

5781

578

Dhananjayrao Gadgil Library



GIPE-PUNE-005781

INDUSTRIAL RELATIONS

FINAL REPORT AND TESTIMONY
SUBMITTED TO CONGRESS BY THE
COMMISSION ON INDUSTRIAL RELATIONS

CREATED BY THE ACT OF
AUGUST 23, 1912

VOL. I



WASHINGTON
GOVERNMENT PRINTING OFFICE
1916

X : 981.73-N12t
E6.1

AUTHORITY TO PRINT.

[Public Resolution No. 15, Sixty-fourth Congress, first session.]

Resolved by the Senate and House of Representatives of the United States of America in Congress assembled, That the final report of the United States Commission on Industrial Relations, including the report of Basil M. Manly, director of research and investigation, and the individual reports and statements of the several commissioners, together with all the testimony taken at its hearings, except exhibits submitted in printed form, which shall be appropriately referred to in said testimony, be printed as a Senate document under the direction of the Joint Committee on Printing; and that ten thousand additional copies be printed and bound in cloth, of which two thousand five hundred copies shall be for the use of the Senate and seven thousand five hundred copies for the use of the House of Representatives; and that of the final report of said commission one hundred thousand additional copies be printed, of which thirty thousand copies shall be for the use of the Senate and seventy thousand copies for the use of the House of Representatives: *Provided,* That the superintendent of documents is hereby authorized to reprint copies of the ~~same~~ for sale or distribution as provided by law.

Approved, April 28, 1916.

5781

CONTENTS OF VOLUME 1

	Page.
Final report of commission (see special table of contents, pp. 7-8).....	5-269
Testimony taken at hearings.....	271-1024
Suggestions of expert witnesses.....	273-398
J. D. Beck, member, Wisconsin Industrial Commission.....	278
C. W. Price, assistant to the Industrial Commission of Wisconsin.....	285
B. W. Campbell, chairman, central safety committee, Illinois Steel Co., Chicago.....	294
W. H. Cameron, secretary, National Council of Safety.....	307
Mrs. Raymond Robbins, president, National Women's Trade-Union League.....	309
John B. Andrews, secretary, American Association for Labor Legislation.....	319
Herbert Quick, author and farmer.....	320
Charles W. Holman, University of Texas.....	333
John A. Fitch, industrial editor, "The Survey".....	334
William M. Leiserson, deputy, Industrial Commission of Wisconsin.....	344
F. C. Croxton, president, American Association of Free Public Employment Offices.....	357, 392
Edward T. Devine, Columbia University.....	358
L. A. Halbert, superintendent, Kansas City Board of Public Welfare.....	360, 364
James H. Boyd, ex-chairman, Employers' Liability Commission of Ohio.....	370
Charles McCarthy, Legislative Reference Bureau of Wisconsin.....	377
Meyer Bloomfield, director, Vocational Bureau of Boston.....	390
Trade agreements in collective bargaining.....	399-761
John Mitchell, member, New York State Workingmen's Compensation Commission.....	401
Francis S. Peabody, coal operator.....	428
Frank J. Hayes, international vice president, United Mine Workers of America.....	449
O. P. Briggs, ex-president, National Founders' Association.....	456, 550
Joseph F. Valentine, president, International Molders' Union.....	481
Thomas J. Hogan, secretary Stove Founders' National Defense Association.....	510
John P. Frey, executive officer and editor, International Molders' Union.....	524
Joseph Schaffner, secretary and treasurer, Hart, Schaffner & Marx, Chicago.....	564, 574
Sidney Hillman, president, Cloak and Skirt Makers' Union, New York.....	566
Earl Dean Howard, manager, labor department, Hart, Schaffner & Marx, Chicago.....	571, 592
Julius Henry Cohen, counsel, Cloak, Suit, and Skirt Manufacturers' Protective Association.....	575, 587
A. Bisno, chairman, educational committee, Cloak Makers' Union, New York.....	579
James M. Lynch, commissioner of labor, State of New York.....	594
Albert W. Finlay, chairman, executive committee, United Typothetæ of America.....	609
George L. Berry, president, International Printing Pressmen and Assistants' Union.....	620
Otto M. Eidlitz, general contractor, New York.....	644

Testimony taken at hearings—Continued.

Trade agreements in collective bargaining—Continued.

