THE STATES & THEIR PEOPLE IN THE INDIAN CONSTITUTION

BY

D. V. GUNDAPPA



KARNATAKA PUBLISHING HOUSE BASAVANGUDI P.O., BANGALORE CITY MYSORE STATE, INDIA THE STATES AND THEIR PEOPLE IN THE INDIAN CONSTITUTION

You have had enough of military reputation have gathered large harvests of that commoditive valuable or be it worthless. I invite you to something better, a. igher, and holier than that; I invite you to a glory not "fanned by conquest's crimson wing," but based upon the solid and lasting benefits which I believe the Parliament of England can, if it will, conf' upon the countless populations of India.—John Bright on If a in the House of Commons, June 24, 1858.

I do not think one realizes or can ever possibly life in a Native State whilst one stays with the Prince. Seems to be a great deal more servility here than in any State 1 have been in. Everybody spends all his time in our presence bent to the ground....

Progress with these Chiefs is a very thin vencer.... India is a cheap country for a rich man, although a dear country for a poor one.....

The right thing to do would be to scrap all their treaties, provided they were willing to do so, and to form a model treaty for all of them.

— E. S. Montagu on the Indian States.

The Princes are a different proposition. Their acceptance of the idea of Federation was certainly for me a surprise; but, if they will become equal partners in a Federal India, I venture to suggest that, of their own free will, they should advance. An undiluted autocracy, however benerolent it may be, and an almost undiluted democracy, are an incompatible mixture bound to result in an explosion. It is, therefore, I think, necessary for them not to take up an uncompromising attitude and imputiently refuse to listen to an appeal from or on behalf of the would-be partner. If they refused any such appeal, they would make the position of the Congress untenable and even most ankward. The Congress represents or endeavours to represent the whole of the people of India. It recognizes no distinction between those who reside in British India or in Indian States. The Congress has, with great wisdom and equally great restraint, refrained from interfering with the doings and affairs of the States; and it has done so in order not to unnecessarily wound the susceptibilities of the States, but also in order, by reason of the self-imposed restraint, to make its roice heard by the States on a suitable occasion. I think that the occasion has now arisen. May I, then, hope that the great Princes will not shut their ears to the Congress appeal on behalf of the people of the States !- MAHATMA GANDHI in a statement to the Press

English statesmen would have to dare to let India wander away into the woods through errors. Freedom is not worth having if it does not connote freedom to err and even to sin. If God Almighty has given the humblest of His creatures the freedom to err, it passes my comprehension how human beings, be they ever so experienced and able, can delight in depricing other human beings of that precious right.—Ibid.

(Young India, March 12, 1931).

THE STATES & THEIR PEOPLE IN THE INDIAN CONSTITUTION

BY

D. V. GUNDAPPA



KARNATAKA PUBLISHING HOUSE BASAVANGUDI P. O., BANGALORE CITY MYSORE STATE, INDIA

BY THE SAME WRITER.

- (1) The Problems of Indian Native States, 1917.

 (Being in large part the re-print of a series of Gr.) Letters addressed to H. H. the Maharaja of Bikaner.)
- (2) The Native States in the Empire, 1918.

 (A Memorial pleading for Federation, submitted to the Rt. Hon. E. S. Montagu.)
- (3) The Indian Native States and the Montagu-Chelmsford Report, 1918.
- (4) The Government of India and the Indian States, 1926, (A Draft Scheme of Federation.)
- (5) The Indian States Committee: A Note on Its Terms of Reference and Their Implications, 1928, (Presented to the Butler Committee.)

Etc., etc.

Copyright

All Rights Reserved

PRINTED AT THE BANGALORE PRESS
"LAKE VIEW", MYSORE BOAD, BANGALORE CITY
1931

PREFACE

"HE can be bold who hath his quarrel just." This line of Sophocles, the writer trusts, will suffice as an apology for this tract. He believes that the cause of the Indian States and their People is likely to be strengthened at the present juncture by such a review of its historical and jurisprudential setting as is herein attempted.

