

## CONTENTS.

### Proceedings of the Sabha:—

I. Village Sanitation in India.

### Independent Section :—

I. The New Mhowra Bill No. II.

II. The Brahmins of Bengal and Kulinism.

# ANIK SABHA.

... wants and wishes of the inhabi-  
... being appointed on a popular elective  
... under rules framed for the purpose.

WALEKAR'S WADA, DANE ALI.

## LIST OF OFFICERS.

### President.

**H. H. Shrinivas Rao Parashram Pandit alias Rao Sahab**  
Pant Pratinidhi, Chief of Oundha.

### Vice-Presidents.

H. H. Dhundiraj Chintaman alias Tatya Sahab Patwardhan, Chief of Sangli.	H. H. Gunpatrao Harihar alias Bapu Sahab Patwardhan, young- er Chief of Kurundwad.
H. H. Mudhojirao Naik Nimbalkar, Chief of Falton.	H. H. Hariharrao Vinayak alias Daji Sahab Patwardhan, Chief of Kurundwad.
H. H. Ramchandraro Gopal alias Appa Sahab Patwardhan, Chief of Jamkhindi.	H. H. Toolajeo Raje Bhosle, Chief of Akalkote.

### MANAGING COMMITTEE FOR 1892-93.

*Chairman*—**RAO BAHADUR VISHNU MORESHWAR BHIDE.**

#### *Members of the Managing Committee.*

H. B. Gopalrao Hari Deshmukhi.	Ramchandra M. Sano Esqr.
R. B. Gunesb Govind Gokhale.	Waman Vishnu Lele Esqr.
R. B. Narayan Bhai Dandekar.	Mahomed Sidik Esqr.
R. S. Chintamanrao V. Natu.	Dorabjee Dadabhoy Butee Esqr.
R. S. Balwantrao Bapuji Phadke.	Gangaram Bhaui Mhaske Esqr.
R. S. Malhavrao Sakharappa Vaidya.	Rajanna Lingoo Esqr.
R. S. Naro Bhaskar Dewdhar.	Vishnudas Harikisondas Esqr.
R. S. Damodar J. Gokhale.	Sakharam R. Joshi Esqr.
R. S. Sadashiv R. Medatkar.	Bhasker Ramchandra Sahasra- bhide.
R. B. Koopswami Vijayarungam.	Wasudeo L. Athawale Esqr.
Professor Bal Gangadhar Tilak.	Nathamal Bharmal Esqr.
„ Gopal Krishna Gokhale.	R. S. Waman Prabhakar Bhawe.
„ Waman S. Apte.	Vinayak Narayen Apte Esqr.
Govind M. Gadre Esqr.	Waman Balkrishna Ranade Esqr.
R. S. Raghonath Daji Nagarkar.	R. S. Sitaram Hari Chiplonkar.
Krishnarao B. Mande Esqr.	Shivram Hari Sathe Esquire.
Govind Ballal Deval Esqr.	Raghunath Narayen Pandit Esqr.

### Treasurer.

**R. S. CHINTAMANRAO VISHWANATH ALIAS BHAI SAHEB NATU.**

### Auditor.

**GOVIND MAHADEO GADRE ESQR. PLEADER.**

**NARAYENRAO CHINTAMAN FADTARE ESQR.**

### Honorary Secretaries.

**GOPAL KRISHNA GOKHALE B. A.**  
**HARI SATHE ESQR.**

# PROCEEDINGS OF THE

## VILLAGE SANITATION IN INDIA.

TO THE JOINT SECRETARIES,

Poona Sarvajanic Sabha, Poona.

GENTLEMEN,

Having expressed to Sir WILLIAM WEDDERBURN the deep interest which I feel in the Bill now under consideration, "to make better provision for Village Conservancy in the Bombay Presidency," I have been advised by him to address the Poona Sarvajanic Sabha with a view to bespeak their special support in favour of Village Sanitation, and to obtain their advice as to the practical steps which can best be taken towards that end. Accordingly, I have ventured to send you these few lines, and I trust you will have the goodness to lay them before the Council of the Association for their favourable consideration.

It appears to me that what is wanted is, as in England, an Act to enable the people, under proper supervision, to organise themselves in the villages for sanitary purposes; the villagers doing the work themselves with the requisite guidance from skilled authority—that is, from the Sanitary Commissioner and the officers of his department. As yet, the higher officers are Europeans, but the time will come, we hope, when these duties will be performed by trained Indian Sanitarians. [It is a truism, but a truism much neglected among us, that it takes a lifetime to make a Sanitarian.] The problem seems to be to combine efficiency with freedom; to provide the impulse and the science from the central authority, without undue local interference; so as to produce a stirring practical sanitary executive which will inspire and direct the willing co-operation of every villager. Looking to the public opinion in such matters

*of the Sabha.*

... of this problem does not appear to be hopeless. For but little money expenditure is required. At certain seasons, when cultivation is not going on, the villagers have much leisure time on their hands, and the works required for cleanliness and a village supply of fire water are generally of a simple kind. And how could the villagers better employ such leisure time than in making their village more healthy and more pleasant for themselves and their families?

There is, of course, daily removal to be provided for of fou matters. But a simple organisation for doing this has been familiar to Indians from time immemorial.

In persuading the villagers and in directing them, the officers of the sanitary department would act as missionaries and preachers of health and cleanliness.

Important help would also be given in the same direction if simple lessons on sanitary matters were included in the text-books for primary schools.

The Sabha are far better informed than I can be regarding the condition of Indian villages, but I would urge upon their notice the fact that, from sanitary reports, it appears that preventable epidemics in the villages are on the increase. The increase of epidemic deaths in 1884 over 1883 was 583,000, and they were still increasing up to our last reports. Does not the protection of life and property from preventable epidemics rank next to protection of life and property from criminals, as a responsibility of Government, if, indeed, it is not even higher in importance? For, since the world began, criminals have not apparently destroyed more life and property than do epidemics every year in India. From the point of view of humanity the need of action is very pressing. And even from a financial point of view there will be gain rather than loss. There is a saving of money as well as of life by sanitary measures. Men must live and be able-bodied in order to plough. Is there not some danger that the population is actually decreasing in vigour? The race deteriorating through preventable epidemics? If so, there will be great financial loss, owing to the decrease of physical human power, and consequently of productiveness. And expenditure to avert this evil will be justified on grounds of ~~the~~ <sup>humanity</sup>. Then, as regards hardship to individuals,



*Proceedings of the Sabha.*

May I cite a case which has come to me direct from another Presidency? The following is the account of the villages described: Typhoid fever lays up the whole population for two months *every year*, with the corresponding loss of productiveness and degeneration of the race. My informant had lost the whole of his family, dead of this typhoid fever; so had, alas! many others. The known causes were that the tanks for drinking-water were fouled by the people, while rank and rotting undergrowths remained uncleared. At last a high-caste Brahmin took up the matter, putting his own hand to the good work, and improvements were effected. These villagers themselves now are awakening to the benefit of such work, and crying out for a little organisation on the part of Government. It is under circumstances like these that I plead for the villages. It appears to be proposed to limit the operation of the Bill to villages of not less than 500 inhabitants. But will not this exclude a large proportion of the whole population from the benefits of sanitation? It appears that out of some 24,600 villages in the Bombay Presidency, only about 9,000 have more than 500 inhabitants; so that about 15,600 villages, or two-thirds of the rural population, would not have the benefit of cleanliness—"simple cleanliness is all we want." The returns show that there is an improvement in the health of the towns having municipal institutions, but these towns have in British India only a population of twelve millions, whereas the villages have a population of 185½ millions, and in these there is a serious increase of preventable epidemics.

In conclusion, I feel confident that the Poona Sarvajanic Sabha, as leaders of public opinion in the Dekkhan, will carefully watch this Bill; that they will take the best means to bring it into a form well suited to local conditions; and, when it is passed into law, that they will use all their influence to make its working effective and beneficial. And I shall esteem it a great favour if, with the permission of the Council, you will inform me how far the provisions of the Bill as it now stands will be effective for the end proposed; and in what respects modifications are required? I shall also be glad to be informed what other practical steps can, in the opinion of the Sabha, be best taken in this most important matter of Village Sanitation?

And

me, Gentlemen—or in all true phrase may I not

*Proceedings of the*

say that I have the honour to be the faithful servant of yourselves and, if it be not too presumptuous, of India?

FLORENCE NIGHTINGALE.

London, W., *February 22, 1887.*

P.S.—For the favour of distribution to Members of the Sabha and others, should the Council so permit it, I forward a few printed copies of this letter. I may mention that I have addressed the Bombay Presidency Association on this subject in similar terms.

F. N.

---

TO THE JOINT SECRETARIES,

Poona Sarvajanic Sabha, Poona.

Gentlemen,

Since I had the honour of addressing you just two years ago on the subject of village Sanitation, there has been published in the "Bombay Government Gazette" of January 24, 1889, a new Draft Bill entitled the Bombay Village Sanitation Bill, 1889, which, in many respects, makes an important advance upon previous projects of legislation. Especially is it a cause for satisfaction that the new Bill proposes to extend the benefits of sanitary legislation to all Bombay's 24,600 villages, without excluding any, as was contemplated by the previous limitation, which, by excluding villages under 500 inhabitants, excluded nearly two-thirds of the total number. You are aware of the great interest I have taken for many years in questions of Indian sanitation, and I am again advised by Sir William Wedderburn to submit for your consideration some points with regard to this amended measure, and to ask the favour of your opinion and advice.

2. The general method which, according to my view, should govern this class of legislation was indicated in my previous letter, namely, that the Act should enable and encourage the people to organise themselves in the villages for sanitary purposes—the villagers themselves doing the work, with the necessary aid; there not in Khandesh unsatisfactory results, stimulate that the Collector or any other high official is filling the village Native, personally

## Proceedings of the Sabha.

department. The villagers should be encouraged to get the necessary work done in their own way, the results being judged by a qualified inspecting officer of the Sanitary Department, upon whose report the Collector would, when necessary, bring pressure to bear to get the work done by village organisation, and only in the last resort cause it to be done through outside agency. The advantage of this method seems to be that the ancient village organisation is thus strengthened and utilised; the hereditary village authorities and servants being gradually trained to the improved methods of performing their customary duties towards the local public, so that eventually the health machinery may come to work almost automatically.

But again would you suffer me to repeat that there must be, as it were, missionaries and preachers of health and cleansing, if any real progress is to be made. In persuading the villagers and in directing them, the officers of the Sanitary Department ought, of course, to act as such. And would you kindly give me your further advice as to how best this important mission can be performed?

3. To those who, like myself, earnestly desire both that the village sanitation should be really effectual and also that it should be carried out by the people themselves with the least possible friction and interference, it will be a cause of rejoicing to find in the new Bill various provisions which will operate in these directions. Prominent among such provisions are the sections (41 and 42) which place the services of the hereditary village servants at the disposal of the village Sanitary Committee, and which ensure to such servants the recovery of their customary dues, provided that their duties have been duly performed. It is believed that indirectly also this provision will be beneficial as tending to remove friction and to produce harmony among the various castes within the village. Again, those sections (28, 30, 38) seem excellent which provide that all money collected in the village, by subscriptions, rates, or fines, shall be spent within the village itself. And I am glad to see that Section 30 contemplates donations and loans being made by District and taken in this most judicious manner to villages for expenditure on sanitary purposes. And you might not also a portion of such donations be made to me, Gentlemen—or in all times as a turban or dress occasion to those Patels



## *Proceedings of the Sabha.*

and other village authorities who most distinguish themselves by their successful efforts to benefit the health of their fellow-villagers?

4. As regards the general scheme of the Bill, it appears that at first every village is to have a chance of showing what it can do by itself. In the beginning each village is to employ its own resources and keep itself clean; the Patel being its natural head. If the village does not keep itself clean, if it is found to be in a bad sanitary state, it is to have a notice, by means of a proclamation, of not less than two months; after that, if it is still unrepentant, arrangements will be made under part II. for the appointment of a Village Sanitary Committee, with powers to punish infractions of the sanitary rules, to carry out the work of sanitation, and to recover the amount expended by a rate charged on the inhabitants of the village. It is my inference that the extension of Part II. to any village is consequent upon the failure of the village to keep itself clean, but it is not expressly so stated in the Bill. Section 6 does not require that the Collector should, in his proclamation extending Part II., make any statement as to the objects and reasons for the extension; nor does this section explain what is the nature of the objections which will be held valid if brought by the villagers. Would it not be desirable that the proclamation should be based on the report of a Sanitary Inspector to the effect that the village is in an insanitary condition? And should not the proclamation specify the nature and particulars of the default? In that case the villagers would understand exactly what were their faults of omission and Commission, would have an opportunity of amending their ways before more stringent measures were adopted.—No doubt the efficacy of the Bill depends primarily upon the executive efficiency of the Village Sanitary Committee. And a very vital question upon which I should wish to be favoured with your opinion is, whether the mode of selection proposed by the Bill is the best one for the objects in view? Section 8 provides that the Committee shall be chosen by the Collector, and that the Chairman of the Committee shall also be nominated by him. Are there not grave objections to such a mode of selection? I am assured by those well acquainted with District life in the Bombay Presidency that owing to the large size of the Collectorates (are there not in Khandesh 2,600 villages?), it is impossible that the Collector or any other high official, European or Native, ~~can personally~~ personally ~~accomplish~~

villagers from among whom the choice has to be made. To place on the Collector the duty of nomination would, therefore, be in practice (would it not?) to give the selection of the Committees to the subordinates of the Taluka office and the Village Accountants, who are not likely to choose the independent men who possess the confidence of the villagers. Would it not be better to allow the villagers to choose their own Committee, to have the old Village Panchayat established by the inhabitants themselves? This was what was proposed by a Draft Bill in 1885, which provided that "the inhabitants of any non-municipal village may at any time establish a Panchayat to look after the cleansing of the village." Such a course would be consistent with the ancient village organisation, and at the same time be in accordance with the spirit of all recent legislation relating to Local Self-government. If this principle be approved, I would ask you kindly to advise regarding the best practical method of carrying out the selection.

5. Part III. is apparently to be put in force when Part II. has proved ineffectual to produce proper sanitation. But, as in the case of Part II., objection may here be taken to the want of definiteness as regards the reasons for the extension, and also to the nomination by the Collector of the members of the Sanitary Board. Would it not be possible to link such Sanitary Board in some way with the Taluka Local Board, making it, perhaps, a sub-committee of that Board? The multiplication of local committees having concurrent or conflicting authority, and elected in different ways, appears likely to produce confusion.

As regards the nature of the tax or rate (to carry out the work of sanitation), it is so very important a consideration, that might I ask the Association what they would recommend, so that it should be acceptable to the people without transgressing accepted principles of taxation?

6. There are a variety of minor points on which I should be glad of your opinion, such as the following questions:

(a) Would it not be well that the Village Rules to be made by the Committee under Section 11, should be approved by the Sanitary Commissioner as well as by the Collector?

(b) Should there not be some provision, by grant of lands or other hereditary village servants to settle in

*Proceedings of the*

villages where their services are required? And if more is demanded of them to properly cleanse the villages than was demanded of their forefathers, must not more be paid them?

(c) What should be the status of the Sanitary Inspector (Sections 21 and 22)? Should he not be an educated man whose sanitary qualifications have been duly tested? Should he not belong to the Sanitary Department, his services being placed at the disposal of the Taluka Local Board?

(d) Is the Contract system (Section 26) such as you would approve, instead of having appointed village servants?

I should esteem it a great favour if, with the permission of the Council, you would kindly inform me how far you would consider the provisions of the Bill as it now stands effective for the end proposed, and how far you would suggest that they should be modified. I should also again venture a request to be informed what other practical steps are, in the opinion of the Association, to be best taken in this most important matter of Village Sanitation.

Pray believe me, Gentlemen, to be

Your faithful and hopeful servant,

FLORENCE NIGHTINGALE.

London, W., *February* 20, 1889.

P.S.—For the favour of distribution to Members of the Association and others, should the Council so permit it, I forward a few printed copies of this letter. I may mention that I have addressed the Bombay Presidency Association on this subject in similar terms.

---

APPENDIX A.

TO THE JOINT SECRETARIES,

Poona Sarvajanic Sabha, Poona, Bombay.

GENTLEMEN,

In continuation of my previous letters of February 22, 1887, and February 20, 1889, on the subject of village sanitation in India, I now take the liberty of addressing your Association with reference to the Seventh International Congress of Hygiene and Demography, which is to be held in London from August 10 to 17 next. ~~The at~~

jects of the Congress are clearly set forth in the Preliminary Statement ( copy of which I enclose ) put forth by the General Committee. As stated by them, " The aim of the Congress is to awaken public interest in the progress of Hygiene and Demography, by which latter term is understood the study of the life conditions of communities from a statistical point of view ; to afford persons interested in these subjects an opportunity of meeting, with the object of advancing their progress ; and by conferences and debates to elucidate questions relating to Hygiene, Demography, and Public Health." H. R. H. the Prince of Wales has consented to act as President ; and it is expected that the Congress will be of great magnitude and importance.

2. You will observe that this is the first time that the meeting has been held in England ; and as a special feature of this Congress it is hoped that there will be a full representation from India and the Colonies. It is also very desirable that this representation should be not only official but also non-official. I am therefore anxious to urge upon Indian friends interested in the cause of sanitation the importance of the present occasion, so that the representatives from India may include as large a number as possible of those possessing detailed and accurate knowledge of the condition and wants of the Indian people.

3. Might not this International Congress, if warmly taken up by the enlightened native gentlemen and Liberal Associations of India, be a turning-point in the sanitary history of the peoples of India ? It has been said " The people of India have no faith in sanitary measures. They regard epidemics as the visitation of a malevolent power." [Is this still true ?] Yet no one can take care of the people's health but the people themselves. How much may—nay, *must* be done by them ! Without them, how little ! Without engaging the people themselves on our side, or rather on their own side, without convincing them of what is for their own interest, their own life and health, we may pass what Sanitary Acts we please, but is it not true that they will remain in great measure a dead letter ? We may have the most exact knowledge of what is wanted to be done to save life and health, to save these great races from physical degeneration, from losing the best months of the year for cultivation through being laid aside by fever—not to speak of the sad and enormous preventable fever death-rate, ~~it is feared.~~ But *we cannot do it.*

## *Proceedings of the Sabha.*

The educated native gentlemen who know the people will shew a practical example, they will first, as has been well said, "observe sanitary rules themselves." Then, must they not give their invaluable, their indispensable influence to help Government in village sanitation by creating a public opinion in its favour among their countrymen, and showing them the benefits, as has been done in some remarkable instances, to be derived from carrying out measures which have for their object improved health, and therefore greater vigour and happiness among the rural population? And is it not for them, and especially for the great popular Associations, to assist the Government in framing the most efficient, the most workable, and least unacceptable methods of carrying out village sanitation? Did they help in the Bombay Village Sanitation Act?

Is it not for *them* to influence the Panchayats where these exist, the headmen, the villagers, as to the causes of death and disease among them, and to remove those of the sad deterioration in physical stamina but too visible?

They will no doubt interchange most useful experience with the forthcoming International Congress. But their work will then lie at home, as will indeed the work of everyone, European and Oriental, who attends the Congress in good earnest to *do good*.

4. And may I as a woman venture to whisper that one of their first duties at home will be to influence their ladies? There is perhaps no country in the world where woman's influence is so high as in India; nor where ladies have sometimes manifested such capacity of governing and of administration.

But it is not to this that I allude. It is to the every-day domestic Government and administration of the home. And perhaps there is no civilised country in the world ("I speak as a fool"; let me be contradicted) where there is such ignorance among women of the first and simplest rules of health for themselves and their children. [Correct me, pray.] Now the domestic health depends on the woman. Yet is it not sometimes the case that the native gentleman, even where he knows, is unwilling to interfere with his own wife? The ladies must be paramount, whether instructed or uninstructed, in their own households. Let the ladies be first instructed by their own husbands and fathers, we humbly suggest; and let them then instruct others.

for women can only be taught by women in these matters. Least of all can they be taught by legislation. A *private public* opinion must, so to speak, be created among them how to save their own and their children's health.

In England there are Ladies' Sanitary Associations, of which our Queen is often the gracious patroness. In India let the time be near when there will be Indian Ladies' Sanitary Associations, of which our Empress, who is deeply interested in the welfare of her beloved daughters of India, might no doubt become the gracious patroness. Let them begin during her life on earth.

5. Bear with me. I have wandered far from the International Congress. Yet not so. These Sanitary Congresses which you will soon create in India, especially at Bombay, where such gigantic sanitary interests are at stake, find their most valuable impulse in contributing to private or non-official effort after returning home. Indeed, were it not for this, would not the Congress miss its highest object—the practical one?

You do not want a neat arithmetical sum in statistics. You want real practical work for the good of all.

You will support us. Let the East meet with the West to learn and to teach in matters of life and death. Let it be the victorious army of peace, is the earnest prayer of

Yours, Gentlemen,

Respectfully and hopefully,

FLORENCE NIGHTINGALE.

London, W., *February 16, 1891.*

P.S.—For the favour of distribution to members of the Association and others, should the Council so permit it, I forward a few printed copies of this letter. I may mention that I have addressed the Bombay Presidency Association on this subject in similar terms.

---

No. 145 of 1891.

Sarvajanic Sabha Rooms,

Poona, 9th June 1891.

To

MISS FLORENCE NIGHTINGALE,

MADAM,

I have the pleasure to acknowledge on behalf of the Poona Sarvajanic Sabha

with thanks the receipt of 50 copies of your printed appeal, and have arranged to distribute them among the members of the Sabha and other persons interested in Indian Sanitation. The Sabha has also chosen Sir W. Wedderburn and other delegate at the Congress of Hygiene and Demography. I hope to be able to send one or two papers written by Indian experts on the subjects of the sanitation of a few Indian cities.

With respect to village sanitation the Local-Government has passed an Act, but as it has not provided for any special funds for the purposes of village sanitation, the Act remains virtually a dead letter. While the Bill was under consideration, the Native members of the Legislative Council strongly insisted upon the necessity of making a statutory provision of funds for village sanitation by appropriating a portion of the Local Funds which as originally intended both for improving communications and sanitation. Latterly nearly the whole of the money is absorbed by the Public Works and repairs. It was proposed to set apart a definite portion of these Local Funds proceeds ( being 8 pies in the rupee of Land Revenue ) for sanitary purposes, but the suggestion of the native members was overruled, and as the people are too poor to pay additional taxes or to raise voluntary subscriptions and as Government themselves are not prepared to make any sensible allotment out of provincial revenue, matters remain at a stand still. If you move the Hygiene Congress to invite the attention of the Indian Authorities to this subject, there is every reason to hope that the present inactivity will be remedied.

Thanking you on behalf of the members of the Sabha and the Indian people generally for your philanthropic efforts and kindly solicitude for the promotion of Indian health,

I beg to remain,

Madam, your truly

VISHNU MORESHWAR BHIDE,

Chairman, Poona Sarvajnik Sabha.

---

To RAO BAHADUR VISHNU MORESHWAR BHIDE,

Chairman Poona Sarvajnik Sabha.

SIR,

I have to thank you for your letter of the 9th June last, and shall feel obliged if you will express to the members of the ~~Poona Sarvajnik~~

nik Sabha my best thanks for their ready response to my request that they would bring the subject of Indian village sanitation before the Congress of Hygiene and demography; and also for the valuable papers which, at their instance, were contributed by Messrs. Kirtikar, Ghole and Dhurandar.

2. I have noted their desire that the Indian authorities should be moved to appropriate a certain portion of the Local Fund proceeds to the expenses of village sanitation under the Act, and I am now in communication with friends interested in the subject with a view to a representation being made to the India Office.

3. In the meantime, may I perhaps be allowed to suggest that the Poona Sarvajanic Sabha should themselves institute a system of Lectures on Village Sanitation to be given in all the villages and small towns?

If villagers are not taught the simple things that they can do for themselves to promote health at home, law cannot force them, nor can funds help them.

Is it not generally not so much the want of money as the want of knowledge that produces bad sanitary conditions? Do not rich people in the towns die from overcrowding and from bad drains? Indeed, are not the typhoid fevers of Bombay city more rapidly fatal than the malarial and typhoidal fevers of Bombay villages? Alas! we have also to remember the life-long deterioration in strength and the annual interruption of labour from these rural fevers.

Must not the poor people be taught that, by merely taking trouble, without spending money, they can do much to make their homes healthy? But they will never take trouble, unless they can be convinced that much of the suffering and sickness from which they and their wives and children suffer so grievously is *preventible* suffering.

4. Are not the great needs of the very poor :

- (a) Diminution of overcrowding.
- (b) Carrying away of sewage.
- (c) Better water-supply.

(e) The question of overcrowding and want of ventilation is the most difficult one for poor people themselves to touch; but is it not a



## *Proceedings of the Sabha.*

question for the Poona Sarvajanic Sabha seriously to consider how fresh dwellings can be most efficiently and cheaply erected ?

(b) and (c) But upon the two other points—(b) the carrying away of sewage, and (c) a better water-supply—the people can most effectually help themselves, if they are made to understand the terrible results of neglect and the most simple remedies.

Might not the Poona Sarvajanic Sabha, which has always shown itself so active in promoting the social and physical welfare of the people, organise a system of lectures and practical demonstrations on such subjects, to be given from village to village by men (1) well versed themselves in the principles of sanitation, and (2) knowing the habits of the people, and able to sympathise with and help them, instead of stirring up their prejudices ?

Much work might be done at little money cost by men working in the untiring missionary spirit of the late Mr. Ganesh Wasodeo Joshi, who gave a bright example in his devotion to the welfare of the people.

Probably the village school-rooms might be utilised for the lectures, which might be made attractive by object-lessons, with the magic-lantern showing the noxious living organisms in foul air and water. Such preparations shown at the Hygienic Congress produced a strong impression. But the lecture would only be the first beginning of the teaching ; a lecturer who had made himself acceptable to the people would go round the village and show the people how to dispose of their refuse; he would explain to them the danger of depositing it in their little close courtyards, and how the solid should be separated from the liquid excreta, and the former utilised in their cultivation. Then he would go with them to examine their water-supply, and show them certain simple precautions to be observed :

not washing near the supply of drinking water;

not allowing human beings or cattle to foul the river, tank, or well.

The Hindu religion enjoins so much purity and cleanliness that the influence of the religious teachers and of the Caste Panchayats might be usefully appealed to.

The people have a high respect for the Panchayat—the Panchayat, for the Poona Sarvajanic Sabha. The Sabha can approach the

people through the Panchayat, if the Panchayat can be brought to interest themselves, not only in domestic and social moral conditions, but in domestic health.

5. Sanitary *primers* are much needed, if sanitation is to be taught in Elementary Schools; not mere adaptations from the English, but productions from the best native experience.

But much more wanted are sanitary *masters*—school-masters who believe in sanitation or prevention of disease, and know something about it.

*What is read in the book stays in the book.* In lectures, in schools, representations to the eye are alike wanted.

The officer of health is too often only a book and a pen. So is the school-master. He must be a *voice*—a voice, as it were, among the villages. Books often do no good; and so few can read.

6. The business of municipal and sanitary reformers, should it not be to see that the public money spent on roads, water-supply, &c., does really benefit the poor who cannot help themselves, and not only the rich who can.

Some roads are sure to be kept clean; but what is the condition of the bye-lanes and back streets of towns and villages? Is it not these ordinary sanitary requirements of the common people that need to be promoted rather than large and expensive schemes for the comfort of those who can take care of themselves?

7. One more suggestion. Might not the Municipalities and Rural Local Boards appoint Sanitation Sub-Committees from among their members, whose duty it would be to help the Health Officers in their work, and to be the medium of communication between them and the general body of these corporations as regards sanitary matters? This plan is now being followed in England, where Teaching Committees are being appointed for technical education and sanitation, under the County Councils. It is found that the members of such Committees are led to make a special study of their subject, and much fresh energy is thus brought into the practical work of the general body.

*Proceedings of the Sabha.*

8. The Sabha will have observed with satisfaction that, on account of the active interest shown by India in the work of the Congress, it is proposed at future Congresses to form a Tropical Section, with a view to secure adequate discussion of the sanitation and diseases peculiar to tropical climates. And it is hoped that Indian sanitary reformers will thus be encouraged to keep in touch with the most recent scientific developments.

Pray believe me, Sir,  
Faithfully yours and the Sabha's,  
FLORENCE NIGHTINGALE

LONDON, December, 1891.

P.S.—Will you kindly allow me the liberty of sending you printed copies of my letter, to follow by next mail, and asking from you the great favour of distributing them to local associations and influential Indian gentlemen, as you think fit?—F. N.

---

To the Rt. Hon'ble. Viscount Cross, P. C., G. C. B., etc., H. M.  
Principal Secretary of State for India.  
My Lord,

The strong interest which, as Her Majesty's Principal Secretary of State for India, your Lordship has shown in the sanitary progress of that country, and especially the active steps which were taken through the India office to bring India within the scope of the last International Congress of Hygiene and Demography, embolden me to address your Lordship regarding that branch of the subject in which I take a special and personal interest, I mean Indian village sanitation.

2. In the Bombay Presidency much attention has been given by the authorities to this subject. And desirous of helping in this work I have during the last five years been corresponding with several of the leading Native organisations, asking them actively to use their influence in spreading among the villagers an elementary knowledge of sanitary requirements. On the occasion of the Congress I addressed a letter (Appendix A.) to the Bombay Presidency Association and the Poona Sarvajnik Sabha, urging them to bring before the Congress detailed and accurate information regarding the condition and

wants of the rural population. In response to this request the Poona Sarvajanic Sabha sent three papers to be read at the Congress. But at the same time they pointed out the difficulties which attended the progress of sanitation in their Province. They stated that, according to their experience, the Bombay village sanitation Act, 1889, failed to produce the desired results, because the Act did not reserve a definite portion of the village cesses to meet the expenses of sanitation; while the rural population were too poor to bear further taxation. They therefore expressed a hope that the Congress might be moved to invite the attention of the Indian authorities to this financial difficulty.

3. There was no opportunity of obtaining from the Congress an expression of opinion of the kind desired. But the insanitary condition of Indian rural villages was much discussed at the special Indian Meetings held in connection with the Congress. And the accompanying copy (Appendix B.) of a Memorandum by Members of the Indian Committee of the Congress will show how strongly the need is felt for active measures to reduce existing evils.

4. In reply to the Poona Sarvajanic Sabha I sent a letter (Appendix C.), in which I renewed my plea in favor of popularizing sanitary instruction. But in doing so I felt how little could be done to improve the rural health conditions without adequate funds; and I also felt how difficult it must be to make the cause popular in the villages if the new movement in favor of sanitation is associated with fresh taxation demands, especially when the villagers have already paid a cess levied to meet the same requirements. Many ancient prejudices have to be overcome, so that it is most important that there should be no fresh grounds of aversion. I have therefore felt it my duty to bring their request to the notice of your Lordship. Through the courtesy of the India Office I have been favored with the perusal of documents showing the origin of the village Cesses above referred to. And I understand that they were originally contributions voluntarily paid for village purposes. Afterwards these cesses were made leviable by law, and the power of directing the expenditure was vested in the Local Boards. But the Government have always recognised the principle of "localization" (as laid down by H. E. Sir Philip Wodehouse), which gives to village necessities the first claim upon the proceeds of the village cesses. From our point of view reasonable sanitation is the

*Proceedings of the Sabha.*

first of these necessities, and therefore we feel strongly that this necessity should be provided for in preference to the needs less directly affecting life and health.

5. We *must* live in order to work. We must *live* in order to drive the cart or cross the bridge. Is not the life more than meat and the body than raiment? A village free from choleraic and typhoidal poisons is more important to the village population than the best means of communication. Reading the debates on the Bombay Village Sanitation Bill, it appears that the main object of the measure is to constitute a good village organisation for purposes of village Sanitation. These village organisations for these purposes supersede the Local Board, and therefore it seems that in them should be vested primarily the administration of the funds raised by village cesses, for village sanitation. According to this view the villagers would not require to ask back from the Local Board a portion of the amount paid by them; but in carrying out a *minimum* of Sanitation would spend what was absolutely requisite. Ought it ever to have gone from them, from the time that a suitable village organisation had been established to administer it? The balance would go to the Local Board for more general local purposes.

6. In conclusion, I should esteem it a favour if your Lordship would be so good as to inform me whether, in accordance with the recommendation contained in the Memorandum, Appendix B., it might not be possible for the Local authorities under the existing law to raise sufficient funds to be appropriated to satisfy the minimum requirements of Village Sanitation?

London,  
21st March 1892.

I have the honour to be,  
My Lord,  
Your most obedient servant,  
FLORENCE NIGHTINGALE.

India Office, White Hall, London S. W.

8th April 1892.

Madam,

I am directed by the Secretary of State for India to acknowledge the receipt of your letter of 21st March, making certain suggestions in regard to the application of the proceeds of village cesses in India.

the purposes of sanitation. While thanking you for your remarks, Viscount Cross desires me to say that a copy of your letter and of its enclosures will be forwarded for the consideration of the Governments of India and Bombay.

Miss Nightingale, 10, South  
Street, Park Lane, W.

I am Madam,  
Your obedient Servant,  
(Ed.) HORACE WALPOLE,

#### APPENDIX B.

##### MEMORANDUM.

From the Papers read, and the opinions expressed, at the Indian Meetings in connection with the last International Congress of Hygiene and Demography, it appears to the undersigned Members of the Indian Committee that the insanitary conditions of the rural village in India is a very serious evil, and that active measures are required to obviate the existing injury to public health.

They understand that as regards villages in the Bombay Presidency, funds are raised by village cesses for works of local public utility, including sanitary improvements. But under the Local Funds Acts these funds are expended by Local Boards, each of which exercises authority over many villages; and it appears from the Local Boards Report that in 1890 the Local Boards received altogether 42½ lakhs, of which about 26 lakhs of rupees came from such village cesses, but out of this amount only 3½ lakhs were spent on village sanitation and water-supply namely, rs. 3,17,250 in improving the water-supply rs. 4,979 on village sites, including clearing tank ~~and~~ on sanitation at fairs, etc. ~~same requirements.~~ Vegetation, rs. 620 and villages. ~~From this~~ and rs. 12780 on conservancy of towns ~~clearance~~ ~~of~~ ~~be~~ ~~of~~ ~~time,~~ it appears that the amount spent in actual ~~should be no fresh ground~~ duty to ~~be~~ operations in the village was very small indeed compared to the amount raised by the village cesses.

In the opinion of the undersigned, the removal of the present sanitary evils in the rural villages is the first necessity as regards these villages, and they would urge on the authorities that reasonable sanitary improvements in each village should be regarded as a first charge on the cess raised in that village.

Until the Minimum of Sanitation is complete, until the cess of that particular village has been appropriated to this, while typhoidal or

choleraic disease is still prevalent, it appears to the undersigned that the claims for any general purposes should be postponed.

Good local communications are no doubt desirable. But they come second in importance to the removal of those insanitary conditions which are undermining the health of the rural population.

(Signed) DOUGLAS GALTON

Chairman of Organizing Committee of International Congress of Hygiene.

GEORGE BIRDWOOD.

W. H. CORFIELD, M. A., M. D. ( O.XON )

Member of the Permanent Committee.

W. ROBT. CORNISH, F. R. C. S., C. I. E., Q. H. P.

Surgeon General.

Late Member of the Legislative Council.

Fort St. George.

W. GUYER HUNTER.

W. J. MOORE

Late Surgeon General with the Government of Bombay.

DADABHAI NAOROJI.

G. V. POORE, M. D.

W. WEDDEBURN.

THOMAS HOLBEN HENDI.

to Colonel C. I. E.  
for Rajputana.

India Office,

White hall,

London, S. W.

8th April, 1892 )

## THE NEW MHOWRA BILL.

### II.

#### ( THE THANĀ COMMITTEE'S REPORT ANALYSED. )

In our last article on this subject, we examined the figures laid by Sir Charles Pritchard on the table of the Legislative Council, and *inter alia* endeavoured to show : 1 That compared with the figures of offences for 1880-81 and 1881-82, the figures for ' recent ' years showed not merely no ' very serious ' rise, but a very substantial fall-off, and that if a Bill based on the heavy figures of those two years was vetoed by the Government of India, *a fortiori* must that Government veto a measure, based on the much lower figures of ' recent ' years, even if the Local Legislature were to pass it : 2 That the fact that when assent to the Bill of 1882 was withheld by the Government of India, the Bombay Government were able by other means to materially reduce the heavy figures of offences detected in 1880-81 and 1881-82 in subsequent years, and keep them within moderate bounds, showed that legislation of the kind proposed was not required for coping with the evil of illicit distillation, which again was now smaller in magnitude than what it had been prior to 1882 : 3 That the sudden increase that had taken place in the number of offences in 1888 was entirely due to the action of Government, and that it was therefore unfair on the part of Government to take advantage of it to justify repressive legislation : 4 That the figure for 1888-89, considerably higher as it was than that for 1887-88, did not represent Mhowra distillation exclusively, but covered much illicit distillation of



toddy also, and therefore it could not be said that there was in that year a very serious increase in the illicit distillation of liquor from Mhowra flowers : 5 That it was unfair to describe the increase that had taken place in 1888 as recent cause statistics for later years were available, and they showed a material diminution in the number of offences : 6 That since the abolition of the experimental arrangements of 1888, the number of offences had been steadily and rapidly diminishing, eliciting expressions of satisfaction from the head of the Abkari Department itself, and that in the course of a year or two, a return to the state of things ~~which had~~ prevailed prior to 1888 might be legitimately looked for. This line of argument was made necessary by the allegation contained in the Statement of Objects and Reasons that the introduction of the Bill was necessitated by a ' recent ' ' very serious ' increase in the illicit distillation of liquor from Mhowra flowers—an allegation entirely opposed to facts, as we have shown in our previous article. The apologists of the Bill, however, seem now to abandon their first position, and turn round and say that the matter should be judged, not in this comparative light, but on its absolute merits. At least this appears to be their intention so far as it can be gathered from the Report of the Select Committee, wherein *not one word* is to be found about the alleged ' recent ' and ' very serious ' increase in the illicit distillation from Mhowra. We are ready to meet this new line of defence and it is clear that our best course under the circumstances is to analyse the evidence and examine the Report of the Thana Committee of 1888, whose recommendations constitute the bulwork of the new official position. The voluminous mass of evidence published has apparently deterred many from wading through it to see how far the Committee's

Report can be said to represent the results of a careful and impartial consideration of the evidence recorded by it. With a *non-chalance* unfortunately not rare in such matters, this Report has been accepted as the basis of the restrictions proposed, and if we could but succeed in exposing the true character of this Report, and show that it was a clever device to reaffirm foregone conclusions under the mask of a solemn inquiry, we think we shall have rendered a distinct service to the public.

In the first place this so-called Committee consisted of two Revenue Officers who had, to a great extent, committed themselves to an advocacy of aggressive legislation. There was no non-official or native member associated in the work. Not that none were available or competent for the duty. One or more of the independent members who had voted against the Bill in Council could easily have been selected for this responsible task. Sir Jamshetji Jijibhai, R. B. Gopalrao Deshmukha, and Mr. W. M. Macaulay, however, took great interest in the inquiry, and the evidence recorded by the Committee consists largely of communications which were sent through these gentlemen. Mr. Macaulay went so far as to record his view, arrived at, as he says, after extensive inquiries carried on for nine months, that "the smuggling and illicit distilling and other crimes which were complained of in the Legislative Council during the discussion of the Mhowra Bill are, in a great measure, due to exorbitant duty, to the stringency of the Act as well, as to the highly objectionable manner in which the liquor revenue is farmed." The same nine months spent by the official Committee in these inquiries satisfied them that the duty was not exorbitant, that there was no stringency in the Act, and that there was nothing objectionable in the manner in which the liquor revenue was farmed.

If officials and non-officials had been associated together, the Committee's labours would have inspired confidence, and there would have been more ground for deliberation and a fair compromise. As it was, the exclusively official view of the department found only a formal reaffirmation of its foregone conclusions in the Committee's Report, and it is no wonder if the results of such an inquiry have failed to convert the public, and lead it to modify its strong and general condemnation of the measure.

It should be remembered that the Committee was appointed by the local Government under the pressure of the Government of India. In vetoing the old Bill, the Government of India expressed its opinion that "further inquiry should be made as to (1) whether the high rate of duty charged on licit spirit in the districts of Thana and Kolaba has not encouraged smuggling, and the opportunity might at the same time be taken to investigate somewhat more closely the question as to (2) whether Mhowra flower is ever used as food in these districts." If it was found as the result of these inquiries that (1) the flower is not used as an article of food, and (2) if it was clearly proved that no remedy for the existing state of things in those districts could be found in a relaxation of the present Abkari laws, it might then be considered, the Government of India said, whether legislation should not be undertaken. There were thus two points laid down by the Government of India on which further inquiry was desired, and the Thana Committee, taking their cue from the traditions of the department, affirmed the following conclusions: (1) That the evils complained of could not be attributed to the rate of the tax on palm trees. (2) That the evils were due not to the severity of the Abkari systems

but to its incompleteness. (3) That the rate of duty was not high. (4) And that Mhowra flowers were not a staple article of food, nor were they used, to any appreciable extent, as food for cattle. The Committee were further of opinion that a reduction of the rate fixed for tapping palm trees and the duty on spirits would increase intemperance and disorder, and that restrictive legislation, regulating the possession and sale of flowers, was the only remedy to check the evils complained of; and they then suggested (1) that this restriction should be relaxed for 2½ months during the flowering season; (2) that a minimum price should be fixed for the purchase of flowers by the licensed vendors; (3) that the number of licensed spirit shops should be increased until every five miles area had at least one shop of its own; (4) that the limit of the maximum quantity removed from a shop should be raised from one gallon to four gallons between June and November to suit the conveniences and needs of the agriculturists; (5) and lastly, that the maximum price for the retail sale of toddy should be reduced by one half.

We shall consider the remedial suggestions later on. At present we are concerned chiefly with the conclusions of the Committee on the two main points submitted to them for report. In our opinion the strongest condemnation of the Committee's report rests on the fact that they willfully chose to misunderstand their instructions. When they were asked their opinion as to whether the rates of duty charged on licit spirits were not so high as to encourage smuggling, they remarked that any rate of duty was an incentive to illicit practices. They construed the word "high" into "unduly high," and having put this construction, they proceeded further to contrast these rates with the duty on imported foreign

liquor, and, as the result of such comparison, arrived at the comfortable conclusion that the rates were low, and not high. Such a quibbling could never have stood the test of a moment's impartial and independent examination. The movements which influence large masses of men are not governed by rules of arithmetic. Practical men know as a fact that every rate of duty is not necessarily an incentive to illicit practices. The rate must over-step a certain line before it practically encourages men to resort to illicit means. The risks and dangers of such practices have their own money value, and it is this element, which varies with place and time, that determines the character of a high or low duty. The words high and low used in this connection have an obvious reference, not to the rates on other commodities used by a different set of people, but to the difference between the normal and natural cost of the manufactured article in the place, and its artificial price owing to the duty charged. These considerations are so obvious that we cannot but wonder how they could have escaped the notice of the official members. If the natural and normal cost of manufacturing spirit from Mhowra flowers is so low that the risks and dangers involved in its secret manufacture are more than counterbalanced by the difference between it and the price of the spirit when charged with full duty, there is ample room for smuggling, and a direct encouragement to it. This practical aspect of the question does not appear to have attracted any attention. All comparisons between Mhowra and toddy rates and the rates charged on imported liquor are absolutely out of place. Imported foreign liquor cannot be made in India. The cost of manufacture and transport is high. The duty charged on it is meant as a tax on the luxury of the rich who

are well able to pay it. There can be no comparison between the rate charged on such liquor and the rates charged on a commodity which can be produced in Thana every-where at a slight cost, and which is not an article of luxury for the rich, but one of daily, though sad, necessity to the very poorest population. The orders of the Government of India referred to in the Report could never have contemplated such a travesty of facts, as appears to have been wilfully made in this connection, with a view to avoid a disagreeable reply in the affirmative to the question proposed. The instructions of the Government of India only suggest that, as nearly as possible, the customs and excise duties should be equivalent, not equal. In view of the facts urged above, and the admission that illicit manufacture has been one of the consequences of the system which imposed high duties, there is only one inference possible, and that is that the illicit manufacture is due to the high rates. There was no complaint, before the present Abkari system was introduced, of illicit manufacture because the duty was low; there is complaint now because the duties are high, as evidenced by the fact that there is smuggling. The Report of the Committee makes a strong point that, while the duty on palm juice spirits is nearly equal to that on Mhowra spirits, there is no complaint of illicit distillation in respect of palm trees, because these are under strict control, while there is loud complaint about the distillation of Mhowra spirits, due, it is alleged, not to the severity, but to the inadequacy, of the control in regard to the possession and sale of Mhowra flowers. The witnesses examined before the Committee admitted that illicit distillation was more difficult to discover in the case of Mhowra flowers than in the case of the palm tree juice. *There is, however, a world wide difference between the existence of facilities for smuggling and the incen-*

*tive to smuggling.* Tax collecting agents have always a fatal temptation to confound facilities with incentives, forgetting that the incentive must exist independent of the facilities, and the two are not convertible terms. We do not all break the law because there are facilities in our way when the police are away. We have all facilities for committing suicide, but till there is an incentive to it, nobody commits suicide. There must be a strong incentive to drive men to take advantage of facilities to break the law. No body ever does misbehave for the mere fun of the thing. The abundance of Mhowra trees in the Thana District may afford facilities for illicit manufacture, but no reasonable man will accept this as a sufficient explanation of the prevalence of illicit manufacture. To seek that reason we must fall back on the heavy duty placed by the department on an article of drink, badly required by the people. That is the incentive and the encouragement which drives men to avail themselves of the facilities and run the risks.

Turning next to the question of the use of Mhowra flowers as food for men and cattle, the Government of India was careful to put the question in a very general way. The question, as put in that Resolution, is whether Mhowra flowers are *ever* used as *food* in these districts. The Committee answer that it is never used as a *staple* article of food by men, and it is *not generally* given to cattle. This answer obviously does not meet the question asked. The Committee wanted to give a negative answer any how, and they, therefore, qualified the word food by the addition of staple, and in respect of cattle too, they tried a similar evasion by saying that it is not food for cattle to any very appreciable

extent. If a straightforward reply had been contemplated, the Committee would have been bound to say that the flower is used as an article of food by men, but not as staple i. e. principal element of food, and it is also given to cattle, but not generally by all classes. Such an answer would have cut the ground from beneath the feet of the departmental advocates of restrictive legislation, and every effort has been made to strain the words so as to secure a negative conclusion. The qualified nature of the reply implies an affirmation, though it is concealed under a cloud of words. In this matter, as in the consideration of the question whether the duty is high or low, there is a painful effort to wriggle out of the positions to which an unbiased examination of the evidence necessarily leads an impartial inquirer.

The objections to the Report admit, however, of being more forcibly stated than we have done above. The Report appears to us to be based on a studied reversal of all the received principles which guide a judicial consideration of conflicting evidence upon a contested matter of fact. In all such matters, it is an admitted principle that positive evidence in favour of a fact given by competent and reliable witnesses, however few in number, always outweighs the negative evidence of a host of ignorant witnesses. Further, in this case even the numerical majority is on the side of those who gave affirmative evidence. The matter under inquiry related to the home life of very poor people, and it was not to be expected that English or Native officials should have the necessary opportunities to form a correct opinion on the points at issue. It is no wonder, therefore, that the Abkari Inspectors who were examined as witnesses (Nos. 1-4) could only state that they had never heard of or seen the use of Mhowra flowers as food by men in the Thana district. These officers were too comfortably placed



to mix with the people, and they had besides every reason to be biased by their connection with the department, and could only see or hear what they wished to see or hear. The Native officials, the Mamlatdars of the Talukas, were also similarly circumstanced. They could only have had very rare opportunities for watching the manner in which forest tribes and the poor and depressed classes maintained themselves in bad times every year. They had also to some extent the official bias or fear of the department in view. It is not, therefore, surprising to find that nearly all of them were able to state that Mhowra flowers were not used as food by men in Thana. Some of them, however, overleaped the mark, and contradicted themselves hopelessly. Mr. Kotval of Murbad ( No. 7 ) stated that these flowers were not used as food either by men or cattle in Murbad. The Uran and Panwel Mamlatdars ( Nos. 8 and 13 ) committed themselves to a similar statement, which is easily explained by the fact that Mhowra trees are few in these Talukas. Against their evidence we have the testimony of the Mamlatdars of Bhiwandi, Bassein, Shahapur, Kalyan, Karjat and Mokhada ( Nos. 6, 9, 10, 11, 12, 14 ), who all stated that the flowers are used for feeding cattle, and one of them stated a fact wellknown throughout the district, that if the trees are not properly guarded during the blossoming season, cattle make a rush to devour these flowers, and have to be warded off. The patent inaccuracy of the official evidence of the Abkari Inspectors and Mamlatdars in respect of the use of Mhowra flowers as food by men was, however, demonstrated by the evidence of Mr. Atkins, the Assistant Collector, ( No. 5 ) who, not content with merely noting down hearsay evidence, put the matter to the test of experiment. He stated that the Kulambi Patels of ten villages had assured him that the poorer classes in the Taluka used the dried flowers

as food when their stock of grain was exhausted, and that they themselves used the fresh flowers. Not satisfied with this answer, Mr. Atkins sent for specimens of Warlis, Thakurs, Kolis and Katkaris, and encouraged them to show their real feelings. And they not only ate the fresh flowers in large quantities, but the dried flowers were mixed with an equal quantity of nagli and made into bread, and these breads were eaten with great relish by the poor people in Mr. Atkin's presence, and Mr. Atkins satisfied himself that the mixed stuff was palatable. These poor people thus demonstrated the truth of the position taken up by the non-official members of the Council in 1881, that fresh and dried flowers, by themselves or mixed with grain flour, are used as food by the poor classes in the hot months. No wonder that Mr. Atkins was forced to give up his previous views on the point, arrived at by merely questioning men who try to give the answer that would please the Sirkar, and had to state that he was satisfied (1) that fresh flowers are frequently eaten in small quantities as a relish by Kulambis and wild tribes, (2) that dried flowers are also sometimes eaten by the wild tribes when hungry, (3) and that dried flowers mixed with bread are eaten by Katkaris and others of the wild tribes, and they seem to like the stuff.

So much for the official evidence. These admissions, however, have to be read with the evidence of the non-official witnesses which we shall now summarize. Witness No. 15 is a pensioner, with the traditions of the Mamlatdar service, and he joined with the Mamlatdars. The first independent witness was the Deshmukha (No. 16), who has been honoured with a special mention of his name in the Report. His evidence about the use of flowers as food by wild tribes is disposed of by the remark that he gave hear-

say evidence, and admitted he had not seen anybody actually using the flowers as food. Seeing that he is a rich landlord and contractor, he is, at the worst, in the same boat with the officials so far as mixing freely with the wild tribes is concerned. But his statements were very specific. He confirmed the statement of the official witness, Narayan Wasudeo of Kalyan, that unless cattle are kept off by a strict watch, they devour the flowers at the foot of the trees. He stated that in the Murbad and Wadha Talukas, husk is mixed with these flowers and made into cakes, and eaten by Katkaris and Thakurs, who also eat the flowers in famine times, and that in Bhiwandi Musalman weavers also use the flowers as food. The next important witness is Mr. Sathe (No. 18), retired Deputy Collector, who states that he could say for certain that the flowers are eaten by Kathkaris and Thakurs. Mr. Gupte, Pensioner, (No. 19), gave evidence that the flowers are eaten, both before and after manufacture of liquor, by the cattle.

We have next a class of non-official witnesses whose evidence has to be considered in connection with the fact that they are liquor contractors, and interested in maintaining the traditions of the department they so well serve, or rather which serves them so well. To this class belong witnesses Nos. 20, 21, 22 who denied the use of flowers as food either by men or cattle. But liquor contractors also, like the officials, will not all co-here together in support of a statement which is notoriously inaccurate. Witness No. 23, himself a liquor contractor, stated that he had 300 cattle, and he fed 100 of them on regular rations of Mhowra flowers and grain or oil cake for 9 months in the year, and that the wild tribes eat the fresh flowers, and when dried, pound them and

mix them with Nagli flour, and make bread. This evidence, being positive, outweighs all the negative opinions of other witnesses of his class.

The next set of witnesses, the Bania dealers in these flowers, freely admitted ( Nos. 25, 26 ) that the flowers are eaten when fresh, and when dried are mixed with grain stuff and eaten.

The newspaper summaries ( Nos. 27, 33 ) and the replies of the Thana Forest and Abkari Association ( No. 30 ) may be taken exception to as being partizan expressions of opinion, but this remark cannot be properly applied to the answers given by the Umbargaon land owners and owners of trees, (Nos. 29, 34, 35, 36, 37,) which answers were sent by them through Sir J. Jeejibhai, Mr. Macaulay and Rao Bahadur Deshmukh, and were signed, some of them, numerously by Parsis, Musalmans and Hindus, all testifying to the actual use of these flowers as food both by men and cattle at certain seasons of the year, and by certain classes among the poor population. The same remark applies to the evidence of Mr. Vithoba Khandapa No. 31, and Bakir, Mohamedan merchant, No. 32. This latter witness mentioned a caste of the weavers as making Panga ( or bread ) of the mixed stuff. All these witnesses agree in stating that the flowers are most required by cattle in the rainy season, and that the poorer classes require this supplement to make their little grain stocks last till the new crops come up to relieve their want.

We have thus passed under review the whole of the official and non-official evidence, and it all points to the same conclusion in so far as the question of fact mainly at issue is concerned, namely, that these flowers are used as food by men and cattle. It is beside the issue to say that they are not staple food. How can flowers

be under any circumstances the staple food *i. e.* principal ingredient of the food of a people? It is a necessary supplemental addition to the grain, and not a mere luxury added to give relish to the food; and as for cattle not only the rich use it as a luxury, but all who can afford it have to feed the cattle on this food in the latter part of the hot and the early part of the rainy season till the grass grows and the new grain becomes available.

Reading Para 33 of the Report in the light furnished by this analysis, it will appear that the statements, which go the length of asserting that Mhowra flowers are never used as food for men or cattle, are really those that are not "entitled to very great weight." The statements that Mhowra flowers are so used were made not by "a few persons" but by a large majority of the non-official witnesses. They did *not* state that the flowers were only used as condiments or "occasional" additions to their other food, and the same majority of witnesses asserted its general use among the poorer classes in the Mhowra Talukas at certain seasons of the year, when their grain stocks are near exhaustion. Deshmukha's evidence cannot be set down as entirely hearsay, and the newspaper reports do not confound the conditions of Thana with those of the Panch Mahals. Mhowra flowers cannot, in the nature of things be used as staple food. Grain alone is, and can be, staple food all the world over. It is certainly not an argument which should have weighed with the Committee that the poor tribes in the Thana District are law-abiding, and not as dangerous as the Bhils in other parts, for whom by reason of their lawlessness, the Committee think, special concessions are required. It is only teaching a bad lesson to these poor tribes to exact concessions by becoming dangerous.

The Committee further on observe that Mhowra fetches

an equal price in Thana with Nagli and sometimes with rice. All the witnesses, official and non-official, stated what is a notorious fact that rice fetches from 2 to 4 times the price of the flowers, quantity for quantity. It is therefore not an entire mistake to suppose that Mhowra flowers are a cheap food, on which the poor classes can subsist when they are too poor to get grain. It is not true that only some of the witnesses stated that flowers are given to the cattle to eat. Nearly all the official and non-official native witnesses stated this fact. It was not merely an individual dealer in Murhad who made a statement to that effect, and whose motives are impugned in the Report. Men like the Deshmukh and Deputy Collector Sathe, and liquor contractor Hormasji, also made the same statement. It cannot therefore be said with any approach to truth that the Committee arrived at their negative conclusions after weighing the evidence before them, as they profess to have done. The question of "appreciable extent" is one of comparison, but there can be no doubt on the evidence recorded, that cattle like the food, and are nourished by it, and it is given largely to them in the places where Mhowra trees abound. Every sentence in this para is thus brimful with inaccurate statements, and it is to us not a little surprising that the Bombay authorities should have ventured to go up to the Government of India relying on the strength of such a Report in justification of their repressive proposals. It was not without reason that the Government of India refused to be convinced by this one-sided Report, and asked the authorities here to try other remedies.

On the two main points referred to the Committee, though their recommendations are negative in form, they imply more than they express, and this implied sense

contention of the non-official members of the Legislative council in 1882, that Mhowra flowers are an article of food for men and cattle. They are not, and can not well be, a staple article of food, but they do supplement grain and fodder stocks in the worst part of every year, and enable men and cattle to subsist, when subsistence otherwise would be impossible.

It is notorious that the heavy tax on<sup>ed</sup> toddy has mainly driven the people of Thana to the use of Mhowra spirits. If Mhowra flowers are brought under control, and the duty on Mhowra spirit continues high or is further enhanced, people will resort to rice, molasses, dates &c. and illicit manufacture of spirits from these articles will again trouble the department, and sharpen its ingenuity. The Committee quietly ignore the fact that it is the high duty which is the main cause of illicit distillation. All the official and non-official Native witnesses agree in deprecating these high duties on Toddy juice and on spirits, and recommend unanimously that they be lowered. The Committee's objection to this is that drunkenness will increase. If the operations of the department really checked drunkenness, the excuse might hold good ; but as a matter of fact the general complaint is that it is the operations of the department that have deprived people of a rather innocent beverage *viz.* fresh unfermented Toddy juice, and forced them to resort to the often adulterated and disease-producing spirits. The admitted increase of the licit consumption from year to year, and the increase of revenue in Thana and elsewhere, point to the same conclusion. The proposed regulations might of course secure an increase of revenue, but that even stricter regulations will check intemperance is a hope which will never be realized.

The Thana. Committee themselves proposed that the

Maximum quantity permitted to be sold should be raised from one gallon to 4 gallons between June and November, when the labourers have to work hard in mud and rain. They thus admit a natural necessity for a relaxation of the oppressive arrangements of the department, and expose the hollowness of the professed anxiety for the increase of temperance among the people. Similarly they propose to reduce the maximum price fixed for the retail sale of toddy by one-half. This recommendation also is not obviously consistent with the theory that the heavy rates which the department imposes are necessary to check drunkenness.

There is one point more to be reviewed in this Report and we have done with it ; the Committee propose to leave the possession of Mhowra flowers free for  $2\frac{1}{2}$  months from 1st February to 15 April, after which date the restrictions are to operate. This recommendation is also made in curious forgetfulness of the actual necessities of the case. The Mamlatdar witnesses ( Nos. 6-12 ) propose the free season to be 1st February to 1st June. Witness No. 7 stated that the flowering season was March to May, and that the Ryats should be restricted from possessing unlimited quantities of flowers after June or July. Another witness ( No. 11 ), also a Mamlatdar, suggested 1st June to 31st December as the close season. The non-official witnesses are generally opposed to the idea of a close season, unless at the same time, as recommended by the Committee themselves, it is accompanied by a provision that the number of licensed vendors is increased largely, and the minimum price at which the vendors should buy the flowers from the poor people is fixed by law. The number of Bania traders engaged in this work ranges from 25 to 75 per Taluka. The number of licensed vendors should not fall short of this.



There is no provision in the present Bill to this effect, though it is a recommendation in which all the witnesses and the Committee concur. The free season, as proposed by the Committee, is obviously too short. In February the flowers do not begin to blossom. It is too cold a season to admit of this phenomenon. There is of course no harm to commence with February to err on the safeside, but the free season must, according to the evidence before us, extend to 1st June at least. From 1st June to October, the cattle require this food, as also the men, till new grass and grain spring up. The quantity which might be held without a license during this interval ought therefore to be larger than 4 seers.

