

THE
QUARTERLY JOURNAL

OF THE

POONA SARVAJANIK SABHA.

VOL. XVI]

JULY 1893.

[No. 1.

UNDER THE AUTHORITY OF THE MANAGING COMMITTEE.

EDITED BY

G. K. GOKHALE, B. A.

POONA.

PRINTED AT THE "DNYAN PRKASH" PRESS.

All Rights Reserved.]

1893.

[Price Rs.1-8.

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

May 1893.

Receipt
Nos.

		Rs.	As.
31	R. S. Balwant Rawaji Gadgil	4-4
32	R. S. Hari Ramchandra Takle	8-8
33	H. H. the Maharaja of Travancore	12-12
34	Babu Bissin Krishna Bose	4-0
35	R. S. Gangadhar Vishnu Limage	8-8
36	R. B. Narayen Ganesh Deshpande	21-12
37	R. S. Narayen Gopal Kelkar	8-8
		68	4

June 1893.

38	R. S. Vishun Moreshwar Mahajani	4-4
39	Darbar office Indore	127-3
		131	12

July 1893.

40	R. S. Shvidhar Mahader Kale	4-4
41	R. S. Krishanji Ballal Fatak	4-0
42	R. S. Dalpatram Pranjiwan	12-0
43	R. S. Moro Govind Joshi	11-4
44	Mr. Vishnu Narayan Apte	2-0
45	R. B. M. Visweswaraya	4-0
46	Mr. Ramchandra Keshav Limaye	4-0
47	Mr. Trimbak Narayen Kirtane...	12-12
48	Secretary Framji Kawasji Institute	4-4
49	H. H. the Maharaja of Dhar	12-0
50	Mr. Rajanna Lingoo	4-0
51	Rev. J. Small	8-8
52	R. B. Ambalal Shankarlal	8-8
53	R. S. Krishanji Hari Kirkiro	4-4
54	Secretary N. G. L. Dhulia	4-4
55	R. B. Narayan Vishnu Bapat	8-8
56	R. S. Raghwandra Ramchandra Gangoli...	8-8
57	R. S. Mukundrai Manikrai	8-0
58	Secretary N. G. L. Satara...	4-4
59	Kasmopolitition Club Madras	4-4
60	R. S. Govind Ramchandra Khandekar	4-4
		137	12

CONTENTS.

Proceedings of the Sabha:—

- I. Address of welcome to His Excellency Lord Sandhurst
with His Excellency's reply thereto.

Independent Section:—

- I. The Tree Blossomed.—Shivaji as a Civil Ruler.
- II. "Our Amusements."
- III. "University Reform."

THE POONA SARVAJANIK SABHA.

Established on the 1st of Chaitra Shaka 1792 i. e. 2nd April 1870
for representing the wants and wishes of the inhabitants of
the Deccan, being appointed on a popular elective
system under rules framed for the purpose.

WALEKAR'S WADA, DANE ALI

LIST OF OFFICERS.

President

H. H. Shrinivas Rao Parashram Pandit *alias* Rao Saheb
Pant Pratinidhi, Chief of Oundha.

Vice-Presidents.

H. H. Dhundiraj Chintaman <i>alias</i> Taty Saheb Patwardhan, Chief of Sangli.	H. H. Gunpatrao Harihar <i>alias</i> Bapa Saheb Patwardhan, younger Chief of Kurundwad.
H. H. Mudhojirao Naik. Nimbalkar Chief of Falton.	H. H. Hariharrao Vinayak <i>alias</i> Daji Saheb Patwardhan, Chief of Kurundwad.
H. H. Ramachandrarao Gopal <i>alias</i> Appa Saheb Patwardhan, Chief of Jamkhindi.	H. H. Toolajee Raje Bhosle, Chief of Akalkote.

Shrimant Shri Baba Maharaj.

MANAGING COMMITTEE FOR 1894-95.

Chairman—MR. VINAYAK RAMCHANDRA PATWARDHAN, B.A., LL. B.

Members of the Managing Committee.

R. B. V. M. Bhide.	Vasudev Ganesh Joshi Esq.
R. B. Narayan Bhai Dandekar.	R. S. Ganesh Ramchandra Phadke.
R. B. Vishnu Balkrishna Sohoni.	R. S. Gangadhar V. Mehendale.
Shrimant Balvantrao Ramchandra Natu.	R. S. Vishnu Bapuji Likhata.
Shrimant Hari Ramchandra Dhandhere	R. S. Mahadeo Ballal Namjoshi.
R. S. Kashinath P. Gadgil.	Ganesh N. Ghotawadekar. Esq.
Hon'ble Bal Gangadhar Tilak.	Waman Prabhakar Bhawe, Esq.
Professor Gopal Krishna Gokhale.	Ramkrishna Bhikaji Kulkarni, Esq.
Gangadhar V. Lale. Esq.	Vinakar R. Jalnapoorkar. Esq.
Vishnu Narayan Apte. Esq.	Narayan Ganesh Amdekar Esq.
Dr. Shankar Amrit Chobhe.	Balkrishna Ramchandra Vaidya Esq.
Ganesh Narayan Sathe.	Dr. Narayan Vinayek Chhatre.
K. S. Kazi Ajmudin.	Narayan B. Kanitkar Esq.
Pandurang Ramji Bari. Esq.	Nathmal Ghansham Esq.
Khanderao Ngrayan Yaidya Esq.	Waman Vishnu Lale Esq.
Suet Hukumchand Ishwardas Esq.	Vishnu Venkatesh Beure Esq.
	Krishnarao B. Mande Esq.

Treasurer.

BALVANTRAO RAMCHANDRA ALIAS BALASAHEB NATU, Esq.

Auditor.

B. S. DAMODAR JANARDAN GOKHALE

Honorary Secretaries.

PROFESSOR GOPAL KRISHNA GOKHALE B. A.
VINAYAK RAMCHANDRA JALNAPURKAR, L. C. E.

Assistant Secretary.

PROCEEDINGS OF THE SABHA

Address of welcome to His Excellency Lord Sandhurst.

The following address of welcome was presented to His Excellency Lord Sandhurst G. C. L. E., Governor of Bombay, by the Sarvajanic Sabha on the 15th of June 1895. A deputation of the Sabha, headed by Sardar Ganpatrao Harihar, the Chief of Kurudwad, Vice President, and consisting of Sardar Ganpatrao Harihar, the Chief of Kurudwad, Sardar Baba Maharaj, Rao Bahadur V. M. Bhida, Mr. D. D. Bootee, Mr. Kapuswami Mudliar, Mr. C. V. Natu, the Hon'ble Mr. B. G. Tilak and Mr. G. K. Gokhale waited by appointment on His Excellency at 4 p. m. in the Darbar Hall, at Ganeshkhind. The address was read by Mr. G. K. Gokhale, Honorary Secretary.

To

HIS EXCELLENCY THE RIGHT HONORABLE

LORD SANDHURST G. C. L. E.,

Governor of Bombay.

MAY IT PLEASE YOUR EXCELLENCY,

On behalf of the Poona Sarvajanic Sabha—a body established twenty-five years ago to represent to Government the wants and wishes of the people of the Deccan—we beg respectfully to offer your Excellency a most hearty and loyal welcome to this historic city of Poona. The selection of your Excellency to preside over our destinies for the next five years was hailed everywhere with feelings of satisfaction and thankfulness, because among other things, of the connection of your distinguished father and uncle with this Presidency and the high esteem in which their names are still held here by the people. The hopeful anticipations thus formed were further strengthened by the declaration which your Lordship was pleased to make on the eve of your setting out for India—a declaration which was received with special satisfaction by the people of this Presidency—that during your administration it would be your ambition to walk in the footsteps of the great Mount-Stuart Elephinstone. The high purpose which prompted such a declaration has already creat-

ed a feeling not merely of hope but also of faith about the beneficent character of your Lordship's *regime*, and even in the brief period that has elapsed since your Lordship's accession to office, events have happened to show that this faith has not been misplaced.

2. It afforded us great satisfaction to see how, conscientiously and quietly your Excellency utilized your short stay in Bombay by personally visiting its public institutions and making yourself acquainted with those who had the management of its Schools and Colleges, Hospitals and Mills. Your courteous invitation to the Bombay Corporation to submit their views on the Police question still under discussion produced also a happy effect on the public mind. Your Excellency's visit to Poona in March last to open the Fergusson College buildings, the inconvenience with which you so readily put up on the occasion with a view to meet the wishes of the Deccan Education Society that the opening ceremony should be performed on the Hindu new year's day, and the sympathetic assurance which you gave on the occasion about the policy of Government in regard to higher education have been very widely appreciated all over the Presidency. Last but not least, the concession of the elective franchise to the Local Boards of the Central Division has filled the public mind with the liveliest sense of gratitude. The Sabha gladly takes this opportunity of tendering to your Excellency the most grateful thanks of the people of the Deccan for thus doing justice to their claims at the earliest opportunity available and thereby removing all cause for complaint in the matter.

3. Among the subjects, which have engaged the public mind for some time past and to which the Sabha would now respectfully invite your Lordship's attention, is the delay which has taken place in the settlement of the question of the constitution of the New Provincial Service. The draft rules intended to regulate first admissions to this Service have now been under considerations for more than 3 years. The rules already drafted by the Bombay Government have created a wide feeling of dissatisfaction and alarm. The Provincial Service has been brought into existence to "do full justice to the claims of the Natives of India to higher and more extended employment in the public service," and it is proposed to amalgamate with it some of the higher posts reserved for Conventured Civil Servants. It is therefore a matter of the first importance that the men who are appointed to it should possess, as recommen-

ded by the Public Service Commission, the highest educational qualifications available in this country. "As the conditions of admissions," the Commission observed, "to the Imperial Service aim at high English qualifications, so the conditions of admission to the Provincial Service should be framed with a view to secure the best qualifications obtainable in India." And again: "the qualifications required for admission to the Provincial Service must be such as to give fair promise that the candidates admitted to it will, in time, be fit to discharge the duties of high appointments formerly belonging to the Covenanted Service, but now to be amalgamated with the Provincial Service, to which members of the Provincial Service will ordinarily in due course be promoted." The London examination for the Indian Civil Service is one of the stiffest competitive examinations in the world, and if men possessing qualifications inferior even to those of an Indian undergraduate—for the proposed competitive examination for the Provincial Service is simpler than even the Matriculation test of our University—are appointed to posts usually held by Covenanted Civil Servants, it would be obviously for these men to enjoy the same consideration at the hands of Government or be held by the people in the same esteem. Passing a high educational test, again, does not merely indicate a certain amount of intellectual development only. It also implies a developed moral sense and an awakened feeling of sympathy with the mass of the population, without which no officer, however able, can properly discharge the duties of his office. The Sabha, therefore, respectfully prays that your Excellency's government will be pleased to reconsider this matter. If the test proposed at present is allowed to stand as it is, the Sabha feels convinced that the failure of the Provincial Service is as certain as that of the Statutory Service. Another defect in the proposed rules, which has caused serious dissatisfaction, is the proposal to distribute the posts to be thrown open to competition on the principle of races and castes. Such a principle directly violates the assurances solemnly given to the people of this country from time to time, viz. that in making appointments to the Public Service, "fitness and fitness alone will be the criterion of eligibility," and that "whatever other tests of qualifications may be adopted, distinctions of race and religion shall not be among the number." If the proposal is intended to help the advance of what are called the backward classes, we humbly submit that this advance can be secured not by conferring on members of these classes ap-

pointments for which they may not be fit and thereby impairing general administrative efficiency, but only by giving them special facilities to come up educationally in a line with the more advanced sections of the community. The Sabha therefore ventures respectfully to hope that your Excellency will yet be able to save the Presidency from the demoralizing results that must arise from the adoption of these rules.

4. Another subject to which the Sabha would humbly invite your Lordship's attention is the great hardship and misery caused by the revision settlements lately effected, more especially in parts of the Kolaba and Ratnagiri Districts. The so-called Settlement Department unsettles men's minds by reason of the total absence of all fixed principles which regulate its work beyond a desire to bring more revenue. It unsettles the relations of lands, disappoints industry of its just expectations, and turns what is intended to be a tax on rents into a tax on capital and on the wages of the hard-pressed agriculturist. The Department does not observe the rules laid down for its guidance and always makes out special cases for exceptions. The enhancements on individual holdings are really those which concern individual Ryots, and these are too often raised far above the limits laid down by Government for its guidance. Even the Taluka and village limits are similarly transgressed. The total increase in the case of Panval and Alibag Talukas has been about 45 per cent. instead of 33 per cent. The pledge, not to tax improvements made by holders, is also often-times violated and the persons aggrieved have no legal remedy or redress. In the Devgad Taluka of Ratnagiri, the revision settlements have practically resulted in a confiscation of the property of many of the Khots, the assessment now demanded being considerably in excess of the total rents due to the Khots from their tenants. In Panvel, Pen and other Talukas, the taxing of Varkas lands separately has worked prejudicially in the same manner. The suffering caused by these operations of the Survey Department is so acute that it is imperatively necessary for Government to adopt measures of relief without further delay.

5. The question of Hindu-Mahomedan riots is also one in regard to which the public mind is not yet free from anxiety. The views of the Sabha on this subject have been exhaustively set forth in two memorials submitted by it to your Lordship's predecessor

some months ago. The present peaceful disposition of the parties should, in the opinion of the Sabha, be taken advantage of for the adoption of the measures suggested there-in to ensure permanent relations of amity and good-will between the parties, especially the amendment of the Police Laws which place unnecessarily large power in the hands of the Police officer in the matter of regulating processions and music, and the formation of Conciliatory Boards on the lines on which they have been formed by the North-West Provinces Government.

6. The question of Forests is also one of great urgency, as it affects seriously the interests of the poorest population. The wise and sympathetic policy embodied in the recent resolution of the Government of India on Forest administration leaves nothing to be desired, if effect is given to it by a change in the rules. The Sabha prays that these rules will be framed in a liberal spirit and that Government will not allow the Department to be worked as a means of increasing revenue from its monopoly so much as of real conservancy of the needs of the agricultural classes, providing free grazing for their cattle of all kinds without distinction and securing their contentment by disforesting nominal forests in barren plains and by restricting strict checks only to those parts where the preservation of trees is likely to be of general benefit by preventing the silting of rivers and streams.

These are some of the subjects to which the Sabha ventures to respectfully invite your Excellency's attention on this occasion. The Sabha is deeply sensible of your Excellency's kindness and condescension in accepting this humble address of welcome, and it trusts that your Lordship's rule in this Presidency will bring increased progress and prosperity and contentment to the people committed by Her Gracious Majesty to your care.

We beg to remain,
Your Excellency's humble
and obedient servants.

(Sd.) GANPATRAO HARIHAR.
" VASUDEVRAO HARIHAR PANDIT.
" DORAJI DADABHAI BOOTL.
" NARAYAN BHAI DANDEKAR.
" KUPUSWAMI MUDLIAR.

(Sd.) VISHNCO MORESWAR BHIDE.
" CHINTAMAN VISWANATH NATU.
" BAL GANCADHAR TILAK.
" KAZI AJMUDIN.
" G. K. GOKHALE.

His Excellency replied as follows:—

Mr. Vice-President and Gentlemen,—I have to thank you most sincerely for the hearty and loyal welcome you give me, and also for the kind terms in which you give expression to your sentiments. I see that you say that you are an Association of twenty-five years' standing, and that you were originally formed to represent to Government the wants and wishes of the people of the Deccan. That being the case, and I on my part being anxious to know the wants and wishes, and indeed to come in touch as closely as I can with all classes in this Presidency, I welcome you here to-day, and I am gratified by the honour you have done me in coming here to present this address. Turning to your address, there are two or three subjects mentioned to which I desire to make allusion. But before I come to these I wish to dwell for a moment on what I consider a somewhat sweeping assertion, which is followed, as is not unfrequently the case with sweeping assertions, by what I consider is at any rate an inconsistency. You say that there is a total absence of all fixed principles to regulate the Survey Department, and follow it not very long after by the statement that the department does not observe the rules laid down for its guidance. These two statements appear to me inconsistent, and I do not admit their accuracy. Now, in regard to these two assertions, I have to make a general remark. I must ask you to believe that no cause can be materially advanced by sweeping and unsupported allegations of this description against a body of public servants who for years past have done their work before the eyes of the public of this Presidency. I may say at once that while I trust all sections of the public in the Bombay Presidency will find me, while I have the honour to be Governor of this Presidency, ready to give a patient hearing and sympathetic consideration to their representations, I on my part shall expect those who approach me to deal with Government officials as honourable men anxious to do their duty according to their lights. But I will say this. Send me what cases you think are hardly dealt with and support them by evidence, and I can assure you then the most careful investigation shall ensue; but I am convinced that we are both more likely to attain the end we have in view, if loose and general charges are avoided. In the remainder of para. 4. I can assure you that the matters there referred to shall have my most earnest and careful attention. I am already aware that the Devgad settlement has raised a most difficult question

which is still under consideration. I think I may remind you that the settlement operations in that taluka are not matters of revision but of original settlement work, and I may also note that the Taluka increases in Alibag worked out in the report to only 33·2 per cent, and that it is more than probable that when the whole thing is completed in detail the actual increase will be within the 33 per cent prescribed. I am aware that the imposition of an agricultural assessment on warkas lands has resulted in a heavy increase of the assessment. I have had the whole matter recently before me in the case of the Bhiwandi Taluka, and in coming to a conclusion on that case I had to refer back to my predecessor's order in the cases of Kalyan and Murbad. I might venture to remind you, however, that this assessment of the warkas has been carried out with the knowledge and previous sanction of the Secretary of State, I can assure you most sincerely that these settlement questions shall have my earnest and close attention. Returning to para. 3, which deals with the new Provincial Service, and which you discuss with a certain amount of detail, there I am in a position of some difficulty. In this discussion I am sorry I cannot follow you nor reply to your criticism. The rules are still under correspondence with the Government of India and have not been made public. I might here remark that the other day I saw a statement either in a speech or a letter by Mr. Wacha in a newspaper that Mr. Birdwood had made a statement on behalf of Government. I have made enquiries, and as far as I can discover, that gentleman must have been under some misapprehension, for Mr. Birdwood has made no statement of the kind. In para. 5, you touch on a subject regarding which I should wish to say as little as possible. I sincerely hope that this is a closed chapter, as far as disturbances go, in the history of the Presidency, and such disturbances are incidents to which none can look back without sincere regret. I very much hope that while I am responsible for the administration the good sense and moderation of all parties will free my administration from the necessity of actively dealing with such matters. But the policy of Government has been authoritatively declared by Lord Lansdowne at Agra, and more recently in a reply given by the Hon. Sir A. P. Mac-Donnell on the 7th February last, I think, in the Legislative Council of the Governor-General at Calcutta. I have recently had before me the question of those differences at Yeola. I have read the papers connected with that matter over and over again, and as far as I can judge they seem to show that the present machi-

nery of Government is ample for the purpose of dealing with such questions where any real desire for reconciliation evinces itself. The greatest credit is due to Mr. Wingate and those who worked under him for their tact and sympathetic firmness, and I should like to avail myself of the opportunity of publicly acknowledging the services rendered by the Raje Bahadur of Malegaum and by the Kaz. of Nasik in this matter. As a result, the the Government have been able, on Mr. Wingate's report and on his recommendation, to reduce by more than 50 per cent. the cost of the additional police force which was in the first instance drafted there to ensure the peace of the town. Seeing how successful these efforts have been, I should like to see some more confidence shown in the local officers and in the action they take. I venture to suggest, gentlemen, that your communities would do well to regard with more trust and sympathy the local officers who are charged with the administration of the districts of this Presidency. I am glad to make that remark by the perusal of a speech made by Mr. Wacha at Belgaum, of which he was kind enough to send me a copy. I read that speech with much attention and great interest, but I was a little surprised to find that towards the close of that speech I was praised for having made, in response to a telegraphic appeal, certain modifications in the police regulations regarding music at Poona. Well, gentlemen, praise is a very pleasant thing, even if undeserved, and I am by no means certain that when it is undeserved, it comes even more as a surprise than at any other time, but it should be bestowed in the right quarter. I am not sure whether any Governor would deserve praise who interfered with the orders of responsible local officers in response to a telegraphic appeal, but in the present case I refer to the matter merely to point out that I had nothing to do with the matter, and that if regulations on this subject, which your communities have felt oppressive, have been relaxed you have, so far as I am aware, to thank your own District Magistrate and Police Superintendent. Your newspaper this morning will show you fresh modifications. I am very glad—and I am sure the local officials were very glad—that it was possible to meet the wishes of the community in this matter to some extent, and I think that this instance and that of Yeola add point to my suggestion that after all the local officials are worthy of your confidence, most anxious to meet your wishes, and ready to relax any unpleasant temporary restrictions as soon as you can show them that these concessions can be safely made.

Coming now to para. 6, I am aware that the management of Government forests has been a burning and difficult question in the past. I am of course, at present but imperfectly acquainted with it, but I have asked for information, and I find that there is a great mass of official literature on the subject. I asked specially also in what respects the Government of India Resolution to which you refer with much gratitude differed from the policy of this Government, and I was referred to a series of Resolutions (I am not sure that they were ever published) initiated by the Government of which Sir Charles Pritchard was the revenue member, and cordially accepted by Government, which show that the policy enunciated by his Excellency the present Viceroy is one in entire accord with previous pronouncements of this Government. The subject is one to which, as you know, Lord Reay paid attention, and it seems to me that his desire for a policy which should safeguard as far as possible the interest of the cultivations was accepted by his successor's Government, and the Departmental orders issued were framed to enforce and elaborate this policy. You may rest assured that I shall loyally accept and do all I can to further the policy of my predecessors and of the Government of India in this respect. And now gentlemen, I have kept you some time I fear. My reply has been longer than is customary and usual in return to address of a congratulatory nature. You, however, raised in your address some points on which I am not sorry to have had an opportunity of saying a word. Pray take note of what I said at the beginning of my reply, as I mean it. I assure you that it is not my intention to lecture, and I have not the slightest wish even to seem to lecture your body, I merely wish to point out that I want to have fair play all round, and that while I should never attempt to screen an official or body of officials, I am resolved that they shall receive the same consideration as I am prepared to give to, for instance, the Sabha, and being not without some little experience I think I may say the more moderate the statements, the less general and sweeping the assertions, the more weighty your counsels are likely to carry in the minds of thinking men, and far more likely are you to bring about the objects for which you announce you are associated, which I understand to be the improvement of the people—a noble object, with which I deeply sympathise. And now I have come to the end of my remarks. I am glad we have become acquainted and, I shall always be glad to receive your representations. Again I beg to thank you, gentlemen, for the cordiality of the terms of your address.

THE TREE BLOSSOMED.

SHIWAJI AS A CIVIL RULER.

The history of Shiwaji's military exploits, narrated in the last Chapter, only presents to our view one side of the working of his master mind, and we are too apt to forget that he had other and stronger claims upon our attention as a civil ruler. Like the first Napoleon, Shiwaji in his time was a great organiser, and a builder of civil institutions, which conduced largely to the success of the movement initiated by him, and which alone enabled the country to pass unscathed through the dangers which overwhelmed it shortly after his death, and helped it to assert its claim to national independence, after a twenty years' struggle with the whole power of the Mogal Empire. These civil institutions deserve special study because they display an originality and breadth of conception which he could not have derived from the systems of government then prevalent under Mahomedan or Hindu rule; and what is still more note-worthy is that when, after the war of independence, the country was reorganised, his own successors returned to the traditions of the past, and departed from the lines laid down by the founder of the Marhatta power, and in so departing from the model he had set up, they sowed the seeds of that disunion and separation which it was his constant solicitude to avoid in all that he attempted and achieved. As has been stated before, Shiwaji did not aspire to found an universal Empire under his own direct rule throughout India. He strove to secure the freedom of his own people, and unite them into one nation powerful for self-defence, and for self-assertion also; but the extinction of all other powers was not contemplated by him. He had friendly relations with the Chiefs of Gol-

conda and Bednur, and even Bijapoor, and did not interfere with their respective spheres of influence, in the Telangan, Mysore, and Carnatic countries, and he allowed his brother Venkoji to retain his father's Jahagir, all to himself, in the Dravid country. He contented himself with levying only *chauth* and Sardeshmukhi from the Mogul possessions. He made a clear distinction between Swarajya (territory directly governed by him); and Mogalai (that governed by foreign kings outside his Swarajya). The civil institutions founded by him were intended chiefly for the Marahatta country proper, though they were also introduced partially in the line of military forts, maintained by him to the extreme south of the Peninsula. The civil territory, held under his direct sway, was divided into a number of Prants (Districts). Besides his ancestral Jahagir about Poona, there was (1) Prant Mawal corresponding with Mawal, Saswad, Junnar, and Khed Talookas of the present day, and guarded by 18 great Hill-forts; (2) the Prants of Wai, Sattara, and Karad,—corresponding with the Western portions of the present Sattara district, guarded by 15 forts; (3) Prant Panhala—corresponding with the Western parts of Kolhapoor, with 13 Hill-forts; (4) Prant South Konkan, corresponding with Ratuagiri, with 58 Hill forts and sea fortresses; (5) Prant Thana,—corresponding with North Konkan district, with 12 forts; (6,7) Prants Trimbak and Baglan—corresponding with the Western parts of Nasik, with 62 Hill forts. The territories occupied by the military garrisons were (8) Prant Wanagad—corresponding with the Southern parts of Dharwar district, with 22 forts; (9,10,11) Prants Bednur, Kolhar, and Sbringpatam—corresponding with the modern Mysore, with 18 forts; (12) Prant Carnatic, being the ceded districts in the Madras Presidency south of the Krishna, with 18 forts; (13) Prant Vellor—(modern Arcat districts) with 25 forts, and (14) Prant Tanjore with 6 forts. The whole of the Sahyadri range was studded with forts, and the territories to the west

as far as the sea, and to the east of these forts, varied in breadth from 50 to 100 miles at the most.

The chronicles make mention of some 280 forts in Shiwaji's occupation. In one sense it might be said that the Hill-fort, with the territory commanded by it, was the unit of Shiwaji's civil government. He spared no money in building new, and repairing old forts, and his arrangements about the garrisoning and provisioning of these forts were of the most elaborate kind. The military exploits, which made these forts so famous, as points of resistance against attack, or centres of aggression, formed the chief interest of these early Marhatta wars. The Empire was knit together by the chain of these Hill-forts, and they were its saviours in days of adversity. In the Sattara district, Sattrra itself stood a siege for many months against Aurangzebe's whole power, and though it was stormed at last, it was the first fort which was taken back from the Moguls under Rajaram's leadership by the ancestors of the present chief of Aundh. Torana and Rajagurh are associated with the first conquests of Shiwaji, Shivaneri was his birth-place, Parandar was made memorable by Baji Parbhu's defence, and Kolada and Singhgad will always be associated with the memory of the brave Tanaji Malusare; Panhala stood the famous siege by Shiddijohar while Rangana was famous for the defence by another Baji Parbhu of the defile which led to it at the sacrifice of his life. The Malwan fort and Kolaba were the places where the Maratta navy was fitted out for its expeditions by sea. Pratapgad was made famous as the place of Afzul Khan's tragedy, while Mahuli and Saleri were scenes of great battles in which the Maratta Mawalees defeated the Mogul commanders. The extreme limits on the east side of these Hill-forts of Shiwaji's possessions were marked by the fortresses of Kalyan, Bhiwadi, Wai, Kerad, Supe, Khataw Baramati, Chakan, Shirawal, Mraj, Tasgaon, and Kolhapoor. The important part played by these

forts justified the care Shiwaji bestowed on them. Each fort was under a Maratta Hawaldar, who had under him other assistants, in charge of each circular wall of defence, from the same class, and he was assisted by a Brahmin Subhedar, or Subnis, chosen from the three great divisions of Brahmins, and a Karkhanis who was a Parbhu. The Hawaldar with his assistants had the military charge of the garrison. The Brahmin Subhedar had the civil and revenue charge and this charge included the villages within the command of the fort, while the Parbhoo officer was in charge of the grain and fodder and military stores and of the repairs. The three classes were thus joined together in a division of work, which ensured fidelity, and prevented jealousy. The hill-sides were carefully protected by strict conservancy, and the charge of the forests below the forts was entrusted to the Ramoshis, and other lower classes of the population. Minute directions were given as to the way watch and ward duties were to be performed by day and night. The garrison varied in numbers according to the size and importance of the forts. There was a Naik for every 9 Sepoys, and the arms were guns, short swords, javelins, spears and pattas (long thin swords). Each man received in cash and kind fixed amounts as wages for service according to his rank.

Coming down from the Hill forts to the plains, the country was divided into Mahals, and Prants very much on the plan now in force, in our Talooka system. The average revenue of a Mahal ranged from three-fourths of a lack to a lack and a quarter, and two or three Mahals made a Subha or a district. The average pay of a Subhedar was 400 *hons* per year i. e. about Rs. 100 per month. Shiwaji did not continue the old Mogul system of leaving the revenue management solely in the hands of the village patels or Kulkarnis or of the Deshamukhas, and Deshapandes of the district. These village and district authorities received their dues as before, but the work

of management was taken out of their hands, and carried on directly by the Subhedars or Mahalkaris for the Subha or the Mahal, while every group of two or three villages was managed by a Kamawisdar (Karkoon) who made the direct collection of the revenue. The plan of farming out land-revenue, either of villages or mahals, found no support under Shiwaji's system.

The gradations of officers and men in the garrisons of the Hill-forts were only copied from the regulations which were enforced by Shiwaji both in his infantry and in his cavalry. In each Infantry corps there was a Naik for every ten soldiers, one Havildar had charge of 5 such parties, 2 Hawals made one Jumaledar, 10 Jumalas made a full corps of 1000 men under a Hazari, and 7 Hazaris made up a Sarnobat's charge for the Mawali infantry. In the cavalry, there were 2 divisions, Bargirs and Shiledars, and 25 Bargirs or Shiledars had a Havildar over them, 5 Hawals made one Jumala, 10 Jumalas made a Hazari's charge, and 5 Hazari charges made one Panch Hazari. The Panch Hazari was under the Surnobat of the cavalry. Every batch of 25 horses had one water-carrier and farrier. Under each of the higher Maratta officers, both in the infantry and cavalry, there was a Brahmin Sabnis and a Parbhoo Karkhanis or a Brahmin Muzumdar and Prabho Jaminis. The Bargir's horses were during the monsoons cantoned in camps where every provision was made for grass and grain supplies, and barracks were built for the men to live under shelter. All the officers and men received fixed pay, which in the case of the Paga Hazari was 1,000 *hons*, and Paga Panch Hazari 3,000 *hons*. In the case of the Infantry, the pay was 500 *Hons* for the Hazari, and for the lower officers and men, the pay varied from Rs. 9 to 3 for the infantry, and Rs. 20 to 6 in the cavalry according to the higher or lower rank of the soldier or trooper. During 8 months in the year,

the armies were expected to maintain themselves by *mulkhagiri* i. e. by levying Chouth and Sardeshmukhi, from the Mogul Districts. When engaged on such service, the men were strictly prohibited from taking their women and children with them. When a city was plundered, the loot had to be accounted for by each soldier and trooper. No soldier or trooper was enlisted without taking a security bond from his fellows to insure good conduct. The military commanders were paid in advance, and they had to account for the Chouth and Sardeshmukhi collected by them. No assignments of revenue or land were allowed for the service of the army in Shivaji's time. Notwithstanding these strict restraints, there was no difficulty found about the enlistment of recruits in the army, and no service was more popular than that which led the Mawalees of the Ghantmatia and the Hatekaries of the Konkan, and the Shilledars and Bargirs of Maharashtra proper, to flock in numbers to the national standard on each Dasara day, when a call was made for their services.

This system of cash payment and direct revenue management was introduced and extended by Shivaji throughout his dominions. Native chroniclers notice this departure from old traditions in these two points more prominently because Shivaji appears to have laid great stress on it. It was his conviction that much of the disorder in old times was due to the entrusting of revenue duties to Zamidars of Districts and villages. They collected more from the Rayats, and paid less into the treasury than was strictly due, and used their opportunities to create disturbances and to resist the commands of the central power. Shivaji engaged the services of paid men—Kamavidars, Mahalkaris and Subhedars, for the duties till then performed by Zamidars. It was the Kamawisdar's duty to levy the grain and cash payments while the crops were standing. The fields were carefully measured out, and entered in blocks in the name of the holders

thereof, and annual Kaboolayats were taken from them for the payments due. In the case of grain payments, the Government assessment never exceeded two-fifths of the actual yield. The remaining three-fifths were left to the cultivator as his share of the crops. In times of distress, or in case of accident, Tagai advances were made liberally, and their recovery provided for by instalments spread over 4 or 5 years. The Subhedars performed both revenue and criminal duties. The work of Civil Courts was not then of much importance, and when disputes arose, parties were referred by the Subhedar to the Panch of the villages, or to those of other villages in important cases, and enforced their decisions.

The Civil organization of the District was of course subordinate to the authorities at head-quarters, two of whom—the Pant Amatya and the Pant Sachiwa, had respectively the charge of what in our time would be called the office of Finance Minister and the General Accountant and Auditor. The district accounts had to be sent to these officers, and were there collated together, and irregularities detected and punished. These officers had power to depute men on their establishments to supervise the working of the district officers. The Pant Amatya and the Pant Sachiwa were, next to the Peshwa, the highest civil officers, and they had, besides these revenue duties, military commands. They were both important members of the Board of Administration, called the Asta Pradhan or Cabinet of eight heads of departments. The Peshawa was Prime-minister, next to the king, and was at the head of both the civil and military administration, and sat first on the right hand below the throne. The Senapati was in charge of the military administration, and sat first on the left side. Amatya and Sachiwa sat next to the Peshawa, while the Mantri sat next below the Sachiwa, and was in charge of the king's private affairs. The Sumant was foreign Secretary, and sat below the Senapati on the left.

Next came Panditrao who had charge of the ecclesiastical department, and below him on the left side sat the Chief Justice. It will be seen from these details that the Asta Pradhan system has its counter-part in the present constitution of the Government of India. The Governor-General and Viceroy occupies the place of the Peshawa; next comes the Commander-in-chief of the army. The Finance and Foreign Ministers come next. In the Government of India, the Executive Council makes no room for the head of the ecclesiastical department, or for the Chief Justice on one side, and the Private Secretary on the other, and in their place sit the Member in charge of the Home Department, the Legal Member, and the Public Works Minister. These variations are due to the difference of circumstances, but the conception which lies at the bottom of both systems is the same, of having a council of the highest officers of the state, sitting together to assist the king in the proper discharge of his duties. If this system could have been loyally worked out by the successors of Shivaji, as it was originally conceived and worked by Shivaji himself, many of the dangers which ultimately destroyed the Marhatta confederacy, even before it came in conflict with the superior discipline and resources of the British power, might have been avoided. The seeds of dissolution lay in the fact that the necessities of the times required all the eight Pradhans or ministers, except Panditrao and Nysyadhisha, to be military commanders, and these military commands necessarily placed power in the hands of the most successful leaders of the army. Shivaji himself carefully guarded against this danger by providing that none of these offices should be hereditary. In his own time he had four different Commanders-in-Chief viz. Mankoji Dahatonde, Netaji Palkar, Prataprao Gujar, and Hambirrao Mohite. He deprived the first Peshawa of his office, and gave it to Moropant Pingle. The Pant Amatya's office similarly changed hands, and in fact the other

offices were not allowed to be hereditary in particular families. This caution was, to some extent, observed in the early years of Shahu's reign; but towards its end the talents and power of the first three Peshawas, Balaji Vishwanath, the first Bajirao, and Balaji Bajirao, made the Peshawaship hereditary in their family, whilst the representatives of the other ministers were mostly incapable men, and their importance dwindled in consequence, and the equal distribution and balance of power was destroyed. Throughout the Peshawa's rule, the Astapradhans or the eight hereditary ministers of state, had no functions, or only nominal functions to discharge, and instead of being the organised government, which Shiwaji designed it to be, we find an unorganised power of the old Asiatic type, depending solely for its vitality upon the capacity of the chief center of power. Shiwaji's system cannot be blamed for such a consequence. It was the departure from his system that was responsible for the failure of his plans.

In another respect also, Shiwaji was far in advance of his times. He set himself steadily against any assignments of land as Jahagir to his successful civil or military commanders. Every one from the Peshawa and Senapati down to the lowest sepoy or karkoon was, under Shiwaji's arrangements, directed to draw his salary in kind or money from the public treasury and granaries. The salaries were fixed and paid regularly at stated periods. The assignment system was condemned because it was liable to be abused under the best circumstances, and with the best motives. The Jahagirdar naturally tends to become a territorial or feudal landlord, and when his influence is strengthened by hereditary connections, he cannot be removed except by force. The centrifugal tendencies towards separation and disunion are always naturally very strong in India, and the system of assigning Jahagirs, and permitting the Jahagirdar to maintain a force of his own out of

the revenue of the land assigned to him, aggravates this tendency to a degree which makes well-ordered rule almost impossible. Shiwaji would not even allow Zamidars of the District to build forts for their protection, but required them to live in houses unprotected like these of the Rayats. None of the great men, who distinguished themselves in Shiwaji's time, were able to hand over to their descendants large landed estates. Neither Moropant Pingley nor Abaji Sondeo, nor Ragho Ballal or Datto Annaji or Neeraji Raoji, among the Brahmins, nor the Maloosres or Kanks, or Prataprao Gujar, Netaji Palkar, Hambirrao Mohite of the Maratha Sardars, were able to found ancient families such as those which Shahu's ministers in the early part of the 18th century succeeded in doing.

The only assignments of land which Shiwaji sanctioned in his time were intended for the endowment of temples and charities. These were public trusts, and the holders thereof had no military duties to discharge, and could not, in the ordinary course of things, become dangerous to the State. Among the charities, the Dakshina system of encouraging learning found strong support with Shiwaji. It was an old edition of our modern system of payment by results. Brahmins received Dakshina according to a scale which was carefully graduated so as to provide both for the extent and quality of learning acquired. There were no public schools in those days, but private teachers taught pupils in their own homes, and both teacher and pupil were placed above want by means of a judicious distribution of annual rewards. Sanskrit learning was at its lowest ebb in these parts when Shiwaji rose to power, but by the methods of encouragement adopted by him, the Deccan soon became known for the proficiency of her scholars who proceeded to Benares for purposes of study, and returned back to their country laden with honors, and rewarded by their sovereign. The Dakshina system of encouraging

learning was, after Sambhaji's capture by the Moguls, kept up by the Dabhades of Talegaon, and when the Dabhades lost their importance, the Peshwas took up the trust, and greatly enlarged its scope, and it flourished down to the times of the British conquest, when the amount disbursed each year is said to have exceeded five lacs.

It will be seen from the details given above that Shivaji's system of Civil Government was distinguished from those which preceded it or succeeded it, in several important respects;—

1stly. In the great importance he attached to the Hill-forts, which were virtually the standing unit of his system of Government.

2ndly. In his discouragement of the hereditary system of transmitting high offices in one and the same family.

3rdly. In his refusal to grant Jagdi assignments of land for the support of Civil or Military officers.

4thly. In the establishment of a direct system of revenue management, without the intervention of district or village Zamindars.

5thly. In the disallowance of the training mystery.

6thly. In the establishment of a Council of Ministers with their proper work allotted to them, and each directly responsible to the King or Council.

7thly. In the subordination of the Military to the Civil element in the administration.

8thly. In the intermixture of Brahmins, Parbhooes and Marhattas in all offices, high and low, so as to keep check upon one another.

Of course some of these distinctive features could not be continued intact when the Marhatta power, instead of being confined to the small area of the Swarajya district, was extended in all directions so as to embrace provinces so distant as Cuttack on the east, and Katiawar on the west, and Delhi in the north and Tanjore in the south. In the Marhatta country

proper, the nation, the army, the officers, and the kings were all of the same race, and a common bond of loyalty knit them together in a way which it was impossible to secure in distant parts of India, where the conquered population differed essentially from the army of occupation, and too often the army of occupation consisted of mercenaries who had no bond of union with their commanding officers, or with the representatives of the central power. It is therefore not to be wondered at that Shiwaji's institutions, as described above, were not found elastic enough to be suitable for all parts of India. The connection of the Hill-forts with the plains commanded by them, for instance, was a feature so entirely local that it could not be accepted as a practical basis of government in the plains of Guzerath, or Malwa, or in the Eastern Districts of Maharashtra itself. For a similar reason, the strict system of direct revenue management and the total supercession of farmers and zamidars was also not equally suited for distant provinces, where the traditions of government had been all along opposed to such direct collection. While therefore allowance may be made for these and other considerations, there can be no doubt that, in other respects, the departure from Shiwaji's system was a distinctly retrograde step, for which no similar excuse can be pleaded, except that the men who came after did not realise the wisdom of his plans, and yielded to the temptation of present convenience, only to find that they had thereby lowered the organised union he had established into an unorganised mass held together by the very loosest ties, and threatening dissolution at the first great crisis in its history.

The system of Government by a Council of eight Ministers, for instance, was retained in the early years of Shahu's reign, but gradually fell into disuse when the Peshawa's power increased so as to overshadow the other Ministers, and it actually ceased to exist when the Peshawas made Poona their capital. The Pant

Amatya and Pant Sachiwa, the most powerful civil functionaries next to the Peshwa, occupy no place in the Marhatta history after Shahu's death, and sank into the position of mere Jehagirdars. The Peshawas did not venture or care to set up any substitutes in their place, and presumed to manage all affairs on their own responsibility. They were their own generals, and their own finance ministers, and foreign ministers also. No wonder that the personal system of rule thus established had not the stability which it would have derived, if Shiwaji's institutions had been faithfully respected by his successors.

The system of filling up high offices as though they were hereditary Watans was another retrograde departure from the instructions laid down by Shiwaji, and systematically carried out by him. When the Peshawaship itself became hereditary, it was not to be wondered at that every other office became hereditary also. But as natural capacity and virtues are not hereditary endowments, the office soon came to be filled up by incapable persons, and brought on, sooner or later, the expected disaster. Four generations of Peshawas retained power by natural right; but the other officers had not even this claim to urge for the continuance of office in their families. New men rose from the ranks to the top-most positions, but there was no room for them in the general Councils of the Empire. Nana Faranavis, for instance, from being a Fadnis, aspired to be Prime Minister, Mahadji Shinde, from being a Sirdar of secondary importance, became the most powerful military commander of his time. There was no room for both of them, and the like of them, in the central council, and each tried to supplant the other by force or craft, and each dragged the other down. More frequently still, the great military commanders became kings in their own territory, and made peace or war at their own will. This danger might have been, to a great extent, obviated, if the system of government by a council, with

the necessary enlargements dictated by altered circumstances, had been continued, and the hereditary principle not allowed to take such deep root, as it did in the course of two generations from Shiwaji's death.

The greatest departure, however, was in the abandonment of the principle of not giving extensive territories as Jahagir to those who could conquer them by the strength of their military prowess. To some extent this departure was forced upon the Government of Shahu by the events that had preceded his accession to power. The whole country of Maharashtra had been conquered by the Moguls after Sambhaji's death, and Sambhaji's brother, Rajaram, and his Councillors had been driven far to the South. The whole work had to be commenced again, and the new leaders who came to power had to be allowed much their own way. No fault therefore can be laid at the door of Rajaram's advisers, and the stress of adverse circumstances continued to be in considerable strength in the early years of Shahu. When, however, Shahu's Government was established in Maharashtra, and plans of extending the Empire in all directions were entertained, the temptation of present convenience was not so strong, and might have been resisted. It was just at this time that the mistake was committed of allowing every soldier of fortune to carve out his own Jahagir. Pillaji and Damaji Gaikawad settled themselves as sovereigns of Guzerath. The Bhosales of Nagpoor became supreme in those parts, while Shinde and Holkar and the Powars established themselves in Malwa and North India, under a very loose system of allegiance to the central power, represented by their agreement to pay a portion of the revenue to the Peshwa as wielding the chief authority in Maharashtra. When these Jahagir assignments were continued hereditarily, the transformation from organized to unorganized power was complete. Those who first acquired these

large domains retained some sense of loyalty to the common cause. Their successors, however, resented all interference with what they came to regard as their own private possessions. - It was in this way that the more important departures from the policy laid down by Shiwaji proved ruinous to the general interests.

Shiwaji's arrangements about the direct management of land revenue, without the intervention of the District and village Zamidars, were on the whole faithfully carried out by his successors, and during the best period of the Peshwa's rule, almost down to the death of Nana Fadanavis, the system of farming revenue found no favour. It was only under the rule of the last Peshwa that Districts began to be farmed out in the Marhatta country proper. In the outlying conquests of Malwa, Guzerath and other parts of North India, the farming system was more in vogue, as being more suited to the unsettled condition of those parts. While in this matter, therefore, Shiwaji's traditions were on the whole respected, the precautions he had taken about the distribution of offices amongst Marhattas, Brahmins and Parbhoo, do not appear to have commended themselves to his successors. The Parbhoo, who had played such an important part in the early history of Shiwaji, ceased to occupy any prominent place in the later history of the Peshwas from Balaji Bajirao's time. Only one great name, that of Sakharama Hari, who was a favourite commander under Raghunathrao Peshwa, appears in this later period, though in the Courts at Baroda and Nagpore, representatives of this class continued to play an important part as civil ministers and military commanders. As regards the Brahmins, there is an impression that the Konkanastha section had no employment under the great Shiwaji. The native chronicles, however, clearly show that Brahmins of all the three sections of that community were employed as Subhedars and Commanders of Hill-forts. The Deshastha Brahmins naturally took the lead in the times of

Shiwaji and his two sons. With the accession to power of the Peshwas in Shahu's time, the balance was turned in favour of the Konkanasthas, and the disproportion became more manifest, because the leading Deshastha Jahagirdars had taken the side of Raghunathrao in his wars with his nephews.

The military profession had not been monopolised by the Marhattas in Shiwaji's time, but they constituted the chief strength of the army, both in the ranks and file. The Brahmin commanders under Shiwaji were as brave in generalship as any Marhatta commander. This continued to be the case under the early Peshwas. The greatest Marhatta commanders were trained in the school of the first Bajirao Peshwa. When the great Marhatta families, who served under Bajirao, established themselves in distant provinces as virtual rulers, and became so powerful as to threaten the safety of the central authority, it was an aim of state policy at Poona to create an equipoise of Brahmin commanders in the south, and the Patwardhans and the Phadakes, the Rastes and the Gokhales, rose to positions of command, but they never could hold their own against the armies of Shindia and Holkar. The rivalry thus set up, however, proved, among other causes, most harmful to the general interest.

It will be thus seen that in all the points in which the principles of government laid down by Shiwaji were departed from by his successors, we can trace the causes of the weakness and decline of the Marhatta power, long before it came in conflict with British authority in India. That authority, when it obtained supremacy, gave its deliberate preference to the principles laid down by Shiwaji over those which found favour with his successors. British rule in India is carried on on the principle of enforcing a complete division of the Civil from the Military department and a due subordination of the latter to the former. It insists upon cash payments for services

rendered, and declines to make grants of lands by way of assignment for military or other services. It refuses to recognise any hereditary claims to public offices, high or low. The government is carried on by Boards and Councils, and not by the unfettered discretion of a single ruler. It collects its land revenue by its own paid agency, and never farms it out to the old Jamidars or farmers. It also provides for a due distribution of offices among all classes of its subject. As a consequence of the observance of these maxims of state policy, a handful of Englishmen have been able to govern the whole country in a way that strikes both native and foreign students of its administration as a marvellous feat of statesmanship. The wisdom of Shiwaji's principles has been thus vindicated, not only by the success which he himself achieved, but by the success which has attended the efforts of those who built their power upon the ruins of the confederacy which he had tried to knit together, and which broke up chiefly because Shiwaji's successors departed from the lines of policy laid down by him for their guidance.

OUR AMUSEMENTS.



A review of the history of different nations shows that human nature requires some sort of amusement. In the case of many rich men, it is a means of passing away their time which becomes burdensome to them for want of work: but with the members of the middle and lower classes amusement is necessary after the hard work of the day in order to enliven and cheer their drooping spirits and thereby enable them to go on with their business with the same energy as before.

Amusement, however, takes different forms according to the inclination of the people. Some find pleasure in athletic sports, some in indoor games and others in chase. But I think it can be said without fear of contradiction that music gives pleasure to all classes of people.

