



# MARGARINE AS A BUTTER SUBSTITUTE

By **KATHARINE SNODGRASS**  
Research Associate, Food Research Institute

**A**N impartial survey of a controversial subject, this book describes the past and present status of the margarine and butter industries and of the competition between them. Emphasis falls not only upon the economic aspects, but also upon the technological, legal, and nutritional.

No. 4

December 1955

FATS AND OILS STUDIES OF THE FOOD RESEARCH INSTITUTE

**Dhananjayrao Gadgil Library**



**GIPE-PUNE-022656**

**MARGARINE AS A BUTTER  
SUBSTITUTE**

**FATS AND OILS STUDIES**  
**OF THE**  
**FOOD RESEARCH INSTITUTE**

- No. 1. *The Fats and Oils: A General View*  
[February 1928]
- No. 2. *Copra and Coconut Oil*  
[April 1928]
- No. 3. *Inedible Animal Fats in the United States: Considered with Special Reference to Sources of Animal Waste, the Rendering Industry, Municipal Reduction, and Some Effects of Meat Inspection*  
[December 1929]
- No. 4. *Margarine as a Butter Substitute*  
[December 1930]

**EUROPEAN SALES AGENTS**

**GREAT BRITAIN:** P. S. King & Son, Ltd., Orchard House, 14, Great Smith Street,  
Westminster, S.W. 1, London

**CONTINENTAL EUROPE:** Martinus Nijhoff, 9 Lange Voorhout, The Hague, Holland



**THE FOOD RESEARCH INSTITUTE**

was established at Stanford University, California, in 1921, jointly by the Carnegie Corporation of New York and the Trustees of the Leland Stanford Junior University, for research in the production, distribution, and consumption of food.

**DIRECTORS**

**CARL LUCAS ALSBERG                      JOSEPH STANCLIFFE DAVIS**  
**ALONZO ENGLEBERT TAYLOR**

X9(F943M). 73

GO

22656

Copyright, 1930, by the Board of Trustees  
of The Leland Stanford Junior University

PRINTED IN THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA  
By STANFORD UNIVERSITY PRESS

## AUTHOR'S ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Although the writer is responsible for the major portion of this work, certain sections have been prepared by Dr. Carl L. Alsberg and Dr. Alonzo E. Taylor, directors of the Food Research Institute, and by Mr. John B. Hurlbut and Mr. Robert F. Lundy, of the Institute staff. Dr. Alsberg prepared chapters xi, xii, and xiii on the technology of margarine manufacture; Dr. Taylor, chapter xiv on the nutritional aspects of the subject; Mr. Hurlbut analyzed the United States Supreme Court decisions applying to state and federal margarine laws in chapters iv, viii, and ix and the Wisconsin decision in chapter vii; while Mr. Lundy prepared the appendix material on state margarine legislation. In addition to their actual contributions, Dr. Alsberg, Dr. Taylor, and Mr. Hurlbut have been generous with suggestions and criticism at various stages of the investigation.

Aside from these who have made substantial contributions to the preparation of the work, a number of specialists in dairying, nutrition, and other phases of the subject have read portions of the manuscript and made helpful suggestions. These include Professor Edwin C. Voorhies and Professor George H. Hart, of the University of California; Mr. Roy C. Potts, of the United States Department of Agriculture; Captain R. M. Estes, of the Bureau of Internal Revenue; Dr. E. V. McCollum, of Johns Hopkins University; Dr. Lafayette B. Mendel, of Yale University; Dr. J. J. Frey, of the Golden State Milk Products Company; Mr. P. I. Aldrich, of the *National Provisioner*; and Mr. J. S. Abbott, of the Institute of Margarine Manufacturers. Dr. J. S. Davis, director of the Food Research Institute, also read the manuscript as a whole and made suggestions. To all of these the writer is indebted and wishes to express thanks for their kindly criticism.

K. S.

STANFORD UNIVERSITY, CALIFORNIA  
July 1930





# CONTENTS

CHAPTER	PAGE
I. INTRODUCTION . . . . .	1
Principal ingredients of margarine—Geographical sources of ingredients—Legal restrictions on the manufacture and sale of margarine—Basis for the special protection of dairying—The consumer's interest in cheap food—Scope of this study	
<b>PART I. HISTORY OF LEGISLATION TO CONTROL THE MANUFACTURE OF MARGARINE</b>	
II. HISTORICAL BACKGROUND . . . . .	12
The opening up of new land after the Civil War—Dairying from the Civil War to 1900—Price decline following the Civil War—Butter making a household industry until the 'nineties—Long-time trend of butter and margarine production—Trend of exports of agricultural products, particularly butter—Exports of oleo oil	
III. EARLY MARGARINE LEGISLATION . . . . .	28
The widespread adulteration of foods and drugs in the 1880's and 1890's—Early state legislation to control the sale of margarine—The federal act of 1886—Analysis of the vote	
IV. DEVELOPMENTS LEADING TO THE AMENDMENT OF THE FEDERAL ACT . . . . .	43
Difficulties of enforcement—The Supreme Court and state legislation— <i>Powell versus Pennsylvania</i> —"Anti-color" laws passed by the states— <i>Plumley versus Massachusetts</i> — <i>Schollenberger versus Pennsylvania</i> —Summary—The 1902 amendment—Adulteration of butter—Effect of legislation on production, 1886 to 1902	

CHAPTER	PAGE
V. ENFORCEMENT AND PROPOSALS FOR FEDERAL LEGISLATION SINCE 1902 . . . . .	60
Food and Drugs and Meat Inspection acts—Further amendment of the margarine law recommended by the Bureau of Internal Revenue—The palm oil cases—Use of cottonseed oil treated with sulphur—Further difficulties of enforcement—The Underwood amendment, 1917—Developments in the packing of margarine—Inclusion of coloring matter in original packages of margarine	
VI. RECENT DEVELOPMENTS IN FEDERAL LEGISLATION	77
Colored cooking compounds—The second Baltimore Butterine Company decision—The Harrow-Taylor Butter Company decision—Passage of the 1930 amendment	
VII. RÉSUMÉ OF STATE LEGISLATION . . . . .	89
State legislation in 1886—State legislation as of 1900—Present status (1929) of margarine legislation by states—Outcome of recent legislation in California, Oregon, Washington, Wisconsin, and Utah	
VIII. PREVENTION OF FRAUD . . . . .	99
Wherein is the fraud at present?—Character of advertising—The Supreme Court on fraud—Further guarantees against deception	
IX. THE TAX FEATURE OF THE LAW . . . . .	108
Advantage of the tax for regulatory purposes—Purpose of the tax—The position of the Supreme Court	
X. FOREIGN MARGARINE LEGISLATION . . . . .	117
PART II. TECHNOLOGICAL DEVELOPMENTS AND DIETARY CONSIDERATIONS	
XI. THE MÈGE-MOURIEZ PROCESS AND THE EARLY MANUFACTURE OF MARGARINE . . . . .	121
Invention of margarine a result of the deficiency of fats in Europe—Properties peculiar to butter—The Mège-Mouriez process	

