CONTENTS


THE ILLUSION OF THE CHARKA
THE ILLUSION OF THE CHARAKA

"The programme of the Charak is so utterly childish that it makes one despair to see the whole country deluded by it."

Rabindranath Tagore

ANILBARAN RAY

CALCUTTA
ARYĀ SAHITYA BHAWAN
1929
PUBLISHED BY
BARIDKANTI BOSE

X91(M71).2.N3

Printed by N. Mukherjee, B.A., at the Art Press,
31, CENTRAL AVENUE, CALCUTTA.
## CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I</td>
<td>A Few Plain Facts About Khadi</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II</td>
<td>Rejoinder by a Khaddarite</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III</td>
<td>Rejoinder by Babu Rajendra Prasad</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV</td>
<td>Reply to a Khaddarite</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V</td>
<td>Reply to Babu Rajendra Prasad</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI</td>
<td>The Beginning of the End</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VII</td>
<td>More Plain Facts About Khaddar</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VIII</td>
<td>The Problem of Poverty</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IX</td>
<td>Moral Value of the Charka</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
THE ILLUSION OF THE CHARKA

I

A FEW PLAIN FACTS ABOUT KHADI

It is being persistently claimed on behalf of the Charka that wherever it has been introduced it has materially improved the condition of the poor people. But a perusal of the reports of the various Khaddar organisations in the country shows that the average income from spinning (including carding) is less than eight annas a month.

At the famous Gandhi Ashram at Puduppalayam in South India 2,402 spinners were
paid Rs. 69,681 only in the course of three years and three months. This amounts to less than twelve annas per head per month. The well-known Abhoya Ashram in Bengal paid Rs. 25,000 only as wages to 9,000 spinners in 1927. The average comes to less than four annas a month. Only persons who are under a hypnotic spell can say that the addition of four annas or even twelve annas to the monthly income of a person materially improves his economic condition.

Even this most insignificant income from spinning is possible only because Khaddar is being made to sell at a price exorbitantly higher than mill-cloth. Mahatma Gandhi has gone so far as to say that “Khaddar is cheap at any price”! An artificial market is being kept up for Khaddar at a tremendous cost of public energy and money.

By a persistent vigorous propaganda the patriotic and charitable feelings of the people are being exploited in favour of Khadi. The Congress is spending the best part of its constructive energy on Khaddar work. Municipalities, Corporations and other local bodies
under the control of the Congress are making compulsory purchase of Khaddar for their servants. All Congressmen are bound to wear Khadi and persons not doing so, have every chance of being hooted out of all political meetings and conferences. No one dares say anything publicly against Khadi. Mahatma Gandhi himself has declared: "To me it appears to be monstrous to see the slightest opposition to such an incredibly simple thing as the Khadi."

In spite of all this attempt for about eight years Khaddar has not come to stay. The Charka is practically nowhere plying on the independent cottage industry basis, people supplying their own need of cloth, which was the original ideal. The spinners depend on the various Khadi centres for the supply of their cotton as well as for the disposal of their products. These centres have to be run at a considerable cost depending on recurring public subscriptions for their very existence.

The present output of Khaddar is being maintained at a great expense. The public pay subscriptions for the speedy attainment of Swaraj and the real amelioration of the condi-
tion of the poor. This money is being diverted to Khaddar work. The All-India Spinners' Association had invested by the 30th September, 1927, Rs. 19,54,377 in spinning wheels. It has produced during the last year cloth of the value of Rs. 24 lakhs. At a rough estimate 84 lakhs of square yards of Khadi were sold during the year. This is a poor figure for an investment of 20 lakhs of rupees!

While the total of other sources is 50,860 lacs of yards the hand-spun Khaddar amounts to only 84 lacs of yards. This is the progress achieved in eight years in spite of the utmost efforts of a man like Mahatma Gandhi and of organisations like the Indian National Congress. Instead of throwing all the blame on the worthless shoulders of the Indian people, is it not high time now to consider whether the programme itself is at all worth the trouble that is being taken for it?

The Khaddar centres are working at a loss. The All-India Spinners' Association lost over a lakh of rupees last year. Thus to maintain even the present insignificant output of Khadi the generous public must regularly
replenish the vanishing funds of the Association. It is not surprising that the General Council of the Association has recently decided to make again an All-India tour to collect subscriptions for Khaddar work.

The simple reason why the Charka cannot establish itself is that it has absolutely no chance of ever standing in competition with the Mill. The mill-owners possessing a bigger purse buy cotton at a rate much cheaper than the home spinner can ever expect to get. Then the cost of production is beyond any comparison. The result is that the money that is required to buy cotton and pay the cost of weaving for a piece of Khadi is more than sufficient to buy a much better finished mill-cloth, thus leaving absolutely no margin for the spinner and the carder; and the argument that whatever is earned in leisure hours is a gain does not apply as there is no chance of earning anything at all.

It is for this quite obvious reason that the Charka has been given up everywhere. A charge is very commonly brought in our country against the British that they destroyed our Charka industry. But the Charka dis-
appeared from India almost at the same time as it disappeared from Great Britain itself and other parts of the world. The true charge that we can bring against British rule in this respect is that our cotton mills could not flourish on account of the unfair competition with Manchester.

The old ideal that the agriculturist should grow his own cotton and spin his cloth as he cooks his food, is not applicable to modern conditions. Apart from the fact that cotton cannot be grown everywhere and by everybody, cotton has now a world market and the cultivator comfortably makes more profit by selling his cotton and buying mill-cloth than by carding and spinning it at his leisure hour and paying wages to the weaver.

Actual facts show that people now do not spin for home consumption but to make some earning through the Khaddar centres. What they earn by spinning they spend in buying mill-cloth, mostly foreign cloth.

The fact that people are not wanting who are ready to spin even for the most insignificant earning shows only the deep
poverty of the masses but not the capacity of the Charka to remedy it.

The poverty of the Indian people can be cured only by removing foreign rule and foreign competition, placing the primitive agriculture of the country on a scientific basis, introducing big machinery and large-scale production, supplemented by suitable cottage industries with modern devices and methods, together with necessary improvements in banking, co-operation, tariff, facilities of transport and so forth. The economic depression in our country is too deep and complex a matter to be dealt with by “such an incredibly simple thing as the Khadi.”

The proposal that our poor cultivators should work in their leisure hours on the Charka to add a few annas to their monthly income is inhuman. While all over the world attempts are being made to reduce the hours of work and the cost of production so that all people may get plenty of leisure and sufficient opportunity to fully develop their body, mind and spirit, our Khaddarites are trying to lead India in just the opposite direction!
One argument very commonly advanced in favour of the Charka as against the mill is that it avoids all the evils of industrialism. This argument, however, is useless as industrialism is already upon us and no one can prevent the introduction of big machinery. Even the Charka work that has been possible under modern conditions is being carried on more or less on the factory system. Then the Khaddarites only object to the cotton mills, while Mahatma Gandhi would go so far as to allow even cotton mills side by side with the Charka though we fail to see how the two can go together.

Big machinery is inevitable and the poverty of our people can be removed only by large-scale production. Big machinery does not necessarily imply all the evils of industrialism. The evils are bound to disappear. The different ideas and schemes that have been suggested in Europe show that people are trying to correct the defects. Unless one enters into it how can the evils be overcome? It is the tendency of the Indians towards poverty which is really responsible for the cry against machinery.
The Charka stands in the way of true constructive village work. Money raised for village reconstruction is being used for the organisation of Khaddar production. But the Charka has no power of creating life in the villages. To infuse life into the villagers means to stimulate them to change and improve their present wretched condition in all possible ways and to combine with one another for that purpose. The Charka gives no such incentive to them but tries to make their present miserable condition a little more tolerable; thus it serves rather as an opiate! Then there is no element of combination or co-operation in Charka. The spinners are merely wage-earners who work individually at home in their leisure hours and for their earning depend absolutely on the Khaddar centres.

Again Khaddar work has become synonymous with village construction and our patriotic young men feeling no enthusiasm at all for this barren lifeless programme of the Charka, turn away altogether from the prospect of village work. Khaddar production is being organised almost everywhere by paid
workers who earn their livelihood by this work. One Khadi Pratisthan alone in Bengal has employed seventy-seven paid workers.

Local bodies are wasting on Khadi much money which could have been used for real constructive work. Srijut Jamshed Mehta, who is the President of the Karachi Municipality, recently moved a resolution there to stop the compulsory purchase of Khadi for the menial staff. In moving that resolution he remarked that during the last three years the Corporation had spent no less than one lakh of rupees for encouraging this cottage industry. . . . The councillors were doing great injustice to themselves and to the rate-payers by spending such an enormous amount on Khadi. It was really a cruelty to ask the sweepers to wear the heavy cloth and go in the streets. Moreover, white Khadi become dirty soon and the poor peons had to spend lot of money for washing. The colour was tried but found useless. The President emphatically declared: "I tell you it is a real cruelty. We have spent nearly a lakh of rupees but Rs. 85,000 is really wasted. Our purpose has not been served."
Khaddar has absolutely no political significance beyond the fact that it has been adopted as the uniform dress by the Congress. On the other hand the compulsory provision that 'every Congressman must habitually wear Khaddar' stands in the way of many sincere and honest patriots joining the Congress.
"The Poverty of the Indian People" writes Mr. Anilbaran Ray in his article entitled "A few plain facts about Khadi", "can be cured only by removing foreign rule and foreign competition, placing the primitive agriculture of the country on a scientific basis, introducing big machinery and large-scale production, supplemented by suitable cottage industries with modern devices and methods, together with necessary improvements in banking, co-operation, tariff, facilities of transport and so forth." No doubt, this is the dream of all patriotic Indians. But this dream cannot be materialised for a long time to come. It requires a very bulky capital to put the "primitive agriculture of the country on a scientific basis," and also to introduce "big machinery for large-scale production,"
and too poor as we are, and as our steel industry is in its infancy, we will have to rely upon foreign capital, if this will be available at all, and we will have to import the whole machinery from foreign people, which will be indeed a colossal drain of India’s wealth. Perhaps these novel suggestions may be relished by imbecile theorists, but a man with a little bit of practical sense does not get enamoured of such noble dreams! Whether these things will benefit the masses at large in the long run, or they will only swell the purses of our capitalists need not be enquired into here. For the present purpose it suffices to recognise the above dreams, as “dreams,” inasmuch as the hunger of our agricultural population will not wait in patience and contentment till the dawning of such “golden” days. What is required is something useful to the “Now.” And, we Khaddarites are firmly convinced of the efficacy of Khaddar in ameliorating, in however small a manner, the present “body-killing and soul-killing” condition of our agriculturists. The bulk of India’s people is agricultural, and since they have work in the field only for about six
months, they can profitably harness the other six months for Charka-work, and as something is better than nothing, they will be only thankful for what little they can make out of Charka. When a patriotic demand for Khadi is created, they will have enough and more work to do, and consequently enough food to satisfy their hunger and also enough clothing for themselves. As in every other commodity, in Khaddar also, the commercial law of "supply and demand" has its sway. Of course, the Khaddar is a bit costly. It is coarse. It gets soiled soon. We do not deny these facts. But it should be borne in mind that with us Khaddar has not yet become a "profit-loss business". It is yet in its infancy. It has got to compete with the Indian mills, Japan, and last but not the least Lancashire. Under the circumstances, we cannot but call upon the patriotism of the people, when they murmur about the coarseness and the high cost of Khadi. With all these handicaps, it has made vast progress, of which every Khaddarite is only too proud.

I have no wish or patience to analyse the idle arguments of Mr. Ray advanced against
Khaddar, because they are the stock arguments of anti-Khaddarites; and I will only invite him and them to peruse the recently-published work on Khadi, "Economics of Khaddar," by Richard B. Gregg. This gentleman, born and bred up in Henry Ford’s country, came to India and studied this subject from all stand­points, and he has given the result of his researches in the above work in a very simple, but forcible and convincing manner.

Let me close this letter by quoting Mr. Edye, Census Officer for the United Provinces. (I have taken this quotation from Mr. Gregg’s work referred to above). Speaking of cottage industry as ancillary to agriculture, Mr. Edye writes:

"The bulk of the population is agricultural, and agriculture here means ordinarily the growing, harvesting and disposal of two crops in the year, and not the mixed farming familiar in England. Agriculture of this kind involves very hard work for certain short periods—generally two sowings, two harvests, and occasional weeding in the rains, and three waterings in the cold weather—and almost complete inactivity for the rest of the year. In precarious tracts inactivity may be unavoidable for a whole season, or even for a whole year. These periods of inactivity are, in the great majority of cases, spent in idleness. Where the cultivator pursues some craft
which will employ him and his family at times when they are not required in the fields—a craft in which continuity of employment is not essential—the proceeds of that craft are a saving from waste, and therefore a clear gain. The most typical of such crafts, . . . . and the one which is most widely pursued, is the production of home-spun* cloth.”

Now that the sceptics and scoffers have got the testimony of a Government official, they may perhaps begin to think independently. Some people take lightly the words of our simple Mahatma Gandhi. While certain others even consider him eccentric. But, generally all unsophisticated persons have understood the import of his teachings.

---

*I think, here by home-spun cloth Mr. Edye refers to home-woven cloth and not to Khaddar. Handloom weaving is widely pursued but not certainly the Charka.

A. R.
Mr. Anil Baran Ray in an article in the "Bombay Chronicle" of the 17th November has tried to show that the Khadi movement is not only useless but harmful to the country. Now the case for Khadi has been stated so clearly and on so many occasions that it is really surprising that Mr. Ray should so completely misunderstand it. It is proposed to take the points one by one as raised in his article. He says: "the Charka can at best give about eight annas a month to a spinner."

This average he has arrived at by dividing the amount of money said to have been distributed by the number of spinners and months in the period during which it was distributed. There is an obvious fallacy in striking an average in this way. It assumes that all the Charkas were plying every day throughout
the period, whereas the fact is that the very nature of the occupation of the spinners makes their work at the *Charka* irregular. They do not spin a given number of hours each day of the month. The hours in the day as also the number of days in the month and even the months in the year are determined by other agricultural work—more time being given to *Charka* in the off season and less in the agricultural sowing or reaping season. As against the imaginary average figure of earning per *Charka* we have the actual figures of some spinners taken at random from the spinners' register at Gandhi Ashram, Tiruchengodu—the very centre whose average Mr. Ray quotes—

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Spinners' Regd. No.</th>
<th>July 1927</th>
<th>Aug. 1927</th>
<th>Sep. 1927</th>
<th>Total for 3 months</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>799</td>
<td>... 4 3 0</td>
<td>... 4 7 0</td>
<td>... 3 15 0</td>
<td>12 9 0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>... 6 5 0</td>
<td>... 3 5 0</td>
<td>... 3 4 0</td>
<td>12 14 0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>304</td>
<td>... 4 8 0</td>
<td>... 2 8 0</td>
<td>... 2 10 0</td>
<td>9 10 0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>488</td>
<td>... 4 6 0</td>
<td>... 3 1 0</td>
<td>... 1 6 0</td>
<td>8 13 0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4416</td>
<td>... 2 7 0</td>
<td>... 2 0 0</td>
<td>... 2 4 0</td>
<td>6 11 0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>565</td>
<td>... 4 8 0</td>
<td>... 2 7 0</td>
<td>... 2 12 0</td>
<td>9 11 0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
It is the uniform experience of all Khadi centres that a spinner gets about an anna and a half a day for about 6 hours' spinning. This earning is small undoubtedly, if taken by itself, but is not inconsiderable when we remember that the average income of an Indian has been calculated to be about one anna and seven pies a day. And let it not be forgotten that for this paltry six pice there are thousands who are willing to spin; there can be no question of depriving them of this means of earning without suggesting a better alternative and none has been so far suggested.

Mr. Ray thinks that in spite of persistent propaganda and the exorbitant price paid for Khaddar, Charka does not ply independently anywhere on cottage industry basis. Here, again, Mr. Ray's conclusion is based on a wrong assumption. He assumes that all the Khadi that is produced and all the yarn that is spun on the Charka is produced and spun under the auspices of the All-India Spinners' Association. The fact, however, is that the A.I.S.A. publishes statistics of only what is produced by it and has no means of collecting the figures of whole and half
Khaddar and the huge quantity of yarn spun and disposed of by the producers independently of the A.I.S.A. It is a well-known fact that in the Punjab, Rajputana, Bihar, Andhra, U. P., and Bengal large quantities of whole or half Khaddar are produced and consumed independently without any effort on anybody’s part; and this has continued in spite of the competition with mills—Indian and foreign. The reason is that the cloth has been found to be suitable, durable and on the whole cheap by the consumers. Gandhiji’s efforts have been directed towards creating a healthy reaction in favour of handspun as against the flimsy and tawdry fabric imported from abroad, which first came into fashion in towns and has permeated villages also now.

Mr. Ray thinks that it is futile to try to stem the tide of industrialism and Charka cannot compete with mills. Mr. Anil Baran Ray admits, however, the fundamental fact of the deep and grinding poverty of the masses and the further undeniable fact remains that millions and millions are unemployed for a great part of their time. The Charka gives employment to such unemployed who on ac-
count of their agricultural occupation which can give them only intermittent work near their homes and cannot permit migration to long distances or absence for any long duration are unable to find work for their off seasons. That it has succeeded in supplementing the income of such agriculturists by enabling them to utilise their off hours is proved by the following facts gathered at one of the centres:—(1) Names of village, (2) Number of wheels, (3) Annual earnings from spinning in rupees, (4) Annual agricultural and other incomes of spinning families in rupees, (5) percentage of 3 to 4.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pudupalayam area:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Uppupalayam</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>460</td>
<td>3360</td>
<td>13</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Sembampalayam</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>450</td>
<td>3065</td>
<td>15</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Puliyampatti</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>346</td>
<td>2650</td>
<td>13</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Chithalandur</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>375</td>
<td>2150</td>
<td>17  1/2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Pudupalayam</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>336</td>
<td>2398</td>
<td>14</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kanoor area:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Komarapalayam</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>1398</td>
<td>9009</td>
<td>15  1/2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Chellamapalayam</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>242</td>
<td>2190</td>
<td>11</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uttukkul area:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Velampalayam</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>401</td>
<td>1400</td>
<td>28  1/2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Papampalavam</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>1205</td>
<td>5220</td>
<td>23</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Sembampalayam</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>372</td>
<td>2672</td>
<td>14</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The above shows an addition of 11 to 28 per cent in income as a result of spinning over the other income of the families concerned taken as a whole. In individual families the results were even more striking. Sometimes the increase was as much as 50 per cent.

There can be no manner of doubt that although the earning from the *Charka* considered independently is by no means considerable, taken in relation to the other income of the families it represents a substantial increase. Considered from this point of view, *viz.*, of finding work for the unemployed, no question of competing with mills arises.

Mr. Ray, however, makes the curious complaint that the proposal that our cultivators should work in their unemployed hours on the *Charka* is inhuman while all over the world attempts are being made to reduce the working hours of the unemployed. I confess I am not aware that there is anywhere in the world a proposal to reduce the working hours of the unemployed. On the other hand, the problem of finding work for them is a pressing problem all the world over. In India no attempt has been made to take a census of the unemployed, and
the reason for this omission is obvious, viz. that it will disclose countless millions as unemployed, and the task is too stupendous to be undertaken.

Mr. Ray complains that such a large sum as nearly 20 lacs is invested in Charka work and can produce but about 25 lacs worth of Khaddar. Mr. Ray forgets again that this sum of 20 lacs is invested not only in producing Khaddar but also in marketing it, and if statistics of mills are taken, it will be found that the return for the investment in production and marketing of Khaddar can stand fair comparison with similar investments in the mills.

Mr. Ray complains that sums collected for Congress and national work are devoted to Khaddar. The charge, in fact, is not true, because nothing that was collected for any other purpose has been diverted. But assuming that money collected for national purposes is used for Khaddar, to those who look upon national work in the terms of the masses of the people, nothing is more urgent than an attempt to ameliorate their economic condi-
tion, and Khaddar claims to do that as the figures given above testify.

The yearly loss incurred by the Charka Sangh is incidental to the reorganisation of an industry which is very nearly dead and which requires to be revived. It is covered mostly by expenses on organisers and experts and office expenses, all of which items may and will disappear when once the industry is reorganised.

The complaint that the Charka Sangh is acting like any other capitalist getting Khaddar made and selling it and not trying to make spinning for oneself popular is also based on ignorance of facts. As a matter of fact an attempt has been made in this direction and the result achieved at Bijolia where nearly 5000 people have become self-sufficient in respect of their clothing requirements is very encouraging. The work is necessarily slow and requires not only technical skill on the part of the workers but also organising and persuasive powers in the workers engaged.

The greatest shortcoming in Mr. Ray's indictment is the absence of any feasible and practicable alternative plan for immediate
amelioration in however small a degree, of the economic condition of the masses. The general statement regarding improvement in agriculture and the establishment of large scale production factories betrays a confusion of thought. No one objects to improvement in agriculture. Charka is not suggested as an alternative but only as a supplementary occupation to agriculture. The establishment of large factories, apart from the great difficulty of finding the necessary capital and the obvious objection on account of the necessity of a great drain on the resources of the country as the price of machinery to be imported and the recurring charges for replacement of parts, repairs, etc., is not likely to solve the problem of unemployment. It is calculated on the other hand, in a country like India which has no outlet for its surplus goods, to intensify the problem of unemployment.

Thus, therefore, if the fundamental facts of poverty and unemployment are admitted, as they cannot but be, and there is no alternative suggested for filling the unemployed hours, Charka must hold the field. The nation has paid crores for propping up some
industry or other where the number of the labourers employed and their share in the profits are after all small. Why should we grudge a bounty the whole of which goes straight into the pocket of a most deserving class of people—viz., those who are willing to work and earn but who cannot do so because they have no work.

It is not necessary to consider here the political effect of Khaddar as Mr. Ray admits that it has at least some value in that direction.

The most surprising statement, however, is that Khaddar stands in the way of village reconstruction. Mr. Ray again speaks without experience and without knowledge. It is common knowledge that Khaddar has verily proved to be the centre of many kinds of activities. It has helped the solution of the knotty problem of untouchability; it has served to help anti-drink campaign. It has enabled village education in a small scale to be undertaken. The results may not be very large, but the work itself has not been very intensive as yet; and it has been in more or less an experimental stage. But it has been sufficient to show its possibilities and poten-
tialities, and that is all that the A. I. S. A. can aim at with its limited resources. Given the necessary capital and technical skill and even a fraction of the talent now employed in mills and in improving machinery, one can make bold to claim that Charka may hold its own one day even as regards prices of its cloth as it does even to-day to some extent as regards its durability and, to some, even in beauty.
REPLY TO A KHADDARITE

A Khaddarite has called me an imbecile theorist and a dreamer because I ventured to suggest that the poverty of the Indian people can be cured only by removing foreign rule and foreign exploitation, and, what would inevitably and speedily follow the removal of foreign rule, the application of science to agriculture, the organisation of large-scale production and so forth. Thus Swaraj to a Khaddarite is a dream which "cannot be materialised for a long time to come"! The foreign rule and foreign exploitation will continue, our agriculture will continue to be crude and primitive, we shall suffer all disadvantages as regards banking, exchange, tariff, transport, yet by the magic wand of the Charka our poor people will be relieved immediately! This
is the practical sense of our Khaddarites. And they have given positive proof of "immediate" help to the poor by annually producing 34 lacs of yards of cloth only by the investment of 20 lacs of rupees after a superhuman effort of eight years! 

Immediate relief to the poor can be given only by charitable relief work and Khaddar is really proceeding on that basis and not on economic or business lines. To remove the poverty of the people you must add to the production of wealth and stop the drainage, there is no other way. And if this cannot be accomplished immediately, we can immediately start on these lines. Our objection to Khaddar is that it is not only giving no real help to the people—a monthly increase of eight annas in the income is no real help—but it is doing positive harm by diverting the attention of our national workers from true constructive work and causing enormous waste of public energy and money.

The plain facts I marshalled against Khaddar have been brushed aside by one phrase that they are the stock arguments of anti-Khaddarites. And Mr. Khaddarite of
course has proceeded to bring forward quite fresh facts and arguments in favour of his fetish! Thus he says that the bulk of India's people is agricultural and they have to work in the field only for about six months, etc. This argument repeated *ad nauseum* is fallacious to the core. In the first place, it is not everywhere in India that the agriculturists have to pass some months in idleness. Then it is only because agriculture is not fully developed that agriculturists do not get full work. Instead of throwing upon them a new work, they should be helped to do their own work well. By adopting simple devices and simple improvements—selection of seeds, selection of bulls, preservation of manure, forming co-operative organisations for sale and purchase,—the agriculturists can make much more profit than they can ever hope to make from spinning and they can be taught and organised to make these improvements by the same effort as is being devoted to the absolutely futile programme of the *Charka*.

Mr. Khaddarite has referred to "Economics of Khaddar" by Richard B. Gregg, which within a year of its appearance has
been raised to the dignity of the Vedas by Khaddarites all over India! I can assure Mr. Khaddarite that this is not the first time that I am hearing of that valuable book. But I would at any time depend on my "plain facts" which no Khaddarite has dared to deny rather than on Mr. Gregg's researches on the solar energy and the similarity of the human body to a machinery. As a drowning man catches at a straw, so our Khàddarites would catch hold of anything that seems to support their pet theory. Thus the testimonial of a Government official, Mr. Edye has been produced in favour of home spun cloth. If our Khaddarites find the testimony and advice of Government official so reliable I refer them to the report of the Agricultural Commission and to find out for themselves what place has been given to the Chàrka in that "precious" report.
REPLY TO BABU RAJENDRA PRASAD

In his rejoinder to my article Babu Rajendra Prasad has mostly tried to explain the facts produced by me against Khadi but not to deny or contradict them. I leave it to the readers to judge for themselves how far he has succeeded in explaining my "plain facts" so as to defend the cause of Khadi.

Babu Rajendra Prasad quotes me thus: He says, "the Charka can at best give about eight annas a month to a spinner." These words, however, are not mine but have been put into my mouth by him to suit his own convenience! The Charka may 'at best' give more than eight annas but in actual fact in general it has not given so much. From a perusal of the reports of the various Khaddar organisations in the country I said, "the average income from spinning is less than
eight annas per month." Rajendra Prasad explains that in some months the earning is larger and in some months it is smaller. But that does not alter the average! If you give full meals to a person for three months that does not compensate for his starving for the rest of the year. Herein lies the necessity of computing the actual average monthly income taking the year as a whole. It is strange that Babu Rajendra Prasad does not see this simple truth.

In order to counteract the impression that the actual earning from the Charka is most miserably low Rajendra Prasad has quoted certain curious figures. Thus he gives figures of the income only for those months when the earning is the highest. In another place he has given figures not on the basis of the number of spinners but the number of wheels. Now it is well-known that one wheel is often run by a whole family and the earning by one wheel is not the same as the earning by one person. My average stands on the basis of reports published by the Khaddar organisations themselves (including Babu Rajendra Prasad's own branch of the
A. I. S. A. in Bihar) and there is no way of escaping out of it. However in order to make my case still stronger I shall take Babu Rajendra Prasad at his word.

He admits in his rejoinder that a spinner gets about an anna and a half a day for about 6 hours of spinning. Thus by working 6 hours a day he earns less than 3 rupees a month! In another article Babu Rajendra Prasad has said that by working whole time on the Charka a person can earn Rs. 5 per month. This is an admitted fact which we must carefully consider in judging the cause of Khadi. One must also remember that even this income from spinning is possible only because Khaddar is being made to sell at a price much higher than mill-cloth. Whatever improvement you may make in spinning by technical skill and talent in organisation the mills will always produce cloth cheaper and at the same time better in quality than Khadi. But let us assume for the sake of argument (though to me this seems to be an impossible assumption) that people will always consent to buy Khaddar in preference to cheaper and better mill-cloth. Then the
monthly income from spinning, to a whole-
time spinner will be between five and six 
rupees. Can a person decently live on this 
income? I put this plain question to my 
readers. It is only when bare squalid poverty 
is put up as the highest ideal of life that one can 
seriously make such a proposal. This is the 
mentality underlying Khaddar and Mahatma 
Gandhi has expressed it times without number. 
Babu Rajendra Prasad stated in an article on 
Khaddar that when a person bought a rupee’s 
worth of Khadi he should remember that he 
was providing for the meals of a poor unknown 
sister at least for four or five days. Now 
when a rupee’s worth of Khaddar is sold, only 
four annas go to the spinner (this is a fact 
admitted by expert Khaddar workers and 
organisers). Thus in Babu Rajendra Prasad’s 
estimation four annas is sufficient to give a 
poor unknown sister her meals at least for 
four or five days!

It is this tendency of the Indians towards 
poverty which is responsible for many of their 
evils and the Khaddar movement is emphasis-
ing and feeding this wrong mentality. 
Eminent specialists have come to the conclu-
sion that for the proper feeding of a person it is necessary to spend from five to six annas per day. This means at least Rs. 10 per month for food only. Then one must have a sanitary dwelling place, sufficient clothing, treatment in case of disease, provision for the future, recreation, education for children and all such things are absolutely necessary. Can the Charka programme ever hope to ameliorate the condition of the poor according to this decent human standard?

It is no use arguing that the Charka is only a supplementary industry and people are not expected to depend solely on the Charka. If a person earns 5 rupees a month by working whole time on the Charka he cannot earn more than a rupee by working on it as a supplementary occupation and actual facts give even a much lower average. In what way will this insignificant addition to his income improve his economic condition?

But the stock argument of the Khaddarites is that as the average income of an Indian is one anna and seven pies per day an increment of six pies or even three pies is not negligible. Rajendra Prasad has quoted figures to show
that in many cases the income of a family has been raised 11 per cent. or even 28 per cent. When the monthly income of a person is only Rs. 3 or Rs. 4 it is certainly better to make it Rs. 5 or Rs. 6. But should that be our ideal? Should we move heaven and earth only for this? What does it matter that the increment is 50 per cent. or even 100 per cent. as long as the actual total income remains within Rs. 5 or Rs. 6? Instead of defending the meagre earning from the Charka by comparing it with the average low income of our people our aim should be to increase that average so that they may live like human beings and herein comes the necessity of improving our agriculture on scientific lines and introducing large-scale production through machinery. By adding a rupee to the monthly income of our miserable agriculturists we do not ameliorate their condition but only prolong their misery and consign them to slow death and sure dehumanisation.

Babu Rajendra Prasad shows a great confusion of thought when he mentions the Charka as a boon to the stupendous number of the unemployed in our country. He him-
self has admitted that "Charka is not suggested as an alternative but only as a supplementary occupation to agriculture." Thus the Charka according to its own votaries is not meant for the unemployed but for those who have already an occupation in agriculture. But neither as a sole industry nor as a supplementary occupation do we find any efficacy of the Charka.

But the greatest shortcoming in my indictment, says Rajendra Prasad, is "the absence of any feasible and practicable alternative plan for immediate amelioration in however small a degree." My article was expressly written to show only that the Charka brought no immediate amelioration and I think I have sufficiently established my point and Babu Rajendra Prasad himself seems to feel it in the heart of his heart. If he would throw away the hypnotic spell of the Charka which is blinding his vision he will easily find out "feasible and practicable alternative plans for immediate amelioration." Thus instead of trying to thrust the Charka on the agriculturists we should see first what possibilities and scope agriculture itself affords for imme-
mediate improvement. Rajendra Prasad does not object to improvement in agriculture, but why does he not try first in that direction leaving aside the fetish of the Charka? It is certainly not possible immediately to make our agriculture wholly scientific and up-to-date, but we can immediately begin on that line and that will bring immediate amelioration to a degree not possible by the Charka. Apart from such simple improvements as the selection of seeds, the selection of bulls, the prevention of the enormous thoughtless waste of manure and its proper use, the agriculturists may be induced to form themselves into co-operative irrigation societies, co-operative credit societies, co-operative sale and purchase societies and so forth. In this way the villagers will be truly roused and organised. The energy and the money that is now being spent on the Charka and the propagation of Khaddar, if applied to the organisation of the agriculturists and their training in simple devices and improved methods, will immediately bring much greater profits than they can ever expect from spinning.
If supplementary work is to be given to the agriculturists one should look to such allied occupations as cattle breeding, dairy farming, poultry farming, fish culture, flower culture, fruit culture, sericulture and similar other industries that may be found suitable to local conditions. All this is not absolutely unknown to our agriculturists but a deadly inertia and helplessness has come upon them and they have lost the ancient art and the ancient vigour. These should be revived and modern devices and knowledge applied—on this way lies the true amelioration of the wretched condition of our people.

Side by side with this improvement in agriculture if big factories are gradually started to manufacture various articles of use which we are now importing from other lands, many persons who now depend on agricultural work will go to the factories, and the remaining agriculturists will get more lands and consequently more work. Money will flow from the factories to the villages and improve them, the agricultural products will have a better market and agriculture itself will be improved by the help of machinery. The
agriculturists will get better price for their raw materials and will be able to buy their necessary articles cheaper from the factories. Rajendra Prasad raises certain objections to large scale production through machinery. The first is the difficulty of finding the necessary capital. But why does he forget that Khaddar work also requires a big capital? It has been necessary to invest 20 lacs of rupees to produce 24 lacs of rupees worth of Khaddar annually! Another objection is that the buying of machinery will involve a great drain on the resources of the country. But what we shall spend on the machinery will stop the drain of crores of rupees that we are spending annually to import mill-made things from other lands—thus it is a gain and not a loss to the country. Gradually machinery also will be manufactured in our own country. Rajendra Prasad’s own province contains sufficient iron and coal to provide all the machinery we need and also to export to our hearts’ content. As regards textile machinery opinion has been expressed by some that the cotton mills that now exist in the country can double their production by
working full time thus supplying almost all the cloth that we now import from foreign lands and at the same time giving employment to twice the number that is now employed in the mills. The last objection raised against big machinery is that India has no outlet for her manufactured goods. But India herself possesses a market which attracts the greed of all the industrial nations of the world. This is the unique advantage of India that she possesses inexhaustible raw materials and natural resources and an almost unlimited market within her own borders. It is really surprising that our eminent men like Babu Rajendra Prasad cannot appreciate these simple facts of our economic life.

He ends his rejoinder by repeating a personal attack on me that I speak without experience and without knowledge. Begging humbly to be excused for this personal reference I must say in self-defence that in the matter of experience and knowledge of Khaddar work, I yield to none. For six great years of my life I did my utmost for Khaddar. Even while undergoing imprison-
ment under the Bengal Ordinance I religiously devoted one hour daily to spinning to see for myself what power the Charka, actually possessed. Yes, I tried the Charka in every possible way and at last found it wanting. It is not a novice, not an idle critic that speaks here. I was the one man in India who carried the loin-cloth even to the citadel of the bureaucracy. Covering my loin only with a rough piece of Khadi I appeared before the Governor in the Bengal Council though I had been warned by the President that His Excellency would take it as a direct insult to him. But on that day the whole of India was behind me. Now I know that the better part of political India is against me in the matter of Khaddar, still I do not recoil in the least as I feel that truth is on my side. As long as the people of India will continue to give me a hearing I will warn them with all the force and emphasis I can command that the Khaddar movement is not only useless, it is positively harmful, it truly stands in the way of the political, economical and spiritual progress of India.
VI

THE BEGINNING OF THE END

It is said that I hold in contempt an addition of an anna or so to the villagers income through spinning. There people misunderstand me. I do not grudge the addition of even a single pie by spinning provided it is practicable and provided that by the same amount of energy and money we spend for this we cannot give them a much larger addition. I have proved by facts and figures that those two conditions are not satisfied. It is admitted that the earning by the Charka is miserable. Apart from this important and vital aspect of the question I have shown that even this miserable earning is possible only because certain people consent to buy Khaddar leaving aside much cheaper and better mill-cloth. This however is practicable only within very narrow limits and for a limited period.
This is a most important aspect of the question to which due attention is not paid by the advocates of Khaddar. They continually harp on the deep poverty and the enforced idleness of our people, on the ease with which the Charka can be adopted and learned by every body, on the convenience of working it at any time and at any place. All this is granted. But of what avail is all this facility of the Charka if you cannot sell the Charka-made yarn? This is the difficulty which with the advent of mills made the immemorial Charka a relic of the past. Readers of Young India will find there an interesting account of the attempt that is being made in Mysore to revive the Charka industry. There the spinning of yarn had died out less than 20 years ago "because there was no demand for the yarn." Some of the spinners were willing to re-start working the Charka ‘if raw cotton was advanced to them and an undertaking was given that the yarn would be purchased.’ The All-India Spinners’ Association had to give that undertaking before the work could start there. This is the condition everywhere. If you
undertake to dispose of the yarn; if the people of India consent to buy Khaddar 'at any price' as suggested by Mahatma Gandhi then of course our poor people can earn something, however miserable, by spinning. But is this practicable? Some men for some time may consent to do this, but the sheer force of economic pressure will compel the Charka yarn to recede before the rising tide of mill-yarn and mill-cloth. If by an Aladdin's lamp you can stop the mills not only in India but all over the world, only then the Charka will supply a universal want and again stand on its own legs and come to stay.

Some people raise the political question of the boycott of British cloth and observe that Khaddar is necessary to complete the boycott. They admit that 'with propaganda and enterprise' the Indian mills can supply three-fourths of our requirements. But do they really believe that Khaddar will be able to supply the rest in the near future? One fourth of our need means roughly about 45 crores of rupees' worth of cloth. And after an almost superhuman effort of eight years by our national workers and organisations the
country has been able to produce annually not certainly more than thirty lakhs of rupees' worth of Khaddar. That is certainly not a practical proposition to complete the cloth boycott with the help of the Charka. If we are in earnest we can immediately complete the boycott by helping and stimulating our mills to produce their utmost and by supplementing the deficit with imports from countries other than Britain; only this is a politically practical proposition. With sufficient backing by the people and the Government of the country the Indian mills, I believe, can very soon supply all the cloth we need. But our alien Government is more concerned with the interests of Manchester and it is all the more necessary that the people of India should stand by the mills at this critical time when by the step-motherly treatment of the Government they have been placed in a very dangerous predicament.

But what is the lead our National Congress is going to give to the country in this vital matter? When I wrote in the Chronicle that Khaddar stood in the way of our economical progress I did not know that another positive
proof of it would be forthcoming so soon. The authorities of the Calcutta Congress Exhibition have refunded the money advanced by the various Indian mills to hire stalls in the exhibition. This they have done not because they were convinced that mill-cloth should be excluded and they expressly said so, but because they wanted to placate the Khaddarites for political reasons! The Khaddarites know at heart that Khaddar cannot stand before mill cloth; they have succeeded in excluding their formidable rival from the exhibition grounds, but will they be similarly successful in excluding foreign cloth from the country? Certainly not. The Indian National Congress may help to paralyse the Indian cotton mills by declaring Non-co-operation with them at a time when they most need its co-operation, but their place will be immediately taken up, not certainly by the Charaka, but by foreign mills, especially those of Lancashire.

Not by reason, not by moral persuasion but by the sheer threat of boycott at this critical political juncture the Khaddarites have coerced the authorities of the Calcutta
Exhibition against their express will to exclude mill-yarn and even mill-cloth made of Indian yarn from their show. The *Khaddarites* may have thus scored an apparent victory, but in reality they have suffered a moral defeat and that is always the beginning of the end.
VII

MORE PLAIN FACTS ABOUT KHADDAR

Though I find that there is not much substance in what Mr. "Khandeshi" has said in reply to my "plain facts about Khaddar" and that his main points have been answered in what I have already written on the subject in the Chronicle yet in order to clear any possible misunderstanding of my views I would like to give a somewhat detailed reply to Mr. Khandeshi if the gentle readers would have the patience to follow me further in the discussion of this subject of vital importance to the nation.

Mr. Khandeshi begins his reply by saying, "No advocate of Khadi has ever said that Charka has 'materially' improved the condition of the poor people." Here is at least one Khaddarite who openly admits that the Charka does not 'materially' help the poor.
Why then this fuss about the Charka? Why is all the nation's constructive energy and money sought to be concentrated on this quite ineffective spinning wheel and why are the poor people of India asked to make considerable pecuniary sacrifice for buying Khaddar? Should we not rather find out 'the true way of materially helping the poor' and concentrate all our efforts on that?

I incidentally referred to the charge brought against the British that they destroyed our Charka industry. The charge is so common and it has been so widely and insistently preached in our country that Mr. Khandeshi need not have taken the trouble of referring me to Dutt's Economic History of India. My intention in referring to the charge was to draw the attention of my countrymen to the real truth about the matter. I did not deny the historical fact that the hirelings of the East India Company often practised inhuman tortures on our craftsmen: but their attack was mainly directed against the weavers, how is it then that the weaving industry is still flourishing while the Charka could not hold its own?
Whatever might have been the methods adopted by the over-zealous Company officials to suppress our cotton industry, it was the cheap products of the British mills which really ousted the spinning wheel; and the handloom weaving survived to the extent it has done because it took the help of the mills themselves by weaving mill-yarn. Let an American historian speak how British craftsmen were ruined by the advent of machinery:

"The craftsmen found the competition of the factory too much for them, as the machine made things much cheaper, if not better, than their hand-work; consequently, many artisans were ruined by the labour of the 'iron men', as the machines were called. A series of riots broke out against the 'iron men'; many machines were destroyed by mobs, and Hargreaves (inventor of the spinning-jenny—1765) himself was attacked by the rioters. But it was all in vain. The artisans were soon forced to give up their hopeless struggle against machinery."—Modern and Contemporary Europe, by J. S. Schapiro.

My contention is this that in India the immemorial Charka really disappeared because the yarn produced by it could not compare in price with mill-yarn. Technical skill in spinning which is now being sought to be revived was not wanting at the time when spinning had to be given up, yet the
Charaka could not compete with the newly-started mills which by this time have greatly multiplied their productive power. Speaking about the possibilities of the Khaddar movement in Mysore, the Director of Industries observed:

"The spinning of yarn by hand had died out less than 20 years ago and several old women well remembered the days when they were employed in spinning yarn in their girlhood. The spinning wheels were still stored up in their offices and the occupation was only given up because there was no demand for the yarn."

That is the crux of the whole question, 'there is no demand for the yarn' and the Khaddarites under the leadership of Mahatma Gandhi are leaving no stone unturned to create an artificial demand! Showing that the Charaka was a futile cry Mr. Venkatasubbiah of the Servants of India Society observed:

"The extinction of the Charaka is due to the existence of the mills. Attempts are now being made to revive the Charaka, but I believe that it is only an artificial stimulus that is being given. The reason for this is that whereas a Charaka spinner gets only an anna and a half for his work for eight hours, the same spinner at the mills get a rupee. The mill-produced cloth is much cheaper and better."
I do not deny that there are still isolated places not only in India but all over the world where people spin and weave their own cloth as a domestic industry. The current of modern life has not yet reached them, they are still holding to the simple primitive type of life and persisting in their old modes and habits. But their number is very few and gradually dwindling. The Khaddar movement may have added a few more to their number, but they are rather the exceptions which prove the rule. The avowed object of the present movement is to help the poor people to supplement their slender income by spinning and the Khaddar organisations all over the country are chiefly engaged in disposing of the yarn obtained from the spinners.

While admitting that industrialism is already upon us Mr. Khandeshi would say: "Thus far and no further." This appears like the divine fiat. "Let there be light and there was light!" I have shown that big machinery and large scale production is indispensable if we would remove the deep poverty of our people. I do not ignore the evils, but I have said that big machinery does
not necessarily imply all the evils of industrialism. The evils are being corrected everywhere. Mr. Gregg in his book gives a dark picture of industrial life in the West which, however, was true only in the early days of industrialism. Since the Factory Act was passed in England in 1833 things have rapidly advanced. Writing of the condition in the West towards the close of the 19th century Dr. Ludwig Stein of the University of Bern observed:

"The philanthropic phase of social politics is now over. The protection of the labouring classes against an inadmissible expenditure of their working powers, against substances prejudicial to health in their work, against prolonging the periods of work beyond the point sanctioned by society, against massing of the labouring classes in hygienically unsound localities, against injuries to the coming generation in the form of child labour and the labour of woman—all these just requirements of society have to-day, thanks to our sharp social sensibility, come to be generally accepted."

Now the factory workers in the West live a life which is a luxury in comparison with the wretched life lived by our agriculturists. In America the labourers often earn enough to keep their own motor-cars. England is preeminently an industrial country, but the
general condition of living there is beyond the dream of the average Indian. All these are capitalistic countries. Socialistic Russia has held before the world the ideal of a novel solution of all the evils of industrialism. India also will solve the problems in her own way. How can the evils be overcome unless one enters into it?

The United States of America is the leading industrial nation of the day. Only sixty years ago she was mainly an agricultural country and her condition was as bad as ours. But she has combined specialisation in manufactures with agriculture and in this way she has been able to utilise her economic resources to the fullest extent. This is the secret of her economic and political strength. India also must proceed on this line and once her political serfdom is ended her progress will be marvellous.

Mr. Khandeshi refers to the Charka as a healthy recreation and refresher. I wonder whether he has ever spun himself or is labouring under a hypnotic charm. Spinning is at least as much tedious as any other work and people take to it only with a view to earn
something, to supply some want. The leisure hours of our labourers and agriculturists should be devoted not to such work but to true recreation by study, rest and enjoyments; only under these conditions they can hope to grow to their full human stature. Writing of the present condition of the labourers in the West an historian observes:

“In the past, when labour was performed by slaves or serfs, leisure was enjoyed only by the very few wealthy persons. But now that machinery is superseding human labour, it has become possible for millions to enjoy a certain degree of leisure. The work-day is gradually being shortened to eight hours, holidays are more frequent, and vacations more general. This gives opportunities of recreation and culture to many who, in the past, were sunk in misery and ignorance.”

My statement that Charka stands in the way of village reconstruction has given a shock to many as it has been the fashion since the days of Non-co-operation to regard Charka as being synonymous with village work. I purposely gave that shock so that it might serve as an eye-opener. It is said that Khaddar workers incidentally do such work as treating the sick people with medicine, teaching the alphabet to the illiter-
ate, removing the bane of untouchability, and so forth. But all these things could have been done better if the energy of the workers had not been mainly taken up by the sterile *Khaddar* work, and those functions not made secondary. Then, what is true village work? You cannot organise the villagers simply by distributing medicines to them or opening primary schools or libraries. The essence of village work is to bring a new light, a new awakening, to rouse in the hearts of the villagers the desire to raise the standard of their living, to make them dynamic and to induce them to combine with one another to change and improve their condition in every possible way. All this is not done by *Khaddar* which, on the contrary, teaches people the virtue of poverty and reconciles them to their lot by adding a few annas to their miserable monthly income. The *Charka* is truly an opiate and not a renovator!

Mr. Khandeshi gives me a parting advice not to criticise *Khaddar* without knowledge. I can assure him that I have read more of *Khaddar* literature and seen more of *Khaddar* work as well as the actual condition of our
poor people than he and his friends fondly imagine. In my turn let me tell *Khaddarites* of Khandesh as well as other places that if they truly desire to be the friends of the poor and aspire to serve our great Motherland they must have an open mind and not fixed ideas and notions, they must not blind themselves by theories and fads, but squarely look at facts and figures and, what is most important, they must always have the sincerity and the courage to give up their pet schemes and plans and even to demolish ruthlessly the works of their own hands if they be found to be detrimental to the true interests of the country. This is a great and difficult act of sacrifice which Mother India expects of all her sons at this critical juncture in her history.
VIII

THE PROBLEM OF POVERTY

The poverty of the people of India is appalling and on account of this they cannot make progress in any direction. All nation-building activities such as education and sanitation which are essential for the welfare of the people require large sums of money to be spent on them. A people suffering from chronic starvation and lowered vitality cannot expect to grow to their full moral and spiritual stature. That England has practically freed herself from epidemics and all preventible diseases, that America has provided for the efficient education of all the people irrespective of caste, creed or sex, that Japan has been able to compete with the foremost Western countries almost on equal terms, all these have been possible on account of the vast wealth those countries have at
their disposal to devote to the well-being of the people. If the Indians are to show the best that is in them, nay, if they are to live, the deep and widespread poverty of the people must be removed in the first instance.

India with her immense natural resources and a people having abundant vitality and creative power was once the richest country in the world showing extraordinary activity and progress in all departments of life; but now she is the poorest. It is not our purpose here to describe the rich and prosperous life in ancient India nor to enter into a detailed discussion of the complex causes that have led to her present pitiable condition with all the political, social and moral evils attendant on the abject poverty of the people. The material causes of India’s poverty can be brought under two heads, India is not producing sufficient wealth and India is being bled white by a foreign rule and foreign exploitation. The first and foremost necessity is to stop this bleeding and to increase India’s national income by an organised development of agricultural as well as industrial resources of the country.
Agriculture which occupies more than seventy per cent. of the people of India is still in the primitive condition. "It cannot be gainsaid" as was admitted by Lord Reading, the former Viceroy of India "that the average standard of production and the general level of rural welfare in India is lower than that prevailing in other countries where for some time past there has been marked concentration of agricultural problems."

Thus, for example, the yield per acre in rice is 6,232 lbs. in Japan, 2,610 lbs. in Egypt, 1,330 lbs. in India. The average yield of wheat per acre in India reaches only 11 bushels. By adequate fertilization the yield can be raised to 38 bushels per acre. The application of science is the key to the improvement of this great staple industry of India.

Then the vast industrial possibilities of the country are lying untapped. Bihar alone is in a position to export both iron and coal to her heart's content and yet retain enough to build up an iron and steel industry that would supply indefinitely half the world. In the matter of industrial development the native
state of Mysore stands as an object lesson to the rest of India. One of the several causes that have made the state of Mysore the most forward in India is its vigorous industrial policy. The success of the gold mines yielding enormous profits and the concomitant employment of thousands of people set the Mysore Government seriously to the task of building up the now accomplished industrial Mysore. The Kavery scheme to generate electricity was undertaken in the 'early eighties, which has from the very beginning proved a highly remunerative project. Then followed in the regime of Sir M. Visweswarya an all round progress of Agricultural and Industrial developments. The second biggest dam in the world, the Krishnaraja Sagara, which has within itself potentialities of great benefit to the future generations of Mysore was built. The dying cottage industries were renovated. Factories were established as a model for the people to copy. Soap factories were started and the silk industry which was in a very crude form was brought in line with the modern standards. The success of the Tata Iron and Steel Works encouraged His High-
ness the Maharaja to start the Bhadrabati Iron and Steel Works. The products manufactured are Charcoal Pig Iron, C. P. Menthaool, Denaturing grade Menthaool, Methyl Acetone, Acetate of Lime, Wood Tar, Wood Preservative, Black Paint, Wood Tar Pitch and Cast Iron Pipes. A market has been steadily built up for the above products in India and foreign countries namely, England, the Continent, America and Japan. The management is conducted mostly by local talent and thousands of people are employed. Mysore has illustrated beyond doubt what India can do to remove the poverty of the people if she has the management of the affairs in her own hands. But it is not to the interests of Great Britain that India should develop industrially and so she is compelled to depend mainly on agriculture and that even of the most crude and primitive type.

As regards the exploitation of India by the British we cannot do better than quote the following description of it given by Prof. A. Demangeon of the Sorbonne University.

"India is the typical colony for exploitation. Immensely rich and thickly populated, she represents for the masters at once a fortune and a
The problem of poverty

defence. It is through India that the British Empire assures her destiny. India is the halting place of British Commerce to the Far East. India gives the fleet places of support for the sea-route. India recruits for the Army legion of high-spirited soldiers; native contingents fight for Great Britain in China and South Africa. During the Great War, India supplied more than a million men of whom more than a lac were killed. India is for Great Britain an enormous market; two-thirds of her importations come from English sources; she furnishes 51 per cent. of the wheat production of the Empire, 58 per cent. of the tea, 73 per cent. of the coffee, almost all the cotton. An immense British capital is invested in Indian mines, factories, plantations, railways and irrigation works. India pays the interest on probably 350 million pounds sterling. India keeps busy an army of British Officials whose salaries she pays and whose savings go every year to Great Britain. She pours into British coffers the interest on her public debt, the pensions of old officials, the Governmental expenses of her administration. More than 30 million pounds sterling a year is the estimate of the sums that India pays in the United Kingdom to her creditors, her stock-holders and officials. At that we do not know how much she brings to the merchants who trade with her and the shippers who transport her goods. Never was the term exploitation better employed."

With this enormous persistent drainage of the wealth, with her natural resources undeveloped, with millions of persons who are chronically under-employed it is no wonder that India has reached the lowest depths of
poverty and hardship. To add to her misery the population of the country is increasing giving more mouths to feed and if the population had not been controlled by disease and an extraordinarily high death rate life in India would have been still more miserable. The poor agriculturists of India cannot make any provision for future scarcity. On the other hand their indebtedness is terribly heavy and is put down at between Rs. 600 to 800 crores! The failure of crop for a year or two at once plunges them into terrible famine and as they have to depend almost entirely on the rains for their crop and as the rains are naturally irregular chronic famine and starvation has become the inevitable lot of the majority of Indians.

But apart from those material causes of the poverty of India there is also a moral cause which on account of its subtlety easily escapes our attention though it has been a fundamental factor in determining our present fallen condition and abject poverty. A distortion of the great spiritual ideal of ancient India has led the people to regard poverty itself as virtue. For centuries the
people of India have been taught that this life on the earth is a *Maya*, a falsehood, that all its joys and sorrows are transitory and unreal, that the enjoyment of life degrades one spiritually and that the sooner one can escape from this life of falsehood the better for his soul. This teaching of asceticism and *Mayavada* has done immense harm to India. The attempt to push *Mayavada* upon a whole people resulted in their losing all zest in life; the higher movement of life was choked in them and the vital being thus suppressed began to move in narrow channels, for example, the family life confined to the husband, wife and children, the life of petty service and so forth. People were not attracted by the higher plays of life. *Mayavada* is all right for a limited few who by their nature are capable of deriving some benefit from it; but it should not have been so vigorously preached to the masses.

It is the impact with the vigorous races of the West with their passion for life and for the joy of life that is helping the Indians to shake the spell of *Mayavada* and asceticism. The national movement coming on its wake
has induced the Indians to study their past and to reinterpret their ancient culture casting off the dead weight of custom and tradition. We are now realising that the neglect of life and the undervaluation of the joys of life were no part of the great ancient teaching of India. The Vedas, the Upanishads and the Gita have taught us to make the best use of life by developing it to its fulness and to make the life of this earth and in this body to be the basis of a higher spiritual and divine life. Thus the Isha Upanishad says: "By renouncing (the base movements of life) thou shouldst enjoy...........Doing verily works in this world one should wish to live a hundred years." In the Gita "the great command to Arjuna given after the foundation and main structure of the teaching have been laid and built, 'Arise, slay thy enemies, enjoy a prosperous kingdom' has not the ring of an uncompromising altruism or of a white, dispassionate abnegation; it is a state of inner poise and wideness which is the foundation of spiritual freedom."

If we consider the ancient scheme of Varna-shram we find that though Moksha or spiri-
tual freedom was regarded as the ultimate aim of life, people had to develop their body and soul through earthly enjoyments *Kama*, and for this they had to acquire the necessary means, *artha*, though of course all their activities were to be guided and controlled by spiritual motives, *dharma*. Thus *Dharma, Artha, Kama, Moksha* constituted the fourfold ideal of life. The life that we find depicted in the *Ramayan* and *Mahabharat* and in the great monuments of classical sanskrit literature does not show that poverty and bareness was ever regarded as an ideal in India. The aesthetic satisfactions of all kinds and grades were an important part of Indian culture and they were made instruments of spiritual development. It is only when the life-force of the Indians had began to decline in the course of time that Acharya Shankara appeared with his teaching of the renunciation of life and *karma*. It is a very happy sign that in modern India we are rapidly outgrowing the ascetic teaching of Shankara and returning to the Vedic ideal of a prosperous joyful divine life even on this earth.
But unfortunately a reactionary movement has already set in and this also has had its immediate origin in our contact with the West. This time it is not the Indian asceticism with its high spiritual significance which is being vigorously preached to the masses but the doctrines of the Christian Monks of the middle ages in Europe, who regarded a bare, poor, ugly, ascetic life as the highest virtue and suffering as a necessary means of salvation. Poverty and suffering were always regarded as evils in India on account of their soul-killing and demoralising effects though some times good might come out of them as out of all evils; but they were regarded as being virtues in themselves by the preachers of Christianity. Blessed are the poor, blessed are they that mourn—these were the tenets of their teaching. The so-called Christian races of modern Europe escaped the disastrous effects of this wrong view of religion by divorcing religion from their life. But in India religion is bound up with the life of the people, the teachings of our saints and sadhakas have the profoundest influence on the mentality and conduct of our masses. At
the present day in India there is no one man who has greater influence on the masses than Mahatma Gandhi. But Mahatma Gandhi has been influenced more by the teachings of Tolstoy and the Bible than by anything Indian. He has been aptly called the Christ of the Indian Road and has vigorously held up before the people of India the medieval Christian ideal of poverty, suffering and gloomy asceticism. In his *Ashram* at Sabarmati the first vow that the disciples have to take is that of poverty. A man may have to cheerfully accept poverty and suffering as a necessary evil in the performance of his duty, but when they are held up as ideals in themselves they have a great depressing effect upon the life of the people.

The remedy that Mahatma Gandhi has prescribed for improving the economic condition of the people is quite characteristic. The *Charaka* is the very symbol of poverty. No one will deny that the vast masses of our people are most miserably poor and that they must be given sufficient employment so that they may earn a decent livelihood. But how does the *Charaka* help? By working whole
day on the Charka a man cannot earn more than Rs. 5/- a month. How can a man live on this income unless he be a world-shunning saint and an ascetic? With five rupees only as his monthly income a man cannot have sufficient food and clothing, a sanitary dwelling place, facilities for self-development, adequate means for properly educating and bringing up his children, provision for the future, treatment in case of disease and such other things which are necessary for a decent human life. If the Charka be wholly inadequate, as it actually is, to meet the essential needs of life how do you hold it up as the means of the economic salvation of the people? It will be said that the ideal is not to depend on the Charka but to make it only as supplementary industry for leisure hours. Supplementary industries are certainly needed and the various dying cottage industries should be revived wherever possible and strengthened by modern devices; they should be encouraged consulting local needs and possibilities—but the simple formula, “Charka for all” cannot at all meet the needs of the situation. The Charka must be judged
not from the ease with which it can be universally adopted provided every one in the country consents to wear *Khaddar* leaving aside cheaper and better-made mill-cloth, but from the actual amelioration in the condition of the people it can bring about. If as a sole occupation the *Charka* can hardly give more than Rs. 5/- a month, as a supplementary industry it cannot generally give more than a rupee and this paltry addition to the income of our people cannot bring any material change in their condition. Apart from all theoretical considerations what economic help the *Charka* has actually brought to the poor people will appear from a consideration of the reports of the various authorised *Khadi* organisations in the country. There is no better *Khadi* worker in India than Babu Rajendra Prasad in Bihar or Srijut C. Rajagopalachari in Tamil Nadu. In Bihar the spinners have earned at the rate of less than one rupee a month on the average; in the Gandhi Ashram in Tamil Nadu they have received wages at the rate of less than ten annas per month. And this is said to be the
only solution of the economic problem of the masses of India!

No, the deep and widespread poverty of our masses cannot be alleviated unless we increase the wealth of the country by large scale production through machinery. Our people seem to have a dread of machinery and large scale production on account of the evils attendant on industrialism. But big machinery does not necessarily imply all the evils of industrialism. The evils are bound to disappear. Unless one enters into it, how can the evils be overcome? The different ideas and schemes suggested in Europe show that the people are trying to correct the defects. Why should the Indians wait until other countries solved their problems so that they might imitate afterwards?

While other countries are trying to give living wages to their labourers—by living wages is meant at least Rs. 40 to Rs. 50 a month—and to reduce their hours of labour to a maximum of 6 to 7 hours a day, the friends of the poor in our country are leaving no stone unturned to increase the monthly income of our toiling masses from Rs. 4 to Rs. 5 and that by
compelling them to work even in their leisure hours! No country in the world is giving up machinery on account of the evils that may arise from it but are trying and that with more and more success to remove those evils in their own way.

It is the tendency of the Indians towards poverty which is really responsible for the cry against machinery. But our leaders do not seem to realise that by raising this cry they are helping the very interests of the British Imperialists, which they are out to destroy. Our British rulers do not want that India should have full industrial development but that she should remain mainly an agricultural country thus providing an eternal market for the industrial products of Great Britain.

Removal of foreign rule with its attendant exploitation, reduction of expenditure on the army and the civil administration, a national mercantile marine; improved railway transport; the inauguration of other less costly means of transport such as canals and waterways for the development of internal trade; application of science and technical skill to
agriculture; extension of large scale production through machinery; organisation of suitable cottage industries with modern devices and methods; facilities in banking and insurance; co-operative organisations for sale and purchase and other purposes; technical education; modification of the whole university system; improved sanitation; a good thumping tariff to protect Indian industries—these measures and others would alleviate the poverty of the Indian masses if the people themselves would give up the false ideal of poverty and bareness being a virtue in itself, if they were inspired by the determination to improve their conditions and were prepared to make the necessary sacrifices of custom, prejudice and quasi-religious beliefs.
MORAL VALUE OF THE CHARKA

Mr. Nair, a member of the Satyagraha Ashram at Sabarmati has sought to give a new turn to the Khaddar controversy by proposing not to oppose me with facts and figures which, he says, are most misleading but to lay stress on the moral and spiritual aspects of the Khaddar movement. I must confess that here I am in my elements as I am constitutionally more a philosopher and a spiritual seeker than a mere politician or an economist. I also feel that no amount of facts and figures and arguments I produce will convert those with whom Khaddar is more a matter of faith and religion than of reason and economics. It seems to them that giving up Khadi means giving up Gandhi, giving up Bapu, and they have certainly not the heart to do that. But my position is quite clear.
My respect for Mahatma Gandhi does not stand on such an uncertain footing as the Charka. The Mahatma may commit Himalayan blunders in the field of politics and economics, still he will occupy a very high position in the hearts not only of his own countrymen but of all people on account of the high moral ideal he has held up before the world in his personality and character. He has rendered a great service to the cause of humanity by pitching moral force against brute force, not only in theory, but in the practical solution of problems that are troubling the race. It is true that he has not been able to achieve much success; but his very attempt is a great contribution to the future possibilities of the human being. The causes of his failure are obvious. His appeal is not to the brute in man, but to his soul. But of how many men on earth can it be as yet said that they have at all a soul to respond? In most people the soul has not yet emerged, they live a physical and vital life with a crude superficial play of the mind and reason and they must be dealt with by physical and vital forces however much these
may have to be backed by moral force to which Mahatma Gandhi has given the name Soul-force. In a world as it actually is at present, a Mirabeau, a Bismarck, a Mussolini has a far greater chance of success in dealing with human beings than our simple, honest, non-violent Mahatma Gandhi. Count Mirabeau was even more revolting in his moral character than in his ugly personal appearance—yet he became the greatest political figure of Europe in his time and inaugurated a historic revolution which sent across the world the ideals of Liberty, Equality and Fraternity,—great ideals which are now bidding fair to create a new higher order of humanity.

It is really the personality of Mahatma Gandhi with his great sacrifice and moral force that is preventing people from seeing the utter futility of the Charka. But if we allow our personal and moral predilections to cloud our vision about the true interests and well-being of the country we shall be untrue to our great Motherland who is higher than even the highest of her sons.

Mr. Nair would fain dispense with facts and figures which seem to him to be
most misleading but he himself cannot resist the temptation of quoting facts and figures which appear to him to be in support of his own cause. Thus he cites the fact of Britain's imperialism which has truly become a standing menace to world peace and also quotes the figure of unemployment in that country. But Mr. Nair forgets that there were war and imperialism in the world even before the advent of modern industrialism and that England enslaved India at a time when all English people were wearing Khaddar and every English village was humming with the music of the spinning wheel. As long as there are greed and lust and passion in human nature man will find out some excuse or other for war and for exploiting weaker people under the moral pretence of trusteeship. The number of the unemployed in Great Britain is not due to large-scale production through big machinery but to the capitalistic system. We do not believe, like our young leaders, that the Russian brand of Socialism or Communism is the panacea for all evils. But the Socialistic theory and the Russian experiment have shown beyond all doubt that large-scale pro-
duction does not necessarily imply all the evils of industrialism. The difference between Capitalism and Socialism does not lie in large-scale production but in the manner of distributing the wealth produced; both agree that there should be the production of plenty of wealth and this is also the clear injunction of our ancient Indian Scriptures. So we must fully utilise the resources modern science has placed in our hands to immensely increase the wealth of our country; and the problem of distribution India will solve in her own way according to her national tradition and genius.

I have already shown beyond doubt that spinning does not and cannot bring any real amelioration in the economic condition of our poverty-stricken masses. So Mr. Nair raises another plea that the Khaddar movement has fostered the spirit of Swadeshi and brought about a 'great national awakening. A little consideration will show that this plea also cannot stand. The Khaddar movement has not brought any awakening, it is rather the awakening caused in the country by the Punjab and the Khilafat wrongs and by the general post-war awakening all over the world.
that was utilised and exploited to re-introduce the use of Khaddar in India. A true spirit of nationalism and Swadeshism was first created in India by the partition movement in Bengal, but the spinning wheel had nothing to do with that movement. On the other hand the great political ardour and enthusiasm shown by the Indian people during the Non-co-operation days was damped by the programme of spinning and selling Khaddar. It was the narrow and rigid cadre of the so-called Constructive Bardoli programme, with Khaddar as its chief item which really killed the Non-co-operation movement. But even now disillusionment has not come to our people. That "Constructive" programme, though it has been able to construct nothing for these eight years, has been again adopted by the Congress in Calcutta by a overwhelming majority under the spell of the personality of Mahatma Gandhi.

Since 1920 no less than fifty lacs of rupees have been spent on Khaddar, but not only the villagers, the peasants and the labourers remain as miserable and unorganised as ever, the Congress itself,
the power house of national work is in a moribund condition. Mahatma Gandhi has even gone so far as to say that the Congress is a bogus organisation consisting of self-appointed delegates! If this huge sum of money and the energy and enthusiasm spent on the Khaddar movement had been devoted to true constructive work, to the organisation of the people into small co-operative groups or samghas to improve their condition in all possible ways according to local needs and conditions, the whole nation by this time would have throbbed with a new life and the problem of finding a sanction for Swaraj could have been easily solved. But that was not to be. Fifty lacs of rupees collected from the poor starving people of India have been wasted to satisfy a fad of "the greatest living man in the world"!

The Charka is at most one of hundreds of handicrafts practised by our people to earn a livelihood and to think that spinning has any specific power to awaken the soul or to create the spirit of Swadeshi and nationalism is pure superstition. It may shock our Khaddarites to know, nevertheless it is quite true, that
there are many spinners and weavers who supply us with pure Khadi, but themselves prefer to wear clothes made in Manchester.

But what about Bardoli? Was it not with the help of the spinning wheel, asks Mr. Nair, that Mahatma Gandhi organised the peasants of Bardoli who have saved the honour of India in the recent no-tax campaign? I hope my readers will forgive me if I indulge here in a little plain talk. We have of late heard so much about the great victory of Bardoli that people have naturally come to believe in it. But when did the fight take place at Bardoli? Both sides were preparing and surveying their own forces and their opponents; the Government gave an ultimatum, but before the date of that ultimatum expired a compromise was brought about through negotiations, in which all the demands of the Government were practically fulfilled. In no sense of the term can that compromise be called a victory for the peasants or a defeat for the Government. That the Bardoli campaign has created no impression on the Government is apparent from the fact that two more taluks in the same Presidency are again
up in arms against assessment; in one case, it is said, the tax has been raised forty per cent! In Bardoli itself the fate of the peasants is still hanging on the balance. So the less we speak of the great victory of Bardoli the better, for self-deception does good to no body.

At the same time I do not grudge in the least to render unto the brave peasants of Bardoli their due. When all over the country our politicians were ceaselessly talking, touring and lecturing and drafting and holding big congresses and conferences and processions as signs of "activism", the peasants of Bardoli courageously stood up for their rights and under the guidance of an able band of workers showed a solid front to the bureaucracy, showing the possibilities of a great mass movement in India. But what has the spinning wheel to do with all this? In the programme of constructive work drawn up for Bardoli just after the compromise, Sirder Vallabhai Patel gave prominence to the boycott of foreign cloth and the introduction of the Charka, showing thereby on the face of it that that programme has yet to be
carried out there though Bardoli has been preparing for Civil disobedience under the guidance of Mahatma Gandhi since 1920. If we free our mind of the Charka-complex and analyse the Bardoli situation in the spirit of a scientist we find that whatever success has been achieved there has been due to the facts that the peasants had a real grievance against the Government, they had able leaders and workers to mobilise and organise them for a fight, the political situation in the country was quite favourable the Government being unwilling to irritate the country for the sake of the Simon Commission, the whole country stood by Bardoli paying a subscription of more than 4½ lacs of rupees and offering every kind of help that might be required. Under similar circumstances a "Bardoli" campaign can be successfully organised everywhere without any preliminary "discipline" and "training" through the Charka.

