

PROCEEDINGS  
OF  
THE PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION.

---

VOLUME IV.

PROCEEDINGS RELATING TO THE BOMBAY PRESIDENCY (INCLUDING SIND).

---

SECTION I.—NOTICE AND LETTERS CALLING FOR EVIDENCE AND INFORMATION SUPPLIED  
BY THE BOMBAY GOVERNMENT.

SECTION II.—MINUTES OF EVIDENCE TAKEN IN BOMBAY.

SECTION III.—REPLIES OF SOCIETIES AND ASSOCIATIONS AND PERSONS NOT EXAMINED  
BY THE COMMISSION.



**PROCEEDINGS**  
OF  
**THE PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION.**

BOMBAY PRESIDENCY (INCLUDING SIND)

VOLUME IV.—SECTIONS I.—III.

**CONTENTS**

**SECTION I**

SUB-SECTION A —NOTICES AND LETTERS CALLING FOR EVIDENCE IN BOMBAY No	PAGE
I.—NOTICE published in the Gazette and leading newspapers . . . . .	1
II.—LETTER No. 4, dated the 16th November 1886, calling for a list of names of selected officers serving in the Bombay Presidency and Sind, whom it might be desirable to invite to give evidence, and of associations and editors of newspapers and members of the general public who should be consulted, and the reply No 8543, dated the 3rd of December 1886 . . . . .	
III.—LETTER No. 19, dated the 30th November 1886, forwarding for distribution sets of questions bearing on the enquiries of the Commission, and the replies, No. 9000, dated the 23rd December 1886, and No 9038, dated the 28th idem . . . . .	
IV.—LETTER No 75, dated the 31st December 1886, requesting that certain gentlemen be invited to give oral evidence before the Commission at Bombay, and asking for a nominal list showing the associations and persons, both official and non-official, to whom the questions had been communicated, and the reply No 95, dated the 5th of January 1887, with two enclosures . . . . .	10
V.—LETTER No 83, dated the 2nd of January 1887, in continuation of No 75, dated the 31st of December 1886, asking that the gentlemen therein named be invited to give evidence, and the reply No. 191, dated the 10th of January 1887 . . . . .	12
VI.—LETTER No 87, dated the 5th of January 1887, in continuation of letter No 83, dated the 2nd of January 1887, asking that certain gentlemen therein named be invited to give evidence, and the reply No 193, dated the 10th of January 1887, and enclosure, and No 243, dated the 12th of January 1887, in continuation, and enclosure . . . . .	13
VII.—LIST of persons to whom sets of questions or issues were supplied, or who were summoned or invited or who volunteered to give oral evidence before the Public Service Commission or the Sub-Committee thereof at Bombay . . . . .	16

SECTION I, SUB-SECTION B —INFORMATION SUPPLIED BY THE BOMBAY  
GOVERNMENT.

I.—REPLIES of the Bombay Government to the set of questions (A) . . . . .	33
II.—MEMORANDUM on the special features of the Bombay Presidency (including Sind) which bear upon its administration . . . . .	57
III.—LETTER No 3, dated the 16th November 1886, calling for detailed information, showing the number of "charges" or offices in which the Covenanted and Uncovenanted officers, engaged in the administration, are employed, &c , and the reply No 49, dated the 4th January 1887 . . . . .	65
IV.—LETTER No 89, dated the 5th January 1887, calling for statistics showing how many persons employed in the Subordinate Judicial and Executive Services in the Bombay Presidency and Sind have passed University Examinations, and the reply No. 145, dated the 8th March 1887 . . . . .	68