CONTENTS

ix

CHAPTER	PAGE
XII. THE SHIFT IN RAW MATERIALS . . . . .	131
Early improvements—Introduction of vegetable oils—Hydrogenation of oils—Experimentation with new oils—Ingredients of American and European margarine	
XIII. MECHANICAL AND OTHER IMPROVEMENTS . . . . .	147
Chilling by spray and brine-cooled drum—Use of sour instead of sweet milk—Other adaptations from the butter industry—Use of egg yolk and lecithin—Emulsification a discontinuous process—Addition of vitamin A—Butter aroma—Summary description of manufacturing process—Likely future developments	
XIV. DIETARY CONSIDERATIONS . . . . .	162
The dietary components of milk and butter—Variations in the amount of fat in the diet—Dietary value of butter and margarine	

PART III. ECONOMIC ANALYSIS

XV. THE RATE OF CONSUMPTION OF MARGARINE IN EUROPE AND AMERICA . . . . .	176
Wide variation among countries in the consumption of butter and margarine—Denmark—Norway—Holland—Germany—United Kingdom—Sweden—Belgium—France and Italy—United States	
XVI. THE TREND OF PRODUCTION AND CONSUMPTION OF BUTTER AND MARGARINE IN THE UNITED STATES AND EUROPE . . . . .	198
Butter production, 1849–1928—Butter production by states—Seasonal aspect of butter production—Margarine production, 1887 to 1928—Seasonal variation in margarine production—United States foreign trade in margarine and butter—Foreign trade in oleo oil and neutral lard—Trend of consumption in the United States—Consumption of butter in California—The seasonal variation in the consumption of margarine and butter—Trend of European production of margarine—International trade in margarine	

x *MARGARINE AS A BUTTER SUBSTITUTE*

CHAPTER	PAGE
<b>XVII. ORGANIZATION AND LOCATION OF THE MARGARINE INDUSTRY . . . . .</b>	<b>222</b>
Concentration of production in a few places—Margarine production frequently a side line—Organization of the European industry—Significance of the method of organization and operation	
<b>XVIII. RECENT DEVELOPMENTS IN THE AMERICAN BUTTER INDUSTRY . . . . .</b>	<b>234</b>
The geographical factor—Tendency toward amalgamation—Similarities and differences between the margarine and butter industries	
<b>XIX. THE RELATION BETWEEN THE BUTTER AND MARGARINE MARKETS . . . . .</b>	<b>241</b>
Relative level of margarine and butter prices—Displacement of butter by margarine—Margarine cheap in price—Seasonal relation between the two markets	
<b>XX. FURTHER CONSIDERATION OF THE MARGARINE AND BUTTER MARKETS . . . . .</b>	<b>255</b>
Coconut oil a cheap ingredient of margarine—Increasing competition among margarine producers—Price relation of vegetable and animal-fat margarines	
<b>XXI. BUTTER IN COMPETITION WITH THE FATS AND OILS</b>	<b>261</b>
Menace to the dairy industry—The tariff and free Philippine imports	
<b>XXII. THE CONDITION OF THE DAIRY INDUSTRY . . . . .</b>	<b>270</b>
Examination of statistics—Accumulation of stocks of milk products	
<b>XXIII. CONCLUDING REMARKS . . . . .</b>	<b>277</b>

**APPENDIX**

**APPENDIX**

<b>I. FEDERAL LEGISLATION ON MARGARINE IN THE UNITED STATES . . . . .</b>	<b>281</b>
---	------------

**CONTENTS**

**xi**

<b>APPENDIX</b>	<b>PAGE</b>
<b>II. SUMMARY OF STATE LEGISLATION ON MARGARINE IN THE UNITED STATES . . . . .</b>	<b>294</b>
<b>III. TABLES . . . . .</b>	<b>309</b>
<b>INDEX</b>	
<b>INDEX . . . . .</b>	<b>319</b>

## MAP, CHARTS, AND TABLES

### MAP

	PAGE
LICENSES TO SELL MARGARINE COMPARED WITH THE POPULATION BY STATES OF THE UNITED STATES, 1928 . . .	194

### CHARTS

#### CHART

1. UNITED STATES PRODUCTION OF BUTTER, ANNUALLY, 1849-1929, AND OF MARGARINE, 1886-1929 . . .	23
2. SEASONAL VARIATION OF CREAMERY-BUTTER PRODUCTION IN THE UNITED STATES IN RELATION TO AVERAGE INTAKE AND OUTGO OF COLD-STORAGE BUTTER, 1917-29	204
3. INDEXES OF SEASONAL VARIATION OF CREAMERY-BUTTER PRODUCTION AND MARGARINE PRODUCTION IN THE UNITED STATES, 1922-29 . . . . .	209
4. PER CAPITA CONSUMPTION OF BUTTER AND MARGARINE TOGETHER AND OF MARGARINE ALONE IN THE UNITED STATES, 1849-1929 . . . . .	213
5. INDEX OF THE SEASONAL VARIATION OF CREAMERY-BUTTER CONSUMPTION IN THE UNITED STATES, 1917-29	216
6. WHOLESALE PRICES OF A HIGH-GRADE AND A LOW-GRADE BUTTER AND OF ANIMAL AND VEGETABLE MARGARINES IN THE UNITED STATES, MONTHLY, 1909-15 AND 1922-29 . . . . .	242
7. RATIO OF MARGARINE PRICES TO BUTTER PRICES AT WHOLESALE, 1901-29 . . . . .	249
8. RELATION OF MARGARINE PRODUCTION TO BUTTER PRICES IN THE UNITED STATES, 1909-15 AND 1922-29 . . .	250

