

## **PROHIBITION OR CONTROL?**



**LONGMANS, GREEN AND CO.**

55 FIFTH AVENUE, NEW YORK  
221 EAST 20TH STREET, CHICAGO  
TREMONT TEMPLE, BOSTON  
210 VICTORIA STREET, TORONTO

**LONGMANS, GREEN AND CO., LTD.**

39 PATERNOSTER ROW, E C 4, LONDON  
53 NICOL ROAD, BOMBAY  
6 OLD COURT HOUSE STREET, CALCUTTA  
167 MOUNT ROAD, MADRAS

# PROHIBITION OR CONTROL?

CANADA'S EXPERIENCE  
WITH THE LIQUOR PROBLEM

1921-1927

BY

REGINALD E. HOSE, M.A.

*The possibility of promoting freedom or well-being by compulsion depends very greatly indeed on the unity of habit and experience which binds together a single Community.—Bosanquet, "The Philosophical Theory of the State."*

LONGMANS, GREEN AND CO.  
NEW YORK · LONDON · TORONTO

1928

**HOSE  
PROHIBITION OR CONTROL?**

**COPYRIGHT · 1928  
BY LONGMANS, GREEN AND CO.**

**FIRST EDITION . . .**

## PREFACE

**T**HE purpose of this book is to record concisely the method adopted in Canada for controlling the liquor traffic. The dearth of collective information on this subject, apart from the official reports issued by the various Commissions, is perhaps sufficient justification for an attempt to treat the subject academically.

Some historical importance is attached to the continuity of the movement, which, from an incipient protest, voiced provincially against prohibitory laws, has developed into a national expression favoring the sale of liquor for beverage purposes. If it should appear that the continent-significance of this experiment is unduly stressed, it is not from any desire to enlarge upon the merits of the system in contradistinction to other methods; rather is it an attempt to bring the subject into true perspective.

Government Control has already been swept into the vortex of international affairs, but its genesis has a separate history in each province. To elucidate this, statistics have been employed, and comment added where such seemed relevant to an impartial rehearsal of the difficulties encountered. Such comment however is purely empirical and not to be interpreted as the viewpoint of those concerned with the administration of the laws.

Any attempt to encompass even one phase of the liquor problem in so brief a manner must necessarily be deficient. The author hopes, however, that something may have been achieved by collating the facts and constructing the framework for a further analysis of the subject.

REGINALD E. HOSE.

*September 14th, 1927,  
Victoria, British Columbia*

## INFORMATION FOR READERS

THROUGHOUT the text the word "Commission" has been used to denote whatever administrative body (whether Board or Commission) the statutes create, with a collective meaning unless the context otherwise requires.

In a similar manner the words "Store Manager" denote any Vendor or Manager in charge of a government store.

Where the Annual Reports of the Commission are referred to, the abbreviations, "Alta.," etc., denote the province, the number following being that of the Report referred to.

## CONTENTS

CHAPTER	PAGE
INTRODUCTION . . . . .	I
I. THE COMMISSION: The Powers, Functions and Duties of the Commission . . . . .	6
II. LOCAL OPTION: Its Application and Development under the Control System . . . . .	12
III. THE RETAIL BUSINESS: Establishment and Management of the Government Stores . . . . .	22
IV. LICENCING: The Commission as a Licencing Board . . . . .	32
V. THE BREWERIES: Controlling the Breweries—the Beer Trade . . . . .	44
VI. LAW ENFORCEMENT: A Review of the Prohibitions and Penalties . . . . .	55
VII. LAW ENFORCEMENT ( <i>Continued</i> ): Supervision of the Licenced Premises . . . . .	66
VIII. TAXATION: Federal and Provincial Taxation . . . . .	74
IX. SURPLUS REVENUE: The Profits and Their Distribution . . . . .	85
X. NEWFOUNDLAND: Government Control in Newfoundland . . . . .	94
XI. CONCLUSION . . . . .	99
APPENDICES . . . . .	107
BIBLIOGRAPHY . . . . .	121
MAPS . . . . .	124
INDEX . . . . .	129

## TABLES

### PAGE

I. Hours of Sale at Government Stores . . . . .	27
II. Sale of Wine and Beer with Meals (Quebec) . . . . .	35
III. Sale of Beer in a Tavern (Quebec) . . . . .	36
IV. Sale of Beer in Hotels and Clubs (Alberta) . . . . .	40
V. Sale of Beer in Licenced Premises (British Columbia) . . . . .	42
VI. Sale of Beer in Licenced Premises (Yukon Territory) . . . . .	43
VII. Conditions of Sale, Licence Fee and Tax (Breweries) . . . . .	46
VIII. Penalties for Selling Liquor . . . . .	60
IX. Penalties for Drunkenness . . . . .	63
X. Revenue and Liquor Taxation . . . . .	75
XI. Comparison of Taxation with Profits . . . . .	80
XII. Trading Profits for Fiscal Year 1925-26 . . . . .	87
XIII. Distribution of Net Profits (British Columbia) . . . . .	91
XIV. Statistics for Years 1925 and 1926 (Newfoundland) . . . . .	97

## GRAPHS

### PAGE

(a) Illustrating Application of Canada Temperance Act (Quebec) . . . . .	15
(b) Illustrating Exportation and Importation of Liquor	78, 79