No	PAGE
V.—LETTER No 102, dated the 22nd January 1887, calling for a return showing the nationalities and castes of persons employed in the Subordinate Judicial and Executive Services in the Bombay Presidency and Sind, and the reply No 2231, dated the 13th April 1887 . . . . .	69
VI.—LETTER No 106, dated the 28th January 1887, calling for (1) a return showing with regard to Mamlátdárs who hold the degree of Bachelor of Arts, (a) the date of appointment in each case as Mamlátdár, and (b) the period spent in each case on probation, &c, (2) a list of probationers for the appointment of Mamlátdár who have taken the B A degree, and the reply No 2744, dated the 4th May 1887 . . . . .	72
VII.—LETTER No 112, dated the 5th February 1887, calling for a return showing (1) the number of persons who have passed University Examinations during each of the past ten years, and (2) the nationalities and castes to which such persons belong, and the reply No 2193, dated the 7th April 1887 . . . . .	75
VIII.—LETTER No 131, dated the 7th March 1887, calling for information showing the extent to which encouragement is offered to Natives of the Bombay Presidency and Sind by means of Government scholarships or otherwise to proceed to England for the purpose of completing their education; and the reply No 814, dated the 17th May 1887 . . . . .	77
IX.—TELEGRAM No 198, dated the 2nd May 1887, enquiring whether all the members of the Subordinate Executive and Judicial Services in the Bombay Presidency and Sind are Natives of that Presidency, and the reply No 33, dated the 28th May 1887 . . . . .	78
X.—LETTER No 133, dated the 10th of March 1887, calling for a full and detailed answer to question No 232, and the reply No 4773, dated the 22nd July 1887 . . . . .	80

## SECTION II.—MINUTES OF EVIDENCE TAKEN IN BOMBAY.

(SITTINGS AT BOMBAY.)

### EXAMINED BY THE SUB-COMMITTEE

I.—Khán Bahádúr BAEJORJI EDALJI MODI, M A., LL B, Subordinate Judge, Ahmedabad . . . . .	1
II.—Ráo Bahádúr CHUNILÁL VENILÁL, Deputy Collector, Broach . . . . .	9

### EXAMINED BY THE COMMISSION

III.—W LEE-WARNER, Esq, M A., B O C S, Acting Secretary to Government (Judicial, Political and Educational Departments), Bombay . . . . .	12
IV.—Maulvi MEHEDI HASAN KHÁN, Chief Justice, His Highness the Nizam's Court, Hyderabad, Deccan, of the Uncovenanted Service, services lent to the Hyderabad State . . . . .	30
V.—Khán Bahádúr HAJI GHULAM MAHOMED, Munshi, Fellow of the Bombay University; founder of the <i>Anyaman-i-Islam</i> Society . . . . .	34
VI.—PÁNDURANG RÁMCHANDRA DESAI, Pleader, Thana . . . . .	37
VII.—Khán Bahádúr PESTANJI JEHÁNGIR, C I E., Taluqdár, Settlement Officer, Gujarat, Ahmedabad . . . . .	41
VIII.—A U FANSHAWE, Esq, B C S, Post-Master General, Bombay . . . . .	47
IX.—Khán Sáheb A'BBÁS ALI BEG MIRZA, B A, <i>Karbhari</i> of the Janjira State . . . . .	54
X.—MANCHERJI M. BHÁVNAGRI, C I E, Agent in Bombay to His Highness the Thákur of Bhávnagar . . . . .	58
XI.—F C BREWIN, Esq, Superintendent, Accountant-General's Office, Bombay, Representative of the Eurasian and Anglo-Indian Association of Western India, Bombay . . . . .	63
XII.—The Hon'ble RÁO BAHÁDUR MAHÁDEV VÁSUDEV BÁRVÉ, C I E., Member of the Legislative Council, and Fellow of the University, Bombay . . . . .	73
XIII.—DR THEODORE COOKE, M A., LL D, Principal, College of Science, Poona . . . . .	76
XIV.—SATYENDRANÁTH TÁGOBE, Esq, B O C S, District and Sessions Judge, Sholápur . . . . .	78
XV.—KÁLÁBHÁI LALLUBHÁI, Pleader, Surat . . . . .	81
XVI.—Professor RÁMKRISHNA GOPÁL BHANDÁRKAR, M.A., PH D, Professor of Oriental Languages, Deccan College, Poona . . . . .	84

