NOTE SUBMITTED TO THE

FUNCTIONS COMMITTE

BY

The Honourable Mr. V. J. PATEI

BAR-AT-LAW,

MEMBER, IMPERIAL LEGISLATIVE COUL

23RD DECEMBER 1918.

Printed at the "Hindusthan" Press, No. 12-16, 'ombay, and Published by the Honourable Mr. V. J.

I. RESERVED & TRANSFERRED SUBJECTS.

The distinguished authors of the Indian Constitutional Reform Scheme have given two illustrative lists of "reserved" and "transferred" subjects. It is admitted by the authors themselves that the lists cannot be regarded as exhaustive; that they will not be suitable to all provinces; that they may not be exactly suitable to any province; and that they should be regarded as merely illustrative of the authors' intentions. Now what should be the subjects for reservation by Provincial Executive Government? The underlying principle of the Reform Scheme is to achieve complete Self-Government by stages, and the goal shall be fowards complete "transfer" of subjects. The ideal lies in the pushing force and not in the pulling force, or in other words towards the "decentralization" or "complete transfer" and not towards "centralization" or "reservation." The authors themselves lay down the following guiding principles:-

- (1) Those subjects which afford most opportunity for local knowledge and local service;
- (2) Those in which Indians have shown themselves to be keenly interested;
- (3) Those in which mistakes may occur which though serious, would not be irremediable; and

- (4) Those which stand most in need of development;
- should be relegated to the "transferred" category.

As regards "Reserved Subjects" the principles laid down are:—

- (1) Departments primarily concerned with the maintenance of law and order;
- (2) Questions of land revenue or tenant rights;
- (3) Problems affecting defence or foreign or political relations or foreign trade or tariff;
- (4) Matters which give rise to questions affecting the interests of more than one province;
- (5) Subjects which concern the interests of all India Services even if serving under Provincial Governments;
- (6) Subjects which raise religious or racial issues; and
- (7) Subjects which affect the interests of existing services;

should be held as " reserved."

The reasons alleged for reserving the first item are:—that maintenance of law and order is not such a subject as would give a scope to *local* knowledge and *local* service; that a mistake therein would be disastrous; that Indians have not yet shown keen interest therein, and that they are

lacking in administrative experience. As to the second subject of reservation, it is argued that it is a matter which vitally affects the well-being of the masses who may not be adequately represented in the new Councils. Items Nos. 3, 4 & 5 are put down as illustrative of the powers of intervention by the Government of India either by Legislative or administrative action, while items Nos. 6 and 7 are stated as illustrative of the powers of intervention by the Provincial Executive Government.

Without deviating from the fundamental principles laid down by the authors of the scheme, it may be stated that the greater the political education and administrative aptitude of a province the speedier should be the action towards the "Self-Government" or its enfranchisement. Besides there should be at least one province in which provincial autonomy is working at full speed at the commencement of the Reform Scheme in order to compare its results with those of partial Autonomy in less developed provinces.

Now there can be no two opinions on the point that the Bombay Presidency occupies the foremost rank in political development. If a claim for full provincial Autonomy is put forth, this Presidency can support it with all possible evidence.

I would, however, concede that the subject of the maintenance of law through police may, for the present, remain with the Provincial Executive and therefore proceed to adduce arguments why all other provincial subjects should be in the hands of Indian Ministers.

Under the broad category of "maintenance of law and order" are included the administration of Criminal Justice, including village-courts, prisons, criminal tribes, working of particular Acts, prisons etc. Now it is as clear as daylight that Indians are as keenly interested in the management of their prisons, criminal tribes settlement, and local and special acts like Poisons, Dramatic performances, Coroners etc, as they are in their village Panchajats, and village sanitation. Those matters should at once be relegated to the Category of "transferred Subjects"

As regards "Administration of Criminal Justice", there is a confusion of thought that this matter is inextricably mingled up with the police administration. The fabric of the Indian Penal Code and Criminal Procedure Code shows that the Magistrates' connection with "crime" commences from the stage of complaint or lodging of information of a cognizable offence by the police. The subsequent proceedings are purely judicial and are to be conducted in accordance with the strict rules of evidence. The association of the head of the police with the head of the magistracy is the topic of constant criticism, and in the New Reform Scheme the separation of the executive from the

judicial will have to be carried through. The magistracy ought to be free from the leading strings of the police, and should be absolutely subordinate to the Judicial department and the High Court.

It may be argued that magistrates have to perform certain duties connected with the prevention of crime in addition to the adjudication of guilt or innocence of accused persons. To this it may be replied that the prevention of crime in which the magistrate's aid is required takes two forms:—

- (1) Proceedings for security for preservation of peace and good behavour; and
- (2) Issue of orders for the use of force and arms in times of riots or disturbance of public peace. The first is not a mere executive function, but a judicial function. The police are bound to adduce evidence in support of the charge of probable breach of peace and bad behaviour. The accused are to be heard and defence evidence recorded. The Magistrate has very little to do with the effect of his decisions in security proceedings. It is this covert intimidation of district disturbance, coupled with the absolute subordination of the magistracy to the Collector—District Magistrate, who in majority of cases accepts the view of a highly paid District Superintendent of Police rather than the verdict of a Mamlatdar—Magis-

trate which keeps back most of the Indian magistrates from discharging their judicial duties fearlessly.

As to the orders in times of disturbance, the magistrate has to take initiative on his own responsibility. It is expected that by his wider outlook and experience, he has to determine the line of action in critical times. He is not expected to be a mere tool in the hands of the police who may feel the necessity to use arms for suppression of riot. If a magistrate does not rise up to the occasion, and if peace is disturbed by his folly or weakness, he is sure to be condemmed in a popular rule under Ministerial control.