TEXT TABLES

TABLE	PAGE
1. PER CAPITA CONSUMPTION OF MARGARINE IN EUROPE AND THE UNITED STATES, 1913 AND 1924-28 . . .	181
2. TOTAL SALES AND PER CAPITA CONSUMPTION OF MARGARINE IN CALIFORNIA, 1919-28 . . . . .	191
3. LICENSES TO SELL MARGARINE AT RETAIL, BY STATES AND INTERNAL REVENUE DISTRICTS, COMPARED WITH THE POPULATION, FISCAL YEAR ENDING JUNE 30, 1928 . . .	192
4. DAIRYING IN COMPARISON WITH CREAMERY-BUTTER PRODUCTION IN THE PRINCIPAL STATES, 1925 . . . . .	201
5. MARGARINE PRODUCTION IN EUROPE, BY COUNTRIES, 1913 AND 1921-28 . . . . .	219
6. RELATIVE IMPORTANCE OF CONSUMPTION OF MARGARINE PER CAPITA TO CONSUMPTION OF BUTTER, ANNUALLY, 1889-1929 . . . . .	245
7. RATIO OF WHOLESALE PRICES OF MARGARINE TO WHOLESALE PRICES OF BUTTER, 1901-29 . . . . .	248
8. ACTUAL AND RELATIVE PRICES OF COCONUT OIL, OLEO OIL, AND NEUTRAL LARD IN THE UNITED STATES, 1900-29 . . . . .	258

APPENDIX TABLES

I. PRODUCTION, FOREIGN TRADE, AND CONSUMPTION OF BUTTER IN THE UNITED STATES, 1849-1929 . . .	309
II. PRODUCTION, EXPORTS, AND CONSUMPTION OF MARGARINE IN THE UNITED STATES, FISCAL YEARS, 1884-1929 . . . . .	312
III. MILCH COWS IN THE UNITED STATES, BY STATES, JANUARY 1, 1900, 1910, 1920, AND 1929 . . .	313
IV. PRODUCTION OF ANIMAL AND VEGETABLE MARGARINE IN THE UNITED STATES, ANNUALLY, 1921-28 . . .	315

xiv *MARGARINE AS A BUTTER SUBSTITUTE*

<b>TABLE</b>	<b>PAGE</b>
<b>V A. MATERIALS USED IN THE MANUFACTURE OF MARGARINE IN THE UNITED STATES, FISCAL YEARS ENDING JUNE 30, 1916-29 (THOUSAND POUNDS) . . .</b>	<b>316</b>
<b>V B. MATERIALS USED IN THE MANUFACTURE OF MARGARINE IN THE UNITED STATES, FISCAL YEARS ENDING JUNE 30, 1916-29 (PERCENTAGES) . . .</b>	<b>317</b>
<b>VI. NET FOREIGN TRADE IN MARGARINE OF PRINCIPAL IMPORTING AND EXPORTING COUNTRIES, 1920-28 . .</b>	<b>318</b>



## INDEX

- Adulteration, of butter, 57-58; of cooking compounds, 85-86; of foods, 28-29; of margarine, subject to Food and Drugs Act, 61; see Legislation**
- Advertising, of butter, 340; of cooking compounds, 103-4; laws regarding, 93, 98; of margarine, 6, 8, 100-3, 175, 240; of margarine, costs of, 233; of milk, field for increased consumption of, 275**
- Allbright, W. D., 149**
- Allbright-Nell Corporation, 149**
- Animal fats, displaced by vegetable oils and fats, 144; economy of, 178; imports of, annual, in Europe, 122; inspection of, 7; in margarine, 1, 137, 223; vitamins in, 165; see Oleo oil**
- Annatto, vegetable coloring matter, 3, 79, 124, 148**
- Armour and Company, 225, 236**
- Armsby, H. P., 38**
- Australia, coloring matter in butter and margarine prohibited in, 3 n.; legislation affecting margarine in, 119**
- Austria, early manufacture of margarine in, 227; laws regarding margarine in, 118**
- Babassu oil, 142**
- Bachaus, R., 149**
- Baltimore Butterine Company, 80-81, 85-86**
- Bannard, Henry C., 36-37, 38-39, 41**
- Beard, C., and A. R., 12, 13**
- Beatrice Creamery Company, 236**
- Belgium:**
- consumption, per capita, margarine, 180; meat, 188
  - control of margarine industry, 230
  - ingredients used in margarine, 144-45
  - laws regarding margarine, 118
  - national economy, 188
  - production of margarine, 220
- Benford ———, 227**
- Best Foods, 223, 224, 225**
- Blue Valley Creamery Company, 236**
- Borah, Senator W. E., 268-69**
- Borden Company, 235**
- Boudet, Felix, 126, 127, 130**
- Bradley, H. W., 134**
- Branding, see Labeling**
- Brannt, W. T., 136**
- Bremen-Besigheimer Oelfabriken, 159**
- Bureau of Agricultural Economics, 24, 198-99, 271, 273**
- Bureau of Animal Industry, 7, 62, 109, 223**
- Bureau of the Census, 23, 198-99**
- Bureau of Internal Revenue, 6, 24, 40, 77-78, 81; amendment recommended for margarine law by, 62-66, 70-72; enforcement of Oleomargarine Act**

