |
| 1 | Propagator | ... $\mathbf{R}_{\text {s. }} 28$ | ... | 28 | 28 | 28 |  | $\cdots$ | 1 |  | Propagator |  | ... Rs. 25-1-35 | $\ldots$ | 31 | 31 | 30 | ... | ... |
| 7 | Malis | ... Rs. 27 | ... | 27 | 189 | 189 | ... | ... | 7 |  | Malis. |  | ... Re. 25-1.35 | - ... | 31 | 218 | 203 | - ... | $\cdots$ |
| 7 | Malis | ... Rs. 26 | ... | 26 | 182 | 182 | $\ldots$ | $\cdots$ | 7 |  | Malis |  | ... Rs. 25 -1-35 | ... | 31. | 218 | 196 | $\ldots$ | ... |
| 74 | Mnlis | ... Re. 25 | . ... | 25 | 1,850. | 1.850 | ... | $\cdots$ | 74 |  | Malis |  | ... Rs. 25-1-35 | $\cdots$ | 31 | 2,302 | 1,998 | ... | ... |
| 6 | Cart Drivers | ... Rs. 25 |  | 25 | 150 | 150 | ... | $\cdots$ | 6 |  | Cart Drivers |  | ... Rs. 25-1-35 | ... | 31 | 187 | 162 | ... | $\cdots$ |
| 30 | Women (sweepers, | c.) ... Rs. 21 |  | 30 | 630 | 630 | ... | $\cdots$ | 30 |  | Women (sweepers, |  | ... Rs. 25-1-30 | ... | 28 | 850 | 750 | ... | $\cdots$ |
| 14 | Watchmen | ... Rs. 25 | ... | 25 | 350 | 350 | $\cdots$ | ... | 14 |  | Watchunen |  | ... Rs. 25-1-35 | ... | 31 | 436 | 378 | $\cdots$ | $\cdots$ |
| 2 | Keepers (Park) | ... Rs. 35 | ... | 35 | 70 | 70 | ... | $\cdots$ | 2 |  | Park Keepers |  | ... Rs. 35-1-40 | ... | 38 | 77 | ,.7 74 | ... | $\cdots$ |
| , 1 | Halallchore | ... Rs. 25 ... | .. | 25 | 25. | 25 |  |  | 1 |  | Halalkhore |  | ... Rs. 25-1-35 | .. | 31 | $\ldots 31$ | 27 | ... | ... |
| ! " |  | Total Carried Forv |  |  | 5,148 | 5,228. |  | 105 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 6,353 | 5,683 | $\square$ | 131 |









Smith Section.


Carpenter Shop.



$\bullet$

















## Appendix D.

Statement showing the extra cost on account of revision of grades under each Major Budget Head.





Staff for Chlorinsting the Tulsi
Wataer Supply and for Tulsi
Filteration Plant

| Water Supply and for Tulsi Filteration Plant | 1,153 | 1,295 | 142 | 1,055 | 1,121 | 66 | ... | $\cdots$ | ... | ... | $\cdots$ |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| G.S.M. College and K.E. M̈. | 816 | 982 | 166 | 673 | 774 | 101 | ... | $\cdots$ | $\ldots$ | ... | . | .... |
| Hospital Research Fund. |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | . | ... | ... | ... |  |



General Account.
$\qquad$
 B. - Coot of Management

$\begin{array}{lllllllllll}\text { Total, B.-Cost of Management } & 47,487 & 54,375 & 6,888 & 50,149 & 52,803 & 2,654 & 2,480 & 3,290 & 810\end{array}$



