

LINGUISTIC PROVINCES AND THE FUTURE OF BOMBAY

K. M. MUNSHI



THE NATIONAL INFORMATION & PUBLICATIONS LTD.
BOMBAY.

SERVANTS OF INDIA SOCIETY'S LIBRARY
POONA 4

CN

AcN

20452

Date of release for loan

This book should be returned on or before the last date stamped below.

An overdue charge of 5 paise will be levied for each day the book is kept beyond this date.

20. 11. 1972

LINGUISTIC PROVINCES AND THE FUTURE OF BOMBAY

LINGUISTIC PROVINCES
AND
THE FUTURE OF BOMBAY

Chandrarajwarao Gadgil Library



GIPE-PUNE-020452

K. M. MUNSHI

Smelted by
DECCAN WORK STALLS



THE NATIONAL INFORMATION & PUBLICATIONS LTD.
BOMBAY.

Copyright Reserved
Published in 1948

Price Rs- 2/-

Published by Kdsum Nair for the National Information & Publications Ltd., 6, Tulloch Road, Apollo Bunder, Fort, Bombay 1, and printed by Dhirubhai Dalal at the Associated Advertisers and Printers Ltd., 503, Arthur Road, Tardeo, Bombay 7.

FOREWORD

This booklet is in substance a Note which as an Associate member I submitted to the Linguistic Provinces Commission. I thought that the results of my labours in this connection should be put before a wider public. As a matter of fact the Chairman of the Commission himself suggested to the Associate members that they were at liberty to publish their notes submitted to the Commission if they so desired.

The maps included in this book were prepared to illustrate the statements in the Note and are naturally approximate. Map I has been largely based on the linguistic survey made by Prof. T. N. Dave, Ph.D. (Lond.), Professor of Gujarati in the London University (of the Gujarati speaking areas.) I have, however, as a result of my studies made certain changes.

Map V "Linguistic Composition of North Konkan" has been prepared by me in the light of the available linguistic data and the personal knowledge of Dr. Hubert Mascarenhas, University teacher in the University of Bombay who carries on considerable social work in this area and knows all the languages in the area.

I take this opportunity of expressing my deep debt of gratitude to Prof. C. N. Vakil for giving me the benefits of his views on the financial implications and to Prof. C. L. Gheewala of the Indian Merchants Chamber and Prof. M. L. Dantwala of the University School of Economics and Sociology, Bombay, both of whom helped me considerably in the preparation of this note.

26, Ridge Road,
Bombay 6. }
December 14, 1948. }

K. M. Munshi.

CONTENTS

PART I.

<i>Chapter</i>	<i>Pages</i>
I NATIONAL EMERGENCY & PROVINCIAL REDISTRIBUTION.. .. .	3-6
DEMAND FOR REDISTRIBUTION INOPPORTUNE ..	3
NATIONAL EMERGENCY :	
(i) EXTERNAL DANGERS AND INTERNAL WEAKNESS	3
(ii) EFFECTS OF PARTITION	4
(iii) WEAK BASIS OF OUR NATIONAL UNITY ..	4
MODERN NATIONALISM	4
THE NEED FOR STRENGTHENING NATIONALISM ..	5
VORTEX OF BITTERNESS AND UNCERTAINTY	5
II LINGUISTIC : ITS ORIGIN & DEVELOPMENT	6-10
ORIGIN AND DEVELOPMENT OF LINGUISTIC	7
LINGUISTIC AND NATIONALISM BASICALLY IDENTICAL	8
THE TECHNIQUE OF LINGUISTIC	9
EFFECTS OF LINGUISTIC	10
III DANGERS OF PROVINCIAL REDISTRIBUTION	10-16
LANGUAGE—AN UNSOUND TEST FOR REDISTRIBUTION	11
REPRESENTATIVE OPINION AGAINST REDISTRIBUTION	11
IRREDENTISM	12
IRREDENTIST CLAIMS	13
CONFLICT OF INTERESTS WITHIN THE SAME LANGUAGE GROUP	14
DANGER OF FRUSTRATED LINGUISTIC	14
MULTI-LINGUAL AREAS PREFERRED	15
CORRECT BASIS OF REDISTRIBUTION	15

PART II

I CLAIMS & COUNTER CLAIMS RE: UNITED MAHARASHTRA	19-22
CLAIMS FOR UNITED MAHARASHTRA—ITS EXTENT ..	19
COUNTER CLAIM BY THE GUJARAT RESEARCH SOCIETY	19
ISSUE UNDERLYING DISAGREEMENT	20
CLAIM FOR THE PROVINCE OF KONKAN	20
BHILLI AND KHANDESHI	21