My view will be completely borne out if we consider the three great Satyagraha campaigns undertaken in Bengal in recent times. In Midnapur the peasants refused to pay tax until the Union Boards were
abolished and they won; they did not, like the peasants of Bardoli, halt with a compromise. Patuakhali also won a real victory. At Tarakeswar the Satyagraha campaign ended in an honourable compromise, the Mohunt agreeing to abdicate, though it was most unfortunately spoilt by the shortsightedness of our own people, the Brahmin Sabha of Bengal. Yet the splendid organising power that the young men of Bengal showed at Tarakeswar was unique, and the peoples’ spirit of resistance was unconquerable. It may not be known to all that it was the organising ability shown by the workers of Bengal in the Tarakeswar campaign which really upset Lord Lytton and precipitated the Bengal ordinance which by itself has dealt a severe blow at British rule in India. In none of these great campaigns of peaceful Satyagraha was it necessary to prepare the workers or the people through the Charka and our national leaders will do well to take note of this carefully when they talk of “Bardolising” the whole country.
BOOKS BY SRI AUROBINDO

The Mother
In this book Sri Aurobindo portrays with vividness and exactness of detail the four great aspects of the Mother,—Maheshwari, Mahakali, Mahalakshmi, Mahasaraswati—four of her leading Powers and Personalities, which have stood in front, in her guidance of this Universe and in her dealings with the terrestrial play.

"In the sublimity of its thought and conception, in the perfection of its expression and the loftiness of its language the book has been a creation worthy of the master mind behind it."—The A. B. Patrika.

The Yoga and its Objects
In a most clear and impressive manner the significance of Yogic culture and the method of integral Yoga have been explained.

The Ideal of the Karmayogin
The real meaning and purpose of India's awakening—the deep and underlying forces that are shaping her destiny—the best way of serving her—the greatest of her children who would make her great.

The National Value of Art
The aesthetic, intellectual and spiritual aspects of art in relation to national life and its development have been touched upon in beautiful language.

"This brochure, we hope, will dispel the superstitious ignorance of those who deprecate art as a fashionable or luxurious and therefore a useless commodity of life."
—The Prabuddha Bharat.
BOOKS BY SRI AUROBINDO

The Renaissance in India

In four luminous chapters the author has given the real meaning and trend of the present re-awakening of India. The present renaissance is a new and decisive turn to the solution of the problems over which all mankind is labouring and stumbling.

The Brain of India

In this article the author has given an exposition of the ancient Aryan doctrine of education and character—the object of which is to indicate the nature and psychological ideas of the old system and point out its essential relation of cause and effect to the splendid achievement of our ancestors.

Kalidasa

A monograph on the characteristic build of Kalidasa's aesthetic genius and the place the great poet occupies in the evolution of India's cultural life—an exemplar of the most penetrating character study and superb literary criticism.

Rishi Bunkimchandra

The book includes among others two fine translations—one in prose and the other in verse—of that famous national anthem BANDEMATARAM.

"A noble offering of praise to the memory of Bunkimchandra Chatterjee, drawing attention not only to his intellectual virtues and great literary achievements, but also to his lofty patriotism as embodied in his writings."—The Modern Review.

Uttarpara' Speech

This speech delivered just after Sri Aurobindo's acquittal in the Alipore Bomb Case is remarkable for its revelation of the new faith and light that dawned in him as a result of the mystic spiritual experience inside the jail.
Hindu Marriage vs. Polygamy

By

K. V. S. ACHARYA,

Vakil, Rajahmundry,

Author of Mitakshara Law of Inheritance,
The Ryot and the Land (Tel.), Adverse Possession and Benami Transaction.

K.V. Srinivasachari, B.A.
First Grade Pleader,
Rajahmundry.
1929.

All rights reserved.
God grant us patience all
To read and then to call
All strength for weaker sex
Born not a male to vex.
To
HIM whose heart is lovely place
For his spouse to live and face
All the worlds with 'ternal bliss
That none may such model miss;
Each bird may live in its nest
With its one mate chosen first;

HIM who curses pests with death
By flame the malicious moth,
By the cat the ranc’rous rat,
So contank’rous cur and cat,
For with them they carry plague
That breaks husband-and-wife league;

HIM who brings round well by falls
The unscrup’lous urchins false
That know not where they leap fast,
That talk rot of things at last,
Though un’ware of head or tail,
While our women’s blessings hail,

This book is dedicated
by
The Author.
CONTENTS.

CHAP. PAGE
I. Introductory remarks on Hindu marriage ...... 1
II. Srutis vs. Polygamy ...... 6
III. Smritis vs. Polygamy ...... 15
    Later Writers ...... 19
IV. Custom vs. Polygamy ...... 26
V. Origin of the Idea of Polygamy. 35
    Judicial decisions ...... 40
VI. Present Day Evils and Remedies ...... 61
PREFACE.

The Hindu Theory that the wife is half the body of her husband or that the husband and wife form 'a united pair with one heart and one mind, free from discord' or that a Hindu marriage is a sacred religious tie and a permanent connection which is indissoluble as evidenced by the Vedic Hymns recited and the sacred vows taken by the married couple during the marriage ceremony even now, its striking contrast with the notion among the young men of the present day that a man can have any number of wives without any restriction or justification, and more than anything else, the most deplorable condition of the fair sex whose sacred union with the male sex is now treated very lightly, roused in me a curiosity to make a historical survey of the law of marriage in India in this aspect and to chalk out the lines therefrom for remedying such situation if possible. My short stay at Madras during this Summer and the facilities offered by the various Public Libraries there to the reading public favoured it and enabled me to give shape to the ideas contained in this little book.

My aim throughout has been to invite the attention of the public to the most glaring of the
PREFACE

"errors and abuses that have insidiously crept into our institution of marriage, eating into the vitals of our society and tending to our decay as a nation" and to the most legitimate material gathered from the various sources, both Divine and Human, on which our marriage law is founded and to appeal to the enlightened public for legal and proper action by way of remedying such situation; and it is for them to see how far they can accept such material and act upon it.

My thanks are due to the several learned authors to whom I have made frequent reference and to the authorities of the Public Libraries here for the facilities they have given for such reference.

TRIPLICANE,  
12th July 1929.  

THE AUTHOR.
Hindu Marriage vs. Polygamy.

CHAPTER I.

Introductory remarks on Hindu Marriage.

Our present Hindu system of marriage is unfortunately honeycombed with evils and our moral sense is so much degenerated that we are unable to recognise them as such or tempted to allow them pass for blessings to the ruin of those dearest and nearest to us. For an adequate treatment of all such evils even a good-sized volume or two will not suffice. So I propose to confine myself in this book to only one of such evils, viz., polygamy which means having more wives than one at a time and which is opposed to monogamy; for it is gradually creeping into our society without our knowing and is threatening in some cases a greater havoc on the fair sex making their position most insecure than even any of the other evils, such as child marriage, enforced widowhood, etc., which many a social reformer has been denouncing outright
for the last many years. At one stage of our society it had no existence; at another it was only a foetus with neither definite shape nor movement; then a harmless insect gradually developing into an ordinary watersnake to all appearances, now proving itself to be a venomous cobra to our society. The meaning of this can be well understood and its truth well realised by a careful study in this aspect of our law of marriage as a history from the earliest times till now.

Before entering into the subject proper let us have an idea of the Hindu system of marriage as contrasted with the other systems.

A Hindu marriage may be defined as a sacred union, for the performance of certain religious duties as husband and wife, of a male and a female of the same caste but not within the prohibited degrees of relationship, celebrated with such ceremonies as are prescribed by law or custom in the presence and with the presumed consent of the relatives and the caste people.

The Hindu marriage therefore is more a religious than a secular institution.
It is not like the English marriage which is nothing but a contract to which the husband and the wife must be consenting parties. It is generally brought about by the parents of the children who are parties to it and yet may exercise no volition at all.\(^1\) It is the last of the ten sacraments or samscaras enjoined by the Hindu religion for purifying the body from the inherited taint.\(^2\) According to the Hindu sastras a man is to marry for the purpose of procreating a son necessary for the continuation of the line of paternal ancestors and for the spiritual benefit of their and his souls.

Their Lordships of the Madras High Court summed up the features of the Hindu marriage thus:—

“There can be no doubt that a Hindu marriage is a religious ceremony. According to all the texts it is a samscara or sacrament, the only one prescribed for a woman and one of the principal religious rites prescribed for the purification of the

---

\(^1\) Purshottamdas Tribhubandas v. Purushothamdas Mangaldas, 21 Bom. 23, 30-31.
soul. It is binding for life because the marriage rite completed by saptapadi or the walking of the seven steps before the consecrated fire creates a religious tie, and a religious tie when once created, cannot be untied. It is not a mere contract in which a consenting mind is indispensable. The person married may be a minor or even of unsound mind, and yet, if the marriage rite is duly solemnised, there is a valid marriage."

This does not mean that the marriage of a lunatic of the worst type or that brought about by force or fraud is allowed by Hindu law as there can be no valid religious ceremony in either case. All that is meant by a Hindu marriage celebrated under normal conditions is that "It is a sacred religious tie and a permanent connection which is indissoluble. The texts would show that the permanency was mutual both as regards husband and wife. Chastity is enjoined on both. The wife cannot marry even after her husband's death and no divorce is recognised.

1 Venkatacharlu v. Rangacharlu, 14 Mad. 316, 318.
2 Moujital v. Chandrabati, 38 I.A. 122, 125 = 38 Cal. 700, 706 (P.C.).
3 Venkatacharlu v. Rangacharlu, 14 Mad. 316, 320.
Marriage creates an indissoluble tie between husband and wife. The idea according to the Smriti writers is that a husband must confine himself to one wife and in fact even a second marriage after the wife's death is only allowed to him (when he has issue or has performed sacrifices) more for the purpose of satisfying his pleasure or lust than as a matter of duty.”

Thus we have an idea of the Hindu system of marriage. Let us now see how far it allows polygamy or plurality of wives, to a man. For this we have to examine the sources of Hindu law on the subject, viz., (1) Srutis or Vedas, (2) Smritis and commentaries, (3) Customs and Usages, (4) Judicial decisions, and finally (5) Legislative enactments if any; for all these are supposed to make up the present Hindu law.

---

1 Mr. P. R. Ganapati Iyer’s Hindu Law Book 1 (1915), page 391.
CHAPTER II.

Srutis vs. Polygamy.

To begin with Srutis, all of us living as Hindus between the Himalayas and the Cape Comorin do almost observe the same rituals for the marriage, of course with some variations in customs; and the bridegroom and the bride do recite still the same Vedic mantras to express their sacred vows, promises, wishes and aspirations in the course of such rituals. It cannot be denied that these mantras are pregnant with many good ideas and principles meaning well and clear to a well determined mind to understand and act. These mantras also reveal the vedic or the primary laws of marriage in spite of all the changes occurred with the lapse of time and imperfectly embodied in the Smritis and Customs as suited to the times. So, the Social reformers of the present day consider these mantras to be most helpful in discovering and formulating certain principles of the
law of marriage which are deemed to be most conducive to the society with all its environments of the present day. It may be out of place here to mention some of the facts alleged to have been discovered with the help of these mantras by the social reformers, though they tend to give good stimulus and sufficient justification to many others in making similar deductions and discoveries in various other aspects of the marriage problems of the present day. Suffice it to say that the learned reformers try to establish that in the Vedic times the females had equal rights and liberties with males. How it could be or have been deduced from the mantras, it is not the province of this little pamphlet to detail. So the reader is left to do it himself and see how far it is correct.

Then coming to the subject proper, we recite the Vedic mantras in all our religious ceremonies because we consider Vedas as the Divine source of knowledge in regard to matters beyond the reach of ordinary human intellect, because they are based on an absolute truth which reveals itself to the unbiased minds of the Rishis, because
they have come down to us through a race of men possessed of vast powers of clear and piercing vision and because it is from them that we can formulate in detail our sacred or primary laws as contrasted with the secondary and the tertiary laws now in vogue among us. The Vedas being thus the primary source of all our laws, it is only when they fail us that we have to look up to the other sources of law, such as the Smritis and Customs which together constitute what is called the *Sampradaya* or tradition. That is to say, "When the practice advocated by the Smriti and the unwritten Custom conflicts with the Vedic law, the latter should be held up as authoritative in preference to the Smriti and the Custom; And where a Smriti teaches a law which cannot be discovered with ordinary human intellect and which is not opposed to the express teachings of the Veda, there only the Smriti is held as an authority in matters beyond the reach of the human intellect."

Thus we see that the Vedic ideal of marriage is to be deduced from the tenor of the *mantras* we recite as the ritual is gone through.
Now how many of the Hindus can lay their hands on their hearts and say if they have done their duties to the weaker sex and to the society by their implicit obedience to the injunctions or recommendations contained in our Divine and Sacred laws which they must be proud of and of which they are from time to time being reminded even through the mantras recited during their marriage ceremonies? I wish all may answer in the affirmative! Then, is it not our duty first to know and then respect our sacred laws which we know to have come down from Heavens to us in this Blessed land in the golden age of our ancient Aryan civilisation when almost all the other lands on the Earth were still in the most barbarous condition? And is it not our solemn duty to abide by our solemn vows and promises made at that auspicious hour of the sacred union of one sex with the other before the sacred fire where all our Gods are invoked to witness all that take place then and to bless the new-married couple with all they wish and aspire in the holy life they as a married couple will have to lead together thereafter?
To these of course, all of us would say "Aye"; and if all such "ayes" are acted up to, there can be no evil in our society, the position of the fair sex becomes quite secure and our status as a nation much elevated in the eyes of the other nations in the world.

Now let us therefore take two or three mantras which are invariably connected with the essential parts of our marriage ritual and see if they suggest monogamy as one of the Vedic ideals of marriage.

"Dharmācha Arthācha Kamācha Naaticheritavyasya-
twayāyam
Naaticheraameeti Varaha"

This is more or less a part of the dialogue between the giver of the girl and the taker (i.e., the bridegroom), recited at the preliminary stage of the marriage ceremony, viz., Kanyakādanam or the gift of the maiden girl.

The giver of the girl should say to the bridegroom: (the above sloka).

"Do not be unfaithful to this girl in the matter of religious acts, wealth and love."

---

3 Vivahaprayogaha by Narain-Bhatta 422, translated by P. Chencheila Row Pantulu.
Then the bridegroom should reply:
“I shall not be unfaithful.”

So goes the solemn assurance given by the bridegroom to the bride’s father or guardian just before “he takes her by the right hand for happiness that she may reach old age with him, her husband.”

A man is said to be faithful to his wife regarding religious acts, wealth and love, only when he does not allow any other to partake in any of them, for, if he allows another to partake in them his wife must necessarily be deprived of at least a portion of her right and enjoyment in the same, which is prohibited by the vow. That is to say he cannot take another female as his wife. Hence monogamy is the rule of the Vedic law.

Then the act of Panigrahana forms a very important part of the marriage ritual. There, the bridegroom holding the hand of the bride utters the following Mantra:—

“Grubhnaami tā suprājaastvaaya
hastammayaa patyaa jaradashtiryathaasaha
Bhago Aryamaa Savitaa Purandhi
rmahyam tva durgaahapatyaayadāvaha.”

meaning thereby,

1 Rigveda X. 85. 36 Translation quoted by A. C. Clayton in his ‘Rigveda and Vedic Religion.’
9 Taittiriya Ekagnikanda I. iii. 3.
"I seize thy hand to have a five progeny, that thou mayest live with me, thy lord, till thou shalt attain decay. The Gods—Bhaga, Aryaman, Savitri and Purandhi,—have given thee to me for householdership."

Having given solemn assurance to the bride's father or guardian the bridegroom now takes the hand of the bride and makes a solemn promise to her also in the same strain saying that he marries her with the object of having a fine progeny and of having her with him till she attains the age of decay or till her death. This means that the bride shall be the sole partner with him in all his religious acts, wealth and love till her death, as already promised, i.e., at the time of the gift. Hence this also suggests that Monogamy is the rule of the Vedic law of marriage.

Then comes the third and the most important stage without which no marriage is complete, viz., Saptapadi (The ceremony of pacing seven steps) after which the bridegroom addresses the bride thus:—

Sakhaa saptapadaa bhava,
sakhaayao saptapadaa babhoova,
sakhyam tā Gamāyam,
SRUTIS

sakhyaatam maayosham,
sakhyaanmaa maayoshtaaha
samayaava sankalpaavahai
sampriyo rochishnoosumanasyama
ishamoorjamabbi sam vasanao sam nao
maanaamsi
sam vrataa samu chithaanyaakaram

It means:—

“A friend shalt thou be, having paced these seven steps with me. Nay, having paced together the seven steps, we have become friends. May I retain thy friendship and never part from thy friendship. Let us unite together: Let us propose together. Loving each other and ever radiant in each other’s company, meaning well towards each other, sharing together all enjoyments and pleasures, let us join together our aspirations, our vows, and our thoughts.”

These words show that from the time of pacing seven steps (Sapta-padi) the relation between the bridegroom and the bride cemented them both together into “a united pair, with one heart and one mind free from discord” permanently so that

1 Taittiriya Ekagnikanda I iii. 14, cited by A. Mahadevasastri in his “Emancipation of women.”
the one is the inseparable half of the other and they coming from the heart and lip (mouth) of the bridegroom on such an important and solemn occasion, form part of his solemn vows that he will thereafter conduct himself towards the bride in the manner described therein and that he will never part from her and her friendship. Then in the *Grihapravasam* ceremony which immediately follows the marriage, that is to say on the occasion of the bride’s first entry into her husband’s house, hymns or parts of hymns are chanted full of goodwill to the wife and her authority is solemnly declared thus:

"Here now remain, nor ever part;  
Enjoy the whole expanse of life,  
With son and grandson joyous sport  
Be glad in heart within your house.  
So rule and govern in thy home  
Over thy husband’s parents both;  
His brother and his sister too,  
Are subject likewise there to thee."  

These and many other sacred *hymns* or *mantras* expressing solemn vows and promises made by the bridegroom to the bride at the time of the sacred union of

---

1 Rig Veda, X 85, 42, 46 Translation quoted by A.C. Clayton in his "Rig Veda and Vedic Religion".
the one with the other, leave neither scope nor room for any second woman to live in his heart, in his brains or anywhere else near him as wife. Hence Monogamy is the rule.¹

CHAPTER III.

Smritis vs. Polygamy.

Then coming to the age of Smritis we find that Monogamy was there also the rule though Polygamy was allowed under very special circumstances, as is evident from many texts of which some may be quoted here.

Anyonya syaavyabheechaaro bhavadaamaran-antikah
āshadharmassamaasāva jnāyah streepumsayoh-parah ²

“It means that in the matter of religious acts, wealth and love, the husband and wife shall not at all part from each other, you must all know that this is the essence of law.”

¹ Vide also Rig Vda Max Muller Vol. II Page 609 as cited by Gour.
² Manu IX. 101;
Then again we have the following:

\[ \text{Tathaanityam yatāyaataam streepumsautu krutakriyao} \]
\[ \text{yathaanaabhi cherātaamtao viyuktaavitāta-rām}^{1} \]

This means that male and female after marriage must always try not to part from each other in the matter of religious acts, wealth and love. The idea contained in the above two couplets is the same as that in the Marriage Mantra quoted in page 10 with foot-note (1). That is to say the smriti strictly follows the Veda at least in its recommendations to man to be content with one wife at a time and to marry a second only after the death of the first as seen from the following Manu and other texts.

"Having thus kindled the sacred fires and performed funeral rites to his wife who died before him; he may again marry and again light the nuptial fire."^{2}

"Special grounds such as barrenness, incurable disease, miscoduct, etc., of the wife may justify the husband to marry a second wife during her life-time and except

---

1 Manu IX. 102.
2 Manu V. 168.
for such causes the first wife cannot be superseded without her consent." ¹

But she who, though afflicted with illness is beloved and virtuous must never be disgraced though she may be superseded by another wife with her own consent. ²

"Supersession of the wife which is Adhivedana in Sanscrit means, as explained in Mitakshara and the Subodhini, merely the contracting of a second marriage while the first wife lives; and it does not imply that the first wife is actually forsaken or that her place is taken by the second, in respect of any matter except perhaps the husband's affection." ³

Illegal Supersession is, according to Sir Thomas Strange, the abandoning with a view to marry another, a blameless wife who has given neither cause nor assent.⁴

Such consent on the part of the husband is, by some texts, treated as a crime and made punishable too; Thus:—

¹ Manu IX. 77-82; Apastamba II., V., II. 12-13 as quoted by Mayne Colebrooke's Digest Book IV 62-70.
² Colebrooke's Digest Book IV, page 73 (Manu).
³ Mitakshara Chapter II. Sec. XI., 2 (note) and 35; Colebrooke's Digest Book IV, 71-72 Commentary.
Narada says that a husband who abandons an affectionate wife or her who speaks not harshly, who is sensible, constant and fruitful shall be brought to his duty (senses) by the King with a severe chastisement.¹

Vishnu says that the man who deserts a faultless wife, shall suffer the same punishment;² and

Devala says that no atonement is ordained for that man who forsakes his own wife, through delusion of mind, deserting her illegally nor for him who forsakes a virtuous son.³

There are other texts which condemn and treat with utmost contempt the second marriage of a man from whatever cause while his first wife is alive; Thus:—

Daksha says: “The first is the wife married from a sense of duty; the second promotes sensual gratification; sensible, not moral effects proceed from her.” That is to say the others are regarded as married from sensual motives.⁴

¹ Colebrooke's Digest (translation) of Hindu Law Book IV Chap I, page 59
² Ib., page 60.
³ Ib., page 60.
⁴ Colebrooke's Digest Book IV, 51.
Manu is also of the same opinion. “With sorrow” says Daksha feelingly “does he eat who has two contentious wives; dissension, mutual enmity, meanness and pain distract his mind.”

These and many other ancient and quasi-ancient texts go to prove beyond all doubt that monogamy is the general rule of the Hindu Law of marriage and polygamy is only an exception.

Also learned writers of great authority on Hindu Law have from time to time, understood the rule to be monogamy and have not countenanced polygamy except in cases of absolute necessity when the first wife herself would be inclined to give her assent to her husband’s second marriage. I think it is not out of place to mention at least some of such great men.

Later Writers.

As Gooroodas Banerjee\(^3\) Points out Macnaughten\(^4\), Strange\(^5\) and Shamcharan\(^6\) consider Polygamy prohibited except for allowable reasons.

---

\(^1\) Manu III, 12, 13.
\(^2\) Colebrooke's Digest, Book IV, 55.
\(^4\) Principles of Hindu Law, 58.
\(^5\) His Hindu Law, Vol. I, 52.
\(^6\) Vyavastha Darpana, 672.
Banerjee himself remarks thus: "In monogamy the strength of the marriage tie is greater and the amelioration of the condition of women. During the earlier or militant stage of social progress when there is greater mortality among men, Polygamy may be necessary and may even prove beneficial as a better means of maintaining the population than monogamy. But as the society settles into a peaceful condition and the numerical inequality between males and females becomes less and less, monogamy becomes a social necessity. And hence even in countries where polygamy is legal, its extent is practically small" ¹. Then he quotes some ancient texts that condemn polygamy and comes to the conclusion that a Hindu husband is permitted to marry again during the life-time of his wife only if there be just cause for such marriage such as barrenness, ill-health, ill-temper, and misconduct of the wife.²

Sir Thomas Strange quotes the texts that would punish the illegal supersession of a faultless wife as a crime such as theft, etc., and

¹ Banerjee's Hindu Law of Marriage and Stridhan (2nd Edit), page 26.
² Ib., page 128.
those that condemn outright the second marriage of a man while the first wife is alive; he quotes for example the texts of Narada, Vishnu, and Daksha, etc., which we have already considered herein.\(^1\) Then he draws his own inference from such texts that a man is not competent to marry a second wife at his mere pleasure when his first wife is alive and that there must be either a justifiable cause for a second marriage such as barrenness, incurable disease, etc., of the first wife, or, the first wife's assent which, on the principle of \textit{volenti non fit injuria}, supplies the want of a justifiable cause.\(^2\)

John D. Mayne in his treatise on Hindu Law and Usage examines the topic in detail thus\(^3\):

"The efficacy of the marriage tie, as binding either party to the transaction, is a matter upon which there has been a considerable change in the Hindu Law, while its earlier stage was evidently in accordance with usages which we find

\(^1\) \textit{Vide} ante.
\(^2\) Strange's Hindu Law, pages 40-43.
\(^3\) Mayne's Hindu Law. 9th Edition, page 111."
at present existing among the non-Aryan races. Among the Khands "So long as a woman remains true to her husband, he cannot contract a second marriage or even keep a concubine, without her permission." ¹ The same rule prevails among the caste of musicians in Ahmedabad and in the Vadanagara Nager caste,² and seems, from the evidence of the Thesawaleme, to have been in force among the Tamil emigrants into Ceylon.³ The Pondicherry Courts, upon the advice of their consultative committee, have decided so lately as 1893, that the husband cannot without the consent of the first wife take a second, unless the first is suffering from some incurable disease, or has failed to produce male offspring. A wife who is barren may be replaced after eight years; one whose children are dead after ten years; and one who has only given birth to females after eleven years. A second marriage, contracted otherwise than under the above conditions, may be annulled at the instance of the first wife, and when annulled neither the second

¹ Hunter's Orrissa II, 84.
² Mandlik's Hindu Law, page 406.
³ Thesawaleme I, para II.
wife, nor her children can inherit. These decisions appear to have been given on the authority of Manu and other native writers, as well as upon actual Usage. They accord with the observations of the Abbe Dubois: he says that Polygamy was tolerated among persons of high rank; though even among them it was looked upon as an infraction of Law and Custom, in fact an abuse." 

Golapchendra Sarkar Sastri observes that Hindu Law "recommends Monogamy as the best form of conjugal life. This recommendation has practically been adopted by the Hindus and Monogamy is the general rule, though there are solitary instances of polygamy."

Even these solitary instances may be the sorry instances in which the first wife is barren or is suffering from some incurable disease or has, for some such reason, given her assent to the second marriage,

V. N. Mandlik observes:—"Manu contemplates polygamy as an exception. Usage has however converted this exception into an

1 Sorg H. L. 51.
2 Dubois 210 (vide also under Custom post.)
ordinary practice which however has not entered into some castes. Thus in the Vadanagara Nagar caste, I understand a man cannot marry a second wife if his first wife be living. If he does, social excommunication follows and so far as his caste is concerned, he is civilly dead.” ¹

Arthur Steele describing the Law and Custom of Hindu castes within the Dekhan remarks thus:

“Marriages in succession in consequence of the death of a former wife are very common but polygamy is not usual except on account of barrenness, etc., of the first wife.” ²

“The consent of the elder wife is, however, essential and is as it were purchased by giving her a present.” ³

Mr. P. R. Ganapati Iyer a learned advocate of the Madras High Court and one of the most learned authors writes in his Hindu Law thus:

“It (marriage) is a sacred religious tie and a permanent connection which is

---

¹ Mandlik's Hindu Law (1880), page 406.
³ ib. page 30.
indissoluble. The texts would show that the permanency was mutual both as regards husband and wife. Chastity is enjoined on both."

"The idea according to the Smriti writers is that a husband must confine himself to one wife and in fact even a second marriage after the first wife's death is only allowed to him (when he has issue and has performed sacrifices) more for the purpose of satisfying his pleasure or lust than as matter of duty."

"Some Smritis allow the husband to take a second wife (during the lifetime of the first) only under exceptional circumstances. Yagnavalkya declares a certain punishment in case a person marries when there are no exceptional circumstances." ¹

There are many more authors who repeat the same idea from the Srutis and the Smritis as the ideal of the Hindu marriage; That is to say almost all the authors are agreed in deducing from the Srutis and the Smritis the same principles of the Hindu Law of marriage, viz.,

¹ Mr. P. R Ganapati Iyer's Hindu Law Book I (1915), page 391.
(1) A Hindu husband must confine himself to one wife i.e. Manogamy is the general rule.

(2) He is allowed to take a second wife during the life time of the first only under the exceptional circumstances such as barrenness, incurable disease, and misconduct, etc., of the first wife and except in the case of misconduct, with the consent of the first wife only.

Now let us see how far these principles were acted up to by the Hindus of various castes and localities. For this purpose we have to study their customs, usages, and manners, etc., regarding the topic in question at any period.

---

CHAPTER IV.

---

Custom vs. Polygamy.

In this connection the name of Abbe J. Dubois the famous author of "Hindu Manners, Customs and ceremonies" is worthy of mention. He was a famous French missionary
belonging to the eighteenth century school and thrived before Colebrooke and other later European scholars in India. He collected carefully and correctly all the information on Hindu manners, customs and ceremonies during his long stay of more than thirty years here and wrote a book on the same in or about the year 1820 A.D. as its translation by Henry K. Beauchamp shows.

Right Hon’ble F. Max Muller in his preface to the book observes: “As a trustworthy authority on the state of India from 1793 to 1823, the Abbe Dubois’ work will always retain its value and in its final and complete form now offered to the public it will be welcome not only to the Sanskrit scholars but to all who take an intelligent interest in that wonderful country. As the Abbe went to India as a missionary and was a man remarkably free from theological prejudices, missionaries in particular will read his volume with interest and real advantage.” So his book is presumed to contain the most exhaustive and correct information regarding the topics dealt with therein and is very often quoted as a high autho-
Such as he was, dealing with the marriage customs in India he observes 1:—
"Polygamy is tolerated among persons of high rank such as Rajas, princes, statesmen and others... None the less this plurality of wives amongst the great is looked upon as an infraction of law and custom, in fact, as an abuse. But in every country in the world those in power have always been able to twist the law in their own favour, however definitely it may be laid down.

The principal Hindu Gods had only one wife. Brahma had only Saraswati, Vishnu, Lakshmi; and Siva, Parvati. It is quite true that under their different forms these venerable personages committed frequent breaches of their marriage vow; but this only serves to prove that from the earliest times marriage was looked upon by the Hindus as a legal union between two persons of opposite sexes."

"If in the present day any person of inferior rank cohabits with several women one only bears the name and title of wife;"

1 "Hindu Manners, Customs and Ceremonies" by Abbe Dubois, pages 210-211.
the others are merely concubines. In several castes the children of the latter are illegitimate, and if the father dies without having previously settled some of his property upon them, they have no share when it comes to be divided.

"I only know of one case in which a man can legally marry a second wife, his first wife being still alive; and that is when after he has lived for a long time with his wife, she is certified to be barren, or if she has only borne female children; for in the latter case the debt to one’s ancestors that is to say, the birth of a son, is considered to have been imperfectly paid. But even in this case, before a man contracts a second marriage it is necessary that he should obtain the consent of the first; and she is always regarded as the chief wife and retains all her prerogatives."

The same author observes at another place thus:¹ —

"The indissolubility of the marriage tie is also an essential principle which it seems to me, is not less firmly established amongst the Hindus than that which

¹ Hindu Manners, Customs and Ceremonies, page 214.
limits this important act to the legal union of one man with one woman. A Hindu can only put away his legitimate wife for one cause, and that is adultery. If this rule is violated it is only among the most degraded of the lower castes. A marriage can also be annulled if it has been contracted in violation of the prohibited degrees which are laid down by custom, and which of themselves are sufficient to nullify the union.

"I have never yet heard of a divorce being permitted on account of incompatibility of temper, nor have I ever heard of a man being allowed to put away his wife, however vicious she might be, simply in order to marry another woman. Hindus as I shall presently show, put too serious a value on this solemn contract to allow it to be thus degraded to a state which would be nothing more or less than concubinage."

From what has been said above, the following principles might be deduced:—

(1) The Hindus, at any rate those living at the time of Dubois looked upon polygamy even among the great as an
infractio of law and custom, in fact as an abuse;

(2) A man was allowed to marry a second wife, his first wife being still alive, when, after he had lived for a long time with his first wife, she was certified to be barren or if she had only borne female children;

(3) Even in the latter case, before a man could contract a second marriage, it was necessary that he should obtain the consent of the first who was always regarded as the chief wife and retained all her prerogatives;

(4) No man was allowed to put away his wife either on account of incompatibility of temper or simply to marry another woman;

(5) It was a firmly established and essential principle among the Hindus of the time that the marriage was limited to the legal union of one man with one woman and that the marriage tie was indissoluble;

(6) If at that time, any person of inferior rank (i.e., a person other than a rajah,
a prince, or a statesman, etc.) cohabits with several women, only one bears the name and title of wife; the others are merely concubines;

(7) In several castes the children of the latter were illegitimate (i.e., the children of those women other than the first wife).

Such were the principles deduced from the customs prevailing at the time regarding the relations between the husband and the wife; and it may be said that the same trend of custom continued throughout as seen from the Census reports of India.

J. A. Baines, Esq., F.S.S. and I.C.S. in his Census report of India 1891 submits 1:

"Not to go beyond very general topics, we find in the returns comparatively little that is new on the subject of polygamy, save that it is almost entirely restricted to the richer members of the mussalman community, on the one hand, and to the sundry hill tribes of the

---

central Belt and the North-East Frontier on the other. The extent to which it exists among the Brahmin sections of the people must be very slight, though we are aware of the fact of its legality, and know that cases are not rare in which a second wife has had to be introduced into the family circle owing to the failure of an heir by the first. Taking the whole of India without Burma, there are seven in every thousand Benedicts who have more than one wife."

It may be safely presumed that even such few cases must have arisen from justifying causes referred to already.

William Crooke, Esq., of the Bengal Civil Service in his "Things Indian" (1906) says that, so far from being a polygamous people, the natives of India with a few exceptions, practise monogamy and in support of his statement quotes the Census Report of India (1901) thus:

"In practice, except among Muhammedans, a second wife is very rarely taken unless the first wife is barren, or suffers from some incurable disease; even then,"

3
in the case of Hindus, a man has frequently to obtain the consent of his caste Punchayats (or tribe council) and occasionally that of his first spouse also........

Then, E. A. Gait, Esq., C.S.I., C.I.E., I.C.S., in his Census Report of India (1911) observes:

"..........most castes (Hindus) object to their members having more than one wife, except for special reasons, such as the failure of the first wife to bear a son or her affliction with some incurable disease or infirmity. In such cases the consent of the caste Punchayat must generally be obtained before a man marries again. Sometimes a second wife may be taken only with the consent of the first. In such cases the second wife is often the younger sister of the first.........The Nambudri Brahmins are polygamous, as the eldest son alone is allowed to marry and unless he took several wives many of the girls would perforce remain unwed...."

These reports consider the Kunnuvans and the Kaikolans of Madras and Kulins of Bengal to be exceptionally polygamous sects for reasons of their own
like the Nambudri Brahmins above mentioned.

Thus we see that the Srutis, the Smritis, the Commentaries, the recent works of the learned Lawyers and the Hindu Customs or the Usages all these go together to establish the general and the main principle of the Hindu Law of marriage, viz., a second marriage is only allowed to a man after the death of his former wife and special grounds such as barrenness, etc., of the first wife and especially her consent may however justify a husband to take a second wife during the life-time of the first so that the Hindu marriage is more a monogamous than a polygamous one.

---

CHAPTER V.


Then the next question is how and when did the idea of polygamy creep and begin to work among the Hindus against the spirit of the Hindu Law. For the
purpose of the second marriage of a man, what is dissolution of the first marriage or divorce to the Western and other nations where marriage is only a civil contract, justifying causes such as barrenness, etc., and the consent of the first wife is to the Hindus where marriage is a religious sacrament and as such cannot be dissolved. The difference lies in the fact that in the one there is complete separation between the husband and his former wife who shall have to seek another husband for protection if necessary, whereas in the other the former wife continues still to be her husband's wife along with the second or the next wife and is still entitled to his protection except in the rare case of unchastity. Such a system of marriage where a man is allowed to have thus more than one wife for any justifying cause or any religious necessity only, keeping at the same time the relation between the husband and his former wife in tact without the necessity of her being left to her fate in the streets, is not polygamy at any rate in the Hindu sense of the word; for, in cases other than adultery such as barrenness, etc., of the first wife, the
ORIGIN OF THE IDEA OF POLYGAMY

motive for having more than one wife being a religious and a sacred one to attain salvation through their would-be-born son or putra and through the religious rites to be performed jointly thereafter, they are considered together to be one wife with one mind and object; and in the case of adultery of the first wife, she is considered to be dead for all purposes to the husband. Hence an institution of marriage which allows a man to have more than one wife under certain justifying circumstances is, to a Hindu, strictly monogamous though, to a Christian it is polygamous. It is only that system of marriage that is polygamy according to the Hindu mind, in which a man is allowed to have any number of wives simultaneously at his will and pleasure for the mere gratification of his senses or lust without any restriction whatever and without any religious or other justifying cause or motive. The distinction is, of course, very subtle and cannot be easily understood by a person belonging to a nation whose idea of polygamy is simply having more than one wife at a time from whatever cause legitimate or illegitimate,
religious or sensual. For instance, the Christian nations of the Western count­ries know no such subtlety as the Hindus. Their conception of marriage is that it is a civil contract between one man and woman to live together as husband and wife for secular and sensual purposes until divorce or death of either of them; and if during the life-time of the first wife a man takes a second wife from whatever cause without the divorce or the dissolution of the marriage of the first wife he is even criminally liable for Bigamy or Polygamy. Their law excuses neither justification nor necessity nor perhaps even the consent on the part of the first wife for taking a second wife; for on such or other good grounds, one can easily obtain a decree for the divorce or for the dissolution of the first marriage and thus a sanction for the second marriage, before he can actually marry another wife. Whereas Hindu Law knows no such divorce or dissolution because a Hindu marriage is a sacred, permanent and indissoluble tie between husband and wife and hence allows the second marriage of a man as an exception only when there are sufficient and valid
ground evidenced specially from the consent of the first or former wife for the same. Though such an exception does not according to the spirit of the Hindu Law, come under the category of Bigamy or Polygamy, a European Christian cannot but naturally treat the same as one coming under it. Then, again, there are a few cases of great men as exceptions such as rajahs, princes and statesmen, etc., already referred to, who, for some political reason or other, were allowed to make more than one marriage-alliance at a time though even amongst them plurality of wives was looked upon as an infraction of law, and custom and even as an abuse, and the first wife alone was treated as the wife or Patni for the purpose of the religious rites and succession. All such exceptions among the Hindus together with the clear cases of polygamy restricted to the richer members of the Mussalman community and to some hill tribes and lower castes such as tank-diggers, the potters, the barbers and the pariahs, come up to, according to the statistical reports, six or seven in every
thousand benedicts; and it is such rare exceptions among the Hindus that prejudiced the minds of the British Judges and acquired for India and Hindu marriage, quite against the spirit of the Hindu Law the unsastratc names of “polygamous country” and “Polygamous Marriage” through the judicial pronouncements of the British courts.

Now let us examine one or two such leading cases as are now being quoted often as authority on the subject and as are at the same time considered to be the root cause of some matrimonial troubles among the Hindus of the present day. The first case, Vira-sami Chetty v. Appasami Chetty arose in or about the year 1862 and was reported in the Madras High Court Reports, Vol. I, page 375. The facts of the case may be briefly stated thus: The plaintiff lent monies to the defendant’s wife for her maintenance and for enabling her to prosecute a suit against the defendant for her maintenance when she was living separate from him as he had married another wife. The main point in issue was

\[1\] Census Report of India 1891 by J. A. Baines, page 254.
whether the first wife had any authority to bind her husband for the debts so incurred by her. The essential part of the judgment of the Chief Justice Scotland, runs thus at page 378:—“According to Hindu Law and Usage it seems clear that whatever may be thought of the morality of the step amongst Hindus, polygamy is permitted and that it is competent to a Hindu to have several wives. How many wives as Sir Thomas Strange observes in his Hindu Law, Vol. I, page 56, it is competent for him to have at one and the same time does not appear. The prohibition which is to be found directed against the plurality of wives save under certain justifying circumstances, such as the first wife’s infidelity, bad temper, barrenness, or production only of daughters, appears to be treated, like so many other rules of Hindu Law, as merely directory and not imperative. If then in the present case it was permitted for the defendant to supersede his first wife by taking another wife to live with him—and this was the sole reason for refusing to live with him—his doing so did not, according to the Hindu Law, justify his wife in separating herself and
remaining apart from him of her own free will, and could not without more give her implied authority as his agent to bind him for debts incurred for necessaries.”

Evidently this decision is more or less based on Sir Thomas Strange’s observation in his Hindu Law (Vol. I, page 56); but no stretch of imagination can reconcile it with the texts quoted, observations made and inferences drawn by himself at pages 52-55 and 59 (i.e. pages 40 to 43 and 47 of the 5th edition) of the same book. For instance at page 40 of the 5th edition (52 old edition) he observes: “It remains to consider the doctrine of supersession; by virtue of which though the woman can marry but once—to the man a plurality of wives at the same time is competent; though not at his mere pleasure—the attempt, which is justifiable in some instances, in others only admissible, being where it can neither be justified or tolerated, illegal.”

To the word ‘competent’ in the above a footnote is added thus: “To this practice the Hindus have begun to see serious objection, and a large body of influential members of the community in Bengal

1 I M.H.C. 375, 378.
have petitioned the Governor-General of India's Council for making laws for an enactment to suppress it in future."

This clearly shows that Hindus have serious objection even to such rare and perhaps such exceptional cases of a man having more than one wife. Then at page 41 (53 old edition) he mentions grounds that justify a man to marry a second wife during the life-time of the first and infers from various passages that upon the principle of *volenti non fit injuria*, the first wife's assent supplies the want of a justifiable cause. At page 42, 43 (54, 55 old edition) he quotes several texts which prohibit illegal supersession and prove beyond doubt that the second marriage of a man during the life-time of the first wife without justifiable cause is entirely against the spirit of the Hindu Law. For instance he observes: "Illegal supersession is the abandoning with a view to another, a blameless and an efficient wife, who has given neither cause nor assent;—a conduct, for which the husband (says Narada) shall be brought to his senses by the king with a severe chastisement; the same doctrine being held by Vishnu, the Smriti
Chendrika and other authorities...........

Then again at page 47 (59 old edition) he observes:

"For the law of polygamy of which the practice is so familiar among the Hindus it admits of less comparison. Not prohibited merely, the thing is with us a crime, punishable as a felony; and, even among the Hindus it appears to be sanctioned with considerable reserve, principally where the failure of the legitimate issue (with them the indispensable end of marriage) seems otherwise, upon reasonable grounds to be apprehended." It is difficult to understand how the prohibition directed thus against a plurality of wives save under certain justifying circumstances appears to be treated as merely directory and not imperative. The Chief Justice seems to be so much perjudiced against the Hindus in the above decision that he expects them to permit anything "whatever may be thought of its morality amongst them." So he considers that polygamy is permitted and that it is competent to a Hindu to have several wives, perhaps even without justifying reasons in spite of the many and strong
prohibitions contained in their sacred texts. The reason for such of his uncharitable view of the Hindu marriage must have been the fact that his attention has not been invited to the various sacred texts of the Hindus on the subject—not even to those quoted and observation made by Sir Thomas Strange in his Hindu Law at pages 40 to 43 and 47 (52 to 55 and 59 old edition). Moreover the question “whether polygamy in its wider sense, that is without any restriction or justification whatever is permitted among the Hindus” is not directly in issue in the case and therefore it is no wonder that, one Chief Justice (Scotland, C. J.) relies on and accepts as authority for his view the stray observations of another Chief Justice (Sir Thomas Strange, C.J.) in his Hindu Law, Vol. I at page 56, to which alone perhaps the parties were content to invite his Lordship’s attention.

Such is one of the decisions on which much reliance is now placed for the point whether polygamy in its wider sense, that is without any restriction or justification whatever, is permitted among the Hindus.
Then coming to the next we have the case of *Thapita Peter v. Thapita Lakshmi* reported in the Indian Law Reports, Madras Series, Vol. 17, page 235. The facts of the case are these: The petitioner and his wife married according to the rites of the Hindu religion. The wife subsequently left her husband and lived in adultery with another man. Both the husband and wife subsequently became Christians, but the wife continued to live in adultery. The husband sued under Act IV of 1869 for the dissolution of the marriage.

Held, that having regard to section 7, the marriages contemplated by the Act are those founded on Christian principles of a union of one man and one woman to the exclusion of others, and that consequently the Act does not contemplate relief in cases where the parties have been married under the rites of Hindu law, a *Hindu marriage not being a monogamous one.*

Here the real point in issue is 'whether the Act IV of 1869 is applicable to a Hindu marriage.' If the marriage is not a monogamous one according to the Chris-

---

1 17 Mad. 235, 239.
tian sense of the word, that is to say, 'if the marriage does not possess the character of exclusiveness which the law of Christendom presupposes in the institution of marriage,' the Act is not applicable. The Act excludes even that system of marriage which allows a man to take a second wife only for justifying reasons; for, even such a marriage is understood as polygamous and not a monogamous one in Christendom. Hence there was no necessity for any decision in this case on several knotty questions of Hindu marriage the decision on which alone determines its true character. But Justice Muthusami Iyer simply remarks as an obiter dicta thus at page 239: "But the Hindu husband may marry several wives at one and the same time or may marry two or more wives during the life-time of the first wife". He does not say when and under what circumstances a Hindu husband can do so because, for the purpose of this decision, he need not go deep into the question and discuss about it any further.

Now let us suppose the case of a man having three daughters A, B and
C. A is fit for marital purposes whereas B and C are, owing to some congenital defects, are unfit for the same. It is a well known principle of Hindu law that marriage sacrament or samscara is compulsory for every woman for purifying the body from inherited taint, just like Upanayanam or the initiation by investiture with the sacred thread in the case of males and that therefore each and every woman whether fit or unfit for marital purposes shall be married. So B and C also must be married to somebody. Then within the meaning of Mr. Justice Muthusami Iyer's obiter dictum above cited a man X may marry A, B and C at one and the same time or he may marry one of them first and then during her life-time may marry others. This is a clear case of polygamy according to the view of the Christendom and is excluded from the operation of the Act IV of 1869; and there ends the purpose of his lordship's reasoning in his judgment. But according to the Hindu ideal, the marriage of X with either B or C is as valid and as indissoluble as that with A. But it serves no purpose to X, for, B and C being disqualified
for marital purposes cannot bear children to him nor can they partake in religious rites. Their existence as wives to X is something like that of a man's issue disqualified for inheritance owing to some congenital defects. So B and C are civilly and religiously dead to X. He had to marry them simply to save them from the sin of remaining unmarried and thus with the inherited taint; He had to marry A to serve his purpose both religious and secular, as an ordinary wife so that X had good and valid reasons justifying his marriage with A, B and C. In any view of the case therefore it cannot be polygamy if viewed with the Hindu eye. It cannot be said that Justice Muthusami Iyer had overlooked the fact that various Srutis, Smritis and a majority of other texts strictly prohibit a man from taking a second wife during the life-time of the first without justifying causes such as barrenness, etc., when he said that a Hindu husband might marry several wives. All that we say is that he has taken only such data from Hindu law as he thought necessary for his decision in that case. But such an in-
complete statement of law sometimes gives rise to many doubts, misunderstandings and unnecessary controversies among the people and then to the unhealthy and undesirable changes in the law itself. So the two decisions discussed above, viz., 1 M.H.C. 375 and 17 Mad. 235 could work a good deal in this direction and could change the trend of the marriage law to a certain extent. An equivocal or ambiguous passage in a text or the decision of a Court must be critically viewed in the light of well-known Srutis, Smritis, and other texts of Hindu Law or Usage common to all Hindus before it is taken as an authority on any point. Here without any such critical examination the above two decisions are simply held as the authorities for the proposition that Hindu marriage is a polygamous one, and that a Hindu can have any number of wives at the same time without any restriction and without any justification though these questions were neither directly in issue nor judicially tried and decided therein. For instance:

(1) John D. Mayne, after deriving and establishing the main principle
of the marriage law from the Sanscrit texts that a Hindu husband cannot take a second wife during the life-time of the first without her consent and without justifying grounds and that if he does so, the subsequent wives are considered as merely a superior class of concubines like the handmaids of the Jewish patriarchs, ultimately states in his learned book of Hindu Law and Usage thus: 1 "It is now quite settled in the courts of British India that a Hindu is absolutely without restriction as to the number of his wives and may marry again without his wife's consent or any justification except his own wish"; and quotes as main authority for such a statement the first case already discussed, viz., Viraswami Chetty v. Appaswami Chetty 1 M.H.C. 375.

(2) Colapchandra Sarkar Sastri observes in his learned book 2: "The Hindu law permits a man to have more wives than one at the same time although it recommends monogamy as the best form of conjugal life. This recommendation has practically been adopted by the Hindus.

---

and Monogamy is the general rule, though there are solitary instances of polygamy;" and for his statement that "Hindu law permits a man to have more wives than one at the same time", he quotes one decision and that is the last already discussed, viz., Thapati Peter v. Thapati Lakshmi, 17 Mad. 235. Others followed suit and the Hindu law on this subject is thus most unintentionally represented to be what it was not more than half a century ago. Yet most of the Hindus retain still their respect to their ancient laws and customs by practically and scrupulously adopting the rules contained therein regarding the second marriage of a man during the life-time of the first; for they know that any change is and will be for the worse. Thus a man is allowed to have more wives than one only under special circumstances or justifying causes such as barrenness, etc., referred to in the Sanscrit texts and with the consent of the first or the former wife, and any attempt to break this rule and to have more wives than one for mere luxury or lust without any such justifying causes and the consent of the first or former
wife is greatly condemned as immoral and irreligious by most of the Hindu communities. This does not mean that the subsequent decisions of the British Courts discussed above could not bring about any change even in the mentality of any Hindu. Surely they have wrought out many evils in the society as we shall see in the next chapter. For the present let us be content with the fact that no Hindu of ordinary means and habits with any amount of decency and civilisation has ever attempted with success to have more wives than one without any justifying cause and without the consent of his former wife.

There may be rare exceptions in extraordinarily great men such as Rajahs, princes, and other ruling chiefs, etc., where the custom of marrying more than one wife originated in political reasons for maintaining peace in their kingdom by making marriage alliances with the neighbouring chiefs, which gradually changed itself to luxury when the political necessity is no longer present.

There may be such exceptions in the hill-tribes and in the labour classes such
as tank diggers, potters, pariahs, etc., where a large number of members in a family is pride and wealth to its head. Then again we have a very sad picture of such exceptions among the Kulin Brahmins in Bengal. A few words about the same may not be out of place here; for it enables us to perceive the cruelty or the absurdity of a practice which has its origin perhaps in the text of Dayabhaga of Jimutavahana which is applicable only to that province and the misunderstanding or the misinterpretation of which alone is perhaps responsible for facilitating its spreading there. The text runs thus:

"Wives must be espoused. Women of like class are preferable for all persons." This is stated as principal rule. The succeeding one follows:

"Four wives of a Brahman are allowed in the direct order; three of a kshatriya, two of a vaisya, and one of a sudra."

The numbers here stated "four", etc., are intended to refer to the tribes. In order to understand such a solitary text

---

1 Dayabhaga of Jimutavahana, Chapter IX. 5
2 ib. Chapter IX. 6
rightly it must be interpreted in the light of the majority of other sacred texts. Then the above text of Jimutavahana does not mean that a Brahman may have any number of wives at the same time without any restriction or justification whatever; but it means that if a Brahmin is justified in having more wives than one, he may have them in the manner described therein; so is the case with a Kshatriya and so on. That is how Sir Thomas Strange, having quoted the same\(^1\) seems to have construed it as evident from his final conclusions on the subject thus “.........and even among the Hindus it (polygamy) appears to be sanctioned with considerable reserve, principally where the failure of the legitimate issue (with them the indispensable end of marriage) seems otherwise, upon reasonable grounds, to be apprehended.”\(^3\)

But, if such a solitary text is construed independently of others, it may mean anything and the result also may be anything; that is to say a superficial interpretation of such a text may lead to bad results. So, whatever may be the reasons, the practice of having any

\(^{1}\) Strange’s Hindu Law, page 56. foot-note.
\(^{2}\) Strange’s Hindu Law, page 59.
number of wives without any restriction or justification is nowhere except in Bengal a serious evil. Rao Bahadur R. N. Mudholkar, B.A., LL.B., in his paper on "Marriage reform among the Hindus" observes: "The number of men with more than one wife is in the other parts of India very small. But in Bengal among the Kulin Brahmans its extent and magnitude are even now shocking. Twenty, thirty, forty, sixty, eighty and even hundred women married to one man who seldom sees the majority of them for years as they are left to pine at their paternal houses by the husband who exacted payment of large sums for descending to marry and whose few and far between visits can only be obtained by the inducements of fresh presents for every such visit, ought to be a matter of great regret and humiliation to any civilised people."¹ This is one view.

Dr. R. G. Bhandarkar, Ph. D., C.I.E., in his paper on "Social reform and the programme of the Madras Hindu Social Reform Association" observes: "Thus

¹ Indian Social Reform, edited by C. Y. Chintamani, Part IV, page 224.
the later practices of the female infanticide and Kulin marriage in Bengal must have been due to the feeling natural in parents to marry their daughters into a respectable family. But it is not everybody that can get a husband for his daughter in a rich or respectable family, and to marry her to a man in a lower condition of life or belonging to a low family was considered disgraceful, and rather than suffer such a disgrace, the Rajputs destroyed their female infants, and the Bengali brahmins gave their daughters to a man even though he had wives already; and he came to have a number of them often so many as 125.” ¹ This is another view. Whatever may be the reasons which induced the Kulins to back up such an unhealthy and absurd custom, the fact is there that they allow a man to have more than 100 wives at a time. But it is said that they too have begun to perceive the absurdity of the practice and attempts are being made to put it down as far as possible and to obtain its prohibition finally by law. Now, it is a well known

fact that India is a vast country containing many provinces and large populations of different castes or creeds adopting different laws and customs. If in such a country, a practice however absurd it may be, prevails in a single caste existing in a remote corner of the country, are we to suppose that it prevails all over India? If, during the great famine in China, a small minority of the poor had once to live on human flesh, are we to think that Asia is a continent of cannibals?

Again if one unscrupulous Hindu for reasons not known even to himself offers his daughter in marriage to another Hindu having already a wife even without caring to know the truth or otherwise of the justification, if any, put forward by him, and yet shamelessly ventures to call a third Hindu who objects to his hasty step, an unscrupulous man, are we to regard all Hindus as unscrupulous polygamists and India a polygamous country? Certainly not.

On the other hand it may be said of India with all the pride of the Hindus that it advocates and adheres to such a
system of marriage as is most conducive to the well-being of both the sexes and as is found perhaps no where else on the globe. It enjoins that the husband must be faithful to his wife in the matter of love, wealth and religious rites and that he must confine himself to one wife; Chastity is enjoined on both; it allows no dissolution or divorce since the marriage tie is mutually permanent and indissoluble; Marriage is compulsory to all women whether qualified or disqualified so that each of such helpless women as the deaf, the dumb, the blind, the lame or the like may be quite safe under the care and protection of a man throughout life; without the necessity of dissolution of the marriage or divorce of the first wife which may leave such a disqualified or helpless wife to her fate in the streets, a provision is made to enable the husband to marry another wife during the life time of the former wife for only justifying causes when the latter will generally be most willing to give her consent also to such marriage; a woman having once become the wife of a man is entitled to his protection under his roof till her death except in
the rare case of adultery on her part or conversion from religion; So also a man having once become the husband of a woman is entitled to her custody except in the case of his cruel treatment, contagious and virulent disease or conversion from religion or the like; In short husband and wife are to be considered as two halves of the same body under the ordinary conditions, 'a united pair, with one heart and one mind, free from discord.' Into such a healthy, convenient and religiously monogamous system of Hindu marriage, an innovation of tyrannous and out and out polygamy is sought to be introduced though involuntarily through the misconstruction of our sacred texts by the British Courts, thus making the position of Hindu women most insecure and disastrous. How it is and what the remedies are, are the subjects for the next chapter.
CHAPTER VI.

Present Day Evils and Remedies.

We have seen that the chief sources of our Hindu Law such as the Srutis, the Smritis, the commentaries and the other sacred texts and also customs enjoin that monogamy shall be the rule of our marriage law, that a Hindu shall confine himself to one wife under normal conditions of marital life, that he can have more wives than one at a time only under special circumstances for certain justifying causes such as barrenness, etc., and with the consent of the first or former wife, and that the last case is not even considered as one of polygamy by the Hindus as no evils of the same result from it and as all such wives except one being barren or otherwise disqualified are considered as one with the latter, having one and the same object in view. That is to say what is polygamy to the Christian may not be polygamy to the Hindu but what is polygamy to the Hindu is also
polygamy to the Christian. So, whenever the word polygamy is used in this chapter hereafter, let us take it to mean in the Hindu sense of having more wives than one without any restriction or justification whatever except one's own wish. Now, such polygamy is surely to be condemned by the whole world, or if the whole world condemns polygamy it refers and must refer to such kind of polygamy, for no evils can result from any other case.

Polygamy is considered to be a fertile source of evil and a relic of barbarism and primeval necessity affording proof that the country in which it is prevalent is still young in knowledge. Considering the life of the animals by pairs how the one member of the pair helps the other, and how the lust of the other animals of the same species is kept aloof from them, you cannot help declaring matrimony to be a necessary institution; whilst dishonest cohabitation or harlotry on the part of man is a shameful proceeding, that does not attain to the standing of the

development of animals, which in every other respect stand far below him. This statement applies to polygamy as it encourages disorderly cohabitation. The case of birds is perhaps the best example of a monogamous life: A male and a female bird unite together into a pair; they help each other in building a nest for them; they live there as husband and wife; no other bird ventures to interfere with them; the female bird lays eggs and hatches them to young ones while the male bird watches and fetches food; they then both fetch food for the young ones and thus bring them up till they get wings and fly; they thus live perhaps till death separates one of them. What a beautiful lesson they teach us in nature!

Thus "Polygamy" is opposed to all laws, both natural and divine. This unnatural custom which finds a place amongst some nations, may be attributed to sinful lust, to abuse of the power of the strong over the weak, and to the dominion of the one sex over the other. It is evidently altogether contrary to the intention of the creator, who, when he created the

\[3\text{Alburuni's India, Chapter LXIX.}\]
father of the mankind, gave him only one woman to wife, and indeed ordained that man and his one companion should form but one flesh.¹

In monogamy the strength of the marriage tie is greater and the amelioration of the condition of women. During the earlier or militant stage of social progress when there is greater mortality among men, polygamy may be necessary and may even prove beneficial as a better means of maintaining the population than monogamy. But as Society settles into a peaceful condition and the numerical inequality between males and females becomes less and less, monogamy becomes a social necessity. And hence even in countries where polygamy is legal, its extent is practically small.²

Abbe Dubois is decidedly of opinion that in hot as well as in temperate climates the births of the two sexes are nearly equal³ as also the deaths. This

¹ Hindu Manners, Customs and Ceremonies by Abbe J. A. Dubois, Page 213.
³ Abbe Dubois on Hindu Manners, Customs and Ceremonies, page 213. Vide note (1) above.
PRESENT DAY EVILS AND REMEDIES

statement seems to be quite correct in case of India also; for, taking the statistic reports from the Census of India for the last half a century or more, we have the following:—

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Total population</th>
<th>Males</th>
<th>Females</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1872</td>
<td>206,162,360</td>
<td>106,055,545</td>
<td>100,106,815</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1881</td>
<td>253,896,330</td>
<td>129,949,290</td>
<td>123,947,040</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1891</td>
<td>287,314,671</td>
<td>146,769,629</td>
<td>140,545,042</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1901</td>
<td>294,361,056</td>
<td>149,951,824</td>
<td>144,409,232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1911</td>
<td>315,156,396</td>
<td>161,338,935</td>
<td>153,817,461</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1921</td>
<td>318,942,480</td>
<td>163,995,554</td>
<td>154,946,926</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

From these figures it is evident that the number of females in India is always less than that of males so that, in the year 1921, for every 1000 persons we have 514 males and 486 females. This means that under the normal conditions 28 males for every 1000 persons or 9,048,623 males of the whole population of India must have remained unmarried. Then if men were allowed to have more wives than one at a time without justifying causes, the percentage of the unmarried males must necessarily increase and may contribute to the deterioration and degeneration of society in moral and physical strength. Now it may be asked whether a man's having more than one wife at a time for...
justifying causes makes any difference: I think it may be answered in the affirmative thus: The justifying cause of the second marriage of a man will generally be some defect or deformity in the former wife that makes her unfit either for marital purposes or for bearing children; for every such woman there will generally be a corresponding man in nature unfit for marital purposes so that the number of males and females unfit for marital purposes is almost equal and the numerical equality between males and females fit for marital purposes is maintained. Therefore a man's having more wives than one at a time with justifying causes does not increase the percentage of the unmarried men as that without such causes does. Moreover, a woman who is unfit for marital purposes and affords justifying reasons for the remarriage of her husband is unfit to be the wife of anybody else, and her existence for the purpose of maintaining the equality of the sexes may be neglected; That is to say, a combination of a man with a number of women in marriage unfit for marital purposes does not alter or vary
the inequality or equality of the sexes existing at a particular time as any number of them are mere non-entities for the purpose of marriage. Thus we see that a man marrying a number of wives without any restriction or justification whatever except his own wish is a curse to himself and to the society; He is a curse to himself because “he eats with sorrow among his contentious wives, and dissensions, mental enmity, meanness, and pain distract his mind.”¹ and because the first is the wife married from a sense of duty, the second or the others are married for sensual gratification and as such no moral effects proceed from them.² He is a curse to the society because he is depriving so many of his fellow brothers as he has extra number of wives fit for marital purposes, of the probability of being married men. In short he is something like a dog which reserves to itself all sorts of food which it cannot even bite, in the manger.

Now let us see what part polygamy is playing amidst the Hindu society of the present day. The supposed change in the

¹ Daksha—Colebrooke’s Digest, Book IV, 55.  
² Daksha—Colebrooke’s Digest, Book IV, 51.
trend of the marriage law towards polygamy unwarrantedly suggested by the judicial decisions already discussed and those that followed them, is giving room to the reckless young men of the present day to think with all vanity that a male can have any number of wives at his mere will and pleasure without any restriction or justification whatever and to act upon such belief in the most awkward manner detrimental to the interests of themselves and of those nearest and dearest to them. Then there is the dowry-devil to back them up to such bad ways. Instances are many in which a husband threatens his wife with desertion and second marriage if she does not bring large dowries from her parents, if she cannot give up her religious, ancient and time honoured customs and sentiments or if she cannot imitate exactly the Europeans in her dress, manners and perhaps in language and speech also; Instances are not rare in which the parents of the husband expect those of the wife to be at their beck and call like servants, feel offended by them for no cause at every step, bear ill feeling, rankling at heart against them always, tease their
daughter-in-law constantly for no fault of hers but for the imagined wrongs of her parents, and finally when their hatred knows no bounds devilishly manage to induce their son to take a second wife as if it were a great punishment or avengement on her parents; Instances are numerous in which matches are settled purely on mercenary motives and when the motive fails after the event, misunderstandings arise which gradually develop into an inveterate enmity which in turn results in the second marriage of the bridegroom; Instances are not wanting in which a propertied and an eccentric husband either himself changes his wives like coats at his mere fancy and pleasure or his parents depending solely on him for their maintenance most inhumanly contrive to bring about such changes of mates lest his love, if concentrated in any one mate, should deprive them of their extravagant use of his properties. Thus the Hindu women’s lot is a perpetual anxiety and suffering. Their position is most degrading and insecure. A woman cannot be sure of even of her married life with peace of mind till she
becomes mother of at least three or four children. Who is responsible for such an anxious and deplorable state of the fair sex in India?

First, the British Courts, in misinterpreting the Sanscrit texts on the Hindu Law of marriage that the prohibitions contained therein against the second marriage of man during the life-time of the first wife without any justifying causes are merely directory and not mandatory or in not interpreting such prohibitions to the welfare of the fair sex as intended by those sacred texts, are responsible for the sad state of the Hindu women. Secondly, the selfishness of some exceptional parents who offer their girls in marriage to a man having already a wife for no fault of her’s and for no justifying causes except their own inability to secure better matches for their girls or to pay the bridegroom price which has become the fashion of the day for a suitable match, except their miserly desire to marry their daughters somehow without the necessity of spending for the bridegroom price or other expenses, except their greed for money to be obtained by
sale of their girls or except their greedy and the hawkish eye on the estate of the bridegroom if he happens to be rich, or the like, is responsible for the miserable condition of the Hindu women.

And thirdly, the dowry-devil, which tempts the avaricious bridegroom to love or to pretend to love any bride till the marriage and till the devil herself becomes his and the temptation vanishes when he tries for another, is responsible for the deplorable state of the Hindu women.

Such among others are the "errors and abuses that have insidiously crept into our institution of marriage, eating into the vitals of our society and tending to our decay as a nation." So it is high time for us to make strenuous efforts to expose them and to restore as soon as possible the full sway of our ancient texts in this aspect of our marriage law. The task before us is not, after all, a very difficult one; for it is only one of restoration and not one of innovation.

Many innovations were made on Hindu Law by legislative enactments such
as the Freedom of Religion Act XXI of 1850 enabling the converts from Hindu religion to succeed to the estates of their relatives in Hindu religion, the Hindu Widow Remarriage Act XV of 1856, legalising the remarriages of Hindu widows in certain cases, the Indian Majority Act IX of 1875 fixing the age of Majority as 18 in ordinary cases and 21 in cases where guardian is appointed to a minor by a court of justice, the Hindu Disposition of Property Act XV of 1916 validating the disposition of property to an unborn person, the Special Marriage Act (Amendment) XXX of 1923, providing a form of marriage of the Hindus otherwise than by Hindu rites and customs, and many others.

The Child Marriage and the Age of Consent Bills are on the anvil in the Legislative House.

So with a view to rectify an error unintentionally allowed to creep into the society by the British Courts, to remove the doubts and to restore our old law to its original force, if Prohibition of Polygamy Bill is introduced into the
Legislative Houses by a lover of India and its ancient civilisation and is successfully passed into an Act, India and the whole civilised world will surely thank very much him who moves it and the House that passes it into law.

Attempts are being made in that direction already now and then. It has been the subject on many a social platform for the last many years. The Honourable Mr. Justice Ranade in his address on "Southern India a Hundred Years ago" on the platform of the Twelfth Social Conference, Madras, 1898, says: "The Brahmin civilisation, whatever else it was, was certainly not a civilisation which favoured Polyandry or Polygamy, drunkenness and obscenity, cruelty and vice. We have records which mirror the thoughts of the Brahmin settlers in Southern India. The ideal of marriage was Monogamy, and it is best typified in the story of the Ramayana, where the hero is distinguished above all men for his single hearted devotion to his consort..........." ¹

Rao Bahadur R. N. Mudholkar, B.A., LL.B., High Court Vakil in his paper on marriage reform among the Hindus writes:

"The Sastras do not permit the super­session of a wife by her husband except under very special circumstances. It is submitted that the reform party ought to take an even higher stand and agitate for the establishment of the principle that no man should marry another wife while one is living or continues united to him in marriage."¹

Resolution IX of the tenth Sessions of the Indian National Social Conference, Calcutta, runs thus: "That the conference strongly denounces the abuse of the institution of marriage practised in certain parts of India and among certain classes where men marry more than one wife without an adequate cause such as is recognised by ancient law texts, and recommends that all Social Reform Associations should discourage this practice of Polygamy as at once degrading and pernicious in its consequences;..............

members not to encourage such marriages by their presence and support.............."
and so on.

The Honourable Mr. N. G. Chandavarkar, B.A., LL.B, as President of the
Fourth Anniversary Meeting of the Madras Hindu Social Reform Association
on 28th November 1896, observes in his speech on Social Reform thus:

"If the Hindu Sastras are wide and comprehensive enough to include any
measure of reform, the social reformer ought not to omit to derive support from
them and base his cause on them so far as he can base it. But our very Sastras have
given us a freehand in changing with the times, by agreeing upon one point more
than upon anything else—that is by pro-
nouncing without any hesitation that
custom or usage can supersede the injunctions
of the Sastras. The whole history of the
Hindu society has been a history of	
tumultuous departure, whenever the de-
parture was rendered necessary or ex-
pedient, from the laws laid down in the Sastras. Every custom marks the begin-
nung of such departure; and if the Sastras
themselves say that we can make new customs, I do not see why the social reformer should confine himself to the Sastras alone. By all means let us not make light of our Sacred books; like the Christian nations of the modern Europe, who owe much to the Bible and cannot therefore entirely do away with the influences they have derived from it we Hindus cannot free ourselves from the influences we have derived from our Sastras. The Sastras have been more liberal than we care to be, by giving us a free hand to deviate from them when necessary. It is this fact that the social reformer must incessantly din into the ears of the masses; the Sastras are a valuable means of showing that our history has been a history of change. As Dr. Bhandarkar pointed out to you in his address from this place two years ago, there was a period when our women were not only educated but learned, when infant marriages did not prevail, widow marriages were not unusual, and caste distinctions did not exist in the aggravated and absurd form in which they exist now. That period was followed by another and we have gone
on changing. We made no doubt bad customs but we made the custom nevertheless and got the Sastras to adopt themselves to those customs. Let us now reverse the process and try to make good customs, and call to our aid the sastras when and where we can, and appeal to the liberty of making customs which they have given us when their injunctions are against us.”