	Page
XXVII.—RÁO SÁHEB VIBPRASÁD TÁPIPRASÁD, Special Assistant to the Municipal Commissioners for the City of Bombay . . . . .	87
XXVIII.—C E G CRAWFORD, Esq, Bo C S, Registrar, High Court (Appellate Side), Bombay . . . . .	88
XIX.—Khán Sáheb IBRÁHIM M SÁYÁNÍ, B A, Head Master, High School, Nadiád . . . . .	92
XX.—RÁO BAHÁDUR GOPÁLBÁO HARI DESHMUKH, Fellow of the Bombay University, of the Uncovenanted Service (retired) . . . . .	94
XXI.—RAHIMUTULLA MAHOMED SÁYÁNÍ, M A, LL B, Solicitor, High Court, Bombay, J P., Fellow of the University, and Member of the Municipal Corporation, Bombay . . . . .	98
XXII.—Professor W. WORDSWORTH, M A., Principal, Elphinstone College, Bombay . . . . .	103
XXIII.—MAHOMED HUSEN HAKIM, Barrister-at-Law, J P., Fellow of the University, and Member of the Municipal Corporation, Bombay . . . . .	112
XXIV.—KAIKHOSHEU NAVROJI KÁBRÁJÍ, Editor, <i>Rást Gofár</i> , Newspaper, Bombay, J. P., Fellow of the University, and Member of the Municipal Corporation, Bombay . . . . .	114
XXV.—The Hon'ble Sir CHARLES SARGENT, KT, Barrister-at-Law, Chief Justice, High Court, Bombay . . . . .	121
XXVI.—The Hon'ble DÁDÁBHÁI NAVROJI, J P, Member of the Legislative Council, Bombay, Fellow of the University, Vice-Chairman, Bombay Branch, East India Association . . . . .	126
XXVII.—G W. FOREST, Esq, B A, Professor of Mathematics, Deccan College, Poona . . . . .	135
XXVIII.—The Hon'ble Ráo Bahádur MAHÁDEV GOBIND RÁNADÁ, M A, LL B, Member of the Legislative Council, Bombay, Special Judge under the Deccan Agriculturists' Relief Act, Poona . . . . .	141
XXIX.—Maulvi CHIRÁG ALI, Secretary, Revenue Department, His Highness the Nizam's Government, Hyderabad, Deccan . . . . .	146
XXX.—R. G. OXENHAM, Esq, M A, Principal and Professor of English Literature, Deccan College, Poona . . . . .	149
XXXI.—Ráo Bahádur KHANDRÁO C BEDARKAR, B A, LL B, Deputy Registrar, High Court, Bombay, Acting Judge, Small Cause Court, Poona . . . . .	152
XXXII.—KHARSHEDJI RATANJI BAMANJI, of the Statutory Service, Assistant Collector, Kaira . . . . .	162
XXXIII.—SYDENHAM SMITH, Esq, Pleader, Poona, Representative, Eurasian and Anglo-Indian Association, Poona . . . . .	167
XXXIV.—J F. FERNANDEZ, Esq, late of the Uncovenanted Service, Manager, Morári Gokuldás Spinning and Weaving Company, Bombay . . . . .	169
XXXV.—Khan Bahádur KAZI KÁMARUDDIN, Uncovenanted Service, Assistant Settlement Officer, Ratnágiri . . . . .	174
XXXVI.—W. R. HAMILTON, Esq, Uncovenanted Service, Deputy Collector, Ahmednagar . . . . .	177
XXXVII.—PHIROZSHÁH MERWÁNJI MEHTA, M A, Barrister-at Law; J P, Fellow of the Bombay University, and Member of the Municipal Corporation, Bombay, Joint Honorary Secretary, Bombay Presidency Association . . . . .	184
XXXVIII.—J MACNABB CAMPBELL, Esq, C I E, M A., LL D, Bo.C.S, Acting Collector, Panchmaháls, Editor of the <i>Bombay Gazetteer</i> . . . . .	194
XXXIX.—S HAMMICK, Esq, Bo C S, District and Sessions Judge, Surat . . . . .	198
. XL.—MANCHERJI PESTONJI KHAREGHÁT, Esq, Bo C S, Assistant Collector, Ahmedabad . . . . .	200
XLI.—RÁO BAHÁDUR BHIMBHÁI KIRPÁRÁM, Personal Assistant to the Director of Agriculture, Poona . . . . .	206
XLII.—MULLA ABDUL HYE MAHOMED ALI, Munshi, Surat . . . . .	211
XLIII.—HARILÁL HARSADRÁI DHRUVA, B A, LL B, Pleader, Surat, Honorary Secretary, <i>Praja Hit Vardhak Sabha</i> , Surat . . . . .	212
XLIV.—DAYÁRÁM GIDUMAL, B A, LL B, Statutory Service, Assistant Collector, Karachi . . . . .	214
XLV.—F. A H ELLIOT, Esq, Bo C S, Survey and Settlement Commissioner, Baroda . . . . .	218
XLVI.—A H. PLUNKETT, Esq, Uncovenanted Service, City Magistrate, Poona . . . . .	221
XLVII.—RÁO BAHÁDUR GURSHIDAPA VIRBASAPA GHGANCHI, Uncovenanted Service, Deputy Collector, Belgaum . . . . .	224
XLVIII.—F. L. GOLDSMID, Esq, District Superintendent of Police, Kolába . . . . .	226
XLIX.—NÁRÁYAN GANESE CHANDÁVARKAR, B A, LL B, Fellow of the Bombay University, Editor, <i>Indu Prakash</i> , Pleader, High Court, Bombay . . . . .	229
L.—THE HON'BLE KÁSHINÁTH TRIMBAK TELANG, C I E, M A, LL B, Member of the Legislative Council, Bombay J P, Advocate, High Court, Bombay, Fellow of the Bombay University, &c. . . . .	231