## Appendix E.

LIST OF GRADES



| Serial No. | 1 Crades and Designationa. | No. | . Grades and Dexignations. |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 50 | Re. 160-10-200Head Clerks (Audit Deptt). Jr. Asstt. Matron. | 58 | R. 125-5-175Junior Sister. Senior Nurse. Nurses. |
| 51 | $\begin{gathered} \text { R. } 160-8200 \\ \text { Senior Clertss. } \end{gathered}$ |  | Mechanic (Fire Brisade) |
|  | Senior Stenographers. <br> Head Clerks(Other than Audit Deptt.) | 59 | Re. 125-5-170- |
|  | Stenographer and Personal Clerk to the Commissioner. <br> Assistant Cashier. <br> Senior Receiving Clerk. |  | Health Visitors. <br> Asstt. Welfare Organiser. <br> Woman Asstt. Welfare Officer. (Health Visitor). |
|  | Semor Stock Verinier. <br> Asstt. Superintendents (AC's Deptt.) <br> Checking Inspector. | 60 | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Rs. } 110-6-170- \\ & \text { Tutors (G.S. Medical College). } \end{aligned}$ |
|  | Supervising inspectors. <br> Yard Foreman. <br> Chief Motor Inspector. |  | Re. 100-5.170- <br> Jr. Rating Surveyor. |
|  | Committee Clerk. <br> Pay and Audit Clerk. |  | Rs. 75-5-100-10-170Sanitary Inspectors. |
|  | Cashier and Cash book wrieer. |  |  |
|  | Record and File clerk. Chief Librarian. |  | Rs. 75-5-100.7-170- |
|  | Head Vaccinator. |  | Motor Inspectors. |
|  | Lady Superintendent, Hostel |  | Ward Inspectors. |
|  | Veterinary Inspectors. ${ }^{\text {Veterinary }}$ Inspectors (Ir) |  | Inspectors (Licensing). |
|  | Sub-Engineer, Ist grade. Engineer. |  |  |
|  | Cashier. <br> Overseer |  |  |
|  | Overseer, | 65 | Rs. 120-8-160- <br> Supervisors (Dog Licensing). <br> Research Assistants. |
|  | Inspectors, (Sr.). <br> Asest, Superintendent (Ptg. Press). |  |  |
|  | Research Assistant. Engineer, Ejector. Meat Inspector. | 66 | Rs. 120-5.160- <br> Head Proof Reader. |
| 52 | Rt. 160-5.31 | 67 | Re. $100-6-160-$Laboratory Assistants.Veterinary Assistants.Engineers Pumping and Comprescor |
|  | Senior Sister. Sister-in-charge. |  |  |
|  | Nurse (T.B. Clinic, Foras Romd). |  | Engineers Pumping and Compressor Station and Dadar Purification |
|  | Re. 150-10-200- |  | Gas Engineer (Dudar Purification works). |
| 53 | Casualty Officer. Chemist. |  |  |
|  | Ro. 120-10-200- |  | Sub-Engineer, 2nd grade. <br> 2nd Engineer. |
|  | Engineer in charge (K.E.M. Hospital). |  | Ir. Inspectors (Shops \& Enta.) <br> Veterinary Inspectors. <br> Junior Inapectors. |
| 55 | Ra. 120-8-200- | 68 | Ra. 100-5-160. Composing Foreman (Pry. Press). Mono Foreman ( Do.) |
| 56 | Re, 140-10-180- <br> Senior Sister. |  |  |
| 57 | $\text { R. } 120-10-180-$ Chief Dispenser. | 69 | R. 90-5-100-6-160Chawl Superintendents. |