We have thus examined the evidence recorded by the Committee, and its conclusions and recommendations. We hope to have shown that the Report is not in accordance with the evidence given before the Committee, and that its conclusions are recorded directly in the face of most weighty and reliable testimony to the contrary. It is the high rate of duty which encourages and stimulates illicit distillation, and as long as this is not remedied, there will be no change for the better in the habits of the people. We have also shown that Mhowra flowers are a very useful supplement to the poor man's stock of grain for himself and of fodder for his cattle, and that the attempt to levy high duties and impose severe restrictions will still more demoralize the people by driving them to turn their hands to other articles from which drink can be made. The evidence warrants only affirmative answers to both the questions referred to the Committee, and the negative answers given are not to the point, and are not true as statements of fact. We now leave it to our readers to say how far the recommendations of this Committee are entitled to weight and what honest justification they furnish for the proposed repressive legislation.

## THE BRAHMINS OF BENGAL AND KULINISM.\*

---

The Brahmins are territorially divided into two classes, viz the Goudas and the Dravidas. These two main divisions are further subdivided into the Punch Goudas and the Punch Dravidas. Under the Punch Goudas are Saraswat, Kanyakubja, Maithil, Gouda, and Ootkal. Gurjar, Maharashtra, Andhra, Karnataka, and Dravida make up the Punch Dravidas. The researches made by antiquarians have shown that the Aryans comprising the Brahmins, the Kshatriyâs, and the Vaishyas originally came to India from Central Asia, and settled themselves in the Punjab. Gradually they spread throughout India. At first they made Northern India their abode, and this part of India was known as Aryavarta. In the second Chapter of Manusanhita, it is mentioned that the tract of land which is bounded by the Himalayas on the North, and the Vindhya Hills on the South, is Aryavarta. From this it follows that the Aryans settled in Southern India after the period when the Manusanhita was written. These subdivisions of the Bramhin caste derived their names from the localities they occupied. Those who lived on the banks of the river Saraswati were called Saraswat ; those, who lived in Kanouj and the adjoining places, were called Kanya-Kubja; those, who lived in Mithila (Modern Tirhoot ), were called Maithila ; those, who lived in Gour, or Bengal, were called Goudas, and those, who lived in Ootkal (modern Orissa), were called Ootkal. The fact of the

---

\* This paper has been kindly placed at our disposal by Babu DinaNath Gangoli.

Brahmins of Northern India having been designated Punch Goudas shews that Gour, the ancient capital of Bengal, held a prominent place among the cities of Northern India at the time when this classification of the Brahmins took place. But to the misfortune of Bengal, Gour is now in ruins, and the Gouda Brahmins proper are scarcely to be seen in that country. The prevalence of Buddhism in Bengal at the time of the Pala Kings appears to have resulted in the destruction of the power of the Goud Brahmins, and their expatriation into other parts of India.

The accounts lately placed before the public by Babu Sharat Chander Dass C. I. E., who, during his sojourn in Thibet, made enquiries about the religion and literature of that country, shew that between the 8th and 11th century of the Christian era, there lived several Buddhist teachers in Gour and other places of Bengal, who, on account of their proficiency in Sanskrit and Palli literature received high honour from the King of Thibet. Buddhism was introduced into Thibet early in the seventh century from China and Nepal, through the influence of the princesses of those two Kingdoms, who were given in marriage to the kings of Thibet. But it was through the teachings of two of the Pandits of Bengal who were invited to Thibet by its king, This-rong-due-stan, about the beginning of the 8th century, that Buddhism became the state religion of that country. These accounts make mention of Shanta Raskhita, a native of Goura, having been invited to Thibet by its king, and appointed the high priest of Thibet. This great man was the teacher of Buddhistic doctrines, and he had a co-adjutor named Padma Sambhava, who conducted the rituals of the Buddhist church. At this time an eminent Buddhist Missionary came from China

to India. His doctrines were at variance with those promulgated by the Indian teachers, and in order to settle the disputed points a discussion took place in which the Indian teachers failed to dis-comfit the Chinese Missionary. In this dilemma the Bengali Acharyas requested the king to invite Komala Silu the philosopher of Bengal, and King Thisrong-deu-tsan did accordingly invite the Bengali teacher to Thibet. On the arrival of this philosopher, an assembly of great men was organised, and the two eminent men were requested to settle the disputed points by argumentation. In this controversy Komala Silu came out victorious, and the King of Thibet placed him at the head of the philosophical section of the Buddhist church of Thibet. The accounts referred to also show that at the request of king Kalpachav, many learned Pandits of Bengal went to Thibet to translate some Sanskrit works into the Thibetan language. In the middle of the 11th century after Christ, a great man named Dipankar flourished in Bengal. He belonged to the royal family of Gour. This great man was well versed in the Bramhin and Buddhistic philosophy and religion. Many corruptions had crept into Buddhism by this time, and at the invitation of the king of Thibet, Dipankar repaired to that kingdom, and effected a thorough reformation in the religion of Buddha; and for the service thus rendered by him, Depankar was honoured with the title of Ateesh, the highest rank that can be attained by a clergyman in Thibet. From what has been stated above, it follows that some of the learned Brahmins of Bengal, giving up their Vedas and Shastras, not only adopted the religion of Buddha, but became its chief supporters: and it is very likely that those, who did not accept Buddhism, left Bengal, and emigrated to other parts of India.

While Buddhist kings ruled Northern and Western Bengal, Hindu kings appear to have held sway over the sou-

thern and eastern portions of that country. It is a matter of dispute whether the Hindu Kings were subservient to the Pal Kings or not, but there is no doubt that their glory was bedimmed by the brighter effulgence of the Buddhist Kings. This much is certain that in the 11th century of the Christian era, Adisoor, the Hindu King of Bengal, made up his mind to perform a Yajna in accordance with the Vedas. There were at that time only 700 families of Brahmins, and they probably belonged to the Gouda community : but they were so ignorant of the Hindu Shastras, that the king could not find a single Brahmin among them capable of conducting the Yajna. Mr. Ramchandra Bhikaji Gunjkar, in his history of the Saraswat Brahmins, makes mention of Gomantak ( Goa ) having been peopled by Brahmins who came from Bengal. They brought with them their *Kuladewata* ( family deity ) Mahadev, who goes by the name of Mangirish, shortened into Mangesh. This account also states that the word Mangirish is given to the deity from a sacred place of that name in northern Bengal. This emigration from Bengal was, no doubt, the result of the ascendancy of Buddhism in that country. Some of the learned Brahmins of Bengal, as stated above, became preachers of Buddhism, and others, who did not accept Buddhism, left for Goa and other parts of India with their family deities. It is, therefore, not surprising to find that not more than 700 families of the Gouda Brahmins should have been left in the whole of Bengal. The descendants of these Brahmins are still seen in Bengal, and they go by the name of Saptashati : and the word Saptasati *i. e.* seven hundred, gives significance to this tradition.

To enable him to perform the Yajna, Adisoor found it necessary to import some good Brahmins from other parts

of India. At that time the Brahmins of Kanoja were reputed for learning and purity of character. The King, therefore, decided to bring a few of them from that place; and accordingly he sent a message to the King of Kanoj requesting him to send five Brahmins of five different Gotras or families, well-versed in the Vedas and Shastras, and I of unimpeachable character. In compliance with this request, Maharaj Beer Sinha selected five good Brahmins, and sent them with a letter to the Hindu King of Bengal. These Brahmins were accompanied by five Kayasthas. The names of the Brahmins with their Gotras are given below :

Name.	Gotra.
1 Bhutta Narayana.....	Shândilya.
2 Daksh .....	Kâshyapa.
3 Chawdarh .....	Watsayana.
4 Sbreeharsha .....	Bhâradwaja.
5. Veda-Garbha .....	Sabarnya.

The Brahmins conducted the Yajna to the satisfaction of the King. It is said that the Yajna, which was performed in the Christian year 1077, produced beneficial results. For soon after the king was blessed with an heir to the throne.

It now became the ambition of Adisoor to induce these Brahmins to remain in his Kingdom. The efforts of the King met with success, and the Brahmins made Bengal their abode. There are conflicting accounts as to whether the Brahmins brought their families with them or not. Seeing that they had only come in the first instance to conduct the Yajna, it was not likely that they brought their wives with them. They either went back to Kanoja, and came again to Bengal with their families, or King Adisoor, in

communication with the King of Kanoja, made the necessary arrangements for their families being brought to Bengal.

Adisoor gave grants of villages to the Brahmins, and did all he could to make them comfortable. Bhatta Narayen received a grant of a village named Panchakoti, Daksha received Kainkoti, Chandarh received Harikoti, Shreebarsha received Kanka Grama, and Vedagarbha received Bata Grama. In time the Brahmins were blessed with many sons. Bhatta Narayen had sixteen, Daksha sixteen, Chawdarh eight, Shreeharsh four, and Vedagarbha twelve. The King made further grants of villages, and each of the sons received a village for himself. The names of these villages became the family names of those who received them in gift. The ancestors of the Brahmins, who are now known as Bannoojies, occupied a village named Bondya. Their family name is Bondya-Upadhya *i. e.* religious teachers of the Bondya village. This title is now changed into Bannerji. In this manner the family names of the Mookerjees, Chatterjees, Gangolis and others have taken their origin. When the descendants of these Brahmins increased in numbers, they spread throughout Bengal, and a large number occupied a tract in Northern Bengal bordering on the river Padma, called Borendra Bhoomi, and these are since known as Borendras. They also received grants of villages from the King, and lived in that tract comfortably. Their surnames such as Maitra, Lahiri and Bhaduri are derived from the names of the villages they occupied. Those who lived in other parts of Bengal are known as Rarhis, being so called from the tract called Rarbhoomi. These two Vorendras and Rahrees are the two main divisions of the Brahmins of Bengal. Most of them conduct divine worship and ceremonies in accordance with

Koothoom, I Shakha of the Sama Veda, and they go by the name of Sama Vedi Brahmins, Rigvedi and Yajurvedi Brahmins are very few in Bengal.

Whilst the Hindu Kings of Bengal were trying to restore the prestige of the Brahmins, and thereby to revive the Hindu religion, a revolution took place which overthrew the Buddhist Kingdom, and swept away Buddhism from Bengal. There is no historical record of this event, but the researches of antiquarians, who have worked assiduously to bring into light the past history of India as far as possible, have shown that in the 11th century, whilst the Chola Kings of the Karnatac were carrying on their aggressive campaign against Jainism in Southern India, a member of that family came to Bengal, and succeeded in subverting the Buddhist Kingdom, and hoisting the standard of Hinduism in Northern Bengal. The inscriptions on the copper-plates found at Rajshayi, in the Sunderbuns, and in the temple of Shiva in Baijanath, have proved conclusively that Vijayasen, son of Hemant Sen, a King of the Chola dynasty, ruled in Bengal in the middle of the 11th century, and established Shaivism in that country. It is said that Vijayasen married a daughter of the last King of the Adisoor dynasty, who had no male issue, and the result of this connection was the birth of a son who in time ruled the whole of Bengal. This statement is borne out by the writings of the Kulacharyas of both the Rarhi and Barendra communities. The son of Vijayasen was the illustrious Ballalsen, who made himself famous not only by extending his kingdom, but by raising the position of the Brahmins and Kayastas of Bengal. We have now come to an eventful period in the history of the Kanoja Brahmins of Bengal, but before dealing with it, let us say something about the minor classes of Brahmins.



Opinion is divided with regard to the Vaidic Brahmins. Some say that they originally came from Southern India, and settled themselves in Orissa. When the influence of Buddhism put a stop to the performance of rites and ceremonies in accordance with the Vedas, these Brahmins were brought from Southern India to revive them. Their reputation for proficiency in Vaidic lore spread far and wide, and some of them were brought to Bengal. Others say that, as at the time of the degradation of the Gouda Brahmins, five Brahmins were brought from Kanoj to revive the Vaidic learning, so in time when signs of corruption were noticed among the Kanya-Kubja Brahmins, it became necessary a second time to bring some Brahmins from the Deccan. Had the Vaidic Brahmins been specially sent for by any king to revive the Hindu religion, some record or tradition of the same would have been preserved. It is true that the descendants of the five Brahmins who came from Kanoj soon lost their pre-eminence in learning to a certain extent: but adequate steps were taken by King Ballal-sen and his successors to raise them to their original status. Moreover, had the Vaidic Brahmins been brought over to Bengal by any king, they would have received villages such as were granted to the Brahmins who came from Kanoj on king Adisoor's invitation. The fact of the Vaidic Brahmins having no surnames to signify the villages owned by them shows that they received no such grants. There is no record to show when they came. They are divided into two classes, viz Dakshinatya Vaidic and Paschattya Vaidic: and this shows that they did not come at the same time. It is likely that the former came of their own accord from the Karnatic in hopes of receiving favours from the Chola kings who ruled in Bengal, and that, the latter, signifying those who came from the West, were forced by Moslem oppression to come

to Bengal to take shelter under the Hindu Kings who ruled that country. There is no doubt that these Brahmins were learned in the Vedas. For they received due veneration from the people, as is evidenced from the fact of their being recognised as the spiritual guides of many noble families in Bengal. They were called Vaidic on account of their knowledge of the Vedas. It is not known whether these Brahmins did any thing towards the revival of the Vedic learning, but it is evident that if they made any effort in that direction, it ended in failure. For we find that the Vedic spiritual guides of the present day initiate their pupils in Tantric worship only. It is a matter of history that when Shaivism succeeded in checking the influence of Buddhism in India, a King of the Chola Dynasty of Kanchipuram gave up Buddhism, and became a Shaiva. He was initiated into Shaivism by Manikya Pandya. The year in which this event took place is not known. In the 7th century of the Christian era, Buddhism was prevalent in Kanchipuram, and in the 8th century Jainism was the religion of that place. It is likely that the King of Kanchipuram embraced Shaivism after the eighth century, and from that time it became the religion of the state. At this period the Pandits of Southern India wrote the Puranas and other books advocating the cause of Shaivism. These Pandits, through the help of the Chola Kings, endeavoured, no doubt, to spread their doctrines throughout India: and it is likely that some of them went to Bengal for that purpose, and established themselves there at the time of the Sen Kings of Bengal. Babu Akshay Kumar Datta in his learned work named 'the religious sects of India' has shown that the Tantric rites originated in Bengal, and that the Tantra Institutes were written not more than a thousand years ago. The Sen kings ruled in Bengal at this period, and it is pro-

bable that in their endeavour to promulgate the Hindu religion in Bengal, they induced the Pundits to write the Tantras. Some of these inculcate the worship of Shiva, and others of Shakti. The Shaivágamás were written first, and the Sháktágamás afterwards. It may be inferred from this that the worship of Shiva was first introduced, and that it was an after-thought to supplement it by the worship of Shakti. The Vaidic Brahmins of Bengal, when initiating their pupils, instruct them to worship Shakti under such names as Kali, Durga, and Jagat-Dhatri ; and the fact of the Tantric worship being prevalent chiefly in Bengal shows that the Tantras were written in that country.

The Vaidic Brahmins have several Gotras. In the Kuladeepika mention is made of 42 Gotras, of which 24 are of a high order. Among these there are Brahmins who have descended from Shandillya, Kashyapa, Batsya, Bharadwaja, and Sabarnya, and these are the Gotras of the five Brahmins who came from Kanouj. Most of them are Sama Vedis. There are very few professors of the Rigveda Yajurveda among them. Although they call themselves Samavedis, they perform divine worship and the ceremonies in accordance with rites followed by those who are Rigvedis and Yajurvedis. The Samavedis have adopted a portion of Koothoona Shákhâ, the Rigvedis a portion of the Ashwalayan Shákhâ, and the Yajurvedis a portion of the Kanva Shákhâ. It is necessary to mention here that although the Tantric worship is prevalent in Bengal, the Vedas are held in great reverence : and among the Brahmins the Vedic and Tantric worship are both in vogue. The Bengal Brahmins are initiated twice, the first occasion being when the ceremony of wearing the sacred thread is performed and they are taught to worship in

accordance with the Vedas, and from that time the Vaidic Sandhya is performed thrice a day. On this occasion the required ceremonies are performed with the assistance of the family priest, and a near relation of the boy instructs him in the Gayatri which is considered to be the essence of the Vedas. The meaning of the Gayatri is :—“ I meditatē upon the wisdom and might of that great God, who has created and developed the universe, who is the source of all good, and who has imbued us with sense and other qualities of the mind.” The second initiation takes place after marriage into the Tantric worship. This is done by the spiritual guide who instructs them to worship Shakti in one of its numerous forms, such as Durga and Kali. The wife assists her husband in this second initiation and both have to perform worship in accordance with the Vedas as well as the Tantras. The writers of the Tantras are very liberal in their views. They enjoy the Tantric worship on Brahmins as well as on the Shudras. It is mentioned in the Maha Nirban Tantra that Mahadeva, in reply to a question put by Parvati, said that the mode of worship prescribed in the Tantras is complete in every respect and that a Dwija can attain salvation by following it even if he does not perform the Vedic Sandhya.

There is no Jagat-Guru or Lord Bishop in Bengal, as is seen in Southern India. There are spiritual guides, each having the spiritual charge of a certain number of families. Among them the Vaidic Brahmins held a prominent place. Many of them reside at Bhatpara one of the seats of learning in Bengal. Some of them are very learned in the Shastras, and are held in great reverence. Chaitannya, the great reformer of Bengal, was a Vaidic Brahmin.

Mention has already been made of the class of Brahmins called Saptashatis. When the descendants of the five Brah-

mins who came from Kanouj began to receive favours from the King, the Saptashati Brahmins lost their prestige, and the people did not pay them the usual homage. In time they began to be called by the name of Saptashati, which indicated their inferiority to the Brahmins from Kanouj. They considered it a disgrace to make themselves known as such. It became, therefore, an ardent ambition with them to incorporate themselves with the Brahmins from Kanouj, as also with those who came from Southern India. Those, who became known as learned and pious, succeeded in their attempt. The rest, it is very probable, became the spiritual guides and priests of the Shudras. It may be mentioned here that Brahmins of a superior order do not officiate as priests in Shudras' houses, and that those who do so are held in disrepute. Most of the Vaidic Brahmins are the spiritual guides of the Brahmins only. When Shudras saw that they could not induce the Vaidic and other good Brahmins to act as their spiritual guides and priests, they asked the help of the Saptashatis who gladly complied with their wishes. At present there are only a few Brahmins of this class who profess themselves to be Saptashati and are also called Saraswats. They are constantly endeavouring to raise their position by forming marriage connections with the Kulin Brahmins. By taking the daughters of the Saptashati and Saraswat Brahmins, the Kulin Brahmins are lowered to a certain extent, and they submit to this degradation on receipt of a very large sum of money, sometimes thousands of rupees, as compensation for this loss of prestige. The Zamindars of Sat-kheera are Saraswat Brahmins. They give their daughters in marriage to Kulin Brahmins, and when so doing give large sums of money to their son-in-law, in addition to the present of watch

and chain, dress, household utensils and bedding, as also gold and silver ornaments, which they give to their daughters.

There are two other classes of Brahmins called the *Mādhyā Srainee* and the *Paschima*. There is a tradition to the effect that the Brahmins comprising the *Madhya Srainee* came to Bengal at the time when the *Moguls* and the *Maharattas* fought with each other. It is not known to what community they belonged, but it is said that after taking their residence in Bengal, they connected themselves by marriage with the other Brahmins of Bengal. In a Bengali work, named *Sambandha Nirnaya*, it is mentioned that on a certain occasion the Brahmins from the *Deccan* and the *Upper provinces* united themselves by marriage with the *Rarhees*, the *Barendras* and other classes of the Brahmins of Bengal, and that the pure Brahmins of that time gave them the name *Madhya Srainee* i. e. Brahmins of the middle class. It is said that these Brahmins were very learned and liberal minded, and that they were much respected by the *Marathā Rulers*. The other class called *Paschima* have many divisions among them, such as *Dobay*, *Choubay* and *Tewari*. These Brahmins evidently came from those parts of Northern India, which lie to the west of Bengal. The word *Paschima* implies it, and the surnames they bear lead us to the same conclusion.—*Dobay* is a corruption of the word *Dwivedi*. The Brahmins, who are familiar with two of the Vedas, *Rig* and *Sama*, bear this name. — Those, who studied three Vedas, *Rig*, *Sama* and *Yajus*, are honoured by the title of *Trevedi* corrupted into *Tewari*; and those, who studied four Vedas *Rig*, *Sama*, *Yajus* and *Atharwa*, go by the name of *Chatur-Vedi* corrupted into *Choubey*. Those, who have accepted Bengali spiritual guides and priests, follow the practices of the Brahmins of Bengal; but those, who have spiritual guides and priests of their own community, perform rites and cere-

monies peculiar to themselves. They perform Sandhya and conduct divine service in accordance with the Vedas. The first initiation at the time of putting on the sacred thread is considered sufficient by them, and the Brahmin who gives instructions at that time in the Vaidic religion is recognised as the real spiritual guide. Initiation into the Tantric worship a second time is not considered necessary by them, and they do not recognise a second spiritual guide. They say that the Tantras are intended for women and Shudras, and not for the Dwijas. They are, however, obliged for the sake of their females to secure the services of a Tantric Gooru, but they do not resort to this course in cases when their Vaidic spiritual guide is able to give instructions in the Tantras also. Both the Hindee and Bengali languages are spoken by them, but when speaking to the members of their own community, they use the Hindee language. The dress they put on is composed of that partly used in Upper India, and partly that worn in Bengal. Although they have not yet been incorporated with the Brahmins of Bengal, it is scarcely possible for them to continue as a separate community for any long period. They have adopted, to a great extent, the dress and diet in use in Bengal and they follow also some of the customs of the Brahmins of that country, and the day is not distant when they will be absorbed in that vast community.

Let us now revert to the Kanouj Brahmins of Bengal. We have made mention of their having spread throughout that country, and there is no doubt that they continued to receive favours from the rulers who succeeded Adisoor. Adisoor granted villages to the first five Brahmins whom he brought from Kanouj, as also to their sons, and the fact of the descendants of those Brahmins having also received grants of villages shows that the successors of Adisoor showed

favours towards them. These Brahmins must have spread throughout Bengal during the time of the Sen kings. It is not known how many kings of this dynasty ruled in Bengal: but there is no doubt that at the time of Ballal Sen Bengal rose to great eminence. Ballal Sen was an accomplished and powerful sovereign. He was learned in the Shastras, a consummate general in the field, and a good administrator. His work named Dana—Sagara is a proof of his learning, as well as of his knowledge of the Hindu Shastras. He gave encouragement to men of learning and piety. Some of the most learned Brahmins were his ministers. Among them was *Shree Adideva of the Sabarnya Gotra*. Ballal Sen was a just as well as benevolent ruler. He took a great interest in the welfare of his subjects. In order to keep the higher classes of the Hindus pure, he established the order of Koulinya, and conferred it on deserving men. The exact time in which this event took place cannot be ascertained. The author of *Samaya Prakash* says that the king wrote his work *Danasagar* in Shakaabda 1019 or 1097 of the Christian era, and his successor Laxuman Sen ascended the throne in the year 1106 A. D. It is mentioned in *Sambandha Nirnaya* that Ballal Sen instituted Kulinism towards the close of his reign. Taking this statement to be correct, Kulinism must have been established in the beginning of the 12th century. Leaving it to the antiquarians to clear up the point, we shall place before the reader a short account of Kulinism.

The order of Koulinya was conferred on the Brahmins as well as on the Kayastas. But as we are giving an account of the Brahmins only, our remarks on Kulinism will be confined to that body. Fortunately for Bengal, there is a class of Brahmins called Kulacharyas who have kept accounts of



the Kulins. These accounts are called *Kulasbâstrâs*. They contain records of the classification and geneology of the Kulins, with full particulars of the changes that have taken place in each family by marriage connections. These accounts show that Ballal Sen gave the title of Kulin to those Brahmins who possessed nine qualities *i. e.* (1) Good behaviour, (2) meekness, (3) learning, (4) being men of good reputation, (5) being men who had performed pilgrimages, (6) having faith in God, (7) having formed marriage connections with good families, (8) practising contemplation of God, (9) and giving gifts to the needy. There is a tradition to the effect that the 7th quality was not among the nine recognised by the King. It is said that *Abritti* has been substituted for *Shanti*, which means peace of mind. This seems to be true. For in the word *Abritti* some vital points in connection with marriage are involved. A Kulin is required to give his daughter in marriage to a family either equal to, or superior to, that to which he belongs. He has also to take a daughter from a family of the same status. In the event of a Kulin having no daughter, the connections referred to cannot be formed, and consequently the Kulin is lowered to a certain extent. The King, who instituted the orders of *Koulinya* with the noble object of giving encouragement to learned and pious men, could not have intended that a Kulin should be degraded for no fault of his own, but for the mere fact of Providence not having vouchsafed to him a daughter. To remove this defect it was enjoined on the Kulins to make an image of grass to represent a daughter, and give it in marriage in the presence of the *Kulacharya*. But this practice is not prevalent now : and the Kulin, who has no daughter, is placed in a rank lower than the first class Kulins. There were nineteen Brahmins who obtained the order of

Koulinya from Ballal Sen. Of the 56 families who obtained grants of villages from the King, only eight could boast of having Brahmins who possessed the nine qualities required of them, and the number of such person was not more than nineteen. The eight families from which Ballal Sen selected the nineteen Brahmins are *Boudya*, *Chatto*, *Mookhuti*, *Gangoli*, *Ghosal*, *Pootintoonda*, *Kanjilall* and *Koondogrami*. Thirty four of the families were deficient in one quality. They, therefore, obtained a rank below the Kulins, and were honored with the title of *Shrotriya*. The remaining fourteen families were not considered by the King to be of good repute. They were, therefore, recognised as *Gouna* or inferior Kulins. In time the *Gouna* Kulins ceased to be designated as such. They came to be known as *Kashta* Shrotriya i. e. Shrotriya of an inferior order. After establishing Kulinism, Ballal Sen designated some of the Brahmins as *Ghataks*, and enjoined on them the duty of recording the doings of the Kulins. There is another class of Brahmins called *Bungshuj*. They are very low in the estimation of other Brahmins, and those Kulins, who form marriage connections with *Bungshuj* families, are degraded. There is nothing on record to show whether the king gave the epithet of *Bungshuj* to any class of Brahmins : but Pundit Eshwar Chandra Vidyasagar in his work on Polygamy gave it as his opinion that as only 19 members of the eight families of Brahmins were honored with the rank of Koulinya, the remaining members of these families were classified as *Bungshuj* with the rank of *Ghatak* or *Kulacharya*, and that the Kulins, who formed marriage connections with the *Bungshuj* families, lost their rank, and swelled the number of *Bungshuj* families.

It is said that Laxuman Sen who succeeded Ballal Sen put on a firm basis the institution of Kulinism established by

his father. He used to supervise the doings of the Kulins to see that they did not go astray. He also like his father encouraged learned men. His Council Hall was adorned by five learned men, called Panch Ratnas, of whom Jeyadeva the famous poet of Bengal, was the most distinguished ornament. The inscriptions on two copper plates, one found in the Sunderbuns, and another near Denajpure, show that the King made grants of some land to two Brahmins. This shows that he tried to maintain the prestige of that class. There is reason to believe that, as long as the Hindu Kings ruled Bengal, the Brahmins, and especially the Kulins, received due encouragement from them, and they retained the learning and piety required of them : but that from the time when Bengal lost her independence, corruptions began to creep into the Kulin community.

In the 16th century of the Christian era, a classification of the Rarhi Kulins took place. Bengal was then under Moslem sway, and there was no Hindu ruler to encourage learned and pious men, and to punish delinquent Kulins. At this time an energetic and earnest man, named Devibara, undertook the work of classifying the Kulins. But it is a matter of regret that the motive, which induced King Ballal Sen to institute the order of Koulinya, was lost sight of, and the classification was made, not according to the piety and learning of the Kulins, but in consideration of their having degraded themselves by forming marriage connections with families lower than themselves. The eight qualities which a Kulin should possess were thrown into the back ground, and Devibara's classification was based solely on Abritti, the 7th quality which enjoins marriage connections being formed with good families. I shall here narrate an incident which induced Devi-

---

bara to classify the Kulins, for it strikingly illustrates the extent to which the Kulins of that period had degraded themselves. On a certain occasion, a Kulin Brahmin, named Jageshwara Pandit, went to the house of his cousin Devibara. His aunt was in the house. Jageshwara made obeisance to her, and made enquiries about his cousin who had gone elsewhere. The good woman blessed Jageshwara, and requested him to take tiffin, telling him that she would prepare food for him. Jageshwara replied that the family, to which she had been connected by marriage, was so low that it was a degradation to a Kulin like him to even wash his feet in that house. So saying, he requested his aunt not to prepare any food for him, as he would be polluted by partaking of the food cooked by her. He might and could cook the food himself, but by so doing he would show disrespect to her. The only course left for him was to go away without taking his meals. So saying, he left his cousin's house. Devibara's mother felt much aggrieved. She considered herself to have been insulted by Jageshwara, and she remained in a dejected mood. After a short time Devibara returned home. Seeing his mother depressed, he enquired of her the cause of it. She then narrated to her son all that had occurred. On hearing this, Devibara became greatly incensed, and he resolved to expose not only his cousin, but the whole class of Kulins.

Devibara was a Ghatak, and as such it was his duty to supervise the doings of the Kulins, and report the same to the ruler of the country. But as there was no Hindu ruler at the time, the Ghataks became slack in their duty, and the Kulins went on violating the rules of Kulinism, there being no one to check them. Devibara now travelled all over the country, and began to inquire into the doings of the

Kulins. He found them more or less degenerated, and he kept notes of the flaws he found in each family. After this, Devibara convened a meeting of the Ghataks at which he suggested a classification of the Kulins being made according to the qualities they then possessed. The Ghataks approved of the proposal made by Devibara, and at a general meeting of Kulins and Ghataks, the proposed classification was made. The Kulins were divided into 36 classes. They were graded in consideration of the amount of purity noticed in the Kulin families. Those, for example, who formed marriage connections with the Gouna Kulins of a particular grade, were formed into one class. Each family was permitted to form marriage connections with another of the same class only. In this manner the purity of the Kulins was retained. For some time things went on satisfactorily. The landed property they received from the Kings of Bengal enabled the Kulins to maintain themselves and their families, but in time as they increased in number, so many divisions were made of the property they possessed, that the income derived from the same was found insufficient to maintain them. They, therefore, began to form marriage connections with Gouna Kulins and Bungshojs, by which means they obtained much wealth. So great was the desire on the part of the lower classes of Brahmins to raise their position, that they scrupled not to give to their Kulin sons-in-law thousands of rupees. Instances are not wanting of some landholders having given shares of their property to their sons-in-law when giving their daughters in marriage. In this manner Kulins of the superior orders dwindled in numbers, and difficulty was found in getting good Kulins to whom they could give their daughters. These Kulins go by the name of Naikooshya. They can take wives from the Shrotriya families, but they cannot give their daughters into these

families without being degraded. For this reason it is necessary for a Kulin family of the superior class to come to an agreement with another family of the same class in view to the intermarriage of their children. To prevent consanguineous marriage connections being formed, a Gangoli family, for instance, has to enter into an agreement with a Mookerji or Bonnerji family. It so happens, sometimes, that in one contracting family there are many girls to be given in marriage, whereas in the other family there is only one Kulin boy available. In such a case the latter is obliged to take all the girls of the other family as his wives. No regard whatever is paid to the consideration of age or bodily and mental accomplishments of the Kulin boy or of the girls. It so happens that after the contract is made, one of the parties by forming marriage connections with either an inferior Shrotriya or a Bungshuj loses his rank, and the other party is obliged to enter into an agreement with another good Kulin. It becomes a matter of great importance to a person who has daughters to give in marriage to secure eligible alliances, for the national sentiment requires that a girl must be married any how. At this time the state of his mind can better be conceived than described. He has to make handsome presents to the Ghataks through whom the contract is made. He has also to pay a very large sum to the Kulin with whom he has to make agreement. Often times parents, on account of their poverty, consent to let their sons be married with daughters belonging to inferior Shrotriyas, which enables them to get large sums of money. When these sons grow old, they feel their degraded position, and they try to raise their status. This they do by taking the daughters of a good Kulin. This is a very difficult task, and they have to take the help of a Ghatak, who, in con-

sideration of the handsome present he gets, arranges the matter by fair or foul means. This is sometimes done through the help of distant relations of the daughter, without the knowledge of the parents themselves. Marriage is one of the sixteen *Sanskaras* or rites which must be performed by a Hindu, and a Hindu family becomes polluted if a female member of it remains unmarried. A Kulin Brahmin, therefore, considers himself fortunate if he can secure for his sister or daughter even an old kulin on the verge of death as husband. But notwithstanding the injunctions of the Shastras, instances are not wanting of Kulin women not having been given in marriage at all by reason of the difficulty of forming suitable alliances.

The NaiKoosbya Kulins consider it a degradation on their part to send their daughters to the house of their sons-in-law. They are, therefore, obliged to invite their sons-in-law now and then to their own houses. It is good to be the son-in-law of a wealthy Kulin. The thought of supporting his wife and children does not trouble such a son-in-law, even if he gets a large number of children by his kulin wife, for the burden of supporting them rests on his father-in-law. His presence in the family is an occasion for great rejoicing. He is not only sumptuously fed, but is given rich presents. It may be mentioned here that a Naikoosbya Kulin is bound, in addition to a Kulin girl, to take a girl from a Shrotriya family, and he is bound to support her and the children that are born of her. The presents he receives from his Shrotriya as well as his Kulin father-in-law enable him to maintain his Shrotriya wife and her children. The condition of a poor Naikoosbya Kulin having several daughters is very miserable. He cannot send his daughters to the house of their husbands for fear of losing his prestige, and on the other hand he has

not the means to support them. Those, who have the good luck of having rich Shrotriya fathers-in-law, get help from them, and thereby manage to support their daughters : but notwithstanding this, they generally lead a very uneasy and miserable life.

There is another class of Kulins called Bhungos. This class has lately come into existence. They are the descendants of such of the Naikoosya Kulins as have formed marriage connections with Bungshojs. In former times, they used to be classed with the Bungshojs, but now some prestige has been enjoyed by them. Their descendants up to the 3rd generation pass their time in great honour, and they do not lose their prestige altogether even up to the 7th generation. We have seen that the Naikooshyas, in order to maintain their status, are obliged to take more than one wife, and the number, so far as is known to us, does not exceed six. They are bound to take two wives, one from a Shrotriya and another from a Kulin family, and it is only when there are more than one daughter in the Kulin family, that they are obliged to marry them all. But the case with Bhungo Kulins is quite different. Well knowing that their prestige will not continue long in the family, they make the best use of their temporary advantage. Brahmins of lower orders vie with each other in giving their daughters in marriage to them, and they always accord to them a hearty welcome, and gladly accept their offer on receiving suitable presents of money and house-hold things. They are not required to support the girls they marry. The girls remain at the houses of their parents, who invite their sons-in-law from time to time, and satisfy them with rich presents. The Bhungo Kulins recognise one of the females married by them as their legiti-



mate wife, and keep her in the house. The other marriages are contracted for the purpose of earning money. Some of the Bhungo Kulins do not wait for invitations from their fathers-in-law. When they require money, they go on a tour visiting their wives at different places, and receiving presents from their fathers-in-law.

It is the opinion of many sensible men that Ballal Sen was the first King of Bengal who established the order of Koulinya, and conferred titles on both the Rarhi and Barendra communities. But in a work published by Babu Mohun Chander Moozumdar, who belongs to the Barendra community, it is mentioned that Dharashura, a King of the *soor* dynasty, conferred the dignity of Koulinya on Brahmins of the Rarhi community, and that Ballal Sen, who ruled Bengal long after him, followed the example of Dharashoor, and conferred a similar honor on the Brahmins of the Barendra community. It is obviously not of much consequence whether the Koulinya order was established by Dharashoor or by Ballal Sen. There is no doubt that the order was established to subserve a very good purpose. But it is much to be regretted that such a useful institution should have been perverted by two individuals viz,—Devibara of the Rarhi community, and Udayanacharya of the Barendra community, to subserve their nefarious ends. There is, however, one good feature in the Kulinism of the Barendra community. The class called Bhungo is not in existence in it. When a good Kulin marries the daughter of a Bungshoj, he is classed as a Bungshoj, and not ranked as a Bhungo Kulin, as is the case in the Rarhi community. So that the evils of Kulinism are not so great among the Barendras as among the Rarhis. The Naikoosbha or good Kulins marry more than one female in order to maintain their prestige, but

the Bhungo Kulins marry as many as they like in order to earn money. In short Kulinism has become a profession with them.

In his work on Polygamy published in the year 1871, Pandit Ishwara Chander Vidyasagara gave a list of 133 Kulin Brahmins who had wives ranging from 5 to 80. These Kulins belonged to 76 villages. Twenty years have elapsed since the publication of the book by the Pandit, and during this period so much general progress has been made in Bengal, that the educated public have been under the impression that Kulinism has lost its vigour, and that whatever remains of it will soon die out, and no steps need be taken to ~~put it down~~. In the National Magazine for November 1891, a writer signing himself Bhargava says—  
“For good or for evil, polygamy is daily becoming a thing of the past \* \* To strike at a dead institution implies only Quixotic chivalry \* \* At any rate it is too late in the day to attack Kulinism on the ground of the polygamous marriages it is supposed to foster.”

We heartily wish this were true, but as a matter of fact the evil shows little or no abatement. The Sanjivani of Bengal, with commendable zeal, lately published lists of Hindus who have more than one wife. The information relates to a limited number of villages only. We have summarised these lists so far as the Brahmins are concerned, and the result of it is given below. In these villages there are 197 Brahmins who are bigamists, and 149 are polygamists. The polygamists have wives ranging from 3 to 36. Some of these polygamists are young men. There are 27 Brahmins of the age ranging from 16 to 35 who have 3 wives each, 16 of the age ranging from 23 to 35 who have four wives each, 4 of the age ranging from 24 to 35

who have 5 wives each, 5 of the age ranging from 25 to 33 who have 6 wives each, one who is 32 years old has 7 wives, one who is 25 years old has 8 wives, two who are 30 or 34 years old have each 10 wives, two who are 27 and 30 years old have each 12 wives, 3 of the age ranging from 25 to 32 have 14 wives each, and one who is 28 years old has 16 wives. We have not, in making up these lists, taken into account those who are above 35 years of age. So that it follows that most, if not all, of these marriages were celebrated after Pandit Ishwar Chunder Vidyasagar had compiled his list of polygamists. It is worthy of note that one of the polygamists who is 37 years of age has got 35 wives. These facts show conclusively that Kulinism, though looked down upon in and about Calcutta, is still in force in Bengal, and speedy steps should be taken to put it down. The number of polygamists here shown is but a fraction of the total number, and if statistics be taken of the whole country, the magnitude of the evil will at once be apparent.

The Kulins themselves should come forward to remove this evil. Barring a few Bhungo Kulins with whom Kulinism is a means of earning money, the system is ruinous to the entire body of Kulins. The Kulins are at the mercy of the Ghataks, who keep an account of all that transpires in their families, and if they note down any thing damaging to the reputation of any Kulins, who may not be on friendly terms with them, that Kulin is lowered in the estimation of his brother Kulins. The Kulins, therefore, not only flatter these Ghataks with words of praise, but bow down to them as they do to their spiritual guides, and make presents of money.

There can be no greater than for a pure Kulin thus to render homage to men who belong to the Bungshoj class, and who, generally speaking, are not of good principles. It is not a little

distressing to a Kulin father to be obliged to marry his daughter, say 10 years old, to an old man on the very verge of death. His distress is more intense when on the death of his son-in-law, he sees before him his daughters, 3 or 4 in number, who had been wedded to the deceased, suffer the misery attendant on widowhood. The anxiety of a Kulin is very great when he desires to enter into a contract with a Kulin family. He has to amass a large sum of money to meet the expenses of marriage, as well as to pay presents to his son-in-law. When the contract is settled, and his daughters are married, his troubles are not over. He has to present money to his son-in-law from time to time, and to support his daughters and their children. When he breathes his last, his son has to bear the burden of supporting his sisters and their children. Often times the daughters of a Kulin remain unmarried for many years, till some grow old, for want of a good kulin husband, and it sometimes happens that they are given in marriage to boys. According to the Hindu Shastras it is a sin to keep in the house a girl who has arrived at puberty, but the Kulins trample under feet the injunctions of the Shastras, and there is no one to check them. After all this anxiety, trouble, and expense, a Kulin is not sure of maintaining his rank. It is ordained in the Kula Shastra that a Kulin who has no sister loses his prestige, and this misfortune may happen to any one. Besides this, kidnapping of boys and girls take place in Kulin families. This is done by the Ghataks who act as bribe-agents to some Kulins; Such of the Kulins, as have lost their prestige, wish to regain their position, and they give perquisites to the Ghataks, who by unfair means get boys or girls from Kulin families through the help of their distant relations. These boys or girls are connected by marriage with the families of the degraded Kulins. From what has been stated above, it is evident that

the Kulins suffer a good deal in order to maintain their so called prestige. They sacrifice their principles at the altar of Kulinism by bribing the Ghataks, their parental affection towards their daughters is blunted, and the means they adopt to keep their status only enhance their sufferings, they incur heavy debts, which they fail to liquidate, and the burden falls on the shoulder of their sons : and, above all, they become miserable by reason of the non-performance of one of the ten sacraments enjoined by the Shastras. Now let us see what they gain by maintaining Kulinism. On occasions of marriage the Ghataks recite from the Kula Shastras texts describing the high lineage and glorious deeds of their ancestors, and extol them to such an extent that the Kulins at the time consider themselves to be super-human. They are respected by the Shrotriyas, the inferior Kulins and the Bungsoj, and this flattery elates them to such an extent that they decline to take meals at the houses of non-Kulins. It is true that the Kulins get money now and then, but this is only when they form marriage connections with families inferior to them, so that the Kulins do not get anything by upholding Kulinism. To a conscientious man the money-gain alluded to above is really a loss. Is it becoming of him to pamper himself with the sycophancy of a low class of men like the Ghataks? Is it becoming of him to consider himself great when he is really not so? Is it becoming of him to call himself a Kulin when he has not got the nine qualities which he ought to possess? Is it becoming of him to boast of his hereditary honour when he himself is personally unworthy of it? Humility is one of the qualities of a Kulin. By boasting of his superiority over others, and even declining to take meals at the houses of gentlemen simply because they are not Kulins, does he not trample that quali-

ty under foot, and become a transgressor of the rules of Kulinism which he is bound to follow? And above all, not possessing the qualities of a Kulin, does he not commit sin by taking presents from those who, really speaking, are not inferior to him in any respect?

There are some educated gentlemen among the polygamists mentioned above: and this makes the case more deplorable. We know they are induced by their parents and guardians to abide by its rules. They would however do well to show their manliness by explaining to them the evils of Kulinism, and acting according to the dictates of their conscience.

The impression, that Kulinism is fading away under the influence of Western education, is an erroneous one. Only the cities and towns are lit with the light of education: and even in them there are but a few really educated men who can realise the baneful effects of Kulinism. Cimmerian darkness still envelopes the interior of Bengal, and it is not known what time it will take before the evil is finally put down. It is therefore highly incumbent on the part of the educated Kulins to bestir themselves, and take immediate steps to re-organize Kulinism on a sound basis. We do not wish to deprive them of the honour they possess: but if they wish to be regarded as rational beings, they should remove from Kulinism the corruptions that have crept into it. If a Devibara or an Udyanacharya succeeded in dividing the Kulins into various classes, there is no reason why the educated Kulins, as a body, cannot reunite themselves. If they cannot at once unite all the classes, they can, as a first step, make groups of some classes, and do away with the practice of making contract with a particular

family. They can also make a rule to the effect that a Kulin shall not forfeit his rank if he forms marriage connection either with a Kulin or a Shrotriya family. The ruling, that a Naikooshya Kulin must take a daughter from a Shrotriya as well as from a Kulin family, seems to have been framed by some designing persons, and there is no reason why such a ruling cannot be replaced by the one suggested above which will confer a real benefit on the Kulins, and raise them in the estimation of the public. By upholding this baneful system the Kulins are not only increasing their own troubles, but are showing inhumanity to their sisters and daughters to an extent which every reasonable man must shudder to think of. Such a state of things cannot last long. It is impossible that the benign British Government should for all time allow the Kulins to treat their females in the manner they do. It will redound to the glory of the Kulins if they themselves come forward to remove the evils in time. If they do not, of their own accord, undertake to do this, the time is not distant when they will be forced to give up a system, which a good ruler organized for the benefit of the Hindus of Bengal, and which they have abused so grievously to their own discredit and misery.

\* \* We have given insertion to this paper with a view to draw public attention to the existence of this enormous evil of over-marriages among the Kulin section of the Bengal Brahmin community. The subject has been under consideration for the past 35 years and we understand that as far back as 1855, the *Bundhu Varga Samavâya Sabha*, at the instance of Babu Kissory Chandra Mitra, sent up a numerously-signed petition praying for a legislative enactment against polygamy. Two years later, in 1857, under the leadership of the late

Babu Rama Prasad Roy, the leading gentry of Bengal, sent up another petition to the Legislative Council with the same prayer. Raja Deo Narayan Sing Bahadur, the Maharaja of Benares, contemplated the introduction of a Bill to check the evil of polygamy during the time that he was a member of the Supreme Legislative Council, but he was unable to carry out his intention as his term of office expired before he could secure the sanction of Government. In 1866, another influentially-signed petition was presented to Sir Cecil Beadon, the then Lieutenant-Governor of Bengal who promised his help, but was at last deterred from giving it by the magnitude of the task. In 1871, the *Savitani Dharma Rakshani Sabha*, an orthodox Society, moved in the matter and in the course of the controversy that was provoked, Pandit Ishwar Chandra Vidâysâgar published his tract on polygamy in Bengal, and in reply to the objection urged by some that the evil complained of was gradually dwindling, Pandit Ishwar Chandra gave details of 133 polygamists who had more than 5 wives in less than a hundred villages in the Hugli district. In this list are given the details of names and places and we gather therefrom that one polygamist had 80 wives, another 72, a third 62, a fourth 56, a fifth 55, a sixth 44. There were three with 50 wives each, one with 42, one with 41, three with 40 each, one with 36, three with 30 each, seven with wives ranging between 21 and 28 in number, six with 20 each, one with 19, two with 17 each, two with 16 each, thirteen with 15 each, three with 14 each, two with 13 each, eleven with 12 each, three with 11 each, fourteen with 10 each, two with 9 each, fourteen with 8 each, eight with 7 each, sixteen with 6 each, and twenty-one with 5 each. Pandit Ishwar Chandra expressly excluded polygamists with less than 5 wives on the ground that their number was numerically so great that it would have filled the whole of



his pamphlet. This was the state of things 20 years ago in a small portion of East Bengal. The Editor of the *Sanjivani* newspaper made similar inquiries last year, viz. 1891, in 328 villages. And he confined his inquiries to persons who may be presumed to have been married during the past twenty years, their ages ranging from 5 to 35. Information with full details was secured about 584 marriages. And it was found that out of this number 339 were bigamists and 245 polygamists. Of the latter, 39 had 3 wives each, thirty-one had 4 each, eight had 5 each, nine had 6 each, five had 7 each, five had 8 each, two had 10 each, two had 12 each, two had 13 each, three had 14 each, one had 32. A boy of 12 years had two wives. The details about others are not given here because their ages could not be correctly ascertained. It will be seen from these figures that though the practice of polygamy is not so outrageously abused as it was twenty years ago, the evil is one which demands the most anxious consideration of all who care for the purity of domestic life:—

*By the Editor.*

---

THE  
QUARTERLY JOURNAL

OF THE

POONA SARVAJANIK SABHA.

VOL. XV.]

OCTOBER 1892.

[ No. 2

UNDER THE AUTHORITY OF THE MANAGING COMMITTEE.

EDITED BY

G. K. GOKHALE, B. A.

POONA.

PRINTED AT THE "ARYA-BHUSHANA" PRESS.

All Rights Reserved, ]

1892.

[ Price Rs. 1-3.

## ACKNOWLEDGMENT.

Receipt	_____	Sum received.
Nos.	<i>May 1892.</i>	
40	S. N. G. L. Belgaum .....	17
		<hr style="width: 10%; margin-left: auto; margin-right: 0;"/>
		17
	<i>June 1892.</i>	
41	R. B. Narayen B. Bramhe .....	17
42	R. S. Vishnu M. Mahajani .....	4-4
43	R. S. Shridher M. Kale .....	8-8
44	Hon'ble Naoroji N. Wadia.....	4-4
		<hr style="width: 10%; margin-left: auto; margin-right: 0;"/>
		34
	<i>July 1892.</i>	
45	H. H. the Khanjurgis of Kutch.....	8-8
46	R. S. Damoder Mayaram .....	4-4
47	R. B. Vishnu Moreshwar Bhide.....	4
		<hr style="width: 10%; margin-left: auto; margin-right: 0;"/>
		16-12
	<i>August 1892.</i>	
48	Shivaji Club Satara .....	0-3
49	R. S. Atmaram Jagannath Kirtiker .....	17
		<hr style="width: 10%; margin-left: auto; margin-right: 0;"/>
		17-3
	<i>September 1892.</i>	
	Amanut .....	1-15-3
50	K. B. Padamji Pestomji .....	4
51	R. S. Raghunath Narayen .....	4-4
52	Mr. K. S. Srinivasachari .....	2-2
53	R. S. Bhasker Shridher Joshi .....	4-4
54	S. N. G. Library Dhulia .....	4-4
55	R. S. Hari Gopal Padhye .....	4-4
56	S. V. G. N. Library Nasik .....	4-4
57	Mr. A. W. Craly-Bovey .....	17

## CONTENTS.

### Proceedings of the Sabha:—

- I. A public meeting in connection with the Election of Mr. Dadabhai Naoroji to the British Parliament.
- II. A representation to the Government of India, regarding the Mhowra Bill.

### Independent Section :—

- I. Indian Political Economy.
- II. Gleanings from Maratha Chronicles.

# THE POONA SARVAJANIK SABHA.

Established for representing the wants and wishes of the inhabitants of the Deccan, being appointed on a popular elective system under rules framed for the purpose.

WALEKAR'S WADA, DANE ALL.

LIST OF OFFICERS.

## President.

H. H. Shrinivas Rao Parashram Pandit alias Rao Sahib Pant Pratinidhi, Chief of Oundha.

## Vice-Presidents.

H. H. Dhundiraj Chintaman alias Tatyasaheb Patwardhan, Chief of Sangli.	H. H. Gunpatrao Harihar, alias Bapu Saheb Patwardhan, younger Chief of Kurundwad.
H. H. Mudhojirao Naik Nimbalkar, Chief of Falton.	H. H. Hariharrao Vinayak alias Daji Saheb Patwardhan, Chief of Kurundwad.
H. H. Ramchandra Rao Gopal alias Appa Saheb Patwardhan, Chief of Jamkhindi.	H. H. Toolajee Raja Bhosle, Chief of Akalkote.

## MANAGING COMMITTEE FOR 1892-93.

Chairman—RAO BAHADOOR VISHNU MORESHWAR BHIDE.

### Members of the Managing Committee.

R. B. Ganesh Govind Gokhale.	Waman Vishnu Lele Esqr.
R. B. Narayan Bhai Dandekar.	Mahomed Sidik Esqr.
R. S. Chintamanrao V. Natu.	Dorabjee Dadabhoy Butee Esqr.
R. S. Balwantrao Bapuji Phadke.	Gangaram Bhaui Mhaske Esqr.
R. S. Madhavrao S. Vaidya.	Rajanna Lingoo Esqr.
R. S. Naro Bhasker Dewdhar.	Vishnudas Harikisondas Esqr.
R. S. Damodar J. Gokhale.	Sakharam R. Joshi Esqr.
R. S. Sadashiv R. Medatkar.	Bhasker R. Sahasrabudhe.
R. B. Koopuswami Vijayarungam.	Wasudeo L. Athawale Esqr.
Professor Bal Gangadhar Tilak.	Nathamal Bharmal Esqr.
„ Gopal Krishna Gokhale.	R. S. Waman Prabhakar Bhawe.
Govind M. Gadre Esqr.	Vinayak Narayen Apte Esqr.
R. S. Raghonath Daji Nagarkar.	Waman Balkrishna Ranade Esqr.
Krishnarao B. Mande Esqr.	R. S. Sitaram Hari Chiplonkar.
Govind Ballal Deval Esqr.	Shivram Hari Sathe Esquire.
Ramchandra M. Sane Esqr.	Raghunath Narayen Pandit Esqr.

## Treasurer.

R. S. CHINTAMANRAO VISHWANATH ALIAS BHAI SAHEB NATU.

## Auditor.

GOVIND MAHADEO GADRE ESQR. PLEADER.

NARAYENRAO CHINTAMAN FADTARE ESQR.

## Honorary Secretaries.

PROFESSOR GOPAL KRISHNA GOKHALE B. A.

SHIVRAM HARI SATHE ESQR.

## PROCEEDINGS OF THE SABHA.

---

### ELECTION OF MR. DADABHAI NAOROJI TO THE BRITISH PARLIAMENT.

---

A large and enthusiastic public meeting of the residents of the City and Cantonment of Poona was held on the 10th of July 1892 at 5 P. M., in the Anandodbhaya Theatre under the auspices of the Poona Sarvajnik Sabha, to vote an address of congratulations to Mr. Dadabhai Naoroji on his election to the British Parliament and another of thanks to the Liberal Electors of Central Finsbury for "generously choosing India's dearest patriot to represent them in Parliament."

On the motion of Sardar Bahadur Gopalrao Hari Deshmukh, seconded by Mr. Balkrishna V. Mudliar, the Hon'ble K. L. Nulker, C. I. E. was voted to the chair. The chairman, having read the notice convening the meeting and a letter from Khan Bahadur Dorabji Padamji, expressing regret, through a domestic affliction, at being unable to attend. The meeting called upon the Hon'ble Rao Bahadur Ranchodlal Chhotalal, C. I. E. to move the first proposition.

The Hon'ble Mr. Chhotalal, C. I. E., said :—I have great pleasure to propose that an address of congratulation be voted to the Hon'ble Mr. Dadabhai Naoroji on his election to the British Parliament, because I think he is a true patriot of India and is most qualified for the post to which he has been raised. As I have had the honour of his acquaintance since 1859, it is a matter of personal gratification to me that I have an opportunity of taking a part in this meeting. Mr. Dadabhai was born in 1825. He distinguished himself as a student in the Elphinstone College, and finished his education when 24 years of age. He was appointed Professor of Mathematics and Natural Philosophy of the Elphinstone College, and I think he was the first native of India who was honored with the appointment of Mathematical Professor in the College. He left the service in 1855 when he was thirty years of age and went to London and started a House of Com-

mission Agency there in partnership with certain Parsee gentlemen. The London firm was carried on in his own name and although he had no connection with the Educational Department we all addressed him as Professor Dadabhai. It was in 1859 that I had resolved to start a Cotton Spinning Mill in Ahmedabad, and my friend, the late Mr. Merwanjee Nusserwanjee Bhownagary, was good enough to introduce me to Professor Dadabhai as the fittest person to whom I could entrust the work of purchasing the machinery and selecting a European mill manager. Mr. Dadabhai made every practicable enquiry and devoted his best attention to our interests, and the result was that we were able to extend our mill in 3 or 4 years from 2,500 spindles to 10,000 spindles and 100 looms. It was after the time of the share mania in Bombay, in 1865, which probably affected some of his partners in Bombay, that the London agency work was changed. Mr. Dadabhai, however, continued to stay and work in London honorably. Mr. Dadabhai did excellent work in England for the benefit of India. It is through his exertions that the East India Association, which is doing so much for India, was established in London. Mr. Dadabhai paid occasional visits to India but has always liked to go back to England and one can truly say that the greater part of his useful life has been passed in England. His election by an English constituency to a seat in the British Parliament, speaks volumes for his excellent qualifications. It is an extraordinary fact that a Native of India should have been elected by Englishmen of high education as their representative in Parliament, while there are so many able Englishmen ready and willing to be elected. This fact alone proves incontestably that Mr. Dadabhai must possess very high qualifications to meet the approval of his English constituents. If India were honored with the privilege to elect only *one* member for the British Parliament, I think no one *more* worthy than Mr. Dadabhai could have been elected. His education is sound and perfect. His desire to be useful to the people of India has been manifested more than once. He has a very good knowledge of Indian commerce. His short connection with the State of Baroda has given him a very good insight into the condition of the Native States and their connection with the Paramount Power. He has had experience of Municipal work in Bombay and also of the Indian Legislative Council. His long residence in England has made him thoroughly acquainted with the tac-

tics of the Parliamentary career. Notwithstanding his excellent ability and energy I think Mr. Dadabhai is a very modest and cautious man, and I have every reason to believe that his advice in Parliament will be quite safe and sound to all concerned. I sincerely pray that God may bless Mr. Dadabhai with good health and long life, and that he may be able to render good service to the people of India and England from his position in Parliament.

Professor Bal Gangadhar Tilak, in seconding the proposition, said that the services of Mr. Dadabhai were so well-known and valued in India that it would be unnecessary to repeat them. They did not meet to recognise Mr. Dadabhai's services for the first time. If any such recognition was needed it was made at the time when the representatives of the people elected to meet under his presidentship in the second Indian National Congress at Calcutta. They met on the present occasion to congratulate the grand old man of India on the success he had achieved by his wonderful perseverance and singleness of purpose, and to assure him that he had their full sympathy and support in the discharge of the duties he had undertaken. His success was a matter of great pleasure and joy to them, for it could hardly be said to be an individual matter. It was the success of the cause of political reform in India. Day by day it was becoming evident that they must transfer their seat of political agitation to England and the success of Mr. Dadabhai was a great encouragement to follow the programme set before them by the Congress. The generous electors of Central Finsbury had proved that the English nation was not apathetic to the claims of justice, and the success of Mr. Dadabhai would animate and inspire all political workers with hope. They might not obtain relief here, or at the hands of the Government of India or from the Home Government. The Prime Minister might himself be opposed to their claims, but still there was a power, which, if difficult to approach and not readily convinced, was at any rate prepared to do justice to their claims when once convinced. Of course they could not avail themselves of the generosity of the British public without a corresponding effort on their own part. The grapes would not be pushed down their throats. But if they set before them a modest programme and worked hard, honestly and devotedly, determined upon not taking refusal, then, the speaker said, there was every hope of



their succeeding sooner or later. That was the practical lesson that they had all to learn from Mr. Dadabhai's persistent efforts and final success. A native had been thought fit to represent an English constituency in the deliberations of the Empire, it was natural to expect that natives would soon be declared fit to send their representatives to their local councils and for local purposes. Viewed in that light Mr. Dadabhai's success was far more important in its indirect than in its direct results and he had no doubt that the day would be long remembered in the histories of England and India.