- Bureau of Internal Revenue  
(*Cont.*)—  
by, 43-45, 76, 109, 223; figures  
on per capita consumption of  
margarine by, 196
- Bureau of Markets, 23
- Burnham, O. G., 149
- Butter:  
adulteration, 57-58  
in butterine, 133  
caloric value, 261  
change from farm to cream-  
ery manufacture, 8, 18-22,  
199-201  
churning, 154-55  
coloring, 3, 124  
components, dietary, 163-67,  
169-75, 261  
consumption, ratio of mar-  
garine to butter, United  
States, annually, 1889-1929,  
244-46; seasonal variation,  
215-16, 251-52  
cost of butter fat, 263-64  
displacement by margarine,  
244-46, 264  
flavor, 150-51, 153, 155-56  
in margarine, 132-33, 144  
production, foreign trade, and  
consumption, United States,  
309-11  
properties peculiar to, 123-25  
ratio of wholesale prices to  
wholesale prices of mar-  
garine, United States, 248,  
249  
tariff rates, 276  
trend of production and con-  
sumption, United States,  
and Europe, 198-221  
yield per cow, 272-73  
*See* Butter industry, Dairy  
industry. Dairying. Prices
- Butter industry, in contrast to  
margarine, 239-40; develop-  
ments in American, 234-40;  
*see* Dairy industry
- Butter producers, given pre-  
cedence in legislation over  
consumers, 120; principal,  
235-37; protection afforded  
by federal legislation, 7; states  
leading in, 202; *see* Butter in-  
dustry, Dairy industry
- Butterine, 133
- California, butter consumption  
in, 214-15; dairy law of, 1925,  
95; margarine consumption  
in, 195; margarine production  
in, 224
- California Bureau of Dairy Con-  
trol, 214
- Canada, importation, manufac-  
ture, or sale of margarine pro-  
hibited by law in, 117, 118
- Canned milk, 173
- Capital City Products Company,  
82, 83, 225
- Casein, elimination of, in butter  
making, 151
- Chain stores, new development  
in production and distribu-  
tion of butter, 238
- Chandler, Charles F., 37-38,  
136
- Chevreur, Michel Eugène, 129
- Chicago, as center of butter in-  
dustry, 236; of margarine in-  
dustry, 132, 222, 224, 225
- Chierichetti, ———, 227
- Chilling, of margarine, 148-50
- China, source of peanut oil, 5
- Clayton, William, 226, 227
- Cochran, Samuel H., 134
- Coconut butter, 136-37

- Coconut oil:**  
 in cooking compounds, 82  
 imports, total United States, 262  
 in margarine, 1, 2-3, 136, 138, 144, 193, 247, 256-57, 259 261-62  
 prices, actual and relative, 258, 261  
 sources, 4-5  
 tariffs, 263; and free Philippine imports, 265-69  
 trade in, Pacific, 224  
 uses, in United States, 262-63
- Cold storage, of butter, 203-5, 215**
- Color:**  
 in butter, 124  
 coloring matter included in original packages of margarine, 75-76  
 in cooking compounds, 78, 88  
 distinction between butter and margarine, 3-4, 49  
 foreign legislation on, 117-20  
 in margarine, 4, 66, 70, 148; tax on, 7  
*See Legislation*
- Competition, between margarine producers, 257-59; of the cheaper fats and oils, with dairy industry, 276; of margarine and butter since 1917, 246; of nut margarine and fats industry, 6; of oleomargarine and butter, 4, 99**
- Consumers, factors determining preference of, for margarine, 176-77, 247, 249, 252, 253; problems of, 278-79; sentiment of, against taxation of food commodities, 10, 265**
- Consumption:**  
 butter, United States, 309-11; butter and margarine, variation of, in countries, 180-82; price consideration important to, 252; seasonal aspect of, 216  
 margarine, United States, 312-13; and butter, related to price of butter, 252; and milk, butter, cheese, in Europe and United States, rate of, 176-91; per capita, in Europe and United States, 181; per capita, United States, 244; ratio of, to butter, annually, 1889-1929, 245-46  
 milk, 275  
 seasonal variation of margarine and butter, 251-52  
 trend of butter and margarine, United States, and Europe, 198-221
- Cooking compounds, advertising of, 103-4; colored, 78, 88**
- Cooking fat, margarine used as, 177, 253**
- Copra, imports, European, 263, United States, 262; source of coconut oil, 5; trade in, 220**
- Corn oil, 141**
- Cosine, Garrett, 135**
- Cottonseed oil:**  
 in cooking compounds, 82  
 hydrogenation, 139-40  
 in lard, 134-35  
 in margarine, 2, 4, 135-36, 138, 143, 144-45, 223  
 in olive oil, as an adulterant, 136  
 treated with sulphur in margarine, 68-70

- Coumbe, Oscar H., 136
- Cows, milch, number of, on farms, 1925-29, 271-72; by states, 313-14; yield per cow, 272
- Creamery production, 198-99, 201-3, 235; seasonal aspect of, 203-5, 209
- Cudahy and Company, 222
- Dairy industry:
- amalgamation, 237-38
  - claims for special protection, 8-10, 98, 100, 109
  - condition of, 270-76
  - connection with the margarine industry, 226
  - efforts to amend Oleomargarine Act, 45
  - historical interest in legislation affecting farm interests, 14-15, 16
  - menaced by fats and oils products, 263-65, 267
  - opposition to margarine manufacture, 7-8, 14-15, 92, 171, 264, 265, 267, 279-80
  - primary and secondary products, 234-35
  - support of tariffs on oil-seeds, 264, 267
  - See* Butter, Butter industry, Butter producers, Legislation
- Dairying, in comparison with creamery butter production in principal states, 201-2
- Daturic acid, 129
- Day, Justice William R., 112, 113
- Deficiency diseases, 170-71, 182
- Definition of term, margarine, 1
- Denmark:
- consumption of margarine, 181-82; per capita, 180
  - industry decentralized, 229-30
  - ingredients in margarine, 144, 145
  - laws regarding margarine, 118
  - national economy, 178-79
  - production of margarine, 218-19
- Derx, H. G., 156, 161
- Diacetyl, substance giving butter its aroma, 155
- Diet, optimum American, 162-63; Danish, 184; German, 184, 185; *see* Nutrition
- Digestibility of margarine and butter, 169, 172
- Distribution, *see* Marketing
- District of Columbia act, on margarine, 30-32
- Division of Chemistry, 28, 29
- Dixie Margarine Company, 85
- Drew, E. F., and Company, 85
- Duties, *see* Tariff
- Dyes, oil-soluble, in butter, 3, 124
- Egg yolk, in margarine, 152-54
- Ellis, Carleton, 139
- Emulsification, of butter, 124; of margarine, in milk, 1, 2, 3, 129, 152-54, 161; of margarine with egg yolk, 152-54; process of, in margarine, 154-55
- Enforcement, of margarine legislation, 43-45; difficulties of, 62, 67, 70-72
- Europe:
- chilling of margarine, 148-50

**Europe (Cont.):**

consumption, of margarine, 176-90; per capita, 181  
 early attempts to produce a butter substitute, 121-22  
 fats, annual imports of animal, 122; deficiency of, 122-23; imports of, from United States, 132  
 imports of oils, 263  
 invention of margarine in, 122-23  
 margarine industry, 27; organization of, 226-33  
 oils, hydrogenation of, 140  
 trend of butter and margarine production and consumption, 198-221  
 use of margarine for economical reasons, 177  
*See* country headings