In ancient times the people of India resorted to music. The devout among them sang the glories of God. The great Yogi Mahadeva used to sing and dance with enthusiasm. Devarshi Narada always found pleasure in singing. The sages of old composed hymns in praise of God and chanted them. The females also derived pleasure from music. It is mentioned in the Mahabharat that Arjuna, the third Pandava, during the 13th year of his exile which was passed *incognito*, taught music, vocal and instrumental, as well as dancing to the female members of the King of Virat in the garb of a female. The Hindus of ancient India attached so great a value to music that the goddess of learning, Saraswati, is associated with it, and she is represented with a Vina in her hand.

* This paper, read some time back by Babu D. N. Gangoli before a Poona audience, has been kindly placed by him at our disposal.—*Editor, Quarterly Journal.*

Other nations of antiquity also appreciated music greatly. The Israilites used to sing hymns in praise of God whenever they were delivered from the dangers and difficulties which beset them. The prophets among them composed hymns and the saintly king David gave vent to his religious feelings through the psalms which have made his name famous throughout the world. Among this people, singing formed a part of their worship. There was a regular establishment of musicians among them. They numbered 288 and 24 parties were formed of them. They used to sing in the temple of God with cymbals, *psalteries* and harps. The Israilites associated with music all that was holy; and it is said in their Holy writings that the angels in heaven sing songs in praise of God.

The Greeks of old associated music with religion to a great extent. The philosophers among them who were believers in one God composed hymns in praise of the Almighty Being, and in their religious feasts music occupied the foremost place. Thus, in the Panathenea festival, persons of all ages and of both sexes used to go in procession singing hymns in praise of the goddess Minerva, and in the Pythian and other games prizes were given to those proficient in music. The Greeks attached so great a value to music that it was considered an essential part in the education of their children. The ruling men of the time also gave encouragement to it and under the orders of Pericles a musical theatre was erected in Athens. The ancient Greeks gave so high a place to music that they considered their God Apollo as its originator and represented him as sitting on mount Olympus with the nine muses.

Coming to modern times, we see music playing a prominent part in leading men to religion. Dnyanoba, Tukaram and other saints of the Deccan composed hymns which go by the name of *abhanga*, and sang them in temples and at the houses of devout persons.

Nanak in the Panjaub and Kabira in the upper Provinces also composed hymns and sang them. Mira Bai of the Rathore family of Marwar and Mriganayani of the Royal family of Guzerat took a great pleasure in composing religious stanzas and songs. Abyar of Southern India also composed religious stanzas. In Bengal, the great reformer Chaitanya roused the religious feelings of the people by means of *Sankirtan* in which that reformer with his disciples sang, danced and played on musical instruments. Chaitanya considered music so efficacious in leading men to God that he recognised drama as a means of religious instruction and actually put on the stage some plays with the help of his disciples. Ramprasad Sen composed hymns of an elevated nature which he himself sang at his native place. They breathed noble sentiments and succeeded in attracting the mind of the great men of that time. Raja Ram Mohun Roy composed hymns of a stirring nature which were sung at the Brahma Somaj in his time.

At the present time, music also takes a prominent part in divine worship. In Southern India, *Haridasas*, whilst giving discourses on religion, sing songs in temples and the houses of the people and Brahmins sing Vedic hymns which tend not a little to lead men to God. In Northern India, *Kothakaries*, *Kirtanwallas* and *Puraniks* render a similar service to the people and in Bengal, specially the Vaishnavas, Brahmins and native Christians perform *Sankirtan* in the manner laid down by Chaitanya. Even Hindu mendicants and Mahomedan Fakirs, who go from house to house to beg, delight the people with their religious songs. In the churches of Christians and Brahmins, hymns are sung to the delight of the devotees.

From what has been stated above, it is evident that from ancient times music has been instrumental in rousing the religious feelings of mankind. The history of nations also shows that it has been used in giving

vent to feelings of patriotism and love. It has always been found efficacious in inciting people to action. Its wonderful power is seen when martial songs sung on the battle-field inspire soldiers to give their lives for the sake of their country. The war song of the French, which goes by the name of Marseillaise, produced a marvellous effect on the French at the time of the great Revolution. It is mentioned in the history of that event that when the 500 soldiers from Marseilles proceeded towards Paris singing this song, all who heard it joined them leaving their domestic affairs. Foregoing all the comforts of a family life and unmindful of the fatigues of the journey they proceeded. Even fear of death could not dissuade them from taking such a step. The party increased as it went on, and when it reached Paris the number swelled to 20,000. I need not dilate further on the power of music. It is resorted to in every notable event of human life, and its value is appreciated throughout the world.

It is, however, a matter of regret that so useful a means of elevating human nature and imbuing it with feelings of patriotism and love, should be applied to excite the evil propensities of the heart. Music has been perverted to ungodly ends in a greater measure in India than elsewhere and my remarks on the subject will be confined to that country.

In the ancient writings of India, the names of Gandharvas and Apsaras occur. It is written in Taittiriya Aranyak that these two classes of beings were created along with the Devas, Manobas and Pitris. It is mentioned in the Atharva Veda that the Apsaras were the wives of the Gandharvas. The Gandharvas used to sing and the Apsaras dance. It is mentioned in the Mahabharat that they were employed by Indra, Yama and other gods to sing and dance before assemblies consisting of gods, Rishis and others. At an assembly in Indra's palace it is mentioned that the Gandharvas sang Samgatha,

which of course tended to elevate the mind, but the description given of the dancing by Apsaras shews that it incited the evil propensities of those who witnessed it. Although described as heavenly beings, the Gandharvas and Apsaras took a part in human affairs also. For, they entertained Yudhisthira and his guests at the Sabha or assembly organised by him. Besides the Gandharvas and Apsaras, there were also fallen women who used to delight the people with their songs. In the Ramayana, it is mentioned that some of the women, who were sent to the hermitage of Vrindaraka Rishi by the king of Anga, led Rishya Shring astray by their melodious songs.

Turning to modern India, we see this precious divine gift abused to a greater extent. In ancient times, music formed a part of the education of females and consequently people tasted the sweets of music in their family circles. It was only on public occasions that singing and dancing parties were employed. At the present time, not finding enjoyment in their homesteads, the people of India try to find it abroad.

We have seen what pleasure devout persons derive from music. They sing hymns in praise of God and when overpowered with feelings dance with enthusiasm. They associate with music all that is holy. But pleasure-seekers have lowered the dignity of music. The great Chaitanya raised theatrical performances to a high position by employing them for the purpose of rousing the religious feelings of the audience, but sometimes after his demise matters assumed a different aspect. Jattras or religious plays began to be performed, but the manner in which they were acted served to lead the audience astray instead of imbuing their minds with noble ideas and the religious plays did more harm than those which were enacted with the avowed object of pleasing the senses. These *Jattras*, proposing to serve religious good by placing before the people the deeds of their beloved God Krishna, depicted him as an

adulterer of the deepest die. Failing to grasp the meaning of the beautiful allegory contained in the Shrimat Bhagvat of the pure love of God towards men, the union of the Divine Spirit represented by Krishna with the human soul represented by Radha has been painted by poets as love between a gallant and his mistress : and the enactment of the scenes of love with poetic colorings has not only lowered Krishna but has served to vitiate the morality of the people. The songs sung in connection with the Jattras are of doubtful decency and they serve to imbue the minds of the audience with improper ideas. In the North Western Provinces, the actors of these plays go by the name of Rashdhari, and they are doing the same mischief in these Provinces. Not satisfied with witnessing these plays and hearing the songs connected with the so-called love fetes of Krishna with Radha, the people began to listen with pleasure to the panchaliwallas or the rhapsadists of Bengal who with their indecent effusions of poetry and singing of lewd songs have served not a little to corrupt the morals of the people of Bengal ; and finally to crown all, women came on the stage to complete the work of degradation which the Jatravallas and Panchalivalas had inaugurated. These are the dancing girls whose performances enchanted those who witnessed them. Forty years ago Bengal heard with rapt attention the licentious songs of men and witnessed without shame the lust-exciting gyrations of women. At that time, amusement was associated with immoral ideas ; and men and women, old and young, were seen in gatherings organised to witness those indecent scenes. And the wonder is that they were enacted before the deities they worshipped. Happily with the spread of education these scenes are now scarcely seen. The educated people of Bengal even now find pleasure in going to theatres, but the plays that are performed at these places are, generally speaking, devoid of

indecent scenes. The incidents connected with the ennobling lives of Chaitanya, Billamangal and other great men, when reproduced on the stage, and the exposure of the evils of society by the actors cannot but produce a beneficent effect on the audience. Whilst giving amusement, these performances serve to engender religious feelings in the minds of the people and induce them to remove from society the evils set forth by the actors in their true colors. There is of course room for improvement. Female actresses have been introduced into some of the theatres. The mixture of males with females in such pleasure parties is not at all desirable and although it is true that females can act the parts of women better than males, the separation of males from females on such occasions is necessary in order to improve the tone of morality in the members of the theatrical parties. The introduction or rather the revival of dramatical performances has checked the influence of the dancing girls to a great extent. On occasions of marriage, well-to-do persons generally entertain their guests with theatrical performances, and those who cannot afford to do so arrange for Jattras which have been greatly improved and are enacted in imitation of dramatical plays.

There are, however, some rich men in the principal towns in Bengal, notably Calcutta, who are setting a very bad example to the people. On occasions of religious festivals such as Durga Puja and Kali Puja, they invite to their homes European and native gentlemen and entertain them with foreign food and the *nauch* of dancing girls. These gentlemen, evidently, have no faith in the Hindu religion; and they make these Pujahs occasions for amusement. Whilst divine worship is going on in one apartment of the house, the rich owners are passing their time in another apartment in enjoyment of every description. This sort of amusement is reprehensible in the extreme. It casts a slur on the Hindu religion and makes us

ridiculous in the eyes of the European gentlemen who are invited. Better far that the rich gentlemen do not perform these Pujahs at all than that they should make them occasions for sensuality.

Let us now turn to the state of things in the North West Provinces. Here the singing of improper songs and the dance of *nautch* girls play a prominent part. On the occasion of Shimga or Holi, not only are songs delineating the love fetes of Krishna with the milkmaids of Gokul sung freely and with enthusiasm, but parties of males, young and old, pass through public thoroughfares in procession singing immoral songs and speaking of women in indecent terms. This is continued for days before and after the festival. On a certain occasion, I myself heard a boy in Allahabad giving expression to some improper words in the presence of his mother and this latter seemed to be well pleased with her son's doing. Although educated men do not take part in these indecent processions, the vile epithets applied to women during the season cannot fail to shock their feelings. Moreover, these indecent scenes tend to demoralise our young men which, on no account, should be passed unnoticed. Besides these indecent scenes on the occasion of Holi, the people of the North Western Provinces are much inclined to witness the dance of *nautch* girls on festive occasions. The *nautch* parties are always greatly in requisition and during marriage seasons they are almost indispensable. For gentlemen of position in society cannot dispense with this mode of amusement on such occasions without losing their prestige. In the Punjab and the Central Provinces also, similar practices are also in vogue.

Let us now turn towards the Bombay Presidency. Mr. Malabari in his "Gujarat and the Gujaratis" thus speaks of the Holi as observed in Gujarat: "It is the season of free love and free language, not only among the Vaishnavas, but the lower castes of Gujarat, the Saturnalia of indecent

song, the carnival of mad carousal. It is the season of *rang* and *vāg*, which two innocent-looking monosyllables the High Court Translator may translate as "red paint and music," but which, in reality, mean the luxuries of love's embrace, the sporting of Kama and Rati. It is a national holiday, and has a wonderful power for demoralization over the infatuated Vaishnava, the sturdy Maratha (the lower order only, I believe), and the stingy Marwari." Speaking of the festival as observed in Bombay, Mr. Malabari says—"But to have a vivid idea of the wild delirium excited by this holiday, one has (in Bombay) to stand for an hour in the Marwari Bazar at Mumbai-devi. He can there see what extraordinary social antics the usually sober, money-grubbing Marwari is capable of. How a crowd of these *bhang*-intoxicated bacchanals will besiege a neighbour's zenana by way of a serenade, I suppose, and shout their rude amorous ditties with significant gestures and attitudes. The filthy epithets, the wanton glances, the obscene gestures defy description; but these are rewarded, on the part of the Marwari, by equally shameless retorts and the squirting of red paint."

In the Bombay Presidency, the *nautch* women hold a prominent place. Not to speak of rich men, even people of the middle class are seen to employ them on festive occasions. Even at gatherings held to welcome great men or present them with farewell addresses, the services of these women are engaged.

The Holi festival is also observed in the Madras Presidency. It goes by the name of *Holi Pandaga*. In some parts of this Presidency, amusements of an innocent nature are resorted to by the people. Thus, in Tanjore, Trichinopoly and other places south of Madras, people do not sing indecent songs but amuse themselves with theatrical representations which are exhibited in the streets, but in the Division of Mysore, the ceded districts and the Telugu districts, the people lose their senses on the occasion. They

derive pleasure from indecent songs which they sing freely and abuse each other in indecorous terms. In the Bellary District, the obscenities are carried to an injurious extent. The songs sung on the occasion are indecent in the extreme and fallen women form the subject of these songs.

The *nautch* women are objects of great attraction to the people of this Presidency, and they derive very great pleasure from witnessing the dance of these women. They are so much liked by the people that they cannot do without them. They are seen at social gatherings, reception meetings, state ceremonies, religious ceremonies and political demonstrations.

We have seen how music, which ought to be utilized in engendering in mankind feelings of a transcendental and devout nature, has been misused by men in order to indulge their lower propensities. We have also seen how music which at one time found a place in the accomplishments of respectable ladies has been allowed to pass over to fallen women. It is distressing to see that such an innocent means of recreation should be thus perverted. We will now first say something about the amusement enjoyed by the people on the occasion of the Holi festival and then make a few comments on the music and dance by *nautch* women.

In Bengal, the Holi festival goes by the name of Doljatra. Krishna is worshipped on the occasion, and people amuse themselves by throwing red powder on each other. Naughty boys do a little mischief by throwing upon the passers-by water mixed with red-powder through a syringe: but neither are obscene songs sang nor people abused on the occasion. Beyond Bengal, as has been already noticed, people seem to lose their senses. In some parts, they take a delight in abusing each other, and in other parts in singing uncouth songs and applying vulgar epithets to women. In the upper Provinces, this festival is observed in honor of Krishna: but it is much to be

regretted that, instead of honoring the great Krishna, they should dishonor him by singing amorous songs touching on his so-called love fetes, with the milkmaids of Gokul. As this is done in connection with religion, it is necessary to explain to the people the real meaning of the love of Krishna with Radhika: and it behoves our reformers to take speedy steps in the matter. They should introduce the singing of hymns relating to the noble deeds done by Krishna instead of the love songs which represent him as lascivious. In Southern India, this festival is not observed in honor of Krishna. In the Deccan it is called *Hutashini*, which is derived from *Hutashan* meaning fire. Fuel is burnt on this occasion. This is done to commemorate the incident relating to a demoness named Dhunda through whose influence the boys were troubled with diseases at the time of King Raghu and who through the advice of Besistha Deva was checked. The methods adopted for checking the demoness were burning fuel, singing songs and abusing the demoness in strong terms. In the Karnatic, it is called *Kamanua Habba* or the festival of *Kama*, the God of Love. In Madrass it goes by the name of *Holi Pandaga* and it is observed in order to commemorate the burning of *Kama* by Mahadeva, mentioned in *Skanda Purana* and *Haribansha*. It will thus be seen that, in the Deccan, the festival is observed in connection with the Demoness Dhunda, but it is not understood why indecent songs should be sung on the occasion and the females abused.

A Pandit will perhaps explain that it is mentioned in the shastras that, in ancient times, the demoness used to be abused and it is necessary to use abusive terms on the occasion. But the demoness being no longer in existence, the use of abusive terms is unnecessary. Then, why should low epithets be applied to women? Is it because they are of the same sex to which the demoness belonged? The object of the festival is a good one, but the people

have perverted it into a carnival of sensuality. I will here give an extract from a paper of mine on "Holi or Shimga festival", which appeared in the National Magazine for January 1889. "The proper word for it (Holi) is Holika. It is derived from Hodri which means lighting. That festival in which the demon is lighted is called Holikotsab. Here disease is represented by the demoness. It is well known that at the time of the change of seasons, the people are liable to sickness; and as fire purifies air, the burning of fuel is preserved as the remedy for it. Then fear has much to do in bringing on and intensifying disease. For this reason, it is enjoined that people should pass their time in merriment and joy so that fear may not take hold of them. Boys and mad men are specially mentioned, as they generally bring on disease by exposing themselves in open air and taking unwholesome food. A man harmed by disease cannot attend to either his secular or spiritual affairs properly. Good health is therefore by all means desirable."

In the Karnatic and in Madras, the festival is observed to commemorate the burning of Kama by Mahadeva. The occasion was a solemn one. It was the victory the great Yogi achieved over the vile passion lust: and the event is worthy of being signalled. But the question is, why should it not be commemorated in a solemn manner? Why should people apply abusive terms to each other and why should indecent songs be sung and female modesty insulted? Should not Mahadeva be adored instead of Kama?

A review of the festival as observed in different parts of India shows that fuel is burnt on the occasion every where. This, as we have seen, is necessary in order to ward off disease. The principle which underlies the observances of the festival in Bengal and the upper Provinces is a good one. It is to give to the people health in the first instance and then to lead

them to the almighty Being. But in Southern India nothing is done to lead men to God. On the contrary, in some parts of Southern India, honor is done to Kama. It is necessary that at this season of the year the giver of all good should be worshipped. I conclude this part of the subject by giving another extract from the paper above alluded to. "After the Holika is performed, the spring season appears in all its glory. The green foliage, the beautiful flowers, the meandering stream, the purling brook and the song of birds imbue the mind of men with pleasure, and induce him to enjoy the sweets of life. To guard him against those seducements, it is necessary to place before him a lofty ideal. And what better ideal can be placed before him than that of the great Shiva warding off the sensual pleasures and burning lust under control. After this is done, a devotee should worship God. * * Let us then with a healthy body and a pure heart appear before the Almighty Father and pass our time in holy communion with him. Let the real scope of the festival be explained to the people. Let our advanced brethren perform this festival in a proper manner, taking out of it the indecencies which are mere excrescences."

I will now make a few remarks about the music and dance of nautch girls. In connection with the movement set on foot by the Social Reform Association of Madras about discountenancing the nautch of dancing girls, a good deal of correspondence took place on the subject and it astonished me to notice some of the editors of journals of repute and their correspondents advocating the cause of the nautch women and pronouncing their performances as harmless. The *Times of India* said—"Whatever may be the character of the girls, the dancing itself is perfectly decorous." The *Statesmen* of Calcutta, in an article-headed "The ethics of nautch", after expatiating on the nature of the performance said that "on no occasion was there any thing in the least offensive to

morals or manners," and called upon his readers not to "plunge an industrious and harmless class into poverty because some of them are no better than they should be."

European gentlemen, it seems, do not see any thing indecorous or immoral in the nautch of dancing girls, and there is reason for it. Different people have different notions of propriety and pleasure. Hindu gentlemen, witnessing the dance of European ladies at balls, do not derive any pleasure from the sight and often feel shocked. But these dances are pleasing to European gentlemen. In fact balls are sometimes understood to be given by European gentlemen with a view to their unmarried daughters making a parade of their beauty and accomplishments in order to attract batchelors. The dance of nautch girls on the other hand attracts native gentlemen and this is the reason why they wish to witness it on every joyous occasion and to spend large sums of money on it. It is natural for man to share with others the pleasures of life, and as the nautch of those girls is considered to be an exhibition of native art, native gentlemen specially arrange it whenever they have occasion to invite European gentlemen. But as it has been publicly avowed by the European editors of some journals of repute that neither the dance nor the song is liked by Europeans, it is hoped that these native gentlemen, who would like to witness the dance themselves notwithstanding its injurious nature, will cease to invite European gentlemen to it.

I will now try to show how the nautch of these girls is injurious to the natives of India. Although native gentlemen are heard to say that by witnessing it they give encouragement to an art, the real object of every one is to derive sensual pleasure from it. In the first place, the services of beautiful girls are secured and that nautch which is not performed by these *houris* is not appreciated. Moreover, the songs that are sung by them are generally of a lascivious

nature. And to crown all, the rich apparel put on by these women, their side-long glances, their gyrations and skilful manipulations of the hand, coupled with their sweet voice cannot fail to enchant those who witness these nautches. They produce an injurious effect on our young men, which is a matter for serious consideration for those who wish to raise the tone of morality among us. It is a matter of great regret that our educated men should evince a passion the prostituted grace and beauty of these women and thereby spoil our youths. The nautch is at present an art to allure men to sin. In order to satisfy those who advocate the harmless nature of Indian nautches, I quote the following from the *Unity* and the *Minister* of 25th June 1893 :—

“ No one ever returns from them without being the worse for having attended them. We can say from what we know that a fair and spotless youth was all but ruined by the pernicious influence of one of these bewitching belles. It was on the occasion of the marriage of one of the members of his family that he attended the *majlis* where several batches of girls were giving their performances. One of these, an up-country woman, particularly attracted his attention and won his heart. He fell a victim to her blandishment; and from that day forth many years he was held spell-bound, renouncing his house, and running into all the excesses of a debauched life.”

A correspondent under the signature of Kamal, wrote to the *Statesman* of Calcutta on the 10th of June 1893 thus—“ A woman who adopts a bad life loses the sweetness of her voice and the grace of her movements. The nautch girl's profession is very lucrative, and no one would be so foolish as to give it up for the wretched life of a public woman. We are supposed to be immoral, and live apart, and therefore we are taken for a bad lot.” Those who lead a life of prostitution and dissipation lose

of course the sweetness of their voice and the grace of their movements and the nautch women do not lead such lives. But who can deny that they have their paramours and well-to-do men run after them to derive pleasure from their company? I admit that nautch women are better than harlots but the former do more injury than the latter. People who lead bad lives openly go to public women. The latter do not and dare not come to the society of men and seduce them to sin. The nautch women, under the mistaken notion of being harmless, are allowed not only to attend social gatherings but are given a prominent place in assemblages of rich and even learned men and of princes and chiefs. They are not only allowed a place in these gatherings but greater attention is paid to them than to women of their families.

In the Madura Mail of 20th May 1893, a correspondent of that journal said:—We have seen with our own eyes these women introduced into respectable circles in open day light and were freely associating with them, whilst the ladies of the house were watching the scene from a distance and not taking any part in the social pleasures going on before them in which the dancing girls were the only participators. Some of the songs sung by these women are highly objectionable." The Shastras say:— "Women should be kept apart from even the least taint of a corrupt assembly. For, if women be not taken proper care of, they will be the cause for regret in both the families on the paternal and maternal side."

The Shastras also enjoin that due respect should be shewn to women. It has been said that there is no difference between a woman and the Goddess Lakshmi. But it is much to be regretted that instead of keeping our women aloof from all impurities we allow them to witness these very improper dances and hear the uncouth songs of these syrens. In a letter

of 8th August 1893 a correspondent of the Hindu said that, at the time of *unjal*, the family women and the nautch women sing songs alternately. This is nothing short of a gross insult to our ladies, and the practice should be put a stop to at once. Again, while we are often indifferent to the company of those who according to the *shastras* are our *Sahadharmines* or companions in the performance of religious duties, we seek pleasure in the company of nautch women and remain spell-bound while witnessing their performances. In addition to this, we are in this matter guilty of a dereliction of duty to our children. We not only fall a prey ourselves to the charms of these dancing girls, but spoil our beloved sons. Apart from the consideration of the shameless want of propriety we exhibit by our enjoying such sensual pleasures in company of our sons, we by encouraging such performances induce them to believe that they are harmless and thus pave the way towards their degradation. And above all, nothing is more reprehensible than the introduction of these girls at religious ceremonies and into places of worship. The Upanayan and marriage ceremonies are two of the several sacraments of the Hindoos. They are religious rites, and any thing that is immoral should not be associated with them. The Upanayana ceremony is the initiation of a Dwija boy into a holy life. He becomes after that ceremony a Brahmachari. The sanctity of the occasion should be preserved: but it is a pity that in several parts of India guests are entertained on such occasions by nauch of dancing girls. This practice I say is a sacrilege, and as such should at once be condemned and put a stop to. Marriage is also a religious rite. The occasion is a solemn one. For, at that time, the union of two souls in religion and morality is effected. The sanscrit word for wife is *Sahadharmini* i. e. the companion of man in religious affairs. It is

only shameful that such a solemn occasion should be dishonored by the presence of immoral women. A superstitious notion has gained ground among women that, the wedding-tie woven by these women is propitious, and it has the power of conferring life-long wife-hood on the newly-married girl and their presence at marriage ceremonies is considered auspicious. Such prominence should not be given to the nautch women simply because of the notion entertained by the women of Western Southern India. Shastras do not sanction the practice nor is it in vogue in other parts of India.

A correspondent under the signature of "Englishman" wrote in the Hindu of 19th May 1893 that, "none can believe that the exclusion of nautch girls from society will stop prostitution. It will only make the lives of prostitutes more miserable. Now that will be an evil, not a good." It is difficult to understand how the "Englishman" arrived at such a conclusion. The exclusion of nautch girls from society may not stop prostitution altogether. Those who are prone to evil may satisfy the cravings of their heart by resorting to other means but it does not follow from this that steps should not be taken to do away with a practice which is doing injury to the native community. The world is full of corruption. We know that it cannot be turned into heaven. But should the good men, who have been preaching against sin and ungodliness, cease to do so because it is not possible to remove the evils of this world altogether? Their preachings may not succeed in changing the world of sin into a heaven of righteousness, but who will deny that their preachings are efficacious in making the world better? When liquor-shops are opened in the midst of towns and villages, good people take steps to remove them to a distance. Of course, drunkards would go to any distance to satisfy the cravings of their heart: but does not the removal of these shops lead to good results? Seeing the sprightly

liquor within easy reach, people resort to these shops, but many would not do so if they have to go to a great distance for the drink. People are easily led to sin if temptations are placed in their way. The nautch of dancing girls has been the cause of ruin to many. It has supped the moral fabric of many young men. It has led many rich men to penury and want. Being allowed a place in society and in some instances respected, these women do more harm than the prostitutes who dwell in the nooks and corners of towns. The "Englishman" said in another place—"undoubtedly dancing girls are a snare and a delusion to men." Then, I ask why should they be allowed to tempt and delude men?

The "Englishman" also said that, by doing away with the nautches we shall make the lives of these women more miserable. This assertion is not clear to me. Did the "Englishman" mean to say that by not witnessing the nautches we will deprive the women of their means of livelihood, and thereby make them miserable or induce them to lead a life of prostitution which is more degrading than their present occupation? I say that by discouraging nautches we shall do good not only to the nautch women themselves but to women at large. By attending the nautches we give them a prominence in society which they do not deserve, and induce them to continue in an occupation which is objectionable in the extreme. What can be more degrading than that some of our women, whom our Shastras dignify with the name of Lakshmi, should prostitute their lives and merely for the sake of money tempt men to sin. The flattery they receive from men, not to speak of the respect shown to them by eminent persons, makes them forgetful of the objectionable life they lead, and it is incumbent on the leaders of Society to convince them of their degraded position and induce them to give up their present occupation and adopt a respectable one. Those who have come forward as friends of the nautch

women should bear in mind that, upholding their cause they actually destroy their real interest. The nautch women will certainly not perish for want of livelihood. The whole world is before them. They can adopt an honorable profession. Art Schools can be opened for them in different parts of India. In Allahabad, there is a workshop for women which has proved to be a successful institution and it is proposed to establish another at Lucknow. Let them resort to these workshops. They, in their new occupation, may not have the ease and comfort which they now enjoy, but they should bear in mind that it is better to lead an honorable life with a small competence, than to live in luxury by pursuing a degrading occupation. The discouragement of nautch will lead to another good result. Women in adverse circumstances make over their daughters to nautch parties on receiving some money. This undoubtedly is a traffic in girls: and with the abolition of the nautch this nefarious practice will cease to exist.

The "Englishman" referred to above, in his earnestness to plead the cause of the nautch women, expressed himself in the following manner:—"Will the anti-nautch association call on all men to discountenance the presence in society of all men who are of immoral character? Will society be proposed to treat as outcast the men who have two wives and perhaps concubines as well? Will Society condemn the elderly men who buy young girls and shut its doors against the man who deserts his wife at home to run after dancing women?" Till society does this it is to small purpose to raise a howl against the women. They are the mere instrument of men's lust and the supply only exists because men demand it."

The movement set on foot to discourage nautch is a good one. It has two objects in view viz. (1) to induce the nautch women to give up their degrading occupation and to adopt an honorable one and

(2) to induce men to keep themselves aloof from the allurements of these women and to lead lives of purity. The first question put by the "Englishman" is difficult to understand. The admission of nautch women into society is quite different from the presence of immoral men in society. The former have cut off the sacred ties of a household life and adopted a calling which is a disgrace to the community. It is distressing to see some women, who were once pure, seducing men to sin by their charms. No howl is raised against these women. A laudable endeavour is being made to take men away from one of the temptations which lead them to the depth of immorality.

The fact of men of bad character being allowed a place in society does not in any way give the dancing girls a right to make bad men worse. Yes as the "Englishman" says "they are the mere instrument of men's lust:" but I maintain that the dance of the nautch women excites lust in men. So the cause must be removed before we can expect the effect to cease and men to lead a pure life.

The "Englishman" however in another part of the article remarks very justly:—"I cannot see why immorality is fine, and manlike in man and infamous in a woman." The Hindu community gives a great license to men. They are considered as gems of purity which nothing can soil. Whilst women when they slip are excommunicated from society, men who have concubines in addition to their wives, not to say of those who lead lives of debauchery openly, are not only allowed a place in it, but are not unfrequently recognised as leaders of the community to which they belong. This is unjust in the extreme. I do not say that leniency should be shown to women who go astray: but what I advance most vehemently is that equal or perhaps more punishment should be inflicted on men. For, generally speaking, men seduce women to sin, and is it not astonishing that the former should be allowed to go scotfree and the latter be driven out of

society? The Hindu Shastras enjoin penances on miscreants of both the sexes, and it is not understood why those penances should not be enforced. The Parasara Sanhita, which is recognised as the Shastra for the Kali Yuga, enjoins in its 10th chapter that men who commit adultery with their female relatives must perform three *Prajapatya Brata* and those who form illicit intercourse with other women are required to perform one *Prajapatya Brata*. In the case of the female sex it is enjoined that those women who after committing adultery once, resolve not to do so again, are purified at the time of their next *menses*. It is further enjoined that, that woman is considered fallen who after forsaking her husband leaves elsewhere for ten days: but if she comes back to the family within ten days, she is purified on performing a penance. It is desirable that justice should be meted out equally to offenders of both the sexes. Let then those men who by their vicious propensities stain our society, be forced to perform penances, and let those women who slip in an unguarded moment be leniently treated and allowed to remain in the house on complying with the injunctions of the Shastras. Men will then know that they cannot with impunity seduce innocent women to sin and females will see that the least taint of sin cannot, if they repent, preclude them from the blessing of society and force them to pass their lives among women of ill-fame. If the leaders of reform come forward to enforce the rules enjoined by the Hindu Shastras or frame other rules to suit the present time, they will succeed in checking the evil propensities in men, and reclaiming many a woman who under the rigorous rules now in force are obliged to lead an infamous life.

It is a matter of satisfaction that steps are being taken in different parts of India to remove the corrupt ways, that have crept into Hindu Society. In Bengal and the Punjab, the Kayastha Social Conference

of Lahore is trying its best to discourage nautches. It has adopted measures for the introduction of male musicians instead of nautch women, and to replace indecent songs by those that breathe sentiments of an elevated nature. In the North Western Provinces, the members of the Arya Samaja established by the late lamented Pandit Dayananda Sarasvati are trying their best to put a stop to this execrable practice. In Bengal, as already mentioned, some of the rich men in that Province take a pleasure in witnessing the dance of nautch women: but it is not resorted to by the people at large. It is satisfactory to note that His Highness the Maharajah of Cooch Behar at the commencement of the present financial year when great festivities took place, invited to his capital theatrical companies from Calcutta, but did not entertain the public with nautches. By this act of prudence His Highness has set a good example to the rich men of Bengal. In Gujarat, nautches do not receive much encouragement. They do not find a place in the houses of Parsee gentlemen. In Baroda, His Highness the Gaickwar has started schools in which vocal and instrumental music and dancing are taught to high class girls, and this system, it is hoped, will raise the tone of morality in rich men and keep them back from the obnoxious practice of witnessing nautches. At Dharwar in the Karnatic, the Hindu Sammilani Sabha moved in the matter three years ago, and declared at a meeting that the members would discourage *nautches* and refrain from attending as far as possible gatherings at which *nautch* women were employed. This was not a mere lip-declaration. The members, generally speaking, have discouraged the practice. One of them dispensed with nautch women on the occasion of his daughter's marriage in opposition to the wishes of his relations and friends, and another did the same at the time of the *Upanayan* ceremony of one of his nephews and entertained his guests with a music by professional male musicians. In Mysore, His

Highness the Maharajah has issued an order to drive away dancing girls from temples within his territories, and it is hoped that he will discourage the dance of nautch women at social and political gatherings. The introduction of music into the Maharânee's College in Mysore shews that His Highness has the laudable object of substituting for the objectionable songs of nautch women the music of a pure nature. I learn from a periodical that, the famous Pundit of Madras, T. M. Venkat Shastri, has introduced music into several schools for girls in the Madras Presidency. The movement set on foot by the Hindu Social Reform Association of Madras against the dance of nautch women will no doubt lead to good results. The discussion that has taken place in connection with it has opened the eyes of the public to the injurious effects of nautches. In the memorial sent by that body to their Excellencies the Viceroy and the Governor of Madras requesting them to discourage this pernicious practice by declining to attend any entertainment at which nautch girls are invited to dance, the following paragraph appears:—"That so keenly do your memorialists realise the harmful and degrading character of this practice that they have resolved neither to invite nautch girls to any entertainment given by themselves nor to accept any invitation to an entertainment at which it is known that nautch girls are to be present." This declaration speaks a good deal of the earnestness of our educated brethren of that Presidency. The memorial was signed by the members of the Reform Association and some other advocates of the cause of social reform. There is every reason to hope that they will act according to the resolution they have made. I am glad to say that good results have already come out of this movement.

All these augur well for the future: but, I hope, our Reformers will not go to the length of substituting for the *nautch* of dancing girls the European

dance which is alike objectionable. Mention has been made of their Highnesses the Maharajahs of Baroda and Mysore who have introduced music into schools for ladies. It is desirable that, our women should cheer the domestic circles by playing on instruments and singing songs of an elevated pure character. These will be an attraction to our men and they will refrain from going out of their family circles for the sake of amusement. Care should, however, be taken to preserve sanctity in the household. The music should be of a nature that would rouse the religious feelings of the members of the house. Throughout the whole of India women are seen to amuse their neighbours with songs on festive occasions. They are not properly trained, they cannot consequently sing in a manner acceptable to our educated men and for this reason it is necessary to teach music to them. Hymns sung by women cannot but produce a good effect on the audience. On a certain occasion, I myself felt the influence of it. When I had once been to the Parali hill, near Satara, festivities were then being held in connection with Kamadas swami's anniversary in the temple of Ramchandra situated on that hill. On that occasion a brahmin widow entertained the guests at their dinner by singing religious songs. Parties of female singers composed of amateurs can be formed gradually. Some of the members of these parties should play on instruments and others sing songs. Their performances should of course be confined to the neighbourhood. Until such parties are formed, women can sing individually and thus can try to cheer their family.

I will now say something about the athletic sports. They invigorate the body and at the same time amuse the mind. The Greeks of old found great pleasure in these sports. At first, they used to pay homage to the spirits of their departed heroes by making exhibitions of strength around their tombs. In the 23rd book of the Illiad, an account is given

of the different sports that were then performed around the tomb of Patroclus. Afterwards, these sports had a place in their religious festivals. The union of these sports with divine worship made the festival attractive to the public. Although all the nations of antiquity resorted to bodily exercises, it must still be admitted that the Greeks attached greater importance to them. The word athletic is derived from the Greek word *athlas* signifying labor or combat. There were regular institutions among the Greeks for giving instructions in these sports. They went by the name of *gymnasia*. Those who joined these schools were placed under teachers who adopted means to inure their pupils to fatigues and to prepare them for the sports. The students had to undergo a severe training. Their food consisted of dried figs, nuts, soft cheese and coarse bread. They had to lead a pure and temperate life. Horace thus alludes to this training :—

“ Who in the Olympic race the prize would gain
Has borne from early youth, fatigue and pain ;
Excess of heat and cold, has often tried,
Love’s softness banished, and the glass denied.”

Besides these, there were other sports among the Greeks. *e. g.* the chariot races, the horse races, the foot races, wrestling, boxing, running, leaping, darting the javelin, single combat, flinging the discus and shooting with arrows. The chariot races were most famous as great men took part in them. The Greeks appreciated these sports to such an extent that the victory gained at them was considered to be more glorious than any thing else. Cicero says that, “ a victory at Olympia rendered the victor no less illustrious than his consulship the Roman consul.”

Turning to modern times we find the people no less inclined to sports than the nations of antiquity were. Coming face to face with the nations of the West, the people of India have begun to borrow several of the sports extant in the West. Some of

them are found in the East as well as in the West although differing in minor details. But it is a matter of regret that some of the good sports peculiar to this country are gradually giving way to the sports of the Western nations. One of them is *Dunda* or *Dahar*. It serves the same purpose as the Parallel Bars do. Another is *Moogoor Bhanja* or playing with mallets. This sport gives strength to the breast, the back, the shoulders and the arms. But the palm must be given to *Kusti* or wrestling. It gives strength to all the limbs of the body. Although practised in different parts of the world, the people of India attach greater importance to it than of any other country. In ancient India, wrestlers were greatly encouraged by kings and other great men. Thirty years ago, I saw this sport much in fashion among the people of all classes. Special grounds were prepared for the purpose, and young men were seen to practise it. But, at the present time, our educated young men consider it beneath their dignity to resort to it. False civilization has influenced them to such an extent that they seem to think it derogatory to remove for a short time every day their fashionable clothes and put on suit proper for the purpose. People of the lower classes are now seen benefiting themselves by it. Besides these, swimming is a very good pastime. Whilst it serves as an exercise, it gives amusement to those who practise it, specially to boys. It should be the endeavour of every one to learn swimming. Riding should also be practised. It gives agility and strength to the body. Beyond Bengal, I have seen with pleasure not only men but women riding on ponies. The people of Bengal are not inclined to ride. It is indeed a matter of satisfaction that, the Government of Bengal have in this connection done a substantial good to our countrymen. They have ruled that, those who wish to pass the subordinate executive service examination must produce a riding certificate

before they are allowed to pass it. This certificate is required to be signed by the District Magistrate and students have to undergo a trial before him. This ruling has been the means of turning some of the young men of Bengal into good riders. Gardening is also a good pastime. Tilling ground and planting trees give as good an exercise to the body. Our young men should have a small garden attached to their houses. It may consist of flower as well as fruit trees. Flowers are delightful to the eyes: and their odour not only gives pleasure, but, as pronounced by medical men, conduces to health.

There is a tendency at the present time to introduce foreign sports, neglecting those actually in vogue among us. This is unpatriotic as well as uneconomical and should not be therefore allowed. The English system is costly, and there is no reason why it should be adopted when our national games serve our purposes equally well. Moreover, it is seen that in the gymnasia attached to schools, exercises are undergone by little boys which do injury to them instead of good. They are of a nature to stunt their growth. Boys under eleven years of age should take to running and jumping only. These are good exercise for them. The *Jhat Jhoppa* or jumping from trees, the *Looka Choori* or the *Hinde and Seek* and the *Dandu Govlee*, a sort of cricket, are games well-adapted to boys. Hindu children are seen performing several things in imitation of what they see done in their houses. For example, they perform mock Poojaha. They collect pebbles, or make an Earthen idol, before which they dance and sing, one of them acts the part of a priest and another that of a drummer and so on. In the case of boys belonging to Shakt families they, in imitation of sacrifice, cut cucumbers and sugar-canes. After the worship is over they all bow down before the deity. These serve as good exercises, for little boys. I like our national games but

I admit that in their absence manly exercises of some sort are necessary. In fact every village should have a gymnasium. Special exercises are not necessary for females. The household works they do, give strength to their bodies. Women, belonging to the middle and lower classes, fetch water from rivers or tanks and wells, wash clothes of the family and sweep and cow-dung their houses. These will serve as good exercise. There are occasions also when they swing and dance. At the time of the Nag Panchami festival, for example, women are seen swinging from trees and dancing in a circle, singing songs suited to the occasion. These serve not a little to give exercise to their bodies. Ladies belonging to wealthy families are now seen passing their time in ease, delegating household work to their servants. This is a step in the wrong direction for it takes away from them the only means they have of giving some exercise to their bodies. By leading lives of ease, the ladies of rich families, become subject to several diseases from which poor women who employ themselves in domestic work are free. This should be a lesson to our ease-looking women. It is not in the least derogatory to their honor to perform household work. If rich persons have sufficient money at their disposal, they can spend the same on objects of charity.

Like boys, girls have also sports of their own. They also perform mock Vratas and ceremonies in imitation of what grown-up women do. These serve as exercise to them. Moreover, they help their female relations in the performance of domestic work. It is also necessary for old men and women to have some sort of exercise; but they should be of a light nature. They should take short walks. They should go to temples and walk round on the shrine to banks of rivers and tanks to enjoy free air. Old persons are generally seen passing their time in idle talk, the burthen of which is for the most

part a criticism on the doings of others. This is undesirable. They should pass their time in reading good books and in hearing Kathas and Kirtan. When, on account of the inclemency of the weather, they cannot go out for walk, indoor games may be resorted to. It has pained me to see young men passing their time in these games. It is very wrong on their part to do so. It is nothing short of killing time and this I consider to be sinful. The time at our disposal should be spent in a proper manner. We should devote it to the good of our own-selves as well as to the service of our fellow brethren. If we are much distressed in mind owing to some misfortune or other untoward circumstances, and if perusal of books fails to give us pleasure, we should on such occasions seek the company of good men and pass our time with them in conversation on topics of an elevated nature or resort to temples to hear Katha and Kirtan. And, above all, the most efficacious method of obtaining consolation is to occupy ourselves with some work of philanthropy. There are helpless men every where. We should seek them out and try to alleviate their sufferings. The pleasure derived from the fact of our having become of some use to our fellow brethren is sure to make us forget our own condition. Time hangs heavily on many persons, and they know not how to pass it. This is owing to their not having formed the habit of reading or of devoting themselves to the cause of suffering humanity. These persons, not knowing what to do themselves, induce others, who are usefully employed, to join with them in some frivolous talk or play. Boileau, the French Saterist, was often disturbed by an idle ignorant person. Out of courtesy, Boileau used to receive him at his house and speak to him. On a certain occasion, the ignorant person complained to him saying that he did not return his visits. Boileau accosted him in the following manner:— "Sir, we

are not upon equal terms; you call upon me merely to get rid of your time; when I call upon you, I lose mine." we should always bear in mind the great value of time and try to make proper use of it.

Hunting has been given a prominent place among the manly exercises by all the nations of the world in ancient as well as modern times. In the old Testament it is stated that Nimrod, the great grandson of Noah, was a "mighty hunter." It was a favourite diversion with the Greeks of old. So great a value was attached to it that Zenophon wrote a book shewing the advantages derivable from it. In ancient India, hunting was greatly resorted to by the people. Mrigaya or chase was a favourite pastime with kings and princes in this Country.

Turning to modern times, we see hunting prevalent to a very great extent. Among the nations of the West, it is much valued by gentlemen. Whenever they find time, they resort to it. In fact, gentlemen in service take leave in order to enjoy the pleasure of hunting. A newspaper cannot be considered complete if it does not give accounts of hunting excursions of gentlemen, and a Railway guide is imperfect if it does not mention the places suitable for hunting and name the game that a hunter may find. In India, chiefs and other great men also find great pleasure in hunting. They make hunting excursions now and then. Whenever Viceroys, Governors and other officials of high position visit native states, the chiefs of these states arrange for hunting excursions as the best means of giving them a cordial reception.

It is necessary for man to learn the uses of gun in order to save himself from the attacks of ferocious animals and ruffians: but it does not speak well of a rational being to take away the lives of innocent creatures under the name of game. In days of yore, when men had not made sufficient progress in agriculture to enable him to arrange for food, it was

necessary for him to live on the flesh of animals; but at the present day, when by the exercise of his reasoning powers he has succeeded in producing cereals and vegetable of different sorts, not to say of the delicious fruits which are available every where, it is a sin on his part to take the lives of his fellow creatures. Man is said to be the lord of creation. But, it should be borne in mind that man claims this supremacy not by his bodily strength but by his mental possessions. The latter should be exercised by him not in oppressing and killing those under him, but in shewing mercy to them.

The Hindus generally and the Brahmins particularly are vegetarians. The shastras enjoin them not to take the lives of inferior creatures, but to shew mercy to them. It distresses me, however, to see some of our educated young men going on hunting excursions in imitation of the people of the west. Our countrymen should bear in mind that, servile imitation of every thing that comes from the west is by no means desirable. Let us try to imitate those traits of character that have made our western brethren great. Their energy and courage, their application and perseverance and above all, their power of organization should be imitated by us, but not their vices. It is a matter of glory to us that Indian sages have reared up a religion which takes the highest place among the religions of the world. The highest teaching that can be found in other religions is "Love to God and love to man." It is only the religion of the people of India which has extended this love to inferior creatures and which has been able to enjoin "Love to God and love to all created beings" as the essence of true religion.

Let us then, my countrymen, follow the religious principles laid down by the sages of old, removing the rust which the lapse of time has brought over them. Let us remain as we are and bear the name of "mild Hindus" tauntingly given to us.

Let people call us unmanly, if we fail to amuse ourselves by taking the lives of innocent creatures. There are many things to amuse us—many things to give strength to our bodies and energy to our minds. We have our sports and pastimes, we have our gymnastic exercises. They are innocent in their nature. Let us, as mild Hindus, remain attached to them. But, gentlemen, whilst passing our time in this way, let us not forget that we have a great battle to fight. It is the battle of life—the struggle for existence. We have now to face with a keen competition. It will not do for us to play when Rome is on fire. Poverty is staring us in the face. This is not the time to sit and nod and to speculate. Let us not shut our eyes to the activities that are in full play around us. Let us not slumber on the lap of ease when our countrymen are in a state of starvation. Let us be up and doing. Let us find out means to save them.

DEENANATH GANGOLI.

MR. JUSTICE RANADE ON UNIVERSITY REFORM.

We think we need make no apology for reproducing here from the columns of the *Times of India* dated 7th and 14th July 1895, the two valuable speeches made by the Hon'ble Mr. Justice M. G. Ranade at special meetings of the Senate of the University of Bombay in connection with certain educational reforms. The changes, suggested by Mr. Justice Ranade and for which we must all be grateful to him, will in our opinion be effectual remedies against the premature end of the graduates of our University: The reduction of the number of examinations from 3 to 2 and the proposal for exempting unsuccessful examinees from being tested over again in the subjects in which they may have once passed, are highly calculated to minimise the evils resulting from the present system of examination of our local University. The ideas embodied in the speeches are the result of special study and long deliberation. Unfortunately owing to opposition from the official element and the non-attendance of some of the Fellows of the University, the proposals were not carried. The question of University reforms is one of vital importance, and we believe it should be early and earnestly resumed by the educationists of our presidency. The speeches given below will, we have no doubt, amply repay a careful perusal.