Mr. Adurjee Dornbjee Ghaswala supported the proposition. He was glad to see that the Hall was crowded with the *elite* of Hindoo society, but he regretted to notice such a small attendance of Parsees. He professed to be thoroughly conversant with the high qualities and delicate manners of Mr. Dadabhai, or, as he was proverbially called, Prof. Dadabhai. Besides being a man of sound education and a politician of a high class, Mr. Dadabhai was a real philosopher of the age. To him personal gain was no consideration, or else, with the head that he had on his shoulders, he would long ago have become a millionaire. The one ambition of his life was to do substantial good service to his country, and he had sacrificed all to that end. The speaker explained that Mr. Dadabhai had not been very successful in everything he had undertaken either as an administrator or a merchant though he possessed extraordinary talents to surmount every difficulty. The reason of that was that he was too independent and altogether too honest and straightforward. Mr. Adurjee forcibly pointed out that no matter how good one's cause might be yet influence now-a-days was required and the privilege of affording a quiet explanation was a great desideratum for success. It was, therefore, extremely gratifying to all of them to see that the result of not leaving the right path happily ended in the achievement of the great object of the noble aspirant. That happy result must greatly encourage them to persevere in all their undertakings if they desired to obtain what belonged to them in spite of all difficulties. Difficulties would arise in all spheres of life. To exemplify that assertion the speaker eulogistically alluded to the recent passing of the Abkari Bill. He said that even a statesman like Sir Charles Pritchard had had difficulties to contend with, and it took him a decade before he could successfully clear up all the misgivings and misapprehensions relative

to the passing of that highly desirable Act, which was as beneficial to the country as it was to the administration. If those in authority had to contend with difficulties in carrying out a desirable project, what could they expect but to meet with difficulties at every turn, and it needed much perseverance before they could attain the object they were aiming at—a good object, but which was misunderstood. He quoted his own example and said that though he had been unsuccessful in giving an impetus to the sugar refining industry in the Deccan that was all the more reason why he should make a most strenuous effort to revive it. Before sitting down he again eulogized the protracted and persistent endeavours, for a series of years on the part of Mr. Dadabhai in getting himself elected a member of Parliament,

Mr. Dorabjee D. Bootee moved the second resolution, for the adoption of an address of thanks to the Electors of Central Finsbury. He said :—

We thank them for their confidence in us, for in Mr. Dadabhai Naoroji India is represented. It always requires courage to depart from beaten tracks, and to commit the interests of their borough, I won't say a foreigner, but to one of another creed and nation is no small exhibition of courage. But we who know and love the man are assured that this confidence is well placed, and our countryman will give them the fullest satisfaction. I rejoice that India has an Indian in that assembly whose decrees can so materially affect the interests of the great Empire which forms so important a portion of that greater Britain, whose benign influence will be now more deeply felt in our dear land. How much we are indebted to our brethren of Central Finsbury cannot be estimated, but I shall be a false prophet if we all have not abundant reason for continual thankfulness to them for the return they have made.

Mr. K. G. Nattu, in seconding the resolution, said :—England has begun to acknowledge her debt to India. The British lion has been after all roused to a sense of duty. Mr. Dadabhai is elected a member of Parliament. The electors of Finsbury have preferred a Native to be their representative in their great national assembly, Oh ! what a self-sacrifice it is ! A solitary individual here or there may show exemplary benevolence, but nothing short of national virtue will

enable a Native to prefer a foreigner over one of its own race. The event has marked a new era in the history of India. After repeated prayers for several years, the saying "knock and it shall be opened" has now been realized. Ye men of Finsbury, in electing Mr. Dadabhai, you have opened a glorious future for India. Hitherto India's grievances had no direct access to the House of Commons. The loud prayers from the far East though they rolled in billows dashed against impregnable rocks, which surrounded this august body. Our ships were moored outside. Sometimes, when the troubled waters were appeased, a Bradlaugh or a Bright or a Fawcett, inspired with love for mankind, stood high on the tower, read our message and communicated it to the august assembly. In fact it was a second-hand affair. The conservative element was blocking every hole and fortifying the rampart to prevent strangers from coming in, and if they had the absolute dominion India would have had to stand outside without any chance of a hearing. But inside this body, in the very heart of it, there is the liberal element, constantly at war with its opponent. It is their pleasure and duty to advocate the cause of humanity. In their heart is enthroned mercy for their suffering brethren. Their motto is liberty and equality. While the Conservatives would have the doors barred and bolted against any but themselves, these latter recognized the claims of mankind and their watchword was—Let him in who deserves to be in, whatever be his caste or creed. In this long struggle, the men of Finsbury, and I may also say the women, undeterred by any prejudices, and true to the call of their conscience, went boldly to the task, removed the impediments, threw the door open to India and admitted one of her bravest sons to a share of England's birth rights. We could heretofore compete for the Civil Service and become Civilians. We could attend lectures on law and become barristers. We could attend medical colleges in Scotland and England and come out as doctors equal in rank to any that belonged to her mother country. These are honors which greatly depend upon personal merit. But never were we hitherto admitted to a share in the deliberations of her Great National assembly. England has admitted our countrymen not only to express his opinion on Indian matters, but he has also the privilege to raise his voice, either for or against, in all important questions concerning the whole Empire. The Irish Home Rule and the disesta-

blishment questions and many others which concern the United Kingdom alone would present themselves for his consideration. What an honor it is for India and how great a matter it is for congratulation ! But stop ! Let me tell you of a triumph which we have achieved nearer home. The majority of our Parsee brethren showed a feeling of alienation in respect to the Congress cause. Mr. Dadabhai belongs to the English Committee of the Indian National Congress. He must be acknowledged to be the most prominent man in England of the Parsee community. He is in our Parliament. For whom ? only for our Parsee brethren and not for others ? No ! he is for the whole of India. He is not a sectarian nor a partizan. But he has a universal good-will at heart for every Indian whether Jew or Gentile. Do we not look upon him as our common benefactor and must not our heart now be knit closer ? By this grand event, we are more at one than before. In this noble act how deeply have the people of Finsbury led us under their infinite obligations. They have made us greater friends and better citizens. They have admitted our countryman to the highest seat of honor, in preference to their own. They have conferred an invaluable blessing upon India. Oh ! Men of Finsbury, if I had a tongue as powerful as Burke's or a voice as eloquent as Brougham I should not have been able even then sufficiently to express India's deep debt of gratitude to your constituency. Your name shall be enrolled with India's greatest benefactors. Now my dear countrymen let us propose a cordial vote of thanks to the electors of Finsbury for this noble act and carry it with acclamation.

The chairman then called upon Mr. G. K. Gokhale, Hon. Secretary of the Sabha to read the drafts of the two addresses which ran as follows :—

To

THE HONOURABLE,

DADABHAI NAOROJI M. P.

LONDON.

Honorable Sir,

We, the members of the Poona Sarvajanic Sabha and the people of Poona in public meeting assembled, respectfully crave leave to offer you our warmest and most sincere congratulations on your election as member of the British Parliament by the Liberal electors of Central

Finsbury. It is seldom given to any public man to inspire, by his personal success, one universal feeling of joy and enthusiasm in the hearts of millions upon millions of his fellow-countrymen without distinction of race, creed or colour, and this high privilege has been yours. After years of devoted work in this country in the interests of your countrymen, you crossed the seas and stood before the English nation as a representative of this great dependancy, seeking admission into their august National Council to secure justice to India's unrepresented millions. All eyes were turned to you in the long and varied struggle that you maintained during the past six years and more, and from one end of the country to the other, the prayer went forth that the heart of the people of England might be so tempered and moved as to welcome and help your efforts to secure justice to your country and practically assert the equality and solidarity of all classes of Her Majesty's subjects. You were qualified for this struggle by your high culture, strong will, great powers of application and eloquence that is born of earnest conviction; but above all, you had in you the faith which removes mountains and fills up valleys. There were moments when clouds appeared gathering and thickening to darken your horizon, but your constancy of purpose and your feeling that you had a life's mission to accomplish sustained you and in the end won over to your side the hearts of English friends, both men and women, who thus have nobly vindicated the reputation which their countrymen in the past have won, as representatives of a race which prizes freedom above all other gifts and justice above all other possessions. The success which has crowned your efforts is, we venture to believe, only a foretaste of what is in store for India in the womb of time. We hail it for the moral interest which surrounds and ennobles it and makes every one of us once in our life feel a hope and an elevation that no other event would inspire. We feel we are all raised in you. We feel that the two great nations, whose destinies have been wedded together by Providence for its own higher ends, are for the first time practically drawn together by ties of fellow-feeling that will eventually prove a stronger defence to the Empire than arms or policy. We realize the fact that we have now taken the first step in a new line of progress under noble guidance, which must strengthen the basis of our common humanity, making it broader and deeper, being cemented by mutual love and mutual esteem and tending to the common elevation of all.

Your success is our success, and it cannot fail to have far-reaching consequences upon our destinies in the future. What these consequences will be, this is not the time to say, when you are putting on the armour for your work, and we therefore conclude with the fervent hope that you may live long to fulfil your noble mission, and that your example may animate and inspire others to walk in your footsteps and do as you have done.

We have the honour to remain,  
Hon'ble Sir,  
Your most obedient servants,  
K. L. NULKAR,  
Chairman, Public meeting.  
V. M. BHIDE,  
Chairman, Sarvajanic Sabha,  
Poona.

To

THE LIBERAL ELECTORS OF  
*CENTRAL FINSBURY,*  
LONDON.

GENTLEMEN,

We, the members of the Poona Sarvajanic Sabha and the people of Poona in public meeting assembled, take the liberty to respectfully convey to you an expression of our most profound gratitude for your generously electing our eminent countryman, Mr. Dadabhai Naoroji, to represent you in Parliament. The people of India will never forget that Central Finsbury was the first constituency in Great Britain to send a Native of India to the House of Commons. They will also never forget that despite previous differences, when the hour of battle arrived, the Liberals of Central Finsbury, true to the generous instincts of Englishmen, forgot all considerations of race, creed or colour and nobly stood by the side of Mr. Dadabhai Naoroji. Gentlemen, your generous action has, if possible, deepened and broadened the foundations of British Rule in India and has practically given a new meaning to the gracious Proclamation of Her Majesty the Queen-Empress about the equality of all her subjects. 288 millions of your fellow-subjects were hitherto unrepresented in the August Assembly which guides and determines their destinies. And through your

generosity, they will now have, for the first time in their history, the privilege of seeing one of their own countrymen sitting in Parliament. The happy event marks a new era in the history of India, and yours, gentlemen, is the credit and yours the glory of inaugurating it. May you long continue to repose in our Dadabhai the same confidence that you have on the present occasion displayed, and may your glorious example inspire other constituencies with a desire to be equally catholic and high-minded !

We have the honour to be,  
Gentlemen,  
Your most obedient servants  
K. L. NULKAR,  
Chairman, Public Meeting.  
V. M. BHIDE,  
Chairman, Sarvajanic Sabha,  
Poona.

After reading the addresses, Mr. Gokhale craved the Chairman's permission to speak just for a minute or two, so as to join his humble voice to the chorus of Dadabhai's praise that was already sounding in their ears. He considered that the occasion was one for great national rejoicing and the nation rejoiced, not for one reason but for several reasons. They rejoiced first because an English constituency had, by practical action, shown that so far as the bulk of the English people at least were concerned, they were prepared to carry out the gracious pledges about equality in all matters that had been given to the people of India from time to time. That was a matter of no small gratification, because till then it had often been found that those noble promises were kept only to the ear and broken to the heart. Then they rejoiced because, for the first time in their history, they were to enjoy the privilege of being represented in Parliament by one of their own countrymen. The nation was indeed happy in their first representative. When it was said, Mr. Gokhale went on to observe, that the dumb millions of India had for the first time found a tongue to give a voice to their growing hopes and their expanding aspirations, he was anxious no one should understand that the Indian people were oblivious of the great services rendered to their country from time to time by eminent English Statesmen. Commencing with Burke and coming down to Bradlaugh, they were indebted to a long roll of English statesmen,

who had generously and unselfishly laboured for India. The services of those men would never be forgotten by the Indian people as long as there was room in their hearts for the feeling of gratitude. But although that was so the speaker hoped there was no invidiousness in saying that no Englishman however eminent and devoted could do for India what Mr. Dadabhai could. Lastly Mr. Gokhale rejoiced for the sake of Mr. Dadabhai himself. It was difficult to conceive how bitter would have been the state of Dadabhai's feelings, if, after his arduous and devoted struggle, against heavy odds and amidst difficulties which would have daunted most men, the high hope of his life had not been realised. The honour conferred by Central Finsbury on Mr. Dadabhai was high, but it was not high, because Dadabhai's position was so singularly eminent. The high task undertaken by Mr. Dadabhai at the venerable age of 67 was a fittingly noble crown to the noble edifice of his past career. All would admit that Dadabhai richly deserved the honour conferred upon him by Englishmen when they thought of Dadabhai's distinguished patriotism, his splendid abilities, his earnestness, his devotion, his spotless private character and the simplicity of his life. That was however a subject on which it was more congenial to the soul to feel than to speak, and Mr. Gokhale, therefore, wanted to leave the audience, without any further intrusion upon their attention to the enjoyment of their own reflections and emotions.

It was proposed by Mr. Bulvantrao Anant Deva and seconded by Mr. R. D. Nagarkar that the addresses read by Mr. Gokhale should be adopted. This proposition, like the previous ones was passed unanimously.

The Hon'ble Mr. Nulkar then made a few remarks. He observed that Mr. Dadabhai Naoroji was of course entitled to their highest admiration and respect for what he had succeeded in achieving but it should be remembered that Mr. Dadabhai had succeeded because he was so much like Englishmen in his qualities and virtues. It was also necessary, he added, to remember amidst all their rejoicings that it was the liberal spirit of the British Constitution that had made the success of Dadabhai possible.

On the motion of Rao Bahadur Narayanbhai Dandekar, a vote of thanks was passed to the chairman and the meeting was declared dissolved.



National Liberal Club,  
White Hall Place S. W.  
*London, 2nd September 1892.*

DEAR SIRs,

I have received from Mr. G. K. Gokhale, Hon. Secretary of the Poona Sarvajanic Sabha, the two addresses voted by a large and enthusiastic meeting of the people of Poona held under the auspices of the Sarvajanic Sabha on 10th July last.

I feel exceedingly gratified and encouraged by the many kind things said in the address to me, and request you to tender my sincere thanks to the meeting and the Sabha for their congratulations and good wishes.

I am glad that you have sent a Second Address for the Electors of Central Finsbury for their generous action on our behalf, and I shall duly hand it them.

Yours very truly

( Sd. ) DADABHAI NAOROJI.

THE HON.

K. L. NULKAR,

Chairman, Public Meeting,

V. M. BHIDE Esquire,

Chairman Sarvajanic Sabha,

.. POONA.

---

THE MHOWRA BILL.

---

A representation to the Government of India, praying that his Excellency the Governor-General will be pleased to withhold his assent to the Mhowra Bill :—

Sarvajanik Sabha Room<sup>s</sup>, Poona, July 26, 1892.

No. 247 of 1892.

To the Secretary to the Government of India,  
Legislative Department.

Sir,— We have been directed by the managing committee of the Poona Sarvajanik Sabha to respectfully submit, for the favourable consideration of his Excellency the Governor-General, this representation, praying that his Excellency will be pleased to veto Bill No. 1 of 1892, otherwise known as the Mhowra Bill, which has been recently passed by the Bombay Legislative Council..

2. In requesting Government to take this rather extraordinary course of vetoing a measure adopted by the Bombay Legislature, the committee is only asking them to abide by the principles enunciated by them in 1882 in regard to this very question of regulating by legislation the free traffic in Mhowra flowers. In that year also the Government of Bombay had passed, through the local Legislature, a Bill similar to the present one in its nature, though much wider in regard to the area to which it was to be applicable. But the measure was vetoed by the Government of India, and in doing so they directed the local Government to make further inquiry as to “ whether the high rate of duty charged on licit spirit in the districts of Thana and Kolaba has not encouraged smuggling,” and “ whether the Mhowra flower is ever used as food in those districts.” “ If after these enquiries had been made,” the Government of India further wrote, “ it was found that the flower was not used as an article of food, and if it was clearly proved that no remedy for the existing state of things in those districts could be found in a relaxation of the present Abkari laws, it might then be considered whether legislation should not be undertaken for the purpose of placing some restriction upon the collection, sale, and possession of Mhowra flowers in those two districts alone.” In accordance with these instructions, the Bombay Govern-

ment appointed a committee to make the inquiries desired by the Supreme Government. The constitution of this committee was, however, open to grave objection, inasmuch as it was a purely official committee consisting of three Revenue Officers, subordinate to the Bombay Government, and in a way pledged to the advocacy of the legislation proposed. This committee confined its labours to Thana alone, thereby necessitating the appointment of another committee of a similar nature for the district of Kolaba. The conclusions of these committees were naturally such as the Bombay Government wanted. They recorded—(1) that the high rate of duty on licit spirit was not the cause of smuggling in the two districts; (2) that Mhowra was not a staple article of food of the people, neither was it generally given, to any appreciable extent, to cattle; (3) and that the only way to check the evil of illicit distillation was to bring the free traffic in Mhowra flowers under legislative control. Armed with the reports of these two committees, the Bombay Government again, approached the Supreme Government in the matter in 1884, promising this time to restrict the proposed legislation to Thana and Kolaba only. But again the Government of India deprecated legislation.

3. The committee of the Sabha would now submit that nothing has occurred since the two previous attempts of the Bombay Government were deprecated by the Government of India, which in any way justifies the measure recently passed by the Bombay Legislature, at any rate nothing for which the people of Thana and Kolaba can be held responsible. After the Bill of 1882 had been vetoed, and after another attempt at reviving it in a smaller degree had been deprecated by the Supreme Government, the Bombay Government took other measures to deal with the evil of illicit distillation; and as its own Abkari reports have year after year claimed, these measures were so far successful as ultimately to “nearly stamp out all illicit distillation.” In 1887-88 the Bombay Government wanted to try a change in their Abkari policy in Thana and Kolaba, which took off some of the restrictions on raw toddy, but at the same time greatly enhanced the price of licit liquor. The experiment was continued till the end of 1888-89, and its results were pronounced by the department to be disastrous. There is no reason to doubt the statement of the Abkari officials that illicit distillation on an alarming scale broke out in the two districts concerned, the enhancement of the price of licit liquor

supplying the incentive and the removal of some of the restrictions on toddy, the facilities. The experiment was, therefore, given up at the end of 1888-89, and since then, to use the words of Mr. Loch, who acted as Commissioner of Abkari in 1890-91, the districts have been recovering from its effects.

4. The statement of objects and reasons published by the hon'ble member in charge of the Bill alleged that the Bill was necessitated by a "very serious" rise that had "recently" taken place in the illicit distillation of Mhowra. No attempt was, however, made in the discussion in the Legislative Council to show that the statement was well-founded. Indeed, a careful consideration of the figures of Abkari offences for the past eleven years leads the committee to an exactly opposite conclusion. In the April number of the Quarterly Journal of the Sabha, where this question is dealt with at considerable length, and a copy of which accompanies this representation, these figures are carefully examined, and it is shown that the examination inevitably leads to the following conclusions :—(1) That compared with the figures for 1880-81 and 1881-82, the figures for "recent" years show not merely no "very serious" rise, but a very substantial fall off, and that if a Bill based on the heavy figures of those two years was vetoed by the Government of India *a fortiori* should that Government veto a measure based on the much lower figures of "recent" years, even if the local Legislature were to pass it. (2) That the fact that when assent to the Bill of 1882 was withheld by the Government of India, the Bombay Government were able by other means to materially reduce the heavy figures of offences detected in 1880-81 and 1881-82 in subsequent years, and keep them within moderate bounds, shows that legislation of the kind now proposed is not required for coping with the evil of illicit distillation, which again is now smaller in magnitude than what it was prior to 1882. (3) That the sudden increase that took place in the number of offences in 1888 was entirely due to the action of Government, and that it is therefore unfair on the part of Government to take advantage of it to pass a piece of repressive legislation. (4) That the figure for 1888-89, considerably higher as it is than that for 1887-88, does not represent Mhowra distillation exclusively, but covers much illicit distillation of toddy also, and therefore it cannot be said that there was in that year a very serious increase in the illicit distillation of liquor from Mhowra flowers. (5)

That it is unfair to describe the increase that took place in 1888 as *recent*, because statistics for later years are available, and they show a material diminution in the number of offences. (6) That since the abolition of the experimental arrangements of 1888 the number of offences has been steadily and rapidly diminishing, eliciting expressions of satisfaction from the head of the Abkari Department itself, and that in the course of a year or two a return to the state of things which prevailed prior to 1888 might be legitimately looked for.

5. The strongest objection to the measure, however, rests on the fact that Mhowra flowers are largely used by the wild tribes and the poorer classes of Thana and Kolaba as an important supplement to the food-grains when the stock of the latter fails, and also they are largely used as fodder for cattle. An attempt was made in the Legislative Council to deny this fact, and the supporters of the measure took their stand upon the Report of the Thana Committee of 1883. It might be remarked in passing here that the Government of India did not attach much weight in 1884 to this Report, because, even with this Report before them, they deprecated the legislation proposed by the Bombay Government. The Committee of the Sabha have already pointed out above that the inquiry made by the Thana Committee in 1883 was not an independent inquiry such as the Government of India had desired. It was conducted by three Revenue Officers subordinate to the Bombay Government, and no independent or non-official gentleman was associated with them in the work, although any one of the five non-official members of the Legislative Council, who vigorously opposed the Bill of 1882, could easily have been selected for the task. But if the constitution of the Committee was open to objection, far more objectionable was the method adopted by it in arriving at the conclusions which it had to record. The Government of India had put their question in the plainest language, namely, whether Mhowra flowers were *ever* used as food in the two districts concerned. The committee answered this question by recording that they were *never* used as a *staple* article of food. The committee of the Sabha would respectfully submit that this was not a straightforward reply to the question of the Government of India, neither was it justified by the evidence which the committee had before it. The committee had to deal with a large mass of conflicting evidence upon a question of fact, and it was bound, in arriving at its conclusions, to act in

conformity with the principles which in all judicial courts guide a consideration of such evidence. Of the witnesses whose evidence was recorded by the committee, a majority had stated that *they knew* that Mhowra flowers were used by the wild tribes and the lower classes of the people as an important supplement to their food. This majority again was composed of respectable and reliable witnesses who had better opportunities than the European Abkari inspectors and other official witnesses of knowing how the poor people managed to keep body and soul together, when their slender stocks of food-grains were exhausted. And yet in the face of the testimony of such witnesses the committee chose to record that the flowers were never used as *staple* food! Technically the statement of the Committee is not incorrect, for no one contends that Mhowra flowers are a *staple* article of food. It is not possible in the nature of things that anything except food-grains can be a staple article of food of a community, and no committee consisting of three high Revenue Officers was required to make the discovery. The committee, we regret to say, wilfully chose to make a statement which was not straightforward, and which anyhow aimed at returning a negative answer to the question put by the Government of India. If a straightforward answer had been contemplated, it would necessarily have been to the effect that the flowers *were* used as a supplement to the food-grains, and not as a staple article. The Committee's answer as to whether the flowers were *ever* used as fodder for cattle was equally unfair and misleading. The evidence before the committee clearly showed that they *were* so used to a large extent during a certain part of the year, and the committee was bound to say so; and yet it chose to record that the flowers were not generally given to cattle!

6. The committee of the Sabha trusts that it has clearly demonstrated above the unreliable nature of the conclusions of the Thana Committee of 1888. The Sabha is inclined to think that the Government of India themselves entertained much the same opinion, when, in spite of this report, they deprecated legislation in 1884. Special inquiries made by the Sabha in this matter have confirmed our view that the flowers are used as food for men and fodder for cattle in these two districts during the latter part of the hot, and the early part of the rainy season—i. e., till the new grass grows, and the new grain becomes available. It is freely admitted by the Bombay Government that Mhowra flowers are used as food in Khandeish, Guzerat,

and other places, and yet it is, somehow or other, asserted that the equally poor and resourceless people of Thana and Kolaba do not so use them ! If the present measure receives the assent of his Excellency the Governor-General, a great and grievous hardship will be inflicted upon the poor people of Thana and Kolaba, whose resources of sustaining life are already far too crippled to admit of any further inroad on them.

7. The committee of the Sabha does not deny the existence of illicit distillation in Thana, nor would it oppose any measures really calculated to check the evil. The Sabha is, however, firmly persuaded that although the present Abkari policy of the Bombay Government is bringing in a yearly increasing revenue to the State Treasury, it is doing so only at the expense of the health and happiness of the people. It is only by cheapening now toddy—a healthy and comparatively innocuous drink supplied to the people of Thana and Kolaba by the bounty of nature,—and by the bounty of nature,—and by keeping the price of licit liquor within moderate bounds that all temptation for illicit distillation will be effectively taken away. The Government of India themselves have thus enunciated the principle that should regulate Abkari taxation:—“Liquor should be taxed and consumption restricted as far as it is possible to do so without imposing positive hardships upon people and driving them to illicit manufacture.” The very complaint of the Bombay Government about the prevalence of illicit distillation in Thana and Kolaba thus proves that licit liquor in those districts is greatly overtaxed. The proper remedy, therefore, against this state of things is not an oppressive restriction of the free use of useful articles but a reduction of this high taxation. Already the Abkari Act of 1878 is extremely stringent in its provisions. Moreover additional powers have been put into the hands of the Abkari Department by certain rules framed under Section 41 of the Forest Act, as amended in 1890. It has been admitted by Mr. Spence, who acted as Abkari Commissioner in 1890, that “a good deal will be able to be effected under the Forest Rules,” and that they will enable the Abkari Department to effectively control the transit of Mhowra flowers. The Department maintains large and costly preventive establishments whose efforts are supplemented by those of the private establishment maintained by liquor farmers at their own costs, for the detection of illicit distillation. Distilling liquor clandestinely from Mhowra flowers, with-

out running great risk of detection, is, again, no easy thing. In the first place, the people know the thing to be an offence, and howsoever they may be given to it, they would instinctively try to avoid it as far as possible. Then the process of distillation is such that a reasonable degree of vigilance on the part of the Abkari Police ought to detect it without much difficulty. It is notorious that before liquor can be extracted from Mhowra flowers, they have to go through a process which makes them emit a stench "powerful enough," to use the words of the *Times of India*, "to awaken a slumbering Abkari peon a mile away and thus set in motion the existing law." Then, again, the private feuds and jealousies of villagers among themselves minimise the chances of successful illicit distillation. Finally, the very heavy fines which courts inflict on those who are convicted of illicit distillation, and which have, in some cases, brought ruin on whole families, have already produced a deterrent effect, and there is no reason to doubt that under normal circumstances illicit distillation will diminish day by day. The committee of the Sabha thinks that these are sufficient safeguards against any appreciable prevalence of illicit distillation, if only the unnatural encouragement at present given to it by the forcing up of the price of licit liquor be taken away.

8. Besides interfering with the use of Mhowra flowers as food (for men and fodder for cattle, and thereby inflicting a grievous hardship on the poor people of Thana and Kolaba, the present measure will prove oppressive in its working in various other ways. In the first place, a terrible power will be put into the hands of the already much-dreaded police who can, under the pretext of ascertaining whether any one has in his possession more than for seers of Mhowra flowers, inflict the indignity of searching the house on whomsoever that they please—a power that must inevitably lead to the levy of blackmail. Again, although the Bill provides that no fees will be charged for permits to hold more than four seers of these flowers, it does not bind the executive to grant these permits to every one who may apply for them. Indeed, with the object which the Bombay Government professes (to have in view, it is impossible that it should be otherwise. For a wholesale granting of licences would defeat the very object for which the Government wants to create the permit system, namely, to fix without any trouble or difficulty the responsibility of illicit distilla-



tion. The large mass of the people will thus be unable to secure permits, and thereby forced to purchase whatever quantity of the flowers they may require from licensed vendors. If the number of these vendors is very small, as the Sabha is afraid it will be, and if their shops are sufficiently removed from one another, they will be able to demand from the purchasers almost any price they please. Lastly, the owners of Mhowra trees in private lands will be put to a severe loss, as, in case they are unable to secure permits, they will have, at the close of the free season, either to sell their flowers to the licensed vendors for whatever price the latter may choose to offer, or else to destroy them as holding more than four seers of them would render the owners liable to punishment.

9. For all these reasons, the committee of the Sabha respectfully prays that his Excellency the Governor-General will be pleased to withhold his sanction from Bill No. I of 1892, passed by the Bombay Legislative Council—a Bill, similar in nature to the one vetoed by the Government of India in 1892, and deprecated again in 1884, and which has evoked the unanimous disapproval of the entire press of this Presidency—European as well as Native.

We have, &c.,

G. K. GOKHALE,

S. H. SATHE,

Hon. Secretaries, Sarvajanic Sabha, Poona.



## INDIAN POLITICAL ECONOMY.\*



In the beginning of this year before a similar gathering in Bombay, a master-hand sketched the outlines of the influence of Nature on Literature and Politics, and in a few bold touches showed how, from time to time, the aberrations and evil tendencies observable in English thought and action were counteracted and corrected by an appeal to, and a diligent study of, the standard of Nature—the final source of all true knowledge, and the only guide to wise conduct. The same master-hand drew also the moral to be learned from such a study,—the moral being that our growth could only be in strict correspondence to our aptitudes and surroundings, and that we should be on our guard against precipitation and hot-house culture, which latter can never lead to permanently beneficial results. There can be no doubt that the historical line of thought so developed is to some extent the chief characteristic feature of the latter half of the present century. It occurred to me at the time that if the law of relativity and correspondence holds good in politics and social science generally, it ought to hold good equally in all kindred subjects, including, among others, the science of national wealth, or as it is more popularly described, Political Economy. As a matter of fact, however, what do we see about us? The same teachers and statesmen, who warn us against certain tendencies in our political aspirations, forget this salu-

---

\* This paper has been kindly placed at our disposal by Rao Bahadur M. G. Ranade M.A. LL. B. C. I. E. It was read by the learned Rao Bahadur before the Deccan College Union on the 30th July last—*By the Editor.*

tary caution when the question at issue is one of Indian Economics. They seem to hold that the truths of economic science, as they have been expounded in our most popular English textbooks, are absolutely and demonstrably true, and must be accepted as guides of conduct for all time and place, whatever might be the stage of national advance. Ethnical, social, juristic, ethical, or economical differences in the environments are not regarded as having any influence in modifying the practical application of these truths. If free trade is good for England, it must be equally beneficial to all countries, and prohibitive or protective duties, bounties and subsidies, restrictions and regulative control, are absolute evils, and no thought need be given to the relative differences in civilization, or the possession of natural advantages or disadvantages in matters of situation, climate, soil, national aptitudes and wants. If factory legislation is good in one country, it must be equally needed to protect labourers everywhere. If laws in restraint of usury are out of place in centres of commercial and manufacturing activity, they must be equally pernicious in backward, antiquated, and agricultural communities. If the State finds no occasion to help credit institutions in England, the demand for such help, in countries where the spirit of private enterprise is feeble, is also held to be preposterous. If the Governments of advanced countries do not undertake certain functions with a view to direct industry and help enterprise, the Government out here is equally precluded from taking any new line of departure in these matters. If direct taxes suit English conditions of life and property, they must be equally suitable to Indian conditions, and octroi and transit duties must be kept down rigorously as sources of our local or municipal income.

I might multiply these instances without number, but those given above will, I hope, serve to illustrate my present purpose.

Even if statesmen had stopped here, there would have been some extenuation for the line of conduct adopted by them. The absolute truths of Political Economy, however, are appealed to as a justification for a curious change of front. Men, who come from a country where private property in land is most absolute, develop on their arrival here a taste for socialistic doctrines. The State aspires to relegate all private property in land into mere superior and inferior holdings. A love for capitalists farming on a large scale gives way to a taste for *petit culture* by poor tenants. In England the landlords as such pay no special tax to the State, but here land is taxed on the ground that there is an unearned increment based on the theory of economical rent, and that this unearned increment belongs of special right to the State. While the nationalization of land is but a socialist dream in England and Europe, it is in full swing here, and furnishes a scientific justification for periodical revisions and enhancements. Status and privilege form still the very cornerstone of English social arrangements, but here every member of society is only a mobile atom, without any differences marking him off from others, so far as the State is concerned. The middle class is the backbone of English supremacy, but here there is no room for a middle class between the State and the poor tax-payers. This change of front is a curious study by itself. For my present purposes, it is not necessary to cite more instances. Of course if Political Economy is a science of general and absolute truths, like physics or astronomy, the tendency noted above to push its principles to their logical conclusions in all times and places, even when English statesmen halt midway in their practical application of these principles, is intelligible, and may be even wise statesmanship. There can be no doubt that those who thus give effect to these principles honestly believe in the scientific and absolute charac-

ter of these economical conclusions. But it is certainly a fair subject for consideration whether this belief is well-founded. If in Politics and Social Science, time and place and circumstances, the endowments and aptitudes of men, their habits and customs, their laws and institutions, and their previous history, have to be taken into account, it must be strange indeed if in the economical aspect of our life, one set of general principles should hold good every-where for all time and place, and for all stages of civilization. This conflict was one of the reasons which induced me to take up this subject for consideration on the present occasion.

Another reason which also influenced me in the choice of this subject was the fact that at this time, when an appeal is being made to the popular will in two great communities to declare itself, the questions at issue are more economical than political in their character. The dreams of Cobden and Bright, of Ricardo and Mill, that the civilized world would, in a few years, with one accord embrace their principles, has not been realized. In America the issues are solely economical. One party favours free trade, the other favours protection. One party favours silver legislation, the other denounces it. In England also, as you are aware, the present Prime Minister has declared himself in favour of what is called Fair Trade, which is a modification dictated by political and economical considerations of the extreme doctrine of Free Trade with a view to restrict the freedom to those who reciprocate it, and the Liberals have denounced this lapse from orthodoxy as unpardonable. Even in Ireland, the political issue is really at its base an economical dispute, which centres round the question of the extent of the rights of private property and free contract as between the landlords and the tenants. Similarly, here in our own country, the Currency Association is also

running a tilt against the economical theorists, and boldly denies the universality of the equation of supply and demand as the best and only regulator of the exchange values of the precious metals. On the Continent of Europe, and in the English Colonies, the same protest is being practically urged against the extreme rigour of the current theories of orthodox Political Economy. The Americans dispute the rights of the Chinese to settle in their country, the Australians fear the same scare, and even in England legislation was contemplated against the immigration of alien Jews, on the ground that they were likely to under-bid the indigenous labourer. The trades-unions and strikes, and the Knights of Labour, of which we have heard so much recently, furnish another form of this same general protest. This conflict of practice with theory, not in one, but all points, not in one place or country, but all over the world, which distinguishes contemporary history furnishes another reason which appeared to me to justify a reconsideration of the question on broader lines than those you will find enunciated in the ordinary text-books.

In justice to some of these writers, it must be admitted that they have taken good care to prevent many of the misapprehensions which are popularly entertained about the absolute and general character of the economical doctrines taught by them. Mr. J. S. Mill, for instance, states in his preface that "for practical purposes, political economy is inseparably intertwined with many other branches of social philosophy. Except in matters of mere detail, there are perhaps no practical questions, even among those which approach nearest to the character of purely economical questions, which admit of being decided on economical premises alone." You will also recollect that one characteristic feature of Mr. Mill's work is his frank recogni-

tion of an essential difference between the laws relating to the production of wealth, which he deems to be universal and not arbitrary, and those which regulate its distribution. The laws of distribution, Mr. Mill admits, are partly of human institution. Mr. Mill, and Mr. Cairns more clearly even than Mr. Mill, affirmed the hypothetical character of the science. Mr. Mill contented himself with suggesting the necessity of verification to establish the soundness of the hypothetical demonstration, but Mr. Cairns went further, and asserted that "economical laws are not assertions respecting the character or sequence of phenomena, and that they can neither be established or refuted by statistical or documentary evidence." It is true this was not the position of the earlier teachers, Adam Smith, Ricardo, Senior, James Mill, M'ulloch, and Malthus, who never doubted that in all their reasonings they were dealing with human beings as they actually exist. Adam Smith, for instance, believed that nature had made provision for social well-being by the principle of the human constitution which prompts every man to better his condition, and in aiming at individual good, every man is led by an invisible hand to promote general good. Human institutions only interfere with this tendency, and when all restraints are removed, the obvious and simple system of natural liberty establishes itself. Ricardo and Malthus were, if possible, still more dogmatic and absolute in their assertion of these necessary tendencies, and made no allowances, or at the best gave scanty recognition to, the one-sided character of their premises. Mr. Senior seriously thought that the whole science could, like geometry, be deduced from four axiomatic propositions. It will be useful at this stage to note the general features of these assumptions of the earlier economists, which they believed to be as necessarily and universally true as the first law of mechanics that bodies move

in straight lines, or the first law of physics that they attract each other directly according to their mass, and inversely according to the square of their distance. These assumptions may be thus briefly stated:—(1) that national economy is essentially individualistic and has no separate collective aspect ; (2) that the individual, or typical economical man, has no desire but that of promoting his own self-interest, or at least that this is his principal motive power, (3) that this self-interest is best promoted by the largest production of wealth, i. e. articles with value in exchange, at the least trouble ; (4) that such pursuit of private gain by each individual promotes best the general good ; (5) that the free and unlimited competition of individuals in the race and struggle of life is the only safe and natural regulator ; (6) that all customary and state regulation is an encroachment on natural liberty ; (7) that every individual knows best his interest, and has the capacity and desire of acting according to this knowledge ; (8) that there is perfect freedom and equality in the power of contract between individuals and individuals ; (9) that capital and labour are always free and ready to move from one employment to another, where better remuneration is expected, (10) that there is a universal tendency of profits and wages to seek a common level ; (11) that population tends to outstrip the means of subsistence ; (12) and that demand and supply always tend mutually to adjust each other.

These assumptions lie at the root of all dogmatical treatment of the subject. It need not be said that they are literally true of no existing community. To the extent that they are approximately true of any state of society, the assumptions furnish valid explanations of its economical statics. Even then they furnish no suggestion as to its dynamical progress or de-



velopment. As these assumptions do not absolutely hold good of even the most advanced societies, it is obvious that in societies like ours, they are chiefly conspicuous by their absence. With us an average individual man is, to a large extent, the very antipodes of the economical man. The family and the caste are more powerful than the individual in determining his position in life. Self-interest in the shape of the desire of wealth is not absent, but it is not the only nor principal motor. The pursuit of wealth is not the only ideal aimed at. There is neither the desire nor the aptitude for free and unlimited competition except within certain pre-determined grooves or groups. Custom and state regulation are far more powerful than competition, and status more decisive in its influence than contract. Neither capital nor labour is mobile, and enterprising and intelligent enough to shift from place to place. Wages and profits are fixed, and not elastic and responsive to change. Population follows its own law, being cut down by disease and famine, while production is almost stationary, the bumper harvest of one year being needed to provide against the uncertainties of alternate bad seasons. In a society so constituted, the tendencies assumed are not only inoperative, but are actually deflected from their proper direction. You might as well talk of the tendency of mountains to be washed away into the sea, or of the valleys to fill up, or of the sun to get cold, as reasons for our practical conduct within a measurable distance of time.

This hypothetical character of the entire fabric of doctrinal economy has been more or less freely recognized, as stated above, by Mr. Mill, Mr. Cairns and other teachers of Political Economy; and in our own time, Mr. Bagehot has gone so far as to assert that the traditional

system rested on assumptions which were not only not true generally, but were true only of England of the present day. He calls it the science of business done in large and trading communities. It does not explain the economic life of earlier times, or of our own times in other nations. It is insular, and has not obtained general recognition, by reason of its being chiefly a convenient series of deductions from assumed axioms which are in many times and places not true, and are only true in England where capital and labour can freely transport themselves from one employment to another. Mr. Sedgwick, another contemporary writer, has expressed the view that the abstract method is useful only for the statical study of economy, and that its conclusions, even within this province, are only hypothetically valid. In the dynamical study of the progress of wealth, the value of the deductive method is almost nil. Mr. Cliff Leslie has expressed himself in stronger terms. The economy of every nation, according to this writer, is the result of a long growth in which there has been continuity and change, and the economic side of this change is only a particular aspect. The laws of social progress in wealth must be sought in the history of the general social evolution which is different in different countries. Professor Jevons was filled with such despair by the sterile character of the hypothetical system that he thought the only way to cure its defects was to fling away, once and for ever, the preposterous assumptions of the Ricardian school. It will be thus seen that, even in the land of its birth and highest development, the claims of Political Economy as ordinarily taught in the text books, have been seriously questioned, and its value as a guide to practical conduct greatly discounted.

You will naturally desire to know how this revulsion of thought has been brought about in the course of a hundred

years. It becomes necessary in this connection to take a retrospective view of the progress of the science in Western Europe during the past 200 or 300 years. Such a retrospect will help you to judge for yourself how far the development of the scientific theory of Political Economy can be regarded as even now complete. The ancient conception of Political Economy had regard chiefly laying down to the practical rules of prudent conduct for each private individual who desired to be rich. The conception of it as a principle of social polity was more or less ignored. The general feeling in those days was that manual labour was below the dignity of a freeman. Such work was done by slaves, or as we would in this country describe them, by the lower castes. A freeman could only devote his attention to agriculture. Commerce and manufactures were later developments. This circumstance also explains the interdict on usury which was a common feature of all ancient Institutes, excepting those of our own country, which in this respect were more advanced than the Greek, or Mahomedan, or Christian notions on the subject. Gradually slaves became serfs, and then freemen who worked for wages. These serfs, seeking refuge in ancient coast towns and Roman colonies, developed into the free commercial cities of the middle ages about the times of the Crusades, and later on into great manufacturing centers. The discoveries of the 15th century gave a stimulus to trade, and later on to colonization. The large imports of gold and silver helped to encourage the greater circulation of money. The gradual rise of European monarchies, and the decay of the Church and the nobility, removed the pressure of feudal ideas, and raised the status of those who were engaged in commerce. The republics of Italy developed banking and credit. It was when the national activity of Europe took such a varied form,

stimulating agriculture, commerce, manufactures, banking, currency, exchange, cooperation, taxation, colonization, and foreign conquests, that the ground was prepared for a systematic study of the theory of the laws which regulated economical arrangements, and made nations prosperous and strong, or the reverse. And the first speculative explanation attempted is known in history as the mercantile theory. It is too much the practice of textwriters to cry down this theory as one which confounded wealth with money and bullion, and made the possession of precious metals the test of national prosperity. This is however an utterly unfair and one-sided view of the subject. The leading feature of the system was that it set a higher value on commerce and manufactures than on agriculture, and on foreign over home trade. It encouraged exports, but desired to check imports with a view not to retain money so much as to develop home manufactures. Lastly, it enjoined the directive control of the state in the way of stimulating domestic manufactures and encouraging commerce. Each state competed with the rest in foreign markets, and sought to secure the most advantageous terms, and it sought also to extend its colonies and dependencies with a view to increase the sphere of open markets for its produce. It is enough to state that men like Colbert, and Oliver Cromwell, Raleigh and Childe, could not have encouraged a system which had not some solid justification in the then circumstances of Europe. Cromwell's Navigation laws have admittedly been the foundation of England's naval supremacy, and Colbert made France in his day the most prosperous state on the continent. He had a keen perception that state protection and control were but crutches to teach the nation to walk, and that they should be thrown away when the necessary advance had been made. It was under the influence of

the same ideas that the Great East India Companies of Holland, France, and England were formed, and received the support of their respective Governments. Charters and monopolies, bounties and subsidies, were freely granted under the influence of the same ideas, and State help and regulation did their work remarkably well.

In the next century the natural progress of events made nations alive to the abuses of the old system, and men began to feel the necessity of freedom in the economical as well as in the political field. This work of destructive negative criticism began in England with the teachings of Hobbes and Locke, but was more earnestly taken up in France previous to the Revolution. The enormous abuses of state control and direction, of monopolies and restrictions, led to a reaction in favour of a theory which was founded on the idea of natural liberty. In this negative philosophy individual man was moreover conceived as being solely guided by private interest, which it was supposed he understood better for himself than others could do for him, and the removal of all restrictions and prohibitions became the watch-word of this school. The previous preponderance of state support in favour of commerce and manufactures was condemned, and a preference for agriculture as the only true source of all wealth was developed into a mania. In grasping the conception that money alone was not wealth, and that all wealth is created by human labour applied to natural agents, people ran to the other extreme of classifying commerce and manufactures along with services under the head of unproductive labour. In protesting against protection and prohibition, the extreme view went so far as to hold that Government itself was only a necessary evil, and that the State had no concern with industry, and must confine itself to its sole function of keeping

the public peace. This conception of the domain of natural liberty in economics was but a part and parcel of the great movement of freedom which culminated in the French Revolution. Quesnay, Guorpey, and the great statesman Turgot, were the advocates of this new school of thought which is known as the school of the physiocrats.

Next in order of time we have Adam Smith who was the direct product of the French negative school of Quesnay, but he improved upon his model, and exposed the weakness of that school in two important respects. He established the fact that agriculture was not the only source of wealth, and that manufactures and commerce were equally efficient in this respect, and that nature helped man equally in all the three departments. While accepting the *laissez faire* doctrine of Free trade as a general principle, Mr. Smith was alive to the fact that restrictive navigation laws had helped greatly to ensure English commercial supremacy, and he justified these laws on the express ground that defence was of more importance than opulence, and he advocated what are now known as fair trade views *i. e.* views which permit retaliation by way of differential duties against nonreciprocating countries, on condition that such retaliation produces its desired consequences. He also approved of temporary concessions by way of monopolies to chartered companies in enterprizes which involved risk and expense. Adam Smith never separated economical from social considerations, and thus occupied a position of advantage, which his successors threw up by their too absolute assertion of his doctrines. I have already spoken of the rigid character of the system of Ricardo, Malthus, Senior, James Mill, Torrens, M'culloch and others, and shown how this dogmatic feature provoked a reaction in

England, at first faintly represented in the protests of J. S. Mill and Mr. Cairns, but more decidedly formulated by Bagehot, Leslie and Jevons. This strong reaction of feeling among English writers was due to the influence of the great French and German teachers. August Comte was the first who denied the name of science to the doctrines taught by the deductive school, and he elaborated his own system of the historical method of research, and these hints were taken up by the German and English thinkers of our day. Sismondi was the first economical writer who gave expression to the dissatisfaction felt in France at the conclusions of the English economists. He charged the individualistic school with tendencies by which the rich became richer, and the poor were made poorer. He protested against the abuses of the *laissez faire* policy, and invoked Government intervention for protecting the weaker individuals and races against the pressure of the stronger and more advanced nations under the *regime* of competition. Sismondi declared that the State was not merely an agency for keeping peace, but that it was an organ for securing the progress of the people as widely as possible, and for extending the benefits of the social union, to all. Another French writer, Dunoyer, defined liberty not as a mere negation of restraint, but a positive effort to increase the efficiency of labour in all its grades.

Two American thinkers, Hamilton and Carey, sounded the same note of difference in more distinct terms. Hamilton was one of the fathers of the American constitution, and he stated that the English doctrine of absolute freedom was practicable only if all nations accepted free trade views simultaneously, and he suggested a scheme of protective duties which were later on adopted as the leading feature of Americans State Tariffs. The Hayleybury Prof. Jones had before

Carey attacked the Ricardian theory of rent as being true only of farmer's rents, and as wholly in-applicable to the Indian Ryots' rent, or the metayer or cottier rents. Carey went further, and denied that there was any economic rent proper, and contended that rent was only a remuneration, in the same way as profits, of past invested capital or labour. Carey justified protection to domestic agriculture on the ground that the waste products of land must return to the soil to restore its powers, and this restoration was not possible where raw products were exported to and consumed by distant countries. Like the French Sismondi, Carey regarded the state as a co-ordinating power in society, which checked the tendency of individuals to seek for immediate gain at the sacrifice of permanent national interests, and he asserted that protection was justified as being the only means by which the obstacles thrown in the way of younger and less advanced communities by more advanced nations could be removed. The immediate loss to the nation was like the sum spent on the education of youth by individuals, which more than repays itself in the long run.

Like the French and American writers, the Italian economists of the modern period, Gioga and Ludovico also advocated state regulation of industry, and asserted the doctrine of relativity as being an essential factor of all true economic theory. The work of positive exposition was however most successfully taken up by the German Professors. Muller first suggested that Adam Smith's system, as elaborated by his more dogmatic disciples, was essentially English and insular. It succeeded in England, because the national life of England was preserved intact by its favoured situation and past history and conservative instincts, while it was unsuitable to the continental countries, because with them the preserva-



tion of the national existence was a subject of greater importance than mere individual prosperity. List, however, gave the fullest expression to this rebellion against the orthodox creed. He urged that the permanent interests of nations were not always in harmony with the present benefit of individuals. National well-being does not consist only in the creation of the highest quantity of wealth measured in exchange value, independently of all variety of quality in that wealth, but in the full and many-sided development of all productive powers. The nation's economic education is of far more importance than the present gain of its individual members, as represented by the quantity of wealth measured by its value in exchange. In a sound and normal condition, all the three departments of national activity must be fully developed. Commerce and manufactures are, if possible, more vital in their bearing on the education of the intelligence and skill and enterprize of the nation than agriculture. In a purely agricultural country there is a tendency to stagnation and absence of enterprize and the retention of antiquated prejudices. The function of the state is to help those influences which tend to secure national progress through the several stages of growth, and adopt free trade or protection as circumstances may require. In this view Free Trade may be good for a country like England, but not for America and Germany.

The subsequent German teachers further elaborated this historical view, and under the stimulus of the success of the comparitive method in philology and jurisprudence, proposed to reconstruct economy by the help of the new method. Raw, Knieys, Roscher, Hildebrand, Wagner and others worked on these lines. Their influence made itself felt on English thought,

and Leslie and Jevons were directly influenced by these teachings. They advocated that economy was only one branch of sociology, and like all social sciences, it must be studied both in its statical and dynamical conditions, and that the basis of a hypothetical economic man, guided solely by one motive of self interest, must be given up, and man as he is, both selfish and altruistic, possessing rights as well as being bound by duties, must be studied in history, including both ancient and modern. In brief, this German school regards that universalism and perpetualism in economic doctrine are both unscientific and untrue.

This resumé of the past and contemporary history of the growth of economic science in England, France, Germany, Italy, and America will satisfy the student that modern European thought does not at all countenance the view of the English writers of the Ricardian school that the principles of the science, as they have enunciated them in their text books, are universally and necessarily true for all times and places, and for all stages of advancement. Modern thought is veering to the conclusion that the individual and his interests are not the centre round which the theory should revolve, that the true centre is the body politic of which that individual is a member, and that collective defence and well-being, social education and discipline, and the duties, and not only the interests, of men, must be taken into account, if the theory is not to be merely utopian. The method to be followed is not the deductive but the historical method, which takes account of the past in its forecast of the future; and relativity, and not absoluteness, characterizes its conclusions. There are those who seek to get over this difficulty by differentiating the science from what they are disposed to call the art of eco-

nomy. This divorce of theory and practice is, however, a mischievous error, which relegates the science to the sterility of an ideal dream or a puzzle, and condemns the art to the position of a rule of the thumb. Theory is only enlarged practice, practice is theory studied in its relation to proximate causes. The practice is predetermined by the theory which tests its truth, and adapts it to different conditions by reason of its grasp of the deep-seated, permanent, and varied basal truths. I hope thus to have shown that the nature of the subject itself as a branch of social science which is best studied historically and not deductively, the actual practice of the most civilized nations, and the history of the growth of its theory given above, alike establish the doctrine of relativity, and the predominant claim of collective welfare over individual interests, as the principal features in which the highest minds of the present day chiefly differ from the economical writers of the old school, with their *a priori* conclusions based on individual self-interest and unrestricted competition.

We have next to consider the bearings of this enlarged view of the science in its Indian aspects. The characteristics of our social life are the prevalence of status over contract, of combination over competition. Our habits of mind are conservative to a fault. The aptitudes of climate and soil facilitate the production of raw materials. Labour is cheap and plentiful, but unsteady, unthrifty, and unskilled. Capital is scarce, immobile, and unenterprising. Co-operation on a large scale of either capital or labour is unknown. Agriculture is the chief support of nearly the whole population, and this agriculture is carried on under conditions of uncertain rainfall. Commerce and manufactures on a large scale are but recent importations, and all industry is carried on on the system of petty

farming, retail dealing, and job working by poor people on borrowed capital. There is an almost complete absence of a landed gentry or wealthy middle class. The land is a monopoly of the State. The desire for accumulation is very weak, peace and security having been almost unknown over large areas for any length of time till within the last century. Our laws and institutions favour a low standard of life, and encourage subdivision and not concentration of wealth. The religious ideals of life condemn the ardent pursuit of wealth as a mistake to be avoided as far as possible. These are old legacies and inherited conditions. Stagnation and dependence, depression and poverty—these are written in broad characters on the face of the land and its people. To them are superadded the modern factor of foreign subjection which, economically considered, represents contact with a race which has opened the country to the commerce of the world, and by its superior skill and resources has developed communications in a way previously unknown. If we wish to realize our situation fully, we may not overlook this factor, because it represents the beam of light which alone illumines the prevailing darkness. It cannot well be a mere accident that the destinies of this country have been entrusted to the guidance of a nation whose characteristic strength is opposed to all our weaknesses, whose enterprize, chiefly in commerce and manufactures, knows no bounds, whose capital overflows the world, among whom contract has largely superseded status, and competition and co-operation play a dominant part, whose view of life is full of hope, and whose powers of organization have never been surpassed.

The first point which illustrates the divergence between the orthodox doctrine and the enlarged views I have attempted to set forth, as characterizing the more developed modern European thought on the subject, relates to the so-called system

of the territorial division of labour by which the orthodox economists assign to the backward torrid zone regions of Asia the duty of producing raw materials, and claim for the advanced European temperate zone countries the work of transport and manufactures, as a division of labour in production which is fraught with the highest advantage to all, and is almost a providential dispensation against which it would be foolish to rebel. Of course as far as the natural advantages of climate and situation force our hands, economically backward races must submit to such an arrangement, but it is fairly open to question whether there is any such inevitable necessity which justifies a line of separation, which has a tendency to accentuate natural deficiencies, and make them a source of permanent weakness.

(1) In the first place, the torrid zone people may fairly appeal to past history, when their skilled products found a ready market in temperate kingdoms, and excited such jealousy as to dictate prohibitive sumptuary laws both in ancient Rome and in modern England. (2) They may also urge that the natural fitness of things requires that the manufactures should spring up where the raw materials grow, and where besides there is demand for the manufactured produce, rather than that bulky goods should be transported many thousands of miles over land and sea, and reconsigned the same way back. (3) The differences in favour of temperate regions are all modern growths due to the employment of steam machinery, and the abundance of cheap iron and coal. This is a real advantage, and has to be faced, but if it can be faced, there is no natural incongruity in an arrangement by which industry would return to its ancient home with a double saving in time and cost. (4) Neither Mr. Adam Smith, nor even Mr. J. S. Mill, recommend absolute freedom in such matters. Adam Smith was a fair trader, and

Mr. Mill distinctly recognises an exception to the general rule of free trade where time is required to see whether new industries are or are not adapted to the natural resources of new countries. The late controversy between Mr. Blaine and Mr. Gladstone chiefly turned upon this point, Mr. Blaine contending that, with a large continental country like America, with all shades of climate and soil and position, the conditions of the problem were different from those of an isolated small territory like England. The Australian colonies also justify their departure from the orthodox policy on this same ground. India may fairly claim the benefit of the experience and practice of these self-governing communities, and demand breathing time. (5) It is further to be noted that such a division of production, if permanently stereotyped, consigns Asia to an industry which is under the bane of the law of diminishing returns, while the west of Europe appropriates to itself those forms of industry which are not subject to any such law. The orthodox view thus condemns the poor to grow still poorer, and helps the rich to grow more rich: it giveth much to him that hath, and taketh away from him that hath not the little that he hath. (6) Lastly, people forget that the agricultural industry in the torrid regions has to work under the disadvantage of an uncertain rainfall, and suffer from famine visitations, which, when they come, paralyze production, and condemn millions to violent or slow death. A due co-ordination of the three-fold forms of industrial activity, even if it be not immediately most advantageous to individuals in any one period, is a permanent national insurance against recurrent dangers, and as such is economically the most beneficial course in the interests of the community.

(2) The point noticed above has reference chiefly to foreign trade. In domestic interchange also, the same law operates, and every nation which desires economical advance has to take care that its urban population she bear and increasing ratio to its rural masses with every advance it seeks to make. Mr. J. S. Mill has expressly laid down that no agriculture can be really productive which is divorced from a neighbouring non-agricultural market represented by thriving towns and cities. Under native rulers there was a sort of rude adjustment made in this direction, when the courts of the petty sovereigns afforded so many centres of urban activity in industries patronized by the court and its dependents. Mr. Mill suggests that in the absence of such near markets, the next available substitute is a large export trade to foreign countries. This substitute cannot however be accepted as really answering the purpose in view. The progress of ruralization in modern India means its rustication *i. e.* a loss of power, and intelligence, and self-dependence, and is a distinctly retrograde move. The growth of the sea ports and of small military and railway stations is not enough to counterbalance the enormous loss that has been inflicted by this retrograde movement. Every class of artizans, the weavers and spinners, the dyers, the oilmen, the paper-makers, the silk and sugar and metal workers &c. who are unable to bear up against western competition, resort to the land, leave the towns and go into the country, and are lost in the mass of helpless people who are unable to bear up against scarcity and famine.

(3). The highest statesmanship may well feel aghast at this rapid change, and I know as a matter of fact this that subject weighs heavily on the conscience of the British Admini-

strators in India. They, however, feel powerless to act under the influence of the all-pervading doctrine that these matters lie outside the province of Government. A regular system of immigration from thickly populated poor agricultural tracts to sparsely peopled new and origin districts is a desideratum. The halting efforts made in this direction produce no good, for the concessions are not liberal enough, and there is no prescience about it. The ancient rulers who settled waste districts, and founded towns with flourishing and extensive industries, made no difficulty about granting the most liberal concessions. Anticipating Mr. Wakefield's colonization proposals, whole village communities with their varied elements of life were encouraged to move *en masse*, and were made comfortable in their new places. Powerful guilds of traders and artizans from distant places were similarly induced to settle in new towns by free gifts of lands and houses and privileges. Stray settlers attracted by a few year's leases can never accomplish the end the rulers have in view, and such attempts are bound to fail. A Colbert or a Peter the Great, is wanted to give effect to such a scheme, and the ordinary doctrines of *laissez faire* must be set aside in view of the great interests at stake.

(4). Conquest, consolidation, and conciliation have had their heroes in British history. Systematic colonization and the promotion of varied culture are the next stages of development, and it may be hoped that, before long, with Africa and Australia and the East and West Indies literally starving for Indian labour, and Burmah at our door opened up, with the ravages of periodical famines, carrying away our thousands and millions for want of work when agriculture fails, the policy of let-alone will be given up, and an active effort made in all



directions to stimulate productions both of raw and manufactured products. If the state can legitimately undertake from borrowed funds the construction or subsidization of railroads and canals, if it can afford to sell the fee simple of waste lands at nominal rates to European settlers on the hills, the road is certainly open for a further development of this same industrial effort on new lines. The Dutch Netherlands Government have shown the way in Java, and with less selfish motives the same method might well be tried in regard at least to the industries allied with agriculture, sugar refining, oil pressing, tobacco curing, silk rearing &c. all of which can certainly be made to thrive in this torrid land under skilled supervision.

