

TRUST PROBLEM

BY

JEREMIAH WHIPPLE JENKS, PH.D.

*Professor of Political Science, Cornell University, Expert Agent United
States Industrial Commission, Consulting Expert United
States Department of Labor*

NEW YORK

McCLURE, PHILLIPS & CO.

1900

COPYRIGHT, 1900, BY
JEREMIAH W. JENKS

First Impression, June, 1900
Second Impression, August, 1900

Press of J. J. Little & Co.
Astor Place, New York

TO

G. B. J.

MY KEENEEST, ABLEST, KINDEST
CRITIC

Contents

INTRODUCTION

	PAGE
Sources of information	3
Purpose and nature of book.....	4
Citations and nature of data	5
Conclusions of Chicago conference on trusts.....	6
Recommendations of Industrial Commission.....	6
Remedies for trusts, by Gov. Roosevelt, Mr. Bryan, and Mr. Coler.....	6
Definition of trust.....	8
Viewpoint of author.....	9

CHAPTER I

COMPETITION : ITS NATURE

Need of studying competition to understand combination	10
Most writers assume free competition contrary to facts of business life.....	10
Prices often not fixed by competition....	11
In most trade an element of combination exists.....	11
Nominal competition at times encouraged to prevent real competition.....	13
Competition more nearly free in wholesale trade, but the element of combination remains.....	14
In manufacture the nature of goods determines the character of the competition	14
Goods, the quality of which can be readily tested and which are uniform, compete in price.....	15

Contents

	PAGE
Goods with brands compete in advertising, not in price	15
Amount of capital needed for plant determines nature of competition	16
Case of the sugar industry	17
Nature of competition when little capital is needed..	18
When much capital is needed	19
In latter case combination is natural	20

CHAPTER II

THE WASTES OF COMPETITION

Competitive prices usually high	21
Wastes of competition distinguished from those of production on a small scale	21
Competitive prices at times higher than monopoly prices	22
Difficulties of securing a market	22
Travelling salesmen	23
Skill of salesmen	24
Frequency of their visits	25
Amount of such loss	26
Cost of advertising	27
Offers of premiums	28
Economic disadvantages of these methods	28
Extension of credits from competition	29
Convenience to buyers from a large establishment ..	30
Savings in freight charges	31
Restriction of output. The Whiskey Pools	33
Advantages of running plants at full capacity	34
The Sugar Trust another example	35
Distribution of machinery in large combination	36
Business ability a factor in cheap production	38
Skilful organization an absolute saving of energy ...	39
A good executive gets best work from subordinates .	40
Distribution of talent important	41
Combination between producers of raw material and finished product	42
Manufacture of by-products	42
Economic function of combination in saving waste energy	42

Contents

CHAPTER III

FAVORS TO INDUSTRIAL COMBINATIONS

	PAGE
Special favors a source of monopoly.	44
The protective tariff has often aided the formation of combinations.....	45
The same principles found in part in unprotected industries.....	46
Probable effect of removal of tariff.....	46
International combinations promoted thereby.....	47
Freight discriminations a cause.....	49
Discriminations contrary to law and public policy, but are given at times in payment for real services rendered.....	51
Freight advantages without illegal discriminations..	53

CHAPTER IV

COMBINATION AND MONOPOLY

Legal monopolies.....	56
Natural monopolies.....	57
Meaning of "Monopoly".....	58
Assuming cost as constant, the holder of a patent in fixing prices considers the nature of the demand.	59
A large manufacturer may be a "monopolist" without special privilege.....	60
The Trust, in fixing prices, must consider potential competitors.....	61
They may be called into the field soon by high prices. They may be kept out by moderate prices.....	62
Can great capital alone secure monopoly?.....	64
Competition attracted by large profits.....	66
Effective rivalry means losses to both parties.....	66
Difference between large business and capitalistic monopoly.....	67
The element of fear important in preventing competition.....	68

Contents

	PAGE
Competition by a combination in collateral industry.	69
Virtual monopoly from power of large capital seems possible, but this is not so complete as a legal monopoly or natural monopoly.	70
Combinations have usually overreached; but have sometimes held much controlling power in market. Examples	70
The large capital gives power which secures special favors	73
Desire to exercise personal power an element in promoting monopoly.	73
Combinations in the export trade	75
Summary.	76