## $348$





## $351$




| Serial No. | Serial No. |
| :---: | :---: |
| Night Maid. <br> Pump-men. <br> Servanta. <br> Watch and Ward Peone. <br> Bigaries. <br> Patels. <br> Plunger-men. <br> Trolley-men <br> Stores Labourer. <br> Pointsmen and Watchmen. <br> Eje tor Labourer. <br> Assistant to Wagon Fitter. <br> Oilers and Greasers. <br> Motor Loaders (Men). <br> Bouquet Maker. <br> Propagator. <br> Yar for elephant. <br> Camel Keeper. <br> Girafte Keeper. <br> Durwans. <br> Butler. <br> Mess Servants. <br> Pantry Boys. <br> Bearers. <br> Stretcher Bearers. <br> Post Mortem Attendants. <br> Barber. <br> Animal Keeper. <br> Gate Watchman. <br> Dispensary Boy. <br> Laboratory Boy. <br> Dust-bin stand cleaners. <br> Junior Rulingmen. <br> Junior Binders. <br> Ballers. <br> Delivery men. <br> Calley-men. <br> Attendant for supplying water to the Stafl. <br> Watch-men. <br> Head Mali, K. E. M. Hospital. <br> Malis. <br> Hamals. <br> Night Watchmen. <br> Labourers. <br> Nowghanis. <br> Porters. <br> Cleancrs. <br> Line-men. <br> Ramoshis. <br> Oil-men. <br> Halalkhores. <br> Sluice-men. <br> Sweepers. <br> Tapkers. <br> Bhistis. | Report Bearers. <br> Ambulance Labourers. <br> Death Registration Peons. <br> Attendants. <br> Chowkidars. <br> CampRameshi. <br> Day Watchman. <br> Day and Night Watchman. <br> Sweeper Male. <br> Disinfecting Labourer. <br> Fire-men. <br> Rat Bigaries. <br> Laboratory Labourers. <br> Attendants at Burning grournds. <br> - Grave Diggers. <br> Scavengering men. <br> Cart Drivers. <br> Dog Catchers. <br> Cycle Peon. <br> Ward Attendants. <br> Ayahs. <br> Assistant Sweeper Muka Jam. <br> Cooks Mate. <br> Kitchen Attendant. <br> Cook. <br> Stable Biggari Men. <br> Line guard. <br> Cangmen. <br> Bisčurics (Unloading). <br> Gate-keeper. <br> 180 Rs. 30- <br> Compounders (Part-time). <br> Band Master. <br> Gymnasium Teacher. <br> Workers. <br> 181 Rs. 25-1.30- <br> Stable Biggari (Women). <br> Biggari (Women). <br> Female Watchman. <br> Sweeper women. <br> Women. <br> Sweeper (female). <br> Scavengering women. <br> Fermele Attendants. <br> Water carriers. <br> Mali (Women). <br> Motor Loaders (Women). <br> Sweepers (Bhangis). <br> Womea (unioading <br> Ha aliciores (Women) <br> 182 Rs. 25- <br> Cames Teacher (Part-time). <br> Probationer Nurses. <br> Part-time compounders. <br> Government Apprentices. |



## 7

## Appendix $\mathbf{F}$.

Statement showing the posts the minimum pay of which has been raised to Rs. 500 or more.

| No. o posts. | of Designations. | Grades in 1934-35. | Present grades. | Proposed grades. |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Deputy Municipal Secretary. | $\begin{aligned} & \text { 450-30-600 } \\ & \text { (Asst, Municipal } \\ & \text { Secretary). } \end{aligned}$ | 450-30-600 .. | 500-40-700. |
| 1 | Deputy Assessor | 500-40.700 ... | 400-25-700 | 600-40-800. |
| 1 | Controller of Stores | $\begin{gathered} 400-25-600 \\ \text { (Chief Storekeeper } \end{gathered}$ | $350-25-600 \ldots$ | $600-40-800$ |
| 5 | Assistant Health Officers | $\begin{aligned} & 600-30-750 \\ & 500-20.600 \end{aligned} \cdots$ | 400-25-700 ... | 600-40-800. |
| 1 | Superintendent of Licences ... | 700-50-1,000 ... | 400-25-700 | 600-40-800. |
| 1 | Superintendent of Cardens ... | 500-50-700 ... | 400-25-700 | 600-40-800. |
| 1 | Junior Legal Assistant | ... | 450-25-725 | 550-25-750 |
| 1 | Municipal Analyst | 600-30-750 ... | 400-25-700 ... | 500-25-750 |
| 12 |  |  |  |  |


[^0]:    * Exclusive of charges amounting to Rs. 620 on account of Dearness Allowance charged direct to the budget provision under "XVIll Dearneas Allowance".

[^1]:    * Industrial Code of 1929 of South Australia. $\dagger$ Textile Labour Inquiry Committee Report, Vol. II, p. 60.

[^2]:    * Textile Lab ur Inquiry Committee Report Vol. II, p. 68.
    $t$ lidi, p. 70.
    $\ddagger\left(b^{i d}, \mathrm{p} .71\right.$.
    § "Your Food '" by M. R. Masani, pp. 80-81.
    If "Our Economic Problem" by P. A. Wadia and K. T. Merchant, p. 351.

[^3]:    *Financial burden of the War on ladia by C. N. Vakil, p. 102-103.

[^4]:    The Textile Labour Inquiry Committee Report. Vol. II p. 90.
    4 lbid p. 91.
    t The Eastern Economist, 1st September 1944, p. 236.
    ( Bombay Governnent Gazette, dated the 28th May 1942, Part I, p. 1900. .