The study of the transactions and documents of the past is often easily tempted out of the region of the relevant,—into that of the didactic or the merely interesting. The writer hopes it will be found that he has guarded himself against this tendency, as well as against the opposite one of speaking without book.

He may be permitted to explain that the considerations and proposals he has ventured to submit have for their basis his continuous study of the problem in its several aspects for over twenty years,—by means of contributions to newspapers and journals, discussions with publicists of various schools, and association with popular movements. That his views have not had to undergo any very radical changes in the course of these frequent re-examinations is to him some ground for seeking for them the attention of the public.

This pamphlet is not by any means planned as a treatise on questions of the general administration and development of the States. The organization of their public services, their financial policies, their programmes of economic advancement, their arrangements for the education and upbringing of the Princes, their provision for the unemployed members of the royal households, their schemes for promoting social welfare—these and similar questions have not been touched upon. Their importance, great as it is, is secondary; and one may be sure they will receive due attention when—but only when—the fundamental condition of a popular and responsible constitution is realized in all possible fullness.

To complain that there is nothing new or distinguishing in these proposals would be to blame the writer for lacking a merit to which he never meant to lay claim. The ideas he has tried to express have all been drawn from the world's common stock of civilized political experience and thought. His object is the simple one of showing how it is both needful

and possible to apply those ideas to the Indian States—for the emancipation of seventy millions of the Empire's subjects.

The writer is not unaware of the defects in his manner of presentation. Had he had the advantage of leisure, he could at least have deleted some repetitions and trimmed up the sentences. He trusts the importance of the subject is such that it will not let the defects of his manner obscure the material points of his argument.

No great optimism has nursed this essay. India's recent experiences prove that reason and righteousness are by themselves not enough to bring success to the People's cause. Not until public opinion manifests itself in forms which can bring home to Governments a sense of its practical power in things that matter to them can it be certain of a serious response to its demands for reform. This means mass action; and that is a subject which the writer dare not discuss here. It is for him rather to pray that enough of patriotic pre-vision and statesmanship may be vouchsafed to the Princes,-and together with it, enough of constructive temper and tact to the public workers who may have opportunities of negotiating with them; for, the Princes too deserve to be handled with a measure of sympathy, held in leash as they are by tradition and custom, like the rest of us,—so that they may, sparing mass energy to be organized for the many other tasks of nationbuilding that are sorely in need of it, build up by their own cheerful and steadfast efforts a polity which will—

> "Keep their thrones unshaken still Broad-based upon the People's will,"

-one in which "Freedom gently broadens down from precedent to precedent." If they will not bring the change in thus gracefully, it is certain to break in stormily. The times leave us in no doubt about it:

"Our little systems have their day; They have their day and cease to be."

So may the People's cause find an early and benign victory and let advocacy like this pass into oblivion.

April 1931,

CONTENTS

CHAPTER.		P	AGE
I.	FACTS AND ISSUES		9
II.			16
III.			34
IV.			44
V.			
٠.	THEIR RELATIVE VALUE AND SIGNIFICANCE	i	59
VI.			67
VII.			85
VIII.			99
IX.		•	108
	An Interim Note	• •	119
X.	THE ROUND TABLE CONFERENCE AND AFTER.		121
	SUMMARY AND CONCLUSION		135
	NDIX.		
A.	TREATIES AND SANNADS (Extracts)	• •	145
В.	Intervention cum Non-Intervention		
~	(Extracts from Speeches of Viceroys etc.)	• •	151
C.	ROYALTY IN RESPONSIBLE GOVERNMENT		
	(Select Articles from the Constitutions of certain Monarchical States in Europe)		158
D.	_	• •	190
D .	of Transition		165
E	Analysis of the States		167
F.	THE STATES' PEOPLE AND THE R. T.	••	101
4.	Conference		169
G.	Mr. Montagu on the States		i73
•••	•		
BIBLIOGRAPHY		• •	176
INDEX			177

BIBLIOGRAPHY.

HISTORICAL.