CHAPTER V

PROMOTER AND FINANCIER

Promoter defined	77
Stock certificates, issued for cash	78
Stock issued for property	78
Stock issued for services.	79
The bondholders pay the costs of building; the stockholders reap surplus profits	82
This custom frequent among public-service corporations	83
Like methods in industrial companies	83
Preferred stock in lieu of bonds.	84
Advantages of preferred stock.	85
The promoter's pay is often in speculative securities; he often receives large amounts.	87
The organization of the American Tin Plate Company	88
The financier	90
Underwriting defined	91
Underwriters' profits.	92
The profits of the organizers of Distilling Company of America	93
The promoter's work often injurious in its results.	94
At times the organization, by paying debts of constituent companies, has relieved small banks of doubtful securities	95

Contents

	PAGE
Bank officials at times improperly influenced	96
The evil of speculation encouraged by promoters is great	97

CHAPTER VI

THE BASIS OF CAPITALIZATION

Stock on cash valuation	98
Massachusetts law. Puerto Rico	99
Capitalization on earning capacity	99
Conceals state of business; stock is more advanta- geously sold	102
Does stock watering affect the public?	103
Capitalization at cash value may mislead	104
Overcapitalization an influence toward high prices . .	105
Full information to investors and stockholders the only remedy	105
Stock to represent proportional parts of business . . .	106

CHAPTER VII

METHODS OF ORGANIZATION AND MANAGEMENT

Systems of pooling	108
Addyston Pipe Company	109
A coal pool's methods	110
The "Trust" form	111
The Trust reorganizations	113
Dissolution of Standard Oil Trust and reorganization	113
The voting trust	115
Voting trust to protect company against absorption by a rival company	116
Combination into one huge corporation	117
Corporation to own stocks of other corporations . . .	118
Effect of such corporations on amount and values of securities	119
Two classes of combinations. The one made up of former competitors; the other of producers of products at different stages in manufacture. The Federal Steel Company an example of latter kind	121

Contents

	PAGE
Different nature of competition.....	122
The combination at times informal.....	124
In all cases, the greatest efficiency is sought.....	125
Methods of management.....	125
Directors may gamble in stocks.....	126
The public often cannot know the condition of business.....	126
Directors may be given too long a lease of power...	127
Stockholders may be given too much power.....	128
Rivals may thus secure business secrets or levy blackmail.....	128
More attention to these evils would bring about improvement in corporation laws.....	129

CHAPTER VIII

PRICES

Combinations, on account of saving the wastes of competition, might lower prices of finished product or raise prices of raw material.....	130
Important to know what effects on prices they do in fact exert. Effects on prices, good test of usefulness or disadvantage.....	132
The differential, or margin, shows costs of manufacture plus profit.....	133
<i>Sugar</i>	
The grades explained.....	134
The English differential.....	134
The American margin lowered before formation of Trust; increased immediately afterward.....	136
Lowered during Spreckels competition.....	137
Increased with new combination.....	137
Lessened under Arbuckle competition.....	138
Trust has fixed prices.....	138
Has had little effect towards steadying prices.....	139
Possible ruin of refiners under fierce competition might have restricted output enough to raise prices.....	140
Under such industries there is no normal competitive rate.....	141

Contents

	PAGE
English margin steadier than American	142
Mr. Havemeyer puts cost of refining high.....	143
Margin properly higher when raw sugar is high....	144
Chart gives no information regarding effect of combination on price of raw sugar	145

Whiskey

During existence of pools, prices of alcohol and profits increased; under Trust, prices cut to force rivals in; later, prices increased.....	148
Combinations have held prices and profits high only for short periods. Have attempted to secure too high profits	149
Present policy.....	149

Petroleum

Export prices for oil usually higher than domestic ..	151
Competition in New York	152
The margin lowered more rapidly during early years of the industry than of late. Only slight decrease in the margin since formation of Trust..	153
During late years, an increase in the value of by-products would justify greater decrease in the margin	154
During last two years an increase both in crude oil and in the margin	154
Increase in margin partly explained by high cost of refining, but profits also have increased	155
Prices of crude oil at times fixed arbitrarily	155
Greater general changes usually due to changes in supply. Examples	156

