



**GOVERNMENT OF INDIA
NARMADA WATER DISPUTES TRIBUNAL**

**FURTHER REPORT
OF
THE NARMADA WATER DISPUTES TRIBUNAL
UNDER SECTION 5(3) OF THE INTER-STATE
WATER DISPUTES ACT, 1956**

**IN THE MATTER OF WATER DISPUTES REGARDING
THE INTER-STATE RIVER NARMADA AND THE RIVER VALLEY
THEREOF BETWEEN**

- 1. The State of Gujarat**
- 2. The State of Madhya Pradesh**
- 3. The State of Maharashtra**
- 4. The State of Rajasthan**

VOLUME I

NEW DELHI

1979

COMPOSITION OF THE
NARMADA WATER DISPUTES TRIBUNAL.

(During the hearing of the References under
Section 5(3) of the Inter-State Water Disputes Act, 1956)

Chairman

SHRI V. RAMASWAMI

Members

SHRI A.K. SINHA

SHRI M.R. V. ANSARI

GOVERNMENT OF INDIA
NARMADA WATER DISPUTES TRIBUNAL

No. 69/1/78-NWDT

New Delhi, December 7, 1979

The Secretary to the
Government of India,
Ministry of Agriculture & Irrigation,
Department of Irrigation,
NEW DELHI.

SIR,

The Narmada Water Disputes Tribunal investigated the matters referred to it under Section 5(1) of the Inter-State Water Disputes Act 1956 and forwarded its Report with its Decision under Section 5(2) of the said Act to the Government of India on the 16th August, 1978.

Within three months of the aforesaid Decision, the Union of India and the States of Gujarat, Madhya Pradesh, Maharashtra and Rajasthan filed five separate References before the Tribunal under Section 5(3) of the Inter-State Water Disputes Act 1956.

The Tribunal has prepared its Further Report giving such explanation/guidance as it has deemed fit on the matters referred to it under these five References. In Chapters I to VIII of its Further Report, Volume I, Shri V. Ramaswami the Chairman of the Tribunal and Shri M.R.A. Ansari, Member, have expressed their opinion on all the important points arising in these References. Shri A.K. Sinha, another Member, has expressed on a few of these points a somewhat different opinion which is reproduced in Volume II of this Further Report. In accordance with the majority opinion, the Tribunal has given its modified Decision in Chapter IX, Volume I of the Further Report under Section 5(3) of the Inter-State Water Disputes Act 1956 read with Section 5(4) of the same Act.

The Tribunal herewith forwards its Further Report to the Government of India under Section 5(3) of the Inter-State Water Disputes Act 1956.

Yours faithfully,
(Sd.) V. RAMASWAMI
Chairman
(Sd.) A.K. SINHA
Member
(Sd.) M.R.A. ANSARI
Member

BEFORE THE NARMADA WATER DISPUTES TRIBUNAL

ASSESSORS

1. Dr. M. R. Chopra, Retired Chairman, Central Water & Power Commission and former Vice Chancellor of Roorkee University (Whole-time).
2. Shri C. S. Padmanabha Aiyar, Retired Chief Engineer, Government of Kerala (Part-time)
3. Shri B. S. Nag, Retired Adviser, Planning Commission, Government of India, New Delhi (Whole-time).
4. Dr. Ambika Singh, Assistant Director-General, Indian Council of Agricultural Research (Part-time).
5. Dr. H. B. Hukkeri, Senior Agronomist, Indian Institute of Agricultural Research (Part-time).

REPRESENTATIVES OF THE STATE GOVERNMENTS

FOR THE STATE OF GUJARAT

Advocates

1. Shri J. M. Thakore, Advocate General
2. Shri S. B. Vakil, Advocate, and
3. Shri M. G. Doshit, Advocate.

Other Representatives

1. Shri P. A. Raj, Secretary (Irrigation)
2. Shri N. Ramaswamy, Superintending Engineer
3. Shri M. K. Joshi, Executive Engineer.