[^5]:    * Bombay Labour Gazette, September 1941, p. 74.
    $\ddagger$ Bombay Govermment Gazette, dated the 16th December 1944, Part I, p. 2911.
    $\ddagger$ Textile Labour Inquiry Comumittee Report, Vol. II, p. 108.
    § Commentary on Bombay Shoy s and Establishments Act by S. K. Gupte p. 39.
    ITMr. Nanavutty's Award in B.E.S.T. case. Bombay Government Gazelle, Part I. dated the 15th December 1944, p. 2995.

[^6]:    *The Eastern Economist Sep. I of 1944 p. 236.

    + Report on Enquiry into the Working Class Family Budgets, p. 12.
    $\ddagger$ lbid, p. 11 .

[^7]:    *Textile Labour Inquiry Committee Report Vol. II, p. 94.
    $\dagger^{\text {"Wages" by Maurice Dobb, p. } 156 . ~}$

[^8]:    *Financial burden of the War on India by C.N. Vakil on 83.

[^9]:    56. Senior Clerks.-The grade of the Senior Clerks is at present

    Senior Clerks.
    Rs. 150-5-190. I have been asked by Standing Committee Resolution No. 174, dated the 9th May 1945, to report on the question of revising it to Rs. 150-10-200. On the basis of my recommendation to revise the grade of Head Clerks in other Departments, which is similar to the grade of Senior Clerks in this Department, I recommend that this grade be revised to Rs. 160-8-200.

[^10]:    - Montague Harnis's description of Town Clerk Munl. Self-Covt, in Britin p. 87.

[^11]:    - Para 10 of the Report of the Sub-Committee of the Standing Committee ander|ring S.C.R. No. 879 of $28-111934$.

[^12]:    88. Office Superintendent, Chief Clerks, Head Clerks and clerks. These posts being common to all the departments have been dealt with in a

    ## Clerical Grades.

    separate chapter.

[^13]:    97. Chief Motor Inspector:-There are at present seven Motor Inspectors. In addition to this, one of the Chief Motor Inspector. Ward Inspectors is entrusted with the work of tracing out motor vehicles hired out by the Motor Companies in the
    City to the Military and Naval Authorities, as it was found on experience that these vehicles had no fixed garages and were also not taxed. For this purpose, the Ward Inspector was granted an extra Conveyance Allowance of Rs. 30 per month in addition to the Conveyance Allowance of Rs. 10 per month attached to his post for the duration of the war and six months thereafter (vide Standing Committee Resolution No. 318, dated the 7th June 1944). The
[^14]:    118. Stores Attendants.-Their duties are to weigh, count and measure all articles received from the contractors and sort out the defective ones. Their grade prior to 1935 was Rs. $40-5-60$. In 1935, it was revised to
[^15]:    153. Assistant Health Officers.-They are five in number; four of them are in charge of Wards and the fifth is
    
    in charge of Malaria work of the whole City. The former are responsible for the health
[^16]:    195. Tutors (Whole-time).-There are four tutors viz. (1) Surgical Tutor attached to two Honorary Tutors. , Surgeons in the Hospital, (2) Medical Tutor attached to two Honorary Physicians in the Hospital, (3) Tutor in Embryology for teaching his subject to the lst M.B.,
[^17]:    204. Assistant Engineer, 1st Grade, Architectural Branch.-The post was created on the amalgamation of the - Ansistant Engineer, Improvement Trust in 1933 on Rs. 700-401st Grade, Aychitectural 900 under Corporation Resolution No. 6690 ,
    Branch. dated the 13th November 1933. This was revised to Rs. $660-40-900$ under Corporation Resolution No. 658, dated the 9 th December 1935. The same grade is in existence at present. The City Engineer has recommended a grade of Rs. 800 $50^{\prime} 1^{\prime}, 400^{\prime \prime}$ after taking into account the responsibilities attached to the post. I' consider that a grade Rs. $700-50-1,000$ would be adequate.
[^18]:    212. Inspector (Electrical).-The present grade of the post is Rs. $140-8-220$ plus Rs. 40 Conveyance
    Inspector (Electrical). Allowance. The holder of the post is in charge of the Electrical Section and has to look after all the Electric Plant and Machinery, including pumping, and compressor stations in the City and has to prepare estimates and designs for electrical installations. The City Engineer has suggested a grade of Rs. $170-10-250$. In view of the extensive area of his work and the responsibilities he has to shoulder, I suggest a grade of Rs. 180-10-270 plus Rs. 50 C.A. the designation being changed to the Sub-Engineer (Electrical).
[^19]:    249. Chowkidars.-The present salary of Chowkidars is Chowkidars. Rs. 25. The Bombay Municipal Peons and Lascars’ Union suggest that they should
[^20]:    *Printed in the Journal of the University of Bombay, Vol. IX, Part IV of January 1941.
    $\dagger$ Incidentally very nearly the same as paid by the Bombay Muricipality which is Rs. 55 per month.