No	Page
LI—RÁO SÁHEB MAHIPATRÁM RUPRÁM NILKANTH, C.I.E., Principal, Training College, Ahmedabad . . . . .	244
LII—RÁO BÁHÁDUR YESHWANT MORESHVAR KEZKAR, Assistant to the Commissioner, Southern Division, Acting Oriental Translator to Government, Bombay . . . . .	245
LIII—W. B. MULLOCK, Esq, B O C S, Acting Collector, Surat . . . . .	248
LIV—J W ORR, Esq, M A, Barrister-at-Law, Prothonotary, High Court, Bombay . . . . .	254
LV—VÁMAN A'BÁJI MODAK, B A, Principal, Elphinstone High School, Bombay . . . . .	256
LVI—GRATTAN GEARY, Esq, Editor and Proprietor, <i>Bombay Gazette</i> , J. P., Fellow of the Bombay University . . . . .	265
LVII—GANGARÁM BHÁU MASKE, Pleader, Poona . . . . .	275
LVIII—The Rev D. MACKICHAN, M A, D D, Principal, Free General Assembly's Institution, Bombay, Fellow of the Bombay University . . . . .	279
LIX.—KÁVASJI DÁDÁBHÁI NÁEGÁMWÁLA, M A, F I C H, F R A S, F C S, Lecturer on Experimental Physics, Elphinstone College, Bombay, J P, Fellow of the Bombay University, Representative of the Graduates Association, Bombay . . . . .	282
LX.—Munshi NUR MAHOMED KHÁN, Secretary, <i>Anjuman-i-Takwiyat-ul-Islam</i> , Poona . . . . .	289
LXI—Ráo Bahadur RAGHUNÁTH SHIVRÁM TIPNIS, B A., LL B, Uncovenanted Service, Subordinate Judge, Poona . . . . .	291
LXII—The Rev J. MATR, S J, Rector of St Xavier's College, Bombay, Fellow of the Bombay University . . . . .	294
LXIII—SHANKAR PÁNDURANG PANDIT, M A, Oriental Translator to Government, Bombay . . . . .	300
LXIV—SORÁBJI SHÁPURI BENGÁLI, Merchant, J P, Fellow of the Bombay University . . . . .	307
LXV—A T SHUTTLEWORTH, Esq, Conservator of Forests, N C, Bombay . . . . .	309
LXVI—JHAVERILÁL UMIÁSHANKAR YÁJNIK, Agent in Bombay to H. H the Ráo of Kutch, J P, Fellow of the Bombay University, Member of the Municipal Corporation &c . . . . .	312
LXVII—DÁJI A'BÁJI KHARE, B A, LL B, Vakíl, High Court, Bombay, Joint Honorary Secretary, Bombay Branch, East Indian Association . . . . .	316
LXVIII—MAHÁDEV BALLÁB NÁMJOSHI, Member of the Deccan Education Society, Poona . . . . .	320
LXIX—BÁL GANGÁDHAR TILAK, B A, LL B, Editor, <i>Mahratta</i> Newspaper, Poona, Professor, Fergusson College, Poona . . . . .	324
LXX—A T CRAWFORD, Esq, B O C S, Commissioner, Central Division, Bombay . . . . .	327
LXXI—W H, CÁOWE, Esq, B O C S, District Judge, Poona . . . . .	333
LXXII.—SIDDESHVAR, MITTER, Delegate of the Society for the Translation of the Máhábhárat . . . . .	336
LXXIII—JEHÁNGIRSHÁH ERACHSHÁH KOHIYAR, Assistant Secretary to Government, Bombay . . . . .	337
LXXIV—The Hon'ble RAYMOND WEST, Esq., M A, F E G S, LL D, B O C S, Barrister-at-Law, Judge, High Court, Bombay . . . . .	344
LXXV—Surgeon K R KIRTIKAR, C.R.L.P M R C S, Indian Medical Service, Acting Professor of Anatomy, Grant Medical College, and Second Surgeon, J J. Hospital, Bombay . . . . .	357
LXXVI—DINSHA E VÁCHHA, Merchant, Joint Honorary Secretary, Bombay Presidency Association, Bombay . . . . .	363