**Exports:**

butter, United States, 25-26, 210, 309-11; and margarine, 209-11  
 margarine, Germany, 221; Holland, 220-21; Irish Free State, 218; United States, 312-13; net, of principal countries, 318  
 neutral lard, 212  
 oleo oil, United States, 209, 211-12

***Extent and Character of Food and Drug Adulteration*, 28**

Fairbank, N. K., and Company, 149

Farmers, margarine consumption by, 178-79, 196-97; position of, on protection, 266-67; production of butter by, 199-200, 203, 212

**Fats:**

in butter, 164, 167  
 characteristics, two groups of, 261  
 in the diet, 167 f., 177, 197, 252  
 industry, competition of, with nut margarine industry, 6; connection with dairy industry, 226; devoted to separation of fats, 133  
 invention of margarine as result of deficiency, 122-23  
 menace to dairy industry, 263-65  
 in milk, 163-64  
 properties of, competing with butter, 123-24  
 substitutability, 261  
 synthetic, 159-60  
*See* Animal fats, Oils, Vegetable oils and fats  
 Field, Stephen J., 47  
 Fish and whale oils, hydrogenated, 140-41; in margarine, 144; vitamins in, 163  
 Flavor, of margarine, 150-51; possible improvement of, 155-56, 160-61  
 Food, Drug, and Insecticide Administration, 62, 109  
 Food and Drugs Act, 7, 28, 60 ff.  
*Foods and Food Adulterants*, 29  
 France:  
 consumption, of butter, cheese, and milk, 189; of margarine, 189-90; of meat and dairy fats, 189; per capita, of margarine, 180, 189  
 ingredients of margarine, 144  
 invention of margarine and sale approved, 125-30  
 laws regarding margarine, 117, 118, 189

- Franck, H. H., 159, 160  
 Franzen, Hans, 131  
 Fraudulent practices: in evading taxes, 71-72; in selling margarine as butter, 8, 26-27, 43, 55, 66-67; measures to combat, 56, 89, 93, 97, 98, 99-107; *see* Legislation  
 Fritsch, J., 144, 227
- Georgia Market Bulletin*, 85
- Germany:  
 consumption, of butter, 185; of margarine, 184-86; per capita, of margarine, 180  
 control of margarine industry, 263  
 exports of margarine, 221  
 imports of copra, 263; of margarine, 221  
 ingredients, in margarine, 142, 144, 145, 152  
 lard substitution, practice of, 33-34  
 laws regarding margarine, 118  
 national economy, 179, 184-85  
 production of margarine, 219  
*See* Patents
- Glidden Company, 225
- Glycol esters, possible use of, in margarine, 159-60
- Gold Dust Company, 223
- Great Britain:  
 companies controlling margarine industry, 228, 229  
 consumption, of butter, 187; of lard, 187; of margarine, 186-88, 218; of meat, 186-87; of milk, 187; per capita, of margarine, 180  
 imports, of margarine, 221  
 ingredients in margarine, pre- and post-war 137, 144, 145f.  
 laws regarding margarine, 117-18  
 production of margarine, 218  
 sugar, use of, to supplement fat, 188  
*See* Patents
- Harlan, Justice John M., 46, 47, 48, 50, 51
- Harrow-Taylor Company, 86-87
- Haugen, Gilbert N., 67
- Heissbauer, Joseph, 153
- Higgins Manufacturing Company, 78, 80
- Hofman, B., 135
- Holland, *see* Netherlands
- Holmes, Justice Oliver Wendell, 105, 116
- Hough, Justice C. M., 83-84
- Hydrogenation of oils, 138-41, 159-60
- Imperial Economic Committee, 137, 218
- Imports:  
 butter, United States, 26, 210-11, 309-11  
 coconut oil, 263  
 copra, United States, 262  
 margarine, Irish Free State, 218; Germany, 221; Great Britain, 221; Scandinavia, 221; net, of principal countries, 318  
 palm kernel oil, 263  
 palm oil, 263
- Ingredients of margarine:  
 American, 1-4, 132-33, 143-46, 151-54, 257; sources of, 1-4  
 British, 137

- Ingredients (Cont.):**  
 egg yolk and lecithin, 152-54, 156  
 European, 143-46  
 German, 142  
 Norwegian, 140-41  
 of nut margarine, 3  
 of oleomargarine, 2  
 use of sour instead of sweet milk, 150-51  
 water, 140-41  
*See* Raw materials
- Inspection, federal, of margarine, 109, 223**
- Introduction of margarine in United States, 6, 12**
- Invention of margarine, 123; see Mège-Mouriez**
- Irish Free State:**  
 control of industry, 229  
 duties on margarine, 218  
 exports and imports, margarine, 218  
 production of margarine, 218
- Italy:**  
 consumption of margarine, 189-90; per capita, 180, 189  
 early manufacture of margarine, 227
- Jelke, John F., Company, 75**
- Jeserick, P., 135**
- Jurgens, 227, 228-29**
- Kirkham, V. H., 137**
- Kluyver, A., 156, 161**
- Labeling, of cooking compounds, 85-86; of margarine, 6, 40, 90, 92, 93-95, 99; difficulties of enforcement of law regarding, 54; foreign regulations for, 117; subject to federal supervision, for oleomargarine, 61; see Packaging**
- Land o' Lakes Creamery, Inc., 236**
- Lard:**  
 adulteration, 134-35  
 in butterine, 133  
 German preference for, over margarine, 186  
 imitations, 133-34, 137  
 in margarine, 132  
 use of fish and whale oils, 141  
*See* Neutral lard, Patents
- Lard compound, 149**
- Lebbin, Georg, 150, 151**
- Lecithin, in margarine, 152-54**
- Legislation:**  
 adulteration laws, 34, 35  
 on advertising, 93  
 anti-color laws, 49, 90-91, 93-95, 99; decisions on, 66-70  
 Burleson bill, 67  
 on cooking compounds, 79-88  
 effect of declining exports of butter on margarine, 26  
 effect of, on margarine production, 1886-1902, 58-59; after 1902, 207  
 federal, on margarine, 6-8, 30, 46-49, 50-58, 61-62, 77-88, 99; Act of 1886, 33-42, 281-87; Act of 1902, 287-93  
 Fordney McCumber Act, 211, 266  
 foreign, on margarine, 117-20, 217  
 "Grout bill," 55  
 Harrow-Taylor Butter Company decision, 86-87  
 Hebe decision, 107  
 McCray case, 112, 115  
 Meat Inspection Act, 60-62, 223