The present task before us is not even such an extreme case as would need an appeal to the liberty of making customs which the Sastras have given us when their injunctions are against us. As I have already mentioned it is only a case of restoration to the Status quo ante from the dilemma resulting from some judicial decisions. Of course the old Law itself develops into customs when it is unnecessarily interfered with by such undesirable innovations. So most of our Hindu castes or communities living in various parts of India adopt only such Law of marriage as is recognised by the ancient Law texts in the shape of customs which outweigh written Law and all innovations brought about by judicial decisions. Most of such customs dictate that no husband shall marry a second wife
during the life-time of his first wife as such, without her consent; and such rule of custom is considered as a boon to the female and as a desirable check on the male. That is why we see cases often in which a husband whose wife is barren purchases her consent for a very high price to marry another. This sort of settlement between the husband and the wife when the former is driven to the necessity of marrying another wife even for such justifying cause as the barrenness of his first wife, is allowed by various ancient texts though its measure is differently defined.\textsuperscript{1} For instance, the husband under such circumstances is made to settle on his first wife a half, a third or a fourth, of his estate. Thus we have such a custom among the Nattukottai Chetties of some villages in Madura District which was upheld also by the Privy Council.\textsuperscript{2} Such a custom based upon ancient texts prevails in many castes and localities and prohibits the second marriage of a man during the life-time of the first wife, as such without her consent. The

\textsuperscript{1} Yagnavalkya 3 Dig. 17, 558, 561; Srikrishnatarkalankara and Vignaneswara 3 Dig. 18. Mitaksara on Inheritance Chapter II, Sec. XI, 34, 35; Jimutavahana, Chap. IV, Sec. I, 14.
\textsuperscript{2} Palaniappa v. Alagam-44 Mad. 740 P. C.
Hindu observes the rule so scrupulously that, even in the case of barrenness of the first wife, he prefers the adoption of a boy to himself to his second marriage without her consent. It is his pious wish, sacred duty and pride to be faithful and constant to one wife in every way and under any circumstances (i.e. to be ākapatnivrataḥ). Such is the mentality of an average Hindu and so well is the Hindu marriage regulated by custom based on ancient law that no innovation is allowed on it.

Then how can the peril of Polygamy threaten to shake such a well-established and well regulated institution of the Hindu marriage to the detriment of the fair sex? In every community or locality there are men who automatically or scrupulously abide by their laws and customs which are generally based upon the standard of morality amongst them there; while there are others who try to become conspicuous by transgressing the limits of their laws and customs and hence the standard of morality involved therein. The latter wait only for the opportunities to jump out of the limits without falls or penalties; and such opportunities arise
when there is a conflict between the general law of a country and special custom of a caste or a locality therein, or where the general law itself is rendered doubtful by different interpretations given to it through the judicial decisions of the competent courts. Thus in cases in which such men are governed by custom, they may try to evade it by submitting themselves to the rule of the general law and by questioning the very existence of custom and its binding nature on them, thus throwing the heavy burden of proof on their adversaries. In cases in which such men are governed by the general law, they may try to evade it also by twisting the same in their favour by means of the different interpretations given to it through the judicial decisions of the competent courts.

Such is the present state of law of marriage here; and its unfortunate victims are our innocent fair sex inspite of all their virtues of Saraswati, Lakshmi, and Parvati the beloved wifes of the Trumvirate Gods Brahma, Vishnu, and Maheswar respectively. "Old order changeth yielding place to new'. Virtue is now subdued by
fashion. That is to say the young men of the present day though not all but an appreciable proportion of them at any rate are impressed more by fashion than by virtue. For instance, they attend the Cinema and the theatre not with a view to learn morals and to appreciate virtue nor with a view to know more about the world and its wonderful contents but with a view to learn to imitate the fashion of a dancing set and then to hate those who are nearest and dearest to them if they cannot learn to imitate the fashion of the dancing ladies of Spain or Paris. In short with them the idea of a Cinema Picture is the outward fashion with all kinds of stuff with no refined feeling or sentiment inward; and from fashion arise many of the present day wants to meet which the present day youths most unscrupulously threaten their wives with desertion if they do not bring enough from their parents. Fashion and money are not the only sources for the insecure state and life-long anxiety of the female sex. There are many others that contribute to their deplorable condition as pointed out already.\footnote{Vide pages (67-71) ante.} For such an abuse
of power of the strong over the weak and for the entire dominion of one sex over the other amounting to slavery, the present unsettled state of the law of marriage and its apparent conflict with the ancient law and custom now in use in almost every civilised community and locality are mainly responsible.

The law that allows no divorce or dissolution of the marriage under any circumstances, the law that expressly disallows the second marriage to a woman especially when her husband is alive, and the law that enjoins chastity on both the husband and the wife equally, ought to be still more definite and express in prohibiting the second marriage to a man during the life time of his first wife as such without her consent; or else where is the safety for the female sex? If a man marries a girl and with no conscience deserts her in her teens for no fault of hers or for no justifying cause such as incurable disease etc. but for satisfying his lust with another or for gratifying his or his parents' ill-feeling against her parents or other relatives or for any trifling or fabulous cause such as that of
a wolf against the lamb, is she to rot in the kitchen and in seclusion throughout her life? Is her position not more precarious than that of a widow who can, if she thinks fit, have the protection under the Hindu Widow Remarriage Act XV of 1856? We are surprised to know instances of the worst type in which a wantonly reckless youth of one family contrives to marry a girl of another family to which the former bears a long-standing enmity and grudge, with the sole purpose of disgracing and thus taking vengeance on the latter by deserting her in whom their affections are centred and for whose forlorn and useless state throughout life they feel and grieve much. Such is the present plight of the female sex in many parts of our country; and thus we see that there is no exaggeration in saying that the evil of the idea of polygamy is creeping rapidly amidst and proving itself to be a venomous cobra to our society. A nation's progress depends a good deal on its marriage laws and ideals and the status assigned to women in it. Taking individual cases, Manu says: In whatever family the husband is contented with his wife
and the wife with her husband, in that house will fortune be assuredly permanent. From this it is evident that Polygamy and polyandry are to be condemned equally.

Moreover, in the same text we see:

"(1) Where females are honoured, there the deities are pleased; but where they are dishonoured, there all religious acts become fruitless.

(2) Where female relations are made miserable, the family of him who makes them so, very soon perishes; but where they are not unhappy the family always increases.

(3) On whatever houses the women of a family not being duly honoured pronounce an imprecation, those houses, with all that belong to them, utterly perish, as if destroyed by a sacrifice for the death of an enemy.

(4) Let those women therefore, be continually supplied with ornaments, apparel and food at festivals and jubilees, by men desirous of wealth."

Similarly we see in Mahabharata:

"Where the females are honoured there the deities are pleased; but where

---

1 Colebrooke's Digest, Book IV, 40.
2 Colebrooke's Digest, Book IV, 39.
they are unhonoured, there all religious acts become fruitless. 1"

Now imagine the cases of men who misappropriate the jewellery of their loving wives and desert them to the wilderness for no fault of theirs! Imagine the cases of the abettors or the accessories of such crimes or wrongs either before or after the fact! We find no such atrocities in a Nation where the second marriage to a man is strictly prohibited as a crime during the life-time of the first wife as such.

What is applicable to an individual is applicable to a nation since a nation is nothing but a number of individuals having their chief characteristics, laws, ideals and interests common. If a nation allows such wrongs among its individuals and in consequence a number of its individuals suffer, it cannot be said to be progressing. So, the first and the foremost duty of the Government of a nation is to check all such wrongs and remove all causes that hinder its progress. No one denies that polygamy is the greatest

---

1 Colebrooke's Digest, Book, IV 38.
evil to the society and a stumbling block to the progress of a nation. All the civilised world condemns it and makes it punishable as a heinous crime. Even in India section 494 of the Indian Penal Code makes polygamy and polyandry punishable with imprisonment of either description (simple or rigorous) for a term which may extend to seven years and also with fine. Of course the section applies only to the cases in which the second marriage is void according to the law applicable to the person marrying so.

Even the Turkish Government is said to forbid polygamy by enforcing that no married man shall entertain another marriage unless the previous marriage is cancelled by death, divorce, or the order of the state. Monogamy is one of the tenets of the modern Brahmo-Samaj sect. The Hindus also consider monogamy as the best form of conjugal life and adopt it practically as the general rule of their marriage law by means of Custom based on their ancient texts. In suits based on such custom, the Madras

---

2 Sonaluxmi v. Vishnu Prasad, 28 Bom. 597.
High Court issued more than once *interim injunction* restraining the husband from marrying the second wife during the lifetime of the first wife as such without her consent.\(^1\) The Privy Council held more than once, as already pointed out, that under the Hindu system of law clear proof of such Usage will outweigh the written text of law.\(^2\) But is it not a greater humiliation and calamity for a deserted, helpless, and penniless wife than the desertion itself that she has to prove beyond doubt the custom that controls her marriage, before she is entitled to prevent her beloved husband from swerving from what the ancient texts, the time-honoured custom, the general public and his own sacred vows dictate? Then is it not the duty of every man that has the least sympathy for the weaker sex to agitate and move the Government to remove the doubts from the existing law and custom of marriage, and make Monogamy in the Hindu sense of the word as already explained, as the rule of the

---


\(^2\) 48 I.A. 539=44 Mad. 740 P.C.; 12 M.I.A. 397, 436 P.C.
marriage law throughout India? Certainly it is high time for every lover of India to introduce into and support to success in the various Legislative Houses a Bill which may be called 'The Prohibition of Polygamy Bill' which may be in the following or such other words:

Whereas it is expedient to define and declare the law relating to marriage among the Hindus of the Presidency of Madras (or of India) and to make the position of women therein more secure it is hereby enacted as follows:

1. This Act may be called the Hindu Prohibition of Polygamy Act. It extends to the Presidency of Madras (or to the whole of British India) and applies to all communities and castes therein except the Hill tribes of the Agency tracts.

2. No man shall be competent to marry a second wife during the lifetime of his first wife as such, without the justifying causes of barrenness and incurable disease and without her consent.
3. A man marrying a second wife during the life-time of his first wife as such, on any of the grounds mentioned in Section 2, shall first obtain sanction for the same from any competent Court in the exercise of its original jurisdiction; and a marriage contracted in contravention with the provisions herein contained shall be void.

Some such provision must be made to safeguard the interests of the female sex among the Hindus, or else there is no salvation for them or for the nation itself; for, applying Manu's aphorism, where the fair sex is honoured, there the deities are pleased and the nation is blessed and elevated.
ERRATA.

Page  Line
1  For 'Five' read 'fine'
18  Inverted comma begins with 'in' and not with 'it'
20  For 'consent' read 'conduct'
14  For 'incompatibility' read 'incompatibility'
20  For 'Colapchendra' read 'Golapchendra'

In foot note
24  For 'mental' read 'mutual'
24  For 'without the' read 'without one of the'
26  Add at the end of section 2:- Explanation: The words 'wife as such' in this section does not include a wife living in adultery or keeping herself away from her husband against his will and for no justifying cause.
**ERRATA.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
<th>Line</th>
<th>Error</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>For 'Five' read 'fine'</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>Inverted coma begins with 'in' and not with 'it'</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>For 'consent' read 'conduct'</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>For 'incompatibility' read 'incompatible'</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>51</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>For 'Colapchendra' read 'Golapchendra'</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>56</td>
<td>In foot note</td>
<td>For 'part IV page 224' read 'part I page 186'</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>67</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>For 'mental' read 'mutual'</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>83</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>For 'without the' read 'without one of the'</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>88</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>Add at the end of section 2: Explanation: The words 'wife as such' in this section does not include a wife living in adultery or keeping herself away from her husband against his will and for no justifying cause.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The Origin of
The Rajpoot Kshatriyas.

HARICHARAN BANDHU
Jiaganj P.O.
D.T. Murshidabad.

Published by
ASHUTOSH CHOWDHURY.
BURDWAN.

[ All rights reserved. ]
द सूर्यग्रहरि बेंगः। क चाचविवियम सति।।
तितोषुद्र तस्र मोहादुधु पेनार्चिं साहाम्म।।
मनदः कवियश्चार्यो गमिष्ठामुषुपहास्थमाम्।।
प्रांशुज्जवे फली बोभादुधाहरिवविधवामन।।
प्रवन्तवागारी बंधंशुम्मनू पूर्वस्वरूरिमा।।
महो वचसम्मुक्रेष्ठ सङ्कस्यवास्त्रै मे गतिः।।

dति महाकवि कालिदासः।
The antiquarians on the origin of the Rajpoot Kshatriyas.

It might be deemed sheer presumption on our part to take upon ourselves the task of tracing and establishing the pure Kshatriya origin of the Rajpoots,—the pride and glory of India,—the story of whose intense patriotism, glorious self-sacrifice and heroic exploits fills up the pages of history and compels universal wonder and admiration. Our task is made all the more difficult by the general acceptance of the theories propounded by modern antiquarians pointing to a mixed descent of the Rajpoot Kshatriyas. One is at a loss to make out how such funny and frivolous theories could have crept into the researches of serious and unbiased seekers after truth. Even Col. James Tod, whose monumental work “The annals and antiquities of Rajasthan” bears ample testimony to his boundless love and admiration for the Rajpoots, has unwittingly permitted himself to arrive at such wrong and erroneous conclusions
regarding the origin of the Rajpootts that they may justly be mistaken for the calumnies of an enemy. Subsequent writers without proper enquiry and an adequate knowledge of the Shastraś appear to have been doing little more than following in the footsteps of the Colonel and confirming and perpetuating the original errors committed by him.

Though yielding to none in his zeal for glorifying the Rajpootts the Col. has failed to realise the inner significance of many Hindu myths and legends and painted them in such black dyes that they cannot but be repulsive and highly objectionable to all Hindus. In support of our contention, we have quoted below some passages in full and the contents only of some of the chapters of his "annals." We would also recommend to the inquisitive reader a perusal of the original text in order to be able to appreciate the full extent of our pain and surprise.

"The Rajpoot tribes could scarcely have acquired some of their still existing scythic habits and warlike superstitions on the burning plains of Ind. It was too hot to hail with fervent adoration the return of the sun from his southern course to enliven the northern hemisphere. This should be the religion of a colder
clime, brought from their first haunts, the sources of the Jihoon and Jaxartes. The grand solstitial festival, the Ashwamedha, or sacrifice of the horse (the type of the sun), practised by the children of Vuvavswata, the ‘sun-born,’ was most probably simultaneously introduced from Scythia into the plains of Ind, and west by the sons of Odin, Woden, or Boodha, into Scandinavia, where it became the Hi-el or Hi-ul (a term of Scythian origin for the sun) the festival of the winter solstice; the grand jubilee of northern nations and in the first ages of Christianity, being so near the epoch of its rise, gladly used by the first fathers of the church to perpetuate that event.” Chapter 1. Vol. I.

“Having investigated the line from Icshwacu to Rama, and that from Boodha (the parent and first emigrant of the Indian race, from Saca Dwipa, or Scythia to Hindusthan) to Krishna and Yudhishthira, a period of twelve hundred years, we proceed to the second division and second table of the genealogies.”

“Indu, Som, Chandra, in Sanscrit, ‘the moon’; hence the Lunar race is termed the Chandra-Vansa, Som-Vansa or Indu Vansa, most probably the root of Hindu.”

“Rama preceded Krishna; but as their historians, Valmiki and Vyasa, who wrote the events they witnessed, were contemporaries, it could not have been by many years” Chapter V. Vol. I.

“Having thus brought down the genealogical history of the ancient martial races of India, from the earliest
period to Yudhisthira and Krishna and thence to Vikramaditya and the present day. A few observations on the races invading India during that time, and now ranked amongst the thirty-six royal races of Rajasthan affording scope for some curious analogies, may not be inopportune.

"The tribes here alluded to are the Haya or Aswa, the Takshac, and the Jit or Gete: the similitude of whose theogony, names in their early genealogies, and many other points with the Chinese, Tartar, Mogul, Hindu and Scythic races, would appear to warrant the assertion of the common origin."

"Though the periods of the passage of these tribes into India cannot be stated with exactitude, the regions whence they migrated may more easily be ascertained."

"Let us compare the origin of the Tartars and Moguls, as given by their historian Abulgazi, with the races we have been treating of from the Puranas:"

"Mogul was the name of the Tartarian patriarch. His son was Ogz, the founder of all the races of those northern regions, called Tartars and Mogul."

"Ogz or Oguz had six sons. First, Kiun 'the sun,' the Surya of the Puranas; secondly Ay 'the moon', the Indu of the Puranas."

"In the latter, Ayu, we have even the same name as in the Puranas for the lunar ancestor."

"The Tartars all claim from Ayu, 'the moon', the Indu of the Puranas. Hence with them, as with the German tribes, the moon was always a male deity."
"The Tartar Ay had a son, Juldus. His son was Hyu, from whom came the first race of the Kings of China."

"The Puranic Ayu had a son Yadu (pronounced Jadoo); from whose third son, Hyu, the Hindu genealogists deduce no line, and from whom the Chinese may claim their Indu origin."

"El Khan (ninth from Ay) had two sons; first Kaian; and secondly Nagas; whose descendants people call Tartary."

"From Kaian, Jungeez Khan claimed descent."

"Nagas was probably the founder of the Takshac or Snake race of the Puranas and Tartar genealogists, the Tak-i-uk Moguls of De Guignes."

"Such are the comparative genealogical origin of the three races. Let us compare their theogony, the fabulous birth assigned by each for the founder of the Indu race."

"1st. The Puranic. Ella (the earth), daughter of the sun-born Icshwacu, while wandering in the forest, was encountered by Boodha (Mercury), and from the rape of Ella sprung the Indu race."

2nd. The Chinese account of the birth of Yu (Ayu), their first monarch "A star (Mercury or Fo), struck his mother while journeying. She conceived, and gave to the world Yu, the founder of the first dynasty which reigned in China. Yu divided China into nine provinces, and began to reign 2207 years before Christ."

"Thus the Ay of the Tartars, the Yu of the Chinese and the Ayu of the Puranas, evidently indicate the great Indu (Lunar) progenitor of the three races."
"Boodha (Mercury), the son of Indu (the moon), became the patriarchal and spiritual leader; as Fo in China; Woden and Teutates, (Tath, ‘father’ in Sanskrit. Qu, Teuths and Toth, the Mercury of Egypt?) of the tribes migrating to Europe."

"Hence it follows, that the religion of Boodha must be coeval with the existence of these nations; that it was brought into India Proper by them, and guided them until the schism of Crishna and the Suryas, worshippers of Bal, in time depressed them, when the Boodha religion was modified into its present mild form, the Jain." Chapter VI. Vol. I.

"Alleged Persian extraction of the Ranas of Mewar. Authorities for it.—Implied descent of the Ranas from a Christian Princess of Byzantium.—The author’s reflections upon these points." Chapter III. Vol. I.

"Vyasa, the author of the grand epic, the Mahabharata, was son of Santanu (of the race of Hari,—Haricula) sovereign of Delhi, by Yajangandha, a fisherman’s daughter, consequently illegitimate. He became the spiritual father, or preceptor, of his nieces, the daughter of Vichitravirya, the son and successor of Santanu."

"Vichitravirya had no male offspring. Of his three daughters, one was named Pandea; and Vyasa, being the sole remaining male branch of the house of Santanu, took his niece and spiritual daughter, Pandea, to wife and became the father of Pandu, afterwards sovereign of Indraprastha." Chapter II. Vol. I.

To show where the Col. has been at fault, we have tried to go direct to the original Sans-
krit authorities and given extracts that will, we trust, serve as a refutation to all that are erroneous and misleading in the "Annals" from the Shastric point of view.

No Hindu worthy of his name and having a grain of Shastric sense will, we dare say, be persuaded to place the least reliance on the conclusions of the Col., in preference to what the Shastras say clearly and explicitly on the subject of the Kshatriya origin of the Rajpoots. Moreover, the Col. himself was not very sure of his ground and has left considerable room for doubt as to the authoritativeness of his findings. Says the Col. in his Introduction to his annals:—

"I have been so hardy as to affirm and endeavour to prove the common origin of the martial tribes of Rajasthan and those of ancient Europe. I have expatiated at some length upon the evidence in favour of the existence of a feudal system in India, similar to that which prevailed in the early ages on the European continent, and of which relics still remain in the laws of our own nation. Hypotheses of this kind are, I am aware, viewed with suspicion, and sometimes assailed with ridicule. With regard to the notions, which I have developed on these questions, and the frequent allusions to them in the pages of this volume, I entertain no obstinate prepossessions or prejudices in their favour. The world is too enlightened at
the present day to be in danger of being misled by any hypothetical writer, let him be ever so skilful; but, the probability is, that we have been induced by the multitude of false theories which time has exposed, to fall into the opposite error, and that we have become too sceptical with regard to the common origin of the people of the east and west. However, I submit my proofs to the candid judgment of the world; the analogies, if not conclusive on the questions are still sufficiently curious and remarkable to repay the trouble of perusal and to provoke further investigation; and they may, it is hoped, vindicate the author for endeavouring to elucidate the subject "by steering through the dark channels of antiquity by the feeble lights of forgotten chronicles and imperfect records."

Giving due credit, however, to Col. Tod for good faith and honesty of purpose and making every allowance for the great difficulties he had to contend with as an alien in steering his way clear between the shoals of conflicting opinions and hear-say evidence, we propose in the following pages to establish the pure Kshatriya origin of the Rajpoots by direct reference to the Dharma Shastras of India; from the Vedas, the highest religious authority of the Hindus to the Jain scriptures which shed a flood of side-light on many of the dim nooks and corners of the
social and religious history of India. How far our humble efforts have succeeded remains for the appreciative readers to judge.

In conclusion we shall be amply repaid if our labour serves to awaken some interest and remove some of the misapprehensions regarding the origin of the glorious Rajpoots who alone are the present-day descendants of the ancient Kshatriya races of India.
The Origin of the Rajpoot Kshatriyas as traced from the Vedas and the Upanishads.

When the Hindus rose to power and distinction as a highly civilised nation, it was religion and the need for the strict ceremonial observance of religious rites and devotional practices from which sprang all the unique, intellectual and cultural advancement attained by the Hindus. Though modern antiquarians feel disappointment at the sterility of the national history of the early Hindus yet all their religious and mythological works abound in ample and reliable accounts of their arts, sciences, philosophy and laws, as well as the social customs and political events of their country. But there are considerable difficulties in sifting and interpreting this vast and inexhaustible mass of materials with a view to arrive at a correct comprehension of the history of the oldest civilisation of the world.

There is a saying that even the sages cannot agree in their opinions. Indeed, there is some
truth in this aphorism. The saintly Judhisthira, in reply to the question put by Dharma, said,—

"The Vedas differ, the Smritis differ, there are no Munies (sages) who do not differ from one another in their opinions. The true essence of religion lies hidden (as in a cave). The true path is that which has been trodden by the great." The unbiassed seeker after truth should bear this in mind, and in his pursuit of truth and knowledge abide by reason and not confound the spirit with the contradictory sayings of the Shastras.

The law-givers (Samhitakars) were fully alive to the controversies, sure to arise from a multiplicity of codes made to vary according to the changing needs of a progressive society. The different Samhitas are exponents of different stages of Aryan development, representing Hindu customs and usages prevalent in different periods. To determine their respective spheres of operation, it is laid down in the Shastras,—

"The ordinances of Manu will hold good in the Satya, those of Goutama in the Treta, those of Shankha
and Likhita in the Dwapara and those of Parasara in the Kali Yuga."

Vyasa, the compiler of the Vedas and the author of the Puranas, has laid down the following dictum for the solution of controversial matters,—

\[
\text{रूपित-सृति-पुराणां विरोची यत्र हम्हे।}
\]
\[
\text{तब श्रौत प्रमाणन्तु तयोद्विधि सृतिवेरे। व्यास-संहिता।}
\]

"Where the Vedas, the Smritis and the Puranas differ, the Vedas are to be regarded as reliable; where the Smritis and the Puranas differ the former should be the authority." Again according to Brihaspaty—

"where the Smritis are at variance, preference is to be given to Manu and his decision accepted as final."

There were originally four Varnas in the early Aryan Society, but in course of time, innumerable sub-castes and mixed castes came into existence by promiscuous intermarriages, by marrying forbidden women and by the giving up of one's own profession and religious rites, called Barnasram Dharma. Many an instance may be cited where the origin of the same caste has been differently explained and traced in different Dharmashastras. Again in many cases, the same caste has come to be known by different names in different Dharmashastras. All
these account for the many divergent opinions and interpolation in the Shastras,—specially in the Puranas, regarding the origin of almost all the castes and sub-castes. In the face of such conflicting opinions, the Lexicographers and the commentators of Dharmashastras in determining the Varna of particular castes have sometimes totally ignored their customs, usages and social status and indulged in fanciful and erroneous theories regarding their origin. Indeed, the caste history of modern India affords a curious study to the students of Ethnology.

In the following pages I have made an honest attempt to trace the origin and Varna of the Rajpoots. I have tried to show from the evidence of Shastras and traditions that the Rajpoots are the noble Kshatriyas of old.

In all ages and climes the body politic in every civilised society develops along the line of the division of labour and gradually resolves itself into four distinct classes according to natural aptitude and diversity of occupation, viz.,—the priests, the warriors, the traders and agriculturists and the labourers. We have already said that with the progress of civilisation, the Aryans also became similarly but more scientifically divided into four Varnas, corresponding
to the four-fold divisions, already referred to, viz., the Brahmins, the Kshatriyas, the Vaisyas and the Sudras.

Regarding the origin of the four Varnas, the Rig Veda, the most sacred and the oldest literary memorial on the face of the earth says:—

"ब्राह्मणोऽयु मुखमार्शीवाङ्ग राज्यः क्षतः।
जरूः यदृश्च तद्वैश्चः पद्मां शूद्रो श्रावयत॥"
(ऋग्वेदसंहितायां १० मण्डलैः ५० चाते १२ ऋक्तः)

But in course of time with the introduction of intermarriage and interchange of occupation we see some Kshatriyas, Vaisyas and Sudras descended from the Brahmins and some Brahmins, in like manner, descended from the Kshatriyas.*

* "पुद्रोऽत्कामदवयापि शुनको यस्य शौनकः।
ब्राह्मणः चतियानवेशः शूद्राःश्चत्वें च॥"
हरिवंशी २५वं चात्मायि।

"जाता वषैं तु मार्गवे।
ब्राह्मणः चत्त्रियाः वैश्यः शूद्राः भरतवभ॥"
हरिवंशी ३२वं चात्मायि।
How it came to pass is rationally described in the following verses of the Mahabharata:

"न विशेषप्रस्तर वर्णानां सर्वं ब्राह्ममिदं जगत्।
ब्राह्मण पूर्वेऽङ्गः हि कर्मभिर्वर्णं गतम्॥
कामभोगप्रियास्तरीयसः भीतनाः: प्रियाश्रयः॥
व्यत्तसख्यं रत्नाङ्गस्ते हिजः: चवतं गतः॥
गोभ्योढ़ं समाख्याय प्रीतः: शुद्धाप्रीजिनः॥
सर्वभ्रातातिईङ्गं ते हिजः: बेश्यतं गतः॥
हिंसासंवतिस्मिया सुमा सर्वकार्यप्रीजिनः॥
श्रष्टा: शोचपरिवर्त्तनं हिजः: शुद्धतं गतः॥
इत्यतः: कर्मभिर्वर्णा हिजः वर्णंतरं गतः॥
धन्द्रीयज्ञनिया तेषां नित्यं न प्रतिष्ठितसः॥"

(Mahabharat-Shramitaprabha)

Dwelling upon the text of the Rig Veda the Manusamhita begins by saying:

"ब्रोकानामु विहरार्थ मुखबाङ्गपादतः।
ब्राह्मणं चतुर्यं वेश्यं शुद्धं निरवर्त्तयत्।

११म चाढ्याच ११७ श्लोकः।"

"ग्रहस्मदसः श्रोतकथातुवंच्नालपरंतितसः बभूतः।"
विष्कुपराजी ४र्थ बंशख २म चाढ्याच।

"चन्द्रपरिवर्त्तकं च कछ: तस्यापि मितार्थचित्वः।
यत: कालियनं हिजः बभूतः॥"

विष्कुपराजी ४र्थ चाष्यें १५म चाढ्याच।
and follows it by describing the birth of the ten great Rishis of whom Marichi and Atri were the progenitors of the ever-renowned Solar and Lunar Kshatriya races respectively. The Manusamhita in course of its comments and arguments in various places goes further and declares in most unmistakable terms the existence of these two stocks of Kshatriyas, as:

"सन्तस्वायत तु सर्गसु गुरस्य व महादृष्टि: ।
सुखवाण्डपाण्डानं प्रथम कश्मीराख्यकल्पात् ॥
( १ माध्यायः ८३ठम श्लोकः ) ।

"सुखवाण्डपाण्डानं या लोके जाते वहि: ।
क्षेष्ठवाच्याचार्याच: सर्वे ते दस्यव: घूमता: ॥
( १० माध्यायः ४५ठम श्लोकः ) ।

"कहुः: नाममेव: यत्: पुरुष: परिकूलित: ।
त्रिक्षाभिनिधत्स्व गुरुकुलं स्वयम् भवानुजः ॥ ६२
उत्तमाण्डिववर्जयेन ब्राह्मणवै धारणात् ।
सर्वस्वायत्स सर्गस्त्र दश्तो ब्राह्मणः: प्रभुः ॥ ८३

१३ चाध्यः: ।

"सन्तस्वायतिप्रकृत्य ब्राह्मणानु प्रति सर्वं: ।
प्रदौव य नियन्त्र स्थात च वचं दि: ब्राह्मणभ्रतम् ॥
( २४ माध्यायः २५० तम श्लोकः ) ।

Another important fact worthy of special note is that it was during the Samhitic age that
the nomenclature of Kshatriya first came to be used as a synonym for राजन्य।

The great Rishi Vyasa, the compiler of the Vedas, nicely differentiates between these two stocks of Kshatriyas in the following manner:

“चन्द्रादिक्रमनुनाम्य प्रवर: चक्रिया: स्त्रुता:।
ब्रह्माथो बाइदेशाचेष्टाण्यः चक्रियजात्यः॥
ब्रह्मवैवर्तं पुराणः १०म चप्पाये।”

Now we may take it as conclusively proved that there are two distinct stocks of Kshatriyas, —the one,—the Vedic Rajanyas, sprung from the arms of Brahma and the other descended from the two great Rishis, Marichi and Atri.

But before coming to details, there is one thing more we have to bear in mind. The term Rajanya or Kshatriya was not the name of any particular caste but it was a comprehensive term representing the whole warrior or ruling class comprising various tribes and sects of the Aryan Society. The Manusamhita says:—

“मनोकृत्ति क्रियालोपादिमा: क्रियजातयः॥
हणजयं गता लोके ब्राह्मणाद्वर्यान च॥ ४२
प्राणायं श्रृणुद्विभः: क्रियोऽजां चवना यकाः।
पार्वतः पञ्जवाचीना: किराता: दिर्दा: ख्या:॥ ४३”

(१०म चप्पाये)
The Brahmabaibarta Purana also says:

"चन्द्रादिक्षमनूनाश्च प्रवरा: चन्द्रिया: स्नृता:। ।
ब्रह्मणो बाणुदेशास्च वान्य: चन्द्रियजातय:॥"

(१०म ऋषाये)

The plural suffix in चन्द्रियजातय: in both the verses quoted above shows that the Vedic Rajanyas as well as the Samhitic Kshatriyas were divided into various classes or castes under different names. But still they always retained their scriptural classification to distinguish one stock from another and so the Vedic Rajanyas, said to have sprung forth from the arms of Brahma, became known as Agnicoola Kshatriyas because of the popular belief that Brahma and Agni are one and the same divinity and there is a custom in vogue, all over India of worshipping Brahma to appease and propitiate Agni (Fire). Even the शतपथब्राह्मण: (६.१११५) says:—"स पशु पुरुषः
प्रजापतिभवत् भयभेद स वैयमन्निधिष्ठिते।"

On account of the extraordinary fighting strength and undaunted spirit of the Vedic warriors and rulers (राजन्य:) they were allegorically said to have come out from the arms of Brahma; and they so often styled and mentioned as Ugras (उग्र:) in all the Vedas and the Upanishads that
Medhatithi, the learned commentator of the Manusamhita, in course of his commentation on the said Samhita says:— “उद्वोगात्मकतिविशिष्टिः। राजेष्वेतत्त्वे प्रयोगों हृदयते।” ४ध्य शब्दाये २१२ श्लोकः।

Another famous commentator, Govindaraj also holds the same view with regard to them. But all the Vedic Rajanyas (राजः), described in the Rig Veda as sprung forth from the arms of Brahma, were no other than the original or primitive Kshatriyas, and in fact, in course of time, they came to be divided into two principal sects or classes, viz.,— the “Ugras” and the “Bhojas”, according to a variation of their physical strength, prowess and munificence. We must quote here a few Ricks to show their character and status as described in the Vedas and the Upanishads.

कष्टं चर्यं कष्टं २ह श्लोकः ॥ मम मण्डलं ४५ शतं ४ध्यं

चो ५ध्य कष्टः

‘षा वृंटं हद्वर्त दर्शे जातं प्रच्छविद्विमात्रस्त। क उप्रा: के च श्रुःखिरे ॥ ४

जातं उत्तव्री हदब्रह्मणों बुद्गमियं। तथा च यासः। वृंट द्रष्ट्यातिः। निं ६।१२ दर्शत। शादे। शादाय चेसुर्या उदगृह्यवें: के के च श्रुःखिरे वैविद्यं विविष्टता दर्शता समातरं विपुष्क्षतः, वर्णाचीतः ॥ ४
( 22 )

The powerful mother replied “He who wants to court your enmity and fights on the hill like a conspicuous elephant.”
Indra being born and being engaged in manifold works, asked his mother “Who is Ugra and who is famous?” Sabashi at once said “Oh son! there are Ournabava, Abishuba and others who should be rescued.”

Indra, the slayer of Britra drew them simultaneously, as the spokes of the wheel of a charriot are drawn with a rope and Dashyabha was triumphant.

Even a vast expanse of water welcomes Indra. On the approach of calamity the Ugra warriors sing hymns to him.
The Ugra, who on becoming king wishes to kill a Brahmin, gets his kingdom ruined and the Brahmin becomes victorious.

As we have numerous Kshatriya tribes or clans named after their respective progenitors such as इच्छाकु, काश्यप, धार्षेक, कौरव, पारशुर, यादव etc. so we have उत्थपुल and राजपुल in the Vedas and the Upanishads, as :

काम्बेदस्थिताया नाथास्पति, वर्म ब्रह्मावय, नम मण्डले,
.४७ स्त्रास, १२ पुष्कर,—
पार्विन द्रोने गम्भीर बृहा उद्युगे निवासानंतः।
मा कि स्तोलर्व नो रिष्ठतः।

चन्द सायणः :—( हे चंदिते! भापर्विन, सम्बैं: पालवसि।
द्रोने चारी गम्भीर उद्वके। उद्वा नामामैत। गम्भीरं गहनं
मिति तत्रामसु पाठात्। उद्युगे, उद्युगे: दुः यथिन् तत।
तभिभवुद्धि निवासानं हिंसतो जालं लोकस्याक्सं। तनयं
मां नाकृरिष्ठु नैव हिंसा करेतु।

O Aditi! save from all sides. Let not the stratagem of the mischievous kill our sons, the sons of Ugras in the water of the weak current.
Gargi said, "O Yajnavalkya! as the sons of Ugras of Kasi or Videha, possessing boundless valour and prowess put strings on the stringless bows and go to the battlefield carrying in hand two enemy-chastising arrows with bamboo shafts, so I too appear before you with two questions.

The Vedic kings (राजन्:) who became supreme in power were called उयोगमयमशी: in the Vedas.
The eighty sixth mantra of the twelfth chapter of the Shukayurveda is just the same as quoted above and Sreemati Ubatacharyya annotates it in the following words:—

उयः चलियो बदगोधाङ्कुलिनाघाण: स एव विशिष्टति मधुमशी:।
मधुमं भागं गृहातीति मधुमशी:। स यथा श्रूवन् वाघवे।

Another commentator, Sreeman Mahidhar says:—

उयो मधुमशीरिव। सध् देहसध्यं मधुमं मद्धभागं
गृहाति हिनस्ति ( शु हिसायाम् +किय) मधुमशी:। मध्यः-
घातकः उय उत्तक्षयो बदगोधाङ्कुलिनाघाण उद्गृहंशचः चलियो
यथा श्रूवन् वाघवे इत्यथः।

O Medicinal herb! as the Ugra sovereigns, equipped with the thumb-protectors, destroy the enemies, so you too pervading the whole body of the patient destroy his disease.
O Unguement! as the Ugra sovereigns punish the enemy near at hand, so you too pervading all over the body of the patient destroy his disease.

Amongst the Vedic Kings, those who were bounteous and liberal in giving feasts and gifts to Brahmins, used to be called Bhojas and their wealth and grandeur are described in the following Ricks:

संधितायं (८म चष्ट्रेः, ६ष चाच्याये, १०मण्डलेः,
१०७ सुतात्) Says.

भोजा मुखुरं नृथनिं नं रिज्जर्णिं न व्यथलोभोजा।
इदं यद्युखं सुवनं खण्डवतं सर्वं दृष्टे यस्मिन्यो दुःखत्व।
भोजा जिसु: सुभृं थोमिनम्ये भोजा जिसुः भृवं सावसाः।
भोजा जिसु यथार्थपेयं सुराया भोजा जिसु यं च बन्धताः प्रवलति।
भोजायाऽः संमज्जन्याः भोजायांस्ते कन्या शुभ्रामाना।
भोजस्येदं पुष्यरशीव वेडस परिष्कृतं देवमानिव चितं। २०
The Bhojas are not subject to death. They do not get into poverty; they do not suffer distress, pain or sorrow. Dakshina gives them whatever exists either in this earth or heaven.

To the Bhojas are first due the cow that gives milk, clarified butter and such other things; they get the essence of wine. It is they who gain the gaily-dressed ladies. It is the Bhojas who conquer the defiant enemies.

The Bhoja is equipped with a fleet horse. A beautiful lady is ready to wait upon him; this house, clear like a pond and splendid like a temple, exists for him alone. Nice riding steeds carry the Bhoja. It is for him that the nicely-shaped charriot is ready. May gods save the Bhoja at the time of battle; the Bhoja conquers the enemy at the time of war.
The Jain Scriptures about the origin of the Rajpoot Kshatriyas.

There is no doubt that Jainism is one of the oldest religions of India. As Goutama Buddha was a contemporary of Mahabir Swami, the 24th or last Tirthankar i.e. a great teacher of Jainism, it is clearly seen that Jainism is much more older than Buddhism. Even in the Sreemadbhagbat (4th and 5th chapters, 5th Skandha) we have a description of the life and teachings of Rishavdev Swami or Adinath Swami, the founder of the Jain religion and so Col. James Tod was justified in saying in the introduction of his great work, the annals of Rajasthan that “From a close and attentive examination of the Jain records, which embody all that these ancient sectarians knew of science, many chasm of Hindu history might be filled up.”

Encyclopædia Britannica (Vol. XXIX) says:—

“It is now certain that the Jain community was really even older than the time of Buddha and was reorganised by his contemporary the Mohavira, named Baddhamana.”
Dr. L. D. Barnett, the distinguished oriental scholar says:—

"Neither the political nor the literary nor the religious history of India can ever be written until an exact study has been made of the Jain scriptures composed in the Magadhi Prakrita."

A great German scholar of Jainism has said:—

"Very few orientalists take interest in Jainism, though it is well-known that many a dark corner in Indian history and culture is to be clearly seen through the help of Jaina Literature and Jaina history."

Indeed the Jain scriptures are of inestimable value to us when we endeavour to trace the earliest history of the Rajpoot Kshatriyas; because it was Rajpootana, the cradle of all the Rajpoot clans, where Jainism was first established and flourished from time unknown. Col. James Tod says:—

"Mewar has, from the most remote period, afforded a refuge to the followers of the Jain faith, which was the religion of Ballabhi, the first capital of the Rana's ancestors, and many monuments attest the support, this family has granted to its professors in all the vicissitudes of their fortunes. One of the best preserved monumental remains in India is a column most elaborately sculptured, to Parswa-Nath in Cheetore. The noblest remains of sacred architecture, not in
Mewar only, but throughout Western India, are Buddhist or Jain; and the many ancient cities where this religion was fostered, have inscriptions which evince their prosperity in these countries, with whose history their own is interwoven.” (Chapter XIX.)

Moreover all the Tirthankars of Jainism, twenty-four in number, were, without a single exception, Kshatriyas of the most illustrious houses of old. Therefore, without any hesitation, or fear of being misled, we may accept as simple truths, all that are recorded in the Jain scriptures and literatures regarding the origin and the status of the different clans of the Kshatriyas of old, specially when such statements are corroborated by the sayings of the most authentic Hindu scriptures, such as the Vedas and the Upanishads.

In the Rig Veda we have Rajanyas (राजन्यः) sprung up from the arms of Brahma, frequently mentioned as Ugras, Ugraputras, Ugramadhyamashis and Bhojas, while according to the Jain scriptures we have four Kshatriya clans founded by Rishav Deva Swami or Adinath Swami, the first Tirthankar of Jainism, of whom the Ugras and the Bhogas are the foremost. Now we must draw the attention of our readers to the fact that both Brahma and Adinath Swami are four-
faced Deities, the former is worshipped by the Hindus as "God the creator" and the Jains being non-believers in creation and a creator, worship the latter as the first Tirthankar, the first world-teacher and the first law-giver, and so we may infer from these coincidences that Brahma and Adinath Swami are one and the same Divinity worshipped under different names and interpreted in different ways by the followers of the two greatest and oldest religions of India, and the Ugras, the Ugraputras and the Bhogas of the Jain scriptures are no other than the Ugras, the Ugraputras and the Bhojas of the Vedas and the Upanishads.

Regarding the four faces of Rishavdeva Swami रिशवदेव श्रम (published by निर्णयसागर यन्त्रालय Bombay) says:—

"यह श्रीकृष्णदेवकी एक हजार वर्ष व्यतीत हुये, तब विहार करके विनोता नगरीके पूरी मताल नामा वागमे चाये, तब बड़ा इतिहास फाल्गुन वदि एवादशीके दिन तीन दिनके उपवासी थे। उन्हीं पहिले प्रहरमे केवल द्वान घर्षणु भूत भविष्यत वर्त्तमानमे सब पदार्थोंके जिनमे देखने वाला भाव-स्त्रापुर रूप केवल द्वान प्रपट हुया, तब चाँगल इन्द्र भाये देवताओंके समवसरण बनाया। तीन गड़ वाया देवता इवादि समवसरणकी रचना करी। एकैक दिशामे तीन तीन
But inspite of the above interpretation of the four faces of Rishavadeva Swami, it is a fact that the followers of the Jaina faith often erected his four-faced images and worshipped the same. The renowned historian Sir W. W. Hunter says:—

"There (on the mount Aboo) are five temples in all, one of the largest being three storied, dedicated to Rishavanath, the first of the twenty four Tirthankars, or deified men whom the Jains worship. The shrine, which is the only inclosed part of the Rishavannath temple, has four doors, facing the cardinal points. The image inside the temple is quadruple, and is called Chaumukh, a not unfrequent form of this Trithankar." (Hunter's Imperial Gazetteer of India. Vol. I).
Now without further discussion on the oneness of the two sectarian gods, Brahma and Rishavanath, we should better try to trace the origin of the different clans of Kshatriyas and determine their status from the different Jaina scriptures.

The Kalpasutra is one of the most authentic Jaina scriptures. In connection with the birth of Mohavir Swami some celebrated houses of Kshatriyas are mentioned in the following manner:

"वरदंतर वा चक्रवर्द्धि वा बलदेव वा वासुदेव वा एवागुलेश्व वा भोगुलेश्व वा इक्ष्वाकुलेश्व वा बतियागुलेश्व वा चतुर्यागुलेश्व वा तहुयागुलेश्व विशुद्ध जात कुले वंशेः पायारंस वा।"

In the annotation in Guzrati of the above extracts, named Sukhabodha, Moharaj Binoy-bijoyjee says:

"पापाकारे निम्य करिनि ड्यू एटले श्रीपादिनाथ श्रव रत्न पणे खापन करिना लोको तेवना कुलमा। भोग एटले गुण पणे खापन करे ना तेवना कुलमा। राजन्य एटले श्रीकप्रभेदव श्रव ए मित्र तरिके खापन करिना तेवना कुलमा।

d्वागुलेस्व एटले श्रीकप्रभेदव वंशमा तथव थायला तेवनां कुलमा। चतुर्यागुलेश्व श्रीपादिनाथ वंशमा दर्शन तरीके खापन करिना तेवना कुलमा।"
The Ubabai Sutra is another authentic Jain scripture. In its first chapter (प्रथम इतिहास) some Kshatriya clans are mentioned, as:

"तन कालेण तेन समवें स्वमन्य भगवयो महावर्तक स्थतवासी वही समाना भगवंतो भणे भद्रया उणा पञ्चवर्त राजपानात कोरब चतविय पञ्चवर्त भडा जोहा ब्रैनाव श्रस्वतायो वेष्टे दम।"

श्रीमभद्रेव सुरुक्त टीका: —पञ्चवार्तक मिश्रम:। पणे गर्वावलित, सचि समुखिए एकेन: एते चने केरिपद्यिक्योऽऽ:। उणा पञ्चवर्त, उणा:। परिक्षेत्रेन थे थाराचिकले नियुक्त:। तत्त्वज्ञान स्रत:। उणा:। सन्त:।। प्रवृत्तक दैवामानित:। पवमन्यायपि पदानि नवर:। भोगा थे तेनेव गुह्लेव अवहंत:। तत्त्वज्ञान:। राजन्या थे तेनेव वस्त्रत्या व्यवङ्गीत:। तदंश-जाता:।। रञ्जाकु वंशविशेष: भूता:। नागवा नागवस्मभूता:।। कोरवत्ति तरवरकु कुस्तवस्मभूता:। चतविया:। चातुर्वेषः। वितिह-वर्णभूता:। भवर्ति चारा भद्रा जोहाती भ्रेत्या:। विशिष्टतरा:। श्वस्ववता:।। सनाव शैवनाथ:।। पञ्चवार्तत प्रस्तृ-तरा धर्मशास्त्रपाठक:।। श्चिन:।। श्रीविद्वाच्चापायित-सीवर्ण-पञ्चवास्मस्वत:।। दवभागसमवेंः।। उणाविष्कृतः।।

Published by the Late Rai Dhanputsing Bahadur, the famous Zeminder of Baluchar, Murshidabad.
Rai Poshani Sutra is another Jaina scripture, in which, on the occasion of a visit to a saint named Keshikumar Shraman the following Kshatriya houses are mentioned:

1. "जन इसे वह दृष्टि उपाया भोगा राज्य
चत्याङ्क कारव जाव इज्जां इज्ज गुप्तान्तायाः
क्यवलिक्रमा जलियोवारावं ताहय भणि गद्द्या दृष्टाय जाव भणि गद्द्या पाद्वारविषारकेष महया वंदो चंद एसि निगच्छति एवं संपीच्छतः।"

2. "कंचुद रुरिसं वाक्बेि एवं व्यासी किंसे देवादुष्पिया
बज्ज्य सवालिन्त नयोर्इए दृष्टि महेंद्रवा जावसागर महेंद्रवा जेना
इसे वह दृष्टि उपाया निगच्छति।"

श्रीमलयगिरि भार्याघ्यक्त टीका:—वह दृष्टि उपाया भोगा इसे ज्ञान चादित्रविषायापिता उपगुप्तास्ताव कुमाराय-
व्या इच्छायंत्राएवं भोगा चादित्रवित्यावस्थायापिता गुणावस्य-जाताः राज्यं भगवन्यस्वामुन्याः यावत् कारारभावं। इत्यादि।"

खत्तिय महाना मद्द जोह भर्ग मलाल भर्गयं तेन तेन
इसे परिष्द्व: तब चत्याय सामाल्यराजकुलिनाः। मद्द
श्रीयेिवान्त: योसारस्तिकी विशिष्टतरा; मद्दकिनी लेख्कविकश
राजविष्टा स्वतं चेत्ताराजस्य कृत्ति केवलस्य राजाने
नव मद्दकिनी नव लेख्किनः। बन्धे च वहव; साराबादि
राजानो माण्डलिका इव्वरा: युवराजनस्तल्वरा; परितुष्-
A part of the commentation in Guzrati named Balabodhe made by Moharaj Meghrajjee is quoted here.

"एक घरा भादिनाथी चार्मणप्रेय धात्यात्तेय तथ्या रेडुला बुद्ध उपयुक्त भादिनाथी मित्रप्रेय धात्या राजस्थान जायते राजन्या चतुर्यात सामान्य राजकुलीन। इलाके शे जस्थात को देवांजीरं बंग जाव में तो धात्या नवमाझर मनार हस्त्री प्रमाणेकं मुद्रा पुनरात लेखत। पुत्ता भारत सर्वल वर्णपना धनोतेः था माण्डल्यां कोडपूण्य सेट सत्यापति सत्यवाहनपित। इलाके पुनरे सम्पुण्य पहिला धात्यानिधिपतना देवता पूजा पवित्र इव लाभारण पहिला जिम वालां मुद्रा लोके वाहिकाली कणा भारत भावत किमी धात्यात निजानु लोकां घोडा वेढा घोडा हाथ वेढा घोडा कपाळ खाड़व देता पालस्वामी सना मनुष्य बंद्रा वा धात्यानां निकल एम मनमातिर विचारं विचारोवाद सुधरा पुणरपति देवांजीरं देवांजीरं एम चित्र सावधी घोडं चित्र घोडो देवानिधिपियां धात्य पालस्वामी नगरी दुर्गा महादेव तां लागिक दुर्गा जेन्द्र कार्येख एहि नाम उपवर्गाणी इतमोगाणिंक सम्बोलिक धात्यां घोडांववलटा जाइकद्र।"

Published by the
Late Rai Dhanput Sing Bahadur.
Nearly five hundred years ago Rishi Joymulji wrote a poem founded on the Rai Poshani Sutra named परदेशी राजाका चौपाठ in the provincial Hindi of Rajpootana, which was collected and published by the Late Rai Shitav Chand Nahar Bahadur, the famous Zemindar of Azimganj, Murshidabad. The portion of it corresponding to the above extract is quoted below:

र्मू विनारिघोड़ा चब्बा जी केद रचने सुखपाल।
के पालिकि यादे हुड़ा वहले जी, गया तिन वानविचाल। ६३
पाँच चभिमग मवि सूं साचवे जी, मन वचने काय।
बेवा करता तिन प्रकारणी जी, जिम उववाक माहि। ६४
तिन वहसर चित साचवी जी, शृणि जन शब्द विश्व।
चित्ता मन माहि एहवि दपनी जी, बहुजन जाता देख। ६५
बाचवी नगरी मे भाज किसो चढ़े जी, दुधमहोच्छव कोई
काष्ठियो कहर सुरुकन बदनी जो, नाग वेकमण होय। ६६
भूत यव कोई मैरव कोई देहरो जी, दच परवत गुफा क्रूः।
नदी तबाह नाहाइद समुद्रियो जी, एता प्रसुख भनूघ। ६७
भोग उववाकाज़ुल दपना जी, इचागु वंशी भाय।
सज भाभर चब्बा निज वांडने जी, टोले मिल मिल जाय। ६८
चित मनमे दम तेवड़ी जी, सेवा पुरुषदुलाय।
चित दपनी लो माहि कःति जी, कार प्रशाम बहु भाय। ६८
केशो भाया नो निहवो हुँठी जी, सेववोशी तीय।
रंद्रादिक धरवर तदो नही जी, भाज महोच्छव कोय। ७०
कैशी खामी पाँचै साहित्यों जी, वाग पवारकालः।
श्रीपादिक कुल बहुजन वन्दना जी, जाय श्रवण हुबे जेठ ॥ ११

चची धराम परितीत सुः, तहत जानि निनंदेह ॥
इच्छा पुच्छो वलि वलि, धर्मि कहो तुम एह ॥ ५२
शेष बनाधिप राजवी, उपकुलादिक सार।
धन वाहन देयादि जी, लिखि सचम भार ॥ ५२
ऐ० पुंछन माहरी, तज्जः भिखर चंसार।
पिण सुभाष समभादयो, श्राक नत्त्वी वार ॥ ५४
शब्दिवान राजेन्द्र compiled by जैनाचार्य सीमवृ
विजयराजेन्द्र घृणेकर श्रीराज says :—
उगम—उगरद्यकारिलवदूः। शादिवानवामापति भारत—
वंशजे चरियभे इ।
उगकुल—चारतिनां शुल्ले।
उगलुक—उयानां गुताः—उयानां कुमारेशु चरियजातित—
विशेषः।
नन्दीकायत्ति—चाचारक्षुद्व ( २ स्तुतिकवथा १० भाष्यन
२ स्त्रय) says :—
"से भिक्षु वा नाव पवित्रे समाणे वे जाये गुप्त कुलाण्ड,
जाने जा, तं बलदा, उमकुलापौि वा, भोमकुलापौि वा, राहच
कुलाण्ड वा, खत्तियकुलापौि वा, दक्षागुप्तकुलापौि वा, तिऱ्क्ष—
कुलाण्ड वा, "
Pandit Rabjee Bhai Debraj and other learned commentators of Cutch in Guzrat in their commentary of the above extracts say:

“उत्तरशी दविवंशलगोना छकुलो राजपूत बगेना हे” i.e. छग, भोज, राजन्य, चत्रिय, रघुजु म दविवंश are the six Rajpoot clans.

However, all these analogical surveys of the Hindu and the Jain scriptures clearly show that in spite of the unavoidable differences, arising from their different religious teachings, they are, in essence, one and the same in their description and opinion about the origin and the status of the different clans of the Kshatriyas of old. Now we shall try in the following chapter to trace out the sources of the legends and fictions prevailing among the family bards of the Rajpoots, and the later interpolations in the Puranas.

“शंतलोहितकैवचं: पीतंनलिङ्ग बन्धुणा।
पभिनिबसिता वर्षोंलिङ्गामनीिन विषुणा॥”

(द्विवंशम्)
Legends about the origin of the Agnicoola Rajpoots.

We have shown in previous chapters that according to the Rig Veda we have Rajanya (Kshatriyas) sprung from the arms of Brahma (बाङ्ग राजन्य: छत:). In the Manusamhita and the different Puranas, we have, besides these, Solar and Lunar houses of Kshatriyas descended from the great Rishis, Marichi and Atri respectively. Rajpoots, as the name implies (Agnicoola, Solar and Lunar) are descended from both the Vedic and the Samhitic Kshatriyas,—originally two distinct stocks of the Kshatriyas of old. In fact, according to popular belief, Brahma and Agni are one and the same divinity and hence the Kshatriyas descended from the Vedic Royal classes springing from the arms of Brahma came to be known and called as Agnicool Rajpoots. If we carefully examine the figments of imagination invented by the Bhutta minstrels, under honest misapprehension of Shastric lore, it will be clearly apparent that they are based upon nothing but distorted and fanciful inter-
pretation of the Vedic and other scriptural texts. To prove our contention we quote below from Col. Tod's Rajasthan some of the fictions originating from the fertile brain of the Bhutta bards.

"Notwithstanding the sanctity of Aboo, and the little temptation to disturb anchorites of Bal, the Munis who passed their time in devotion, whom desire never approached, who drew support from the cow, from roots, fruits and flowers yet did the Daityas envying their felicity, render the sacrifice impure, and stop in transit the share of the gods.

"The Brahmins dug the pit for burnt-sacrifice to the south-west (nairrit); but the demons raised storms which darkened the air and filled it with clouds of sand, showering ordure, blood, bones and flesh, with every impurity on their rites, their penance was of no avail.

"Again they kindled sacred fire; and the priests assembling round the Agnicoonda prayed for aid to Mohadeva.

"From the fire-fountain a figure issued forth, but he had not a warrior's mien. The Brahmins placed him as guardian of the gate, and thence his name Prithihadwara. A second issued forth, and being formed in the palm (choeloo) of the hand was named Chalooka. A third appeared and was named Pramara. He had the blessing of the Rics and with the others went against the demons. but they did not prevail."
"Again Basistha seated on the lotus, prepared incantations; again he called the gods to aid: and as he poured forth the libation, a figure arose, lofty in stature, of elevated front, hair like jet, eyes rolling, breast expanded, fierce, terrific, clad in armour, quiver filled, a bow in one hand and a brand in the other, quadriform (chatooranga) hence his name Chohan.

"Basistha prayed that his hope might be at length fulfilled, as the Chohan was despatched against the demons. Sacti-devi on her lion, armed with trident, descended and bestowed her blessing on the Chohan, and Asapurna or Kalika promised always to hear his prayer. He went against the demons; their leaders he slew. The rest fled, nor halted till they reached the depths of hell. Anhul slew the demons. The Brahmins were made happy and of his race was Pri-thwiraja." Rajasthan Vol. I, Chapter VI.

"When the impieties of the kings of the warrior race drew upon them the vengeance of Parusarama, who twenty-one times extirpated that race, some, in order to save their lives, called themselves bards; others assumed the guise of women; and thus the singh (horn) of the Rajpoots was preserved; when dominion was assigned to the Brahmins. The impious avarice of Sahasra Arjuna of the Hya race, king of Moheswar on the Nerbudda, provoked the last war, having slain the father of Parasurama.

"But as the chief weapon of the Brahmin is his curse of blessing, great disorders soon ensued from the want of the strong arm. Ignorance and infidelity spread
over the land; the sacred books were trampled under foot and mankind had no refuge from the monstrous brood. In this exigence Viswamitra the instructor in arms of Bhagwan, resolved within his own mind, and determined upon, the recreation of the Chetries. He chose for his rite the summit of Mount Aboo, where dwell the hermits and sages (Moonis and Risis) constantly occupied in the duties of religion, and who had carried their complaints even to the Kheer Samudra (sea of curds), where they saw the Father of Creation floating upon the hydra (emblem of eternity). He desired them to regenerate the warrior race, and they returned to Mount Aboo with Indra, Brahma, Roodra, Vishnu and all the inferior divinities, in their train. The fire fountain (anul coond) was lustrated with the water of the Ganges; expiatory rites were performed; and, after protracted debate, it was resolved that Indra should initiate the work of re-creation. Having formed an image (pootli) of the durba grass, he sprinkled it with the water of life, and threw it into the fire-fountain. Thence, on pronouncing the Sanjivan mantra (incantation to give life), a figure slowly emerged from the flame, bearing in the right hand a mace and exclaiming "Mar I Mar I" (slay, slay). He was called Pramar; and Aboo, Dhar and Oojeein were assigned to him as a territory.

"Brahma was then entreated to frame one from his own essence (ansa). He made an image, threw it into the pit, whence issued a figure armed with a sword (Kharga) in one hand, with the Veda in the other and
a Zunoo round his neck. He was named Chaluk or Solanki, and Anulpur Patun was appropriated to him.

"Roodra formed the third. The image was sprinkled with the water of the Ganges, and on the incantation being read, a black ill-favoured figure arose, armed with the dhanoos or bow. As his foot slipped when sent against the demons, he was called Purihar, had placed as the poleoh or guardian of the gates. He had the nonangul marústhalī, or 'nine habitations of the desert,' assigned to him.

"The fourth was founded by Vishnu; when an image like himself four-armed, each having a separate weapon, issued from the flames and was then styled Chaturbhooja Chauhan, or the four armed. The gods bestowed their blessing upon him and Macavati-nagari as a territory. Such was the name of Gurra-Mundilla in the Dwapur or silver age.

"The Dytes were watching the rites, and two of their leaders were close to the fire-fountain; but the work of regeneration being over, the new born warriors were sent against the infidels, when a desperate encounter ensued. But as fast as the blood of the demons was shed, young demons arose; when the four tutelary divinities, attendant on each newly-created race, drank up the blood, and thus stopped the multiplication of evil. These were,

Asapurana of the Chohan.
Gajun Mata .. Purihar.
Keonj Mata .. Solanki.
Sanchair Mata .. Pramara.
"When the Dytes were slain, shouts of joy rent the sky: ambrosial showers were shed from heaven: and the gods drove their cars (Vahan) about the firmament, exulting the victory thus achieved.

"Of all the thirty-six royal races (says Chand, the great bard of the Chohans), the Agnicoola is the greatest: the rest were born of women: these were created by the Brahmins!"

Rajasthan,—annals of Haravali, chapter I,

Though on account of the custom of changing the appellation of the Kshatriyas of old to correspond with the change of domicile or in commemoration of personal celebrity or great conquest, it is difficult to trace the particular scriptural name of each clan of the present day Rajpoorts, still by an analogical survey of the Vedic allegorical writings and the legends invented by the family bards it is clearly established that the Agnicoola Rajpoorts are identical with the Vedic Rajanyas (राजन्यः) sprung from the arms of Brahma. It is also a matter to be noted that even the derivative meaning of the word राजन्यः is राजपूतः or Rajpoorts.
The Interpolations in the Puranas about the origin of the Rajpoot Kshatriyas.

In almost all the Dictionaries, compiled in Sanskrit, Bengali or Hindi within the last fifty years, the Rajpoots are declared to be a mixed caste born of Kshatriya fathers and Karan or Vaishya mothers. The cause and basis of such assertions are the two verses interpolated in the two Puranas, as quoted below:

"चब्रात् कश्चकन्यायां राजपुत्रो बस्तृतं द |
राजपुत्रान् कर्षादायुर्यिति प्रकृतिः। इसति वधवावर्त्त पुराणम्।"

"शूद्रानां वै वैश्वजातः करणो वर्षसहर:।
वैश्वानां व्रजपावातोवर्षसहस्र गान्धिको विषिक्।
कांसकार-श्रीकारी व्रजचाल्तव संभूलत:।
उपयु राजपुत्रच तस्मां चब्रात् बभूत:।।
इसति वधवावर्त्त पुराणम्।"

Before we proceed to entertain any argument against the genuineness of the foregoing verses,
we must, first of all, acquaint our readers with the history of the Ugrakshatriyas or Aguris, who are, according to the said verses, only collaterally related to the Rajpoot Khatriyas, although in reality, they are none other than one of the main sects of the Rajpoot Khatriyas.

The said Ugrakshatriyas or Aguris are found under those nomenclatures, only in the district of Burdwan in Western Bengal. Generally they pass themselves as उग्रचत्रियपुत्र, the true synonym of the Vedic उग्रपुत्र, though some of them, who strictly observe the rites and customs of Khatriyas and wear Janoo or sacred thread, call themselves Jana Ugrakshatriyas. However, it is an uncommon and ever-enjoyed privilege of the Ugrakshatriyas to wear sacred thread in Bengal, where the members of all other castes, high or low, beneath the rank of Brahmins, have been deprived of such a distinction and treated as Suditas from time immemorial, with the single exception of the Baidyas of Western Bengal. There is a time-honoured custom among the Ugrakshatriyas to put the word “Raja” before the names of their respective progenitors, whenever they have occasion to mention them, without any distinction of sect, class or family. They are, in their childhood, taught to get by
heart the following verse setting forth the characteristic virtues of their race or caste:—

यश: सुशील: सुधीर: सुवज्ञा,
कौतिष्ठ वित्तम् न हिंसातुर्वर्वा।
जगलंभवं बलमल्लभवः
नवन्नवन्नकुलभ्रोणिः॥

Since the Ugrakshatriyas came and settled in Bengal, diverse theories, solely based on imagination, have been invented by the Pandits of Bengal about the origin of this caste. As the Ugrakshatriyas or Aguris are nowhere to be found except in the district of Burdwan in Western Bengal, there is no doubt that it was in Bengal that the above-quoted verses were composed and interpolated in the Puranas, embodying the earliest theories of the Bengalees about the origin of the Ugrakshatriyas.

Pandit Lalmohon Vidyanidhi wrote a voluminous book named Sammandha Nirnaya (सम्मन्द निर्णय) to trace the origin and ascertain the status of all the castes of Bengal. The book is chiefly based on the Brihat Dharma Purana, which contains a vivid picture of the Bengalee society of the time and consequently he held the Ugrakshatriyas and the Rajpoots to be the sons of
Kshatriya fathers and Vaishya mothers. However, as regards the character, custom and usages of the Ugrakshatriyas, he said:—

"Though the Ugrakshatriyas are by nature of an imperious temperament, they are well versed in the observance of religious and secular rites and ceremonies and all social good usages. * * * Both the sects have set up and worship idols of deities and perform rites of hospitality."

Though the interpolations of the above-quoted verses in the Puranas decidedly prove that when the Ugrakshatriyas or Aguris first came and settled in Bengal, they were not thought of as the Ugras of the Manusamhita, still the latest theory, invented by the modern lexicographers of Bengal, is that the Ugrakshatriyas or Aguris are the sons of Kshatriyas, born of Sudra mothers. Mohamohopadhaya Panchanan Tarkaratna follows the same theory in his "Ugrakshatriya Bibaran." But as regards their character, customs and usages, he highly praises them in the following manner:—

"The Ugrakshatriyas from time immemorial have been following the laws and precepts of the Vedas. Many of them have alms-houses and guest-houses. They are, in general, devoutly hospitable. Many have established idols of gods. The god Salagram is installed
almost in every household. Many have set up and endowed temples of the god Shiva."

"All observe the religious rites prescribed for the different days of the year, practise vows and fastings and give gifts to the preceptors, priests and Brahmins. All go on pilgrimage with ardour. Such a caste, pure in customs and usages, is very rare now-a-days."

"Though on account of their maternal descent they are deprived of being Dwijas*, still their uncommon faith in religion, spiritedness, benevolence, sheltering the needy and the helpless and their extra-ordinary self-sacrifice, which are the characteristics of their forefathers, have invested this race of Kshatriya descent with a greatness and glory of its own, not dimmed by the ages."

"Their womanfolk are pure in conduct and accustomed to observe religious vows and rituals. They know full well how to value chastity. Formerly many ladies of this caste burnt themselves on the funeral pyres of their deceased husbands; to commemorate the memories of these Satees, some Satee-temples are still to be found in many places in the Burdwan district on the banks of rivers or tanks or in the planes."

* But the fact that still a sect of them wear Janoo (sacred thread) and observe the rites and customs of true Kshatriyas, decidedly proves that they are neither a mixed caste nor deprived of being Dwijas.
As regards their occupation, though they are numerous at present, the above-quoted Brihat Dharma Purana says:—

Pandit Ghanaram Chakraverty, one of the earliest poets of Bengal, in describing the foundation of a new town says in his शीघ्र-मास्थः:—

“उपरनाथ्यारी, वसिष्ठ भागुरी,” “Aguris of imperious temperament settled there.” Again he says:—

“कुलिन वायस्व वैद्य, वायस्व पागुरी भाव, विजय जायगिरि यार गाँ।”

“The Kaisthas and the Baidyas of noble families and the members of the first twenty two families of the Aguris, who hold villages as Jaigirs for their victories in battles, settled there.”

In भविष्णवस्त्रांश्च, compiled by Halaudh, the author of the भ्रात्राणस्त्रांश्च: and the court Pandit of Maharaj Lakshan Sen, the last Hindu king of Bengal, we see “उपर युगक्रियाहति:” though it was, most probably, inserted in that dictionary at a later period when the Ugrakshatriyas came and settled in Bengal.
Pandit Rajendralal Acharyya, B.A., in his “बाजारी बल” (strength of the Bengalees) says:—

“The history of the valour and prowess of the Ugrakshatriyas of Burdwan were still vivid at that time in the memory of all. The emperor Sulaiman was able, after long and hard fighting, to bring them into subjugation. The captive Ugrakshatriyas, like the Sikhs, not only parted with their plaited hair but also offered their heads with it. They gladly preferred death by impalement on the iron stakes to the sin and dishonour of forsaking their own religion. Still then the Brahmins of Bengal did not forget that the Ugrakshatriyas had, not long before, been engaged in hard fighting with the Pathans to protect the temples of Saptagram.”

In the seventies or eighties of the last century, the Late Rev. Lalbihary Day wrote a book titled “Bengal Peasant Life” to describe the life-history of the peasants of Bengal. In course of time, some of the Ugrakshatriyas, being of a warrior class, but thrown out of military employment, had been reduced from the exalted position of Jaigirdars to the peaceful occupation of husbandmen, and so the author preferred one of them as the hero of his famous work. Here we must quote a few lines from
the remarks he made on the character and temperament of the Ugrakshatriyas.

"Amongst the peasantry of Western Bengal there is not a braver nor a more independent class than the Ugrakshatriyas or Aguris, the caste of which our hero was a member. Somewhat fairer in complexion than Bengal peasants in general, better built, and more muscular in their corporeal forms, they are known to be a bold and somewhat fierce race, and less patient of any injustice or oppression than the ordinary Bengali raiyat, who is content quietly to submit, even without a protest, to any amount of kicking. The phrase Agurir gonar, or the "Aguri bully," which has passed into a proverb, indicates that the Aguris are, in the estimation of their countrymen, a hot-blooded class; that they are fearless and determined in their character, and that they resent the slightest insult that is offered them. Fewer in numbers than the Sadgopa class, which constitutes the bulk of the Vardhamana peasantry, they are a compact and united band; and there is amongst them a sort of esprit de corps which is hardly to be found in any other class of Bengalis."

Chapter XLII

Such were the Ugrakshatriyas or Aguris, whose unflinching valour and undaunted spirit, even in the most adverse circumstances proved unique, and whose splendid spirit of self-sacrifice and superhuman endurance and fearlessness of the most tortuous and cruel death for the sake
of their unshaken faith in their own religion, were unparallelled.

Now let us try to analyse the sayings of the Puranas about the origin of the Rajpoorts and the Ugrakshatriyas and their relation to each other. According to the above quoted verse of the Brahma Baibarta Purana, the Rajpoorts are a mixed caste, born of Kshatriya fathers and Karan mothers, and Aguris of Karan fathers and Rajpoot mothers. The second verse quoted above from the Brihat Dharma Purana says that the Ugrakshatriyas and the Rajpoorts are one and the same caste and both of them are born of Kshatriya fathers and Vaishya mothers.