Our Indian Protectorate. By Sir C. L. Tupper (1893). Protected Princes of India (1894) Re-named The Native States of India (1910) By Sir W. Lee-Warner.

Imperial Gazetteer of India Vols. II and IV-Esp. Ch. iii (1909). Peoples and Problems of India By Sir T. W. Holderness (1928).

Relations of Indian States with the Government of India By K. M. Panikkur (1927). Lord Hustings and the Indian States By M. S. Mehta (1930).

Relations between the Indian States and the Government of India By M. Ruthna. awamy (1930).

OFFICIAL.

Report on Indian Constitutional Reforms-Montagu Chelmsford Report, especially Chapter X. (1918).

Report of the Indian States Committee-Butler Report (1928-29).

Report of the Indian Statutory Commission-Simon Report, Vols. I and 11 (1930), Proceedings of the Indian Round Table Conference in London, Umd. 3778. (1930-31).

The Indian States-List corrected up to 1st January 1929. Treatien, Engagements and Sanads. Compiled by Sir Charles Aitchicon. British Enactments in Force in Native States. Compiled by J. M. Macpherson.

Government of India By Sir Courtenay Ilbert (1916).

Speeches and Documents on Indian Policy Ed. by A. B. Keith, Vols. I & II (1922).

Indian Constitutional Documents Ed. by P. Mukherji, Vols. I and II.

India, a Federation? By Sir F. Whyte (1926).

Indian Constitutional Problems By Six P. S. Sivaswamy Aiyer (1928).

Report & Supplementary Report of the All-Parties Conference-Nehru Report (1928). The Future of Indian States By V. S. Srinivana Sastri (1926) Problems of Indian States By G. R. Abhyanker (1928).

[There are many speeches and pamphlets of Prof. G. R. Abhyanker on the case of the States' People.]

Memorandum of the Indian States' People, Publ. by the Indian States' Peoples' Conference of Bombay (1928).

Indictment of Patiala. By a Special Committee of the above I. S. P. C. (1930).

This organization has issued a number of books and pamphlets on several questions pertaining to the States, from the People's standpoint.]

Report of the Jamuagar I jara Tapas Committee. Issued by Jamnagar Praja Mandal (1929).

What are Indian States? By B. S. Pathik (1928).

Indian Princes under British Protection By P. L. Chudgar (1929).

Presidential Address to the South Indian States Peoples' Conference at Trivandium (1929) By Sir M. Vievesvaraya.

The British Crown and the Indian States By the Special Organization of the Chamber of Princes (1929).

Scrape of Paper By A. P. Nicholson (1930).

Indian States By Sirdar D. K. Sen (1930).

Problems of Indian Stites By Diwan Bahadur A. B. Latthe (1930). Petitions submitted to H. E. the Governor of Bombay by the Subjects of the Idar State in July 1926 and June 1927. (Published by the Idar Prajakiya Mandal, Bombay).

Memorandum of the Indian States People's Conference (Presented to the Indian States Committee in London by Mesers, G. R. Abhyanker and P. L. Chudgar, 1928). M. Ramachandra Rao.

R. T. C. and Indian States Subjects By Mr. S. G. Vaze (Presidential address to the Deccan States People's Conference, Poona, March 1931, printed in the Servant of India of March 26, 1931).

Pamphleta by the present writer-(See page 4 unte).

INDEX.

(References are to pages.)

A .

Adoption Sannad 22, 51.
Alien 18, 28, 32 (See Foreigners' Act).
Allegiance 16, 22, 23, 25.
Alliance 37, 38.
Alternative Schemes 111, 165.
Alwar 23, 57, 99, 174-5.
Analysis of the States 89, 111, 167.
Anson, Sir W.--16.
Autocraey 10, 99, 101.

Bahawalpur 152.

В.