- Legislation (*Cont.*):  
 as a national policy, 10  
 New York act, 32  
 Oregon law on butter substitutes, 95-96  
 palm oil cases, 66-67  
*Plumley v. Massachusetts*, 50-51, 59, 207  
*Powell v. Pennsylvania*, 46-49, 97, 104, 105, 106  
 to prevent fraud, 99-107  
 prohibitory, on margarine, 45, 51, 54, 55, 89-91, 99; legality of, 46-49  
 recommendations of Bureau of Internal Revenue for further, 62-66, 70-72  
 regulatory, 45, 49, 89-91  
*Schollenberger v. Pennsylvania*, 51-54, 97, 104, 106, 207  
 situation in the 'nineties, 54 f. state, on margarine, 7, 30-33, 49, 89-98, 99; summary of, 294-308  
 Tariff Act, 211  
 Underwood Tariff Act, 268  
 Utah, statute providing for tax on margarine, 98  
 Washington, law on butter substitute in, 95-96  
 Wilson Act, 48, 55  
 Wisconsin law on butter substitutes, 95-98  
*See* Enforcement, Food and Drugs Act, Labeling, Oleomargarine Act, Regulations of margarine industry, Taxes  
 Lever, Ashbury F., 67  
 Lever Brothers, 175, 229  
 Licenses, to sell colored and uncolored margarine, retail, United States, by states and internal revenue districts compared with population, 1928, 192-94  
 Licensing, of manufacturers and dealers, in margarine, 6, 43-44, 54; evasion of law regarding, 54-55  
 McAdoo, W. G., 73  
 McFall, R. J., 189  
 Manchuria, source of soy bean oil, 6  
 Manufacturers, margarine:  
 as butter manufacturers, 226  
 competition between, 257-59  
 location, 223-25  
 outside of packers, 222-23, 232-33  
 prohibited by law from coloring margarine, except on payment of 10-cent tax, 4  
 relationship to producers of raw materials, 240  
*See* Packers, Margarine industry  
 Margaric acid, 129  
 Margarine, use of term, 129; *see* Oleomargarine, Nut margarine, Vegetable margarine  
 Margarine industry:  
 capital necessary for production, 22  
 case for, 277  
 in contrast to butter industry, 239-40  
 evolution of, 131  
 integration of European, 220; of United States, 225  
 location and organization, American and European, 152, 222-33, 276  
 opposition of dairy industry, 8-10



- Margarine industry (Cont.):**  
*See* Processes; Manufacturers, margarine; Regulation of margarine industry
- Margarine-Unie, 229**
- Margarine Union, 229**
- Marine oils, use of, in margarine, 88, 144; see Fish and whale oils**
- Marketing, of butter, 240, 270; of margarine, 231-32, 240; of milk, 201-3, 234, 235, 238, 273; problems, consideration of, 255-60; relation between butter and margarine, 241-54; seasonal aspect of, 249-54**
- Marshall, George S., 134**
- Maypole Dairy Company, 228**
- Mège-Mouriez, Hippolyte, 125-30, 131, 227**
- Meinert, C. A., 135**
- Milk:**  
 in butter, 50-51  
 competitor of butter, 172  
 consumption in various countries, 187  
 in the diet, 29, 162, 163-67, 170, 234, 280  
 expense of distribution, 280  
 in margarine, 1, 103, 137, 144  
 marketing, United States, 201-3, 234, 235, 238, 273  
 sale from farms, 178-79  
 skim milk, 150  
 use of sour instead of sweet, in margarine, 150-51, 157-58  
*See* Canned milk, Emulsification
- Morton, Professor Henry, 37, 38, 136**
- Mott, H. A., Jr., 131, 132, 147-48, 150**
- N. V. Margarine Unie, 229**
- N. V. Unilever, 229**
- Napoleon III, offers prize for butter substitute, 123, 125**
- National Dairy Union, 55**
- National Foods, Inc., 85**
- Nestlé Company, 235**
- Netherlands:**  
 consumption, butter, 187; margarine, 183-84; per capita, margarine, 180  
 exportation of margarine, 183-84, 220-21  
 importation of oil seeds, 188  
 laws regarding margarine, 117-18  
 manufacture of margarine, 27, 144  
 national economy, 183-84  
 production, margarine, 218-19; European, practically controlled by Dutch companies, 227-28
- Neutral lard, in oleomargarine, 2, 143, 260; actual and relative prices, United States, 1900-29, 258; sources of, 4; trade in, 212**
- New Jersey, as important center of margarine industry, 224, 225**
- New Zealand, laws regarding margarine in, 118-19**
- Niel, C. B. van, 156, 161**
- Normann, W., 138**
- Norway:**  
 consumption, of margarine, 182-83; per capita, 180  
 control of margarine industry, 230  
 production of margarine, 220  
 use of whale oil in margarine, 140, 146

- Nut Grove Butter Company, 78
- Nut margarine, 1; a post-war product, 2-3, 223, 224; source of ingredients of, 4-6; superiority of, to oleomargarine, 247; *see* Oleomargarine, Vegetable margarine
- Nutrition: value of margarine, 155, 165; legal recognition of nutritive value of margarine, 52, 97; value of margarine in comparison to butter, 8, 169-75; value of milk and butter, 172-74; *see* Advertising
- "Nut-Z-All," 78, 80, 87
- Oils:
- characteristics, two groups of, 261
  - duty-free, 266, 267
  - experiments with new, in margarine, 141-43
  - hydrogenation, 138-41
  - in margarine, equivalent to fat in butter, 169
  - menace to dairy industry, 263-65
  - protection, claims for, 266-67
  - substitutability, 261
  - synthetic, 159-60
  - tariffs, United States, 5-6
  - trade, international, 262-63
  - See* oil headings, Fats, Patents
- Oleo oil, actual and relative prices of, United States, 1900-29, 258; exports of, 27; in margarine, 1, 2, 143, 144, 260; sources of, 4; trade, international, in, 132, 211-12
- Oleo stearin, 2, 133
- Oleo stock, 1-2, 133
- Oleomargarine:
- common name in United States for margarine, 1; in Europe, 2 n., 129
  - ingredients, 21, 143; origin of, 4
  - a packing-house product, 18
  - production, United States, 315
  - re-definition of term to include cooking compounds, 81
  - Oleomargarine Act, 1 n., 7, 24, 35-36, 61, 62, 79, 82, 84; analysis of vote on, 36-42; the 1902 Amendment, 55-58; the Underwood Amendment to, 1917, 72-73, 75; the 1930 Amendment to, 88; taxation, exemptions from, final form in, 88; *see* Enforcement
  - "*Oleo-margarine butyreuse*," 126
  - Olive oil, in margarine, 136; use of, in southern Europe, 122, 124
  - Packaging, of margarine, 6; bills on, 56, 73-76; internal revenue stamp on, 75, 107; original-package doctrine, 50, 67, 106; recommendations for, 107; *see* Labeling
  - Packers, location of, 223-25; as margarine manufacturers, 132-33, 222-26, 232; oleomargarine a by-product of, 18, 225, 232, 239; *see* Manufacturers
  - Palm kernel oil, 3, 136, 138, 263, 266; importations of, 263; sources of, 5-6; tariffs on, 267
  - Palm kernels, trade in, 220