The administration of Criminal Justice is cannected on the one hand with the police, and on the other with the Revenue Administration. If its connection is to be severed from the police; it should go bodily with Land Revenue to the "transferred category" both on economical and administrative grounds as will be presently shown:—

One of the arguments advanced against separation of the "executive" from the "judicial is that will involve considerable cost by duplication of establishment. Individually I am of opinion that the desideratum is complete separation at any cost at the earliest opportunity. But if this goal is not to be achieved in immediate future, the transfer

of control of Land Revenue and Administration of Criminal Justice to Indian Ministers, will remove the fang of the cobra of combination of judicial and exe-The Mamlatdar-Magistrate, or Deputy Collector-Sub-Divisional Magistrate, or Collector-District Magistrate will feel that he is not under the control of two masters: that he will not have to look to the Provincial Government for prospects in service while performing his dual function; and that he will not give undue importance to one side of his duites viz, executive, as at present. He will try to learn to respect the wishes of the people more than heretofore by his subordination to Indian Ministers who, though appointed by the Governor, will be returned by popular will to the Legislative Council.

As to "Land Revenue" I am of opinion that so far as this Presidency is concerned, there is no necessity to apprehend that the interests of the masses will be jeopardised; or that the tenancy rights would be crushed; or that revenue would be sacrificed. In the proposed broadening of the elective franchise, the interests of Rayats will be duly represented. The principal land revenue tenure in the Bombay Presidency is Rayatwari, and the interests of tenants or inferior holders are sufficiently safeguarded by express provisions of the Land Revenue Code. The Settlements with reference to agricultural lands have been revised

in the whole of the Presidency, and there have been second revision also in some of the Talukas. These settlements involve a guarantee of assessment for a period of 30 years, and the new form of Government with "transferred" powers is legally bound to respect this guarantee. As to non-agricultural settlement, the areas which have already developed, or which are in a stage of development have their situation value and standard rates determined. Settlements already effected for periods of 50 or 99 years cannot be disturbed. As to future policy with regard to agricultural or non-agricultural settlements, the possible improvment may take the form of subjecting the revision proposals involving grouping of villages, and fixing of maxima rates to the vote of the Legislative Council. The greatest drawback in the present Land Revenue Administration is that although the adjective law relating to the procedure of Revenue Officers and the modes of recovery of Government dues is subject to the decision of the Legislative Council, the substantive law relating to the settlement of land-revenue for a period of 30 years in the case of agricultural lands, and of 50 years in the case of agricultural lands is left to the Absolute will of the Executive Government. Neither the people nor their representative in the Legislative Council have any voice in shaping the destiny of Rayats. As a matter of fact the fate of the Rayat is determined by

the will of one Settlement Officer. It is true that his proposals are subjected to scrutiny by the Collector, Divisional Commissioner, and Settlement Commissioner and that Rayats are given one opportunity to raise their objections against the proposals before final orders are passed by Government. But a glance at the green books of the Government of Bombay relating to the literature of Settlement reports will convince any unbiassed mind that in many cases Rayats have not understood the gravity of the proposals, their intricacies and their effect on individual holdings, and in some cases their objections valid though they may be intrinsically, are brushed aside against the strong bulwark of statistics gathered by the Settlement Officer, Government in passing final orders have, under the circumstances, to acquiesce in their proposals. The system is all one-sided and when the Local Legislative Council will contain adequate representation of Rayats and other large land-holders, the periodic settlement of land revenue must be subjected to the vote of the Council, and should not be left in the hands of the mere executive Government, which at present gets a blank cheque under the rule-making section of the Land Revenue Code.

As to alleged encroachment on the tenancy rights, it may be observed that under the existing provisions of the L. R. C. the possibility of rack

renting is guarded against, so much so, that although the matter of revision and suspension of land-revenue due from superior holders to Government is subject to executive rules, the levy of rent due by inferior holders to superior holders is legislatively controlled by barring the proceedings of assistance applications, (See Amended Land Revenue Code).

I think the apprehension of Government is on the side of tenants and not on the side of landlords. Assuming that the Government are also anxious about the rights of landlords or superior holders under which term are included all Inamdars, Jagirdars, Talukdars, I can say that this section of population is well advanced in education to look after their own interests.

Thus all grounds of "reservation" are futile, so far as the Bombay Presidency is concerned, with reference to Land Revenue administration. Under the existing regime the land revenue administration is not subject to the legislative coutrol of the Government of India. In certain matters of alienation of lands and land-revenue the Government of India exercise administrative control (Vide pages 15 & 16 of the statement showing the heads of business dealt with in the Revenue Department prepared by the Government of Bombay). Thus it is not on the ground of encroachment on the

powers of the Central Imperial Government that "reservation" is justifiable. It is already a Provincial subject, and the question is:—whether it should be under the control of the Provincial Executive Council or of Indian Ministers? The only answer is that it should go to the control of Indian Ministers.

If the subject of Land Revenue Administration is declared to be "transferred", the question how far the Government of India should retain administrative control becomes of secondary importance. It is then a question of detail, and not of principle. As an illustration as to how far the control of Government of India can be withdrawn, I append a concise statement with my remarks on some of the heads of business dealt with in the Revenue Department of Bombay in which Government of India at present exercise control.

ACCOMPANIMENTS TO SECTION I.

STATEMENT SHOWING THE HEADS OF BUSINESS IN THE REVENUE DEPARTMENT THE CONTROL ON WHICH IS EXERCISED BY THE GOVERNMENT OF INDIA TOGETHER WITH REMARKS AS TO HOW FAR SUCH CONTROL SHOULD BE RELAXED.

Heads of business.	Control exercised by the Government of India.	Remarks.
The Gujrat Talukdar's Act VI of 1888 (Bombay Act). (1) Fixing the pay and allowance of the Talukdari Settlement Officer.	This is sanctioned by the	This appointment is listed for provincial Civil Service. Its pay has already been fixed for a P. C. S. at Rs. 800. In future the appointment should be absolutely provincialized as it is not reserved for I. C. S. according to the shedule to the Government
(2) Making an allotment	This is sanctioned by the	ernment of India Act.

Talukdari Distribution of the allotment is made by this Gov. ernment.

See Note on Finance.

The Sind incumbered Estate Act XXII of 1896.

(1) Pay and allowances of the Manager Sind in in the Government of India. cumbered Estates.

These are sanctioned by

See remarks against (1) under Gujrath Talukdar's Act. The appointment is fit to be provincialized.

Department of Agriculture.

(1) Measures for the exetc..

Orders on this subject are ernment of India.