<i>Chapter.</i>	<i>Pages</i>
NEED FOR DISPASSIONATE INQUIRY INTO LINGUISTIC CLAIMS.. .. .	21
LINGUISTIC CLAIMS AND MULTILINGUAL AREAS ..	22
BOMBAY CLAIMED MARATHA TERRITORY	22
II NORTH KONKAN AND BOMBAY	22-24
HISTORICAL LINKS BETWEEN NORTH KONKAN AND GUJARAT	23
UNIFORM PERSONAL LAW IN GUJARAT, NORTH KONKAN AND BOMBAY	24
HISTORY OF THE BOMBAY CITY	24
FOUNDATION OF BOMBAY	24
III NORTH KONKAN : EARLY IMMIGRANTS AND THEIR SPEECH	25-27
EARLY IMMIGRANTS TO NORTH KONKAN AND BOMBAY	25
THE ARRIVAL OF THE KOLIS OF NESHIDAS IN BOMBAY..	26
KHARVA KOLIS	26
EARLY ARYANS IN NORTH KONKAN	26
KONKANI ALLIED TO GUJARATI	27
IV NORTH KONKAN : ITS POPULATION AND SPEECH UPTO 1885	28-31
IMMIGRANTS INTO NORTH KONKAN—EARLY CENTURIES	28
PRABHUS IN SALSETTE AND BOMBAY	29
IMMIGRANTS—1800-1800	29
MIXED POPULATION IN 1885	30
NORTH KONKAN MAINLY NON-MARATHI	30
V GEOGRAPHICAL LINKS WITH BOMBAY ..	31-35
POPULATION : 1850 AND 1872	31
THE THATS SEPARATE BOMBAY AND MAHARASHTRA TILL 1865	32
TRANSPORT LINKS WITH GUJARAT AND MAHARASHTRA COMPARED	33
KONKAN ROUTE	34
TRANSPORT LINKS WITH GUJARAT	34
BOMBAY, AN EXTERNAL PORT	35
VI POPULATION OF BOMBAY : ITS PRESENT COMPOSITION	35-39
POPULATION : 1931 and 1941	35
POPULATION ESTIMATES : 1948	36
SPECIAL FACTORS IN THE INCREASE OF POPULATION	37
MARATHI SPEAKING 37%	37

<i>Chapter</i>	<i>Pages</i>
MARATHI SPEAKING PROPORTION IN TEXTILE LABOUR	
IN 1941	38
DO. IN 1948	38
NON-TEXTILE LABOUR	38
QUASI-MANUAL LABOUR	39
VII CULTURAL AFFINITIES OF BOMBAY	39-42
BOMBAY—AN ALL-INDIA CENTRE OF CULTURE	39
COSMOPOLITAN OUTLOOK	40
THE UNIVERSITY OF BOMBAY	40
BOMBAY AND MARATHI CULTURE	41
BOMBAY AND OTHER CULTURES	41
MULTI-LINGUAL CITY	42
VIII THE ECONOMIC IMPORTANCE OF BOMBAY	42-46
INDIA, BOMBAY'S HINTERLAND	42
ALL-INDIA TRADE CENTRE	43
ALL-INDIA INDUSTRIAL CENTRE	43
FINANCIAL NERVE-CENTRE OF INDIA	44
DANGERS OF TRIFLING WITH CAPITAL MARKET OF THE COUNTRY	44
ECONOMIC AND INDUSTRIAL INTERESTS PREDOMINANT- LY NON-MAHARASHTRIAN	44
CONSEQUENCES OF INCORPORATING BOMBAY IN MAHARASHTRA	45
IX FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS OF REDISTRIBU- TION	46-49
ESTIMATES OF FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS OVERHEAD CHARGES	46
REVENUE ACCOUNT	46
ESTIMATES ON REDISTRIBUTION	47
OFFICIAL ESTIMATES	48
INJUSTICE IN INCLUDING BOMBAY IN MAHARASHTRA	48
EXPENDITURE ON CAPITAL ACCOUNTS	49
POST-WAR RECONSTRUCTION PLANS	49
X THE PROVINCE OF BOMBAY: AN ORGANIC UNITY	49-51
ORGANIC UNITY OF THE PROVINCE DUE TO THE CITY	50
THE EFFECTS OF DISRUPTION	50
SO-CALLED FEDERAL APPROACH	50
THE CONGRESS PLEDGE	51

<i>Chapter.</i>	<i>Pages</i>
XI BOMBAY CITY AS A CENTRALLY ADMINISTERED AREA	51-98
BOMBAY CITY : A SEPARATE PROVINCE	51
ANALOGY OF CITY-STATE INAPPLICABLE	52
BOMBAY CITY : ADMINISTRATION COMPARATIVELY INDEPENDENT OF THE PROVINCE	52
BOMBAY UNIT SIZE AND REVENUE	53
BOMBAY UNIT : ITS VALUE TO THE CENTRE	53
THANA AS PART OF THE BOMBAY UNIT	54
THE FOUR COASTAL TALUKS : LINGUISTIC POSITION ..	54
LINGUISTIC POSITION OF THE COASTAL TALUKAS ..	55
BOMBAY CITY NOT AN INTERNAL AREA	55
EXAMPLE OF CALCUTTA NOT APPLICABLE	56
VIABILITY	56
JUDICIARY OF THE UNIT	56
BOMBAY AS A CENTRALLY-ADMINISTERED AREA ..	57
CENTRALLY-ADMINISTERED AREAS ESSENTIAL ..	57

o

ANNEXURE.

JUDGMENT OF WESTROPP C. J., 30 BOMBAY LAW REPORTS,
P. 365

MAPS.

- I LINGUISTIC LIMITS OF MAHA-GUJARAT.
- II KONKAN.
- III NORTH KONKAN.
- IV MASTER PLAN AREA OF BOMBAY.
- V LINGUISTIC COMPOSITION OF NORTH KONKAN.