- Palm oil**, 3, 266; importations of, 263; legislation on use of, as coloring matter, 66-67, 136; sources of, 5-6; see Legislation
- Patents:**  
 on chilling of margarine, English, 149; German, 149; United States, 149  
 on hardening of oils, British, 138; German, 138  
 on lard, United States, 134  
 on margarine, British, 125, 127, 131, 135, 137, 175; German, 135, 175; Norwegian, 175; United States, 131-32, 135, 136  
 on shortening, United States, 134-35  
 on use of egg yolk for emulsification of margarine, German, 153
- Peanut oil**, imports of, 263; in margarine, 2-3, 66, 136, 138, 140, 143, 144, 223, 256; sources of, 5
- Pellerin, A.**, 227  
**Pellerin, E.**, 226-27  
 "Pflanzenbutter," 136
- Philippines**, opposition of dairy industry to free importations from, 264, 265-69; source of copra and coconut oil, 4-5, 262, 263
- Planters Foods, Ltd.**, 175
- Population**, licenses, retail United States, for sale of colored and uncolored margarine, compared to, 192-94; pressure of, factor for increasing use of food substitutes, 121
- Premier jus**, 2 n.
- Prices:**  
 actual and relative, of coconut oil, oleo oil, and neutral lard, United States, 1900-29, 258  
 butter, following Civil War, 17-18; trend of margarine production related to, 206, 207-8, 250  
 butter fat, established central market determining, 240  
 coconut oil, 262  
 level of margarine and butter, relative, 241-44, 254  
 margarine, cheapness of coconut oil responsible for, 256-57; compared to butter, 176; means to put margarine on parity with butter, 56; related to position of margarine as by-product, 231; responsible for displacement of butter, 241, 247-49, 250-51, 254  
 relationship between butter and uncolored margarine, 243  
 seasonal variation of butter and margarine, 243-44, 259  
 vegetable and animal-fat margarines, 260  
 wholesale, of whole milk, 274; of high-grade and low-grade butter and of margarines, United States, 242; ratio of margarine to butter, 1901-29, 248, 249
- Processes of manufacturing margarine:**  
 American, 132  
 hydrogenation, 138-41  
 improvements in European, early, 131-33

- Processes of manufacturing  
(*Cont.*):  
 mechanical and other, 147-61  
 Mège-Mouriez, 125-30  
 use of vegetable oils, 133-38  
*See* Patents
- Production:  
 animal and vegetable margarines, United States, 1921-28, 315  
 butter, declining importance of 235-36, 274; shift from home to production for sale, 178; United States, annually, 1849-1929, 23 f., 309 ff.  
 cheese, 274  
 concentration of margarine, 223-25  
 costs of margarine, not seasonal, 259  
 effect of legislation on margarine, 58-59  
 evaporated and condensed milk, 274  
 margarine, 1886-1929, 23; in 1884-1929, 312-13; in 1920, 24; trend of, 24; trend of butter and margarine, United States and Europe, 198-221; in the United States, 1888-1903, 59  
 milk, 274-75; per year, United States, 272-73  
 relation of margarine, to price of butter, 206, 250  
 side line in packing house companies, 225
- Prohibition of sale of margarine, effect of, on butter, 255-56; *see* Legislation
- Protection, *see* Legislation, Tariffs
- Proteins, in milk, 163
- Quality of margarine, in recent years, 247, 253-54
- Raw materials, relationship to margarine manufacturers, 240; shift in, 131-46, 156; in 1916-29, 316-17; used in margarine, 1-3, 263; *see* Animal fats, Fish and whale oils, Oils, Vegetable oils
- Reeves, Judge Albert L., 87
- Regondi, ———, 227
- Regulations of margarine industry, foreign, 117-20; sectional interests for, 56-57; in United States, 6-8, 45, 49, 74, 76, 89-91; *see* Legislation
- "Rich Nut Shortening," 86
- Roberts, Robert R., 136
- Rubner, M., 179
- Ruffin, A., 137
- Russell, Edward, 137
- Sabatier, P., 138
- Salad oil, 136
- Sale of margarine, in United States, 191; *see* Legislation, Fraudulent practices, Regulations
- Sanitary processes of oleomargarine subject to federal inspection, 61
- Sarg, ———, 227
- Sargs, F. A., Sohn und Cie, 148
- Sauerbeek, Augustus, 17
- Scandinavia, exports and imports of margarine in, 221; ingredients of margarine in, 144
- Schicht, ———, 229
- Schou, E. V., 149
- Schweinitz, E. A. de, 25