## SECTION III.—SUB-SECTION A —REPLIES OF SOCIETIES AND ASSOCIATIONS

I.—The LOKA HITTECHU SABHA, Broach . . . . .	1
II.—The SIND SABHA, Karachi . . . . .	3

## SECTION III —SUB-SECTION B —REPLIFS RECEIVED FROM PERSONS SUMMONED OR INVITED BUT WHO WERE UNABLE TO ATTEND THE SITTINGS OF THE COMMISSION.

I—The Hon'ble J JARDINE, M A, C S, Judge, High Court, Bombay . . . . .	11
II.—The Hon'ble SIR M MELVILL, C S, C S I, K C I E, Member of Council, Bombay . . . . .	17
III—The Hon'ble H M BIRDWOOD M A, LL M., C S, Judge, High Court, Bombay . . . . .	22
IV—The Hon'ble L H BAYLEY, Barrister at-Law, Judge, High Court, Bombay . . . . .	26
V—The Hon'ble W E HART, B A, Barrister-at-Law, Chief Judge, Small Cause Court, Bombay . . . . .	28
VI—W. H PROPERT, Esq, C S, Commissioner, Southern Division . . . . .	33
VII—E. T CANDY, Esq, C S, Acting Judicial Commissioner, Sind . . . . .	39
VIII—CHESTER MACNAGHTEN, Esq, M A, Principal, Rajkumar College, Káthiáwar . . . . .	47
IX—E M H FULTON, Esq., C S, Acting District Judge, Belgaum . . . . .	55

No.	Page
X.—G. C. WHITWORTH, Esq, Judicial Assistant to the Political Agent, Kathawar .	59
XI.—The Hon'ble DAYARAM JETHMAL, Additional Member of the Legislative Council, Bombay . . . . .	64
XII.—The Hon'ble J. B. RICEY, C S, C.S.I., Temporary Member of Council, Bombay.	74
XIII.—T. D. MACKENZIE, Esq, C S, Acting Chief Secretary to Government, Bombay.	78
XIV.—J. MONTEATH, Esq, M.A., C.S., Private Secretary to His Excellency the Governor of Bombay . . . . .	83
XV.—VINAYAK VASUDEV, J. P., Fellow of the University and Secretary to the Civil Military Examination Committee, Bombay . . . . .	87
XVI.—SYAD NURUDDIN KHAN, C.S., (Statutory) Assistant Collector, Thana . . . . .	88
XVII.—KHAN BAHADUR, NAVROJI DORABJI KHANDALAVALA, B.A., Acting Judge, Small Cause Court, Ahmedabad . . . . .	96
XVIII.—NARAYAN MEGHAJI LOKHANDAY, Editor, <i>Dinbandhu</i> , Bombay . . . . .	106
XIX.—MANEKJI BAJORJI MINOCHEEHOMJI, Editor, <i>Bombay Samachar</i> , Bombay . . . . .	109
XX.—RAO SAHEB MADHVACHRAM BALVACHRAM HOBA, Subordinate Judge, Balsar . . . . .	111
XXI.—BEHRAMJI MERWANJI MALBARI, Editor, <i>Indian Spectator</i> , Bombay . . . . .	120
XXII.—A. D. HUSEN ALI, Pleader, Karachi . . . . .	124
XXIII.—DINSHA ARDESHIR, TALEYABKHAN, Municipal Commissioner, Baroda . . . . .	127
XXIV.—T. S. TAIT, Esq, M.A., principal, Baroda College, Baroda . . . . .	138
XXV.—SITARAM HARI CHIPLUNKAR, Secretary, Sarvajanic Sabha, Poona . . . . .	140
XXVI.—Khan Bahadur NASAWANJI KHAESHEDJI, Merchant, Ahmednagar . . . . .	155
XXVII.—SIR W. WEDDEBURN, Bart., C.S., 1st Grade Judge and Sessions Judge, Poona . . . . .	160
XXVIII.—The Hon'ble NANABHAI HARIDAS, Judge, High Court, Bombay . . . . .	164
XXIX.—ITCHARAM S. DESAI, Editor, <i>Gujerati</i> , Bombay . . . . .	172
XXX.—CUBSETJI RUSTUMJI THANAWALA, Chief Justice of Baroda . . . . .	176
XXXI.—BHAIHANKAR NANABHAI, Solicitor, High Court, Bombay . . . . .	180
XXXII.—Rao Bahadur CHINTAMAN NARAYAN BHAT, B.A., LL.B., Subordinate Judge, Dhaha . . . . .	182
XXXIII.—Khan Sahab KARMALI RAHIM NANJANI, B.A., Deputy Educational Inspector, Hindustani Schools, Northern Division . . . . .	185
XXXIV.—Rao Bahadur BRCHARDAS VEHARIDAS DESAI, Honorary Magistrate, Nadiad . . . . .	189