Baker, Prof. E .- 19. Barlow, Sir G .- 47. Baroda 22, 53, 54, 99, 149. Bentinck, Lord W.-49. Berars 22, Bharatpore 57, 99, 141n., 152, 174. Bhopal 22, 99, 129, 131, 132. Bikaner 23, 42, 129, 130, 131, 174. Blackstone 16, 18. Bright, John-2, 133. British Crown 9, 19, 22, 32, 70; Definition of -- 74,75. British Crown and Indian States 11, 36, 49 British Government 9, 11; Its Responsibility 14, 16, 29, 31, 33, 65; States' Relations with-75, 79. British India 11, 28, 38, 39; Kept apart from States 77, 79. British Subject 18, 30, 142. When an inhabitant of British India was not-70. Bryce, Lord---123. Bureaucracy 101. Backe, Edmund--133. Butler, Sir Harcourt-17.
Butler Report 9, 12, 17, 22, 26, 29, 30, 39

C. ('anning, Lord-22, 23, 36, 40, 51, 52,

83, 84, 105, 129.

40, 42, 44, 51, 57, 59, 65, 66, 73, 74, 80,

Chamber of Princes 14, 31, 49, 120, 144 Charter, E. I. Company's First—68. ... Act 46. Chelmsford, Lord—152 (See Montagu-Chelmsford Report). Citizenship, Rights of—91,92, 95; Imperial—20, 32; Federal—129, 139. Clive, Lord—45. Cochin 57, 105. Commission, Indian Statutory—(See Simon Report).

Simon Report).
Simon—(See Simon Report).
Committee, Butler—(See Butler Report).
Indian States—(See Butler Report).

C .-- Contd.

Company, East India-34, 35, 37, 45, 46, 50, 68, 71. Conference, London-(See Round Table Conference). Congress, Indian National-71, 105, 121, 133. Constitution, Dominion-87 et segg., 135; Revision of the-143. Consultation of Unfederated States 141. Consulting Princes and People 81. Cooch Behar 99. Cornwallis, Lord-46, 47, 48, Councils Act, Indian-37. Creasy, Sir E.-20. Crown (See British Crown). Curzon, Lord-55, 56, 62, 151, 152. Customs Rights 140n. Cutch 99.

Defence under Federation 96.
Democracy—Its Race-transcending Universality 106.

in the States 15; Merits of —102-103; Dangers of—103, 138 (16); —Essential to Federation 104, 138a (See Responsible Government).
Dicey, Prof. A. V—18.
Dominion 18a;—Constitution for India 12, 85, 87, 134, 135;—Status defined 82n.
Dufferin, Lord—55.

Dalhousie, Lord-47, 50.

E.

East India Company Acts 34.
Economic Relations and Adjustments
10, 95, 137, 139, 140.
Edward, King-Emperor 23.
Elgin, Lord—52, 53.
Elizabeth, Queen—69.
Emperor, 19, 31.
Emperor vs. Tewari 17.
Empire 19, 32.
Empress of India 38, 55.
External Relations under Federation 96.

F.

Federal Constitution 87-92 et seqq., 135, 137.

" Government 87, 139.
" Executive 88.
" Legislature 88-89, 138.
" Judiciary 94, 129, 139.
" Jurisdiction 90.
" Finance 95.
" Foreign Relations 96, 137.
Federation 9: Unitariem 123.
Federation 9: Cardinal Points of Indian—12.

Federation, Effects of-on Sta-42. First Official Adumbration of-85. Steps towards-108, 111, and Paramountary 127. Fewlatory States 9 (See States). Fiduciary Responsibility 29, 49, 51. Financial Adjustments 95, 96, 140 & s. Fiscal and Economic Equity 126.

Foreigners' Act (of 1864-1915) 17, 142n.

Foreign Jurisdiction Act 26.

Gandhi, Mahatma-2, 133. tieneral Clauses Act 38, 40, Government of India 10. Jurisdictions of Executive and Legislature Not Co-extensive 77, 79. Government of India Acts 10, 25, 28, 31, 34, 35, 36, 37, 61, 68, 69, 70, 76, 77,

78. Governor-General 10, 22, 38 (See Government of India).

in a Dominion Constitution 83 & st. Greater India Council 109-11. Gwalior 145, 146, 151, 174.