Proceeding next to the department of Distribution, the enlarged view of Political Economy stated above does not accept the position of the unearned increment as a leading feature of the law of rent in India. The unearned increment theory fits in only where landed property continues for generations in the possession of the same family. If the land changes hands, the incoming purchaser buys it at its market value, and he enjoys no unearned advantage, and the so-called rent is but a return by way of profits on his investment. The English conditions of landlordism, where the land under a complicated system of entails and settlements and primogeniture, continues in the same family for generations, allow free play to the law of the unearned increment. Here in this country lands and houses are not so tied up, and they change hands frequently and largely. In every 20 years, the registration returns show that the value of sales comes up to the total value of landed property. In one generation, property thus changes hands, and when new men come in as purchasers for value, they do not enjoy any unearned increment of the past, but have to

pay full value for the differential advantages of superior productiveness and vicinity. In the same way, the Ricardian theory that economic rent does not enter as an element of price admittedly does not apply when all occupied land has to pay monopoly rent to the state landlord. There is no competition among landlords in this country, for there is only one landlord, and the so-called tax on rents frequently encroaches upon the profits and wages of the poor peasant, who has to submit perforce to a loss of status and accommodate himself to a lower standard of life as pressure increases.

Lastly, the advanced theory expounded by the modern school fully justifies the attempts made by the Government here and in England to check the abuse of competition among poor tenants by conferring fixity of tenure, by adjusting rents judicially for a term of years, and imposing limitations on its increase. In this matter the tenants of Government claim the same consideration as those of private Zemindars. The justification for this active interference is as valid in regard to agricultural labourers and tenants as it is in the case of factory labourers and miners in Europe. These people are unable to combine for self-protection, or at least their combination is not so effective as that of the employers of labour, and when their efforts fail to obtain regular redress, disorder and misery result as consequences, and threaten public peace and general well-being. In the same spirit, the regulation of the freedom of contract in regard to the fixing of rates of interest in transactions between the poor disunited indebted classes and the money-lenders, and the protection of immovable property from being sold away for improvident debts, not secured on the same, are all legitimate forms of protection of the weak against the strong, and do not affect the real freedom of distribution,

The advanced theory concedes freedom where the parties are equally matched in intelligence and resources ; when this is not the case, all talk of equality and freedom adds insult to the injury. It is in this spirit that the distribution of property among the needy many and the powerful few has to be arranged, *i. e.* in a spirit of equity and fair play, and the orthodox views of finality in such matters must be reconsidered in all the relations of life.

Lastly comes the great department of Governmental interference. The meddlesomeness of the mercantile system provoked a reaction against state control and guidance in the school of natural liberty. The doctrines of this negative school have now in their turn been abused by a too logical extension of its principles. There is a decided reaction in Europe against the *laissez faire* system. Even in England, the recent factory legislation, the qualified recognition by law of trades-unionism, the poor law system, and the Irish land settlement, are all instances which indicate the same change of view. Speaking roughly, the province of state interference and control is practically being extended so as to restore the good points of the mercantile system without its absurdities. The state is now more and more recognized as the national organ for taking care of national needs in all matters in which individual and co-operative efforts are not likely to be so effective and economic as national effort. This is the correct view to take of state functions. To relegate them to the simple duty of maintaining peace and order is really to deprive the community of many of the advantages of the social union. Education, both liberal and technical, post and telegraphs, Railway and canal communications, the pioneering of new enterprise, the insurance of risky undertakings, all these functions are usefully dis-

charged by the state. The question is one of time, fitness, and expediency, not one of liberty and rights. In our own country, the state has similarly enlarged its functions with advantage. The very fact that the rulers belong to a race with superior advantages imposes this duty on them of attempting things which no native rulers, past or present, could as well achieve, or possibly even think of. This obligation is made more peremptory by the fact that the state claims to be the sole landlord, and is certainly the largest capitalist in the country. While the state in India has done much in this way in the working of iron and coal fields, and in the experiments, made about cotton and tobacco, and in tea and coffee and cinchona plantations, it must be admitted that, as compared with its resources and the needs of the country, these attempts are as nothing by the side of what remains yet unattempted. Even if political considerations forbid independent action in the matter of differential duties, the pioneering of new enterprise is a duty which it might more systematically undertake with advantage. In truth there is no difference of principle between lending such support and guidance, by the free use of its credit and superior organization, in pioneering industrial undertakings or subsidizing private co-operative effort, and its guaranteeing minimum interest to railway companies. The building up of national, not merely state, credit on broad foundations by helping people to acquire confidence in a free and largely ramified Banking system, so advantageously worked in Europe under different forms, has also not been attempted here. There is, lastly, the duty cast on it of utilizing indigenous resources, and organizing them in a way to produce in India in state factories all products of skill which the state departments require in the way of stores.

These are only a few of the many directions in which, far more than exchange and frontier difficulties, the highest statesmanship will have a field all its own for consideration and action. They will no doubt receive such consideration if only the minds of the rulers were once thoroughly freed from the fear of offending the so-called maxims of rigid economical-science. It is time that a new departure should take place in this connection, and it is with a view to drawing public attention to this necessity that I have ventured to place before you the results of modern European thought. In this, as in other matters, the conditions of Indian life are more faithfully reproduced in some of the continental countries and in America than in happy England, proud of its position, strong in its insularity, and the home of the richest and busiest community in the modern industrial world. If the attempt I have made leads to a healthy and full discussion of the change of policy I advocate, I shall regard myself amply repaid for my trouble.

---

The following extracts will show that the views embodied in the foregoing paper are not confined to the native community only, but that Anglo-Indian thinkers of note are also becoming every day more and more alive to the evils of the present *laissez faire* policy of the Government of India. The first extract is taken from "A modern Zoroastrian" by S. Laing sometime Financial Minister to the Government of India. The second extract is taken from "A study in Indian Administration" by Sir William Wilson Hunter and it represents the views entertained by the late Sir Maxwell Melvill on Indian Political Economy.

"When Sir Robert Peel some forty years ago announced his conversion by the unadorned eloquence of Richard Cobden,

and free trade was inaugurated, with results which were attended with the most brilliant success, every one expected that the conversion of the rest of the civilised world was only a question of time, and that a short time. Few would have been found bold enough to predict that forty years later England would stand almost alone in the world in adherence to free trade principles, and that the protectionist heresy would not only be strengthened and confirmed among Continental nations such as France and Germany, but actually adopted by large and increasing majorities in the United States, Canada, Australia, and other English-speaking Communities. Yet such is the actual fact at the present day. In spite of the Cobden Club and of arguments which to the average English mind appear irresistible, free trade has been steadily losing ground for the last twenty years, and nation after nation, colony after colony, sees its protectionist majority increasing and its free trade minority dwindling.

It is evident there must be some real cause for such a universal phenomenon. In countries like France and Russia we may attribute it to economical ignorance and the influence of cliques of manufacturers and selfish interests; but the people of Germany, and still more of the United States, Canada, and Australia, are as intelligent as ourselves, and quite as shrewd in seeing where those interests really lie. They are fettered by no traditional prejudices, and their political instincts rather lie towards freedom and against the creation of any thing like an aristocracy of wealthy manufacturers. And yet, after years of free discussion, they have become more and more hardened in their protectionist heresies.

What does this prove? That there are two sides to the

shield, and not, as we fancied in our English insularity, only one.

Free trade is undoubtedly the best, or rather the only possible, policy for a country like England, with thirty millions of inhabitants, producing food for less than half the number, and depending on foreign trade for the supplies necessary to keep the other half alive. It is the best policy also for a country which, owing to its mineral resources, its accessibility by sea to markets, its accumulated capital, and the inherited qualities, physical and moral, of its working population, has unrivalled advantages for cheap production. Nor can any dispassionate observer dispute that in England, which is such a country, free-trade has worked well. It has not worked miracles, it has not introduced an industrial millennium, the poor are still with us, and it has not saved us from our share of commercial depressions. But, on the whole, national wealth has greatly increased, and, what is more important, national well-being has increased with it, the mass of the population, and especially the working classes, get better wages, work shorter hours, and are better fed, better clothed, and better educated than they were forty years ago.

This is one side of the shield, and it is really a golden and not an illusory one. But look at the other side. Take the case of a country where totally opposite conditions prevail: where there is no surplus population, unlimited land, limited capital, labour scarce and dear, and no possibility of competing in the foreign or even in the home market with the manufactures which, with free trade, would be poured in by countries like England, in prior possession of all the elements of cheap production. It is by no means so clear that protec-

tion, to enable native industries to take root and grow, may not in such cases be the wisest policy.

Take as a simple illustration of the case of an Australian colony imposing an import duty on foreign boots and shoes. There is not a doubt that this is practically taxing the immense majority of colonists who wear and do not make these articles. But, on the other hand, it makes the colony a possible field for emigration for all the shoe-makers of Europe, and shoe-making a trade to which any Australian with a large family can bring up one of his sons. Looking at it from the strict point of view of the most rigid political economist, the maximum production of wealth, which is the better policy? The production of wealth we must recollect, depends on labour, and productive labour depends on the labourer finding his tools—that is, employment at which he can work. A labourer who cannot find work at living wages is worse than a zero: he is a negative quantity as far as the accumulation of wealth is concerned. On the other hand, every workman who finds work, even if it may not be of the ideally best description, is a wealth-producing machine. What he spends on himself and his family gives employment to other workmen, and the work must be poor indeed if the produce of a year's labour is not more than the cost of a year's subsistence. The surplus adds to the national capital, and thus capital and population go on increasing in geometrical progression. The first problem, therefore, for a new or backward country is to find 'a fair day's wages for a fair day's work,' for as many hands as possible. The problem of making that employment the most productive possible is a secondary one, which will solve itself in each case rather by actual practice than by abstract theory.



This much, however, is pretty clear, that in order to secure the maximum of employment it must be varied. All are not fit for agricultural work, and, even if they were, if the conditions of soil and climate favour large estates and sheep or cattle runs rather than small farms, a large amount of capital may provide work for only a small number of labourers. On social and moral grounds, also, apart from dry considerations of political economy, progress intelligence and a higher standard of life are more likely to be found with large cities, manufactures, and a variety of industrial occupations than with a dead level of a few millionaires and a few shepherds, or of a few landlords and a dense population of poor peasants. If protection is the price which must be paid to render such a larger life possible, it may be sound policy to pay it, and the result seems to show that neither it nor free trade is inconsistent with rapid progress, while, on the other hand, neither of them affords an absolute immunity from the evils that dog the footsteps of progress, and from the periods of reaction and depression which accompany vicissitudes of trade."

"But Sir Maxwell Melvill, or Max Melvill as he was affectionately called throughout his career, was an important personality and a living influence quite apart from his official work. In economies he did not shrink from declaring himself a protectionist of the American type that is to say an advocate for protection not for a single isolated country, but for a great continent like America or India made up of a number of States, possessing within them the resources for almost every kind of production, indeed for almost every form of human industry, and capable of a self-sufficing economic development. One of those who knew him best believes that it was this consciousness of holding views not in accordance with the prevailing doctrines of the Government of India, which influenced him in declining the seat in the Viceroy's Council."

## GLEANINGS FROM MARATHA CHRONICLES.

—: 0 :—

It is well-known, that the standard (1) history of the Marathas by Captain James Grant Duff is based, to a considerable extent, on Maratha Bakhars or chronicles and other original papers and documents, to which the author had access. Of several of these, Grant Duff had copies made, which, he tells us (2) in his history, were deposited by him with the Literary Society of Bombay. This was certainly the most appropriate thing to do at that time, so as to provide facilities for students of Maratha History to examine for themselves the original materials which Grant Duff had worked up into his book. Unfortunately, however, the Literary Society has long ceased to exist. And Grant Duff's Manuscripts cannot now be traced anywhere. I have had inquiries and search made in the library of the Bombay Branch of the Royal Asiatic Society, which is the successor of the Literary Society. But the Manuscripts are not in that library, and nothing on the records of either Society now available affords any clue to their present whereabouts. An impression has existed for several years past in some quarters, (3) that the Manuscripts in question were burnt, with the knowledge, if not under the orders, of Grant Duff himself. I have never, however, been able to as-

---

(1) See *inter alia* Journal Bombay Branch, Royal Asiatic Society Vol. IX. pp vi, ix, xxxiii and Vol. X. p. 120.

(2) See the foot notes to his History *passim*.

(3) See *inter alia* Visidhajanavistara Vol. VIII. p 213, Vol. IX. p 247 ; A review of Grant Duff's History of the Marathas by a student of the Poona College (now Rav Bahadur Nilkanth Janardan Kirtane.) p. 9 *et seq.* I am told that no such impression has existed at Satara where Grant Duff was officially employed.

certain the basis on which this impression is founded, (4) And the story itself is so improbable, and so much like the stories about the burning of papers and documents by the Inam Commission, that it does not deserve any further consideration. It must have originally arisen probably when it was ascertained, that the Manuscripts were not on the shelves of the Library of the Bombay Branch of the Royal Asiatic Society.

Some of these documents, however, have within the last ten or twelve years become accessible to the Marathi reader in print. And with these, there have also been published some others, which apparently were not before Grant Duff. An examination of both these groups of documents discloses sundry passages of interest in connection with Maratha History, although it did not fall within the scope of Grant Duff's work to cast any except a very incidental and hurried glance at them, and that, too, only at some of them. Grant Duff's work devotes itself mainly, if one may not even say exclusively, to the purely political history of the Marathas. Their social and religious progress receives only a very occasional and very indirect notice in its pages. \* It is true, that even in the original documents above alluded to, the various political transactions of the periods to which they respectively relate form

---

(4) The basis all-ged in the Review mentioned in note (2) is certainly very unsubstantial, and not to be implicitly relied on, under the circumstances. A certain "Southern Commissioner" is also mentioned as having had some share in the destruction of the Mss. The name of the gentleman who gave the information on which this story is based is mentioned in the second edition of the Review p. 28. But I do not see that that improves matters very much. Mr. Kirtane himself has in his second edition (p. 95-7.) very properly and candidly expressed his disbelief in the story, together with the grounds for his disbelief. It is, perhaps, worthy of note in this connexion, that it appears from Sir H. Elliott's History of India by Prof. Dowson Vol. VII. pp. vi and 210, that another of Grant Duff's Mss—a translation of a *Musulman original*—is also not now forthcoming.

almost exclusively the subject-matter of the narrative. (5) Still, when these original documents are before us, the incidental references contained in them to social and religious matters are even now capable of being utilized, while in the case of the Manuscripts that are lost, this is necessarily not the case. And for the reasons stated, we cannot now have access even at second-hand to such references as may have been contained in them. Considering that taken altogether, the light thrown on the social and religious history of the Marathas by the documents now available is not very plentiful, but comes, so to say, in only scattered rays, it is a subject of just regret, that even the chance of adding to it an extra ray here and there is now foreclosed by the loss of Grant Duff's Manuscripts. In default of them, however, it is proposed in the present paper, to gather together to a focus such of these scattered rays as may be obtained from the papers and documents which have, within the last few years, been made generally accessible in print, in the pages of the *Vividhajnānavistāra*, of the *Kāyastha Prabhūnchya Itihāsāchin Sādhanen*, and above all in those of the *Kāvyetibāsa Sangraha*. (6)

The first point of interest, then, to be noted here is the attitude of the State towards the social and religious concerns of

---

(5) In Sir H. Elliott's *History of India* by Prof. Dowson Vol. I, pp xix-xxi, one may read some very bitter, but not, I fear, unfounded complaints, about the character of the chronicles written by Hindu writers which Sir H. Elliott had to examine.

(6) These are the principal sources. Some others have also been utilised, as will be seen later on. The *Bakhar*, a translation of which is contained in Prof. Forrest's *Selections from Bombay State Papers* Vol. I, must, it seems to me, have been in some parts mistranslated, and in all abridged in the translation. The original is hardly likely, for instance, to have spoken of a night darker than Sivaji's heart. (See p. 15)—a phrase which one would not expect to occur in relation to Sivaji in a *Maratha Bakhar* deposited in *Rāyagad*.

the people. Here we are enabled to go back to the very beginnings of Maratha power, to the system established by its great founder. And it is to be remarked, that in spite of the unfavourable conditions then existing, in spite of the all-engrossing militarism of the day, (7) Sivaji found time to apply his genius to the elaboration of a regular system of Civil Administration (8), in a manner to which we find almost no parallel throughout the whole period of Maratha History, except during the régime of that excellent Peshva, the elder Mâdhavrav. (9) One principal feature of Sivaji's system consisted in the creation of a Cabinet Council—the famous *Ashta Pradhâna*—or eight Ministers. (10) And one of these eight was known as *Panditrav*. (11). His functions, like those of the other

---

(7) Bernier in his *Travels* (see new edition in Constable's *Oriental Miscellany* pp. 220-1) and Ovington in his *Voyage to Surat* (pp 189-228) afford some indication about the large armies maintained in those days, and the expenses which their maintenance entailed.

(8) Grant Duff Vol. I, p. 223 *et seq.*

(9) See about him Grant Duff Vol. II, p. 208 *et seq.* and compare Forrest's *Bombay Selections* Vol. I. p.p. 250; Fryer's *Travels* pp. 79,146

(10) See Grant Duff Vol. I, p. 235 *et seq.* comp. Chitragupta's *Life of Sivaji* p. 103; Sabhasad's *Ditto* p. 69. ; and *Vividhajanavistara* Vol. XIII. p. 238 *et seq.* ; Forrest's *Selections* pp. 14,80.

(11) There is some diversity in the various accounts contained in our authorities about the institution of the *Panditrav's* office. The *Maratha Samrajya Bakhar* (p. 28) says, that it was established some little time after Sivaji's plunder of Surat, in order to provide an officer who would look after the grants made to Brahmans with a view to the preservation of virtue and justice in the kingdom. Malhar Ramrav Chitnis seems to agree with this (See *Vividhajanavistara*, vol. X, p. 8) and to show that all Sivaji's administrative arrangements took shape at that time. Krishnaji Anant Sabhasad (p. 23) says that the title of *Panditrav* was bestowed on Raghunath Pandit, when he was appointed as a fit and proper person for the negotiations with Mirza Raja Jayasing—an appointment which M. R. Chitnis also mentions. Chitragupta in his *life* (p. 105) and Gupte the author of the *Bhonsle Bakhar* (p. 10) refer the institution of the office to the time of the

Ministers and high officers, are stated in a Note or Memorandum which purports to be written on the 13th of Jyeshtha Vadya, Tuesday, of the first year of the era of the Installation. (A. D. 1674.) (12) It states that the Panditray's duties are to exercise all the ecclesiastical powers of the State, and to order punishment to be inflicted after investigating into what is and is not in accordance with the religious law. He is to receive learned persons on behalf of the State, and countersign all documents that may issue from the Sovereign relating to Acbâra, Vyavahâra, and Prâyaschitta, that is to say, rules of conduct, civil and criminal law, and penances—(13) the three departments of the Dharma-sâstra. He is also to look after the performance of Sântis (14) and other ceremonies and the distribution of the royal bounty. It is further stated in the Life of Sivaji written by Malhar Ramrav Chitnis, that the scheme of the cabinet and its functions was settled by Sivâji in conformity with previous practice and tradition. (15)

In an Ajuâpatra, or Rescript, bearing date Mârgasîrsha Sûdha 4th, Thursday, of the forty-second year of the installation era (1716 A. D.) issued by Râjâ Shambhu Chhatrapati of

---

Installation. See further as to the Panditray's functions, M. R. Chitnis's *Râjniti*, pp. 10, 30, and compare Malcolm's *Central India* Vol. II. p. 429; and Forbes's *Oriental Memoirs* Vol. I. p. 214 (*Quære* what is the meaning of Jeiram Bopput there mentioned? Can it be a proper name Jayarâm Bapat?). The Dhavadasi Bakhsh mentions the Panditray in connexion with the Svami's funeral ceremonies.

(12) Letters, memoranda &c. (published in the *Kavyetihasa Sangraha*) p. 357.

(13) See West and Bühler's *Hindu Law* p. 13.

(14) See Mandlik's *Hindu law*. Intr. p. XXXII.

(15) *Vividhajoana Vistâra* Vol. XIII. pp. 201, 238; see also *Sabhasa's Life of Sivaji* p. 69. At p. 725 of Mr. Forrest's *Bombay Selections* Vol. I. is a translation of an essay by a Muhammadan writer of the last century, who alleges that Sivaji borrowed his scheme from the Musulmans. He does not mention any grounds for his statement.

Kolhâpur, it is said that it is among the duties of a king of men to destroy any tendency towards impiety, and to increase piety, among his subjects, and thus to acquire eternal happiness in the life to come. (16) Accordingly it is laid down, (17) that heretical opinions antagonistic to religion, should not by any means be allowed to prevail in the kingdom, and if perchance they should be found to have manifested themselves anywhere, the matter should be inquired *frâto* personally, that is to say, I understand, by the Minister himself to whom the order is directed, and due punishment should be inflicted, so that no one else may join in the evil courses, and they may ultimately be altogether stopped.

It would thus appear, that the Maratha Rajas considered it their right, or rather their duty, to regulate the religious affairs of their subjects, although it is to be remarked, that the Minister appointed for the purpose of attending to this part of the Raja's duties was in fact always a Brahman, as indeed might naturally be expected. It further appears, that these duties were practically enforced, and did not exhaust themselves in being committed to paper. We find, for instance, that in the reign of Sambhâji, the son and successor of Sivâji, the favourite "Kabji." (18) Kalushâ, among his other high crimes and mis-demeanours, induced the King, against the advice and

(16) V. J. Vistâra Vol. V. p. 194.

(17) Ditto p. 91 and comp. Letters &c., (K. I. Sangraha ) p. 9.

(18) The writer of the note at Dowson's Elliott Vol. VII. p. 338 seems to be puzzled by this word ; but it is, of course, equivalent to kab or kavi *plus* the honorific "ji." The *Buonsile* Bakhar (p. 14) and M. R. Chitnis's *Life of Sambhaji* (p. 7) and the *Sri Siva Kavya canto. vi. st. 21* suggest that Kalusha was an emissary of Aurangzeb. See also Forbes *Oriental Memoirs* Vol. I. p. 462. The Muhammadan account, summarized in Dowson's Elliott (*loc cit*) does not support this suggestion ; while it connects Kabji with the Brahman ( Kasi-pant ) in whose charge Sambhaji had been left by Sivâji on his flight from Delhi.

remonstrance of the responsible Minister Panditray, to order Prâyaschittas or penances, to be performed by eminent Brahmins, "masters of six Shâstrâs." (19) What offences or shortcomings were alleged for justifying these orders, the document before us does not state, and there is no other source of information on the subject known to me.

In the time of Shâhu again, when Balaji Bajirao was Peshvâ, the State had to deal with a dispute even then of long-standing between the Brahmins and Prabhus. (20) The dispute appears to have commenced as early as the days of Sivâji, (21) and the settlement then arrived at was, apparently, adhered to during the reigns of Sambhaji and Rajaram, and the greater part of the reign of Shâhu himself. Towards the latter end of Shâhu's reign, however, the dispute was rekindled, as the Prabhus were much in favour with Shâhu, as they had been with Sivâji. (22) The Brahmins of the day are charged, in the Prabhu Chronicles, with having interpolated new verses into old Puranic and other books like the Sahyadri Khanda, for the purpose of lowering the status of the Prabhu caste. The disputes having come before Balaji Bajirao, the Peshva, he wrote to Shâhu, recommending that the old practice should be adhered to, that the new quarrels raised by the Brahmins should be discountenanced, and that they should be given final and clear orders in the matter. Shâhu (23) thereupon sent an order to all the Brahmins of Khande and Mahuli (on the banks of the river Krishna) ordering that they should continue

---

(19) Marathi Samrâjyâchi Bakhar p. 59.

(20) This is the correct mode of spelling the name of the caste as claimed by themselves. The change to Parbhu (corrupted by Anglo-Indians to Purvoo) they attribute to jealousy. See Kayastha Prabhunchi Bakhar p. 6.

(21) See K. P. Bakhar (K. P. I. S.) pp. 10-2.

(22) See. Chitrâgupta's Sivâji p. 123.

(23) See K. P. Bakhar (K. P. I. S.) pp. 12,17.



to perform all ceremonies, funeral and other, as the same had been theretofore performed, during the régime of the Bijapur Emperors, (24) and also in the time of Sivaji, Sambhaji, Rajaram and Tarabai, and in the early days of the their current reign. They were directed "not to do anything new, not to break anything old." At the same time with this order of the Sovereign, the Panditnav Raghunath appears also to have addressed a communication to the Brahmans aforesaid, reciting briefly the order made by Shahu, and adding that the old practice should be revived. (25) We learn, however, that although these orders were sent, the disputes were not in fact settled, as the Pratinidhi Jagjivanrav Pandit, and his agent Yamaji, who were managing all affairs at Satara on behalf of Shahu, would not accept the settlement, seeing that Shahu's end was approaching. Subsequently Shahu died, as was expected, and Balaji Bajirav immediately placed both the Pratinidhi and his agent Yamaji (26) in prison, and ordered (27) the old practice as regards ceremonies among Prabhu families to be resumed. That practice, then, continued undisturbed until the end of the administration of Madhavrav, and the beginning of that of Narayanrav.

Many years after this, (28) in the days of the Peshva

---

(24) It seems to follow from this, that the Musalman Rajas had also dealt with the questions between these two castes.

(25) See K. P. Bakar (K. P. I. S.) pp. 12-3 where the letters are set out at length.

(26) See Grant Duff Vol. II. pp. 17, 32.

(27) Grant Duff Vol II, p. 35. The Panipat Bakhar of Raghunath Yadav states ( p. 7 ) that Shahu on his death bed, made over the whole kingdom to Balaji Bajirav.

(28) See Letters, Memoranda &c. (K. I. Sangraha) p. 76. A similar question arose long afterwards in connection with the case of Sri-pat Seshadri—a brother of the late Rev. Narayan Seshadri—in which the late enlightened Prof. Bal Gangadhar Shastri is understood to have taken a prominent part which mortally offended the orthodoxy of his day.

Savai Madhavray, a Brahman, we learn, named Narhari Ranalekar became yavanamaya and bhrashta, which I understand to mean converted to Muhammadanism and fallen off from Hinduism. He was then taken back into the fold by certain Brahmans of Paithana, although, as the Peshva's order says, this was an unwarrantable proceeding. His re-admission led to a split in the Brahman community of the place; and then an officer of the Government came upon the scene, and by coercion got all the Brahmans, the excommunicated ones and the others, to sit down to dinner together. The result, says the Peshva's order, was that the whole of the Paithana Brahmans became excommunicated. And therefore the Sarkar, or Government, sent two Karkuns to administer penance wholesale to all the Brahmans of Paithana; and this was accordingly done. The order, then, which is addressed to the Deshmukhs and Deshpandes of Pargana Jalnapur, after reciting all this, directs that the other Brahmans of the Pargana, having had intercourse with the Paithana Brahmans, must also perform due penance, according to the measure of their intercourse, through the instrumentality of the two Government Karkuns aforesaid. This case presents several remarkable features, not the least remarkable of which is the severe logic by which the penance is made to extend to all the Brahmans of a whole Pargana. The same severe logic may be noticed in a later case, which occurred in October 1800—soon after the deaths of Nana Fadanavis and Parshuram Bhaui Patvardhan. It seems then to have been found out, that one of the household attendants in the Peshva's palace, who had been supposed to be a Brahman, was in fact of a low caste—a saddler. The man was ordered to be punished, and penance was administered to the whole city of Poona, that is, presumably, to

the Brahmans of the place, who must have been then, as they are now, the large majority of the inhabitants. (29)

A curious ecclesiastical case was disposed of by Sadashivrav Bhau (30) at Trimbakesvar. The Giri and Pari (31) sects of Gosavis had some dispute about bathing at Trimbakesvar in the Sinhastha year—a dispute, apparently about which of them was to have precedence. The dispute led, we are told, to severe fights, until Sadashivrav, having offered to settle the matter “on the part of the Government,” the two parties agreed, and then Sadashivrav taking hold of the hands of the Mahants of the two rival sects, entered the sacred waters of the Kusavarta with the two Mahants for his companions. The two thus entering the water together, all disputes about precedence ceased. (32)

The Peshva, however, had not been equally successful in settling another dispute, between rival Brahmans, (33) which had arisen sometime before at Trimbakesvar, in relation to the Temple built by him at that place. The

(29) Letters, Memoranda &c. (K. I. Sangraha) p. 523. I know of no other source of information regarding the matter than the very short entry there. A curious extension of the severity of this logic even to deceased persons is suggested at Kayastha Prabhuunchya Itihāsachin Sādhānen (Gramanya) p. 9. See further Letters, Memoranda &c. (K. I. Sangraha) p. 9. The passage there is rather obscure.

(30) It seems that Sadashivrav principally managed the Peshva's affairs, Balaji as a rule “taking it easy.” See *inter alia*, Forrest's Bombay Selections Vol. I pp. 121, 134 and compare Asiatic Researches Vol. III, p. 91.

(31) See Prof. H. H. Wilson's Religious sects of the Hindus Vol. I. pp. 202-3.

(32) See Peshva's Bakhar pp. 68-9.

(33) For another unsuccessful interference, or rather a series of unsuccessful interferences, by the State in ecclesiastical affairs, see the Kayastha Prabhunchi Bakhar p. 13 *et seq*; Kayastha Prabhuunchya Itihāsachin Sādhānen (Gramanya) p. 5 *et seq*.

consecration of the edifice could not be performed at the time when Balaji wished it to be performed, because the Yajurvedi and A'pastamba Brahmins had some dispute—the nature of which is not more precisely indicated—in connection with the southern gate of the Temple. (34) How the matter was ultimately settled does not appear. (35) It may be remarked in passing, that some of the stone used under the orders of the Peshva for erecting the Trimbakesvar Temple, is stated to have been taken from the Muhammadan Musjids or Mosques in the Mogal districts. Whether such mosques were then unused and dilapidated or not does not appear. (36)

Another matter, in which the Peshva of the day failed to carry out his own wishes, in consequence of opposition from the people, was one which had occurred in the time of the first Bajirav. I have not seen any original authority for this, but a note of the Editor of the Peshva's Bakhar says, that Bajirav having had a son by the Mussulman woman Mastani, wanted to perform the thread-ceremony on that son and make a Brahmin of him; but that the plan fell through in consequence of the opposition of the Brahmins. (37) In a sketch of the career of Bajirav, bearing date in 1840,

---

(34) Peshva's Bakhar pp. 68-9

(35) But it appears from Letters, Memoranda &c. (K. I. Sangraha) p. 522 that the consecration of the Trimbakesvar Temple was made by Bajirav II in Saka 1728 (A. D. 1806). The delay seems unaccountably long in spite of the difficulties raised by the Brahmins.

(36) Peshva's Bakhar p. 68. And compare *inter alia* Dowson's Elliot Vol. VII, pp. 404, 415, 446, 456 and Malcolm Central India Vol. I, p. 56.

(37) Peshva's Bakhar p. 40. That such an idea should have occurred to a Hindu defender of the faith is itself rather remarkable as an example of that relaxation of old traditions adverted to further on in this paper. And compare Grant Duff Vol. I, p. 599. Well might Grant Duff say that Bajirav was free from "bigotry"!

(though this is probably the date of the copy, not of the original sketch itself) a brief account is given of the sort of quasi-marriage, which had been celebrated between Bajirav and Mastāni. (38) The account there given is that Mastāni was the daughter of the Nabob of Hydrabad, that is to say the Nizam, and that the Nabob's wife suggested that their daughter might be married to Bajirav, as a means of cementing friendship between them. The marriage was accordingly celebrated, but with a dagger; (39) and Bajirav afterwards brought Mastāni away, and kept her in a separate mansion built specially for her in a part of the grounds of the Sanavar palace at Poona.

One matter of considerable importance, to which attention is being directed among Hindus at the present day, was dealt with by an order of the Peshvas—which of them was then in power it is not possible to say. The order provides, that no Brahman in Prant Vai should accept a money payment for giving his girl in marriage; that whoever receives any money should forfeit double the amount of it to government; whoever pays any should forfeit as much; and whoever may act as go-between in arranging

---

(38) Letters, Memoranda &c. (K. I. Sangraha) p. 539. The whole story is a curious one, and there are sundry discrepancies in the various accounts we have of the transaction. See Shri Sivakāyva, canto X st. 58; Marathi Samrajya Bakhar pp. 74-77; Kashiraj's Bhonsle Bakhar p. 40; Peshva's Bakhar pp. 37-40 see also p. 49; Peshva's Sakavali p. 6; Raghunath Yadavs Panipat Bakhar p. 48; Chitnis's Shāhu p. 76; Forrest's Selections p. 658. As to Sumsher Bahadur, the son of Mastani, and the manner in which he was treated, and the de-ignation he bore in relation to the Peshvas' family, see Forrest p. 102 and Dowson's Elliott Vol. VIII, p. 283, and compare Peshvas' Bakhar p. 150.

(39) As to this compare *inter alia*, Malcolm's Central India Vol. II p. 158.

such a marriage and receive money for his services as such should forfeit the amount of his brokerage. The official to whom the order is conveyed is directed to communicate the terms of it "in an emphatic manner" to all the Brahman caste, and to all Jamindars, ecclesiastical functionaries, officiating priests, astrologers (Joshi's), and to Patils and Kulkarnis; and he is ordered to recover the amounts as prescribed without listening to any pretexts about expenses &c. The letter now published acknowledges receipt of this order, the whole of which it recites; and promises to communicate it to the people of the town of Vai and of Government villages, and to Deshmukhs and Deshpandes. It is unnecessary to say anything more with reference to this order, than that its all-embracing character deserves notice. All parties to the nefarious transaction are hit at, the man who sells his girl, the man who buys her, and the man who arranges the bargain and sale. (40)

It would thus appear, that under Maratha rule, the union of Church and State was very close indeed; that it was not merely a theoretical but a practically enforced union; and that it was so, as well during the regime of the Maratha Rajas, as under that of the Brahman Peshvas, though it is to be observed, *valeat quantum*, that the order of the Peshva last mentioned bears the usual seal containing the name of Raja

---

(40) See Letters, memoranda &c. (K. I. Sangraha) pp. 121-2. Manu chap. III st. 51 *et seq.* and chap. IX st. 98 *et seq.* forbids what he in terms stigmatizes as a sale of a daughter, and the established name for the transaction in Marathi still is Kanyâvikraya or sale of a daughter. See also Manu chap. XI st. 62 *et seq.* It will be seen that the particular sanctions enacted by the Peshva are not such as can be found in the Manu Smriti, and so far the Peshva's order is, in its nature, legislative, to borrow a term appertaining to the conceptions of the present day.

Shabu. (41) This is not much to be wondered at, considering that the idea of a State leaving all ecclesiastical and religious affairs outside its own jurisdiction, is not one which is even now universally accepted ; and considering further that the main inspiring principle of the whole movement initiated by Sivaji and carried on by his successors down to the closing years of the Peshva regime was the preservation of the Hindu religion against foreign aggression. (42) The only point one is struck by is that the Maratha Rajas should have been prepared and able to meddle so far as they did in religious matters. One possible explanation is that the people at large may have accepted the claims made in favour of Sivaji's Kshatriya origin—a matter on which something more will have to be said in the sequel. On the other hand, it is to be observed that the Shastris generally have been chary of admitting, and in fact have often expressly denied, (43) the existence of any castes other than Brahmanas

---

(41) In the Kayastha Prabhunchi Bakhar p. 12 is a letter from the Peshva making a recommendation, and one from the Raja issuing the required orders through the Panditray.

(42) See *inter alia* Sabhasad's Life pp. 27-8; V. J. Vistara Vol. IX pp. 50-3; Marathi Samrajya Bakhar p. 76, Bhonsle's Bakhar p. 7; Bhonsle Letters, Memoranda &c. (K. I. Sangraha) p. 147; Nigudkar's Life of P. B. Patwardhan p. 87; Malcolm Central India Vol. I. p. 69.

(43) See *inter alia* West and Bühler's Digest of Hindu Law p. 921 note. The learned authors of that work, Sir R. West and Dr. J. G. Bühler, had seen a large number of opinions of Shastris recorded in the various British Courts in the Bombay Presidency. The Shastris in other parts of the country also have, on various occasions, expressed opinions to the same effect. They may be seen referred to in the report of a case decided by Her Majesty's Privy Council at Moore's Indian Appeal Cases Vol. VII pp. 35-7, 46-9. Steele is there quoted as showing that the claims to Kshatriya descent of the Bhonsles and other Maratha families have been denied; and that the denial is based, not on the passage of the Bhagavata referred to in the text, but on the extinction of the Kshatriyas by

and Sudras at the present day. They have generally, I believe, relied on an old text of the Bhagavata Purana, (44) which says that the Nandas were the last of the Kshatriyas; and they have not, as far as I am aware, grappled, from that standpoint, with the claims of Sivaji to rank as a Kshatriya-claims, which appear to have been at least acquiesced in by Ramadasa. (45) Another explanation may, perhaps, be found in the old doctrine that every king has more or less of the divine element in him. In one passage of one of our recently published Bakhars, no less a person than the Mogal emperor of Delhi has been given the benefit of that doctrine. (46) And if

---

Parasurama. But it is obvious that this last argument proves too much. For if it is correct, what is to be said of the caste status of Rāma of Ayodhya, to take only one instance, and the series of his successors as described, for example, in Kalidasa's Raghuvansa? See further Malcolm's Central India Vol. I p. 43.

(44) One explanation of this text, which I believe to be the usual one, applies it only to the land of Magadha, not the whole of Bharatakhanda. For another explanation, given by Benares Pandits, see Kayastha Prabhunchi Bakhar p. 17.

(45) See *inter alia* Dasabodha XIII, 6. Hemadri, too, describes the Jadhav prince, Mahadeva, as of the Somavansa, and as having performed Yajnas. At V. J. Vistara Vol. IX p. 35, it is said that the Marathas are Rajputs with only altered names. See also as to this Journal B. M. Br. Roy. As. Society Vol. IX p. cxlv; and compare. Bhonsle Bakhar pp. 3-5; M. R. Chitnis's Rajaniti p. 7; Forrests Selections p. 726; Dowson's Elliott Vol. VII p. 254 Vol. VIII p. 258.

(46) The passages relating to this point are all extremely curious, and deserve to be examined in their original places. See Panipat Bakhar by R. Yadav pp. 19-20; Chitnis's Rajaram I p. 71; Bhanu Saheb's Bakhar p. 56; Chitragupta's Sivaji p. 137; Chitnis's Rajaram II p. 55; Sri Sivakavya canto I st. 119; Compare Letters &c. p. 37, see also Forbes's Oriental Memoirs Vol. III. 149, (which shows that Akbar was regarded as a divine incarnation), and Dowson's Elliott Vol. V. pp. 569-70. In Dowson's Elliott Vol. VII. p. 284 we are told that, there was in Delhi a sect of Hindus, who did not take their daily food until after they had "Darsana" of Aurangzeb, and were thence called Darsanis!



monies for the Prabbus in the regular manner. And it is stated subsequently that this was accordingly done.

Perhaps the incidents relating to the marriage of Shabji may be looked at as affording another illustration of the same character. The incidents are curious on other grounds also, and may, therefore, be fitly set out at some length. ( 52 ) Maloji, the father of Shahji, and his brother Vithoji, were both employed in the service of Lukji Jadhavrav, a Mansabdar under the Nizamshahi Government. On one occasion, in 1598, when the Shimga festivities of the Ranga were being celebrated at the house of Jadhavrav, Maloji and his young son Shabji being present, the host seated Shabji then five years of age and a handsome looking boy, by the side of his daughter who was three years old. And in the course of conversation he happened to remark, as people often do on such occasions, that the two would make a very suitable match, and asked the girl if she would like to have Shabji for her husband. Immediately Maloji and his brother Vithoji declared to the assembled guests that the word of Jadhavrav had been passed in favour of the match, and called on them to bear witness to the fact. Jadhavrav's wife, however, would not consent to this, and she got him to dismiss Maloji and Vithoji. They both left, but after some time they appear to have prospered, and to have placed themselves at the head of a body of two or three thousand soldiers, and also to have got help from others. They then went to a place near Doulatabad, and throw some slaughtered pigs into the mosque there with letters addressed to the Nizam, stating the contract between them and Jadhavrav, and threatening that if the king did not arrange for the

---

(52) See Marathi Samrajya Bakhar pp. 4-7 and compare V. J. Vistara Vol. IX p. 37 *et seq.*, also Grant Duff Vol. I p.

marriage being celebrated in pursuance of the contract, they would desecrate(53) other mosques in the same way. The Nizam at once took up the matter, and directed Jadhavrav to carry out the contract of marriage. This was ultimately done with great pomp under the auspices of the Nizam himself, who took Maloji and Vithoji into his own service. The proceedings connected with this affair are, it need hardly be remarked, altogether of a curious and irregular character, but they appear to indicate, that even in the delicate affairs of marriage, recourse was had by the Hindu subjects of Musalman Kings to the assistance of their Sovereigns, in whatever way such assistance might be invoked.

There is a passage in the Bakhar of the battle of Kharda, which illustrates how this ecclesiastical jurisdiction was sometimes invoked, and how it was practically worked on its judicial side. At Talegaum, it seems, there was a Brahman woman, who lived in adultery with a Mussalman. (54) The Brahmins of the place made a complaint about this to Nana Fadanavis at Poona, stating the facts, and adding, in the usual style, that the days of Brahmanism were gone! Nana expressed his disbelief in the charge, but appointed a Panch or board of arbitrators to investigate it. (55) The Panch were apparently bribed by the Mussalman, and even before the time for final decision was reached betrayed a tendency to decide in the Mussalman's favour, holding that the charge was false. Thereupon

---

(53) For a funny story of an Englishman's revenge on a Mussalman, in which pig's flesh plays an important part, see Tavernier's Travels by V. Ball Vol. I p. 11.

(54) See the Kharda Bakhar pp. 5-6. (Grant Duff's spelling of the name, Kurda, is incorrect.)

(55) As to this mode of administering criminal justice see Grant Duff Vol. II p. 237, compare Forbes Oriental Memoirs Vol. I p.

"a hundred or two hundred Brahmans" gathered together and went up to Poona. There they went before the tent of the Peshva, ( who was starting with his army on the expedition which ended at Kharda ) and sat there in the middle of the day with torches blazing. When the Peshva came out of the tent, the Brahmans set up a loud cry " Har ! Har ! Mahadev ! " And on the Peshva desiring to know the meaning of it all, they said they had come from Talegaum, stated their whole case, and explained that they had lighted torches at midday, as there was so much darkness, that is, absence of justice, prevailing in the kingdom. Nana was thereupon sent for, and subsequently the arbitrators, and finally the accused woman. The woman on being asked at first remained silent. But cane sticks being ordered to be sent for, ( 56 ) she acknowledged her guilt, and the Peshva thereupon decided that both the accused persons were guilty—a decision in which Yajnesvar Shastri is stated to have concurred. The sentence was that the male culprit was ordered first to be paraded through the streets of Poona on the back of a donkey with his face turned towards the back (57) of the animal, and then tied to the foot of an elephant and killed;

---

474 ; Malcolm Central India Vol. I p. 536 ; Vol. II pp. 290, 426 ; Stephen's Impey and Nandkumar Vol. I p. 247 ; Vol. II p. 78. As to what is said by Grant Duff about women and Brahmans not being put to death, compare M. R. Chitnis's *Life of Shahu the younger* pp. 72-80 ; and Peshva's *Bakhar* p. 132; Forrest p. 18 ; Chitragupta's *Sivaji* p. 5 ; Chitnis's *Shahu* I pp. 25, 5 ; Sambhaji pp. 12, 14.

( 56 ) This is in accordance with old tradition; compare *Mudrâ-râkshasa Act V* Wilson's *Hindu Theatre* Vol. II, 225, Malcolm's *Central India* Vol. I p. 538 and Stephen's *Nandkumar* Vol. I p. 201.

( 57 ) See *Scott's Deccan* Vol. I p. 375.

and the female culprit, as she could not be sentenced to death, ( 58 ) was banished from the kingdom.

The various incidents to which we have thus referred illustrate the ecclesiastical jurisdiction of the Maratha Sovereigns in all aspects. We see from them that those sovereigns, as heads alike of the State and the Church, to borrow a Christian expression, exercised legislative powers, judicial powers both by themselves and through the medium of arbitrators, administrative powers by a departmental Minister, and executive powers through the instrumentality of Government Karkuns. And the documents, it may be added, which furnish this information, extend over nearly the whole period of Maratha rule, from the time of Sivaji down to that of Savai Madhavray.

It has been already stated, that the Maratha Rajas who claimed and exercised the wide ecclesiastical jurisdiction thus

---

( 58 ) See note 55 *Sopra*. The punishments here mentioned were in use in those days for divers offences. The infamous Ghási-rám Kotral was subjected to the parade called Dhinda ( See Peshva's Bakhar p. 157 ) though he appears to have had a camel instead of a donkey to ride on. But see Forbes Oriental Memoirs Vol. II p. 135 where the whole affair is described at length. See also Fryer p. 97. Some of Narayanrav Peshva's murderers, and the pretender Sadāshivray Bhau ( Grant Duff's spelling of this name as Sewdasheorao is incorrect ) were tied to the feet of elephants and thus killed. ( See Bhausahab's Kaifiyat p. 8, and compare Forrest's Selections p. 4, Dowson's Elliott Vol. VII. pp. 359-63, Bernier's Travels p. 177, Scott's Deccan Vol. I pp. 184, 285, 393 and Hamilton's East Indies Vol. I p. 178 where it is said that this was esteemed an ignominious death. ) Others were beheaded or shot. And some had torches tied to their persons, which then were lighted, and they were thus burnt to death, after their fingers had been pierced with needles. See Peshva's Bakhar p. 132. For different and varying accounts of the pretender Sadashivray's death, see Peshva's Bakhar p. 134 and Nigudkar's Life of Parasharam Bhau Patvardhan p. 40, and Grant Duff Vol. II p. 331-5. Peshva's Sakāvali p. 30 ; Dowson's Elliott Vol. VIII 294, Marathi Samrajya Bakhar p. 100, and Chitnis's Rajaram p. 45.

indicated in outline, were regarded as Kshatriyas. The recently published documents contain many allusions to this point. But from those which relate to Sivaji himself, (59) it rather appears, if we read between the lines, that the claim set up on his behalf to be of the Kshatriya caste was not universally regarded as really and truly tenable, although from considerations of policy and expediency it might be conceded. From the Biographies of Sivaji, by Krishnaji Anant Sabhásad, (60) and by Chitragupta, (61) it seems to follow that the search for the origin of Sivaji's family, which resulted in the discovery that he belonged to the Sisode (62) clan of Rajputs who reigned in Udayapur, (63) was not commenced until after the idea of a formal installation (or Abbisheka) had been started. And Malbar Ramrao Chitnis's narrative, although it proceeds on the assumption of the fact as already established, rather indicates that Gagabhata, the great Pandit of Benares, whose services were put in requisition for the installation ceremonies, had some considerations of policy put to him before he was

---

(59) See *inter alia* Chitragupta's Life pp. 108, 116, 168 and compare Marathi Samrájya Bakhar p. 47.

(60) See p. 68, See also Forrest's Selections p. 22.

(61) P. 98.

(62) See V. J. Vistára Vol. X pp. 44, 116-9.

(63) See Chitnis's Shahu p. 9; see too V. J. Vistára Vol. IX. p. 32; Gupte's Bhoale Bakhar p. 4; Letters, Memoranda &c. (K. I. Sangraha) p. 362; M. R. Chitnis's Life of Shahu the Younger pp. 101-2, where the different practice of the old Udayapur family in a certain matter of ceremonial is referred to. It will be remembered, that the Udayapur family were the oldest of the Rajput clans (See Grant Duff Vol. I p. 27) and that they were the only family which had not permitted a daughter of theirs to marry into the family of the great Mogul. (See Elphinstone's India by Cowell. pp. 480-506-7, and compare V. J. Vistára Vol. IX p. 29, Bernier Travels p. 126a, Dowson's Elliott Vol. VII pp. 195-6.

persuaded to join in those ceremonies. (64) They had also to strain a point, when as a preliminary to the installation, the thread ceremony essential for a Kshatriya, was performed on Sivaji at a time when he was "forty six or fifty years old" and had already had two sons—an irregularity, which also was, we are told, expressly assented to by all the Brahmans and Pandits. (65) How the Brahmans and Pandits worked their way to this decision, none of our authorities states. Further it is remarkable that none of those authorities anywhere mentions the performance of the thread ceremony upon any of the members of Sivaji's family, except the ones who were installed on the gadi; (66) and then that ceremony is mentioned only in connection with the installation ceremony. (67) In view of these facts, it may be permissible to doubt, whether the statements of both Krishnaji Anant Sabhasad (68) and Malbar Ramrao Chitnis, about Shahaji claiming to be a Rajput of the Sisode clan, or about Jayasing Mirza Raja of Jeypore acknowledging Sivaji as a Kshatriya and dining with

---

(64) V. J. Vistara Vol. XIII p. 202. See the history of the Chitnis family (K. P. I. S.) pp. 6,8 and Kayastha Prabhunchi Bakhar pp. 10-1. According to a writer in the Jnana Prakash newspaper of Poona, Gagabhatta used the argument from expediency to reconcile the people to what was being done. No authority is quoted for this version of the affair.

(65) See V. J. Vistara Vol. XIII p. 203.

(66) Rajaram's is mentioned by M. R. Chitnis V. J. Vistara Vol. XIII p. 248. (Sambhaji's thread ceremony appears to have taken place at a much earlier age than Sivaji's; apparently it was celebrated as a preliminary to his installation as Yuvaraja or heir-apparent).

(67) *e. g.* See Chitnis's Life of Rajaram II. p. 2, Life of Shahu p. 16.

(68) Sabhasad's Life pp. 28, 38. See V. J. Vistara Vol. IX p. 30; Vol. X pp. 44, 119; Vol. XIII p. 202, where Sivaji claims that other members of his family are reigning in Cutch and Nepal.

him before the installation, deserve to be entirely trusted. (69) That at a later time the Satara Rajas, (70) the Sindhias (71) and the Nagpur Bhonsles and Ghorpades and others claim to be Kshatriyas is a matter which after Sivaji's affair need excite no surprise. The explanation of it all is contained in a passage in K. A. Sabhasad's Life. He says that Gagabhata (72) was much pleased with the splendid reception given him by Sivaji ; and it was he suggested that while a Mussalman Padsha sat on the throne, and had the chhatra or umbrella indicative of sovereignty, (73) it was not proper that Sivaji, who had achieved what he had, should not adopt the formal ensigns of kingship. (74) And it was when this suggestion was accepted by Sivaji, and a formal Abhisheka determined on, that it became necessary to look into the origin of the family, and to promulgate that Sivaji was by birth a Kshatriya. Taking the whole evidence together, it looks

---

(69) See to Chitnis's Shahu pp. 9, 61 ; and Rajaram II p. 2 In Forbes's Oriental Memoirs we are told that the Marathas, "are accounted among the lower tribes of the Hindus " Vol. I p. 459 Vol. II p. 61 ; and compare Dowson's Elliott Vol. VIII p. 209.

(70) See Marathi Samrajya Bakhar p. 116 ; and the references already given; compare also Scott's Deccan Vol. I, p 32 ; Vol. II p. 4 Forrest's Selections p. 725.

(71) See Bhau Saheb's Bakhar p. 68.

(72) Chitragupta (p. 95) appears to say that Gagabhata had come of his own motion to see Sivaji. The other authorities point the other way. Gagabhata is said to have got a lakh of rupees as a present. See Chitnis family p. 6 (K. P. I. 3.)

(73) See Scott's Deccan Vol. I pp. 81, 93, 210, 288, 351, 370-6. The passage at p 351 should be noted; and compare Ovington's voyage to Surat p. 315.

(74) P. 30.

like a case of a more or less deliberate manipulation of facts and religious rules, in aid of a foregone conclusion adopted for a purely political purpose.(75)

Of similar manipulations, or of more open and direct violations of religious rules of greater or less importance, the documents before us afford sundry other examples. One of the earliest occurred in connection with the arrangements for the accommodation of Sambhaji, when Sivaji, after the flight from Delhi, was obliged, in order to disembarass himself of all impediments, to leave the young prince behind him. It appears, that some of Aurangzeb's people suspected that the boy was not, as pretended, a son of the Brahman Kashipant, in whose charge he was. And in order to silence their suspicions, Kashipant was obliged to accept their challenge, and to eat out of the same dish as Sambhaji. The Brahman made the offence as light as he could make it, by taking a quantity of parched and flattened rice(76) (Pohe) mixed with curds on a plantain leaf(77), for the purpose

(75) Sivaji is stated to have been rather keen about getting his Munja, or thread ceremony, performed. See Chitrageeta's Life p. 84. In the V. J. Vistara Vol. XIII p. 202, it is said that he consulted all and sundry upon that and kindred matters. It is also stated [ See Marathi Samrajya Bakhar p. 47, and account of Baba Sahib Gupte ( K. P. I. S. ) p. 8 ] that at one time Sivaji, after being taught the Gayatri mantra (Om Tat Savitur &c.) was going in for the regular Brahmanical life in preference to the Kshatriya ( Compare Sri Siva Kavya canto I at 50 ). But he subsequently allowed himself to be dissuaded from this by his officers. He then ordered that no mean employment was to be given to Brahmans, and he made several transfers accordingly. See also Grant Duff Vol. I p. 266; Forrest's Selections Vol. I p. 251.

(76) Compare Dowson's Elliott Vol. VII p. 285; See also *Ibid* Vol. I p. 9; V. J. Vistara Vol. X p. 200.

(77) Forbes, (Oriental Memoirs Vol. II p. 49) says that in his days a Brahman might not eat out of tinned copper vessels but had to use plantain leaves, &c.



of eating in the presence of Aurangzeb's myrmidons. These men made a favourable report to the Emperor, and Sambhaji was saved. But one of Sivaji's biographers, Chitragupta, says that the Brahman Kashipant secretly performed penance for what he had done.(78) It is to be remarked, that Sambhaji is stated by the same writer to have been dressed like a Brahman(79) with a Dhotar(80) tied round his waist, and also with the sacred thread, which he did not get as of right till about 1679, when Sivaji had his thread ceremony performed, with a view to instal him as Yavaraja or heir apparent.(81)

---

(78) P. 75. Other authorities say nothing about any penance. This sort of dining together appears to have been frequently copied in Maratha History. See *inter alia* M. R. Chitnis's *Life of Rajaram* II p. 2; *Asiatic Researches* Vol. III p. 137; *Grant Duff* Vol. II p. 39; *Malcolm's Central India* Vol. II pp. 131, 149; besides Chitragupta's *Life* p. 62; *Gaikavadi's Kaifiyat* p. 6; *Marathi Samrajya Bakhar* p. 32; *V. J. Vistara* Vol. IX pp. 31-2, 70; Vol. X p. 202; *Gupte's Bhonsle Bakhar* pp. 9, 20, 31. For two curious incidents connected with dining together, see *Holkar's Kaifiyat* p. 4; *Gupte's Bhonsle Bakhar* p. 31. A writer in the *Jnana Prakash* of Poona says that when Rajaram and his attendants were moving about the country, Aurangzeb's people once encountered them; and in order to avoid their suspicions, Marathas, Prabhus, and Brahmans all sat down together to dinner in one row with sicken clothes on. I have not seen this stated in any of the published Bakhars. "

(79) See *Chitragupta's Life* p. 77; *V. J. Vistara* Vol. X p. 185; *Scott's Deccan* Vol. II p. 16.

(80) *Peshva's Bakhar* pp. 105, 139, 143 shows that Brahmans used trousers without much scruple. Savai Madhavrav appears to have put them on on the occasion of his wedding. See also *Chitragupta's Sivaji* p. 5. *Forbes's Oriental Memoirs* Vol. II p. 12. In the *Bhonsle Bakhar* p. 48 a change in the established fashion of the head-dress is strongly objected to. It may be allowable, perhaps, to point out the parallel between this, and the curious conservatism of an English lawyer mentioned in that most interesting work—*Charles Sumner's Life and Letters* Vol. I p. 338.

(81) See *V. J. Vistara* Vol. X p. 185; *Marathi Samrajya Bakhar* p. 32; *Bhonsle Bakhar* p. 9; *Chitragupta's Sivaji* p. 77. At *Dowson's Elliott* Vol. VII p. 272, it is clearly implied that Sambha-

A somewhat similar occurrence had taken place before in Sivaji's family, on his father Shahaji's death, when in spite of the prayers of her son, Jijibai at first insisted on preparations being made for her sacrificing herself as a Sati. Chitragnpta's Life(82) shows, that the argument which ultimately prevailed with the lady was, that if she insisted on having her own way, Sivaji's life could not be relied on, and the empire established by him would at once cease to exist. . Other instances of the same character are not wanting in subsequent years—in the days of the Peshva power. The great violation of religious rules, which was involved in the Brahman Peshvas taking to the military profession, is become so familiar, and such a matter of course, so to say, that it hardly strikes one sufficiently as being a violation at all.(83) In the protest made by the eminent Ram Shastri against the Peshva Madhavrav's devoting too much time to religious observances,(84) their incompatibility with the duties of Kshatriyas, which the Peshvas had undertaken, is the strongest point in the argument; and the departure from the ordinances of the faith is assumed as an accomplished and irreversible fact, not a matter under discussion

---

ji had been married before going to Delhi. The contrary appears from V. J. Vistara Vol. X p. 203; Marathi Samrajya Bakhar p. 117; see also V. J. Vistara Vol. XIII p. 242.

(82) See P. 85. Compare Sabhasad's Life p. 55. See also Holkar's Kaifiyat p. 67, and Bernier p. 308.

(83) For what a Brahman of our own day says about it, see V. J. Vistara Vol. XXI p. 284; also Sri Siva Kavya I pp. 112-5, 121; II pp. 49, 117. Compare Macaulay's Central India Vol. I, p. 77; Forbes's Oriental Memoirs Vol. II p. 209; Forbes p. 728. From Letters, Memoranda &c. (K. I. S.) p. 9 we learn, that the Peshvas had resorted to special religious ceremonies for obtaining sovereignty.

(84) Forbes (Oriental Memoirs Vol I p. 472) speaks of Madhavrav as "possessed of a mind unfettered by the restraints and superstitious tenets of the Hindus."

at all.(85) Another story, pointing the same way, is told of the same eminent Peshva—Madhavrav. When he was arranging for his expedition against Hyder Ali, he sent a summons in the usual way(86) to the Bhonsle Chief of Nagpur to come over to join the Maratha army. The Bhonsle's agent at Poona went to consult] the Ex-minister, Sakharam Bapu, as to what should be done. The latter was afraid to give his counsel openly, as the Peshva's Karkun was present. But he managed to convey his advice to the Bhonsle's agent, without the Karkun understanding the point. Sakharam Bapu suggested to one of two persons who were sitting near him playing chess, that as the pawns(87) of his opponent had advanced in force, he should take back his king a square or two. The Bhonsle's agent, taking the hint, at once wrote off to his master to advise that he should not come to Poona in pursuance of the Peshva's summons, but should go back the one or two stages he had advanced from Nagpur. This was done accordingly, and Madhavrav, who had a great reputation for obtaining news of every thing that was going on in which he was interested, (88) heard of the Bhonsle's return to his capital, and also of Sakharam Bapu's advice which led to it—though the

---

(85) Grant Duff Vol. II. p. 209.

(86) This formed the subject of special stipulations between the Peshvas and Bhonsles. See Bhonsle Letters &c. (K. I. S.), pp 23, 64, 65, 70, 114, and compare Chitnis's Rajaram p. 23, Peshva's Bakhar p 91.

(87) Pawns in Marathi are called Pyadas which also means "soldiers."

