

Official No.: Conf. D. 158.
[Conf. D./C.D./C.T. 160 (2).]

Geneva, April 8th, 1933.

LEAGUE OF NATIONS

CONFERENCE FOR THE REDUCTION AND LIMITATION
OF ARMAMENTS

NATIONAL DEFENCE EXPENDITURE
COMMISSION

REPORT
OF THE
TECHNICAL COMMITTEE

Volume I

Series of League of Nations Publications

IX. DISARMAMENT ✓

1933. IX. 3. Vol. I. •

TABLE OF CONTENTS.¹

	Page
Covering Letter to the Report	XVII
Definitions	XIX

CHAPTER I. — INTRODUCTION.

1. Committee's Terms of Reference.	1
2. Composition of the Committee	2
3. Summary of Previous Work on Limitation and Publicity of Expenditure	3
4. Information requested from States by the Committee	4
5. Scope of the Committee's Work	4
6. Procedure	5
7. Nature of the Present Report	6

Part I. — General Principles.

CHAPTER II. — WHAT IS TO BE UNDERSTOOD BY NATIONAL DEFENCE EXPENDITURE ?

1. General Considerations	8
2. Attempt at a Definition of National Defence Expenditure for the Purposes of the Draft Convention	9
3. Conventional List of National Defence Expenditure	9
4. Line of Demarcation between Specifically Military Expenditure included in the Conventional List and Expenditure which, though of Military Importance, has not been so included	10
(a) <i>Expenditure of a general nature</i>	10
(b) <i>Subsidies to private armaments undertakings</i>	11
(c) <i>Expenditure on the preparation of industrial mobilisation</i>	11
(d) <i>Expenditure on pensions</i>	12
(e) <i>Expenditure on formations organised on a military basis.</i>	12
(f) <i>Expenditure on certain associations</i>	12
(g) <i>Expenditure on services made use of to some extent by the armed forces in time of peace.</i>	13
5. Interpretation, for Purposes of the Convention, of the Conventional List of Expenditure on National Defence.	14
(a) <i>Expenditure arising out of certain exceptional and unforeseen events</i>	14
(b) <i>Expenditure arising out of the reduction of armaments</i>	15
APPENDIX I. — CONVENTIONAL LIST OF ITEMS OF NATIONAL DEFENCE EXPENDITURE	16
APPENDIX II. — SPECIAL LIST OF SUBSIDIES TO PRIVATE FIRMS HAVING AMONG THEIR OBJECTS THE MANUFACTURE OF WAR MATERIAL IN PEACE-TIME, AND SUBSIDIES FOR THE PREPARATION OF INDUSTRIAL MOBILISATION (paragraphs (b) and (c) of Chapter II)	18

CHAPTER III. — NEED FOR UNIFORM PRESENTATION OF THE FIGURES OF NATIONAL DEFENCE EXPENDITURE.

1. Expenditure by the State.	19
2. Expenditure by Regional or Local Public Authorities	20

¹ Volume II contains: (1) The *Summary of the Information* supplied to the Technical Committee on the subject of the defence expenditure of the various States; (2) The *Recapitulatory Tables of the Model Statements* of countries the documentation of which has been examined; and (3) A *Table for Rough Conversion of Currencies* according to the average exchange rates for the periods to which the Model Statements of the various countries relate.

	Page
3. Expenditure by Colonies	20
4. Expenditure by Organisations and Individuals	20
5. Different Methods of Accounting	20
6. The Model Statement	21
7. Reconciliation Tables	21
8. The Model Statements of Expenditure do not allow of the Comparison of the Armaments of Different Countries	21

CHAPTER IV. — PAYMENTS MADE DURING THE FINANCIAL "EXERCICE" MUST SERVE AS THE JURIDICAL BASIS FOR THE PUBLICITY AND LIMITATION OF EXPENDITURE.

1. Object of Limitation	23
2. Conditions to be fulfilled by the Legal Definition of Expenditure	23
3. Successive Acts in settling Expenditure	23
4. Authorisation of Expenditure by the Public Authorities.	24
5. Commitments	24
6. Liquidation of Expenditure	24
7. Issue of Orders for Payment	25
8. Payment of Expenditure.	25
9. Coincidence of Date of Payment with Performance of Service or Delivery of Material	25
10. Deferred Payments	26
11. Unpaid Services.	26
12. Material for Consumption taken from Store	27

Part II. — Budgets and Accounts.

CHAPTER V. — PREPARATION, ADOPTION, AND EXECUTION OF BUDGETS.

1. Drawing-up of Estimates of Expenditure	29
2. Draft Estimates.	29
3. Discussion of Draft Estimates in Parliament	30
4. Preliminary Examination of Draft Estimates by Parliamentary Committees.	30
5. Discussion of Draft Estimates at Plenary Meetings of Parliament	31
6. Annual Nature of Credits	32
7. Legal Significance of Authorisations for Expenditure	32
8. Date of voting Annual Expenditure	34
9. Special Prerogative of the Executive	35
10. Budgetary Differentiation	35
11. "Virements"	36
(a) <i>Possibility of virements</i>	37
(b) <i>Possibility of tracing expenditure accounts in respect of which virements have been made</i>	37
12. Publication of Budgets	38

CHAPTER VI. — SUPERVISION OF THE EXECUTION OF THE BUDGET AND ACCOUNTS.