[^21]:    - Thomas Conmittee Report, p. 99.

[^22]:    * Textile Labour Inquiry Committee Report. Vol. II, page 76.

[^23]:    - Municipal Local Govemment in England, p. 150.
    $\dagger$ Labour Conmission's report p. 276.
    I Rent Enpuiry Committee Report p. 57.

[^24]:    * Textile Labour Enquiry Committee Report, 11 p. 278-279

[^25]:    * For mintaining Horse Carriage.

[^26]:    *Bombay Government Gazette. Pert I, dated the Foth December 1944,. p. 2988-3004.

[^27]:    *Vide Mr. Nanavatty's Award in the B.E.S.T. Company's case, Bombay Goverument Gazeite, Part I., dated the 16th December 1944, p. 2993

[^28]:    *Labour Commission Report of 1931, p. 40-44
    $\dagger$ K. S. Gupte's commentary on the Shops and Establishments Act.

[^29]:    *Labour Commission's Report, p. 55.

[^30]:    $\therefore$ : Labour Commission Report, p. 218-219.

[^31]:    *Thomas Committee's Report p. 110.

[^32]:    *This is on the lines of the recommendations of the Thomas Committee Report p. 106.
    $\dagger$ Thomas Committee's Report p. 105-106.

[^33]:    *Thomas Cammittee's Report p. 107.

[^34]:    * Bombay Labour Cazette, May 1945, p. 545-546.
    + The Textile Labour Inquiry Committee Report Vel. II p. 335.
    5 Ibid. p. 334.

[^35]:    - Labour Commission Report p. 264.

[^36]:    - Textile Labour Inquiry Committe Report Vol. II, p. 308.

[^37]:    * Labour Commission Report p. 265.

[^38]:    - Eastern Economist 17-11-1944 p. 533-534.
    $\dagger$ Eastern Economist 24-11-1944 p. 564.

[^39]:    $\therefore$ : $\because$ Labour Commission Report p. 24.
    $\dagger$ Textile Labour Ingnary Committee Report. Val. Hip. 336

[^40]:    *Karchi Manicipal Adminiunation Report for 1943-44, p. $27 \pm 44$.

[^41]:    "Appendix III, Municipal Self-Covernment in Britain by G. M. Harris.
    $\therefore$ SLe $\ddagger$ Kale Committee Report, p. 33.

[^42]:    - Taxation Inquiry Committec Report, p. 230.
    $\dagger$ Kale Committee Report, pp. 0.31.

[^43]:    - A, B and C of Local Coverrunent by C. Kent Wright, p. 157.
    $\dagger$ MunicipalSelf-Government in Britain, p. 21 h.

[^44]:    * Municipal Self-Covernment in Britain by G. Montagie Herris, pe I80:

[^45]:    * Introduction to American Covemment, pr. 958-959.
    tCity Goverument, p. 29. See also Municipal Self-Govemment in Britain by C. M. Harris, p. 194.

[^46]:    ${ }^{*}$ Local Government Officer by L. Hill, p. 58.

[^47]:    *. The Standing Committee have only recently approved of this mugestion Vide S. C. R. No. 691 dated the 30th August 1945.

[^48]:    * The figures in the columns for averages are shown after omitting the fractions.
    + The figures in the columns for average cost are worked out on the basis of aclual averages including fractions but omitting fractions in the final figure.
    Posts provided for only a part period of the year are not included in the appendix.

[^49]:    * Rs. 125 if a motor car is maintained, otherwiee Rs. 100.

[^50]:    *Messing Allowance.

[^51]:    * The figures in the columns for averages are shown after omitting the fractions.
    + The figures in the columns for average cost are worked out on the basis of aclual averages including fractions but omitting fractions in the final figure.
    Posts provided for only a part period of the year are not included in the appendix.

[^52]:    * Rs. 125 if a motor car is maintained, otherwiee Rs. 100.

[^53]:    *Messing Allowance.