There is no harm in the Governtension of the area under issued in accordance with ment of India issuing general instrucwheat, castorseed, linseed the instructions of the Gov-tions, as the distribution of foodstuff is an Imperial concern.

Agricultural conditions and prospects-scarcity and famine.

(1) Standing preparation

(a) An efficient system cers in accordance of intelligence.

of relief works.

ment and tools.

against famine including, carried out by District Offi-| Famine Relief Code under (b) An effective programe the orders of the Local Government and are subject (c) reserves of establish to the general control of the Government of India.

These arrangements are General control of the Government of India may stand.

Heads of business.	Control exercised by the Government of India.	Remarks.	
(2) Submission of sepa- rate famine or scarcity tele- grams to the Government of India every week when	his is done under the orders of the Government of India.	May stand.	
the existence of scarcity or famine is recognized and of monthly reports to that Government subsequently.			.)
Adoption of measures for T the relief of the affected	by the local officers under	May stand.	
tracts.	the Famine Relief Code subject: to the General control of the Local Gov- ernment and the Govern- ment of India.		,
The Destructive Insects and Pests Act II of 1914.		Do.	

The Co-operative Societies Act 11 of 1912.

(1) This act which was of India applies to the whole British India.

of articles likely to cause infection to any crop is vested in the Government of India under section III of the Act while the power of framing rules for detention, inspection, disinfection or destruction of any article or articles notified under that section is vested in the Local Government.

The Act is worked by the following matters however (1) must be retained with the Governrequire the sanction of Gov- ment of India. rnment of India:-

(1) Exemption of the re-

Matters of administrative control passed by the Government | Registrar of the Co-opera- | by the Government of India. As long tive Societies and the Gov- as Imperial control in matters of ernment of Bombay. The Income Tax etc. is retained, Item No.

> Item No. II should be provingistered Co-operativ- cialized. The appointment should es Societies from In- not be kept up for an I. C. S.

Heads of business.

in the acquisition or land which may be required by them.

(3) Grant of financial assistance to co-operative societies.

In 1904 the Government of India sanctioned the grant of loans (free of interest)

India sanctioned the grant of loans (free of interest for the first three years) to Co-operative Societies subject to the condition that the total amount advanced to a Society and due by it should not exceed (1) the total amount of money subscribed and deposited or of share capital paid up by the members or (2) Rs. 2000 in each case. Any relaxation of the conditions requires the sanction of the Government of India. See note on finance.

Heads of Business,	Control exercised by the Government of India,	Řemarks.	
Civil Veterinary Department. (1) Appointment ot officers to the Indian Civil Veterinary Department.	These appointments are made by the Secretary of State for India. Officers are appointed on probation for five years and the Government of India have to decide the question of confirming them at the end of that period.	This department is wholly provincial. This service should be provincialized.	18
Land and Land Revenue (outside Bombay City). (1) Formation of divisions under the Commissioners.		A Provincial concern. The Government of India may be informed.	

- (2) Grant of settlement allowance to a member of the Provincial Civil Service appointed to do settlement work in addition to his own duties.
- (3) Grant of unalienated venue in cases referred to items (1) to (9) at pages 15 and 16.

The sanction of Government of India is necessary.

Government India land revenue-free or on exercise general control and Survey or other tenures, their sanction is necessary

There is no propriety in retaining this power by the Government of India. No such power is retained when the Settlement Officer is an I. C. S.

General control over the right of alienation of land or assignment of land revenue in the Imperial Governand alienation of land re | in certain cases (e. g. in | ment is needed. If land revenue is declared to be a "transferred" subject a restriction may be imposed on Provincial legislature that rules so far as they relate to this subject should be subject to the approval of the Government of India. Under the existing rules the Local Gove innerv have embodied the principation of down by the Government of In Jaio

Heads of business.	Control exercised by tne Government of India.	Remarks.
Excise.	Vide page 18 of the Note showing the heads or business dealt with in the Revenue Department.	bay are loath to part wispects

The remarks against Excise apply

to Salt and Customs also.

necessity for a change in a Native State, and if the Native State is not willing to agree to the proposal the Provincial Government in the "trans. ferred" Department should propose a subsidy and in case of refusel the matter may be left to arbitration. But this by itself should not be taken as a valid argument for reservation of the subject by Provincial Government.

the Note. Vide page 36 and 37 of The question of retaining control The Indian Civil Service and the Provincial Civil the Note. over all India services is a thorny one. On a careful consideration of Service. pros and cons, I am of opinion that if the control of services is to be retained by the Provincial Executive as a "reserved" subject, the conditions specified in my Note on control of services should be enforced. (Vide separate note on this subject).

Vide pages 21 and 22 of

Salt and Customs.

Heads of business.	Control exercised by the Government of India.	- Remarks.
Native titles.	Vide page 38 of the Note.	In the interests of Public Service a few remarks are necessary. These native titles are boons of Royal prerogative. Let the Provincial Executive pour these boons on non-officials as they like as incentive to good work. But to confer titles on Officers of Government while they are in actual service leads to invidious distinctions in members of the same service in rank and precedence. Long and meritorious services may be rewarded after retirement.
Income Tax,	Vide page 46 of the Note.	May be retained as an Imperial item.

Forest.

(1) Declaration that any forest or any portion thereof reserved under the Indian | Under the Executive orders | control may stand. Forest Act shall cease to of that Government, the be a Reserved Forest.

- (2) Compilation of the annual forest administration report.
- (3) Resignation of Officers of the Imperial forest Service.

Subject to the control Bombay Government may Sanction disforestments from reserved forests when the area involved does not exceed one square mile in each case.

of India Government exercise general control i.e. they specify the form of ment of India. the report.

The sanction of the Government of India to the acceptance of resignations should be followed. is necessary.

Should be Provincial. Subject to of Government of India. this restriction Government of India's

> No harm in retaining such an administrative control by the Govern-

See remarks against Indian Civil Service. The same principle

II Subjects for Provincial Legislature.

The authors of the Reform proposals have laid down certain principles on this subject in the para relating to legislative devolution (para 212).