Mr. Justice Ranade, in speaking to the motion, said :—
 Mr. Vice-Chancellor and Gentlemen of the Senate :—It will be useful to refer briefly here to the circumstances under which the proposition, which I have the honour to move for your consideration, comes up before you in its present form. In the Vice-Chancellor's address at the Convocation meeting in 1894, considerable stress was laid by him upon the strain of studies under which our students labour, and to which they too often succumb, being prematurely cut off in the prime of life. The strain of studies was admitted as a fact by all those who took part in that controversy. The only difference in our views related to the causes which disabled the students to bear the strain. Last year about this time, a large number of the Fellows of the University submitted for the consideration of the Syndicate two proposals by which this strain of studies might to a considerable extent be lightened and made bearable. They took the form of the proposition I have now the honour to move, and the other proposition which succeeds it in the agenda paper. A majority of the Syndicate, however, declined to take any action in respect of these suggestions, or even to refer them to the Faculties for their opinion. The gentlemen who had made these suggestions, finding that the Syndicate was thus immovable, made a special requisition for a meeting of the Senate to consider these same propositions. I cannot but think that in this and in some other matters it would have been more graceful on the part of the Syndicate, if, before setting their face against these suggestions, they had referred them for consideration to the Faculties, for in that case, we should have had now here the benefit of the mature deliberation of the several Faculties instead of the bare refusal of an executive body like the Syndicate to consider the matter. This is, however, by the way. Those who made the requisition were, in consequence of what had happened before, obliged to stick to the form of the propositions as they were placed before the Syndicate. If they had changed the wording, or altered in

any respect the details of the suggestions made by them, they would have to wait for another year, as the Syndicate must, under existing rules, deliberate upon all propositions ere they can be brought before the Senate. To avoid this delay it was thought proper to stick to the wording of the propositions as they were placed before the Syndicate and take a vote of the Senate, trusting that in the discussion here suitable amendments might be introduced if deemed necessary. I may say at once that I and those who are with me in this matter will welcome such amendments in detail, as we are above all anxious that only the principle involved in this suggestion should be affirmed. That principle, I need hardly say, is that as far as possible, when a student has passed in any one or more subjects or group of subjects and failed in others, he should not be compelled to pass again in that same subject or group of subjects in which he has obtained satisfactory marks. Whether this limit of satisfaction should be represented by 45 per cent. marks or 50 per cent, or whether it should be confined to failure in one or more subjects, are questions of detail on which we are quite willing to take the sense of a Senate as a whole and bow to its decision. Forty-five per cent. has been fixed upon, because the limit is neither too high nor too low, for in most of the examinations in the Arts course 30 per cent. is the limit for passing in all subjects, and 45 per cent. is necessary for second class and 60 per cent. for the first class. The percentages in the B. Sc., L. C. E. and M. A. examinations are lower than the limits mentioned above. In the subject of Law the necessary pass marks are $33\frac{1}{2}$ in each subject and 50 per cent. are required for the total. In Medicine in the first and the second examinations the necessary pass marks are $33\frac{1}{2}$ and 45 for total, and in the L. M. the necessary marks are 50 per cent. in each subject and also in the total. I understand that in the Cambridge University the standard of pass marks is 25 in each subject and 30 on the whole, and the examination takes place in two parts which may be

taken separately at the option of the students. It will be thus seen that 45 per cent., being 50 percent., more than the Cambridge standard, represents what may be called a satisfactory limit in most of the examinations, and that is the reason why that limit has been selected. If, however, it is the sense of the majority of those who are present here that the limit in any particular examination should be 50 per cent., I shall for my part be prepared to accept such an amendment. It will be seen that we do not wish to touch the classes, but want only to provide for the passes in each examination. This point will, I hope, be borne in mind by those who take part in this discussion.

It may be said that this is a novel suggestion, which has not been before recognised by this University. In educational matters we are all Conservatives, and if it were really a novel suggestion, I should myself have felt much hesitation in bespeaking your favour on this occasion. As a matter of fact, however, there is no novelty in the proposal, as the principle has been recognised by this and other Universities. In the regulations published in our Calendar, B. A. candidates who have passed in Roman History and Roman Law are regarded to have passed the first LL.B. examination without being required to separately run the risk of a second examination. (*Vide* Bombay Calendar, 1894-95, N. B. to regulation 31st, p. 44.) Similar concessions are made in regard to the B. Sc. examination in favour of candidates who have passed M. A. and B. A. examinations in certain subjects which come under the B. Sc. course (*vide* N. B. to regulation 35th, p. 49); and a like exemption is allowed in regard to certain subjects in the L. C. E. examination (N. B. to regulation 27th, p. 80); and also in First examination in Medicine (N. B. to regulation 4, p. 67). The principle on which these exemptions are allowed is a very correct principle, and if its correctness has been accepted in the manner stated above, its more general extension may be

objected to on other grounds, but certainly not on the ground that the principle is a novel one and not recognised by the University. If the principle is recognised as a wise one in reference to examinations in different Faculties, I fail to see how its recognition in respect of the same Faculty and the same examination, can be deemed to be out of the usual line. In the sister University of Madras, students are allowed to pay fees in proportion to the subjects in which they wish to appear any year, and in this way they are permitted to pass separately in groups of subjects, (*vide* Madras Calendar for 1894, pp. 59 and 79.) In the medical examinations in England the same practice prevails to a large extent. In the Cambridge University the Arts course is divided into two parts, any one of which may be taken separately. There is, therefore, no novelty in the principle advocated.

I am fully aware that there is not much force in the argument that a change is not novel if one cannot show that it is also a desirable and necessary improvement. The prevailing impression seems to be that which Professor Muller gives expression to in his letter to me. He thinks that the number of students who pass in a subject one year and fail in it the next year is very small and not worth legislating for. If the number of such students were really very small I should agree with this opinion. The case, however, is just the other way. The number is not small, and is, in fact, so considerable that there will be no excuse for our further indifference in this matter. I arranged to consult the views of a large number of those who are practically acquainted with the working of our colleges, and they fully bear out what I have stated above. Of course everything depends upon the basal number or standard with which we compared these figures of second failures in subjects in which the candidates have once passed. It is obvious that we cannot accept the figures for first failures as a basis for comparison. By the condition of the inquiry the comparisons can only be made with the totals of second or

third failures. The Principal of Samaldas College has furnished me with returns showing that during the last two years 1892-93 and 1893-94 out of 19 second failures in the different Art examinations as many as 14 failed in subjects in which they had passed once and five failed in other subjects than those in which they had passed before. The Professor of Mathematics of Baroda College has sent a return which shows that for the same two years out of 98 students who failed twice, 23 failed in the subjects in which they had passed before and 65 in other subjects. The Professor of Sanskrit in the Ahmedabad College has sent a return which shows that out of 23 students who failed twice, 12 failed in subjects in which they had passed before and 11 in other subjects. Professor Muller of the Elphinstone College has sent a return from which it appears that out of 103 students who failed twice, 26 failed in the subjects in which they had passed before and 77 failed in other subjects. Professor Kathawate of the Deccan College has sent a return from which it appears that out of 32 students who failed twice, 13 failed in subjects in which they had passed before and 19 in other subjects. The returns from other places have not been prepared in a handy way.

The following statement was placed before the meeting by Mr. Justice Ranade in support of his arguments relating to the percentage of failures at examinations:—

STATISTICS OF FAILURES.

In the following statement is shown the number of students who have failed second and third time in several examinations held by the Bombay University in 1893-94. In the third column is given the number of such students as have failed in the subjects in which they had passed previously, and the fourth column gives the percentages:—

FOR 1893 AND 1894.

Name of Examination.	No. of Students failing in 2nd & 3rd time.	No. of Students failing in subjects in which they had passed.	Proportion of failures in 3rd column to those of 2nd
Matriculation 1892-94	188	144	76 p.c.
Previous Ex. in Arts	353	148	41·9
Intermediate Ex. for B.A. ...	38	15	39·4
2nd B.A. (under old rules)...	36	10	27·7
LL. B. (under old rules).....	54	32	59·25
M. A.....	1	1	100·
First Ex. in Medicine	9	3	33·3
Second Ex. in Medicine	15	8	53·3
L. M. & S.....	29	15	52·
F. C. E.....
S. C. E.....	2	1	50·
L. C. E.....
2nd B. C.....	5	2	40·
2nd Ex. in Agriculture	2	2	100·
Total.....	732	381	52·

At an adjourned meeting of the Senate held for this purpose at the Sir Cowasjee Jehangir Hall of the University, the Hon. Mr. M. G. Ranade, C. I. E., said: Mr. Vice-Chancellor and Gentlemen of the Senate,—The proposition for the consideration of which this meeting of the Senate has been convened on the requisition of a large number of Fellows stands as follows: "That in the Arts' course the three examinations necessary before graduation be reduced to two and that the Syndicate be requested to propose such a re-distribution of the subjects in the present Arts' course as may be

necessary in consequence of such reduction in the number of examinations." Like the other proposition which was discussed last Friday, the present proposal also was submitted to the Syndicate, but as that body refused to entertain the proposal, or refer it to the Arts' Faculty, the requisitionists had no choice in the matter but to bring it before a special meeting of the Senate. In anticipation of this discussion, it has been observed in some quarters that the change from two to three examinations was so very recently made, that unless a very strong case were made out, it would be almost puerile to pluck by the roots the freshly planted tree to see how it was growing. I accept this warning in good part though I may be permitted to observe that the warning is a little out of place and date, because the change was not recently made, as some people suppose it to be. It was made as far back as 1879 under circumstances of so special character that even men like the late Mr. Justice Telang said that they rued the day when, in a spirit of pedantic love for the teaching of science, the Arts' course was disturbed. None outside a small coterie of friends defended it at the time, or are prepared to defend it even now. More than fifteen years have elapsed since that day, and it cannot be said with justice that we are acting like children in taking stock of the effects of that change at this distance of time. I am, however, prepared to concede that, whether the change was made recently or more than fifteen years ago, the Senate have a right to expect that a strong case must be made out before it is called upon to revise the arrangement then sanctioned. The whole subject was reviewed in 1889 on the motion of the late Mr. Justice Telang, than whom we cannot cite a better authority in educational matters in this presidency. In 1889 both Mr. Telang and our present Vice-Chancellor agreed in expressing in the most emphatic terms possible the general sense of disappointment in regard to the general character of our graduates and undergraduates, and

their inability to profit by the instruction they received. It was in consequence of this disappointment that Mr. Telang moved in 1889 a series of propositions to raise the number of years from 3 to 4 of College studies, and also to re-arrange those studies in a way which, it was hoped, would, to some extent, cure the evil. With neither of these two reforms have I any quarrel. I believe both these changes were in the right direction, and that they are likely to help our students in securing that general culture without which no man can claim to be educated in the proper sense of the word. Mr. Telang was led by the force of tradition more than by his nobler impulses to sanction the continuance of the two intermediate examinations which had been adopted under very exceptional circumstances ten years before. He, however, gave expression to his own feeling in the matter when he observed that examinations were a necessary evil, and that their number should be, as far as possible, reduced. He said he had himself no strong opinion on the subject, and if the course was not extended to four years, he would prefer one to two intermediate examinations. The Hon. Mr. Justice Telang did not stand alone in this view. The report of the Committee (signed by Dr. Mackichan, Principal Oxenham, Hon. Mr. Birdwood, Mr. Justice Telang, Mr. Modak, and Rev. Father Mayr, Prof. Peterson dissenting) itself asserts that "the members sympathised with the desire to reduce the number of examinations as much as possible, and if the course were not extended to four years, they would be very strongly in favour of reducing the number of examinations." The proposition which I have now the honour to move seeks to correct this necessary evil of too many examinations in the spirit in which Mr. Justice Telang and the Committee expressed their views six years ago. Even in the course of that discussion a similar proposition was pressed upon the attention of the Senate by a large body of independent members, but without success. There is, therefore, nothing revolutionary, or likely to be disastrous in the present proposal.

In this matter, however, it is not only our University authorities who have admitted the necessary evil of too many examinations, but the example of the sister Indian Universities and the great centres of learning in England and Scotland, is a more powerful argument in its favour. None of the Indian Universities have followed the example of Bombay in this matter, though their course of college studies has all along been four instead of three years. There is only one intermediate examination at the end of two years from Matriculation, and two years after a candidate passes the Intermediate, he is qualified to appear for the B. A. degree examination. Those who are in favour of the present arrangement have, therefore, to explain what is there so peculiar in the atmosphere of Bombay which necessitates this double system of examination first introduced in 1879 in this Presidency. The authorities there have not seen any reason to think that their students bring the atmosphere of the schools with them to the colleges, or that if two years' interval is allowed, they will not use their early period of study in the proper way, but pass it in listless idleness, as stated in the report of the Committee of 1889. This experience of Indian Universities is a strong argument, which men who bring a fresh mind to the consideration of the subject will find it difficult to get over. Turning next to the English and Scotch Universities we find that in the Oxford University the responsium or first year's examination is not a University Examination at all. It is the Teachers' Examination, separate for each college. Then comes the Moderator's examination, and lastly the public examination, all within three years. In the London University they have only one Intermediate Examination between the Matriculation and the B. A. In the Cambridge University they have a Previous Examination in parts one or two, followed by a general examination, also divided into two parts, and a special examination in one out of ten or twelve voluntary subjects. In Edinburgh and in the Scotch Universities generally, there is only one preliminary examination, and then there is

no examination except for the M. A. degree. It may also be noted that in most of these Universities, except in the London University, there is either no Matriculation examination or only a nominal one. It is only in London and Dublin that they have a separate Matriculation examination. In all these Universities the Arts' course is three years for the B. A. degree. Whether, therefore, we have a three or four years' course, there is no precedent either in India or in England for two intermediate examinations. If in these Universities, with the experience of centuries to guide them, students are not found to be listless or idle in their first year of college attendance, one fails to see what particular element of mischief works so powerfully in this Presidency that it requires the University here to take special steps to secure the students from doing harm to themselves. Students here may be assumed to be as good or indifferent as their fellows in the other Universities. They have generally to pay heavy fees and other charges, and they cannot afford to spend their most promising years in unwearyed idleness. There are idle and listless students in every place of learning, but I do not think that we have any monopoly of these irregular habits in the case of the large majority of our students. The change when it was first made was not introduced from any such considerations. It was intended to give special facilities to the study of science, and the P. E. pass qualification was deemed to be necessary as evidence of general culture for those who wished to take up science degrees. It is, therefore, evident that when the Committee in their report observed that "past experience shows that not an inconsiderable portion of the first year is wasted, and that at that period of their college life the ordinary run of students have not acquired those habits which would enable them to use their two years to good purpose," they lent the weight of their authority to an argument which neither past, nor present, experience confirmed, and that this suggestion was entirely an after-thought to which past and present ex-

perience both in India and in England gave but little countenance. We have very few gentlemen commoners among our students here. With most of our students success in life depends upon the way in which they pursue their studies in Colleges, and the presumption is just the other way. If then examinations are admittedly a necessary evil, and they must be reduced as far as possible, it follows that the existing arrangement, so entirely without precedent, here as elsewhere, requires to be reconsidered. It might be said that these are only general considerations, and that for justifying the change proposed we must produce stronger evidence of actual and great evil resulting from the present practice. I shall, therefore, briefly consider this aspect of the question in this place. One illustration of this evil which lies on the surface may be adduced by an appeal to the figures of those who fail at the P. E. In 1891 the failures were 76, and in 1892 they were 68, and in 1893 they were 61 per cent. In other words the average of these years shows a percentage of two-thirds failures against one-third pass. Out of those who failed a second time, as many as 40 per cent. failed in subjects in which they had passed before, so that this additional examination results in preventing as many as two-thirds of the students from proceeding to their higher studies. The percentage of passes and failures in the London University which is our chief model for a number of years and that in our University for the past three years, are given below :—

Examination.	Percentage of failures.—	
	London University 1838—1838.	Bombay University 1891—94.
Matriculation...	43	72
Previous.....	..	67
Intermediate...	28	35
B. A.....	42	57
L. M.....	24	59
LL. B.....	35	63

These figures will show how generally our examinations are much more stiff than those of the stiffest English University. Out of every hundred students who appear at the Matriculation Examination here, about 28 pass. Out of these 28, about 67 per cent. are again plucked at the P. E. Thus leaving nine students to pass the P. E. Out of these nine about 35 per cent. fail at the Intermediate, leaving about 6 to pass that examination. Out of these 6, about 43 per cent. fail, leaving less than three students who pass the B. A. In the London University out of every 100 students who appear for Matriculation 43 per cent. fail, leaving 57 to pass. Out of these 57 about 28 per cent. fail, leaving 41 who pass the Intermediate. Out of these 41, about 42 per cent. fail, leaving 25 who pass the B. A. In other words our examinations are eight times more stiff than those of the London University, and this stiffness is very much increased by the additional Previous Examinations. In the other Universities the pass proportion is, if possible, larger than in London. In the above calculation I have not taken into account students who pass on second or third trial, but if the additions were made on both sides the relative disparity will still remain as marked as stated above. They talk of separating the chaff from the grain. It must be a very curious process of separation which results in leaving three grains at the bottom of the sieve. And then what becomes of these three grains? The Vice-Chancellor has told us from his place in the Convocation that from 20 to 40 per cent. of them die prematurely, the death being larger among those who pass in the higher examinations and in the Maratha Hindoo community than in others. We are thus in a curious fix. We separate the chaff till only three grains remain, and of these three grains nearly 20 to 40 per cent. die before they have in any way utilised their powers of superior cultivation. If these results satisfy the members of the Senate, well all I can say is that we are more Chinese than the Chinese themselves in our love of competitive examinations. It suggests to my mind at least a very

uneasy feeling, from the contemplation of the results of a system which all our talents and abilities have been elaborating for so many years. It seems as if people have made competitive examination a fetish before which they fall down and worship. I do not wonder that my native friends make this mistake, because they know no better models, but it is a very sad spectacle to see Englishmen and Scotchmen all joining together and sanctioning this halocaust in the name of encouraging higher education in this country. It is not absolutely necessary that this thing should last for ever. We might well take a leaf from the Oxford rules, and leave these intermediate examinations to the College authorities. These College examinations will be conducted by men in sympathy with the students, by men who know their students all the year round as human beings, and not as mere machines. If you must have the University to examine the work of the Colleges at an intermediate stage, one examination is quite as good as two, and we might be satisfied with it. Even in England this abuse of competitive examinations has provoked a protest which was published in the *Nineteenth Century* some years ago, signed by some 500 men of education from all ranks and professions. These examinations were denounced as mischievous, because they subordinated teaching to passing tests, they set young men to race with one another in cramming and rote, they destroyed variety and established one level of uniform teaching all over the country, they promoted superficiality and a desire for show, checked original thought, and finally they created disinclination to study in after-life. These are the necessary evils of the abuse of competitive examinations, and every unnecessary examination test that we allow to remain at work aggravates these mischiefs. It may be said that the students will have no guidance in studies. In reply I would say that the teachers are their best guides when they do not descend to be crammers, as our present system too often tempts them to be. A minor objection about what we should do with our B. Sc. degree and the Engineering degree if we do away with the

P. E. may be similarly disposed of. I would leave it to the College to provide their own test examinations. The work would be done better, and with more efficiency. In the discussion of 1889, Sir. R. West was quoted with approval by Mr. Latham as suggesting that students should be allowed to appear at the P. E. without attending any school or college. If that course is not feasible, we might have a few High Schools which will prepare matriculated students for the P. E. These are, however, details into which I do not wish to dogmatise, but will leave them to be worked out by the Syndicate and the Faculties, to whom this proposition allots the work of the re-arrangement of studies. As on the last occasion, so now, I and my friends only desire that the Senate should affirm the principle of adopting a rule of one intermediate examination in the Arts' course, which works so satisfactorily in all the Indian and English Universities, and departure from which has worked great mischiefs without producing any corresponding gain to the bodily and mental health and wealth of the students in this Presidency. Examinations are means to an end, and not the end itself. The end is to have young men enjoying health and long life with a capacity and desire to work out the problem of life with the advantage of general culture, both of head and heart. This end is not promoted by our present system. It will be to some extent promoted if we leave the teacher and the student to themselves, for at least two years of the College course. The change of 1889 was made expressly with this view, but owing to the increase of studies and bad selection of text-books and the bother of two examinations that change has not produced its desired effect. The teachers in our Colleges complain of their inability to teach, within the time allowed, the books prescribed, and thus the work is hastily gone through with benefit to nobody. The amendment suggested will, to some extent, correct the evil and it is on that account that I have ventured to solicit your calm deliberation of this proposal. (Applause.)

THE
QUARTERLY JOURNAL

OF THE
POONA SARVAJANIK SABHA.

VOL. XVIII.] JANUARY 1896, [No. 3

UNDER THE AUTHORITY OF THE MANAGING COMMITTEE

EDITED BY

G. K. GOKHALE, B. A.

POONA:

PRINTED AT THE "Argha-Bhushana Press"

All Rights Reserved.

ACKNOWLEDGMENT.

Receipt No.		Rs.	Ans.
40	Secretary N. G. L. Dhulia	4	4
41	Secretary N. G. L. Calcutta	8	8
<i>December 1895.</i>			
42	S. H. S. E. Belgam	4	4
43	Sundry	1	11
44	K. B. Dhanjish Edaji	2	8
45	R. B. P. A. Gupta	8	3
46	Shrimant Gopalrao M. Bosti	8	8
47	R. S. Hari S. Dixit	8	8
48	R. S. Govind B. Shandekar	8	8
49	R. S. Narob. Dewdhar	4	0
50	R. S. Vittakrao N. Natta	12	0
51	R. S. Balwantraoji Gadgil	8	8
52	R. S. Harichand Sadashiv	8	8
53	R. S. Gajanan Venkatesh	4	4
54	R. S. Raghunath Narayan	12	12
55	Kasmopolitan Club Madras	8	8
56	R. S. Raghendra B. Gangoli	9	4
57	H. H. the Nawab of Cambay	4	4
58	R. B. Narayan V. Barve	8	8
59	R. B. Laxuman G. Deshmukh	8	8
60	Diwan Bahadur Subramani Iyer	8	8
61	R. B. Ramchandra B. Mule	4	4
62	K. B. Karsetji Bustomji	4	4
63	Karbhari Sawanstan Jamkhindi	8	8
64	R. S. Blaskar S. Joshi	8	8

CONTENTS

Proceedings of the Sabha.

- I An Address of welcome to H. E. Lord Elgin with H. E's. reply.

Independent Section.

- I The present Financial Position—a grave Crisis.
- II The Address of the Chairman of the Reception Committee of the eleventh Indian National Congress.
- III The Salt Duty.
- IV Stray thoughts about the development theory as applicable to the origin and Progress of Science and Religion.

THE POONA SARVAJANIK SABHA.

Established on the 1st of Chaitra Shake 1792 i. e., 2nd April 1870
for representing the wants and wishes of the inhabitants of
the Deccan, being appointed on a popular elective
system under rules framed for the purpose.

WALEKAR'S WADA, DANE ALI

LIST OF OFFICERS.

President

H. H. Shrinivas Rao Parashram Pandit *alias* Rao Saheb
Pant Pratinidhi, Chief of Oundha.

Vice-Presidents

H. H. Dhundiraj Chintaman *alias*
Tatya Saheb Patwardhan, Chief
of Sangli.

H. H. Madhojirao Naik Nimbalkar, Chief of Faltan.

H. H. Ramchandra Rao Gopal *alias*
Appa Saheb Patwardhan, Chief
of Jamkhindi.

Shrimant Shri Baba Maharaj.

H. H. Ganpatrao Harihar *alias*
Bapu Saheb Patwardhan, younger
Chief of Kurundwad.

H. H. Harihar Rao Vinayak *alias*
Daji Saheb, Patwardhan, Chief
of Kurundwad.

H. H. Toolaji Raje Bhosle, Chief
of Akalkote.

MANAGING COMMITTEE FOR 1895-96.

Chairman—MR. VINAYAK RAMCHANDRA PATWARDHAN, B. A. LL. B.
Members of the Managing Committee.

R. B. V. M. Bhide.

R. B. Narayan Bhai Dandekar.

R. B. Vishnu Balkrishna Sohoni.

Shrimant Balvantrao Ramchandra Natu:

Shrimant Hari R. Dhamdhare.

R. S. Kashinath P. Gadgil.

Hon'ble Bal Gangadhar Tilak.

Prof. Gopal Krishna Gokhale.

Gangadhar V. Lele, Esq.

Vishnu Narayan Apte, Esq.

Dr. Shankar Amrit Chobhe.

Ganesh Narayan Sathe, Esq..

K. S. Kazi Ajmudin.

Pandurang Ramji Bari, Esq.

Khanderao Narayan Vaidya, Esq.

ShetHukumchand Ishwardas, Esq.

Vasudev Ganesh Joshi, Esq.

R. S. Ganesh R. Phadke.

R. S. Gangadhar V. Mehendale.

R. S. Vishnu Bapuji Likhate.

R. S. Mahadeo Ballal Namjoshi.

Ganesh N. Ghotawadekar, Esq.

Waman Prabhakar Bhawe, Esq.

Ramkrishna B. Kulkarni, Esq.

Vinayak R. Jalnapurkar, Esq.

Narayan Ganesh Amdekar, Esq.

Balkrishna R. Vaidya, Esq.

Dr. Narayan Vinayak Chhatre.

Narayan B. Kanitkar, Esq.

Nathmal Ghanasham, Esq.

Waman Vishnu Lele, Esq.

Vishnu Venkatesh Behere Esq.

Krishnarao B. Mande, Esq.

Treasurer.

BALVANTRAO RAMCHANDRA *alias* BALASAHEB NATU.

Auditor.

R. S. DAMODAR JANARDAN GOKHALE

Honorary Secretaries

PROFESSOR GOPAL KRISHNA GOKHALE B. A.

VINAYAK RAMCHANDRA JALNAPURKAR, L. C. B.

Assistant Secretary

KRISHNARAO BAPU MANDE

PROCEEDINGS OF THE SABHA,

AN ADDRESS OF WELCOME TO LORD ELGIN.

A deputation of the Sarvajanic Sabha, consisting of Shrimant Baba Maharaj (Vice-President), Mr. V. R. Patvardhan (Chairman of the Managing Committee) the Hon. Mr. B. G. Tilak, Shrimant B. R. Natu, and Messrs. V. P. Bhawe, Nathmal Ghanasham, B. R. Vaidya, G. K. Gokhale and V. R. Jalnapurkar waited by appointment on His Excellency the Right Hon'ble Lord Elgin, Viceroy and Governor-General of India, on 9th November 1895 at Government House, Poona on the occasion of His Excellency's visit to this city with an address of welcome. The Deputation was presented to His Excellency by the Collector of Poona, after which, Mr. G. K. Gokhale, one of the Honorary Secretaries, read the following address :—

To

HIS EXCELLENCY THE RIGHT HON'BLE

VICTOR ALEXANDER,

EARL OF ELGIN AND KINCARDINE,

P. C., LL. D., G. M. S. I., & G. M. I. E.

VICEROY AND GOVERNOR-GENERAL OF INDIA.

MAY IT PLEASE YOUR EXCELLENCY,

We, the members of a deputation of the Poona Sarvajanic Sabha (an Association established in 1870 for representing to Government the wants and wishes of the people of the Deccan), embrace this opportunity to heartily welcome your Excellency to this historic city and to respectfully testify our sense of deep loyalty to you, the august and worthy representative of her most Gracious Majesty, the Queen-Empress, for the numerous blessings which we enjoy under her benign and enlightened rule. The administration of this vast continent is a responsibility which makes it impossible

that the Viceroy entrusted with this charge should be enabled, during his short term of office, to visit the different parts of the country except for a short time, and it is, therefore, a source of great satisfaction that your Excellency has found time in this, the second year of your rule over us, to pay a flying visit to this part of the country, and we offer you our most heart-felt thanks for the opportunity your Excellency has kindly afforded to us of expressing, as representatives of the Deccan, our sense of the honour conferred on this Presidency by your Excellency's condescension in receiving this address at our hands.

2. The question of the improvement of the condition of the Agricultural population in this country engaged the serious attention of your Excellency's predecessor, and we are glad to see that your Excellency's Government contemplates the deputation of Sir E. Buck to all the Local Governments with a view to give effect to the recommendations of the Agricultural as also of the Deccan Agriculturists' Relief Act Commission. The measures suggested by these two Commissions will, however, not be able to achieve the end in view, unless some steps are taken to impose limits on enhancements in resettlement-operations in the same spirit in which the Government of India have imposed restrictions upon the rights of the Zamindars in Bengal to increase the rents payable to them by their tenants. Temporary remissions and postponements are but palliatives, and unless some limitations are placed on the State-demand, no real relief will be afforded. We have learnt with some apprehension that the proposal to restrict the powers of alienation of private properties in land is advocated in some quarters in this connection. A more retrograde proposal, and one calculated to check all progress in land improvements, cannot be conceived and we trust that your Excellency's Government will give no encouragement to suggestions, which will undo the work of centuries, and turn the Ryots into serfs attached to the soil.

3. Your Excellency's Government has earned the hearty good-will of all classes by promulgating the noble resolution of November last regarding the aims of Forest conservancy, and the considerations which should be borne in mind in the administra-

tion of forests in India. In theory these considerations have always been recognized as the ideals to be aimed at by the Local Governments, but the practical working of the Department has been of a sort to thwart and defeat these considerations by subordinating them to the policy of making the forests a profitable State property, and not a trust in Government hands for the wants of the agricultural interests throughout the country. We accordingly submit that your Excellency's Government will direct the attention of Local Governments to revise their rules, and to work them in the spirit in which the resolution is conceived.

4. In regard to the administration of justice, the proposed legislation in the matter of increasing the powers of the Session Judges and of the High Court in jury trials has filled the public mind with considerable alarm. As a matter of fact, in nine instances out of ten, the Judge and the Jury agree in their verdicts, and in the small minority of cases, where serious differences arise, the power to refer the final decision to the High Court is a sufficient protection. The High Court does not always find in these referred cases that the judge is right and the jurors are wrong in their appreciation of the evidence. The association of the Jury with the Judge in the administration of justice represents a moral force of the highest value to the cause of good government. Juries, all the world over, do not always give verdicts which the Judges approve but that circumstance has never been allowed to influence the Government in restricting their freedom. Even if a criminal escapes on occasions, the evil is not so great as when the sense of the Jury is liable to be overruled by a Judge, who, in this country, being generally a foreigner, cannot be said to understand fully native habits, and conviction by whom under such circumstances will often be understood as an exercise of arbitrary power. We, therefore, request that, as recommended by the Jury Commission, no retrograde changes may be made under your Excellency's presidency in the Council.

5. The differences between the Hindu and Mahomedan communities in connection with music rules in religious and other processions have become a disturbing element. The Sabha has re-

cognized these opposing elements, and it has suggested plans by which the chances of misunderstanding might be minimised and reconciliation promoted between them for ensuring prevention rather than repression of these disturbances. The Queen's peace is an interest which concerns all. That peace cannot be ensured by adopting repressive measures after the breaking out of troubles, or by investing the Police with greater powers in the execution of their duties. The leaders on both sides, having no function of advice, and no power to enforce their wishes, stand aloof and unconcerned, and the police are left alone to deal with the disturbers of peace. Conciliation Boards, enjoying the confidence of Government, and empowered to act as advisers of district authorities, will, it is hoped, better succeed in securing good feelings than is at present possible. Lastly, the question of music regulation in public streets has to be considered both in its general and special bearings. Regulations intended for such purposes should be confined to limitations of time, and place, and form of music, and should not empower police officers to stop music practically at all times and in all places. This general principle being laid down clearly, the details might well be left to the discretion of local authorities according to custom or compact to be arranged between the leaders of both communities before disturbances break out.

6. In conclusion, we again beg to heartily thank your Excellency for your kindness in accepting this address from the Sabha and we take this opportunity to express a hope that your Excellency will continue at the head of the Government for the full term of your office and thus ensure the completion of the many beneficial reforms, which are engaging the attention of your Excellency's Government. We also beg to express our grateful thanks to Lady Elgin for her visit to this ancient city and its institutions and for the kind interest she has shown in the movement for the medical relief of Indian women, first started by Lady Duffarin about 10 years ago.

We beg to remain,

Your Excellency's most obedient, humble servants.

His Excellency the Viceroy, in reply to the address, said :—

I have to thank you sincerely for the welcome which you have given me as representatives of the ancient and historic city of Poona, and of the great district of the Deccan. I believe it is well known that I welcome the opportunities which these addresses afford. I do so for a reason which is easily stated. The Sarva-janik Sabha have well described the visit of a Viceroy as a flying visit. It is, as they justly remark, impossible for him, if he is to endeavour to reach the various parts of this great Empire, to spend much time in any one place. Under these circumstances it is of primary importance to him to consider, when he visits a district, how he can best utilise the short space of time at his disposal. To my mind one of the most beneficial ways in which he can do so is, in the first place, by meeting face to face with the representatives of local bodies; because, after all, there is a good deal in actually seeing one another; and, in the second place, that these opportunities should be used for calling his attention to any special questions of local interest on which, if, at some future time, it should come up to the Government of India for decision, a knowledge of the locality will be of value. I think, therefore, addresses presented to a Viceroy on occasions of this kind must aim at two principal objects. In the first place, they give the opportunity for those courteous greetings which, if you are willing to receive him, and the Viceroy is willing to come, will be readily exchanged; and, in the second place, they are fit occasions on which to put on record the special questions, which those who know local interests best consider of most consequence. I am well aware that there are other questions of greater and graver interest which concern not merely the locality but the community at large. I wish to point out that this is an inconvenient opportunity for discussing questions of that kind. I assert with some confidence that to give their true value to general statements made by bodies, however representative, when they deal with controversial topics in a short and summary manner, you must have full knowledge of the discussions that preceded the conclusion, or full opportunity of discussing them at the time. And on the other hand, it is a painful, if not intolerable, position that a man replying to a welcome should be called upon to controvert facts or challenge fallacies which he cannot accept but equally cannot

altogether ignore. Therefore, I think, it is more convenient that in the case of these larger questions of which I have spoken, if a representation to the Government is desirable, it should be made in a form that will ensure for it a full consideration and a reasoned and deliberate reply. Gentlemen of the Municipal Corporation of Poona,* you have rightly conjectured that you could enlist my sympathy on the two subjects to which you have specially directed my attention, namely, Municipal administration and education. I observe that with regard to Municipal administration—in which I may say I am informed that you stand amongst the first—you have still before you two of the greatest problems which Municipal bodies can have to grapple with. I know that in the discussion of the great questions of water and drainage, there is often a good deal of unnecessary heat excited, and some troublesome questions may arise. I sincerely wish you well through the discussions which you say are still unfinished, and I trust they will not occur in your case in any exaggerated form. I would counsel, if they do occur, to keep steadily before your minds that, apart from any of the manifold points of procedure of technical detail, and even, if I might say so, of financial pressure which may arise, you should keep always before your minds the fact that you have in your hands the life and death of your fellow citizens, and that, therefore, it is your supreme duty not to imperil these great objects for any advantage of comparatively less importance. In this way you will justify the belief in municipal institutions which you so warmly profess. Gentlemen, with regard to education I have heard with great pleasure from your address the efforts you are making in that direction. As you have said, it is a subject to which I have paid a good deal of attention in days gone by, and which, if time and opportunity allowed, I should like very much to study in India and to consult with those who, like you, take an interest in the subject. It is a many-sided subject; and it is not the work of one day, or like a work of great sanitary importance to be solved by one plan that will last for ever; it has to provide for every generation as one follows the other and to meet the wants of each succeeding age. I am glad to learn that here in Poona you

* A deputation of the Poona Municipality had also presented an address of welcome on the occasion.

have recognised this fact, and have not hesitated to give to this movement the support without which it cannot succeed. I am glad also to hear that in Poona an attempt has been made to advance in one of the latest forms of educational progress—I mean technical education. This is a subject which had been before us very prominently just before I left England, and I venture to say that it is one that deserves careful attention, and is not perhaps quite so easily dealt with as some people are at first sight inclined to think. I only wish that time permitted me to study more particularly the methods you propose to adopt here to provide the beginnings at all events of this branch of study. Gentlemen of the Sarvajanik Sabha, you have called my attention to some of the great problems of the agricultural question in a paragraph which, if you will allow me to say so, seems to illustrate some of the inconveniences of dealing with those large questions on an occasion of this kind. You have expressed very confident opinions on some extremely controversial subjects. I have no means of knowing how these opinions were arrived at, whether after discussion or otherwise, though much might depend on that; but in any case it is obvious that I cannot discuss them here and now. Time would fail me even if the occasion were opportune. Let us take, for instance, an illustration. You have spoken in this paragraph of the question of re-settlement, and if I rightly understood your meaning, the natural inference from your observations is that you consider the new settlements which are continually being made to press hardly upon the people. I should be inclined to traverse that allegation, altogether. I think, if I had time and opportunity, I could produce facts and figures to show that at no time in the history of India has the demand for a share in the produce of the lands, to which the Government is legally and by immemorial custom entitled, been so moderate as it is at the present time. I mention this in order to show, with regard to this and other questions, that if I do not discuss them with you because there is no opportunity you must not for that reason think I am able to accept the propositions you have set before me. All I can say is that the views which you have expressed—and I have not the slightest objection to your expressing them—will be fully considered in the course of those inquiries which the Government of India is now instituting, and of

which the deputation of Sir Edward Buck, to which you have alluded, is but a part. When these enquiries are completed, I trust that the Government of India may be in a position to introduce legislation on this subject; and, when we do, I hope that it will be based on the same general principle as the Forest Resolution of which you have spoken so appreciatively, namely, that while we conserve the due rights of the State, we do all we can to protect the rights and interests of that great class of cultivators on whom the prosperity of most countries depends and none more than India. Gentlemen, I can only allude very briefly to two other matters of moment to which you refer in your address. I do not think it would be proper for me to enter into any discussion of the details of a Bill now before the Legislative Council, but I may say a word or two as to procedure. I cannot help thinking that a wholly disproportionate excitement has been got up over this matter. I gather that you at all events assent unreservedly to the recommendations of the Jury Commission, and acknowledge, therefore, that reforms are desirable in the law. One point remains outside those recommendations, and on that point there is, admittedly, great difference of opinion. If the Government had ignored that point and left it out of the Bill, this difference of opinion, and all the consequences that result from differences of opinion, would have remained. The Government thought it better that this point should be carefully and deliberately considered, and it will be carefully and deliberately considered in the proceedings of the Legislative Council. As the Hon. Member who introduced the Bill stated at the time, that is the object with which the Government have introduced this particular provision, and I venture to hope that by the co-operation of all who take an interest in the due, the efficient, but still in the conservative administration of the law, the result of the discussions in Calcutta will be that the law will be put into a shape which will meet the approval of your Sabha as well as of the rest of the community. Gentlemen, you have also called my attention to the differences between the Hindu and Mahomedan communities in connection with music rules in religious and other processions. Well, gentlemen, I am not here to speak "ex-cathedra" or to lay down a general rule which will be applicable in all cases. It has proved to be very

difficult to ascertain and record all the varieties of custom in these matters which are found in different places. Under these circumstances I do not see how it would be possible—indeed, I am not sure that in any case it would be justifiable—to do otherwise than to hold the police authorities to the responsibility which falls upon them for the preservation of the Queen's peace. But, all the same, I welcome most sincerely the emphatic declaration which the Sabha has made that the Queen's peace is an interest which concerns all. I trust that that sentiment will go forth far and wide. I venture to think that this declaration coupled with their advocacy of conciliatory action by the leaders on both sides is of happy omen; and I earnestly hope that your efforts may eventually achieve the great object which is common to you and to the Government, that is, that the time may come when police interference in religious ceremonials will no longer be required by circumstances of the case. Now, gentlemen, I think I have detained you long enough. I am well aware that there are many great questions which I have either not discussed or, perhaps, not alluded to. I have frankly told you why. Let me also frankly assure you that as long as I continue to hold the great office to which, by the favour of her Majesty the Queen Empress, I have been appointed, I shall make it a point to receive and carefully consider any representation which may be sent to me by the important bodies whom I am now addressing, and in thanking you for the good wishes expressed in the addresses which have now been read, I venture to hope that when my term of office expires, I may, at least, leave behind me some token of the beneficial reforms to which you have alluded. (Applause.)

The deputation then withdrew.

THE PRESENT FINANCIAL POSITION.

A GRAVE CRISIS.

A dispassionate survey of the present position of our finances reveals a state of things almost bordering on the desperate, and which demands our most anxious consideration. Expenditure shows an alarming growth in recent years—particularly the cost of what is known as the “forward” policy of Indian Frontier Defence—involving a continual extension of administrative and diplomatic, territorial responsibilities,—and yet there is no effort—nor even a serious disposition to make any—to effect retrenchment or enforce economy. The clumsy financial expedient of irresponsible despotism,—*viz.* increase of taxation is recklessly resorted to in order to ensure the requisite equilibrium of Revenue and Expenditure with the result that the weight of public burdens in the country in relation to the economic condition and resources of the people is now such as, in the opinion of competent observers, to constitute a grave political peril. The existing statutory safeguards against extravagance and waste and the employment of India's means except for India's requirement have thus far proved illusory and the constitutional machinery, as at present organized, seems altogether inadequate for purposes of effective control.

A brief general analysis of the situation will suffice to mark the nature of the financial crisis which at present confronts us.

Broadly speaking, the existing position of Indian Finance presents three very remarkable features, which at once arrest attention, and which, in the opinion of Lord George Hamilton (*vide* his recent speech on the Indian Budget in the House of Commons) constitute its peculiar strength :—

(a) Looking over a series of years, and taking good years with bad, we have on the whole a substantial equilibrium of Revenue and Expenditure.

The figures for the past 12 years are as under :—

(In Millions Rx.)

YEAR.	GROSS REVENUE	GROSS EXPEN- DITURE.	SURPLUS.	DEFICIT.
1883-84	71,841	69,962	1,879
1884-85	70,690	71,077	386
1885-86	74,464	77,265	2,801
1886-87	77,337	77,158	178
1887-88	78,759	80,788	2,028
1888-89	81,696	81,659	37
1889-90	85,085	82,473	2,612
1890-91	85,741	82,053	3,688
1891-92	89,143	88,675	467
1892-93	90,172	91,005	833
1893-94	90,565	92,112	1,546
1894-95	95,154	94,163	990
1895-6 (Budget)	96,924	99,288*	2,364
Total...			9,851	9,958

Thus, since 1883-84 we have had 7 years of surplus against 6 years of deficit—the aggregate surplus fairly balancing the aggregate deficit, including the estimated cost of the Chitral expedition and occupation. (*vide* Lord G. Hamilton's speech on the Indian Budget, September 4.) Considering what a trying period these years have been and what a heavy bill of extraordinary charges we have had to pay on account of wars and war preparations, conquests, and development of conquered provinces, exchange and exchange compensation, nothing could be a more satisfactory result on the general account.

* Budget 96,878 + Estimated cost of Chitral Expedition 2,410 = Rx. 99,288.

(b) The position would appear to be even better if we look to the Assets and Liabilities of the Government of India. The balance sheet stands as under on March 31st 1895.

In India.

<i>Assets</i>	<i>Rx.</i>	<i>Liabilities.</i>	<i>Rx.</i>
Railways constructed by the State.....	85,354,000	Debt.....	104,346,000
Irrigation works.....	30,331,000	Other obligations	18,605,000
Loans to Municipalities.....	11,177,000		<u>122,951,000</u>
Cash Balance	22,680,000		
	<u>149,542,000</u>		
	122,951,000		
Excess of Assets over Liabilities.....	26,591,000		

In England.

<i>Assets</i>	<i>£.</i>	<i>Liabilities.</i>	<i>£.</i>
Purchased Railways..	59,236,000	Debt.....	116,006,000
Advances to Railway Companies.....	5,409,000		116,006,000
Cash Balance.....	2,448,000		<u>67,091,000</u>
	<u>67,091,000</u>	Excess of Liabilities over Assets.	48,915,000

There is, thus, uncovered debt in England to the amount of £ 48,915,000 against which we have in India surplus assets to the extent of Rx. 26,591,000

Add, moreover, on the side of assets, the entire material apparatus of civilized administration—including civil buildings and roads we possess, and the national balance sheet shows a most gratifying surplus of assets over liabilities in England and India. What civilized nation, excepting perhaps the United Kingdom, has a more satisfactory balance sheet to present? It ought, further, to be borne in mind that our final sheet of account, such as it is, has been reached across a century and a half of unparalleled trials and difficulties, and that

throughout the period of the British connection, India has had—unlike the other colonies and dependencies of the Empire—to meet her charges and liabilities—whatever they have been—including the whole cost of conquest and the suppression of the mutinies—with her own unaided resources, with absolutely no help from the Imperial Exchequer, and, moreover, has had like a loyal vassal dependency to co-operate, at the call of the suzerain Power—whether in the fields of Persia, Afghanistan, Abyssinia or Egypt—with the armed strength of the Empire and in defence of Imperial interests.

(c) Thirdly, in view of a financial equilibrium so resolutely maintained and of a balance sheet so clear and satisfactory, what wonder if the credit of the country stands so high in the money market? The success of debt-conversions, carried out within the past 12 years both in England and India, testifies to the growing strength of the public confidence in the solvency and soundness of Indian finance. Our debts in England and India and interest charges during the period under review compare as below :—

In India.

YEAR.	RUPEE DEBT.	INTEREST.
1883-4	Rx. 93,191,384	Rx. 3,741,148
1895-6	Rx. 103,455,775	Rx. 3,633,400
	+Rx. 10,264,394	—Rx. 107,748

In England.

YEAR.	STERLING DEBT.	INTEREST.
1883-4	£ 68,108,837	£ 2,725,748
1895-6	£ 110,109,492	£ 2,658,100
	+£ 42,000,655	—£ 67,648

Thus, increase of debt both in sterling and rupee is accompanied by a considerable reduction in interest charge—a result on which any financier might well congratulate himself.

We have therefore as characteristic features of our financial position :—

- (1) a *fair balance* between Revenue and Expenditure on an average of years ;
- (2) a *final balance sheet with a clear surplus of assets* over liabilities including every kind of debt and obligation ;
- (3) *high credit* in the money market both in India and England ;

and Lord G. Hamilton claims—and not without apparent reason—such a position of national finances, so maintained in the face of difficulties and embarrassments of no ordinary nature, as a brilliant feat of financial skill :—and no doubt in any constitutionally governed country and under normal conditions of responsible direction and control, such a result would have been a splendid financial success. In India, however, where Government is virtually free from all effective responsibility and possesses uncontrolled powers over expenditure and taxation, the so-called financial feat achieved only testifies to the merciless vigour of the administration, and affords no indication of the strength or soundness of the position, which remains after all as weak and full of peril as ever. The reckless policy of a practically irresponsible and despotic bureau is permitted to determine the expenditure of the Empire and the expenditure so established is made to determine the level of public taxation, which, however, does not bear any normal relation to the tax-paying capacity of the people. The principle of English Finance—*viz.*, that of raising the whole of the

supplies within the year—is here adopted and rigorously carried out, and a financial balance enforced and worked out without reference to the ability of the people to bear the load and stand the strain. There are under the existing arrangements, no effective motives to economy, and no constitutional checks to enforce it. Under the Company's Government, we had always in the Court of Directors an ever vigilant board of directive supervision, interested in economical management and invested with constitutional power to ensure it; under the direct administration of the Crown, we have no such sheet-anchor of financial protection, and no one in a position to prevent waste and extravagance. The result is as might be expected. We now stand on the brink of a financial crisis of unprecedented magnitude and severity. Expenditure has established itself on a most extravagant scale, which does not easily admit of reduction, and which even threatens to rise as years pass by with the growing needs of our newly acquired provinces and protectorates; while public taxation, already too heavy and crushing, is found increasingly inadequate and yet cannot now be augmented to the level of the new requirements—without a dangerous exhaustion of national resources.' Such is the dilemma with which we have to deal.

Let us take the *expenditure* side of the national account. We have first to take note of the disturbing action of two of the many standing factors of uncertainty in the Indian Finance—*viz. Exchange and Opium.*

Exchange has fallen since 1883-84 from 19-536d. to 13-0d. per rupee in 1895-96, and the loss on Home remittances has increased in consequence from Rx. 3,373,700 to Rx. 13,116,300, —a net increase of about 9½ crores, exclusive of additional

payments to European soldiers on account of exchange. These payments have risen from Rx. 46,000 to Rx. 1,156,400.

(Three 0s omitted.)

Year.	Average rate of exchange.	Net sterling expenditure	Exchange on net sterling expenditure.	Additional payment to British soldiers on account of exchange.	Total charge for exchange.
	d.	£.	Rx.	Rx.	Rx.
1884-5	19.3	13,844	3,364	184	3,548
1885-6	18.2	13,755	4,329	224	4,553
1886-7	17.4	14,172	5,329	275	5,604
1887-8	16.8	15,128	6,356	436	6,792
1888-9	16.3	14,652	6,817	517	7,334
1889-90	16.5	14,513	6,512	631	7,143
1890-1	18.0	15,176	4,969	587	5,546
1891-2	16.7	15,716	6,825	407	7,232
1892-3	14.9	16,114	9,694	612	10,306
1893-4	14.5	15,633	10,159	852	11,011
1894-5	13.0	15,694	12,995	1,134	14,129
(Revised Estimate)					
1895-6 (Budget.)	13.0	15,739	13,116	1,156	14,272
					98,470
1883-4	19.5	14,764	3,373	46	3,358

The aggregate excess loss on account of exchange, including additional payments to European soldiers, over the level of 1883-84 amounts to no less than 58 crores during the period—averaging 4.84 crores a year and more than absorbing the whole net Revenue from stamps. The increase in Home charges since 1884-85 has been about £1.9 millions, due mainly to increase of Military expenditure and increase of loss on the Railway account.—Had there been no such increase, the saving in exchange would have been about half a crore.