As for the above mentioned verses they materially differ from each other. Firstly, the Ugrakshatriyas and the Aguris are not two separate castes, nor are they even different sects of the same caste. The term Aguri was applied to the Ugrakshatriyas to mean that they had come from Agra. Others say that as they were engaged to guard the frontiers of Bengal and Orissa they got the appelation of Aguri derived from the Hindi word Agorna (to guard). But in the two Puranas their origin and even their nomenclatures have been recorded differently. Secondly, the origin of the same Rajpoorts is
differently treated and versified in the two Puranas. Thirdly, as both the Puranas are compiled by the same great Rishi Vyasa, these different versions regarding the origin of the same caste are absurd and must have been interpolated in the two Puranas at a later period.

The Brihat Dharma Purana is indeed correct in so far as the oneness of the Rajputs and the Ugrakshatriyas is concerned, but the basis of their oneness is not that they were both born of Kshatriya fathers and Vaishya mothers. The basis of their oneness is to be found, as we have already seen, in the Vedas, the Upanishads and the Jaina scriptures, as it has been shown in the previous chapters and both of them are the descendants of the noble Kshatriya races of old, said to have sprung up from the arms of Brahma and latterly known as Agnicoola Kshatriyas.

But what did make these Agnicoola Rajputs, domiciled in Bengal, so much fascinated with the synonym of the Vedic nomenclature while the Kshatriyas of all the noble houses, living all over India, were known,—and felt it so very glorious to be known, as Rajputs?

Since the conquest of Bengal by the Mahomedans, Burdwan became a place of great
political importance. The Hindu rulers of Orissya reigned gloriously and independently in the middle of the sixteenth century and often extended their dominions up to the Western banks of the Damodara, and that is why the great and far-sighted Mahommedan ruler Sher Sah constructed the Grand-Trunk-Road from Delhi to Burdwan for easy communication between these two far-situated parts of his empire and for the convenience and facility of the mobilization of troops when necessary.

Some Agnicoola Rajpoots came down to Bengal as soldiers in the ranks of the early Mahommedan rulers and were placed in the eight Parganas of Burdwan, the South-west frontier of Bengal, to guard against the encroachments and invasions of the powerful Hindu rulers of Orissya.

But on account of the meagre knowledge of the Bengalees about the origin and social status of the Rajpoots, they were, with all their valour, prowess and good usages, looked down upon by them as low caste people. In the epic poem, the Chandi, written by Sreekabikankan Mukundaram Chakraverty, the greatest and one of the earliest poets of Bengal, the Kshatriyas are described as the true heroes
of the Ramayana and the Mohabharata in the following manner:—

"चबि वैसे मातुवन, सबव्यासी-भववंश,
चन्द्वंश वैसे महाजन।
पुराण वर्ण पाषाण, वसिल हिजी पाषाण,
प्रतिदिन हिजी देय घन।"

"The Kshatriyas of the solar race, the jewels of the crown of the world and the great men of the lunar race settled there. In the hope of hearing the Puranas they settled by the side of the Brahmins and gave them riches every day."

But in making a mention of the Rajpoots he writes:—

"दोसर यमेर दूत, वैसे यत राजपूत"

"The Rajpoots, the accomplices of the agents of Yama (the god of death) settled there."

Not only this but he also went further and made his hero Kalketu chastise Bhandu Dutta, a Rajpoot refugee, in the following manner:—

"ह'वे तुढ़ राजपूत, वल्लास कायङ्कुत,
नीच ह'वे वज्ज चंभलाष।"

"Being a low caste Rajpoot, are you so much ambitious as to pass yourself for a Kayastha?"
O! pity for those Rajpoot warriors, who had the misfortune to come down to Bengal, where, in spite of their matchless bravery and high position all over India, they were thought to be such a low born race.

Now it is clearly seen how far the Rajpoots, who had been domiciled in Bengal, were justified in accepting the Vedic nomenclature with the word “Raja” put before the names of their illustrious progenitors to mean that they were no other than the descendants of the Vedic Rajannyas, and though we are not quite sure how far they were able to enlighten their new neighbours in Bengal, in this respect, certain it is, that in spite of so many legends, fictions and interpolations in the Puranas, regarding their origin, it was not unknown to the Agnicoola Rajpoot Kshatriyas that they were the true Kshatriyas of old, sprung up from the arms of Brahma, and there is no doubt that this is the only true and correct interpretation of the origin of the Agnicoola Kshatriyas, which is also corroborated by the most authentic religious books, such as the Vedas, the Upanishads and the Jaina scriptures.

However, in the list of the Ugrakshatriya families domiciled in Bengal, drawn up by the
Kulacharyya Shashtidias Bhattacharyya and quoted by both Mohamohopadhaya Panchanan Tarkaratna and Pandit Lalmohan Vidyanidhi, we see that the Indu and the Soma, the two chief branches of the lunar dynasty of the Rajpoot Kshasriyas, head the list, as:

निःशाले इन्द्र घर सोम सुझाफर ।
वाचाते परेशकुल पवि पदहवर ॥
वाचवक काजुन सोम याते विग्राह ।
सात-सद्रकाय गुस्त हृद दैसि करि रय ॥
धे धाते पवित्र कुल दरा, दरा, दे ।
हृदसपुरे सुनि सांख्यान याते ॥
बह्मानि रत्नाकर दचिष्ये राजन ।
एक्यारे शल्लिकारे शेनि नन्दन ॥

The cause of this is that during the reign of Akbar, the great Moghal Emperor, a new horde of Rajpoots, under Raja Mansingh came down and fought a battle at Mogulmari, defeated and drove away the Pathans from Bengal and settled down in the Burdwan Division, under the governor of the province. It was not long, before these two hordes of Rajpoots, thrown together so far away from their cradle, came to be united into one community, and that is why we have
the above quoted interpolations in the Brihat Dharma Purana and the Brahmabaibarta Purana, connecting the Ugrakshatriyas or Aguris and the Rajpoots, so closely with each other, though in reality, they are only different stocks of the same pure Kshatriyas of old.
An appeal to the Rajpoot Kshatriyas.

We have seen that the Rajpoorts alone are now the only race in India that can lay a just claim to their direct descent from the pure Kshatriyas of old. This claim is fully and indisputably supported and corroborated in this book by copious references to the Vedas, Upanishads, Samhitas, Puranas, Jain scriptures, ancient literature and contemporary annals. Modern scholars are, however, of opinion that the present-day Rajpoorts have in them the blood of Scythian, Huna and other foreign settlers in the country, and their admission into Hindu society is often laid stress upon as one of the main argument in favour of the Suddhi movement. But as the result of the great pains we have been taking for the last fifty years, to find out the truth, we are convinced that a most careful and comprehensive discussion of all available authorities leads to the unmistakable conclusion that the customs, usages, ceremonials and even the division of the Rajpoorts into three distinct stocks are all in accordance with the clear injunctions of the Shastras and this is
The only trustworthy and authoritative test that should be applied to determine the origin and status of a particular caste in Hindu Society. The result of our long and arduous study has been condensed and reduced into the compass of this small book, and the only apology for our venturing to publish it, is the humble hope that it may help to dispel the gloom and darkness that enshrouds the social history of the Rajpoot Kshatriyas.

In conclusion we appeal to our Rajpoot brethren, zealous of the fame and glory of their race, to help and encourage us with their esteemed co-operation in furnishing us with any fresh materials at their disposal, to enable us to bring out a revised and enlarged edition for wider circulation.

Jiaganj,
Murshidabad,
The 27th Feb. 1929.

HARICHRAN BANDHU.
Published by the author
    Jiaganj,
Murshidabad.

Printed by D. P. Mitra,
The Elm Press,
63, Beadon Street, Calcutta.
TRADE UNIONS STUDY
UNEMPLOYMENT

Price, 35 Cents

AMERICAN FEDERATION OF LABOR
WASHINGTON, D. C.
X: 922
90
CONTENTS

Introduction.........................................................William Green

DISCUSSING THE PROBLEM IN GENERAL

Business Cycles and Their Control
Charles O. Hardy, Institute of Economics...................... 9

Productivity and Unemployment
Ewan Clague, Economist, Metropolitan Life Insurance Co... 22

"Technological" Unemployment
Jürgen Kuczynski, formerly with American Federation of Labor ......................................................... 44

Occupational Shifts in the United States, 1920 to 1927
Lawrence B. Mann, Assistant Chief, Division of Statistical Research, Bureau of Foreign and Domestic Commerce.... 51

Measuring Rods for Unemployment

Unemployment and the Coal Industry
Isador Lubin, Institute of Economics.......................... 67

STABILIZATION

What Management Can do to Relieve Unemployment
H. S. Person, Secretary, Taylor Society....................... 76

Employment Can be Regularized
Henry S. Dennison, Dennison Manufacturing Co............. 86

Employment Stabilization through Union Management Cooperation
Fred Cullum, Chairman Cooperative Committee, Stratford Shops, Canadian National Railway......................... 93

Recent Efforts to Stabilize the Construction Industries
James S. Taylor, Division of Building and Housing, U. S. Department of Commerce................................. 98
OTHER MEASURES FOR PREVENTION AND RELIEF

Public Employment Bureaus
William M. Leiserson, Professor of Economics, Antioch College 109

Public Works as a Prosperity Reserve
Executive Council Report 1928, American Federation of Labor, Extracts published in the................. 129

Unemployment Compensation in the United States: Joint Plans in A. F. of L. Unions and Plans Operated by Employers
Mary B. Gilson, Industrial Relations Counsellors, Inc........ 134

Trade Union Unemployment Relief Payments
Margaret Scattergood, American Federation of Labor...... 149
**Introduction**

We have been prone in the past to give little constructive thought to unemployment. When a crisis made relief necessary to prevent widespread human suffering, the newspapers carried stories and the public generally was aroused. But relief was given with the thought only to lessen the present hardship and no attempt to prevent future unemployment. Apart from these crises unemployment received even less attention. Plants closed down in dull season with little regard for the needs of their workers; business depressions threw hundreds of thousands out of work; the machine came to replace skilled craftsmen and workers were laid off regardless of the effect on their standard of living and on those dependent upon them. The human element in these industrial changes had little consideration.

But recently more attention has been given to the human side of the problem. Unemployment had been accepted as an inevitable evil, like fire or accident. But when modern technicians gave their attention to the problem, it became just as possible for science to conquer unemployment as to conquer the air with the airplane, and space with the radio. We no longer treat a problem as an inescapable evil. It is a challenge to scientific research and technical achievement.

We are realizing, too, that the human element in industry cannot be ignored. Men and women can live better and work better when they are not anxious for the future. The fear of losing his job is a constant
anxiety to the worker, especially if he has a wife and children dependent on him. Freed of that fear, he can give more to his work and to his home. Stabilization of employment has not only meant better morale in the plant but has also brought other economies through more regular operation. Efforts to reduce unemployment have been well worth while for the employer.

Industry has a further interest in unemployment in that a man without income cannot buy. Loss of work deprives manufacturers of at least 1,000,000 customers each year. These men and women, if they are out of work for a long time will finally have to call on charity for help, and this brings a further cost to the community. There are heavy demands for public and private aid in times of unemployment.

Because it is possible to prevent unemployment and because the workers are vitally interested in the problem, we have gathered these discussions by industrial executives, engineers, research workers, representatives of labor and others who have studied unemployment. This booklet is in answer to the desire of the workers themselves to know more about unemployment. Its purpose is to discuss the general background of the problem and describe some of the methods which have been successful in preventing unemployment and providing incomes during unemployment.

Experience has taught us that there are three main causes of unemployment:

(1) Seasonal dull periods in certain industries, causing seasonal unemployment; (2) business depressions, or dull periods in business generally which occur with a certain regularity every few years, causing cyclical unemployment; (3) widespread changes in methods of
production, such as new machinery or improved work processes which make it possible to do more work with fewer workers and so displace large numbers, causing technological unemployment. The extraordinary development of machinery in the last ten years has made the third type—technological unemployment—an outstanding problem.

After discussing this background of the problem we come to the question—How many workers are unemployed?—and find that there is no way of knowing. It is very hard to keep records of unemployment, for people out of work do not report at any factory or shop. But information is very much needed if we are to formulate plans to prevent unemployment. The change in industrial method has also lead to changes in the kind of work people do. More salesmen and clerical workers are needed now, more school teachers and professional men, fewer factory workers. This shift in employment is part of our industrial advance.

Next we come to the actual remedies which have successfully lessened unemployment. Stabilization or regularization of work and production makes it possible to keep a plant running steadily throughout the year. Where management or management and workers jointly in an industrial concern have taken responsibility for providing steady work, it has been practical to assure workers of a year round job.

Not to provide an effective way for workers to find work when they are unemployed means much waste of time as well as actual hardship for the job seekers. Employment exchanges make it possible for the worker to find work and the employer to get the men he needs with the minimum of waste.
Income during unemployment is a relief measure. Unemployment payments or benefits cannot take the place of full time work, and stabilization rather than relief is the constructive method. Nevertheless it is not possible to provide against every emergency, and unemployment relief funds can protect workers when unemployment cannot be prevented. Unemployment funds may be undertaken as part of a program for stabilization.

Public works programs may be held as a “prosperity reserve” to provide work in times of business depression. In the early stages of a depression, when unemployment is increasing and business is moving downward, the launching of a public works program gives work to unemployed and so produces more buying power in a community. The stimulus of this new buying power tends to check depression and restore confidence and may be influential in starting business on an upward trend.

As business forecasting improves and we are more able to provide against the future, it may be possible to prevent business depressions. So much has already been done that the prospect seems hopeful. The problem would then be to prevent seasonal unemployment by stabilization; and to protect the worker against technological unemployment by unemployment funds, employment exchanges to help him to find new work, by reducing hours of work, increasing purchasing power through higher wages, and by other methods which would make the adjustment less difficult.

It is to be hoped that this booklet may suggest workable measures to those who are looking for constructive solutions.

William Green
Business Cycles and Their Control

CHARLES O. HARDY

One of the greatest elements of uncertainty in the position of the worker in the society in which we live arises from the fact that many, if not most, industries are subject to wide changes in the volume of their operations from year to year. Part of this change is of the nature of growth and is offset roughly by year-to-year growth in the number of workers who seek employment. Other changes are of the nature of decay. Old industries give rise to new ones, either because people's wants and needs are changing, or because ways of providing for those wants have been developed. Such changes often cause heavy losses both to laborers and to capitalists. These losses are part of the price of progress and must be met by someone.

But the fluctuations in business activity, which are commonly called "business cycles," bring, so far as can be seen, no compensating benefit to anyone. Time after time the pace of business swings from prosperity to depression, and back again to prosperity. Planning for the future is made uncertain, for employer and employee alike, by doubt as to whether business will be good or bad. Overtime in one year with slack time the next produces no more goods for the public, no more profit for the employer, and no more wages for the worker, than would steady operation through both years, and the irregularity and uncertainty bring loss and cost to all concerned. The extent of these fluctuations cannot be appreciated until we compare the record of output of
typical industries in good years with that of years that are even moderately bad. The mild depression of 1924 may well serve as an illustration. In the late spring of 1923, business in the United States was more active than it had been for three years. Prices of many commodities were advancing, as were also wage rates in most industries. The volume of production in most lines had been increasing for a year and a half. Building activity was at an especially high level and railroad traffic was breaking all records. There was no apparent reason why prosperity might not continue for many months. The railroads were handling their record-breaking load without car shortages or terminal congestion. The banks had abundant resources, and interest rates had advanced only slightly from the bottom levels of the depression. There is no evidence that inventories of merchandise had piled up in dealers' hands in excessive quantities. The cost of living had not advanced as much as had wages; strikes were few, and political conditions were not particularly disturbing.

Nevertheless, the prosperity movement came to an end. From May, 1923, on through to July, 1924, prices, employment, volume of production, interest rates, prices of stocks, and volume of trade, all moved slowly downward. There was no panic and no violent collapse of prices, and many people were unaware of what was going on. But except for a brief revival in February and March, the situation got a little worse from each month to the next until by the early summer of 1924 the existence of depression could not be disputed. The accompanying table gives some illustration of the extent of this decline in business activity.
Another illustration of the instability of business conditions is furnished by the record for 1927, as shown in the following table (page 12).

These tables indicate clearly that even in years which attract no attention from the general public as years of depression, the extent to which business activity is carried on varies greatly from year to year, and also that there are considerable differences in the fluctuations in different lines of business. Wholesale trade fluctuates much more than retail; the production of raw materials varies from year to year more than that of finished products; production fluctuates more than employment and employment more than wage rates. There are always certain businesses whose changes are out of line with the general trend, but there is nearly always such a
## Changes in Business Activity, October, 1926, to October, 1927

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Increase or Decrease (per cent)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Manufacture and Production:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>- 6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pig Iron</td>
<td>- 16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Automobiles</td>
<td>+ 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cement</td>
<td>- 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lumber</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wool Consumption</td>
<td>+ 8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cotton Consumption</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Raw Material Production:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minerals</td>
<td>- 8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Petroleum</td>
<td>+ 11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bituminous Coal</td>
<td>- 19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Copper</td>
<td>- 8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Factory Employment:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Prices:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wholesale</td>
<td>- 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Retail Food</td>
<td>- 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cost of Living</td>
<td>- 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Distribution:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bank Debts, 141 Cities</td>
<td>+ 12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wholesale Trade</td>
<td>- 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Department Store Sales</td>
<td>- 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mail Order Sales</td>
<td>- 6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Imports</td>
<td>- 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exports</td>
<td>+ 10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Car Loadings</td>
<td>- 7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Finance:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interest Rates</td>
<td>- 12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bond Prices</td>
<td>+ 6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Failures</td>
<td>+ 10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1 Some of these items, like pig iron production, automobiles manufactured, and imports, are based on substantially complete reports. Others, like the retail sales, are based on large samples. Still others, like factory employment and the price series, are indexes based on small but probably well selected samples.

Data from Survey of Current Business.

degree of uniformity that the trend can easily be distinguished.

When we come to the more violent changes such as the business collapse of 1907-8 and the subsequent recovery, or the decline from 1919-20 to 1921 everyone recognizes the extent of the evil.

Before we can prevent or control the fluctuations of business activity, it is necessary, first to form a fairly accurate idea of the character of these phenomena and, second, to work out a reasonably complete and satisfac-
tory theory of their causes. The first task is less difficult than the second, but it is not easy, for no two business cycles are alike—just as no two social movements of any sort—wars, religious revivals, strikes, migrations—are alike. But there are certain outstanding features of a business cycle about which there is general agreement.

First, there is no such thing as a normal state of business. Formerly it was thought that under normal conditions business runs along on an even keel with full employment, full utilization of productive equipment, and stable prices. Any disturbance of this normal level, whether a boom, or a slump, was regarded as an event which had to be explained by special circumstances outside the normal course of the business process itself. Wars, crop failures, inventions, and discoveries, currency changes and taxation changes were among the most common causes described as responsible for the beginning of these changes.

Now, however, it is generally accepted that a certain amount of up-swing and down-swing is itself normal. Special events outside the business process itself may increase the violence of the swing or may cause an abrupt reversal of the trend, like the sudden rush of prosperity in 1916, when the war orders for munitions came in. Special factors may prolong a period of prosperity or of hard times, as the good wheat crop of 1890 sold at high prices is believed to have delayed a panic from 1890 or 1891 to 1893. But if such a special and disturbing event does not happen, the wave-like movement goes on anyway. Prosperity in time undermines itself, and depression in time brings about recovery and prosperity without the necessary aid of outside disturbing factors.
To illustrate the way in which this tendency works, take the situation in a period of bad business. For a time it may appear as though the tendency is the other way—for depression to generate more and more depression. Orders are slow and producers cut prices. Instead of stimulating purchases, the cuts seem to make business worse, for buyers are encouraged to hold off for still bigger cuts. Mills close and men are thrown out of work. The buying power of these laborers being cut off, other industries lose part of their market and are forced to curtail operations. Each curtailment is a new reason for further curtailments. Promoters of new industries are alarmed by the evidences of slack demand for the products of existing concerns, and hold off, in spite of the abundance of labor and the cheapness of capital. The industrial machine appears to be stuck on a dead center.

Nevertheless, there are always tendencies of the opposite character, and sooner or later they gain the upper hand. Prices get low enough so that some buyers decide it is of no use to wait for further declines and begin to expand their purchases. Stocks of goods get low. They are usually large in the earlier stages of depression, but production is always curtailed in bad times more than is consumption, so that inventories are drawn down. When the point is reached where new stocks must be built up, some producers get an increase of orders. The influence of any such gain is passed along from one to another just as is the influence of the curtailment of orders on the down-swing.

Moreover, the low costs of construction encourage expansion, at least on the part of those businesses which have not felt the full force of depression, and
there are always such firms. Public utilities, for example, especially those which serve a domestic rather than an industrial demand, usually find that their operating costs have gone down more than have their incomes. Hence, they are in a position to take advantage of the favorable opportunity to build for the future. Government construction enterprises are apt to expand also in depression years. If the building industry expands, brick, cement, and lumber interests feel the effect at once, copper and transportation a little later. Each of these passes its growing prosperity to others. Still later retail buying shows some effect of the increased volume of employment.

So the revival starts. It may "fizzle out" when the exhausted stocks are replenished—as it did in 1895—or it may run on into a revival and a prosperity movement, which has no real basis excepting the reaction from a depression that itself had no real basis.

A second characteristic of the business cycle is a certain definiteness in the order in which various changes take place. Security prices move up or down very early; interest rates very late. Prices of most manufactured goods change less readily than do such indicators of prosperity as employment, shipments, and check payments. On a down-swing prices are held up by mutual understanding even when orders are slack, and on an up-swing each producer hesitates to raise prices till he has all the business he wants, or is forced to do so by rising raw material and labor costs. Manufacturers come into a business revival with a lot of idle plant capacity, which makes it possible for them to get lower costs as the volume of business goes up. Until the expansion of orders gets to the point
where orders run ahead of capacity, prices show little tendency to advance. After a time, however, there comes to be enough demand so that manufacturers decide it will pay to raise prices even though they risk losing some business. Once this process starts, each price advance is likely to stimulate price advances somewhere else. At the first, high prices check demand, for buyers are thinking in terms of low prices and they resent and resist advances. But when increases have become numerous enough to create an expectation of new increases, they begin to stimulate buying. Middlemen, speculators, and to some extent even consumers, begin to buy ahead in anticipation of further advances, and stocks begin to accumulate.

Raw material prices change more quickly than most prices as demand changes. In most lines of raw material production, there is very little organization to control prices; consequently they go very low during the depression, and when competitive buying begins they go up quickly. At the other extreme, railroad rates, public utility charges, and prices of patented articles change very slowly.

If we had some program by which we could check the progress of a boom at the point where labor and equipment are fully utilized without starting a swing in the opposite direction, we should all be the gainers. But, unfortunately, there is no automatic check on a boom at this point. The expectation of price changes and the speculative buying which results, tend to reduce the supply of goods available for actual consumption. The effect of the accumulation of goods by dealers and speculators is to create temporarily the same situation
which would appear permanently if an equal amount of wealth were sunk in the sea.

At the same time the current product itself tends to be reduced by the working out of prosperity. The rush of orders and the excesses of productive effort bring with them a long series of wastes. Managers with more orders than they can handle neglect details of economy. Imperfect goods are shipped out on the theory that time is more important than quality, and consumers accept inferior goods rather than get none at all. With high wages and abundant employment, workers take more time off and change jobs more frequently, and strikes are numerous. Interest rates advance. The boom is no longer adding anything to the real income of the nation.

Both the accumulation of speculative inventories and the falling off of productivity tend to cause the cost of living to rise faster than wages. More money is being paid out in wages than at any other time, both because wages are good and because there is full employment and much overtime. But if the supply of goods is curtailed, more money paid to wage earners can have no other effect than to cause prices to be bid up. If higher prices no longer cause increased output, the cost of living is certain to keep ahead of the advance of incomes—till the speculative stocks are unloaded.

If no outstanding event comes along to end the boom, it ends itself just as surely as does a depression period. Sometimes the bankers get overextended and have to force a curtailment of loans in order to protect themselves. Sometimes it becomes known that excessive stocks of goods are being held for specula-
tion and a scramble to unload starts prices downward—as was the case with silk, sugar, rubber, and other commodities in 1920.

Sometimes a boom ends gradually, but often the down-swing is short and somewhat violent. According to the severity of its symptoms, this state of business is called a period of "readjustment," of "liquidation," of "crisis," or of "panic." Prices of raw material decline rapidly. Production is curtailed, partly because managers find their orders falling off, partly because they anticipate lower costs, and sometimes because they have to apply their receipts to pay off loans instead of putting them into new production. The weakest firms pass into bankruptcy, and the next weakest submit to "voluntary reorganization," which means the transfer of control to their creditors without the publicity and expense of bankruptcy. Under modern conditions the shock is less violent than it was a few years ago, because the banks are better able to work together. If the banks cannot cooperate and each tries to protect itself by collecting from its own debtors ahead of the others, the result is a panic, a disappearance of cash, and a greatly increased number of bankruptcies. Such was the history of the crises of 1873, 1893, and 1907. That the same thing did not happen in 1921 is evidence that some progress has been made in controlling the business cycle.

The root weakness of the present system which gives rise to the alternation of prosperity and depression (aside from such business changes as are directly attributable to wars and natural disasters like the Tokyo earthquake) is the lack of adequate infor-
mation on the part of those who have to decide the amount of goods to be produced. This uncertainty seems to be almost a necessary accompaniment of a competitive organization. Over-production at certain times and under-production at other times arise from the fact that independent producers all make their decisions as to the scale of their operations in the immediate future on the basis of the same information, and each without adequate knowledge of what the other is doing with that information.

The two principal ways in which output is adjusted to demand are advance orders and prices. While this system works fairly well in most respects, it has the serious defect that prices and orders give information concerning the present facts of supply and demand, but not the changes in supply and demand which they are themselves likely to cause. What a business man needs to know is not merely how many units of his product would be bought at a given price, but also how many other producers are reaching the same conclusion that he is reaching at the same time. If A's plans are wrong because A does not take account of B's, and B's plans are wrong because he does not take account of A's, there is no escape from uncertainty except through an agreement between the competitors, or through some outside control. Complete business monopolies, or a socialistic organization, could either one avoid the alternation of excessive optimism and excessive pessimism because they could plan on the basis of adequate information. Business cycles are part of the price we pay for whatever benefits we get from competition and individual free enterprise.
Whether there is any way by which we can keep freedom of individual enterprise and still pool enough information to prevent business cycles is a question as yet unanswered. The writer does not believe we can, though it is probable that much more can be done to modify their violence. For instance, we might give wider publicity to dangerous tendencies as soon as they become evident to a few people, instead of waiting for them to become evident to all. It is probable that the early termination of the prosperity wave in the spring of 1923 was due largely to the alertness with which people whose fingers had been burned in 1921 were watching for signs of trouble. Rising prices checked buying instead of stimulating speculation as they would in a period when the spirit of caution was not so widespread.

The accumulation and wide dissemination of information concerning stocks of goods on hand, employment, foreign trade conditions, building activity, and other phases of the current business situation, are certainly helpful in preventing either an over-estimate or an under-estimate of the prospective supply of goods from becoming so general and lasting as long as it would in an era where every man attended to his own business.

Two other programs for the elimination of business cycles have received much attention from students of the question. One is the employment of government construction works as a reserve to be expanded when private business falls off. This is discussed in another section of the volume and need not be discussed here. (See page 129.) The other is a suggestion, now very
popular among theoretical students, that business conditions can be controlled through the control of interest rates. Particularly in America it is urged that the Federal Reserve System can control the pace of business through marking up interest rates and selling its holdings of bonds in time of boom, and marking down rates to stimulate business in time of depression. The Board has been criticized severely for its failure to control the money market so as to prevent the boom of 1919-20 from running to the heights that it reached, and was given great praise for preventing the same thing from happening in 1923.

Advocates of this sort of control generally place much more emphasis than the author believes is justified on the importance of money market conditions as prime causes of the up-swing, and down-swings, of business. They point to the low money rates of depression as the primary factor which brings the depression to an end, and likewise regard the high interest rates of such a period as 1920 as the principal cause of the collapse of 1921.

To the author of this section, this view seems to involve tremendous exaggeration of a single factor, and he is correspondingly skeptical of schemes to use interest rates as a cure for business cycles. In the author’s judgment it would be a tremendous mistake to throw on any agency the responsibility of stabilizing business through the control of a single element of business costs, especially such a minor element as the cost of money.

---

1 Business conditions have not, as is generally supposed, been more stable in the period since 1922 than they were before the Federal Reserve System came into existence.
Productivity and Unemployment

Ewan Clague

I. Productivity

The United States is at the present time going through a period of remarkable industrial progress, the like of which has never before been witnessed in any nation. An industrial revolution surpassing anything achieved in the famous period of England's development, 1760-1830, is now going on in American industry. In a sense this revolution seems to have taken place almost over night, but in actual fact it had been germinating for a considerable period of time prior to the World War.

For all practical purposes, American industrial development dates from the Civil War, which was in itself an event of tremendous importance in the economic history of the United States. It was the Civil War which decided once and for all that the industries of this country should be developed by the free labor of the North rather than by the slave labor of the South. It is an open question whether or not an industrial system can ever be built upon slave labor, but regardless of this, the fact remains that the outcome of the war definitely settled the question as far as this country is concerned. In the half century which elapsed between the end of the Civil War and the outbreak of the World War, the industrial development of the United States proceeded at a rapid rate. The following table shows the growth of industry during the 45 years from 1869 to 1914.
During this whole period of rapid expansion, there were many machines and mechanical improvements introduced into industry from time to time. But, for the most part, the captains of industry centered their attention upon getting more labor rather than on improving its efficiency. The swelling tides of immigration supplied the millions of laborers needed to build railroads, roll steel ingots, mine coal, or tend looms. And, lest the supply of labor should be insufficient, the bigger industrial corporations actively stimulated further immigration by contracting to furnish jobs to those who would come over from Europe to work in the factories or the mines.

Then came the World War, bringing with it an unprecedented demand for the products of American factories and at the same time completely shutting off the inflow of new labor. The history of wartime industrial activity is now an old story—how the women and children, the lame, the halt and the blind, were all pressed into service for the emergency, especially after the United States entered the war and five million able-bodied men were withdrawn from productive labor.
The point which concerns us here is that the war crystallized all the previous wandering, scattered tendencies into a single overwhelming movement toward mass production by labor-saving machinery.

The war was in no sense a cause of the tremendous outburst of mechanization among American industries. It was rather the occasion which touched off forces that had been in operation for some time. In the scientific management work of Taylor at the beginning of the twentieth century, in the astonishing performances of Henry Ford during the last few years prior to the war, in the development of automatic machinery in the glass industry, and in a dozen other striking examples of productive efficiency, there were clear indications of the direction which industry was taking. But it required the shock and strain of war to transform these more or less isolated and tentative experiments into a flood which swept all before it. During the war industrial engineers found out what they needed to do; during the depression following the war they took the time to do it. And in the last six years industry has been reaping the harvest in the greatest era of increasing productive efficiency ever known.

Inventions and mechanical improvements seem to run in waves or cycles; perhaps it is because industry is more ready to receive them at certain times than at others. But whatever the reason, it is undoubtedly true that there have been long periods of quiet and orderly progress followed by short periods of sudden, rapid changes. No one who reads English industrial history can fail to be struck by the tremendous strides made in England in the two decades following the Napoleonic Wars, when Great Britain became the steel
and textile center of the world, partly at least through the application of labor-saving devices which turned out large quantities of product at comparatively low cost.

The United States, in the years since the World War, has been going through a period of development remarkably like that which took place in England 100 years ago. The automobile industry, for example, is playing the same dominant part in American economic life today that the textile industry was playing in England in the years following 1815. Of course, the drama is being played upon a larger scale—billions as against millions in money, millions as against thousands in men—but the general relationships are the same; the machine is once more displacing labor and the workers are again hunting new jobs. The same old question is being put once more—why, when prosperity is booming, when profits are soaring, and when wealth is abundant, is there so much unemployment and absolute want among working people?

The increase in the productive power of labor during recent years has been remarkable. Two years ago the U. S. Bureau of Labor Statistics conducted some studies on the increase in the productivity of labor in various American industries. The following table shows the figures published by the Bureau.¹

The productivity is expressed in the form of index numbers, but this need not be confusing. In many of these industries it would be impossible to express productivity in actual units—tons per man-hour, pairs per man-hour, barrels per man-hour, etc.—because there are sometimes as many as five or ten important prod-

### Table 2

Indexes of Productivity of Labor in 11 Industries [1914=100]

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Industry as a whole</th>
<th>Blast furnaces</th>
<th>Steel works and rolling mills</th>
<th>Boots and shoes</th>
<th>Leather tanning</th>
<th>Slaughtering and meat packing</th>
<th>Petroleum refining</th>
<th>Paper and pulp</th>
<th>Cement manufacturing</th>
<th>Automobiles</th>
<th>Rubber tires</th>
<th>Flour milling</th>
<th>Cane sugar refining</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1899</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>93</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1904</td>
<td>69</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>108</td>
<td>92</td>
<td>115</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1909</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>104</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>92</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1914</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1915</td>
<td>120</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1916</td>
<td>124</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1917</td>
<td>109</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1918</td>
<td>103</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1919</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>101</td>
<td>105</td>
<td>98</td>
<td>93</td>
<td>104</td>
<td>103</td>
<td>135</td>
<td>130</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>79</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1920</td>
<td>115</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1921</td>
<td>94</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>92</td>
<td>115</td>
<td>126</td>
<td>119</td>
<td>111</td>
<td>94</td>
<td>124</td>
<td>193</td>
<td>118</td>
<td>82</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1922</td>
<td>136</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1923</td>
<td>139</td>
<td>154</td>
<td>137</td>
<td>107</td>
<td>134</td>
<td>128</td>
<td>135</td>
<td>116</td>
<td>132</td>
<td>270</td>
<td>266</td>
<td>128</td>
<td>102</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1924</td>
<td>137</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1925</td>
<td>139</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>106</td>
<td>126</td>
<td>127</td>
<td>163</td>
<td>128</td>
<td>143</td>
<td>262</td>
<td>301</td>
<td>114</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1 This figure is not representative of productivity in the automobile industry in 1918 because of the fact that the Government, for war purposes, placed a restriction on the number of cars which could be produced. In addition, many manufacturers were extensively engaged in executing war orders.

Estimate. For details, see December, 1926, issue of the Labor Review, pp. 31, 32.
ucts in any one industry. There are a few industries, such as cement, in which there is a single uniform product, easily measurable. In these it would be perfectly possible to divide the 1914 output in barrels by the total man-hours of labor worked in 1914; the result would give the barrels of cement per man per hour. Similar figures for 1925 would show what the situation was at that time, and a comparison of the outputs in the two years would show how much of an increase in productivity of labor had taken place over the period.

In the great majority of industries, however, it is impossible to get any common unit of output. Therefore, the various products must be linked together by means of index numbers to get a single index of production, the labor time must be transposed into an index series, and then by comparing the two indexes, the final index of productivity is obtained. It is not necessary to know the process, however, in order to understand the figures in the table above. The index number 100 can be thought of as being 100 per cent, which in fact is exactly what it is. Then an index of 161 for cement in 1925 simply means that the output of cement per man-hour of labor in 1925 was 61 per cent greater than it was in 1914. The figures do not show the actual output of cement per man-hour in either year; they show only that the output (whatever it was) in 1925 was 61 percent greater than the output (whatever it was) in 1914. All the indexes in the table can be interpreted in the same way.

The most striking point in connection with the table is the remarkable increase in productivity in some industries. In the manufacture of rubber tires, for ex-
ample, the worker in 1925 was turning out over three times as many tires as he was in 1914. In the automobile industry the record was nearly as good. Petroleum refining, cement, and iron and steel also rank high. On the other hand, in the older, more established industries like boots and shoes, leather tanning, slaughtering and meat packing, etc., there was much less improvement in productivity over the period. This does not necessarily mean that these industries are backward; possibly they were at a much higher level of productivity in 1914 and could not show such a large increase in the next ten years. All that the table shows is that the amount of increase since 1914 is not so great in these last-mentioned industries.

Approaching the problem from a slightly different angle, Woodlief Thomas, of the Federal Reserve Board, has worked out the following data on productivity in the United States in the last 25 years (page 29).

This table is also shown in index numbers, which can be read in the form of percentages. These figures differ considerably from those published by the Bureau of Labor Statistics. In the first place, they are much more inclusive, since they cover the four major branches of American industry, but not the individual industries within those branches. The Bureau of Labor Statistics figures were confined to manufacturing industries only. Secondly, Thomas' figures are not carried to any such refinements as are those shown in Table 2; the former show the output per worker, not the output per man-hour. To a certain extent Mr. Thomas underestimates the real increase in the productivity of labor from 1899 to 1925 because he makes no allowance for the shorter working day. It would be next to impossible
### Table 3

**Increase in Production of Major Branches of Industry**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Period and Branch</th>
<th>Number of workers (thousands)</th>
<th>Index for end of period (Beginning=100)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Beginning of period</td>
<td>End of period</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1898-1900 to 1908-1910:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agriculture</td>
<td>10,700</td>
<td>11,400</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mining</td>
<td>600</td>
<td>1,010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manufactures</td>
<td>5,300</td>
<td>7,700</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Railways</td>
<td>970</td>
<td>1,575</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total &amp; average</td>
<td>17,570</td>
<td>21,685</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1908-1910 to 1918-1920:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agriculture</td>
<td>11,400</td>
<td>11,300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mining</td>
<td>1,010</td>
<td>1,050</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manufactures</td>
<td>7,700</td>
<td>10,850</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Railways</td>
<td>1,575</td>
<td>2,035</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total or average</td>
<td>21,685</td>
<td>25,235</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1918-1920 to 1924-1926:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agriculture</td>
<td>11,300</td>
<td>10,700</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mining</td>
<td>1,050</td>
<td>1,050</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manufactures</td>
<td>10,670</td>
<td>9,770</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Railways</td>
<td>2,035</td>
<td>1,860</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total or average</td>
<td>25,055</td>
<td>23,380</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1898-1900 to 1924-1926:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agriculture</td>
<td>10,700</td>
<td>10,700</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mining</td>
<td>600</td>
<td>1,050</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manufactures</td>
<td>5,300</td>
<td>9,900</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Railways</td>
<td>970</td>
<td>1,860</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total or average</td>
<td>17,570</td>
<td>23,510</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mining excluding petroleum</td>
<td>576</td>
<td>858</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Petroleum</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>192</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1 Differences due to changes in census classification.


to estimate the exact decline in the average length of the working day in the last 25 years, but we all know that there has been a very considerable shortening of hours in all manufacturing industries, while even the farmers now work much shorter hours than they used to. Therefore, in spite of the remarkable increase in
## Table 3
Increase in Production of Major Branches of Industry

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Period and Branch</th>
<th>Number of workers (thousands)</th>
<th>Index for end of period (Beginning=100)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Beginning of period</td>
<td>End of period</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1898-1900 to 1908-1910:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agriculture</td>
<td>10,700</td>
<td>11,400</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mining</td>
<td>600</td>
<td>1,010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manufactures</td>
<td>5,300</td>
<td>7,700</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Railways</td>
<td>970</td>
<td>1,575</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total &amp; average</strong></td>
<td>17,570</td>
<td>21,685</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1908-1910 to 1918-1920:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agriculture</td>
<td>11,400</td>
<td>11,300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mining</td>
<td>1,010</td>
<td>1,050</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manufactures</td>
<td>7,700</td>
<td>1,10,850</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Railways</td>
<td>1,575</td>
<td>2,035</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total or average</strong></td>
<td>21,685</td>
<td>25,235</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1918-1920 to 1924-1926:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agriculture</td>
<td>11,600</td>
<td>11,700</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mining</td>
<td>1,050</td>
<td>1,050</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Railways</td>
<td>2,035</td>
<td>1,860</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total or average</strong></td>
<td>25,055</td>
<td>23,380</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1898-1900 to 1924-1926:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agriculture</td>
<td>10,700</td>
<td>10,700</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mining</td>
<td>600</td>
<td>1,050</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manufactures</td>
<td>5,300</td>
<td>9,900</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Railways</td>
<td>970</td>
<td>1,860</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total or average</strong></td>
<td>17,570</td>
<td>23,510</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mining excluding petroleum</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>576</td>
<td>858</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Table 3

**Increase in Production of Major Branches of Industry**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Period and Branch</th>
<th>Number of workers (thousands)</th>
<th>Index for end of period (Beginning=100)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Beginning of period</td>
<td>End of period</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1898–1900 to 1908–1910:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agriculture</td>
<td>10,700</td>
<td>11,400</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mining</td>
<td>600</td>
<td>1,010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manufactures</td>
<td>5,300</td>
<td>7,700</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Railways</td>
<td>970</td>
<td>1,575</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total &amp; average</td>
<td>17,570</td>
<td>21,685</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1908–1910 to 1918–1920:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agriculture</td>
<td>11,400</td>
<td>11,300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mining</td>
<td>1,010</td>
<td>1,050</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manufactures</td>
<td>7,700</td>
<td>10,850</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Railways</td>
<td>1,575</td>
<td>2,035</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total or average</td>
<td>21,685</td>
<td>25,235</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1918–1920 to 1924–1926:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agriculture</td>
<td>11,300</td>
<td>10,700</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mining</td>
<td>1,050</td>
<td>1,050</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manufactures</td>
<td>10,670</td>
<td>9,770</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Railways</td>
<td>2,035</td>
<td>1,860</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total or average</td>
<td>25,055</td>
<td>23,380</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1898–1900 to 1924–1926:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agriculture</td>
<td>10,700</td>
<td>10,700</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mining</td>
<td>600</td>
<td>1,050</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manufactures</td>
<td>5,300</td>
<td>9,900</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Railways</td>
<td>970</td>
<td>1,860</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total or average</td>
<td>17,570</td>
<td>23,510</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Mining excluding petroleum**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Index for end of period (Beginning=100)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Workers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>576</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


to estimate the exact decline in the average length of the working day in the last 25 years, but we all know that there has been a very considerable shortening of hours in all manufacturing industries, while even the farmers now work much shorter hours than they used to. Therefore, in spite of the remarkable increase in
productivity shown by the data in the table, we are quite safe in saying that they are probably too low to express fully the increase in man-hour productivity over the period.

In view of the fact that our primary interest is in manufacturing, rather than in the other branches, the following detailed table covering this branch only is shown below.

Table 4

Growth of Manufactures by Census Years, 1899-1925
(Index Numbers, 1899=100)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Quantity of output</th>
<th>Number of persons engaged</th>
<th>Output per worker</th>
<th>Primary horsepower installed</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1899</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1904</td>
<td>122</td>
<td>117</td>
<td>104</td>
<td>134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1909</td>
<td>159</td>
<td>145</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>185</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1914</td>
<td>169</td>
<td>156</td>
<td>108</td>
<td>222</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1919</td>
<td>214</td>
<td>204</td>
<td>104</td>
<td>232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1921</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>158</td>
<td>107</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1923</td>
<td>261</td>
<td>197</td>
<td>132</td>
<td>330</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1925</td>
<td>275</td>
<td>187</td>
<td>147</td>
<td>356</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1927 estimated</td>
<td>280-3</td>
<td>182-6</td>
<td>151-5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


These figures substantiate very well the productivity indexes of the Bureau of Labor Statistics. Note the steady increase in productivity from 1899 to 1909, then the decrease through 1914 to 1919, with only a very indifferent showing in 1921; followed finally by six years of tremendous progress, during which time productivity in manufacturing increased nearly 50 per cent.

However, in spite of all the figures given above, the most striking examples of increased productivity are to be found within the limits of a particular industrial process, where the full influence of a labor-saving machine can be felt at once. There are few industries in which
mechanization has occurred more swiftly or more completely than in the glass industry during the past ten or fifteen years. The results of such mechanization on labor productivity are set forth in a recent bulletin of the Bureau of Labor Statistics. The following table emphasizes the extent of the changes which took place when the hand processes gave way to machine methods.

**Table 5**

*Index numbers of labor productivity and labor cost in the glass industry, by article and process*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Article</th>
<th>Labor productivity</th>
<th>Labor cost</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Hand process</td>
<td>Machine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bottles:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2-ounce prescription ovals</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>3906.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-ounce prescription ovals</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>4109.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2-ounce extract panels</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>2511.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3½-pint sodas</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>1642.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1-pint whisky dandies</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>742.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1-quart milk bottles</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>1449.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3-gallon water carboys</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>994.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pressed ware:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8-9-ounce table tumblers</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>1228.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10-ounce table tumblers</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>1240.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4½-5-inch nappies</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>759.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-7-inch nappies</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>491.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3½-ounce sherbets</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>817.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4½-5-ounce sherbets</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>630.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Blown ware:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lamp chimneys</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>142.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25-watt electric bulbs</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>3126.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40-watt electric bulbs</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>3142.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9-10-ounce punch tumblers</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>1419.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Glass tubing, sizes 19-21</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>591.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Glass tubing, sizes 32-34</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>746.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Window glass:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Single strength.</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>261.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Double strength.</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>228.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Plate glass:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rough plate</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>145.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Polished plate</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>160.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


The tremendous changes in productivity brought about by machine methods are almost unbelievable.
For example, in the production of 4-ounce prescription oval bottles: By the hand method which was used extensively until early in the twentieth century, the average output of bottles per man-hour of labor was 0.536 gross (a gross being 12 dozen, or 144 bottles), in other words, about 75 bottles per man per hour; by the semi-automatic process which came into general use in the late 90's, the average output was 0.797 gross, approximately 115 bottles per man-hour; by the automatic machine processes which began with the invention of the Owens machine in 1904 and were perfected in 1917, the output per man-hour was 22.028 gross, or about 3,172 bottles.

A case almost equally striking is that of electric light bulbs. By hand the average output per man-hour of 40-watt electric light bulbs is approximately 54 bulbs; by semi-automatic machine it is nearly 117 bulbs, or about twice the output by hand; but with the automatic machine the output per man per hour is slightly over 1,700 bulbs, more than 30 times the output by hand. At the same time the labor cost has been almost eliminated. To make 100 bulbs by hand cost about $1.39; with the automatic machine the labor cost per 100 bulbs is somewhat less than 5 cents. The astonishing thing is that this whole development has taken place since 1917. Dr. Stern’s bulletin is filled with similar examples, but it is impossible to mention them all here; enough examples have been cited to show the revolution which has recently taken place in the glass industry.

II. PRODUCTIVITY AND UNEMPLOYMENT

Increased productivity of labor through the invention of machinery or the use of improved methods of pro-
duction is one of the oldest causes of unemployment. It is probable that there was never a machine invented which did not at least partly destroy the value of an industrial craftsmanship that had been perfected after years of patient effort by skilled workers. Mention has already been made of the bottle-making machines which at a single stroke completely wiped out all necessity for skilled craftsmanship in one branch of the glass industry, and reduced one of the most highly developed crafts in modern times to the level of unskilled laborers. Such happenings have not by any means been confined to American mass production. Who does not remember the pitiable scene portrayed by Thomas Hood in his poem, "The Song of the Shirt?"

"Work—work—work
From weary chime to chime
Work—work—work
As prisoners work for crime!
Band, and gusset and seam,
Seam, and gusset and band,
Till the heart is sick, and the brain benumb’d,
As well as the weary hand."

Thomas Hood was a poet, so he made no attempt to account for the poor woman's misery, but as economists we know that she was one of those thousands of English workers who fought a bitter, yet losing, struggle against the sewing machine.

Books which would fill a library have been written to show the beneficial effects of machinery upon the human race. Ordinarily a machine does not move men to express themselves in poetry and song, for it is a rather unsentimental affair. But at times machines do stir
men’s emotions, particularly those of pride or fear, and these lead to the writing of romantic volumes extolling the machine as the slave and benefactor of mankind or else to the publication of bitter pamphlets which attribute nearly all human misery to the domination of machines over men.

However, we are not concerned here with these larger aspects of the relationship between men and machines. Our immediate interest is the direct effect of the introduction of machinery upon the workers in an industry, and the indirect influence of this machine upon all workers. In order to understand fully what is the relationship between productivity and unemployment, it is necessary to trace, step by step, the developments following the introduction of important labor-saving machines or processes in an industry.

The first and immediate effect of an increase in productivity is to reduce the demand for labor. It makes no difference whether the increased productivity of the workers is due to better machinery, improved chemical processes, new methods, or faster work on the part of the men themselves. The result is that it will require less labor to produce a given amount of product; that is, there will be a reduction in the number of man-hours of labor needed in the particular process. Under very favorable circumstances, such as in a rapidly growing industry in which labor is scarce, the worst that is likely to happen is that the demand for additional labor will cease; there may be some drastic readjustments of men and jobs, but since trade and craft lines in such an industry are not very sharply drawn anyway, this may not work any great amount of hardship on the workers generally. But, in the case of an old, well-established
industry, in which the workers have invested years of training and effort, the change in productivity is almost sure to destroy the need for certain skilled trades, causing widespread unemployment among these particular groups of workers.

The second result of increased productivity is likely to be a marked expansion of the industry. Improved methods mean reduced costs to the employer (if they did not, he would not install them) and in the course of time these reduced costs lead to lower prices of the product. The consuming public is attracted by the cheap prices and buying increases. Soon the manufacturers find that the demand for the product has exceeded the supply, and then they begin to expand their productive capacity in order to take care of the customers. Then there is a need for more laborers, so some of those who were laid off are taken on again, though probably not as skilled workmen, as they were before.

The course of events just outlined is now so well known to intelligent business men that they look upon it as almost a matter of routine. It was thoroughly understood long before Henry Ford astonished the world by making a billion dollars out of it. The railroads in this country in the early days, for example, made use of it just as Henry Ford has done—that is, they reduced the price first, trusting that the increase in public demand would be great enough to boom the industry and enable them to put in labor-saving devices afterward. Henry Ford boasts that he has always fixed the price of the Ford car far below the cost of production. He counted on an enormous sale of cars at the cheap prices; the engineers, faced with the problem of turning out these cars, would rack their brains to dis-
cover short-cut methods; these methods would result in lower costs, and the car would finally yield a profit. So far Henry Ford has never been wrong in his calculations.

The third step in the process is that the expansion of the one industry leads to increased demand for raw materials, more machines, tool makers, and so on. When the automobile industry is expanding, there is more demand for steel to make engines and bodies, for rubber tires to equip the finished autos, for railroad cars to haul both the steel and the finished automobiles, etc. In a thousand different directions the demand spreads back to other industries, which in turn must hire more labor in order to supply the automobile manufacturers. So the remaining unemployed laborers, who were thrown out of work when productivity increased in the first industry, now find their way back into other industries, and eventually every one is at work again.

This, in brief outline, is the classical economic theory concerning the effects of increased productivity upon unemployment. A sudden improvement in one industry, workers thrown out of work; lower prices lead to increased demand for the product, the industry expands and some of the workers are taken back; other industries supplementary sell to the expanding industry and take on additional workers to increase their output. The net result is that every one has gained something; the consumers have lower prices; the workers are all employed again, and even though their wages are no higher, they can buy more goods with them because of the lower prices; the employers are probably making higher profits.
Nevertheless, in spite of all this obvious general benefit, it is not at all unusual to find working men and women bitterly hostile to labor-saving machinery. Nor is this hostility necessarily due to ignorance and stupidity. The simple story of increased productivity makes very pleasant reading, but in real life it isn't nearly so romantic a tale. Several important points are concealed in the above analysis.

First, there is the time element. Where the employers take the initiative and actively push the expansion of the industry by reducing prices in the beginning, the workers may be rather fortunate in that the two developments take place together. But in many, many cases it does not work this way. Some overwhelming invention, like the linotype, the Owens bottle machine, or the conveyor belt, dispenses with such a large number of workers that it requires years to build up a demand for the product which will employ even a reasonably large proportion of the old working force. All during this time of readjustment, whether it be a matter of months or of years, the workers are unemployed; and, in addition, they are worried about the prospect of employment in the future. This is no small burden for working men to bear.

In the second place, skilled craftsmanship is often rendered utterly useless. What comfort is it to the skilled glass blowers to be told that the glass factories need hundreds of floorsweepers? It may be that the glass blower never will be able to find work as a glass blower. All the years of apprenticeship that he has invested in the industry are completely wasted; in the competition for a new job he is even worse off than the man who has had no training whatsoever. A large
group of workers, capable craftsmen, respected members of the community in which they live, are reduced to poverty. The industrial loss is even greater than the social. Men of 35 and 40 years of age who have been at the very top do not fit in further down the scale. To the young man beginning his life work, a job as floor sweeper may be an opportunity; to the older man with a previously established career, it represents degradation and shame. Thus a certain small group of men may find their lives ruined by the invention which is to benefit the human race.

Thirdly, in a still larger way any disturbance of the even tone of industrial development is a severe blow to the workers. Of course, the workingman does not want a static society in which every one is fixed in his place once and for all, and in which the only opportunity for promotion comes when some of the older ones die off. But of all classes in society, the industrial worker has the greatest need for security. To the capitalist, industrial disturbances often mean opportunity; to the worker they seldom mean anything other than loss. In boom times his wages lag behind prices and profits, while in bad times he is constantly in fear of coming unemployment. Therefore, the increased productivity which disturbs the industrial situation strikes directly at the security of employment and wages which the workers need so badly.

Finally, there is the ultimate difficulty that the results of increased productivity do not often work out in any such simple way as that outlined above. An important invention very often spreads throughout all industry instead of being confined to the particular industry in which it was first applied. For example, the belt con-
veyor which has been such an important influence in recent increases in productivity is being introduced everywhere. Attempts to use it in coal mining have just been pronounced fairly successful, so that the miners may soon find their jobs being timed and mechanized. When improved processes spread in this way the effect on the worker is intensified. Driven out of one industry the workers rush to another, but here too they are soon driven out and must hunt for still another. There are 1,000,000 fewer workers in manufacturing since 1920. It is useless to talk about the workers finding work in the industries which help make the new machines. Before long the labor-saving development has been carried so far that they are inventing machines to make the machines that make the machines.

The only way to grasp this point clearly is to get the idea of a rate of change. Rate means speed, or amount of change per unit of time. If inventions and improved processes spread faster than the workers can adjust to them, then it is clear that jobs are being destroyed faster than new jobs are being created. The rate of invention is greater than the rate of adjustment; speaking in the language of immigration, inventions are coming in faster than they can be absorbed.

This undoubtedly describes the situation in the United States during the past five years. In spite of the tremendous increase in the output of manufactured products during those years, the volume of employment in manufacturing industries has been steadily shrinking. According to the employment indexes of the Bureau of Labor Statistics there are at least 10 per cent fewer workers employed in manufacturing now than there were in 1923. Even in the comparatively slight
setback which industry in general experienced in the autumn of 1927, there was a tremendous volume of unemployment.

Of course, all the men who have been pushed out of manufacturing employment during the past five years are not now unemployed. One of the latest statistical games consists of trying to discover where they have gone. Personal experiences would lead one to believe that an astonishingly large number of them have become traveling salesmen or life insurance agents. It is known that thousands of men and women have found employment as cab drivers, automobile mechanics, gasoline service station owners, women's hair dressers, etc. They have left manufacturing industries entirely. This change is not necessarily bad; it may in fact be very good, for most of this work is much pleasanter than factory work. But the essential fact is that the extremely rapid rate of invention is steadily reducing the number of industrial workers. The disadvantages to the workers are the difficulties of shifting over to entirely new jobs and the danger of unemployment whenever slight slackening of industry occurs. It is hardly necessary to point out that any serious depression in industry would throw millions of men out of work, more even than were unemployed in the disastrous year of 1921.

The problem of productivity as far as Labor is concerned thus becomes—What can the workers do to enable them to gain the utmost possible benefits from the introduction of new machinery and processes without paying most of the costs, as they do now? The policy often pursued in the past has been that of opposing the new machine entirely and doing everything possible
to prevent any change whatever. This is not a very good method, because it is purely destructive, not constructive. It puts Labor in the position of opposing all improvement, and it has the further disadvantage that it is often very ineffective. The workers may block the change for awhile, but if it is important enough it will eventually be forced through in spite of all opposition, and then the workers will be doubly handicapped because of the ill-will of the employers.

The better, more constructive, and more effective method of meeting the situation is for the workers to cooperate fully in increasing productivity, accepting inventions, etc., but to bend their efforts in the direction of controlling the machines or processes. An organized attempt should be made to obtain for the workers already established in the industry the first chance to operate the new machines or derive some of their advantages. One of the most interesting cases in recent years is the struggle of the musicians with the talking movies. Here is an example of a well organized, powerful union faced with an invention having tremendous possibilities. What a joke it would be to go around among the musicians, assuring them that no matter what happens to music there will be plenty of opportunity for ushers in the new theaters. Yet the musicians cannot prevent the introduction of talking movies. The one way open to them is to devote all their efforts toward controlling the talkies, controlling them in the interest of musicians, so that every job which could possibly be filled by a musician will be filled by one.

In the manufacturing industries the case is even more clear. The workers must be organized sufficiently to
protect their interests, and they must have foresight enough to handle the matter intelligently. If the unions cooperate with the employers in raising productivity to the highest possible level, they will then be in a much better position to insist upon having steady employment and full opportunity to share the benefits of all improvements.

One of the simplest and most effective ways of meeting unemployment caused by high productivity is to decrease the hours of labor. It is very fitting that this particular kind of unemployment should be met in this way. In the first place, the increased output often requires speedier and more intense work on the part of the employees, thus causing greater fatigue during the day. Shortening the hours is sometimes absolutely essential to the health of the men. Secondly, increased productivity means that more product can be turned out in a given amount of time, or that the same product can be produced in a shorter time; fewer man-hours of labor are required. If the men work the same hours as before then obviously there will be fewer men employed; by shortening the hours a larger number of men can find employment. It is very much like the system used in bad times—dividing up the work by using two men for half a day each rather than employing one man all day. The workers will be meeting the unemployment problem directly if they press for shorter hours when productivity increases. This is an old, well-tried union policy, and a great deal has already been done along this line.

No one can deny that great material benefits have flowed from the tremendous increase in productivity in this country since the depression of 1921. Not all in-
dustries and not all parts of the country have benefitted equally, but on the whole the condition of American Labor has been steadily improving; wages have been rising, standards of living have been going up. Labor, just as much as any other class in the nation, is interested in industrial progress. All that Labor wants is that the benefits from this progress shall be fairly equally divided among all classes of people.

It is not to be expected that unemployment caused by increased productivity can ever be entirely eliminated. All progress means change and confusion. It is bound to be costly in some ways. As Prof. Irving Fisher says, "Unemployment brought about by improvements and inventions is just part of the price we pay for progress." The workers would not want a security based upon stagnation. Change also means opportunity for some, and no one wants to close the door to opportunity completely. Long after all other causes of unemployment are eliminated, this one will still be operating. It is up to the workers to recognize its importance and to adopt the best possible methods of controlling it.
"Technological" Unemployment

JÜRGEN KUCZYNSKI

UNEMPLOYMENT is nothing new in economic history. There has always been unemployment. However, in some years unemployment is higher than in other years, just as in some months unemployment is higher than in other months.

The development of industry never has been continuously in one direction and uninterrupted. After some years of prosperity follows a period of depression. Prosperity usually means increasing production and depression usually means decreasing production. And if production increases employment usually increases too, just as employment usually decreases when production decreases. Nobody has as yet specifically explained why a period of prosperity is followed by one of depression. The causes of the depression have probably been different for the different depression periods. The time covering one prosperity and one depression period is called a cycle. And the unemployment caused by the depression following prosperity is called cyclical unemployment.

Yet even during years of prosperity, prosperity has not been continuous, but production and business have been dull in some months of the year and active in others. In the building industries, for instance, employment has always been lower in the winter than in the late spring and summer. That means that during the winter fewer workers are working, more workers
are unemployed than during the late spring or summer. Production, business, briefly prosperity, always has fluctuated according to seasons. And so have employment and unemployment. Unemployment caused by seasonal slackening of business is called seasonal unemployment.

Cyclical unemployment occurs once every few years. It is very serious and can last for a year or longer until prosperity prevails again. It affects almost all trades and most of them at about the same time. Seasonal unemployment occurs every year. It is less serious than cyclical unemployment because it ceases with the change of the season. It does not affect all trades at the same time, because all trades do not have their dull season at the same time. For example, while building trades have their dull season in the winter, the iron and steel industry's dull season comes in the summer.

Although cyclical unemployment occurs with a certain regularity every few years, there seems to be no uniform reason for it, and therefore no uniform remedy. Perhaps it will be mitigated or even eliminated when business, supported by adequate statistical research, will have a better foresight into economic developments. The remedy for seasonal unemployment is not so complicated: more even distribution of production over the year as a whole. In practice, however, this may be difficult. Take for instance the building trades. There are certain materials which in the first days after their preparation would be damaged by frost. Therefore one cannot use them during the winter. But one may argue, and rightly, that materials should be prepared which can be used in every season.
Progress has been made. Much time and money has been spent to find the best materials for the security of the house which is to be built; why should one not spend just as much time and money for the security of those who build the house, for the workers, whose economic security depends on their employment and wages? If employers would seriously try to distribute production more evenly over the year as a whole, and to secure thus more stable employment for their workers, much would be done for the elimination of seasonal unemployment.

We have distinguished between cyclical and seasonal unemployment. There are, however, many more kinds of unemployment. The most important among them is the so-called "technological" unemployment. What does that mean? We all know that for 150 years more and better machines have been introduced into industry. A machine is better than another if it produces more without more expense per unit of product. Let us assume a machine produces 100 cigarettes in half an hour at a price of 1 cent apiece and another machine produces 200 cigarettes during the same time for the same price, then of course we would say that the second machine is the better one. But what do the workers say? In the one case two machines are needed in order to produce 200 cigarettes; in the other case only one machine is needed. From the point of view of the worker, in the one case workers for the operation of two machines are needed, in the other case workers for one machine only are needed. That means that production with the better machine requires fewer workers. The machine itself does the work of those
workers; it replaces them. Those workers are out of work because of the progress in technique; the better technique of the machine has caused technological unemployment.

What can we do against technological unemployment? Should we turn against improvements in technique, against the machine which makes production so much easier for mankind, which relieves mankind of much hard and difficult work, and which does this work much faster than any human being could do? Should we turn away from the machine, an instrument of human progress? It would be turning backward to condemn the machine, for machines make it possible for everyone to enjoy greater freedom from work and a higher standard of living. On the other hand, the immediate needs of the individual worker should be considered.

We have used machines for 150 years, and in spite of continued improvement in machinery the number of workers has increased from decade to decade up to 1920. There have been difficult times of adjustment during this advance, when workers were thrown out of work by the coming of new machines. But in the long run employment has increased and in 1920 industry was giving work to more wage-earners than ever before. But in 1920 the increase suddenly stopped and employment has been decreasing since then.

The increase in productivity in the last few years has been so great and has taken place in so short a time that we have not yet adjusted to it. Productivity increased in earlier years, too; it increased greatly from 1800 to 1850 and from 1850 to 1900. It increased
also from 1900 to 1910. But between 1910 and 1920 it did not increase at all. Then from 1920 on came a general improvement of industrial technique, so that the increase in productivity from 1920 up to date has been sudden and greater than ever before recorded in so short a time for industry as a whole. To protect the workers in this sudden adjustment and prevent them from being scrapped with the oncoming of the machine is our problem. How can this be done?

If productivity and the machine are not the whole reason for technological unemployment, what is the other factor which has made adjustment possible in the past? This other factor is the purchasing power of the public which makes it possible to sell industry's increasing product. The reason for the present technological unemployment is that the buying power of the consumer, especially of the worker, has not kept pace with the increased producing power. In theory, the explanation is as follows: Increasing productivity of the worker means that he is able with, for instance, the help of better machines, to produce more and more per hour. His output in cigarettes, for instance, may increase from 100 cigarettes per hour to 110, 120, 150, 200 and more cigarettes. If his output has reached 200 cigarettes per hour he can produce just as much as 2 workers before, when the machine turned out only 100 cigarettes per hour. It seems that half of the workers on these cigarette machines have become superfluous, since the other half's productivity has increased so much that they can produce what the whole group of workers had produced before. But how, if the total output increases, too? If the demand for
cigarettes also doubles? In this case all workers will have to remain at work. Although one worker produces now as much as two workers before, none of the workers will be dismissed, because the total production has to be doubled in order to satisfy the demand for cigarettes. Here we get at the kernel of the problem. As far as employment and unemployment is concerned, an increase of productivity, replacement of the worker by the machine, do not mean anything final. The only important problem is, does the demand for goods and, consequently, does production, increase at the same rate as the productivity of the worker? Does the total output increase as fast as the output per worker? Does the cigarette production, for instance, increase from 100 million to 200 million cigarettes if the production per worker per hour increases from 100 to 200 cigarettes? If this is the case, then increasing productivity does not mean unemployment but simply greater output by the same number of workers. Actually, however, it takes time for this adjustment to be made. There must be a period of transition between the time when new machines are introduced and the time when demand for the product has increased enough to bring the workers back into industry. The time since 1919, when the improvements in machinery and production techniques have been so widespread, has been relatively short.

We know that production has not increased as fast as productivity, and that the purchasing power of the consumers, most of whom are workers, is not high enough to make use of the opportunities which im-

49
proving technique offers, by buying more and more goods, by enlarging their standard of living.

Those who say that today technological unemployment prevails are right. Productivity has increased considerably in the last years. But production has not followed the increase of productivity. The nation has not produced as much as its technological facilities permitted it to produce. And the nation could not use its production facilities since its consumers had not enough purchasing power to buy all the goods which could have been produced.

Not decrease of productivity, not curtailment of output, but increase of purchasing power of the nation's consumers, is a primary means for decreasing and eventually eliminating technological unemployment and for giving producers free and complete use of the nation's producing facilities. The more quickly the adjustment can be made the less the workers will have to suffer from technological unemployment.
Occupational Shifts in the United States, 1920-1927

LAWRENCE B. MANN

COMPREHENSIVE statistics of the occupational distribution of the American people are only collected every ten years in connection with the census of population. Great changes in the efficiency of production in the agricultural and manufacturing industries have, however, brought about some very interesting shifts in the occupations of the people since 1920.

Unfortunately official data concerning employment by industries is comparatively meager except in census years. Consequently, the latest official statistics of employment in the manufacturing industries are for 1925 and there are no complete data compiled by government organizations for employment in distributive industries, professions, and various types of personal service since 1920. However, it is possible to make some estimate of the changes which have taken place in these industries from data compiled by trade associations and various private publications.

For purposes of analysis the occupations of the people of the United States are divided into six main groups: Production of commodities, transportation and communication, distribution, professional service, personal service, and government service. There have been some marked shifts in employment both within
these groups and between different groups since 1920, as is indicated by the accompanying table.

**Number of Workers 1920 and 1927 (estimated)**

(000 omitted)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Group</th>
<th>Industry</th>
<th>1920</th>
<th>1927 or latest year</th>
<th>Increase</th>
<th>Decrease</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Production</td>
<td>Agriculture (1925)</td>
<td>11,300</td>
<td>10,500</td>
<td>800</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mining (1925)</td>
<td>1,063</td>
<td>1,063</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Manufacturing (1925)</td>
<td>10,689</td>
<td>9,772</td>
<td>917</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Construction</td>
<td>2,500</td>
<td>2,600</td>
<td>100</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Electric Light &amp; Power</td>
<td>150</td>
<td>203</td>
<td>53</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Transportation &amp; Communication</td>
<td>Railroad</td>
<td>2,080</td>
<td>1,776</td>
<td>304</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Telephone</td>
<td>300</td>
<td>378</td>
<td>78</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Telegraph &amp; cable</td>
<td>69</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Distributive Industries</td>
<td>Automotive Industries, including chauffeurs</td>
<td>1,692</td>
<td>2,858</td>
<td>1,166</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Radio</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>150</td>
<td>125</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Electric Refrigeration</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Oil Heating apparatus</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Insurance Agents</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>216</td>
<td>96</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mail Order Houses</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Motion pictures</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>350</td>
<td>150</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Professional and Semi-professional</td>
<td>Teachers and Professors</td>
<td>815</td>
<td>1,000</td>
<td>185</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Lawyers and judges</td>
<td>123</td>
<td>145</td>
<td>22</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Clergyman</td>
<td>199</td>
<td>216</td>
<td>17</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Physicians and surgeons</td>
<td>145</td>
<td>150</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dentists</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Domestic and Personal Service</td>
<td>Hotels, restaurants, etc</td>
<td>1,500</td>
<td>2,025</td>
<td>525</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Barbers, hairdressers &amp; manicurists</td>
<td>216</td>
<td>385</td>
<td>169</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Military and Naval Service, U. S.</td>
<td>334</td>
<td>245</td>
<td>89</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The latest complete statistics for the agricultural industry were compiled by the Census Bureau in 1925,
and show that there was a decrease of approximately 800,000 in the number of workers in that industry as compared with 1920. This resulted from increased per capita output of agricultural workers, and the comparatively low prices for agricultural products which prevailed in the period from 1921 to 1924.

Employment was also reduced in manufacturing industries by about 917,000 from 1919 to 1925, in spite of the rapid expansion in total output. The manufacturing industries which showed the greatest reduction in employment between 1919 and 1925 were shipyards, railroad shops, foundries and machine shops and various chemical industries. Manufacturers of motor vehicles, bodies and parts, electrical machinery, rubber tires, and of certain other articles for which there is a rapidly growing demand have increased the number on their payrolls in spite of the increase in their production per employee.