FOR THE STATE OF MADHYA PRADESH

Advocates

1. Shri Y. S. Chitale, Senior Advocate
2. Shri M. S. Ganesh, Advocate, and
3. Shri Shekhar Bhargava, Advocate

Other Representatives

1. Shri K. L. Handa, Irrigation Adviser
2. Shri M. S. Billore, Superintending Engineer (Narmada)
3. Shri L. K. Wagh, Executive Engineer
4. Shri D. V. Sahasrabudhe, Executive Engineer

FOR THE STATE OF MAHARASHTRA

Advocates

1. Shri F. S. Nariman, Senior Advocate
2. Shri B. R. Zaiwalla, Advocate

Other Representatives

1. Shri K. K. Framji, Technical Consultant
2. Shri N. M. Jog, Deputy Secretary
3. Shri V. N. Chandratroya, Under Secretary.

FURTHER REPORT OF THE NARMADA WATER DISPUTE TRIBUNAL

Table of Contents

CHAPTERS		Page Nos.
I	Scope of the jurisdiction under Section 5(3) of the Inter-State Water Disputes Act (Act 33), 1956	1
II	Reference No. 1 of 1978 by Union of India	7
III	Reference No. 2 of 1978 by the State of Gujarat	21
IV	Reference No. 3 of 1978 by the State of Madhya Pradesh	45
V	Reference No. 4 of 1978 by the State of Maharashtra	81
VI	Reference No. 5 of 1978 by the State of Rajasthan	91
VII	Order as to costs and other incidental matters	95
VIII	Modification in the Report of the Tribunal (except in the Final Order)	97
IX	Final Order of the Tribunal modified as a result of the explanation/guidance given by the Tribunal under Section 5(3) of the Inter-State Water Disputes Act, 1956	105
STATEMENTS		
1.	Modified Statement 14-3 (Chapter III of the Further Report— Comparison of cost of power generation in Jalsindhi and Sardar Sarovar	36
2.	Statement 4-1—Power Generation at Sardar Sarovar with FRL+436	46
3.	Statement 4-2—Power Generation at Sardar Sarovar with FRL+453	48
4.	Statement 11-11—Explanatory Notes to Working Table of Sardar Sarovar (Chapter IV of the Further Report)	53
ANNEXURE		
1.	Modified Annexure XIV-8—Cost of Energy/Kwh at Sardar Sarovar Power Complex at different stages (Chapter III of the Further Report)	38

FOR THE STATE OF RAJASTHAN

Advocates

1. Shri K. K. Jain, Advocate
2. Shri B. D. Sharma, Advocate

Other Representatives

1. Shri Moti Ram, Hony. Adviser & Technical Consultant
2. Shri D. M. Singhvi, Superintending Engineer
3. Shri C. B. Mathur, Executive Engineer.

FOR THE UNION OF INDIA

Advocates

1. Smt. Shyamala Pappu, Senior Advocate
2. Shri V. P. Nanda, Advocate.

FURTHER REPORT OF THE NARMADA WATER DISPUTE TRIBUNAL

Table of Contents

CHAPTERS		Page Nos.
I	Scope of the jurisdiction under Section 5(3) of the Inter-State Water Disputes Act (Act 33), 1956	1
II	Reference No. 1 of 1978 by Union of India	7
III	Reference No. 2 of 1978 by the State of Gujarat	21
IV	Reference No. 3 of 1978 by the State of Madhya Pradesh	45
V	Reference No. 4 of 1978 by the State of Maharashtra	81
VI	Reference No. 5 of 1978 by the State of Rajasthan	91
VII	Order as to costs and other incidental matters	95
VIII	Modification in the Report of the Tribunal (except in the Final Order)	97
IX	Final Order of the Tribunal modified as a result of the explanation/guidance given by the Tribunal under Section 5(3) of the Inter-State Water Disputes Act, 1956	105

STATEMENTS

1.	Modified Statement 14.3 (Chapter III of the Further Report— Comparison of cost of power generation in Jalsindhi and Sardar Sarovar	36
2.	Statement 4.1—Power Generation at Sardar Sarovar with FRL+436	46
3.	Statement 4.2—Power Generation at Sardar Sarovar with FRL+453	48
4.	Statement 11.11—Explanatory Notes to Working Table of Sardar Sarovar (Chapter IV of the Further Report)	53

ANNEXURE

1.	Modified Annexure XIV-8—Cost of Energy/Kwh at Sardar Sarovar Power Complex at different stages (Chapter III of the Further Report)	38
----	--	----