Tin Plate

Rapid increase in price of steel due chiefly to demand, especially in structural steel	158
Tin has also increased in price	159
During 1897-98 the margin declined.....	160
On formation of Trust the margin increased.....	161
Since March, 1899, while price has largely increased, the margin has not	161
Chart shows also effect of changes in duty.....	163

Contents

	PAGE
<i>Steel and Wire</i>	
Rapid increase in prices during 1899.....	165
Decided effect of wire nail pool	166
Increase of wages	167
Increase in the margin partly explained by increased price of raw material involving more expensive waste	167
Chart indicates nevertheless increase in profits	168
Contract prices differ from market prices	169
Combination has legal monopoly in barb wire.....	170
Trust enabled to take advantage of market conditions	170

CHAPTER IX

THE TRUSTS AND WAGES

Savings of combination a fund from which wages might be increased	171
Trusts have at times raised wages. The Whiskey Trust.....	172
Trusts think it just to divide benefits with wage earners, and wise to placate the public thereby.	172
The Sugar Trust and Standard Oil Company have paid fair wages.....	173
The tin plate and steel companies have raised wages	173
The increase due to the condition of business and demands of employees	174
Power of the combinations over laborers, greater than that of a single employer	176
Trusts usually not hostile to trade unions, but some will not deal with them	176
In case of strike a combination may close one or several plants and fill orders from the others ...	177
If unions are coextensive with an entire industry, the advantage would be with them.....	178
The trade unions may also combine and wrest from the employer a fit share of the savings of combination.....	178
If the laborers gain thus, sometimes the consumer must furnish the fund.....	179
Actual disposition of fund arranged by struggle ...	180
Public sympathy will aid the laborer in a contest ...	181

Contents

	PAGE
Trusts discharge commercial travellers.....	182
Superintendents also removed by combination.....	183
Cases of the officers of the constituent members of the Federal Steel Company, and of the American Steel and Wire Company.....	184
Savings from discharged men may aid the public or the contrary.....	185
Apparently a larger average output per man under combination.....	186
Steadiness of employment under combination.....	187
Labor and capital may combine—at the expense of the consumer ...	188
The ultimate outcome.....	189

CHAPTER X

POLITICAL AND SOCIAL EFFECTS

The influence of corporations upon legislatures.....	190
Blackmail of corporations.....	191
Is the fault with the corporations or the legislators?.	193
The effect upon our social organization.....	194
Competitive system develops individuality.....	195
Combinations save the weak from bankruptcy.....	196
Creditors fare the same under both systems, though the feelings of the bankrupt might be injured more by the Trust.....	197
Excessive competition sometimes produces shoddy goods to injury of public, and leads to business depression.....	198
Difficult for individuals to start in business indepen- dently.....	200
Nepotism doubtless obtains in large corporations. A decided evil.....	201
Under competitive system many men direct who are fit only to follow directions.....	202
Subordinates usually are granted discretionary power, if they prove themselves fit.....	203
Example of a combination of railroads.....	204
All officials of corporations are responsible to others.	205
The art of managing superiors develops individuality.	205

Contents

	PAGE
Corporations urge employees to dishonorable practices no oftener than does the competitive system	207
Combination limited to only part of industrial field..	208
Difficult in agricultural products.....	209
Individual genius independent.....	209
Experience only can show the limits of the field of competition.....	210
Monopolistic power should be held in check by society	211

CHAPTER XI

LEGISLATION

Industrial combinations have both good and bad qualities.....	212
The saving of the wastes of capital and of energy good qualities.....	213
Enumeration of evils: to investors; to stockholders; to consumers through high prices and through low prices for raw material; to the wage-earners; to the State through political corruption; to business community through difficulty of entering business, or the employment of unscrupulous methods, though individuals managing corporations are no worse morally than others. Greater social effect of evil practice by head of great corporation.....	214
Let-alone policy.....	217
Present laws, aiming at destruction.....	217
Such laws have not prevented combinations, but have probably changed the form of organization....	218
Some, if interpreted strictly, would have been harmful, but the courts have generally been conservative.....	218
Special advantages should be removed.....	219
Discriminations in railroad rates can be checked by amending the Interstate Commerce Law.....	220
The patent laws might be improved.....	220
Removal of the tariff.....	221
Amendments to corporation laws holding directors and promoters to strict responsibility desirable.	222