Now the proper course is to classify the subjects first into Imperial and Provincial subjects. Subjects which are of overlapping nature i. c. those which require Imperial Control should be sub-divided into:—mixed subjects requiring legislative control; and mixed subjects requiring administrative control of the Government of India. The Government of Bombay have rightly divided the subjects into the following four categories:—

- I. Matters which are of wholly provincial concern.
- II. Matters which are primarily provincial but in respect of which some statutory restriction on the discretion of the provincial Government may be necessary.
- III. Matters provincial in character but as to which it is advisable that the right of legislation should be in the hands of the Government of India.
 - IV. Matters which are wholly Imperial.

Those which are wholly Provincial (No. I) or those which although mixed require administra-

der the control of the Provincial Legislative Council. I give one or two concrete instances of various Departments showing how matters which are at present entirely provincial in point of administration are retained by the Government of India "Treasure Trove"— a subject of the G. D. entirely provincial in character and in which the power of the Collector has been delegated to the Mamlatdar is retained in the hands of Imperial Legislature. I fail to see what Imperial concerns are involved in the disposal of Treasure Trove.

Take another instance of "Lepers and leper Asylums" dealt with by the G. D. The subject is purely Local rather than Provincial, and yet an Imperial importance is given to it, although the Government of India have not exercised any control under the Act III of 1889 up to now.

Take again for instance "Endowment Funds"—a subject deal with by the Educational Department. If any donation is made for local benefit where is the propriety that the Imperial Legislative Council should take up the Bill for its management? It is purely a Provincial concern.

Similarly the management of "Reformatory Schools" is a Provincial concern and the Imperial Legislature should have no hand in it.

An Imperial halo is unnecessarily attached to various subjects which can safely be relegated to the Provincial Legislature. A large number of subjects can be pruned out in this way out of the statements prepared by the Government of Bombay.

I append a list of enactments framed by the Government of India, and administered by the Government of Bombay with my remarks as to the necessity or otherwise of transferring the subjects thereof to the sphere of Provincial Legislature.

Accompaniment to Section II.

List of enactments of the Government of India administered by the Government of Bombay in the various departments with remarks as to whether the subject,—matter is fit to be left to Provincial Lagislature.

GENERAL DEPARTMENT.

Present Law Code or Regulations etc.	Category under which the subject falls.	Remarks
The Indian Treassure Trove Act, 1878.	III	There is no necessity to keep any control in the hands of the Legislature of the Govt: of India. A few broad principles may be laid down for the guidance of the Provincial Govt: for the disposal of finds and numismatics etc. At present the whole Act is administered by the Mamlatdar to whom the Collector's power has been delegated.
The Irdian Lunacy Act IV of 1912.	III	This is also a provincial concern. If it be relegated to the Provincial Legislative Council, the rules to be framed by the Local Govt: may be subjected to the administrative approval of the Government of India.

Present Law Code or Regulations etc.	Category uuder which the Subject falls.	Remarks.
The Indian Lepers Act III of 1898.		This is purely a Provincial subject for Provincial Legislature.
The Cantonment Act XV of 1910.	III	Legislative power may remain with the Imperial Government.
The Cantonment House Accomodation Act of 1902.		Do.
The Indian Emigration Act XVII of 1908.	III	Do,
The Indian Explosives Act IV of 1884, & Explosive rules.		Do.
The Indian Patents & Designs Act II of 1911.		Do.
The Native Passengers Ships Act X of 1887.		Do.
The Indian Petroleum Act VII of 1899.	III	Legislation may remain with the Government of India.
The Pilgrim Ships Act XV of 1895.	III	Do.
The Protection of Pil- grims Act, Bombay Act II of 1887.		Do.
The Indian Volunteers Act XX of 1859.	IV	Do.

Present Law Code or Regulations etc.	Category under which the Subject falls.	. Remarks.
Army Regulations Vol IX. Registration of Mar- riages Act III of 1872. The Births, Death & Marriage Registra- tion Act VI of 1886. The Indian Tramways Act, XI of 1886. The Epidemic Diseas- es Act, 1897.	III -	Legislation may remain with the Government of India. Do. Where Local Acts are in force this Act is a dead letter. Purely a Provincial matter for Provincial Legislature. This Act is wholly administered by the Provincial Govt: The Legislative power may be left to the Province & rules be subjected to the scrutiny of the Imperial Government.
The Ancient Monuments Preservation Act, VII of 1904. Indian ports Act XV of 1908, Rules under Clause (p) of subsection (11 of section 6).	III	May remain with the Imperial Legislature. Do.
The Indian Census Ac XVI of 1910.	t III	It is an All-India concern & may remain with the Central Government.

Present Law Code or Regulations etc.	Category under which the Subject falls.	Remarks.
The City of Bombay Improvement Trust Act IV of 1898.	II	Absolutoly a provincial affair. It is absurd that when the Municipal law of the Town of Bombay is under the control of Provincial Legislature, this institution should be raised to an Imperial status.
The Indian Factories Act XII of 1911	III	Legislation may remain with the Government of India.
The Indian Copyright Act III of 1914.	IV	To be delegated to the Provincial Legislature.
The Bombay Smoke Nuisance Act VII of 1912 (sec. 2).		Provincial entirely.
The Prince of Wales Museum Act III of 1909.		Do.
C. S. Regulations.	I	Imperial concern.

EDUCATIONAL DEPARTMENT.

The Indian Universities Act, 1904.	III	Imperial for uniformity of higher education in India.
	`	

POLITICAL DEPARTMENT.

Present Law Code or Regulations etc.	Category under which the Subject falls,	Remarks.
The Indian Extradition Act, XV of 1903.	IV	Imperial.
The Fugitive Offenders Act, 1881.	IV	Do.
The Political Prison- ers and Detenus Bombay Regulation XXV of 1827.		Imperial. It is an old regulation of Bombay.
Sardars in Deccan Regulation XXIX of of 1827 and Section 5 of Regulation VII of 1830.		Provincial entirely and to be treated as such.
The Foreign Ordinances of 1914,	II	Imperial.
The Indian Naval and Military News (Emergency)	1 '	Do.
Ordinance No. I of 1914.	IV	Do.
Impressment of Vessels Ordinance No. II of 1914.	II	Do.
Ingress into India Ordinance No. V of 1914.	.1	Do.