Deducting such avoidable increase, we have a net increase of loss on account of exchange over the level of 1884-85, amounting to 10.2 crores as lying entirely outside the control of Government.

Similarly in regard to *Opium* we have a continual fall-off in receipts during the period. Opium Revenue averaged during 10 years (from '74-5 to '83-4) 7.238 crores; since '84-5 it has fallen to 4.105 crores in '95-6,—the average for the period being 5.812 crores.

(000's omitted)

Year.	Net Revenue.	Year.	Net Revenue.
	Rx.		Rx.
'74-5	6,214	'84-5	5,850
'75-6	6,252	'85-6	5,884
'76-7	6,280	'86-7	6,213
'77-8	6,521	'87-8	6,090
'78-9	7,699	'88-9	5,964
'79-80	8,249	'89-90	5,977
'80-1	8,451	'90-1	5,698
'81-2	7,803	'91-2	6,150
'82-3	7,216	'92-3	6,391
'83-4	7,701	'93-4	4,750
		'94-5	5,675
		'95-6	4,105
	72,386		69,747
Total annual average.	7.238 Crores of Rupees.	Total annual average.	5.812 Crores of Rupees.

The aggregate deficiency of receipts under this head of Revenue, as compared with the annual average for the preceding decade, comes up during the period to 1.72 crores—a loss of income also lying beyond the control of Government.

With these two large disturbing elements—*falling exchange*, inflicting upon the Treasury a net aggregate excess loss of 58 crores—and *falling Opium*, causing a total net deficiency

of Revenue during the period to the extent of 17·2 crores, no prudent Government, really solicitous for the welfare of the people under its charge, and, certainly, no responsible administration would have chosen to embark on a policy of reckless adventure. The Government of India, however, thought otherwise, and under military lead, permitted itself in the spring of 1885—under cover of precautionary measures for the better protection of the Indian Frontiers—to be launched upon a costly Imperial programme of operations in defence and furtherance of Imperial interests beyond the border. On the N. W., the steady advance of Russia towards the N. W. Frontier—almost within striking distance—as marked by her occupation of Merv in 1884 and her subsequent march to the Murghat, and the unfortunate collision between her troops and the Afgans at Penjdeh in March 1885—on the one hand,—on the other and increased French colonial activity in the far East, were seized as pretexts for reviving old ambitious schemes of territorial expansion beyond the Indian Frontier; and to forestall Russia on the one side and France on the other, Government entered upon a vigorous prosecution of what is known as the forward frontier policy, which, while it has had the effect of weakening our natural defences, has resulted in a vast extension of our territorial responsibilities and necessitated large additions to our annual expenditure.

As a necessary precedent condition, a comprehensive scheme of measures of military precaution and preparation was planned out and vigorously put in execution :—

- (a) Improvement of frontier communications by rail and road. About a crore and-a-half have been since 1886-7 laid out on frontier military roads, and close on 14 crores spent on the construction of strategic railways ;—the net annual charge on account of these railways coming up to 60 lakhs—nearly 6 lakhs on working and 54 on account of interest on capital outlay.

- (b) A large programme of special Defence works to cost altogether 5 crores, undertaken. 4.6 crores have already been spent for the purpose, leaving 40 lakhs for future years.
- (c) Increase of the armies by 29,000 troops carried out in '86-7-8. The addition, it was stated, was required for "placing the Indian army on a footing adapted to the new conditions which it may be called upon to meet. Till lately the functions of that army were limited to maintaining the internal peace of India and to supplying small bodies of troops for foreign expeditions against adversaries possessing very limited resources. By the recent advance of Russia, the military problem with which the Government of India has to deal has been profoundly modified. We have now in close proximity to our frontier a great European power with which we may at any time be brought into hostile contact, and consequently our existing military establishments are no longer adequate for the duties they may have to fulfil." (*Vide* Government of India's Despatch to the Secretary of State dated August 14, 1885.)

The net increase of charge on account of these additional troops is, under administrative expenditure alone, close

	Crores.	}	on 4 crores. The aggregate additional expenditure during the period amounts to 22 crores.
'84-5.....	14.838		
'95-6.....	18.829		
Increase	3.991		

With these measures of military precaution and preparation in rapid progress, the Government of India embarked upon a vigorous course of frontier extensions and launched its armies beyond the border towards the close of 1885.

(1) Upper Burma was the first to be conquered and annexed. The expeditionary force under General Prendergast

crossed the frontier on 14th November 1885, and within a fortnight Mandalay was occupied and King Theebaw was a prisoner. On the 1st of March 1886, the province was formally annexed to British India. The expedition cost Rs. 630,000 in '85-6 and the new province has ever been a dead charge on the Indian Revenues. The net amount we have had to spend on account of special military expenditure and civil administration during the period has been 14.9 crores. The annual charge is, yet, close on a crore.

	Net charge in crores.
'85-6	.630
'86-7	2.068
'87-8	2.618
'88-9	1.695
'89-90	1.333
'90-1	1.082
'91-2	1.391
'92-3	1.176
'93-4	1.082
'94-5	.819
'95-6	.925
Total.	14.092

Upper Burma covers about 100,000 sq. miles with a large belt of subordinate chiefships (the Shan states) covering an equal area as a political appendage. The protected border land is still in a state of political unrest and frequent punitive expeditions have to be despatched to maintain peace and enforce order.

(2) Next we come to British Baluchistan. It was in 1887 that Pishin, Sibi, Shorarud, Thal-Chotiali, and Harnai—districts taken over from the Amir of Kabul under the treaty of Gandamak in '79-80 and till then administered by a political officer—were formally incorporated with British India and formed into a new province of the Empire under a Chief Commissioner. The valleys of Bori and Zhob were occupied in '87 and '89 respectively and annexed to the new province; Mnsal Khel, Khetram and Khibzai were subsequently added and in '89-90, the country, intervening between the Panjab and the Zhob, occupied by various tribes, was taken over and incorporated with British Baluchistan.

Thus enlarged, the new province is now an extensive province of vast strategic importance thrust wedge-like into the Central Asian Zone. A regular civil administration has recently been organized and the Government grant-in-aid of civil expenditure is about Rs. 86,000 a year. The garrison in the province consists of about 9,000 troops and the military charge at the lowest estimate cannot be below 50 lakhs per annum. Besides, the works and communications of Quetta are a heavy charge on the Public Works Budget of the Empire. The Province covers an area of about 45,000 sq. miles.

(3) We have in the third place to notice the establishment of a large protectorate under the Gilghit Agency. The Agency, with a brigade of Kashmir troops, was re-established at Gilghit in 1889. The object was to watch the course of events beyond the Kashmir frontier and control the country lying to the south of the Hindu Kush and to hold in readiness a force strong enough in time of trouble to prevent any *coup de main* by a small body of troops acting across the passes. The Government of India urged in this connection:—"The advance of Russia up to the frontiers of Afghanistan and the great recent development of her military resources in Asia have admittedly increased the necessity for strengthening our line of defence, and among the points requiring special attention are the northern passes of the Hindu Kush, which afford a difficult but not impracticable route for a force large enough to cause much excitement if nothing worse, in Kashmir and among the tribes of Bajour, and perhaps at Jalalabad and on the Panjab frontier. We cannot afford to disregard this risk. Further we cannot afford to permit any foreign power to establish in time of peace its influence in the country." (*Vide* Chitral papers, page 7.)

The Gilghit Agency so re-established has now an extensive protectorate under its control—stretching right up to the heights of the Hindu Kush and including Hunza, Nagar, Chitral, Swat, Dir, and Bajour and other adjoining chiefships.

By the Durand treaty of 1893, the Amir of Kabul gave up all claim to sovereignty over these tribal chiefships.

The cost of the Agency was at first estimated at half a lakh, but subsequently the establishments of officers and troops had to be increased and subsidies to the tribes received considerable additions, and the total cost rose to 2 lakhs per annum. The occupation of Chitral is officially estimated to cost 20 lakhs a year for the present. The area of the Protectorate is about 35,000 sq. miles.

Further, the Kuram Valley, which was abandoned in 1881 as a worthless strategic position, has been re-occupied and is now held up to the Peiwar Kotal.

(4) At about the same time, we have in the far west a third British protectorate established outside the limits of the Asiatic continent. The Somali Coast in East Africa from Wahadu to Ziyada became an Indian protectorate in 1884 and is now under the political control of the Aden Residency under the Bombay Government. By an arrangement with Italy in 1894, the limits of the protectorate (covering an area of 75,000 sq. miles) were definitely defined. At present Berbera, Zaila, and Bulhar are the only three military outposts held by the Indian troops. The cost of the protectorate for the present varies from 1 to 2 lakhs a year.

The protectorate was extended in 1886 by the inclusion of the island of Socotra off the coast of Africa and the Kuria Muria island off the coast of Arabia, acquired from the Sultan of Muscat.

(5) But by far the most important extension of our frontier responsibilities remains yet to be noticed. It is during this period that our protectorate over Afghanistan has been finally and definitively established. Afghanistan is no longer

a "neutral intermediary zone"—lying outside the sphere of Russian influence and separating British India from the Czar's dominions in Asia, as was contemplated by Lord Clarendon in 1868, but is now an integral part of our vast British protectorate in Asia. It came within the recognised sphere of British influence in '72-3 and we are now under solemn treaty obligations to defend under all circumstances its integrity and independence. Sir L. Griffin, than whom no one knows these relations better, holds that "England is as much bound in honour to defend Herat, Maimana, Balkh or any other portion of Afghanistan against Russia as she is to defend the Isle of Weigh against France." The Amir is strictly bound to conform to our advice in the conduct of all his foreign relations, and is always entitled, like every other chief under British protection, to claim material and moral support from us in the hour of need. The respective spheres of control of the Amir and the Government of India have been defined, and by the recent Durand treaty (1893), the Amir has given up all Suzerain rights over the entire intervening belt of tribal territory between his dominions and British India—which is now brought under English administrative control; he has further withdrawn his pretensions over Waziristan. As part of the Durand agreement, the Amir's subsidy has been increased from 12 to 18 lakhs per annum. The demarcation of the Russo-Afghan frontier, begun in 1884, was completed in 1888, which is accepted by the Czar's Government. Similarly in 1891 the Perso-Afghan boundaries were settled. The protectorate is now bounded on the North by the Central Asian States under the influence of Russia, on the West by Persia and on the South by British Baluchistan and covers an area of 200,000 square miles.

This definitive incorporation, during the period, of Afghanistan with the British Indian protectorate is an event of the gravest moment in our recent political history. It brings British India into actual territorial touch with the Russian Empire in Central Asia, and opens up a vista of large possibilities. It imposes upon us military and diplomatic liabilities, which it is simply appalling to contemplate. The new protectorate profoundly modifies the military situation and adds infinitely to our difficulties of frontier defence. What the financial and other demands of the new condition of things so established on the N. W. frontier will be, time alone can show, but that they will be vast—intolerably vast—there can be no shadow of doubt. For the present the charge on account of the protectorate is represented by the Amir's subsidy of 18 lakhs per annum.

(6) These vast territorial extensions have not been achieved without a large expenditure on expeditions and military operations. Including the cost of operations in Burma and on the Burmese frontier, as also the cost of the recent Chitral expedition, the aggregate charge during the period on this account is no less than 15·6 crores.

(7) Further large additions to "political" expenditure have been necessary. Political missions beyond the frontier, explorations, boundary commissions, tribal levies, subsidies to tribal chiefs, new political agencies at distant centres of political control—these and such like have cost us considerable sums of money during the period and have permanently increased our "political" expenditure from about 50 lakhs in '83-4 to over 96 lakhs during the current year. The total excess charge over the figure for '83-4 has been close on 3 crores (2·838 crores).

To sum up the financial results of the new frontier policy—

Preparatory measures.	Aggregate charge during the period in crores.	Permanent annual charge in crores.
Military roads.....	1.250	"
*Strategic Railways.....	14.000	.600
Special Defence Works.....	4.630	"
Army increases..... (including Beluchistan garrison.)	22.000	3.900
Frontier extensions.		
(1) Upper Burma	14.920	.925
(2) British Beluchistan.....	"	0.086
(3) The Gilghit Agency and Protectorate..... (including Chitral)	"	.220
(4) Somali Coast	"	.012
(5) The Afghan Protectorate....	"	.180
Cost of expeditions, &c..... (exclusive of Burma)	8.240	"
Political expenditure.....	2.838	.457
Total in crores....	67.878	6.038

Such are, as far as we can gather from official returns, the financial results—so far of the forward policy of Indian frontier defence—resumed in the spring of 1885. In the very nature of things such expenditure once undertaken can have no finality and must needs grow with each fresh development of the policy.

A heavy bill of extra charges—albeit a crushingly heavy one—including a net aggregate expenditure of 67·8 crores and involving a permanent addition to the annual charges of the

* The charge is met from capital and not from current revenue.

country to the extent of 6·3 crores—a bill, moreover, likely to grow as time passes by—is not, however, the only outcome of the new policy. We have, besides, on our hands a vast additional area—partly under direct dominion and partly under protective political control—to look after embracing two new provinces (Upper Burma—100,000 sq. miles, and British Beluchistan—45,000 sq. miles), together containing an area of 145,000 sq. miles and equal in size to the whole Bengal Presidency, together with 4 protectorates covering a total area of 410,000 sq. miles, (*viz.* The Shan states 100,000 sq. m., the Gilghit Agency and Protectorate 35,000 sq. m., Afghanistan 200,000 sq. m. and lastly Somaliland 75,000 sq. m.=410,000 sq. m.)—in all covering an aggregate area of 555,000 sq. miles, more than the area of France, Germany and Italy put together. And all this enormous expansion of territorial responsibilities, with its necessarily heavy bill of charge, has been carried out within the short space of 12 years in the name of India's safety and for the better protection of her frontier!

To the calm observer of the situation, the first question that suggests itself is, was all such territorial extension at all necessary for the purpose? Was it necessary to advance the bounds of the Empire so far into the wilds and deserts of Mid-Asia and East Africa? Was it not possible to avoid so large an extension of administrative and diplomatic liabilities—consistently with the obligations of national safety? Would it not as well have served the purpose to keep to the old border lines, and trust, as Lord Lawrence and his able co-adjutors so strongly recommended, to the strength and loyal support of a united and contented India against all menace of foreign aggression? It is, however, no use now reviving the old controversies, and we have to accept the fact that the natural lines of the country's frontier—once held to be impregnable—are now left hundreds and hundreds of miles behind. And we sincerely wish it were even now permissible, after all the toil and trouble of the past decade, to hope that the new advanced frontier line, which has cost us so dear, is truly the

“ scientific frontier, ” of which the Government was so long in search, and constitutes an invulnerable line of defence,—proof against all assault. The new policy—and its results—so far as may be judged from present indications, leave the military and diplomatic situation, we fear, distinctly worse and weaker than it was 12 years ago. But our present concern is only with the financial aspects of these so-called “ defensive ” measures of the past 12 years, and we have here only to take note of the fact that they have entailed on the country a total expenditure of 67·8 crores and a net additional of 6·33 crores to its annual expenditure.

Apparently not content with making such large additions to the expenditure of the country, Government has, further, simultaneously pushed on with vigour a vast scheme of Railway extensions. During the period since '83-4 capital outlay on Railway construction by the direct agency of the State has amounted to 61·9 crores, to which a further sum of 25 crores has to be added as expended by the Companies—giving a total capital expenditure of about 87 crores. Up to the end of '82-3, the total capital outlay by the State was but 39 crores. (1868—'82-3). Some of these lines are complete and some are still under construction, which may require further expenditure. Several of the new lines—especially on the Panjab side are avowedly for strategic purposes and are worked at a loss. The N. W. Railway, for instance, on which 35·4 crores have been spent up to date, does not yet pay its way. Similarly, the Mushkaf Bolan Railway—the third line constructed since 1880 to connect Quetta with Sibi and which has cost 2·26 crores—is now ready to be opened for traffic but clearly it will have to be worked at a dead loss for years. Further extensions are in contemplation and various surveys at an immense outlay have been carried out. The Mandalay-Kunlon Railway project has just been sanctioned; the line is intended to extend to the frontiers of the Chinese province of Yunnan and open it up to English commerce, forestalling French projects in the same direction, and is estimated to cost 2·5

crores. We have also at Chaman, the Afghan terminus of the Quetta line, a large quantity of *frontier Railway reserve material* (of the value of 44 lakhs) piled up on the Kandahar side of the Kwaja Amran range with a view to political eventualities.

This vigorous prosecution of Railway construction has, however, partly owing to the falling exchange and partly because several of the new lines are strategic only—largely increased the net loss to the State during the period. The loss in '83-4 was only 30 lakhs : it is now in the current year 2·149 crores. The aggregate loss on this account in excess over the figure for '83-4 comes up to 14·4 crores. As fresh extensions proceed on the N. W. and on the N. E., and if exchange does not, in the mean time, improve, the loss must grow *pari passu*.

Lastly, to swell this bill of extra charge for the period, Government chose in '93-4 to grant exchange compensation to its European Services. The amounts granted are :—

	Crores	}	This is a new charge and will vary with the fluctuations of exchange. In the current years Budget, it stands at little less than a crore and a half—almost absorbing the whole increase of Revenue sought to be secured by enhancement of the salt duties in 1888 :—
'93-4.....	624		
'94-5.....	1·235		
'95-6.....	1·456		
	3·315		

Surely, the hardships of the European Services in the matter of their family remittances to England owing to low exchange far outweigh in official estimation the silent sufferings of the poorer millions of the land, who are compelled, in consequence of the enhanced duties, to eat less salt.

The new charge, so lightly undertaken in the midst of such heavy embarrassments, sufficiently marks the reckless character of the present financial administration. What responsible Government, we ask, would have ventured

to increase the pay of its already overpaid services by 15-20 p. c. by a stroke of the pen—while retaining such a cruel impost on a prime necessary of life as the salt poll-tax at so high a rate?

Here closes our account of the *extraordinary expenditure* of the period—which Government has chosen to incur without apparent excuse or necessity. The following is a rough summary :—

	Total expenditure.	Permanent addition.
	Crores.	Crores.
Frontier Policy	67·80	6·380
Railway Extensions	14·46	1·242
(exclusive of strategic lines)		
Exchange Compensation.....	3·31	1·456
	<hr/>	<hr/>
	85·57	9·078

We have thus had, during these 12 years since '83-4 an extraordinary expenditure of 85½ crores and have had 9 crores added to our permanent Budget of annual charges. Moreover this is a bill of extra charge we have had to meet, besides providing for the normal annual charges of the country. What civilized nation, we may ask, has had so heavy a bill to pay during a similar period?

Be it further noted that Government has elected to inflict upon the country such a needlessly heavy expenditure in the face of *falling Exchange* and *Jailing Opium*, exerting a most disturbing influence on the financial position of the country.

Indian public opinion is unanimous in holding that not a rupee of this enormous extra expenditure has brought us any good. The whole amount, we agree in thinking, has been recklessly and wantonly wasted under the uncontrolled management of a cynical and irresponsible bureaucracy—an amount, which, if it had been properly applied to its legitimate purposes in promotion of internal progress and development, might have resulted in a large increase in the happiness and

contentment of the teeming millions of the land and in an accession of moral strength and stability to the British position in India infinitely greater than any number of conquests and annexations, defence works and strategic lines could ever ensure. The constitution gives us no effective voice in the administration of our own funds and provides no other agency to guard our interests, and hence is possible all this waste and diversion of our resources to purposes in no way connected with our safety or our welfare.

At all events, it will not be disputed, we think, that in undertaking such an enormous extra expenditure in the face of the accumulating difficulties of *falling Silver* and *failing Opium*—and moreover at a time when the country was just struggling to emerge from the effects of one of the most frightful famines on record, and required, above all, breathing time and repose, Government has not shown, during these years, in respect of the management of the national finances, that due care and caution which we had a right to expect of it as a trustee of our resources :—

The recklessness of the existing financial administration of the country—due to the absence of adequate constitutional control—will be still more apparent when we pass on to an examination of the ways and means by which Government has endeavoured during these 12 years to meet the new extra demands, and maintain the requisite balance of Revenue and Expenditure. As, in respect of Expenditure, so in the matter of Revenue, it has shown itself singularly regardless of the true interests of the country. If there has been, according to Sir A. Colvin, a "*perilous growth*" of expenditure in India since '83-4, particularly in the military and political departments of Government, it will be seen that there has been a *still more perilous growth of public burdens* in the country—a growth, moreover, proportionately larger by far than in any country of Europe or America and which is besides accompanied by ruthless readjustments of expenditure—which have

had the effect of seriously hampering administrative improvements and the material and moral progress of the nation.

Among the financial expedients adopted by Government during the period, we may specially note :—

(1) Frequent suspensions or curtailments of the Famine Insurance grants.

During the past 12 years, the grant has been suspended 5 times, ('86-7, '87-8, '88-9, '94-5, and '95-6) and twice curtailed ('89-90, and '90-1)—apparently in complete disregard of the fact that each such suspension or curtailment of the fund was a distinct violation of the solemn, "religious" pledges volunteered by Lord Lytton's Government in justifying the special taxation imposed for the creation of the Fund. The total expenditure on famine relief and insurance since '84-5 has been 11.9 crores, i. e. short of the normal amount pledged by full 6 crores.

(2) Appropriations of Provincial resources and balances in aid of Imperial expenditure.

The Provincial contracts were revised in '87-8 and a net asset of Rx. 640,000 was secured to improve the position of Imperial revenues; the contracts again underwent a revision on expiry of a 5 years' term in '92-3 and the Government of India got Rx. 466,300 as a net gain on revision. The total amount thus secured in aid of Imperial revenues has been since '87-8 Rx. 4,598,900. Besides, special contributions were exacted from the local administrations to the amount of Rx. 895,000 (Rx. 490,000 in '90-1 and in '94-5, Rx. 405,000). The aggregate exactions so obtained from the Provincial Governments come up to full 5½ crores during the period.

Such frequent sweepings into the Imperial Treasury of these Provincial monies evidently tend to unsettle the contracts, shake the confidence of the Provincial administrations, contract and cripple their resources and reserve balances, weaken motives to economy and careful management and interfere

with Provincial progress. But what chance was there of any weight being allowed to considerations such as these, when money was imperatively wanted for improving the fortifications of Quetta or the defences of Aden, or for maintaining garrisons at Gilghit and on the Somali Coast, or for subsidizing the Khyber and Kuram Chiefs?

(3) Postponement of administrative reforms.

We need only refer here to the question of Police Reform and the Separation of Judicial and Executive functions—reforms, the necessity for which has been most amply recognized, times without number, but which have been put off from year to year for “want of funds”

(4) Curtailment of useful expenditure in various ways.

Take, for instance, the Department of Public Education. Expenditure under this head has increased during the period by only 35 lakhs—from 1·238 crores in '84-5 to 1·587 crores in '95-6; while “political” expenditure beyond the frontier has increased by nearly 46 lakhs—for the purpose of increasing the subsidies of the Amir and other frontier chiefs, paying increased amounts to the tribal levies, and giving increased allowances to the Swatis and Bajouries and other tribes—apparently as if the enforced allegiance of these semi-wild tribes were of more consequence to the peace and glory of the Empire than the moral and intellectual elevation of the people of the country!

(5) But such re-adjustments of expenditure could not possibly suffice and instead of adopting a policy of retrenchment and economy as the circumstances of the country demanded, Government has chosen to have recourse to *increase of taxation* to meet the increased expenditure.

The following table exhibits the net expansion of taxation proper during the period ('83-4—'95-6), taking only the “principal heads” of Revenue—the other receipts being non-tax revenue; and omitting

(a) *Tributes from native states*—as an extra receipt.

- (b) *Opium receipts*, as contributed by the foreign consumer.
 (c) And further deducting from the figures for '95-6 *Upper Burma receipts*—the province being annexed only in '85-6.

(In crores of rupees.)

Principal heads of Revenue.	1883-4	1895-6	Increase.	Percent- age.
Land Revenue.....	22·361	25·646	3·285	14
Salt.....	6·145	8·693	2·548	41
Stamps.....	3·513	4·611	1·098	32
Excise.....	3·836	5·474	1·638	42
Provincial rates.....	2·878	3·654	·776	25
Customs.....	4·187	4·814	3·627	300
Assessed taxes.....	·526	1·791	1·265	240
Forest.....	1·052	1·413	·801	35
Registration.....	·258	·417	·159	60
Total.....	41·761	56·516	14·757	35

* (*Note* — Land Revenue is here included as being properly a *tax* and not *rent*,—as is erroneously held by Sir H. H. Fowler and others. The theory of the landlordship of the State, on which the "rent" view is based, is opposed to both precedent and fact.)

The expansion of taxation during these years has thus been over 14·7 crores—which gives an increase of about 10 annas per head of the population or (taking 5 persons to a family) Rs. 3-2 per family per annum.

In no European country—not in the United Kingdom nor even in France or Russia—has there been during the period so large an augmentation of public burdens. While the United Kingdom;—of which India is but a distant dependency—with all its widening responsibilities of Empire and Imperial protection, adds only 14 per cent. to the burdens of the people;—while France, with her admittedly great military and political difficulties and colonial requirements, increases her public taxation by but 13 per cent.; while Russia, with her vast Empire stretching across two Continents, could manage her world-wide concerns with only a 32 per cent. addition to her public revenues;—British India,—while under the protecting shadow of the British Empire, is condemned to add 35 per cent. to her burdens! The following table, compiled from the Statesman's Year Books, will be of interest in this connection.

(In Millions £. Sterling.)

Name of Country.	1882-3	1894-5	Increase	Percentage of increase.
* Great Britain & Ireland	148.6	169.4	20.6	14
* France.....	139.4	157.4	18	13
* Italy.....	73.6	87.9	14.3	19
Austria-Hungary.....	74.8	87.5	12.7	17
Sweden and Norway.....	6.8	8.4	1.6	23
Belgium.....	11.9	14.28	2.3	19
Denmark.....	2.76	3.28	.46	17
Netherlands.....	8.9	10.5	1.6	18
Russia (Direct and indirect tax revenue)...	81.0	107.2	26.2	33
British India.....	Mill Rx. 41.761 (1883-4)	mill. Rx. 56.516 (1895-6)	14.7	35

* Including both Imperial and local taxation.

* Here parenthetically we may conveniently notice Sir J. Westland's contention that the increase of taxation in India thus arrived at by comparison is only apparent—as being calculated in a depreciated currency. Reduced to a sterling basis, argues the Finance Minister, the taxation for the period shows a positive diminution—which means a sensible alleviation of the people's burdens! And he gives us an elaborately constructed return as an appendix to his last Budget speech in support of his argument (*vide* Financial Statement, April '95). Taking for comparison only Land Revenue and Taxation, the table works up as under:—

Revenue.	1883-4	1894-5
£1=Rx.	1,229	1,833
Land Revenue.....	Mill £ 18,022	Mill £ 13,887
Forest.....	854	895
Other Taxation.....	14,801	15,344
Total	33,678	30,128
Deducting for Upper Burma	—600
	33,678	29,528

Decrease of Taxation—£4.15 millions.

Sir J. Westland hence argues that the taxation of the country has been reduced during the period and claims credit on behalf of the Financial Administration for the enforcement of a "severe economy", which has rendered such reduction possible. His table, however, gives us only one side of the national account which vitiates his comparison. He omits the other term of the equation—the income of the country—on which the taxation is levied, which, if similarly reduced for

the period to a sterling basis, would also exhibit a parallel proportionate decrease! The decrease on reduction to an appreciated currency being then balanced on either side, the equation would be a correct financial equation and the ratio between taxation and the income of the country would be in correspondence with fact and would furnish a right standard for comparison. The fallacy of Sir J. Westland's argument lies in the assumption that while the revenue and expenditure of the country are calculated and stated in the depreciated currency of silver, the entire volume of the country's transactions ranges and adjusts itself on a gold basis following the variations of exchange. The fact is that the regulating currency of the country is essentially the currency of silver—exchange coming in only in respect of foreign liabilities, and that neither rents nor profits nor wages nor prices are appreciably influenced by the fluctuating course of exchange. The country's transactions are all on the silver basis and obey the normal economic laws in entire independence of the variations of the value of the rupee in relation to gold. It is in silver that we deal in all our business relations and it is in silver that we pay our taxes. Increase of taxation, therefore, in the regulating currency of the country is a positive increase of burdens and cannot be whittled away by any academic manipulation; and it can, for instance, carry no conviction to the mind of the poor contributor to the salt-tax—who earns his daily wage in silver—to be told that he now pays less for the salt he eats than he did 12 years ago—as calculated in gold and that the enhancement of the duty is only apparent!

We may then take it that the net increase of taxation, during the period, has been, as shown before, full 14·7 crores or 35 per cent. since 1883-4—and is proportionately heavier than in any other civilised country in the world,—heavier by far than in the United Kingdom.

But there are other features, besides, of this increase of public burdens with us during these years, which deserve special attention;—

(A) Economically :—

(a) Government has thought fit to inflict upon the country such a formidable load of additional taxation—and for no intelligible reason—just at a time when it was trying to recover from the disastrous effects of a most dreadful famine, and when it needed all the sympathetic consideration it could have received.

(b) While in England and other European countries the expansion of national income depends on and follows a normal advance in material prosperity ; in British India, the recent increase of taxation has been simultaneous and concurrent with a steady deterioration in the resources of the people. Everywhere else, the nations are progressing with rapid strides in wealth, comfort, and every other element of material strength; we alone in British India are steadily losing our ground in the industrial field, and such is now the break-down of our economic system that we have amongst us—particularly in the lower strata of the population—a degree of acute distress and grinding poverty, such as is perhaps nowhere to be met with in the rest of the civilized world. Among other indications of a serious decline in recent years in the economic condition of the people we may notice ;—

1.—*Severe agricultural depression.*—The area of cultivation not advancing with advancing needs of a growing population—a fast-proceeding exhaustion of the soil under pressure of continuous, unmanured cropping and in the absence of agricultural improvements—a diminishing yield of crops—the growing indebtedness of the agricultural classes—these are some of the determining features of the industry which is the que surviving economic mainstay of the nation and on which 80 p. c. of the people depend for very bread.

2.—*An alarmingly increasing death-rate,*—an unmistakable indication of the growing destitution of the poorer classes. The mortality for '91-2 amounted to a fearful total of 7,000,965 deaths or 32.12 per mille. There has been some

improvement since but the fact remains that the present death-rate in the country is a good deal higher than it was 12 years ago. In '82-3, there were only 4,595,648 deaths or 22·17 per mille.

3.—*A growing fall-off in the consumption of salt* since the enhancement of the duties in '88—another unailing indication of the diminishing resources of the poorer classes. In '86-7 the total consumption was 33,735,054 Indian maunds; for '94-5 it is 34,150,507 or only 415,453 maunds more. Taking the rate of increase at 1 p. c. per annum, the population of the country during these 8 years must have increased by about 23 millions, for which the additional consumption of salt at the normal rate of 10 lbs. per head per annum ought to have been about 30 lakhs of maunds, against which we have only an increase of little more than 4 lakhs. The consumption of this prime necessary of life is thus now 26 lakhs of maunds short of the normal—which means that 80 millions and more of our struggling poor, who alone cannot afford to buy enough salt when it is dear, are forced to cut down their supply by about 3 lbs. per head.

4.—A stationary condition of the general wage-rate of the country in the face of rising prices—a sure sign of a fall-off in the standard of living of the labouring classes.

(B) *Financially* ;—

(a) As regards the character of our taxation ;—while in the countries of the West, every effort is made to adjust public taxation so as to make it weigh as lightly as possible on the springs of national industry, in British India it is as if specially designed to cripple the national resources and to impede material progress, and we need only refer to some of the recent enhancements of land revenue in the Deccan, the Central Provinces, and the Punjab, the enhancement of the salt duties, and the growing *forest* receipts as fair illustrations of the radically vicious character of our present fiscal system.

(b) With this enormous increase of burdens, the extreme limits of taxation in India are, in the opinion of competent observers, reached if not already overstepped. Income-tax, salt-tax, forced periodical increases of land revenue, local rates have been one after another, during these years, sweated from the shaking sides of the struggling Indian tax-payer and now no fiscal reserve remains available for emergencies. Not a rupee more can now be raised from him without dangerous exhaustion.

(c) And be it further recommended that all this stretching and straining is during a quiet time of peace! And if such is the stress of peace, what may be the stress of war, when it comes? And where is the reserve of strength on which reliance is placed?

(C) *Politically*;—There is yet a third aspect of this increase of taxation which cannot be passed over. There is a growing feeling of uneasiness—if not of alarm all over the country at this fearful growth of burdens—a feeling as yet vague and undefined—but which, as it gathers strength and volume, constitutes a political danger which it is no longer safe to overlook. Every one with disquieting anxiety waits to see what may be the next turn of the fiscal screw? Further, among the more intelligent classes in the country there is an increasing sense of keen discontent and dissatisfaction at the way in which all this money, so squeezed out, is so recklessly squandered away amidst the inaccessible wilds and sandy deserts, far away outside the limits of the country; and, indeed, it is impossible to hold one's patience when one finds that the unfortunate country is being so ruthlessly bled—for the purpose of extending the benefits of civilized rule to semi-barbarous tribes, inhabiting the wild border-lands of the Empire!

Such, then, is, in general outline, the way in which Government has managed the *revenue* side of the national account during these years—and such are the methods which it has thought fit to adopt to meet the demands of a situation it

itself has created in blind disregard of all prudent considerations—*regrettable readjustments of administrative expenditure* and an *intolerable increase of taxation*, and that too of the sort above indicated.

Taking now in one broad view both the sides of the financial administration of the country (—*expenditure* and *revenue*—) during the past 12 years, it will be seen what a formidable *impasse* we have come to, under the guidance of a bureaucracy—left to follow its own instincts and adopt its own devices—in blissful freedom from all outside check or control—a growing expenditure with an irresistible tendency to grow still further *ad infinitum et ad libitum* on the one side, and on the other, a taxation forced up to the extreme limits not only of the peoples means but now even of their patience !

Such is the situation—desperate and full of peril—with which we have to grapple. Revenue and expenditure, no doubt, balance each other, and according to European tests the financial equilibrium so established is a decisive proof of the soundness of the system—a view of the position which Lord George Hamilton evidently holds. But such are the conditions of Government and administrations in this country that in this very balanced position of the national finances—on which the Secretary of State congratulates us—there lurks *grave danger* to which we ought no longer to shut our eyes.

This vaunted financial equilibrium is itself a delusive equilibrium, and presents a dilemma from which escape does not seem easy. In the presence of such an embarrassing situation, it would, in our opinion, serve no useful purpose to criticize particular items of public expenditure or particular aspects of public policy, and it would be a mistake and a wrong diagnosis of the evils to seek to fasten the blame on this or that individual administrator or on this or that individual Administration. It is, we submit, the system—the entire financial management of the country—which is responsible for the present difficulties; and unless there is a change—a radical change in the system—the root of the evil will remain untouched. It is the machinery and not the product nor its working agents on which we have to concentrate our attention.

High authorities concur in the view that the root of all our financial embarrassments lies in the absence of any adequate control under the existing constitution of the Government of the country over the management of the national finances. Professor Fawcett remarks on this point (*vide* "Indian Finance" Introduction) : "When the Government of India was transferred from the Company to the Crown, many safe-guards for economy were swept away, and the substitutes for them have proved ineffective." Sir D. Barbour similarly says (*vide* his speech at a meeting of the International Bimetallic Conference, 1894) : "The system for the control of Indian expenditure (as provided under the existing constitution) is defective," and refers in this connection to "a constant tendency for expenditure to outgrow revenue, a system of Government in India favourable to increase of, and unfavourable to, reduction of expenditure, no financial control by intelligent and well-informed public opinion either in India or in England." An insufficient check on expenditure in India, and a remote and imperfect control exercised from England." Sir A. Colvin takes an analogous view and writes in a recent article : "The root of our financial difficulties in India is the insufficient check exercised under the constitution of its Government by the Financial Department.....There is no control on expenditure from outside the Government; no fear of being turned out over an unpopular or extravagant policy."

This is testimony indeed! For when two such ex-Finance-Ministers as Sir A. Colvin and Sir D. Barbour—steeped to the lips in the most inveterate traditions of bureaucratic rule—deem it necessary to come forward and complain with Indian critics that under the constitution, there is practically an absence of effective control on expenditure, surely no more conclusive proof of the mischievous character of existing arrangements could be needed. There are few subjects more important than this of the necessity of constitutional safeguards to control Indian expenditure, but we have already exceeded our limits and we will, therefore, conclude the present survey with the hope that steps will be taken by those who are interested in the proper administration of Indian finance to press this point on the earnest attention of the Royal Commission, sitting at present in London.

THE CHAIRMAN OF THE RECEPTION COMMITTEE'S ADDRESS.

The following address was delivered by RAO Bahadur V. M. Bhide, Chairman of the Reception Committee, on the first day of the sittings of the 11th Indian National Congress :-

Brother Delegates, Ladies & Gentlemen,

On behalf of the Reception Committee and the general public of this Presidency, I offer to you all a most cordial welcome to this ancient and historical city, where we have now met under this roof to inaugurate the sittings of the 11th Session of the Indian National Congress. There is a peculiar propriety in our meeting together here on this occasion. Such of you, as have been privileged to labour in this great national cause for the last 10 years and more, know full well that it was in Poona that our General Secretary first discussed the scheme of the National Congress with his native friends, and it was in this city that its first sitting was to have taken place in December 1885. Untoward circumstances, however, interfered with that arrangement, and at the eleventh hour the meeting had to be transferred to Bombay. After having completed its first cycle of ten years' existence, the Congress now enters upon a fresh cycle of another ten years of useful activity, as a great instrument of political education, welding together all the various races and creeds of India into a great and glorious whole, destined under Providence to take its rank among the foremost nations of the world. The welding process is always a work of time, and implies a long course of heating and hammering, and this process of heating and hammering has to be repeated times out of number before the union is completed. The hammer-

ing is done for us under Providence by great extraneous agencies, represented by the supremacy of a militant civilization and literature, which will allow us no rest and no seclusion from the outside world; but will force us to take our place in the race of material improvement, in which it deservedly occupies the foremost position. Not all the hammering in the world, however, can accomplish the full results of the welding process, unless it is accompanied by a responsive generation of internal heat, without which the outside forces would only splinter us to pieces, as has been unfortunately the case in many other parts of the world, where old civilisations have crumbled down and never learnt to raise their head again. Even in our own days in these last years of the 19th century, we have before us the spectacle of a great Mahomedan power in Europe and a great Mongolian power in Asia unable to retain their places from sheer inability to generate the heat without which the outside influences can never work to any good account. A hundred years ago, the city where we now meet was the centre of a Native confederacy of powers, which held together the whole continent of India from the foot of the Himalayas to Cape Comorin, and from Dwarka in the West to Cuttack in the East, and appeared at one time well able to dispute on equal terms the place of supremacy with the great European power which had established itself in the lower Gangetic valley and on the Coromandal Coast. You all know what change a hundred years have effected. The moral union among even the stronger races that inhabit India was of such a loose and unorganised character that it gave way at all points when the struggle commenced in right earnest. If after a hundred years we had stood in no better position than we did then in regard to these moral forces which tend to union and strength in union, our condition would be hopeless indeed. Fortunately for us our affairs have been entrusted to the safe keeping of a power which has won a world-wide reputation as the mother of

at nations and the liberator of mankind. Brought up under such a discipline, which, while it strikes, strikes gently and tends its helping hand to all who aspire to rise again, we have benefitted by the education that we receive and by the material civilisation which annihilates time and distance, and brings us together to feel a common interest in our own elevation under the vivifying influence of a literature and a history, the like of which the world has not known in the past for its triumphs in the emancipation of mankind. The meetings of this Congress represent the highest triumph of the influences that have been at work for fifty years and more and it is for us to respond to this noble call in a way worthy of the place we occupy in the world's history.

I know there are those among our critics who dispute the truth of this position and proclaim with an air of superior wisdom that India is but a geographical expression and that there is no Indian nation as such, but only a congeries of nations, races and creeds, who have no cohesion in them and are only prevented from throttling each other by the fear of the Pax Britannica which rules over us all. At times indeed we do present in our internal quarrels about trifles a humiliating spectacle which provokes this scorn and ridicule of nations better circumstanced than ourselves. But I feel that with the magnificent spectacle we now see before us, you will agree with me in thinking that these temporary aberrations do not represent our true condition, and that the races and creeds in India have learnt to love and respect each other, and to work together for their common elevation. Here in this gathering we have representatives from the most distant Provinces, Bengal, Assam, Punjab, N. W. Provinces, Rajpootana, Sindh, Gujara-
rath, Maharastra, Carnatic, Telangan, and the Dravid country. Nobody forces us to come together from all these distant places, and nothing but a common spark of heavenly fire could animate so many of the best and noblest of the land to sacrifice time, money and convenience and testify by their presence in these gatherings from year to year that they are determined to forget

all their differences and do all that is in their power to build up the great Indian Nation which has been their aspiration by day and dream by night, and which, if not fulfilled before their eyes, will certainly be accomplished in the near future. All the elements which go to make a common united nation are now present with us; a common political citizenship, a common loyalty to the Queen-Empress, a community of interests, under the influence of which no part can thrive or suffer without the whole sharing in the prosperity or misfortune, and a common language and literature which binds us morally and spiritually together and connects us with the wider world outside. Differences of race and creed there still exist, but they are getting more and more tolerant of each other, less and less angular every day, and it is the function of the National Congress, its chief and most glorious function, to induce in all the electric current of enlightenment which will hasten the union and make it strong to bear the strain which time may place upon it. The watch-ward of the congressmen is Indians first, Hindoos, Mahomedans, Parsees, Christians, Panjabees, Marhattas, Bengalees, and Madrasees afterwards. It is for us by the moderation and business-like character of our deliberations, by our mutual toleration of each others' feelings and prejudices to justify in act and word the hopes and aspirations of those, who, in the not distant future, seek to realise the dream of a united and federated India, resting secure in its loyal dependence on the Great British Nation and able to lead the nations of Asia in the path of progressive advancement in all directions of human activity.

I have said that the welding process is a process of hard hammering and heating. We should not delude ourselves with the thought that things will be made easy for us and that we could enter upon this new inheritance until we are regenerated, and our sins in the past have been washed out in the tears that burn with repentance. Our whole nature has to be purified and elevated by constant

struggles with injustice in ourselves and others. Many people among us do not sufficiently realise how hard this struggle is naturally bound to be. They seem to imagine that we can pass from the old world to the new, pass from the dominion of custom and status to one of individual freedom and responsibility, from a fond clinging to the past to an earnest confidence in the future, from obedience to force to an appreciation of self-imposed law, in fact from a narrow cast-iron type of life to a freer and more liberalised form of existence, without budging an inch or sacrificing anything. The sooner they abandon visions such as these, the better will it be for them and for us all. There will be struggles, our consciences accusing and excusing night and day, castes and creeds in conflict with one another in endless directions. Such struggles are inevitable and people who are put out by the first signs of such differences are not the men from whom we can expect success in such high tasks. The process of fusion always requires and develops a great amount of heat. The heat of controversy is only a form of such struggle for self-improvement. Already the struggle has commenced in earnest, and though it is a most unpleasant experience to those who have to take part in it, we have to reconcile ourselves to its inevitable necessity. Compromises and adjustments are the practical lessons which can only be learnt usefully and become part of our second nature,—habit—when we are earnestly engaged in a war of principle. As the Chairman of the Reception Committee, it is not for me to enter more into the history of our recent experiences in Poona. I can however assure you, brother-delegates, that if the struggle was keener here than elsewhere, it was due to the fact that on both sides there was an earnest desire to make this Congress gathering as great a success as any that preceded it. How far we have succeeded in giving you all a cordial welcome and providing for your comforts and conveniences, is more than I can say at present with confidence. This much is certain that this

gathering of delegates is one of the largest that have hitherto taken place. We see assembled here the representatives of all the races, classes and creeds that inhabit this vast country. They come from all Provinces and I can only hope that our actual success in the arrangements adopted here will not fall far short of what we desire.

The last Congress gave a commission to the Poona Committee to frame a draft constitution which will give some stability to our organization and provide for its permanence. The Committee have accordingly prepared such a draft. I trust it will receive due consideration at the hands of this Congress. The necessity of some written code like this is becoming every day more and more apparent and it is hoped that our labours in this respect will commend themselves to you all.

Our Mahomedan friends in this town have, as in some other places, held aloof, but it is a matter of great satisfaction to us to find that this organised attempt to stand aloof is entirely confined to this city, and that the Mahomedans of other places have more or less cordially co-operated with their Hindoo brethren in this national work. Even our local Mahomedan friends, who have held aloof, have found it necessary to formulate their reasons for so doing. This is a very welcome change, as it makes the question not one of feeling but one of reasonableness, with which argument is possible, and further discussion may lead to a change of conviction. It is urged by our Poona Mahomedan friends that the Congress does not represent adequately all the races of India. This statement is itself a great concession, because the fact of representation is not denied, but the question is narrowed to a consideration of its adequacy. The proportions are not certainly adequate in regard to the population test, but judged by the test of the spread of English education, the adequacy will not seem to be very far from the true numbers. Besides what defect exists in

this respect will be most satisfactorily removed by Mahomedans sending more representatives to the Congress. The second reason assigned is difficult to deal with. Even the bitterest enemies of the Congress do not now venture to question the honesty of the motives which lead so many men from all provinces to cast in their lot with its success. Its wisdom has been questioned. Its practical usefulness might be improved; but there is only one opinion now that it is an honest, spontaneous, native Indian effort to co-operate loyally with the British rulers of the land, by setting forth the non-official view on all the great questions of the day which engage public attention. Great British statesmen have always been anxious to see such an organization spring up in the land. Lord Ripon paved the way for it by his local and municipal reforms. Lord Lansdowne assigned a distinct constitutional function to the Congress. It is not necessary, therefore, to dwell further on this reason which has been assigned by our Mahomedan friends in justification of their position. The third reason has more force in it. But every year the Congress programme of work has shown improvement on its practical side, and the leading Bombay organs have especially noted this feature as a hopeful characteristic of this year's work. The note and the resolutions issued by the Reception Committee will be the best answer to this charge that we can give for the present. The fourth reason assigned is that the Congress is not important enough to deal satisfactorily with the subjects it takes up. This is however a defect for which the responsibility is on other shoulders. It rests with the Government to utilise this vast force of public opinion, and I feel sure a day will come when such a recognition will be cordially extended to it. The rulers in the land have recognized its value by undertaking some of the reforms which it has striven for. They no doubt are waiting to see that it strikes its roots deeper in the soil, and when they recognize it as a part of their deliberative machinery, the Congress will

naturally be enabled to claim the full measure of the importance to which its title at present may to some appear inadequate. The fifth reason assigned is one which, in our opinion, calls for no answer. The Congress meets and deliberates from a faith in the capacity and willingness of Government to do all that it can to promote the material prosperity, and raise the general condition of the people of India. If this were not its faith, it would not meet from year to year. If it meets as it has been doing, it is because it wishes to co-operate with Government in this work. The question is not what Government is doing, but how we respond to the call it makes on us. If Government errs, it errs from ignorance, from want of touch with the people, from differences of language, race and creed, from variations in its stand-point, which cannot be the stand-point of the millions under its rule. It is to supply this want that it becomes the duty of the people to organise themselves and give voice to public opinion. The last argument of an appeal to the Koran is an argument which begs the whole question at issue, and the Mahomedans of other parts have shown by their attendance here that they do not desire to transfer their responsibility for inaction in the matter to their scriptures. These explanations, it is hoped, will satisfy our Musalman friends in Poona that their position is untenable, and will secure more sympathetic action on their part in future.