SECTION III.—SUB-SECTION C—SELECTED ANSWERS OF OTHER PERSONS.

I.—The Revd. ALEXANDER G. FRASER, D.D. . . . .	194
II.—Correspondence put in by W. LEE-WARNER, Esq, C.S., Acting Chief Secretary to Government, Bombay . . . . .	196
III.—The Hon'ble RAYMOND WEST, M.A., LL.D., F.R.G.S., C.S., Barrister-at-Law, Judge, High Court, and Vice-Chancellor of the University, Bombay . . . . .	203

## ERRATA

### VOLUME IV —SECTION II.

- Page 9, Q. 174.* For "undergraduates" read "graduates"  
*Page 20, Q. 300, line 3* For "after" read "during"  
*Page 41, Heading* For "Talugdar" read "Talugdari," and omit "Ahmedabad"  
*Page 41, Q. 577* For "Talugdari Settlement Office at" read "Talugdari Settlement Officer in."  
*Page 44, Q. 638* For "Lukshminarain" read "Lakshman"  
*Page 68, Q. 919, line 5* For "Mr." read "Lord"  
*Page 113, Q. 1693.* After "would" insert "you."  
*Page 162, Q. 2271* For "even" read "ever"  
*Page 168, Q. 2184, line 4* Omit "on the same pay"  
*Page 215, above Q. 3093* For "Mr Stewart" read "Mr. Nulkar."  
*Page 314, Q. 4391* For "Sathyanandan" read "Satyendranath"  
*Page 219, Q. 3182.* After "would" insert "you"  
*Page 320, Q. 3199.* For "Bedouns" read "Bedouins"  
*Page 221, Q. 3241* For "Morarity" read "Inverarty"  
*Page 291, Q. 4082* For "Khaist" read "Kayesth"  
*Page 311, Q. 4347, line 4* For "1853" read "1833"

1887 to T. H. Stewart, Esq., Bombay Civil Service, Byculla Club, Bombay, with a short note of the points on which they wish to give evidence.

F. C. DAUKES,

*Secretary, Public Service Commission.*

*January 3rd, 1887.*

## II.

No. 4, dated Lahore, 16th November 1886.

From—The Secretary to the Public Service Commission,

To—The Chief Secretary to the Government of Bombay.

I am directed to request that, with the permission of His Excellency the Governor in Council, the Public Service Commission may be favoured with a list of the names of selected officers serving in the Bombay Presidency and Sind and belonging to (a) the Covenanted Civil Service, (b) the Statutory Service, and (c) the Uncovenanted Service, whose opinions the Bombay Government may consider it desirable for the Commission to invite on the subject-matter of the enquiries with which it has been entrusted, as set forth in the Resolution of the Government of India in the Home Department No. 34—1573-80, dated 4th October