ECCLESIASTICAL DEPARTMENT.

Present Law Code of Regulations etc.	Catelogy under winch the Subject falls.	Remarks.
The Government of India Act, 1915, Sec. 115, 117-121.	III	This is an old relic of the East India Company's times in the Parliamentary Statute. When the Parliamentary Bill comes up for consideration, maintenance of the Ecclesiastical Department out of the revenues of India should be opposed in view of the non-interference policy of His Majesty's Government in matters of religion. The establishment may be maintained by the followers of the various churches.
THE MAR	INE D	EPARTMENT.
The Indian Merchant's shipping Act V of 1883.	1	Imperial Legislation.
The Indian Steam Ves-	III	Do.
sels Act I of 1917. The Indian Transfer of		Do.
Ships Registration		
Act. XX of 1917. The Indian Ports Act XV of 1908.	III	Do.

JUDICIAL DEPARTMENT.

	<u> </u>	
Present haw Code or Regulations etc.	Category under which the subject falls.	Remarks.
ne Criminal Tribes Act (India) III of 1911.		Should be absolutely pro- vincialized in legislation and administration.
P. C. V. of 1898. Proners Act IV of 1871.	I	Imperial. Do.
Dombay Civil Courts Act 1869 (India Act XIV of 1869).	II.	To be delegated to the Provincial Legislature.
ne Provincial Small Causes Courts Act (India Act IX of 1887).		Do.
he Cantonment Act India Act XV of of 1910.	I	Imperial.
he Parsi Marriage and Divorce Act.	Ι	Do.
ndia Act XV of 1867)		
risons Act (India Act IX of 1894).	II	Do.
risoners Act III of 1900 as amended by Act I of 1903.		Do,
		•

Present Law Code of	Category under which the subject falls,	Remarks.
The European Vagrency Act IX of 1874.	II .	Imperial.
The Indian Lunacy Act IV of 1912.	III	See remarks against this Act in the G. D. Schedule.
The Court fees Act VII of 1870.	I & III	
The Schedule Districts Act XIV of 1874.	•	Do.
The Negotiable Instru- ments Act XXVI of 1881.	IV	Do.
The Transfer of Pro- perty Act IX of 1882	Ί	Do.
The Poisons Act I of 1904.	I, II & IV	Purely a Provincial matter. Formerly the Bombay Presidency had an Act of tits own.
The Provincial Insolvency Act III of 1907		To be Provincialized.
The Official Trustees Act II of 1913.	IV	Imperial.
The Defence of India Act IV of 1915 and rules thereunder.		Do.
The Indian Soldiers litigation Act IX o 1918.	L	Do.
The Indian Stage Car riages Act XVI o 1861.		To be delegated to Pro- vincial Legislature.

Present Law Code or Regulations etc.	Category under which the subject falls.	Remarks,
The Indian succession Act X of 1865.	III	Imperial.
The Press and Registration of books (XIX of 1876.)	I	To be delegated to Provincial Legislature.
The Dramater performens Act XV of 1876.	Ι	Do.
The Indian Arms Act XI of 1878 and Rules.	IV & III .	Imperial.
The Probate and Administration Acts, V of 1881 and VIII of 1903.	III	Do.
The Newspapers (Incitement to offences) Act VII of 1908.	I	Do'
The Indian Criminal Law amendment Act XIV of 1908,	I & II	Do.
The Indian Press Act I of 1910.	I	Do.
	I & II	Do.
The Indian Airships Act XVII of 1911 XVI of 1914.	IV	Do.

Present Law Code or Regulations etc.	Category under which the subject falls.	. Remarks.
The Administrator Generals Act III of 1913.		To be delegated to the Provincial Legislature.
The Indian Criminal L w Amendment Act VIII of 1913.		Imperial. This was the subject of
The Indian Motor Vehi- cles Act VIII of 1915.		Provincial Legislature and should be restored as such.

III CONTROL OF SERVICES.

It is proposed to retain the subject of the appointments, conditions of service, and control of all Provincial Services under the "Reserved" category (vide entry No. 4 of the illustrative list No. 1 under appendix II of the Montagu-Chelmsford Report).

Now if Provincial Autonomy is to be given in all or almost all subjects in an advanced province like Bombay the control of services prima facie be transferred to popular control. The chief arguments against the transfer of the control over the Indian and Provincial services to the Ministers are:—

- (i) That the Indian Civil Service is an Imperial service, and its officers are spread over the whole of India in various departments of Provincial Government.
- (ii) That the subject cannot be confined to the sphere of action of one province and should, therefore, be a "reserved" subject as per principles laid down in para 212.
- (iii) That the Government of India ought to have power of intervention in "questions concerning the interests of All-India services even if serving under Provincial Governments" (para 240).

(iv) That the Ministers will find it difficult to "inaugurate new services for their own departments" and that if such a responsibility is saddled on them the experiment will prove a failure (para 259).

INDIAN CIVIL SERVICE.

Now the premier service viz. the Indian Civil Service is technically Imperial, but it is really a Provincial Civil Service. New recruits are from the beginning attached to various provinces and except in the case of members who are lucky in securing a footing in the Imperial Government, the majority retire in the same pro-The Members of the Indian Civil Service are primarily connected with (1) the Land Revenue and General Administration Branch and (2) Judicial Department and a glance at the schedule tothe Government of India Act, 1915, will show what posts in these departments are reserved for the Indian Civil Service. The accompanying schednle will, however, show that a number of other appointments belonging to "specialised" departments are held by members of the Indian Civil Service. There is no reason why members this Service should be selected fill up the special posts, when competent Europeans or Indians of other Provincial Services could be had. If these officers are confined to

Land Revenue, General Administration and Judi cial Departments the argument for keeping the control of the services as a "reserved" subject will lose much of its force.

If Land-Revenue and Administration of Civil and Criminal Justice are transferred to ministrial control in an advanced province like Bombay, it becomes imperatively necessary for good and responsible Government that members of the Indian and Provincial Civil Services should be under the control of ministers. Without meaning any disrespect to these distinguished services, it may fairly be stated that ministers who have no voice in the transfer and promotions of officers placed under them will find it difficult to secure loyal co-operation from the services.