The large number of delegates that have attended this gathering, the fact that a small city like ours has been able to undertake this national work which has taxed the energies of much larger presidency towns, the earnestness which, notwithstanding our differences, has animated the people of the Deccan to put forth all their energies, the desire on the part of our Mahomedan friends to take their stand on argument and not merely on feeling :- these are elements of hope and satisfaction. The ideas represented by the Congress programme must filter from the higher to the lower strata of society, and the lead

that Poona has taken in this matter justifies the hope that Patna and Lucknow, Benares and Cawnpore, Delhi and Amritsar, Ahamedabad and Karachi, will now come to the relief of the Presidency towns, which alone have till now borne this great annual charge. More satisfactory than all these elements of hope and progress—considered from the stand-point of the success of the present session—is however the choice that we have made this year for the office of the President of the 11th Congress. The Hon'ble Mr. Surendranath Bannerji joins in himself all that is good and enlightened in young and in old India. He is pre-eminently a man of work, working in a profession which is the peculiar privilege of the Brahmin community to which he belongs, and working at it with a zeal and energy that has won for him the foremost place in the heart of what may well be called the hope and blossom of coming years,—the hearts of many thousands of students in all parts of the country. He has been a Congressman ever since its birth and he has laboured for it both day and night, both here and in England, with a success that is borne witness to by the approval of the entire nation. Under such guidance, this year's session is bound to be a conspicuous success.

Ladies and Gentlemen, I am now an old man past three score years and ten—the allotted span of human life. I remember the time when English education first commenced in this city, and I was one of the first recipients of that education. Fifty years have since then passed and during all these years I have tried to be an humble worker in all fields of progressive activity. I feel I have not lived in vain, when I see before me the dream of my younger years realized in being privileged to take part in such an assemblage as this. Ladies and gentlemen, I now request you to proceed with the formal election of your President.

THE SALT DUTY QUESTION.*

Renter's telegram from London under date 12th December ran as follows:—

“ Lord George Hamilton, Secretary of State for India, replying to the Manchester Deputation, which waited on him yesterday, said that the present antagonism of interests was a danger to the unity of the Empire. Indian finance, he said, had slightly improved during the year, and he sincerely hoped it would continue to improve and thus permit remission of the Cotton Duties. He assured the Deputation that their grievance would be first for removal if the finances improved. ”

It is to be regretted that the Secretary of State has committed himself to a view of the question and given a pledge in the matter, which are alike open to the gravest exception. The Cotton Duties are only 5 per cent. duties, reimposed as part of a larger measure and for purely fiscal purposes—to meet a pressing financial emergency—and that too with the approval of Her Majesty's Government—and balanced as they are by a countervailing excise, are absolutely non-protective in their incidence, and free from all objections on the grounds of free trade. They are no new fiscal expedient, having been resorted to more than once before now,

* This paper was written at the end of December last—nearly three weeks before the Government of India introduced into the Supreme Legislative Council—and rushed through it with such indecent haste—its latest legislation in the matter of the Cotton duties, by which a revenue of 50 lakhs a year has been wantonly sacrificed at the bidding of Lancashire, and a most unjustifiable blow dealt to the infant Cotton industry of the country,—imposing, at the same time, in a most cruel and heartless manner, an additional burden on the starving, struggling millions of India.—By the Editor.

in times of financial stress. Such duties, besides, are a most legitimate form of taxation—to which the general sentiment of the country reconciles itself—and falling, moreover, as they do on the richer classes, serve in a measure to rectify the inequalities of our present fiscal system, which tends to throw the main weight of public burdens on the poorer people. And lastly they constitute a fiscal reserve of no mean value in the general financial system of the country.

The question then in connection with these duties is essentially and primarily a financial question—and not a trade question. Of course, such import duties cannot but affect particular trades and industries; but their economic bearings—whatever they are—hold only a subordinate place in the general considerations.

Lord G. Hamilton, however, looks at the matter mainly in its trade aspects—as dissociated from its financial,—and seems to hold that it is highly inexpedient to retain a fiscal measure, which—whatever its justification,—is, nevertheless, by reason of its (supposed or real) adverse effect on the position of a leading British industry, productive of a grave “ antagonism of interests ” between India and Lancashire—so grave indeed as to imperil the unity and harmonious working of the Empire. This is evidently an exaggerated view of the question—magnifying what is but a local matter into an Imperial question of grave moment. It is, moreover, a view which is most earnestly to be deprecated as seeking to subordinate the financial policy of a great Dependency to the convenience of British commerce and British industry. No one would, of course, ever desire that the interests of India should come into such perilous conflict with those of British industry. But from an Imperial point of view, it would certainly be intolerable, if India—with all her obligations to fulfil,—should not be allowed to raise her income in the ways and by the methods she deems best and should have her financial independence placed at the mercy of an English trade organisation—no matter how powerful.

8

The Lancashire vote may be of vital importance to the position of Her Majesty's Government, but to comply with the selfish demands of a particular trade interest and compel the Indian Government to abandon an important and unobjectionable source of income—and that too at a time when it can least afford the sacrifice—would be to sacrifice India to the exigencies of party politics in England and from a constitutional point of view would be a grave injustice, if not a scandal.

As regards the question of remission of these duties—Her Majesty's Government and a powerful section of the Conservative Party are no doubt pledged to an early repeal. But it is satisfactory to observe that the pledge is on the whole a conditional pledge—dependent on the condition and prospects of Indian finance. The more responsible leaders of the party fully recognise the present embarrassing position of our finances and promise to take up the question of remission of the duties only when it is financially safe to do so.

No one will be disposed for a moment to take exception to any such conditional pledges. We do not want these duties for their own sake and as soon as they cease to be financially necessary we should be as happy as the Manchester merchants to see them removed. But any demand for a premature remission of these duties—irrespective of financial considerations—is a demand which we are bound in duty to resist.

Lord G. Hamilton, moreover, goes a step further, and after referring to the recent slight recovery of the rupee and the consequent improvement in the financial position, promises in his reply to the Manchester Deputation "that their grievance would be first for removal if the finances improved"—a pledge which ignores previous pledges. And it is necessary to remind his Lordship that it is not the Manchester Merchant nor the Bombay mill-owner but the poor Indian salt-tax-payer, who has the plighted word of Government that he is to get the benefit of the first improvement.

In 1888, when the salt duties were enhanced, Sir J. Westland, the Finance Minister, speaking on behalf of the Government of India, said: "It is with the greatest reluctance that the Government finds itself obliged to have recourse to the salt duty." Sir J. Gorst, Under-Secretary of State for India, speaking a few days later in the House of Commons, followed with a similar expression of regret. Lord Cross, then Secretary of State of India, in his despatch to the Government of India, dated 12th April 1888, wrote as follows (paras 15-16);—

" I do not...propose to comment at length on any of the measures adopted by your Government, except the general increase in the duty on salt. While I do not dispute the conclusion of your Government that such an increase was, under existing circumstances, unavoidable, I am strongly of opinion that it should be looked upon as temporary and that no effort should be spared to reduce the general duty as speedily as possible to the former rate." (~~The Italics are ours.~~) His Lordship further urged upon the attention of the Government of India the following weighty considerations on the point;—
" I will not dwell on the great regret with which I should at any time regard the imposition of additional burdens on the poorest classes of the population, through the taxation of a necessary of life; but apart from all general considerations of what is in such respects right and equitable, there are as your Excellency is well aware, in the case of the salt duty in India, weighty reasons for keeping it at as low a rate as possible. The policy enunciated by the Government in 1877 was to give to the people throughout India the means of obtaining an unlimited supply of salt at a very cheap rate; it being held that the interests of the people and of the public revenue were identical, and that the proper system was to levy a low duty on an unrestricted consumption. The success of that policy hitherto has been remarkable; while the duty has been greatly reduced, the consumption through this and other causes has largely increased.....The revenue is larger now than it was before the reforms commenced

in 1877, and I see no reason to doubt that the consumption will continue to increase, if it be not checked by the enhancement of the tax." Speaking, again, at a public meeting in England, Lord Cross took occasion to repeat his views that "he was convinced that *the earliest occasion should be taken to abrogate the increase in the salt tax*" (28th February 1889). In the March of the same year, Sir D. Barbour, speaking in the Viceregal Council with special reference to a proposal for the abolition of the income-tax, observed :—"I think it would be an injustice so gross as to amount to a scandal if the Government were to take off the income-tax while retaining the salt duty at its present figure". In 1890 Sir J. Gorst, in his speech on the Indian Budget in the House of Commons (August 14, 1890), remarked ; "*the tax (on salt) was no doubt a tax which ought to be removed and would be removed as soon as it should be financially possible to do so.*" Similarly Lord G. Hamilton himself, in his ¹⁸⁹⁵ recent Indian Budget Statement in the House of Commons (September 4, 1895), emphasized the necessity for reducing the salt duty as early as possible, pointing out that no other tax pressed so "heavily" on the Indian people. His Lordship said :—"The only additional taxation from 1882, which has been imposed upon India, is that in connection with the customs duty of last year. I have looked through the proceeds of the various taxes which have been imposed and *I am bound to say there is only one tax which does seem to press more heavily on the Indian people.* That is the salt tax, which was raised in 1888. The consumption of salt seems to be an unfailing gauge as to the condition of the rayats throughout the country. The increase in the consumption of salt went on up to 1892-3, and then there was a falling off of 4 p. c. In 1894-5 there was a recovery of 2 p. c., and so far

as statistics are available at the present moment, there are symptoms that that recovery is continuous. At the same time I shall watch the salt tax, which seems to have reached the maximum limit, with the view, if possible, of taking an early opportunity of reducing it."

Such a view, so expressed only 3 months ago, regarding the exceptionally oppressive nature of the salt duties as enhanced in 1888, is obviously in direct conflict with his Lordship's present pledge to the Manchester Merchants, as telegraphed to this country. The customs duties, as the Secretary of State frankly admits, do not press so heavily as the enhanced salt duties, and yet—strange logic this!—it is the customs duties that are "first" to go—as soon as the financial condition improves! Are the repeated pledges—Parliamentary and other—of himself and his predecessors in office, to the salt taxpayer to be thus thrown to the winds under the deflecting influences of interested agitation and party pressure—and that too in the face of a sad, indisputable fact—as will be presently shown—that the enhancement of the salt duties is causing a deplorable fall-off in the country's consumption of this prime necessary of life?

When the salt duties were enhanced in the spring of 1888, Sir J. Westland expressed himself as sanguine that the enhancement would have no adverse effect on the consumption of salt. He said, (*vide* Fin. Statement 1888) "considering the improvement in all means of communication and the generally improved condition of the people, we may reasonably hope that the burden of a duty of Rs. 2-8 will not now have any effect in restricting the rate at which the consumption is increasing."

Unfortunately the hope thus expressed by the Finance Minister has not been realised. The figures are :—

Year.	Consumption in thousands of maunds (exclusive of Upper Burma.)	Remarks.
1880-81	27,385	<p>In 1882, the duty was lowered to Rs. 2 all round.</p> <p>Increase during 6 years ('82-7)=6,350 thousands of maunds or 23 p. c., giving an annual average of increase of 3·8 p. c.</p> <p>The duty was enhanced in 1888 to Rs. 2·8 in Continental India from Rs. 2, and to Re. 1 from as. 3 in Burma.</p> <p>Increase during 8 years, (1887-88—'94-95)=415 thousand maunds or ·12 per annum.</p>
1881-82	28,373	
1882-83	29,800	
1883-84	30,678	
1884-85	33,007	
1885-86	31,690	
1886-87	33,735	
1887-88	33,067	
1888-89	31,355	
1889-90	33,048	
1890-91	33,291	
1891-92	34,451	
1892-93	35,051	
1893-94	33,628	
1894-95	34,150	

From the foregoing table, it will be seen that the reduction of the duty in '82 was followed by a large increase in consumption,—during the next 6 years—which rose from 27·385 mill. maunds in '80-1 to 33·735 mill. maunds in '86-7—an increase of 6·350 mill. maunds or about 23 p. c., which gives an annual increase of 3·8 p. c.

If the increase had continued unchecked during the next 8 years since '87-8, in which year the duties were raised, we should have had for '94-5 an increase of over 30 p. c. on the consumption of '86-7 or full 10 mill. maunds—against which, however, we have to be contented—under the restrictive effect of the ill-advised fiscal measure of '88—with an increase of less than half a million (415). The net diminution in the

consumption during these 8 years as compared with the previous 5 comes up to no less than 9.6 mill. maunds. Further, not only have we lost this almost certain increase—which would have accrued under the low duties of '82-7; but the consumption since has not even kept pace with the growth of population during the period. Taking the rate of increase at 1 p. c. per annum, the population must have increased during these 8 years by about 24 millions, for which the consumption ought to have shown a corresponding increase of at least 30 lacs of maunds (at, say, 10 lbs. per head), whereas we have only 4 lakhs. There has thus been not only no increase over the figures for '82-7, but a positive diminution in the country's total consumption of salt to the extent of 26 lacs of maunds as a direct result of the enhancement of the duties in 1888. The consumption continues all but stationary—concurrently with a normal growth of population. The rate of consumption thus compares for the different periods:—

Year.	Population in millions.	Consumption in thousands of maunds.	Consumption per head in lbs.
1880-81	253.7	27,385	8.8
1886-87	266.5	33,735	10.3
1894-95	294.1	34,150	9.5

During the Administration of Lord Lawrence, very careful inquiries were made into the general consumption of salt throughout India, and it was ascertained (*vide* Report of East India Finance Committee, Vol. 1 page 148, Sir C. Beadon's evidence) that on an average the consumption was 12lbs. per head. What a fall off is here for '94-5 from the ascertained level of the sixties—the consumption having gone down to 9.5 lbs. per head! Mr. Pedder, one of the ablest officers of the Bombay Government, stated in a special report on the

subject, (1871) para 103—"I have formed the conclusion that 14 lbs. is the probable actual consumption in the Bombay Presidency." For '93-4 we have only 11.66 lbs. per head consumption in this Presidency.

Such a diminution in the consumption of salt has, besides, a meaning and a mournful reality which ought not to be mistaken. It is upon the poorer classes that the pressure almost exclusively falls—for it is they—and not the richer classes—who eat less salt when it is dear and heavily taxed. It is the starving pauper—the half-starved labourer—the struggling farmer,—and not the richer Zemindar or Bunia,—who is forced to stint his daily supply when the price is high.

--- Taking the fall-off in the consumption during these 8 years at 26 lacs, as estimated before, and assuming that we have 40 millions as the half-starved section of the population ("going through life on insufficient food.") and 40 millions more who find it a hard struggle to earn bread enough—we may take it that it is these millions of our hard-pressed poor—and not the rest of the population—who are compelled to reduce their annual consumption by so much as 26 lacs of maunds—which means that they now eat from two to three lbs. less salt *per capita* than they used to do 8 years ago.

The hardship—the cruel hardship—thus inflicted upon the poorest of the poor—and for no other object than that of obtaining additional revenue—who have to be content with 6 to 7 lbs. only of salt per year—may be better imagined than described; and a fiscal system which renders it necessary to so bleed the starving poor—no matter how great the necessities of policy—is open to grave condemnation. No canon of finance—no principle of political economy—could ever sanction such a merciless application of the fiscal lancet; and no necessity, however imperative—and no financial emergency, however pressing,—could be pleaded in justification of such cynical indifference to the sufferings of the poor.

But our financial administration knows no such weaknesses of common humanity and shows little sympathy with

struggling poverty. The salt laws, which safeguard the State monopoly, and protect the fiscal interests of the State in this respect are severe beyond measure and are, besides, so stringently worked as to necessitate 18000 and more criminal prosecutions for offences under their provisions every year. The terrors of the criminal law thus enforce the demands of the State and the revenue comes into the Treasury with charming ease!

This brings us to the revenue side of the salt question. The figures of salt revenue for the past 15 years are as under :—

Year.	Revenue in crores.	Remarks.
1881-82	7.375	} Sacrifice of revenue consequent on reduction of duty— 1.198 crores.
1882-83	6.177	
1883-84	6.145	
1884-85	6.507	
1885-86	6.345	} Increase of revenue on expanding consumption—48 lakhs.
1886-87	6.657	
1887-88	6.970	
1888-89	7.675	
1889-90	8.187	} Increase of revenue due to enhancement of duty=
1890-91	8.523	
1891-92	8.636	} crores 6.657 in 1886-87 " 8.694 in 1895-96
1892-93	8.656	
1893-94	8.228	} Increase 2.037 crores.
1894-95	8.645	
1895-96	8.694	
(Budget)		

When the duty was lowered in 1882 under the Ripon administration, the revenue sacrificed was 1.198 crores. During the next 4 years, the consumption extended under the lower duty, and with it the revenue rose by full 48 lakhs.

If the consumption had continued to expand as before and risen during the next 8 years by 10 mill. maunds, there

would have accrued to the State at the old rate of duty an increase of revenue to the extent of full 2 crores of rupees—almost *equal* to the amount of additional revenue which has been actually obtained under the enhanced duties. But this was not to be. The duties were raised in spite of the unanimous protests of the Indian people, and the additional revenue has been secured, but with this difference that the country's consumption has been brought down in the fiscal process by so much as 26 lakhs of maunds per annum,—let alone the certain increase of 10 mill. maunds which would have accrued during the period under the lower duties !

And let us next inquire how the additional revenue of 2 crores—so squeezed out from our struggling poor—under the enhanced duties is spent. Nearly $1\frac{1}{2}$ crores are required to pay exchange compensation to the European Services and 40 lakhs more for increased "political" expenditure beyond the frontier. The number of Europeans serving in India on 31st March 1890, drawing Rs. 1000 and more as pay and allowances per annum, was (*vide* Parl. Return dated 24th April 1891), 13,178, receiving Rs. 8,77,14,431 as an aggregate amount of salaries per year. It is these 13,000 and more European officers, already in receipt of an annual income of about Rs. 6,700 on an average, who get this exchange compensation to the amount of $1\frac{1}{2}$ crores (Rs. 1,45,65,000)—and that too at the cost of 80 millions of our starving poor going though they toil and moil from morn to eve, without bread enough ! Such is our fiscal ethics ! And thus do the hardships of the highly paid European officers of the Crown in India—in the matter of their remittances home owing to fall in exchange—weigh in the bureaucratic balance, as against the sufferings of the silent struggling millions of the land ! The remaining 50 lakhs of the additional salt revenue are expended on increased subsidies to the Amir and other tribal Chiefs and tribal levies, whose good-will so bought is, in the estimation of Government, of greater value to the strength of the Empire

than the well-being of 80 millions and more of our poor salt-tax-payers!

This whole question—as regards the enhanced salt-duties and their effect on the country's consumption, as also the additional revenue so obtained and the way in which it is so wantonly squandered away, is with us emphatically the poor man's question—with a mournful ethical aspect. For the salt duty is admittedly (in the weighty words of the Herschell Indian Currency Committee, Report para 36) "in the nature of a poll-tax, which falls on all classes but presses most heavily on the very poor."

Can it be right—or humane—or even financially expedient—to so bleed the bleeding poor—and that too, not to provide against any imminent national danger or meet any fiscal disaster—but to pay the European Services a kind of compensation to which they have not a tittle of right, and to subsidize the tribes and tribal chiefs of the wild border land whose allegiance so sought is after all of doubtful value? This is the crux of the question. The fall-off in the consumption of the poorer classes to so considerable an extent is a fact of sad significance and is an unfailing indication of their deepening destitution and as such deserves the most earnest attention of Government.

The financial position at the present moment is showing gratifying signs of improvement—the rupee is slowly recovering and so far the frontier horizon is clear. And if these favourable circumstances continue, the revised estimates for the current year will probably close with a substantial surplus—not a mere balancing entry. And next year, if Government only resists the temptation to send out "punitive" expeditions or scientific exploration parties or political missions to distant regions across the border, it would have an ample margin of surplus on its hands.

wherewith to grant to these poorer classes the fiscal relief they so sorely need in the matter of the salt duties.

Should, however, such improvement in our financial position as present indications lead us to expect fail us, there is ample room, we submit, for economies in the administrative expenditure of the State; and Government could without difficulty—if it only had the will—find the requisite means to reduce the salt duty to its old level of the Ripon period, and relieve the hardships of the poor in respect of a prime necessary of life, which is also their only luxury.

During recent years, much of our military expenditure has been more or less of an exceptional character. The exceptional exigencies of the military situation, which rendered it necessary, no longer exist. Besides, the late Pamir agreement with Russia and the Durand treaty with the Amir of Kabul, with the various delimitations of frontier lines across debatable regions, serve in large measure to assure peace on the frontier and minimise chances of collision beyond; while the completion of special defence works, the vast extensions of Railway lines—largely improving communications with the frontier—the formation of a strong reserve to the Native Army, the organization of Imperial Service troops in Native States and a considerable increase in the Volunteer Corps—these are all important accessions of strength to our military resources.

With the defences of the country so strengthened during the past 12 years, Government might reasonably be asked to consider whether the increases to the armies of the country (30,000 troops nearly), carried out in 1885-6-7, are any longer required. And if it be conceded that these additional troops are now clearly in excess of the military wants of the country, we might urge they may be abolished and the armies reduced to their old strength at the earliest opportunity. Some such measure would effect a large saving in our

Military estimates and place at the disposal of Government more than ample means for the fiscal reforms which we all so anxiously desire.

Whether, however, the anticipation of a considerable improvement in the financial condition of the country is realised, or failing such improvement, it be found possible to enforce economies of the sort we suggest, all that we wish is that Government may see its way—at the first and earliest opportunity it finds itself in a position so to do—to allow the benefit of the first improvement in the financial prospects to the poor salt-tax-payers of the country and in fulfilment of its solemn Parliamentary pledges grant relief to them—*before* any such relief is given to the cotton trade of Manchester—in the matter of these enhanced salt duties, which are having such a deplorable effect in restricting their consumption of a prime necessary of life, which as Professor Fawcett justly urges ought to be “as free as the air we breathe and the water we drink.”

* STRAY THOUGHTS ABOUT THE DEVELOPMENT
THEORY AS APPLICABLE TO THE ORIGIN
AND PROGRESS OF SCIENCE AND
RELIGION.

There are good grounds for the belief that Science and Religion had both a beginning and have been progressive ever since. I have endeavoured in the following pages to set those down that have been convincing to my mind, for I am fully conscious of want of such ability in me as is required to convince others especially the orthodox. The subject of Religion being uppermost in my mind, I set about to inquire into the same under three distinct heads :

- I. How man came on Earth.
- II. How he found God and
- III. How Religion or Religious knowledge came to him.

Man consists of two distinct elements blended together : the Brutal and the truly Human. By the teachings of Geology and other kindred sciences, we are able to ascertain how he acquired the *first* and by means of instruction received from the ancient Vedic literature and the teaching of all Religious teachers we are enabled to trace the origin and gradual development of the *second* by which the brutal nature that prevailed in man in the beginning has come to be subdued and the truly human element has been striving to become uppermost in the end. Before proceeding further I beg to submit some considerations as to why I believe the Vedic texts as the most ancient record of human thought. By means of written and printed papers, books, periodicals and by telegraphic and telephonic messages, man of the present day is able to make his thoughts known throughout the world and in such a short

* This paper has been kindly contributed to the Journal by Dr. Atmaram Pandurang of Bombay.

time too as would not have been believed by any one about less than half a century ago. Before *this* printing, writing and speaking were the means at man's command of communicating his thoughts to other men and writing and speaking were the only resources he possessed before the art of printing was invented by him at about the end of the 15th century : when manuscripts of works of great authors had to be preserved with care and their copies made and kept by their admirers at a great sacrifice both of time and money. History informs us that the alphabet or some sort of symbols had to be invented before *writing* in hieroglyphic and other characters, engraved in wood or stone or written on the bark of trees or leaves of plants and this before man had acquired the knowledge of preparing out of vegetable products the present writing material the paper, came into use. Going backward further still, that is to say, before the discovery of any sort of symbols which helped him in inventing the art of writing, speech was the only medium of communication between man and man and such is the case even at the present time amongst men who have not learnt the art of writing. Thoughts and deeds of great men of their time could be preserved therefore only by means of stories or folklores being communicated from sire to son or the teacher to the taught by speech alone ; the sire &c. repeating so as to enable the son &c. to commit them to *memory*. श्रुति *shruti* the faculty of *hearing* and स्मृति that of *memory* were the means then by which alone was it possible to preserve things and deeds of the remotest ancestors of men, before *speech* could be put in *writing*. And hence is it that the Vedic texts so preserved may claim to be considered as the most ancient record of human thought we possess. The same may be said also about some legendary stories of remotest antiquity that may be found amongst men.

By the aid of sciences like Geology, Embryology &c., and by the study of the Vedic texts read in the light of these sciences, I believe, we would be enabled to go as far back as

is possible for us to do, for the purpose of investigating the subject of this paper under the three heads mentioned above. I am conscious of my weakness to treat so great a subject but if by my writing really competent persons should be induced to take it up, it would afford me a great satisfaction that I have not written in vain.

1. How man came on earth? This has been so well treated of by men like Darwin and others that I need simply to briefly run over the ground traversed by them. Our earth, there is every reason to believe, was at one time one molten mass of matter devoid of any living thing on its face. Germs of organic matter, however, began to appear and to develop into vegetable and animal life as the Earth cooled. Germ matter, to all appearance similar, but owing to differences in the surroundings and environments assumed different forms of plants and animals and these, owing to similar causes, *viz.* differences in their environments caused by the cooling process continuing and thereby producing changes on the earth's surface and its surrounding atmosphere, developed into other forms different from their original. By successive and gradual changes produced in this manner, the original simple structure developed into the most complicated and diversified forms of life seen at present. In the lowermost of the earth's strata, we meet with very simple forms of structure which give place to more complicated and diversified forms as we approach nearer the surface, on which are seen the existing forms of both animals and vegetables. The present forms of life have been, therefore, developed out of those that preceded them. If tailless primates have been evolved out of those bearing tails, and mammalian animals from such as carry their young ones in pouches and these again from those who had no such appendages, and so on, till we are carried back to the very beginning when simple structural life only existed; then there ought to be no difficulty about believing that man himself must have been evolved out of some higher form of

mammalian animal that has become extinct since, as we know for certain, for instance, that the elephant of the present time is a distinct beast from the forms from which he is developed, which bore more trunks than one or none at all. But this ancestral form of the present elephant is now extinct. In short, man has been produced from the same dust as other animals, as he goes to dust like them when he dies. Like them too, he is evolved out of an impregnated ovule, scarcely visible to the naked or unaided eye, after undergoing various changes in the course of its development, into the perfect being. Is it less wonderful, because we are daily familiar with the occurrence, that an impregnated germinal spot within the human womb, after undergoing various changes, assumes in the course of about 280 days a perfect human form, than that simple germinal matter after assuming various shapes, since this molten matter of our Earth began to cool, became developed, in the womb of time, into so many extinct and existing forms of life and some of these into man! And as none of the animals in their present or previous forms, have been sent down on Earth from another world, it would be preposterous to believe, with the knowledge of Geology Embryology and other kindred sciences we possess, that man alone came on Earth ready made as it were from elsewhere. The question then how man came on Earth must be considered as settled. He is not sent here as such from another world but is the product of the law of development existing in creation, *viz.*, that beings *lower* in the scale have been the progenitors of those that stand *higher*.

From some recent geological discoveries, it is calculated that man has been living on earth for more than 200,000 years. This may or may not be exactly true. At any rate, it is quite certain that man has been more than 7,000 years on earth and in the very remote antiquity about man's existence on earth Hindus' idea agrees. Hindus also believe that

after passing through some 84,00,000 (84 lacs) yonis which may mean many or countless forms of animal life, the noble human form is attained. There is therefore no conflict between science and religious belief of Hindus as regards the antiquity and appearance of man on earth, in accordance with the development theory; as there is between science and religious belief among other nations. Hindus believe, however, that man was perfect in the Satya Yuga, in the former age; and that he has become deteriorated or degenerated since, in the present age, the Kaliyuga, and I believe there is some truth in this belief of theirs also, for there is no doubt Hindus of the present age are much inferior to their ancestors of the age of Vedic literature, the Upanishads, of Budha, of Bhagwat-Gitā and of the age of Mahābhārata and Rāmāyana. From the earliest texts of the ऋग्वेद (Rig-veda) read in the light of the sciences and discoveries of the present day, abundant evidence is found that the progenitors of those great ancestors must have been men in a very primitive state indeed. This may seem somewhat of a digression in the investigation of the subject "How man came on earth" yet it may not be altogether irrelevant.

2. How man found God?

If he was not sent here from another world but is like other animals a product of the earth and evolved out of some species of mammiferous animals, then he must have been at the very beginning a mere brute, and like these animals must have dwelt in the hollows of trees and rocks and lived on fruit and flesh he could lay his hand upon. He had to depend entirely upon the bare strength of his arms and the agility and swiftness in his limbs or in other words upon the working of his own unaided organism, for the purpose of procuring food and for offensive and defensive warfare, killing others for food or protecting self from being attacked and killed. It was in the struggle for existence that, when he began to get help from agents external to his self, -his own person-, the difference between him

and his fellow-beings the other animals commenced which has ultimately produced such a chasm between him and them that he now finds it hard to believe he ever was akin to them and evolved out of them or in other words to trace his ancestry to any other animal lower than man. He invoked help from material objects at first and from immaterial agents afterwards. The objects whose help he sought were undoubtedly *stones* which he could pick up and use by throwing them for self defence at those who came to attack or kill him or for the purpose of killing others for food. At first he used them indiscriminately perhaps and threw them by his hands and unaided arms ; then he commenced to search for such stones as he had found by experience to serve his purpose better on account of their hardness, shape &c., and to fling them by the aid of a string or a bow. This led him to make search for other objects or in other words to make observation and research. From the use of stones and stone instruments and utensils he gradually proceeded to the use of bronze, and iron and from iron to the use of steam and electricity. The periods in which such advances were made have been styled the *stone age*, the *bronze age*, the *iron age* and the present, the age of *steam* and *electricity*. The chasm between him and the lower animals thus became wider with the succession of periods or ages mentioned above. He has now become the lord of creation, for none of the lower animals can now cope with him. Though at a period of time long gone by, they were his equals and able to struggle with him for the supremacy he has since attained. He has now no formidable enemy in the lower animals : the big elephant he uses as a beast of burden, and the lion, the tiger, the chimpanzee &c., amongst the most formidable and ferocious of beasts, he keeps for the purpose of show or for mere pleasure he goes about shooting them. Man's formidable enemy is no other now than man himself. But yet some minute microscopic creatures can bring him to death and his present efforts are directed at finding which amongst these are friendly and which are his deadly enemies.

The use of material objects alone, however, did not produce the existing difference between man and the lower animals. Invoking the aid of immaterial agents and of such material objects as he could not lay his hand upon, has contributed even more towards this end. If man's beginning and subsequent career have been as they are sketched out here, then in the earliest texts of the ऋग्वेद (Rigveda) ample material must be found, by which it can be shown that when procuring material objects for his use to aid him in the struggle for existence, he began to invoke help from immaterial agents or from material objects he could neither grasp nor handle. Evolved from brute, his career as man commenced when he began to communicate his thoughts to his fellowmen by means of speech or articulate sounds, which must have been but few and simple at first. In his simplicity of mind he must have been quite incapable of knowing that there was any relation between darkness and light, or in other words that the one was the absence of the other. On the contrary he looked upon darkness and light as two distinct objects just like a child that tries to catch shadows evidently believing them to be distinct objects. It must be quite natural therefore, in the very dawn of the intellects, for man to believe that the dawn or the light he saw at the break of day and before the rising of the sun, was some distinct object from the darkness which the dawn followed, and from the sun that followed the dawn and to believe also that the dawn and the sun came out of the womb of darkness that enveloped the heaven and the Earth before their appearance. In the ऋग्वेद (Rigveda) the dawn is called उषा (usha), the sun मित्र (Mitra), the heaven and the Earth together द्यावापृथिव्यौ (Dyavapृthivyau). Usha and Mitra being born of their mother darkness were sister and brother and as there was then no law prohibiting a man running after a woman, even when the two had been born of the same womb, Mitra is described as running after his sister Usha : and as darkness disappeared, as the sun came up high, he is stated in the same Veda to kill his mother,

which shows also that killing one's mother was not then considered a crime. To the man of the period with childlike simplicity of mind it appeared also as therein stated that the *Heaven* and the *Earth* lived together like man and wife before they were separated by the morning twilight, and as by the dropping of rains the heaven made the earth fruitful, the *Heaven* was believed to be the father and the *Earth* the mother of every thing she produced. The Rigveda in which these statements appear is, I consider, not simple poetry but poetry founded on the beliefs handed down from the remotest antiquity to the authors of the Veda.

Man at first lived evidently on fruit and raw flesh. And when roaming about in search of food he must have come at times across forests in conflagration and had then to run for life from it. When the fire disappeared however and when he found himself safe amidst a destruction of life he may have met with a plenty of *roasted* meat to satiate his hunger and found comfort from warmth the fire gave him in cold chilly weather. And thus in first conflagrations, awfully fearful and destructive as they were, he must have found in this way some-thing that was both useful and agreeable. It gave him cooked meat and warmth in a cold inclement weather and thus it may have led him to find out *how* fire appeared and how it went out. In noticing that forest fires were produced by friction he tried to imitate the process by rubbing hard one piece of wood against another and when thereby he succeeded in producing fire, he must have become very naturally overjoyed at his production of fire by friction and this must have been a very grand and very useful discovery to him. And he found it was much more easy to preserve fire by feeding it constantly with fuel &c. and so to keep it constantly burning than when it vanished to have recourse to the process he had discovered of producing it : a process so very hard and tiresome. Therefore instead of allowing it to vanish he began to preserve

the fire he had found so very useful to him for the purpose at first of cooking food and keeping him warm and comfortable in cold weather. To preserve the fire became a necessity to him. Hitherto and before this grand discovery he must have been leading more or less a desultory or scattered life like other animals, but now he began to collect together into a sort of family gathering round a blazing fire : when some had to go about in search of food for all, and others had to remain behind to keep the fire burning. Fire thus became a strong necessary inducement for man to live in social gatherings or circles who had before lived in a scattered life like other animals in the hollows of trees and rocks. But now he began to build, for, himself and his family circle, simple arbours or bowers at first, then cottages, houses and great palaces afterwards ; to search for metals from earths and construct arrows and other weapons and utensils both useful and destructive. When man knew the one simple method of producing fire by friction, how important and necessary was it to him to preserve fire, men of the present day can form no idea perhaps. But we may be able to form some conception of it if we could but imagine what state we would be in, if all fire accessible to us was extinguished and we were in complete ignorance of all the methods we at present know of reproducing it. We would then be able to conceive why was it that our ancestors of the Vedic or pre-vedic period, attached such great importance to the original method of producing fire by friction effected between two logs of wood and of preserving it by feeding it constantly with fuel &c. The man of the time had a hard work to do and to utter perhaps certain sounds to help the bodily exertion required to produce the necessary amount of friction with success. These sounds may have been converted into speech invoking fire to come out of its hidden place in the heart of the wood itself and be visible. In the course of time perhaps he began to believe certain words were more efficacious and these in order to prevent any

mistake being made in their utterance he had to preserve by reducing them to the form of *hymns*. Such may likely have been the origin of the Vedic texts used in the method adopted for producing fire by friction. Man of the present day may well afford to ridicule the simplicity of these Vedic hymns forgetting of course the child-like simplicity of the mind of the man of the period. Those who could repeat the texts without mistakes and were engaged in preserving fire, acquired an importance and in course of time became priests, while those, who fought and protected the family or the clan, became warriors the *Kshatriyas*, and the most powerful became the head or the king.

It may have been quite natural for Man to believe in the dawn of his intellectual faculty, when the head of the family died, who when living had protected them, that that element of his body, by means of which, he used to speak and command the services of those he protected, went up to the starry firmament, the heaven—the father—and resided therein as a bright object, leaving the body, his earthly element, to the mother Earth. Invoking or calling for help of the departed *spirit* in heaven may have been quite a natural act of man; also the placing of the food in some corner of his abode in the belief that the spirit of the departed would return and eat the food so placed or the spirit or essence of it. Ancestor worship in the way of *पितृभक्त* thus became an institution from time immemorial and is observed to this day throughout the length and breadth of Hindustan. It is begun on the death of one's near relations and is *महाळ* or *महालय* the great feast that is given to all deceased ancestors in the latter half of the month of *भाद्रपद* (Bhadrapad) in about September each year. Somewhat similar ceremony in or about the same time each year is also observed by the Parsees the Zoroastrians in India evidently showing that they had a common ancestry with the Hindus.

Some of the brightest stars in heaven, believed by the early man as the bodies of his departed relatives, he must have found very useful in guiding his path in hours of darkness. By their means and by the fire kept blazing by his people he could reach his destination when overtaken by the darkness of night after a hard day's work in search of food or it may be perhaps after an engagement with the enemies carried on for the protection of his people. On finding stars so useful he may have begun to make observation of their movements connecting the same with occurrences in his life &c. He so laid the foundation of Astronomy and Astrology of our day.

Let me go over the ground in consideration of the problem. How man found God? The great task imposed upon the whole animal creation is as regards *how to live*, that is to say, how to procure food for the nourishment of the body and how to protect it from coming to harm. In the struggle for existence all the lower animals as well as man in the very beginning of his career had to depend entirely upon the working of their own organisms, without any extraneous or foreign help. It was, however, since man began to procure aid from objects external or foreign to his body or person that difference between him and other animals commenced and this difference widened in accordance with the progress he made in his acquaintance with his environment, the nature that surround him. While his fellow beings, the other animals, remained in complete ignorance, man has been busily engaged in acquiring knowledge and use of objects, and in being acquainted with the phenomena in nature. To procure food and secure protection, he first commenced to pick up and throw stones, then to make search for other objects and with the help of fire he succeeded in procuring and preserving, to construct instrument and utensils for his use; and instead of living scattered to gather together into hordes and to wander from place to place with the cattle he reared, then to construct and live in cottages and houses clustered into villages or cities and towns, and to

cultivate land and to hand down his knowledge and experience to succeeding generations by collecting both into systems called sciences. These were necessarily few and simple at first but they went on, by the collective wisdom of such succeeding generations, increasing in number and intricacies of the present time and promise to go on increasing still more in future. Man did not however confine himself to resorting for help to objects in nature he could handle and thereby to laying the foundation of what are called the natural and physical sciences but at the same time he was busily observing natural phenomena and carefully noticing objects he could see but was unable to handle or wield. Childlike he took note of shadows, of darkness, of the dawn, of the starry firmament, of clouds with thunder and lightning, of storms, of the sun, the moon and of the earth, of rains, of fire &c. &c. and believed them as so many distinct beings on whom he depended for life and comfort and named them as it is found in the ऋग्वेद (Rigveda), उषा (Usha) the dawn, इंद्र (Indra) clouds with thunder and lightning, वरुन् (Marut) storm winds, वरुण (Varuna) the starry firmament, द्यावापृथिव्यौ (Dyawaprethivyo) the heaven and earth, पर्जन्य (parjanya) the rain, अग्नि (agni) the fire. द्यौषितर (dewpetar or Jupiter) the father in heaven &c. &c. He noticed as he advanced in knowledge that breathing was of highest importance and so breath he called प्राण (prana) life, and speech was to him equal in importance to truth. When reading and writing were unknown it is quite natural for Man to attach so much importance to speech as it is found in the ऋग्वेद (rigveda). By speech he was able to produce fire for the purpose of making sacrifices, invoking the aid of the several objects mentioned above to procure food and secure protection from his enemies. As he advanced in knowledge he found as stated in the Upanishadas that all the divinities to whom sacrifices were offered were under the influence of some power unseen. It was for instance in the seed but could not be seen. This unseen power in the seed made the seed grow into the tree and similarly it was the unseen that

made the sun, the moon and stars move in their own assigned paths, and the fire consume what was presented to it : it conducted breathing, made the eye to see, the ear to hear, mind to think and tongue to speak &c. &c. Man thus found the unseen in breathing, in speech, in fire, in the sun, the moon and the stars, in thunderclouds, in rain, in the earth and in short present every where in nature outside, as well as within the body. The Upanishadas are full of description of the great unseen which is in perfect harmony with the teachings of modern sciences. I here quote from Professor Max Muller's translation of the Brihadaranyaka Upanishada adhyaya 3 Brahman 11th the following:—"That Brahman O Gargi " said Yádnyavalkya to her " is unseen but seeing, unheard but hearing, unperceived but perceiving, unknown but knowing. There is nothing that sees but it, nothing that hears but it, nothing that perceives but it, nothing that knows but it," for the behoof of our modern scientists and others who do not believe in God (the God) (it may be however) as described in the Jewish scriptures. But in the ऋ discovered by the Rishis is to be found the real living God of the Universe, we have thus seen how the unseen ऋ (Brahman) the true God was discovered by man. But there is another aspect of God also. He is personal God. The idea of personal god may be explained in this manner : Man began to invoke when in trouble perhaps the help of his deceased ancestor who, when he died, left his body to the mother earth, yet his spirit was believed to be living with heaven, the father and when his deceased ancestors were numerically increased he had to come to the conclusion that amongst the ancestors of all deceased ancestors there ought to be *one* who could have no father but that he must be the father of all, the first man ऋषिदेव, the most ancient man वृषभदेव ; the procreator वृषभदेव, the father in heaven ऋषिदेव (Davpitar). His help was asked, food and other offerings made to him in other words he was worshipped. Anthropomorphic form of worship--anthropomorphism--thus commenced. And so it was

really man who made God after his form instead of God making "man after his image" आदि or पुराण पुरुष or प्रजापति or चाण्डिकर is never mentioned in the Hindu religious books as the God of Aryans or of any particular nation on Earth ; as the God in the Jewish scriptures is he who spoke with Moses and other prophets as God of Abraham, God of Israel and God of Joseph and who was therefore the God of the Jewish people, Johova, a tribal God only such a God could not be God of all nations or God of the Universe as the one named in the religious books of the Hindus is. I have thus endeavoured to show how God was found by man the God in the Universe the personal God and the tribal God of some people also. And now *

III. How religion or the religious idea came to man : In other words was religion ever revealed to man by God himself or has man acquired religion or religious knowledge without any direct revelation from God but by man's own unaided effort as he advanced from the child-like simplicity of mind in which he must have been at first if all that has been stated previously about him be true. God must be a personal God a tribal God for man to receive any direct communicating from him as found in expressions such as I am thy God and " God said ", " God spoke to Moses, " " the God of Abrahams " "the God of Issac and the God of Joseph " met in the Jewish scriptures, the existence of such a God depends entirely on the testimony of men with whom he is stated to have communicated. But who saw God when he spoke to Moses and gave him the ten commandments. All that the people saw and heard at the time was darkness followed by a flash of lights and thunderbolts. Was there absolutely no possibility whatsoever about Moses being deceived excusably perhaps that God declared the law to him which he brought down in the manner stated in the scriptures? Did law-givers in other countries get laws thus direct from God? If others did not, why

should we believe. Moses to get his directly from God? Was there besides no law before writing was invented? We have therefore no scientific proof about the existence of such a personal God as is described in the Jewish scriptures and hence there is a conflict between science and religion as it is based on the Jewish scriptures. There is no evidence that will stand any scientific test that religion was declared to man directly by God himself. On the contrary, there is ample evidence for believing that progress in religion, as in every thing else, was made by man as he advanced in enlightenment from the ignorance of childhood in which he was at first brought up. The objects of his reverence, therefore, were the great phenomena of nature—*bright* thunder-clouds, heaven and earth, rain, storms, stars which he believed to be the abodes of his deceased ancestors, the fire he found so useful to him, the sun that gave him warmth, formed clouds that sent him rain, making the earth fruitful thereby, and in fact such objects as we find in the Rigveda. To them sacrifices were offered, and their aid invoked. The Vedic texts pronounced, on the occasion of producing fire and making sacrifices, may seem to be very absurd now, but they should be understood as the outcome of the crude or immature state of 'mind of men at the time.' Fire being so useful was required to be preserved for bare necessity and for sacrificial purposes his offerings were consumed and disappeared in fire; it was easy for him to believe that the same were really carried off by fire to those objects of reverence whom he wished to propitiate such as his deceased ancestors, his sun God, his rain God, his storm God &c. &c. Temples and altars were therefore built to preserve and worship fire and no religious ceremony in any country is ever performed by man even to the present day without fire in some form or other being present at the time. Men's objects of reverence and worship changed as they advanced in knowledge we have seen how man came into the world and how by observation of nature and the influence of his environment he advanced in the knowledge of sciences.

and how he acquired reverence for objects that were useful to him in giving him his daily bread, in other words, for the knowledge and belief of all and every thing that enabled him "how to live" and in this is comprehended, in the wider sense, his knowledge of science and religion. God did not reveal himself to man nor did he reveal to him the knowledge of science nor of religion he is in possession of. Was man less in need of science than of religion? Certainly not; for he needs them both. Now as none of the *scriptures*, believed to be revelation direct from God, can claim so great an antiquity as this ऋग्वेद (Rigveda) because they came into existence after man had acquired knowledge of writing. The Jewish scriptures were written and were so handed down to all succeeding generations. Moses brought His "Ten commandments" from mount Sinai written on stone. The most ancient of the religious books of the Chinese "the Kings" were I believe written books. But the Vedic text alone which had to be handed down from mouth to mouth and from sire to son, was not written at first and for many centuries after.

In the Vedic hymns and literature therefore read with the knowledge that the mind of man had to advance, from the childlike simplicity, it was in, at first, to the maturity of intellects it gradually attained ample evidence may be found that *pari passu* with the development of mind, how man by observation of nature and natural phenomena outside as well as within "his self," gradually acquired knowledge of what constitutes *religion*. And what does religion teach? It teaches or ought to teach what relation the *mind* of man अत्मा (atma) bears to the Universe and to the *great mind* परमात्मा (Paramatma) of the Universe. Man has and is still acquiring knowledge, of what is comprehended in the word science not by any direct revelation from God. It was not necessary for man that God should reveal to him, for instance, that the earth is not a plane, as it seems, but is globular and the surface, he walks on, is a

part of a globe ; that the sun and stars, though they appear to move round the earth, do not do so, but it is the earth that really rotates on its axis ; that water which appears as an element is made up of two substances which are both gaseous : that when a body burns, it is not reduced but is increased in weight and not a particle is lost, that arteries are not empty tubes filled with air but they contain and carry on the circulation of blood ; that heat, electricity, magnetism, chemical action, motion, or mechanical power are all convertible into one another. All these and a thousand other facts in science have been discovered by men like Copernicus, Gallileo, Harvey, Faraday and others, men more gifted, no doubt, than others of their time with such faculties of observation, reflection and making deduction from them, as enabled them to effect grand discoveries in the domain of science. If the discoveries in science have been the work of men, high in their intellectual powers, of past as well as of our own time and without introduction of any direct revelation from God ; why was there such revelation necessary to obtain knowledge about religious truths ? And what proofs they, who believe that the latter were obtained by a direct revelation from God, can give which will satisfy men of science ? None, whatever, like scientific truths, there is abundant evidence to believe that truths in religion have in like manner been obtained also by men singularly eminent in spiritual faculties. Lots of people had seen an apple fall but it was given to Newton alone to draw from that fact a law pervading matter throughout the universe and so was it given to the Rishis in the Upanishadas to draw from observations made by their predecessors as well as by themselves regarding nature and natural phenomena around and within them that there is One Unseen that rules the sun, the moon and stars in their regular paths. He forms rain clouds and thunderbolts, sends down rains and makes the earth fruitful. He exists in fire, in breath, in speech, in the organs of sight and hearing, in the heart, in the air, in short there is no place where He is not and they

called this unseen ब्रह्म (Brahma) the one without a second. Like the Rishis other great men in this and in other lands have risen and taught from time to time Man's relation to the Great one, the unseen. But in order to impress their teaching upon their fellowmen in most cases they or their followers have made the people believe they had received their teaching direct from God, the father in heaven which owing to their simplicity of mind the people believed to be true.