The total number of persons employed in the extraction of mineral products has shown practically no change since 1920. Employment at coal and metal mines has been reduced during this period but this decrease is about offset by an increase in the number of persons employed in extracting petroleum. Certain of the other productive industries have increased their employment during the past seven years, particularly construction and electric light and power. It is impossible to state the exact increase in number of persons employed in the various branches of the construction industry, but judging from the changes in the total annual output, it seems probable that employment was larger by 100,000 in 1927 than in 1920, especially in connection with the building of roads and various pub-
lic works. In the electric light and power industry there has been an increase of employment amounting to 53,000, or about one-third, since 1920.

The transportation and communication group, as well as the production group, shows a net decrease in employment during the past seven years. This is due largely to an increase in efficiency of operations by the railroads which has permitted them to reduce their force by 304,000 since 1920. This reduction in railroad employment has, of course, been more than offset by an increase in the number of persons engaged in driving motor trucks and buses, but for convenience the automobile drivers are grouped with other automotive workers (except those in factories) under the distribution industries. Employment in the telephone industry increased by about 78,000 between 1920 and 1927 and there was also a small increase in the number of persons employed by telegraph and cable companies.

There has unquestionably been a very large increase in employment in the distribution industries in the period since 1920, but unfortunately no complete data are available concerning wholesale and retail trade. The number of persons engaged in the distribution of automotive products and the servicing of such products (including salesmen, chauffeurs, garage workers, operators of filling and service stations, etc.) increased by over a million in the seven-year period ending with 1927. Even greater relative expansion was shown by the radio industry, which is estimated to have increased the number of its employees from about 25,000 to 150,000. Other distributive industries which have shown large relative increases in employment are chain stores, mail-order houses and distributors of various
types of household appliances such as electric refrigerators, washing machines and vacuum cleaners. The motion-picture industry has also shown a large expansion since 1920, increasing its employment by about 150,000, most of the increase appearing on the distributive side of industry. Other distribution industries which undoubtedly have substantially increased their employment in recent years are real estate and insurance. Estimates of a large insurance company indicate that there was an increase in the number of agents amounting to about 50 per cent between 1920 and 1924, and on this basis it is probable that the total number of insurance agents and employees of insurance companies increased by about 100,000 in the period 1920 to 1927.

The professional occupations have also shown large gains in employment since 1920. Statistics compiled by the United States Bureau of Education indicate that there were about 185,000 more teachers and professors in 1927 than seven years earlier. Estimates from unofficial sources indicate that there have also been very large increases in the number of dentists, lawyers, clergymen, physicians, and other professional men in the United States.

One of the industries which has shown an especially large increase in total number of workers since the last census of occupations is the hotel and restaurant business. Estimates based on changes in the number of hotel rooms indicate that this industry has increased its employment by more than half a million people since 1920. This great growth in the hotel business is a direct result of the increased number of passenger automobiles and the consequent rapid expansion in automobile touring.
The number of barbers and hair dressers has also increased very rapidly during the last few years as a result of the increased patronage of women. It is estimated that there were approximately 385,000 barbers, hair dressers and manicurists in the United States in 1927 as compared with 216,000 in 1920.

The Federal Government has considerably reduced the number of people on its pay rolls during the past seven years, while there has probably been some increase in the number of persons employed by state and local governments. The number of persons in the military and naval service of the United States was 89,000 less in 1927 than in 1920, while the civil service showed a decrease of 132,000. The increase in employment by state and local governments is largely in connection with the schools and the maintenance of roads, and has consequently been considered in connection with those occupations.

Summarizing the changes which have occurred in the main occupational groups since 1920, it appears that there has been a total increase of over 2,500,000 in the number of persons employed in trade and other forms of distribution, professional work and various types of personal service, while the production industries, transportation, and the government service have decreased their employment by a somewhat smaller amount.

Editor's Note: While Mr. Mann concludes that the increases in employment have been slightly greater than the decreases from 1920 to 1927, this does not mean that all those seeking employment could find it. The population has increased since 1920, so that in 1927 there were between 3½ and 5 million more persons who would normally want to work. If we assume that as large a proportion of the population wanted to work in 1927 as in 1920, if they could find employment, there would have had to be between 3½ and 5 million more work opportunities.
Nobody knows much about the actual volume of unemployment in the United States. Astonishing though it may seem in these days when such a vast amount of statistical work is being done by public and private effort, no accurate figures on unemployment are available. It is possible to piece together a great deal of indirect evidence, but the results are incomplete and none too useful. True, a great deal of information showing fluctuations in employment is available, particularly for manufacturing industries. As we shall see however, employment figures do not furnish an adequate basis for measuring unemployment even if all groups were satisfactorily covered.

It is frequently asserted that there is regularly a "reserve army" of about one million unemployed in this country, that is, about 3 per cent of the thirty-six million non-agricultural employees in our population. When unemployment is acute during times of depression, popular interest is aroused and various estimates of total unemployment are made. Frequently these estimates are made by groups or persons who will gain or lose something by demonstrating that unemployment is high or low. Sometimes the estimates are carefully made and are quite helpful in understanding the situation at the time. However, unbiased, careful, and conscientious the investigation may be, it still remains true that all figures on total unemployment should be sus-
pected of serious inaccuracies to an unknown degree.¹

Since it is very important that accurate knowledge be made available, it will be worth while to consider the causes of this unsatisfactory condition. It is explained partly by the natural difficulties in deciding who should be counted as unemployed. Even where a complete census of those out of work is taken, as has been done in several American cities, it is difficult to determine just who is unemployed. Does any individual without a job belong among those “not gainfully occupied,” or among the unemployed? Is he always desiring and willing to accept suitable employment? Suppose he finds work of emergency character as a substitute for his regular occupation—is he still to be counted as unemployed? Or is he to be classified as employed, though he is dissatisfied and has found only temporary employment at best? These questions illustrate some of the troubles which beset the statistical enumerator, and they should be kept in mind by those who desire to understand discussions of employment and unemployment.

Nevertheless, we could count the unemployed with useful accuracy, by arbitrarily applying some reasonable and consistent definition and deciding who should fall within its limits. This is done in England where all jobless persons covered by the Insurance Act must register the number of days of idleness in claiming compensation. Compulsory registration of the un-

¹A rather elaborate attempt to measure unemployment since the war is to be included in the forthcoming study of recent economic changes undertaken by the National Bureau of Economic Research. In this attempt the writer has contributed in cooperation with Mr. Leo Wolman of the staff of the bureau.
employed under a system of nationally operated em-
ployment exchanges would also show how many are
out of work. Some system of registration is the only
really satisfactory way of measuring unemployment.
This is not provided for at present in the United States,
and we must resort to the records of employment and
business conditions in the effort to infer the amount of
unemployment.

Before going farther with an examination of
methods and materials, it will be well to examine
briefly the chief purposes and needs back of any attempt
at measurement. Why is it necessary to have accurate
figures on the amount of unemployment? We are
concerned about prevention and relief; will statistics
be of direct benefit in attaining these ends? An affir-
mative or negative answer should not be given carelessly.
It is true that accurate information is useful in con-
structing a program for dealing with unemployment,
but today there is too little consideration given to the
practical uses to which statistical data once compiled
may be put. Information compiled with the greatest
of care may be useless in whole or in part if the pur-
poses of the compilations are not carefully kept in
mind when the investigation is planned and continually
as it is carried out. Stubborn adherence to time-honored
methods in the interest of uniformity in a statistical
series may cause the most carefully compiled material
to become out of line with changing conditions, as in
the case of an employment index which covers identical
firms from month to month and as nearly as possible
from year to year while new and important concerns
are not quickly enough included.

59
If it is important to obtain accurate and complete information on unemployment, if statistical investigation will materially aid or should prove indispensable in the prevention and relief of unemployment, then the community should insist on wise and efficient expenditure of funds and energy in the development and improvement of useful measuring rods. Those who plan and administer statistical work should ideally be economists vitally concerned with the purposes of their work, not merely statistical clerks or jobholders anxious to publish reports whatever their final value in use.

An earlier chapter\(^1\) has pointed out the distinctions between three kinds of unemployment: *seasonal*, *cyclical*, and *technological*. Technological unemployment is a part of what we might call “*long-run* unemployment”—due to fundamental changes in the make-up of industry such as the permanent decline of production or employment in certain lines and expansion in others. Such long-run changes, frequently called “industrial progress,” are characterized by permanent shifts of industrial energy. As a district or an industry declines its workers must find other employment. If an expanding industry increases its productivity its workers are sometimes temporarily or permanently forced to abandon their old occupations. In a progressive industrial age like our own, such changes are inevitable. Unemployment which results from such changes is accounted for by delay in readjustment as workers shift permanently from one industry to another, and in the refusal or inability of individual industries to

---

\(^1\)“Technological” Unemployment, by Jürgen Kuczynski.
share the cost of present loss of employment opportunity with the worker.

Distinctions between these different kinds of unemployment are important, because different remedies must be applied to the differing sets of causes. Seasonal unemployment is essentially a problem for individual industries which, by better control of their own affairs, may conceivably deal with employment and production on an annual basis instead of hand-to-mouth as at present. Cyclical unemployment is bound up with the ups and downs of business and industry as a whole, the remedy for which is inseparable from a better control of money and credit and prices. "Long-run" unemployment is an affair to be considered by an individually prosperous industry at the time of layoff, and by the community through some system of employment exchanges and insurance for lightening the burden laid on the shoulders of the worker by inevitable industrial "progress."

Not only must we distinguish between these varieties of unemployment, but it is desirable that we measure them separately. Seasonal unemployment may be partially measured by studying employment changes on an annual basis, where monthly or weekly figures are available. Employment figures will not measure unemployment, but they will measure irregularity, which is the thing to be attacked. At present it is impossible to measure each kind of unemployment separately. Before this can be done, it is necessary to arrive at the total amount of unemployment in whatever industry or area is being considered, and in the country as a whole. Therefore the most practical discussion will
relate to the possibility of measuring total unemployment, and the purposes served thereby.

For purposes of planning public works in time of unemployment, sensitive indicators of the number of jobless are necessary. The detail of unemployment insurance, the development of actuarial rates, etc., must rest on adequate statistical information. In considering the relation of the cycle to unemployment, it is clearly necessary to have statistics of unemployment to parallel those showing the volume of business, price changes, wages and earnings, etc. Where such information is available, as in certain European countries, it is always used prominently by students of the business cycle. Unless relationships between unemployment and other elements in the cycle are established continuously, the factors involved in the attempt to stabilize business and employment through levelling out the cycle cannot be clearly understood.

Figures on total unemployment are built up from analysis of localities, districts, and industrial groups. These subdivisions are essential in the case of both employment and unemployment figures for purposes of placement and equalization of the labor supply between industries and localities. It is further important to have comparisons between the volume of unemployment in various industries and localities from time to time, as well as a measure of the change in unemployment in the country as a whole. Such comparisons show when and where progress is being made, and they make it possible to compare the merits of various attempts at unemployment control in different industries and localities under varying conditions.
With no registration of the unemployed, it is necessary to estimate the volume of unemployment by determining as closely as possible the margin between actual employment and the total number of persons available for employment. Every ten years, the Federal Census of Occupations shows the number of persons gainfully occupied in the United States. This is too infrequent, and the census is published too tardily to be of much service in analyzing a current problem. So it is necessary to use elaborate methods in estimating the total number of persons attached to industry. Actual employment is known accurately only for manufacturing, railroad, and certain other important employment groups, while vast numbers are not counted, such as taxi drivers, garage employees, the majority of the white-collared workers, and employees of tradesmen. The hazy groups are so large that any attempt to get at the actual volume of unemployment is fruitless; the best that can be done is to estimate the minimum volume of unemployment. Even then, it is difficult to discover how far reduction of employment in one group is compensated for by increases in another.

A common method used in estimating unemployment has been that of determining the shrinkage in employment, and assuming that the difference between “peak” employment and actual employment at some later time is unemployment. As has been suggested, this is inaccurate. Probably no period can be called one of “full employment,” nor can we assume that a reduction in employment has not been accompanied by a change in the number expecting or desiring employment.
In attempting to attain security for wage-earners, trade-unionism is necessarily concerned with unemployment in a very vital way. Unions may do several things in connection with the problems we are raising. First, every wide-awake union leader should be familiar with the available statistical material relating to employment in his locality. A number of states, notably Massachusetts, New York, Pennsylvania, New Jersey, Wisconsin, Illinois, and Iowa publish monthly reports on employment and earnings, in some cases with detailed information by localities as well as by industries. These reports may be supplemented by figures currently available in the Monthly Labor Review published by the United States Department of Labor, and frequently by local information compiled by banks, charity organizations, trade associations, employers’ groups, etc. Whether these sources are continually used is of less importance perhaps than their ready availability when wage negotiations are impending or in progress.

Secondly, trade-unionists should be alert to the value of better statistical work on the part of official public bodies, and they should be earnest campaigners for the accumulation of improved and more useful information.

Immediately it is of importance that labor should engage in careful record-keeping of its own, realizing the shortcomings of the more generalized public sources of information. This can readily be done. Every union member should fill out a card daily or weekly, showing actual days and hours of work, earnings and the character of alternative employment during slack times, the duration of layoffs, etc. A card such as that shown below
would furnish information which could be compiled by
the central office, the gathering of which would be
amply justified in wage negotiations and in the framing
of trade agreements. Care is needed in summarizing
such information of course. A standardized system
arranged by the national office of the union would make
possible comparisons between districts and perhaps
between different trades and industries covered by
various organizations. This kind of data gathered
now by some unions, sometimes with the help of an
economic expert, not only makes collective bargaining
more effective but furnishes important facts for those
who are attempting to learn more about the general
problem of unemployment.

In the foregoing nothing has been said about under-
employment, or as it has been frequently called, "un-
employment within employment." To determine how
much "short time" and irregular operation there is
among those who remain on payrolls during slack
times, it is necessary to have statistics showing how
many man-hours are worked during a pay period.
Knowing the total number of persons on a payroll dur-
ing any given period, and knowing how many man-

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Weekly Report Card</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Name or number:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Address:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Union:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employer:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Occupation:</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Earnings for week</th>
<th>Straight time</th>
<th>Over time</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hours worked</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
hours were worked, it is possible to determine how many hours per day are put in by the average employee. From this, by comparison with standard or "full-time" employment, can be discovered the amount of "lost time." Statistics of man-hours are also useful in measuring productivity (output per man per hour). Such measurement is important for manufacturers desiring to watch progress in improving efficiency; it is also important for workers concerned with wage scales and the effect of improved operation on employment.
Unemployment and the Coal Industry*

Isador Lubin

Any attempt to explain employment conditions in the bituminous coal industry must take into account two distinct factors, namely (1) the nature of the product, and (2) the nature of the industry's organization.

Coal, it should be borne in mind, is a raw material. It is used primarily in the creation of energy which in turn is consumed as heat or power in the production of other goods. Approximately 90 per cent of the bituminous coal consumed in the United States is used for industrial purposes. Manufacturing in general uses 23 per cent of the production, the railroads 30 per cent, public utilities 8.1 per cent, and by-product coke ovens 10.4 per cent. Domestic consumers consume about one-eighth of the bituminous output in their stoves and furnaces.

It should be evident that the demand for coal must vary with industrial conditions. Being a raw material, the fluctuations in industrial activity are virtually the sole determinant as to how much coal will be taken from the market. The price of bituminous coal, except where substitutes come into competition with it, plays a relatively small part in determining the demand.

*This article is an abstract of a paper delivered by the author at an unemployment conference held at Bryn Mawr, Pa., in July, 1928.
The cost of power and heat which are the forms in which coal enters into the production of other goods is usually a relatively small factor in the total costs of most industries. To be sure, they are an important factor in the cost in the production of aluminum and in certain branches of the steel, chemical, and a few other industries. But by and large, changes in the price of coal have a relatively small effect upon the costs of the commodities in whose production it is a raw material. This being the case, it is the demand for the products of industry and for the services of our transportation system rather than the price of coal which largely determines the market demand at any given time.

The coal industry itself is a highly competitive affair. Due to the ease of opening up certain types of new mines in periods of high prices, it is relatively easy to overstock the market once prices get high enough. Moreover, there is a tendency in the industry for capacity to be consistently greater than the demand for its product. This has been true for many decades. It is the result of a situation in the industry which makes it more profitable usually to keep a mine going at a loss than to shut down entirely. Once a mine has been shut down, overhead costs continue to go on. Closing a mine exposes it to the possibility of cavings, floods, and other forms of deterioration and may even involve a complete loss of investment. Working faces, roadways, and airways must be kept in shape lest a fall of roof incapacitate the mine entirely. A mine which has been shut down must continue to employ a certain minimum number of workers and their wages must be paid irrespective of the fact that no coal is coming from
the tipple. Nor can capital once invested be easily withdrawn. It is no rare practice to continue producing at a loss, for the owner can for a time more easily cope with small losses from sales at a low price than withstand the larger losses which might follow the closing down of his operations.

Due to the tendency of the coal industry continually to overproduce, mines are usually operated on a very irregular basis. It is no rare occurrence for a mine to operate but two, three, or four days a week. Unemployment, therefore, is not a seasonal thing as in other industries where men are laid off for a month or two at a time. It is rather a spasmodic thing which may and usually does occur in any month of the year. To be sure, unemployment is more generally widespread at some seasons than at others. But by and large there are relatively few operations which average five or more days each week.

Nor has it been possible, as in some other industries, to regularize employment by storing output. Thus far, reliable and inexpensive methods of stocking coal for future use at either the mine mouth or in consumers' yards have not been successfully developed. Many grades of coal deteriorate when exposed to the elements. Some are highly combustible and in order to prevent their catching on fire they require careful piling, or, as is practiced by some of the bigger steel companies, submersion in water. Moreover piling up coal above ground at the mines is an expensive procedure. Coal coming from the tipple usually falls right into the railroad cars and no costs of any significance are involved in loading. When it is stocked, however, it must be piled up on the ground and later shovelled
into railroad cars, an undertaking which frequently may add as much as 5 to 25 per cent to the mine cost of the coal. Some coals, because of their friability, do not lend themselves to storing. The larger lumps break up into small pieces thus lowering their market value, for many consumers insist upon their coal being graded according to definite size.

During the war and immediate post-war period, that is—from 1915 to 1923—the capacity of the American bituminous industry was increased by 244 million tons. During the 10 years preceding the war the mine workers in this country were employed on an average of approximately 215 days or about eight and one-half months a year. In 1923, a year of great activity in manufacturing and the third largest year in the history of the bituminous industry, capacity for production was so large that mine workers averaged but about 179 days or about seven months of employment.

While the capacity for the production of bituminous coal has been increasing, the industries which consume heat and power have been undergoing a widespread technical revolution. The public utilities, which consume about one-twelfth of the coal mined, increased their efficiency to so great an extent that they made a ton of coal do 64 per cent more work in 1925 than in 1919. Whereas in 1919 they consumed 2.4 pounds of coal for every horse-power-hour of electrical energy produced, in 1926 they used but 1.46 pounds. Likewise the railroads considerably improved the performance of their locomotives with a marked decline in coal consumption per unit of traffic carried. For every thousand tons of freight hauled one mile in 1917 the average locomotive consumed 176 pounds of coal; in
1926 they burned but 137 pounds, a reduction of 22 per cent. In the passenger traffic the decrease in coal consumption per train car mile was 19 per cent. Similar increases in the efficiency of coal consumption can be found in the manufacturing industries. The tendency toward increased efficiency, incidentally, is still going on.

While industry has been curtailing its consumption of coal per unit of goods and services produced, substitutes have been further restricting the demand for coal. Many industries, particularly ocean shipping, have radically cut down their consumption of coal and have substituted fuel oil for generating their power. By the use of fuel oil it is possible for the ship to cut down on the size of its crew and at the same time increase its paying cargo space. This substitution on the part of industry and transportation has resulted in fuel oil displacing 30 million tons of coal annually.

Hydro-electric power has been also playing its part in restricting the demand for coal. In 1913 it constituted 3.3 per cent of the energy production of the country; in 1926 it satisfied 6 per cent of our power demand. Between 1920 and 1926 it is estimated that hydro-electric power supplanted 20 million tons of bituminous coal.

As a result of all the factors which have affected the consumption of coal the output of the bituminous mines of the United States has remained more or less stationary during the past 10 years. Prior to 1918, the coal production of the country increased at an average rate of almost 17 million tons a year. Since the war that growth has just about stopped. Indeed, our average annual production in the last decade approximated that of 1918 in only a few instances.
Coincident with the developments in industry which have led to a restricted consumption of coal have been certain developments in the status of labor organization in the bituminous mines which have resulted in shifting production from one part of the country to another. The fields of West Virginia, Kentucky, and western Pennsylvania have been striving to divest themselves of any relationship with organized labor. In West Virginia, particularly, where, because of certain coal resources of high quality, abnormally good natural conditions which make possible low production costs, and the laws of the state which make it possible for mine owners to keep labor organizers from their properties, production has been increasing at a very high rate. The operators in this section of the country have frequently been able to adjust their wage rates in such a way as to cut their costs when they have desired to secure additional advantages in the market. Taking advantage of their control over their labor supply, they have been able to cut their costs and undersell those competitors in other fields who had working contracts with unionized miners. As a result, West Virginia and other non-union sections of the country have been able to keep their mines operating more or less regularly at the expense of their competitors in the union fields. The results are well shown in the following table which portrays the days worked in 1923 and 1926 in the union and non-union fields.¹

¹ The year 1926 is used as a basis of comparison with 1923 for two reasons: (1) It was a year of great industrial activity. (2) It was the last year of more or less normal conditions in the union fields, the last two years having been characterized by a strike in most of the organized districts.
### Days Worked by Mines in Various States

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>State</th>
<th>Days Worked 1923</th>
<th>Days Worked 1926</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Alabama</td>
<td>232</td>
<td>266</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>West Virginia</td>
<td>169</td>
<td>247</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kentucky</td>
<td>152</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ohio</td>
<td>150</td>
<td>159</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illinois</td>
<td>158</td>
<td>172</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indiana</td>
<td>136</td>
<td>173</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In West Virginia, in 1926, the mines operated on an average of 247 days; in Alabama, another non-union field, 266 days; in Kentucky, 230 days; in Ohio, a highly organized district, work was available for but 159 days, and in Indiana and Illinois for just about 170 days. It will be noted that even the non-union fields, although able to give approximately two more months of work to their laborers than the union fields, were unable to keep their men employed for more than eight or nine months a year.

Without a radical change in the organization of the coal industry one can look for but little change in the employment situation in the mines. The plea that the number of miners in the industry be cut down and that fewer workers be more steadily employed is not an effective one. Unless the number of mines which employ these laborers is radically decreased one cannot look for a decline in the number of workers employed. A mine must have a minimum working force at all times. If orders come in for its product, the probability will be that it will require a complete working
organization to produce economically. If a number of miners leave a given mine, it becomes necessary for the management to replace them in order effectively to operate. The attack must be made upon the number of mines and not upon the number of workers.

The result of prevailing conditions in the bituminous industry is a competitive situation which forces the price of coal below the production costs of most of the operating units. The larger consumer who buys at the mine is actually getting his bituminous fuel at a price which is less than the cost of production. The loss is being borne by the operators, the large majority of whom have shown deficits for the past four years, and by the miners who are compelled to bear part of the burden in the form of a restriction in income which results from forced unemployment and lowered wage rates.

One of the measures frequently suggested as a means for affording the miner relief from the sufferings of irregular work is a system of unemployment insurance. The cost of such insurance is a legitimate charge upon the consumer of coal, for by no stretch of the imagination is he entitled to his coal at prices which place the burden of maintaining the mining industry upon the workers and the owners in that industry. Yet with the industry as now organized it is questionable whether it would be possible for bituminous mining to add to the price of its product the cost of maintaining its workers during the periods in which they are unemployed. That is to say, an unemployment insurance scheme organized to cover the bituminous industry by itself would hardly be practicable. Unless the industry were radically reorganized, an unemployment insurance
scheme would have to include other industries also, particularly those which use coal as a raw material. Since it is for these industries that coal is produced in the main it is no more than just that they help bear the cost of supporting the miner. If they cannot be made to do that by means of unemployment insurance organized on an industrial basis the only effective means remaining is a general unemployment insurance system with a common pool to which all industries must contribute and from which workers from all industries will receive benefits.
What Management Can Do to Relieve Unemployment

H. S. Person

There are really two problems which confront such a conference as this; one is immediate relief of those in distress because of the lack of current income; the other is avoidance of recurrence of unemployment in the future. The first of these is a community problem requiring emergency action; the second is an industrial problem requiring investigation, long-run planning and reorganization of habits. It is with the second of these problems that this session is concerned.

It is unfortunate that serious consideration is given to the problem of unemployment only when there is a serious condition of unemployment. In the first place, attention is naturally focused on the problem of relief rather than on the problem of avoidance; in the second place, because factories are either shut down or getting along under conditions of extreme managerial difficulty, there is wanting that atmosphere of optimism, buoyancy and adventure which stimulates industry to take up serious consideration of the reorganization of established habits of conduct.

I believe that such things as unemployment are chiefly—not entirely—the consequences of habits of conduct of management in industry, and that the avoidance of such things as unemployment must come from

1 Passaic Conference on Unemployment early in 1928.
elimination of the causes; from replacement of prevalent methods of management by better methods; especially by replacement of managements which are opportunistic and interested primarily in the profit of the immediate turnover, by managements of foresight and calculation which are interested in the profits of the long run. The stabilized industry is the industry that is profitable in the long run—profitable to both owners and workers. Stabilization of an industry can be secured only by good management; management that is good in every department of operations—financing, merchandising, selling and production. The responsibility for stabilizing industry rests primarily with ownership and management; but labor has a large responsibility to recognize good management when it sees it, and to promote it by applause, the removal of obstacles and generally by hearty cooperation. Good managers get more real satisfaction out of the goodwill and active support of workers than out of any margin of unusual financial profit that may result from the good management.

Referring again to the matter of habits, it should be observed that institutions—plants, industries—have habits as do individuals. The management of a business is the sum of its detail habits. The habits of a business are a result of its reactions to its environment, just as an individual's habits are the result of his or her reaction to particular surroundings. And it should be observed further that habits once established are changed with difficulty. Every one of us knows this to be so with respect to humans. Change of habits is more difficult for organizations because the habits involve more intricate relationships and change means
change with respect to many individuals at the same time. So it should not be surprising to realize that management may and does lag behind the fulfillment of demands which changing conditions impose upon it.

The prevailing methods of management became established when industrial conditions were different from what they are at the present time—and from what they are likely to be in the future. American industry has been engaged in pioneer exploitation of great natural resources. Nature provided cheap basic materials which could be easily and cheaply converted, especially on a quantity basis; and a rapidly increasing population plus an established world market provided a ready quantity market. The dice were loaded in favor of success, the market was on the whole a producers' market, and it was not necessary to calculate far ahead. We became opportunistic and complacent, and developed corresponding habits of management—short-sighted and wasteful.

Within a decade the situation has changed. The war unsettled established factors in the environment. Eight years ago our entire industry was thrown on a buyers' market, and many individual industries have continued on a buyers' market to this day. Among these are industries which affect this community particularly. For these industries the environment is no longer one of favorably loaded dice; of opportunism; chance-taking; of short-sighted, wasteful habits. For them there is a problem of reorganization of habits of management to meet new conditions successfully, and the right reorganization means deliberate, well-planned research, covering the whole range of factors form industrial tendencies and market conditions at
the one extreme to individual operations and their tools and methods at the other. And it involves the cooperation of labor in the research and the development of new methods of management.

This argument that management can and must establish much greater regularization—avoidance of unemployment—by new patterns of management is not visionary. It can be done and it has been done—by a few. I have one instance in mind, and without mentioning names shall describe it for you in outline. It is an actual case in the cotton division of the textile industry. Within twenty-five years it has grown from one little insolvent shoddy mill, acquired at that time by the present management, to a group of seven mills, five in the South and two in the North, all dove-tailed together into one profitable enterprise. And the period of its greatest success and growth has been during the past five or six years of depression in the cotton industry. Here is an instance in which wise leadership and superb all-round management have done something more than eliminate unemployment; employment has been increased—created. And not least in significance this has not been accomplished by depressing wages; this enterprise pays wages well above the market at every mill. It gives expression in concrete form to the dictum of Taylor that high wages and low labor cost go together.

I have spoken several times of all-round good management. The management I am about to describe briefly is all-round good management. It uses investigation, research and experiment as a basis for decisions whether of policy, plan or method. As a result of research and experiment it sets up standards of policy,
plan and method—definite and understood practicable goals. And on the solid basis of these standards it establishes a system of coordinated efforts which achieves goals with little waste of human and material effort. And the use of research and experiment, of standards, and of systematic coordinated efforts is not limited to any one phase of management; they appear in every phase—general administration, merchandising, selling, production and finance.

Let us take an illustration of general administration—the determination of policy and long-run plans. When the present management acquired the original plant of this business, it was an insolvent shoddy mill. Why insolvent?—because it had continued to make shoddy products long after the Civil War market for shoddy had disappeared. The old management had not studied industrial tendencies as affecting the textile business. (That is the case of many a textile enterprise today!) The first thing the new owner-manager did was to study the textile industry from its beginning in the United States. He made up his mind that the prevalent organization in the textile industry—manufacturer, factor, commission merchant, and so on—was out of date; that it may have had a good economic basis a hundred years ago, but that the economic basis for such a disjointed industry has disappeared. So he decided upon the policy of organizing under one management a business which should integrate every process from the purchase of baled cotton to the sale of packaged cotton fabrics. Furthermore, his studies showed clearly that a new line must be substituted for the manufacture of shoddy, and he decided upon a line based upon coarse-weave gray goods, a line including
every possible product which could be manufactured from such gray goods. Here we have science in the determination of general policy. What does it mean for stabilization? It means a greater probability of continuous orders, continuous processing and continuous employment.

Now as to merchandising—determining what particular items of the general line to make for any particular season, what particular style elements, what quantities, and so on. This was not left to chance; hunch, habit or imitation of others. The merchandising department of this enterprise is a research and experimenting department. It searches for and tries out new items, searches for new uses for old items, drops items which are becoming obsolete, seeks new consumers and new and better channels to consumers. As a consequence each season's operations are carefully budgeted in advance; every department knows its task in connection therewith—treasurer, sales manager, production managers—and all work together. Such research into markets, forecasting and scheduling, increases still more the probability of hitting the demand, of adequate orders, continuous processing and continuous employment.

These phases of management are very important to workers. The basic thing is to gauge general tendencies and particular demands correctly, in order to make a profit and keep the business going as an employing agency. There is no use of a business talking about doing things for workers if it can not keep itself alive.

Manufacturing follows gauging of tendencies and the particular market, and the making of budgets and schedules. In this enterprise which I am describing—
so successful in these difficult times—I wager Mr. McMahon has already recognized it, it stands out so conspicuously to those who know the textile industry—in this enterprise standards, determined by research and experiment, control the manufacturing operations. There is a standard construction and arrangement of the buildings; standard (the very best) machines, tools, and other equipment for every operation; standard raw materials; standard methods of operating machines; standards of output; and standard rates of pay—higher than competitors. Every worker knows what he or she is expected to do, what facilities are at his or her command, what the standards of expectation are, and that they are practicable and reasonable. Certainty and precision have taken the place of uncertainty and guess.

For instance, a standard of raw material is maintained and deliveries of cotton which do not meet standard are rejected. The spinners know that they may always expect even running grades, and loom tenders know that yarns will run the same. Finishers know that they can count on even running gray goods. And equipment as well as materials is maintained in standard condition. Inspection and adjustment of all equipment is continuous, and every piece of equipment is taken down completely at predetermined periods, worn parts replaced, reassembled and readjusted. Every possible facility is given the workers to maintain quality and output, and to do this easily and comfortably.

No wonder output is high, rates are high, earnings are high and human relations exceptional.
What is the significance of research, standardization and precise control of all manufacturing conditions in regularization of employment? It means that the enterprise can produce goods of a quality which attracts consumers and at a cost which permits successful competition, both of these being factors which keep the enterprise going as an employing agency.

I wish I had time to describe the situation with respect to personnel relations in these plants, but you will have to take my word for that—or better, ask Mr. McMahon. I have considered it necessary today, considering our general topic, to dwell on those things which keep employment steady, rather than on those relationships which follow after employment. Permit me to make just three or four observations. I have already said that wages are higher—much higher—than those paid by competitors in the same communities, and that earnings are steady. Now I want to add that the non-financial satisfactions of workers are correspondingly exceptional. The plants are well built and the conditions of light, heat and ventilation as perfect as science can make them. Retiring and rest rooms are provided. Skilled medical and nursing aid is available. The supervisors are advisors and not drivers. The relations between individuals are free—functional organization makes them horizontal instead of vertical through “authorities.” The villages attached to the southern mills are model villages; surfaced and landscaped streets, sidewalks, churches, movies and pleasant dwellings with baths. These villages are self-governed by the workers. This management is a management of practical idealism; practical because it aims to make and does make its operations
successful in a financial sense; idealistic because it believes good citizenship, independence, self-reliance, self-respect and happiness as important as profits. The workers respect and admire and are enthusiastic supporters of such leadership.

My final thought is that if we really desire to solve the problem of unemployment—not the emergency problem of relief confronting you today, but avoidance of such emergency problems in the future—managements and workers must get together and cooperate earnestly in developing better managements. The state can not do it; students and publicists like the speaker can not do it; the active participants in industry must do it. In the nature of things, in any particular instance ownership and management must take the initiative, but Labor can do much to inspire owners and managers to take the initiative, and can then contribute a great deal in the designing of better management after a start has been made. The designing of better management should be a continuing teamwork affair.

There are three things organized workers can do now. They can cooperate with organized employers in real and continuing study of industrial tendencies and conditions of success in business, and can help to define the policy for any particular industry. They can study methods of management, define what good management is, discover where the good managements are, and then give public approval of such managements. That would be a big influence. Good managers are human beings, are proud of their achievements, and public approval by Labor of their achievements would please the good managers and stimulate others to earn such approval. Finally, if Labor should really study
management and define standards of good management which would meet all the tests, including the test of profitableness and survival, it would be in a position to bring effective pressure to bear on owners and managers who lack the vision and initiative, even though they may have the technical ability, to lift themselves into the class of enterprises which are so well managed as to afford continuous employment.
Employment Can Be Regularized

HENRY S. DENNISON

In the Dennison Company's attempts to regularize employment, six major measures have been gradually evolved. They are:

1. Long range stock goods planning
2. Adding stock items to supplement special
3. Getting seasonal special orders in early
4. Building up "out of season" business
5. Training operatives into supplementary jobs
6. Studying the business cycle

Long Range Stock Goods Planning

Practically all estimates for stock items are made six months in advance by the merchandising division of the business. This division is set up solely to study merchandise in all its aspects, one of which is the gauging of demand for lines and items. On the basis of the

*The Dennison Manufacturing Company are makers of a range of products, the major classes of which are crêpe paper, shipping, marking and system tags, paper cases and boxes, gummed paper and gummed paper products, sealing wax and holiday merchandise. The whole line of stock goods totals some nine thousand items, and made-to-order goods equal stock goods in quantity. The home office and main plant are located at Framingham, Mass.; there are two smaller plants in nearby Massachusetts towns, and one in London, England. Sales offices are maintained in the major cities of the United States, and sales representation of one kind or another in most parts of the world. In all, the company employs about four thousand people. The factory force is about equally divided as between men and women.

86
merchandiser's estimate, factory schedules for stock merchandise are made by the manufacturing division and include requirements for the necessary personnel.

Adding Stock Items to Supplement Specials

By studying great numbers of special orders, a stock item which seems to meet the requirements of many of them can often be created. This stock item helps eliminate rush orders, allows of manufacture in large lots and at such times as to balance the production schedule, and yet makes possible immediate deliveries. These things in combination result in lower costs.

For example, a study of marking tags used for special sales by department stores and other retailers, enabled special sales tags to be designed in sizes and styles that meet the requirements of nearly all users. A study of special orders for alteration tags, system tags and garage tags led to the creation of standard forms for these items that meet practically all demands of the market.

Getting Seasonal Special Orders in Early

The evils of seasonal orders can be reduced if customers can be persuaded to anticipate some at least of their requirements for seasonal items well in advance. This has been accomplished partly by persuasive salesmanship, partly by being able to promise a greater security as to delivery, and sometimes by reducing prices to "buy-early" customers. For example, originally, box production was exceedingly seasonal. Orders would not come in any large numbers until early summer, and then there would be a painful rush of work.
until Christmas. As a result of our modified sales policies, however, we now secure a considerable number of our holiday box orders in January, and are well scheduled up by March.

Building Up "Out of Season" Business

This is a levelling up process which increases total output while at the same time it decreases fluctuations. As an example, printed greeting cards were added to the line to occupy the box die stamping crew during their off season. We created, as you might say, a supplementary season for die stamping.

Another example of this same method is the securing of contract orders calling for split shipments. For instance, we may accept an order for five million tags to be delivered in lots of 500,000 for a ten months period. We may, as factory schedules require, make simply the 500,000 in any one month, we may run the whole five million at once, storing the tags against the delivery required, or anything between the two. This plan, of course, requires great care in operation, otherwise the plant may become jammed with what can prove to be very unprofitable business.

Still another example is the creation of temporary stock items which may be made during a period of slack operation. The making of specialties from crêpe paper filled such a place as have other crêpe paper novelties. During periods of active business inquiries often come in for merchandise we might make but which appears to be outside of the strictly Dennison line. Such inquiries with samples are kept in a special file. In times when work is slack this special file forms
the basis for new sales leads for goods normally outside of our usual range of work, but which can be made on our facilities. Incidentally it occasionally happens that an item or line of merchandise turned up this way as an emergency measure can very profitably be added as a regular part of the line.

Training Operatives Into Supplementary Jobs

Wherever it is feasible, an effort is made to train operators in more than one type of work. If it so happens that the off season of one department coincides with the busy season of another, it then becomes possible to transfer operatives from one to the other. As a matter of fact it can be planned to adjust the work of one department so as to use the unemployed operatives of another department, if training in both departments has been given. To insure, however, that there is no loss to the operative during the training period, a retainer system is used by which a flat amount per hour is added to piece rate earnings, the amount being decreased as the operator gains sufficient skill to bring his earnings up to his usual piece rate.

Following out this plan, box makers are trained as liners and liners as box makers, inspectors on box machines are trained as makers of box parts, operatives of eyeleting machines to do packaging, gum label cutters as power press operators, and box makers to work on the various wax crafts.

Study of the Business Cycle

It is desirable to avoid expansion at the peak of any cycle and to conserve resources for the different times
when the cycle is near the bottom. Of course no amount of study can as yet tell when the exact top and the exact bottom of any cycle is to come. But a constant study of cyclical movements makes possible guesses that are workably accurate. As well as our ingenuity can contrive, every effort is made to operate so that all our resources of every kind can be available and brought to bear during times of probable slack operation. For example, advertising appropriations are made with the idea of advertising heavily near the bottom of the cycle and very little near the top; funds being conserved and allocated accordingly.

Occasionally these regularization methods fail fully to accomplish their purpose. So the company has assumed the responsibility of paying relief to those for whom, temporarily, there is no work. This responsibility has been taken over on the assumption that the opportunity to reduce the amount of unemployment lies very largely with the employer.

Some years ago there was created an unemployment fund out of the profits of the business, originally accumulated over a five-year period. This fund is not a charity; it does not constitute an unlimited guarantee, either of employment or of the maintenance of the regular wage rate; nor is it anywhere stipulated that the fund may be renewed; proof of its value is the only reason for renewing it.

The fund is administered by a small committee, the membership of which is equally divided between the management and the works committee. Whenever there is actual unemployment, the fund is set in operation in this way:
Employees of more than six months' service who are temporarily laid off for more than one or two days in any month receive 80 per cent of their regular wages if they have dependents and 60 per cent of their regular wages if they have no dependents. Both classes of employees when they secure temporary work outside are entitled to an amount equal to 10 per cent of their outside earnings plus 90 per cent of their usual earnings with the Dennison Company. The unemployment fund is used to make up the difference between this amount and the amount they receive outside. Employees who are temporarily transferred to other work in the factory are paid their full wages* if they are timeworkers and 90 per cent of their six weeks' average if they are piece-workers. Whatever they are worth on their new jobs is charged to operating expenses and the rest is made up out of the unemployment fund. At any time after six days' payment have been made, the unemployment fund committee may stop payments to any employee who, in its opinion, is not making proper efforts to secure outside work. So far there has been no case of this sort.

The company retains the right of discharge, but have several checks against its arbitrary exercise. We avoid discharging workers when there is only a temporary shortage of work; and if, in long-continued depressions, discharge becomes necessary as a last resort, the employee is given two weeks' notice or its pay equivalent.

*Examples of typical labor loans where the difference in pay is taken from the unemployment fund are: Hand die stamper to cutting brush, first-class printer to Stockman or Prouty press, wood case maker to rough carpentering, gold leaf stamper to paint spraying, leather case covery to inspecting hardware on cases, coating machine operator to trucking, etc.
The fund started at $150,000. Out of this the total disbursements since 1920 have been about $75,000 and interest and a few special appropriations have been credited to it. In comparison with the annual payroll figures, the amounts paid out in any one year are insignificant. The drain on the unemployment fund in 1921 was greater than in any other year; and yet, in 1921, the total amount paid out of the fund was about 0.7 of 1 per cent of the total yearly payroll.

We feel sure that the payments have been of actual practical value to employees and that the general feeling of security the fund has built up has been of even more value. But we are wholly positive that the effects of the fund, in making management work hard to overcome irregularities of employment, have been extraordinary.

When mutual fire insurance came in with its rates varied in accordance with preventive efficiency, a big start was given to fire prevention. I have known many cases where the promise of even a slight change in rates has caused very earnest and persistent efforts on the part of management to decrease fire risks. We are finding the same thing with unemployment relief funds. The economic spur is in itself relatively small, but it acts as a release valve for the motives of pride of accomplishment. The influences, moreover, are widespread. Our company and several others who have something of the same plan report that the influence can be distinctly felt even by salesmen in the field. Our company feels that its unemployment relief is a measure of considerable economic advantage which will assure the continuance and intensification of our efforts to regularize employment.
Employment Stabilization Through Union Management Cooperation

Fred Cullum

As the peace and happiness of the home of the worker, together with the removal of the fear of want and hardship to wife and family, are to a large extent consequent on continuity of employment, any movement that tends to make this possible is of vital interest to the worker.

Inasmuch as the development of Union Management Cooperation in the railroad industry, under normal conditions, has in the experience of the Canadian National Railway contributed to this very desirable feature in industry, a few facts bearing on the subject of Union Management Cooperation in relation to the stabilization of employment may be of interest.

Two of the seven basic requirements of Union Management Cooperation in the railroad industry are:

1. Systematic cooperation between unions and management for improved railroad service and elimination of waste, and
2. Stabilization of employment.

Other features having a bearing on this subject include:

1. Securing new business for the railroad
2. Securing new work for the shops
3. Railroad work for railroad shops
4. Clearing house for furloughed employees
5. Conferences between management and system representatives of unions, when necessary to curtail expenses to an extent affecting employment.

Let us consider first the conditions of employment previous to the establishment of the Union Management Cooperation.

Generally speaking the system was one of supply and demand. Much work, much employment. Men taken on when busy and laid off when slack. There was very little thought of distributing work over given periods or of preparing during slack periods for rush periods. Lack of regulating work resulted in furloughs, irregular periods of employment, reduction in working hours, and during very slack periods in some of the shops employees were willing to work three weeks each month rather than permit a 25 per cent reduction in staff. Other times shops closed for week periods, in each of these cases meaning to the employee in the shops reduced pay cheque, and constant concern as to the future, together with lower standards of living. It is perhaps not necessary to remark here what effect this would have on the morale of the workman, and the tendency to prolong the life of a job, a not very desirable attitude from the management point of view. During rush and busy seasons the practice was to contract out work to outside industries, and borrow equipment from other railroads.

Since the establishment of the Union Management Cooperation conditions have certainly changed. With one exception during a period of adjustment, the ex-
perience has been one of continuous employment - of not less than 40 hours per week until the beginning of 1927, and full schedule hours from that date until the present. In the case of the exception referred to, the furlough in this case was of very short duration, all men are back again at work, and today the number of employees is greater than for some time past. The factors contributing to these benefits will be dealt with later. Records of the management show that in 1924 employees worked 73 per cent of the possible working days in the year; in 1925, 80 per cent; in 1926, 82 per cent; in 1927, 83 per cent. On the whole there has been an 11 per cent improvement in employment stabilization in the shops during the four-year period. From a wage standpoint the annual increase in wage over the year 1924 was $102 in 1925; in 1926 the figure was $139, while by 1927 the figure had reached $147. This had not been accomplished by reduction in staff as the number of employees affected was 18,997 in 1924, and in 1927 was 18,934.

It would be interesting now to consider the reasons for this improvement in employment in so short a time, and while this can not be placed solely to the credit of Union Management Cooperative policy, yet it must be admitted that to a very large degree this policy has been responsible for the improved conditions. Among the many things contributing to the change may be noted:

Conferences between management and system representatives of unions with a view to the spreading of work over given periods making possible stabilization of employment, resulting in the repairs to equipment
during slack periods for rush periods, and also generally avoiding previous practices of borrowing equipment from other railroads.

Another factor is the reconstruction of steel cars in our own shops, which had previously been done in other than railway shops.

Another factor of far-reaching influence in this connection and made possible mainly through the Union Management Cooperative activities, is the elimination of waste in material and overhead, resulting in additional revenue being available for extension, development, and wages.

Another factor not so much a development of the cooperative movement is the modernizing of equipment, such as application of stokers, waterheaters, and syphons to locomotives.

In the march of progress it has been found necessary to close down some of the smaller plants and concentrate work at larger points and in these cases the establishment and recognition of clearing centers for furloughed employees, has resulted in those laid off being transferred to other places with very little loss of time and wages, this feature being recognized as one of the most helpful growing out from the Union Management Cooperation.

Stabilization of employment can be proved by results to be beneficial both to management and employee. The increased interest that the men have in their work, when they feel that management is willing through their representatives to consider those things that mean so much to them, must and does result in honest effort toward production, and the highest degree of
efficiency. This attitude must be recognized and appreciated by management. Imagine on the other hand the feeling of peace and contentment that must come to a man who feels that his employment is secure, and wages sufficient to ensure his wife and family or dependents those things that make life worth living. The employees on the Canadian National Railway where the Union Management Cooperation is in effect have just enjoyed a week's holiday with pay, and this together with the continuous employment leads us to the conclusion that a continued interest in the development of this cooperative policy, substituting this policy for that of conflict, recognizing the obligations we owe to each other, will result in increased benefits to all within the industry.
Recent Efforts to Stabilize the Construction Industries

James S. Taylor

Efforts to promote stability in the construction industries during the past eight years show substantial accomplishment, and give great promise of results from further efforts. More careful planning of construction programs by individual owners for definite needs, or to meet probable demands of tenants, and their readiness to make adjustments of a few weeks or months in the time of commencing projects in order to fit in with local employment conditions have done much. Building trades labor has contributed to many organized efforts to combat irregular employment, and has been instrumental in achieving a great reduction in the amount of work held up on account of jurisdictional disputes between trades.

The problem of putting construction on a more definitely stable basis is one of vast magnitude, and of tremendous significance to the prosperity and security of millions of families throughout the length and breadth of the country. The ups and downs in construction in the past have meant irregular and uncertain employment to more than a million workers in the building trades, and to a similar number in the industries producing lumber, iron and steel, brick, cement, lime, paint, roofing, hardware, and heating, plumbing and electrical equipment. The ill effects have also been felt by railway employes, teamsters, truck
drivers and others engaged in transporting building materials, as well as by those engaged in other industries such as coal mining, for cement and brick manufacturing plants are large consumers of coal.

Up to 1921 it was common for building in the country as a whole to fluctuate considerably from one year to another with serious depressions occurring every now and then as in 1908 and 1914.

Reports of construction contracts awarded for the years 1925 to 1928 indicate a remarkable steadiness in the national construction program. This has been a stabilizing influence in the general business and employment situation and shows that definite progress is being made in the right direction. The problem cannot, however, be dismissed as solved. Detailed figures show that even in the past four or five years new building undertaken in various cities has decreased or increased from one year to another by 50 per cent or more.

Men employed in the building trades can confirm by their own experience these fluctuations from year to year, and know also that there is still a large field for improvement in reducing seasonal unemployment by distributing building activity more evenly throughout the year.

Many types of building are started in the spring and do not get fully under way for several weeks or months so that the period of reasonably full employment in a number of leading trades such as carpentering and bricklaying is not reached in many cases until June, July, or even August. Much less construction work has usually been carried out during the winter months than is practicable and during several weeks or months
of excellent building weather in the autumn and spring building operations are commonly well below the midsummer level.

The efforts to stabilize the building industry accordingly have followed two related lines of attack: On the one hand, efforts directed at minimizing of ups and downs from year to year, and on the other, those directed at cutting down seasonal fluctuations and thus putting building more nearly on a year round basis.

The movement can be traced back to small beginnings before 1914. Forward looking business men here and there undertook to rebuild and extend plants during business depressions, when building generally had slowed down. Economists occasionally pointed out the advantages which might follow better stabilization, but usually spoke as without much hope. It was not until after the world war when men became more accustomed to thinking in national terms and to gain more confidence in their own ability to modify economic conditions by conscious control, that the movement began to take definite shape.

In the years 1919 to 1921 efforts were made in a number of cities by public spirited groups of architects, engineers, contractors, building trades labor and others connected with construction to find out the facts in regard to irregular employment in the different building trades, and to make intelligent efforts to improve conditions.

Early in 1921, Herbert Hoover, as chairman of the American Engineering Council, appointed a committee on elimination of waste in industry, which assembled further material, and presented its conclusions in a form which commanded wide attention. Meanwhile a
Senate committee on reconstruction and production conducted hearings at which the need for greater stability in construction was developed at length. Mr. Hoover, upon taking office as Secretary of Commerce in March, 1921, pointed to the fact that "we had three or four million idle men walking the streets" and that at the same time we were "short more than a million homes." He pledged the backing of the Department of Commerce for efforts of business, labor, and professional groups to find a way out of that situation, and to devise measures to prevent its recurrence. Under an authorization from Congress, he set up, on July 1, 1921, the division of building and housing to cooperate with the various elements in the building industry.

In July, 1921, he addressed a letter to the heads of state highway departments suggesting an extension of the policy of letting highway contracts in the autumn, so that work might get under way earlier in the spring.

A committee on construction which Mr. Hoover as Chairman of the President’s Conference on Unemployment, appointed in September, 1921, was the first of three bodies created by him representing business, professional and labor groups which dealt in detail with the problem of stabilizing construction. The Unemployment Conference Committee on Construction dealt first of all with the existing emergency, and its recommendations for hastening a return to active building were approved by the unemployment conference as a body and carried into effect by many public officials, business men and cooperating groups in cities and towns throughout the country. This committee also emphasized the need of further study and of inter-group
efforts as a means of preventing a recurrence of building booms and slumps.

Building, which recovered rapidly during 1922, became so active early in 1923 as to result in a rapid rise in building costs. There appeared grave danger of a building boom with inflated building costs, which would have led to a slump and widespread unemployment. In response to an inquiry from President Harding, Secretary Hoover reviewed the building situation at the time, pointing out that construction projects already under way, and private construction in view, would command the full resources of the men attached to construction, the supply of materials, and available transportation, and recommended that such federal government work as was not urgently required by public necessity, be deferred for the time being. This statement received wide publicity, and due to the conservative policies followed by owners and builders throughout the country, there was no inflation. Building continued stable and helped to sustain general business and employment conditions later in the same year and in 1924.

The idea conveyed in Mr. Hoover's letter was further emphasized by a report in April, 1923, of the Committee on Business Cycles and Unemployment, which he had appointed in 1922. This report pointed out that many types of construction could be carried out most advantageously during periods when general business conditions were dull.

In July, 1923, Secretary Hoover announced the appointment of a Committee on Seasonal Operation in the Construction Industries, which included the President of the Building Trades Department and one other
officer of the American Federation of Labor. This committee asked the division of building and housing of the Department of Commerce to make an extensive survey of the facts and possible remedies. This study found that custom, not climate, was mainly responsible for seasonal idleness in the construction industries.

The committee recommended that local community efforts, such as those which have been made in New York, Boston, Philadelphia, Chicago, Portland (Ore.), Rochester, N. Y., and many other cities, be undertaken to encourage year round building. These efforts are usually supported by all leading groups connected with construction, by civic bodies and by officials of the local government. They include collection of facts regarding the seasonal employment conditions in the various trades, and advertising and general propaganda to get people away from the idea that spring is the one logical time to start a building. They stress the idea that a more even building year means a saving to the community as a whole, and steadier employment to the important group of citizens comprised in the building trades. In Chicago and some other cities efforts are being made to distribute leasing dates more evenly throughout the year so that there will not be a rush to complete many buildings of the same type all at the same time. In several cities vacancy surveys have been made from year to year, which have helped to iron out large fluctuations in building. Much of the improvement is attributable to the efforts of trade associations and manufacturers of building materials who have encouraged year round building through nation-wide advertising and publicity.
### Planning Construction with Reference to Labor Supply

Factory Building Actually Started in September  
(Favorable Labor Supply)

#### If Start had been Postponed until April  
(Unfavorable Labor Supply)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Laborers</th>
<th>Masonry</th>
<th>Carpentery</th>
<th>Roofing</th>
<th>Painting</th>
<th>Heating</th>
<th>Electrical</th>
<th>Plumbing</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>JAN, FEB, MAR</td>
<td>APR, MAY</td>
<td>JUN, JUL, AUG</td>
<td>SEP, OCT</td>
<td>NOV, DEC</td>
<td>JAN, FEB, MAR</td>
<td>APR, MAY, JUN, JUL, AUG</td>
<td>SEP, OCT, NOV, DEC</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Legend:**
- Months where no vertical lines appear show that all workers are employed.  
- Short vertical lines show unemployment or labor available.  
- Heavy horizontal lines show duration of work of the various crafts on the project.  

*Note: Labor conditions in other cities may not be the same as in Boston.*
The effects of advancing or deferring construction of a building are well illustrated by the accompanying chart, which was prepared for the Department of Commerce Committee on Seasonal Operation in the Construction Industries. It is used, as indicated in the committee's report, as follows:

"The short vertical lines represent seasonal unemployment in Boston, Mass., for each of eight building trades.

"In the upper half of the chart is shown the schedule of progress of a factory building started in September, the heavy horizontal lines indicating the period in which workers in the various trades were employed on the job. The crews of men from each of the eight trades were recruited in months in which some workmen in that trade are usually unemployed.

"If the same factory building had been started in April, the laborers, masons, carpenters, and plumbers would have had to be recruited during months when they are fully occupied—that is, in April, May; June and August, respectively."

In most cities the following recommendations indicate months during which alteration and repair work of different types may be carried out with reasonable assurance of an adequate supply of building trades labor, and help to provide more work when jobs are usually hardest to find in the various trades:

"1. Painting and Paperhanging: Do interior painting and paperhanging from December to April."

"2. Plumbing: Make alterations and additions from December or January to April. Clean out grease traps when houses are closed; do not wait until they are open again."
"3. Heating: Overhaul and repair your heating plant when you shut down in the spring; plan major repairs and replacements of heating plants during the winter so that work can be started April 1.

"4. Electric Wiring: Overhaul fans, motors, and other equipment from January to March.

"5. Masonry, Carpentry, Plastering, Lathing, etc.: Do miscellaneous interior remodeling, patching of plaster, etc., from December 1 to April 1. This is a good season to replace fences, and outdoor work on steps and porches may also be done at this time.

"6. Screens and Awnings: Arrange for these during the fall and winter months."

Efforts directed primarily at regularizing building activity have been supplemented by advances in other directions. A marked decrease in stoppages due to labor difficulties of employers and employees, and to the virtual elimination of delays arising from jurisdictional disputes, has been most important. In some cities this was a serious source of irregularity prior to the establishment in 1919 of improved means for their settlement. A dispute between two minor trades which resulted in their stopping work frequently tied up many entire projects which could not proceed beyond a certain point without them. Thus the employment of thousands of other tradesmen not directly concerned was often involved. The prompt and regular handling of freight by railways has cut out another source of irregularity.

More and more corporations have long time construction programs mapped out, and individual owners have become accustomed to the idea of advancing or
deferring the time of starting buildings so as to avoid periods of peak activity, and thus obtain better service.

Building owners also have become more apt to take into consideration the seasonal trends in building trades employment when they are undertaking maintenance and repair work.

The division of building and housing of the United States Department of Commerce is glad to answer inquiries from groups interested in activities designed to promote stability in construction.

In summary, it appears that fifteen years ago the fluctuations in building activity from month to month and year to year were treated as more or less necessary evils, which, like the weather, could only be talked about.

By 1928 a general change in point of view has come about. The idea of practical remedy has become accepted and applied widely among the business, professional, labor, governmental, and other groups connected with construction. They have spent many thousands of dollars to help put the idea into effect. The presidential candidates of both the major political parties in 1928 recognized the responsibility of the federal government to adjust its own construction activities as far as practicable in order to help relieve slack periods of business and employment.

Investigations covering a number of pre-war years and post-war years up to 1922 indicated that from 170 to 225 full working days constituted an average year's employment for a man in one of the building trades, according to the trade and city. Employment during the three winter months was commonly reported as being well under half the amount during the three most
active months. Since 1923 the ratio of employment during December, January, and February to that during the remainder of the year has been maintained at approximately a half higher than formerly.

The success of local efforts to promote year to year and seasonal stabilization has been substantial, and warrants their continuance in cities where they are already under way, and their extension to other cities. From the point of view of national totals, the trends in favor of year to year, or "cyclical" stabilization of construction, have been so successful that the main problem is to sustain them in the future.
Public Employment Bureaus

WILLIAM M. LEISERSON*

JANUARY 1, 1929, newspapers throughout the country carried Henry Ford's announcement that he would add 30,000 employees to his working force in order to operate his plants on a six-day schedule while maintaining the five-day week for each worker. The announcement stated that Detroit citizens would be given preference, and warned people from a distance against coming to the city for these jobs.

On the morning of January second, according to a dispatch to The New York Times—

"A shivering, jobless army estimated at 25,000 men, . . . were herded in a parking space near the employment office . . . (and) about 600 were successful in being assigned jobs at the Ford Motor Company plant.

"Automobile licenses indicated that at least scores of job-seekers had defied the Ford edict that Detroit citizens would have preference over outsiders. There were cars from Illinois, South Carolina, Ohio, Missouri, Indiana, New York, Louisiana, and Kentucky.

"'We are from other states,' were comments from some of them, 'but if we are asked about it, we've been in Detroit all our lives. What we want is a job.'

*Part of this article was published in a recent issue of The New Republic.
"The dingy little all-night 10-cent movie houses in Detroit did a rushing business. Men straggled in all through the night, not so much interested in the show as to keep warm."

We talk of industrial waste. But could anything be more wasteful than this method of supplying our industries with the labor they need, or connecting our labor forces with the available jobs? Yet this is the prevailing method. The Detroit incident is only a dramatic example of what is happening every day.

What would we say if the Ford Motor Company secured the steel or copper or other materials it uses in the manner that it gets its labor? Suppose it advertised throughout the country for 30,000 tons of copper, and thousands of dealers parked truckloads of the material near the purchasing agent's office every morning, out of which a small portion would be taken, while the owners of the rest were told to cart their stuff away? Would anything be more ridiculous? But isn't this about what our industries do with labor every day?

And suppose the materials were brought long distances from a half dozen different states when ample supplies of the quality and cost desired were available in the immediate vicinity? Wouldn't we say that is inefficient and wasteful management, even if the dealers deceived the purchasers as to the states from which they came?

Here we have illustrated the two fundamental wastes which a national system of public employment bureaus is designed to eliminate. Such a system of labor exchanges can not, of course, create work where none is available. It has been amply demonstrated, however, that it can keep more people at work than
is possible when labor is recruited by the haphazard, traditional methods that our industries follow in the absence of such a system. It can fill the available jobs more quickly by sending to the employer promptly the labor of the exact kind and quality needed; for, its business is to register and classify applicants for work and send, in response to orders from employers, only such applicants as meet his specifications. It can prevent thousands of workers who have no chance of being hired from travelling long distances or wasting innumerable hours waiting at the gates in a vain hope that perhaps by some chance they might be taken on. And it can save the management nerve-racking time and effort in interviewing thousands who cannot qualify for the work in hand.

Contrast the manner in which the State of Ohio organized the recruiting of 20,000 men to build the cantonment at Chillicothe during the war with the ordinary methods used as illustrated in the Ford example, and you see how these purposes of a system of public employment bureaus are actually accomplished. The state organized local free employment offices in 21 cities with the cooperation and financial aid of the municipalities. The procedure and policies of these offices were unified under a centralized, directing management located in Columbus. Instead of announcing to the world that 20,000 men would be needed to build the cantonment and picking a few hundred every morning from the thousands that would flock to the city, the officials in charge of construction notified the central office from time to time (sometimes every day, sometimes once a week), of the various kinds and grades of labor they needed and the number of each. The state
director immediately wired or telephoned to the local employment bureaus whose daily reports to him showed that they had registered men of the kind wanted, and he ordered each office to send to Chillicothe a specified number of workers of each kind.

A steady stream of selected workers was thus kept moving to Chillicothe from local offices in every part of the state, and each man who went had a definite prospect of getting a job. While the construction contractors did not obligate themselves to hire every one who was sent by the employment bureaus, very few were rejected, because all were carefully selected before they were started on their journey. Men from the offices nearest to Chillicothe were sent first, and when these could not supply all the needs, the cities farther away were called upon. Only occasionally were workers from outside the state recruited for the work, and when this was necessary, arrangements were made wherever possible, with public employment bureaus in nearby states to interview and select men and send them in response to written requests for specified kinds of workers. In this way the wild scramble for work, the disappointed hopes and the waste of time and money in useless transportation and waiting, such as accompanies methods like those used by the Ford Company, were definitely avoided. The available jobs were filled in an organized and orderly manner in place of the gamble that usually develops on such occasions.

Every investigating body that has studied unemployment seriously (and there have been many of these abroad as well as in this country) has reached the conclusion that a national system of public employment exchanges must be the first step in any practical pro-
gram of dealing with the problem. But, it may be asked, are there not private employment agencies and philanthropic labor bureaus to connect unemployed workers with whatever jobs may be available? The answer is no. As for the philanthropic agencies, their work is usually a minor factor in the placement of labor in the communities in which they operate. The total business that they do is negligible. The private fee-charging agencies, on the other hand, tend rather to increase unemployment and waste of labor than to reduce them. They are separate, competing agencies, and they make just so many more places to apply for work. They are interested in the profits they can make by collecting fees, and in order to increase their earnings the deliberate practice of encouraging labor turnover is universal among them. In addition certain well-known abuses, such as false advertising, misrepresentation as to work, petty graft, and extortionate fees, seem to be an inseparable part of their business which no amount of state regulation has been able to eliminate.

Investigating bodies have invariably come to this conclusion about private labor agencies, and that is why they have uniformly concluded that a system of public employment offices is essential. Public employment bureaus have also been severely criticized, but their weaknesses have been inefficient management, in sufficient funds and inadequate service rather than anything inherently wrong in a public employment service as such. Recommendations have been in the direction of improving the organization and administration of the public employment bureaus and extending their services, rather than in curtailing them.
The President's Conference on Unemployment in 1921, which brought together experts familiar with both European and American employment exchanges, reported:

"A permanent system of employment offices for bringing workers and jobs together with the quickest dispatch is necessary, both in times of depression and prosperity."...

"The existing provision of the federal government and many state governments for all branches of such work is inadequate, and should be strengthened. The work is of first-rate importance, and should be recognized as a job for men of first-grade ability from the top down. The director should be appointed directly by the President. Adequate salaries should be provided and adequate safeguards to secure the proper personnel and to protect the tenure of office.

"An adequate permanent system of employment offices as above suggested would obviate the necessity of creating new offices whenever new emergencies arise. It would also prevent the public employment office from being regarded as a mere temporary, philanthropic device, and thus through misunderstanding from not being used generally."

But what is an adequate system of public employment offices? There are now in existence 190 public employment bureaus operating in 42 states and the District of Columbia. Illinois leads with 17 offices. Pennsylvania comes next with 14; then California with 13. New York, Michigan, and Ohio each have 11, and Wisconsin 10. Seventeen states have but one office, and six have none. Most of these offices are main-
tained and operated by the states. A few are municipal enterprises.

The total amount spent by states and localities for these services amounts to about a million and a quarter dollars annually. In addition the federal government appropriates $200,000 for the United States Employment Service. Of this amount about half is distributed in aid to state offices, $82,000 is spent in operating the Federal Farm Labor Division which extends its services during the harvesting season over eight states west of the Mississippi River; and the rest is used in maintaining the administrative offices in Washington and the local employment bureau in the District of Columbia.

The total from all sources that is spent in maintaining the existing public employment bureaus is therefore about a million and a half dollars a year. That this sum is quite inadequate may be seen from a simple calculation. All together the 190 offices filled about 1,450,000 jobs last year (exclusive of harvesting), thus making the cost per placement about $1. Considering that private employment agencies charge their patrons from $2 to $5 for common labor jobs, up to $10 for skilled and semi-skilled positions, and a third of the first month's salary for clerical and office work, this average cost of $1 for all classes of jobs secured by the public bureaus does not seem unreasonable. But some of the best managed offices such as those in Wisconsin and California operate at a cost of 50 to 60 cents per placement. The amount of business done by the better managed offices also shows that five million placements a year could easily be attained if the public offices were equipped and financed to extend their operations. At least about five million dollars annually
is therefore needed to provide anything like an adequate national system of employment bureaus.

This brings us to the question of the best form of organization for a national employment system. Obviously it would be absurd for Congress to ignore the existence of almost 200 state and city bureaus and provide for the establishment and operation of local employment bureaus throughout the country by the national government. It can not abolish the existing offices, and to compete with them or to duplicate their work would be absurdly wasteful. This makes it out of the question for the federal government itself to establish and operate the employment bureaus as it does the post offices. Various proposals have therefore been made for cooperation between the nation and the states in jointly maintaining an employment system.

Without considering these proposals in detail, it is sufficient to say that all authorities agree that in any permanent system of public employment bureaus, the federal government itself ought not to operate local offices or do direct placement work, except in the District of Columbia. The responsibility for organizing and operating the local offices should be lodged in the state governments. A national system can be made most effective in this country if the federal government confined its duties to stimulating the states to assume their full responsibility in this respect, to promoting uniform methods and standards of efficient management, and to coordinating the work of all the state and local offices so as to bind them into a national placement organization. The American Association of Public Employment Services has adopted a resolution recommending this division of duties between national
and state governments. The President’s Conference on Unemployment in 1921 made the same recommendation and an exhaustive investigation conducted by the Russell Sage Foundation came to the same conclusion. The Wagner Bill (S. 4157), now before Congress, which is the same as the Kenyon-Nolan Bill of former years, also proposes this arrangement.

While a national system is essential for proper distribution of labor throughout the country, the problem of placing workers in jobs is primarily a local one. Most of the business of connecting workers with jobs is done by placing local residents in industries in the immediate vicinity. Only a small proportion of the total placements is made by transferring labor from city to city or state to state. Placement work is a highly technical business which requires trained employment managers, who must have the closest contacts with employers and workers alike. The business can not be carried on at long range or by “mail order” methods. This means that the idea of collecting general information about industrial opportunities by mail and distributing it to workers by means of bulletins or posters must be discarded. Few know how to make use of such information, and those who do often find that crowds have preceded them to the jobs, more than enough to supply all demands. Any employment service operated directly from Washington must from the necessities of the case have these defects, and, therefore, the employment offices must be primarily local agencies, in touch with all the opportunities for employment in the industries of the locality, and capable of mobilizing all the local labor supplies.
Unless the local offices are organized efficiently and are operated on the basis of sound management policies no effective national system can be built. Since the primary object is to centralize all labor demand and supply in one place, it is important not to multiply the number of offices in a city. One large office is better than many small ones. In very populous communities more than one office is needed, but these need to be operated as mere branches rather than as separate bureaus. The local employment offices in various cities of a state also need to be in close connection with one another. This is best accomplished by establishing them under a state law with a single directing head who conducts the local offices on a unified state plan and maintains a central clearing-house for transferring orders for help and applicants for work from one office to another.

The offices must be operated as pure business propositions—exchanges for facilitating the meeting of buyers and sellers of labor. Fitness for position must be the prime test in all dealings. If applicants are unemployed because of old age, inefficiency, or disability of any kind, it will be no help to them to refer them to positions they can not hold. Such applicants should be referred to the proper relief agencies.

Impartiality between labor and capital is particularly essential in the management of the offices, for without this the confidence of employers and labor organizations can not be maintained, and without such confidence employment agencies can not operate successfully. To insure this impartiality and confidence, representatives of employers' associations and labor organizations must be induced to act as an advisory committee for
the office, and they should be kept fully informed regarding the work of the office.

It is no part of the business of an employment office to act as factory inspector or to raise or reduce wages. Other agencies, both public and private, exist for regulating working conditions and wage bargains. An employment agency to be successful must confine itself to bringing to the attention of the unemployed workers exact information as to the available jobs in the community that they can do and to employers it must refer workers who are fit for the jobs. Experience has proved that when an employment office goes beyond this to regulate working conditions or wages to be paid it soon ceases to function properly as an employment exchange.