(88) Nana Fadanavis is believed to have adopted and carried out Madhavrav's system of obtaining news from everywhere. See Grant Duff Vol. II p. 229. It is one of the points specially noticed in Gopikabai's letter to Savni Madhavrav; see Letters, Memoranda &c. (K. I. S.) p. 459. And as to Nana compare Peshva's Bakhar pp. 146-8 *inter alia*.

latter was perceived only by him under the facts he learnt from the cross-examination of the Karkun. Madhavrav was a man of very strong will; he at once sent for the Bhonsle's agent, and told him of his master's return to Nagpur on the advice of Sakharam Bapu, and added, "If your master is in Poona within fifteen days, well and good: if not I will pay no heed to the fact of your being a Brahman,(89) but will smash your head with a tent-peg(90)!"

The matter, may, perhaps, be said to be carried a step further, when a Brahman Karkun, writing of the end of the Brahman Parashuram Bhau Patvardhan's life, writes as follows(91): "The end of the deceased was excellent. For he served the Peshvas, performing a Kshatriya's duties to the very last!"(92) But even if we pass from the cases of these secularised Brahmans (93) as they may be called, we find in the instance of the priests of Kayagaum, and perhaps I may add

---

(89) See Peshva's Bakhār p. 94. For a more ferocious story, about Razhoba Dada, see Peshva's Bakhār p. 81-2. The *Juana Prakash* newspaper of Poona recently published another story with a similar moral. It appears that a Brahman employé of the Peshvas, in the Military department, accidentally discharged a gun and killed another Brahman. The former was thereupon excommunicated for Brahmanicide. But Ram Shastri, having regard to the fact of the death being accidental, publicly dined in company with the excommunicated Brahman; and when asked for an explanation as to the authority for his proceeding, replied that it had the same authority as there was for associating with the Peshvas, who, though Brahmans themselves, were answerable for many more heinous homicides!

(90) As to killing with a tent-peg, see Chitnis's *Rajaram* p. 72; *Marathi Samrajya Bakhār* p. 100; *Peshva Sakavali* p. 30; *Holkar's Kaiyiyat* p. 79.

(91) *Letters, Memoranda &c.* (K. I. S.) p. 501.

(92) This is nearly all reproduced in the *Life of Bhau* by Nigulkar recently published n. 123. Compare also *Panipat Bakhār* p. 42; and *Bhau Sahab's Kaiyiyat* p. 24.

(93) As to a Shastri transmogrified into a soldier, see Chitnis's *Rajaram* p. 104.

of the Svami of Dhavadasi, that these men, while still living as religious Brahmans, appear to have devoted themselves to worldly, that is, political, pursuits. About the latter I only know from oral information, the recently published Bakhar, and the note in Grant Duff's history (94). The original correspondence alluded to, I have not seen. But with regard to the former, the published letters show that they lent money at interest(95) to the Peshvas, were consulted by them about men and things connected with the State, and in fact took an active personal, if occasional, share in public affairs.(96)

Another point of the same sort may be noted, as being a somewhat remarkable one. Among the papers recently published is a letter addressed to the Peshva Savai Madhavraj, by his grand-mother Gopikabai, in reply to a request by the former for advice as to how he should conduct himself. One of the directions given to her grand-son by this old lady, the widow of Balaji Bajiraj, was that he should cut short his Sandhya-worship, and that while the household priest performed the general daily worship of the household gods, he should only offer them the leaves of the Tulasi plant. Such a direction, given by a woman, and to a young boy who was only just learning to read write and cipher,

(94) Grant Duff Vol. I p. 523 n.

(95) A वेदनासम्पन्न gentleman is mentioned at Letters, memoranda &c. (K. I. S.) p. 395 as engaging in financial transactions.

(96) See Letters, Memoranda &c. (K. I. Sangrha) p. 2 *et seq.* In this connection the metamorphosis of Gosavs into soldiers may also be noted. See Grant Duff Vol. III. pp. 33, 338. and *inter alia* Bhau Sahib's Kaifiyat p. 23; Bhau-Sahib's Bakhar p. 53 and Holkar's Kaifiyat p. 53; Dowson's Elliott Vol. VII. p. 294; Malcolm's Central India Vol. II. p. 168; Forbes's Oriental Memoirs Vol. II. p. 9. See also as to Bairagis, Holkar's Kaifiyat pp. 7, 8, 62; Peshva's Bakhar p. 230.

affords remarkable evidence of how the exigencies of the times were operating to relax the rigours of the old religious observances even in the family of the Peshvas. (97) Gopikabai was a very practical lady, of quick intelligence and strong will,(98) and must have seen the habitual course of life of several prominent men in the history of the Peshva regime.(99)

There are one or two curious points to note in connection with the relaxation of the rules regarding the taking of food. The first point I take at secondhand from a note by the Editor of the Life of Shahu(100) written by Malhar Ramrav Chitnis. The Pratinidhi, Parashuram Trimbak, having come under the displeasure of Shahu on account of his son's having gone over to the Kolhapur interest, was about to be put to death by Shahu's orders, when Khando Ballal Chitnis hastened to the spot and, interceding for the Pratinidhi, saved his life.(101) From that time forward, it is said that one prominent member of the family of Khando Chitnis was, for a long time,

---

(97) See Letters Memoranda &c (K. I. Sangrha) p. 458; V. J. Vistara Vol. v. 179 where also Gopikabai's letter is published; and compare also Peshva's Bakhar pp. 62-4; Marathi Samrajya Bakhar p. 93.

(98) See Grant Duff Vol. II. pp. 129, 168 and compare *inter alia* Bhan Saheb's Bakhar pp. 89-90; Peshva's Bakhar pp. 61, 64-5. Forrest pp. 250-1, and 677 shows what was thought of her by the English in those days. But they were prejudiced in favour of Raghoba Dada their ally, and therefore not altogether fair judges of his opponent Gopikabai. But see also Dawson's Elliott Vol. VIII. pp. 267, 287; Forbes's Oriental Memoirs Vol. I. p. 478.

(99) See Forrest's Selections Vol. I. p. 725.

(100) P. 26. I can refer to no original authority, but only from the Prabhu side of the question. See the history of the Chitnis family in K. P. I. S. p. 11 see also K. P. Bakhar (K. P. I. S.) p. 13 n.

(101) See Bhonsle Bakhar p. 17; Grant Duff Vol. I. p. 426.

always asked to the Srâddha or anniversary dinners of the Pratinidhi's family, in company with the Brahmans invited. Two similar departures from strict rule in regard to dinners are mentioned in the Bakhar of the battle of Kharda. After the victory, the Peshva was taken round by Nana Fadanavis to honour the various Sardars with a visit. Among others, they called on the two Sardars of the Sindhia—Jivba Dada and Lakhoba Nana. There the Peshva was invited to what is called a Faral, that is, a dinner about which there are fewer ceremonial difficulties than the ordinary preparations. The Peshva turned to Nana, saying "these people are Shenvis, (102) how can their request be granted?" Whereupon Nana said, "the preparations have been made by our Brahman cooks. What does it matter, if they are Shenvis? Jivba's wishes must not be balked. He has handled his sword well. Such difficulties with the Sardars must be overcome." Then the Peshva and the Brahmans who accompanied him sat down to the Faral—the Peshva taking something only for form's sake, and the rest taking the Faral in the usual way. From the narrative in the Bakhar, it seems clear, that all parties thought that something not in accordance with the prevailing rules was being done, and that the justification or excuse for its being done was found in the political exigencies of the occasion. From Jivba Dada's tents, the Peshva pro-

---

(102) P. 20. The Shenvis are called "fish-eating Brahmans" in Chitrakupta's *Life of Sivaji* p. 123 and K. A. Sabhasad's *Life* p. 57 (where there are certain paragraphs, pronounced by the Editor on good grounds to be interpolated, which are nevertheless of interest from a historical point of view). The objection of the Peshva mentioned above was based upon the prevailing custom, which must have originally arisen from the Shenvis being ordinarily a "fish-eating" caste, while other classes of Brahmans are not such. See also Fryer p. 190.

ceeded to those of Parashuram Bhau Patvardhan. (103) Here, too, the Peshva had an invitation to stay for dinner. There was, of course, no caste difficulty here, as both parties belonged to the same caste—division. But the Peshva said to Nana, "Parashuram Bhau is in mourning. (104) What should be done?" Again Nana was up to the occasion and ready with his practical advice. "Bhau's wishes," said Nana, "must not be balked on such an occasion, as this; some way out of the difficulty about the mourning shall be found." (105) Ultimately the Peshva consented, and he and all his party took their night meal at Parashuram Bhau's camp—Bhau himself sitting apart, and not in the same row with his guests, in consequence of his mourning. The writer of the Bakhar says, that on account of the Peshva's condescension, Bhau forgot his grief for the loss of his nephew, and told (106) the Peshva

---

(103) Kharda Bakhar-p. 20.

(104) Parashuram Bhau's nephew had been killed at the battle of Kharda, and for ten days after his death, his dwelling and all his family would be in a state of ceremonial impurity. See Fryer p. 101.

(105) This idea is worthy of note.

(106) P. 20 Jirva Dada also had expressed himself in terms of similar gratitude. The elder Madhavrav Peshva's dining with Janoji Bhoisle, as mentioned in the Lives of the Nagpur Chitnais (K. P. I. S.) p. 3 does not seem to be a matter of much religious or social significance. It appears from Mr. Forrest's Selections from Bombay State papers (Vol. I. p. 162) that the elder Mâdhavrav Peshva once invited Mr. Mostyn "to stay and sup with him," and that Mr. Mostyn did so. How the supper went off, and what were the details of the arrangements, one would have liked to know, but no information is forthcoming on that head, as far as I am aware. As to what Westerns think about Indian preparations, see Ovington's Voyage to Surat pp. 295-6, 397; Forbes's Oriental Memoirs Vol. II. p. 49; Tavernier's Travels Vol. I. p. 409.



that the latter's staying to dinner in the house of mourning was an ample reward to him for his labours in the field. (107)

On the next point of this sort to which I now proceed to draw attention, the evidence is not quite as clear as could be wished. Such as it is, however, I will now adduce it. One of the most splendid festivities celebrated during the days of the Peshva power was on the occasion of the marriage of Savai Madhavrav. The grand doings are described in much detail in the Peshva's Bakhar (108). And we have also a Memorandum

---

(107) In his recently published Life by Nigudkar, Parashuram Bhanu is stated to have been a very pious Hindu. His request to the Peshva, therefore, is remarkable, as well as Nana's counsel, and the Peshva's compliance.

(108) See pp. 135-44. The note of the Editor of the Peshva's Bakhar on this passage seems to me, I confess, hardly to deal fair measure to Mahadji Sindhi. It is true that Mahadji was in all likelihood not himself really a lover of such exhibitions (See Fort's Selections Vol. I. p. XXIX which is presumably based on Malcolm's Central India Vol. I. p. 125). And doubtless it is, therefore, not unfair to infer that he had an object in arranging for them on this occasion. But the elaborately sinister object attributed to him in the note under reference is scarcely the probable one. There is nothing, that I am aware of, in Mahadji's career or character to warrant the imputation, that he wanted to enfeeble the whole of the Deccan Marathas for his personal aggrandisement. What he probably did aim at was the establishment of an influence on the single individual, Savai Madhavrav more potent than that of Nana Fadanavis. And he probably sought to secure this by means of striking shows, which would naturally be supposed to be the best passport to such influence with one whom apparently all around him were then treating as a child. The Peshva's Bakhar, further, does not indicate that Nana on his part objected in the slightest degree to any of these shows, but rather the contrary. The idea that he must have done so may be correct, but there is no evidence whatever adduced to substantiate it. Such as it is, the evidence seems to me rather to point the other way, so far as the general taste of those days is concerned—though I am not aware of anything sufficiently specific about Nana himself in relation to this point. (See *inter alia* Peshva's Bakhar pp. 131, 167, 172, 175, 193; Bhanu Sahib's Bakhar pp. 92, 130; V. J. Vistara Vol. V. p. 200; *Ibid*

dated sake 1704 (A. D. 1782) containing a most elaborate series of directions as to each one of the innumerable elements making up the "pride pomp and circumstance" of a glorious marriage, including the perfumery, refreshments, amusements to be provided, the men to superintend them, and so forth. (109) Among other things, the Memorandum directs that Sardars, Siledars, Marathas, Mussalmans, Ali Bahadur (110) and others, should be taken after they are assembled together to the house of the bride's father for dinner and for Faral; and they should be invited to a Faral or dinner at the palace on the proper occasions. And again it is said, that the Nabob, Bhonsle, Holkar, and Siledars of high position, Sarkarkuns (*sic*), Marathas and Mussalmans, should be invited. And, after determining what is appropriate, they should be taken to the house of the bride's father and to the palace for dinner, and to see the dance. They should be invited, and provisions also should be sent to them. It is not clear from these directions how the various guests—Marathas, Mussulmans, &c.—were accommodated at the time of the dinners and farals, nor how they were served. And, therefore, one cannot be sure that they all sat down together and were served out of the same pots, though this

---

Vol. X. pp. 6, 7; Chitnis's *Sushu* p. 49; *Marathi Samrajya Bakhar* pp. 87, 102; *Peshva Sakavali* pp. 17, 90; Chitnis's *Rajaram* p. 50; *Asiatic Researches* Vol. III. p. 24; *Ovington's Voyage to Surat* p. 329. *et seq*; *Grant Duff* Vol. II. p. 159; *Dowson's Elliott* Vol. VIII. p. 280. For the marriage of Savai Madharav, celebrated without Mahadji having his finger in the pie, 50,000 Rs. were spent on cloth alone, and this was under Nana Fadanavis's management. See *Letters, Memoranda &c.* (K. I. Sangraha) p. 226. See also in connexion with this *Ibid.* pp. 273-74.

(109) *Letters, Memoranda &c.* (K. I. Sangraha) pp. 277, 292.

(110) The son of Samsher Bahadur, who was the son of the first Bajirav by Mastani.

does not seem altogether unlikely. (111) In any case, however, it seems clear that, Mussalmans as well as Marathas sat with to the grand marriage dinners at the palace and at the house of the bride's father, and in this elaborately detailed Memorandum, there is nothing said about their having any separate parts of the houses set apart for them other than those which were used for the Brahmans invited.

Passing now from this point about dinners, we come to the important point of marriage. And here, too, it appears that the Peshvas on their part initiated a change of custom which, however, failed to get itself established. I am not now referring to Bajirav's left-handed marriage with Mastani; but Balaji Bajirav, who was, of course, of the Chitpavan or Konkanastha section of the Brahman caste, married Radhabai, who belonged to a different section of that caste viz Desastha. (112) And it is said, though no written authority is forthcoming for the statement, that Balaji had also married a Karhada girl, in order to secure the ultimate complete amalgamation of three of the great sections of the Brahman community—viz Desasthas, Konkanasthas and Karhadas. The object, however, has not been attained, and it is still usual, to put it in

---

(111) See further Letters &c. (K. I. Sangraha) p. 278. In the Peshva's Bakhar p. 148, a separate dinner for Mussalman guests is mentioned.

(112) Letters, Memoranda &c. (K. I. Sangraha) p. 541, Peshva Sakāvali p. 18. I have recently had an opportunity, thanks to the kindness of Mr. V. V. Lele of the Poona Bar, of seeing a modern compilation from miscellaneous sources known as Pendse's Diary. There, as in the two authorities just adduced, only two marriages of Balaji Bajirav are mentioned, while reference is also made to Balaji's kept mistresses. There is room, therefore, for reasonable doubt about the statement regarding the Karhada marriage.

the mildest language, to look askance at intermarriages (113) amongst the several subdivisions.

It is curious to notice, that even in the days of Peshva rule, there had come into existence a number of Brahmans who were unable to help in the performance of ordinary religious ceremonies. In the Sketch, already once referred to, of the last days of Parashuram Phau Patwardhan, we read, that after the body had been collected for the cremation of the great warrior's corpse, and some Bhiksus, or priestly Brahmans, had been brought together from the village near the place of cremation, the Karkun, Naro Hari Karandikar, wished to burn the body with the proper mantras and ceremonies, but a good Brahman could not be secured for the occasion; the Joshis of the village were sheer dunces; and so the body had to be burnt with an unconsecrated fire (114).

A similar instance of ignorance, perhaps, however, more excusable than this, is recorded in connection with the death of the famous Svami of Dhavadasi, the Mahapurusha of

---

(113) They do take place, but on extremely rare occasions. The Jnana Prakash newspaper says, that even dining together was extremely unusual among these three divisions before the times of Bajirav.

(114) Letters, memoranda &c., (K. I. Sangraha) p. 300. The statement in Nigudkar's recently published Biography that Parashuram Bhau was burnt with the usual ceremonies (p. 125) is not consistent with the Sketch referred to, which expressly speaks of a Bhadagni. The story mentioned at Grant Duff Vol. III pp. 185-6 note, about the inhuman treatment of the corpse by the Maharaja of Kolhapur (which seems to have been merely reproduced by Capt. Robertson, in his Life of Nana Fadanavis p. 167, without any addition or modification, or apparently corroboration from original documents seen by himself) is not supported by the Sketch of Karandikar. The story offers a curious instance of how error arises from accepting secondhand reports not embodying direct evidence.

Bajirav I and others. We read in the Bakhar of Brahmendra Svami of Dhavadasi, that the attendant Brahmanas performed the ceremonies consequent on his death, with the Ritual book in their hands. Even with this aid, however, they appear to have blundered, and after they had declared in answer to a question from Shahu, that the whole of the ceremonial was finished, the Raja inquired whether their book did not contain any direction about the breaking of the Svami's skull with a conch-shell—which he had heard was the proper thing to do in the case of a Samnyasi. The Brahmans replied that there was a direction to that effect in their book, but that they had overlooked it through inadvertence, and they were thereupon taken up roundly by the Raja for their ignorance and carelessness. I have said before, that this was, perhaps, a case of more excusable ignorance than was betrayed by the Brahmans concerned in the death-ceremonies of Parashurain Bhan Patvardhan. These latter ceremonies are every-day ceremonies, which, one would suppose, ought to be familiarly known to all priestly Brahmans. Those in connection with the death of a Samnyasi, on the other hand, might well be unfamiliar, as being only of rare occurrence. Still the ignorance betrayed even on this latter occasion is remarkable, especially when one has regard to the place and the time where the event occurred. It cannot be, that the ignorance was due to there being no demand for that sort of learning in which the men were found deficient. That is a condition of things, of which some sort of indication is, perhaps, beginning to be visible in some parts of the country at the present day. But its existence in the old days to which these events carry us back is not to be assumed. (115) How-

---

(115) I do not think that much weight can be attached, from the point of view from which the above various incidents have been collect-

ever, whatever may be the true explanation, the facts themselves are worthy of note. (116).

In connection with these incidents relating to funeral ceremonies, may be noticed one which is stated to have occurred on the death of the uncle of the famous Bapu Gokhale viz. Dhondopant Gokhale. Dhondopant having

---

ed. to the attack made by one of the Patvarthan chiefs—namely Konher pant—on the Matha of the Santkarabharya Svami of Sankesvar, (as to this see V. J. Vistara Vol. XX. p. 118. I presume it is the same incident that is referred to by Forbes at Oriental Memoirs Vol. II. p. 134, though it is Parasuram Bhanu that is named there); nor to the plundering raid which seems to have once gone against the priests of Kayagaum [ see Letters, Memoranda &c. (K. I. Sangraha) p. 26; nor to that which went against Jayaram Svami's Vadgaum [ see Letters &c. (S. K. I. Sangraha) p. 188; nor to the people at large making use of English medicines ( see Forrest's Selections p. 540. Forb's Oriental Memoirs Vol. III. p. 431 and compare Bhone Letters &c. (K. I. Sangraha) p. 79; Hoikar's Kaifiyat p. 128 ] ; nor, perhaps, to the fact, mentioned by Tavernier, that some classes of people who would not touch one another under ordinary circumstances, did not scruple to do so in war ( see Tavernier Vol. I. pp. 245, 254, and compare Forb's Oriental Memoirs Vol. I. p. 231, where he complains of the wretched accommodation he and his party got on one occasion, though under the protection of Raghoba Dada's escort, in consequence of the Hindus' fear of contamination.) Still these facts are not altogether without interest in this connection. I have not seen any original Indian authority about the Sankesvar incident. There is a further reference to it, and explanation of it, at V. J. Vistara Vol. XXI. p. 285. And see too Malcolm's Central India Vol. I. pp. 148, 224.

(116) With the above instances of the ignorance of Bhikshuks, must be coupled the instances of the laxity of Pandits and Shastris betrayed on the occasion of Sivaji's thread ceremony (as stated in the authorities referred to in notes 59, 72, 75 supra and the remarks in the text to which they are attached) and on the occasion of the adoption of Chimnaji Appa by the widow of his nephew Sarai Madhavrav. That adoption was afterwards cancelled; Chimnaji Appa performed penance; and the Shastris who advised the adoption were banished. Robertson's Life of Nana Fadanavis p. 118, which is based probably on Grant Duff Vol. III p. 145. For original authorities see Chituis's Life of Shahu II p. 67, Letters, Memoranda &c. (K. I. Sangraha) p. 414; see, too, the recent Life of Nana Fadanavis by V. V. Kuare p. 203.

been killed by a free-booter, named Dhondi Vagh, in an action in which Bapu Gokhale also was injured and was unable to save his uncle, Bapu cremated the body at the scene of the disaster, and returned to Poona where he wished to perform the residue of the funeral ceremonies enjoined by the customs of the caste. Dhondopant's widow, however, it is said, would not hear of it. She is reported to have spoken very stingingly to Bapu on the occasion, and to have directed that none of the funeral ceremonies should be performed until after Bapu had taken vengeance upon Dhondi Vagh for the slaughter of Dhondopant. The ceremonies were accordingly held in abeyance. Bapu Gokhale did soon afterwards get an opportunity of encountering Dhondi Vagh. Dhondi was killed, (117) and his head was carried on a spear's point by Bapu, and shown to Lakshuibai, the widow of Dhondopant Gokhale. The lady was satisfied, and the countermanded ceremonies were then finished. (118)

(117) Wellington's Letters &c. by Gurwood p. 9.

(118) Cf. Gaikwad's Hakikat p. 11. The above incident I only know of from Aitihāsik Goshti (Historic anecdotes), one of the many interesting Marathi works, for which we are indebted to one who has departed from among us since this paper was read, and who was, indeed, a living repertory of interesting and varied information—the late Gopalrav Hari Deshmukh. I have seen no original authority for the story, and it is not mentioned in the recently published Life of Bapu Gokhale, where it is simply stated that Bapu determined, of his own motion, not to put on his turban, until after he had wreaked vengeance on Dhondi; see Life p. 37. (With this compare Chitragupta's Sivaji p. 56, K. A. Sabhasad's Ditto p. 35). There were some comments in the first edition of that Life on Grant Duff's account of the destruction of Dhondi (pp. 98-99) which were not conspicuous for historic criticism. These are not repeated in the second edition, however, so nothing further need now be said about them, for other instances of woman's stern determination. See Bhau Saheb's Bikhari p. 14 Malcolm's Central India Vol. I. p. 107 Bernier p. 41, Hamilton's East Indies Vol. I. p. 136, also Dowson's Elliott Vol. VII. p. 231.

There is one incident in the Life of Parashuram Bhau Patvardhan, which is entitled to notice here, although I have not come across any reference to it in any original document accessible to me. The incident itself is pretty familiar to people in the Maratha country, but I take the account of it that is given in the biography of Parashuram Bhau recently published by Mr. B. D. Nigudkar. (119) It appears, then, that Parashuram Bhau's eldest daughter, Bayabai, was married into the family of the Joshis of Baramati. She was only about 7 or 8 years old at the time. And her husband died within about a fortnight after the marriage. She, therefore, became a child-widow according to the usual custom. Some time afterwards, Parasuram Bhau laid the whole of the case of the unlucky girl before the celebrated Ram Shastri, who has been already mentioned in this paper. His heart was touched; and he declared it as his opinion, that there was no objection to the little girl being remarried. Then, Parashuram Bhau sent up the case to Benares, and the opinion of all the Shastris there was obtained in favour of such remarriage. But after this stage was reached, Parashuram Bhau abandoned his intention of getting the girl remarried, because it was represented to him, that the remarriage of widows was against the custom which had existed for many years, and that it was not advisable for him to run the risk of offending his people by taking a departure from such a custom. The result was that the idea was abandoned. But the incident is, nevertheless, of much historic importance. That such a man as Parashuram Bhau Patvardhan, one of the most prominent men at

---

(119) pp. 131-2. This book is stated to have been written, after reference to some original unprinted papers; and it is also stated that some of these papers were subsequently examined by Rav Bahadur M. G. Ranade, for verifying Mr. Nigudkar's account.



the Court of the Peshvas, a man who, as his biographer shows, was at heart a full believer in the religion of his ancestors, (120) should seriously contemplate such a departure from established rules, (121) is a thing sufficiently remarkable, when we are considering the nature of the hold which those established rules had upon the conscience of that generation. That so venerable and eminent an authority as Ram Shastri, a man widely respected then and since throughout the Maratha Empire, should have lent his countenance to that contemplated departure from established usage, makes the incident still more remarkable. And it is most remarkable of all, that the Shastris of Benares should have afforded the support of their unanimous opinion to such a departure. On the other hand, it illustrates the condition of Hindu Society in reference to such a practical departure, that even with the powerful support (122) now indicated, and with the proofs in his hand that the current notions rested on no substantial basis, a man like Parashuram Bhau Patvardhan should, nevertheless, have found himself unable, owing to his surroundings, to take the step to which the kindly impulses of his own heart prompted him.

One other incident of this same class I must here notice, though here again I have not been able to obtain any information about it from any of our own original documents. It relates

---

(120) *Ibid* pp. 132-4; *Comp. Letters &c.* (K. I. Sangraha) p. 501.

(121) We learn from that most valuable treasurehouse of information on the condition of India about 1000 or 1200 years ago, viz: Buddhist Records of the Western world, that in the days of Hiuen Tshang widow-marriage was not customary among Hindus (See Vol. I. p. 82).

(122) A writer in the *Juana Prakash* newspaper of Poona asserts that Ramshastri had died before the Benares opinion was received; and that the consequent loss of his support prevented Parashuram Bhau from carrying out his original intention.

to a matter about which many members of the Hindu community throughout India may be said to be in some degree exercised at the present day. The only information I have about it is contained in the famous Oriental Memoirs of Forbes ( 123 )—who was in Western India in 1766 and for several years subsequently. Forbes relates, that “ two Brahmans, whom he (*i. e.*, Raghoba Dada) sent as ambassadors to England, were, on their return to Hindusthan, compelled to pass through the sacred yoni, or female lingam, made of the finest gold. After performing this ordeal, ( 124 ) and making valuable presents to the Brahmanas, they were restored to the privileges of their caste, which they had lost, by the impurities contracted in travelling through so many polluted countries.” It would thus appear, that in those good old days, when the country was to all intents and purposes still under the rule of Brahman Sovereigns, the sin of crossing the Kalapani was not considered quite inexpiable, and the doctrine

---

(123) See Forbes's Oriental Memoirs Vol. I p. 379. From a later part of the same interesting work, we learn, that Raghoba having gone from Surat to Cambay by sea, “ many religious Brahmans and strict professors among the high castes of Hindus, censured Raghoba for undertaking a voyage by sea, in which they alleged he not only deviated from the established laws and customs of his tribe, but thought he acted contrary to the divine injunction ” Forbes Vol. II p. 8. These “ religious Brahmans and strict professors,” would, therefore, have condemned all their brethren, who for many years past have been voyaging up and down the Indian Coasts, from Ceylon to Karachi. Their condemnation was not confined, as that of their brethren of the present day most illogically and baselessly is practically confined, to a voyage to Europe. Raghoba traveled by sea more than once (See Narayanray Peshwa's Bakhar p. 13); and Sivaji went by sea to Bednore. See V. J. Vistara Vol. IX. p. 132.

(124) A writer in the V. J. Vistara Vol. XI. p. 235 asserts it to be a well-known fact that Raghoba's emissary Aba Kale was re-admitted to caste without penance. As usual no voucher for this well-known fact is adduced. It is not a fact at all, according to Forbes's contemporary account.

now propounded—that a twiceborn person, who goes out on a sea-voyage, cannot be admitted to the “privileges of his caste,” even after a penance—was not the accepted doctrine of the people, and had not the sanction of the then reigning Peshva

As I have brought together so many instances in which the rigours of existing rules appear to have been deliberately relaxed to a greater or less extent, (125) it is right also to point out one or two instances which, in some respects, may be said to present a different appearance to the view. Thus there can be no doubt that the documents before us show many instances of very early marriages in the Peshva family. (126) Balaji Bajirav, for instance, was married when he was 9 years old; Visvasrav when he was 8; the elder Madhavrav 9; Narayanrav 10; Savai Madhavrav a little over 8. And this was not merely the practice in the Peshva's family. (127) We find from a brief autobiographical sketch of Nana Fadanavis, that he was married when he was only 10 years old. (128) Again we find a record of more than one remarriage immediately after the death of a first wife. (129) As to widows, there

(125) Compare also, generally, Chitnis's *Life of Rajaram I.* pp. 58,86; Grant Duff Vol. I, pp. 322,373n.

(126) See *inter alia* Peshva Sakavali pp. 5, 10, 14, 22, 33.

(127) See V. J. Vistara Vol. IX, pp. 41, 51; Chitnis's *Rajaram* pp. 44 52; Ramdas Charitra pp. 1, 2; Marathi Samrajya Bakhar p. 126 for some other cases. And see, generally, Hamilton's *East Indies* Vol. I. p. 158; Ovington's *Voyage* pp. 321-4; Fryer p. 33; Forbes's *Oriental Memoirs* Vol. I. p. 73.

(128) *Letters, Memoranda &c.* (K. I. Sangraha) p. 34. It would seem that this Sketch was not seen by Capt. Robertson, Nana's biographer. The original of the Sketch is said to have been taken to England by Mr. Brook; see V. V. Khare's *Life* p. 4. From Mr. Nigudkar's *Life of Parashuram Bhau Patvardhan*, it appears that Parashuram Bhau was married when he was thirteen years old.

(129). See *inter alia* Peshva's Bakhar p. 172; Peshva Sakavali pp. 15,35; Chitnis's *Rajaram II.* pp. 3, 57; *Samrajya Bakhar* p 103; *Vinchurkar's Bakhar* p. 6.

is a curious entry in a chronological list of important events which occurred in the last few years of Peshva rule. (130) On the 12th of Sravan Suddha 1729, it is stated that widows were subjected to the shaving operation at the Nakazari in Poona. One would have liked to possess some further-information about this hideous performance. Again it appears that a dancing girl's dance was among the entertainments ordinarily provided at marriages; (131) and that not only a man's wives, but even his kept mistresses, (132) sacrificed themselves as Satis upon his death.

Looking at the facts and circumstances here collected as a whole, we may say that we get some slight glimpse of the social and religious condition of Maratha society during the days of the old regime. That many things which exist now

---

(130) Letters, Memoranda &c. (K. I. Sangraha) p. 523. See Orington pp. 343-4, and Tavernier Vol. II. p. 209 for some remarks on the custom as prevalent in their days.

(131) See *inter alia* Marathi Samrajya Bakhar pp. 49, 102-4; Peshva's Bakhar pp. 139 161; V. J. Vistara Vol. XIII. pp. 203-238. See also the Life of Ravji Apaji (K. P. I. S.) pp. 27; 63. and compare Forbes's Oriental Memoirs Vol. I. p. 81. This has precedents of quite respectable antiquity. See Kalidasa's Raghuvansa Canto III Stanza 19. Tavernier often mentions such entertainments; see *inter alia* Vol. I pp. 71, 87, 158, 259, 289, and compare Scott's Deccan Vol. I. pp. 29, 77; Forbes (Oriental Memoirs Vol. II. p. 53) mentions that loose women used to be in the Maratha Camps, though Siraji's rule was absolute against it. See Chitragupta's Life p. 36 (also p. 150) Fryer's Travels p. 176; see too, however, Chitragupta p. 162.

(132) See the Bhonsle Bakhar pp. 79, 119; Peshva Sakavali p. 10, compare Dowson's Elliott Vol. I p. 6.; and Bernier p. 310. Self-immolation by widows was controlled by the Mussulman rulers of India. See Orington p. 343; Tavernier Vol. I. p. 210; and see Lord William Bentinck (Rulers of India Series) p. 104. From the Bhonsle Letters &c. (K. I. Sangraha) p. 12 it appears that on one occasion the thirteen wives of a man all sacrificed themselves together as Satis.

also existed then, of course, goes without saying. (133) That the Brahmanical system existed then in greater strength than at present, is also what might naturally have been anticipated. But that there should have been so many actual departures from traditionary rule, that there should have been such schemes contemplated as some of those which have been here noticed, are facts which are not in harmony with the notion that prevails in some quarters, that laxity in these matters began with the introduction under British rule of Western ideas into this country. (134) To my mind, the various items above set out indicate a relaxation which had commenced long before that period. And when we have regard to the causes of the relaxation, as indicated in one or two of these instances, the conclusion which they suggest is, that the surrounding conditions, even in the days of the Maratha power, were too strong for the dominion of rules which had had their birth under

---

(133) In Mr. Forrest's Selections from Bombay state papers, one can see many instances of business being delayed by reason of weddings, and formal mournings, Holi celebrations, and unlucky constellations. See *inter alia* pp. 129, 130, 145, 146, 149, 150, 159, 175, 596. See also Forbes's Oriental Memoirs Vol. II. p. 22; Dowson's Elliott Vol. VII. p. 296: At Prof. Forrest's Bombay Selections Vol. I. p. 489, we find one example of the constellations being given the go-by when met by firmness on the part of the British Officer with whom business had to be transacted. See also Forbes's Oriental Memoirs Vol. III. p. 473 for another similar case. At Bhau Sahab's Kaijiyat p. 11, we have a recorded instance of how an enterprise commenced under favourable conditions of the constellations nevertheless resulted in failure.

(134) In the Kayastha Prabhunchi Bakhar p. 10, it is stated that the ordinary conduct of all castes was spiritually unclean under Muhammadan rule. Brahmans did not observe the rules about what to eat and what not. See also the opinions of the Benares Pundits, at pp. 17-8. See further Kayastha Prabhunchya Itihaachiin Sadhanen (Gramanya) P. 13; V. J. Vistara Vol. IX. pp. 31-3; Chitrugupta's Sivaji pp. 97, 137; Sri Siva Kavya Part 1, pp. 51-2, 107, and compare N. Macleods Peeps at the Far East p. 266 for some remarks by an outsider on this topic.

quite other and different conditions. Originally, I suppose, the incompatibility manifested itself only in certain special instances. But once the solvent, so to say, is applied in that way at one point, similar results sometimes follow even at other points, though the conditions are not equally directly favourable.

It will have been noticed that some of the instances above given, of departure from the old rules of conduct, are instances of deliberate departure, consciously made in view of the existing conditions, while others cannot be so clearly traced to a conscious initiative, but seem to form part of what I have called a general relaxation of the rigours of traditionary bonds. In both respects, I am disposed to think, further progress, upto a certain point, would have been achieved, and achieved with comparative ease, if the sceptre of Maharashtra had not passed away from the hands of the Peshvas. Under indigenous rulers, whose fundamental rules of Government have been illustrated above, such progress would have come directly, and perhaps also indirectly, with less friction, (135) than under a foreign power like the British, governed by the principles which it has laid down for itself, although, no doubt, the silent force of education in Western science and art, in Western history and literature, which the British have brought to bear, must necessarily have been entirely absent under indigenous rule (136.)

The late Sir Sumner Maine pointed out many years ago, that the operations of British Courts of Justice had resulted

---

(135) Compare the remarks, of somewhat similar purport, in Sir H. S. Maine's *Village Communities* (3rd Ed.) pp. 46-7.

(136). This would have been absent in both its aspects as indicated by Sir, H. S. Maine in his *Village Communities* p. 273 and also pp. 270 and 288.

in the arrest of the further development of Hindu Law. (137) It may with truth be said, that the passive influence of British administration generally, has had a somewhat similar effect on the general social development of the Hindus. It is not easy as yet to analyse fully the causes which have so far led or are leading to such a result; nor would this be a proper place to institute such an analysis. But speaking broadly, it would appear, that the general effect of British administration has been to render feeble the various forces, which were, in old days, working from within the community itself as a community; (138) while on the other hand individualism has become, or is becoming, more and more the prevailing force. Nana Fadanavis, for instance, when the occasion arose, gave advice as to what was required to be done, even in defiance of what was supposed to be right according to existing traditions. And the Peshva acted on such advice, the Brahmanas about him followed the example, and nobody apparently raised any storm about it. It does not appear, that the way out of the difficulty which Nana said *would be found* after the act itself was done, (139) had even to be sought after. If it had

---

(137) See Village Communities pt. 45-7.

(138) In the Kayastha Prabhunchi Bakhar (K. P. I. S.) p. 9, we read that a dispute having occurred in these parts between the Brahmanas and the Kayastha Prabhus, the matter was referred to the Pandits of Benares, and on their decision in favour of the Kayasthas, all people in Western India commenced to act in accordance with that decision, notwithstanding all the previous dissensions. Some recent doings, however, of a different aspect also find their parallel in events of the days of Savai Madhavray. See Kayastha Prabhunchya Itihasachin Sadhanen (Gramanya) p. 7.

(139) See notes (103) and (104) *Supra*. Yet Nana himself, it must never be forgotten, was not a sceptic nor free-thinker. (See Letters, Memoranda &c. (K. I. Sangrah) pp. 34, 39 and V. V. Khare's Life p. 166 (where the Poet Moropant is quoted in proof

been necessary to seek after it, it would doubtless have been found—the community being still endowed with vitality as a community ; and it would, no doubt, have been a way of the same nature as is indicated by the various instances we have stated. The old rules would, by common, even of tacit, consent, have been gradually relaxed; and in process of time custom would have sanctioned everything. Such a process, I believe, is what might have been witnessed under Peshva, and even under what may be called, in the narrower sense, Maratha rule. But such a process hardly takes place at our present stage of progress, or at all events is incomparably more slow and tedious in its operation, wherever British influence is in other respects powerful. The late Mr. Krishna Shastri Chiplonkar, thirty years ago, having been supposed to have eaten fruit at the table of a European friend ( 140 ) was hauled over the coals in a community where he was a leader of thought. A similar thing has occurred since with similar results. It has been said that the first event retarded progress, and whether that is true or not, and whether there has been progress since then or not, it is perfectly clear, that such progress as there has been is extremely slow. And on the other hand it has certainly disclosed the existence of persons, to whom the real gist of the movement under Peshva rule is either unknown or unacceptable.

---

of his piety; see also Sri Siva Kavya XVI 27.) He was in truth, a thoroughly pious Hindu. The pious of the present day, on the other hand, are still digging into the depths of the Smritis &c. to disinter texts justifying a voyage to England, or saying with decrepit helplessness—the thing is forbidden, and there is an end of the matter as far as we are concerned.

(140) See the incident referred to in Dr. Norman Macleod's *Peeps at the Far East* P. 68n and P. 375.



I must not, however, permit myself to continue these reflexions any further. The main purpose of this paper is to piece together some features of the past, from the scanty and desultory materials available. This having been done, the lessons to be drawn from a study of those features must be allowed to remain over for consideration and discussion elsewhere. I will only, in conclusion, add one line of explanation. The incidents here collected have been drawn from the available records, without any attempt to discriminate between those records which are contemporaneous and those which are not such. It must, of course, be admitted, that many, even most, of these records are not really contemporaneous. But in dealing with such a theme as that to which this paper is devoted, it has not been thought necessary to take any account of that circumstance. In any case, these records are of value on the principle which Grote applied to the older Greek writings—"the curtain is the picture." And as most if not all the documents drawn upon belong apparently to the period of the ancient regime, their special evidentiary value, as regards to the special incidents for which they are relied on, has not appeared to me to be a subject necessary to be dealt with as part of the present inquiry. \*

---

\* This paper, which was read before the Deccan College Union on the 17th September last, has been kindly placed by the Hon'ble Mr. Justice K. T. Telang.

---

## NOTICE.

A desire has been expressed by several European and Native well-wishers of the Poona Sarvajanic Sabha that its proceedings should be published regularly in the form of a quarterly publication so as to be easily available for purposes of reference. The Managing Committee of the Sabha have accordingly resolved to try the experiment of such a periodical publication of the proceedings of the Sabha. Besides publishing the proceedings, it is proposed to take advantage of such a publication to insert independent communications, reviewing and discussing the more important political questions of the day. There are many topics upon which public opinion has to be created and formed before any formal action can be taken in respect of them by the Sabha. Such topics will find a fitting place in the independent section of the proposed Quarterly Journal.

The services of a competent Editor have been secured and contributions have been promised by many writers of established reputation.

The Journal will consist of about 48 pages royal octavo to be priced at four rupees per annum to be paid in advance or one rupee and a half for each separate number, besides postage charges, and it will be published in the months of July, October, January and April.

As the Sabha has undertaken this work at considerable risk and expense and as the publication will supply a long-felt want the Managing Committee of the Sabha trust that the public and the Princes and Chiefs in India will give their most cordial support to the scheme.

Names of intending subscribers can be registered at the office of the Sarvajanic Sabha.

All communications should be addressed to the undersigned.

S. H. SATHE.

*Hon. Secretary, Poona Sarvajanic Sabha.*

THE  
QUARTERLY JOURNAL

POONA SARVAJANIK SABHA.

VOL. XV.]

JANUARY 1923.

[NO. 3.]

UNDER THE AEGID OF THE MANAGING COMMITTEE.

POONA.

POONA.

PRINTED AT THE "DINESHVARAN" PRESS.

## ACKNOWLEDGMENT.

*October 1892.*

Receipt Nos.		Rs. As.
58	R. B. Ganesh K. Apte ... ..	4-4
		<hr style="width: 100px; margin-left: auto; margin-right: 0;"/> 4-4
<i>November 1892.</i>		
59	R. S. Krishnaji B. Fatak... ..	4-0
60	Secretary N. G. Library, Satara ... ..	4-4
61	K. B. Kersetji Rastamji ... ..	4-4
		<hr style="width: 100px; margin-left: auto; margin-right: 0;"/> 12-8
<i>December 1892.</i>		
62	R. B. Chintamanrao N. Bhat ... ..	4-0
63	R. S. Naro B. Devdhar ... ..	4-0
64	Mr. Ramchandra K. Limaye ... ..	4-0
65	R. B. Gopalrao V. Bhanap ... ..	20-0
66	R. B. Jagannath Sadashiv ... ..	4-4
67	Sorabji Shapurji Bengali Esq. ... ..	8-8
68	Kasmo Polition Club Madras ... ..	8-8
69	R. B. Ganapatram Gowrishanker ... ..	8-8
70	R. S. A. S. Nagavker ... ..	4-4
71	R. S. Shripatrao A. Chatre ... ..	10-0
72	Hon'ble Becherdas Viharidas ... ..	6-6
73	R. S. Dinkarrao N. Sidhaye ... ..	8-0
74	Diwan Bahadoor S. Subramani Aier ... ..	12-12
75	R. S. Kashinath B. Pendse ... ..	4-0
76	{ S. Katewar G. L. Long Institute Rajkote } ... ..	4-4
	{ R. B. Gopalji Sarbhai Desai } ... ..	4-4
77	R. S. Harischandra Sadashiv ... ..	8-8
78	S. Guzrath V. S. Ahmedabad ... ..	8-8
79	S. Literary Union Mysore ... ..	4-4
80	R. B. Nana Moroji ... ..	8-8
81	R. S. Pandit Suroop Narayen ... ..	8-8
82	S. N. G. L. Sangli ... ..	4-4
83	S. N. G. L. Akola ... ..	8-0
84	R. S. Khasgi Karbhari Kolhapoor... ..	4-4
85	R. S. Goyind Anant Gokhale ... ..	8-8
86	Framji Kawasji Institute... ..	8-8
87	R. S. Dadoba Sakharam ... ..	17-0
88	S. N. G. Library Kolhapoor ... ..	4-4

## CONTENTS

---

### Proceedings of the Sabha —

- I. A representation to the Registrar of the Bombay High Court regarding the Subordinate Judges and Pleaders Examination in the Bombay Presidency.
- II. A representation on the Report of the Deccan Agriculturists' Relief Act Commission.
- III. Mr. Digby C. I. E. in Poona.

### Independent Section :—

- I. A Note on Education in Baroda.
- II. The Net out-come of the Public Service Commission No. I

# THE POONA SARVAJANIK SABHA.

Established for representing the wants and wishes of the inhabitants of the Deccan, being appointed on a popular elective system under rules framed for the purpose.

WALEKAR'S WADA, DANE ALI.  
LIST OF OFFICERS.

## President

H. H. Shrinivas Rao Parashram Pandit alias Rao Saheb  
Pant Pratinidhi, Chief of Oundha.

## Vice-Presidents.

H. H. Dhundiraj Chintaman alias Tatyasaheb Patwardhan, Chief of Sangli.	H. H. Gannpatrao Harihar alias, Bapu Saheb Patwardhan, younger Chief of Kurundwad.
H. H. Mudhojirao Naik Nimbalkar, Chief of Falton.	H. H. Hariharrao Vinayak alias Daji Saheb Patwardhan, Chief of Kurundwad.
H. H. Ramachandrarao Gopal alias Appasaheb Patwardhan, Chief of Jamkhindi.	H. H. Toolajee Raje Bhosle Chief of Akalkote.

## MANAGING COMMITTEE FOR 1892-93.

*Chairman*—RAO BAHADUR VISHNU MORESHWAR BHIDE.

### *Members of the Managing Committee.*

R. B. Ganesh Govind Gokhale.	Waman Vishnu Lale Esqr.
R. B. Narayan Bhui Dandekar.	Mahomed Sidik Esqr.
R. S. Chintamanrao V. Natu.	Dorabjee Dadabhoy Butee Esqr.
R. S. Balwantrao Bapuji Phadke.	Gangaram Bhanu Mhaske Esqr.
R. S. Madhavrao S. Vaidya.	Rajanna Lingoo Esqr.
R. S. Naro Bhaskar Dewdhar.	Vishnudas Harikisondas Esqr.
R. S. Damodar J. Gokhale.	Sakharam R. Joshi Esqr.
R. S. Sadashiv R. Medatkar.	Bhaskar R. Sahasrabudhe Esqr.
R. B. Koopuswami Vijayarungam.	Wasudeo L. Athawale Esqr.
Professor Bal Gangadhar Tilak.	Nathamal Bharmal Esqr.
„ Gopal Krishna Gokhale.	R. S. Waman Prabhakar Bhave.
Govind M. Gadre Esqr.	Vinayak Narayan Apte Esqr.
R. S. Raghunath Daji Nangarkar.	Waman Balkrishna Ranade Esqr.
Krishnarao B. Mande Esqr.	R. S. Sitaram Hari Chiplonkar.
Govind Ballal Deval Esqr.	Shivram Hari Sathe Esquire.
Ramchandra M. Sahe Esqr.	Raghunath Narayan Pandit. Esqr.

## Treasurer.

R. S. CHINTAMANRAO VISHWANATH ALIAS BHAI SAHEB NATU.

## Auditor.

GOVIND MAHADEO GADRE ESQR.

NARAYENRAO CHINTAMAN FADTARE ESQR.

## Honorary Secretaries.

PROFESSOR GOPAL KRISHNA GOKHALE B. A.

SHIVRAM HARI SATHE ESQR.

# PROCEEDINGS OF THE SABHA

---

## A REPRESENTATION TO THE REGISTRAR OF THE BOMBAY HIGH COURT REGARDING THE SUB- ORDINATE JUDGES AND PLEADERS EXAMI- NATION IN THE BOMBAY PRESIDENCY.

---

No. 288 of 1892.

Sarvajanik Sabha Rooms,  
Poona, 19th November, 1892.

To

THE REGISTRAR OF THE BOMBAY HIGH COURT.,  
BOMBAY.

Sir,

We have been directed by the Managing Committee of the Poona Sarvajanik Sabha to request you to kindly place before the Honourable the Chief Justice and Judges of Her Majesty's High Court of Judicature Bombay, for their favourable consideration, the following proposals regarding the examination of candidates of the office of District Pleader in the Bombay Presidency.

The unusually low percentages of successful candidates in this examination during recent years have naturally created a feeling of uncertainty and dissatisfaction, not only in the minds of the Candidates but also in those of their parents and guardians, and it was chiefly at the request of the latter that the Committee of the Sabha was led to enquire into the subject. On a careful consideration of the whole question, the Managing Committee of the Sabha has come to the conclusion that, though the severity of results above referred to may, to some extent, be due to the incapacity or want of preparation on the part of the candidates, certain modifications in the rules for this examination are desirable and necessary, with a view, first, to suit the test of efficiency to the varying requirements of the profession, and secondly to minimise the evil caused by uncertain fluctuations in the standard of examination from year to year.

According to the rules in force at present, two law examinations are held every year, one for the office of District Pleader and one for that of Subordinate Judge and High Court Pleader. But though

the examinations are thus distinct, the books recommended, the number of papers set, and the minima of marks required for passing are the same for both. It appears to have been contemplated that the question papers for the examination of Subordinate Judges and High Court Pleaders should be more difficult than the corresponding papers for the District Pleader's examination. And yet the distinction is generally lost sight of and the papers set at the Pleader's examination are often as difficult as, if not more difficult than, those set at the Sub-Judge's and High Court Pleader's Examination. As a necessary consequence, the same standard of efficiency appears practically to be required of the candidates for both, and it will be readily admitted that this is a great hardship to those who appear for the lower examination.

The Committee of the Sabha believes that this is the main cause of the large percentage of failures in the Pleader's examination, and the ground of complaint can only be removed by so modifying the existing rules as to prescribe a definitely and distinctly lower standard for the District Pleader's examination than the one for the examination of High Court Pleaders and Subordinate Judges. The very fact that the two standards are designated as 'higher' and 'lower' shows that the High Court, in framing the present rules, intended that the two tests should differ in nature; and considering the quality of the work that a High Court Pleader or a Subordinate Judge is called upon to do and contrasting it with the work of a pleader in the District and Subordinate Courts it will at once be seen that the distinction is both just and reasonable. The Committee of the Sabha is fully aware that the standard of efficiency required of the candidates for the office of Subordinate Judge or High Court Pleader must always be kept sufficiently high and it does not, therefore, mean to make any proposals which would lower the present test of efficiency for that examination. But the standard of efficiency required for the office of District Pleader is admittedly a lower one and the following proposals are, therefore, made in order to make this distinction more real than it is at present.

- (1) The minimum number of marks necessary for passing in each paper should be the same as at present, viz. 30 per cent, but the minimum percentage of the aggregate number should be reduced from 60 per cent to 50 per cent. The present standard of 60 per cent of the total number of marks obtainable is too high for candidates for the District Pleader's examination and many of the failures would appear to be due to this high percentage required. It may here be mentioned the minimum percentage required in the University for examinations in the Faculty of Arts is only 33 per cent



of the total number of marks obtainable ; but in consideration of the fact that the Pleader's examination is for a profession, it would not be unreasonable to adopt a higher standard as has been done by the University itself in the case of its law examinations.

- (2) Instead of merely recommending books for the examination, definite text books should be prescribed for each subject, and the examiners should be directed to test the candidates in regard to these books only. The University always adopts this course in the case of its lower examinations and the Committee of the Sabha is of opinion that if the High Court follows this wholesome practice in the case of the District Pleader's examination, all cause for complaint on the score of fluctuations in the standard will be removed.

We have the honour to be,

Sir,

YOUR most obedient Servants,

(Sd.) G. K. GOKHALE.

(Sd.) S. H. SATHE.

Hon. Secretaries, Sarvajanic

Sabha, Poona.

---

A REPRESENTATION ON THE REPORT OF THE DECCAN  
AGRICULTURISTS' RELIEF ACT COMMISSION.

—◆◆◆—  
No. 6 of 1893.

SARVAJANIK SABHA ROOMS,

Poona, 17th January, 1893.

To

THE SECRETARY TO THE GOVERNMENT OF INDIA.

SIR,

We have been directed by the Managing Committee of the Poona Sarvajanik Sabha to submit the following observations for the consideration of Government on the Report of the Commission appointed to enquire into the working of the Deccan Agriculturists' Relief Act.

2. The Committee regret that the request contained in their letter to the local Government, No. 318 of 24th November 1891, to appoint two non-official members on the Commission, was not placed by that Government before the Government of India and that when the Honourable Mr. Nulkar could take no important part in the work of the Commission owing to serious illness, the Commission did not apply for the assistance of another Native colleague in their deliberations. If the Commission had been assisted by the advice and experience of the Honourable Mr. Nulkar, or in his absence, of any other competent non-official gentleman, acquainted with the habits of the people and able to take part in the work of the Commission, the Committee are of opinion that the Commission would have arrived at quite different conclusions on many of the points discussed in the Report. The Committee also notice with regret that officers having a personal acquaintance with the working of the Act were not more freely consulted by the Members of the Commission, the only assistance which the Commission appears to have had from such officers being secured, in a great measure, by examining them along with other witnesses.

3. After careful perusal of the able and lengthy report of the Commission, the Committee of the Poona Sarvajanik Sabha think that no facts have been elicited in the enquiry which, in their opinion, would justify any change in the views they expressed in their letter No. 317 dated 30th September 1891 (copy of which is sent herewith), with regard to the conciliation, Village Munsiff and Village Registration systems, and the advisability of having a

Special officer to superwise the working of the Relief Act in the districts in which it is at present in operation. On the other hand there is much in the Report of the Commission which goes a great way to support the views held by the Committee on these important points and to which expression was given in the previous letter.

4. The Commission supports the estimate of Mr. Woodburn that the conciliation system saves each court on an average 50 contested and 175 uncontested cases, every year. The Commission have also found that the system places within the reach of a considerable body of persons a cheap mode of obtaining redress and gives rise to less ill-feeling between the parties than a regular suit, and that debtors are more ready to comply with the terms of these agreements than with the decrees of a court. The Commissioners are further unwilling to lose any assistance that the people can give in the administration of civil justice. And yet the Commission has recorded that these undisputed advantages are more than balanced by the trouble and expense to parties in unsuccessful cases, though it does not appear that there was any complaint on this point made by the people examined as witnesses and the expense of getting a certificate of the Conciliator is but a trifle. Under these circumstances, it is certainly a matter of surprise that the Commission should recommend that Government should subject private settlements so arrived at with the consent of parties to ordinary stamp and revenue laws and also require parties to pay court-fee charges before they are permitted to execute the same. The Government has, of its own motion, liberally allowed partial or total exemptions from stamps and court-fee charges in agricultural suits with a view to give relief to the poor classes and this liberal policy has given assurance to the public that Government does not desire to make money by encouraging litigation, and that it would be only glad, if compromises increase. The Committee are, therefore, of opinion that it would be a most unfortunate reversal of the policy of Government, if, as recommended by the Commission, Government now seeks to discourage amicable settlements by laying fees thereon. The Committee are also surprised to find that any doubts should linger in the mind of the Commission in regard to possibility of finding out a sufficient number of men qualified to act as conciliators and induce parties to come to an amicable settlement, when the same Commission has expressed its opinion that there are qualified men available to act as Village Munsiffs to decide small disputes between parties where decisions are by law final. Agreements effected by Conciliators, on the other hand, are never filed, unless notices to show cause why they should not be filed, are served on parties thereto and are liable to be set aside for any good cause by Sub-Judges of their own accord or on the complaint of the parties. A careful perusal of Mr.

Evan's report regarding the working of village Munsiff Courts in the Madras Presidency would show that the settlement of claims by friendly advice is so popular there that many village Munsiffs settle disputes coming before them by informally acting as arbitrators.

5. The Committee are glad that the Commissioners have unanimously pronounced in favour of the Village-munsiff-system. In the opinion of the Sabha, the system is properly made a part of the D. A. R. Act, so that the Special Officer supervising the working of the other provisions of the Act can conveniently supervise the work of the village courts also.

6. The Committee are of opinion that there is ample evidence in the Report of the Commission to prove the good results of the village-registration system. The work of Village Registrars is supervised by an Inspector, the Mamledar and Assistant Collector, and the District Collector, and is controlled by the Registrar general. The trouble and the cost to parties for registering all documents at Taluka stations will undoubtedly be greater than under the existing village registration system, and the saving in the cost to Government by making the registration of simple bonds optional would not be much. False recitals of the consideration in the bonds might sometimes occur but the difficulty of subsequently proving the true consideration would show villagers the folly of joining the creditors in such mis-statement and put them on their guard to see that the consideration was truly set forth in the deeds passed by them. Moreover the possible danger of a false consideration being entered in deeds exists in any conceivable system of registration and cannot be prevented by the mere transfer of the work of the village Registrars to Taluka Registrars. The increase of work at the Taluka station again would leave no time to Taluka Registrars to give the executors of documents the salutary advice and warning which all village registrars are at present required to give and would cause great inconvenience to people coming from distant villages with witnesses to indentify them by making it necessary for them to remain at the Taluka station for several days before their documents could be registered. The Commission has taken no note of the fact, noticed by the Government of India, that this Presidency is far behind other provinces in respect of the popularity of registration. The appointment of Honorary Registrars from among respectable gentlemen and retired servants of Government will greatly reduce the cost of Registration. Until agriculturists become better able to read and write for themselves, the abolition of compulsory registration of simple bonds passed by them will, the Committee think, only open a fresh door to dishonest dealing. The alleged fall in the fees of village registrars is met by a corresponding increase in the fees of Taluka

Sub-Registrars and there is, therefore, not much appreciable loss in the total revenue from Registration in the four districts. The Committee are, therefore, of opinion that the village-registration system, which has checked the fabrication of false documents and which furnishes reliable statistics of the transactions of agriculturists, should not be dispensed with.

7. The Commission speaks with confidence in para (29) of its report of the great care and ability with which the power of revision is exercised by the Special Judge and remarks that the procedure of revision is simpler than that of appeals and that at first it possessed certain other advantages. It is, therefore, strange that the Commission should recommend the abolition of the office of the Special Judge without any enquiry as to whether the work done by the officer can be done without additional assistance by the District Judges in the four Districts. The Commission states in para (17) of its report that it is unable to say what the financial result of the changes recommended by it, if adopted, would be. The District Judges have not much time to supervise the work of Sub-Judges, although it is a part of their duty to do so, and the Committee apprehend that District Judges will not have time to attend to the work now done by the Special Judge and to supervise the work of conciliators and village munsiffs. Each of the four District Judges will require the assistance of an Assistant Judge or a first class Sub-Judge specially for that work as observed by the Committee in their former communication. Much of the good already achieved by the Act during the last 12 years would disappear, if no special officer is charged with the duty of supervising its working. Government, it is said, is in favour of extending the act to the Nasik district and in that case the services of the Special Officer would be very valuable.