- Seasonal variation:  
 in butter and margarine consumption, United States, 215-16  
 in prices of butter and uncolored margarine, 243  
 in production of butter, 203-5; of margarine, 208-9
- Senderens, J. B., 138
- Sesame oil, compulsory use of, in margarine, in Germany, Austria, and Belgium, 138; in United States, 136; tariff, 267
- Shea butter, 141-42
- Sheppard, Senator Morris, 268
- Shipping, *see* Trade
- Shortening, exemption provisions for taxation of, 88; patents on, 134-35; taxable as a butter substitute, 87
- Skim milk powder, 152
- Société Anonyme d'Alimentation, 272
- Soy bean oil, 3, 66; imports of, 263; lecithin from, 154; sources of, 6
- Stamps, internal revenue, on margarine packages, 75
- Standard Nut Margarine Company, 85
- Standardization of margarine products, 143, 233
- Stearin, 133, 134
- Stocks, butter, United States, 205, 274; of evaporated and condensed milk, 274; of milk products, 274-76
- Storch, V., 150
- Sudan III, coloring dye in butter, 3
- Sulphur, use of, in cottonseed oil for coloring margarine, 68-70
- Sumatra, source of palm and palm kernel oil, 5
- Sweden:  
 consumption of butter, 188; of margarine, 188; per capita consumption of margarine, 180  
 control of margarine industry, 230  
 early manufacture of margarine, 227  
 production of margarine, 220
- Swift and Company, 222, 224, 225, 236
- Switzerland, milk consumption in, 187
- Synthetic fats and oils, 159-60
- Taft, Chief Justice William Howard, 114
- Tallow, used in lard adulteration, 133-35
- Talmadge, Eugene, 85
- Tariff on Animal and Vegetable Oils, The*, 279
- Tariffs:  
 on butter, 211, 276  
 on coconut oil, 263  
 and free Philippine imports, 265-69  
 Irish Free State, on margarine, 218  
 on margarine, 6 n., 220  
 on oils, 5-6  
 on peanuts, 264  
 position of American agriculture on, 266-67, 278-79  
 of Seventy-first Congress, 267-68  
 on soy beans, 264
- Taxes:  
 advantages, 108-9  
 in California, 95

**Taxes (Cont.):**

- controversial features of law, 89
- on cooking compounds, 80, 87
- effect of, on margarine manufacture, 207
- manufacturing, on margarine, 6, 7, 35, 43, 55, 56, 66, 71-73, 92, 93, 99
- position of Supreme Court on, 111-17
- purpose of, 110-11
- in Utah, 98
- See* Legislation, Licensing
- Technology of margarine manufacture, improvements in, 147-61
- Texture of margarine, improvements made in, 147-48, 156, 161
- Trade:
  - butter, trend of foreign, 25-27, 309-11
  - in copra and palm kernels, 220
  - in margarine, international, 220-21; interstate and foreign, 211-12; of principal importing and exporting countries, 318
  - in oleo oil, 132
  - regulations regarding margarine, 7
- Troco Company, 225
- Troost, ———, 127
- Types of margarine, 1, 2-3, 137-38, 143
- Uhlenbroek, J. C., 149
- Underwood, Senator Oscar W., 72-73
- Unilever, 229, 230

**United States:**

- chilling of margarine, 150
- consumption, of butter, 187, 212-14; of fats, 197; of margarine, per capita, 180, 181, 190-91, 196-97, 212-14; of milk, 187; ratio of margarine to butter, 244-46
- cottonseed oil, use of hydrogenated, 139-40
- imports, butter, 210-11; of oils, 203
- ingredients of margarine, 144-46
- lard adulteration, 134-35
- licenses to sell margarine, by states and internal revenue districts, compared with population, 192-94
- national economy, 197
- neutral lard, 212
- organization and location of margarine industry, 222-23
- production, exports, and consumption of margarine, 1884-1929, 312-13; production, foreign trade, and consumption of butter, 1849-1929, 209-11; production of margarine indication of business enterprise, 122
- sales of margarine, 191
- trade, foreign, in margarine and butter, 209-11; in oleo oil, 209, 211
- trend of butter and margarine production and consumption, 198-221
- See* Legislation, Patents, Prices
- United States Dairy Company, 131, 147

- United States Department of Agriculture, 144, 146; figures on margarine consumption by, 196, 197
- United States Department of Commerce, 218
- Vail, Ed. S., Butterine Company, 85
- Van den Bergh, 227, 228-29
- Van den Bergh, Ltd., 228
- Vegetable margarine, 223, 258; preference for, 247, 249; production of, United States, 315
- Vegetable oils and fats:
- claims for protection against foreign, 266
  - crushing by companies in United States for use in margarine, 225-26
  - economy of, 177-78
  - in Europe, 27, 137, 144-46, 189; deficiency in, 122-23
  - in imitation of lard, 133-34
  - in margarine, 1, 79, 144, 223, 225
  - in shortening, 134
  - in soap, 226
  - vitamins in, 165
- See Oils, Patents
- Vitamins:
- addition of A, in margarine, 155
  - claims for, in margarine, 103, 165, 171, 174-75; validity of, 107
  - in the diet, 163-67, 169-72
  - in fish oils, 163
  - in milk, 163-65
- Wahl, W. H., 136
- Warr, G. C., 137
- Warren, Charles, 60
- Water, in margarine, 140-41
- Watson, Sir William George, 137, 228
- Wedderburn, A. J., 28-29
- Weigmann, H., 150
- Weist, E., 55
- Wesson, David, 135
- West Africa, source of palm and palm kernel oil, 5
- Whale oil, *see* Fish and whale oil
- "Wiener Sparbutter," 227
- Wilson and Company, 222
- Wright, Henry R., 136
- Wright, P. G., 279
- Wright, W. T., 137

**CHECKED**  
**2003-04**



**THE FOOD RESEARCH INSTITUTE**  
Stanford University  
California

Established in 1921 jointly by the Carnegie Corporation of New York and the Trustees of Leland Stanford Junior University, for research in the production, distribution, and consumption of food.

**DIRECTORS**

Carl Lucas Alsberg  
Joseph Stancliffe Davis  
Alonzo Englebert Taylor

# **PUBLICATIONS**

## **OF THE**

### **FOOD RESEARCH INSTITUTE**

#### **WHEAT STUDIES—**

Issued monthly, except in April and October. A series designed to give a sound, impartial view of the world wheat situation. Annual volumes contain a review of the world wheat situation for the preceding crop year, three surveys of current developments, and six special studies.

#### **FATS AND OILS STUDIES—**

Issued irregularly. A series of research studies in fats and oils of vegetable and animal origin, dealing primarily with economic aspects, but with due reference to technical knowledge.

#### **MISCELLANEOUS PUBLICATIONS—**

Three published studies deal with several aspects of the American baking industry; a fourth is on farm costs of production in the United States; and a fifth, in this series, is on the export debenture plan.

#### **REPRINTS—**

Contributions to periodicals on various subjects by members of the Food Research Institute.

For detailed lists of publications,  
with prices, address

**FOOD RESEARCH INSTITUTE**  
**STANFORD UNIVERSITY, CALIFORNIA**