The business of an employment office to be successful must be carried on in as aggressive a manner as any commercial undertaking. Experience shows that work can be obtained for men by closely watching the advertisements in the daily papers, by keeping in close touch with employers through the use of the telephone, and by following up information secured in such a variety of ways, as through leads furnished by the men themselves in their search for work, or through newspaper notices of building operations or the opening up of factory work in neighboring localities. This latter information may be obtained either by use of the long-distance telephone or by correspondence. Such aggressive measures should be supplemented by personal visits to shops and factories and interviews with superintendents and foremen. By such methods the head of a bureau gets accurate knowledge of the labor market, especially in the trades having seasonal activi-
ties. Moreover, certain industries are continually on the lookout for new material for beginners, and such can be selected to advantage from the daily grist of applicants.

The proper selection of the applicants is possible only by a careful system of registration. It is most important that every person who comes to the office should be registered whether there is work immediately available for him or not. Name, age, experience, period of unemployment, etc., should be carefully recorded and all the essential information required as indicated on the application cards. Record of the positions to which applicant is sent must also be kept on the back of his application card. Selection for fitness will be greatly facilitated by recording full information about each applicant and classifying the cards in a file by trades and occupations.

Applicants for work must be given as full information as possible regarding the working conditions on the jobs offered them. No discrimination is to be made in favor of or against union men. If the employer calls for a union man, he is to be sent; otherwise the first qualified applicant is referred who will accept the work offered.

The final test of the bureau’s efficiency is its quickness and dispatch in getting the right man to a job in response to an employer’s call for help. The efficiency of the office is especially promoted by securing increased confidence of employers in the ability of the office to select the right man for a position. When this confidence is secured they are more willing to give detailed information regarding wages paid and other conditions of employment in any position offered.
bureau must also have the confidence of the workers, making them feel that the office is an actual clearing­house where reliable information may be secured regarding openings for employment in a wide range of industries. In this latter connection it is of distinct advantage to applicants to have at their disposal a good­sized waiting room. Semi­s­skilled shop workers and especially casual laborers may make use of this waiting room at all times of the day. However, applicants should not be permitted to use the waiting room as a loafing place and should be excluded when this tendency appears. The employment bureau should be located on the ground floor as near as possible to the business center of the community.

The office records are made more complete and the efficiency of the office is further promoted by the readiness of the employers to report back to the office whether applicants referred to them have been hired. Applicants themselves may also assist by reporting to the office failure or success in obtaining work to which they have been referred. The attention of the office must be given each day to the important work of verifying positions filled through the office, for the service rendered by the bureau does not end simply in referring one or several applicants to a vacancy. Positions are verified over the telephone, by personal call on the employer, or through the mail.

Advertisements for help wanted in the daily papers are closely watched by the superintendent of the office and may be posted in the waiting room every day. Letters are sent to employers who have difficulty in securing workmen. The telephone is used to solicit orders from such employers, and this is followed up when­
ever possible by a personal call on the employer by an office representative. The employment bureau must open early enough in the morning to meet the needs of business establishments which may want help at the beginning of their working day.

The work of an employment bureau naturally divides itself into a men's and a women's department. In the men's department the skilled and unskilled workers are, as far as possible, handled separately. Particularly important also is a special division for casual labor.

In the women's department, also, specialized services have been developed for the different occupations in which women are employed in the community. Special services in placing day workers, charwomen, or washwomen are successfully operated in a number of cities. Experience has shown that such a service can find work for very many women in every community in the worst periods of depression, and thus add to the incomes of many families. There are great possibilities also in the women's department for developing opportunities in domestic employment, and special attention should be devoted to this branch of the service.

Unemployed juveniles between 15 and 20 need special attention, because unemployment may have a specially demoralizing effect on them. They are handled in a separate department, and in some cities separate juvenile placement bureaus are established in cooperation with the public schools. A separate department is needed also for clerical workers. Immigrant non-English-speaking laborers also present a special problem, and interpreters or interviewers who speak foreign languages are employed in the larger offices.
Transients and nonresidents should be carefully distinguished from citizens of the community, and if any labor is to be sent to distant places to work this class of labor should be used for the purpose. An energetic employment office manager can often get the cost of transportation advanced by the employer from a distance who needs help. Preference in employment within the city must be given to residents.

These principles and methods of organizing and operating public employment bureaus have been developed by about half a dozen states which now maintain efficient employment bureaus. These, however, are prevented from carrying out their policies to the fullest extent by lack of funds to get competent managers, and by lack of a proper national organization to unite them into a unified system, and to bring the rest of the 42 states which maintain offices up to the standards set by the best.

Nevertheless the essential elements of a comprehensive national employment organization are already in existence. All but six of the states now have local bureaus, and the leading industrial states have a centralized administration of their local branches with a state director in charge. In addition there is the United States Employment Service; operating as a bureau of the Department of Labor through which about $100,000 annually, as well as the franking privilege for postage, is granted to aid the work of the states. In return for this the states send reports to the Federal Service and cooperate with it on a national scale to some extent. All that is needed now is Congressional legislation to unite these elements into a working national system.
with adequate funds to make possible the necessary improvements in administration.

The bill now before Congress provides an appropriation of $4,000,000, of which not less than $3,000,000 is to be apportioned among the states to aid them in establishing and operating public employment bureaus. Since the condition on which this aid is given is that each state shall appropriate a sum equal to the amount it receives from the federal government, this should be sufficient to maintain an adequate national employment system. But the national government must avoid employing and paying the salaries of any of the staff of the state bureaus. This is done to some extent with the present appropriations for the United States Employment Service, and it has proved unwise. All the money granted to a state should be turned over to the state treasury, and each state should employ its own staff, and fix and pay the salaries.

An essential condition on which the federal aid should be given, which the Wagner bill does not provide, is that every member of the state employment bureaus, including the state director, shall be appointed and protected in his position according to civil service laws. In states which have no such laws provision can be made for a Personnel Committee of some kind to act as an examining board. The experience of the existing public employment bureaus has amply demonstrated that an efficient service cannot be built up where the staff changes with every change in political administration.

Similarly, the entire staff of the United States Employment Service organization that coordinates and standardizes the work of the state employment offices
must be under the civil service. Quite aside from any politics that might prevent efficient operation of the employment service, there is the greater danger that conflicts between labor and capital will demoralize the management of the offices, if the employees are not under the civil service laws.

In order to secure and maintain the confidence of both employers and workers in the impartiality of the service rendered and in the statistics and other information published, the legislation should provide for an advisory committee of employers and workers to cooperate with the Director-General of the National Service. And the existence of a similar local advisory committee for each of the state and municipal bureaus should be another condition for receiving federal aid and cooperation. Such advisory committees representing different interests are provided in the Federal Reserve Act for the Federal Reserve Banks, and they have proved of great value.

There is much loose talk about a national employment service moving labor from places where unemployment prevails to places where labor is in demand. Everyone who has had experience in conducting employment bureaus knows that wholesale movement of great bodies of men is rarely desirable or possible except for such casual labor as harvesting. Floaters are much more likely to be encouraged in moving about by such efforts than competent workers given permanent positions. Therefore the federal employment service should confine its efforts to distributing information and bulletins to keep the managers of the state offices in touch with jobs and men in distant places, and any
transfer of labor should be handled by the local offices directly, sending men to fill specific positions.

In this connection proposals have been made for advancement of transportation fares by the government. This, too, is ill-advised. Managers of public employment bureaus rarely have any difficulty in getting transportation for workers if there are real jobs available for them. Employers are usually willing to advance fares, if reliable workers can be sent, and often relatives and friends of the workers will advance the fare if the employment office shows a job available in a distant place. On the other hand, if transportation is furnished freely or too cheaply to unemployed men seeking work, many take advantage of it merely to travel and float around.

To create an effective National Employment Service, therefore, Congress needs to establish a Federal Bureau of Employment in the Department of Labor, and provide for the building-up of a force of experts trained in methods of organizing, managing, and supervising. With such a staff, the federal bureau should be authorized to aid states and cities in establishing employment offices, assist in installing uniform systems of management and record-keeping, and supervise their work to maintain standards of service and efficiency.

The states should be encouraged to enlist the aid of cities and counties in financing the local bureaus. And as an inducement to state and city offices to join the National System, the law should offer the federal franking privilege and a grant from the federal appropriation to all those offices which become a part of the national system and adhere to its standards. But actual operation of local employment offices by the federal
government outside the District of Columbia should not be authorized.

The essential duty of a system of public employment bureaus being to distribute information regarding labor supply and demand, it is necessary that the National Service be authorized to publish some kind of Labor Market Bulletin. But the purpose of publication and the method of distribution of such a bulletin needs to be rather carefully prescribed. It should be designed primarily as a sort of a "House Organ" for the managers of employment offices. This is necessary to overcome the evils that come from indiscriminate publicity about opportunities for employment. Often, as we have seen, workers are led to travel long distances and to spend their last dollar to go to some place where they heard there was work. Then they may find either that there was no genuine demand for labor, or if there was a real demand it required a kind of skill or experience which most of those who came did not have. The Labor Market Bulletin of the National Employment Service ought, therefore, to indicate opportunities for employment and supplies of labor only in the most general way, so as to lead workers not to travel unnecessarily, but rather to apply at local employment offices for specific information about the jobs that are available.

Again, even if true statements as to the number of workers required in a certain district were published, it might be none the less mischievous to distribute such statements indiscriminately. For, if 100 men were needed in a certain territory and this was widely published, a thousand or ten thousand might be led to respond to the call. Such things are of frequent occur-
rence, and that is why the American Association of Public Employment Offices early went on record against widespread distribution of labor market bulletins. Therefore, any bulletin that is published must make certain that no one will be led to travel to a distant place for work without first applying at a local branch of the National Employment Service for definite reference to a specific job.

The publication of any labor market bulletin should be done in cooperation with the Bureau of Labor Statistics, for besides aiding in placement of workers, it ought to be designed to give accurate information to officials who are responsible for administering other measures for the relief of unemployment. Thus if a policy of saving public work for periods of depression were adopted by the government, then the bulletin ought to have a reliable index of employment which will show when public work needs to be pushed forward and when it ought to be held back.
Public Works As a Prosperity Reserve

Extracts from Executive Council Report 1928, American Federation of Labor

During the severe unemployment crisis of 1914-15 over 100 cities throughout the country made special provision for carrying on public work of various sorts, such as sewer-building, street and road-making, quarrying, forestry, drainage, waterworks, building, painting, and even clerical duties. In the majority of cases the officials in charge declared that they had secured full efficiency from the workmen and some even stated that necessary work had been done at a distinct saving.

It is fast becoming recognized, however, that to wait until the emergency has overtaken the community before the movement to provide public work is set on foot is wasteful and productive of unnecessary hardship. Public officials are therefore more and more turning their attention to preparing in ordinary times for the period of stress which experience has shown is likely to follow in a few months or a few years.

Within the last few years the number of American cities acting upon this principle has steadily grown. Several progressive communities have made definite plans to reserve work on unimproved parks, sewers and streets for future dull periods. Several, also, without

1 Except where otherwise noted, the material in this article is taken from "Business Cycles and Unemployment," National Bureau of Economic Research.
planning definite undertakings, have issued bonds or established contingent funds to provide the resources when needed.

During the brief period of unusual unemployment in the winter of 1918-1919 a very general resort to the remedy of public work was noticeable. The Federal Department of Labor listed 6,285 work projects to cost $1,700,000,000.2

The President's Conference on Unemployment of September, 1921, marks an epoch. Previous to its sessions, unemployment and long-range planning had been subjects left largely to groups outside the government—to local committees, charitable associations, social workers, and labor unions. In the public works field the conference produced results of immediate as well as far-reaching influence. The sale of municipal bonds for local public works broke all records during the months immediately following the Conference on Unemployment. The term "municipal bonds" includes bonds of counties, school districts, road districts, states, etc. The total for the year 1921 was $1,383,000,000, or nearly double that of any previous year and over three times the sixteen-year average.

The mayors of 125 cities with a total population of 25,500,000 reported to the conference that public works construction was being energetically pressed.

The effect of the nation-wide program, executed because of a national emergency under national leadership, was a powerful one. Organized national determination, locally expressed, galvanized our industrial

---

and civic forces to fight depression and unemployment as never before.

The proposal to anticipate public works, which would have waited ordinarily until "a more convenient season," came from the conference to several hundred local emergency committees. The spirit of helplessness and inaction noted in other periods of unemployment was conspicuously absent.

Successful execution of public works assisted the resumption of private construction on the large scale noted in 1922. The total probably shortened the depression, but is only a partial index to what may be accomplished in the next unemployment period if the states, counties and towns incorporate their experience into administrative methods of long-range planning.

Road building was given a national impetus by the passage of a $75,000,000 federal aid appropriation to the states in the autumn of 1921. The governors made substantial promises, which the highway commissions undertook to fulfill after the passage of the appropriation. The appropriation was passed earlier because of the direct urge of the conference and of the home districts. The Chief of the Bureau of Public Roads, Thomas H. MacDonald, under whose supervision the appropriation was made available to the states, was alert to facilitate the national policy by arranging for rapid federal approval of local projects.

Manufacturers of road-building machinery reported that they received orders in December instead of in April, as in previous years.8

---

Statistics show that public and private activity actually dovetail to a certain extent, even when there is no wide agitation for unemployment relief, state and municipal construction activity tending to expand when business is dull. Figures for securities issued for new capital (other than U. S. Government) show a very large increase in new capital for state and local purposes in 1921, when there was agitation for unemployment relief, and smaller proportionate increase in the depression of 1924, when there was no agitation. Thus new capital issued for state and local purposes increased from $688,000,000 in 1920 to $1,226,000,000 in 1921, an increase of 78 per cent, and from $1,051,000,000 in 1923 to $1,388,000,000 in 1924, an increase of 32 per cent, while issues of new capital for industrial purposes and for land and building fell off sharply from the totals of 1920, and in 1924 there was a smaller decline in new industrial capital from the year 1923.\(^4\)

Building contracts show similar developments. The number of contracts awarded for educational institutions increased 54 per cent in 1921 over 1920\(^6\) and for public and semi-public buildings increased 52 per cent, while contracts for industrial building fell off sharply in 1921 and to a less degree in 1924, and commercial building contracts fell off also to a small degree in 1921.

Mr. C. O. Hardy, Institute of Economics, states that with the use of public construction as a prosperity re-

---

\(^4\) Figures from Commercial and Financial Chronicle, data taken from "Tax Exempt Securities and Surtax" by C. O. Hardy, pp. 112-113.

\(^6\) Figures for 36 states from Survey of Current Business, data also taken from Mr. Hardy's report.
serve "probably it would be possible with careful planning and reasonably good administration to mitigate considerably the violence of alternation of prosperity and depression."

As regards the use of public construction to provide work for the unemployed during the unemployment period of last winter, a survey by economists ⁶ has revealed no outstanding evidence of new work undertaken by cities to provide employment. A few cases have been found where work already under way was pushed forward to give occupation to unemployed. Statistics of contracts awarded for public and educational buildings also do not indicate any important effort to provide relief in this way during the winter of 1927-28.

⁶ Survey being conducted under the direction of Institute of Economics.
Unemployment Compensation in the United States

JOINT PLANS OF A. F. OF L. UNIONS AND PLANS OPERATED BY EMPLOYERS

MARY B. GILSON

According to a survey recently conducted by the International Labor Office, real wages in the United States are double those in European countries. It is frequently asserted that our nominal unemployment rate in relation to total population, insofar as we can estimate it with our appalling lack of statistical material, is higher than abroad. It will be recalled that during the discussion last winter between Great Britain and ourselves concerning comparative unemployment in the two countries the Ministry of Labor pointed out that even the conservative figures presented by our Department of Labor (which, according to Labor Bureau, Inc., are far too low) show a higher rate of unemployment in the United States than in Great Britain.

One frequently hears the light remark that because the American workman is so well paid he ought to provide for his own future. We shall not go into this question, as its consideration falls more logically to others on this program. Nor shall we comment upon

---

1 Extracts from address given at Bryn Mawr Conference on Unemployment, July, 1928.
the argument concerning the workman's present-day prosperity in America in comparison with the foreign workman excepting to say that averages are misleading, that there are in the United States large holes in our industrial fabric through which fall workers who get high wages for short periods, workers who get low wages for long periods, and workers who get both low wages and short time work. When we have really adequate statistics of wages and hours of employment and unemployment in this country, we shall know in which industries and plants the incidence of unemployment causes the greatest havoc and we shall condemn the conscience-salving use of averages.

In the meantime, while awaiting that happy time when individual firms, employers' organizations and trades unions not only realize the value of but agree on common terminology and learn how to keep accurate data concerning those factors so vitally affecting the life of the worker—wages, hours, and continuity of employment—it is not unreasonable to proceed on the assumption that, regardless of its extent, any involuntary unemployment with its accompanying financial insecurity is an evil which should be given short shrift in our American program for general well being.

Many contend that unemployment should be prevented and not relieved. If we could be optimistic enough to accept as attainable the pleasant ideal of preventing all unemployment, no doubt all of us would subscribe to this viewpoint. But it is not necessary to point out to an audience of this sort that in spite of all intelligent effort to reduce unemployment we can never hope to have such a perfect coordination of production
and consumption, such a static world in scientific invention, such a peaceful, well-ordered, non-emergency kind of world as completely to decapitate the hydra of involuntary unemployment.

The stabilization measures taken by individual employers to reduce unemployment by regularizing production and distribution deserve every encouragement. But it is obvious that far more could be accomplished if a whole industry engaged in cooperative effort to survey its unemployment problem and introduced concerted means of meeting it.

Oliver Sheldon, one of Great Britain's foremost industrial managers, says:

"Rationalization is the process of associating together individual undertakings or groups of firms in a close form of amalgamation, and, ultimately, of uniting, in some practicable degree of combination, whole industries, both nationally and internationally; with the allied objects (beyond what is possible to an industry divided into many competitive units) of increasing efficiency, lowering costs, improving conditions of labor, promoting industrial cooperation and reducing the wastes of competition. These objects are being achieved by various means which unification alone makes in full measure available—the regulation of the production of an industry to balance the consumption of its products; the control of prices; the logical allocation of work to individual factories; the stabilization of employment and regularization of wages; the standardization of materials, methods and products; the simplification of the ranges of goods produced; the economical organization of distribution; the adoption
of scientific methods and knowledge in the management and technique of trades as a whole; and the planning and pursuit of common trade policies.” By Oliver Sheldon. Harvard Business Review, April, 1928, p. 264:5.

As we become more and more cognizant of the basic factors causing instability of work, not only enlightened self interest but public opinion will demand industry-wide policies and procedures involving the closing of marginal mines, textile mills and similar units of industries now afflicted by over-production and excessively irregular employment.

But, as we have implied, in spite of all possible measures taken to promote the stabilization of industry, it is certain that some unemployment is inevitable. How, then, shall this inevitable involuntary unemployment in the United States be met in order to relieve the distress and demoralization consequent upon the exhaustion of the worker’s savings, if indeed it has been possible to lay any aside for that rainy day which so often visits even the most unsuspecting worker in these days of kaleidoscopic changes in the industrial world? It is obvious that large numbers of people abroad and some people in the United States regard the alternative of no work to be pay.

Workers covered by American unemployment insurance plans have about the same proportion to American workers bearing the risk of unemployment as the proverbial needle has to the haystack. Yet a study of the pioneer effort to cover this hazard of insecurity is distinctly worth while in that every experiment offers
an added spotlight, weak as it may be, turned upon this comparatively unexplored field in the United States.

It is superfluous to state that trades union out-of-work benefits were the first form of compensation for unemployment in the United States as they have been in many other countries. As this subject will be covered by another paper we shall discuss the other two kinds of unemployment compensation in the United States, those established by joint agreement between a trades union and an industry and those established by an individual company.

Joint Agreement Plans

The joint agreement plans now in operation in unions affiliated with the American Federation of Labor, are those in the ladies' garment industry in Cleveland and the cloth hat and cap industry in locals throughout the country. Plans were formerly in operation in the cloak and suit industry and in the dress industry in New York City and a plan was proposed but never executed in the fur industry.

It is not to be wondered at that a systematized method of relieving unemployment should have originated in the needle trades. Their highly seasonal work naturally focused the attention of organized workers on the hazards of insecurity of income. The oldest of the joint plans is that established by joint agreement between the International Ladies' Garment Workers' Union and the Cleveland Garment Manufacturers' Association in 1921. The New York plan in the same industry was adopted in 1924. It was a pooled fund plan, contrasting with the guarantee-of-employment
plan of Cleveland. These plans were undertaken in the difficult period of post-war deflation which intensified seasonal unemployment. This fact and the prolonged labor dispute in the New York market caused the abandonment or at least suspension of unemployment compensation in New York. In January, 1925, a plan was adopted in the dress industry of New York, but due to internal friction in the union and inability of the opposing factions to agree, and the inability of the union to enforce collection of contributions from employers, the union moved for the dissolution of the scheme in June, 1926. Contributions were refunded to workers before any benefits were ever paid. In February, 1927, a new agreement between the union and the contractors made provision for the revival of unemployment compensation if agreement should be reached on the subject, so there is a possibility it may some time be resumed.

The cloth hat and cap industry established its plan in New York City in 1925, small locals having previously had plans in other cities.

All of the joint agreement plans define unemployment as involuntary unemployment through temporary lay-off, short time, or dismissal. Overtime is balanced against short time. In the cloth hat and cap industry any unemployment involving lay-off or short time in excess of 22 hours a week must be paid for. Only in the latter industry does work outside of the industry disqualify a man for unemployment insurance when he can not find work in the industry. In all the joint agreement plans there is a common pooled fund. The Cleveland plan provides for refunds to employers according to the rate of unemployment. Both of these
plans may therefore be said to furnish an incentive toward better management for the prevention of un­employment.

Funds for joint plans are built up in different ways. The Cleveland fund is an amount equal to 10 per cent of the payroll guaranteed by the manufacturers, the undistributed balance being returned according to the demands their distributions of unemployment benefit have made on the fund. The cloth hat and cap fund is wholly provided by employers, their contributions amounting to 3 per cent of the total payroll.

Eligibility for protection under these plans includes the requirement that, for benefits in the Cleveland la­dies' garment industry only regular workers—no cas­uals and probationary workers—are covered, and in the cloth hat and cap industry all claimants must be union members in good standing for six months previous to application for benefits as well as employees in a shop having an agreement with the Joint Council.

Waiting periods vary in the joint plans. Cloth hat and cap workers must be unemployed 44 hours, also, before beginning to qualify for benefit. The Cleveland ladies' garment workers must be out of work twelve weeks before entering upon compensable unemploy­ment.

Rates of benefit and periods of duration of benefit also vary. Cleveland ladies' garment workers get 50 per cent of their minimum earnings, for the period be­tween the actual number of weeks worked and the weeks guaranteed. Cloth hat and cap men workers in New York get $13 a week and women workers get $9 a week for a maximum of seven weeks a year.
The Cleveland joint plan is administered by an impartial Chairman and a Board of Trustees consisting of an equal number of representatives of workers and employers. The cloth hat and cap fund is administered by the union.

It is noteworthy that joint agreements on unemployment compensation in the United States have not extended beyond the needle trades, except for two cleaners and dyers local unions. With the exception of coal mining probably employment is more uncertain in these trades than in any others. Although the period since 1920 has been one of depression in the needle trades the plans which have survived show promise of future interesting development.

Company Plans

The number of workers covered by unemployment insurance in the United States by individual company plans is probably about 8,000.

Of the nine plans now in existence the first one, which was that of the Columbia Conserve Company in Indianapolis, was established in 1917. The Dennison Manufacturing Company started contributing to its unemployment insurance fund in 1916, but the plan did not become effective until 1920. Two were established in 1919, one in 1920, two in 1921, one in 1922, and two in 1923. None have been established since 1923 with the exception of the short-lived plan of the American Cast Iron and Pipe Company in Birmingham, Alabama, and a plan recently established by the Brown and Bailey Company in Philadelphia, a folding paper box establishment employing about 150 workers.
All company plans cover any unemployment due to the inability of the firm to furnish employment to any eligible employee, although one company pays benefits only in case the entire plant closes down. The procuring of outside work does not disqualify a worker from receiving unemployment benefits as long as he is ready to resume work in his own company when needed. One firm modifies unemployment benefits according to what a man is drawing when temporarily employed elsewhere in case he obtains outside work. Several firms make every effort to transfer workers to other work if their own work is slack and in some cases workers are given general maintenance jobs at the rate of their regular jobs. The Dennison Company systematically transfers workers, paying time workers their regular rate and piece workers by a rating scale varying from 70 to 100 per cent of their previous six weeks' average earnings.

Eligibility to unemployment benefits involves a stipulated length of service varying from three months to five years in company plans. In two of the plans workers are transferred from a wage to a guaranteed salary basis of pay when they become eligible for unemployment compensation. In some cases only factory workers are covered and in others both factory and office workers. One firm covers all employees, whether office or factory, who get less than $2,600 a year. Two plans require for eligibility participation in other activities, as, for example, the Procter and Gamble Company, which guarantees steady employment to only those workers who participate in profit sharing.

Rates of benefit vary greatly in company plans. In two companies dependents are taken into account and
rates varied accordingly. One firm pays full salary for all unemployed time, another pays minimum earnings and another pays a maximum of $72 a year. In one case a certain rate is stipulated for the first hundred days of unemployment and half of this rate for the second hundred days. One firm introduces sex differentiation into the benefit schedule, paying 25 per cent of their average earnings to men and 20 per cent of their average earnings to women.

The duration of benefit also shows great variation in the existing plans. Some firms guarantee pay or work for the full 52 weeks a year. The Leeds and Northrup Company bases the duration of benefit on length of service, ranging from three weeks' benefits for three months' service to twenty-six weeks of benefit for five years of service. The Dutchess Bleachery pays benefits for unemployed time within a 48-hour week unless the fund falls below $50,000 in which case it pays on a 35 hour week basis. This firm guarantees 24 hours pay a week for an indefinite period. In some companies holidays are considered unemployed time and in others they are not and no pay is given for them.

The amount of time constituting a waiting period before unemployed time is counted as compensable varies from none at all in six cases to one-half and one day in the other three.

The majority of firms operating unemployment compensation plans do not pay a dismissal bonus in case of complete termination of employment. The Dennison Manufacturing Company and the Leeds and Northrup Company, however, give two weeks' notice or pay if a regular employee has to be laid off because of lack of work, a thing which seldom happens in either place.
Company plans are administered in the majority of cases by joint committees consisting of an equal number of representatives of employers and employees and in all but two cases there is equal joint representation for the handling of appeals.

Few of the plans provide for a definite fund, benefits being paid out of profits. The Dennison Company, the Dutchess Bleachery, and the Leeds and Northrup Company are the only companies setting aside a definite fund for unemployment insurance, the last named being the only one with a definitely assumed obligation to set aside regularly a percentage of the weekly payroll for this purpose, maintaining a fund whose maximum must be equal to twice the maximum payroll of the preceding 12-months period. In every case the employers stress the fact that they can not legally guarantee a continuance of benefits in case of prolonged business depression or misfortune which affects their plants to such an extent as to prove too great a drain on their resources.

General Remarks

Examination of the cloth hat and cap unemployment insurance plan indicates a desire to get the policies and procedure in the different locals on a more uniform basis and to set up machinery for a more adequate reporting of statistical data to headquarters. The New York plan shows need of more cooperation between employers and workers, a duty equally incumbent upon both groups.

Both employers and employees in industrial establishments operating unemployment compensation plans
express the opinion that, while many improvements could be made both in their provisions and in the execution of them, they undertake to meet a real need. It is not possible to measure the effect they have had on regularizing employment but in every case it is quite evident that great emphasis is laid on possible means of preventing unemployment and in some cases employers testify that it was only after their compensation plans were installed that there was any vital interest taken by the sales organization in providing a steady market for plant output.

The fact that all funds in the United States may be abandoned at the will of the contracting parties or of the management gives a somewhat insecure tone to them. Legal decisions in relation to joint agreement plans, however, have furnished evidence that the payment of contributions during the life of the agreement can be legally enforced. The abandonment of the two company plans previously mentioned was due to depression in the industry in one case and to precipitate introduction of new machine methods in another which exhausted the funds. Two other company funds show a marked decrease. The two plans established by joint agreement and later abandoned were given up because of internal dissension in the unions. The proposed fur plan never saw the light of day because of left wing opposition.

It is obvious that in both the joint agreement and company plans large numbers of workers without the prerequisite length of service are not covered by unemployment compensation. This, of course, furnishes ample leeway for expanding and contracting an organization according to requirements without any paying
of benefits. The Cleveland Ladies’ Garment Workers restricts the number of temporary employees who may be taken on at peak seasons, but temporary workers are not paid benefits.

It is, moreover, obvious that expansion and contraction may also be provided for through overtime and short time. It is unfortunate that overtime records are seldom kept in such form as to be usable for a study of this sort.

The hours and vacation policies of most of the plants administering unemployment insurance are comparatively generous. Discharge is usually safeguarded where these plans are in operation by means of providing for appeal to a committee equally representative of workers and management. 'It goes without saying that unless there is honest and aboveboard scrutiny of every leavetaker it would be only too easy to discharge workers without benefit at slack times on the basis of inefficiency or misconduct.

Without time-consuming special investigations it would be impossible to state how many workers had been “squeezed out” of the plants studied because of improved technique and machinery and how many more had been taken on because of the improving of quality and lessening of price of product, with the consequent widening of markets. We understand that studies of this sort will soon be undertaken.

It is obvious in places where data were available that the unskilled workers tend to be displaced by mechanization more than skilled workers. For instance, the number of unskilled workers in the Manning Company has steadily decreased. In one paper plant of this com-
pany the number of skilled and semi-skilled employees was greater early in 1927 than at any time previous to that while the number of unskilled workers had declined by 50 per cent from the peak of 1924. The other plan has shown an upward trend in employment for skilled employees but a downward trend for the unskilled. Another company shows expansion of its force to be twice as great in the office as in the shop.

It is evident, as we have said, that only a negligible number of workers in the United States are covered by unemployment compensation. It is also true that although employers and workers are increasingly interested in stabilization measures, no matter how we may forge ahead in the latter field and thus reduce unemployment we can never completely eliminate it. In the meantime we are as babes in the woods until we can see a path ahead. And we need not delude ourselves into thinking we can see a path or even be able to map one out without a compass which will tell us where we are going.

In the meantime, praise be to all the valiant efforts of workers and workers' organizations and industrial managers and their organizations to work with each other and with the government toward the elimination of waste in every form, which is so basic to reducing if not to eliminating unemployment. And let us applaud those in high position who not only insist upon removing the shroud of secrecy from industry but who steer with clear vision and unflinching purpose toward a sound financial policy, an intelligent attitude toward tariff in relation to our place in international affairs, toward immigration and toward all the other problems.
which so vitally affect this ever present evil of unemployment.¹

¹ Most of the material for this paper has been taken from "Mary B. Gilson and Bryce M. Stewart. Unemployment Compensation Plans in the United States; preliminary report. Feb.-April, 1928, mimeographed, 3 parts." (This report was issued for limited distribution and the supply is now exhausted.) The final report, which will include foreign experience, will be published in book form in 1929. Before publication, however, the material contained in the preliminary reports will be corrected where necessary and brought up-to-date.
INCREASING attention has been given to problems of unemployment in the United States in the last few years. The President’s Conference on Unemployment in 1921 brought together technicians, employers, and representatives of management and labor to consider the causes of unemployment and discuss measures for prevention. The emphasis laid by the conference on elimination of unemployment rather than relief for those out of work, has been a leading factor in developing a constructive attitude toward the problem in this country. In contrast to Europe, where the emphasis has been on insurance to provide relief, there has been an effort in the United States to get at the causes of unemployment and to develop measures which would insure steady work to the wage-earner.

Various experiments in stabilizing employment have been tried in the last eight years, and their success has proved that it is possible to provide year round employment for a normal force of workers when the necessary adjustments are made. These and other measures, discussed elsewhere in this booklet, give grounds for hope that eventually much of the wage-earners’ suffering from unemployment may be eliminated.

There is, however, another phase of the problem. The needs of the unemployed worker are immediate, and programs of stabilization will become effective
slowly over a period of years. Thus far only a few thousand of the 25 million wage-earners in the United States have been reached. Statisticians estimate that about one million of these wage-earners suffer from unemployment yearly, even in times of normal business activity, and in times of depression the number out of work may reach four, six, or even eight million. The temporary suffering of these unemployed might be very greatly lessened by measures for relief.

Also it will probably always be necessary to provide relief for the emergencies which cannot be covered in any other way. Changes in industrial process which must occur as part of our advance bring temporary unemployment in their wake. New machinery displaces workers; changes in demand for certain kinds of products may put industrial firms out of business. Emergencies such as fires may also cause unemployment.

The wage-earner's small income cannot bear the brunt of these occurrences without serious handicaps to himself and his family and often actual want and suffering. When the head of the family is out of work savings must be drawn out, debts accumulated, goods bought on installment often lost, and in too many cases the family may have to call on charity for help. Therefore, measures to provide at least a small temporary income through unemployment payments can do much to help the American wage-earner maintain his standard of living.

Thus far the trade union has been the chief agency to provide unemployment payments for wage-earners in America. Union benefit plans have increased during the period of post war adjustment until in 1927 about 43,000 members of 59 local unions affiliated with the
American Federation of Labor were covered by unemployment funds. Of the plans now in existence, the oldest reported is in Lithographers Local No. 1 in New York City, which started when the union was organized in 1882. Up to 1919 some 24 local unions followed this lead and established funds. Since 1919, 34 more have adopted this protective feature. In 1927, about 450,000 was paid in unemployment benefits to over 6,000 unemployed members.

Forms of Unemployment Payment Plans

A. Guaranteed Employment

We are particularly interested in the form of plan which will tend to stabilize employment while at the same time assuring wage-earners of benefit payments if they are out of work. The ladies' garment industry in Cleveland provides a good example.

It is not surprising that one of the most constructive of union plans should have developed in the garment industry. Seasonal unemployment brings particular hardship to garment workers. There are two dull seasons every year, in the spring and fall, when many shops close down or run with a minimum of workers. Consequently large numbers of workers are laid off, and the average season of work for most wage-earners is short. It is not unusual for a garment worker to have only 30 to 36 weeks employment in one year.

The Cleveland plan was the result of joint deliberation by the union and the employers. It was discussed in connection with questions of wage payments, and because the union insisted on some form of employment
guarantee the present plan was evolved after careful study and investigation by experts employed jointly by both parties.

The plan was adopted by agreement between the Cleveland Local of the International Ladies' Garment Workers and the Cleveland Garment Manufacturers Association, and by separate agreements with the independent garment manufacturing firms, making the plan uniform for the Cleveland market.

Under the Cleveland plan the employer undertakes to guarantee a certain number of weeks employment to all his employees. It has been possible thus far to guarantee only 40 weeks employment each year, because of the seasonal character of the industry. This figure was set because it was felt that it would be attainable for all firms. Some are, of course, able to provide more than this.

In case the employer falls short of the required number of weeks, the wage-earners receive unemployment payments. Since it is the employer who pays, it is to his advantage to save money by regulating his production and sales so as to give the required 40 weeks employment. The provisions of the plan are as follows:

Each employer deposits with the impartial chairman of the industry a fund amounting to 10 per cent of his payroll each week, or a surety bond guaranteeing payment of this amount. If he fails to provide 40 weeks employment for any of his workers, they receive one-half their minimum rate of earnings for each day of the 40 weeks they are unemployed, until the fund is exhausted. If the employer gives his wage-earners the full 40 weeks employment, the whole fund he has de-
posited with the impartial chairman is returned to him at the end of the year.

The plan has had the effect of encouraging manufacturers to stabilize work: Representatives of the union and of the manufacturers both declare that the plan has resulted in better conditions. Mr. Perlstein, an official of the union, says: "Employers planned their work so as to avoid the necessity of farming out part of it, and this gave steady employment to their regular forces." The manufacturers' association testifies: "The result of the plan has, without a doubt, been an increase of work in the shops."

The following table shows the payments made through the Cleveland fund. The amounts paid to workers, in every year except the first, are not over 15 per cent of the total fund, since the firms in general have succeeded in giving work to their wage-earners for all but a small proportion of the time guaranteed. There has been good improvement over the first year, and a tendency to decrease the percentage of the fund paid out with the exception of certain years, as 1927, when unemployment was particularly severe.

In 1927, 5 out of the 11 firms concerned worked steadily for the full forty weeks and had no insurance to pay; two others worked nearly the full time, so that nearly all of the insurance was paid by the four other firms where employment was considerably under guaranteed time.

The percentage in column 1 refers to the per cent of weekly payroll deposited by the employer. The plan was changed in 1923 to provide for a deposit of 10 per cent instead of 7½ per cent.
Unemployment Fund and Benefit Payments, 1921-1927

Cleveland Ladies' Garment Industry

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Per cent</th>
<th>Total fund</th>
<th>Total paid to workers</th>
<th>Total saved</th>
<th>Per cent paid out</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1921 (6 mos.)</td>
<td>7 1/2</td>
<td>$93,274.40</td>
<td>$32,526.41</td>
<td>$60,747.99</td>
<td>34.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1922</td>
<td>7 1/2</td>
<td>263,524.26</td>
<td>33,622.31</td>
<td>229,901.95</td>
<td>12.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Blacks</td>
<td>25</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Campen</td>
<td>29</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sunshine</td>
<td>43</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1923</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>166,871.35</td>
<td>25,794.83</td>
<td>141,076.52</td>
<td>15.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1924</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>138,435.75</td>
<td>16,620.36</td>
<td>121,815.39</td>
<td>12.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1925</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>132,476.93</td>
<td>18,929.24</td>
<td>113,547.69</td>
<td>14.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1926</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>142,566.61</td>
<td>12,078.10</td>
<td>130,488.51</td>
<td>8.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1927</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>136,784.46</td>
<td>20,959.25</td>
<td>115,825.21</td>
<td>15.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The United Wall Paper Crafts also have a plan of guaranteed employment which covers their membership. A clause in the standard agreement made between local unions and their employers requires that the employer shall guarantee employment for all workers for 45 weeks a year at full pay and five weeks at half pay. Employers in general have lived up to this provision, and unemployment payments have not been necessary except in the print cutting trade, where competition and contract work have cut into a well regulated industry so severely that stable employment could not be maintained. The union in this craft, therefore, is now paying benefits from its own funds. In 1927, 38 per cent of the print cutters received unemployment payments amounting to $10,000.

Less seasonal conditions in this industry make it possible to guarantee employment for a longer period.
than in the garment industry. But even in wallpaper manufacture employers sometimes find it difficult to keep their shops open for 50 weeks and occasionally close down during the last 5 weeks, releasing their wage-earners but providing half pay. Here also as in the garment industry the guaranteed employment plan has helped to stabilize work. Employers who are responsible for wage payments during a guaranteed period make every effort to keep their shops in operation and avoid loss.

These plans are an example of what has been accomplished thus far by linking unemployment payments with a plan for employment stabilization under joint agreements.

B. Other Joint Plans

In some cases joint plans have not gone so far as to provide a guarantee of employment, but meet the problem simply by assuring the wage-earners of a benefit payment if they are laid off in dull season. Such plans are in force in 8 locals of cloth hat and cap workers and 2 cleaners and dyers locals.

The cloth hat and cap workers plan is practically uniform for the 8 local unions. In all cases the employer pays the cost of the insurance, and the plan is administered by the union. Although it appears from this that the employer is taking more responsibility than the union, in reality the union has contributed largely, for the plan was accepted in lieu of a 3 per cent raise in wages. It was started in 1925 and operates as follows: The employer pays 3 per cent of his payroll each week into a fund which is kept in custody by the union. The union then makes payments to unemployed
members after they have been out of work for two weeks, at the rate of $13 a week for men and $10 for women. Payments continue for 7 weeks in any one year. In the period from July 1, 1925, to February 28, 1927, 3,900 people received $175,907 from this fund, or an average of $45.10 each.

The cloth hat and cap workers have found this plan an important asset, not only to members who were out of work, but to the industry. It is very easy in the cap trade for a man out of work to set up a small shop with a few machines, get together a few of his fellow unemployed workers and begin making caps. He stays in the business only a short time and will not take responsibility for the working conditions of his employees. He may work long hours and pay low wages. If a number of small shops are set up they cut seriously into the business of the reliable shops which are attempting to provide regular employment and are responsible for good wages and working conditions. The payment of unemployment benefits has taken away the temptation to go into this "fly by night" business and so is making possible more stable conditions. Thus the plan, while primarily a benefit plan, has had the effect of stabilizing the industry.

Since similar conditions in other towns create a general need for unemployment benefits, the International has been discussing the question of applying the system on a national basis. This would extend the benefit to some of the smaller locals which find it difficult to initiate plans of their own.

Two cleaners and dyers unions also have plans initiated by joint agreement. Unemployment funds started in Chicago in 1925 and St. Louis in 1927. The
plans are essentially the same. In both cases they are financed by the employer. It is not so costly to provide unemployment insurance as in the cloth hat and cap industry and the number of unemployed is not nearly so large proportionately. In Chicago the employer pays 1½ per cent of his weekly payroll. The fund is administered by the union and each member may receive $12 a week for 8 weeks after he has been out of work two weeks. If he has a family he receives $2 extra for one child and $1 more for each other child. In Chicago 314 members received $34,120 in 1927, or an average of $108.66 each.

In the plans mentioned thus far, both union and employer have taken responsibility for protecting the workers against unemployment. This is a step in advance of the old theory that unemployment is an unavoidable evil and it is no one's business to provide against it. Acceptance of responsibility by the employer as well as the workers shows a new attitude of mind and one that promises a far more constructive approach to the problem. It is in management's power to reduce unemployment and often practically to eliminate it, if the necessary study is given to it and the proper measures applied. When the industry is responsible for the income of its workers, stabilization will be advanced. This will in turn benefit the industry itself and also the community where it is situated.

While employment stabilization is a distinct advantage to the industry, and firms are continually proving that it is more economical to maintain production steadily through the year, nevertheless the need of stabilization is much more obvious to the workers than to the employer. It therefore happens that the advan-
tages of stabilization are gained through the urge of the union. This has been true of all the cases mentioned above. In the Cleveland Garment Plan, for instance, the guarantee feature would have been dropped if the union had not insisted that it be made part of the new wage agreement. This is an example of the value of joint action on a plan of this kind. The wage-earners have had a definite contribution to make. The plan evolved from the thinking of all groups interested has contained the constructive features valuable not only to the wage-earners but to the industry as a whole.

C. Unemployment Payment Plans Operated by Unions

It has not always been practical to make joint agreements for unemployment compensation. The idea of industrial responsibility for the wage-earners' income is comparatively new. Trade unions were the organizations which protected their members against emergencies, and therefore unemployment insurance has been carried on to a large extent by unions with no help from the employer, and the majority of union plans are of this type.

The plans are similar in form. Benefits varying from $5 to $30 a week are paid to unemployed members for a certain number of weeks and the cost is financed by a tax on the whole union membership. This tax is either collected regularly as part of the monthly dues, or it is levied only at times when severe unemployment has drawn the funds down to a low level. In some unions the money to finance the payments is kept in a separate unemployment fund; in some it is part of the general fund of the union. The cost of benefits and the
amount of benefit which can be paid varies greatly with unemployment conditions in the different trades and different towns and cities. The table at the end of this chapter gives a summary of benefit payments in 1927.

A good example of these plans is that of the photo engravers union in New York City. The New York local of photo engravers have an unemployment season which lasts usually for about five weeks. In some years it is longer. In 1927, for instance, the average was over 6 weeks. But the general experience in the five years from 1923 to 1927 has been that one member in every 8 could expect to be unemployed about 5 weeks. Usually between two and three hundred men out of a membership of 2,400 are out of work in one year and in the worst year, 1927, 400 were out for over 6 weeks on the average. A photo engraver out of work loses about $60 a week, so that in five weeks he would lose approximately $300. What does the unemployment benefit plan do to make this up?

The union provides that benefits are paid after one week of unemployment, so that men who are out 5 weeks receive benefits for 4 weeks. And the benefit paid is $25 a week. Therefore a member receives $100 if he is out of work 5 weeks. In 1927 the 400 men out of work for an average of over 6 weeks received an average of $136 each.

A member of the union may know, then, that if he is the unlucky man who is laid off during the dull period, he will have a very substantial sum of money to fall back on and will not be left entirely without income. Especially to those who have families dependent upon them, this help means more than mere protection.
against material losses. It prevents the constant anxiety which the family must suffer when their income is uncertain, and above all it means that the advantages and opportunities, the standard of living which they have won through hard work and saving, need not be so much lowered as it would otherwise have been.

The following table gives a record of the percentage of unemployed members receiving benefits and the benefits paid for a period of five years:

Local 1, International Photo-Engravers' Union, New York City

Membership 1927: 2,398

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Unemployed members receiving benefits</th>
<th>Average number of weeks unemployed</th>
<th>Benefit payments during year</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Number</td>
<td>Percent of membership</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1923</td>
<td>260</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>over 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1924</td>
<td>380</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>nearly 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1925</td>
<td>212</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>over 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1926</td>
<td>188</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>nearly 6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1927</td>
<td>400</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>over 6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>1,440</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>over 5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The New York photo-engravers local is a large union, but it is also possible for a small union to support a benefit plan. The bakery workers in Madison, Wis., with a membership of 40, pay unemployment benefits of $6 a week, the lithographers of Seattle, with
a membership of 24, pay $5 a week, the photo-engravers of Montreal, with 73 members, pay $15 a week. While these payments are not so large as in some locals with over 2,000 members, they are a decided help to the unemployed members in tiding over dull periods.

The cost of this unemployment relief to the union per member seems small when compared to the benefits derived. It depends on two factors: A. The percentage of the membership unemployed. B. The length of time they are out of work. The amount of benefit paid also influences the cost, but not always as much as might be expected. For instance, two bakery workers locals have had this curious experience. The local in Buffalo pays a benefit of $4 a week. In 1927 this cost an amount equal to nearly $8 per member for the year. In Washington, on the other hand, the local pays $12 a week, three times as much as in Buffalo, and yet it cost them, in 1927, only $2 per member, or one-quarter as much. This difference is due to the fact that Buffalo had over 5 times as many unemployed receiving benefits proportionately to its membership, as Washington. Buffalo paid benefits to one member in every 6, and Washington to one in every 33. Also members were unemployed for a longer time in Buffalo, averaging 12 weeks, while Washington workers averaged less than 10 weeks during the year. The more stable condition in Washington is due at least in part to the fact that the Washington local makes every effort to keep employment steady and also has a policy of dividing work among the work force in dull periods, so that unemployment benefits are paid only in extreme cases. In New York, the cost of paying photo-engravers a benefit of $25 a week averaged about $16 a year.
from each union member for the five year period from 1923 to 1927. On account of the great variation in unemployment conditions, it is impossible to give any general figure for costs. In a number of unions paying from $7 to $15 a week the cost varies between $5 and $8.25 per member per year, or between 40c and 70c a month.

There have been various methods for financing unemployment benefits. Members may be taxed an amount varying from 50 cents to $2 in addition to their regular dues each month until a large enough amount is raised to establish an unemployment fund. This fund is then invested at interest, the interest helping to provide for benefit payments. The fund is a guarantee against times of severe unemployment when many members may be suddenly thrown out of work. Payments are made from it and as the original amount is drawn down it is replenished by further taxes on the membership. The taxes may be collected in two ways. Either a steady tax is continued regularly, the amount calculated on the union's experience in benefit payments, or the tax may be taken off until the fund is drawn down to a certain point and then put on again.

Typographical Union No. 6 in New York follows the first method. Members are taxed one-half of one per cent of their weekly earnings for 26 weeks from April to September. Of the fund thus raised, $35,000 is set aside each year for benefit payments. The New York photo-engravers use the second method. They have a fund of $50,000 set aside for unemployment. When it is drawn below $35,000, a tax of $1 per member is levied until the fund again reaches $50,000.
Some unions pay benefits without having a separate unemployment fund, the general fund being sufficient for usual needs. This system could not, however, provide for very high benefits or for severe unemployment. An unemployment fund makes the system more secure financially. By collecting a regular tax of a certain fixed amount monthly or weekly, the union avoids the risk of exhausting the fund when unemployment is particularly severe and having to call on the membership for heavy payments when many are out of work and the union is less able to pay.

Instead of unemployment benefit systems, unions sometimes provide loans for unemployed members. These are furnished without interest and are repaid in weekly payments when the member is again at work. This system makes it possible to give temporary relief where a union does not feel able to undertake a benefit plan, but it places the whole burden on the unemployed member, who is least able to bear it.

The problem of the man out of work is not solved until he is back at work again, and an important part of the mechanism for union unemployment relief is the employment bureau or employment exchange. Often unions make it their responsibility, in connection with unemployment benefit systems, to find work for unemployed members. The union office, or the business agent, keeps in constant touch with employers and is informed as soon as a position is open. Employers, knowing that they can obtain skilled help at the union office, call by phone when they need men and the union office thus becomes a clearing-house for employment of much service both to employers and members. Where unions have no unemployment payment plans, the em-
loyment bureau furnishes the main source of help to members out of work. Whether or not there is an actual registry of unemployment kept at the union office, it is customary for union officers to make it one of their duties to find work for unemployed members. So widespread is this custom that the majority of union members can count on help from their union in finding work. Reports from 51 local unions with 12,019 members show that 5,461 positions were found for members in the year 1927.

The need for unemployment relief has been particularly evident in the last few years. Another chapter * shows how modern improvements in machinery have very greatly increased the amount of goods one workman could produce and therefore hundreds of thousands of men and women have been thrown out of work. While these workers will probably be taken back into industry eventually or find work in other occupations, they must all go through a painful period of unemployment before the readjustments are made. Some form of insurance against these hardships is necessary if they are to keep up their health and strength and their families' standard of living.

Unemployment relief through the trade union is a distinctly practical measure to meet immediate needs. It is practical because it can be adopted at once in individual plants, and because it can become part of a plan to prevent unemployment, in which both labor and management representatives will share. In cases where a joint plan is not feasible, the union itself can initiate a plan of its own. If a system covering wider territory

*Productivity and Unemployment by Ewan Clague.

164
would answer the need more effectively, plans in different towns may be linked together and administered through the international union. Thus the separate plans can be the starting point for a more comprehensive system, a tendency which is already appearing and which would bring more persons under the protection of unemployment payment plans.

Plans could be based upon insurance experience and their success made more certain, if more information about unemployment could be had. The information we have at present is very limited and not nearly enough to place the unemployment payments on an actuarial basis, as with life insurance or fire insurance. Records of unemployment, and research work to collect and compile what information is available will do much to meet this need.

Even with the scanty information we have, there has been enough experience with unemployment prevention and compensation in the United States to make great progress toward solving the problem if enough attention is given to it. It is to be hoped that we may look forward to a time when unemployment will be very much more rare than it is today, and when wage-earners will be so protected that an emergency like last year's will be impossible.
### Unemployment Benefits, 1927

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Union</th>
<th>Number protected by benefit plans</th>
<th>Benefit payments, 1927</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Local unions</td>
<td>Members</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>INTERNATIONAL PLANS</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diamond Workers</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>400</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Siderographers</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>LOCAL PLANS</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bakers and Confectionery Workers</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>3,732</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bookbinders</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>696</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brewery, Flour, Cereal and Soft Drink Workers</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cleaners and Dyers</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2,009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cloth Hat, Cap and Millinery Workers</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2,561</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lithographers</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2,944</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Photo-Engravers</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>5,289</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Printing Pressmen</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3,914</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stereotypers and Electrotypers</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1,015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Telegraphers, Commercial</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Typographical Union</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>17,029</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wood Carvers</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>48</td>
<td>40,582</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

¹ Estimated for one local.
³ Estimated for two locals.
¹ Includes sick benefits for two locals, probably totalling between $10,000 and $25,000.
⁴ These figures exclude six locals with 1,049 members which have benefit plans but gave no report of payments.
## Guaranteed Employment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Union</th>
<th>Number members covered</th>
<th>Amounts paid</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>United Wall Paper Crafts</td>
<td>229</td>
<td>$10,000.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International Ladies Garment workers</td>
<td>1,500</td>
<td>$20,959.25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>1,729</strong></td>
<td><strong>$30,959.25</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total, all Unions</strong></td>
<td><strong>42,311</strong></td>
<td><strong>$446,330.92</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
THE PROSPECTS OF DEMOCRACY

BY T. G. P. SPEAR

I.

THE present time exhibits one of those revulsions of political sentiment which must puzzle most students of European politics. Within ten years of the "war to make the world safe for democracy", when it was seriously suggested that only democratic governments should be admitted to the League of Nations, it is asserted on all sides that democracy has failed, that it is only suitable to certain countries at certain times and in certain conditions, and that even then it may only be a temporary phenomenon. The war to end autocracies has replaced two military monarchies by three dictatorships, of which two are more ruthless, more arbitrary, less bound by law, and more dangerous to the peace of the world than their predecessors. President Wilson, the apostle of democracy, is now often spoken of as the last and greatest of the Liberals. The political ideal which was the dream of thinkers and the goal of statesmen through the 19th century has lost its attraction at the moment of its completest fulfilment, and this is bound to be particularly disconcerting to a country like India which finds that it has no sooner accepted a political ideal than the rest of the world discards it.

Even those who do not admit its failure acknowledge the defects of its working and devices like Proportional Representation, the Referendum and Initiative are attempts to improve the working of the machine. Others take the line that while it is no
much better, it is no worse than other systems, but this sort of view is the most unsatisfactory of all. It is this view which makes Lord Bryce's *Modern Democracies* such depressing reading.

It is noteworthy, however, that though criticism of democracy was never more general, the choice of alternatives was never more limited. Apart from the traditional governments which have been discarded, the choice lies between the dictatorship of the Bolsheviks, a régime of violence based on fanatic dogmatism, and that of the Fascists, equally arbitrary and violent, and based on the fear of the possessing classes. The Russian state is Marx's communist dictatorship, and the Italian the capitalist dictatorship which he predicted would precede it.

Amidst this pessimism and lack of constructive ideas, it is necessary to ask what we mean by "democracy" as a form of government or a political ideal before we decide how successful it has been or estimate its prospects.

Democracy, or the co-operative government of a state by its people, appeared first in Europe in the Greek City States, which have ever since served as a model and an inspiration for later thinkers. But Greek democracy was very different from our modern governments. Not only was there a radical difference of size and complexity, not only was there no representative system, but the democracy itself was partial. The free Greek citizen was in a minority of about 1 to 3 of his domestic and industrial slaves, the former of whom were often people of equal ability and culture with their masters. Greek democracy was really a racial oligarchy; the principle of equality was there, but it was confined to one class. Christianity over-
leapt in the West the barriers of class and race; it recognised neither Greek nor barbarian, bond nor free, but before this universalism had time to bear fruit in the political sphere the Roman civilisation collapsed in the fifth century. Throughout the winter of the Middle Ages the Church provided the only career open to talent and preserved within itself the germ of democracy amid the wintry blasts of feudalism and brute force. The bursting of the bud came with the Reformation, which on one side was the protest of the common man against ecclesiastical experts and arbitrary authority. Protestantism, when it has not been mere faction or the expression of vested interests, has always asserted a positive idea as well as protested against a particular abuse; in this case it was the right of private judgment as against the dead hand of Church authority, and the equality of all believers in the sight of God. Protestantism rapidly congealed into another authoritarian system resting on an infallible book, but its spirit lived on in the religious sects of Germany and England and found political expression in the Puritan movement. Cromwell's godly commonwealth and the tyrannical "rule of the Saints" had a democratic basis in spite of its religious exclusiveness and moral intolerance. Though the rule of the Major-Generals was a tyranny, yet it was a tyranny based on private judgment which carried with it the seed of its own supersession. With the Revolution settlement England reached an equilibrium which was the source of much complacency to herself, and of admiration to foreign thinkers like Montesquieu.

Democracy found its modern prophet in Rousseau, who extended the democratic idea from the "all believers" of the Puritans to all mankind. Though
his facile belief in the innocence and rationality of human nature, and his emphasis on rights to the exclusion of duties, worked much mischief, yet his passionate belief in the equal value of every man and his doctrine that the state must express the free will of its citizens, was of the greatest importance. Rousseau thought only of city states on the classical model or like his own Geneva, but for the translation of his ideas into fact in large country states a new model was needed. This new model was ready to hand in the English constitution. The new period, heralded by the American revolution, dramatically commenced with the explosion of the French revolution. From that time throughout the 19th century the process of introducing democratic principles into the European country states continued, and the form almost invariably adopted was the representative parliamentary form of England.

The nineteenth century was the great age of Liberalism, and Liberalism was the 19th century form of Protestantism. Every protestant movement must protest against something as well as assert (or protest) a principle. The Liberal principle was individual liberty, and the Liberal battle was waged against its opponents, the traditional monarchies, the Roman Church, privileged classes and vested interests. But every protestant movement, after defeating its immediate rivals, is apt to develop a new dogmatism as cramping as the one which it has just overthrown, and the process has to be repeated afresh. On the existence and constant repetition of this process the vitality and progress of the world depend.

It is this fate, the nemesis of completing its own programme, which overtook democratic Liberalism in Europe in 1919. Privilege had almost disappeared
nationalism had triumphed, parliamentary institutions were universally accepted. The mandate of the old Liberalism was exhausted, and political Liberals, having nothing more to fight for, tended to take the capitalist side in the socialist controversy, and to become conservative guardians of the social order. The protestant or liberal spirit moved elsewhere and entered into the various socialist and labour groups. This process had begun before the war in the emergence of the different socialist parties, and it represented the discovery that parliamentary institutions were not in themselves sufficient to express the whole principle of democracy. So we reach the post-war situation in which the world has become dissatisfied with Parliamentarism as soon as it has no enemies left, for the simple reason that Parliamentarism by itself is not sufficient to express the whole spirit of democracy. Here we may note that the cause which has led to the eclipse of Liberalism in Europe has no application for India; here privilege, tradition and vested interests still exist in such abundance that the Liberal movement (under whatever label) is still in its initial stages.

The question then remains, if representative parliamentary institutions do not adequately express the democratic principle, what exactly do we mean by democracy?

II

DEMOCRACY begins with the individual. "The awful ultimate fact," says Dr. Whitehead, "is the human being, consciously alone with itself for its own sake." Man is fundamentally solitary on one side, yet he is also fundamentally gregarious on
the other; he can neither live wholly alone nor wholly in public. Even hermits collect in groups, and those successful communists, the Catholic monks, have cells. As according to the same writer "religion is what a man does with his solitariness," so we may say politics is what a man does with his social relationships.

We begin then with man, a being both solitary and social, who insists equally on his separateness from and his community with others. But psychology has long ago shown us that man is not the innocent child of nature of Rousseau, of an angelic benevolence and the embodiment of sweet reasonableness; nor is he the cave man of Hobbes, a compound of violent passions, delighting in war, and restrained only by some overmastering authority; nor yet is his heart so "desperately wicked" as some theologians have imagined. There is, in fact, "a war in his members;" he is a creature of conflicting instincts and impulses, which have to be co-ordinated and directed by his own will. Man, as Plato said, is the charioteer who must drive on a straight course the contrary pulling horses of reason and passion.

Man has various needs and these needs constitute his rights. A right is what is necessary to the fullest self-development of the individual. Thus he has the need of life, of food, of shelter, of a family, of security, of freedom of action. But as soon as the elementary needs are satisfied another series of spiritual needs appears no less vital than the first. He has an intellect which craves for truth, a conscience which demands justice, an aesthetic sense which looks for beauty, and a creative instinct which finds
satisfaction in realising some ideal conception. Only when all these needs are satisfied, when all these instincts find a free outlet, is the full potentiality of the individual realised.

Corresponding to these needs or rights are duties, which are the recognition of the needs of others. Rousseau did much damage by emphasising only rights, which has led to individual and group selfishness, and though his bias was corrected by T. H. Green, it is perhaps unfortunate for the world that while Rousseau was the most eloquent of men, Green was one of the most unintelligible.

Democracy recognises the potential value of every man, and the democratic principle involves giving to all this chance of the fullest self-development. This brings us back again to the individual, for all depends on him. If external authority is removed it must be replaced by authority within; self-control is the corollary of self-government. The external authority of priest or king, by removing from the individual the necessity of choice and decision, automatically prevents the possibility of his fullest development, and leaves him no more than a cog in a machine, a pawn on the chess table, or a unit in a herd; he is also the master of his fate. All our possessions, whether material or spiritual, are valuable to us only in so far as we have made them our own, or achieved them as the result of our own efforts. It is more blessed to make than to receive. Thus it is that however benevolent a paternal government may be, however excellent its administration or well developed its culture, it is of little value to the individuals of the State because they have acquired these things by no effort of their own. They
are external to their souls, not a part of them; the individual has received and not created for himself. So the paternal system inevitably takes away independence and initiative from the individual, or rather never fosters it, and leaves him dependent on authority; and in the day of trouble, when the lightning falls on the roof tree, and the leaders are struck down, their is nothing but a witless or panic-stricken mob to resist the invader.

The root principle of democracy is the free development of the individual. But this places the burden of government on the individual himself: "Democracy," says Dr. Masaryk, "is based on individualism, not on capricious individualism, but rather on the effort to strengthen individuality and the sense of individual responsibility. Democracy means self-government, which means self-control, and self-government begins at home." This means the deliberate choice of an ideal and the self-disciplining of oneself to it; it means doing things for oneself instead of going to others for help, it means rooting oneself in one's own convictions, and standing alone if necessary. "Who so controls his rising anger like a running chariot, him I call the charioteer; the others only hold the reins," says the Dhammapada. True freedom is the choice of one's own ideal. Man's highest moment is the moment of free homage to a Master. The opposite dependent view is well illustrated by this description by Dr. Masaryk of pre-war Austria. "In old Austria, all of us were more or less in opposition to the State and ended by thinking it enough 'to call upon the Imperial or Royal government' to do this or that. In other words we left the administration of the State to our masters, and quarrelled merrily among ourselves."
If the first principle of democracy is the free development of the individual, the second is the free cooperation of individuals for the common good. Democratic society is a free association of wills co-operating to achieve the possibility of the fullest life for all.

If a well-ordered society based on individual dependence leads to spiritual inertia, clamant individualism without give and take or compromise would lead to inevitable chaos. Just as a man must he free to be himself, so he must also co-operate with others if he is to achieve even this own self-development.

Democracy then is a system which aims at making possible the fullest self-realisation for all. It does this first by recognising the supreme value of the individual, and secondly by realising that the individual can only achieve his best self in co-operation with and in the society of his fellows. Man must express his own individuality, but he can only express through society. Otherwise the highest bliss would be residence on a desert island, the most perfectly developed characters the hermits of the Egyptian deserts, or the sadhu of the forest. It is government for the people which, as can be easily seen from history, inevitably in the long run means government by the people. For Paternalism always puts the father first.

III.

If the foregoing is the ideal of democracy we may well ask, What democratic system in existence then can be saved? The answer is that all such systems from the Greek City States and the Swiss Forest Cantons to the Referendum and Proportional Representation are not so much expressions of the
democratic principle as approximations to it, means of moving towards the goal of true democracy. Democracy is not so much a system that exists as an ideal to be attained. Existing systems must be judged by their results in moving towards this goal, and if they are faulty, must be discarded. But the ideal remains; it is only the method of approach which is altered. Thus there is nothing particularly sacrosanct about the Parliamentary system, Federalism, the universal suffrage or any other nostrum for realising democracy. The means of realising this ideal must be freely adapted to the circumstances of particular countries, and one method may be substituted for another, so long as the same ideal is steadily aimed at. The political progress of a nation is to be judged, not by the particular system of government which it adopts, but by the ideal towards which it is working, and its constancy in pursuing it. Thus France in 1848 substituted the Presidential form of approach in place of the limited Parliamentary; the coup d'etat of 1851 was a violent substitution of the plebiscitary method for the Presidential, which in 1870, by another sudden shock, was changed for the responsible Parliamentary method. Though opinions might differ as to which was the best method, the fact is that throughout that period the goal of democracy remained unchanged, "constant as the northern star." In sharp contrast to this are the modern Fascists, who not only denounced the working of the existing Italian parliamentary system as undemocratic (which it was), but denied democracy itself. The result is a system based on nothing but (at first) fear of revolution and force, a tyranny in the Greek sense of the word, which has no hope for the future, and
which can only be changed by voluntary abdication or bloodshed. The only alternative to the democratic ideal, self-government and voluntary cooperation right through, is paternalism or authoritarianism whose end is the slave mentality (mental if not physical) and the Servile State.

For the realisation of democracy it is obvious that something much more than juggling with ballot boxes and virtuosity in lobbying is required. It is the individual which counts and to the individual we must go. The democratic man is a "homo sapiens", who "sees life steadily and sees it whole," who has a "balanced outlook upon life." More important than any electoral system is therefore a system of education, without which the potentialities of man can never unfold themselves, but remain like dropped seeds in an infertile soil. Plato and Aristotle saw clearly that education and psychology were the twin foundations of political science, and Pestalozzi and Rousseau (in education an innovator as in so much else) in modern times applied, as we might say, the principle of self-government to education. Is the enfranchising of our ignorant multitude really a step towards democracy or does it not make the seizure of power by a dictator (aided by the resources in mendacity which modern journalism provides) all the more easy? It may be an earnest of the intention to build up a democracy, but it is hardly positively a progressive step, and in modern conditions it may be a very dangerous one. It is true that most European countries did this and got the education afterwards, but Russia and Spain and Italy have paid the price in dictatorships. Similarly education without political power may lead only to more intelligent and efficient servility. So the Germans, with all their
splendid expert organisation, when their leaders blundered during the war were helpless to replace them. It is all a question of ways and means, of what expedient will best promote the self-development of the individual without endangering the safety of the state and the whole ideal of government. It is not contended that universal suffrage or any other political expedient is necessarily bad, but only that no one expedient is infallible per se: all must be judged by the degree in which they develop the personality of the average citizen. Thus electoral devices like the alternative vote, decentralisation, etc., are ways of making the vote of a citizen more effective, and more radical proposals for economic reorganisation like those of Guild Socialists, the Syndicalists and the Functionalism of Prof. Laski and his school, are ways of increasing the control of the citizen over his life, based on the realisation that politics or public affairs are now too intimately bound up with economics or private affairs and the whole of social life, to be neglected or left to run their own unregulated course. The various schools of social thinkers are only the recognition that self-government and its corollary, willing co-operation and mutual control, must govern the whole of life and not merely its conventionally public aspect.

The real obstacles to the realisation of democracy are not the opposition of interested or mediæval minded groups, or the defects of particular machines; statistics of corruption, revelations of graft and self-seeking and all the ills which parliamentary institutions are heirs to, are only the symptoms of difficulties which lie much deeper in the conditions of the modern world.
These fundamental difficulties are in the main the great size of modern countries, the numbers of modern populations, and the fact that much of the necessary work of the world is of so unattractive a nature that none could do it unless compelled, or unless his mind had not yet risen to conceiving any alternative. Expressing the people's will to-day is not so easy a matter as when the ideal state was "the largest number which suffices for the purposes of life and can be taken in at a single view."* How can the vast populations of a modern state be civilised right through? Will the cinema goer ever appreciate Shelley and Shakespeare? Who would be a miner or sweeper if he could avoid it, or who would wish to go on being one after once becoming conscious of new desires and a larger life?

The problem of size and numbers is the furthest on the way to solution as it has engaged attention ever since the difficulty of applying Rousseau's ideas to a country state was realised. The British Constitution was the first model, and all the refinements of political science from Federalism downwards are steps in this direction. It is the problem of giving to a whale the delicate nervous system of an ant. More recently it has been realised that mere political decentralisation will not solve the whole question. Since government, society and the individual are under modern conditions inextricably intertwined, democracy must express itself through the whole of life, social and economic as well as political. This is the foundation of the various social theories. Marx's State Socialism was a move towards the ideal of democracy although, soured as it was by hardships,

a bad tempered and very wooden one. The later communists have retained the bad temper and woodenness and dropped the democracy, and thus produced their fanatic and violent authoritarianism based only on force, and with no more moral claim to obedience than Fascism. The bomb and the big stick are short cuts to nothing but the breaking of heads. Since Marx, however, our social thinkers have improved in technique; they are neither bomb throwers or social drill serjeants; they aim at making the organs of government multiple, to cover all aspects of life, because they realise that society is multi-cellular. One man has many needs, and they must be met in many ways.

The civilising of society right through depends on real education and the development of some means of self-expression for the masses. For the former universal education is only a beginning and for the latter there must be democratic art in its different forms to provide means of self-expression for the mind as athletics already do for the body. Here science promises to do what might otherwise not be possible, to combine a democratic with a centralised art, the village craftsman with the metropolitan virtuoso. We see the beginnings of these possibilities in England in the gramophone and broadcasting as well as in the cheap printing of literature, music, and art on the side of mass distribution, and in community singing, the revival of country patriotism, of village craftsmanship, country dancing, and institutions like the Glastonbury School of Art and the Welsh Eisteddford on the side of local and individual self-expression. Culture is much more than passive receiving, the painting of a fresh coat of enamel on the outside of the platter; it receives only to give forth. So people
can receive the seeds of art from science, and fertilise them into a democratic culture by their own individual and corporate efforts at self-expression. This process has hardly begun in India yet perhaps; we have been too busy in teaching English in order to provide clerks for office stools, but nevertheless there is the dream, there is the power for creating new life. Science, Janus-like, has two faces, bad and good. Rightly used, she may be the recreator as much as the destroyer of the world.