OTHER IMPERIAL SERVICES.

In addition to the Indian Civil Service the Bombay Government have under their control members of the following Imperial services:—

- 1. Imperial Finance Service.
- 2. Indian Educational Service.
- 3. Indian Medical Service in Civil Employment.
- 4. Military Officers in the Political Department.

- 5. Imperial P. W. D. Service.
- 6. Indian Agricultural Service.
 - 7. Indian Civil Veterinary Service and
- 8. Indian Forest Service.

It is a foregone conclusion that most of the subjects with which these services are conected will fall under the category of "transferred" heads. Members of these services will have to co-operate and carry out the orders of the Indian Ministers. I don't wish to go into the details of the system of recruitment of members of these services; nor do I wish to criticize the conclusions of the Public Service Commission as regards pay, pension and leave rules. These are subjects which are to be determined by Govern. ment in the interests of their own servants. The point involved in the constitutional Reform scheme so far as services are concerned is connected with the question of control only.

In view of the difficulties pointed out by the authors of the Reform Scheme it may not be found possible to "transfer" the subject of control of services by itself to Indian Ministers. But I am emphatically of opinion that while "reserving" this subject for the Provincial executive the following conditions shall be laid down for good Government:—

- (1) That the members of the Indian Civil Service should be confined to their legitimate spheres determined in the schedule to the Government of India Act. 1915.
- (2) That they should be withdrawn from "Special Departments" on suitable Indians being found available from the Provincial or other services;
- (3) That although members of all Imperial services may remain subject to the rules of Imperial Government about recruitment etc, the disciplinary control shall be entirely with the Indian ministers with respect to their functions relating to "transferred" subjects;
- (4) That they shall not be removed from "transferred" Department to a departmental dealing with "reserved subjects" without the consent of the Indian Ministers:
- (5) That promotions and prospects of these servants shall be dependent on the opinion of Indian ministers, and in case of difference of opinion the matter shall be determined by the full Council of the Provincial executive and Indian Ministers by majority of votes;
- (6) That corresponding Provincial Services should be under the same controlling authorities as govern the Imperial Services;

- (7) That just as there regular rules of recruitment etc., for the Provincial Services (Executive and Judicial Branches) there should be regular rules for Provincial Services of other Departments (viz, Educational, Agricultural, Political). There is much laxity in filling up posts of these Provincial Services. A reference to pages 28 and 32 of the Statement of subjects prepared by the Political Department will convince the Committee that in filling up Political appointments Government have got absolute patronage which requires to be regularized.
 - (8) That even services connected with "reserved" subjects also e,g, police administration, Indian Ministers should have a voice in expressing their views on the conduct of officers as revealed from their actions in departmental or judicial proceedings connected with "transferred" subjects. If such a principle is not laid down, a Superintendent of Police under the control of Provincial Executive will be put on a more privileged position than a judge whose subject happens to fall under "transferred" category.

Schedule the Presidenc Total I. (Tem Permaner Supernum not 8	ANIMET TO SECTION Is of distribution of I. C. S. Officers on the list apporarily reduced to 171). Int	cers in il lists 173 124
•	Total	173
GOVE	RNMENT AND SECRETARI	AT.
	Members of Council (including additional temporary). Secretaries. Private Secretary. ND REVENUE AND GENINISTRATION.	
$\begin{array}{c} \times 13 \\ \times 14 \\ \hline \\ \frac{1}{32} \end{array}$	Divisional Commissioners. Commissioner in Sind. Senior Collectors. Junior Collectors. Deputy Commissioner U. S. District. TERIOR POSTS.	Frontier
×10 ×17 ×18 ×1 - 46	Assistant Collectors @ Do @ Do @ T. S. O. (in his capacity a Collector).	1200 900 700 s Asst :

III. J	UDICIAL DEPARTMENT
×	3 High Court Judges @ 4000
×	1 Judicial Commissioner in
	Sind @ 3500 1 Addtional Judicial Commis-
, ··· ~	sioner in Sind @ 3000
×	sioner in Sind @ 3000 3 District Judges @ 2500
	6 Do. (a) 2323
×1	Do. Including Jud.
	Asst: to the Agent at
. -	- Kathiawar 1800
2	$oldsymbol{5}$
IV,	POLITICAL DEPARTMENT.
-	Agent to the Governor.
V. (OPIUM EXCISE ETC.
×1	. Comissioner of Customs, Salt etc.
$\frac{1}{2}$	Superintendent of Stamps etc.
	LAND RECORDS DEPARTMENT.
	. Director.
$\frac{1}{2}$	Supt. of L. R.
VII. S	SPECIAL APPOINTMENTS.
1.	. Chairman Improvement Trust.
	Do. Port Trust.
.1.	Additional Secretary to Govt.
	Director of Industries.
1.	. Deputy Secretary to Govt. Political
	Judicial Department.
•	. S. D. O.
1,	. Administrator Junagadh. Do. Palitana.
1.	
1.	 Deputy Director of Civil Supplies (Temporary.)
1.	Bombay Municipal Commissioner.
3.	. Municipal Commissioners at Ahmeda
	bad, Surat and Hyderabad.

Assist. Commissioner in Sind.

Asst: Collector on Settlment of Crimi-1. nal tribes at Belgaum.

Assistants on Settlement duty.

Board of Trade. 1.

With other Governments. 15.

On Military duty. 26.

61

	Total
XThese are appointments reserved for	12 ₀ 32 46
I.C.S., as per Schedule Schedule III of the	25 1
Government of India Act. 1915	2 2
(5 & 6 Geo. 5.)	61
107	181
Note I-Permanent I. C. S., Officers come up 124 If follows therefore that 17 appointments which are 'unreserved' are by I. C. S. Officers in addition to the legitimate reserved posts. Deduct I. C. S. Officers with other vinces Total	pro- 177
(Deduct)	4 retired
Note II-Number of "Listed" posts. 2 Collectors @ Rs. 1600 and 1200 3 District Judge @ Rs. 1600. 1 T. S. O. 3 Assistant Judges.	173
9	,

Out of two Collectorships, only one is given to a P. C. S., the other is held by a Statutory Civil Servent T. S. O's post is still held by an I. C. S.