	Page.
W. J. Spencer, building-trades department, American Federation of Labor.....	659
Henry Struble, secretary, National Cut Stone Contractors' Association.....	665
Thomas J. Williams, president, building trades department, American Federation of Labor.....	675
Edward A. Crane, architect, Philadelphia.....	681
Charles Francis, president, Printers' League of America.....	683
J. E. Williams, mediator of labor disputes.....	697
W. L. Mackenzie King, former minister of labor, Ottawa, Canada.....	713, 732
Samuel Gompers, president, American Federation of Labor.....	718, 738
James A. Emery, counsel, National Association of Manufacturers.....	724, 745
Exhibits, printing trades.....	748
Exhibits, building trades.....	760
Efficiency systems and labor.....	763-1024
Frederick W. Taylor, consulting engineer, Philadelphia.....	765, 795
John F. Tobin, president, Boot and Shoe Workers' Union, Boston.....	810
Harrington Emerson, standard of practice and efficiency engineer.....	822, 1021
Charles W. Mixer, time-study man Sentinel Automatic Gas Appliance Co., New Haven.....	835
Robert G. Valentine, industrial counselor.....	852
James M. Dodge, chairman, Link Belt Co., Philadelphia.....	862
P. J. Conlon, vice president, International Association of Machinists.....	873
David Van Alstyne, assistant to president, New York, New Haven & Hartford Railroad.....	883
Carl G. Barth, consulting engineer, Philadelphia.....	886
A. J. Berres, secretary-treasurer, metal-trades department, American Federation of Labor.....	899
Sanford E. Thompson, consulting engineer, Boston.....	913, 928
N. P. Alfias, president, district No. 44, International Association of Machinists.....	940
Henry Lawrence Gantt, consulting engineer, Montclair, N. J.....	955
James Duncan, president, Granite Cutters' International Association of America.....	965
John Golden, president, United Textile Workers of America.....	985, 1012
Louis D. Brandeis, counselor at law, Boston.....	991

5781

**FINAL REPORT OF THE
COMMISSION ON
INDUSTRIAL RELATIONS**

**INCLUDING THE
REPORT OF BASIL M. MANLY, DIRECTOR
OF RESEARCH AND INVESTIGATION
AND THE
INDIVIDUAL REPORTS AND STATEMENTS
OF THE SEVERAL COMMISSIONERS**

THE COMMISSION ON INDUSTRIAL RELATIONS.

FRANK P. WALSH, Missouri, *Chairman.*

JOHN R. COMMONS, Wisconsin.

S. THRUSTON BALLARD, Kentucky.

FLORENCE J. HARRIMAN, New York.

JOHN B. LENNON, Illinois.

RICHARD H. AISHTON, Illinois.¹

JAMES O'CONNELL, District of Columbia.

HARRIS WEINSTOCK, California.

AUSTIN B. GARRETSON, Iowa.

LEWIS K. BROWN, *Secretary.*

WILLIAM O. THOMPSON, *Counsel.*

BASIL M. MANLY, *Director of Research and Investigation.*

EXTRACT FROM ACT OF CONGRESS OF AUGUST 23, 1912, CREATING AND DEFINING THE DUTIES OF THE COMMISSION ON INDUSTRIAL RELATIONS.

That a commission is hereby created to be called the Commission on Industrial Relations. Said commission shall be composed of nine persons, to be appointed by the President of the United States, by and with the advice and consent of the Senate, not less than three of whom shall be employers of labor and not less than three of whom shall be representatives of organized labor.

* * * * *

SEC. 4. That the commission shall inquire into the general condition of labor in the principal industries of the United States, including agriculture, and especially in those which are carried on in corporate forms; into existing relations between employers and employees; into the effect of industrial conditions on public welfare and into the rights and powers of the community to deal therewith; into the conditions of sanitation and safety of employees and the provisions for protecting the life, limb, and health of the employees; into the growth of associations of employers and of wage earners and the effect of such associations upon the relations between employers and employees; into the extent and results of methods of collective bargaining; into any methods which have been tried in any State or in foreign countries for maintaining mutually satisfactory relations between employees and employers; into methods for avoiding or adjusting labor disputes through peaceful and conciliatory mediation and negotiations; into the scope, methods, and resources of existing bureaus of labor and into possible ways of increasing their usefulness; into the question of smuggling or other illegal entry of Asiatics into the United States or its insular possessions, and of the methods by which such Asiatics have gained and are gaining such admission, and shall report to Congress as speedily as possible, with such recommendation as said commission may think proper to prevent such smuggling and illegal entry. The commission shall seek to discover the underlying causes of dissatisfaction in the industrial situation and report its conclusions thereon.

¹ Appointed commissioner Mar. 17, 1915, to serve the unexpired term of Hon. F. A. Delano, resigned.

CONTENTS OF FINAL REPORT.