The last problem remains, which has baffled every civilisation up to the present. How are we to avoid a menial class, whether servile or free, subjected by force or by law or by religion? Here again science provides the hope. By labour-saving devices, by methods for increasing production, by tapping new sources of power like the steam engine and electricity, by its increasing mastery over nature and its knowledge of man, science is steadily reducing the essential menial work to vanishing point. Indeed it would have made more progress already had not its early exploiters been more moved by the thought of profits and power than the needs of humanity. It has been reckoned that in a perfectly organised community it would only be necessary for each individual to do three hours of mechanical or menial work per day. This would not mean the end of physical labour of course; in democratic society each man would do what best expressed and fulfilled his own inner needs. Public school boys, for instance, would make excellent agricultural workers.

Let no man say that the modern world is dull and that life is but a tedium to be endured.

"The fault, dear Brutus, lies not in our stars,
But in ourselves."

He who complains of a dull world is like a man who knocks his own head with a hammer and then complains of the pain. There is an infinity of interest to see if a man will only look for it. Behind the cynicism and apathy left by the war in Europe and the non-co-operation movement in India, the desparing attitude of "moderate Satanism" (as Mr. C. E. Montague calls it), neither very good nor very bad, behind complacency in high places and jobbery and hate in low, stand the "cloud capp'd places, the gorgeous towers" of a new world waiting to be seen by struggling humanity. Nor is this vision any mere shadow of a dream to be wistfully talked of and forgotten. There have been periods of hope and new ideas before, as at the Court of Akbar in India, or of Elizabeth in England or in the 18th century in France, but they have lacked the power to realise these dreams. But now a new power is upon us which can thoroughly cleanse our floor. If you go into company meetings or the halls of county families or even theological assemblies you will easily understand that the world will shortly perish, but if you go to thinkers, to meetings of the people and above all to the laboratory, you will find a new world throbbing with new ideas, new hopes and new achievements. The old world may indeed grow old and die, but a new world is rising to take her place. Democracy has not crushed her wings against the sharp spikes of actuality; she is but spreading her wings to take her flight.
ADDRESS DELIVERED

BY

Mr. R. G. Pradhan, B.A., LL.B., M.L.C.

AS

President of the Peasants' Conference

held at


on 19th May 1929.

POONA:


1929.
The substance of this speech in Marathi was read out at the meeting.

R. G. PRADHAN.
Let me thank you most sincerely for having asked me to preside over this Conference of agriculturists held to protest against the proposed enhancement of land revenue in the Malegaon Taluka. I am glad that the agriculturists of the Malegaon Taluka have awakened and are carrying on agitation against the proposed revision settlement. I cannot help thinking that it would have been better if the movement had been started simultaneously with that in the Baglan Taluka, so that the peasants of Malegaon Taluka would have got the same opportunity, as the latter, of representing their grievances and objections in an organised manner to the Revenue authorities. However, better late than never; and it has given me sincere pleasure to find that the peasantry of Malegaon are organizing themselves, holding public meetings to express and record their protests against the proposals of the Settlement Officer and carrying on a movement which, I see, is growing in strength, in order that Government may realise the reasonableness of their objections to the proposed resettlement, and be satisfied that it ought not to be sanctioned.

I want to tell you what is the exact stage reached by this question at the present moment. Mr. Ghosal, the Revenue Commissioner, has submitted to the Government his reports on the proposals of the settlement officer. When the Honourable Mr. Rieu, the Revenue Member, visited Nasik last month, I saw him and asked him whether the papers in connection with the matter had come to him.
He replied in the negative; but when I told him that Mr. Ghosal had sent his report to Government, he added that the papers might have come to the Secretariat and might come to him, in due course, at Mahableshwar. So, you will see that the whole question is still under the consideration of the Government.

II

In the meanwhile, as you know, an event of far-reaching importance, bearing on the whole question of the Land Revenue policy and administration, has taken place; and, it may be hoped, that it will lead to a new orientation of that policy, and to improvements in land Revenue administration. The report of Messrs Broomfield and Maxwell, the Special Inquiry Officers appointed to inquire and report upon the complaint of the people in Bardoli and Chorasi Talukas against the enhancement of Land Revenue has been published. The people of Bardoli Taluka have triumphed, and their agitation has been proved to demonstration to have been just and reasonable. Messrs Broomfield and Maxwell have recommended that the enhancement should not be more than 6 per cent and 5.24 per cent over the old assessment, in the Bardoli and the Chorasi Taluka respectively.

It is a matter of satisfaction that the Government have promptly issued a resolution accepting these recommendations.

The Broomfield-Maxwell report is an important document; it is a notable contribution to the growing literature on the subject of Land Revenue; and as such it is entitled to great weight and consideration. The question of the best Land Revenue
system and the best method of administering it is by no means easy. I have been studying and pondering on the problem for the last 6 years and more; and its inherent difficulties and the variety of views expressed on its different aspects sometimes make me think whether a solution can ever be reached, to which no objection can be taken on any ground whatever and which will be acceptable to all, whether scientific theorists, statesmen, the Government who are naturally tempted to look at the problem from the point of view of revenue, or the agricultural classes directly affected by the system. But if the problem is difficult, it has become a very live and urgent problem; and until and unless a solution is reached to which the people can agree, it is bound to be a source of constant difficulty and trouble. Such being the case, any careful and thoughtful contribution to the clarification of the problem and to its solution is welcome; and I gladly express my opinion that, as such, the Broomfield-Maxwell report will have more than ephemeral interest and importance: and those upon whom lies the responsibility of placing our revenue system on a sound and satisfactory basis, that is, the Legislatures and the Government will find in it much that is valuable, helpful and suggestive. I hope, I may be permitted to pay my tribute of appreciation of the work done by Mr. Broomfield and Mr. Maxwell, and to offer them my sincere congratulations upon the care, the thoroughness, the independence, the freedom from prejudice, or from the desire to uphold, at any cost, the prestige of the Government, with which they have discharged their duties. The spirit, the care, and thoroughness with which they have conducted the inquiry entrusted to.
them ought to be an object lesson to the Government and their officers.

III

But while I fully recognise the great merits of the report, it is not a faultless document; and on two points, in particular, it is open to criticism. The most important question with regard to land revenue assessment is: What should be the basis of assessment? Will it be right to consider rental value the sole or even the main basis for fixing the assessment? Much of the controversy on the subject hangs on this question. Messrs Broomfield and Maxwell have discussed it at the very beginning of their report. After pointing out that to base assessment on rental value is not inconsistent with section 107 of the Land Revenue Code, they say:

"On the other hand, we are of the opinion that the proviso, viz. that the rental value shall have been properly ascertained, is of vital importance. Rental value is not the same thing as rents, and does not emerge from a mere enumeration of the rents actually paid or agreed upon. It appears to be hardly a concrete thing at all. To quote Mr. Anderson, "Rental value is a sublimation or abstraction from actual rents of all sorts." Therefore bound to be considerable difficulty in ascertaining it correctly, and where leasing is the exception rather than the rule, as in both the Talukas with which we have to deal, one must be very cautious in applying any rental value deduced from the actual rents found, to the much larger area which is never leased at all." (The Italics are mine).

When I started reading the report and came across these sentences, I thought that probably some other basis than rental value had been adopted by
Messrs Broomfield and Maxwell for reaching their final conclusions, and I felt great desire to know what that basis was. I do not say that the language they have used absolutely negatives the adoption of the rental value as the basis for fixing the assessment; but their clear admission, first, that there is bound to be considerable difficulty in ascertaining rental value correctly, and, secondly, that in cases where, as in these two Talukas, leasing is the exception rather than the rule, the application of any rental value, even when correctly ascertained from the data available, to the much larger unleased area, requires great caution, would naturally suggest that in fixing the assessment they had adopted a method which was not open to the same difficulty and did not call for the same great caution. But what do we find? They have considered the general economic position of the two Talukas and found that it does not show any material alteration which would strongly affect the grouping. They have examined the direct method of calculating the profits of agriculture, as suggested by the people and their counsel, and their conclusion is that the indications yielded by that method are too far negative to afford basis for resettlement. Their consideration of the evidence of indebtedness has also led them to the same conclusion. In other words,—if I understand them rightly—(1) The general economic condition of the Talukas, (2) evidence as regards the profits of cultivation and (3) evidence as regards indebtedness, do not warrant any increase in assessment at all. So they say:—

"We are thus left with the evidence of the value of land, and more particularly the rental evidence, as the main basis for our recommendations."
So, an increase, though small, is recommended by them, because, in their opinion, it is justified mainly by the rental evidence. The very method which they have described as difficult and as requiring great caution in its application to an unleased larger area, they have ultimately adopted as the basis for fixing the enhanced assessments they have recommended, for the whole area.

Now the report shows that the rental evidence has been carefully sifted and every care taken to ascertain the rental value properly in the small leased area. (The Italics are mine). But what the report does not show is in what way, caution, which has been admitted to be necessary, has been exercised in applying the rental value, as thus ascertained in the small leased area, to the much larger unleased area in the two Talukas. I cannot help suggesting that it would be much better if this point was made clear by Messrs Broomfield and Maxwell in a supplementary report or note. Otherwise, some people cannot but feel a doubt whether even the small increase recommended by them is really justified.

The second point in the report, which calls for criticism, is their treatment of the question of determining the profits of agriculture as a basis for assessment. The question is whether the profits of agriculture can be ascertained or not? This involves the question what items should be taken into account on the expenditure or debit side? Both these questions are capable of being scientifically treated and prima facie, it should not be difficult to ascertain the profits of agriculture. One fails to understand in what way agriculture is so different from other industries that whereas, profits can be ascertained in
the case of the latter, they cannot be ascertained in the case of agriculture. Section 107 of the Land Revenue Code says that regard should be had to the profits of agriculture in revising assessments of land revenue. The expression "the profits of agriculture" would not have been used in the section, if it had been thought that they were incapable of being ascertained. The Taxation Inquiry Committee have recommended that the basis of assessment should be annual value, and they have defined annual value as "the gross produce less cost of production, including the value of the labour actually expended by the farmer and his family on the holding, and the return for enterprise". The annual value is nothing but the profits of agriculture; and the Taxation Inquiry Committee, in recommending that the basis of assessment should be the annual value or the profits of agriculture, obviously thought that the profits of agriculture were capable of being ascertained.

Now, my criticism on that part of the report which deals with this question is that it is very perfunctory and not at all marked by the scientific spirit. The Inquiry Officers may be perfectly justified in holding that the actual evidence presented to them by the people regarding the profits of agriculture, was unsatisfactory, and afforded no basis, in the particular cases, for fixing the assessment. But a more thorough and scientific investigation of the method than they have done is needed before any definite conclusion can be reached as to its soundness or workability, and before it can be condemned, as they have done. It is eminently desirable that economists and others should consider this question in a true scientific spirit, in all its bearings.
IV

Having made these criticisms upon the report, I shall now turn to the lessons to be drawn from this inquiry. One thing is beyond doubt. The work of the Settlement Officer is extremely difficult, and labourious; and if any injustice to the ryot is to be avoided, as it must be avoided, it must be done in the most careful and thoroughgoing manner. All the available data must be carefully sifted and examined. It would not be enough simply to note the facts bearing on the economic condition of the area in question, which would at first sight indicate an improvement in that condition. The facts themselves must be probed deeper, and it must be clearly ascertained whether they have really benefited the agricultural population, and if so, in what way and to what extent. For instance, it would not be enough simply to note that a railway has been constructed and from that fact at once to jump to the conclusion that it is a factor justifying an all round enhancement of land revenue. The condition of the railway itself must be examined; and the measure of benefit it may have conferred upon the cultivating classes in different villages, assessed at its proper value. In the case of Bardoli, the Settlement Officer took into account the Tapti-valley Railway as a factor favouring increase in assessment; but the Special Inquiry Officers have rejected it as no new factor in the situation which has made a vital difference from the point of view of agricultural economy. Again, they have rightly pointed out that motor traffic, far from being an index of agricultural prosperity, may even be a source of loss to the ryot. I shall not multiply instances. Part II
of the report which I consider the most important, clearly shows how every factor that enters into the calculation must be considered and examined. Even official statistics of prices are of no practical value. Rental data in the village records do not give all the information that is necessary; and to ascertain from them the true rental value even in the leased area is a matter of extreme difficulty, requiring the closest scrutiny in the villages in the presence of the parties or of people acquainted with the facts.

2

Now, we start with these premises, viz (1) Any injustice to the ryot must be avoided. (2) It can only be avoided if the inquiry is made in the most careful and thoroughgoing manner, in fact, in the way in which Messrs Broomfield and Maxwell have done it. And it is no disparagement of the excellent way in which they themselves have made it, to say that they would not have attained such a high level of excellence, unaided, if the inquiry had not been open, full and independent, and if the people had not been permitted to lead and test evidence, even with the help of legal advisers.

Now the question that suggests itself is: If the method of inquiry followed in the case of these two Talukas is alone capable of yielding results that would avoid injustice to the agricultural classes, and enable a proper resettlement to be made, why should it not be the normal method of inquiry in every case? The great lesson which this Bardoli affair teaches is that the existing system of revision settlement must be radically improved. The method of inquiry adopted in the present case must become a part and parcel of the system. The Land Revenue Code must be so
amended so as to embody provisions clearly laying down such a method of inquiry.

If then such a method of inquiry is absolutely necessary in order that injustice may not be done to agriculturists, and such enhancement of assessment, if any, may be fixed as may be clearly justified, it follows that fresh inquiries on the same lines must be made in our Talukas of Baglan and Malegaon, and those Talukas in other Districts whose revision settlement has been or is about to be sanctioned by Government. Nothing but such fresh inquiries can satisfy the people; and this request is so reasonable that I have every hope that it will be granted. I suggest that this conference should pass a resolution to this effect.

I have not yet had the pleasure of coming in close personal contact with His Excellency the Governor. But I have been favourably impressed by the speeches His Excellency has hitherto made. He is reputed to be a careful and assiduous student of the problems of this Presidency; and I am sure, he is fully alive to the necessity of keeping the peasantry contented, happy and prosperous. His thinking and open mind ought to enable the Government to solve aright the problem of land revenue in this Presidency; and I entertain the sincere hope that profiting by the Broomfield-Maxwell report His Excellency's Government will be pleased to direct that fresh inquiries on the lines of that made in the Bardoli and Chorashi Talukas should be held in Baglan, Malegaon, Bassein and other Talukas where movements are going on against the sanctioned or proposed enhancements of land revenue. If this simple and reasonable request is not granted and the revision settlements objected to are sanctioned-
...ed or maintained, I am afraid, the people will be strengthened in their desire to follow the example of Bardoli. I hope the Government will not drive them to despair and to the adoption of such a course. The institution of fresh inquiries is fair and reasonable, and they should at once be ordered.

V

I now propose to consider some other aspects of our land revenue system. Section 148 of the Land Revenue Code authorises the revenue authorities to impose a penalty on a defaulter who has failed to pay an instalment within the prescribed time, and to levy at once the entire balance of land revenue due by him. Section 150 prescribes various processes for the recovery of arrears including the penalty. Two of the processes are:—(1) service of a written notice of demand on the defaulter and (2) distraint and sale of the defaulters' moveable property. Section 152 provides that a notice of demand may be issued on or after the day following that on which the arrears accrued.

Now what happens in this. The Talathi submits a report to the Mamlatdar that so and so has failed to pay his instalment and should therefore be ordered to pay the penalty, namely ¼th of the Land Revenue due from him, and that the whole amount, including the penalty, should be recovered by distraint and sale of this moveable property. The Mamlatdar at once passes an order, as requested by the Talathi, who immediately proceeds to restrain the defaulting Khatedar's moveable property. Section 152 which provides for the issue of a written notice of demand is not brought into operation in every case; and the order imposing the penalty and for the recovery of
the amount by distraint is made by the Mamladhar behind the back of the Khatedar and without his knowledge. The Khatedar comes to know of the order when the Talathi goes to his house to make the distraint.

Now, I do not understand why a notice of demand under section 152 is not issued in every case. The section contains the word “may”, and apparently, is not mandatory; but, surely, its spirit ought to be mandatory; and it is but fair that every defaulter should receive such a notice. In fact, the proper procedure that should be observed is this. If a penalty is to be imposed and an order for distraint to be made, a notice should be issued to the defaulter requiring him to show cause why a penalty should not be levied from him. If he shows cause which is deemed satisfactory, no penalty should be imposed, and an order in writing should be communicated to him to the effect that he must pay the arrears within such and such a date, and that if he failed to do so, he would have to pay the penalty, and the whole amount would be recovered by distraint. If he does not show cause, or if the cause shown is considered unsatisfactory, an order should be passed and communicated to him, levying a penalty and requiring that the whole amount should be paid by him on or before a particular date, after which it will be realised by distraint. It is very unfair and harsh that an ex parte action should be taken simply on the report of the Talathi whose statements about deliberate default may or may not be true. Such action contravenes the principle of “sympathy in collection,” laid down by the Government of India, in their resolution on Land Re venue issued in 1902. It moreover contravenes...
all methods of civilized administration, or sound canons of judicial procedure. The Land Revenue Code stands in urgent need of amendment in this, as in so many other respects.

VI

I see from the Press that a Conference of Revenue Members was recently held at Simla under the presidency of His Excellency the Viceroy. We are told that at that conference, the adequacy of the existing system of Land Revenue administration to meet the present conditions was examined, and that the Government of India hope, after consulting the Local Governments, to issue a resolution setting out the main conclusions reached by the Conference. I am glad, His Excellency the Viceroy has interested himself in this all important question, and I sincerely hope that the Local Governments will take their Legislatures in confidence, and give full consideration and weight to their views, and that the resolution to be issued by His Excellency Lord Irwin’s Government will be as memorable as that issued by Lord Curzon’s Government in 1902 (a resolution drafted by Lord Curzon himself) and will really contribute to the satisfactory solution of this problem. It will be a sad irony of fate, if, after all that has happened with regard to this problem during the last so many years, the resolution does not embody well—considered principles and views, and proves a disappointing document. A proper solution is possible if a fresh, open and sympathetic mind is brought to bear on the problem; otherwise I am afraid it will continue to give trouble as at present.
19 Oct 1929

From Nursery School to University

A Labour Policy

Report

of the Education Advisory Committee of the Trades Union Congress and the Labour Party

Foreword by

The Rt. Hon. J. Ramsay MacDonald, M.P.

Published by the Trades Union Congress and the Labour Party

32, 33 and 34 Eccleston Square, Westminster, London, S.W. 1
V3, 4N: 106 T. N2.
FOREWORD

THIS study in the Education policy of the Labour Party must commend itself to all who are interested in the creation of fine qualities in the human material that is to carry on the life of our country. We have had many schools and we spend a large sum of money every year on education, but we are only beginning to systematise our work, relate each part to the rest and build up a unified plan of education related to child nature, social conditions, the science and art of teaching, and the purposes of learning.

Labour approaches the problem from an experience of the elementary school and the workshop, the mine and the field. To it the school is not a luxury that may be limited in a fit of economy, but a necessity that can be starved only at the national peril. The impetus that the short-lived Labour Government gave to everyone engaged in teaching was but a proof of what value it placed upon education and what enthusiasm it would spend to put it on a satisfactory footing.

In these chapters the whole field from nursery schools to universities is surveyed from the Labour point of view and the book is published not only to explain what that point of view is, but to put before the public ideas that it is hoped will influence general opinion.

J. Ramsay MacDonald.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SUMMARY OF LABOUR'S POLICY</td>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I.</td>
<td>THE PROVISION OF NURSERY SCHOOLS</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II.</td>
<td>THE LIMITS OF ELEMENTARY EDUCATION</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III.</td>
<td>THE RAISING OF THE SCHOOL AGE AND NEED FOR MAINTENANCE</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV.</td>
<td>SECONDARY EDUCATION FOR ALL</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V.</td>
<td>ACCESS TO THE UNIVERSITY</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI.</td>
<td>TECHNICAL EDUCATION</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VII.</td>
<td>THE PART III. AUTHORITY</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VIII.</td>
<td>THE SMALL RURAL SCHOOL</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IX.</td>
<td>THE EXAMINATION SYSTEM</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X.</td>
<td>EDUCATIONAL RESEARCH</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XI.</td>
<td>MODERN TENDENCIES IN EDUCATION</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XII.</td>
<td>THE SIZE OF CLASSES</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XIII.</td>
<td>THE RECOGNITION OF UNQUALIFIED TEACHERS</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XIV.</td>
<td>THE EDUCATION AND TRAINING OF TEACHERS</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XV.</td>
<td>SCHOOL BUILDINGS AND EQUIPMENT</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XVI.</td>
<td>MEDICAL INSPECTION AND TREATMENT</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XVII.</td>
<td>SPECIAL SCHOOLS</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XVIII.</td>
<td>SCHOOL FEEDING</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XIX.</td>
<td>PROBLEMS OF FINANCE</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS

I.—THE PROVISION OF NURSERY SCHOOLS.—Children under seven may best be taught in open-air nursery schools, staffed by fully qualified nursery school teachers, or in infant departments run on similar lines. Efficient schools could be used under approved conditions as training centres for girl students taking a course in infant care. It should be the duty of the authority to provide nursery schools for children over two and under five, where formal notice had been given by the parents that a certain number of such children (say 30) were prepared to attend.

II.—THE LIMITS OF ELEMENTARY EDUCATION.—Elementary or primary education should be the education, not of a particular class, or section of the people, but of every child in the community up to a certain age, being prior to and in preparation for secondary education. All normal children attending elementary schools should be transferred about the age of eleven to separately organised schools (or, temporarily, separate departments) providing some form of secondary education. The arrangement of age-groups would be thus as follows:

- Children under 7—Nursery or Infant School.
- Children between 7 and 11—Elementary or Primary School.
- Children over 11—Secondary School.

III.—THE RAISING OF THE SCHOOL AGE.—There should be a short Act of Parliament, which would raise the school-leaving age from fourteen to fifteen, and also make it the duty of authorities to provide adequate maintenance allowances for all children over fourteen in need of them. At least 80 per cent. of expenditure under the latter head should be borne by the Treasury. The authority should have power, during a period of transition, to grant exemption to young people over fourteen who have found "suitable and beneficial" employment.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Summary of Labour’s Policy</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Chapter</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I.</td>
<td>The Provision of Nursery Schools</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II.</td>
<td>The Limits of Elementary Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III.</td>
<td>The Raising of the School Age and Need for Maintenance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV.</td>
<td>Secondary Education for All</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V.</td>
<td>Access to the University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI.</td>
<td>Technical Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VII.</td>
<td>The Part III. Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VIII.</td>
<td>The Small Rural School</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IX.</td>
<td>The Examination System</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X.</td>
<td>Educational Research</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XI.</td>
<td>Modern Tendencies in Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XII.</td>
<td>The Size of Classes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XIII.</td>
<td>The Recognition of Unqualified Teachers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XIV.</td>
<td>The Education and Training of Teachers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XV.</td>
<td>School Buildings and Equipment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XVI.</td>
<td>Medical Inspection and Treatment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XVII.</td>
<td>Special Schools</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XVIII.</td>
<td>School Feeding</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XIX.</td>
<td>Problems of Finance</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS

I.—The Provision of Nursery Schools.—Children under seven may best be taught in open-air nursery schools, staffed by fully qualified nursery school teachers, or in infant departments run on similar lines. Efficient schools could be used under approved conditions as training centres for girl students taking a course in infant care. It should be the duty of the authority to provide nursery schools for children over two and under five, where formal notice had been given by the parents that a certain number of such children (say 30) were prepared to attend.

II.—The Limits of Elementary Education.—Elementary or primary education should be the education, not of a particular class, or section of the people, but of every child in the community up to a certain age, being prior to and in preparation for secondary education. All normal children attending elementary schools should be transferred about the age of eleven to separately organised schools (or, temporarily, separate departments) providing some form of secondary education. The arrangement of age-groups would be thus as follows:

Children under 7—Nursery or Infant School.
Children between 7 and 11—Elementary or Primary School.
Children over 11—Secondary School.

III.—The Raising of the School Age.—There should be a short Act of Parliament, which would raise the school-leaving age from fourteen to fifteen, and also make it the duty of authorities to provide adequate maintenance allowances for all children over fourteen in need of them. At least 80 per cent. of expenditure under the latter head should be borne by the Treasury. The authority should have power, during a period of transition, to grant exemption to young people over fourteen who have found "suitable and beneficial" employment.
IV.—SECONDARY EDUCATION FOR ALL.—The number of places in grant-aided secondary schools should be immediately increased to 20 per 1,000 of the general population, and authorities required by the Board to submit schemes for dealing progressively with an increasing number of children reaching the age of eleven. Fees in grant-aided secondary schools should be abolished.

Concurrently with the progressive development of the secondary system, authorities should be required to undertake the reorganisation of the upper classes of elementary schools. New types of "central" school, which would admit all children over eleven not already accommodated in secondary schools, should be regarded as forms of secondary school, being built and equipped on secondary school lines, while the scale of staffing and size of classes would be brought up to the secondary school standard. Such schools should offer a variety of courses suited to children of different aptitudes and capacities. On the other hand, they should be allowed to retain pupils after the age of sixteen, and required to provide, in addition to courses with a technical or other bias, a general course leading up to the university.

V.—ACCESS TO THE UNIVERSITY.—The age of entry to a university should be normally eighteen or over, the standard of attainment being roughly equivalent to the present Intermediate Examination for a degree. Authorities should be required to provide one university scholarship (covering all expenses of maintenance) for every fifty of the secondary school population. All payments made out of scholarship endowment funds should be in proportion to need, and a systematic attempt made to reduce the student's cost of living. There should be more colleges open to women, and the removal of all sex disabilities made a condition of grant.

Every university should be required to undertake a large extension of extra-mural work, more especially by means of university tutorial classes.

VI.—TECHNICAL EDUCATION.—Authorities should be required to develop day time technical education, and
SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS

attendance at a technical school in working hours made an integral part of every apprenticeship. Central technical schools, related to the nearest university, should be established in every important area; while, related again to these, there should be local technical institutions, some of which would train for particular trades. The best students from the local school should be able to proceed to the central school, and from thence on to the university.

VII.—THE PART III. AUTHORITY.—(x) Full educational authority should be given, when desired by the authority, or at the discretion of Parliament, to Part III. authorities in towns of 50,000 population and over, not having the status of county boroughs.

(2) Where the population of the area is below this figure, the authority (unless already autonomous) should be required to relinquish their powers and duties under the Education Acts, and the area be merged in the county.

VIII.—THE SMALL RURAL SCHOOL.—Every village should, so far as possible, have its own school where children under eleven would be taught. Older children should be transferred to secondary or "central" schools conveniently situated so as to serve a number of villages. Authorities should be required to organise efficient means of transport for children living at a distance from the school, and also to provide a suitable midday meal and proper facilities for drying clothes, rest, &c.

IX.—THE EXAMINATION SYSTEM.—External examinations should be postponed until the end of the secondary school course, and only a proportion of pupils in the new type of secondary school expected to take the First School Examination. Where an examination is taken:

(1) overpressure should be avoided;

(2) the teacher's estimate should be taken into account as well as examination results. Also, experiment should be made under proper safeguards on the use of "intelligence tests";
SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS

(3) there should be a more uniform standard in the award of passes, credits and distinctions;

(4) there should be more effective co-operation between examiners and teachers with a view to the readier adaptation of the examination system to the diverse requirements of the schools.

X.—EDUCATIONAL RESEARCH.—With a view to encouraging definite research into the more pressing educational problems of the day, and also to reaping the full benefit of the experimental work actually being done by teachers in the schools, we consider it desirable that the organisation and financing of research should be made the subject of careful inquiry with a view to placing it upon a permanent and satisfactory basis.

XI.—MODERN TENDENCIES IN EDUCATION.—There is need to develop more “practical” and less “bookish” types of education, while teachers should be encouraged to experiment in new methods of teaching by freeing them so far as possible from outside interference in their work. It should, however, be pointed out that modern ideas of education involve comparatively small classes, a highly-qualified staff, and adequate buildings and equipment.

XII.—THE SIZE OF CLASSES.—The size of classes in elementary schools should be limited forthwith to 50 pupils, and this maximum reduced to at most 40 within a period of five years. Large classrooms which could not conveniently be remodelled should be “written down” in accordance with the amended regulations, and new places equivalent to the number of pupils displaced provided for children over eleven in secondary or “central” schools.

XIII.—THE RECOGNITION OF UNQUALIFIED TEACHERS.—There should be no new appointments of supplementary teachers. Women appointed prior to, or in conformity with, the regulations of 1909 and 1914 should be allowed to remain in their present posts. Other supplementary teachers should
be offered reasonable facilities for obtaining the Board's certificate, but those who failed to do so within a short time-limit should be discharged after due notice.

The appointment of new uncertificated teachers should in future only be recognised as a temporary arrangement where a certificated teacher is not available for the post. The Acting Teachers' Examination should be discontinued, but existing uncertificated teachers who wished to qualify fully should be offered a special course in a training college. The Board should carry out their intention of taking into account the proportion of certificated teachers before paying grant.

XIV.—THE EDUCATION AND TRAINING OF TEACHERS.—

(1) Intending teachers should be drawn from students who have taken a full secondary course up to the age of eighteen. The present practice of making special grants to intending teachers during the educational period should be gradually discontinued.

(2) While the aim should be a full course at a university, to be followed by professional training, time must elapse before this end could be reached. Existing training colleges could not be abolished at the present moment, but their outlook should be broadened by bringing them into closer touch with the universities.

(3) The universities should regard the education of teachers as one of their most important functions, while post-graduate courses of professional training should be developed under general university supervision, the conditions to be laid down by a joint Board, upon which the universities, the Board, and the teachers would be represented.

(4) The output from the universities should be such that an increased number of university graduates would be available each year for employment in elementary and "central" schools. Elementary schools should follow the present practice in secondary schools under which a higher salary is offered to university graduates.
XV.—BUILDINGS AND EQUIPMENT.—In all town-planning schemes building sites should be scheduled in advance. In crowded areas where the cost of suitable sites is prohibitive, experiment should be made in providing schools for children over eleven outside the area and organising the necessary means of transport. All schools for children over eleven should be built and equipped on secondary school lines, while the standard for younger children should be correspondingly improved, more especially as regards playgrounds and playing fields, floor space, sanitary accommodation and water supply. Classrooms should be equipped with modern desks and sleeping appliances for infants, and there should be an adequate supply of books, stationery, apparatus, &c.

Existing buildings should be made to conform with modern requirements within a period, say, of five years, and there should be no distinction made between council and voluntary schools. All buildings should be kept in a proper state of cleanliness and repair.

XVI.—MEDICAL INSPECTION AND TREATMENT.—The school medical service should be staffed by doctors specially qualified for the work; but, subject always to this condition, use should be made of part-time practitioners for routine inspection and treatment. The staff of school nurses should be largely increased and made responsible for all duties of following up and home visiting, now undertaken in many cases by untrained volunteers, and for the more simple processes of routine inspection.

Authorities should be required to organise an efficient system of school clinics in their areas. More especially there should be a large expansion of dental work. Parents' fees in respect of medical treatment should be abolished.

XVII.—SPECIAL SCHOOLS.—Special education should be available for all children who, by reason of physical or mental defect, are unable to take advantage of ordinary education. New special schools are urgently needed, outside London especially, for mentally defective and epileptic
SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS

children. Where the special school is not residential and at a distance from the home, the authority should provide, free of charge, proper means of transport.

XVIII.—SCHOOL FEEDING.—Authorities should be compelled to adopt the Provision of Meals Act (now consolidated in the Education Act, 1921), and to provide meals for all children in need of them. Further, they should be required to provide a suitable midday meal, as a part of the ordinary school curriculum, where the school doctor advises it or the parents claim it. Milk meals should be provided under the same conditions. The cost could be recovered from the parents, but the charge should not exceed the price of the actual food provided, and should be remitted where payment would deprive the family of other necessaries.

XIX.—FINANCE.—It may be estimated that, at the end of a five years' development under the scheme outlined above, the expansion of the education system would involve an increase of about 50 per cent. on present expenditure making a total expenditure of £107,000,000 a year. As this increase takes effect, a growing proportion of the cost should be borne out of national funds. The Treasury should undertake at once the greater part of the cost of financial aid to students, and also of all branches of higher education. Further, the Treasury should set aside a capital sum of £25,000,000 to be allocated as a special non-recurrent grant in aid of school building.
CHAPTER I

THE PROVISION OF NURSERY SCHOOLS

PRESENT POSITION

LOCAL authorities have power to admit children over three to elementary schools and to provide special "baby classes." Further, under the Education Act of 1918 they may make arrangements for "supplying or aiding the supply of nursery schools for children over two and under five, or such later age as may be approved by the Board of Education, whose attendance at such a school is necessary or desirable for their healthy, physical and mental development." Authorities also may make arrangements "for attending to the health, nourishment and physical welfare of children attending nursery schools." There are in all England and Wales only 27 nursery schools with an accommodation for about 1,320 children, but some 220,000 children between three and five years are accommodated in ordinary elementary schools.

POLICY

We are in favour of the most rapid possible increase of nursery schools and baby classes consistent with efficiency. Our object is not to put these schools in place of the home, but to add to the latter something which the children of the rich have always had and those of the poor always lacked, namely, a nursery or play-room, a place, that is, where children can be, under responsible supervision, with other children in surroundings suited to their needs and interests. What now occurs is that the children of the poor live in rooms, often overcrowded, in which the activities belonging to their age are of necessity cramped and repressed with results injurious both to their bodily and mental growth. While we do not think it desirable that parents should be
compelled to send little children under five to school, we
take the view that mothers who wish to do so should be
given this opportunity.¹

Our policy would work its way out in practice much as
follows:

I.—PROVISION OF SCHOOLS.—The provision of nursery
schools or baby classes—now optional—should be made
obligatory in any area of suitable size where a certain num-
ber of parents give formal notice that a sufficient number
of their children (say 30) between the ages of two and five
would attend.

II.—TYPE OF BUILDING.—Experience and medical opinion
suggest that nursery schools should be built on open-air
lines. "There should be," writes Miss McMillan, founder
of the Rachel McMillan Nursery School in Deptford,
of course shelter, heating and common-sense, but
men must learn to build for the open as they have learned
to build for the deep sea. The idea at the back of the
builder of yesterday was shelter—shelter from animals,
foes, weather. But the child's worst foes to-day are
germs. All the rest is as nothing in view of that danger."¹²
Then little children must be able to move freely. That
is a great part of their whole education, and it is a
greater need for little ones than for older children.
No site should be built on which does not leave plenty of
space for garden, lawn, little terraced pathways and hillocks.
The number of shelters on the same ground and the area of
the ground would, of course, vary with the density of the
population. According to Miss McMillan, the very small
nursery school is out of place in London. The children
lack space and freedom, and it is comparatively expensive to
run. One shelter should take as a rule not more than
40 children.

It may be pointed out that nursery schools on Miss
McMillan’s plan can be built at a comparatively low cost.

¹ In London 38 per 1,000 of the children between three and five
are at school.

² Memorandum prepared by Miss McMillan for the Committee.
She estimates that half-an-acre will accommodate about 200 children, while the cost of building in capital expenditure need not be more than £20 per head, that is about two-thirds the cost of providing places in an ordinary elementary school.

III.—STAFFING.—We regard it as an essential condition that nursery schools should be staffed by fully-trained certificated nursery school teachers, with special qualifications for the work, on a scale at least equivalent to that laid down by the Board for ordinary elementary schools. A teacher of this standing should be in charge of every shelter.

It would be necessary to employ in addition a certain number of assistants. According to Miss McMillan, one assistant should be provided for every group of six or seven children of three, and for children of four, five and six, "massing and even classing is still more or less a failure if a class exceeds ten or twelve children." It is unlikely that staffing on this scale could be wholly provided by means of trained teachers. It is, therefore, proposed that efficient schools recognised by the Board as training centres, should be allowed to utilise the services of girl students working under the supervision of a fully-trained nursery teacher, and subject to certain conditions. "Young girls," Miss McMillan writes, "are the best friends and playfellows of little children." These girls would themselves profit by the experience, and the time they spent in the nursery school should be excellent preparation for many occupations, and in no sense a blind alley pursuit. The students might comprise future hospital nurses, children's nurses, school nurses, health visitors, domestic workers, and finally future mothers. They would be admitted in the ordinary way at the age of eighteen, but the age-limit might be reduced to sixteen in suitable cases. They would take a one or two years' course, and part of the time would be devoted to general subjects, the curriculum to be approved by the Board.

IV.—CARE OF HEALTH.—The doctor should visit the school at frequent and regular intervals. The services of a trained nurse should be readily available, and in large schools
NURSERY SCHOOLS

It seems desirable that a trained nurse should be attached to the staff.

It is a part of the nursery school idea that the children should be able to remain at school all day, and be provided with regular meals and proper facilities for bathing and rest. Miss McMillan estimates that in schools of 250 children or over, three good meals a day may be provided at a cost of 28. per head per week. The sum is not more than any save very poor parents should be able to afford.

V.—Transfer to the Elementary or Primary School.
—Transfer from the nursery school to the elementary school takes place normally at the age of five, but, where the nursery school is able to provide separate classes for children over five, there is a great deal to be said in favour of raising the leaving age to seven. From the physiological standpoint, the first seven years of life make one epoch, and the conditions of a good nursery school are those best adapted to this age. The nursery school should not, however, be regarded as a separate institution. Nursery school methods may be adopted in ordinary elementary schools which provide special baby classes for children under five. Much admirable work on modern lines is already being done in this direction, and infant departments could in future be built and equipped with proper facilities for meals and rest on the open-air nursery school plan. Whether or not the infants are accommodated in a separate building, the aim should be one continuous process of education, wherein the nursery school, or infant department, would form the first stage.
CHAPTER II

THE LIMITS OF ELEMENTARY EDUCATION

PRESENT POSITION

It is the duty of authorities under the Education Acts to provide elementary education free of charge for all children in need of it from the age of five until the end of the term in which they reach the fourteenth birthday, while the duty of parents is to make their children attend. The Board may authorise the instruction of children in elementary schools until the end of the term in which they reach the age of sixteen, or until a later age in special circumstances, but attendance is in this event voluntary.

There are to-day\(^1\) in England and Wales 5,611,000 children on the registers of elementary schools. Of this number, 1,126,000 children are under seven, 2,488,000 are between seven and eleven, and 1,997,000 are eleven and over. The latter age-group comprises 158,500 children between fourteen and fifteen, 9,800 between fifteen and sixteen, and 1,200 are sixteen or over.

POLICY

We aim at a system where elementary or primary education would be the education not of a particular class or section of the people, but of every child in the community up to a certain age, such education being prior to and in preparation for secondary education. So long as children left school at the age of ten or eleven it is plain that little more could be taught in the time than the elements of reading, writing and arithmetic; but, with the raising of the school-leaving age beyond the period of adolescence the need arose for more advanced courses for older and more intelligent pupils.

\(^1\)Figures for 1923-24.
The normal child should have completed his elementary course about the age of eleven, and be ready to pass on to some form of secondary education. We would point out in support of this view that:

1. Intelligent children of eleven have reached a stage when the elementary school, as at present organised, can offer little possibility of further progress. (2) A definite physical change has begun to take place at this age and the child develops special aptitudes and capacities. There is need for differential treatment as well as for courses of a more advanced kind. (3) Transfer at the age of eleven permits of a continuous four or five years’ course of more advanced, or secondary, education up to fifteen or sixteen—the normal school-leaving age in “central” and secondary schools. (4) Transfer at this age has the advantage that it would cause the least interference with the present administration of secondary and “central” schools.

In order to carry out our scheme, the arrangement of age-groups should be as follows:

- Children under 7—infant or nursery school.
- Children between 7 and 11—elementary or primary school.
- Children over 11—secondary school.

We should be opposed to a scheme of reorganisation, such as that outlined in Circular 1350 (April, 1925), which, in order to overcome certain temporary administrative difficulties, would make transfer from the junior to the senior school take place at the age of nine. Not merely is such a scheme educationally unsound, but, if adopted, would tend to perpetuate the present dual system of education, and also prejudice new schemes based on a future school-leaving age of fifteen or sixteen.
CHAPTER III

THE RAISING OF THE SCHOOL AGE

PRESENT POSITION

The authority has power, under the Education Act of 1918, to adopt a bye-law which would raise the age of compulsory school attendance from fourteen to fifteen, and during the late Labour Administration two authorities, namely, Carnarvon and East Suffolk, elected to do so. Where such a bye-law is in force, the authority may, if it pleases, grant exemptions to young people between the ages of fourteen and fifteen.

The authority, further, has power, under the Act, to grant allowances for maintenance to pupils over twelve in elementary schools, but the total sum so spent in 1925 was only about £25,000. Before the Act of 1918, maintenance allowances could only be granted to pupils in secondary schools. The annual sum spent here may roughly be estimated at £250,000, and covers some 30,000 scholars. The Board prescribes a limit for expenditure on maintenance ranking for grant of 9s. per unit of average attendance in elementary schools.

POLICY

While we aim at a system where every child would remain at school until the age of sixteen, we realise that for practical reasons the raising of the school-leaving age must be a slow and gradual process. We consider, however, that the time has now come when this age should be raised to fifteen, and the higher age-limit made universal. Few authorities are prepared to accept the onus of retaining young people at school after the age at which they are exempted in adjoining areas.

We would point out in support of our view, that authorities are responsible under the Act of 1918 for organising,
as a part of the ordinary elementary curriculum, more advanced courses suited to older and more intelligent children, and that a pupil starting such a course at about the age of eleven could not have satisfactorily completed it at the age of fourteen. Experience shows that anything short of a four years' course of post-primary education tends to be ineffectual and wasteful. Hence, no scheme can be regarded as educationally sound which does not provide for a raising of the school age to at least fifteen.

Another argument in support of an immediate raising of the school age may be found in the present state of juvenile employment. There are, at the time of writing, no less than 63,000 young people between the ages of fourteen and eighteen on the unemployment registers, and the actual number unemployed is probably at least twice as many. If boys and girls could be kept at school until fifteen, not only would they benefit considerably, but their removal from the labour market would render more work available for young people over fifteen. As things are now, it is only a very small percentage of unemployed young people who are obtaining education or training of any sort or kind, and the demoralising effects of this neglect on mind and character can hardly be exaggerated. As Lord Eustace Percy, President of the Board of Education, has pointed out, children under sixteen do not come under the Unemployment Insurance Acts, and their attendance at a place of education, unlike that of older young people, cannot be influenced by the threat to withdraw unemployment benefit.

It is, however, plain that, at the present moment, no new restrictions could be imposed on young people's employment without some other provision for maintenance, which would compensate poor families for the loss of children's earnings. The average working-class income has little or no margin for the support of dependent young people of fourteen and over. It is, therefore, an integral part of our scheme that the raising of the school-leaving age should be accompanied by a greatly increased provision for maintenance.

Our proposals, broadly speaking, are as follows:—

I. There should be a short Act of Parliament which would raise the school-leaving age from fourteen to fifteen.

1 December, 1925.
II. All restrictions on the provision of maintenance allowances should be abolished, and authorities administering the new Act required to provide adequate allowances for all young people over fourteen in need of them, subject to their attendance at an approved place of education. The greater part of the additional cost involved should be borne out of national funds in order not to throw too heavy a burden on local rates. The Board’s grant in this respect was raised under Labour administration from 20 to 50 per cent. of local expenditure, and should be further increased to at least 80 per cent. It may be pointed out that young people under sixteen have been excluded by Parliament from the Unemployment Insurance Acts, and that the sum so saved on unemployment benefit could be used for purposes of maintenance. A saving of £80,000 for the year 1924-25 was, in fact, handed over by the Labour Government to the Board of Education.

III. We recognise that some elasticity in the law would be necessary during a period of transition. We propose, accordingly, that authorities should be allowed to retain for a time the option of granting exemptions to children between the ages of fourteen and fifteen, whose parents claimed them to have found “suitable and beneficial” employment. The number of such cases would be few where the authority had made proper provision for maintenance.
CHAPTER IV

SECONDARY EDUCATION FOR ALL

PRESENT POSITION

SINCE the Education Act of 1902, county and county borough authorities have been responsible for organising secondary education in their areas. Fresh powers and new duties were conferred by the Act of 1918. Authorities were placed under the obligation of securing that “children and young persons shall not be debarred from receiving the benefits of any form of education of which they are capable of profiting through inability to pay fees.”

According to the Board’s figures for the year 1923-24, there are in all 1,137 secondary schools on the “grant list,” with a total attendance of 359,444 children, and another 344 schools (57,192 pupils) are recognised by the Board as “efficient.” Of the grant-aided schools, 600 are provided by local authorities, and others are aided out of the local rates. The larger majority of pupils are between the ages of ten and sixteen. Some 32,860 are sixteen years or over, while 21,792 are under the age of ten.

Most authorities make it their business to provide a limited number of junior county scholarships which enable selected pupils in elementary schools to pass on at an age between ten and eleven to secondary schools. The Board make it a condition of grant that 25 per cent. of all places in grant-aided schools must be available for free-place scholars, and this minimum may be increased to 40 per cent. without further sanction by the Board. Some fifteen authorities, or more, have abolished fees altogether in their own “provided” schools. In spite, however, of the advance made since 1902, the total number of secondary school places does not amount to more than 9.5 per 1,000 of the general
population, and little over one-third of the total accommodation in grant-aided schools is available for free-place scholars. Only about ten per cent. of all children entering elementary schools pass on to secondary schools, and a large proportion of these leave school before the age of fifteen.

Admission to a grant-aided secondary school is intended by the Board to be subject to a qualifying test alone, but, where there is a shortage of places this test may be made, and is, in fact, a competitive one. The Board permit, moreover, a method by which free-place and fee-paying pupils are examined in two separate groups, with the result that the increasing competition among free-place candidates tends to expose them to the more severe test.

In London and elsewhere a certain number of children pass at about the age of eleven from the elementary to some form of "central" school, or analogous institution, designed for pupils from eleven to fifteen, but the total accommodation in "central" schools amounts to less than five per cent. of the pupils belonging to this age-group. "Central" schools come under the Board's Regulations for Elementary Schools, but the best of them afford what is in effect a secondary education. The type of "central" school which is superseding other types in London offers, in addition to courses with an industrial or commercial bias, a course leading up to matriculation, and retains a proportion of its pupils until 16 and over. The result is that there is growing up under the Board's Regulations for Elementary Schools a new type of post-primary school which may hardly be distinguished from a true "secondary" school except as regards the character of the building, the standard of staffing and equipment, and the slightly lower age of leaving.

POLICY

"The only policy," the Labour Party has declared,¹ "which is at once educationally sound and suited to a democratic community is the one under which primary education and secondary education are organised as a single and continuous process, secondary education being the education

¹ "Secondary Education for All," edited by R. H. Tawney.
of the adolescent and primary education being the education preparatory thereto. Its objective, therefore, is the development of public secondary education to such a point that all normal children, irrespective of the income, class, or occupation of their parents, may be transferred at the age of 11 from the primary or preparatory school to the secondary school and remain in the latter till 16."

The practical difficulties in the way of a rapid development of this policy are:—(1) the shortage of places in grant-aided secondary schools, (2) the exaction of parents' fees so far as two-thirds of the total accommodation is concerned, (3) the lack of proper provision for maintenance, and finally (4) the inelastic character of the secondary regulations which do not meet the needs of large numbers of children. The question of maintenance has been discussed in a previous chapter. Our proposals for increasing the supply of secondary education available for pupils in elementary schools may roughly be stated as follows:—

I. The number of places in grant-aided secondary schools should be increased to at least 20 per 1,000 of the general population, or to rather more than twice the present figure. The proposal follows that of the Departmental Committee on Scholarships and Free Places, which reported that 75 per cent. of children in elementary schools are capable of profiting from full-time general education up to the age of sixteen. With a view to further extension, we suggest that the Board should require authorities to submit schemes with an estimate for dealing progressively with an increasing number of children reaching the age of eleven.

II. All fees in grant-aided secondary schools should be abolished within a given time-limit, say, five years. In the meantime the Board should offer a special grant to schools where the number of free places exceeds, say, 40 per cent. of the total accommodation. This principle was adopted by the Board under the Labour administration, but reversed by the succeeding Government.
III. Secondary schools assisted out of public funds should not in future be allowed to admit pupils under ten, and the places so released made available for children of ten and over. The present preparatory departments of grant-aided secondary schools were instituted because of the lack of efficient private day preparatory schools available for parents of limited means. Our aim is so to improve the public elementary system that parents, whatever their income or social position, will prefer to send their children to the people's school; but, so long as private schools are allowed to exist, they should be subject to regular inspection, and required to maintain a reasonable standard of efficiency.

IV. We recognise that the full programme of secondary school accommodation, as outlined above could not be reached within a considerable period of years. It is, therefore, a part of our scheme that, concurrently with the progressive development of the secondary system, authorities should be required to undertake the reorganisation of the upper classes in elementary schools. The Board should warn authorities that in future no scheme could be approved which did not provide for children over eleven in separately organised schools or, as a temporary expedient, in separate departments. The adaptation of certain elementary schools to a more advanced curriculum need not involve at first a great increase of expenditure, and in some cases may even effect a saving.

V. The Board's Regulations for Secondary Schools should be so widened in scope as to cover the education of all children over eleven who would thus be removed from the elementary system. New types of "central" school which would admit all children over eleven not already accommodated in secondary schools, should be regarded as forms of secondary school, being built and equipped on secondary school lines, while the scale of staffing and size of classes would be brought up to the secondary school standard. It could not at once be made a condition that a fixed proportion of the staff should be university graduates, but as facilities for preliminary education are improved an increasing number of teachers should be required to possess this qualification.
VI. New types of "central" or secondary schools should provide a wide variety of courses suited to children of different aptitudes and capacities. Not more than a proportion of pupils could be expected to take the present secondary course leading up to the First Examination. Courses for other children should have a more practical bent, e.g., scientific, commercial, technical, agricultural. While we recognise the advantages to be gained where the school has a definite bias, we would be opposed to a scheme which differentiated between a type of school retaining its pupils until university age, and a type where the pupils were expected to leave at the age of fifteen or sixteen. A division on these lines not merely would tend to accentuate undesirable social distinctions, but the lower grade school would lose the valuable stimulus of a university class. We attach great importance to the condition that "central" schools should be allowed to retain pupils after the age of sixteen, and required to provide in every case a general course leading up to the university. On the recommendation of the headteacher, pupils should be able at any stage to pass freely from one course to another, or, where circumstances made it desirable, from one school to another school of a more suitable type.

VII. While we would encourage the provision of part-time day continuation classes on a voluntary basis for young people leaving school, these classes do not in our opinion offer any effective substitute for full-time secondary education.
CHAPTER V
ACCESS TO THE UNIVERSITY
PRESENT POSITION

The whole university system of this country is a stunted and lopsided growth. It is stunted in that, taking the community as a whole, only one child out of a thousand now reaches a university. It is lopsided in that, in the first place, the proportion of children of working-class parents who enter a university is incomparably smaller than the proportion of children of wealthier classes, and, in the second place, the proportion of girls of all classes who reach a university is incomparably smaller than the proportion of boys. This lopsidedness is specially marked at the older universities of Oxford and Cambridge.

The method of granting university scholarships is a medley of things very old and very new, national and local, rational and sometimes, perhaps, the reverse. So far as concerns scholarships enabling boys and girls to pass from secondary schools to universities and institutions of similar rank, it consists of scholarships awarded (1) by the Board of Education, (2) by local educational authorities, (3) by universities and colleges, and certain schools administering school-leaving exhibitions, or by trustees of certain unattached endowments.

(1) The State scheme, which dates from 1920, aims at providing annually 200 university scholarships for students coming from grant-aided secondary schools. For financial reasons no fresh awards were made in the two years 1922-24, but the scheme was revived under Labour administration. The average amount of assistance (including maintenance) awarded in the year 1923-24 was £65 per head.

There are in addition a small number of “royal scholarships” and other awards in science tenable at the Imperial College of Science and Technology, and a few “Whitworth
scholarships” held mostly by apprentices in His Majesty’s dockyards.

(2) Most local authorities also grant university scholarships, but they differ very greatly in the degree to which they have developed their schemes. Nor are these differences wholly explicable by differences of population and economic resources. Some award scholarships of a fixed value; some fix a minimum value which can be subsequently increased; some, though not all, vary their award according to the income of the parents; some grade it according to the university for which it is awarded; a few give scholarships in the form of a loan to be subsequently repaid. The annual amount of the grant varies from anything up to £100, or £200 in the case of residential scholarships, to as little, apparently, as £25 in some cases. Methods of award vary in the same degree. Some authorities give scholarships about the age of eighteen on the results of the Second School Examination, others make a preliminary selection at an earlier age, others hold a special examination, others again limit the grant to candidates who have already won an open scholarship.

The system of local education authority scholarships has grown up unequally through the country as a natural result of the unequal development of the secondary schools. It has been rendered necessary by the almost complete absence of national provision, and by the need to supply leaving scholarships for schools, particularly for newly established schools which have no endowments of their own to apply to this purpose. The opportunity of a university education has thus come to depend over much on accidents of birthplace and residence, and the exact position of the county or borough boundary has assumed a fortuitous and unreasonable importance.

(3) The older universities, and some “public schools” and grammar schools, have rich endowments available for scholarship purposes, but these awards are reserved for the most part to students of a certain social class, many of whom have ample means, and would proceed in any case to a university.
The universities, including Oxford and Cambridge, are now assisted by grants from the Treasury. These grants are administered, not by the Board of Education, but by a Committee of the Treasury known as the University Grants Committee.

POLICY

Our policy is based on the following principles:—

I. The age of entry to universities should normally be eighteen or later. At present admission is allowed in some instances as early as sixteen.

II. The universities should be relieved as far as possible from the need for giving a type of instruction more suitable to a secondary school. The matriculation examination hitherto used as a test of attainment at entry is becoming more and more inadequate for this purpose. In particular, “little-go” at Cambridge and “responsions” at Oxford fail to exclude numbers of students who have no claim to benefit by the expensive facilities afforded by our older universities. Increasingly a standard of attainment roughly equivalent to the present Intermediate Examination for a degree should be expected of candidates before entry.

III. Conversely, the successful conclusion of a secondary school course, as evidenced by the passing of the Second School Examination, the Intermediate Examination, or its equivalent, should be the test of suitability for full-time university work.¹ Many local education authorities already award scholarships to all who reach this standard. The London County Council and other authorities award free places at universities to such pupils.

As a general principle, a free place should be secured to every candidate who reaches the standard of the Second School Examination, and desires to follow a university course. The number of students who would have been eligible for such awards was 3,245 in 1923-24. There is no excuse for excluding any of this relatively small number, when many thousands with lesser qualifications are admitted.

¹ The examination system would need to be modified to some extent and given a broader basis. See page 41.
IV. In addition to the foregoing provision, it may be necessary for some time to give supplementary awards to certain candidates who cannot reach the standard imposed, not because of any lack of native intelligence, but because of the inadequacies of existing secondary schools. At present only 698 secondary schools out of 1,481 recognised as efficient in England enter pupils for the Second School Examination. This is due to defects in school organisation, and to the stringency of the regulations governing advanced or post-matriculation courses.

The pupils of small, or imperfectly organised, schools are as capable as those in other schools, but they have not the same opportunities. It might be desirable to consider whether this injustice could be corrected by the method of attaching scholarships to individual schools, a practice which has the additional merit of continuing the old established English tradition of school-leaving exhibitions.

V. In order to carry out our views we propose as an immediate objective that authorities should be required to offer at least one free place at a university (or a higher technical institute) for every fifty of the secondary school population, this being rather more than twice the average number which is now offered. If the schools were equally well organised everywhere, at least this proportion could be expected to pass the Second School Examination, and the standards of university education would be amply safeguarded.

The maximum number of exhibitions which would have been awarded on this basis in 1923-24 was 7,894. Not all of them would have been taken up.

VI. The provision of a free place without maintenance does not in itself make the university accessible, and many properly qualified candidates only proceed to further education by raising loans, or by undertaking to become teachers, and thus availing themselves of special grants.

---

a The output from grant-aided secondary schools to the universities was 2,889 students in 1920-21.
b 9,162 full-time students entered English universities in 1922-23.
All scholarships to universities should secure not only a free place, but reasonable maintenance covering all incidental expenses. There should be no need for students to supplement their grants by borrowing.

VII. Scholarships should continue to be awarded and administered by local education authorities, which can investigate individual cases more thoroughly than any central department, and which are conversant with the needs and special peculiarities of their areas. Each local education authority should be compelled to comply with the minimum requirements of a national scheme. At the same time, the State should increase its direct contribution to the provision of university scholarships. We aim at a system where university fees would be abolished. It is highly undesirable that the student's choice of a university should be determined, as now, by the amount of the fee to be paid.

VIII. For a considerable period there should be no difficulty under our scheme in accommodating the normal output of the secondary schools at the universities, but as the secondary school system extends and its efficiency grows, a larger number of pupils will reach the university standard. As the need arises, university facilities must be extended to meet a growing demand. Every region should have its own university, but in order to economise forces universities should be encouraged to develop a predominant bias which may be expected to vary with local opportunities for study and research. Students from all parts should be able, by means of residential scholarships, to attend the university best suited to their needs.

IX. The title of "scholar" or "exhibitioner" awarded to students who have done well in examinations should not carry with it a grant of money. All payments made to students out of endowment funds should be in proportion to need.

X. A systematic attempt should be made to keep down the cost of living for resident students at universities. This cost is specially high at Oxford and Cambridge.

XI. It should be a condition of grant to a university that women should be admitted on the same terms as men.
and not subject to disabilities. This equality exists already except at Cambridge where women can receive only titular degrees and are debarred from membership of the university.¹ There is urgent need, more especially at the older universities, for more women’s colleges.

XII. It should be an important function of every university to develop adult education, and thus to bring university teaching within reach of working-class students who are unable to take a full university course. There should be a large extension by universities of their extra mural work, and especially of university tutorial classes.

XIII. The University Grants Committee should be more closely related than it is now to the Board of Education, which should represent the interests of the universities in the House of Commons. The disinclination of the Treasury to authorise grants adequate with the growing needs of the universities may at least partly be traced to a lack of effective championship of the university cause.

¹ The Statutory Commission for Cambridge University is now, however, engaged in drawing up new statutes for the organisation and government of the university.
CHAPTER VI

TECHNICAL EDUCATION

PRESENT POSITION

TECHNICAL education is aided by the Board of Education under a special system of grants, except in its higher branches, which rank as university education, and are assisted by the University Grants Committee of the Treasury.

Existing institutions are very diverse in type and not amenable to any systematic classification. Roughly speaking, however, we may recognise three types of institution corresponding to the several stages of technical education, namely:

1. The technological departments of universities, and technical colleges of university rank, which should certainly be associated with a university.¹

2. Local technical institutions undertaking intermediate work. These comprise 43 recognised institutions (39 of which are in London and the county boroughs) attended by 4,135 full-time students and about 500 part-time students; detached day classes and groups of classes in 109 institutions, providing full-time and part-time courses for some 13,000 students; and six schools of nautical training attended by 1,375 students. Not only the total number of full-time students is very small, but since 1920 the figures have decreased alarmingly each year.

3. Junior technical schools, and trade schools of various kinds, where the work grades off almost imperceptibly into the semi-vocational work undertaken in “central” schools, or the practical, or manual work, of elementary or secondary schools. There are in all 89 junior technical schools, attended by 10,613 boys and 1,793 girls.

¹ The Board of Education is only concerned with intermediate and junior technical education, and this outline of policy will only deal with these grades.
In addition to the above there are 4,129 institutions providing part-time technical and other instruction (122 providing day courses), and attended by 659,936 students for an average of 65 hours per year. Practically the whole of adult education, apart from university tutorial classes, is, however, included in these figures, and it is not possible to say how much of the work done is in any sense technical. We exclude from this review the 181 schools of art (45,239 students) which can only be regarded as technical in a very special sense, and also the agricultural colleges aided by the Ministry of Agriculture and Fisheries, and not by the Board of Education.

Entry to a technical school, whether for day or evening work, takes place normally at the age of sixteen or in the years immediately following. Junior technical schools have done something in very few areas to fill the gap between fourteen and sixteen, but technical teachers complain bitterly of the alarming and appalling ignorance of young people who have left school at fourteen. Mr. Eclair Heath states, from an experience of twenty years, "that with this material to commence with, technical education will never be efficient, economical, or successful." It is well known that large numbers of students in technical institutions are merely preparing for the matriculation examination, and, to this extent, that the institutions are serving as evening secondary schools. Such courses frequently end when the student has matriculated, and this in part accounts for the leakage of students from the institutions after a comparatively short course. Another weakness is the lack, especially in the small local institutions, of properly organised courses covering a number of years, and the small extent to which the system of scholarships to more advanced courses has been developed.

The problem of technical education as a whole seems not to have been considered by any but the largest cities. There has been no organised attempt to remedy the defects and deficiencies of private industry. More especially commercial education has been left over-much to private enterprise, with the result that indispensable parts of it,
for example, a study of the materials of commerce (Warenkunde), such as that made in Germany can hardly be obtained in this country.

POLICY

No proper definition of technical education has ever been offered, and it seems impossible to frame one. The term must be used, therefore, in a very wide sense to cover not only instruction in the detail of industrial and commercial operations, but the teaching of science, in so far as it is directed to industrial and commercial ends. The range of technical education as thus defined is enormous, for it must be followed intensively by all who wish to hold professional and the higher directive posts, to a less extent and in a different fashion by those who are capable of becoming managers, foremen, or workers in skilled trades, while some sort of vocational instruction is desirable for those engaged in semi-skilled, or even unskilled, occupations.

Before technical education can be successfully undertaken in any of these grades, a suitable background of general education is necessary, and this will continue to be supplied to varying extents in the departments, or institutions, where the more definitely technical work is carried on. Any reasonable scheme of technical education should provide, not only for the transfer of suitable students from secondary or "central" schools to technical schools, but for the transfer of the more able pupils from any given grade to a higher one. Opportunity and promotion in both industry and commerce are now largely a matter of chance, and technical education if well developed in all its branches would help greatly to find and to train the right people for the right jobs at every stage. Suitable technical and commercial courses should lead their best pupils towards a university degree in science, economics, or commerce.

As an example of a reasonably consistent policy towards industrial training, which might be applied with advantage in numerous non-nationalised industries, we may instance H.M. Dockyard Schools, where a gradual process of weeding out goes on from year to year, with the result that a very fine type of artificer is produced by the full training. It is
significant that a large majority of the Whitworth Scholarships are won by the pupils of these schools, which provide what we may regard as indispensable in a well thought out scheme, namely, (1) the possibility of a full course leading to the technical department of a university, and (2) a careful selection of candidates at each stage of the training.

We recommend that a Royal Commission should be appointed to inquire into and report on the whole question of technical education.

Meanwhile, we suggest that:

I. Technical institutions of an intermediate grade should be relieved of the necessity for conducting secondary education by that development of the secondary school system that we have outlined in earlier chapters.

II. All authorities should develop and encourage technical education in the daytime, and the attendance at day technical schools should be, where possible, an integral part of every apprenticeship, and should count in full towards the number of years to be served.

III. Central technical schools should be established in every important area, being grouped and associated with the technical department of the nearest university, to which the best of their students would proceed. These schools should offer a consecutive course covering a number of years, and be made available to promising students by means of scholarships, residential or otherwise.

IV. Local technical institutions of all kinds, adapted to young people having completed a secondary course, should be established in close relationship with the central technical school of their area, to which the best of their students would proceed.

V. Institutions training for particular trades should be established in every centre where the number of young people entering the trade will justify such a course. Centralised provision for a single trade leads to better equipment and a closer contact with the realities of industry.
VI. All technical schools should be equipped with the most modern devices, and have access to the most recent literature of their subjects, so that they should lead and inspire industrial development rather than follow it.

VII. Teachers in technical schools should have increased leisure and opportunity to keep themselves acquainted with all changes in workshop practice, and abreast of the rapid progress of industrial discovery.
CHAPTER VII

THE PART III AUTHORITY

PRESENT POSITION

In boroughs and urban districts elementary and secondary education are administered by two separate authorities. While the county council is responsible for secondary education, the borough or district council—known under the Education Act of 1902 as the Part III. Authority—is responsible for elementary education. Under the Act of 1921 the two authorities are urged to consult and co-operate in matters of common interest, including particularly the conditions of admission to secondary schools, but there is no doubt that the division of function is a real difficulty in the way of a progressive development of a unified system of schools. Part III. Authorities may, if they please, relinquish their powers and duties under the Education Acts. Some 900,000 elementary school pupils, out of a total of about 5,000,000, come under Part III. Authorities.

POLICY

Our view is that:—

I. Full educational authority should be given, where desired by the authority, or at the discretion of Parliament, to authorities in towns of 50,000 population and over not having the status of county boroughs.

II. Where the population of the area is below this figure, the authority (unless already autonomous) should relinquish their powers and duties under the Education Acts, and the area be merged in the county.
CHAPTER VIII

THE SMALL RURAL SCHOOL

PRESENT POSITION

Of the 11,500 elementary schools in rural areas, about two-thirds have less than 100 pupils on the roll, and over 3,000 schools have less than 40 pupils. It is usual in village schools for the staff to consist of the head teacher and one uncertificated assistant, or a supplementary teacher. In thousands of schools, the head teacher has sole charge of all the pupils between the ages of eight and fourteen.

POLICY

The closing of small village schools has been advocated on purely financial grounds, but from the educational standpoint there is a great deal to be said on both sides. Excellent work on modern lines is being done in many village schools, where the small size of classes has encouraged the adoption of “individual” methods of teaching. Nor is it desirable that little children should be obliged to travel long distances from home, and parents should be able to keep in personal touch with the school. In many villages, moreover, the school is the only public building, or social centre (other than the church or chapel), of any sort or kind, and the villagers would deeply resent an order to close it.

On the other hand, where the upper school consists of a mere handful of pupils, the high cost of providing more advanced courses and specialist teaching for older children makes provision of this kind almost prohibitive. Older boys and girls, further, lack the stimulus of association in a large group of school-fellows. The school life is too dull, too cramped. Organised games are impracticable.
There is in rural areas a particular need for new secondary, or "central," schools to which older children could be transferred about the age of eleven. One of the practical difficulties in the way is the large proportion of rural schools belonging to the Church, or Chapel, which may have no funds in order to build new schools but is violently opposed to any scheme which would remove the older children from its special sphere of influence. While parents should be secured the right of obtaining for their children the religious teaching of their own denomination, the claims of no denominational body should be allowed to weigh against those of the children's best educational prospects.

Our scheme would work out as follows:—

I. Every village should, so far as possible, have its own school where children under eleven would attend. Where there were less than 70 pupils on the roll, the Board should make a special grant—subject to the appointment of a certified teacher—for every group of 35 pupils or less. It may be pointed out that before the Act of 1902 a special grant of this kind was made in respect of village schools where the population within a two-mile radius was less than 300, subject to the adoption of a certain scale of staffing numerically in excess of the Code requirements. The Board has partially revived this policy by imposing a new differential scale where the attendance does not exceed 250 pupils.¹

II. Children over eleven—following our general plan—should be transferred to secondary or "central" schools, or temporarily to "central" classes, which would be conveniently situated so as to serve a number of villages.

III. Authorities should be required to organise efficient means of transport for pupils living at a distance from the school. Children ought not to be expected to walk more than one, or at most one-and-a-half miles each way, and girls especially should not be obliged to bicycle long distances. The conveyances should be covered in bad weather.

¹ In Scotland there is a special grant of £65 a year for schools of less than 20 pupils, £40 for schools between 20 and 50 pupils, and £25 for schools between 50 and 100 pupils, provided the school has a fully qualified teacher.
IV. Further, the authority should be required to arrange a suitable midday meal, and a comfortable rest room, with efficient means of drying clothes, for pupils obliged to remain at school all day. So long as meals are not provided free of charge as a part of the ordinary school curriculum, the cost of the meal could be recovered from the parents, but the charge should not exceed the price of the actual food supplied. Where the parents could not afford to pay for a decent meal, authorities have ample powers to remit the whole, or a part of the charge. Authorities have power under the Act of 1918 to enter into arrangements with parents for providing food and lodging, and the necessary arrangements could be made for pupils living at too great a distance from the school to be travelled every day.
CHAPTER IX

THE EXAMINATION SYSTEM

PRESENT POSITION

CHILDREN in elementary schools are not subject to an external examination except in so far as they may enter for junior county scholarships in secondary schools. It is, however, becoming the practice among authorities which provide these to prescribe some sort of preliminary examination for children approaching scholarship age, and this test may be imposed by the head teacher on the age-group as a whole, or on a select number of pupils. Candidates for junior county scholarships must be under the age of eleven.

Pupils in secondary schools are expected to take the First Examination about the age of sixteen. Under the Board's regulations (Circular 1002) a school may be examined on its own syllabus; also, it shall not be a condition of receiving grant to take the First or Second Examination, but this privilege has been very little used.

POLICY

We recognise the dangers inherent in the examination system. There is a growing feeling among teachers that as a result of the system many pupils suffer severely from over-pressure. The younger children especially are said by school doctors and others to be liable to overstrain as a result of external examination. It is further claimed by teachers in secondary schools that the needs of education tend to be subordinated to examination requirements and the schools to be dominated by the universities which exercise an undue influence on syllabus and methods. The curriculum becomes in consequence too academic in character to interest the average boy or girl. Nor does the present system take sufficiently into account other factors than those
THE EXAMINATION SYSTEM

of the immediate success in examination, such as the pupil’s past record in school, or make as much use as it might of such new methods as “intelligence tests.” Another source of dissatisfaction is the lack of effective co-ordination between the eight separate examining bodies, so that there is too little uniformity in the standard of passes, credits and distinctions.