Hall, Prof. W. E .- 19, 60. Halabury, Lord-9, 16, 17, 23, 70. Hanlinge, Lord-- 49, 50, 152. Hastings, Warren-15. (Lord Moira) 47, 48. High Courty Act, Indian -37. High Court of Bombay 17. ., of Mysore 25. Holderness, Sir T.-23, 58. Holdsworth, Prof. W. S.-18, Holkar 52, 53. Hyderabad 22, 57, 99, 153, 174.

Ilbert, Sir C. P.-17, 20, 21, 22, 26, 27, 28, 43, 69, 70, 77, 79, 141. Imperial Conference 82, 83, 136, Imperial Gazetteer of India 21, 24, 27, 45. 47, 50, 51, 72. " India ", Definition of-35, 36, 37, 39, India, One Care 51, 70, One in Royal Proclamations 31. Indian India 9 (See States). Indian Problem, Uniqueness of-12. " Predominant Viewpoint, 13. ... Sacrifice from All Parties, 14. Indian States 9 (Ser States.) Committee (See Butler Report). Indian Statutory Commission (See Simon Keport).

Indore 22, 57, 99, Interim Note 119.

I.--Contd.

Interim Charge of Suzerainty 118, International Law 19, 20, 60, 142. International Law, Indian States Outside-10, 24, 55, 134, Interpretation Act 39, Intervention 41, 42, 44, 57, 62, 63. To be Regulated 64, 112, 118, 141. Irwin, Lord-119, 120, 122, 133, 143, 153. 156. Ismail, Sir Mirza M .- (See Mirza).

J.

Jaipur 144, 154. Jamnagar 99. Javakar, Mr. M. R. - 130. Jodhpur 152,

ĸ.

Kashmir 57, 199, 129, Keith, Prof. A. B .- 74, 80, 82, 83, Khairpur 99. King, The-and the Subject 16, (See Crown, Emperor and Sovereign).

Lansdowne, Lord-55. Lawrence, Lord-53, Laws of England (See Halsbury). Lee-Warner, Sir W .- 24, 27, 36, 45, 48, 49, 50, 51, 60, 134, Liberals, Indian-105, 121. Low, Sir Sidney-100, 101. Lowell 132. Lytton, Lord-38, 54.

Maladministration, "Gross" -- to Warrant

Maedonell, Sir J.-40.

Interference 65, 100, Manipur 22, 24, 55, 149, 150. Mayo, Lord-53. Mehta, Mr. M. 8,-45, 47, 48. Ministers under the R. T. C. Scheme and Paramountey 128. Minto, Lord-29. 55, 56, 57, 61. Mirza M. Ismail, Sir-129, 132. Monarchy in Responsible Government 158 et segg. Montagu, Rt. Hon. E. S.-31, 70, 133; on the States 173-5 (Nee Montingu-Chelmsford Report). Montaga Chelmsford Report 10, 85, 104, 111, 115. Moriey, Lord-56s, 71, 133. Motifal Nehru, Pandit-85. Mughal Policy 72. Mutiny, Indian- 50. My-ore 22, 47, 49, 55, 58, 65, 102, 105, 173.