8. The Committee of the Sabha are entirely unable to support the opinion of the Commission that section 525 of the Civil Procedure Code has been abused. Every dispute, after it is compromised, is likely to appear as having never been a dispute, and this fact has led the Commission to doubt the usefulness and value of arbitration awards and conciliation agreements. In India, it is the attempt of all true friends of the people, including conciliators, and arbitrators, to orally explain the reasons of their opinion to both the contending parties and, if necessary, to modify it in such a way that both the parties may accept it. This procedure preserves a good feeling between the parties and keeps them well disposed towards the Conciliator or Arbitrator. It also saves the arbitrator the trouble of writing a judgment and stating forth the reasons which have led him to arrive at it. Mr. Evan's Report clearly shows that village Munsiffs are in favour of compromises for the same reason. The Commission, therefore, is not correct in inferring that in the majority of cases, there

was no dispute between the parties merely because the parties consented to the terms of the award and that the transaction between the parties or the evidence was not reviewed. The Commission have found that out of 79 awards, in six cases only a creditor was making a fresh advance and in a few only, the award was in respect of the value of grain just borrowed. On the amount awarded in their awards by arbitrators, a charge in the form of general stamp revenue required for the bond of the same amount (not exceeding 5 Rupees) is levied. There is, therefore, no loss to Government whether the parties prefer to have their settlement of disputes embodied in an award or a fresh bond, so long as the amount thereof does not exceed Rs. 1000. The Commission was not called upon to review the working of the Arbitration system provided for in the Civil Procedure Code and its remarks, therefore, in reference to section 525 thereof may be regarded as irrelevant to the present inquiry. It is not safe, in the opinion of the Committee, to effect a change in the law affecting the whole of British India on account of some points casually noticed by the Commission in the case of only one District in the Deccan.

9. The Committee of the Sabha entirely concur with the Commission in holding that some causes, which prevent the Ryots from improving their condition, lie entirely outside the administration of justice by the civil courts. Only a few days ago, the Bombay Government noticed how rigorously forest laws are worked and villagers oppressed to make good trifling and sometimes imaginary losses. There is no doubt that, as found by the Commission, the Revenue officers are not generally disposed to suspend collection of assessment even in cases of unusual failure of crops. The Committee also agree with the Commission in holding that dates for the realization of the assessment should be so fixed that farmers may be able to pay it by selling part of their produce and not be compelled to borrow money on exorbitant terms for the purpose of paying it. There is no reason why agriculturists in Government villages should not be as well-off as those in Inam villages, provided Government shows the same leniency in collecting revenue from Khalsa villages as Inamdars show in Inam villages. It has been properly observed by one of the Commissioners that among the loans contracted by the Deccan Rayat, those resorted to for escaping the penalty of eviction for arrears of revenue are burdened with the most ruinous rates of interest and discount on sales of crops to the money-lender. The Committee, therefore, would respectfully request Government to adopt, at an early date, such measures as would adequately relieve agriculturists of the necessity of resorting to money-lenders for payment of Government assessment. The Committee have drawn the attention of Government on other occasions to the rigidity of the revenue system prevailing in this Presidency. It has also been pointed out before, by both the Deccan

Ryots' Commission and the Famine Commission. The Committee, therefore, trust that Government will be pleased to see its way at an early date to afford the necessary relief to the poor and indebted Ryots of the Deccan.

10. The changes suggested by the Commission in the provisions of the Deccan Agriculturists' relief Act, other than those noticed above, do not seem to be suggested on the strength of the evidence taken by the Commission, while on tour in the four Districts. The statements of witnesses examined by the Commission in Poona are not appended to the Report and the Committee of the Sabha are not, therefore, in a position to say how far the suggestions are in accord with the views of the public in this matter.

We have &c.

G. K. GOKHALE

S. H. SATHE

Hon. Secretaries, Sarvajanic Sabha, Poona.

---

MR. WILLIAM DIGBY C. I. E. IN POONA

---

In accordance with previous arrangements, Mr. Digby arrived here from Madras by the mid-night train on Wednesday last. A deputation of the Poona Sarvajanic Sabha, whose guest he was during his brief stay here, headed by the Chairman, Rao Bahadur V. M. Bhide, was at the station to receive him. Mr. Digby stayed in this city till 10 p. m. on Thursday, when he left for Bombay. During the stay, he paid visits to the New English School and the Fergusson College, the Female High School and the Ray Industrial Museum. At 6 p. m. a public meeting was held in honour of Mr. Digby, under the auspices of the Sarvajanic Sabha, in the great Arya-Bhushan Theatre. Never was the theatre so densely crowded and never was an audience more enthusiastic. Mr. Digby's arrival was the signal for a most enthusiastic outburst of cheering. On the motion of Rao Bahadur Bhide, Rao Bahadur Nilkantha Janardan Kirtane, Ex-Dewan of Dewas, was voted to the chair. The Chairman, after a few remarks, called upon Mr. G. K. Gokhale, Honorary Secretary of the Sabha, to express to the distinguished guest the thanks of the Sabha and the audience. Mr. Gokhale began by tendering to Mr. Digby the warmest and most sincere thanks of the

Sabha for his kindness in accepting the Sabha's invitation and honouring Poona with a brief visit. He assured Mr. Digby that it would have been a sore disappointment to the people of Poona, if he had not made it convenient to break his journey for a day there and thereby enable Poona to show the high respect which was entertained for him. Mr. Digby himself had once observed that whatever might be the faults of the Indian people, ingratitude was certainly not one of them. And that being so, how was it possible for them to remain insensible of the valuable services which Mr. Digby had rendered to India. Mr. Digby's services during the dire days of the famine of 1877 were so signal that they had wrung a recognition even from Government. On that occasion it was Mr. Digby's earnestness and his devotion and energy and ability with which he wielded his pen that forced the Government to adopt a more humane policy towards the sufferers, and his was the credit and his the glory of saving in the Madras Presidency thousands upon thousands of lives, and alleviating and mitigating the sufferings of many more. Mr. Digby's services in England had also been very substantial. His efforts to awaken and stimulate there interest about India were unceasing, and no better testimony on that point was required than the fact that Mr. Caine had dedicated his *picturesque India* to Mr. Digby, because it was Mr. Digby who first aroused in him feelings of interest and sympathy about India. The speaker did not wish to continue longer in that strain however congenial it might be to his own feelings, because the audience was there to hear Mr. Digby and not him. But he could not help saying a few words on two or three points, partly because there was very strong feeling in the country on those points, partly because the audience would very much like to hear Mr. Digby on them. All thoughtful observers perceived that a wave of retrogression was at present passing over the country in regard to the relations of the rulers and the ruled: that Government was daily regarding the public with increasing jealousy and distrust and that the people, in their turn, were returning a full measure of those feelings. In one sense, the country stood on the threshold of new and important privileges. But though Mr. Gokhale hoped, he said he did not expect that the rules which were about to be published in connection with the reformed and reconstituted Legislative Councils, would be conceived in any liberal spirit. He was aware that the venerable and illustrious statesman ' whose lead Mr. Digby followed in English politics and whose name awakened feelings of admiration and enthusiasm even in the bosoms of the Indian people, was at the helm of affairs and that he had delivered a very sympathetic speech in the matter when the question was being debated in Parliament. But, after all, with the Indian Government as it was at present constitu-



ted, it was only to be expected that the rules would take their real colour from the prevailing policy of the Government of India. And of that policy, there were already only too many mournful indications. Mr. Gokhale mentioned the recent orders of the Government of India on the Public Service question as an illustration of the policy of Government. He denounced the orders as entirely retrograde in their character and regarded them as simply an insult to the intelligence of the country. The number and quality of the posts recommended by the commission had been reduced and besides a large and perilous discretion was reserved by Government to itself which was almost certain to be abused. The speaker also condemned the present policy of Government in the matter of education as unsympathetic and short-sighted. Speaking of the Jury notification of the Government of Bengal, Mr. Gokhale said that a more wanton, a more mischievous, a more stupid and a more precipitately introduced measure he could not conceive. The speaker then ventured to say a word about the Currency question, although he confessed it was an extremely difficult question. Judging from appearances and from inspired paragraphs in Anglo-Indian papers, he was filled with alarm that the country was on the eve of a revolution in its monetary system. The introduction of a gold standard coupled with a declaration that silver was not a legal tender beyond a certain amount would obviously enhance, in an indirect manner, the taxation of the country and cripple many of the growing industries of India. So far as the agitation of the official class was concerned, the question was perfectly clear. Practically they wanted their salaries to be enhanced but the money for this purpose could only come from increased taxation. And he asked the Anglo-Indian Officials to remember what Mr. Dadabhai had recently said that they should be ashamed of trying to regain the luxuries they were losing by burdening still further the poverty stricken millions of India, many of whom could not get even enough food to eat. Mr. Gokhale thought that if ever India needed the exertions of English friends, they were required at the present juncture. In this connection he regretted that Mr. Digby had been unsuccessful in his last attempt to enter Parliament. For he was tried friend of the Indian people, and the past had taught them to reckon on his sympathy and earnest work. In conclusion Mr. Gokhale hoped that by Mr. Digby's exertions and the exertions of other English friends and by the exertions of the Indian people themselves, such a change would be brought about in the spirit of the Indian Government that the country would march steadily and onward in the path of progress to the lasting glory of India and England alike.

Mr. Digby began his reply by remarking that it was impossible for one in his position to speak without emotion of the great kindness which he had experienced at their hands. His present visit to India was a purely business visit and had no manner of connection with the political activities in which he and they were alike interested. It was his object to leave the country on the present occasion without mixing himself up in politics. But when he received a cordial invitation from the Poona Sarvajanic Sabha to hault in Poona for a day, such was his respect for the Sabha, that he could not refuse. And indeed it was well after all that he should have had that opportunity given him of assuring the people of India, that his sympathy with them and his zeal for their work was entirely unabated. ¶ Mr. Digby then paid a very high compliment to the Poona Savajanik Sabha which, he said, was rendering most valuable service to the country. What was unique in the Sabha's work was that it took care to embody its views on topics of great importance in articles which it published in its Quarterly Journal. In that respect on other association in India, could in any way be regarded as its equal and the volumes of the Sabha's Quarterly Journal constituted a useful and a most important record, which must be valued by every student of Indian Politics. ¶ Turning next to the questions which Mr. Gokhale had touched on in his speech and about which he ( Digby ) was requested to express his opinions, the speaker said that he never had greater reason to congratulate the educated classes of India on the importance which public opinion had attained in the country. He agreed that there were signs of political reaction everywhere and that Government seemed bent on undoing much of the good work done by Lord Ripon. It was true that as remarked by Mr. Gokhale, a wave of retrogression was passing over the land, but he would ask them to remember that a wave of retrogression was often the precursor of a wave of progress, just as there was always darkness before it was dawn. It was true that he himself did not expect the rules of the Government of India on the question of the Legislative Councils to be very liberal, but that must only encourage the people to strive harder and more strenuously for the rights and privileges of civilized nations, and he was sure, if unfortunately their fears came, to be realized, the country would not rest, especially after the work of the past eight Congresses, contented with a sham and a delusion. But after all, it was clear that the importance of public opinion in India had enormously increased during recent years, and at the present moment in spite of the reaction of which the people of India had good reason to complain, there were not in the country two persons more unhappy or trembling with greater fear in their places than Lord Lansdown and Sir Charles Elliot. And the more there was of such reaction, the surer the prospect of the present system of Government

being doomed. From that point of view it had to be admitted that Lord Lansdowne and Sir Charles Elliot were benefactors of the country and it was surely no light compliment to public opinion in India that owing to its pressure these two august personages were now reeling in their saddles and consulting the lists of the P. and O. Company's steamers to see by which steamer they might most conveniently leave India. With regard to the Public Service question Mr. Digby said that there were very few persons who had studied the literature on the subject so carefully as he. There was not a witness examined before the commission, whose evidence he had not analysed and he asserted that the people of this country were most shamefully and disgracefully treated in the matter; in fact, to use a remarkably frank expression of Lord Lytton, that *they had been cheated entirely*. The recommendation of the Commission against simultaneous examinations was absolutely against the weight of evidence recorded; and as an Englishman he felt deeply disgraced by it. As an Englishman he also felt disgraced by the fact that the most solemn promises made to the people, time after time, by their English rulers remained so entirely unfulfilled. Indeed when he thought of all that, he often asked himself the question—What were the Indians really made of that they quietly submit to the slicing away of their rights conferred upon them by Parliament, by the Government of India? If he were an Indian he assured them he would have made the India Office feel week after week that there was at least one man in the land, who was aggrieved by their faithlessness. Turning next to the subject of Education Mr. Digby said that he sympathised with them in their distress, though perhaps not quite as much as they might wish. It was perfectly clear why the Government was pursuing a reactionary policy in the matter of Education. The educated classes of India were the most severe and formidable critics of the abuses of authority in this country and it was natural that Government should not take any pleasure in manufacturing such opponents. But in that matter he was anxious not to pass a sweeping condemnation against all the Governments in India alike. He felt that the Government of Madras was the best of them all in that particular respect of educational expenditure, as the Government of Bombay was the worst of the whole lot. But in that matter he could ask the people, if they really valued education to depend less on Government and more on themselves, that the spirit of self-help and self-sacrifice of which the Fergusson College is a magnificent example could alone supply a correct and satisfactory solution of the whole problem. Speaking of the Currency question Mr. Digby shook his head and observed that though years ago he thought he understood the question very well, he felt at present how little he knew of it. But he agreed that any measure which would enhance the burdens of the already frightfully

overburdened masses of India would be disastrous in its consequences. Mr. Digby then spoke very earnestly about the need of keeping up strong agitation about Indian matters in England. It was because the English people did not know anything about them that they were so indifferent to misrule in India. He asked the audience to bear in mind that no true and lasting reform was ever possible without great difficulties and he assured them that their cause was advancing much faster than they imagined. Just as the spectators saw more of a game than the players themselves, so an impartial observer such as he had tried to be during the last few months, saw more clearly than those who were actually engaged in the fight, how the fight was going on. And in conclusion he assured the people of India that he would continue to work for them as he not merely liked or esteemed or respected them but loved them. After the conclusion of Mr. Digby's speech Mr. Gangarambhai Mhaske proposed a vote of thanks to the distinguished guest for his speech and also for his many services to the country; and Mr. K. G. Natu having seconded it the proposal was carried with acclamation. A vote of thanks to the Chairman terminated the proceeding.

Mr. Digby then drove to the Sarvajanic Sabha Rooms, where an evening party in his honour had been arranged by the Sabha. Most of the leading men of the city were present. The party dispersed after an hour's pleasant conversation and interchange of views. Mr. Digby left Poona for Bombay by the 10-30 p. m. train.

---

## A NOTE ON EDUCATION IN BARODA.



The more recent administration Reports of this State give a general synoptical view of the present state of education in Baroda, and furnish a brief comparative summary of the results attained within the last twenty years. It was only in 1871 that the first steps were taken in the direction of organizing a State system of popular education. The advance made since then has been rapid, continuous, and satisfactory, testifying at once to the energy and intelligent direction of the administration, and the expansive vitality of the educational policy pursued. In 1871, the first start was made with the establishment of one English School and a few Vernacular schools in the capital of the State. In 1875, the number of schools rose to 70, with about 7,000 scholars. In the next ten years, the number of schools and scholars showed a rapid and gratifying expansion, and in 1885, the State had 261 schools, with a roll of 27,000 pupils. In the same year, the educational curricula were arranged, the scope of operations of the State Department of Education was widened, and the entire system of education in the State attained a larger freedom, and a wider variety of growth. Such a development and success of the system along varied lines of progress, reached in the short space of 15 years, naturally encouraged efforts on a broader and more extended scale; and His Highness the Maharaja issued in 1885 a comprehensive Minute on the whole question, laying down the lines of a fresh forward advance, and the principles which should govern it. This minute marks a turning point in the educational history of the Baroda State, and may be fitly styled the educational Magna Charta of Baroda. The final aim of the efforts was clearly and authoritatively defined,

and practical action was ordered on the lines of the programme therein laid down. Universal primary education—reaching down to the very lowest strata of the population,—education beyond the primary stage to be in all its higher branches as varied as practicable, so as to suit the varying requirements of the several sections of the population—this was henceforth to be the ideal to be steadily kept in view, and by gradual and cautious steps to be worked up to by the State Department, and increased funds were placed at the disposal of that Department by the Administration. The next five years ( 1886-1891 ) have been years of unprecedented development and progress. The number of Schools has increased from 261 with 27,000 scholars, to 515 with over 54,000 pupils on the rolls,—the institutions including among them a high Technical Institute, Agricultural classes, Music schools, and special schools for Sanskrit and Urdu. The progress so made more than brings up the State into line with some of the most advanced provinces of British India in respect of educational activity, the proportion of children at school to the total population of school-going age stands as high as 27·2 p. c.,—a percentage as yet no where reached in British territory, not even in Bombay. This is a measure of educational advance, achieved in less than a quarter of a century, on which His Highness's Government may be most heartily congratulated. The success of the Baroda educational Department in dealing with the problem of the education of aboriginal and hill tribes is still more striking. No less than 4,261 children of these classes, says Mr. Hargovind Dwarkadas, Director of Vernacular Education, are at school—certainly a most satisfactory school-roll for an aboriginal population of ( by the recent census of 1891 ) 29,854 souls in the State. In the Northern Division of the Bombay Presidency, the total aboriginal and hill population is over 250,000, and yet we have in our schools no more than 5,612 children of these classes. This disparity of

results as between Baroda and the British territory is a remarkable illustration of what can be done in an enlightened Native State by an energetic Administration in the matter of the education of backward classes, in regard to which Mr. Lee Warner in his report of the Department of Public Instruction in Bombay for 1884-85, frankly admitted the "absolute failure of the Department." On the whole, the results achieved in the field of popular education in the Baroda State, by whatever test measured and judged, constitute a splendid record of successful work, of which any Administration may be proud, and which fully sustains the reputation of Baroda as being one of the most enlightened States in British India.

Splendid, however, as has been the work thus far done, much—very much—still remains to be accomplished; the field yet to be occupied is vast, and the most strenuous efforts of the State will be required to meet in an adequate manner the wants of the situation. Baroda, according to the late census, has a total population of 2,414,000 souls, or on the calculation of 1 in 6, there are 400,000 children of school-going age, of whom only 54,000 are at school, or roughly 1 in 7. Again, the total number of towns and villages in the State is 3,012, while the number of schools for boys and girls is only 465, *i. e.* not even one school for every six villages. In the Bombay Presidency including Sindh, the proportion of institutions to the total number of towns and villages is nearly one school for every three villages. In the advanced portions of the Presidency the proportion is much larger. If we take the four neighbouring British Districts of Ahmedabad, Kaira, Broach and Surat—which together have much the same area and population as the Baroda State,—8,543 sq. miles, and population 2,783,000,—we have 1,192 schools for a total of 2,630 towns and villages, or only a trifle less than one school for every two villages. Lastly the progress made as between the different Districts of the State appears

more unequal than seems desirable. Nawsari, for instance, with its total of 793 towns and villages, has only 70 schools, *i. e.* not even 1 for every 10.

These and such other facts at once arrest attention, and show that the educational policy of His Highness's Government, as laid down in the Minute of 1885, is not even yet within measurable distance of practical realization, and suggest the necessity for a careful inquiry into the working of the present educational arrangements with a view to ascertain on what lines further efforts should be directed to insure a more thorough carrying out of the intentions of His Highness's Government in this matter.

It is fully anticipated that any larger extension of the operations of the Educational Department on the lines suggested must involve a large permanent addition to the educational expenditure of the State, and it is satisfactory to have the assurance on the part of His Highness's Government that every reasonable increase of means and resources required for the work will be allowed to the State Department of Education. And the practical question for the consideration of the Education Commission now sitting at Baroda is, how to employ the resources of the State, so improved and augmented, as to attain the maximum of successful results with the minimum expenditure of funds and of educational power. The policy of the Administration, as conceived in the best spirit of higher statesmanship, is clearly enunciated, and the aim is two fold :—(1) to secure the widest possible spread of education among the masses, and (2) to attain as free and varied a development of educational activity as is under the circumstances practicable

Accordingly, the first question formulated for consideration by the Baroda Commission relates to the desirability of making education compulsory by law.

This is the first time in the educational history of India that such a question has been proposed for



practical consideration by a responsible Administration. In no province of British India—not even in the most advanced Presidency Town, has the subject as yet ever been regarded as coming within the scope of practical action; and Baroda may justly claim the honor of being the first to move in this direction. Nothing so forcibly illustrates the change that is fast coming over the life and thought of the country as the fact that problems, held to be difficult or impossible of solution in British territory, are being boldly taken up in our leading Native States, where the conditions of practical effort are necessarily freer and more spontaneous. Mysore is silently solving the problem of representative Government in India; Indore and several of the Southern Mahratha States have taken up the question of industrial reform; Rajputana, that of social reform; and now Baroda stands forth the first in the field to effectively grapple with the problem of popular education on the basis of a full and complete recognition of State obligations in the matter.

The object aimed at by His Highness's Government will of course meet with universal approval and sympathy. In the present circumstances of India, nothing is more necessary or desirable from every point of view than that education should be, as the first indispensable precedent condition of national progress, as widespread and general as possible among the masses. Universal education is the most powerful instrument for national emancipation and upheaval, and nothing can better give us in India the requisite *moral leverage* for the task. But, the method of legal compulsion suggested in the question under consideration, opens up a wide and contentious field of discussion. The subject will be approached from various stand-points, and views will most widely differ. There will, however, be a general consensus of opinion that the time is not yet come when such a wide departure from existing arrangements can

be with success or advantage attempted in Baroda. Public opinion in the country can scarcely be said to be ripe as yet for so radical and important a change.

No doubt, in most of the advanced countries of the world, education is general. In America, and in a few countries of Europe (e. g. Belgium) the system rests on the Voluntary basis. In England, France, Germany, Portugal, Spain, Denmark, Austria—Hungary, Sweden and Norway, Switzerland, Greece, and Italy, universal education is ensured by statutory compulsion, and parents are bound to send their children to school, and any neglect on their part is made punishable with fine, and in some cases, with imprisonment. Japan so far is the only Asiatic country that has adopted the compulsory method. It is not known under what circumstances a resort to the aid of the law in the matter of popular education has been found necessary in Japan. But in European countries, where the compulsory system obtains, it represents one of the most striking phases of a grand and varied movement of democratic life, which is the leading characteristic of European progress during this present century. Prussia was the first to lead the way in the early years of this century after the close of the War of Liberation: Greece followed in 1831, having regained her national independence in 1830 after centuries of foreign subjection. Portugal in 1844, and Spain in 1857, followed next, having succeeded, after years of toil, in organising their free institutions on a firm and sound basis. Denmark, Austria,—and Hungary, Sweden and Norway, Switzerland, and Italy copied the Prussian system with short intervals. England made education compulsory in 1870, and France in 1881.

Thus it will be seen that in all these countries, it is only within the last 50 or 60 years that any change has been found necessary from the voluntary to the compulsory system; and even so, the change comes upon the swelling tide of a great development of de-

mocratic life and sentiment, and as a necessary aid to its advance, in response to a clear and distinct popular demand, after 400 years and more of emancipatory struggle for intellectual and political freedom.

In India, such a disciplinary struggle has only just commenced, and democratic life is just having its humble beginning. And in this state of things, however, we may wish for a wide diffusion of education among the masses, the room for voluntary action is still vast, and until the limits of voluntary efforts are reached, and a clear necessity for compulsory methods arises, a recourse to compulsory legislation in the matter will be without adequate justification. But another, and practically a stronger, objection to resorting to compulsory legislation in regard to popular education is to be found in the fact that, neither in the Baroda State nor in British territory, is there as yet any adequate provision of educational facilities made. In the free countries of Europe and America, where education is general—whether on the compulsory or voluntary basis,—the establishment of a requisite number of schools is obligatory by statute. In Prussia, every town or commune must maintain a school supported by local rates. In Italy, every commune must have one lower grade school for boys, and one for girls. In Spain, there must be a primary school for every 500 inhabitants; and similar provision is made obligatory by law in the other countries of Europe. In England, by the Education Act of 1870, it is laid down that sufficient school accommodation must be provided in every District for all the children resident in such District between the ages of 5 and 13. A similar Act applies to Scotland also. Thus, in all these countries, there is not a commune, a village, or a parish, but is bound by law to provide sufficient school accommodation for its children. In India, nothing strikes an outside observer so much as the utter inadequacy of the existing supply of schools to meet the requirements of the country. In British India, Government, while fully recognizing its

duty in this regard, openly confesses its inability to find the requisite funds for the task, and though increasing efforts are being made in all directions to increase the number of educational institutions, still there are hundreds and thousands of villages and hamlets all over the country where schools do not exist. In all India, we have barely one school for every four villages, *i. e.* 75 villages in every 100 are without schools. In Bombay, 66 out of every 100 villages have no school. In the Northern Division of Bombay, about 60 per cent villages still remain unprovided for. In the Baroda State, out of a total of 3012 villages, only 465 have school accommodation, the remaining 2500 villages and more, or 84 villages in 100 have no schools within reach. Similarly, again, the low castes nowhere come in for any fair share of school accommodation for their children. In the Baroda State, the low caste Hindus, on the basis of their numbers being 10 p c. of the population, probably number more than 200,000, but there are, only 10 Antyaja schools with a total attendance of 800 children.

A proper provision of educational facilities within the reach of all classes and castes of the community must obviously be the first preliminary condition before compulsory legislation on the subject can be even thought of. And as long as this condition is not established, any proposal to make education obligatory by law can clearly have no justification in the facts of the case, or in the equities or necessities of the general position.

But, further, the question of compulsory legislation in the present conditions of Indian life and feeling is beset with insurmountable practical difficulties. For obvious reasons, such statutory compulsion in the case of girls cannot be enforced. Popular prejudices are still strong on the point, and though, of course, here and there, a community like the Parsees may be found to accept the principle of the system, the general sense of the people is clearly opposed to such legislation, and

any proposal embodying such legislation must be put aside for the present at least, as being outside the sphere of practical action. In the case of boys, no statutory compulsion seems needed. The question here is more one of available funds and resources than of sentiment and prejudice. There is no important class in Indian Society opposed to male education on principle. There is, no doubt, apathy; there is poverty and the indifference induced by it; but there is no hostile feeling on the subject. The desire for boys' instruction is about as universal as may be wished for, though of course existing in various degrees of strength. On this point, what the late Dr. Rajendralal Mitra remarked about Bengal in his evidence before the Indian Education Commission, applies to all India "The desire (*i. e.* for instruction) is common, and not limited to any particular class or classes. None hold aloof from it deliberately as noxious or not desirable, but many cannot afford it either from want of means, or from want of schools within an accessible distance. Many cannot spare their children to go to school, as they require their services for the conduct of their own business. To them a lad of 8 or 10 years is more profitably employed in tending cattle than in grinding the alphabet." As to the low castes, he continues, "Mehters, Chaudals and Bagdis are practically excluded from village schools, and they are nowhere so numerous as to be able to maintain schools for their own communities. Pods are as low in the scale of caste as Bagdis, but they are numerous, and in the southern parts of the 24 Parghanas, they maintain schools for their own education." The same is our experience in Bombay with regard to the low castes of this Presidency.

Thus, where the means are provided, most of the sections of the Indian community freely avail themselves of them to a greater or less extent. The Parsees in Bombay have all their children of school going age—both boys and girls—at school. So again have the

Brahmins all their boys at school. Lower down in the scale, the general attendance of the schools shows considerable variations; the low castes coming in for the smallest share of representation in the attendance returns. But all these variations are determined by the measure of school accommodation that is provided for the different classes and castes, and have no relation whatever to any feeling or prejudice or custom hostile to the progress of boys' education. Here the cry is for more and more schools. But the supply for want of funds is no-where responsive to the demand. Mr. Giles, Educational Inspector N. D. told the Indian Education Commission in 1882 that "if he had funds to open schools, he could add 60,000 scholars to the school attendance in a few months."

Such being the general facts of the case as regards the supply of schools, it is evidently premature to consider the advisability of making education obligatory by law. In the meanwhile, however, it may be strongly recommended for the consideration of the Baroda Education Commission that every effort should be made to aid the progress and spread of education in the State by increasing to the fullest limit of available resources educational facilities for all classes of the population. Every means should be employed, every agency utilized, and every form of local effort elicited and encouraged to the widest extent. In regard to this matter of education, it is of supreme importance to enlist the sympathies and active support of all classes in the cause. It will never do to place exclusive dependence upon the agency and activity of the State. The resources of the Government as a trustee for the general tax-payer must be, even in the widest view of the State obligations in the matter, very limited; and the aim of the Education Department should be to call to the assistance of its limited resources local effort and local co-operation, whether in regard to teaching power, or teaching methods, or educational

funds. This should be the aim of State action. *Centralization* in this, as in other spheres, only tends to weaken local springs of action, and blunt the local sense of responsibility, and thereby lessens the vital force of the general movement of advance. As to teaching power, private enterprise should be called out, wherever and in whatever direction such help is possible, and every agency—private, local, missionary, should be assigned a definite place in the general machinery of State education. The desire of His Highness's Government to have a school in every village of the State will be most widely appreciated. This will be the first necessary step in the right direction. The 2,500 and more villages of the Baroda State, which still lie outside the scope of the Education Department, should be brought within the reach of State educational effort as early as the resources of the State may permit, and in connection therewith it may be suggested that every such village school, aided or unaided, public or private, should have a separate class, housed under a separate roof for Antyaja children attached to it, and under the supervision of the village master. These Antyaja castes are found scattered in small numbers over the whole area, and are seldom numerous enough anywhere to justify the establishment of separate schools for them. It may also be remarked, while dilating on this point, that the teachers of these low caste classes should be found from among those castes as far as practicable, so as to ensure sympathetic treatment. Similarly, free play and development should be allowed to elementary instruction as imparted in the indigenous schools. It is not a healthy educational system that seeks to cast the youths of the country in the same educational mould; diversity of growth should be encouraged as far as possible. But, above all, much skill will be necessary in the disposal of state funds set apart for educational purposes. The effort should be to employ these funds with the most extensive effect under a proper system of rules for grants and

subventions in aid of private enterprize, and by calling into play a suitable machinery of rewards and honours to the local officials (the Patels, Kulkarnis &c.) as an encouragement and stimulus to their efforts, where necessary. There need be no waste of educational resources here. The Baroda reports are silent on the subject of grants-in-aid rules; but it is presumed that they are more liberal and less rigid than the Bombay rules. In Baroda, as in the rest of the country, there must be scattered over the entire area of the State a vast network of indigenous schools. Many of the 2,500 villages, as yet without State institutions must have some sort of school accommodation. These schools—though their number is not stated by the Director of Vernacular Education, Baroda—form, so to speak, an outer circle of educational activity, apparently as yet without State recognition or support in any form. Very probably they correspond to the old Pathshalas of Bengal, and serve a most important purpose in the general system of national education, and it is to be hoped they might be brought, if not so already, within the cognizance and administrative control of the State Department of Education under a liberal policy of incorporation and grants-in aid. On this subject of indigenous schools, the following recommendations of the Government of India to the Local Governments in their Resolution of October 1884 may be quoted:—

(1) "That all indigenous schools, whether high or low, be recognized and encouraged, if they serve any purpose of secular education whatsoever."

(2) "That a steady and gradual improvement in indigenous schools be aimed at with little immediate interference with their *personnel* or curriculum as possible."

(3) "That where Municipal and Local Boards exist, the regulation, supervision and encouragement of indigenous elementary schools, whether aided or unaided, be entrusted to such Boards."

(4) "That such Boards be required to give



elementary indigenous education free play and development, and to establish fresh schools of their own only where the preferable alternative of aiding suitable indigenous schools cannot be adopted."

One more suggestion on this point may be made, and that is in regard to a definite assignment of funds for the support of primary education, secured by a *quasi* legislative guarantee. In France, every commune is bound by statute to devote to the service of its primary schools a certain definite portion of its annual revenues. In the United States, about six percent. of local taxation is assigned for the support of the public primary schools. In Bombay, one third of the local cess is set apart for primary education, supplemented by contributions from the provincial revenues. In Bengal, in former times, under native rule, rent-free lands were reserved for the village Pathashalas. The question as to the most suitable method of assignment to be adopted in any state is a practical question for the Administration to decide. But to ensure permanence to the system, it is necessary that there should be a definite assignment of revenues under a statutory obligation for the support of primary schools.

These are some of the suggestions that may be offered on the general subject, and it is hoped that action based on some such lines as have been indicated will render possible, before many years have passed by, a great approach to the final goal. As schools increase in numbers, and other facilities for instruction advance under the well-regulated stimulus of State aid, and State encouragement is generously extended to every side and form of educational activity, a wider diffusion of education among the masses may be confidently anticipated.

A next question for consideration is, what is, and what should be, the general character of the instruction that is imparted to the masses. For, after all, the only education that can be given to the mass of our pupils must be of the most elementary

kind. Fully 95 percent among them leave school after the primary stage is reached, and can receive no more than simple instruction in reading, writing, and arithmetic, with only elementary notions of history and geography. Should primary education stop at such an elementary stage, or should it advance somewhat further, and embrace a wider range and variety of practical instruction, than can be imparted to the vast mass of scholars whose education begins and ends with the primary school? This is the second question which we have next to consider.

In India, as in Europe, two systems prevail; and on this subject Sir A. Croft, in his *Review of Education in India for 1886* (pp 195-96) thus writes;—  
 “In some provinces, primary instruction is carefully distinguished from the primary stage of higher instruction; and the village boy, whose education begins and ends with the primary school, goes through a course of instruction altogether different from the introductory stages of secondary and higher education. In others, no such distinction is made, and all pupils alike receive the same initial training.” “In the primary schools of Bombay, a single uniform course is prescribed for all pupils as far as the upper primary (or fourth) standard. The primary school, in fact, is regarded as being, and is intended to be, not only the village school, but the preparatory school for secondary education.....As far as the upper primary stage is concerned, all pupils and all classes of society read side by side in the same school, and read the vernacular only. In Bengal, a different course is followed. It is held there that the primary instruction suited to each pupil varies with, and should be determined by, the highest standard that he is likely to reach, that a boy, for example, who is intended for the University, or for a professional career, requires a different initial training from one whose education will end with the village school, and whose days will be spent in the humble occupations of rural life. Under this

latter system, High Schools necessarily have their own primary departments, in which English is for the most part taught from the beginning, and the course, from the lowest class to the highest, is governed by the final matriculation standard. In a middle school, again, the junior classes read a course different from either. Primary instruction is therefore regarded in Bengal under three separate aspects,—first, as an education designed to meet the simple requirements of the masses of the people, and therefore complete in itself, so far as it goes; secondly, as that which leads to a somewhat more advanced education in the Vernacular, with possibly a later infusion of English; and thirdly, as the initial stage of an English education, leading to the University, and therefore justifying the study of English from the outset. The Bombay system resembles that of America, in which all classes of society read together the same course in the town or village school. The Bengal system finds a parallel in England, where children of one social class learn their elements in the Board school, those of another in the Commercial Academy, and those of a third in the great public schools of Eton, Harrow &c..... These are the two extreme types, while Madras occupies an intermediate position. Its system recognizes the existence of attached primary departments in which English is read from the beginning. In the N. W. Provinces and Oudh, there are two alternative courses throughout the primary stage—English and Vernacular respectively. In the Panjab, the course is common to English and Vernacular schools in the lower primary stage of three years, but diverges at the commencement of the upper primary stage." Thus, it will be seen that "in all provinces, primary education—understood as the instruction provided for the masses of the people—is conducted in the Vernacular exclusively; while the primary stage of higher education is sometimes identical with the former throughout the whole or through a part of

its course, and sometimes altogether special and different." It is claimed for the Bombay system "that if the higher castes can give a tone to society, and if the example of the educated can stimulate the backward classes, this stimulus is provided by associating every section of the community in the class rooms of the primary school." On the whole, the Panjab plan appears to be by far the best and most suitable for our requirements, as tending to the maximum economy of educational force, and at the same time combining the advantages of the Bombay and Bengal systems, the primary course being the same for all grades and classes of learners up to a certain stage, and then diverging along distinct lines to suit varying demands.

The next point for consideration has relation to the subjects of instruction. Here also views and standards equally differ. In France, under the Education Law of 1881, "all children between the ages of 6 and 13 are required, besides reading and writing, to receive moral and civil instruction, to be taught geography and history, some notions of law and political economy, the elements of natural, physical and mathematical science, their application to agriculture, health, and industry, and the elements of drawing, modelling, and music," with gymnastic exercises for boys, and needle work for girls. In the elementary schools in Austria, the subjects taught are "religion, reading, writing, language, arithmetic with elementary geometry, some branches of natural history and physics, geography, history, drawing, singing, to boys gymnastics, to girls domestic duties." The Indian schemes are much less ambitious. In addition to Vernacular reading, writing and arithmetic, the boys are taught the elementary history and geography of India, and in some provinces a little of sanitation and mensuration and physics; and attention is given to gymnastics in boys' schools, and needlework in girls' schools.

The European schemes aim rather too high, and the Indian schemes somewhat too low, to be suitable for our requirements of the primary stage. The Bombay system is too literary and defective to be a complete course, either for those whose education ends at the primary stage, or for those who intend to proceed to the higher stages. As intended for the former, the Bombay Government has more than once admitted that the scheme, as at present arranged, does not contain a sufficient infusion of practical instruction, and it has directed a revision of the existing standards with a view to that end. A similar recasting of the standards of primary education in the Central Provinces is under the consideration of the authorities there.

As the Government of India remark, "the curriculum of a primary school ought, while not neglecting the preparation necessary for any pupils who may be advancing to the secondary stage, to aim principally at imparting instruction calculated to be of real practical benefit to the bulk of the children whose education will terminate with the primary course." This may be accepted as a sound definition of what the general aim and character of primary education ought to be. The majority of our children begin to attend school at 6 or 7 years of age, and in our Bombay schools, require 5 years to go through the lower primary stage (Standards I-IV) which is the same for all, and two more years to do the two upper standards as an advanced voluntary course of primary instruction. It is thus a course of 7 years, arranged in two stages.

The Bombay course may be accepted as at present fixed, with a modified arrangement, and an altered curriculum. It might be more advantageously arranged on some such plan as the following:—

The course to be in three stages instead of two:—

(1). The first stage—to be of three years, as in

the Panjab, and to embrace besides, reading, writing, arithmetic, and the history and geography of India, the two additional subjects of *drawing* and *manual work* on the Sloyed system.

(Drawing is insisted upon in the primary schools all over Europe and America; the study tends to train the eye and the hand, and at the same time, to give the infant mind of the young pupil a useful appreciation of form and beauty, proportion and symmetry. As for the Sloyed system it is much valued in Swizerland, Sweeden, Norway, and several other European countries. It has been also introduced into the primary schools of the Central Provinces, as a means of training the eye and the hands to accuracy, dexterity, and a sense of proportion. The object is so to train boys that when they leave school, they may be fit learners of a trade, and that the manual dexterity acquired at school may be useful to them, whether they subsequently take to trades or not. )

- ( 2 ) The second stage—to be of two years. In this period,—the general instruction begun in the first stage should continue, and be combined with practical instruction in the elements of physics, natural history and physical geography ( chiefly by means of object-lessons ), sanitation and mensuration. Drawing, and manual work on the Sloyed system should proceed.

( This stage will be the lower stage of primary education, and the course is sufficiently wide and varied to be suitable for all. There is to be no specialization of study so far. )

- ( 3 ) Lastly, the third stage—to be of two years.

The general instruction, as continued in the second stage, should proceed with optional groups of studies, literary or technical, such as may be adapted to the wants of the two classes of learners. The literary optional group might include, where possible, a study of English; the technical should be arranged in the three sections of agricultural, mechanical, and commercial. (The *agricultural* section should include—the principles of agriculture as in Tanner's Text-book, agricultural chemistry, and elements of Veterinary science; the *mechanical* course should include mechanics and elementary natural science; and the *commercial*, should embrace book-keeping, commercial correspondence and commercial geography.)

[ This stage represents the upper primary stage, and, so arranged, ensures a fair average of general knowledge, combined with literary and technical instruction sufficiently diversified and useful, and the aim of primary education, as defined in the Government of India Resolution quoted before, will be fairly attained. ]

The adoption of some such scheme of primary education must depend upon the supply of duly qualified teachers and good books, and until these are forthcoming, practical action in the desired direction is impossible. It may, therefore, be recommended for the consideration of the Baroda Commission that the efforts of the state department of education may, in the first place, be usefully directed to develop the Normal Schools up to the requisite standard of efficiency, and to introduce into the curricula of these schools practical subjects, both scientific and technical. On this point, the remarks of Mr. Lee-Warner are interesting: "If young Brahmin lads—who

are fitted to be masters of our higher primary and our secondary schools,—will only go through a course of mechanical instruction in the workshops, whilst they acquire a theoretic knowledge of various crafts in the lecture-room of the Poona College of science, we shall have solved the first of our difficultie, viz. the provision of competent teachers. We can then institute schools after the model of that at Rotterdam, which has been introduced into other parts of the Continent. The school there is on the-half time system, the morning being devoted to mental education, and the afternoon to practical teaching in the workshop, and the course extends from the age of 13 to 16. The pupils learn drawing, mathematics, physics, chemistry, and the elements of various trades, the best practical workmen being engaged to teach these trades." As regards school text-books, it is satisfactory to learn on the authority of Mr. Hargovind Dwarkadas that the Baroda state department is doing all that is necessary to encourage their preparation and publication.

Beyond this primary stage, all instruction should be as varied and specialized as possible. The two main divisions of education—*literary* and *real*—in all the higher stages should be on a co-ordinate basis, and move together on parallal lines.

After an adequate average of general instruction is attained in the primary courses, much may be done :—

( A ) For Technical Education. :

- ( 1 ) By extending the plan of the Baroda Technical Institute, and enlarging the scope of instruction imparted in the Institute by the establishment of agricultural and commercial departments.—[ These additions to the curriculum of the Institute will enable it to impart a complete course of practical instruction of a superior kind. ] And
- ( 2 ) By opening special trade schools on the



Rotterdam model, at some of the centres of trade and industry; there should be also agricultural classes attached to the Taluka schools. [ These schools will be feeders to the central Technical Institute at Baroda; and the Institute should serve at once both as a higher Institute of Technical Instruction, as well as a Technical Normal College for the training of masters for upper primary and special schools. In these special industrial schools, a study of the local crafts—e. g. wood-carving, carpentry, smithing—might be advantageously pursued. ]

(B) And for Higher Literary Education in the Vernacular.

A central Vernacular College at Baroda, with one or two Vernacular high schools at the zilla centres, might be suggested. The curriculum will of course be of a classical type, including Sanskrit. It may not altogether be out of harmony even with a higher course of education in the Vernaculars to suggest that some knowledge of English may be insisted upon. The study of the English language furnishes a key, not only to a rich and noble literature, but also to the entire thought of modern Europe, and as such seems an indispensable training to every Vernacular scholar.

---

The scheme so outlined suggests a comprehensive programme of educational effort. It is not proposed as a scheme to be adopted *per saltum*, but to be worked up to by tentative steps, as the funds and resources placed at the disposal of the State Department of Education may allow.

We can only briefly notice the question of

female education before we conclude these observations. In Baroda, as elsewhere, the difficulties in the way of female education are great. Popular sentiment, ignorant prejudice, the cast-iron sway of custom—all concur in impeding the advance of female education in every Province and State of India. The movement to be successful must be spontaneous and voluntary, emanating from the people themselves, and growing out of a proper appreciation of the benefits of female education. In this respect, there are limits to Governmental interference and State action, which cannot be overstepped, and for any solid advance in the field we must perforce leave much to time and its ameliorative and solvent influences, and to the progress of general male education.

In the meanwhile, it is a pleasure to observe that so much good and useful work is being silently done in the Baroda State. There are 42 girls' schools in a high state of efficiency, with a roll of 5000 pupils, besides 5 Zenana classes with 222 grown up girls under instruction. The system of instruction pursued seems also a sound one. As a further development of the teaching machinery, an extension of the Zenana system, which is found to work so well in Bengal and elsewhere in Northern India, may be recommended. The curriculum of instruction, it may also be suggested, should be of a liberal, and literary character as far as practicable. Our present need in this respect is not so much the acquisition of high technical or scientific skill or knowledge by our women, as a broad liberal culture of the mind and heart, which may, in the progress of time, be found effectual to remove the dead incubus of darkness and superstition and prejudice, that makes in too many cases our homes dreary, and our home-life burden. Besides, therefore, music, needle work, cookery, domestic economy &c, higher portions of Vernacular and Sanskrit literature, and history and geography, might be usefully included in the course. The aim should be to give these pupils a broad basis

of liberal education, such as will enlarge their minds, cultivate their sympathies, and ennoble their lives. It is more light that we want for the enlightenment of our homes—the light of knowledge, of higher culture, and nobler aims.

---

Here this note must close. The observations cover the ground suggested by the principal points of the inquiry

To conclude, as there is no more sacred or imperative duty imposed on rulers of States than its obligations in regard to popular education, nothing can be a more gratifying sign of the times than the fact that a leading native State like Baroda is coming forward to accept its full responsibility in this respect, and is further prepared to take practical action on the basis of such a recognition of its obligations. We may be permitted to express a confident hope that the outcome of the labours of the Baroda Education Commission will be a larger development in the near future of the enlightened educational policy of His Highness's Government, and a wider extension and more varied expansion of educational activity in the Baroda State, resulting in a great advance of the moral, material, and intellectual well-being of all classes of the people of Baroda.

---

# THE NET OUTCOME OF THE PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION.

No. I.

“ With regard to the employment of Natives in the Government of their country, in the Covenanted Service formerly of the Company and now of the Crown, *I must say that we have not fulfilled our duty or the promises and engagements which we have made.*” These words were uttered nearly a quarter of a century ago by the Duke of Argyll, who was then, as Secretary of State for India, the most responsible adviser of Her Majesty on Indian matters! And, alas! although twenty-four years have rolled by since they were first uttered by His Grace, they are as true today as they were on the 11th of March 1869. Indæd, if the history of England’s broken pledges to India ever comes to be written, the manner, in which the claims of the Natives of this country for admission into the higher branches of the Public Service have been, from time to time, treated, must find a prominent place in its pages. It was in 1833 that the Parliament of England enacted that “ no Native of the said territories ( India , nor any natural-born subject of His Majesty resident therein, shall, by reason only of his religion, place of birth, descent, colour, or any of them, be disabled from holding any place, office or employment under the said ( East India ) Company.” This enactment formed the text of a despatch which the Court of Directors addressed in 1834 to the Government of India, and in this despatch, the Directors thus wrote:—“ It is fitting that this important enactment should be understood in order that its full spirit and intention may be transfused through our whole system of administration.....The meaning of the enactment we take to be that there shall be no go-

verning caste in British India; that whatever other tests of qualification may be adopted, distinctions of race or religion shall not be of the number.....Fitness is henceforth to be the criterion of eligibility." Nearly sixty years have elapsed, since these solemn declarations were made and these assurances given, but we grieve to say that no real attempt has been made during this long period to bring, even to a limited extent, the actual policy of the Government of India into harmony with them. Indeed the history of the whole question possesses an uncommon amount of melancholy interest, and we, therefore, present it briefly to our readers before dealing with the net result of the Public Service Commission's labours.

The Civil Service of India, or as it was till recently called, the Indian Covenanted Civil Service was, in the beginning, composed of the writers, factors, and junior and senior merchants, who were employed for purposes of trade by the East India Company. As the character of the Company changed gradually from mercantile to political, the functions of its servants also changed correspondingly. But it was not till 1790, *i. e.*, till the system of Civil and Criminal justice was entirely remodelled by Lord Cornwallis, that steps were taken to formally recognize the altered duties of the Company's servants, and place on a clear and permanent basis the administration of all branches of the Public Service in the territories of the Company by European officers. In 1793, the first Parliamentary enactment, regulating by law appointments to the Civil Service of the East India Company, was passed. This enactment provided that all posts in the Civil branch of the Company's service under the degree of Counsellor should be filled up from amongst Covenanted Civil Servants of the Company, the term Covenanted having reference to the Covenant, into which the servants of the East India Company had to enter, prior to leaving England, wherein "their privileges were recited and their obligations were

defined." The enactment of 1793 also provided that the age of writers on first appointment should not be less than 15 years or more than 22 years. In 1806, the celebrated College at Haileybury was established to provide a preliminary training for the Civil Servants of the Company. Admission to this College depended upon nomination by the Court of Directors. The course of instruction extended over two years, at the end of which an examination was held to test the qualifications of the candidates. In 1833, Parliament declared by an enactment that thereafter there was to be no governing caste in India, that whatsoever other qualifications might be required, distinctions of race or religion shall not be of the number, that, in fact, thereafter fitness alone was to be the test of eligibility. Noble intentions these, which, unhappily, no serious attempt was ever made to translate into deeds! It was when this enactment was in Bill form, that Macaulay delivered his famous speech on the Indian Government, so full of generous sentiments and noble eloquence. In 1837, a Parliamentary enactment laid down that the maximum age limit for admission to Haileybury should be 21 years, and for appointment as a writer, 23 years. In 1853, admission to Haileybury was declared dependent on the results of an open competitive examination, instead of on the nomination of the Court of Directors. This was, undoubtedly, an important step from the Indian point of view; for, as it was impossible for a Native of India to secure nomination by the Court of Directors, he could not, under the old system, cherish even that distant and meagre hope, which he may now entertain of getting into the ranks of the 'heaven-born' service. The Statute of 1853 declared that all powers, rights and privileges of the Court of Directors of the East India Company "to nominate or appoint persons to be admitted as students (at the Haileybury College)" should cease and that "subject to such regulations as may be made by the Board of Commissioners for

the affairs of India, any person, being a natural born subject of Her Majesty, who may be desirous of being admitted into the said College at Haileybury..... shall be admitted to be examined as a candidate for such admission." A Committee, with Mr. (afterwards Lord) Macaulay as Chairman, was at the same time appointed to draw up a scheme of examination for the competitive test. The report of this Committee is an able and cleverly written document, but one melancholy feature of it is that it is *written exclusively and entirely in the interests of the English Candidates*. Indeed, so completely is this the case that the thought of Indian candidates competing for this examination does not appear to have been so much as present in the minds of Lord Macaulay and his Colleagues. It is all "English gentlemen" succeeding or failing. The subjects recommended for the examination are so selected that unsuccessful 'English gentlemen' may not feel that their time was wasted "at that period of life at which time is most precious, in studies, which will never, in any conceivable case, be of the smallest use to them." The Vernacular languages of India are discarded as "of no value, except for the purpose of communicating with Natives of India;" and if Sanskrit and Arabic are admitted into the curriculum for their being "by no means without intrinsic value in the eyes both of philologists and of men of taste," that is done with the dry remark that practically no candidate will offer himself for examination in those languages! The important question of age limits is also determined in the same manner. "It seems to us," say the Committee, "that it would be a great improvement to allow students to be admitted to the College up to the age of 23, and to fix 25 as the latest age at which they can go out to India in the Civil Service. It is undoubtedly desirable that the Civil Servant of the Company should enter on his duties while still young; but it is also desirable

that he should have received the best, the most liberal, the most finished education that his native country affords. Such an education has been proved by experience to be the best preparation for every calling, which requires the exercise of the higher powers of the mind; nor will it be easy to show that such preparation is less desirable in the case of a Civil Servant of the East India Company than in the case of a professional man who remains in England. Indeed, in the case of the Civil Servant of the Company, a good general education is even more desirable than in the case of the English professional man; for the duties even of a very young servant of the Company are more important than those which ordinarily fall to the lot of a professional man in England. In England, too, a professional man may, while engaged in active business, continue to improve his mind by means of reading and of conversation. But the servant of the Company is often stationed, during a large part of his life, at a great distance from libraries and from European society, and will, therefore, find it peculiarly difficult to supply by study in his mature years the deficiencies of his early training." Lord Macaulay's Committee thus proposed 18 and 23 as age limits in place of 17 and 21 of the nomination system. Two years later, i.e. in 1855, the Haileybury College was abolished as not providing "arrangements suitable to the age and standing of those likely to be selected as candidates at the open competition." In 1858, when the Government of India was transferred from the Company to the Crown, a Parliamentary enactment entrusted the duty of making regulations from time to time regarding the Competitive examination, to the Secretary of State for India, acting with the advice and assistance of Her Majesty's Civil Service Commissioners in England. And in the same year, the gracious Proclamation of Her Majesty to the people of India, which has often been described as "a document of



singular beauty and royal breath," and which is believed to have emanated from her Majesty's own pen, was issued. This Proclamation repeated the Parliamentary declaration of 1833, already referred to, and assured once again the people of India, "of whatever race or creed," that thereafter they "shall be freely and impartially admitted to office in our Service, the duties of which they may be qualified, by their education, ability and integrity duly to discharge." Two years later, *i. e.* in 1860, a Committee of the India Office, consisting of Mr. J. P. Willoughby, Sir Erskine Perry, Sir W. R. Arbutnot, Mr. Ross D. Mangles and Sir E. Macnaghten, deliberately expressed their unanimous opinion that the solemn pledges given to the people of India from time to time had not been fulfilled and that it was an act of bare justice to the Indians to hold, for admission into the Covenanted Civil Service, "simultaneously, two examinations, one in England and one in India, both being, as far as practicable, identical in their nature." And the Committee added these emphatic words:—"Were this inequality (the unequal conditions under which English and Indian Candidates had to compete for the Indian Civil Service Examination) removed, *we should no longer be exposed to the charge of keeping promise to the ear and breaking it to the hope.*" Alas! Nearly a third of a Century has elapsed since then, and yet the promise continues to be kept only to the ear and broken to the hope! In the same year, in which the above Committee of the India office recommended Simultaneous Examinations, the Secretary of State for India lowered the maximum age limit from 23 to 22. The next year, *i. e.* in 1861, a Statute was passed by Parliament, reserving certain offices for members of the Covenanted Civil Service only. These offices were stated in the schedule to be the following:—

Secretaries, Junior Secretaries, and under-Secretaries to the several Governments in India, except the

Secretaries, Junior Secretaries and under-Secretaries in the Military, Marine and Public Works Departments.

Account General.  
Civil Auditor.  
Sub-Treasurer.

*Judicial.*

1. Civil and Sessions Judges or Chief Judicial officers of districts in the Provinces, known as Regulation Provinces.
2. Additional and Assistant Judges in the said Provinces.
3. Magistrates or Chief Magisterial officers of districts in the said Provinces.
4. Joint Magistrates in the said Provinces.
5. Assistant Magistrates or Assistants and Magistrates in the said Provinces.

*Revenue.*

1. Members of the Board of Revenue in the Presidencies of Bengal and Madras.
2. Secretaries to the said Boards of Revenue.
3. Commissioners of Revenue or Chief Revenue officers of divisions in the Provinces, known as Regulation Provinces.
4. Collectors of Revenue or Chief Revenue officers of districts in the said Provinces.
5. Deputy or Subordinate Collectors, where combined with the office of Joint-Magistrate in the said Provinces.
6. Assistant Collectors or Assistants to Collectors in the said Provinces.
7. Salt Agents.
8. Controllers of Salt Chowkies.
9. Commissioners of Customs, Salt and Opium.
10. Opium Agents.

At the same time, the Statute provided that the authorities in India might, under special circumstances, appoint to such offices persons other than Covenanted Civil servants, subject to the following conditions:—(1)“That no person shall be so appointed who has not resided for at least seven years in India.” (2)“That every person previously to his being so appointed to any of the offices in the Judicial and Revenue Department shall pass an examination in the Vernacular language of the district in which he is to be employed, where such examination is now required; and shall be subject to all the departmental tests and qualifications and restrictions which are, or may be imposed in the like case on Covenanted Civil Servants.” (3)“That every such appointment shall be provisional only, and shall forthwith be reported to the Secretary of State in Council of India, together with the special reasons of making the same;” and (4)“That, unless the Secretary of State, in Council shall approve such appointment, with the concurrence of a majority of members present at a meeting, and shall, within twelve months from the date of such appointment, notify such approval to the authority by whom the appointment was made, such appointment shall be cancelled.” These powers, however, were, practically for the most part, never exercised in favour of natives. Only one appointment of a native would appear to have been made in exercise of them, viz. that of the late Rao Bahadur Gopalrao Hari Deshmukh, who was, in 1862, for some time appointed Assistant Judge. This appointment, however, was soon cancelled. In 1866, the maximum limit of age, which was then standing at 22, was further reduced by a year, the minimum limit also being at the same time reduced from 18 to 17. In 1868, Sir Stafford Northcote, who was then Secretary of State for India brought before Parliament a Bill called the Government of India Act Amendment Bill, which contained a clause empowering the Government of

India to liberally appoint *Natives of India* to the posts reserved by the Statute of 1861 to members of the Covenanted Civil Service only. In introducing the Bill, Sir Stafford made the following remarks:—

“ The impression of myself and the Council is that the Uncovenanted Service should be, as far as possible, a Native Service, though, no doubt, certain appointments should be given to Englishmen. In explanation of the large proportion of Europeans in the Uncovenanted Services, I mention that appointments were given to many Europeans who rendered services during the Mutiny, and other appointments were given to the sons and relatives of old officers. Still I feel that the Uncovenanted Service is a dangerous service for Europeans, as it affords a scope for jobbing and we ought to confine it more to Natives than to Europeans. In addition to this, I think it desirable that we should provide some mode by which Natives should be admitted into the Covenanted Service; and I, therefore, propose to introduce into the Bill a clause to open, to a certain extent, a door for that purpose. At present, there is an act by which a certain number of choice appointments are reserved to members of the Covenanted Civil Service, which can only be entered by competitive examination in this country, but there is also by a section of that Act power given to the authorities to appoint other persons, provided they have resided in India a certain number of years and have passed certain language tests. This latter provision, however, not being thoroughly effective, I propose to introduce a clause declaring that nothing in that Act shall prevent the authorities from appointing any Native of India to any post in the Covenanted Service, subject to such regulations as may appear expedient to the Governor-General and shall be approved by the Secretary for India and the majority of his Council.....I propose also to define a Native of India as being a person born of

parents habitually resident in India and not of persons merely established there for a temporary purpose."

A little later in the same year, the late Mr. Fawcett raised a debate in the House of Commons on the following motion :—

"That this House, while cordially approving of the system of open competition for the appointments in the East India Civil Service, is of opinion that the people of India have not a fair chance of competing for these appointments as long as the examinations are held nowhere but in London. This House would, therefore, deem it desirable that simultaneously with the examination in London, the same examination should be held in Calcutta, Bombay and Madras."