	Page.
Letter of transmittal.....	9
I.	
REPORT OF BASIL M. MANLY, DIRECTOR OF RESEARCH AND INVESTIGATION, SIGNED BY COMMISSIONERS WALSH, LENNON, O'CONNELL, AND GARRESON.....	11-152
Letter of submittal.....	13
Introduction.....	17
Method and character of investigation.....	19
Classification of witnesses upon industrial subjects.....	20
Summary of conclusions and recommendations.....	21-68
Labor conditions in the principal industries, including agriculture.....	21
Existing relations between employers and employees.....	25
Causes of industrial unrest.....	29
Unjust distribution of wealth and income.....	30
Unemployment and denial of opportunity to earn a living.....	35
Denial of justice.....	38
Denial of the right of organization.....	61
Conclusions and recommendations.....	69-152
I. Industrial conditions of adult workmen in general industries.....	68
Wages.....	68
Hours of labor.....	69
Safety and sanitation.....	69
Housing.....	70
II. Women and children in industry.....	71
III. Industrial conditions and relations on public utilities.....	73
General.....	73
Telegraph.....	74
Telephones.....	75
The Pullman Co.....	76
Railroads.....	77
IV. Industrial conditions in isolated communities.....	78
V. The concentration of wealth and influence.....	80
VI. The land question and the condition of agricultural labor.....	86
VII. Judicial settlement of labor claims and complaints.....	89
VIII. The law relating to trade unions and industrial disputes.....	90
IX. The policing of industry.....	92
The origin of industrial violence.....	92
State constabulary.....	97
Free speech.....	98
X. The conditions and problems of migratory laborers.....	101
XI. Unemployment.....	103
Extent and character of unemployment.....	103
Existing conditions of employment.....	106
Existing agencies for employment.....	108
Public employment agencies.....	112
XII. Organization, methods and policies of trade unions.....	115
XIII. Organization, methods and policies of employers' associations.....	117
XIV. Joint agreements.....	119
XV. Agencies of mediation, investigation, and arbitration.....	120
Proposed plan of a national system.....	121
Organization.....	121
Powers, duties, and jurisdiction.....	123
Cooperation.....	124
XVI. Industrial conditions and the public health—Sickness insurance.....	124
XVII. Education in relation to industry. (See Report of Commissioner John B. Lennon on Industrial Education, p. 253).....	127
XVIII. Scientific management.....	127
Possible benefits to labor and society.....	128
Diversities and defects.....	129
General labor problems.....	139
Conclusions.....	143
XIX. Prison labor.....	143
XX. Immigration.....	144
XXI. Labor conditions in American colonial possessions.....	145
XXII. Chinese exclusion.....	147
Constructive suggestions:	
Changes in the law.....	147
United States commissioners.....	149
The judicial system.....	149
General administration.....	149
Selection of inspectors.....	149
Chinese interpreters.....	150
Staff organization at Washington.....	150
Salary plan.....	151
Redistricting.....	152

	Page.
SUPPLEMENTAL STATEMENT OF CHAIRMAN FRANK P. WALSH.....	153
SUPPLEMENTAL STATEMENT OF COMMISSIONER AUSTIN B. GARRETSON.....	158
SUPPLEMENTAL STATEMENT OF COMMISSIONERS JOHN B. LENNON AND JAMES O'CONNELL.....	161
Criticism not justified.....	161
Strong organizations the cure.....	162
The evidence.....	162
Extent of unrest.....	163
New governmental machinery unwise.....	164
The one true remedy.....	165
The public's duty.....	166

II.

REPORT OF COMMISSIONERS JOHN R. COMMONS AND FLORENCE J. HARRIMAN, SIGNED BY COMMISSIONERS COMMONS, HARRIMAN, WEINSTOCK, BALLARD, AND AISHTON.....	166-230
Enactment, interpretation, and enforcement of labor law.....	171
Industrial commissions.....	173
Advisory representative council.....	176
Civil service and comments on preceding paragraphs.....	180
Commissions and class conflicts.....	182
Investigations.....	191
Rules and regulations.....	195
Review by commission.....	198
Court review.....	199
Testimony.....	200
Continuous industry, employment and insurance.....	200
Police and military.....	201
Legal aid.....	202
Legislation.....	203
Supreme courts.....	204
Mediation and minimum wage.....	206
Trade disputes.....	214
Foundations.....	220
Subsidies.....	221
Federal fund for social welfare.....	221
Immigration.....	225
Farmers and farm laborers.....	226
Corporation control.....	228
Dissenting opinion of Commissioner Harris Weinstock.....	230
REPORT OF COMMISSIONERS WEINSTOCK, BALLARD, AND AISHTON:	
Points of dissent.....	231
Employers' objection to organized labor, fear of—	
Sympathetic strikes.....	235
Jurisdictional disputes.....	236
Labor union politics.....	237
Contract breaking.....	237
Restriction of output.....	238
Prohibition of use of nonunion-made tools and material.....	240
Closed shop.....	240
Contests for supremacy between rival unions.....	242
Acts of violence.....	242
Apprenticeship rules.....	246
SUPPLEMENTAL STATEMENT OF COMMISSIONER S. THEUSTON BALLARD.....	249

III.

REPORT OF COMMISSIONER JOHN B. LENNON ON INDUSTRIAL EDUCATION, SIGNED BY COMMISSIONERS LENNON, O'CONNELL, GARRETSON, BALLARD, AND WALSH.....	253-261
Demand for industrial education.....	255
Control of vocational schools.....	257
General recommendations.....	258
Continuation of part-time schools.....	259
Teachers.....	260
Conclusions.....	260

IV.

ADDITIONAL FINDINGS OF FACT, CONCLUSIONS, AND RECOMMENDATIONS.....	263-267
--	---------