Man did not come on Earth, as we have seen, in a state of perfection, for if he had, he would have then had to work like a mere machine only doing this and avoiding that without choice or freedom of action on his part. He would then have remained the same, without alteration from first to last. It is owing to imperfection and at the same time being endowed with requisite faculties for improvement, however, that he has advanced to his present state and is to go on advancing further still hereafter. He has been given freedom of action and being endowed with faculties of observation, reflection and of drawing deduction therefrom that he has been enabled to rise superior to the brute creation to which he owes his origin. Such being the case when any people believe they have got all that man requires, they will not rise superior to those who believe that man's knowledge is progressive and that he is always in need of "light, more light." Hindus have failed to rise higher since they began to believe they wanted no more "light" than their ancestors had given them in the Vedic texts and ritual founded on those texts setting aside altogether that "more light" the authors of the Upanishadas found for them and for mankind in general: not only so but they have fallen down because they have set aside this true enlightenment for their guide to rise higher. If other nations now in the zenith of greatness were likewise to think they are not in need of any "more light" than is found in their "sacred scriptures" and go on believing them as direct revelation from God and therefore that they are not to be read by

the light of science at all; they too instead of rising would take a downward course. My appeal to the great Christian divines is not to confine their attention to finding God and religion in the written history only but, to carry their research backwards to times when writing was not known. They are now in the place of the Rishis of the time of the Upanishadas and they are sure to throw "more light" upon mankind in general on the true path of religion, if they only search after religious truths the same way the old Rishis had done before them and believe that as God has not confined his gifts in the sun, the moon and stars &c., &c., to any particulars or "chosen people" on Earth but to all alike so He would not be partial in giving the best of all his gifts in Religion to any one nation in particular and as scientific truths have been the work of observers like Galilio, Copernicus, Newton, Wat Franklin, Faraday, Harvey, Hunter, Edison and other great men of the past and present times, so have been religious truths also, the result of observation of men like the Vedic Rishis, of Vyas, Budha, the author of the Bhagvat-Gitā (the song colebal of Sir Edwin Arnold), of Socrates, Zoroaster, Christ, St. Paul, Mohomed, Kabir, of Nannk, Tookaram, Ram Mohan Roy &c. Nor is God, the God of Abraham, of Isac, and of Joseph only but is also God of the authors of the Upanishadas, of Vyas, Valmic, of the author of the Bhagwat Gita, of Zoroaster, Christ, Mohomed, of the Muturians, of the Hindu unsectarian Theists of the present time in short He is the God of all alike of the savage as well as of all highly intellectual men who have discovered to mankind truths not only in science but also in Religion, by the light of which man has been enabled to advance higher and higher from his brutish origin and brutish propensities and who can be judged properly only by placing before our mind the time and the surroundings when they lived, which we always forget to do. We will then find they were really as great in *their* time if not greater than were the teachers of scientific truths.

It has been the practice in all nations on the part of the disciples and followers of the teachers of religious truths to raise or deify the teachers so as to make *them* objects of supreme regard and veneration while *their teaching* and the *examples* afforded by their life, both so very useful in raising man from his brutal propensities, are made secondary in importance or even lost sight of altogether. In deifying the teachers they have cast aside God himself—the one without a second and in his place Budha, Krishna, Christ, Rama &c. have been made objects of supreme regard and worship. To raise man up from brutish propensities, *Christ* not as one in the God head to be useful by his intercession hereafter but as an exemplary teacher in this sublunary world as he is found to be by his sermon on the mount and by several other precepts given by him for teaching which he suffered, but bore his suffering in so imitable a manner as to ask forgiveness of God for his enemies by saying “father forgive them for they know not what they do,” at his crucifixion: *Budha* who preceded Christ by several centuries not as an *Avatar* or incarnation of God but as one though born a prince, on finding disease decrepitude and death and all their concomittant miseries in life, left his kingdom, his wife and his child to seek wisdom to remedy the evils and when wisdom came to him when in the midst of meditation that though sufferings and pains in life cannot be extirpated they yet can be soothed or alleviated in others by forbearing in one’s self all privation and pain or in other words by making sacrifice of self for attaining that purpose; in short life’s end is to live not for self but in doing good to others and this he both practised and preached: *Krishna* not as God but one who taught Arjoona and through him mankind in general in Bhagwatgita his duty on Earth: *Rama* again not as an *Avatar* of God but one who set a very bright example of filial duty by allowing himself to be banished just when he was about to be crowned and proclaimed as heir to the kingdom rather than permit the king his father to revoke the promise he had given to the queen

Rama's step-mother. By placing such exemplary teachers on the high pedestal of God himself, the influence of their teaching and examples as men are lost, for it is but natural for men to believe they cannot follow in their lives what those who were believed to be not men but incarnations of God did for the good of mankind. Deification of such great teachers of men has been therefore a great loss to mankind and the sooner they are placed in their true position as men and as great teachers the better it would be for all. The example, for instance, in our own time Father Darwin has set as long as he is not regarded by us as an *Avatar* of God would encourage some amongst us to follow in his footsteps and do as he did and suffered alleviating pain and miseries in others. But if he were made a God and worshipped, his example would be lost to such believers, who would then think it impossible for them to work as he worked helping the helpless and the needy at the cost of his life. This deifying of their teachers, however natural it may have been with their followers, raises the personality of the Teachers at the sacrifice of their noble teachings. I have been able thus to ascertain how religious faculty was developed in man. Man has become cognizant of religion in the same manner that he became acquainted with science there has been no direct revelation of either.

Conclusion.

It is by his discoveries in material no less than in spiritual nature that man has risen superior to other animals and is destined to rise still higher as his knowledge extends further in all directions. We should therefore recognize that all truths scientific as well as religious are equally essential in developing his nature. Progress in the knowledge of only scientific truths to the utter disregard of spiritual truths tends to encourage his brutal propensities and so to make a most powerful animal of him but nothing better. He thereby becomes a very formidable enemy to his fellowmen. Take the instance of the Arab slave-dealer in Central Africa. As a

simple child of Nature the African savage is more powerful in physique than the slave-dealer and yet the latter is a more deadly enemy to the Negro to deal with than the most formidable amongst the beasts of the forests in which they live, simply because the Arab slave-dealer wields a better scientific weapon, the gun, with which the African child of Nature is unacquainted, but which is far superior to the bow and arrow, by the aid of which he can cope with the most powerful amongst the beasts but not with the slender looking animal, the Arab with his gun. And in what were the *civilized* Spaniards superior to the American Indians whom they extirpated. They were simply more formidable animals than any the Indians knew before?

Man's elevation from the savage condition; or in other words his progress in true civilization is dependent upon his wants and upon the surrounding environment from which the wants are supplied. When he can get his food-supply and protection from being killed by means of his bow and arrow he settles down and remains there in the condition of life as we find him in Central Africa and in other places, until he is molested by some powerful neighbour; when he may be wholly or partially exterminated as all primitive races have been more or less every where. The same process is perhaps threatening to be repeated in "the dark continent" at the present time if the stronger races were not imbued with true religious or human feeling.

But when the surrounding nature is such that by the use of his bow and arrow man is unable to procure supply of his necessary wants, he begins to till the ground to procure and preserve fire and to acquire the required knowledge in both science and religion. Both kinds of knowledge are equally necessary for the purpose of solving the problem of life "how to live."

Amongst the Eastern Aryans, progress in both science and religion, it seems, went on *pari passu* with each other at

first. But after a time owing to the rise and ascendancy of priesthood and the same becoming a hereditary institution, progress was stopped. The true religious element, their ancestors had acquired by the observation of the working of nature both without and within them, became distorted or entirely lost and thus after making splendid progress in religious knowledge, the Eastern Aryans became stationary in their civilization. The progress they had made will be best seen from the following passages. "He who dwells in and within the *Earth* whom the Earth does not know; who dwells in and within the *water* whom the water does not know; who dwells in and within the *fire* whom the fire does not know; who dwells in and within the *sky* whom the sky does not know. who dwells in and within the *air* whom the air does not know; who dwells in and within the *heaven* (*Dyava*) whom the heaven does not know; who dwells in and within the *sun* (*Aditya*) whom the sun does not know; who dwells in and within the *space* whom the space does not know; who dwells in and within the *Moon and stars* whom the Moon and stars do not know; who dwells in and within *ether* (*Akasha*) whom the ether does not know; who dwells in and within *darkness* whom the darkness does not know; who dwells in and within the *light* whom the light does not know; who dwells in and within *all beings* whom all beings do not know; who dwells in and within the *breath* (*Prana*, life) whom the breath does not know; who dwells in and within the *tongue* (*Vaka* or speech) whom the tongue does not know; who dwells in and within the *eye* whom the eye does not know; who dwells in and within the *ear* whom the ear does not know; who dwells in and within the *mind* whom the mind does not know; who dwells in and within the *skin* whom the skin does not know; who dwells in and within the knowledge self (or individual self) whom the knowledge does not know; who dwells in and within the *seed* whom the seed does not know; He is the self within the immortal *unseen* but seeing; *unheard* but

hearing ; *unperceived* but perceiving ; *unknown* but knowing ; there is no other seer but He ; there is no other hearer but He ; there is no other *perceiver* but He ; there is no other *knower* but He ; the *one* without a second without *beginning* and without *end* always *infinite* in knowledge, in power, in affection, in joy, is the source of all ;—instead of making this one without a second, as the sole and highest object of veneration and worship and bringing into practice, the true principle of religion, as taught by Budha of making self-sacrifice for the good of others and placing Budha's teachings on the basis of the old Vedic texts as they really were, the Eastern Aryans stuck to and continued with the old form of worship of performing sacrifices and reciting the old Vedic texts without understanding them and left the true object of worship found in the Upanishadas to the limbo of mere verbal discussion and philosophical doctrines of no earthly use whatever to man. The fact was that all knowledge, about the real origin of the texts and of the sacrificial ceremonies at which the texts had to be recited, and why so much importance was given to the texts as without them no sacrifices could be performed, was entirely lost ; and all that they knew was that from time immemorial such was the practice of their ancestors handed down to them which they did not feel they would be justified to stop, but which on the contrary they believed it was their duty to continue by handing it over to their—successors in the manner they had themselves received. The texts and the ceremonies were believed to be अनादि (without a beginning) and so they were, for no body knew when they had begun. There was no history verbal or written that they had any authors and they did not know or had forgotten that the ideas embodied in the ceremonies belonged to ancestors in the most primitive state. When there is no history, no one knows the real state of things existing in the life-time even of the father of one's grandfather. If there were no history Englishmen of the present times would hardly have believed that their ancestors

in the time of the Great Roman Empire painted their bodies and worshipped stocks and stones. Such being the case, the Aryans in process of time lost all real knowledge about the origin of the Vedic texts and of the ceremonies performed with the aid of the texts. In the beginning,—but when that was is unknown,—fire had to be produced by causing friction between two logs of wood and by no other means, for none else was then known, and *preserved* by feeding it with fuel and such other things which when consumed by it were believed to be carried to the spirits of their departed ancestors and those other divinities in nature whose aid was necessary, for the purposes of life. Vedic texts were composed for the purpose of invoking fire to appear, and also other divinities, to whom offerings were made through its means, for their assistance and help. To ensure success it was necessary, they thought, that the texts should be recited without mistake and hence repeating them correctly, for reading and writing were then unknown, was a *sine qua non* to getting the highest honor one could aspire to. It mattered little if one was quite an ignoramus in other respects. He presided at grand sacrificial ceremonies which kings and great men had to perform. Even at the present day, one who can repeat the Vedic texts correctly and with proper accentuation without even knowing a word about the language and literature of Sanskrit, holds the first place in an assembly of learned Sanskrit scholars—the great Shastris and Pundits. There is nothing strange in this: when writing was unknown, the Vedic texts, being necessary in performing sacrifices and other religious ceremonies, had to be preserved, and so repeating them without mistakes was the only method men in those days possessed. The reciter did not care for their meaning. All he cared for was the words and letters they contained and their proper order and accent. It was not their meaning so much as the method of reciting them correctly that in process of time acquired the same sanctity as the texts themselves, for both the texts and the method of reciting them became *अनादि* i. e., without a

beginning. They could not therefore be given up even after writing became known. No unhallowed ears were allowed to hear the texts and the reciter with pride considered himself disgraced if he had to touch any written pages when reciting. The texts and the correct method of reciting them were every thing because these had come to them from time immemorial. Under these circumstances, reformers like Buddha, who taught the true principles of religion but taught them by discarding the time-honoured texts and ceremonies, could make no lasting impression upon the people, especially upon the privileged classes, who had such a strong hold upon them. Buddha's followers, on the other hand, instead of going about doing what he both practised and preached *viz.*, relieving pain and suffering in their fellow-beings or, in other words, making self-sacrificing efforts in doing good to others, longed for that wisdom to come to them that had come to Buddha by meditation. And so the religion, which Buddha taught, had to leave the land of its birth, leaving the people again under the thralldom of the priest. And so the old belief in the performance of mere Vedic ceremonies could not be shaken off and thereby the leaders of the people entirely lost the honors of observation and judgment, that had guided their ancestors in the pre-vedic period. The teaching of the Upanishadas, of Buddha and his followers, of Bhagwat Gita &c., became mere knowledge or controversial doctrine of very little practical use to the people, while the practical form of religion with them became mere ceremonial worship of Gods and Goddesses—some of them most cruel ones too—and of stocks and stones which barbarians, lower in the scale of civilization, whom they have come in contact with in extending their own dominion, worshipped. With growing conservatism, they became mere speculative instead of practical men, and therefore less speculative but more practical people from time to time became masters of the land; but yet they did not let go

their hold upon the most primitive form of religious practices on any account. They have succeeded in preserving the Vedic texts, however, which otherwise would have been entirely lost, though at the cost of the loss of a power of observation and judgment on their part. But mankind in general is profited thereby, for without the existence of the texts so preserved, to trace the real origin of religious knowledge would have been a hopeless task and the conflict between science and religions almost an endless one.

With the western nations, on the other hand, the case was different. They had to work hard, as owing to their inclement surroundings, their wants were many and not easily procurable and in order to meet them they were compelled to question or implore nature for help the more and so they became more expert in scientific acquirements; and had hardly any time on hand after working for their daily bread and other necessary wants, to seek from nature the God of the universe and had therefore to content themselves, for practical purposes of life, with the form of religion presented to them by others. Their greater scientific knowledge, however, made them more powerful than their brethren in the East; who, on the other hand, their daily wants being few and easily procurable, found ample time and the necessary material on hand to seek true knowledge in religion. The great Aryan nation, therefore, found in the East a scope for obtaining knowledge in religion and in the West for acquiring distinction in science. The Western nations, however, now find that the science, in which they have made and are making still so much splendid and unparalleled progress, conflicts with their religion,—the religion of the Bible which they have been taught to believe is a direct revelation from God. In this conflict it is natural that there should be, outside the circle of scientific men, disbelief in or distrust of sciences, and in others, if not altogether want of faith in religion itself, at any rate want of faith in most of the facts mentioned in the scriptures. But as scientific truths

are incontrovertible and as men generally find no consolation without religion, some have busied themselves with directing all their best efforts to bringing about some sort of reconciliation between statements in the Bible and the scientific truths with which they conflict. As a consequence of all this, however, there is not only a growing disbelief in the Bible, but absolute scepticism is spreading very widely about religion itself. But man without religion cannot overcome his brutish nature.

By some mysterious working of Providence, western Nations have obtained by their superior scientific knowledge mastery over their Eastern brethren, who, in their turn, I am inclined to believe, are destined to triumph over them in matters of religion. The religion the western Nations follow is believed to be a direct revelation from God and the very foundation of their belief is laid up in miracles, but that of the Eastern is not so based at all on miracles and its origin is to be found in the origin of man himself. It is not history but science, aided by Vedic texts and sacrificial rites, that can throw a deal of light on the otherwise obscure origin of both. Science and the theory of development, assisted by Vedic texts and ceremonies, and the teachings of the Upanishadas, can give us sufficient information about the origin and growth of religious knowledge without any aid from miracles. The Vedic literature and particularly the Upanishadas, to be properly appreciated and enjoyed, must be studied in their original form, if Christian Nations and Christian Divines are to be convinced that religious truths have been revealed to man in the self-same manner in which scientific truths have been and in no other. Both kinds of truths are the results of observation of men superior in intellect to the common horde of mankind and the source from which they have been able to draw them out is one and the same—Nature Herself—सत्यं ज्ञानमनन्तं ब्रह्म—truth (or also that which is always), knowledge and boundlessness is ब्रह्म God. If there is truth in science and truth in religion, as there cannot be conflict between one kind

of truth and another, there ought not to be any between science and religion founded on truth ; on the contrary, there should be a complete harmony between the two. If the origin and development of religious knowledge be searched in the same scientific spirit in which Darwin, for instance, worked out the Theory of Development as applicable to the entire animal creation and in which men like him even at the present day are engaged in disentangling mysteries about the manner in which, for instance, *Vertebrate* animals have been developed out of the *Invertebrates* ; and if the enquirers would not confine their research to the period of the written history only but extend it to the times when man knew not how to write but could speak only, the results are bound to be highly satisfactory. Man could not have been living without some form or other of religion before the art of writing was invented. He knew, for instance, how to sing long before he had the notation of music. It is quite preposterous, therefore, to believe that he was unacquainted with any religious knowledge before he was able to read and write ; in other words, before he came to have the *scriptures*. If an inquiry into religious knowledge before any *scriptures* came into existence be made in a true scientific spirit, no better field for such enquiry could be found than the Vedic literature that has been handed down from the remotest antiquity. It may be that some of the ideas belonged to the pre-Vedic time, that they existed in the form of legendary stories before the Rishis of the Vedic period, in order that they may be better preserved, clothed them in the forms they are found in the Vedic texts and handed them down from sire to son. At any rate they are sure to afford an excellent field for unprejudiced enquirers after the true origin and development of religious knowledge, such as is no where else to be found. They must be studied, however, in their original and to do so our inquirers should be perfect masters of the old Sanskrit language in which the Vedic literature exists. If

those, who take to study religious subjects with the view of qualifying themselves in the first instance for degrees in Divinity in the old Universities of Oxford and Cambridge and ultimately become teachers in great schools of learning or preachers of religion in the Church, were to learn Sanskrit and Pali languages in addition to Latin and Greek, and so apply their minds to the study of the oldest Sanskrit and Pali literature, including the Upanishadas, Bhagvat Gita, and Dhamapadi and other Buddhistic works, they will then be the custodians of true religious knowledge which will be in complete harmony with the teachings of science of the present or of any future period.

When the scientific knowledge of the West is thus joined with true religion, not founded on miracles nor believed in as direct revelation from God, scepticism and materialism, that now prevail more or less throughout Europe, and thence threaten to spread amongst some of the educated classes here in the East, owing to their being better acquainted with English and the English literature of the present day than with Sanskrit and the literature of their forefathers contained therein, will exist no longer or at least will lose their hold upon the people ; for scepticism and materialism that prevail now are chiefly owing to an entire disbelief in the religion of the Bible, which claims to be the only true religion because it has been revealed to man by God Himself. God has not revealed any religion, nor any religious or scientific knowledge direct to man : and I have endeavoured to show in these pages how man has acquired knowledge of God, of Religion and Science. No one is so fully conscious, as I am myself, of my poor qualifications for treating so grand a subject adequately and in a satisfactory manner, and it would, therefore, be a great satisfaction to me if some were induced thereby to take it up and deal with it in a manner it deserves to be treated.

If there be no religion at all or in other words if man has not found any truth in religious subjects as he has discovered in science, then the question arises, is there any real difference between man and the lower animals? I remember, when studying Sanskrit in my early days, having come across the following passage in the Hitopadesha; it is so very appropriate to the subject matter of this paper.

आहार निद्रा भयवैयुने च । सामान्यभेदस्पृग्निर्नराणाम् ॥
धर्मो हि तेषामधिको विद्येते । धर्मेण हीनाः पशुभिः समानाः ॥

The poet says : "Hunger, sleep or rest, fear and sexual congress, are common to both men and beast : religion is the only additional thing man has and therefore without religion men are like beasts." Is there no truth in this? Materialism however makes no difference between man and other animals. According to that creed man is simply a higher form of animal and so he really is, if he is to depend upon the aid he gets by discoveries in science and science only, believing nothing besides. With the aid of science he is a most powerful animal and is a very formidable foe to his weaker neighbour because he is made more powerful by his superior scientific discoveries to exterminate the weak; but with the aid of religious teaching he uses his higher scientific knowledge to help the helpless and the needy at the risk even of his life. If Materialists derive consolation from their creed even when they have to bear afflictions in life, do not grudge it to them so long as they do not use their superior knowledge to support the doctrine *might is right* and thereby bring man to the level of beasts. Such is not, however, the accepted creed of Humanity. In spite of all that the Materialists have to urge in support of their doctrine, men will never give up their Vedic Rishis, their Vyasa, Budha, Socrates, Christ, St. Paul, Zoroaster, Mahomed, Tookaram &c. &c. nor their Upanishadas, Bhagvat Gita, Dharmapadis, the Bible, the Kuran, the Zendavesta &c &c. even if faith in revelation be entirely lost.

Little coral insects work, each by itself, and after centuries of incessant collective labour, they produce a reef or an island. When such huge and gigantic work is got out of such small insignificant *insects* doing their work and at the same time enjoying life allotted to them, it is obvious some good work is expected of man and that he is perhaps doing without being conscious of it. He is however given a freedom of choice and so long as he is doing the work with the aid of scientific knowledge only, he is creating unnecessary miseries to his fellow-workers. But when individual man will be doing the part allotted to him with his scientific acquirements aided by the teaching of the world's great Teachers, the work will be a labour of love—the strong helping the helpless and the needy and the weak receiving the help with love and gratitude. The good purpose to be accomplished in both the material and spiritual world will secure his salvation here and here-after and secure for him the Love and Mercy which flow direct from Fountain Head, God Himself.

THE
QUARTERLY JOURNAL
OF THE
POONA SARVAJANIK SABHA.

VOL. XVIII.] APRIL 1896, [No. 4.

UNDER THE AUTHORITY OF THE MANAGING COMMITTEE

EDITED BY

M. R. BODAS, K. A., LL. B.
HIGH COURT PLEADER, BOMBAY.

POONA:

PRINTED AT THE "Arya-Bhushan Press".

All Rights Reserved.

Price 1s.

CONTENTS.

Proceedings of the Sabha.

L. A representation to the Government of India
regarding the Jury Bill.

Independent Section.

The Fifth Provincial Contract.

THE POONA SARVAJANIK SABHA.

Established on the 1st of Chaitra Shaka 1792 i. e., 2nd April 1870
for representing the wants and wishes of the inhabitants of
the Deccan, being appointed on a popular elective
system under rules framed for the purpose.

WALEKAR'S WADA, DANE ALI

LIST OF OFFICERS.

President :

H. H. Shrinivas Rao Parashram Pandit *alias* Rao Saheb
Pant Pratinidhi, Chief of Oundha.

Vice-Presidents :

H. H. Dhundiraj Chintaman <i>alias</i> Tatya Saheb Patwardhan, Chief of Sangli.	H. H. Ganpatrao Harihar <i>alias</i> Bapu Saheb Patwardhan, younger Chief of Kurundwad.
H. H. Madhojirao Naik Nimbalkar, Chief of Faltan.	H. H. Harihar Rao Vinayak <i>alias</i> Daji Saheb Patwardhan, Chief of Kurundwad.
H. H. Ramchandra Rao Gopal <i>alias</i> Appa Saheb Patwardhan, Chief of Jamkhindi.	H. H. Toolaji Rajee Bhosle, Chief of Akalkote.

Shriment Shri Baba Maharaj.

MANAGING COMMITTEE FOR 1895-96.

Chairman.—MR. VINAYAK RAMCHANDRA PATWARDHAN, B. A. LL. B.
Members of the Managing Committee.

È. B. V. M. Bhide.	Vasudev Ganesh Joshi, Esq.
R. B. Vishnu Balkrishna Sohoni.	R. B. Shriram Bhikaji Jathar.
Shriment Balvantrao R. Natu.	R. B. G. R. Phadke.
Shriment Hari R. Dhamdhare.	R. S. Gangadhar V. Mehendale.
R. B. Narayan Bhai Dandekar.	Mr. Ganesh Narayen Sathe.
R. S. Kashinath P. Gadgil.	Mr. Narayen Bapuji Kanitkar.
Hon'ble Bal Gangadhar Tilak.	K. S. Kazi Ajmodin Saheb.
Prof. Gopal Krishna Gokhale.	Ganesh N. Ghotawadkar, Esq.
Gangadhar V. Lela, Esq.	Waman Prabhakar Bhawe, Esq.
Vishnu Narayen Apte, Esq.	Nathmal Ghanasham, Esq.
Dr. Shankar Amrit Chobhe.	Ramkrishna B. Kulkarni, Esq.
Khanderao Narayen Vaidya, Esq.	Narayen Ganesh Amdekar, Esq.
Mr. B. R. Vaidya.	Waman Vishnu Lela, Esq.
„ Vinayek R. Jalnapurkar.	Pandurang Ramji Bari, Esq.
R. S. Hukumchand Ishwardas, Esq.	Vishnu Venkatesh Behare, Esq.
Dr. Narayen Vinayek Chhatre.	Krishnarao Bapu Mande, Esq.

Treasurer :

BALVANTRAO RAMCHANDRA *alias* BALASAHEB NATU.

Auditor :

R. S. DAMODAR JANARDAN GOKHALE

Honorary Secretaries :

PROFESSOR GOPAL KRISHNA GOKHALE,

VINAYAK RAMCHANDRA JALNAPURKAR, L. C. E.

Assistant Secretary :

KRISHNARAO BAPU MANDE, Esq.

PROCEEDINGS OF THE SABHA.

A representation to the Government of India regarding the Jury Bill.

No. 690 of 1896.

Sarvajanik Sabha Rooms,
Poona, 14th March, 1896.

To,

THE SECRETARY

TO THE GOVERNMENT OF INDIA,

Legislative Department,

CALCUTTA.

Sir,

We have been directed by the Managing Committee of the Poona Sarvajanik Sabha to submit, for the favorable consideration of the Government of India in the Legislative Department, the following observations of the Committee of the Sabha on the Bill which has been introduced by the Hon'ble Sir A. Miller in the Legislative Council on the 22nd August 1895 to amend the Code of Criminal Procedure of 1882. It is needless to go into the history of the question, for the subject has been thoroughly discussed and treated in the report of the Jury Commission appointed under a Resolution of the Government of India, dated 23rd February 1893. The Committee, therefore, desires to confine its observations to such changes as have been proposed to be introduced by the Bill now before the Legislative Council, and to make a few recommendations in the interests of justice.

2. The Committee of the Sabha has noticed with regret the attempts that are every now and then made to tamper with the system of trial by Jury introduced in this country more than thirty years ago, and against which the people of the country have not, so far as the Committee is aware, raised any the least complaint.

Apart from the question, whether the system of trial by Jury or any other similar to it, existed in India before the commencement of the British Rule, there can be no doubt that the introduction of the system in its present form has been warmly appreciated, and highly valued by the natives of this country as one of the most important and permanent privileges conferred upon them by the British Government after a careful consideration of the advantages, and disadvantages resulting therefrom. The Committee of the Sabha is not unaware of the difference of opinion that exists among eminent lawyers as regards the comparative merits of the trial by a Judge with jury, and that by a Judge without a jury, or as regards the suitability of the jury system to this country. But the Committee of the Sabha respectfully begs to submit that if the decision once arrived at by Government in this matter, be allowed to be re-opened at every time the revision of the Criminal Procedure Code is taken up, it will shake the confidence of the people in the good intentions of Government, and also in the administration of criminal justice in India, and will become a source of general discontent.

3. There is no system of administering Criminal Justice which can be said to be ideally faultless, and in making their choice from among the various systems, Government should be guided more by the comparative preponderance of the advantages attending any one of them, and also by considerations of keeping up general contentment of the public, and of securing a potent means of practically educating the natives of this country in the administration of its affairs, than by the special defects of each system. It was such comparative preponderance and political considerations that induced the Government of India to extend to this country the system of trial by jury on the model of the English institution, and the Committee of the Sabha begs to request that Government should not hesitate to firmly adhere to the decision they have once arrived at in this matter.

4. Trial by Jury is an institution which has peculiar advantages of its own in a country where the Criminal Law is foreign, and is administered by Judges, who are also foreigners. Individual Judges and officers may, now and then, be led to report unfavourably

on this popular system of the administration of Criminal Justice ; but it must not be lost sight of that a Judge is necessarily to some extent, at least, a prejudiced witness on this subject, and that sufficient attention has not been given by the officers who have reported against it, to the inherent merits of the Jury trial as a system (which may be held to compensate for its defects,) or to the special advantages which it has in India, and which must be set off against the special disadvantages necessarily to be expected therefrom. And further it may be remembered that a system of the administration of Justice which is once deemed to be the best from political and other considerations, should not be interfered with, merely to meet the wishes of such individual Judges and officers. But the Committee of the Sabha regrets to find that the foregoing important facts are overlooked in framing the proposals incorporated in the Bill under consideration. That Bill, it is true, does not propose to abolish the form of the trial by Jury, but it practically deprives it of its important characteristics, and thus reduces it to the level of a trial by Assessors, while the original object with which the trial by a Judge with the Assessors was introduced, was to pave the way for the ultimate adoption of the Jury system for the whole of India. The Committee of the Sabha begs, therefore, to state that the present attempt to impose additional restrictions on the trial by Jury or to abrogate the rights of the Jurors, is clearly a retrograde measure diametrically opposed to the liberal policy inaugurated by Government, of introducing into this country useful and important British institutions. The Indian people expect a gradual extension and development of these beneficial institutions, and hence any restrictions that may be imposed on the rights already conferred upon them, are highly calculated to give rise to serious dissatisfaction.

5. But besides these general objections, there are special reasons why the changes now proposed to be introduced in the system of trial by Jury are highly objectionable, and harmful to the cause of Justice. The Hon'ble mover of the Bill has observed in his statement of objects and reasons that the Bill is introduced to give effect to such of the recommendations of the Jury Commission as have been approved of by the Government of India and Her Majesty's Secretary of State. On a reference to the report of the Commission, it will, however, be found that the Commissioners have

recorded their opinion against the principal change sought to be introduced by the Bill. Speaking of the proposal to amend section 303 of the Code of Criminal Procedure, so as to enable the Sessions Judge to obtain special verdicts, the Commissioners, in paragraphs 32 and 33 of their report dated 24th March 1893, observe as follows:—

“ 32 It has been suggested that the terms of section 303 of the Code of Criminal Procedure should be amended, so as to enable a Sessions Judge to obtain more clearly the opinion of the jury on facts of the evidence; so as to learn and place on record the grounds upon which the verdict was arrived at. We are not in favour of any alteration in the present law which provides sufficient means for obtaining a verdict, and we think that there are strong objections to anything of the nature of a Cross-Examination of the jurors as to details of a case, so as to obtain their opinion on portions of the evidence. Amongst these it will be sufficient to say that it must very frequently happen that the jurors may individually arrive at the same conclusion by different processes of reasoning or they may find difficulty in expressing intelligently or logically a conclusion fairly arrived at on consideration of the entire case. No doubt certain cases—for instance, in cases of culpable homicide not amounting to murder, or of house-breaking with intent to commit an offence, it may be necessary to give a special verdict to determine the exact offence, so as to regulate the sentence; but the terms of the present law sufficiently provide for this, and we are opposed to any alteration for the purposes suggested.”

“ It has also been proposed to permit questions to be put to the Jurors, after a verdict delivered, so as to enable the Sessions Judge to determine, whether he should refer the case to the High Court, as well as to enable the High Court itself in a referred case to learn whether a verdict was on reasonable and proper grounds; but the same ob-

jections equally apply. We prefer to adopt the course recommended by us,—namely, that each case referred by a Sessions Judge should be tried by the High Court on its merits on the evidence, as less likely to cause embarrassment and more certain to ensure a just and proper decision. ”

“ 33. We have considered anxiously whether it is practicable to enable the Judge to direct the Jury to return a special verdict on issues framed by him. This proposal is supported by high authority, and we are fully sensible of the advantages it would be to the High Court in referred cases, to have a special, instead of a general, verdict to deal with, but we have reluctantly come to the conclusion that such a procedure would be liable to create greater evils than it would remedy. ”

It is, therefore, against the deliberate opinion of the Commissioners that the present Bill proposes to arm the Judge with powers to obtain special verdicts from the Jury.

6. It is true that the Government of India openly dissented from the opinion expressed in paras 32 and 33 of the report of the Jury Commissioners, which was against the introduction of special verdicts, and in calling for the opinions, and reports of the several local Governments on the working of the system of trial by Jury under their respective administrations, they even intimated to those Governments that they still adhered to their former view, viz., that section 303 of the Criminal Procedure Code should be amended so as to empower the Sessions Judge to require special verdicts on particular issues of fact ; for in one of their letters (dated 6th May 1893) to the Government of Bombay the object of the intended amendment is stated to be “ to enable the presiding Judge to ascertain for his own guidance, and (if necessary) for the information of the High Court, what elements of the charge have been established to the satisfaction of the Jury. *A charge of theft based on evidence of recent possession* may be taken as an apt illustration. In a case of this kind, which actually occurred, the Jury had brought in a *general verdict of not guilty*, but it was subsequently ascertained that they

were all of opinion that the *property was stolen* and that the *accused was in possession of it* at the time alleged, but they *refused to draw the inference that he was the actual thief*. But if the case had been referred to the High Court upon the bare general verdict, it would probably have been assumed that the evidence as to the property being found on the accused had been thought untrustworthy." As this specific statement of the object and reason of the amendment of section 303 was made subsequently to the date of the Commissioner's Report, it could not, as a matter of course, be considered by them, and it is, therefore, necessary to examine here closely, and at some length the statement in question.

7. In the first place it must be observed that the striking idea which appears to be prominent in the mind of Government, and which runs throughout the statement, is that Juries in Criminal cases should act merely as guides and assistants to the presiding Judge, by giving their decisions on single facts or issues that may be brought to their notice by the Judge. On the other hand, the Jury Commissioners think that Juries in Criminal cases are entitled to exercise a higher function assigned to them by English Law, and they endorse and quote with approval in their report the observations of Sir F. J. Stephen, who in his history of Criminal Law in England (Vol. I page 572) writes " that the institution (of trial by Jury) *does place the Judge in a position in which, with a view to public interest, he ought to be placed — that of a guide and adviser to those (Jurors) who are ultimately to decide, and a moderator in the struggle, on the result of which they are to give their decision.*" The dissent, therefore, of the Government of India from the opinion of the Jury Commissioners in the matter of special verdicts must be attributed to the radically different functions being assigned to Criminal Juries by either party.

8. Now, according to the English Law the verdict in a criminal case is either *general* on the whole charge (which the Jury are at liberty to find, in all cases, both upon the law and the fact of the case); or *partial*, as to a part of the charge, as where the Jury convict the accused on one or more counts or items of the charge, and acquit him of the residue; or *special*, where the facts of the case alone are found by the Jury, the legal inference to be drawn

from them being referred to the Court. The portion of the English Law relating to general and partial verdicts, has alone been enacted into the present section 303 of the Criminal Procedure Code. Under the English Law it is left *entirely to the discretion of the Jury* to give any one of the three kinds of verdict, and, accordingly, the Jury *have a right, in all Criminal cases, to find a special verdict*, but such verdict *must state positively the facts themselves, and not merely the evidence adduced to prove them, and all the facts necessary to enable the Court to give judgment, must be found by the Jury*; for the Court cannot supply by implication any defect in the statement. In fact, so far as special verdicts are concerned, the Jury and the Judge may be said to exchange their duties, and it is only in cases of doubt and difficulty that English Juries in criminal cases throw the burden and responsibility on the Judge by giving special verdicts, and by undertaking the equally onerous and difficult duty of stating facts to enable the Judge to infer the legal effect from the findings of facts, or, in other words, to pronounce the accused guilty, or otherwise.

9. Section 303, as proposed to be recast, and amended into 5 sub-sections, will not introduce the English Law of special verdicts into the Indian Code, but it will practically, and in effect deprive the Indian Criminal Jury of its right of giving the general verdict, and will empower and authorise the judge to pronounce and record the accused as being convicted, or acquitted, or, in other words, guilty, or not guilty, which is nothing less than the subversion of the Institution; for none of the proposed sub-sections limits the power of the judge, in requiring the jury to return a special verdict, to any specific or particular offences, cases, or circumstances. Moreover, the words "unless otherwise ordered by the court" with which the present section 303 begins refer, in our humble opinion, to partial verdicts, and authorise the Court to direct the jury to omit from their consideration, and verdict any unimportant counts in the charge made against the accused, rather than that they refer to special verdicts, and authorise the judge to order the jury to determine the facts, and leave the inference to be drawn from the findings to himself. On the other hand, the words, viz., "instead of directing the jury generally to return a verdict on any charge," with which the proposed sub-section 2 begins, when construed with

the words, viz., " save as otherwise in this (proposed) section (303) provided," leave it entirely in the power of the judge to enforce sub-section (2) to the entire suppression of sub-section (1) at any time and as often as he may be pleased. It must be specially noted here that none of the words of the present section 303 does in any way either directly, or by implication destroy or lessen the right and authority, as established by the English Law, of Juries of giving at pleasure, and in their discretion an ordinary or common verdict which includes the finding or determination of a fact or facts as well as the declaration of the legal effect of such finding, and of giving special verdicts, which are, so to say, denuded of the declaration of the legal effect; whereas the proposed sub-sections 2 to 4 of special verdicts openly, and completely trample down the said time-honored right of the juries, and by thus lowering their function, and making them sub-servient to the judge, destroy the independence, value and utility of the Institution. General verdicts, accordingly, will be a rarity, and special ones will be the order of the day. By the bye the word " ordered " in the expression " unless otherwise ordered " in the present section 303 is misleading, and should be replaced by the word " suggested " or, at least, " directed " in recognition of the independence, and discretionary powers of Juries.

10. These sad consequences of the proposed amendment have been graphically described, as it were by anticipation, by Mr. Justice Phear in the case of *Rajcoomar Boss* (19 W. R. 41), where it is said " The Judge has not simply expressed his opinion and then left all the evidence fairly before the Jury on the one side, and on the other, for them to judge of it by the aid of his opinion if they choose to avail themselves of it. But he has endeavoured from the first to the last to persuade the Jury to take a particular view of the facts and of the inferences from the evidence, which he has himself taken and drawn, and indeed he has left them no loophole for taking any other view. That is not in accordance with the Code, but is a course calculated in the mofussil to withdraw altogether from the Jury the actual decision of the case." It will thus be seen that many Indian Judges are in the habit of forcing their own individual views, and convictions on the Jury, and the introduction of special verdicts in the Indian Law will simply

legalize, and perpetuate the evil and malpractice without any chance of its being checked by the High Court. It is really a departure from the settled English Law that the proposed amendment does not leave it to the discretion of the Jury to find a special verdict in any given case.

11. Looking at the proposed amendment from a broad constitutional point of view, it is a question whether it is justifiable to deprive a British Indian subject practically of his privilege of being tried by a Jury without any adequate reason for such a measure. By a notification published in the *Gazette of India*, 1862, P. 1286, all trials in the Sessions Courts in the Province of Assam were ordered by Government to be held by Jury. Goalparah, then a district of Assam, was afterwards transferred to Ooooh Bahar, and made subordinate to the Sessions Court of that Province, and accordingly, it was ruled by the High Court in the case of Khoodeeram (8 W. R. 39) that trial by Jury in Goalparah ceased on its transfer from Assam. But the Government of Bengal saw the justice of restoring the privilege to the people of Goalparah, and accordingly, it ordered on 31st of August 1867 that the trial of all offences at Goalparah should be held by Jury. This is, therefore, a remarkable case of constitutional Law, which impressively and vividly illustrates how the British Government in India have been anxious to preserve to their subjects rights and privileges once acquired by, or conferred upon, them. In short, British Indian subjects have a right to claim such treatment at the hands of the benign Government as will not deprive them of their much valued rights and privileges without a proper justification.

12. Besides the constitutional consideration, there is another aspect in which the proposed amendment may be deemed prejudicial to the interests of the accused as well as to those of the administration of justice generally. As proposed by subsection 2, the Jury will return a special verdict consisting of separate findings on any particular questions of facts which the Judge may desire, and will, by the very nature of things, be prevented from taking a view of the case tried by them as a whole, and as the Judge alone will pronounce as to the legal effect of such single findings of facts, his verdict regarding the guilt or otherwise,

or conviction or acquittal, will come to be substituted for the general ordinary verdict which is a combined declaration resulting from the consideration of the evidence which has been balanced, weighed, and tested by more persons than one who may form the Jury. The verdicts to be given by the Judge being based upon facts as determined by the Jury, any appeal or reference in the matter will, of course, be effectually barred. Moreover, although, on the one hand, it is an admitted fact that the only legitimate object of a prosecution is to secure not a conviction but that justice be done, yet, on the other hand, the proposed Sub-section (2) does not provide that a Judge shall submit to the Jury all the facts that may be in any way necessary to find to arrive at a right and just decision of the case. Thus, trials by Jury becoming only nominal, and, therefore, mischievous, justice will more often than not be either stifled, or completely frustrated, and the abnormal phenomenon of what will be, practically speaking, the decision of a single man in a criminal case standing unquestioned, or unappealable, will be realized in every day life to the utter distress, nay, even ruin of many an innocent inhabitant of the country. Moreover, it would seem from para 9 of the Jury Commissioner's Report that Government did not include Sec. 303 among the causes which, as discovered by them, were only two, and to which in their opinion the defects of the trial by Jury in this Country were mainly attributable. Government, however, without giving any reason, noted for consideration on an amendment of the Law the question whether before or after a general verdict has been taken, special verdict should not be required on particular issues of fact, if not on the general credibility of particular evidence. As just now stated above, the two causes to which defects of the present Jury system have been attributed are:—“(1) Extension of the Jury system to areas to which it is unsuitable, and to classes of offences which ought not to be cognizable by jury, and (2) the fact that the provisions of Section 307 of the Criminal Procedure Code which were introduced to give Sessions Judges, and the High Court power to remedy and correct wrong verdicts, have failed to fulfil this intention.” Without, however, admitting the correctness of these statements, the alleged causes of wrong verdicts may be effectually removed, the first one by means of an administrative measure which the Local Governments are already authorized to

adopt under Section 269, and the Second by not amending Section 307 as proposed in Clause 3 of paragraph 24 of the Jury Commissioner's Report, but by simplifying it, and, with a view to lessen the latitude given by it to the Sessions Judge, by disallowing references unless where the verdicts are clearly, and patently wrong, and completely against the recorded evidence. Why the present Sections 269 and 307 should not be amended as proposed or recommended, has been briefly discussed here in the sequel. It is, therefore, difficult to see the necessity, reason, and object of amending Section 303.

13. Verdicts are said to be wrong and perverse when they are patently against the recorded evidence in the case, and, setting aside cases of wilfully wrong verdicts, which, by the bye, are but rare occurrences, the chief source of the wrongness of verdicts, is the well-known misdirection of the jury by the Judge in setting out the case before them, and as the Sessions Judges, and the High Courts have to decide whether a given verdict is wrong, or perverse, *by no other means than by direct reference to the recorded evidence*, and as it has already been shown that the English as well as the current Indian Law makes the presiding Judge a guide of the jury, there seems to be absolutely no necessity whatever to interfere with the simple and clear law of verdicts as is laid down in the present section 303.

14. Having thus shown that the reason and necessity of amending section 303 have neither any good ground nor justification so far as the aforesaid sources of the defects of the present Jury system are concerned, it now only remains to be seen whether the instance given by the Government of India, and quoted herein above in paragraph 6, of a charge of theft based on evidence of recent possession, does in any way prove the necessity of the proposed amendment. It is said that in this case the jury had brought in a general verdict of not guilty of the theft, although they were all of opinion that the property was stolen, and that the accused was in possession of it at the time alleged. Evidently, the jury could not have rightly convicted the accused of theft under section 379, because proof was wanting of the presence of some of the important elements of the offence of theft, *viz.*, that the accused dishonestly moved the property in

question out of another's possession without that other's consent, nor could they have justly held the man guilty under section 411 of dishonestly receiving, or retaining stolen property, because evidence of guilty knowledge was wanting. But supposing that there was evidence on record of all the elements of any of the two offences, the Sessions Judge, and the High Court could have easily ascertained the wrongness of the verdict by reference to the recorded evidence itself, for the current law clearly provides that on reference in a Jury case, the High Court shall deal with it as on an appeal, and the Sessions Judge is authorised to make the reference, properly speaking, only when the recorded evidence and the ends of justice require it. It is, therefore, difficult to see how the delivery, and condemnation of the wrong verdict could be prevented by bringing into existence the altogether new species of special verdicts. The case at 2 W. R. 63 that the theft, and taking and retaining of stolen goods formed one and the same offence, and cannot be punished separately, only proves that a thief may be the retainer of the stolen property, but not the reverse that a taker and retainer of stolen goods is the thief. And the Jury, in the above case, were perfectly right in not setting down the retainer, and receiver of stolen property as the thief. In all probability, in the case under consideration, the Sessions Judge must have failed, or omitted to properly charge the Jury, and to arrange and set forth adequately, and in a fitting manner, the evidence for their consideration as bearing on the different important elements which constitute the offences of theft, and retention of stolen property. Thus, it has been conclusively shown that the amendment of the law by the introduction of the so-called special, or, rather, compulsory special verdicts is neither defended by fair and good reasons, nor by any the least necessity. This conveniently leads us to the consideration of the important subject of the Judge's charge to the Jury.

15. In para 15 of their Report the Jury Commissioners say that "it must be borne in mind that some of the *erroneous verdicts are probably due to want of practice on the part of the Judge in the very difficult art of charging a Jury. A good and clear charge or an inefficient one frequently makes all the difference in a verdict. A careful appointment of only the best and most experienced Judges to Jury*

Districts must mitigate this danger, but the exigencies of the service must occasionally cause *inexperienced officers to be temporarily appointed.*" The Committee of the Sabha fully endorses the opinion of the Jury Commissioners, and recommends that the law on the subject may be at once amplified and amended. The provisions of Section 297, 298 and 367 have been long considered insufficient, and inadequate to meet the purposes of justice, and so long back as the year 1875, the High Court of Calcutta made a circular to the effect that the statement of the Judge's direction, or heads of the charge to the jury should be such as would enable the Appellate Court to decide *whether the evidence was properly laid before the jury and whether there was any misdirection in the charge*; and about three years earlier, that is, in about 1872 in the case of *Rajcoomar Bose* already cited herein above Mr. Justice Phear observed to the effect that it was no doubt useful because, it saved time, that the Judge should state to the Jury in the narrative form so much of the facts as were admitted by both sides. But when he reached that point it was best that he should explain distinctly the issues of fact that it remained for the Jury to determine, having regard to that part of the case which was admitted, and to the charges upon which the prisoners were tried; and, having made the Jury understand those issues, the more convenient mode of summing up for him to adopt was to present to the Jury as clearly and impartially as he could, a summary of the evidence and the considerations and inferences to be drawn from the evidence as they might bear both on the negative and affirmative sides of each of those issues. It was also further remarked that it was impossible for any Judge to state every item of evidence or to draw the attention of the jury to every fact which was deposed to, but he might, without difficulty, give them a summary of the leading points of the evidence, and the considerations and inferences to be drawn from the one side or the other. The committee of the Sabha, accordingly, begs to submit that these and other like observations of other Judges might be immediately incorporated in our Criminal Procedure Code. It must be here, however, added that this statement of the charge to the Jury must be reduced to writing before delivery. This will at once remove the patent, and primary cause of wrong verdicts, and the consequent failure of justice and greatly reduce the number of chances of the necessity of making

a reference, and enable the High Court on reference to see clearly what the jury had before them in forming, and giving their verdict, and, above all, show in the course of a short time to demonstration that the burden of blame hitherto put to the account of the jury, should have been long transferred in its major portion to the shoulders of the majority of young Civilian Sessions Judges, many of whom being strangers to the language, manners, and customs of the people of this country, and from other causes, are often disabled from working harmoniously and cordially with the Jury to secure the ends of justice.