It is not our object to abolish the examination system. Our aim is rather to modify it in such a way as would minimise its dangers. It may be pointed out that under our scheme for universal secondary education there would be no need to take an external examination until the end of the secondary school course, when the pupil would have reached the age of fifteen or sixteen. Elementary pupils would be passed on to one type or another of secondary school on the recommendation of their head teacher. Further, we would point out that in the new type of “central” or secondary school, not more than a proportion of pupils would be expected to take the First Examination. Where an examination is taken, the conditions should be modified as follows:

(1) Overpressure should be avoided. This may be effected by a lowering of the standard of attainment, subject to a compensating rise in the standard of accuracy.

(2) In awarding certificates, the teacher’s estimate should be taken into account as well as examination results. Also, experiment should be made under proper safeguards in the use of “intelligence tests.”

---

1 In Scotland the intermediate certificate was discontinued in 1924, and the certificates now issued are two in number:—(1) the “leaving certificate,” awarded by examination on the completion of a secondary course of not less than five years in duration; (2) the “day school certificate,” awarded on the successful completion of an approved “advanced division” course of not less than three years in duration. This is attainable at about £15. The certificate is awarded on the recommendation of Inspectors, and the basis of the award is the school record of the pupil, and the teacher’s estimate of his abilities, supplemented by such further investigation as may be considered desirable from time to time. For the school record three internal tests must be imposed each year, and records of them must be kept. Those who follow the course for “leaving certificates” and fail to complete it may be awarded “day school certificates.”
(3) There should be a progressive unification of existing examining bodies with a view to securing a more uniform standard in the award of passes, credits and distinctions.

(4) The functions of the present Secondary School Examinations Committee should be developed so as to make for more effective co-operation between examiners and teachers, the end being the readier adaptation of the examination system to the diverse requirements of the schools, whether by the provision of alternative syllabuses and question papers, or by the exercise of the privilege each school possesses of being examined on its own syllabus.
CHAPTER X

EDUCATIONAL RESEARCH

PRESENT POSITION

While large sums of public money are spent yearly on Medical and Industrial Research, nothing has so far been allocated to the equally important research into methods of home and school education, into class and school management, or into the administration of school systems. It is otherwise in the United States, where research in education is being carried on in a large number of institutions and where, in fact, the demand for it tends to outstrip the supply of trained research ability.

POLICY

With a view to encouraging definite research into the more pressing educational problems of the day, and also to reaping the full benefit of the experimental work actually being done by teachers in the schools, we consider it desirable that the organisation and financing of research should be made the subject of careful inquiry with a view to placing it upon a permanent and satisfactory basis.
CHAPTER XI

MODERN TENDENCIES IN EDUCATION

PRESENT POSITION

"The purpose of the elementary school," the Code states, "is to form and strengthen the character, to develop the intelligence of the children entrusted to it, and to assist boys and girls to fit themselves, practically as well as intellectually, for the work of life."

The general tendencies underlying the changes of recent years in the curriculum are said by the Board to aim at bringing the child's life in school into closer relationship with his life outside it, to make education more "practical" and less "bookish" than it was. Thus, the work of a rural school, the Board suggests, should centre round such practical subjects as are suited to the occupations of the locality, namely, gardening, handicraft and domestic economy, and associated with these should be subjects teaching the principles underlying the practical instruction, such as arithmetic, drawing and rural science. In almost every subject in the curriculum, in English and history, hardly less than in nature study and in geography, the teacher of to-day uses materials and experiences with which the children are familiar in everyday life.

Modern ideas of education are in the air. Even those teachers who are not prepared to adopt them do not escape their influence, and this influence is manifest in the way in which they carry out their work. The essential characteristic of the new teaching is the emphasis placed on the pupil. The modern idea is to "draw out" the child's own disposition, to encourage him to realise himself, not merely to impart information, still less to impose on him the teacher's personality. Nor is experiment discouraged by the Board.
The head teacher is responsible for the drawing up of the syllabus and has a very considerable freedom in the arrangement of his work. In hundreds of schools to-day teachers are carrying out successfully the "Dalton" plan, and other methods of "individual" work.

POLICY

I. We recognise the high ideals of education which in recent years have inspired the Board’s curriculum for elementary schools, and appreciate the changes which aim at giving a greater elasticity to the Code, and a more "practical" and less "bookish" bent to education. We take the view that, while practical instruction which serves a merely technical or vocational end would be out of place as a general school subject, educationists must not be deterred from cultivating the natural tendencies of children towards practical forms of work merely because of a prejudice against vocational training.

II. We have, however, to point out that practical work, and modern "individual" methods of teaching, involve comparatively small classes, a highly trained body of teachers, and suitable and well-equipped classrooms. It is the failure to secure these which is the great hindrance to the realisation of ideals in education.
CHAPTER XII
THE SIZE OF CLASSES

PRESENT POSITION

The Code for elementary schools provides that "the number of children on the register of any class or group of classes under the instruction of one teacher must not exceed 60." The clause dates from 1909, and remained unchanged until the Labour administration of 1924, when a note was added to the effect that the authority must consider "whether it is practicable to arrange that no class shall have more than 50 children on the register." The change was accompanied by the issue of Circular 1350, which made a maximum of 50 pupils "a practicable objective." Authorities were told that classes approaching 60 had to be abolished within the year, and were required to attack without delay the problem of school organisation "with a view to a speedy and substantial reduction in the number of classes over 50." In providing for the last three years of school life, which ought to be the most fruitful years, authorities were advised that "a maximum of 40 may even now be taken as the objective."

The Board’s Regulations for Secondary Schools require that "the number of pupils taught together at one time must not as a rule exceed 30, and must never exceed 35."

In April, 1923, the number of classes in elementary schools containing 40 pupils and over was as follows:—

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Under 20</th>
<th>20 and under 30</th>
<th>30 &quot; &quot; 40</th>
<th>40 &quot; &quot; 50</th>
<th>50 &quot; &quot; 60</th>
<th>60 and over</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>11,088</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>26,159</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>39,181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>41,064</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>27,166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>4,022</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A substantial reduction in the size of classes took place under Labour administration in every area, but there are
THE SIZE OF CLASSES

still classes of 60 and even 70 pupils. The broad fact remains that the large majority of children in elementary schools are taught in classes of 40 and over. The largest group of classes is the group 40-49 pupils, but the comparatively low average figure is due to the small size of classes in rural areas. The largest group of classes in county boroughs is the 50-59 group. The figures give, moreover, a more favourable impression than is actually the case. By no means all these large classes have the whole-time attention of a certificated teacher. Several thousand classes of 40 and over have only the part-time attention of the head teacher, and as many as 1,500 of such classes are taught by supplementary teachers who are assigned under the Code a maximum staff value of 20 pupils.

POLICY

We take the view that no class should exceed 40 pupils, while classes for children over eleven should approximate to the secondary school standard. “All theories of education,” the National Union of Teachers points out, “are based upon the treatment of the individual child by the individual teacher.” The suggestions made by the Board as to aim and method can only be carried out in classes where individual attention is possible. The effect of large classes is practically to compel the teacher to adopt the old mechanical methods of teaching which tend to stultify the pupil’s intelligence, destroying all interest in study, or any desire to know more.

The great stumbling block in the way of reducing the size of classes is the old-fashioned character of classrooms built to accommodate 60 pupils or more. The practice of teaching two or more classes in one room, which obtains still to some extent in large towns, may directly be traced to the fact that the accommodation was originally intended for as many as 100 or 150 children. Circular 1350 lays down that in future classrooms must be built for not more than 50 pupils, and at least the majority of rooms intended for children over 11 must be planned for 40 pupils. As regards the building of new schools, the London County Council and other authorities have already established a
standard classroom accommodation of 40 for senior departments, and 48 for junior departments; and considerable effort has been made from time to time to remodel old-fashioned buildings on these lines. This process of remodelling is not an easy one, but may be accomplished in two ways. Two large classrooms with, say, a combined accommodation of 120 or 150 may be divided into three small and convenient classrooms. Or a classroom with an accommodation of, say, 60 or 80 may be "written down" to 40 or 50. The latter method is the more satisfactory and, as a rule, the less costly. It has the further advantage of increasing the floor-space per child, which in elementary schools is on the narrow side. It can, however, be only successfully undertaken where there is a considerable margin of accommodation. The "writing down" of classrooms to a 40 limit, or even to a 50 limit, would entail in nearly all large towns the building of a certain number of new schools.

Our policy would work out in practice as follows:

I. The Code should be so amended as to limit forthwith to 50 the number of pupils on the register of one teacher, and this limit reduced to at most 40 within a period of five years. Large classrooms, which could not conveniently be remodelled, should be "written down" in accordance with the amended regulations, and new places equivalent to the number of children so displaced provided in secondary, or "central" schools, for children over 11. The total number of new places required under the scheme may roughly be estimated at 200,000 on the "writing down" of classrooms to a 50 limit, or at 750,000 on the "writing down" of classrooms to a 40 limit. The latter figure, which is equivalent to about one-half the total number of children between 11 and 14 in elementary schools, may be taken as representing roughly the amount of new accommodation which would be necessary in order to carry out the complete reorganisation of the upper classes of elementary schools.

II. The "writing down" of classrooms may cause hardship to head teachers whose salaries are fixed so as to vary with the school accommodation. This difficulty could, however, be met by a different method of grading schools.
CHAPTER XIII
THE RECOGNITION OF UNQUALIFIED TEACHERS
PRESENT POSITION

There are three grades of teachers recognised by the Board as teachers in elementary schools, namely, the certificated teacher, the uncertificated teacher, and the supplementary teacher.

To be recognised as a certificated teacher, he or she must have passed the Board's final examination for students in training colleges, or an alternative examination recognised by the Board as its equivalent. About 80 per cent. of certificated teachers are college-trained. A small percentage are university graduates.

Uncertificated teachers were originally presumed to be young people in process of completing their studies. They must have passed the Board's preliminary examination or a recognised equivalent, but they need not have taken, or may have failed to pass, the final examination. The Certificate Examination for Acting Teachers, whereby uncertificated teachers have been able to obtain the Board's certificate, will be held for the last time in November, 1926. Teachers are uncertificated for two reasons. Some are content with their undignified status and their inferior pay, and have not attempted to certificate. Others may have attempted to enter training colleges, but have not succeeded, either because they had not sufficient money, or because of the lack of accommodation in these institutions. They may have worked assiduously in their spare time after a hard day's work in school, and have taken the Acting Teachers' Examination, but have failed to pass. The figures given by the Board of Education for the year 1920 are instructive. Of students in training colleges for that year, 8.2 per cent. failed to qualify. Of acting teachers who took the examination, no less than 52.5 per cent. failed to pass.
The supplementary teacher is a woman recognised by the Board as "suitable," but she has no specific qualifications as a teacher. The educational qualifications of many teachers belonging to this grade are very low indeed and they are mainly employed in small schools in order to save expense. Supplementary teachers have no fixed rate of salary. The following table shows the total number and the grades of teachers employed at the end of March, 1923:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Certificated teachers</td>
<td>116,720</td>
<td>72.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uncertificated teachers</td>
<td>32,881</td>
<td>20.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supplementary teachers</td>
<td>11,448</td>
<td>7.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>161,049</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The proportion of unqualified teachers is highest in rural areas, where the number of certificated teachers counts only about one-half the total adult staff, while the group of supplementary teachers counts nearly one-third, and the combined group of uncertificated and supplementary teachers over two-thirds the total number of assistants employed.

In order to encourage the employment of fully-qualified assistants, the scale of staff values, laid down by the Board as the minimum scale to which the school as a whole should conform, gives a reduced value to uncertificated and supplementary teachers.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of Children in average attendance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The Head Teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Each Certificated Assistant Teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Each Uncertificated Assistant Teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Each Supplementary Teacher</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Board has, for many years past, warned authorities that the appointment of supplementary teachers must not be considered a permanent arrangement. The Code for 1909 laid down that as from August, 1914, no supplementary teacher would be recognised on the staff of any school, or department, save as a teacher of infants, or of the lowest class of older scholars in small rural schools. The date of
operation was afterwards postponed to 1919. The Board, however, decided in 1914 to sanction no new appointments of supplementary teachers in urban areas. The new rules were suspended during the war. They came nominally into operation in 1919, but the rule as to the employment of supplementary teachers was practically negatived owing to a new clause introduced in 1922, which sanctioned, not only in towns, but in country districts, the appointment of “suitable women teachers” to take charge of classes where the majority of children are under six. It was not until the Labour administration of 1924 that the Board finally decided to enforce the rule prohibiting the appointment of new supplementary teachers in urban areas. Authorities were warned at the same time that the Board proposed to take into consideration the proportion of certificated teachers employed before paying grant.

POLICY

We consider that the time has now come when the Board should cease to differentiate between town and rural schools in respect of the employment of unqualified teachers. They should rely instead on an improvement in rural conditions which would attract young qualified teachers to village schools. Since the levelling up of salaries under the Burnham agreement, more than one county authority has remarked for the first time an influx of young teachers from the training college into rural areas.

Our proposals, broadly speaking, are as follows:

I. The Board should not, in future, recognise the appointment of supplementary teachers. Women appointed prior to, or in conformity with, the regulations of 1909 and 1914 should be allowed to remain in their present posts. Other supplementary teachers should be offered reasonable facilities for obtaining the Board’s certificate. A special course in a training college could be offered to suitable candidates, but those who failed to qualify within a reasonable time-limit should be discharged after due notice.

II. Uncertificated teachers stand in a somewhat different position. They possess certain qualifications specified by the Board, and their appointment has been recognised as
a permanent arrangement. The Board could not now withdraw its recognition from an uncertificated teacher already employed. The time is already overdue when the Certificate Examination for Acting Teachers should be discontinued, but existing uncertificated teachers should be allowed to qualify fully by taking a special course in a training college, or at a university. The appointment of new uncertificated teachers should only be recognised, as a purely temporary arrangement, where a certificated teacher is not immediately available for the post. An uncertificated teacher should not be allowed to take charge of a class where the majority of children are over eleven.

III. The Board should carry out its intention of taking into account the proportion of certificated teachers employed before paying grant.
CHAPTER XIV

THE EDUCATION AND TRAINING
OF TEACHERS

PRESENT POSITION

There are 111 institutions recognised by the Board as training-colleges, of which sixteen are university training departments. The total number of students in attendance in the academic year 1923-24 was 16,860, 4,593 of whom were in university training departments. Only one university training department, and 32 training colleges, are provided by local authorities. The rest are provided by denominational bodies and other voluntary agencies.

All the university training departments provide a four years' course, of which the first three years are devoted wholly, or mainly, to study in preparation for a degree, and the fourth year is devoted to professional training, giving a suitable preparation for the work of teaching in elementary schools. University colleges give only a two years' course followed by a year of professional training. Other training colleges provide a course of training covering two years which includes both professional and academic work, and leads up to the Board's certificate. Some colleges also make provision for a third-year course for selected students who have completed a two-year course, or for a one-year course for certificated teachers, or for graduates and other advanced students. A few colleges also make arrangements for a four-years' course which includes a university degree.

The university training departments and some other colleges provide courses of training for secondary school teachers, but the whole number of such students in the academic year 1923-24 was not more than 649.
Of the total number of 6,627 entrants to training colleges in the year 1923, 6,084 were previously educated in secondary schools on the Board’s efficient list, 280 in pupil-teacher centres, or under pupil-teacher schemes in rural areas, and 263 in various other schools.

The pupil-teacher method, which prevailed before the secondary school system was really established, was effective in filling the ranks of the profession; on every other ground it must be wholeheartedly condemned. With the expansion of the secondary school system, the Board adopted a new and better policy. Intending teachers were encouraged to enter into the broader life and the more general interests provided by the secondary school. To this end bursaries and student-teacherships were instituted. The change, unfortunately, had a disastrous effect on the supply of teachers. Many entrants, to whom the new arrangements gave a freer access to other walks of life, abandoned their original intention of becoming teachers. The status and pay of the profession had been determined by the older and inferior method of training and were not attractive to scholars in secondary schools. Confronted by a serious shortage of teachers, the Board have recently shown a tendency to revert to antiquated methods of recruitment and training.

The present bursary system, by which special scholarships in secondary schools are allocated to intending teachers, is a great advance on earlier methods, but the practice survives, to some extent, of asking parents to commit their children at the early age of fourteen to a career of teaching. In consideration of this undertaking, the child is awarded special financial help at a secondary school. So great is the desire on the part of authorities to create teachers that free places and bursaries are commonly given to children who have not attained the standard of the ordinary scholarship holder, or of the normal entrant to a secondary school.

Another survival from the pupil-teacher method is the so-called “student-teacher year.” During this year, the student gives as a rule not more than one day a week to study, while the rest of his time is spent in teaching, for which he receives a small salary. There are some 5,800 student-teachers so employed to-day in elementary schools.
The modern type of training college aims at providing, in addition to professional training, a modified university or general course. The weakness of the system in its present form is that, at the age of eighteen or so, it separates intending teachers from students of their own age who intend to enter other professions; it weakens their contact with the main current of life, and hinders the growth of wide social interests. The valuable experience of community living offered by residential colleges may easily become positively harmful in some of its aspects unless it is based on the broadest and most humane foundations. In too many cases young persons of the same sex, and approximately the same age, are segregated in institutions where they are subject to an artificial and repressive discipline. The denominational colleges are probably the most unhappy in these respects.

POLICY

I. Our view is that the general education of teachers is necessarily bound up with the development of the secondary school system. Until the age of eighteen the young teacher should have the very best general education that the country can provide. With the development of the secondary school system, together with the increased provision of maintenance allowances, which we anticipate, there should be no difficulty in securing that in future teachers shall be drawn only from those who have taken a secondary school course, roughly to the standard of the Second School Examination.

II. When all normal children receive a secondary education, it will be possible, without prejudicing the supply of teachers:—

(1) To abolish the last remains of the antiquated pupil-teacher method of recruitment and training.

(2) To abolish the so-called “student-teacher year.”

(3) To dispense with special bursarships at secondary schools to such children as pledge themselves to teach.
(4) To insist on a full secondary course leading up to the university for all intending teachers up to the age of eighteen.

III. We recognise that time must elapse before all intending teachers could receive a full university course. The existing training colleges could not be abolished at the present moment, but their outlook should be broadened by bringing them into closer touch with the universities.

IV. The output from the universities should, however, be such that an increasing number of university graduates would be available each year for employment in elementary and “central” schools. Elementary schools should follow the present practice in secondary schools and a higher salary be offered to university graduates.

V. For we believe that the education of the intending teacher, whatever his future sphere, should be “higher” education of that type which it is the function of the university to supply. This education should precede, and be distinct from, any training course. During the educative period the intending teacher should be enabled to associate with fellow students from all parts of the country, and should not be segregated from those who are preparing for other professions.

VI. We criticise the system of two-year training colleges for teachers on the ground that it contravenes some or all of these principles. We propose that the education of intending teachers should be regarded by every university as one of its most important functions, and that the formation and operation of a scheme providing a suitable general course should be the condition of any public grant for university purposes.

VII. The post-graduate training of the teacher is a necessary prelude to professional efficiency, and those employed on the staff of this department should possess high qualifications for the work. The extent and method of such training should be, in the future as in the past, the subject of far-reaching experiment. Special facilities should be offered in suitable cases for post-graduate training abroad.
While it may be desirable to train teachers for service in a particular type of school, no bar should be raised against their transfer from one type to another as occasion arises. We suggest that this technical training should also be carried out under the general supervision of the university. The lines upon which it should be conducted, together with the general conditions of certification, should be laid down by a council, on which the universities, the Board, and the teachers should be represented. It should be the duty of this body also to regulate the number of admissions to the teaching profession according to national needs.

VIII. While we are opposed on general grounds to the practice of making special grants to intending teachers during the educational period, we recognise that, until facilities for university education are supplied on a much more extensive scale than at present, it may be necessary to take measures to ensure that a sufficient number of young people of the secondary school-leaving age adopt teaching as a career. Suitable candidates over eighteen should receive the necessary financial assistance for "higher" education and professional training.

IX. We consider that a teacher's training should not be regarded as coming to an end with his entry upon school work. He should be given every opportunity of keeping himself abreast of advances in educational principles and practice. These opportunities should take the form of courses of lectures or discussions, of circulating libraries, and of periodic leave of absence for special study.

X. The professional training of teachers is a national rather than a local concern, and the whole cost should be borne out of national funds.
CHAPTER XV
SCHOOL BUILDINGS AND EQUIPMENT
PRESENT POSITION

ELEMENTARY and secondary schools are built under separate regulations, and different standards are laid down by the Board relating to the two types of building.

Thus, a secondary school must provide at least two acres of playing-field, together with playgrounds of 50 square feet per head. The whole site, on the other hand, of an elementary school need not afford more than a quarter-of-an-acre for every 200 children (54 square feet per head), and there is no need for playing-fields to be provided at all.

Again, classrooms in secondary schools must give a floor-space of sixteen to eighteen square feet, in no case being less than sixteen square feet, and each group of four classrooms should accommodate not more than 100 scholars. Classrooms, on the other hand, in elementary schools (including all sorts of higher elementary and “central” schools) must be built to accommodate 50 children on the basis of ten square feet, or 40 children on the basis of twelve square feet where children over eleven are concerned. Before the regulations were amended under the late Labour administration, the elementary basis was only ten square feet, and nine square feet as regards infants. Conditions in elementary schools not merely tend to overcrowding and unnecessary risks of infection, but hinder freedom of movement and the growth of feelings of individuality and self-respect. The fact alone that the restricted area of elementary classrooms compels the use of double desks should condemn the standard as inadequate. In America, where children of all social classes attend the public elementary school, the minimum floor space is from sixteen to twenty square feet according to the regulations in different States.
The Board require that all schools should be supplied with adequate and wholesome drinking water, but there are no requirements as to hot water. This is commonly supplied in secondary schools, but not in elementary schools, though more necessary for little children than for older ones, especially in cold weather. There are even two standards of sanitary accommodation. The secondary regulations require, broadly speaking, from one-half to one-third more accommodation than is allowed in elementary schools where only one closet is required for every ten to twenty-two girls, and only one closet (apart from urinals) for every thirty to sixty-six boys, according to the size of the department. In large boys’ departments the standard is considerably less than one-half that in secondary schools, and actually less than two-thirds that prescribed under the Factory Acts for adult men! Closets in elementary schools must be built in such a way as to be completely disconnected from the main building. The result is that delicate little children from the age of three are obliged in all weathers to cross an open court which may mean exposure for a hundred yards or more.

The Board’s building regulations apply only to the building of new schools. “Reasonable regard” must be had to them in dealing with existing buildings, but the term, unfortunately, is very loosely interpreted. The suspension of nearly all school building during the war and since has, in fact, resulted in a state of things which is little short of appalling. There are buildings still in use to-day condemned by the Board twelve or fifteen years ago. Old-fashioned “stepped” classrooms where free movement is impossible, classrooms so monstrous in size that two or more classes must be taught in one room, no hall for assembly, no head teacher’s room or staff room, no kind of facilities for medical inspection which must take place in the draughty passage or hall, in the cloak-room, or where it can; out-of-date and quite inadequate sanitary accommodation, representing only one-half the Board’s standard; defective water supply or none at all; faulty ventilation, bad lighting, insufficient heating in winter, no means of drying clothes; desks of a pattern long since condemned by medical opinion,
SCHOOL BUILDINGS

seats much too small for growing boys and girls, no sleeping appliances for infants; playgrounds so cramped and ill-paved that games of any kind are impossible; buildings in every stage of dirt and disrepair; the Board's attention is called year after year to the same grave defects and deficiencies. Practical work is held up in hundreds of schools because there is no space available, or the apparatus is not forthcoming. Both teachers and pupils are handicapped in varying degrees for want of books, stationery and other school necessaries. Some of the worst conditions may be found in the small voluntary schools of rural areas. "The conditions," the School Medical Officer for Wiltshire reports, "under which many children spend their school hours are object lessons in neglect of hygiene, and it is not surprising that on completion of their elementary education these lessons have been so thoroughly ingrained that they are reflected in their homes in after life."

POLICY

Our aim is gradually to level up the conditions in elementary schools to the standard now obtaining in secondary schools. The present distinctions in matters of the simplest human needs—playgrounds, air-space, water supply, sanitary accommodation—distinctions which seem to mark off elementary pupils as belonging to an inferior social order, tend more than anything else to discourage parents of moderate means from sending their children to the public elementary school, and so perpetuate the present dual system of education.

Our policy would in practice work out as follows:—

I. The first consideration in town-planning schemes should be suitable sites for schools. Land should be scheduled by authorities in advance so that the public should not be obliged to buy at inflated prices. "Permanent" schools need not be of too permanent a nature, and authorities should be encouraged to experiment in new types of light, or portable, building on open-air lines. The best type of classroom would be so built that each of its side walls is completely, or almost completely removable. One
or other side can then be opened according to the direction of the wind, or on a hot summer’s day, both. These classrooms are best placed on the ground floor, with an asphalt yard adjoining, into which the children can move their desks when the sun is shining. Where this is impossible owing to shortage of space (in towns), they can be built one upon the other in the form of a two or three storied building, and the flat roof used for classes in the sun.

II. In crowded areas, such as the central districts of London, where the cost of suitable sites is almost prohibitive, experiment should be made in providing schools for children over eleven outside the area, and organising the necessary means of transport. The empty trams and trains returning to the suburbs in the morning and to the cities in the afternoon and evening, could be economically used for this purpose.

III. There should be a school area of at least ten square yards (90 square feet per head), and not more than one-fifth of the site should be built on. Schools for children over eleven should be provided with playgrounds and playing fields on the secondary school scale, and the provision for younger children increased by at least 50 per cent.

IV. Classrooms for children over eleven should be built on the secondary school basis of at least sixteen square feet per head, and classrooms for younger children on the basis of at least fifteen square feet, with an aggregate minimum of 600 square feet. It may be pointed out in this connection that under the new regulations classrooms designed for over-eleven classes must be built for forty pupils on a twelve square feet basis. Thus, where authorities adopted our plan for making over-eleven classes approximate in size to the thirty limit, the area of floor-space per head would be automatically increased from the elementary to the secondary standard, namely, from twelve to sixteen square feet.

V. There should be in all schools a pure and adequate supply of cold water, and hot water should be available more especially in infant departments. Closets and washing basins in elementary schools should be provided on the
secondary school scale, and at least one office for infants should be placed inside the school building.

VI. Schoolrooms should be heated so that the temperature does not fall below 50° Fahrenheit. The American plan by which the floors are warmed to 75° and no other heating is supplied, has worked successfully in Derbyshire and elsewhere. There should be proper facilities for drying clothes. Experiment could be made in providing slippers at wholesale prices to be worn in class.

VII. Modern requirements as to lighting should be rigidly enforced. Classroom windows should reach to within three feet of the floor and within three inches of the ceiling, and the window space in this latitude should be at least one-fifth of the floor area.

VIII. Classrooms should be equipped so far as possible with single desks. The American plan of a movable chair seat with an adjustable desk and a book box under the seat could be copied here. Where undue noise has been caused by movable chairs, the reason is that the floors are not properly laid. All infant classrooms should be properly equipped with sleeping appliances.

IX. There should be in all schools an adequate supply of books, apparatus, stationery, &c., so that teachers and pupils are not, as now, unnecessarily handicapped in their work.

X. Existing buildings could not at once be brought up to the standard outlined above, but the Board should insist that "reasonable regard" must be had to their building regulations in dealing with old schools. Further, authorities should be warned that insanitary or unsuitable buildings must be rebuilt or remodelled within a reasonable time-limit. In the five years before the war the output of elementary schools—for the most part new schools replacing old ones—was from 200 to 250 a year or, roughly speaking, an annual output of 60,000 places.¹ The annual output would thus need to be at least 120,000 places during the next five years in order merely to make good the arrears of 1914–24.

¹ The average size of a school is about 300 places.
XI. All buildings should be kept in a proper state of cleanliness and repair. Hard wood floors with polished surfaces may be more easily kept clean and more free from dust than floors which need perpetual scrubbing. Windows should be regularly cleaned. Neglect in this respect is a common cause of bad lighting.

XII. There should be no distinction made between council and voluntary schools. Where the church, or chapel, owns the building but is unable, through lack of funds, to bring it up to the Board’s standard, the school should be closed, or handed over to the public authority.
CHAPTER XW

MEDICAL INSPECTION AND TREATMENT

PRESENT POSITION

It is the duty of education authorities to provide for the periodical medical examination of all pupils in elementary schools. According to the Board's regulations, the children must be examined on admission, between the ages of eight and nine, and again between the ages of twelve and thirteen. Under this rule 1,697,561 children were subject to routine inspection during 1924, almost as many were reinspected, and 722,744 "specials" were examined in addition.

Medical inspection in places of higher education is a comparatively new growth, but 128 out of 147 authorities have made a start. About 32,000 pupils in 1,000 secondary schools were inspected in 1924.

Of the total number of children examined at routine inspections in 1924, about 20 per cent. were found to be suffering from defects requiring immediate treatment, but this percentage does not represent all the children found to be defective. Nor does it include children needing treatment for uncleanliness or for dental caries. It is estimated by the Chief Medical Officer of the Board of Education that two-thirds of the elementary school population are suffering in one degree or another from dental caries.

All save two authorities have made provision for medical treatment in varying degrees. In some cases arrangements are made with voluntary hospitals; in others the work is farmed out to groups of private practitioners. At other times the authority provides its own treatment centres, or "school clinics." There are in all over a thousand school clinics.
In spite, however, of the advance made in recent years, a serious leakage still exists between the number of children referred for medical treatment and the number who get it. This leakage is very marked in regard to dental treatment. In London, where about 80 per cent. of the children referred for treatment other than dental secure it, the corresponding percentage relating to dental treatment is only about 50 per cent. The more severe cases are dealt with to a larger extent than the slight cases in which caries is just commencing. A truly preventive scheme would require that the very slight cases should receive more consideration than the advanced cases.

The Education Act of 1921 is very definite regarding the recovery of the cost of medical treatment. Parents must be charged such an amount, not exceeding the actual cost, as the authority may determine; and, unless the authority is satisfied that the parent is unable to pay, the amount may be recovered as a civil debt.

The school medical service comprises 2,365 men and women but only 15 out of 317 school medical officers, and 237 out of 2,038 assistants and specialist doctors, give all their time to school work. The post of school medical officer is commonly combined with that of medical officer of health, while most assistants are engaged part-time on public health work, or in private practice. There are, in addition, 4,368 school nurses. Of these, 1,077 are employed whole-time on school work and the rest are part-time health visitors under the public health department, or district nurses.

The general criticism of the school medical service is that its benefit to the community has been too much restricted to the picking out of obviously defective children. These defects are eventually treated at a considerable cost, but comparatively little is done to remove the underlying causes of defect or to educate the rising generation in a healthy rule of life. The great need of the service is to draw into it men and women with special medical and social knowledge, and a keen interest in their work. It is unfortunate that

---

1 Figures for 1923-24.
this highly technical branch should be almost entirely con­
trolled by medical officers of health who have little clinical
experience, or special knowledge, of children's diseases.
The service, as at present organised, offers no worthy
openings to clever young practitioners. The policy of
employing whole-time officers on continuous routine work	
tends in time to destroy their interest, while they are over­
burdened with clerical work. Nor is it a good plan to
employ untrained voluntary workers on such important
duties as those of following up, and home visiting, which are
properly the function of a trained nurse, or a qualified health
visitor. In London, where the care committee system is
established, the duties of the school nurse have practically
degenerated into those of mere cleansing, while unqualified
members of the care committee—often quite untrained and
inexperienced young girls—give instruction to parents on
vital matters of health!

Another weakness of the present system is the inadequacy
of the facilities often provided for medical treatment.
Arrangements made with voluntary hospitals or groups of
private practitioners over which the authority has no effective
control, have seldom proved altogether satisfactory. Accord­
ing to the Chief Medical Officer, school clinics run by the
authority are the most practicable method of dealing with
large numbers of children. He points out that the type of
case dealt with in the school, namely, defects of eye, ear,
nose and throat, dental disease and minor ailments, failed
formerly to receive treatment either by the private prac­
titioner or by the hospital. Few, if any, private practitioners
wish to treat such cases at a very small fee; while the
hospitals are glad to be relieved of a mass of out-patients
who are scarcely suitable for hospital attention, but over­
crowd the out-patients' department and interfere with the
treatment of adults.

A further serious hindrance to treatment, as well as to
educational work in the home, is the practice of requiring
payment from parents for the treatment of slight defects
and minor ailments, the importance of which from the
preventive point of view, they may not as yet have learned
to appreciate. The difficulty in securing the early treatment of dental caries has been attributed by school medical officers to this cause. The increased charges imposed on parents under the “Geddes” axe were everywhere followed by a falling off in the percentage of children who obtained treatment. Most working-class budgets are very exactly balanced, and the unexpected charge of even a shilling or two means that someone has to go without something which may be equally necessary. The whole sum recovered from the parents does not amount to more than about £30,000 a year out of a total expenditure of £1,220,000 on the school medical service and, from the most commercial point of view, seems hardly to repay the expense and trouble of collecting it.

POLICY

I. While we support the principle that the school medical service should form an integral part of the public health department, we take the view that the school medical officer should as far as possible be separately appointed to the medical officer of health, and should have special qualifications for the post. He should be assisted in the work of administration and direction by a number of whole-time experienced men and women recruited from the ablest of the school doctors. The routine work of inspection, on the other hand, may be best carried out by part-time practitioners. It should, however, be a condition of service that all school doctors should have previously undergone a short course of special training to be approved by the Board of Education. Similarly, part-time practitioners engaged on treatment should have had special experience of the type of case treated. Thus, the young general practitioner, who has often time on his hands whilst waiting for practice, would come into touch with this public work when he was fresh and enthusiastic, his knowledge of normal children and slight deviations from health, the origins and causes of disease, would gain in exactness, and later react to the benefit of the community and the profession.

II. The filling in of forms which is now the duty of the school doctor should be devolved so far as possible on the school nurse, who should also undertake some of the more
simple processes of routine inspection. The school doctor would thus be freed to carry out intensive work on small groups of children. The ultimate result to the country would be cheaper and profoundly better if more of the routine work were to be done by the school nurse, in cooperation with the teacher, and only the selected cases passed on to the doctor.

III. The number of school nurses should be increased each year until at least one whole-time nurse, or the equivalent in part-time services, would be employed for every group of 1,000 children, or one for every group of 500 children where the majority were under seven. The practical training of little children in healthy bodily habits, now undertaken by teachers, could be better carried out by a trained nurse.

In most places outside London the duties of the school nurse and those of the health visitor under the Notification of Births Act are undertaken by one and the same person. Where this is not the rule, the school nurse should work in close and active co-operation with the local health authority responsible for infant care.

IV. Every school should have available a medical room suitably equipped and properly lighted and heated.

V. All arrangements for medical treatment should be under the direct control of the authority, and the authority required to organise an efficient system of school clinics.

VI. Special attention should be given to dental treatment. The Board should in future refuse to sanction schemes which did not provide annually for the treatment of at least one-third of the school population, or half the number now estimated to be in need of it. Where the large majority of children require treatment in varying degree, as in dental caries, it would save time and money in the end if all the children were passed every year through the dental chair, and both inspection and treatment carried out in one and the same sitting.

1In addition to general qualifications, the school nurse should have had special training for her work.
VII. Parents' fees for medical treatment should be abolished. Medical inspection and treatment were instituted because, as the result of ill-health, so many children were unable to take advantage of the free education which the State provided for them. If the State accepts the duty of educating its future citizens, and if disease can be shown, as it certainly can, to interfere with the efficiency of this education, it is surely the duty of the State to accept full responsibility for the removal of this disability, and to allow no financial consideration to interfere with the efficient education of its future citizens.
CHAPTER XVII
SPECIAL SCHOOLS
PRESENT POSITION

The following table shows the number of children in special schools, together with the estimated number of defective children, for whom no special provision is made:

**NUMBER OF DEFECTIVE CHILDREN IN ENGLAND AND WALES, 1924**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Attending Certified Special Schools</th>
<th>Attending Public Elementary School</th>
<th>At other Institutions</th>
<th>At no School or Instruction</th>
<th>Total 1924</th>
<th>Total 1923</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Blind:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Totally</td>
<td>1,675</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>279</td>
<td>2,042</td>
<td>1,957</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Partially</td>
<td>1,003</td>
<td>1,857</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>286</td>
<td>4,135</td>
<td>3,444</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deaf:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Totally</td>
<td>3,584</td>
<td>226</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>301</td>
<td>4,173</td>
<td>3,020</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Partially</td>
<td>424</td>
<td>1,270</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>79</td>
<td>1,781</td>
<td>1,563</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mentally Defective:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cases not “notifiable”</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Epileptics</td>
<td>15,590</td>
<td>11,103</td>
<td>703</td>
<td>3,335</td>
<td>30,821</td>
<td>20,278</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physically Defective:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(a) Active Tuberculosis, Pulmonary &amp; Glandular:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Infectious</td>
<td>1,295</td>
<td>395</td>
<td>3,547</td>
<td>4,237</td>
<td>4,488</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-infectious</td>
<td>2,710</td>
<td>8,505</td>
<td>196</td>
<td>4,089</td>
<td>15,504</td>
<td>10,439</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(b) Delicate children</td>
<td>2,453</td>
<td>2,748</td>
<td>606</td>
<td>2,466</td>
<td>7,003</td>
<td>7,143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(c) Crippled children</td>
<td>9,492</td>
<td>48,031</td>
<td>546</td>
<td>3,739</td>
<td>61,708</td>
<td>40,338</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>46,232</td>
<td>96,813</td>
<td>4,589</td>
<td>22,533</td>
<td>170,167</td>
<td>148,602</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In addition the following number of mentally defectives were notified to the Local Control Authorities during the year 1924: feeble-minded 900, imbeciles 1,273, and idiots 180. Furthermore there were 4,488 cases ascertained of children suffering from epilepsy which was not severe.

It may thus be seen that there are over 120,000 defective children who are not provided for in special schools, or in institutions other than ordinary elementary schools. Of
this number, about 14,500 are classed as mentally defective. Over 11,000 mentally defective children are taught in ordinary elementary schools. Another large group for whom no special provision has been made is that of "delicate" children. There is urgent need, more especially in crowded cities, for a greatly increased number of open-air recovery schools.

Authorities have power to retain children in special schools until the age of sixteen.

**POLICY**

The idea of special education is to provide for the needs of certain groups of children who by reason of physical or mental defect cannot benefit from ordinary education. It is not possible to give any definition of defect which will afford a clear and uniform standard. Thus, as the Chief Medical Officer points out, a child who by reason of physical defect cannot profit by instruction in a badly-lit and badly-ventilated elementary school may be perfectly well able to profit by the same instruction in a modern elementary school built on open-air lines. Or, a child who, by reason of mental defect cannot profit by instruction in a large class under an unsympathetic teacher, may be quite adequately provided for in a smaller class in an ordinary school under a teacher with special knowledge of the needs of backward and abnormal children. The only safe rule to apply is that every child should be taught in the school where he is best able to develop his particular aptitudes and capacities.

I. THE GENERAL POSITION. While the needs of certain types of slightly defective children for special education will tend to diminish as the conditions in ordinary schools are improved and brought into line with modern hygienic requirements, it is plain that a number of others more seriously handicapped can only be taught in special schools. There is urgent need for a greatly increased number of places in special schools for mentally defective and epileptic children, outside London especially, and also for certain types of tubercular or delicate and crippled children.
II. **Blind Schools.**—Day schools are the best, although for sparsely populated districts residence may be necessary. It is important that pupils should be made as independent as possible and not segregated from the general life of the community. There should be separate schools for myopic children, who are destined to take part in ordinary life. They should be educated so far as possible in ordinary schools, and always apart from the blind. The official term “partially blind” is an unfortunate phrase for the pupil’s future and also a misnomer, as most myopes can get normal vision with glasses. All pupils with defective vision should be under the observation of a competent ophthalmic surgeon.

III. **Deaf Schools.**—The deaf for some reason are exempt from compulsory education before the age of seven. Yet they are the class who most of all requires special training commencing at the age of two to three, and the five years lost can never be made up. Congenital deafness should be made a notifiable disease, and all deaf children taught lip reading and oral speech from the earliest possible age. Children not totally deaf, but yet so hard of hearing that they appear stupid or even mentally defective, should be picked out and put into a “hard-of-hearing” class where they would spend part of their time in lip-reading and part in ordinary class work. All deaf children should be superintended by a doctor who has had special otological experience. Residential schools for the deaf, which segregate them from their fellows, are undesirable.

IV. **Invalid Schools.**—These are necessary for children who by reason of serious physical defect are unfit to attend the ordinary elementary school. Such schools have been on the whole very successful. The chief failure has been in preventing the influence of harmful environmental conditions beyond the school. Pre-school observation of children and nursery schools would avoid at least sixty per cent. of the crippling which exists.

V. **Open-Air Recovery Schools.**—The open-air school is specially required for children with tubercular tendencies or suffering from malnutrition, nervous affections, debility after serious illness, and similar complaints for which fresh
air and sunshine are the best remedy. It is a part of the open-air school idea that the pupils should remain all day at school, where they are under medical supervision and provided with suitable meals and facilities for the midday rest. Cheap substitutes are offered in the form of playground classes, but without proper means of feeding and rest there is the danger of taxing unduly the strength of debilitated children.

VI. MENTALLY DEFECTIVE SCHOOLS.—It is probable that between one and two per cent. of all children should be classed as mentally defective, and in need of special education. One of the great troubles in the past was that children were rejected by the school authority as imbecile and unfit for education, but refused, on the other hand, by the Guardians, and thus between them left to roam the streets. The Board of Control was established in order to meet this difficulty, but the question is now arising as to what is educability and what is not. The only final solution is that the education authority should be responsible for all young people during the period of growth.

There is also a large group of children—many dull merely from the effort to grow under adverse conditions—for whom the ordinary school tasks are too complicated. These backward, or slightly abnormal, children should be segregated in special classes adapted to their needs, but allowed otherwise to share so far as possible in the ordinary school life.

Teachers of mentally defective and retarded children should have undergone a special course of study in addition to the ordinary training.

VII. CO-OPERATION BETWEEN AUTHORITIES.—In all save the largest urban areas the only satisfactory way of dealing with special school problems is by co-operation between authorities. Two or more authorities can combine to provide a single school, or one authority can provide the school and admit to it pupils from other areas in return for an approved fee.
VIII. RURAL AREAS.—The problem of defective children in rural areas is a specially difficult one. It seems at present impossible to deal with it effectively except by means of residential schools.

IX. MEANS OF TRANSPORT.—It is inevitable even in large towns that many children attending special schools should be obliged to make a long journey to school. The shortest walk would entail on others too severe a strain, or they need guiding and assistance. Authorities should be responsible for providing free of charge efficient means of transport for all defective children in need of it. The present practice of recovering the cost, or part of it, from the parents works unfairly against those who, through no fault of their own, live at a distance from the school.
CHAPTER XVIII

SCHOOL FEEDING

PRESENT POSITION

Local authorities are empowered under the Provision of Meals Act (now consolidated in the Education Act, 1921), to take such steps as they think fit to provide meals, on school days and during the holidays, for children attending elementary schools. In the year 1924-25, 132 out of 317 authorities were working the Act, and provided in all 10,205,790 meals for a total of 97,993 children, the average cost (including breakfasts and meals other than dinners) being 3.8d.\(^1\) per meal. Owing to the system of rationing adopted by the Conservative Government of 1922-23, the figures have fallen considerably from those of previous years. In 1921-22 the total number of meals provided was 60,676,000, the average cost being 6.68d., while the total number of children fed was 592,500. Where the family is in receipt of poor law relief, school dinners are now, as a rule, refused.

Some authorities, notably London, Birmingham, and Chatham, provide, in addition to school dinners, milk meals and cod liver oil, for debilitated children. In London alone 945,868 milk meals and 135,500 doses of cod liver oil were administered in 1923-24.

The cost of school meals may be recovered from the parents, but where the parents are unable to pay a part or whole of the payment may be remitted. The total sum recovered from the parents in 1922 was £16,557 out of a gross expenditure of £173,621, or an expenditure of £107,085 on food alone. Of all the milk meals provided about one-third were provided free of charge.

\(^1\)This figure relates to 1923-24.
Where the Act is in force no child attending an elementary school should be in immediate want of food, but there are a number of other children not actually hungry yet found by medical inspection to be below the normal in nutrition. In London about 6 per cent. of all elementary children come under this head. It is a well-known fact that the average working-class child, both in height and weight, falls below the average middle-class child of the same age. Thousands of children—perhaps a majority of the elementary school population—fail to obtain the diet necessary for full physical and mental growth. As the Chief Medical Officer points out, precisely the foods which many children need are those which, on account of expense, e.g., fresh milk, butter, eggs, fruit and vegetables, they seldom get, and the same ground of expense tends to the omission in large measure of such foods from the menu where school dinners are provided.

There is a further problem where, as often in rural areas, the school is at a distance from the children’s homes. Complaints come from the parents that they must either incur increased expenses for dinners to be taken to, or possibly provided at the school, or the children suffer through having a less suitable meal than could be given at home. The same question arises in towns where the “central” school draws its pupils from a comparatively wide area. There is evidence, the Chief Medical Officer reports, that much ill-health among children is attributable to the lack of sufficient and suitable food, and it is clear that children who bring their dinners to school are not, as a rule, ensured a satisfactory meal.

POLICY

We aim at a system where regular meals would be provided in elementary schools, as they are in many secondary schools, as a part of the ordinary curriculum. The full

---

*It was estimated by the Chief Medical Officer in 1913 that about ten per cent. of total elementary school population was suffering in varying degrees from malnutrition.


*Annual Report for 1924, page 133.
provision could not be undertaken all at once, but we think that the time has now come when certain steps should be taken in this direction.

I. All authorities should be required to adopt the Provision of Meals sections of the 1921 Act, and to provide meals for all children in need of them. Where necessary, meals should also be provided during week-ends and holidays.

II. It should be the duty of authorities to provide a suitable midday meal, as a part of the ordinary curriculum, for children living at a distance from the school, where the school doctor advises it or the parents claim it. The cost could be recovered from the parents, but the charge should not exceed the price of the actual food provided, and should be remitted where payment would cause hardship to the family.

III. Authorities should be required to provide milk meals, comprising half-a-pint of fresh (Grade A) milk and a biscuit, for all children where the school doctor advises it, or the parents claim it. The cost could be recovered from the parents where payment would not deprive the family of other necessaries. It may be anticipated that, as a result of this policy, the provision of milk meals would be extended to the majority of the school population, while at least 10 per cent. of the children would be supplied free of charge.

We would point out in support of our view that:

(1) Milk contains to a special degree the vitamins which form the best protection against disease and are so often deficient in the diet of the working-class child.

(2) Where special milk feeding has been undertaken, as in London, Birmingham, or Chatham, excellent results have followed. Dr. Hobrogde, of Chatham, has summed up his experience as follows:

(a) There is an all-round improvement in weight and nutrition.

(b) The children are more alert and energetic.

(c) The improved physical condition makes them more attentive and receptive of school teaching.  

---

*Annual Report of Chief Medical Officer, 1923, page 120.*
(3) If every child were secured a milk meal the conditions in open-air classes could be made to approximate more nearly to those of open-air schools.

(4) The milk meal may be taken in class, and involves a minimum of trouble and expense in preparation and serving.

(5) Where large quantities of milk were distributed through the authority, a good supply could be organised at a price much below that now paid by the private consumer.
CHAPTER XIX

PROBLEMS OF FINANCE

PRESENT POSITION

PUBLIC expenditure on education is administered by local authorities which may impose a local rate for the purpose. The function of the Board is to make grants in aid of approved local expenditure, including that of voluntary agencies. The Act of 1921 lays down that the sum paid to authorities out of monies provided by Parliament “shall not be less than one-half of the net expenditure of the authority recognised by the Board of Education as expenditure in aid of which parliamentary grants should be made.”

It is now proposed by the Conservative Government (Circular 1371) to abolish the percentage system, under which good progress has been made since 1918, and to substitute a new system of “block grant,” which would practically limit expenditure in 1926-27, and in each of the two succeeding years, to that incurred in 1924-25—a year when the number of children on the registers touched its lowest point since the war and before the effects of the Labour administration had begun to be felt—less (1) one per cent. on all elementary education, and (2) 30/- for every child under five on the registers. As a result of a conference held in December, 1925, between the Board and the local authorities, who were in arms against the Circular, the Board agreed to withhold the new provisions for one year, but on condition only that the authorities would consent drastically to cut down their expenditure. Administrative memorandum 44, issued by the Board in January, 1926, puts an end to all “normal expansion” unless accompanied by “compensating economies,” compels authorities to abandon or restrict the programmes undertaken at the Board’s own invitation, and reveals the new Conservative policy as one of ruthless retrenchment in the name of “economy.”
PROBLEMS OF FINANCE

The total expenditure in 1923-24 may be regarded as being expended on the various objects, thus:

(1) Teachers' salaries and pensions 50,754,000
(2) Loan charges, rents, rates and taxes 5,584,000
(3) Equipment, books, upkeep (including fuel and light), repairs, and capital expenditure on buildings provided out of revenue 7,454,000
(4) Medical inspection and treatment, school feeding, &c. 1,594,000
(5) Aid to students (free places, maintenance allowances, and scholarships) 1,802,000
(6) Museums 205,000
(7) Miscellaneous services 2,119,000
(8) Administration 3,915,000

£73,427,000

Of this total, 59 per cent. fell on the taxes, and 41 per cent. on local rates.

In addition to money spent by the Board, or by local education authorities, the Treasury in recent years has made separate grants of its own to the universities. The estimated total expenditure under this head for 1924-25 was £1,272,970.

POLICY

WHAT THE SCHEME WOULD COST

We anticipate, as a result of our scheme, not so much any large immediate addition to the present expenditure on education, as a steady increase from year to year. It is obvious that practical considerations, in particular the shortage of teachers and accommodation, make it impossible to advance except by gradual stages. The cost of our scheme will thus depend upon the pace at which it is carried out, and also vary with the needs of different localities. It is impossible to give any exact estimate of cost. The following outline is intended only as a rough indication of the additional annual expenditure which certain items in our programme might involve at the end of a five years' development, or a full Parliamentary term.

*Statement reported as being made by Lord Eustace Percy, President of the Board of Education. The Times, October 2nd, 1925.*
I. Nursery Schools.

The cost per head in an open-air nursery school is not more, but tends to be less, than that in an ordinary infant department, but additional expenditure would be involved under our scheme by the obligation imposed on authorities to provide nursery school accommodation for children under school age where a formal claim had been made by the parents. The extent of such claims would not, however, be very great at first. A total of 5,000 new places a year should be sufficient to meet it.

The annual cost (including all capital charges) at the end of five years would work out as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No. of nursery school accommodation at the rate of 5,000 new places a year for five years</th>
<th>Cost per head</th>
<th>Total cost</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>25,000</td>
<td>£11 8s. 9d.</td>
<td>£275,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

II. The Raising of the School Age.

According to the Board's figures, there were 465,130 children between the ages of fourteen and fifteen who, in 1922-23, left elementary schools after becoming totally exempt from attendance, and another 26,460 left school between the ages of twelve and fourteen. The combined figure of 491,500 may be taken as about the number of children who would be affected by the raising of the school age to fifteen. Some of this number, however, say 25 per cent., would be exempted under the provision in our scheme which, during a period of transition, permits the authority to release young people over fourteen who have found "suitable and beneficial" employment. The net addition to the school population would be thus about 368,600 children. The cost of maintaining these children in ordinary

---

3The average cost of a place in an ordinary elementary school is £11 8s. 9d. per annum, but would be rather less for younger than for older children.

4Exemption for children under fourteen was discontinued as from July, 1922.
elementary schools, as at present organised, may be estimated as follows:—

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No. of children</th>
<th>Cost per head</th>
<th>Total cost</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Children between fourteen and fifteen added to the elementary school population as at present organised</td>
<td>368,600</td>
<td>£12</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Our scheme requires, however, that children over eleven should be taught, not in ordinary elementary schools, but in schools of the secondary type, so that the statement as it stands does not represent all the expenditure involved by the raising of the school age. The further cost of providing new secondary and other accommodation is included in a later estimate. (See page 84).

III. ALLOWANCES FOR MAINTENANCE.

Of this group 368,600 children between fourteen and fifteen retained at school, it is probable that at least one-third, or 122,860, would be in need of maintenance, the cost of which may be estimated as follows:—

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No. of children</th>
<th>Cost per head</th>
<th>Total cost</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Additional allowances for maintenance</td>
<td>122,860</td>
<td>£10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

IV. ABOLITION OF FEES IN SECONDARY SCHOOLS.

The income from fees was estimated by the Departmental Committee on Scholarships and Free Places (1920) at £2,000,000. This figure, therefore, may be taken as the price of abolishing fees in existing secondary schools.

---

*The average cost per head in an ordinary elementary school is £11 8s. 9d. per annum, but would be slightly higher for older than for younger children.

*The average cost of allowances for maintenance was estimated by the Departmental Committee on Scholarships and Free Places (1920) at £8 9s. 0d. per head per annum, so that the figure given would allow for some increase in the amount of the allowance.
V. TRANSFER OF ELEMENTARY PUPILS OVER ELEVEN TO SECONDARY, "CENTRAL" SCHOOLS, &C.

Our scheme proposes that all children over eleven should be transferred from elementary schools to separately organised schools of a secondary type. The number of children over eleven in elementary schools is now 1,997,000, or 1,897,150, if we deduct the five per cent. now already accommodated in "central" schools. The total number of pupils concerned, including the 368,600 children between fourteen and fifteen to be added to the school population, may thus be estimated at 2,265,750. It may be anticipated that of these, 360,000—a number equivalent to an additional ten places in secondary schools per thousand of the general population—would be accommodated in new secondary schools, while the remaining 1,905,750 children would be provided for, say, one-quarter, or 476,430, in new "central" schools approximating to the secondary school type, and the rest in ordinary elementary schools temporarily adapted to a higher curriculum.

The annual cost would work out as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Description</th>
<th>No. of children</th>
<th>Cost per head per annum</th>
<th>Total cost</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>New places in secondary schools</td>
<td>360,000</td>
<td>£30</td>
<td>£10,800,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New places in &quot;central&quot; schools</td>
<td>476,430</td>
<td>£20</td>
<td>£9,528,600</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Places in adapted elementary schools</td>
<td>1,429,320</td>
<td>£15.10</td>
<td>£21,439,800</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deduct cost of places in ordinary elementary</td>
<td>2,265,750</td>
<td>£12</td>
<td>£27,189,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>schools</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The figures include the 368,600 children between fourteen and fifteen to be added to the school population.

The average expenditure per head in 1922-23 was £26 6s. od. excluding capital charges, for which we allow a sum of £3 14s. od., being about equivalent to 5½ per cent. or an estimated capital outlay of £74 per place.

In London the average cost per head in "central" schools is about two-thirds of that in a secondary school.

A sum of £3 is added to the cost of a place in an ordinary elementary school so as to allow for a practical room and a slightly superior standard of staffing and equipment.
VI. UNIVERSITY SCHOLARSHIPS.

Our scheme proposes that authorities should provide one university scholarship covering all expenses of maintenance, for every fifty of the secondary school population. The number of awards to be made annually on this basis may be estimated at about 7,000, each scholarship being held for three years. The total number of scholarships to be provided by authorities would be thus 21,000, or 14,000 if we deduct the existing provision estimated at about 7,000. The large majority of students may be expected to attend local universities, but a certain number would proceed to universities involving extra expenses of journeys, lodging, and in some cases residence in college.

The following table shows the estimated additional annual expenditure involved under our scheme:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Estimated No. of students</th>
<th>Cost per head</th>
<th>Total cost</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>New University Scholarships</td>
<td>14,000</td>
<td>£120 11</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

VII. GRANTS IN AID OF THE UNIVERSITIES, TECHNICAL INSTITUTES, &c.

We propose that the present annual expenditure on university grants should be doubled, involving an additional outlay of £1,250,000, while a further sum of £250,000 should be allocated to university tutorial classes. Additional grants to technical institutes, art schools, agricultural colleges and other places of higher education may be estimated at the round sum of £1,000,000 per annum.

According to the Board's returns, 2,889 students proceeded in 1920-21 from grant-aided secondary schools to a university, the majority of these being assisted out of public funds. A certain proportion of students, probably about one-third, would, however, have taken only a two years' course. Assuming the same number of university scholarships to have been awarded in subsequent years, the number of scholarships now held would be roughly equivalent to 1,926 scholarships awarded each year for three years, and 963 scholarships awarded each year for two years, making in all 7,704 scholarships.

The figure is estimated so as to provide scholarships averaging £100 per annum, a further sum of £20 being added so as to cover special expenses of residence, &c., where the student attends a non-local university. A student without private means proceeding to Oxford or Cambridge could not do so on less than £200 per annum.
VIII. STAFFING IN ELEMENTARY SCHOOLS.

Our proposal is to limit the size of classes in elementary schools to 40 pupils within a period of five years. All classroom accommodation would be "written down" to this limit, and the estimated displacement of 746,000 children made good by the transfer of a corresponding number of elementary pupils over eleven to more advanced types of school. The cost would be thus equivalent to the difference between the cost of a place in one type of school or another, but is already fully covered in our estimate for providing 800,000 new places in secondary or "central" schools.

The proposed reduction in the size of elementary classes, on the other hand, would entail, more especially in large towns, a certain increase in elementary staffs. The average figure would be raised, say, from 31.3 to 33.3 teachers per thousand pupils. There would be thus one teacher on the average for every thirty pupils, which margin should be sufficient to allow for any necessary adjustments in order to bring down classes to the proposed forty limit. Over-eleven classes tend already in this direction, but whatever expenditure would be involved is included in the estimates for transferring children of this age to higher types of school, or adapting the elementary school to a higher curriculum. No provision has, however, been made as regards the 3,614,000 children under eleven remaining in ordinary elementary schools. On the basis of two additional teachers per thousand pupils, another 7,228 teachers would need to be added to existing staffs, and according to our scheme should be all certificated teachers.

The cost would be as follows:—

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>New elementary teachers</th>
<th>No. of teachers</th>
<th>Cost per head per annum</th>
<th>Total cost</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>7,228</td>
<td>£256(^{13})</td>
<td>£1,850,368</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\(^{13}\)The figure represents the average salary of a woman certificated assistant teacher, namely £250 per annum, so weighted as to allow for the appointment of ten per cent. of men teachers. The proportion of men certificated assistant teachers taking classes of children all under eleven is now about six per cent.
Our proposal to restrict the employment of unqualified teachers further would entail some additional expenditure on teachers' salaries. Where such restrictions were in force, every year would see a steady decline in the number of supplementary teachers. It may be anticipated that in five years this number would have fallen by at least 25 per cent., equivalent to 2,800 teachers. A number of these would be replaced by certificated teachers, but others by uncertificated teachers prohibited under our scheme from taking classes of children over eleven. The addition to salaries involved may be estimated as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Displacement of 2,800 supplementary teachers by</th>
<th>Difference in average salary</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Certificated teachers</td>
<td>£150 p.a.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uncertificated teachers 14</td>
<td>£50 p.a.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>£210,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>£70,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>£280,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Some increase of expenditure is entailed in connection with our proposals for improving the preliminary education of teachers, but should be covered by the estimates for additional free places, and aid to students, in secondary schools and universities.

IX. THE REBUILDING OF ELEMENTARY SCHOOLS.

We propose a building programme which would provide for the rebuilding of insanitary and antiquated elementary schools at the rate of 120,000 places each year, equivalent to twice the rate of building in the five years before the war. The cost of building ordinary elementary schools (apart from the site) is estimated by the L.C.C. in its new building programme at £32 10s. od. per place, but the cost in many places is £30 or less and could probably be further reduced by experiment in lighter and less permanent forms of building. An average sum of £33½ per place should be thus sufficient to cover such further expenditure as might be involved by our proposals to raise the present standard as regards sites, floor-space, sanitary accommodation, &c.

14There are in all some 1,600 uncertificated teachers taking classes of children all over eleven.
The total annual cost may be estimated as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No. of places</th>
<th>Cost per place</th>
<th>Total cost</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Five years’ output of elementary schools at the rate of 120,000 places a year</td>
<td>£33½</td>
<td>£20,000,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Interest and sinking fund estimated at 5½% p.a.¹¹

£1,100,000

X. ELEMENTARY SCHOOL EQUIPMENT.

We propose to improve the supply of furniture, books, apparatus, stationery, &c. While the L.C.C. spent in 1923-24 under this head £1 19s. 9d. for every pupil in a “central” school, the corresponding figure for elementary schools was only 12s. 5d. per pupil. As regards the 3,614,000 children under eleven remaining in ordinary elementary schools, there should be an all-round advance of at least 3s. per head on present expenditure.

The total cost may be given as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No. of children</th>
<th>Cost per annum</th>
<th>Total cost</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>New equipment in elementary schools</td>
<td>3,614,000</td>
<td>3/-</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

XI. MEDICAL SERVICES.

Our scheme has in view a considerable expansion of the school medical service. The most important items involving additional expenditure are as follows:

(1) To abolish parents' fees estimated at £30,000 per annum.

(2) To increase the provision of dental treatment so that in five years at least one-third of all children, or about one-half the estimated number in need of it, should obtain it.

(3) To increase the staff of school nurses, say, by the appointment of 300 additional whole-time nurses every year, being an average of one new appointment each year in every area up to the required standard.

¹¹The figure is estimated so as to cover interest on capital at the rate of 4½ per cent., or a fraction over, and a premium for a sinking fund calculated on a 40 years’ basis at 4½% per cent. The rate of interest taken is the current rate on Government loans. The cost of building under our scheme (see page 91) would be largely met by means of a special grant from the Treasury which further should guarantee any building loan raised by local authorities.
(4) To increase the accommodation in special schools according to the needs of each area, say, at the rate of 2,000 additional places every year until all defective children are accommodated in schools of the type best suited to their special needs.

(5) To provide a midday meal as a part of the ordinary curriculum where the school is at a distance from the children's homes and the doctor advises it, or the parents claim it. The number of children to be immediately provided for may be estimated at 200,000, the cost of the actual food being recovered in most cases from the parents.

(6) To provide milk meals (½ pint of milk and biscuit) for all children where the doctor orders it, or the parents claim it. The number of children to be supplied free of charge, in addition to those already provided for, may be estimated at 250,000.

The following table gives a rough estimate of the annual cost under each head:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No. of children</th>
<th>Cost per head per annum</th>
<th>Total cost</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Abolition of parents' fees</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>s. d.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dental treatment</td>
<td>1,800,000</td>
<td>6/8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School nurses</td>
<td>1,500</td>
<td>£200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Special schools</td>
<td>10,000</td>
<td>£32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School dinners</td>
<td>200,000</td>
<td>£25 plus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Milk meals</td>
<td>250,000</td>
<td>30/-</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

18The average cost per annum in London.
19The average cost per annum in London. The actual figure is £48, but from this should be deducted the cost in an ordinary elementary school, namely, £16 10s. 6d.
20The figure represents the cost of administration at the present average rate of 1½d. per meal, the meal being provided on five days a week for 40 weeks, plus a sum of £50,000 per annum for assistance in necessitous cases. Assuming some improvement in the quality of the food, the cost at present prices to be charged to the parents may be estimated at about 3d. per dinner for children under eleven and from 4d. to 5d. for older children, the sum varying to some extent with the type of district.
21The cost of the milk meal is estimated at 1½d. per meal, namely ½ pint plus about a farthing for biscuit and administrative charges. The meal would be provided, as a rule, on every school day, i.e., on five days a week for 40 weeks.
### Summary of Cost

Estimated additional yearly expenditure at the end of a five years' development:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Cost</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Nursery schools</td>
<td>£275,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Raising of the school age</td>
<td>£4,423,200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Allowances for maintenance</td>
<td>£1,228,600</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abolition of fees in secondary schools</td>
<td>£2,000,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transfer of elementary pupils to schools of the secondary type</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University and higher technical scholarships</td>
<td>£1,680,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grants to universities, university tutorial classes, technical institutes, &amp;c.</td>
<td>£2,500,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Staffing in elementary schools</td>
<td>£2,130,360</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rebuilding of elementary schools</td>
<td>£1,100,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elementary school equipment</td>
<td>£542,100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medical services</td>
<td>£1,933,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Total cost for 1923-24 (including Treasury Grants to the universities): £32,391,660

### How the Money Would Be Raised

We take the view that, with the expansion of the educational system, an increasing share of the total cost should be borne from national funds, in order not to add unduly to the already heavy burden of local rates. The present system of rating amounts to what is virtually a single tax on housing which, for obvious reasons, presses more heavily on poor men than on rich men, and with the utmost severity on large families. It is an essential part of our programme that:

1. At least 80 per cent. of the cost of allowances for maintenance granted to young people of 14 and over should be paid by the Treasury.
2. The State contribution in respect of university and higher technical education should be greatly increased.
3. The whole cost of the professional training of teachers should be borne out of national funds.
4. Further, we propose that the State should undertake the greater part of the cost of making good the heavy arrears of school building.
Our view is as follows:—

(1) The Treasury should set aside a sum of £5,000,000 per annum for five years, or £25,000,000 in all, to be allocated to authorities as a non-recurrent special grant-in-aid of school building, and out of this sum should offer to pay a super-grant, being not less than two-thirds or more than three-quarters of local expenditure, on all school building undertaken by an authority during the five years period in excess of the building programme which such an authority might reasonably be expected to carry out.20

(2) The special grant should be earmarked for (a) the building of new secondary and “central” schools, (b) the rebuilding on modern lines of insanitary or antiquated elementary schools.

Authorities would thus be encouraged to extend and put forward their schemes so as to take the greatest possible advantage of the super grant while the offer was open. The need for school building is almost as pressing as the need to build houses, and calls for similar measures of State encouragement and assistance. The present reluctance of many local authorities to engage on big schemes of school building may no doubt be traced to some extent to the practical difficulties in the way of carrying out the work, e.g., high cost of building materials, shortage of skilled labour, the claims of other types of building, &c., but difficulties of this kind are not impossible to overcome. In so far as the building of schools would interfere at all with other forms of building, it should be with the building of hotels, shops, theatres and such like “luxury” building, rather than with housing schemes. Where authorities have really wanted to build schools they have found no insuperable obstacle in the way. The greatest hindrance has been the unwillingness, or inability, of authorities to undertake the necessary capital expenditure.

20 The proportion now borne by the Treasury is only 20 per cent. in respect of elementary schools, except in London where it is 50 per cent., and 50 per cent. in respect of secondary schools.

21 The expectation might be based on the average rate of school building in the five years before the war.
CAN THE NATION AFFORD TO PAY?

Can the nation afford to spend so great a sum on education as £107,000,000 or £117,000,000 if we include Scotland? In other words, is our scheme a reasonable position? It is a question of relativity. For no conclusion can be drawn as to the reasonableness, or otherwise, of the sum to be spent unless this sum is brought into relation with other items of expenditure in the budgets both of the State and of private individuals. The following items of expenditure may be compared with the cost of education.

1. The total national income amounted in 1923-24 to £3,400,000,000 (The Economist, October 4th, 1924), of which more than one-third is in the hands of those persons and their families who have incomes of £1,000 a year and over, though they form only about one-thirtieth of the community.

2. The distribution of the national income in 1923 was as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Amount</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rent</td>
<td>280,000,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interest</td>
<td>840,000,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Profits and salaries</td>
<td>820,000,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wages</td>
<td>1,360,000,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>£3,400,000,000</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3. The total public expenditure in the year 1923-24 was about £790,000,000.

4. The nation pays in interest alone on the national debt over £300,000,000 a year.

5. The annual expenditure on the army, navy and services in 1924-25, after six years of peace, was £115,000,000.

6. The cost of building one battleship is nearly £10,000,000.

7. It was estimated by Professor Marshall in 1913 that the wealthier classes spent £400,000,000 a year on luxuries and unnecessaries. The large increase since the war is shown by the aggregate income enjoyed by these classes suggesting that the figure would be now at least £600,000,000 a year.

*"Facts for Socialists," Fabian Tract, published 1926.*
PROBLEMS OF FINANCE

(8) The national bill for drink in 1923, after deducting the yield of taxation, was £160,000,000 (The Observer, October 15th, 1925). The profits on beer alone were £19,000,000, or more than twice the sum in 1913.

(9) The gross yearly bill for tobacco in 1924 was £118,000,000, or £120,000,000, if we include pipes and other smokers’ accessories (The Times Tobacco Supplement, October 20th, 1925). The duty on this sum was estimated at £51,000,000.

It is plain that a nation which has so large an income to spend, and so lavishly spends it, or wastes it, on things, at best, unproductive or merely luxuries, at worst, sources of danger and disease, will not be crushed, and may be even re-enforced by spending something more on education. The total annual expenditure proposed under our scheme at the end of a five years’ development amounts to less than one-thirtieth of the total national income, and to less than one-seventh of the total public expenditure. Every country must depend, in the long run, on the physical and mental vigour of its people. In a sense, and to a large degree, this health of body and mind is purchaseable. Money spent on education is more than a “business proposition,” it is the only national investment which is sure of a large and ever increasing return.