Of course, it was not Mr Fawcett's intention to divide the House on the question, and he, therefore, withdrew his motion after a sympathetic speech from the Secretary of State. Sir Stafford meanwhile was proceeding with his own measure, when the Conservative Ministry was defeated on the Irish Church question, and a dissolution of Parliament took place. With the fall of the Ministry, the Government of India Act Amendment Bill naturally dropped. By the ceaseless efforts of Mr. Dadabhai Naroji, however, the subject was revived next year, *i. e.* in 1869, and the Duke of Argyll, who was then Secretary of State for India, introduced his "East India (Laws and Regulations) Bill. It is this measure, which ultimately became law in 1870, which is known in connection with the Public Service question as the Statute of 1870. Clause 6 of this measure, expressly intended for providing "additional facilities for the employment of Natives of India of proved merit and ability in the Civil Service of Her Majesty in India," empowers the Government of India to appoint, under rules sanctioned by the Secretary of State in Council, Natives of India to posts reserved for members of the Covenanted Civil Service, although they may not have passed the competitive

examination held in London. On the occasion of the second reading of the Bill, His Grace described this clause as "one of very great importance," and then made these weighty observations:—"It may be asked how far this provision is consistent with the measures adopted by Parliament for securing efficiency in that Service; but there is a question, and, in my opinion, a much more important question which I trust will be considered—how far this provision is essential to enable us to perform our duties and fulfill our pledges and professions towards the people of India.....With regard, however, to the employment of Natives in the Government of their country, in the Covenanted Service formerly of the Company, and now of the Crown, I must say that we have not fulfilled our duty or the promises and engagements which we have made.....I believe that by competitive examinations, conducted at Calcutta, or even by pure selection, it will be quite possible for the Indian Government to secure able, excellent and efficient administrators." The Bill became law in March 1870. Three years were, however, allowed by the Government of India to elapse before the first set of rules under the Act was drafted and submitted to the Secretary of State for India for approval. These rules laid down that a Native of India, of proved merit and ability, might be appointed to any post in the Civil Service of India, provided that (a) he had served in some employment under the British Government of India upon a salary of not less than Rs. 250 monthly for a period, not less than five years, and that (b) in the case of an office, the functions of which were not executive but wholly judicial, he had served in some Judicial office upon a salary not less than Rs 250 monthly under the British Government in India, for a period not less than five years, or had passed a period not less than ten years either (1) as a Barrister, Advocate or certified Pleader in practice before a Court of Justice of a grade not lower than the Court of Sessions Judge or

of a District Civil Judge; or (2) in such practice and in Government service in the Judicial line, upon a salary not less than Rs. 250 monthly, together. These rules were, however, disallowed by the Secretary of State, who, guided by the opinion of the Law Officers of the Crown, declared that they were based on too narrow an interpretation of the Statute of 1870, and that they were not, therefore, calculated to adequately carry out "the spirit and intention of the Act of 1870." In 1875, another set was framed by the Government of India and this time it received the sanction of the Secretary of State. But the wording of these rules was of the vaguest kind, and they remained practically inoperative. Finally in 1879, the famous rules, constituting the Statutory Civil Service, recently abolished, were framed and approved by the Secretary of State in Council. Meanwhile during the previous year, *i. e.*, in 1878, the maximum age limit for admission to the competitive examination in London had been reduced from 21 to 19, thus making the difficulties in the way of Indian candidates for that examination "almost insuperable. The rules of 1879 provided (1) that a proportion, not exceeding one-fifth of the total number of Civilians appointed by the Secretary of State to the Civil Service in any one year should be Natives selected in India by the Local Governments; (2) that each selection should be subject to the approval of the Governor-General in Council; and (3) that the selected candidates should, save under exceptional circumstances, be on probation for two years." At the end of 1879, the Government of India issued a resolution laying down (1) that appointments under the rules, should, generally speaking, be confined to "young men of good family and social position, possessed of fair abilities and education, to whom the offices open to them in the inferior ranks, or Uncovenanted Service, have not proved a sufficient inducement to come forward for employment;" and

(2) that appointments of persons, who have already proved their merit and ability either in the service of the Government or in professional practice, should be exceptional, and should be confined to persons "who have obtained great distinction in the offices they have held or the professions they have followed—persons in short, whom the Government would spontaneously desire to appoint to superior offices." Under these rules, upto the time of the appointment of the Public Service Commission, 46 Natives in all had been appointed Statutory Civilians in the whole of India. These were distributed as follows:—8 in the Madras Presidency, 9 in the Bombay Presidency, 11 in Bengal, 11 in North-West Provinces, 5 in the Punjab, and 2 in the Central Provinces. The modes of selection adopted by the different Governments were different. Thus in the Madras Presidency, "the general rule was to nominate persons of good family, social position and general influence, regard being at the same time had to educational qualifications; but the plan more recently advocated and acted upon has been to adopt a system of nomination on the ground of merit and ability proved in the uncovenanted Service, or in the practice of one of the learned professions, alternating (once in every three years) with a system of nomination based on the results of an examination amongst a limited number of candidates, being Natives of the Madras Presidency, Graduates in Arts of a recognized Indian University, and between 22 and 25 years of age." In the Bombay Presidency, generally young men of good family and social position were appointed "subject to the possession of sufficient educational attainments." Only one gentleman was appointed on the ground of merit and ability proved in the Service of Government, and one only for merit and ability in the practice of a profession. In Bengal, "the system adopted in 1879 and in the four succeeding years was one of nomination pure and simple, the factors taken



into account being family respectability, good education, past Government Service and physical powers. Since 1884, a system of limited competition among a limited number of Candidates has been instituted, according to the results of which nominations have been submitted by the Local Government. The candidates for this examination have been chosen from (a) officers in the service of Government who had specially distinguished themselves; (b) persons who had taken the degree of Bachelor of Arts at the Calcutta University, provided that such persons were able to produce certificates of their having a thoroughly practical knowledge of the English language, of their physical fitness for the service of Government, of good moral character, and of their being of active habits and able to ride; (c) persons of proved merit and ability in the practice of a profession." Persons of more than 25 years of age were not allowed to appear at the examinations, unless they had been already in the service of Government, or had been engaged during at least five years in the practice of a learned profession. Four Statutory Civilians were appointed in Bengal "on the ground of high birth, social position, and general influence" and four more on the ground of proved merit and ability in the service of Government. None was appointed on the ground of professional merit and ability. Of the four, appointed on the ground of high birth, one resigned after having been on leave for a considerable period, and *the services of the other were dispensed with "owing to his failure to pass the prescribed departmental examination!"* The system, adopted in the North-Western Provinces and Oudh was to appoint "such persons as appeared to the Local Government to possess, in the highest degree, the qualifications necessary for the discharge of the duties of Statutory Civilians." No preliminary examination was held and no minimum standard of educational attainments, except a competent knowledge of English, was re-

quired. In the Punjab, the essential qualifications for nomination were "good family and social position, combined with educational, moral and physical fitness." None was appointed in this province on the ground of merit and ability proved in the service of Government or in the exercise of a profession.

In 1884, complaints reached the Government of India that the system of nomination was a failure. This led to a correspondence between that Government and the Secretary of State, which ultimately resulted in the appointment of the Public Service Commission. On the 4th of October 1886, the Government of India issued a resolution announcing that a Commission had been appointed "to devise a scheme which may reasonably be hoped to possess the necessary elements of finality and to do full justice to the claims of Natives of India to higher and more extensive employment in the Public Service." (The italics are ours). Lord Dufferin was then Viceroy, but his Lordship's 'epoch-making' speech at St. Andrew's dinner had not then been delivered; and though very few were oversanguine about the result, all seemed disposed to welcome the appointment of the Commission. The *personnel* of the Commission was announced in another Government resolution, issued a month later, *i. e.* on the 4th of November 1886; the Hon. Sir Charles Aitchinson, K. C. S. I., C. I. E., the Lieutenant-Governor of the Punjab, was appointed President, and the Commission was to include fifteen other members and a Secretary. These fifteen members were Sir Charles Turner, Chief Justice of the Madras High Court, Messrs Crosthwaite, Quinton and Peacock of the Bengal Civil Service, Mr. Stokes of the Madras Civil Service, Mr. Stewart of the Bombay Civil Service, Mr. Ryland of the Bengal Uncovenanted Civil Service, Messrs Hudson and White, representatives of the non-official European and Eurasian Communities respectively, the Hon. Romesh Chundra Mitra, Judge of the Calcutta High

Court, the Raja of Bhinga, Rao Bahadur Krishnaji Laxman Nulkar, of Poona, Khan Bahadurs Sayyid Ahmad and Kazi Shahbudin, representatives of the Mahomedan Community, and Mr. Salem Ramaswami Mudaliyar of Madras. Mr. Daukes, of the Bengal Civil Service, was appointed Secretary. The Commission held its first collective meeting at Lahore on the 15th of December 1886, where a general plan of operations was discussed and agreed upon. In the course of the inquiry, 469 witnesses were examined, of whom 399 attended by summons or special invitation of the Commission, and 70 voluntarily offered to be examined. Of these 469, 129 were Europeans, 11 Eurasians, and the rest Natives. On the 8th of March 1887, the Government of India issued a resolution appointing a Sub-Committee of the Commission to enquire into the question of Special Departments.

In our criticism of the work of the Commission, we intend to confine ourselves to the questions of the Covenanted and Statutory Civil Services,—to the recommendations of the Commission and the final orders of Government in regard to them. The most important point, of course, connected with these questions was whether the examination for admission into the Covenanted Civil Service, at present held in London only, should or should not be held simultaneously in England and India. We have already stated that a Committee of the India office in London did actually recommend in 1860,—and recommend unanimously—that unless the competitive examination was held simultaneously in England and India, the promises of equality of treatment, solemnly and repeatedly given to the people of India, would continue to be kept only to the ear and broken to the hope. Be it remembered that this recommendation was made only three years after the great mutiny, when the minds of Englishmen must naturally have been full of distrust and violent prejudice against us, as the impressions left by the

dark days of that terrible event must still have been fresh in them. And yet, by a strange irony of fate, when this self-same question came to be considered in 1887 by a Commission, the Commission, sitting amidst manifestations of loyalty as universal as they were deep, evoked by the year being the Jubilee of Her Majesty's reign, gravely came to the conclusion that the institution of simultaneous examinations in England and India for admission into the Civil Service of this country, was fraught with dangerous consequences and was entirely inexpedient ! Indeed it is impossible to speak, without a feeling of the strongest indignation, of the perverse, we had almost said disingenuous, manner in which the Commission thought it fit to declare itself against the holding of simultaneous examinations. The careful and elaborate analysis, given by Mr. Digby in one of his letters to Lord Cross, of the evidence recorded by the Commission on this question, clearly and fully establishes the fact that the recommendation of the Commission in this matter was entirely against the weight of that evidence. The Commission had before it the views of 597 persons, tendered either orally or in writing, of whom 361 were in favour of simultaneous examinations, 163 against them, and 73 had not expressed themselves clearly or definitely on the point. Of those who gave their opinion in favour of the proposal, 49 were Europeans and 312 Natives ; while of the 163 who declared themselves against it, 90 were Europeans and only 73 Natives of India. We thus find that while the European witnesses were, by less than 2 to 1 against the institution of simultaneous examinations, the Native witnesses were by more than 4 to 1 in favour of the proposal. It should also be borne in mind that four-fifths of the witnesses examined were specially invited by the Commission to offer their evidence. Considering the attitude of hostility which the average Anglo-Indian, unhappily, generally assumes towards the aspirations and

efforts of the educated classes in India, it is not to be wondered at that a majority of European witnesses could not approve of the proposal to hold simultaneous examinations in England and India for the Indian Civil Service. Indeed the wonder is all the other way, and really it speaks volumes in favour of the moderation of the proposal that more than one-third of the European witnesses, 18 of them, being, again, themselves members of the Covenanted Civil Service, should have been for it. The Commission, however, quietly ignored all these considerations—not one word about its being alive to them appears in the Report. And we deliberately record our opinion that in discarding the overwhelming weight of evidence in favour of simultaneous examinations, the Commission was guilty of a grievous dereliction of duty. We do not mean that a bare numerical majority ought to decide a question and we are prepared to allow that Commissions would be right in exercising a moderate amount of discretion in weighing opinions, when these happen to be almost evenly balanced. But when the weight of evidence recorded is so overwhelmingly on one side as in the present case, a Commission's inquiry would be a sham and a delusion, if the view of the majority—not a bare majority, but an influential, overwhelming majority—is not to be, in the main, adopted. Any one who reads the Report of the Commission will at once see that the Commissioners themselves felt the difficulty of their position. They could not but be conscious that the recommendation which they had made up their mind to make was against the weight of evidence recorded. And they, therefore, deliberately adopted a most misleading standard from the beginning in judging and speaking of that evidence. "The evidence," they wrote, "tendered before the Commission on this point may, broadly speaking, be divided under two heads, namely—(1) that given by witnesses belonging to those classes which have made the greatest progress in edu-

cation; and (2) that given by others who feel that in the present circumstances of the country, important classes of the community are practically debarred from success in examinations designed mainly as tests of educational qualification." Under which of these two heads, we may ask, did the Commission intend to place the evidence of the 49 Europeans who declared themselves in favour of simultaneous examinations? Nor surely under the first, because that division is intended to be confined only to the Brahmmins, the Parsees and such other 'advanced' sections of the community, and yet obviously not under the second, because they were in favour of simultaneous examinations, whereas that division can include only opinions that were against such examinations. Perhaps the Commission intended to quietly ignore the evidence of these 49 European gentlemen, among whom were to be found men like Sir Raymond West, the Honourable H. J. Reynolds, Mr. Garstin, Mr. Stokes, Sir A. Croft, Mr. Wordsworth, Mr. Geary, Mr. Monteath, and Mr. H. J. S. Cotton, even if we were to omit the names of Mr. Hume and Sir William Wedderburn as those of men who were in open sympathy with the aims and aspirations of New India! By adopting a most unfair principle of division, the Commission was able to discount the value of the evidence of the overwhelming majority in favour of simultaneous examinations and magnify that of the small minority whose views supported the recommendation which the Commission had already resolved to make. An examination of the arguments on which the Commission's recommendation is based cannot fail to show to any impartial and fairminded person how lame and inclusive those arguments are. An analysis of the Commission's remarks on this subject shows that these arguments are eight in number:—

1. That in the present circumstances of social life in India, open competition in this

country would not justify, to the same extent as similar competition in England, the presumption that the successful candidates would possess in a sufficient degree the qualities essential for high administrative office.

2. That Indian Schools and Colleges do not, at the present time, supply an education and training of the high and liberal kind, considered to be a necessary qualification for admission to the Indian Civil Service.
3. That an open competition in India for the Covenanted Civil Service would operate with inequality, excluding altogether some important classes of the community, while giving undue advantage to others.
4. That a competitive examination in India could scarcely fail—in view, on the one hand, of the large number of candidates who would offer themselves for examination, and, on the other hand, of the small number who could, under any circumstances, be successful,—to create a large disappointed, and thereby probably discontented class which would cause considerable embarrassment to Government.
5. That there is reason to fear that pressure would, sooner or later, be brought to bear on the Government with a view to make the examination of a less English and a more oriental character and to adjust it on terms more favourable to Native Candidates.
6. That perhaps an injurious effect would be exercised on the development of education in this country by an open competition for the Civil Service. In view of the value of the prizes offered, such an examination would be followed by the creation of private

establishments for the main, if not the sole, purpose of offering special preparation to intending candidates, while the regular educational institutions would scarcely be able to resist the temptation of so shaping the course of their study as to secure success at the Indian Examination rather than to impart a general liberal education to the mass of their scholars.

7. That it would be very difficult to maintain the secrecy of the examination papers in India.
8. That it would be impossible to make satisfactory arrangements for that portion of the examination which is conducted *viva voce*; that it would be impossible to secure either uniformity of test or the high standard, exacted in England, if the work were undertaken by the professional staff available in India.

A careful examination of these objections to the institution of Simultaneous Examinations will show that they are not such as would, in any way, justify the rejection of the proposal made by the India Office Committee of 1860 to fulfil the obligations incurred by the rulers of this country by their pledges and declarations. Objections 2 and 6, to a certain extent, contradict each other. There can be no supply unless there be demand, and if the existing educational institutions in India do not supply an education and training "of the high and liberal kind considered to be a necessary qualification for admission to the Indian Civil Service," evidently it is because there is at present no demand for such education and training. That institutions, which will supply facilities for such education, will come into existence as soon as simultaneous examinations are instituted, must be clear even to the meanest understanding, and objection



No. 2 cannot hold water even for a moment. The sixth objection shows that the Commissioners themselves were, as was to be expected, alive to this fact; for that objection is based on the assumption that the institution of simultaneous examinations "would be followed by the creation of private establishments for the main, if not the sole, purpose of offering special preparation to intending candidates." The fear that "the regular educational institutions would scarcely be able to resist the temptation of so shaping the course of their study as to secure success at the Indian examination rather than to impart a general liberal education to the mass of their scholars," is hard to understand. For if the examination for the Civil Service requires an exceptionally high and liberal kind of culture, where is the harm if the ordinary educational institutions place the Civil Service standard before them as a sort of ideal? But then can these institutions do so? Is it not a fact that almost all the "regular educational institutions" in this country for secondary and higher education are either Government or aided institutions? And is not their course of studies subject to the control of Government in the educational department? Objections 4 and 5 are equally worthless. Can the Government seriously apprehend that the institution of simultaneous examinations would create a large class of disappointed persons who would cause considerable embarrassment to it? How will this expected embarrassment be caused and what will be its nature? Are not there already in the country large classes—much larger than any that could be created by a competitive examination in India for the Civil Service—of persons "disappointed" and "discontented" because they have to encounter difficulties at every step and turn on the score of their race and colour? And have they ever caused any "embarrassment" to Government? How are Natives in the military Service of Her Majesty treated?

Indeed even if there be some foundation for the apprehension that the unsuccessful candidates would cause embarrassment to Government,—and in our opinion there is none—is not the disappointment and disaffection of these men to be preferred to the disappointment and disaffection of the whole country as comparatively a vastly smaller evil? The fear that pressure would sooner or later be brought to bear on Government with a view to make the examination of a less English and more oriental type, is equally baseless. The examinations in our universities, from the lowest to the highest, are of a distinctly English character, and yet, who ever heard of attempts to orientalize them in any way? Not merely are the subjects the same as are studied at English universities, but even the medium used is English. The subjects prescribed for the Civil Service examination are for the most part those for the M. A. examination of the Indian Universities in the various groups, and there is, in our opinion, not the slightest justification for the assertion that an effort will ever be made to get the Civil Service Curriculum in any way orientalized, since no such attempt has ever been made in regard to the M. A. examination of our Universities. Objection 3 may also be dismissed as without weight. It is true that some classes in India who possess special advantages in intellectual contests will have an advantage over other classes. But they have such advantage even now in regard to the University and other competitive examinations. Government would in every way, be justified, if it offers special inducement to the back-ward classes to come up to the level of the Brahmins and the Parsees in intellectual matters. But it is monstrous to shut out all classes of the community from the benefit of simultaneous examinations, simply because some of them are more backward than others. When the principle has been once laid down that an open competitive examination is to determine admission into the Civil Service—

and this principle is adhered to both by the Commission and by Government—competition and competition alone ought to decide the choice of persons, and it is neither fair nor straightforward to consider to what class a successful candidate belongs. Fix the qualifications as high as you please; make the examination as stringent as you can. But after this is done, all those who stand the test successfully must, in all fairness, be admitted into the Service, independently of what may be their caste or creed. Objections 7 and 8 are too paltry to be seriously considered. A Government that administers a country of 288 millions of people can surely take the necessary steps to maintain the strictest secrecy about any examination papers. And in regard to the portion conducted *viva voce*, the examiners in England could very well be brought out to India, if only they are adequately remunerated. And such remuneration would be but a trifle to the exchequer of Government. There remains now only objection No. I, and we admit there is some force in it. But the difficulty suggested by it could very well be got over by laying down that all those who pass in India must spend two years at least at an English University. In this way the advantages of residence in England for the successful candidates could be secured with the prevention of all waste of expediture in the case of those that would be unsuccessful. It will thus be seen that the objections to the institution of simultaneous examinations, to which the Commission deemed it proper to give so much weight, are, after all, not such as would, in any way, justify the recommendation of the Commission on the point. Can it be, then, that there was some other reason which influenced the Commissioners in their decision in the matter, but which they deemed it inexpedient and impolitic to openly state? A careful perusal of the portion of the Report dealing with this subject will, we are afraid, leave no doubt in the mind of the reader

that the Commission declared itself against holding simultaneous examinations, not for the reasons which it has ostensibly alleged, but for the fear which it undoubtedly entertained at heart, - that the institution of simultaneous examinations would bring into the Covenanted Civil Service a much larger number of Natives than Sir Charles Aitchinson and his colleagues would like to see. It is, of course, needless to observe that after having declared itself bound by the solemn pledges given to the people of this country in 1833 and 1858, it was clearly the duty of the Commission to disabuse its mind of any such fear and consider the question for the only purpose of determining how best to give full and adequate effect to those pledges. And if the Commission was really afraid that the holding of simultaneous examinations - would bring too many Natives into the Civil Service, it would have been more straightforward on its part to say so distinctly and propose a limit, as was done by some of the witnesses examined by it, beyond which Natives would not be admitted. The Commission might, for instance, have recommended that not more than half ( or we might have been satisfied with even a third ) of the appointments made every year would be given to Natives. But the President of the Commission had already made up his mind on the question and thus the strong, we might even say, unanswerable arguments on the other side were entirely ignored, and in the teeth of all boasted declarations of equality, the Commission approved of the existing system, which requires Indian candidates to go at a very early age "to a distant country, where they are exposed to many temptations and where sufficient supervision may not be exercised over them " for the purpose of passing a very hard competitive examination so that they may be declared qualified for the Civil Service of their own country. All practical considerations, such as the enormous expense required to train up Indian youths in England, the risk to

their health owing to their stay in a strange, distant country, the great risk of failure and such others—considerations which, in the words of the Commission itself, “practically have the effect of a race disqualification,” were quietly ignored and thus the greatest hope of those who had hailed the appointment of the Commission was dashed to the ground!

In the next number, we will deal with the scheme recommended by the Commission “to do full justice to the claims of Natives of India to higher and more extensive employment in the Public Service,” and the transformation it underwent at the hands of the Government of India and the Secretary of State. Meanwhile it is only fair to observe that in one respect, viz., in regard to its recommendation about the age limits for the competitive examination, the Commission has deserved well of the public. The Commission recommended “unanimously and strongly” that the maximum age limit for candidates appearing for the Civil Service examination should be raised again to 23. We have already stated that this was the limit originally fixed by Lord Macaulay’s committee, and that it had been gradually brought down to 19. Of course it must not be forgotten that the restoration of the old limit is not an unmixed blessing to the Native candidate. The competition will now be much harder; English youths who have won honours at Oxford or Cambridge will perhaps appear in the field. But on the whole, the Native candidate is a gainer by the new arrangement. With 19, as the maximum age-limit, it was almost impossible for him to compete successfully. With the limit standing at 23, the chances are comparatively better, though only comparatively so.

---

# NOTICE.

---

A desire has been expressed by several European and Native well-wishers of the Poona Sarvajanic Sabha that its proceedings should be published regularly in the form of a quarterly publication so as to be easily available for purposes of reference. The Managing Committee of the Sabha have accordingly resolved to try the experiment of such a periodical publication of the proceedings of the Sabha. Besides publishing the proceedings, it is proposed to take advantage of such a publication to insert independent communication, reviewing and discussing the more important political questions of the day. There are many topics upon which public opinion has to be created and formed before any formal action can be taken in respect of them by the Sabha. Such topics will find a fitting place in the independent section of the proposed Quarterly Journal.

The services of a competent Editor have been secured and contributions have been promised by many writers of established reputation.

The Journal will consist of about 48 pages royal octavo to be priced at four rupees per annum to be paid in advance or one rupee and a half for each separate number, besides postage charges, and it will be published in the months of July, October, January and April.

As the Sabha has undertaken this work at considerable risk and expense and as the publication will supply a long-felt want, the Managing Committee of the Sabha trust that the public and the Princes and Chiefs in India will give their most cordial support to the scheme.

Names of intending subscribers can be registered at the office of the Sarvajanic Sabha.

All communications should be addressed to the undersigned

S. H. SATHE,  
*Hon. Secretary, Poona Sarvajanic Sabha.*

THE  
QUARTERLY JOURNAL

OF THE

POONA SARVADANIK SABHA.

VOL. XV. ]

APRIL 1893.

[ NO. 4.

UNDER THE AUSPICIUMS OF THE MANAGING COMMITTEE.

EDITED BY

G. K. GOSSALE, B. A.

POONA.

PRINTED AT THE "DINESH PRakash" PRESS.

All Rights Reserved.]

1893.

[Price Rs. 1-8.

## ACKNOWLEDGMENT.

January 1893.

Receipt  
Nos.

		Rs. As.
1	R. S. Mahadeo Shridhar Kulkarni ...	9—4
2	Private Secretary to His Excellency the Viceroy ...	4—4
3	R. S. Karbhari Sanwastan Jamkhendi ...	8—8
4	His Highness The Chief of Ichalkaranji ...	1—8
5	K. B. Monvi Mahamed Ali Hyderabad ...	8—8
6	K. B. Bamanji Ednlji Modi ...	4—4
7	Mr. Rajnna Liuga ...	4—0

---

40—4

February 1893.

8	R. S. Shridhar Nerher Kulkarni ...	8—8
9	R. S. Vittalrao Narayan Natu... ..	8—0
10	R. S. Krishnarao Vinayek Shurangpani... ..	12—12
11	R. S. Narayan Balkrishna Godbole ...	4—0
12	Balaji Sudashiv Barionikar Esqr ...	8—8

---

41—12

March 1893.

13	R. S. Vinayek Mahadeo Pandit ..	4—4
14	R. B. M. Visweswaraya ...	4—0
15	K. B. Kersetji Rastauji ...	4—4
16	Dr. Pandurang Gopal... ..	4—4
17	R. S. Ramchandra Vittai Vyas... ..	5—0

---

21—12

April 1893.

18	R. S. Gopalrao Vishambhar Gayatonde ...	8—8
19	R. S. Haridas Vibaredas ...	4—4
20	R. B. Chunilal Maniklal ...	4—4
21	R. B. Ganesh Krishna Apto ...	4—4
22	R. B. Vinayakrao Narayan Bhagvat ...	20—12
23	R. S. Hariprasad Santookram Desai ...	8—8
24	Annaji Keshav Esqr... ..	4—4
25	R. S. Balkrishna Atmaram Gupte ...	4—4
26	The Darbar Office Baroda State... ..	187—8
27	R. S. Swamirao Nerher ...	8—8
28	R. S. Nerbhiram Raghunathdas ...	8—8
29	R. S. Chintaman Anant Paranjpe ...	8—8
30	Reporter on the Native Press ...	4—4

---

285—4



## CONTENTS.

### Proceedings of the Sabha :—

- I. Election of the Hon'ble Sir W. Wedderburn Bart to the British Parliament.
- II. The representations to the Government of Bombay regarding the New Council's Act of 1892, No. 37 of 1893.
- III. " No. 162 of 1893.
- IV. " No. 163 of 1893.
- V. " A representation by a public Meeting.

### Independent Section :—

- I. The Exigencies of Progress in India.
- II. The Census Report of 1891 of the Bombay Presidency.

# THE POONA SARVAJANIK SABHA.

Established for representing the wants and wishes of the inhabitants of the Deccan, being appointed on a popular elective system under rules framed for the purpose.

WALEKAR'S WADA, DANE ALL

## LIST OF OFFICERS.

### President

H. H. Shrinivas Rao Parasbram Pandit alias Rao Sahab  
Pant Pratinidhi, Chief of Oandha.

### Vice-Presidents.

H. H. Dhundiraj Chintaman alias Tatya Sahab Patwardhan, Chief of Sangli.	H. H. Gunpatrao Harihar alias, Bapu Sahab Patwardhan, young- er Chief of Kurundwad.
H. H. Mudhojirao Naik Nimbalkar, Chief of Falton.	H. H. Hariharrao Vinayak alias Daji Sahab Patwardhan, Chief of Kurundwad.
H. H. Ramachandrarao Gopal alias Appa Sahab Patwardhan, Chief of Jamkhindi.	H. H. Toolajee Raje Bhoale Chief of Aalkote.

### MANAGING COMMITTEE FOR 1892-93.

*Chairman*—RAO BAHADUR VISHNU MORESHWAR BHIDE.

*Members of the Managing Committee.*

R. B. Ganesh Govind Gokhale.	Waman Vishnu Lole Esqr.
R. B. Narayan Bhai Dandekar.	Mahomed Sidik Esqr.
R. S. Chintamanrao V. Natu.	Dorabjee Dadabhoy Butce Esqr.
R. S. Balwantrao Bapuji Phadke.	Gangaram Bhau Mhaske Esqr.
R. S. Madhavrao S. Vaidya.	Rajanna Lingoo Esqr.
R. S. Naro Bhaskar Dewdhar.	Vishnudas Harikisondas Esqr.
R. S. Damodar J. Gokhale.	Sakharam R. Joshi Esqr.
R. S. Sadashiv R. Medatkar.	Bhaskar R. Sahaarabudho Esqr.
R. B. Koopuswami Vijayarungam.	Wasudeo L. Athawale Esqr.
Professor Bal Gangadhar Tilak.	Nathamal Bharmal Esqr.
" Gopal Krishna Gokhale.	R. S. Waman Prabbakar Bhave.
Govind M. Gadre Esqr.	Vinayak Narayen Apte Esqr.
R. S. Raghonath Daji Nagarkar.	Waman Balkrishna Ranade Esqr.
Krishnarao B. Mande Esqr.	R. S. Sitaram Hari Chiplonkar.
Govind Ballal Deval Esqr.	Shivram Hari Sathe Esquire.
Ramchandra M. Sane Esqr.	Raghunath Narayen Pandit. Esqr.

### Treasurer.

R. S. CHINTAMANRAO VISHWANATH ALIAS BHAI SAHAB NATU.

### Auditor.

GOVIND MAHADEO GADRE ESQR.

NARAYENRAO CHINTAMAN FADTARE ESQR.

### Honorary Secretaries.

PROFESSOR GOPAL KRISHNA GOKHALE B. A.

SHIVRAM HARI SATHE ESQR.

# PROCEEDINGS OF THE SABHA.

---

## ELECTION OF THE HON'BLE SIR W. WEDDERBURN BART TO THE BRITISH PARLIAMENT.

---

23rd March 1893,

9, Ovington Gardens S. W.

DEAR SIR,

Will you kindly convey to the Poona Sarvajanic Sabha my best thanks for their kind Telegram of congratulation on my entrance into the House of Commons. It is a real pleasure to receive on such an occasion an expression of sympathy from such old and valued friends.

Yours sincerely

To

(Sd.) W. WEDDERBURN

The Chairman Poona-Sarvajanic Sabha.

---

SARVAJANIK SABHA ROOMS,

Poona, 5th April 1893,

To

SIR W. WEDDERBURN BART. M. P.

LONDON.

Hon'ble Sir,

We, the members of the Poona Sarvajanic Sabha, respectfully crave permission to offer you our most sincere congratulations on your election to Parliament. This happy event has been the occasion of great national rejoicing in this country and we can only here attempt to give expression, however weak and inadequate, to this universal feeling of satisfaction.

Your long and memorable connection with Poona, and the warm interest which you always took in the welfare of the people of the Deccan and in the work of this Sabha, make it a doubly pleasing duty to address this letter to you. It

is a melancholy fact that the spirit of sympathy with Native aspirations, which used to characterize Civilians of the old school, is now growing perceptibly less every day, and it is therefore but natural that in these times, our minds should often turn to one who in his time represented the old spirit in a most conspicuous manner and whose noble personality was not without influence in raising the traditions of the Bombay Service.

In an address which we had the honour of presenting to you in 1889, when you were kind enough to pay a flying visit to this city after the fifth session of the Indian National Congress, we had observed as follows;—"The Sabha ventures to express its devout hope that the electors of North Ayrshire will do themselves the honour of electing you as their representative in the House of Commons, and thereby also confer a great obligation on the people of India. It is true that inside Parliament or outside it, your enthusiasm and earnestness for our welfare will be the same. But by your return to the House of Commons, the Indian Party in Parliament, which you have yourself for many years nobly and strenuously striven to form will be a living and flourishing organization, rendering services to India as nobody of men have hitherto rendered." What it did not please North Ayrshire to do, Banffshire has done and with two trusty Champions of her cause in Parliament as Mr. Dadabhai Naoroji and yourself India must be peculiarly unfortunate, if her grievances fail to attract greater attention from the legislators and the British public. Trusting that you will be long spared to add to the many claims which you already have on the gratitude of the people of India.

We beg to remain,

Hon'ble Sir,

(Sd.) V. M. BHIDE,

Chairman Sarvajanic Sabha.

(Sd.) G. K. GOKHALE

(Sd.) S. H. SATHE

Honorary Secretaries, Sarvajanic Sabha, Poona.

No. 37 of 1893.

SARVAJANIK SABHA ROOMS,

Poona 4th April 1893,

To

The Secretary to the Government of Bombay

Legislative Department

BOMBAY,

Sir,—We have been directed by the Managing Committee of the Poona Sarvajanik Sabha to submit, for the consideration of His Excellency the Governor in Council, the following observations on the Notification and Rules published by Government with a view to give effect to the regulations, made by H. E. the Governor-General in Council, under Section 1 of the Indian Councils' Act of 1892, for the Presidency of Bombay. These rules have created such an intense feeling, of disappointment and dissatisfaction among the higher and more intelligent classes in all parts of the Deccan districts, that the Sabha feels it would be wanting in its duty to Government if it refrained from giving expression to this general feeling, even though it is afraid that the publication of these rules as the final orders of Government on the subject makes the chances of a modification of them rather remote. But whether the observations of the Sabha lead to any practical action on the part of Government or not, the Sabha deems it to be its plain duty to protest strongly against the extremely unfair manner in which the eight seats thrown open to election have been allotted.

2. At the outset, the Sabha must record its humble but emphatic protest against the manner in which the notification under consideration has been published as containing the final orders of Government in the matter. Whatever reasons of State policy might have led the Government of India and the Secretary of State to publish their regulations without previously furnishing an opportunity to the people of this country to express their views in regard to them, they could not in any way hold good in respect of these subsidiary rules which were left practically to the discretion of the local Government. A proper exercise of that discretion made it incumbent upon the local Government under standing orders of the Government of India in the Legislative Department, in the first instance to publish the rules in draft-form, and not confirm them until some time was allowed to the public concerned to submit their

views in regard to them for the information of Government. And the remarks made last month by H. E. the Viceroy in concluding his speech on this subject in the Supreme Legislative Council had naturally led the public to expect that such an opportunity would be allowed to them. The disappointment caused by the action of Government in this respect is greatly increased by the fact that the resolution of 30th March last gives no indication of the reasons why the usual practice followed in respect of all rules framed to give effect to statutory powers vested in Government has been departed from on this most important occasion.

3. The distribution of the additional councillorships proposed to be effected under these rules will in a general view, give two seats to Sindh, one seat to Guzerat with Tanna and Kolaba, one to the whole Deccan, one to the Carnatic with a portion of the Konkan, and three to the Town and island of Bombay. Regarded from another point of view, the distribution has been made as follows:—The European mercantile community will have two seats; the Deccan Sardars and the Sindh Zamindars will have one seat each; the general community of Bombay will have one seat; the Senate of the Bombay University will have one seat; the town population in the Northern Division will have one seat; and the rural population in the Southern Division will have one seat. The rural and urban interests in Sindh and the Central Division, the rural interests in the Northern Division and the urban interests in the Southern Division will thus be wholly unrepresented. Judging, therefore, of the arrangements proposed, from the stand-point of territorial division, as also from the point of view of the interests represented, these arrangements lack all the elements of fairness and justice, and are inconsistent with the speech made in Poona by H. E. the Viceroy last year, in reply to an address from the Poona Municipality. On that occasion his Excellency observed:—“ We are at this moment in correspondence with the Secretary of State as to the rules and regulations to be issued under the new Act, and it would obviously be improper for me to offer you a premature announcement of our intentions: but I may without indiscretion tell you that we are in agreement with you upon one of the most important principles involved, and that we hope to be able, in accordance with your suggestion, to recognise the urban and the rural boards in the several provinces of India, as units for the selection of some proportion of the non-official

members of the reformed councils." It would appear from this that his Excellency then concurred in the view that for the purpose of ascertaining the wishes and opinions of the general public it was necessary to give substantial representation to rural and urban boards. The notification under consideration, however, leaves out of account entirely the rural boards of Sindh and Northern and Southern Divisions and the urban boards of Sindh and Central and Southern Divisions.

4. The following comparative statistics regarding the area, population, and revenue, both provincial and local, of the several divisions, will bring out the disparity noticed above in greater relief. The Central Division has thrice the area of the Northern, and over fifty per cent. more area than the Southern Division. The area in Sindh is considerable, but its population is only about twenty-eight lacks, while the population in the Northern, Central, and Southern Divisions is respectively about 44, 61, and 44 lacks. The number of villages and towns is again the largest in the Central Division, being twice those in Sindh or those in the Northern Division. As regards land revenue, Sindh shows a revenue of 92 lacks, the Southern Division 100 lacks, the Northern 220 lacks, and the Central 133 lacks. The gross revenue in the several divisions is also nearly in the same proportion. The number of civil subdivisions and of the Police and Magistracy have the same preponderance in the Central over those in the other Divisions. The figures of local funds and Municipal revenues, as given in the Administration Report for 1891-92 for the several Divisions are as follows:—The Northern Division, local funds 13 lacks, Municipal revenue 15 lacks; the Central Division, local funds  $14\frac{1}{2}$  lacks, Municipal revenue  $12\frac{1}{4}$  lacks; the Southern Division, local funds 11 lacks, the Municipal revenue  $5\frac{1}{4}$  lacks; and Sindh, local funds 8 lacks and Municipal revenue 10 lacks. It will be seen from these details that the Central Division is the largest of all in area, population, and revenue, and is besides, in point of education, the most advanced part of the Presidency outside the Town and island of Bombay, and no arrangement, therefore, which ignores the claims of this Division can claim to be just. It will be seen that in point of magnitude of the interest involved, Sindh stands last among the several Divisions and any arrangement which places it over other Divisions, cannot but be regarded as one-sided and defective. The Sabha requests that in consideration of the facts set forth above, Government will be

pleased to reconsider the distribution with a view to the assignment to the several divisions of their proper share in the representation of additional members in the reformed Councils.

5. The regulations appear to contemplate a reserve of three non-official seats besides the eight to be filled by election, and these three seats would appear to be reserved to protect the interests of minorities, and to be filled by Government by representative nomination. The arrangements proposed, however, give more than half of the available election seats to the minorities, and even these are given to minorities who are very small fractions of their own classes. This is a most important defect in the proposed arrangements. The Chamber of Commerce, at Bombay and Karachi, instead of being clubbed together, get two independent seats. Although these Chambers contain a very small minority of native merchants, the overwhelming majority is distinctly European; and thus practically these two seats have been given exclusively to the European mercantile community. As representatives of trade, these Chambers should have been joined together with the Mill-Owners' Association and the piecegoods merchants of Bombay, but the native traders and manufacturers are shut out altogether and have been left voiceless as before, while the European merchants who are well able to take care of themselves and their interests get two out of the eight election seats.

6. In a similar manner, the Sardars in the Deccan, as also the Zamindars in Sindh, are very small minorities, and yet they get two out of the eight election seats. Taking the Sardars of the Deccan by themselves, it should be noted that all the more important among them are rulers of Native States not paying any taxes, nor subject to the laws of the Presidency. There are, besides, in the list what are known as red-ink Sardars, who possess no special claim for recognition. There are many landowners, such as the Inamdars in the Deccan, and Carnatic, &c., the Talukdars in Guzerat, and the Khots in the Konkan districts, who have better claims to be allowed to represent the landed interest; but all these are shut out by these new rules. As regards the Sindh Zamindars, many of them are involved in debt and are not known to be the best representatives of landed interest in their part of the country. In fact, there is not even an authorized list available to show the strength of their body. The Sabha, under these circumstances, feels itself at a loss to understand the principle on



which undefined and small classes out of these minorities have been deemed worthy of representing the landed interest in the Council. Properly speaking, the Chambers of Commerce and the privileged classes should have been provided for with one seat each, distributed alternately, so as to secure a representation in turns of these interests. The more than double share of representation allotted to them largely encroaches upon the legitimate expectations of the bulk of the population, whose interests are chiefly involved in the work entrusted by law to the reformed Councils. The bulk of the population can only be fairly represented by persons recommended by Local and Municipal Boards, and at least four seats, one for each division, to be filled alternately by electoral colleges of Municipal and Local Boards' representatives, should have been allowed, if justice was intended to be done to these interests. Looking to its area and population and revenue, the Central Division is fairly entitled to claim two seats for itself; and certainly at least one seat should have been allotted to it. The present arrangement denies to it all representation whatsoever, and as long as this anomaly remains uncorrected, the new arrangements can never give satisfaction to the general public, nor can Government be said to have made earnest attempt to give real representation to the people.

7. The rules already notified by Government will have to be supplemented by further rules as the instructions regarding the procedure for selection are not laid down with sufficient fullness and detail for practical purposes. Government itself is aware of this necessity, and has notified to the local authorities concerned that it awaits their full reports before taking action. Elections without contests can hardly fail to be other than unnecessary formalities, and the large share assigned to the commissioners and agents in the regulation of these elections will, the Sabha is afraid, interfere seriously with that freedom of choice in the electors which is so essential to make elections real. The Sabha, therefore, submits that even at the risk of delaying the elections for a few months, these subsidiary rules of procedure might be further revised and amplified, and published in draft form before they are put into operation.

8. The administration of this Presidency has always been noted for its liberal spirit, especially in the matter of Local Self-Government. The Local Self-Government Acts in this Presidency

are in many respects more liberal than any of those in other parts of India. The Sabha, therefore, notes with regret that in this higher sphere of Local Self-Government this old tradition has been departed from to an extent which makes the rules and regulations in this Presidency more one-sided and illiberal than those adopted in other parts of India. In Bengal and the North-West Provinces the maximum number of additional members has been allowed by the local Governments there, and if the newspaper reports may be believed, the Madras Government also has resolved to secure a full Council of twenty-five members. In this Presidency the number has been restricted without any reasons being assigned for the step. Moreover, in most of the other Presidencies, at least, half the recommendation seats has been allotted to the representatives of Local and Municipal Boards, while in this Presidency, as shown above, a much smaller portion has been so allotted, and the interests of the minorities have been provided for by assigning to them double their proper number of seats. The Sabha, therefore, trusts that on a fuller consideration of these points, and with the example of the other Presidencies before them, the authorities here will also feel disposed to redress the inequalities complained of above.

9. A fair redistribution of seats will be secured by the following arrangements :—

- (1.) One seat to the Bombay Municipal Corporation.
- (2.) One to the University.
- (3.) One to the Chambers of Commerce in Bombay and Karachi clubbed together, or in alternate turns. The native merchants and manufacturers, persons paying a certain minimum of income-tax, should be joined with the Chambers in an electoral college in proportion to the interest of trade represented by them.
- (4.) The Sardars and the landed gentry, owners of entire villages of incomes over Rs. 1,000 a year, should be clubbed together or allowed to select, in alternate turns, one representative.
- (5.) The remaining four recommendation seats should be filled by Local and Municipal Boards, electors alternately, so as to have always two urban and two rural members for the four divisions.

(6.) Besides the eight recommendation seats, three more seats should be filled by Government by representative nomination of minority interests.

10. The actual elections need not be held simultaneously in all the divisions, and whenever the elections take place, they should be held under the superintendence of an officer unconnected with the District Executive administration. The Under-Secretary in the Legislative Department should have the superintendence of these elections. Such a unity of control will facilitate work, prevent friction, and enable Government to ascertain the real wishes of the electors with a freedom which the agency proposed by Government will never be able to secure.

11. The Sabha submits these suggestions to Government with a full consciousness of its responsibility in this matter. The difficulties are undoubtedly great, but they have been unnecessarily aggravated by the one-sided procedure adopted and given effect to in these rules. Should the Government unfortunately feel not inclined to reconsider these rules at an early date, the exclusion of the general public of the Central Division from all share in the proposed representation would be a permanent and unmerited reflection on their intelligence and public spirit, and would prejudicially affect their interest to a serious extent.

We have the honor to be,

Sir,

Your most obedient servants.

(Sd.) S. H. SATHE,

(Sd.) G. K. GOKHALE,

Hon. Secretaries, Sarvajanic Sabha, Poona.

No. 162 of 1893.

SARVAJANIK SABHA ROOMS

Poona, 20th April 1893.

To

The Secretary to the Government of Bombay,  
Legislative Department.

Sir,

In continuation of our letter No. 37 dated 6th April 1893, we have been directed by the Managing Committee of the Poona Sarvajanik Sabha to request the attention of Government to the fact that since the letter of the Sabha, referred to above, was addressed to Government, public meetings, attended by all classes of the community, have been held in Poona, Satara and Ahmadnagar to consider the rules recently promulgated by Government under the Indian Councils' Act of 1892, and that at these meetings, respectful but emphatic protests were recorded against the exclusion of the Central Division from all participation in the representation allowed to the various parts of the Presidency under the Act in the local Legislative Council. These meetings and others which are likely to follow, will leave no doubt in the mind of Government that the feeling of dissatisfaction occasioned by the rules is not confined to one place or one section of the community, but is shared by all classes in the whole of the Central Division.

2. The Committee of the Sabha would respectfully ask Government to note that all other local Governments have allotted *four* out of the recommendation seats at their disposal, to the Municipal and Local Boards in their Provinces, whereas it is only in the Presidency of Bombay that five seats have been considered sufficient to adequately represent the rural and urban interests of the general community. This comparison becomes all the more unfavourable to this Province, when it is remembered that while the Government of India have allowed 8 recommendation-seats to Bombay, only 7 such seats have been allowed in the case of Bengal and Madras, and only six for the N. W. Provinces. Government would thus see that in the case of the other Provinces, the number of seats assigned to electoral colleges of Municipal and Local Boards is more than half the total number thrown open to election, whereas in this Presidency this proportion is only one-fourth. The

object of the Indian Councils' Act of 1892, as explained in Parliament by leading statesmen of both parties, as also by His Excellency the Viceroy in some of his speeches in this country last year, was undoubtedly to secure the interests of the general public of each Province by giving substantial representation to Municipal and Local Boards and the Committee of the Sabha regret to observe that the rules of the Bombay Government are much less calculated to attain this object than those of the other Governments.

3. It would appear from some of the comments in the English Press that the observations in the last letter of the Committee in regard to the Sardars of the Deccan have been, to some extent, misunderstood in certain quarters. It is an entire misapprehension of the Sabha's position to say that it in any way regrets the representation that has been allotted to these Sardars by these rules. All that the Sabha contends for is that the distribution of the eight recommendation seats has been so made as to trench on the claims and disappoint the legitimate expectations of the general public of the Central Division, and that the nominees of the Sardars cannot, in any way, be regarded as representing the rural and urban interests of this Division. An analysis of the lists of the Deccan Sardars, published officially in October last, shows that more than one third of these—including again almost all the more influential of them—reside outside the Central Division. Under these circumstances, it cannot, in fairness, be urged by Government that the person returned by the constituency of the Sardars would also be a representative of the general public of the Central Division. The Committee may mention that a large number of these Sardars belong to the Southern division, and yet Government have been pleased to assign one member to the Local Boards of that Division.

4. Government may have noted that a question has been raised in some quarters about the legality of forming two separate constituencies under head D of the clause II. of the regulations of the Government of India about the Presidency of Bombay. The words used by the Supreme Government in that clause are "The Sardars of the Deccan or such other class of large landholders" and it is argued that the local Government could form only one constituency under head D, viz. that of the Deccan Sardars or of such other Zamindars, and that the regulations of the Supreme Government in question do not empower the Government of

Bombay to form *both Sardars and Zamindars* into two *separate* constituencies. The Sabha is inclined to think that there is considerable force in this contention. Should the legal advisers of Government concur in this view, the Sabha would suggest that the constituency of the Sardar should be retained under head D, and that the seat at present allotted to the Zamindars of Sindh should be assigned to the Municipal and Local Boards of that Division. Further, by grouping together the Chambers of Commerce of Bombay and Karachi, or by giving them a seat alternately, one more seat would become available to Government, which Government might very well assign to the Local and Municipal Boards of the Central Division. And in this way, the allotment of the Bombay Government to Municipal and Local Boards would come up to the standard of the other Local Governments.

5. Another point in which the rules of the other Provinces appear to advantage compared with the Bombay rules, is that in their case provision has been made for alternate elections in the several Divisions by the Electoral Colleges of Municipal and Local Boards. The Bombay scheme is decidedly defective in so far as it does not contemplate such alternate elections, and the Sabha therefore requests that steps will be taken to remove this defect, and thereby to secure in an equal degree the representation of rural and urban interests of each Division.

6. In conclusion, the Committee of the Sabha would respectfully request that His Excellency the Governor will be pleased to receive, through the Sabha, a small deputation of one or two representatives from each of the six Districts of the Central Division, so as to enable the people of these Districts to lay their case personally before His Excellency. Should His Excellency be pleased to entertain this humble proposal of the Sabha favourably, steps would at once be taken by the Sabha to bring together and keep such a deputation in readiness to wait on His Excellency at such a time and place as His Excellency might be pleased to appoint.

We have the honour to be,

Sir,

Your Most obedient Servants.

(Sd.) S. H. SATHE.

(Sd.) G. K. GOKHALE,

Hon. Secretaries, Sarvajanic Sabha, Poona.

No. 163 of 1893.

Sarvajanik Sabha Rooms

Poona, 2nd May 1893.

To,

The Secretary to the Government of Bombay,

Legislative Department.

Sir,— In continuation of our letter No. 162, dated 20th April, 1893, we have been directed by the managing committee of the Poona Sarvajanik Sabha to submit for the consideration of Government the following additional points in connection with the rules promulgated by Government in March last, under the Indian Councils' Act of 1892.

(2) Since—those rules were published, the Sabha has made careful enquiries about the status and position of the zamindars in Sindh, and about their fitness to properly exercise the franchise conferred upon them by Government. These inquiries show :—

(a) That there are about three hundred zamindars, who belong to the first and second class and pay Rs. 1,000 and more by way of assessment.

(b) That they are scattered all over the province, the largest number being, however, found chiefly in Upper Sindh.

(c) That most of these superior zamindars have been for a long time so involved in debt, that two special Relief Acts have been passed for their benefit and a special officer has been appointed to administer this relief.

(d) That in spite of the relief thus given to a considerable portion of these zamindars by the Sindh Encumbered Estates Acts (XIV. of 1876 and XX. of 1881), they have again involved themselves in debts.

(e) That among them, there are not more than four or five who understand English, that the general level of their attainments is not very high, and that none of them possess sufficient education to intelligently follow the proceedings of the Legislative Council.

(f) That no zamindar would care to come forward to seek the suffrages of the members of his class, and that none of them would care to take the trouble of coming all the way to Bombay or Poona to attend meetings of the Legislative Council.

(g) And that as a class, the zamindars are not in a position to appreciate the privilege conferred upon them by Government.

Under these circumstances it appears to the Sabha that the Municipal and Local Boards of Sindh would make a better constituency than the zamindars and would exercise the franchise in a more satisfactory manner. The Karachi Chamber of Commerce, as pointed out in the memorial submitted by the Bombay public on the subject of these rules, is a small body, consisting of only thirty-one mercantile houses, out of which again sixteen are branches of Bombay firms. This circumstance strengthens the reasonableness of the request made by the Sabha that this Chamber should, for purposes of representation, be associated with the Bombay Chamber. The seat which would thus become available, should be assigned to the Central Division. Should the Government, however, deem it necessary to give separate representation to the Karachi Chamber, the Government could easily do it by giving to that body one of the nomination seats at their disposal.

(4) Since the date of our last memorial further, meetings have been held in Dhulia, Nasik, Sholapur, and also in Bombay, and memorials from these places have been addressed to Government. These memorials will, the Sabha hopes, satisfy Government that the representations made by it on this subject are fully supported by the intelligent public of the entire Central Division, as also by the people of Bombay. Both the Anglo-Indian and Native Press have expressed views to the same effect. The Sabha is aware of the difficult nature of the responsibility placed on Government, but it hopes to have made out a case that, even within the restricted limits for choice laid down, it is possible to arrange the distribution in a more fair and reasonable manner. The Sabha, therefore, requests that Government will be pleased to reconsider their scheme, and obtain additional powers, if necessary, so as to remove all cause for complaint in this matter.

We have the honour to be,

Sir,

Your most obedient servants

(Sd.) G. K. GOKHALE,

(Sd.) S. H. SATHE,

Hon. Secretary, Sarvajanik Sabha, Poona.

---



**A MEMORIAL TO THE GOVERNMENT OF BOMBAY  
REGARDING THE NEW COUNCILS' ACT OF 1892.**

---

At a largely attended public Meeting of the inhabitants of the City and Cantonment of Poona held under the auspices of the Poona Sarvajanic Sabha on 9th April 1893, the following Memorial was unanimously adopted. Rao Bahadur Narayan Bhai Dandekar was in the chair -

To,

HIS EXCELLENCY THE RIGHT HON'BLE

LORD HARRIS

Governor of Bombay.

My Lord,

We, the people of the City and Cantonment of Poona, in public meeting assembled, respectfully crave leave to submit, for your Lordship's favourable consideration, this memorial regarding the rules recently promulgated by the Bombay Government to give effect to the Indian Councils' Act of 1892 for the Bombay Presidency and trust that your Lordship will be pleased to reconsider them in the light of the criticism passed on them on all sides since their publication, so as to remove the intense feeling of dissatisfaction to which their one-sided and unfair character has given rise.

2. It is a matter for great regret that in this instance your Lordship's Government did not follow the usual course of publishing the rules in draft form before their final adoption, so as to allow time to the people to represent their views and opinions in regard to them to Government. Had this course been followed, we are inclined to think that matters would have taken a more satisfactory turn.

3. The people of Poona fail to understand on what principle the general public of the Central Division have been excluded from all share in the representation allowed under the Indian Councils Act of 1892 to the various part of the presidency in the Local Legislative Council. In point of area, population and revenue the Central Division is the most important in the Presidency, and

after the town and island of Bombay, it is also admittedly the most advanced in point of education. Any scheme, therefore, which ignores the claims of the Central Division, while recognizing those of others, is so obviously objectionable that it is impossible to understand how, Government could have failed to see this before the publication of the rules. The interests represented by the Central Division are so large, that it would have been but just, if two out of the eight seats thrown open to election, had been assigned to the rural and urban boards of this Division. Government, therefore, might well conceive the bitterness of the disappointment of the general public of this Division at their being totally excluded from all representation in the Council.

4. It might perhaps be urged that the Central Division would be, to some extent, represented by the nominee of the Sardars of the Deccan. But a little consideration will show that this can not be the case. There are, in this class, some who represent the traditions of the old aristocracy of the land. But under the altered circumstances of the times, they can not be taken to represent the *varied rural and urban* interests of the general community of this Division. Some of the Sardars besides do not even belong to this Division; therefore the people of the Division can not be expected to be satisfied if they are told that the nominee of the Sardars would represent their interests.

5. The people of Poona would also take this opportunity to point out to your Lordship, the extremely unfair nature of the distinction made by these rules between Native and European merchants. The Chambers of Commerce of Bombay and Karachi are practically associations of English merchants. Both these bodies have been allowed one representative each in the Local Legislative Council. While the European Mercantile community in this presidency have thus secured two of the eight recommendation seats, the claims of Native Mercantile Associations, such as the Bombay Mill-owners' Association have, we regret to say, been completely ignored.

6. Your Lordship may be aware how the Government of Madras, Bengal and North West Provinces, have framed their rules in this matter, and how these rules are conceived in a more liberal spirit, and are more sympathetic with the general aspirations of the people than those promulgated by your Lordship's Govern-

ment. All these Governments have allowed the maximum number of additional members, and have besides taken care to see that no part of their provinces is shut out from its just share of representation. It is a matter of deep regret to us that in both these respects the Bombay Government compares very unfavourably with these other Governments.

7. My Lord, it used hitherto to be the pride of the Government of this Presidency that in matters of this kind it was always in advance of the rest of the country. And the people of this Presidency too participated to some extent in that feeling. All that, however, appears now to have been changed. It would be a grave public misfortune, if the spirit of distrust exhibited in this instance were to continue to sway the policy of Government. We therefore respectfully but most earnestly appeal to your Lordship to reconsider these rules and—

(a) Give at least one representative to the Municipal and Local Boards of the Central Division.

(b) Allow the maximum number of additional members as has been done by the Government of Madras, Bengal and North West Provinces.

(c) And do away with the distinction between Native and European merchants, by forming an Electoral College for the mercantile community to which members should be returned by all mercantile Associations, native as well as European, in proportion to the interest of trade represented by them.

Wishing your Lordship long life and prosperity,

We beg to remain,

My Lord,

Your Lordship's most obedient humble servants.

(Sd.) N. B. DANDEKAR  
Chairman of the Public Meeting  
and other inhabitants of the City  
and Cantonment of Poona.

(Sd) V. M. BHIDE  
Chairman Sarvajanic Sabha,  
Poona.

## THE EXIGENCIES OF PROGRESS IN INDIA.

Nations like individuals are generally the architects of their own fortune. Alike in the lives of individuals and of multitudes, we observe that past habits and present fortunes bear the relation of cause and effect, and that reward and retribution follow human action with unerring sequence. "Nations and individuals," says Professor Froude, "have the same responsibilities. Those who are frugal, pure, honest, and industrious, are inwardly happy, and outwardly prosperous. Those who follow pleasure, power, wealth, and luxury, are brought to account one way or another, and made to know that they have missed the road." The worth of a nation is the sum and reflex of the collective energy and industry of its constituent individuals. Occasionally a country may secure a fortuitous ascendancy; geographical situation and physical resources may give its fortunes a passing impetus; but true progress and uninterrupted prosperity must have a surer basis, resting on the character and capacity of the people themselves. The exigencies of modern progress are indeed very exacting. A position of prosperity presupposes national prowess, and sustained effort and unsparing activity can alone help a people even to preserve a supremacy already established. Those who strive for success in the field of politics or industries, and who aspire for an honored position in the front rank of civilized communities, must learn to utilize their energies to the best advantage, to move with the times, and to understand the demands of the day. No reliance on mere prestige will avail us in the struggle. Success in unfamiliar pursuits necessitates radical changes in our private lives, and we must release ourselves from traditional constraints which clog reform, and reconcile ourselves to the abandonment of senti-

ments and prejudices which obscure the view and pervert the judgment. Those who aspire for pre-eminence in these days cannot live the life of a sinecure. Unfailing in resource, untrammelled by prejudice, and unremittingly watchful of every passing change, the individual or nation that would succeed, should be ever ready to recognise difficulties as fast as they arise, and ever prompt in applying remedies and adjusting efforts to ever-recurring obstacles. The habits and the practical good sense and activities of a people afford thus a test of their true progress, a criterion of their standing in the scale of civilization. It is our purpose in this article to apply this test to the conditions of Indian life, and to determine in a judicious spirit what constitutes our weakness, and what conditions make for a hopeful estimate of the situation.

We have a record in India of some 50 years of settled rule since the more warlike races submitted to the British domination, and the date from which we can reckon peaceful progress on the lines of modern civilization is more recent still. Progress, as understood in the West, began in this country within the past half a century, and scarcely two generations have elapsed since the system of higher education was introduced into the country, which has enabled us to understand and enter into the spirit of that progress. We now feel that the forces of transition are fully on us, and we open our eyes on a new scene to find ourselves surrounded by conditions hitherto unfamiliar to us, and utterly foreign to our old habits and traditions. In this strange situation, while we clearly see the impossibility of regaining our past independence under conditions which existed at the time of its forfeiture, we are nevertheless beginning to feel that progress of a certain kind is within our reach, and if we only made timely efforts to adapt ourselves to the conditions that have overtaken us, we yet might hope for a bright future, and secure our due share of independence, comfort and

material prosperity, the attainment of which is the goal of all the leading nations of the world. Under these changed conditions the path of progress and prosperity is clear, and we should either follow that path and reap our reward, or neglect our opportunities and abandon ourselves to hopeless debasement in the near future.

Satisfied with our ancient civilization, we have never, in recent history, endeavoured to fall in line with modern progress; nor, but for our education, is it likely that even now we should cherish any new ideal. Our ruin is attributable to our national apathy, lethargy and torpor, the direct result of past isolation and foreign conquests. The active impediments to progress at present are the inquisitorial power of religion, and the overpowering influence of tradition and custom, which have associated the highest ideal of happiness in our minds with in-activity and ease. While the Western nations have striven to develop human energies and powers, and to secure a mastery over physical nature, we have stood before the world with folded hands, a picture of helplessness and despair, lost in dutiful veneration of everything pertaining to the past, and yielding ourselves in placid contentment to the guidance of antiquated usages, and to rules of conduct which regulated social life before the dawn of modern civilization.