16. In this connection, it may be usefully observed that there would be no difficulty in finding out a sufficient number of judges to discharge properly the duties of a Sessions Judge in Jury trials, and the exigencies of the service which, as said by the Jury Commissioners, must occasionally (they could have even properly said frequently) cause inexperienced officers to be appointed Sessions and District Judges, would be reduced to the minimum, if the wise, and straightforward recommendations made by the Hon'ble Sir Charles Sargent, late Chief Justice of the High Court of Bombay, in his examination before the Public Service Commission, Bombay, be accepted, and carried out by Government. He says:—

“ At present all the Subordinate Judgeships are held by Natives of the Country, and I think that, *not only without any prejudice to the administration of Justice, but indeed with some benefit to it*, the Subordinate Judges and other natives, who have had the requisite legal training might be appointed to the post of Assistant and District Judges now held by Covenanted Civilians. Of course they would have to be selected with care; but I think *the body of Subordinate Judges, the native Advocates and High Court Pleaders would supply all you could want, as regards both ability, and integrity.* * * * * It is to be remembered that under the system which prevails, I believe throughout India, *the Civilian Judges perform almost exclusively appellate functions, and it is almost impossible to expect that men would perform the appellate duties satisfactorily who*

*have never done any original work * * * * The rule in this Presidency (Bombay) is that after four years, a Civilian must elect whether he will enter the Judicial or Revenue branch of the service. Supposing him to come out with some knowledge of law—it cannot be very much—and with some slight experience in the administration of Justice in the English Courts, during the first four years of his service, he does no Judicial work whatever except as a Magistrate * * * I must say that my experience is that on the whole and particularly as regards the decision of questions of fact, the administration of Justice suffers from the appeals lying to young Civilian Judges. And indeed generally speaking I should say that owing to the acquaintance of the subordinate Judges with the ways, manners and customs of the country being vastly superior to that of the Civilian Judges, the result is, that on questions of fact the findings in the appellate Courts, where they differ from those of the Court below, are more generally wrong than right; and if that is so, of course the administration of Justice suffers."*

17. The notable and frank observations of the learned Chief Justice, regarding the decisions of the questions of fact by native Judges as being more right and correct than those of the civilian Judges apply *mutatis mutandis* to verdicts of native Jurors also, and they are substantially echoed and reproduced in the remarks of the Jurors' Commissioners in paras 16 and 17 of their Report, in respect of the verdicts of the Jury.

"In such (referred) cases" say the Commissioners "there is a fair probability that the Jury may be right, for there are many referred cases in which the High Court has, on a full consideration of the evidence, adopted the same conclusion as the Jury and rejected that of the Judge. * * * * Statistics, however, show how possible it is for Judges conscientiously to come to different conclusions on the same evidence, in a large percentage of cases, and emphasize the observations that it is unsafe to assume as a rule that the Judge is right, and the Jury wrong when they disagree."

The observations and recommendations of Sir Charles Sargent

must be understood to apply to Civil and Criminal branches of the Judicial administration alike, and his view, that the Criminal Judicial administration should remain substantially in the hands of European Civilian Judges, cannot be accepted since the same has been based by him entirely on the political aspect of the question, in so far that he considers it absolutely necessary for bringing home the power of the British Raja to the general mass of the population, and for the maintenance of the proper supremacy of the British Government in the country, that the criminal administration should remain substantially in the hands of Europeans.

18. The Committee of the Sabha does not deem it necessary to dwell any further on the drawbacks of the proposals now made regarding Special verdicts. The Hon'ble mover of the Bill may be aware of other objections that may be urged against the proposed amendments in addition to those that have been already noted herein above, and that the proposed law may be perverted into a kind of brow-beating or cross-examination of the jury. But he hopes, though he does not specify the grounds of such a hope, that it is not unlikely that some form will be found before the Bill passes, which will avoid the danger arising from it. The Committee of the Sabha has given its careful consideration to this subject, and is unable to suggest any method by which the admitted dangers of the proposed procedure can be averted. It is well-known that the system of returning special verdicts at the request or direction of the Judge does not obtain in England at any rate in Criminal cases; and the Committee of the Sabha cannot understand why it should be deemed necessary in India. And here may be usefully reproduced from the work of a standard writer a summary of the Law of verdicts as it obtains in Civil cases in England. "Although in theory it is the office of the Jury to deliver their verdict on the issues of fact raised by the pleadings, yet in practice, where the evidence before the Court is complicated and difficult in its legal application, the direction of the Judge may, by assisting the Jury in the elucidation of the evidence and as regards its connection with any specific issue, virtually determine how the verdict ought to be found. That the Jury may persist in finding on an issue contrary to the expressed opinion and direction of the Judge, is true; but if this should subsequently be made apparent to the Court, the verdict might be set aside as being against evidence, or perverse. The Jury, however, are usually content to exercise the discretionary power

confided to them, subject to, and in accordance with the advice, or suggestion proferred by the Judge, *under whose direction the jury may return a special verdict, finding the facts of the case, and leaving the Court subsequently to pronounce as to the legal effect, and signification of such verdict*". This will at once show that in England verdicts, whether special, or common, are voluntary and discretionary, and not enforced and obligatory, and, also, the circumstances under which special verdicts are given.

19. The Hon'ble Sir Alexander Miller has tried to defend the introduction of special verdicts on the ground that the system of special verdicts works extremely well in Civil Cases in England, and that, therefore, the same should be followed in India in Criminal Cases. But the reasoning, or, rather, the analogy, is defective and inclusive on its very face. In the first place English Legislature, or Judges have not yet acted upon the analogy pointed out by the Hon'ble Sir Alexander Miller, and, secondly, he has overlooked the grand difference that separates a civil from a criminal cause, and also the distinction that exists between the procedures followed in the conduct of cases of either kind. The chief question in a civil cause, is who has the right, or is entitled to a thing; whereas the sole, and important question in a criminal case, is who has committed, or attempted, or abetted the offence, or guilty act. The answer to the former, or civil question, is, rarely if ever, based upon findings of issues of simple and pure facts alone, and hence a verdict, whether special or common, given on the whole of any civil case, must be a rarity; and verdicts on single issues of fact are common, and take the special form *only* when the jury find it difficult to deduce the legal effect, owing to the complication of facts, or other causes. On the other hand, the answer to the sole, and main question in a criminal case is entirely based upon findings of issues of facts which are generally simple, and hence verdicts are common and general, and take the special form only in cases of doubt.

20. Moreover, in every civil case issues are framed, and on each of them evidence is taken, arguments heard, and findings recorded. Such is not the case in a criminal trial, and the jurors whose special recommendation to a share in the administration of criminal justice consists in the fact that they do not judge of facts in a methodical and artificial way, but take a practical common-sense view of all the facts placed before them, will always be at a disadvantage to give detailed

reasons for the conclusions they might have drawn from the evidence not by artificial rules and generalisations capable of being reduced to definite expressions, but by a general common-sense consideration of the whole matter. If the issues are framed before the commencement of the trial, the jurors after listening to the arguments of the pleaders which must in such a case especially be directed to the issues framed may, perhaps, be able to give special verdicts and reasons for the same, and also to state the necessary facts and circumstances of the case together with their findings to the judge to enable him to deduce and draw the legal effect and conclusion. But as the Criminal Procedure stands at present, the jurors who, being generally untrained in law, are little expected to give accurately reasons for their verdicts, will always be taken by surprise, when the judge, as is now proposed, begins to ask them for information on any question of fact, or for special verdicts on issues to which their attention might not have been specially directed during the course of the trial.

21. Quite apart from the general objections to the system of special verdicts, and supposing that such verdicts are made optional and discretionary as in England, the difference between the respective natures of Civil and Criminal cases, and also that between the procedures followed in Civil and Criminal enquiries, make it, therefore, impossible to adopt in Criminal cases in India the system of special verdicts followed in England in Civil cases. The Committee of the Sabha is, therefore, of opinion that the change now proposed to be introduced would in the words of the Jury Commissioners *give rise to greater evils than it would be able to remedy*; and hopes that Government will abandon the idea of degenerating the system of trial by jury into an engine for defeating the ends of justice.

22. As regards the finality of the verdicts of the jury, the Committee of the Sabha is of opinion that, if the Government of India are not prepared just at present to make the law in section 307 more explicit and definite so as to curtail the ample latitude given to Sessions Judges in the matter of making a reference, the existing law is sufficient to meet cases of the failure of justice under the present system of trial by jury. The Committee believes that the finality of the verdict, unless where it is clearly perverse, is one of the chief characteristics of the system of trial by jury. The very object of associating the citizens with the judges in such matters is to secure confidence

in the administration of criminal justice, and to afford a kind of constitutional protection to the people. This advantage is so obvious and important that some of those who have attacked the jury system in the main have conceded that it ought to be retained in cases where the liberty of a subject may come in question. In important constitutional cases people generally have greater confidence in the verdict of a body of citizens who are unknown until the moment of trial, and who are strangers to the prisoner and indifferent to the prosecution than in the decision of a Judge who is liable to be suspected of sympathies on the side of authority. It is in cases like these that system of trial by Jury is most needed in all its integrity, and the present Bill proposes to deprive it of its chief commendation in such cases.

23. The principle that the Judge should not refer all cases to the High Court in which he differs from the Jury simply on the ground that he doubts the propriety of a verdict, or if he had been a Juror he would not have ventured the same verdict, was accepted by the Government of India, and the Secretary of State in 1872 ; and the proposed amendment of Section 307 is, it is submitted, a *further departure* from this view, because even the latitude given to the Judge by the section in question in its present form is too much, and gives scope to the play of mere sentiment ; and references ought, accordingly, to be strictly limited only to verdicts which are patently and clearly wrong and against the recorded evidence. If the High Courts have all along uniformly refused to set aside a verdict unless it was clearly wrong and against evidence, there is no reason why the judge's disagreement should not be limited to the same ground. As at present worded, the section allows, the Sabha begs to submit, much scope to the play of undefined sentiment, which is undesirable, and injures the finality of verdicts to a great extent. Moreover, in cases tried by a jury, if the judge's agreement with the verdict cannot, properly and legally speaking, be deemed as its valid, and necessary complement, there is no reason why his disagreement should be recognised by law. In short, goodness or badness of both verdicts and references must be tried by the same tests, and controlled by one and the same definite, tangible, and unvarying standard,—the recorded evidence in the case.

24. Saving just exceptions, it is the settled policy of the law to give finality to verdicts, and maintain it in tact. It might be that some

really guilty persons might escape punishment by this means ; but the Committee of the Sabha begs to point out that the superiority of a system of the administration of criminal justice cannot be impugned on such grounds. As remarked above there is no system that is ideally perfect, and it is a principle of English Criminal justice that it takes care to see that no innocent man suffers, never mind if some guilty person escape punishment. The Committee of the Sabha is, therefore, of opinion that if Government will not see their way to simplify, and make definite the law of reference, and, above all, consistent with the sole right of the jury to give an independent final verdict, on the lines indicated herein above, any disturbance of the finality of the verdict of the Jury, beyond what is allowed by the present law, would be disastrous to public interest, and seriously damage the constitutional protection which the present system affords ; and which protection is justly deemed by the people as a valuable privilege conferred on them by the British Rule.

25. There are two more amendments proposed in the Bill now before the Council ; first, with regard to the formation of special Juries ; and second, the amendment of section 263 so as to require the previous sanction of the Governor-General-in-Council, when it is desired by a Local Government to extend, or restrict the system of trial by Jury under that section. With reference to the first of these, the Committee of the Sabha desires to state that the formation of Special Juries is not generally speaking necessary under the present system ; nor have the Jury Commissioners laid any special stress on this point. The Jury system is not extended yet to all districts, or to all offences. It is only some important offences that are at present triable by Jury ; and if the ordinary lists are prepared with greater care, where such care is needed, there will be no necessity for a special Jury list in any district. When all offences are made triable by Jury, then perhaps it would be advisable, and convenient to have two kinds of Jurors, ordinary and special ; but such is not the case in India where certain specified offences are triable by jury. The Committee of the Sabha is, therefore, of opinion that it is not desirable to have special Juries at present unless it is proposed to extend the system of trial by Jury to all criminal offences. By the bye, it may be here usefully remarked that in Superior Courts in England a special jury may be obtained in any case whatsoever, whether civil or criminal, or on any penal statute, excepting only indictments for treason or felony. It is, accordingly, further submitted that if

special juries are at all to be introduced in India, offences against the State, murder, rioting, and other similar grave offences should be excluded from the cognizance of special juries.

26. As for the second of the two points noticed above, the Committee of the Sabha ventures to submit that the amendment now proposed will not materially remedy the evil which it is intended to guard against. No local Government is likely to issue a notification under Section 269 without first consulting, or ascertaining the wishes of the Supreme Government. But under the existing law, the Supreme Government is not directly responsible for such order; and, consequently, an appeal from the local Government to the Supreme Government is fairly open to the party aggrieved by the notification. If the amendment now proposed be carried, it will have the effect of committing the Supreme Government to the view of the Local Government without hearing the other side. The Committee of the Sabha is, therefore, of opinion that such a change in the existing law is not desirable; and that the powers of the Local Government would be more effectively controlled, if the Legislature enacts that before issuing any notification under section 269 of the Criminal Procedure Code, the Local Government should give publicity to its intention of issuing such notification, and invite objections thereon within a reasonable time from the date of its publication. If the Legislature is not prepared to adopt this suggestion, section 269 of the Criminal Procedure Code should, in the opinion of the Sabha, be rather left as it is. Moreover, the Sabha begs to quote here with approval the remarks in this connection made by the Government of Lord Lansdowne in their Despatch, No. 82 of 1892, dated, the 21st December, 1892, to the Earl of Kimberley the then Secretary of State for India, namely—
 “we have, however, decided that it would be undesirable in any way to fetter the discretion or limit the responsibility of the provincial Governments * * * The decision whether any particular district is ripe for the application of the system must obviously depend on a minute knowledge of local circumstances and aptitudes, as to which the provincial Governments alone can be fully informed.”

27. In connection with the several amendments proposed in the Bill, the Committee of the Sabha begs to quote, and reproduce the remarks of the Bombay High Court in the case of *Khanderas Bajiras* (I. L. R. I, Bom. 10) and those of the Calcutta High Court in the case of

Ramchurn Ghose (20. W. R. 33) respectively, as showing the general lines on which the law regarding the respective powers of the Judge and jury, and the finality of verdicts, should be sympathetically handled, discussed, and settled:—"It is a well recognized principle that the Courts in England will not set aside the verdict of a jury, unless it be perverse and patently wrong, or may have been induced by an error of the Judge. We adhere generally to this principle, notwithstanding our large discretionary powers, first, on the constitutional ground of taking as little as possible out of the hands to which it has been primarily assigned by the Legislature, and secondly, because any undue interference may tend to diminish the sense of responsibility. Burke profoundly versed in the principle of the British Constitution said of juries—" I will make no man or set of men a complement of the constitution." In this country, we must never let our acquiescence grow into a betrayal of justice. When juries know that they are liable to the scrutiny and supervision of this court, they will feel the necessity of exercising conscientious deliberation in arriving at their verdict. The same check will prevent temptation to a wilfully wrong verdict from being held out to them." And " the (Calcutta) High Court will not interfere with the verdict of a Jury unless it be established in the clearest possible manner that they have wholly miscarried in their conclusions on the case. They are the constituted tribunal upon questions of fact, and it would be wholly destructive of that institution if the greatest possible confidence is not placed in them."

28. Such are the principal objections against the provisions of the Bill to amend the Criminal Procedure Code, 1882, now before the Supreme Legislative Council. The Sabha regrets that it has to disapprove of all the proposed amendments, excepting one viz., the proviso to the proposed sub-section 5 that " he (the Judge) shall not in any case inquire of the Jury their reason for the verdict " which should, in the humble opinion of the Sabha, be added to the present section 303 in order to settle the law once for all on the subject ; for the Judges of the High Courts have given varying judgments on the subject in several cases. e. g. cases of *Meahjan Shaikh* (20 W. R. 50);

Uday Chang (20 W. R. 73) &c. Moreover, the Sabha begs to recommend that :—

- (a) The misleading word "ordered", in the expression "unless otherwise ordered" in Section 303 be replaced by the word "Suggested" which is more consistent with the right of the Jury to give any one of three kinds of verdict in a Criminal Case ;
- (b) Sections 297, 298 and 367 should be amplified, and amended so as to make it obligatory on the Judge to make a written statement of the charge to the Jury by incorporating in them the substance of the observations such as those of Mr. Justice Phear cited herein above, para 15, which will greatly reduce the chances of wrong verdicts being given, and render any *special verdicts unnecessary even for the purpose of regulating the sentence* ;
- (c) And section 307 be recast so as to permit reference *only* where verdicts are patently wrong, and against the recorded evidence in order to secure reasonable finality to them.

While the above observations were made ready for the Press the proceedings of the Supreme Legislative Council which contained some discussion on the several amendments appeared in the papers, about the 22nd of February last, and the Committee of the Sabha was, accordingly, required to reconsider the whole subject. The Committee must, however, observe that even after a careful re-consideration, there was found no reason which called for any change in the statement of the views, and conclusions on the subject already made herein above.

29. As observed in the Welcome-address presented by the Sabha to His Excellency the Viceroy on the occasion of his visit to Poona in November last, juries all the world over do not always give verdicts which the Judges approve. But that circumstance has never been allowed to influence Government in restricting their freedom. The Committee of the Sabha trusts that this wise principle will be followed by Government in the present instance, and the efficiency, and utility of popular will, will not be allowed to be marred by making it unpleasant, or difficult for the Jurors to give an independent judgment, or by depriving their decisio-

of the finality which, as pointed out herein above, is one of the principal recommendations from a constitutional point of view. His Excellency the Viceroy in his reply to the Welcome-address above referred to was pleased to remark that Government was not committed to a particular view of the question, and that the law on this Subject would after discussion in the Legislative Council be put into a shape, which would meet the approval of the Sabha as well as the rest of the community. In conclusion, the Committee of the Sabha confidently hopes that Government would give up the idea of modifying the Jury System in the way now proposed, and be pleased to give effect to the few recommendations made by the Sabha herein above.

We have the honour to be,

Sir,

Your most obedient servants,

V. R. PATAVARDHAN,

Chairman.

V. R. JALNAPURKAR,

Honorary Secretary.

THE FIFTH PROVINCIAL CONTRACT.

This is the last year of the Fifth Provincial Contract, and the terms of the next Contract will be settled before the close of the current official year. It will, therefore, be not inopportune, at this time, to examine the working of the present Contract and see how far it has been beneficial or otherwise to the Bombay Government and what modifications are needed, in the interests of efficient Local administration, to be made in the scheme of Financial Decentralization introduced in 1871. The objects and purposes of this scheme as well as its history and growth have been fully explained in Mr. Justice Ranade's Note on the Decentralization of Provincial Finance published in this Journal. But the Note was published in 1894, when only the Revised Estimates of 1892-93 and Budget Estimates of 1893-94 were available. The learned writer of the Note could not, so far as the present Contract was concerned, therefore, do more than give a summary of the Resolution No. 1142 of the Government of India dated 17th March 1892, which forms the basis of the present Contract, together with a detailed analysis of the Budget figures of 1893-94. The Actuals of the first three years of the Contract and the Revised and the Budget Estimates of the last two years respectively are, however, now available; and it is proposed to review here the five years' working of the Contract, in the light of these figures, without repeating the information contained in Mr. Justice Ranade's Note. The classification of Revenue and Expenditure as between Imperial and Provincial under the current Contract follows for the most part that adopted under the last

N. B.—The figures are in thousands of rupees (three 0s being omitted), except where the sign Rs. is prefixed or otherwise specified.

Contract; and we do not intend to give here a detailed description of each head of revenue and expenditure and its distribution between Imperial and Provincial. The information will be found in the last chapter of Mr. Justice Ranade's Note. It is, however, necessary to state in what important respects the current Contract differs from the last. The first of these relates to the method of calculation in settling the Contract figures. The present Contract came into force on the 1st of April 1892 and the revised figures of 1891-92 were naturally taken as basis for the purposes of the current Contract. But unlike the previous Contract the Government of India did not communicate to the Government of Bombay the standard figures settled by itself under each head of Revenue and Expenditure. The Contract was said to be a whole and entire one for all the heads of Revenue and Expenditure and not a collection of separate contracts for each Provincial head. It will not, therefore, be possible to compare the receipts and charges under each head with the standard figures under that head as has been done in the case of the previous Contracts. We have, however, given the Actuals of 1891-92 in order to make it clear how far the revenue or expenditure under each head has increased or decreased as compared with these actuals, which, though not the recognised standard in this case, may yet serve as a useful guide in examining the growth of receipts and charges during the last five years. The other important changes in the current Contract as compared with the last, are as follows :—

- (1) Inter-provincial adjustments have been stopped.
- (2) Railway Police charges have been wholly provincialised.
- (3) The charges of the Inspector-General of Jails, Registration and Stamps and such members of his establishments as are not wholly entertained for one department have been transferred to the head of General Administration and made wholly

THE FIFTH PROVINCIAL CONTRACT.

3

Provincial, instead of being divided under the three heads of Jails, Registration and Stamps.

- (4) The Provincial Establishment of the Accountant General's office has been made Imperial.
- (5) The Payments in England on account of Stamps are converted at the official rate of Exchange.
- (6) Extraordinary items—Miscellaneous, not in excess of Rs. 10,000, have been made Provincial.

For the purposes of the consolidated Contract, the total normal expenditure under the heads now classified as Provincial was taken at Rs. 3,89,53,000 and the total Revenue at Rs. 3,12,39,000, a sum of Rs. 13,11,000, which under the old Contract would have been Provincial, having been resumed by the Imperial Government in the revision. The assignment required to produce the Financial equilibrium was accordingly fixed at Rs. 77,14,000 and it was arranged that this sum should be adjusted annually, as before, through the head of Land Revenue, along with such other minor items as may have to be adjusted under the same head every year. The fixed assignment under the fourth Contract was Rs. 81,87,000.

The following statements present the Actual Receipts and Expenditure for the first three years of the Contract, the Revised Estimates for 1895-96 and the Budget Estimates of 1896-97. The Actuals of 1891-92 are also given for facility of comparison :—

Comparative Statement shewing under each Major Head the Receipt figures, being the Actuals of 1891-92 and those of the first three years of the present Contract, the Revised of 1895-96 and the Budget Estimates of 1896-97. *The figures are in thousands of Rupees.*

Major Heads of Revenue.		Actuals. 1891-92.	Actuals. 1892-93.	Actuals. 1893-94.	Actuals. 1894-95.	Revised. 1895-96.	Budget. 1896-97.
I Land Revenue.	Provincial 1/4th share.	89,78	91,33	93,66	89,45	98,38	94,92.
	Alienated	89,98	97,47	96,85	96,13	96,59	95,78
	Fixed allotment and adjustments ...	92,44	77,55	77,20	71,34	82,87	76,46.
III Salt...	57	57	53	57	54	54	
IV Stamps.	40,86	42,98	41,55	43,57	45,90	45,90	
V Excise.	25,64	25,64	26,79	27,53	29,00	29,00	
VII Customs.	40	43	48	79	92	92	
VIII Assessed Taxes.	17,03	17,67	17,22	17,97	18,44	18,61	
IX Forest.	16,42	16,35	18,97	15,75	18,65	17,74	
X Registration	2,69	2,85	3,01	3,16	3,25	3,25	
XII Interest.	2,32	2,59	2,84	2,93	2,97	3,24	
XVIA Law and Justice—Courts of Law.	4,07	4,31	4,20	4,11	4,28	4,19	
XVIB Law and Justice—Jails.	2,19	2,02	2,14	1,74	1,77	1,79	
XVII Police..	3,90	5,13	4,26	4,27	4,30	4,19	
XVIII Marine.	69	66	63	69	66	66	

THE FIFTH PROVINCIAL CONTRACT.

XXIX	Education.	2,80	2,87	3,03	3,12	3,15	3,15
XX	Medical.	1,13	1,19	1,19	1,35	1,33	1,34
XXI	Scientific and other Minor Departments	33	28	27	24	26	29
XXII	Receipts in aid of Superannua- tion, &c.	2, 5	2,33	2,42	2,31	2,32	2,36
XXIII	Stationery and Printing	66	69	67	67	73	70
XXV	Miscellaneous	52	82	1,07	1,36	51	56
XXVI	State Railways	0	64	1,43	1,46	1,60	1,40
XXX	Irrigation	17	17	31	17	24	24
XXXII	Civil Works... ..	7,51	8,03	8,44	8,88	8,76	8,37
	Contributions from Local to Provincial	2,97	1,44	1,84	1,80	1,86	1,79
	Total... ..	*4,07,48	4,06,01	4,09,90	4,04,29	4,28,78	*1,17,39
	Opening Balance... ..	46,02	40,70	38,31	40,26	30,01	39,14
	Grand Total	4,53,50	4,46,71	4,48,21	4,44,55	4,58,79	4,56,53

* Includes 5 ; Post office (1) and Telegraph (4), heads which do not appear in subsequent years.

Comparative Statement showing under each Major Head the Expenditure figures, being the Actuals of 1891-92 and those of the first three years of the present Contract, the Revised of 1895-96 and the Budget Estimates of 1896-97. *The figures are in thousands of Rupees.*

Major Heads of Expenditure.	Actuals. 1891-92.	Actuals. 1892-93.	Actuals. 1893-04.	Actuals. 1894-95.	Revised. 1895-96.	Budget. 1896-97.
1. Refunds and Drawbacks. ...	1,87	2,16	2,05	2,03	1,87	1,83
2. Assignments & Compensations {						
Cash ...	14,53	14,88	14,62	14,34	15,98	15,86
Alienations ...	77,35	84,86	82,64	83,44	83,73	82,92
3. Land Revenue.. {						
Cash ...	56,03	57,86	56,42	56,96	55,94	57,07
Alienations ...	7,80	7,72	7,74	7,73	7,86	7,86
6. Stamps. ...	1,66	1,78	1,83	1,97	1,99	2,00
7. Excise. ...	87	84	87	86	89	90
10. Assessed Taxes. ...	26	25	27	27	26	27
11. Forest. ...	9,64	9,49	10,31	10,74	9,90	10,06
12. Registration. ...	1,50	1,39	1,44	1,44	1,45	1,49
13. Interest on Ordinary debt ...	1,79	2,05	2,19	2,28	2,43	2,65
15. Post Office. ...	1,07	1,05	1,03	1,03	1,01	1,03
18. General Administration. ...	13,62	13,68	13,77	14,59	14,28	14,68
19A. Law and Justice-Courts of Law. ...	43,95	43,73	45,09	46,02	46,80	46,68
19B. Law and Justice-Jails....	6,36	6,47	6,62	6,60	6,65	6,85

THE FIFTH PROVINCIAL CONTRACT.

20.	Police	{ Cash ...	48,42	46,42	46,78	51,09	52,41	53,08
		{ Alienations. ...	4,83	4,88	4,97	4,96	5,00	5,00
21.	Marine. ...		43	38	45	60	43	41
22.	Education. ...		16,36	16,42	16,73	16,72	18,00	20,09
24.	Medical. ...		13,28	14,22	15,17	15,48	15,61	16,45
25.	Political. ...		3,25	3,29	3,77	3,48	3,58	3,65
26.	Scientific and other							
	Minor Departments. ...		1,87	1,60	1,62	1,90	1,81	2,32
29.	Superannuation allowances							
	and Pensions ...		15,53	16,06	16,95	17,35	17,83	18,24
30.	Stationery and Printing. ...		5,84	7,08	7,30	7,73	7,27	7,80
32.	Miscellaneous. ...		3,61	2,54	1,99	2,10	2,00	1,94
33.	Famine Relief ...		2	4
37.	Construction of Railways. ...		11,72	4,22	77	59	17	45
38.	State Railways (working							
	expenses)	64	1,14	1,07	1,19	1,10
43.	Irrigation. ...		38	10	1,39	9	18	57
45.	Civil Works. ...		39,82	35,17	33,69	33,31	34,09	36,11
	Contributions from Provin-							
	cial to Local. ...		9,11	7,13	8,34	8,27	9,04	9,69
	Total. ...		*4,12,80	4,08,40	4,07,95	4,14,54	4,19,65	4,28,55
	Closing Balance. ...		40,70	38,31	40,26	30,01	39,14	27,98
	Grand Total. ...		4,53,50	4,46,71	4,48,21	4,44,55	4,58,79	4,56,53

THE FIVE PROVINCIAL CONTRACTS.

* Includes 3; Telegraph (4) and Miscellaneous Railway expenses (-1), heads not appearing in other years.

Any conclusions based upon the figures in these statements will have to be modified, according to the Actuals of the last two years when they will be available. But subject to these modifications we can now take a general review of the current Contract. It is already stated above that the Contract is considered to be a consolidated one; and we have in consequence only one standard figure on the revenue and the expenditure side, *viz.*, Rs. 3,89,53,000. Comparing with this figure the total Provincial income and expenditure of each year it will be found that both the revenue and expenditure have increased by several lakhs, but the increase in the expenditure being greater than the increase in the revenue, the Contract, if the Revised and the Budget Estimates for the last two years turn out to be tolerably correct, will, on the whole, prove unfavourable to the local Government by about 12½ lakhs. The opening balance for 1892-93 was Rs. 40,70,000; while the closing balance for 1896-97 is estimated to be Rs. 27,98,000. How this deficit is distributed over the different years may be seen from the following table which gives the excesses of revenue and expenditure of each year over the Contract figure settled by the Government of India for the purposes of the current Contract, *viz.*, Rs. 3,89,53,000. The figures are in thousands of rupees.

Excess over the Contract figure in

	Revenue.	Expenditure.	Surplus or Deficit.
Actuals 1892-93	+ 16,48	+ 18,87	-2,39
" 1893-94	+ 20,37	+ 18,43	+1,94
" 1894-95	+ 14,76	+ 25,01	-10,25
Revised 1895-96	+ 39,25	+ 30,12	+9,13
Budget 1896-97	+ 27,86	+ 39,02	-11,16
Total.	+1,18,72	+1,31,45	-12,73.

This shows that both the Revenue and Expenditure of the Presidency have been steadily growing during the last five

years; and that whereas the local Government received 1,18,72 more than the consolidated Contract figure of revenue, it spent 1,31,45 in excess of the standard expenditure, showing a deficit of 12,73 in five years. We must, however, deduct from these totals of revenue and expenditure the book adjustments on account of the alienated land revenue which appear under Alienations under Land Revenue on the Revenue side, and as Alienations under the major heads of Assignments, Land Revenue and Police on the Expenditure side. Taking the Actuals of 1891-92 as the standard these book adjustments will be found to be in excess of the corresponding figures in the Actuals of 1891-92 by 31,42 during the period of the current Contract. Deducting this sum from the above totals the net excess of revenue in five years amounts to 87,30 and the net excess of expenditure during the same period comes to about 1,00,00; or taking the average it will be found that the Bombay Government annually realised an income of about 17½ lakhs more than the Contract figure and spent nearly 20 lakhs in excess of the same, thus causing on an average a deficit of about 2½ lakhs per year. The details of this increase and decrease are discussed further on. Generally speaking it may be stated that the principal increase in Revenue is under the major heads of Land Revenue, Stamps, Excise, Registration, Forest and Assessed Taxes; while the chief increase in expenditure is under Police, Superannuation Allowances, General Administration, Education, Medical and Contributions. The Government of India levied a contribution of Rs. 5,60,000 in 1894-95, but restored it in the next year. There was consequently no deficit on that account; but another burden, and a far heavier one too, was imposed on the Provincial Finance by the Imperial Government, viz., that of Exchange Compensation Allowance which was unforeseen, and consequently not taken into account, at the time when the terms of the Contract and the Contract allotment were settled. This unforeseen charge amounted to 3,56 in 1893-94, 6,70 in 1894-95, 7,25 and 6,59 in the Revised and Budget Estimates

of 1895-96 and 1896-97; the total for the four years being 24,10 or about 24 lakhs. The Provincial Government was allowed no increase in the allotment for this unforeseen charge which abnormally swelled its expenditure, and but for which the Fifth Provincial Contract would have left a surplus of a little less than 12 lakhs instead of a deficit of 12,73. The Exchange Compensation Allowance is thus the *chief* cause of disturbing the equilibrium of the Provincial Finance during the period of the current Contract.

We shall now take up the principal major heads of the Provincial revenue and expenditure and examine the increases or decreases in revenue and expenditure under each of these heads. The most important of them is :—

Land Revenue.—The revenue under this head is made up of three minor heads : (1) The Provincial $\frac{1}{4}$ th share ; (2) Alienated revenue ; and (3) Fixed allotment and adjustments. Of these three the *second* sub-head, which is entirely Provincial, is merely nominal. It represents book adjustments which have to be made on account of land revenue alienated to Inamdars, Vatandars and other landholders and village servants. Credit is taken for such revenue on the Revenue side and the corresponding charges are shown as Alienations under Police, Land Revenue and Assignments. There has been a steady increase in revenue and expenditure under this head ; and this is said to be due chiefly to the Revised Survey Settlements by which the revenue of these alienated holdings was increased in the several Districts of the Presidency. The remeasurement of Bakar Khairat lands in Sind caused a portion of increase in 1892-93, while the decrease in 1893-94 is explained as due to the survey of the holding of the jahagirdars in Sind under which assessments have been fixed only on land fit for cultivation, whereas before 1893-94 it was fixed on all lands. All these, however, are book adjustments, that is, credits counterbalanced by *per contra* charges on the expenditure side. Simply stated it means that the value of the lands held by Inamdars

and others has naturally increased by the introduction of the revised rates of assessment; and as alienations of revenue are shown in accounts by book adjustments only, this improvement in the value of the alienated holdings served to swell the totals on both the sides. Under the *third* sub-head of *Fixed Allotment and Adjustments* there is not much that calls for remark. The allotment under the present Contract was fixed at 77,14 that is nearly 4½ lakhs less than what it was under the previous Contract. This decrease in the allotment and the absence of large adjustments on account of the value of rails for the Hyderabad-Umarkot Railway and other purposes, which were made in 1891-92, caused a large falling off under this sub-head in 1892-93 as compared with the Actuals of 1891-92, the last year of the previous Contract. There is also a marked decrease under this head in 1894-95 followed by a large increase in the next year. This is due to the levy of a contribution of 5,60 by the Imperial Government in the first and the restoration of the same in the next year. Other fluctuations are due to several minor contributions from and to the Imperial during the period of the Contract. The most important of these are charges in connection of the survey of the river Indus (amounting in all to 91), for the preparation of price current (32), for the provincialization of His Excellency the Governor's band (16 per year), for arming the Guzerat agency Police (13), and for half the cost of the Dekkan Agriculturists Relief Act Commission (25). These represented transfers from Imperial to Provincial, but they were counterbalanced by similar contributions from Provincial to Imperial in connection with the charges of the North-Western Railway Police transferred to the control of the Punjab Government in 1894 representing a charge of 37 per year, the closing of the Military Secretariat in 1895, contributions for Satara water supply project (19), and to the interests on the value of Rails for the Hyderabad-Umarkot Railway (nearly 10 per year). All these adjustments are made under the Land Revenue head by increasing or decreasing

the amount due on account of the fixed allotment, and this causes temporary fluctuations in the amount under the third sub-head.

The *first* sub-head, *viz.* of the *Provincial ¼th share* of Land Revenue is, therefore, the only sub-head that really represents the permanent increase in the land revenue of the Province. It comprises (a) Ordinary fixed revenue, in which variations are caused by Revised rates of assessment, postponement of demands, recovery of arrears, or extension of cultivation; (b) Revenue from canals in Sind, which is subject to rather violent fluctuations in consequence of favourable or unfavourable inundation of the Indus river; (c) Fluctuating collections from sale of occupancy rights, rents, tree-tax, grass and grazing &c.; and (d) Miscellaneous, such as revenue record room receipts, Revenue fines &c. The following table gives the total (Imperial and Provincial) revenue realised under each of these heads:—

Divisible Land Revenue.	Actuals 1891-92.	Actuals 1892-93	Actuals 1893-94.	Actuals 1894-95.	Revised 1895-96.	Budget 1896-97.
(a) Ordinary fixed revenue ...	2,93,44	2,98,67	3,01,77	2,88,72	3,17,24	3,09,31
(b) Revenue from Canals in Sind ...	48,42	50,53	55,24	53,02	59,00	53,31
(c) Fluctuating collection. ...	16,08	14,90	16,37	14,88	16,07	15,89
(d) Miscellaneous ...	1,19	1,21	1,28	1,18	1,20	1,20
Total Divisible...	3,59,13	3,65,31	3,74,66	3,57,80	3,93,51	3,79,71
Provincial ¼th share...	89,78	91,33	93,66	89,45	98,33	94,92
Increase or decrease over 1891-92 ...		+155	+3,88	-33	+8,60	+5,14

The total increase in the Provincial $\frac{1}{4}$ share in five years is 18,84, or on an average about $3\frac{1}{2}$ lakhs per year, of which 12,13 is under (a) Ordinary fixed revenue in the above table. Roughly speaking we might say that the increase in the Provincial share of the Ordinary fixed revenue, under head (a) in the above table, is on an average $2\frac{1}{2}$ lakhs per year. What portion of this increase in the Ordinary fixed land revenue is due to revision of settlement is not separately shown in the Budget Estimates, but there are reasons to hold that out of the total revenue (Imperial and Provincial) under the head of Ordinary land revenue, about 3 to 4 lakhs per year are due to the introduction of the revised rates of assessment, which means that out of the total average annual increase in the Provincial share of the Land Revenue of the Presidency about one lakh is due to the revision of survey settlements, in the various Districts in the Presidency such as, Poona, Khandesh, Broach, Sikarpur &c. This does not however exhaust the whole increase due to the revised rates of assessments, for these rates are still to be introduced in some Talukas, while in others though already introduced they are not yet levied in full. It is quite probable therefore that for some years to come the Provincial share of the ordinary fixed revenue will go on increasing by about 1 or $1\frac{1}{2}$ lakhs per year. The abnormal decrease under (a) in 1894-95 is due to postponements of the collections of Land Revenue caused by late and poor crops in Ahmedabad, Broach and Surat Districts; and by change in the date of instalment by which close upon 13 lakhs (of which $\frac{1}{4} = 4\frac{1}{4}$ lakhs represent the Provincial share) were not collected until after the close of the year, thereby causing a correspondingly large increase in the receipts under this head in 1895-96. The variations under (b) are, as stated above, chiefly due to the nature of the inundations in Sind, or low condition of the Indus river, which causes contraction or extension of cultivation. The receipts under (c) are, in their nature, fluctuating and those under (d) shew no great variations. Again the two

latter form a small portion of the total divisible Land Revenue. Generally speaking if we, therefore, except these causes of temporary annual fluctuations, the improvement in the Provincial $\frac{1}{4}$ share of Land Revenue amounts on an average to nearly 3 $\frac{1}{2}$ lakhs per year, of which a third part at least is due to the Revision Survey Settlements introduced in the various parts of the Presidency; and considering the fact that full revised rates are not yet realised and that high limits fixed by the Survey Department are still to be reached, a large continued increase of revenue from this source might be safely expected for some years to come.

The Provincial *expenditure* under Land Revenue head includes the charges of (a) the District administration, (b) Survey and Settlement Department, (c) Land Records and Agriculture and (d) Allowances to District and Village officers. These charges are made up of cash and alienations in the proportion stated in the general table on page 6. The increase in alienations is small and is, as explained already, due to revised assessment. How these charges have been growing will be seen from the following table:—

Minor heads.	Actuals. 1891-92.	Actuals. 1892-93.	Actuals. 1893-94.	Actuals. 1894-95.	Revised. 1895-96.	Budget. 1896-97.
(a) Charges of District Administration.	29,10	29,20	28,64	28,84	28,73	28,82
(b) Survey and Settlement Department	7,78	7,05	5,82	5,26	4,96	4,97
(c) Land Records and Agriculture.	75	1,13	3,20	3,34	3,49	3,64
(d) Allowances to District and Village officers.	26,20	28,20	26,50	27,25	26,62	27,50
Total	63,83	65,58	64,16	64,69	63,80	64,93

The first thing that would strike any one in the above figures is the gradual decrease in the charges of the Survey and Settlement Department and the corresponding growth of expenditure on Land Records and Agriculture; so much so that the totals of the charges on account of both these Departments for 1891-92 and 1895-96 differ only by about 8 thousand rupees.* It was on this account, that the amalgamation of the appointment of the Survey and Settlement Commissioner with that of the Director of the Land Records and Agriculture carried out in 1893-94 showed no perceptible decrease in the total expenditure under this major head. In other words the reorganisation of the Department of Land Records and Agriculture, necessitating an extension of Agricultural staff in the various Districts, swallows up all the saving caused by the gradual reduction in the establishment of the Survey and Settlement Department. With reference to Land Records and Agriculture it should be further noted that in 1894-95 a sum of 1,56 representing charges on account of Circle Inspectors' staff was transferred from the first sub-head

* The charges of the Survey and Settlement Department include the expenditure of the resurvey of the Indus river, which is paid by the Government of India; and it is said that we deduct this expense from the charges of the Survey Department and then compare the totals as above, the result would shew a saving. Now the expenditure on account of the resurvey of the Indus river amounted to 14 in 1892-93, 32 in 1893-94, 33 in 1894-95 and 12 in the revised estimate of 1895-96. If we deduct these figures from the charges of the Survey Department for the corresponding years and then compare the totals as above, it will be found that the total charges for the two departments amount to 8,33 in 1895-96 as against 8,04 in 1892-93, shewing an increase of 29 instead of a saving, small as it is, of 8 as stated above. Any how it is clear that the statement about the growth of Land Records *pari passu* with the gradual abolition of the Survey Department, made above, requires little modification, even if we deduct the Indus river survey charges from the total expenditure on the Survey Department.

to Land Records. Similarly all charges on account of village accountants and village servants useful to Government were transferred, with effect from 1893-94, from the 4th to the 3rd sub-head in 1895. But the latter variations have not been shown in the above table in order to bring into prominence the full growth of the Department of Land Records. These variations are mere transfers from one sub-head of charge to another and represent no new expenditure incurred. If we, however, take into account these transfers of charges from one sub-head to another the expenditure on Land Records will swell to 16,55 in 1893-94, 17,12 in 1894-95, 16,09 in 1895-96, and 17,12 in 1896-97 causing a corresponding reduction under the 4th sub-head. *Allowances to District and Village officers*, which is the fourth sub-head in the above table, comprise payments to Patels, Kulkarnis and other village servants and the main cause of decrease and increase in them is large payment of arrears (as in 1892-93) or the postponements of payments to the District and Village officers. As regards the charges on account of the *District administration*, the first sub-head of charge, they show no increase inspite of the fact that the charges, as shown above, include over a lakh of rupees on account of the Exchange Compensation Allowances. It should be remembered, however, that a sum of nearly $1\frac{1}{2}$ lakh was transferred, as stated above, from this head to Land Records in 1895-96. There was a proposal of converting 2 Collectorates and 1 Deputy Commissionership in Sind into 3 Collectorates, but the idea was given up for financial difficulties. The Budget of 1896-97, however, makes a provision of Rs. 5,000 for the appointment of additional Deputy Collectors under the Provincial Service scheme. The charges on account of *Pat-Pahani* establishment are also included under this head. Small savings have been effected in charge on account of supplies services and contingencies.

Excise.—This is the next head of revenue that shows a large increase during the period of the current Contract, while

the Provincial Expenditure under it is nearly constant. As compared with the Actuals of 1891-92 the average increase in the Provincial revenue is 1,93 per year, or about 9½ lakhs during the five years. On the other hand the average expenditure is very nearly the same as it was in the last year of the previous Contract. If we compare the Actuals of 1891-92 with the Revised estimates of 1895-96 it will be found that the increase in the Provincial Revenue amounts to about 3½ lakhs. The following table shows the total Imperial as well as Provincial revenue from Excise under the different sub-heads.

Names of sub-head.	Actuals 1891-92.	Actuals 1892-93.	Actuals 1893-94.	Actuals 1894-95.	Revised 1895-96	Budget 1896-97.
1. License and Distillery fees and Duties for the sale of Liquors and Drugs....	90,49	90,97	95,46	98,17	1,03,58	1,03,57
2. Transit duty on Excise opium ...	10,76	10,50	10,60	10,59	11,00	11,00
3. Gain on sale proceeds of Excise opium ...	39	25	28	38	48	48
4. Duty on Ganja ...	4	5	5	4	5	5
5. Fines &c., and Miscellaneous.....	87	80	78	90	94	90
Total Prov. and Imp...	1,02,55	1,02,57	1,07,17	1,10,08	1,16,00	1,16,00
Provincial ½ share ...	25,64	25,64	26,79	27,52	29,00	29,00

It will be at once seen from this table that the increase in the revenue is mainly under the first sub-head. The receipts comprise License and other fees on foreign liquor and opium but chiefly on country liquor and toddy. When the Budget for 1892-93 was prepared it was apprehended that the abolition of the condition in the license penalising the farmers for the sales of opium below a fixed minimum, the gradual abolition of the competition system with regard to the Abkari Contracts and other changes, and the necessity of remissions in

Khandesh and other Districts would lead to a decline in the receipts under this major head ; but this expectation was not realised owing to unexpectedly large receipts from still-head duty and license fees on liquor and toddy. A part of the increase is also due to the larger issue of spirits from the distilleries in good seasons, which, in other words, means some increased consumption of liquor. The receipts for 1892-93 under the first sub-head do not show any perceptible increase owing to a remission of 1½ lakh having been granted during the year to the country-spirit farmer in the Khandesh District on account of large deficiency payments made by him in the previous three years. The contractor was not paid in cash but was allowed to remove liquor free of duty to the amount stated. The consumption of liquor was slightly reduced in 1893-94 owing to the closing of the shops in Bombay during the late riots and to the Temperance movement in Kolaba which, however, collapsed after four months. The figures of the increase in the consumption of country-liquor given in the annual reports of the Abkari Department show that the total number of gallons of country liquor issued from the distilleries was 2,631,638, in 1894-95 as against 2,457,541 in 1891-92, shewing an increase of 5 or ½ dram per head of population. There are no large fluctuations in the expenditure under this head. The slight increase in 1893-94 is said to be due to improved preventive arrangements and that in 1895-96 is attributed to the grant to village officers of some of the Districts of the Southern Division of remuneration for the collection of tree-tapping fees. It is said that the revenue under this head is not likely to show the same progressive increase that it has done hitherto, but the fears do not appear to be based upon any reliable grounds.

Stamps.—This is the third sub-head of rapidly increasing revenue. The Provincial share of the revenue has increased from 40,86 in 1891-92 to 45,00 in 1896-97. If we take the whole period of the Contract, the increase in the Provincial share is 16 lakhs as compared with the Actuals of 1891-92.

This improvement is chiefly due to an increase in the receipts from the sale of Court Fee Stamps, as may be seen from the following table :—

Names of sub-head.	Actuals 1891-92.	Actuals 1892-93.	Actuals 1893-94.	Actuals 1894-95.	Revised 1895-96.	Budget 1896-97.
1 Sale of General Stamps. ...	19,15	19,66	19,72	20,05	21,20	21,20
2. Do. of Court Fee Stamps ...	30,35	32,22	30,80	32,51	34,54	34,54
3. Duty on Impressing documents ...	4,38	4,87	5,20	5,31	5,30	5,30
4. Fines and penalties.	12	13	13	13	13	13
5. Miscellaneous ...	3	43	6	9	3	3
Total (Imperial and Provincial). ...	54,48	57,31	55,92	58,09	61,20	61,20
Provincial $\frac{1}{4}$ share...	40,86	42,98	41,95	43,57	45,90	45,90

The increase under Miscellaneous in 1892-93 is on account of composition of Stamp Duty on Bombay and Karachi Port Trust bonds. The death of a Bombay millionaire in 1892-93, of three wealthy gentlemen in 1894-95 and of two more in 1895-96 caused an increase in those years under the 2nd sub-head on account of Probate duty on the estates of these gentlemen. There has also been an improvement in the receipts from duty on impressing documents since 1893-94.

The *Expenditure* under this head is also gradually increasing. Part of it is due to the change in the method of calculating the cost of Stamp paper issued for sale by which sterling value is converted at the official rate of exchange instead of, as formerly, at 2s. per rupee. The increased sale of stamps also caused a corresponding increase in the charges of Stamp paper issued and in the amount of commission on sales of general and Court Fee stamps. This increase in the charges was partly counterbalanced by the transfer of a portion of the

salary of the Inspector-General of Jails, Registration and Stamps, previously debited to this head, to the head of General Administration.

Assessed Taxes.—The revenue under this head is progressive. From 17,03 in 1891-92 it has gone up to 18,61 in the Budget estimate of 1896-97, shewing a total increase of 4,67 in five years. The increase is mainly due to larger receipts from the tax on salaries, payments by Government on account of which were swelled by the Exchange Compensation Allowances. The following statement shows the increase in the total Provincial revenue, which is $\frac{1}{2}$ of the total realisations under all minor heads except tax on surplus profits of Railway Companies, which is an entirely Imperial sub-head.