Contents

	PAGE
Publicity more satisfactory, if properly managed	222
Mr. Coler's plan ; comments	223
Publicity would protect the investors ; the stockholders ; the public, by encouraging competition ; the laborer	224
Governor Roosevelt's plan gives another view of publicity needed	224
Mr. Bryan's plan	224
Constitutional amendment not discussed	225
A few large States could accomplish much	225
Publicity will give basis for more vigorous action	226

APPENDIX A

SUGGESTIONS AT CHICAGO TRUST CONFERENCE

Unlawful conspiracies in restraint of trade should be declared illegal by a statute, well enforced	232
Corporations should be organized only under careful government control, and laws should be uniform	232
Objects of corporations should be limited and clearly defined	233
Issue of stock and bonds should be carefully safeguarded	233
Stock watering should not be allowed	233
There should be governmental supervision of corporations, with detailed reports ; yet proper business secrets should be respected	233

APPENDIX B

PRELIMINARY REPORT OF THE UNITED STATES INDUSTRIAL COMMISSION

Extent of inquiry	235
Trusts have become fixtures in business life ; their power for evil should be destroyed, their means for good preserved	236
Organizers should be prevented from deceiving the public by (a) furnishing details of their organization ; (b) being held responsible ; (c) expressing in certificate of incorporation powers and limitations of directors and officers	236

Contents

	PAGE
Directors should report to stockholders.....	237
Stockholders should see certain records.....	237
Stockholders should receive lists of members before annual meeting.....	237
Large corporations should publish annual report, audited, subject to government inspection	238
To prevent railroad discriminations, Interstate Com- merce Commission should be strengthened: (a) by being authorized to prescribe methods of accounting; (b) by having its decisions made operative till reversed; (c) by being authorized to prescribe freight classifications; (d) penalties should be fines against carrier, not imprisonment of officials.....	238

APPENDIX C

PLAN OF BIRD S. COLER FOR REGULATION OF TRUSTS

Existence of corporations should be limited in time.	241
Business requiring secrecy of management should not be incorporated	241
Securities should be issued only for actual value, and not put on market till after one business year...	241
Places of business named not to be changed without consent of State	242
Accounts to be open to public officials.....	242
Nature of business to be limited.....	242
Laws requiring publicity to be uniform throughout the Union	243
The right of State unquestioned and each State best qualified to legislate for itself	243

APPENDIX D

NEW YORK COMPANIES' ACT

Powers and purposes.....	244
Registered office and agent	246
Certificate of incorporation.....	248
Incorporation fees	250

Contents

	PAGE
Amendment of certificate.....	251
Reincorporation under act.....	252
Act optional.....	253
Directors.....	253
Duties of directors regarding election.....	254
Officers.....	256
Meetings.....	258
Stock and certificates.....	259
Penalties for delinquent officials.....	263
Powers of corporation to buy and sell stock.....	264
Dividends.....	265
Promotion.....	265
Balance sheet.....	270
Duties of auditors.....	273
Private balance sheet.....	275
Annual report.....	276
Merger and dissolution.....	278
Monopoly act not repealed.....	279

APPENDIX E

PLAN OF WILLIAM J. BRYAN FOR REGULATION OF TRUSTS

A Congressional act requiring a license issued by some power created by Congress.....	280
Without license no corporation permitted to do busi- ness outside its own State.....	280
License to be granted only on conditions that will—	
Prevent watering of stock.....	280
Prevent monopoly.....	280
Provide for publicity.....	280
License may be repealed.....	280
Willing to preserve benefits of corporations and take away possibilities of harm.....	281



Diagrams

	FACING PAGE
PRICES OF SUGAR	133
PRICES OF SPIRITS AND CORN	146
PRICES OF CRUDE AND REFINED OIL	150
PRICES OF STEEL, TIN, AND TIN PLATE	157
PRICES OF CRUDE AND FINISHED IRON AND STEEL	165