The majority of our people have been and are intensely priest-ridden and ritualistic in their religion and sacramental systems of religion have always been inquisitorial in their tendencies. The spirit and essence of true religion have long ceased to wield any leavening influence; we are but the slaves of the forms which custom has petrified. Our professions have long been settled for us, and the minutest detail of life prescribed by tradition. Every man's position in society and in the industrial community is generally inherited by him and it was rank blasphemy, it was against Heaven's ordination to talk of improvement. Exclusiveness and not assimilation has been the rule of life with us. It

is this spirit which has checked intermarriage between castes, and interdining between communities; it is the same feeling which has multiplied to the Hindu the inconvenience of travel and thus strangled enterprise among the intellectual aristocracy of the land. In the social line, too, the effects of ignorance and superstition have been disastrous. Every religious squabble intensifies ancient animosities and divides society and the divisions eventually constitute separate sub-castes. The process of disintegration has gone on unchecked for centuries, till now we have reached a depth and stage where nature itself seems to protest against further transgressions. Witness, for instance, the case of those castes, consisting of a handful of families, their number so limited that unequal marriages are almost the rule, and more often than not, an adult individual has to wait in patience for the birth of a girl in a caste family, before he can qualify for married life. A worse case still is that of certain communities at the foot of the Himalayas, among whom custom assigns a common wife to a family of several brothers.

The popular sentiment in India has all along been opposed to change, adventure or exertion in any untried direction. For centuries, popular belief and aspirations have taken a definite mould, and the regulations of caste have crystallized and the community has lost the capacity of forming new organizations. The masses have been staunch in their allegiance to tradition and custom which have governed their actions or rather their stolid inaction from pre-historic times. People have clung tenaciously to old-world ideas, and independence of thought or action in conflict with the received notions has become foreign to their nature. Such independence was denounced in past times as godlessness and scepticism. It entailed persecution in this life, and endless damnation in the next. There was no incentive to effort and emulation. Superstition indeed promoted the belief that the *Kali-Yug*—the

age in which we live—was one of human and physical deterioration, that perfection was altogether a thing of the past, that the good old times had been left far behind, and were receding from our grasp, and that the cycle of years only hastened the growth of sin and heresy and general decline.

The conflict of views between the western nations and ourselves has been always sharply marked. Whilst the West looks forward to a future of unlimited human development, and trusts to self-help for its attainment, the East regards existence itself as pre-ordained misery, and values all human exertion for the betterment of the race as only doomed to disappointment. The West is practical and optimistic, the East ideal, dreamy, contemplative and pessimistic.

The struggle we have to wage then is against inaction and public apathy, misleading prejudices and conservative traditions. The struggle is disagreeable and at times disheartening, but by courage and perseverance, it should be waged to the bitter end until the Indian races are brought into harmony with their surroundings, and placed in a healthy environment by which progress may be hastened and insured.

And here an enquiry naturally suggests itself into the conditions of this modern progress and into the precise character of the civilization we are exhorted to adopt. Modern civilization is a condition of existence in which every person is ceaselessly striving to improve his station in life, to develop his powers, to raise the standard of his comforts, and as far as he can, with reasonable sacrifices on his part, of the country or nation, with which his personal interests and the welfare of his kindred are in some measure bound up. Romantic sentiment and prejudices of race and birth are entirely subordinated to the attainment of these practical ends, and the physical forces are utilised to the utmost extent to minister to the daily comfort and convenience of man. Modern progress is specially



calculated to develop the practical instincts and practical traits of human character. It is calculated to give one the power of true insight into the actualities of life—the ability to grasp the practical bearing of every question. It enables a sound mind, in short, to see clear, to think straight, and to differentiate dreamy ideals from practical possibilities.

The real standing of a country in the scale of civilization is thus measured by the practical pursuits of its people, the number and magnitude of their callings, their industries, their enterprise, their skill, their ambition and their performances and by the extent to which they employ natural forces as aids to production. Progress is measured by the superiority enjoyed by one nation over another in the arts and reproductive industries of the world.

Science and scientific culture occupies the pedestal of honor, and absorbs the same amount of attention that in the Middle Ages was accorded to chivalry and to religious worship. "Scientific education removes those superstitions and prepossessions which are the fog and pestilence, the mist and malaria of the human mind." The development of science is continuous and its practical results are cumulative ; there is no resting until the ideal industrial epoch is reached, when, according to Ralph Waldo Emerson, the natural forces would be so perfectly harnessed to the use of man that the "farmer would be able to reach his market by hitching his wagon to a star." Scientific culture and industrial training occupy the foremost place in every scheme of national education, since it is such training alone that in the present day is calculated to equip men for the battle of life.

There is no nation in modern Europe, in whose educational system religious instruction occupies any but an inconsiderable place. Civilized Nations are complacently tolerant towards the unbelief and rank heresy which undoubtedly exists in their midst. On this singular aspect of modern civilization, a cynical

writer in a London Weekly thus unburdens himself:—

“Modern civilization is the apotheosis of commerce, the triumph of fact over fiction, of the purely practical, over sentiment. Capital, enter-prise, steam and electricity have deposed the immortal gods. In these high pressure days, human life is estimated as so much mechanical power for the reproduction of wealth. We have no leisure to waste over ideal and sentimental considerations.....Faith is analogous to credulity, and charity is the recognised medium of self-advertisement. Under the new order of things, mankind places no sort of value on any thing, but pounds, shillings and pence, consols, mortgages and debenture stock. All but property is vanity.”

It may not be an unmixed advantage altogether for us to emulate the western nations in their breathless struggle for progress. It may be inadvisable also to assimilate, into our national life, all the questionable blessings of this material civilization. There are those who consider that modern civilization is all a mistake, that human wants and aspirations are needlessly multiplying the growth of artificial habits, and that the increase of luxury and other accompaniments - of national prosperity are a sorry substitute for the sacrifices they involve of the mental rest and tranquil contentment which characterises oriental life. The nations of the East, and the Hindus especially, live simple and sober lives themselves; they are perfectly harmless to others; they share their earnings with their relations, and are disposed to be charitable to man and beast. They regard in fact the support of their indigent and helpless relations and dependents as a social obligation. “Live and let live” is their motto. Western nations, on the other hand are grasping; they are ceaselessly creating new wants which they can well do without, and struggling to satisfy them. There is greed, there is selfishness, there is dissension and disintegration every where. The rich are getting richer, the poor, poorer. The

masses are set against the classes, the subjects against the rulers, the poor against the rich, the labourer against the capitalist. There is an utter absence of cohesion in social and domestic life. Every one lives by himself and, for himself. Woman claims emancipation, and equality with man; the wife claims rights and privileges as against the husband. Party feeling, class bias and self-assertion everywhere have acquired an unheard-of prominence. We have first the individual struggle for existence; next the class struggle; then the race struggle; and lastly of humanity against brute creation. While man is extremely chary of destroying human life, he slaughters numberless animals daily for the sake of his food, and often for mere sport. It is true in oriental countries the masses suffer oppression and petty tyranny from the insolence of arbitrary power, but the brotherly attachment, family affection, faith and romance which ennoble life, are simply priceless and wholly unapproachable as agencies to cheer up existence, by all the solid comforts and appliances of material civilization. In by-gone days, devotion to a cause, religious or social, lent charm to existence, and made slavery itself welcome. The bonds are now loosened, which attached servants to masters, which united sects and creeds in life-long devotion to their religious and secular heads. In modern days we have indeed acquired a certain amount of personal freedom, but the disseverance of the old ties of service and servitude has involved with it the forfeiture of claims to assistance and patriarchal support, and becoming free we are at the same time become forlorn. "I have heard men talk," says the slave in I vanhoe who was set free, and whose beloved master was taken captive, "I have heard men talk of the blessings of freedom, but I wish any wise man would teach me what use to make of it now that I have it." Not all the hardships of past tyranny can compare in intensity with the colossal misery occasioned by the unequal distribution of the

necessaries of life, by the concentration of wealth and property, the legalised slavery of labour to capital, the squalor and suffering from insufficient sustenance, the numberless deaths due to starvation, and the unrecorded suicides brought about by despair and disappointed ambition. Talking of human progress, Professor Froude, whom we have quoted once before, gave expression to somewhat similar views, in a lecture delivered not many months since. He said :—

“It was now seen clearly that each generation was necessarily wiser than the generation preceding, having inherited all that was before, and added its own acquisitions. He could but say it might be so. Indisputably there was progress of a kind, but he was obliged to ask, whither? Progress from what to what? Was it so certain that in things most essential, they were so much wiser than those who went before them? He did not believe that the distribution of the necessaries of life was as unequal as it was at present. Of liberty no doubt there was a great deal more going now than there used to be. In his reading of English history, there was once a warmer relation between high and low, when each class thought more of its duties than its interests, and religion, which was the same to all, was really believed in. Under such conditions equality was natural and wholesome. Human society was in a healthy condition when the wise ruled the ignorant—ruled with equal-handed authority over high and low, rich and poor.”

There is another stand-point from which the present tendencies are criticized by people who regret what they call the decadence of individual character, the disappearance of high emotions in individual life. Life to these seems to be growing extremely flat and tame. There is little heroism, less martyrdom, no poetry and no romance, in the humdrum life of civilized communities. The following extract is an able summary of this view of modern

progress It is taken from an article in the London Spectator, from a recent review published by that paper of a remarkable book by Mr. C. H. Pearson on "National Life and character."

"Mr. Pearson supplements his arguments from the statistics of the race, by a still more discouraging argument from the political and social tendencies of modern democracy, to show that even among the great races themselves, there is a growing tendency to the decay of individual force and the substitution of what we may call a pallid average of humble comfort, and well-to-do secular content, for the great storms and struggles which have produced the highest form of human energy and genius. The State is, he thinks, rapidly taking the place of the church in moulding men's morality up to a certain average decency, a complacency of moral harmlessness. The intenser forms of religion are dying out. Intensity even in the form of Puritanism and Catholic asceticism is disappearing. Literature is more and more descending to the level of commonplace task, and providing for the demands of the vacant minded, rather than the satisfaction of high ideal emotions. The epic and the drama have lost their hold. Even lyric poetry is losing some of its freshness and simplicity. The Novel is more and more taking the place of the higher flights of genius, and even the novel is adapting itself to the tastes of those who like simply to be amused without exerting their minds. Democracy tends to the drilling of the multitude rather than to the elevation of the highest qualities of political and individual life. The force of family ties is sensibly on the wane. The affections are becoming less exacting and more reasonable, but also less romantic. Marriage loses in sacredness as legislation more and more provides alleviations for the wrongs of unhappy ties. Even commercial and industrial individualism flies at less ambitious aims. The tendency of modern society is to substitute a certain

socialistic kind of tame well-being for the greater efforts of adventurous and eager enterprise. On the whole, Mr. Pearson is inclined to expect a higher level of social order, the suppression of violence, more and more tameness of life, governments which succeed best in protecting the poor and extinguishing all crushing misery and destitution; but by way of compensation, far less variety and intensity in human life, a lower class of ambitions, a poorer class of tastes, a lower type of physique, a lower type of energy, less religion, more secular decency, more tepid and placid lives."

It will be thus seen that modern progress has its lights and shades. While we gain advantages in one direction, we are at the same time forfeiting others incidental to that very gain and, though we cannot regard with serene complacency all the changes which progress has brought, we certainly have no cause to regret the change as a whole. Motion and change are the law of the universe, and every change brings both good and evil with it. It is vain search that would discover unmixed good in this imperfect world. And what after all is perfection? It certainly is not existence where all is ease and contentment. The more one has, the more one wants. "Tell me," asked Prince Bismarck of an interviewer, "did you ever know a banker with a million who was contented, or a scientist, politician, artist, lawyer satisfied with his gains and position? I will go further and ask you, have you ever known a contented man? Suppose you give a workman a pound a day, in a fortnight's time his wife will want an extra shilling or two *per diem* for her children's adornment or her own dress, and will perseveringly inoculate the husband with her own dissatisfaction. To make work-men contented by legal regulations is a mere exaggeration of the fancy, a mere phantom evading the grasp whenever approached. If human contentment could be attained, it would be a misfortune. What could be more disastrous than a

dead level of well-being, a millenium of univereal satisfaction, blighting ambition, paralysing progress, and weakening moral satisfaction".

Ambition and discontent are inseparable from human nature. Considerations of good and evil, pleasure and pain, contentment and discontent are hopelessly and inextricably mixed up, so that, if we exclude extreme instances, the one state seems almost essential to make the other felt. "Every human benefit and enjoyment, every virtue, every prudent act," says Burke, "is founded on compromise and *parter*?"

In the age in which we live, the civilized world is guided by certain prominent ideas and certain forces regulate progress. Some beneficial influences may, in the world's estimation, have acquired an undue and exaggerated importance and the same may, to future generations, appear to have been illusory and unworthy. It is the interest of every people to possess the training and good sense needed to escape from the evils and to single out and participate in, the beneficial influences of the time. They are vain longings that would sigh for the restoration of the exact condition of a happier past. It is not in human power to arrest the forces of evolution or to divert the genius of the age. India is brought into contact with the industrial and progressive civilization of the West, and the same political and commercial forces which are revolutionising the Western world are operating on its destinies, and even did it desire exclusion, other nations would not let India remain in peace. Having come in contact with Western peoples, we are enabled to judge for ourselves the true character of our affairs and comparing present conditions with the past, we see how profoundly the balance of forces has altered. It behoves us, therefore, to accept the inevitable and adopt ourselves to the demands of the time and fall in line with the onward march of civilization.

Within the short time that western education has been within our reach, the Indians have made as good use of their opportunities as might be expected from their past history and eminently conservative traditions. Education has made inroads on the strongholds of superstition and prejudice, which had remained unassailable during centuries of internal dissensions and foreign domination. If we have occasion, therefore, in the sequel to refer to defects of temperament and character in the Indians in respect of their adaptability to modern industrial life, we ought not to lose sight of the consideration that the influences which are working out our regeneration are new and foreign, that they are operating on a people whose civilization has been stationery and whose character and life have hitherto known of no change. Any impatience, therefore, that our remarks may betray, is directed not so much against inadequate progress in the past as in favour of increased speed at present. There is much leeway to make up already and if we are to prosper at all, it behoves us to take note of the times, to take warning early, and by dint of perseverance and combined action, to emulate and win for ourselves a place among the enterprising and progressive nations of the world.

There is no gainsaying the fact that there is urgent need for reform. A radical change in our industrial life has become imperative—not merely to prevent others from getting the start of us, but even to retain that which is still ours but would be directly other people's, if we neglected our opportunities. We observe around us the causes and conditions of progress; we see how those that keep abreast of the times and work with perseverance in profitable occupations on modern methods are able to live well and enjoy a high scale of comfort; we notice that the great majority of our people are barely able to make both ends meet and that some millions of them live on the very verge of subsistence. It may be preju-



dice, it may be ignorance, or want of opportunities, but, certain it is, that they continue to follow discredited methods of industry and occupation too slow for the age. The natural, almost inevitable, consequence is that their scale of comfort is distressingly low and misery is writ large as their destiny. The bullock was swift enough for locomotion before there were roads and may have been tolerated even after horses came into general use, but since the introduction of the steam engine, it stands utterly discredited for that purpose. So it is with the slow manual industries and handicrafts. The times have changed and if our working classes will not adopt modern methods of work and rapid ways of production, they must inevitably be crowded out of all profitable occupation.

The population of India, taken as a whole, is a trifle under 290 millions and in the past decade it has increased by over 10 per cent. Assuming this to be decennial increase, we find by calculating backwards, that at the beginning of the present century *i. e.* 90 years ago, the population must have been 124 millions, or assuming that in the earlier decades the growth was slower than it has been in later, more peaceful times, it could not have been more than 145 millions. The population has thus at the lowest calculation doubled and as the chief support of the population is agriculture, two blades of grass have to grow on the same soil where one sufficed before. The latest statistics show that more than two-thirds of the population of India live on agriculture, that relatively to the means of subsistence, certain parts of the country are already over-peopled; and we have it from Mr. Baines, the Census Commissioner; that whereas countries such as England and Wales, Saxony and Belgium, pre-eminent in the field of manufacturing industries are peopled at a rate ranging between 500 and 600 per square mile, we have in British India nearly 47 million people (larger in number than

the total population of the three countries, above named, put together) "living in the proportion of 600 to the square mile and over, and more than  $36\frac{1}{2}$  millions of them are packed to the extent of 960 or more than one and a half person to the square mile—" "Three quarters of an acre per head of standing room," exclaims Mr. Baius, "is close enough I should think for the rest." Any one giving a moment's thought to this severe pressure on the land and the inevitable poverty and misery which this state of things betokens and the appalling prospect before future generations cannot but regard the situation as one of extreme gravity.

The difficulties which beset every effort at reform in India are, if we may say so, both objective and subjective. The objective element, *i. e.* difficulties over which we have no control, are the political traditions which have come down to us, the foreign domination and the partial in-compatibility of interest between the rulers and the ruled. The former, with every intention to be just, cannot be expected, as human nature goes, to overlook their own interests; and it is where the interests of the two nations clash that the weaker is placed under disabilities. The ruling nation does not see eye to eye with the subject race in all matters affecting the prosperity of the latter. All questions of conflicting interests, the master of legions decides as seems most fair to himself. Enterprise is crushed by the sense of subjugation and by a feeling of humiliation and inferiority and small beginnings come to nothing through lack of the moral stimulus and powerful support of authority. Political and industrial progress in these circumstances can only be permissive, depending on the casual charity of our rulers. Yet we have no cause to grumble at this our providential relation with the foremost nation on the earth. With great losses, we also have been great gainers. The education we have received and this very awakening to a sense of our duties and

responsibilities, we owe to the generosity of our rulers. The balance of advantages is on the side of our acquiescence in the political situation with feelings of satisfaction, if not of positive gratitude. Moreover government has shown, by its past attitude and treatment of the subject races, that as the latter develop in energy and intelligence, it is prepared to concede more rights and to place equal opportunities of advancement in life before all, until in the end the diversity of interests disappears and the two nations work with common aims and common interests for the glory of a Greater Britain.

It is, however, with the subjective difficulties we are more immediately concerned in this article. These difficulties are associated with our inherited customs and prejudices, modes of temperament, character and habits which, however unobjectionable in themselves and even creditable on abstract considerations of justice and humanity, are incompatible with the demands of progress and utterly out of place in the present conditions of the country. This part of the subject is so important that we make no apology to dwell on it at some length.

Strangers often remark and every well-informed Indian is painfully alive to the fact that there is a conspicuous absence of economy and regulation in our national life. The great majority of our people, some even among the cultured and the progressive, display in their daily avocations, a lack of system, method and precision—the usual characteristics of practical training—and are impatient of the restraints imposed by considerations of time and punctuality. In controlling those under their authority, they occasionally betray a tendency to condone faults and are led away by extravagant considerations of leniency and mercy with the natural result that efficiency is impaired and the very foundation of order and discipline is sapped. There is undoubted capacity for work—both mental and physical—but the results so far are not commea-

surate with the capacity for effort. Their exertions are spasmodic, often put forth under compulsion, through necessity or in fits of enthusiasm, but we look in vain among the general public for patient toil, sustained interest and persevering application to the minutæ of business. The ordinary Indian, however intelligent and prompt, will not, except when compelled by authority or by necessity, allow himself to be fettered by considerations of time. To come late to a meeting—to be waited for—was once the privilege of high station, and the habit, whatever may be the motive, exists to the present day to a most lamentable extent. Witness the enormous inconvenience and waste of time which business men have to put up with at our Municipal Meetings. A meeting, say, is convened at a particular hour, but business will scarcely commence within half an hour or an hour after the advertised time. Members go leisurely at their sweet will and very often messengers are dispatched to the place of meeting to ascertain if others are already in their places. In the district towns the more important councillors have to be sent for after the humbler citizens have congregated. Business, which, if members met punctually and addressed their discussions to practical conclusions, could be disposed of in the course of a few minutes is thus prolonged for hours, and a great, a scandalous waste of time is the consequence.

The small manufacturer thinks nothing of a week or fortnight's delay in executing an order, and when time is of any consequence, the customer is obliged to be on the look out and to make sure by frequent visits and enquiries that satisfactory progress is being made with the order. The case is even worse with the minor artisans and workmen. Absence from duty of an artisan on the slightest pretext or difficulty or on a festival day without leave or licence is an ordinary experience of business-men in this country. If a workman happens to fall sick, he thinks his obligations to his employer to be at an end. He gives himself no trouble

even to give intimation ; if his employer is put to inconvenience, it is his own affair and the workman is bound to him by no moral obligation.

In domestic and social engagements also, we are no less prodigal. A consultation, a dinner or an entertainment does not commence at the announced time and a delay of hours is not looked upon as a breach of etiquette or hospitality. When some business is to be transacted, morning, evening or some other equally in definite period of the day is indicated to the party seeking an interview, and in many matters of domestic life we are not open to the charge of over-punctiliousness or excessive haste. It has not yet become the fashion to appoint a specific hour for every duty and by a rigid observance of an appointment to economise time and save the loss which parties would otherwise suffer.

The student population also suffer owing to irregular habits of study, by alternate over-strained efforts and lapses to indolence, and it is regrettable that the English system of education, so beneficial in other ways, should provide no early and special correction to these wasteful habits which the Indian student carries to school from his home.

In villages again, ease and indolence is the fascination of life. The peasant proprietor prefers to idle away his time in the village *Chawdi*, indulging in gossip or discussing his neighbours' affairs instead of taking his proper place in his own fields to study their needs, to guide his labourers and otherwise direct the agricultural operations. The small farmer is, indeed, a hard-worked individual; with unremitting toil, he earns a bare pittance and bad seasons expose him to severe trial. A famine threatens his very existence. He sees the outer world changing, the village population growing around him and with increasing mouths to feed, the holdings and harvests are contracting by continual partition. These changes, however, signify nothing to him and if they affect him adversely, they are set down as the wrath of the village deity—an expiation for transgressions in

past life. To his mind any change in implements or methods of husbandry seems well-nigh a sacrilege. He has few pleasures; hard and exhausting work is his lot; he toils and moils with the sullenness of a bondsman, but he exhibits neither taste nor enthusiasm for the mere pleasure of improvement. A deep rut in the village cart track, a steep rising in the street, a dangerous river crossing in the peasant's neighbourhood are passed on from generation to generation with no attempt at improvement beyond the needs of the day. The day's labour is to him a stern necessity and directly the compulsory work is finished he returns home to enjoy the coveted ease—the sloth which has such a fatal attraction for him. He follows the ways of his ancestors even to a fault, with a simplicity which must appear child-like to western minds. A peasant's ambition is gratified if he lives up to the standard of his father's life. The father's ways and habits are his ideal and it is sufficient if he passes through life with the opportunities enjoyed by his ancestors. To wish for more were greed—perhaps the promptings of the evil spirit. The family may grow and outgrow the limits of subsistence but he submits to semi-starvation with resignation as unto a dispensation of providence. He seldom quits his native village to seek fresh fields and pastures new. The difficulties and privations only tend to make him cling more tenaciously to his home. Rooted aversion to change and adventure, the love of home, the attraction of ease—alas! how much misery has this gospel of self-effacement to answer for? These traces of Indian character tell a history in themselves and, in our opinion, sum up all the causes of political degradation and national decay.

How very unlike is all this to the temperament of the European; his roving disposition, constant desire for variety and change, and the love of adventure which is almost second nature with him. The Indian succumbs helplessly to the first difficulty he meets

with ; he broods over every failure ; life looks cold and dreary to him ; he sits still in silent meditation and the more he thinks, more "weary, stale, flat and unprofitable seem to him the uses of this world." On the other hand, ease is the one quality wanting to the life of Europe. The European is always busy from some invisible compulsion which he does not notice—often from mere habit. He lives in incessant excitement and is terribly in earnest. His bustling life leaves him no time for idle contemplation ; no stroke of adversity subdues his unconquerable resolution ; he bids defiance to danger and the more hazardous and hopeless an undertaking, the more he delights "to lead a forlorn hope against the powers of darkness."

All this callousness and apathy—this *vis inertie* is the result of ignorance prevailing in the country. Through ignorance, the Indian is unable to suit his actions and daily habits to the demands of the day. The one great boon of English rule is the gift of higher education. It is to the educated classes we should look for the spread of education and it is they alone that are able to interpret to the masses the principles and motives which govern modern life and the demands of progress. They are the natural leaders of the people and a great responsibility rests on them conjointly with our British Rulers to instruct, guide and raise the masses.

It is sometimes stated that it was a mistake to grant higher education to the Indian, that it has produced conceited and self-sufficient men and that politically it was a blunder. To prejudiced minds, that will not rise above the passions of the hour, it may seem so, but no right thinking man will deny that the gift is one which has blessed both the giver and the receiver. Is not the stability of Government safer now with a class of people who are fully informed of its might, resources and moral worth than if it had to deal with a fanatical population, steeped in ignorance and prejudice.? It is said that

primary education was sufficient for this purpose. Even to fulfil this humble purpose, it is difficult to conceive how without higher education, without first training instruments to teach, the spread of primary education was at all possible.

The fact should not be overlooked that education and high culture existed in the country before the introduction of English education. Education there undoubtedly was, but it was on the beaten track and confined to a favoured few. Many men there are still living who have laboured all their life in acquiring knowledge, in the study of ancient literature, but does any one pretend that that study is of any use as a guide, to regulate practical conduct or for success in life? In reading a University address, we once came across an apologue of a French Savant, who was caught by an Arab tribe. "His captors proceeded at once to turn their prize to good purpose. They asked him if he could ride? He answered 'No.' Could he fight? Again a negation. Could he run? No. He said he was accustomed only to sedentary pursuits. Thereupon they tarred and feathered him and set him to hatch eggs, that being the only sedentary pursuit with which they happened to be acquainted, and of the practical utility of which they were at all convinced." If Indians have these unpractical characteristics, thanks are due to the class of men whose learning was exclusively confined to the sacred languages and the metaphysical philosophy of the east. They lived to learn and inculcate the truths of religion but would not put their learning to any lower use calculated to promote the practical comforts of life.

The fact that the Indian is indisposed to exertion and adventure is often attributed to the enervating influences of the tropical climate. The defect exists but it is unfair to hold the climate *altogether* responsible for it. With equal consistency may we make the stars accountable for the backward condition of the Indian races. Whatever impracticability is dis-



cernible in their lives is due to the influence of home, defective early training and, chief of all, to the traditions they have inherited. From early life the young man is surrounded by uneducated females who are thoroughly unpractical in all matters concerning the outside world and utterly ignorant of the equipment one needs in after-life. Brought up in the atmosphere of superstition and surrounded by intolerant religious and social prejudices, the Indian feeds his thoughts with dreamy ideals. A European finds himself at home with his principles in his domestic circle; but the Indian, especially if himself a convinced reformer, has to live in ceaseless—often—unequal conflict with his family, and the family influences are still so powerful that he feels himself battling against odds and in the end gives in, rather than subject himself to domestic infelicity and social ostracism. By his elders and relations, his intellectual attainments are appreciated in the light of material for making a living, but with his social ideals the household has absolutely no sympathy and any attempt at practical reform on his part is resented and resisted.

Wedded for centuries as we have been to an uncompromising conservatism in habit, instincts and traditions, the education we hitherto used to receive disposed us to intellectual indolence. Change and progress has been with us by-words for apostasy and heresy. Whilst in the Western world improvements are discovered, examined and daily assimilated into practical life, we habitually regard every invention merely as an intellectual curiosity and the influence of home and association sets us against its adoption. It is this attitude of unconcern and apathy which has retarded progress and debarred us from taking the utmost advantage of modern inventions of every kind for the practical conveniences of life.

Trade and manufactures among the western people have been the handmaids of progressive civilization. Commercial pursuits, from an abstract point of view, are

invaluable as disciplinary agencies. This aid we have, as a body, lacked in India. Trade here has been in the hands of distinct castes and guilds. The thinking classes and the working and trading classes have always lived separated. The highest thought lived, as it were, divorced from the highest practical skill.

Modern education has changed all this. It has opened our eyes to the practical uses of the highest intellectual training. It gives us, above all, a practical conception of the lives we have to lead in order to be able to go through this world, as far as in us lies, in health, peace and comfort. Barring specific disabilities, it depends on an individual himself whether he is to become a useful member of his family and community. Given the power to reason judiciously and to act rightly, you have the practical man. The more prosperous a community, the more practical men it contains—men who are able to form an admirable judgment of the present needs and suit their actions to these needs. A practical man is a blessing and a 'song of rejoicing' to his family, his country and his nation. It is the practical man that examines his ways and habits and the ways of those amenable to his devotion with a view to cultivate the healthy development of character and conduct favourable to true progress and to correct and eradicate false sentiments and prejudices which usurp the place of true patriotism and religion. To lead practical lives as here indicated, one need give up nothing, take nothing on trust, do nothing but what commends itself to one's own common sense and judgment. Action following self-reasoning constitutes self-help and it is self-help in the highest acceptance of the term that we need to cultivate, the spirit of enquiry and examination into every question—be it personal, family or national—from the standpoint of reason and expediency, to arrive at practical decisions and act on these decisions in the smaller and larger concerns of life.

We shall once more revert to the population difficulty. It is not the fashion however to discuss this question and great delicacy is necessary in handling the problem of over population. No one who values the good opinion of the polite public cares to face this problem or to drive the natural conclusions home to the ignorant masses. It is an Indian proverb that says,—“He that created the months feeds them.” Millions die in every famine and the unregenerated might remark that the growth of population has so far exceeded the resources of nature that the creator is abandoning his charge in despair. The population difficulty is one which is in the power of the people themselves to get over. In a lecture delivered a few days ago before the Society of Arts (on February 16th, 1893) that eminent statistician Sir William Hunter dwelt on this subject. We take the following extract from a report of his lecture.

“Regarding the poverty of India, Sir William Hunter admitted having some years ago estimated the number of persons, living on the margin of subsistence at forty millions, and he attributed this to the improvidence of early marriages in India. In the old times, the population was kept down by sword and famine, but now there were no deaths by the sword, and famine in the old sense of the word was practically impossible. He remembered when he was employed in the famine of 1866, going about to get the starving people out of villages where no food was to be had to others where it was to be obtained. They said “No; it is a true famine, what can the Government do? It is merely watering the tops of a tree whose roots are cut.” Well they had watered the tops of the tree with great success and the problem of the poverty of India now rested to a large extent on the people themselves. It was only by indirect influence, by education and by the general advance of the natives of India in Western thought and standard ideals of what is right and what is wrong,

that this increase of population, *independently of increased means of subsistence*, would each be overcome. The government could do something but they could do far less than what we hoped and believed within two generations more the natives of India would do for themselves." Let us say "amen" to this expression of hope. In the discussion which followed the lecture Mr. Hyndman significantly asked how a country could be called prosperous which had 250 millions of people living on 154 million acres.

We have indicated the difficulties and the obstacles in the way of rapid improvement. The chief remedy as we have already stated is education—more higher education, practical and technical education, scientific education, primary education, even compulsory education should, in our opinion, be resorted to. There is no such thing as over-education in the present educations of Indian life. For this remedy, we must lean on government sympathy and support. The money now spent on education is out of all proportion to the needs of the case. When the Indian races shall have risen to the level of European countries in education and civilization, when they understand the value of education sufficiently to make personal sacrifices for it and when they have the means to make those sacrifices, it will be time to compare the percentage of revenue expended on education in India with the corresponding outlay in European countries. Education is so important a remedy that in the interests of the people, no outlay on it would be too great at present. It is education that has roused those who are working for the regeneration of India and it is education that may be expected to rouse the millions that are still sunk in deadly torpor.

If education were diffused to the extent we have indicated and at an outlay which it is however hopeless to expect the government to undertake, we do not see why in less than two generations, the condition—mental and material—of the *average* Indian should

not be on a par with that of his European brother. We are accustomed to hear of the traditional ineptness of the Indian and his inaptitude for representative government. But all this is really statutory disability. If higher education has, within the past forty years, produced men who are pronounced fit and who have struggled their way into the highest walks of life open to them. Even to a seat in the imperial Parliament, who will say it is an extravagant expectation to foretell that half a century hence with proper opportunities, the Indian ryot will become as intelligent a unit of the Indian electorate as is his European confrere today?

The real remedy, chiefly in the hands of the people themselves, consists in the development of trades and manufactures and in the encouragement and resuscitation of the manual dexterity and industry of the older class of artisans.

Much can be done by every educated man by personal example, by developing the spirit of enquiry into and criticism of, the social life of the country. Every father, every employer of labour, every school-master can do something if he set a healthy example and cultivated in these amenable to his guidance, a practical knowledge of the conditions which govern success in modern life.

And here we must draw these observations to a close. We have said above that one system of education needs considerable expansion in depth and width. Even within the limits now permitted to us, there is need for reforms in the present agencies of education, reform in directions specially calculated to develop the practical traits of Indian character into special reference to its present acknowledged defects of this reform and other allied reforms in the industrial, social, political and religious life of the country, in directions in which reforms are necessary and possible, we hope to treat in a future article. The chief reform of all, the basis in fact of every kind of

improvement is what we have urged above, the development of active habits in the Indian and the provision of knowledge and qualities needed to hold his own in the fierce struggle of existence.

The foregoing remarks have been suggested by a keen sense of the loss that is happening daily by the partial neglect on our part to take advantage of all our opportunities calculated to improve our position. We do not say that our progress in the past is not encouraging but what we feel, say and earnestly urge that the slower we are to appreciate our opportunities, the longer we remain unconvinced of the unwelcome truths about our short-comings, the greater will be our loss and the greater the difficulty to take our place among the progressive nations of the world. The conditions of existence are ever changing. It is so in the life of every nation. The habits and the lives our forefathers led, may have been unexceptionable in their day, when population was sparse, when only fertile soil came under cultivation, when human wants and comforts were few and the struggle for existence such as we see around us was not even heard of. But the conditions of life have changed now. The changes have brought with them new pleasures and new spheres of activity and also grave responsibilities.

The future of the Indian people is full of uncertainty. If Indians do not attempt to lead truly practical lives, if they do not take advantage of every opportunity however insignificant to make their lives beneficial to themselves and to their country, if they do not take note of the changes of the time, and take warning from the struggle among nations for industrial supremacy—age, for very bread,—if they adhere to antiquated notions of things and life, and disclaim to enquire how they arose or what the consequences of such adherence would be to them and their descendants, it would mean the spread of misery and the hopeless postponement of domestic happiness and national advancement.

---

## TWENTY YEARS' REVIEW OF CENSUS STATISTICS.

---

The decennial Census Report for 1891 for the Bombay Presidency loses much of its interest by reason of the great delay that has taken place in its publication. This defect, however, sinks into insignificance by the side of another and more serious omission, for which apparently there was less excuse,—we refer to the disappointment caused by the total and studied neglect to bring together the facts and figures of the past three censuses in a way to illustrate the social and economical history of this Presidency during the last 20 years. Attempts indeed have been here and there made to compare and contrast the Census figures of 1891 with those of 1881; but these attempts, being only half-hearted and unsystematic, lead to very inconclusive results. In the first place, India is not America, and a period of 10 years is too short a term to measure any real or permanent changes in the condition of Indian society. The figured results of 1881, moreover, had the additional disadvantage of recording the losses sustained in consequence of the great famine of 1876-78., and thus furnished no safe basis for a comparison of the normal conditions of life in this country, and of its progress or otherwise in ordinary circumstances. Thirdly, the Census figures of 1881 were arranged and classified in many respects upon lines not observed in 1872, and these lines have been again abandoned in enumerating the results of the last census. For these reasons, the census report of 1891 appears to us to be useful chiefly in its appendices, and we propose in the

following pages to make an attempt to present a connected view of the progress of this Presidency during the last 20 years, as far as it may be gathered from a comparison of the results of 1891 with those of the census of 1872, only occasionally referring to the intermediate census of 1881. Mere figured statements, however detailed and numerous, have no suggestiveness about them, and it is necessary to study them in the lights and shades of contrasts and comparisons to obtain practical lessons for the guidance of the administration, and for the studies of the political economist. We shall confine our observations for the present to the purely British districts of this Presidency, reserving our remarks upon the figured results for the feudatory states to a future issue of this Journal.

The area of the British districts has continued constant, being shown to be 124,462, 124,122, and 125,064 square miles respectively, according to the censuses of 1872, 1881, and 1891. The population statistics, however, do not present stationary figures. The total population according to the census of February 1872 was 16,228,774. The numbers were almost stationary in 1881, being 16,454,414, or an increase of only  $2\frac{1}{2}$  lacks, or 1.5 per cent in 10 years. In February 1891, the numbers returned were 18,857,004, the increase being over 25 lacks, or 16 per cent, in 20 years, or about .8 p.c. per year. The density of the population which was 130 per square mile in 1872, and 135 in 1881, has increased to nearly 151 per square mile. A comparison of these figures with those of England and Wales cannot fail to be very instructive. The area of England and Wales is 58,186 square miles, and its population, which was 22,712,266 in 1871, rose, to 29,001,048 in 1891, showing an increase of 6,278,782, or nearly 30 per cent in 20 years, being nearly double our rate. This high rate of increase was, it must be noted, maintained not-



withstanding the great relief given to the population of England by an extensive system of emigration, the like of which relief we do not enjoy here. The actual density of the English population increased from 389 per square mile in 1871 to nearly 500 per square mile in 1891. The rate of increase in this Presidency was only '8 per-cent against the English rate of  $1\frac{1}{2}$  per cent per year, and the increase in our rate of density is only 20 per cent against the English figure of 110 per cent. In other words, the rate of density in England, which was three times our rate in 1872, has now increased to three and a half times the average density in this Presidency.

We have next to examine the details for the several divisions of the Presidency. For enumeration purposes, the Census Report of 1872 recognised chiefly four divisions based on the principle of distinctive physical and climatic peculiarities, namely the Deccan, Konkan, Guzerath, and Sind. In the census of 1881 this principle was not followed, and the grouping was made on the basis of 5 divisions (Deccan, Konkan, Guzerath, Karnatic, and Sind) based partly on physical and partly on language peculiarities. In 1891, the same principle was followed with this further change that the Kanara district, which was classed under Karnatic in 1881, has been classed under Konkan this time. These changes make it impossible to compare the totals of one census with another, and introduce a needless element of variations which should always be avoided in such enumerations. We have found it necessary in consequence of these changes, to take up the district figures separately, and then group them together, and the following statement presents the comparative results of the ascertained totals of population by districts and divisions in 1872 and 1891.

Division.	Population 1872	Population 1891	Increase or Decrease in 20 years.	Percentage Increase.	Remarks.
1 Guzerath					
Ahmedabad ...	829,637	871,589	41,952	5	
Panch Mahals...	240,743	313,417	72,674	30	
Kaira ...	782,733	871,589	88,856	11	
Broach ...	350,322	341,400	-8,832	-2.5	
Surat ...	607,087	649,989	42,902	7	
Total Guzerath...	2,810,522	3,098,197	287,675	10	
Area in square mites ...	10082	10,256			
2 Konkanj					
Kanara ...	398,406	446,357	47,945	12	
Ratnagiri ...	1,019,186	1,105,926	86,790	8.6	
Kulaba ...	350,405	509,584	159,179	4	Due partly to transfer of Talukas.
Thana ...	847,424	904,868	57,444	16	
Total Konkan...	2,615,371	2,966,729	351,358	13.5	
Area in square miles ...	13,558	13,639			
3 Deccan					
Khandesh ...	1,028,642	1,460,851	432,209	42	
Nasik ...	734,386	843,582	109,196	14	
Nagar ...	773,938	888,755	114,817	15	

	Sattara	...	1,116,050	1,225,989	109,939	9.5	
	Poona	...	907,235	1,067,800	160,565	18	
	Sholapur.	...	662,986	750,689	87,693	13.5	
	Total Deccan...	...	5,223,237	6,237,666	1,014,429	20	
	Area in square miles	...	39,355	38,390			
4	Sindh						
	Karachi	...	423,495	564,880	141,385	33	
	Hydrabad	...	721,947	918,646	196,699	28	
	Thur-parkar	...	180,761	238,203	117,442	65	
	Shikarpur	...	776,227	915,497	139,270	18.5	
	Upper Sindh Frontier	...	89,985	174,548	84,563	90	
	Total Sindh...	...	2,192,415	2,871,774	679,359	34	
	Area in square miles	...	46,598	47,789			
5	Karnatic						
	Belgaon	...	938,750	1,013,261	74,511	8	
	Dharwar	...	988,037	1,051,314	63,277	6.5	
	Kaladgi	}	816,037	796,332	- 19,698	- 2.4	One partly to transfer of Talukas.
	Bijapur						
	Total	...	2,742,824	2,860,914	118,090	4	
	Area in square miles	...	14,853	14,928			
6	Town & Island of Bombay	...	644,405	821,764	177,359	26	

It will be seen from this statement that the increase of population in Sindh has been nearly twice the average for the Presidency, it has been a little over the average in the Deccan, sensibly below the average in Guzerath and Konkan, and much below the average in the Karnatic. The surplus population of Guzerath finds a convenient outlet in the Panch Mahals, that of the Deccan in Khandesh, that of the Konkan in Bombay, while in Sindh the expanse of arable but unoccupied land is almost limitless, being dependent upon the extension of irrigation and not on rain-fall, and there is apparently no outlet, for such expansion in the Karnatic districts. The relative densities of the several divisions disclose the following variations in the proportion of increased density during the last 20 years.

	Density		
	1872	1891	
Guzerath.....	279	300	} The largest absolute in- crease in density occurs in the Deccan, and the least in Karnatic.
Deccan.....	134.5	162	
Konkan, excluding Bombay City	193	217	
Karnatic.....	185	191	
Sindh .....	47	60	

If the Panch Mahal figures be excluded from those of the Guzerath division, the increase of population in 20 years in the older and settled districts of Guzerath has been only 8 per cent, and in Broach there has been an actual decrease which requires to be accounted for. Excluding Khandesh, the increase of population in the Deccan districts has been about 14 per cent in 20 years. The Sindh rate of increase is nearly equal to that of England. The Konkan districts show a rate of increase which is nearly equal to that of the Deccan excluding Khandesh, and the Karnatic districts fare the worst of all—the increase being almost nominal—only 4 per cent in 20 years. It is obvious

that the small proportion of increase in these districts is due to the after effects of the famine, from which apparently these parts of the country have not yet recovered. The population of Belgaum, Dharwar and Kaladgi or Bijapur in the years 1872, 1881, and 1891, will be seen from the following statement.

	1872	1881	1891
Belgaum.....	944,985	864,014	1,013,261
Dharwar.....	989,671	882,909	1,057,314
Kaladgi or Bijapur.....	816,273	688,493	796,339
Total ...	2,750,929	2,385,416	2,866,914

It will be thus seen that these three districts lost nearly  $3\frac{1}{2}$  lacks of their population or 3 per cent in the famine, and they have been just able to make up that deficit during the last 10 years. The actual loss of population was of course more than  $3\frac{1}{2}$  lacks, for the normal increase in ten years must be added to this figure of registered deficiency. This circumstance accounts for the small rate of increase in these districts. Compared with the totals of 1881, the increase in the Karnatic districts has exceeded 20 per cent in ten years, the rate of increase being 2 per cent per year. In the Deccan districts, Khandesh and Nasik did not suffer a shrinkage of population in consequence of the famine, and Khandesh showed an increase of over 2 lacks, and Nasik of 143000 people. The other four districts showed a fall off of 27109 in Nagar, 20732 in Poona, 229 in Satara, and 136888 in Sholapur, the deficiency being in all  $1\frac{1}{2}$  lacks between the totals of 1872 and 1881. The actual increase in these four districts between 1881 and 1891 is about 7 lacks, which raises the proportion of increase in ten years to nearly 23 per cent. In other words, the Deccan districts, having suffered less severely, have rallied more rapidly than the Karnatic districts—which now stand very much

where they stood 20 years ago in point of population. The Guzerath districts, excluding Panch Mahals, did not suffer in any way from the famine, and the slow progress of population there appears to be due partly to external checks such as cholera and fever mortality, and partly to the operation of prudential and preventive influences. The advantages of a fertile soil and industrious population are fully utilized by the existing population of 300 souls per square mile, and the available area for extension is so limited that the Ryots have no other resource but to emigrate to the Panch Mahals. There is a similar escape for the congested parts of the Deccan in Khandesh, and for the Konkan districts apparently in Bombay,

Excluding Sind, whose climatic conditions are so entirely different from the rest of the Presidency, there are only four districts where the number of available arable land per 100 of the populations exceeds 10 acres, and in two only, Khandesh and Panchmahals, this provision exceeds 25 acres per 100 of the population. In all the remaining districts, the proportions are below 10 acres per 100 of the population, which, as every body will admit, is a very nominal figure. These proportions will perhaps not be quite intelligible without further amplification. As the chief dependence of our increasing agricultural population is on the land still available for cultivation, the following statement has been prepared to show what area of culturable unoccupied land is still available for further expansion of cultivation, to keep pace with the increase of population.

District.	Popula- tion.	cultivated land	Land still available for cul- tivation.
Ahmedabad..	871,589	1,870,717	87,872
Kairah .....	871,589	747,565	74,132
Panch Mahals	313,417	480,716	177,800
Bronch .....	341,490	649,477	25,863
Surat .....	649,989	740,266	65,260
Gujerath.....	3,098,197	4,448,741	430,932
Thana .....	847,424	953,993	115,046
Kolaba ... ..	350,405	704,786	57,914
Ratnagiri ...	1,019,136	395,877	5,403
Kanara .....	398,406	324,746	61,743
Konkan .....	2,966,729	2,378,702	240,106
Khandesh ...	1,460,851	3,187,064	779,864
Nasik .....	843,532	2,316,207	134,076
Nagar .....	888,755	3,079,555	123,263
Poona .....	1,067,800	2,451,806	18,188
Sholapur.....	750,689	2,456,513	23,031
Satara .....	1,225,989	2,123,870	35,245
Deccan ... ..	6,237,666	15,615,015	1,113,667
Belgaom.....	938,750	2,087,353	105,157
Dharwar.....	988,037	3,113,655	103,899
Bijapur .....	816,037	2,314,014	72,953
Karnatic.....	2,860,114	7,515,922	282,006
Karachi .....	423,495	850,476	1,139,634
Hydrabad ...	721,947	2,198,200	2,300,263
Shikarpur ...	776,227	1,490,961	1,722,414
Upper Sind Frontier ...	89,995	522,390	1,54,781
Thur and Parkar ...	180,761	1,278,623	443,203
Sind .....	2,817,189	6,440,650	5,760,296
Total .....	17,980,615	3638,830,4	7,827,007

The average per head of the population of cultivated area is  $1\frac{1}{2}$  acres in Guzerath,  $1\frac{1}{5}$ ths acres in Konkan,  $2\frac{1}{2}$  acres in the Deccan,  $2\frac{3}{4}$  acres in Karnatic, and  $2\frac{1}{3}$  acres in Sind. These figures give for the Presidency an average of 2 acres of cultivated land per head of the population, or 10 acres per head of each peasant proprietor's family. As regards arable land available for cultivation, it is about 5 p. c. of the cultivated area in Ahmedabad, 10 p. c. in Kairah, about 37 p. c. in Panchmahals, 4 p. c. in Broach, and 9 p. c. in Surat, the average for the division being 9 p. c. of the cultivated area. In the Konkan, this margin is  $1\frac{1}{2}$  p. c. in Ratnagiri, 12 p. c. in Thana, 8 p. c. in Kolaba, and nearly 20 p. c. in Kanara; this last figure brings up the average for the whole division to nearly 10 p. c. In the Deccan, this proportion of arable to cultivated land is 24 p. c. in Khandesh, 5 p. c. in Nasik, 4 p. c. in Nagar, less than 1 p. c. in Poona and Sholapur, and about 1 p. c. in Satara. The average for the whole Deccan is 7 p. c. These same proportions are 5 p. c. in Belgaum, and 3 p. c. in Dharwar and Bijapur. The average for the whole division is 4 p. c. In Sind the uncultivated arable land largely exceeds the cultivated land in Karachi, Hyderabad and Shikarpur. The average for the whole division is nearly 90 p. c. It will be seen from these details that, excluding Sind, there is not much room left for extended cultivation except in Panchmahals and Khandesh, and to a small extent in Kanara and Nasik. In Sind these conditions are reversed. In all the older and settled districts of the Presidency, the agricultural classes must henceforth resort chiefly to intensive cultivation or improvements. As it is, about one crore of the agricultural population manage barely to support themselves upon the yield of about 4 crores of acres, including fallow and twice cropped lands, and have, except in Sind, Khandesh and Panchmahals, less than 15 lacks of arable land to fall back upon for extended cultivation. These figured results present a very dark future as loom-



As before our vision if our chief dependence were placed on extended cultivation as the only resource for supplying the wants of our increasing population.

The only escape from this danger lies in the direction of the gradual transformation of the chief means of our livelihood, and the growth of an urban and industrial population, in other words the rise of towns or Cities. A careful examination of the statistical results furnished by these Census reports satisfies us that there are indications which prove that such a change was operating strongly in our favour. Defining a town as a collection of over 5,000 inhabitants, it appears (1) that there has been a large increase in the number of our towns, and (2) that the increase of the town population has been greater than the increase of the rural population. In 1872 there were in the 23 districts 178 towns, excluding the City of Bombay, with a total population of 2134419. In 1881 a different principle was adopted which did not accept the test of population as the basis of distinction, and 16 places below 5000 in population were included, and 28 places with a population exceeding 5000 were excluded, from the definition of towns, giving as the result 165 as the number of towns according to the census of that year, with a population of 2925190 inhabitants. This unnecessary refinement was dropped in the last census enumeration, and applying the old test of population, it was ascertained that there were in all 231 places which had more than 5000 inhabitants, and might be therefore regarded as towns. Comparing the figures for 1872 with those of 1891,—it will be seen from the following statement that all the divisions except Karnatic showed an increase under this head.

	Number of Towns.		Population of Towns.	
	1872	1891	1872	1891
Guzerath.	35	46	592,459	665,856
Konkan.	26	30	218,397	283,292
Deccan	65	96	724,862	957,499
Karnatic.	43	34	412,268	387,863
Sind,	9	25	186,431	242,295
Bombay City.	1	1	644,405	821,764
Total	179	232	2,778,822	3,458,569

The number of towns has thus increased nearly 30 per cent, while the population of these towns show an increase of nearly 25 per cent. The total increase of the population in 20 years has been shown above to have been about 16 per cent, and it is thus plain that there is a slight tendency inclining the scale in favour of urban increase over rural increase. This last appears to have been about 14 per cent, the actual figures being 13,553,962 as against 15,398,445, as the population of the rural tracts in 1872 and 1891 respectively. So far the figures are not unsatisfactory. (3) The percentages of the rural and urban population for the several large divisions, according to the census reports for 1872, 1881 and 1891 will be seen from the following statement.

	1872		1881		1891.	
	Urban	Rural	Urban	Rural	Urban	Rural
Guzerath	21	79	19·9	60·1	21·5	78·5
Konkan	8	92	9	91	8·8	91·2
Deccan	13·8	87·2	14·3	85·7	15·4	84·6
Karnatic	15	85	12·2	87·8	13·5	86·5
Sind	9	91	10·7	89·3	12·6	87·4

The statement shows clearly that the progress is very slow and, not very striking. Guzerath retains an easy command over the other divisions, and no district in that division comes up to the level of Ahmedabad, which has 25 per cent. urban to 75 per cent rural population.

The Sind figures are more hopeful, and Deccan also appears to be slowly but successfully struggling against ruralization. The Karnatic districts however do not appear to have yet recovered from the shock they sustained during the famine. Taking the several districts in their order, while Poona, Dharwar and Karachi show large advances in the direction of urbanization, and Ahmedabad, Broach, Nasik, Bijapoor and Belgaum show slight advances in the same direction, ten districts Ratnagiri, Surat, Tanah, Kolaba, Kanara, Nagar, Satara, Thur and Parkar, Upper Sind frontier, and Hyderabad show slight decline, and Kairah, Panch Mahals, Khandesh, Sholapoor, and Shikarpoor show decided decline in the urban elements of their population. Even in the districts which show better results, the so-called towns are only larger villages, and are wanting in the essential element of industrial activity.

(4) This partial and not very strongly marked tendency towards urbanization is also attested to by the figures which show the relative proportions of villages of different sizes and population. Excluding Sind and Bombay City, it appears from the Census returns of 1881 and 1891 that while the proportion of villages inhabited by less than 500 persons was  $65\frac{1}{2}$  per cent in 1881, this proportion fell to 60 per cent in 1891. The proportion of the class of Villages next above it, with population ranging from 500 to 1000, was 21 per cent in 1881, and 23 per cent in 1891, of the class next above it, with inhabitants ranging from 1000 to 1500, was 9.7 per cent in 1881, and 11.3 per cent in 1891, of the class next to it, with a population ranging from 2000 to 3000, was 2 per cent in

1881 and 2·7 per cent in 1891, and the highest class of all, with populations ranging from 3000 to 5000, was 1·3 per cent in 1881, and 2·6 per cent in 1891. It is not generally known, but is none the less true that the proportion of urban to rural population normally stands higher in this Presidency than in most of the other Provinces of India.

(5) Of course it must be noted that the residents of urban towns as defined above are not all really urban in respect of their profession or source of livelihood, and on the other hand the residents of rural areas do not all of them derive their livelihood from the land. It thus becomes necessary to examine the statistics about the occupations of the people given in these census reports. The Census classification of occupations given in the report of 1891 departs so materially from the principles adopted in the two previous reports that no fair comparison can properly be made between their results. Both in 1872 and 1881 there was a large class, nearly 50 per cent of the total population, who, being dependent on other persons, were returned as having no profession or occupation. This principle was not followed in 1891, when all these dependents were counted as forming a portion of the class to which the male or female bread earner on whom they depended belonged. This appears to us to have been a perfectly wanton innovation, and even if there were some apparent advantages in the new classification, the report ought to have furnished columns of comparative tables contrasting the results of 1891 with those of previous years on the old basis.

In the absence of such comparative tables, we can only present the results separately. In 1872, persons employed in Government and other public service were 184332, and formed 1·1 per cent of the whole. The professions absorbed 135340 persons, and were ·8 per cent of the whole. Those who engaged themselves in personal service were 281216, and

were 1·7 per cent of the whole. The agricultural industry, including the care and breed of cattle and sheep, was followed by 40 lacks, who thus constituted 24·7 per cent of the entire population. Those who were engaged in trade and commerce were about 4½ lacks, and were 2·6 per cent of the whole. Artizans and handicraftsmen came to about 22 lacks, and were 13·5 per cent of the entire number. All these classes made up 45 per cent; and the unoccupied and dependent classes came up to 90 lacks, being 55 per cent of the total population. In 1881 Government public servants and, those who were employed in the professions, made up 1·5 per cent, those rendering personal service were 1·1 per cent, and the commercial and trading classes represented 1·2 per cent. The agriculturists were 32 per cent, the industrial and artizan classes were 15 per cent, and the unoccupied were 49 per cent of the whole. In the Census of 1891 the heading of unoccupied classes was discontinued as a separate class, and we find that 60 per cent of the total, and 69 per cent of the rural, populations are shown to be agricultural. The artizans and handicraftsmen, or the industrial classes, are shown to be 21 per cent. Their proportion is slightly higher in towns than in the Country. The two classes between them absorb 80 per cent of the population. The trading and commercial classes are shown to be 4·6 per cent in towns, and 3·5 p. c. in the country. Those who rendered personal and domestic service are shown to be 2·7 per cent. Those engaged in public service appear to be 3·8 per cent, and the professionals 3·3 per cent. If we halve these percentages so as to exclude the dependent population, mostly women and children, we shall arrive by a rough guess at what these proportions would be under the old plan of classification. The old proportions of those engaged in agriculture and handicrafts do not appear thus to have been sensibly altered in favour of the latter classes; and the same remark holds good of the commercial and trading classes. This

seems to be the general impression left on the mind by a study of these figures—into the details of which we cannot now afford to enter at greater length.

The statistics relating to occupied houses are also vitiated by the innovations adopted at the last enumeration of excluding unoccupied houses from the Census definition of a house, and the omission to classify houses according to quality which attempt was made in 1872 with some success.

The Census of 1872 showed that the total number of houses in the Bombay Presidency was 3254540, out of which about (336629) were of the better class, and were occupied by 1885910 persons. The rest about 90 per cent (2917911) were of the inferior sort, and were occupied by 1434242 persons. These figures furnish a safe basis for fixing the relative number of our classes and masses which are as 8 to 92 of the population. In the Deccan Division including Karnatic the average number of persons per house was 5.43, in the Konkan it was 5.7, in Guzerath it was 3.6, and in Sindh it was 4.9 per house. The superiority of Guzerath in this respect is further brought out by the fact that out of the better class of houses fully 58 per cent are found in the Guzerath Division. The Deccan comes a long-way behind, and Konkan and Sindh follow at no great distance. The Census of 1881 showed the total number of occupied houses and other buildings to have been 3605812, being an increase of  $2\frac{1}{2}$  lacks over the figure for 1872, but of these 2822731 houses were occupied. Between 1881 and 1891 the several divisions showed the following increases.

	1881		1891.		Increase	
	Houses in towns	Houses in country	Houses in towns	Houses in country.	per cent in town -	per cent in country
Guzerath.	135293	499082	160737	536209	19	7½
Konkan.	42465	430144	46667	490320	11	14
Deccan	128001	637867	187468	861770	47	23
Karnatic	54488	975847	69475	446611	27½	17
Sindh	42223	391331	64804	452216	53	15
Bombay city	28310		56959		100	

Here also, next to the town and island of Bombay, Sindh heads the list, Guzerath while it is absolutely at the head of the rest of the Presidency, shows no progress. The Deccan districts take a high rank, and Karanatic and Konkan come last.

We have now passed under review all those points of the Census enumeration which have a bearing upon the economical condition of the country. The statistics relating to sex and age and civil condition, education, religion, languages, and infirmities are interesting in themselves, but they have little or no direct bearing upon the economical well-being of the population, and we must therefore resist the temptation of entering upon a consideration of these matters. We hope however to take them up in a separate issue of the Journal.

# NOTICE.

---

A desire has been expressed by several Europe and Native well-wishers of the Poona Sarvajnik Sabha that its proceedings should be published regularly in the form of a quarterly publication so as to be easily available for purposes of reference. The Managing Committee of the Sabha have accordingly resolved to try the experiment of such a periodical publication of the proceedings of the Sabha. Besides publishing the proceedings, it is proposed to take advantage of such a publication to insert independent communication, reviewing and discussing the more important political questions of the day. There are many topics upon which public opinion has to be created and formed before any formal action can be taken in respect of them by the Sabha. Such topics will find a fitting place in the independent section of the proposed Quarterly Journal.

The services of a competent Editor have been secured and contributions have been promised by many writers of established reputation.

The Journal will consist of about 48 pages royal octavo to be priced at four rupees per annum to be paid in advance or one rupee and a half for each separate number, besides postage charges, and it will be published in the months of July, October, January and April.

As the Sabha has undertaken this work at considerable risk and expense and as the publication will supply a long-felt want, the Managing Committee of the Sabha trust that the public and the Princes and Chiefs in India will give their most cordial support to the scheme.

Names of intending subscribers can be registered at the office of the Sarvajnik Sabha.

All communications should be addressed to the undersigned.

S. H. SATHE.  
*Hon. Secretary, Poona Sarvajnik Sabha.*