R. - Contd. Nabha 22, 57, 99. Proclamation to Introduce Re-Nationality and Status of Aliens Act, 18. forms 14 (See Prociamation). Royal Titles Act 19, 38. Native States 9 (See States). Naturalization Act, British 27. Royalty in Responsible Government 158 Nehru Report 14. et regg. Non-Intervention (See Intervention). Northbrook, Lord-54. Safeguard in Responsible Government 138. Oppenheim, Prof.-20. Salisbury, Lord-39. Sanna 1 (See Treaty). Oppenheimer, Dr. H.-123. Sastri, Rt. Hon. V. S. Srinivasa-57, 67, 91, 123. Paramountcy (See Suzerainty). Scott, Sir L.-73, 74, 80, 83. Parliament, British-Its Pledge 16; Its Secretary of State for India 10, 38. Sedition Law, Common—24. Shore, Sir J.—45, 46. Powers 25; Its Acts 28; Its Responsibility 31, 33, 129. Simon Report 10, 12, 17, 70, 81, 108, , New Act of-108-9, 135. Patiala 22, 23, 57, 99. Pax Britannica 47, 100. Simon Scheme Examined 109. Sivaswamy Aiyer, Sir P. S.—67, 72, 74, 75, 77, 91, 114, 165. People of the States 10; Their Organizations 86; Their Complaints 11; Their Status 32; Their Demands 143-4, Slave Trade Act 37. Political Department (of the Government Sovereignty in the States, Bipartite 21. of India) 21, 64, 118, 128, 141. Pollock, Sir F.—134. External-9, 20, 136, 137. Internal Sub-10, 135. ** Preparations Commission and Committees Internal Super-9, 20, 136, ** 97, 140, 142. Princes 9, 10, 11, 122. 137. Special Matters between States and the " Chamber of-(See Chamber). Rest of India 138 Protection Act 57. States-What are they 9. Proclamation, Royal-31; To Introduce Number, Size, Population etc., 9, Reforms 14, 107, 137. ,, Queen's—41, 51, 52, 69, 145. 167. and Legislature of British India 28. Protected States 9 (See States). Within Federation 93-94, 135-6. Outside Federation 112, 140. Their Individuality and Integrity Queen (See Empress and Proclamation). 61, 135, States' People and the R. T. C. 121-2, 129 et segq., 169. Ramachandra Rao, Dewan Bahadur M .-Problem-Integral and Organic 122, 129, 131. Part of the Indian Problem 130-1. Ranjit Singh, Maharaja-47, 52. Subjects of the States, Status of—16; Not Foreigners 22 seq., 142 (See Reading, Lord--57. Representation of States in Federal Gov-People). ernment 138, 139, Subjectship Bipartite 21. Responsible Government in States 92, Supreme Court (See Federal Judiciary). . 99, 137, 138; No harm to Princes etc., Suzerainty (Paramountcy) 9, 19, 20, 22, 34, 36, 37, 39, 40, 41, 69, 70, 71, 73, 104; Demand for-105; Fitness for-106; Steps towards-108, 115. (See 136, 137, Democracy.) Suzerainty-What it is 9, 19, 40-41, 136. Revenues of India 75. Quintessence of Sovereignty Rights of Citizenship (See Citizenship). 20. "Ring Fence" 45, 46, Its Legal Sanction 39, Ripon, Lord-55, Its Dualism and Dubiety 65. ** Round Table Conference 121 et segg. In Law and Practice 75. ** Objects of-As an Incident 35, 37, 70, 71, 119, 121, 78. Princes at Transcends Statute-law 79. the-122, 131. Its Mission 84, 133. Work of theand Dominion Status 72. 123, 124, 125, 126, and Federation 127, 128, 136.

and the Ex-

clusion of the People 169.

and Federal Cabinet 128.

Interim Charge of-108, 118,

Tennyara 6. Travancore 47, 105. Travancore 47, 105.
Treaties 9, 44, 46, 50, 51, 58, 59, 61.

" To be Replaced 81, 142, 143, 175.
" of Baroda 149; Bhopal 145;
Gwalior 145, 146; Indore 145, 146;
Kolhapur 146, 148; Manipur 149, 150;
Mysore 58, 149; Patiala 147, 148;
Travancore 145; Udaipur 48.
Tributes and Subsidies 17, 140.
Tupper, Sir C. L.—45, 50, 54, 55, 156.

U.

Udaipur 29, 48, 56.

V.

Venkatasubbaiya, Mr. V.-167. Viceroy, Unknown to Statute, but Known to Constitution 79.
Visvesvaraya, Sir M.—85, 86, 102, 114.

Wellesley, Lord-47, 48, Westlake, Prof. J.-19, 134, Wheaton, H.-142, Winterton, Lord-138. Wordsworth 15.