Names of sub-head.	Actuals 1891-92.	Actuals 1892-93.	Actuals 1893-94.	Actuals 1894-95.	Revised 1895-96.	Budget 1896-97.
1. Salaries and Pensions ...	3,51	3,56	3,79	3,99	4,10	4,11
2. Profits of Companies ...	1,39	1,73	1,53	1,31	1,50	1,60
3. Interest on Securities ...	97	1,01	1,07	1,21	1,13	1,16
4. Other sources of Income ...	11,15	11,36	10,82	11,43	11,70	11,73
5. Other items ...	1	1	1	1	1	1
Total Provincial ...	17,03	17,67	17,22	17,97	18,44	19,81

The increase in the 1st head has already been explained. The decrease under the 2nd sub-head from 1893-94 is attributed to a falling off in the income liable to taxation under that head due to the stagnation of trade caused by the disturbance in exchange and the accumulation of surplus stock of yarn in China. The increase under the 3rd sub-head in 1894-95 is due to larger collections in connection with the tax on securities owing

to the anticipation interest paid in advance on the conversion of 4 per cent. loan into 3½ per cent. The income under the 4th sub-head shows a decrease in 1893-94 but in subsequent years goes on steadily increasing probably owing to "stricter scrutiny and care in assessment." The slight increase in the expenditure does not call for any remark.

Registration.—This is another head of steadily expansive revenue. The increase is due chiefly to larger collections on account of fees for registering documents. The total revenue, that is, Provincial as well as Imperial, under this sub-head gradually increased from 5.18 to 6.30 in the Revised Estimate of 1895-96, and half of this increase is Provincial. The total increase in the Provincial revenue in five years

over the Actuals of 1891-92 is a little over 2 lakhs or on an average 40 thousand rupees a year. The expenditure under this head shows a falling off in 1892-93 owing to the transfer of charges on account of the Inspector General of Jails, Registration and Stamps to General Administration. The subsequent increase is due to an increase in the commissions to the Sub-Registrars and village Registrars arising out of *per contra* increase in the revenue. The estimated expenditure in 1896-97 is further increased on account of the proposed new opening of Registering offices and to the transfer to this head, from the Public Works Budget, of the charges for minor works.

Customs.—The revenue under this head shows an unusual increase from 1893-94. The total increase for 5 years is 1.54, or an average of about 31 thousands a year. The better results were due chiefly to larger receipts in 1893-94 from transhipment fees owing to the re-export of Kerosine oil to foreign ports being greater in 1893-94 than in 1892-93 and to these fees being then levied on all goods liable to duty under the new customs' Tariff Act. The revenue under Customs is mostly Imperial and hence the larger receipts on account of the Tariff

Act are not all brought under Provincial revenue. The Warehouse and wharfage-rents and Miscellaneous are the only two Provincial sub-heads. All the expenditure under this head is Imperial.

Forest.—Under this head the revenue and the expenditure are equally shared between Imperial and Provincial; and there has been a steady increase both in revenue and expenditure. The total increase in the Provincial share during 5 years is 8,36 while the total increase in expenditure is about 1,92 thus showing an average net annual increase of little over 1½ lakh. The following table gives the increase under the various sub-heads :—

Sub-head.	Actuals 1891-92.	Actuals 1892-93.	Actuals 1893-94.	Actuals 1894-95.	Revised 1895-96.	Budget 1896-97.
1. Timber and other produce removed from the Forests by Government agency ...	16,01	16,11	18,60	17,52	15,16	12,85
2. Timber and other produce removed from the Forests by Consumers or Purchasers ...	15,57	15,37	17,88	18,95	21,10	21,55
3. Confiscated drift and waif wood ...	12	11	10	8	6	7
4. Revenue from Forests not managed by Government ...	27	29	62	24	23	24
5. Miscellaneous ...	88	82	74	71	75	76
Total (Imperial and Provincial)...	32,85	32,70	37,94	37,50	37,30	35,47
Provincial ½ share...	16,42	16,35	18,97	18,75	18,65	17,74

Taking up the last three minor heads first, it will be found that there are not large fluctuations in them except under the 4th head in 1893-94. This is said to be due to the sale of the Government share of trees standing in an Inam Forest, which is not a recurring item. The real increase is under the first two sub-heads which must be taken together inasmuch as Government agency has been recently discontinued in Sind and the produce sold to contractors which causes a decrease under the 1st and a corresponding increase under the 2nd sub-head from 1894-95. The total income from these two sub-heads rose from 31,58 in 1891-92 to 36,26 in the Revised Estimates of 1895-96 and 34,40 in the Budget of 1896-97. The sudden rise in 1893-94 was due to better receipts under the first two sub-heads in all Circles, but specially to a greater demand for forest produce and higher prices obtained in consequence in the Southern circle and to higher sale proceeds of conpes in Thana. The yearly fluctuations are due to the variations in the quantity of the Forest produce sold and the demand for such produce in the market. It should, however, be borne in mind that in spite of these fluctuations the revenue is, on an average, steadily increasing. The following table gives the details under the 1st sub-head in the above table:—

I. Timber &c. removed by Government Agency.

Names of minor sub-head.	Actuals 1891-92.	Actuals 1892-93.	Actuals 1893-94	Actuals 1894-95.	Revised 1895-96.	Budget 1896-97.
(a) Timber ...	6,10	7,45	9,40	9,02	9,36	8,33
(b) Fire wood and Charcoal ...	8,15	7,30	7,51	7,36	4,89	3,07
(c) Bamboos
(d) Sandalwood ...	9	17	20	23	14	19
(e) Grass and other minor produce ...	1,67	1,19	1,43	91	77	1,26
Total (Imperial and Provincial) ...	16,01	16,11	18,60	17,52	15,16	12,85

The decrease from 1894-95 in the total revenue under the 1st sub-head is, as explained above, merely nominal. The forest produce, specially timber and firewood was sold to the North-Western and the Southern Mahratta Railway for sleepers, fuel &c.; and this demand which was one of the causes for a sudden rise in the receipts in 1893-94 did not remain constant; and joined with other causes, it produced a decrease in subsequent years. Under the 4th sub-head myrobolams are included and the crop and the prices show sometimes large variations. Under the sub-head "Timber and other produce removed from the forests by Consumers or Purchasers" there are similar minor heads the revenue from which is shown below:—

II. Timber &c. removed by Consumers and Purchasers.

Names of minor sub-head.	Actuals 1891-92.	Actuals 1892-93.	Actuals 1893-94.	Actuals 1894-95.	Revised 1895-96.	Budget. 1896-97.
(a) Timber ...	6,29	6,37	8,57	9,23	10,68	10,32
(b) Fire-wood and charcoal ...	1,57	1,65	1,46	1,85	2,29	3,17
(c) Bomboos ...	98	1,02	1,22	1,11	1,15	1,18
(d) Grazing and fodder grass ...	5,87	5,57	5,64	5,87	5,85	5,92
(e) Other minor produce ...	86	76	99	89	1,13	96
Total (Provincial and Imperial) ...	15,57	15,37	17,88	18,95	21,10	21,55

The increase under (a) from 1894-95 is due to the cause stated above. Under (d) are included receipts from grazing fees for which separate figures are not given in the Budget. But from the departmental reports the income from grazing for every departmental year which ends with June, seems to be about 4,00 in 1892-93, 4,18 and 4,29 for 1893-94 and

1894-95; of which nearly 60 per cent. is from the Central Division. This shows that most of the increase under (a) is due to this cause. The revenue from grazing in the Central Division has increased from 1,80 in 1892-93 to 2,65 in 1894-95.

The expenditure under Forest is also increasing. It is divided under two sub-heads, (1) Conservancy and (2) Establishment; and the figures under the different heads are as follows:—

Names of sub-head.	Actuals 1891-92.	Actuals 1892-93.	Actuals 1893-94.	Actuals 1894-95.	Revised 1895-96.	Budget 1896-97.
(1) Conservancy ...	10,83	10,10	11,33	10,96	10,03	10,19
(2) Establishment ...	8,44	8,88	9,30	9,72	9,77	9,94
Total (Imperial and Provincial) ...	19,27	18,98	20,63	20,68	19,80	20,13

Half of this expenditure is Provincial. The decrease under the first head in 1892-93 is due to the curtailment of operations and that in 1894-95 and subsequent years is caused by a change in the system in Sind of causing the forest produce to be removed by contractors instead of by Government agency, which, though it reduced the gross receipts, caused more than a corresponding increase in the net profits. The expenditure under this sub-head again depends on the abundance of crop and the quantity of Forest produce removed by the Government Agency during the year; while the charges under the 2nd sub-head, Establishment, are of a permanent nature. They show an increase in 1892-93 owing to the increased expenditure in connection with the reorganisation of the superior staff for the Forest Department of the Presidency according to the scheme sanctioned by the Secretary of State for India.

producing on the whole an increase of about 62 thousand rupees a year. In 1893-94 an additional Extra Assistant Conservator was appointed in the Southern Division and the Northern circle was split up into two Divisions in 1892-93. The Exchange Compensation Allowance granted to the officers in this Department explains the rest of the increase under this sub-head. The charge on this account varies from 19 to 22 thousands per year.

We have examined the important revenue heads. *Salt* does not show any large increase and the same is the case with some other heads. We shall now take up the important heads of expenditure and see how the revenue has been spent. The expenditure under some of these heads has been already examined above along with the revenue under those heads. Of the remaining heads of expenditure we shall first take up :—

Refunds and Drawbacks.—The expenditure under this head shews a steady increase over the Actuals of 1891-92 for the first three years ; but has again gone down to the old figure in the Revised of 1895-96 and in the Budget Estimates for 1896-97. To this head are debited sums refunded under various revenue heads, the most important of which are Land Revenue, Stamps, Excise ; and the refunds generally vary with the magnitude of the transactions of the year under the corresponding revenue head. There are, however, special causes which swell the figures of refund in different years. Thus the large increase in 1892-93 over the Actuals of 1891-92 is under the head Stamps and is due to the refund to the Bombay Port Trust of the composition of Stamp duty on the Prince's Dock Loan. There was also a special refund of income-tax recovered from the employees of the G. I. P. Railway residing in the Berars. There were no such special refunds in 1893-94, but the refunds under Land Revenue and Excise were proportionately higher. Still the expenditure under this head in 1893-94 is 11 less than in the preceding. In 1895-96 the

Excise refunds are expected to show a decrease and hence the Revised Estimate is lower than the Actuals of the preceding year. The decline in 1896-97 is due to the same cause.

Assignments and Compensations.—Assignments are subdivided into Cash and Alienations, and comprise payments to Inamdars and other grantees of revenue such as District and Village officers. They also include payments on account of charitable and religious allowances, Varshasans and Devashtans. There are no large fluctuations under this sub-head except in 1892-93. The large increase in this year was due to an increase in the adjustment of alienated Land Revenue in Shikarpur as explained above under Land Revenue and the decrease next year is due to the same cause. In 1895-96 there is a large expenditure due to payment of arrears to certain Inamdars and to the chiefs of Bhor and Vishalgad. Under Compensations, which are all in cash, there was a large increase in 1892-93 owing to the arrears, from 1878, of opium Compensation being paid to the Palanpur Darbar. Provincial expenditure under this sub-head principally consists of Salt, Opium and Excise compensations granted to the various Native States; the revenue, being credited to the corresponding heads. The renewal of Abkari leases in the Native States involved some increased expenditure in 1894-95 and in the subsequent years.

Police.—The revenue under this head, which is wholly Provincial, shows a large increase in 1892-93. This increase was due to the payment by the Bombay Port Trust of the arrears of the moiety of the Dock and Harbour Police charges; and to a large adjustment of the value of muskets returned to the Military Department in connection with the re-arming of the mofussil and Agency Police with new weapons. There are no other variations that require any explanation. The receipts mainly consist of contributions from Municipal and Cantonment funds, cash receipts under the Arms Act, fees, fines &c. and are steadily increasing :—

Under expenditure there is a large increase during the period of the Contract. The Expenditure is divided under Cash and Alienations, and if we take the cash figures alone it will be found that the total increase over the Actuals of 1891-92 is little over 16½ lakhs during the period of the Contract. But this does not give a correct idea of the large increase in expenditure under this head, first because the contributions from the Bombay Municipality are taken in reduction of the Presidency Police charges, which in consequence show a nominal falling off, and secondly because the charges in 1891-92 were swelled on account of heavy expenditure on clothing supplied to the District Police, on arms and ammunition and on buildings for the Palanpur Agency Police, charges which were not of a recurring nature. We must, therefore, examine each minor head separately in order to ascertain the real growth of expenditure under this head. The following table gives the total charges (Cash and Alienations) under the different sub-heads :—

Names of sub-head.	Actuals 1891-92.	Actuals 1892-93.	Actuals 1893-94.	Actuals 1894-95.	Revised 1895-96.	Budget. 1896-97.
1. Presidency Police...	3,35	2,29	3,08	4,30	3,78	2,41
2. Superintendence ...	57	60	65	85	88	88
3. District Executive Force ...	33,51	31,00	31,91	36,26	38,20	39,62
4. Municipal and Can- tonment Police ...	40	39	39	43	43	46
5. Village Police ...	8,62	9,21	8,80	8,98	8,85	9,10
6. Special Police ...	6,11	6,00	5,95	4,41	4,44	4,75
7. Railway Police ...	67	1,21	96	81	81	85
8. Refunds ...	2	1	1	2	1
Total...	53,25	51,30	51,75	56,05	57,41	58,08

It will be seen from the above table that the expenditure begins to grow from 1894-95 when the Police reorganisation schemes were carried out at an annual cost of about

4½ lakhs for the mofussil Police and 1 lakh for the Presidency Police. In the above table the expenditure under Presidency Police shows irregularly large increases and decreases. They are due to the non-payment of the full contribution by the Bombay Municipality owing to a dispute regarding its liability to pay $\frac{2}{3}$ of the charges of the whole of the City Police. We cannot therefore get a correct figure of the increased expenditure under this sub-head without taking into account the contributions from the Bom-

Municipal contributions.

1891-92 ...	2,69
1892-93 ...	3,74
1893-94 ...	3,41
1894-95 ...	3,84
1895-96 ...	5,10
1896-97 ...	6,42

bay Municipality, which, exclusive of the contribution towards Public Land Conveyance charges, are shown in the margin. It was in August 1893 that Government sanctioned an increase in the Bombay City Police force at a cost of about 1 lakh of rupees and directed that the Municipality should pay $\frac{2}{3}$ of the

charges of the City Police from the date of the introduction of the scheme for increasing the force, that is, 1st September 1893. The Municipality protested against this decision and the matter was finally settled in December 1895. By this decision, the amount of the Municipal contribution was considerably reduced by a recasting of the divisible share of the charges, retrospectively from 1st April 1892. Certain items previously included in the calculations were now omitted from it and the Municipality, which, pending the decision of the matter, had not paid the increased contribution, was asked to pay all arrears according to the reduced scale. These payments will be made in the current year and as usual they are brought to account by deduction from charges under the head of Presidency Police. The falling off in expenditure in 1896-97 under the 1st sub-head is therefore merely nominal. If we do not exclude the Municipal contributions the Budget Estimate of the expenditure for 1896-97 on the Presidency Police will be found 8,04, as against 6,64 in the Actuals of 1891-92. About

20 thousands of this increase is due to Exchange Compensation.

The next sub-head of large increase is the District Executive Force. The expenditure under this head in 1891-92 was exceptionally large for special reasons noticed above. It was reduced to its normal level in the next two years ; but in 1894-95 it increased owing to the reorganisation of the District Police Force according to the scheme sanctioned by Government in February 1894 at a cost of about 44 lakhs for the Presidency including Sind. The scheme was not fully carried out in 1894-95 and this accounts for the increase of expenditure in the two subsequent years. The object of the scheme was to secure better men by rearranging the lower grades of the service and by offering better pay to them rather than to increase the numerical strength of the Force. Under this scheme the Bhil Corps was absorbed into the Regular Force from 1894-95. The following few details will give some idea of the nature of the scheme and the increases in expenditure caused by it.

In 1893-94 the sanctioned strength of the District Police Force was 22 Superintendents, (on salaries ranging from Rs. 1000, to 500 per month each); 5 Assistant Superintendents (Rs. 400-300); 10 Probationers (Rs. 250-200); 54 Inspectors and Sub-Inspectors (Rs. 250-75); 6 Court Prosecutors (Rs. 100); 274 Chief Constables (Rs. 95-25); 2,596 Head Constables (Rs. 30-11); 13,113 Constables (Rs. 14-6); 6 European Constables (Rs. 90-80); and 1,196 Mounted Police (Rs. 70-14). Besides this there was the Bhil Corps establishment of 8 Chief Constables, 10 Jamadars, 54 Hawaldars, 98 Naiks, 1,097 Privates, 5 Buglers and 26 Recruit boys, costing about 1 lakh and 27 thousands a year. In 1896-97 the sanctioned strength of the Regular Force is 23 Superintendents, (salary as before); 9 Assistant Superintendents (Rs. 400-350-300); 3 Probationers (Rs. 250); 58 Inspectors and Sub-Inspectors (Rs. 250-50); 6 Court Prosecutors (Rs. 100); 270 Chief

Constables (Rs. 100-35); 3,200 Head Constables (Rs. 35-12); 13,753 Constables (Rs. 14-7); 10 European Constables (4 in Poona, at Rs. 100 per month); and 1,194 Mounted Police (Rs. 80-24). There is now no special Bhil Corps. As regards Establishment there were 198 clerks and 104 servants in 1893-94 as against 284 clerks and 12 servants in 1896-97. The increase in expenditure caused by these changes will be seen from the following table :—

Sub-head of Charge.	Actuals 1893-94.	Actuals 1894-95.	Revised 1895-96.	Budget 1896-97.
1. Salaries of Superintendents, Assistant Superintendents and Inspectors	3,28	3,27	3,19	3,36
(a) Exchange Compensation...	19	36	37	34
2. European Constables	6	7	8	12
3. Court Prosecutors	6	7	7	7
4. Chief Constables	1,94	2,15	2,18	2,28
5. Head Constables	4,41	5,73	5,89	6,03
6. Constables	12,43	14,15	15,00	15,30
7. Mounted Police	3,45	3,43	4,00	3,90
8. Establishment—Clerks &c....	78	70	93	98
9. Bhil Corps	1,27	1
Total...	27,87	29,94	31,71	32,43

The decrease under the 1st sub-head in 1895-96 is due to the rearrangement of grades of Assistant Superintendents and decrease in the number of Probationers. The charge of one thousand for Bhil Corps in 1894-95 is probably on account of payments of arrears &c.

Returning to the first table under the major head it will be found that the Village Police charges shew an increase in 1892-93 and 1894-95 owing to the payment of arrears to the heads of Village Police and Watchmen. The increase under Alienations under this sub-head is mostly due to the revised survey

rates as explained under Land Revenue. Special Police shows a falling off from 1894-95 on account of the absorption of the Bhil Corps establishment costing about 1½ lakhs per year into the District Police Force under the reorganisation scheme, the recovery of contributions for Railway Police in Kathiawad which is brought to account by reduction from charges, partially counterbalanced by the charges on account of the reorganisation of the Force. The increase in 1896-97 is under supplies for clothing charges. Under Railway Police the expenditure is higher in 1892-93 than in the last year of the previous Contract on account of the whole of the Railway Police being made Provincial under the current Contract, thus causing an increase of nearly 40 thousand rupees per year under this head. In September 1893 the North-Western Railway Police was transferred to the Panjab Government. This causes a decrease in expenditure under this sub-head in 1893-94 and subsequent years. But the decrease is nominal as the Local Government has to make a contribution of 37 to the Imperial Government on this account, the adjustment being made, as usual, under Land Revenue. The increase under Superintendence is due to Exchange Compensation Allowance and partly to increase in the establishment. There is again a large increase of 70 under Supplies and Services in 1896-97 for the District Executive Force on account of clothing charges, incurred every five years.

Education.—This is one of the wholly Provincial heads of revenue and expenditure. The revenue consists of receipts from School and College fees plus a small sum on account of Municipal contributions towards the cost of schools and sundry miscellaneous items. It is slowly but steadily increasing, the average annual income during the current Contract period being 3,06 as against 2,80 in the Actuals of 1891-92. The total expenditure shows an increase of 6,07 (or nearly 6 lakhs) as compared with the expenditure in the last year of the previous Contract. Most of this increase in Expenditure occurs, however, only in the last two years of the current Contract. If we take

the first four years of the Contract, it will be found that the total increase in the revenue was 97 as compared with the Actuals of 1891-92 while the increase in the expenditure was 24 thus showing a net total increase in expenditure of 1,44 (nearly 1½ lakhs) till 1895-96. This fact shows that the increase of expenditure under this head is due to certain exceptional grants in the last two years of the Contract. The details of this expenditure will be seen from the following table :—

Name of sub-head.	Actuals 1891-92.	Actuals 1892-93.	Actuals 1893-94.	Actuals 1894-95.	Revised 1895-96.	Budget 1896-97.
1. University ...	15	10	5	5	5	0
2. Direction ...	46	51	44	49	50	50
3. Inspection ...	2,24	2,28	2,38	2,36	2,46	2,48
4. Government Colleges-General ...	1,41	1,48	1,43	1,53	1,63	1,59
5. Government Colleges-Special ...	1,16	1,13	1,04	98	97	1,06
6. Government Schools-General	5,03	4,94	5,30	5,31	5,62	5,59
7. Government Schools-Special...	1,32	1,40	1,41	1,35	1,37	1,46
8. Grants-in-aid ...	4,04	3,97	4,11	4,09	4,77	6,81
9. Scholarships ...	32	34	35	35	38	38
10. Miscellaneous and Refunds ...	23	27	22	21	25	22
Total...	16,80	16,42	16,73	16,72	18,00	20,09

The total figures for expenditure do not show much variation till we come to the Revised Estimate of 1895-96. In that year there is an increase of about 30 under Government Schools-General and nearly 70 under Grants-in-aid while in the Budget Estimate of 1896-97 an additional provision of 2 lakhs is made under Grants-in-aid causing a corresponding increase in the estimated total expenditure of that year. If we exclude these three exceptional items the

figures in the above table do not show any material increase in the total expenditure on Education, and if we take into consideration the fact that the revenue has been increasing at the average rate of about 26 thousands a year there is little *net* increase in the expenditure on Education. Coming to the different sub-heads we find that the University Grant has been gradually reduced to zero. The charges under Direction and Inspection do not show large fluctuations. The small increase is due to Exchange Compensation Allowance and to the strengthening of the subordinate staff of Inspection at a cost of about 2 thousand rupees per year in 1893-94. The decrease under Professional Colleges is said to be due to savings in salaries and allowances and is counter-balanced by an increase under Government Colleges General. These variations do not therefore denote any extraordinary changes in the working of the Department. The sub-head, Government Schools-General, comprises (1) Secondary schools, (2) Primary schools and (3) Payments in support of Municipal schools. The increase of expenditure under this head in 1893-94 and 1895-96 is due to the improvement of the inspecting staff and of the teaching staff in some Government High Schools, but chiefly to the additional provision for primary education under the sub-head Payments in support of the Municipal Schools. These payments rose from 1,48 in 1892-93 to 1,82 in 1893-94, 1,79 in 1894-95, 2,04 and 2,00 in the Revised and Budget estimates of 1895-96 and 1896-97. This explains most of the increase under Government Schools-General during the period of the current Contract. Under Grants-in-aid the increase in 1895-96 is chiefly due to an increase of 41 in the results grant. In 1896-97 the increase of 2 lakhs over the Revised Estimate of 1895-96 is mainly due to a special provision for a large increase of 1,54 to the building grant, of 12 to the results grant, and 9 for the improvement of the Government Law School Library. It will thus be seen that if we except the large increase for special

and non-recurring purposes in 1895-96 and 1896-97 there has been no great increase in the total expenditure under this head except such as was required by small revisions for establishments, for the Exchange Compensation Allowance and to larger payments to Municipal schools. The Grants-in-aid to Local Fund Schools are not brought under any of the above minor heads. They appear under the head of Contributions from Provincial to Local. In 1891-92 the grant under this head for mofussil schools was 4,08 and only 80 for school-buildings. The grants in the successive years are as follows :—

	Grant to Local Fund Schools	Grant to School- Building
1892-93	4,39	63
1893-94	4,84	18
1894-95	5,30	14
1895-96	5,32	45
1896-97	5,34	0

Thus during the period under Contract Government grant to the Local Board Schools was increased by about a lakh of rupees. There is an increase of nearly 45 in 1893-94 and of 46 more in 1894-95, which was applied to the revision of the pay of the lower teachers in primary schools, first in the Southern Division and then in the Central and in the Northern Division, raising the minimum pay to Rs. 7 per month. A part of the grant was also spent in the improvement of schools by the employment of certified teachers ; and in increasing the results grant. The grants to Local Fund School-buildings do not, however, show the same liberal increase. It should, however, be noted that increased grants to Municipal and Local Board Schools were made necessary by increased expenditure on Education from Municipal and Local Revenue. The Local Boards spent 13,93 on Education in 1891-92 which sum rose to 15,32 in 1894-95 and to 16,29 in the Budget Estimate of 1896-97. The same remark applies to Municipal Schools.

In the Educational Estimates provision, to some extent, is generally made for construction and maintenance of Educational School buildings, which charges are ultimately debited to Civil Works. This expenditure is, no doubt, connected with Education, but as it does not result in the improvement of the teaching or the inspecting staff, it is properly debited along with similar items, connected with other departments, to Civil Works. It is also usual to name in connection with the charges under Education allowances to Dakshina Fellows debited to Assignments and Compensation, and charges on account of Medical College and Schools under Medical, and those on account of Veterinary College and class under Scientific and other Minor departments, making up in all a total of about 2½ lakhs. These charges do not show any material variations.

Law and Justice.—This is one of the wholly Provincial heads and is divided, both for revenue and expenditure, under two sub-heads (A) Courts of Law and (B) Jails. Next to Land Revenue and Police this stands as the head of greatest expenditure, the charges on account of both the sub-heads being estimated at 53,53 in 1896-97 as against 50,31 in the Actuals of 1891-92. The increase in expenditure under Courts of Law is chiefly due to Exchange Compensation which amounts to 2 or 2½ lakhs per year in spite of the appointment of two native High Court Judges, who are not entitled to this allowance. A moiety of the salaries of Collectors and Magistrates, inclusive of Exchange Compensation Allowance, is transferred to this head and this, joined with the high salaries paid to the High Court Judges and the District and Sessions Judges, swells the charges for salaries under this head and with them the charge on account of the Exchange Compensation Allowance. During the period of the Contract no great changes were made in this department. Small revisions of establishment, appointment of Sub-judges to hear appeals, of an Assistant Judge with full powers and the appoint-

ment of a Covenanted Civilian to the post of the Judge, under the Deccan Agriculturists' Relief Act are some of the causes of increased expenditure; but the main increase is on account of the Exchange Compensation Allowance as explained above. The total increase of expenditure under this head during the five years of the Contract over the Actuals of 1891-92 is about 8½ lakhs. There is a slight decrease in expenditure in 1892-93 due to temporary vacancies among the Judges of the High Court, to the absence of the Administrator General and the Prothonotary on long leave and to the retirement of the Legal Remembrancer whose successor drew smaller salary; but in the next year the absence of these causes again produced a rise in the charges. The Budget of 1896-97 makes a lump provision of Rs. 14,000 for the reorganisation of the Judicial staff in Sind. There has been a slight increase in revenue under this head due to better receipts under minor sources of income such as general fees, fines &c.

Under *Jails* the revenue shows small decreases. The receipts consist chiefly of payments or credits from other departments for convict labour and the State proceeds of Jail manufactures. They were the highest in 1893-94, but owing to the absence of sufficient remunerative employment for the various convict gangs the receipts are smaller in subsequent years. Under expenditure the cost of superintendence has been nominally reduced by the transfer to General Administration of a share of the charges on account of the Inspector-General of Jails, Registration and Stamps previously debited to this head. But this was more than counterbalanced by special miscellaneous expenditure at the Nara jail, larger purchases of raw material and such other minor items of expenditure.

General Administration.—This is a head of expenditure only and is almost entirely Provincial. It includes charges on account of the salary and establishment of His Excellency the Governor, the members of Council, Commissioners, Inspector-General of Jails, Registration and Stamps, the Secretariat

officers and Local Fund establishments in the offices of the Collectors and the Accountant-General. The ordinary expenditure is not subject to large variations. During the period of the Contract the expenditure has, however, increased owing to the grant of the Exchange Compensation Allowance and also by the transfer to this head of the charges on account of the Inspector-General of Jails, Registration and Stamps, and by the Provincialisation of His Excellency the Governor's band. The abolition of the Military Department of the Secretariat caused a nominal saving of 72 per year under this head from 1895-96, the Local Government having had to make a contribution of nearly 49 per year to the Government of India on this account. But even this nominal saving was absorbed by the charges on account of a new third Civil Secretary whose salary does not appear to have yet reached the maximum. The charge on account of Exchange Compensation Allowance per year is about 60 thousand rupees and the total increased expenditure during 5 years (in the first of which no Exchange Compensation was paid) amounts to nearly 3 lakhs over the Actuals of 1891-92.

Medical.—The revenue under this head chiefly consists of Medical College fees, Hospital and Lunatic Asylum receipts and contributions. The increase in revenue in 1894-95 is chiefly due to the recovery of arrears from the Bombay Port Trusts on account of the maintenance of the European Hospital and to larger fees from paying patients in the same Hospital and that in 1895-96 is due to the raising of fees at the Grant Medical College and to the increased attendance therein. The Expenditure under this head shows a large increase of about 10½ lakhs in five years when compared with the Actuals of 1891-92. The following tabular statement will explain the nature of this increase :—

Name of sub-head.	Actuals 1891-92	Actuals 1892-93	Actuals 1893-94.	Actuals 1894-95.	Revised 1895-96.	Budget 1896-97.
1. Medical Establish- ment ...	3,00	3,16	3,56	3,53	3,81	3,77
2. Hospitals and Dis- pensaries ...	5,15	5,75	5,69	5,83	5,58	6,00
3. Sanitation and Vac- cination ...	2,05	2,23	2,78	2,94	3,11	3,35
4. Grants for Medical purposes ...	1	2	1	2	1	2
5. Medical Schools & Colleges ...	1,78	1,72	1,81	1,79	1,73	1,83
6. Lunatic Asylum ...	1,04	1,12	1,10	1,13	1,13	1,17
7. Chemical Analyser	18	20	22	24	24	25
8. Refunds ...	1	2	0	0	0	1
Total...	13,28	14,25	15,17	15,48	15,61	16,45

It will be seen from the above that the greater part of the increase is under the first three sub-heads. The increase under the first is mainly due to Exchange Compensation which amounts to nearly 43 thousands per year under this sub-head. Under the second sub-head the increase in expenditure in 1892-93 was attributable to the opening of new hospitals in Bombay as well as in the mofussil; and that in 1894-95 is due to payment of arrears of rates and taxes on account of Sir Janisetjee Jeejebhoy Hospital, to the special charges sanctioned in connection with the outbreak of cholera in that Hospital and to an increase in the establishment of St. George's Hospital as well as to the payment of Exchange Compensation Allowances. In the Budget of 1896 provision has been made under this sub-head for additional travelling dispensaries in the mofussil and for extra-tutors at the Grant Medical College. The increase under the third sub-head is partly due to Exchange Compensation and to increased grants to the Village Sanitation Committees. These grants amounted to Rs. 27,00

in 1895-96 and Rs. 12,500 in the Budget Estimate of the current year. The Budget Estimate for 1896-97 also makes a provision of Rs. 20,000 under this sub-head for expenditure under the Pilgrims Ships' Act of 1895 for construction of a shed &c. for pilgrims. The abnormal increase in 1893-94 is due to the transfers to this sub-head of all the charges of the Local Fund Vaccination establishment, part of which was debited to Local Fund previously. But the increase is merely nominal being counterbalanced by increased *per contra* receipts under Contributions from Local to Provincial; while the charges on account of the Exchange Compensation amount to about 16 thousands per year. The increases under other sub-heads call for no remarks. The total Exchange Compensation Allowance under all sub-heads amounts to about 80 thousand rupees every year.

Scientific and other Minor Departments.—Under this head a number of minor heads are comprised, many of which do not shew any material increase in expenditure during the period of the current Contract. These are (1) Provincial Museums costing 9 per year, but shewing an increase of 10 in 1896-97, on account of a grant to the Reay Industrial Museum; (2) Public Observatories at an annual cost varying from 15 to 18; (3) Donations to Scientific Societies to the amount of 5 per year; (4) Public Exhibitions and Fairs at an annual charge of 3; (5) Botanical gardens, 3; (6) Charges on account of Gazetteer and Statistical memoirs of about 2, but discontinued from 1894-95; (7) Registration of Railway Traffic, costing between 11 and 12; (8) Provincial statistics about 4 to 5 and (9) Miscellaneous, chiefly the establishment of the Reporter on the Native Press, costing about 9 per year. There are other sub-heads, however, the charges on account of which have increased during the last five years and especially in 1896-97. These are (10) Experimentation, with an average annual cost of 32, but increased to 53 in 1896-97; (11) Veterinary and Stallion charges, which include charges

on account of Veterinary College and School, increased to 73 in the current year as against 69 in 1894-95 and 52 in the Revised Estimate for 1895-96; (12) Inspector of Factories, costing 20 in the last two years, as against 4 in 1892-93, owing to the appointment of a new Inspector and (13) Inspector of Explosives, a new charge of 2 to 3, created last year. The charges on account of Departmental examinations are also included under this head and amount usually to 1 every year, but in the Budget of 1896-97 these are estimated at 7 owing to the new Provincial Service examination.

If we take the total charges under this head, they shew a falling off in 1892-93, owing to the special charge of 17 for the Census being debited to this head in 1891-92, and also to a reduction of 10 in the Veterinary and Stallion charges. Then there is an increase in 1894-95 owing to the appointment of a separate Factory Inspector, while in 1896-97 the total charges have risen to 2,32 as against 1,80 in 1894-95 and 1,59 in 1892-93, owing to special grants to Museums, Experimental cultivation, and increase in the Veterinary charges. Speaking generally the total expenditure under this head during the last five years shews an increase of 64 over the Actuals of 1891-92, if we exclude from these Actuals the charges on account of Census. This increase is too small taking into consideration the fact that there are some very useful Departments included under this head.

Superannuations and Pensions.—This is a progressive head of expenditure. The Revenue shews little increase, while the charges are yearly growing on. They are almost entirely on account of superannuation and retired allowances paid in this country to members of the Bombay service and naturally grow with the growth of the Administrative Departments. The receipts are on account of contributions from officers lent to Municipalities, Local Boards or in Foreign Service. The total expenditure during the period of the current Contract amounts to 86,43; or 8,78 more, when compared with Actuals of 1891-92.

These charges do not seem to have yet reached the maximum and will, it appears, go on increasing at least for some years.

Stationery and Printing.—The expenditure under this head in 1892-93 shows a large increase over the Actuals of 1891-92. This is mainly due to a transfer of about 1,10 to this head of charges on account of stationery purchased in the country which was previously debited to the various departments. The increase in 1894-95 is on account of larger supplies of paper to the Government Central Press and the purchase of woollens for clothing the Sind Police. The Budget of 1896-97 makes a provision for the new machinery for the Commissioner's press in Sind. In spite of the fact that Government has 4 or 5 Press establishments the charge on account of printing at private presses amounts to nearly 3 thousand rupees a year. The receipts under this head, which show little variation, are made up chiefly of the sale proceeds of *Gazettes* and other publications as well as of receipts on account of work done at the Central Press for Departments other than those of Government.

Political.—The increase under this head in 1893-94 is due to a large increase on account of Durbar presents. The main expenditure under this head, however, consists of charges on account of the Political Agencies in Kathiawar, Kutch, Mahikatha and Southern Mahratta Country. The contributions from the various States are taken in reduction of charges.

Under *Miscellaneous* the large increase in the receipts in 1893-94 and 1894-95 is on account of the sale proceeds of Durbar presents received at the Darbar at Nagar and also those paid by the Maharaja of Kolhapur. There were also increased receipts on account of the sale of the Bhadgaon farm; while there has been no increase in expenditure which is mostly of a fluctuating nature.

We next come to the Public Works Department which absorbs all the residue of the total income after providing

for the wants of other Departments. The chief remunerative work constructed during the quinquennial period of the current Contract is the Hyderabad-Umarkot Railway the accounts of which appear under three different heads, *viz.* *Construction of Railways*, and *Working expenses of State Railways* under Expenditure, and under *State Railways* as a head of revenue. We shall take all these together under the head—

State Railways.—The total expenditure on the Hyderabad-Umarkot Railway is 6,29 during the period of the Contract. The work was commenced in 1891-92 and 11,72 were spent upon it in that year. Thus the total expenditure on the Hyderabad-Umarkot Railway is 17,92 or about 18 lakhs. The work is constructed out of the ordinary revenues and the sum spent upon it is somewhat like an investment inasmuch as if the work be taken over hereafter by the Government of India or a Company, the Local Government will have a claim for a refund of the capital expenditure. The total gross income amounts to 6,53 and the working expenses will come to 5,14 during the period of the Contract, thus showing a net profit of 1.39 over a capital of 18 lakhs for four years, the Railway being opened for traffic in the latter part of 1892. This amounts to a dividend of 2 per cent. per annum. Under this head we must, however, include the annual expenditure of 10 paid to the Government of India on account of the interest on the value of rails supplied to this Railway. This will reduce the total profit by about 50.

Irrigation.—The only Provincial work under this head is the Gokak Canal. During the five years of the Contract the receipts from it amounted to 1,13 while the expenditure is 2,33, that is, 1,20 more than the income. This increase in expenditure is due to the payment of compensation for lands taken up and for improvement of the canal storage works. The working expenses as such amount to about 5 per year. The rest of the expenditure is debited to capital account.

Civil Works.—This head is divided into two sub-heads; (1) Works in charge of Civil officers and (2) Works in charge of Public Works Department. The ordinary charge under the first sub-head is made up of grants to station funds at Panchgani and Mahableshwar and to the Bombay Municipality towards the maintenance and repairs of the Queen's statue. The exceptional expenditure in 1892-93 was due to a grant of about 10 for the improvement of water-supply in some Districts. The total expenditure under this sub-head amounts to 72 out of the total of 1,72,37 spent upon Civil Works during the period of the Contract, as shown in the general table on page 6. There is nothing else that calls for remark under this sub-head. Under the second sub-head, *Public Works Department*, the Provincial receipts are derived from tolls on roads, rents and sales of buildings, produce of trees and sales of old material tools and plants; and they show no great variations amounting on an average to 8½ lakhs. The expenditure is on account of the construction of new buildings for the Police, Educational, Judicial, Revenue and other Departments of Government as well as on account of repairs to old Government buildings. The total expenditure on Public Works under this sub-head during the quinquennial period of the current Contract is 1,71,65, which is considerably lower than the expenditure incurred during the period of the last Contract but greatly in excess of the amount for which the Government of India was disposed to give credit to the Provincial Government on this account when the Contract allotment was fixed. On an average the Provincial expenditure on Public Works Department amounts to 34,33 a year; of which sum nearly 10 lakhs represent the cost of the Establishment, 12 lakhs of Original Works and about 12½ lakhs of repairs to Government buildings. Of the sum allotted to Original Works from 1 to 2 lakhs seem to be spent on communications every year. The Establishment charges have remained the same, though it has become impossible to make higher allotments for Public Works owing to financial pressure.

Interest.—This is a head of Revenue and Expenditure and is entirely Provincial. The Revenue consists of interest received on sums lent to Municipalities, Local Boards, Landholders and cultivators as well as on loans advanced under special Acts such as the Talukdars and Local Authorities Loans Act. The expenditure represents the charges on account of interest to be paid to the Government of India upon sums placed by it at the disposal of the Local Government for the purposes mentioned above. Takavi advances and other loans to cultivators are brought under this head, but are not shown either on the credit or on the debit side which include receipts and charges on account of interest alone. The total receipts during five years of the current Contract amount to 14,56 and the total expenditure comes to 11,60, thus showing a net gain of 2,97 or on an average of 59 per year. Taken as a whole this is, therefore, a head of net income of little over $\frac{1}{2}$ lakh to the Provincial Government. The amounts advanced to cultivators only since 1891-92 are as follows :—

Years.		Amount in Rs.
1891-92	Actuals.....	7,85,398.
1892-93	„	8,82,280.
1893-94	„	5,94,134.
1894-95	„	8,79,192.
1895-96	Revised.....	9,81,000.
1896-97	Budget.....	10,87,000.

Contributions from Local to Provincial.—These appear on the Revenue side and show no great variations when compared with the Actuals of 1891-92, if we exclude from these Actuals the special contribution of about $1\frac{1}{2}$ lakhs by the Hyderabad and Thar and Parkar Local Boards towards the completion of the Hyderabad-Umarkot Railway. The increase of 40 in the Actuals of 1893-94 is on account of contributions for the Vaccinators' establishment. Previous to 1893-94 these charges were debited to the Local Fund, but now they are at first debited to Medical and the contribution from the Local Fund on this

account is credited under this head. The increase, therefore, is nominal being counterbalanced by an increase in the charges under Medical. Other receipts include contributions for cost of establishments in the revenue and account officers for Local Fund purposes and grants for Medical and Public Works.

Contributions from Provincial to Local.—These appear on the Expenditure side, and are made up of (1) A fixed contribution of 1,55 per year in lieu of 1 anna cess on Excise Revenue; (2) Grants to Local Fund Schools and Buildings and an annual contribution of 6 to the Ratnagiri School of Industry; (3) Grants to Dispensaries and for Village Sanitation and Water-supply; (4) Grants to road repairs and other public works and (5) Miscellaneous, including a grant of 2 for Horse shows and of 2 more for Madha-Ghat Annachatra distributed between Poona and Satara Boards. The 1st is a fixed allowance settled by the Government of India in lieu of a share of the continuously increasing Excise Revenue payable to the Local Board under the Local Boards' Act of 1869. The details of the second grant which is for educational purposes are discussed under Education. During the period of the Contract this grant has been increased by nearly 1 lakh in two instalments of about 46 each, one in 1893-94 and the other in 1894-95. The expenditure from Local Fund proper on Education also shows a similar increase. The grants to Local Fund dispensaries which were brought under this head in 1894-95 amount to 24 in 1894-95, 28 in the Revised Estimate of 1895-96 and 30 in the Budget of 1896-97. Besides this sum there is a grant of 8 to Veterinary dispensaries in the Revised and the Budget Estimates of 1895-96 and 1896-97. The principal expenditure under this sub-head, however, consists of grants for Village Sanitation and Water-supply, necessitated by the introduction of Village Sanitation Act. This grant amounted to 29 in 1892-93, 1,40 in 1893-94, 75 in 1894-95, 90 in the Revised Estimate of 1895-96 and 2,18 in the Budget Estimate of 1896-97. The grant is, therefore, the

highest in 1893-94 and the current year. Large re-appropriations are, however, very often made from the sums assigned for this purpose in the Budget and perhaps the Budget grant for this year may be similarly reduced. In spite of such reductions the total Actuals, however, show a marked increase and this increase in the total contributions from Provincial to Local since 1893-94 is attributable chiefly to increased grants to Mofussil Schools and for Village Sanitation and Water-supply. The Actuals of 1891-92 were swelled by specially large grants for Public Works and Water-supply not repeated in 1892-93.

We have now examined almost all the heads of Revenue and Expenditure and it will be seen from it that the principal heads of Revenue and Expenditure show large increases during the quinquennial period of the current Contract. The absence of the Contract figure for each head makes it impossible to exactly state the increase in Revenue and Expenditure under each head. But if we compare the figures under the different heads with the Actuals of 1891-92, as has been done in the above examination, it will be found that almost all the principal heads of revenue shew a progressively increasing revenue during the Contract period. It has been pointed out above that the total increase in the Revenue as compared with the Contract figure is 87,30, exclusive of book adjustments, or about 17½ lakhs. per year. The same result might be stated in a different form by comparing the increase in Revenue under the principal heads with the Actuals of 1891-92. Such a comparison will show that the average annual increase in the Provincial $\frac{1}{4}$ share of Land Revenue during the period of the current Contract amounts to about 3½ lakhs, that under Stamps to 3½, Excise to 2, Forest 1½, Civil Works 1, Assessed Taxes $\frac{1}{2}$, Police $\frac{1}{2}$, Registration $\frac{1}{2}$, Customs $\frac{1}{2}$, and Education $\frac{1}{2}$ lakh. These are rough figures, but they clearly show how the revenue under the principal heads has been steadily increasing during the quinquennial period of the Contract. We

must add to this the revenue from State Railways which on an average amounts to $1\frac{1}{2}$ lakhs per year. This makes up a total of nearly 15 lakhs per year. The rest of the increase is under other heads of Revenue.

Coming next to Expenditure it may be remarked that the main heads of increase are Exchange Compensation Allowance which amounted to 24 lakhs in four years or on an average of $4\frac{1}{2}$ lakhs per year during the period of the Contract, Police showing an average annual increase of $4\frac{1}{2}$ lakhs, Superannuation charges $1\frac{1}{2}$ lakhs, Medical $1\frac{1}{2}$, Education 1 lakh, Contributions to Local 1 lakh, Forest $\frac{1}{2}$, and General Administration $\frac{1}{2}$, making up in all a total of about 16 lakhs per year. We must add to this the expense incurred on the construction of Railways amounting on an average to $1\frac{1}{2}$ lakhs per year and about $\frac{1}{4}$ lakh on Irrigation. The rest of the increase is due to increase of expenditure under other heads.

The causes of this increase in Revenue and Expenditure are discussed above under the different Revenue and Expenditure heads. But, generally speaking, it may be stated that the increase of revenue under Stamps, Registration, and some other heads is due to the expansive nature of the revenue; but that under Land Revenue, Forest, Excise, or Assessed Taxes cannot be said to be obtained without causing inconvenience or hardship to the people. The increase in Expenditure is, of course, mainly due to the Exchange Compensation Allowance and to the heavy charges on account of the reorganisation of the Police Force. The expenditure on the Hyderabad-Umarkot Railway may be regarded as an investment; while the increased grants to Education, Dispensaries, Village Sanitation and Water-supply &c. represent expenditure directly useful to the rayat. We may also notice here the fact that the Revenue and Expenditure for the first two years of the current Contract are nearly balanced, the Police reorganisation scheme and

the Exchange Compensation Allowance swell the charges from the third and large grants to Education, Civil Works or Village Sanitation appear only in the last or the last two years of the Contract, thus fully verifying the remark of the Lieutenant-Governor of Bengal that under the quinquennial contract system we have generally "two years of screwing and saving and postponement of works, two years of resumed energy on a normal scale, and one year of dissipation of balances in the fear that, if not spent, they will be annexed by the Supreme Government, directly or indirectly, at the time of the revision."

There is another way of measuring the increase or decrease in the various heads of Revenue and Expenditure, *viz.*, by comparing the five years' figures of the current Contract with the five years' figures of the last. We have taken the Actuals of the first three years, the Revised of the fourth, and the Budget figures of the fifth year of the current Contract. Similar figures for the fourth Contract have been collected in a table in Mr. Justice Ranade's Note and if we compare the two, it will be at once found how the principal heads of Revenue and Expenditure have been steadily progressing during the last ten years.

Excess over the Contract figure in-	4th Provincial Contract.	5th Provincial Contract.
Revenue ...	1,25,84	1,18,72
Expenditure ...	1,35,74	1,31,45

These figures include book-adjustments. The excess in each case is found out by taking Actuals of the first three years and the Revised and the Budget figures of the last two years of each of the two Contracts. The comparison is therefore as accurate as it

could be. It shows that during the quinquennial period of the last as well as of the current Contract both Revenue and Expenditure increased remarkably, but the increase in Expenditure was greater than the increase in Revenue by about 10 or 12 lakhs. The increase of Revenue under the 4th Contract was principally due to the high receipts under Land Revenue (by about 6 lakhs a year), Stamps, (4 lakhs), Assessed Taxes (about 2½) and Excise (2½ lakhs), as compared with the Contract figures under these heads; while the excess in expenditure during the same period was mainly due to an increase of 25 lakhs under Police and 47 lakhs under Civil Works. This at once indicates how the excess Revenue during the period of the current Contract might have been spent had it not been required for meeting the unforeseen charge of Exchange Compensation Allowance. But it is needless to dilate on the subject. The figures for the last ten years clearly prove that the Provincial Revenue is sufficiently elastic, and that if the Local Government means to carry out improvements most needed by the people *e. g.* in the Educational, Agricultural and Judicial Departments there will be no difficulty of finding funds for the same. But the Local Government must, for this purpose, have greater Financial independence and control over the Provincial Revenue, and must change its policy of spending most of the increased revenue on the expansion of the various Administrative Departments or on Public Works. The Imperial Government must not also endeavour to closely clip the Provincial sheep every fifth year.