- Out of 17 "Unreserved" posts it may be conceded that the following are fit to be held by I. C. S. Officers only in public interests:—
 - 1 Private Secretary to the Governor.
 - 1 Agent to the Governor at Kathiawar. Director of Land Records,
- There is no justification for I. C. S. Officers holding the remaining 14 substantive "un reserved" appointments.

IV FINANCIAL DEVOLUTION.

No amount of Legislative devolution or Administrative decentralization will secure the Provincial Autonomy unless the key of the provincial exchequer is in the hands of the Provincial Government. A careful analysis of the Reform proposals shows that the following principles are recommended for adoption:—

- (1) The broad divisions of Indian and Provincial heads of Revenue are to be maintained.
- (2) Income Tax and general stamps are to be transferred to the Indian Revenues.
- (3) Land Revenue, Irrigation, Excise and Judicial stamps are to be declared provincial heads.
- (4) The present "divided" heads of revenue are to disappear.
- (5) Government of India to levy a contribution of 87 p. c. of the gross Provincial surplus.
- (6) Government of India to be empowered to impose a special supplementary tax upon Provinces in times of emergency.

- (7) Periodic Commissions recommended should examine the adequacy of the Provincial contribution
- (8) There should be complete separation of. Imperial and Provincial Budgets.
- (9) The Code restrictions to continue on the spending power of provinces unless the control of the Secretary of State is withdrawn from the Government of India.
- (10) A schedule of the powers of taxation to be determined for provinces; the rest remaining with the Government of India.
- (11) Power of borrowing to remain with the Government of India. In some cases the Provincial Government to be allowed to float a loan for unproductive public works with a sinking fund as in the case of Municipalities (paras 203 to 211 of the Reform Report).

The whole liberal policy underlying the Reform Scheme is nullified by principle No. 9 which puts the Provincial Finance under the guidance of the Government of India even with reference to expenditure from Provincial revenue. The point is fully emphasized by the authors of the Report who state:—

n provincialization of heads of re"The mere pliture will, therefore, not itself
venue and expen provinces from the restrictions
suffice to free the powers which the provisions of
on the spending ther standing orders impose upon
the Codes and of the Government of India. except
them. Nor caninor extent, enlarge their powers
to a relative m'mselves have to conform to the ressince they the xpenditure imposed by the Secretary
trictions on Council etc."
of State in C

It is st he consideration of the Government of are under to will be considered by the India Office. India and I ninistrative consideration of this crucial But any adr will not solve the problem. The control question - revenues of India and expenditure thereom is at present exercised by the Secretary of State under the provisions of Part II of the Government of India Act, 1915 (5 and 6 G. S. O. 5). Under these provisions "the revenues of India" are regarded as a unit. It is indispensably necessary that the new Parliamentary Bill for the Government of India should include provisions for the independnet financial working of the provinces. My point is that after determining the Imperial and Provincial heads of revenue, and after providing for the provincial contribution at a prescribed rate as a first charge on provinces, the control of the provincial revenue should be

placed absolutely in the hands
Government. Unless this imper
free working of provincial finan
secured by Legislature in Parliar
ment in the Codes and standing
relaxation of power of the Governi
interfere, will be merely a palliative
the administrative control of the
State for India in Council, and the C
India is exercised on provinces in
the Government of India Act, 1915,
following Codes:—

- 1. Civil Account Code.
- 2. Civil Service Regulations.
- 3. India Army Regulations.
- 4. State Railway Codes.
- 5. Forest Code.
- 6. P. W. D. Code.

The provisions of these codes will have to be modified considerably as soon as the Government of India Act is amended. fore, of opinion that the Committee their recommendations the necesment of the Government of India indicated. As to how far the ament of India should be wither existing system, I append a there relaxation is possible and

ACCOMPANIMENT TO SECTION IV.

STATEMENT SHOWING THE HEADS OF BUSINESS IN FINANCIAL DEPARTMENT WHERE.

THE CONTROL OF GOVERNMENT OF INDIA SHOULD BE RELAXED.

***************************************	OF GOVERNMENT OF INDIA	SHOULD BE RELAXED.
Subject.	Control exercised by the Government.	Remarks.
Accounts.	. /	
curred by the Bombay Government on behalf of other Governments or Vice versa.	Sanction of Government	No objection.

Audit.

Objections raised by the Accountant Audit.

If the Accountant General General in holds that a certain expenditure requires the sanction of an authority higher than the Local Government and the lattet does not accept his decision, the case must be referred to the Government of India in the Finance Department for Orders.

Budget.

Preparation of the Ancussion in the Legislative ment of India. Council.

This is governed by rules nual Budget and its dis- prescribed by the Govern-

Government of India on the opening of Special Accounts should be absolutely withdrawn.

This may stand.

As the Covernment of India's Budget is to exclude Provincial transaction, the rules of the Provincial Budget should be prescribed by the Local Government and not by the Government of India (Para 208 of the Report).

Remarks.

Provincial Settlement.

The current Provincial manent character and its the Provincial Governments Parliament. terms are not subject to al- are specified in Nos. 5 and 6 teration, save in the case of of the rules given in the extreme and general ne Annexure to the resolution ween Imperial and Provin- No. 361. E. A. dated 24th cial of the general revenue July 1916. and expenditure in each province is shown in Annexure A to Chapter 66 of the C. A. Code Vol. II pages 286 to 692.

Public Expenditure.

Creation of new permanent appointments the cost of India is required to the of which is charged to a creation of an appointment. Provincial or divided head.

The general limitations The division bet- of the Government of India

Sanction of Government

To be modified after the Govern-Settlement is of a quasi per- to the financial powers of ment of India Act is amended by

appointments to an amount exceeding Rs.

800 a month.

(1) Which would ordinarily

May Stand.

(2) The remuneration of Not necessary with the Government which exceeds Rs. 800 of India under the new scheme.

May Stand.

Not Necessary.

Subject.	Control exercised by the Government.	Remarks.
Creation of temporary appointments and deputations the cost of which is charged to a Provincial or divided head.		This restriction should be removed altogether.

vincial or divided head.

which is debitable to Pro- if the additional expeniture ment of India is guaranteed. involved exceeds Rs. 50,000 a year. In the following cases the draft orders of the Local Government have to be submitted to the Government of India and if no orders are received within three months from the date of receipt by the Government of India the scheme may then be brought into effect:—

(a) When the scheme involves revision of the rates of pay at a cost of more than Rs. 25,000 a year to any one branch of the service;

Schemes for revision of | The sanction of the Gov- | To be removed altogether providestablishments the cost of ernment of India is required ed the surplus quota of the GovernRemuneration of an Offic-

Grant of pension or gra- The sanction of Governkilled) during or in con-one case. sequence of service rendered to Government, or who, though not injured has rendered some exceptional service.

putation.

of officers paid for Imperial revenues is employed.

The sanction of the Gover already in the Service ernment of India is required of the C. S. R. be amended. of Government who is ap- to the grant of higher repointed to a temporary ap-|muneratian than is admispointment or placed on de-sible under Articles 36 B and 81 of the Civil Service Regulations.

to a non-official who is a pension exceeding Rs. injured (or to the family 1,000 a year or gratuity exof a non-official who is ceeding Rs. 3,000 in any

Should be withdrawn and articles

Not necessary if the payment is to tuity from Provincial funds ment of India is required to be made from Provincial revenue.

Subject.	Control exercised by the Government.	Remakrs,
able or religious institution	The sanction of the Government of India is required to a grant exceeding Rs. 10,000 a year if recurring and Rs. 50,000 if non-	Not necessary.
Grants to local bodies from Provincial Funds.	recurring.	d o
Expenditure on State	nonrecurring. The sanction of the Government of India is	do
and on the entertainment	required when the estimated outlay exceeds Rs. 1 Lakh.	
o India The number of a motor		d o

of a vessel required for ment of India is required inland navigation or for use if the cost exceeds Rs. 1. of ports.

dental loss of property by Government is limited to civil officers.

made in the budget estimates required when the aggregate the Local Government. for the year. budget grant for Provincial

Treasuries.

Issue of remittance transinterested.

Construction or purchase | Sanction of the Govern-Lakh

Compensation for acci- The power of the Local the payment of compensation not exceeding Rs. 1000 if it is debitable to an Imperial head.

Provincial expenditure in The sanction of the expenditure is exceeded.

The Government of India fer recripts at par in connec- have directed that the tion with the collection of privilege should not be subscriptions for any Public extended to remittances or quasi-public purpose which are of a private or in which Government is quasi-private nature as the ordinary facilities for remittance of money have now greatly increased.

May stand.

This should be regularized by the excess of the provision Government of India is Budget rules to be sanctioned by

May stand.

Remarks

Employment and remu- \mathbf{of} shroffs deal receipts. or - heavy accompany remittances.

Transfer of the work of the Government treasury to Government of India is a local branch of the Bank required. of Bombay.

Miscellaneous.

Delegation of financial powers to Heads of Departments and other subordinate sanctioned have been presauthorities.

temporary have fixed a maximum of ment to decide. with Re. 1 a day as the pay of to these shroffs.

> The sanction

The limits within which such delegations can be

cribed by the Government of India in the Resolution No. 352-E. A., dated 25th July 1917.

This is a matter for local Govern-

Not necessary.

To be delegated to the Local Government.

(O

names of candidates for en-	Government of India ex-	May stand
under the Local Authorities Loans Act IX of 1914:—		
(i) Framing of rules under the Local Authorities Loans Act.	The rules are framed by by the Government of India.	do.
(ii) Issue of short term bills.	This requires the sanction of the Government of India.	do.

Subjects.	Control exercised by the Government.	Remarks.
(iii) Grant of loans by Government.	vernment of India is required to the grant of loans for a period exceeding 30 years or when funds are not available from the grant placed at the Local Government's disposal or when the rate of interest to be charged is less than 6 per cent. The Local Government may, however, remit the payment of interest and may also remit and write off, as Provincial expenditure, any irrecoverable balance of the loans.	
(iv) Permission to raise loans in the open market.	The sanction of Government of India is required if the term of the loan exceeds Rs. 5 lakhs.	

(v) Utilization for other The sanction of Governworks of the unex-ment of India is required if

pended balance of a the term of the loan exceeds non-Government loan 40 years; or if the amount of the unexpended balance exceeds Rs. 4 Lakhs.

(vi) Borrowing by District This requires the sanction railway construction. by means of deben-

tures repayable at the option of the Boards.

(vii) Postponement of an

The sanction of the Govinstalment in payment ernment of India is required

in repayment of a loan. When the postponement involves an extension of the period of repayment to a period in excees of that up to which loan can be sanctioned by Local Government.

Not necessary.

Not necessary; See Last sentence Boards of money for of the Government of India of para 211 of the Reform Scheme.

May stand.

The grant of a loan to a Native State in excess of Rs. 5 Lakhs or a series of tary of State.

The control be transferred to the Government of India from the Secretary of State.

Remarks.

Miscellaneous loans and Such loans require the This is not necessary. sanction of the Governadvances.

ment of India.

The Local Government should look

Banks

the Presidency.

The sanction of the Proposals to open branch- Govetnment of India is to it. es of the Bank of Bombay in required to the opening of the Branches.

under it.

The sanction of the Negotiabale Instruments Government of India is control is reasonable. Act. Fixing of Holidays required for unusual state Holidays. The date to be observed for the King's birth-day is notified by them to the Local Government.

The Act is Imperial and hence

Subject.	Control exercised by the Government.	Remarks,
Endowments Funds.		
Charitable Endowments Act.	Government of India is	Government if the Legislative control is transferred to the Province.
Coins.	Exemption of Shroffs from bearing, loss due to to acceptance of diminished or counterfeit coins requires the sanction of the Government of India.	Government.

Miscellaneous advances, These are regulated by the e. g., for building houses, rules in the Civil Account Government bodily.

Code 136 and 137; the tents etc.

The power should go to the Local Government bodily.

sanction of the Government of India is required if an exception to the rules is to be made.

Local Funds including Budget Estimates of the Government of Fund.

The sanction of the Government of India is required to the creation of new Funds. In other respects no control is exercised by them.

May go to the Local Government.