A. Preventive Supervision during the Execution of the Budget	40
(a) <i>Degree of independence of the bodies responsible for supervision during the execution of the budget</i>	40
(b) <i>Powers of the bodies responsible for supervision during the execution of the budget</i>	42

	Page
B. Final Audit	44
(a) <i>Degree of independence of organs responsible for final audit</i>	44
(b) <i>Working of final audit</i>	46
Conclusions	50

ADDENDUM TO PART II. — THE BUDGETS AND ACCOUNTS OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL COLLECTIVE ENTITIES.

A. General Observations	52
B. Regional or Local Collective Entities of the Home Country	52
C. Budgets and General and Local Accounts of the Colonies	53
D. (Conclusion)	54

Part III. — Is it possible to establish and control the Total National Defence Expenditure of Each State ?

INTRODUCTION	55
------------------------	----

CHAPTER VII. — IS IT POSSIBLE FOR EVERY STATE TO DRAW UP A COMPLETE ACCOUNT OF ITS NATIONAL DEFENCE EXPENDITURE ?

A. BY WHOM IS NATIONAL DEFENCE EXPENDITURE EFFECTED, AND HOW IS SUCH EXPENDITURE TO BE FOUND IN THE ACCOUNTS ?	57
I. THE CENTRAL AUTHORITY.	57
(<i>Diagram showing by whom National Defence Expenditure is effected</i>)	58
1. Structure of State Accounts (<i>Central Authority</i>)	59
2. Separate Indication of National Defence Expenditure in the Accounts of the Central Authority	60
1. <i>Expenditure shown in the budgetary accounts of the National Defence Ministries (War, Navy and Air)</i>	60
2. <i>Expenditure effected by Colonial Ministries</i>	62
3. <i>National defence expenditure in civil budgets</i>	62
4. <i>Expenditure in special accounts</i>	63
II. EXPENDITURE EFFECTED BY REGIONAL OR LOCAL AUTHORITIES:	
I. Colonies	64
Note	65
(a) <i>Military expenditure of mandated territories</i>	65
(b) <i>Military expenditure defrayed by certain States having special links with the Powers signatory to the Convention</i>	65
(c) <i>"Partisan" forces</i>	65
2. Regional and Local Collective Entities in the Home Country	66
(a) <i>Federated States in countries with a Federal Constitution</i>	66
(b) <i>Other regional and local collective entities</i>	67

	Page
B. PROBLEMS RAISED BY CERTAIN PECULIARITIES OF ACCOUNTANCY	68
(a) Special Funds	68
" <i>Fonds des masses</i> "	68
(b) Autonomous Establishments for National Defence Manufacture or Construction	69
(c) Subventions, Loans, and Participations	71
(d) Expenditure effected by Means of Loans	71
(e) Gross Accounts and Net Accounts	71
<i>Transfers of material from ministry to ministry</i>	72
<i>Transfers from Government to Government</i>	72
<i>Price of the material transferred</i>	72
<i>Transfers by the national defence services to private individuals or to civil organisations</i>	73
(f) Special Case of Deductions from Pay	75
(g) Treatment of Donations and Bequests for National Defence	75
(h) Losses on Exchange	76
Conclusion	76

CHAPTER VIII. — WITH WHAT DEGREE OF ACCURACY IS IT POSSIBLE
BY MEANS OF PUBLISHED ACCOUNTS TO VERIFY THE TOTAL
NATIONAL DEFENCE EXPENDITURE OF EACH STATE ?

A. GENERAL OBSERVATIONS	77
B. NATIONAL DEFENCE EXPENDITURE BORNE BY THE CENTRAL AUTHORITY	77
(a) Insertion in the Model Statement of the National Defence Expenditure included in the Budgetary Accounts of the Ministries of National Defence (War, Sea, Air):	
<i>Expenditure appearing in the national defence budgets which is not national defence expenditure within the meaning of the Convention</i>	78
<i>Mixed services</i>	78
<i>Military aviation and civil aviation</i>	78
(b) National Defence Expenditure borne by the Ministry of the Colonies	79
(c) National Defence Expenditure borne on the Budgets of the Civil Ministries	79
<i>Mixed services</i>	79
(d) National Defence Expenditure entered in Special Accounts	80
C. NATIONAL DEFENCE EXPENDITURE BORNE BY REGIONAL OR LOCAL COLLECTIVE ENTITIES OR BY PRIVATE ASSOCIATIONS OR PERSONS:	
(a) Expenditure borne by the Colonies	80
(b) Expenditure borne by Regional or Local Collective Entities of the Home Country	80
(c) Expenditure met by Associations or Private Persons	80
D. DIFFICULTIES OF SUPERVISION INHERENT IN CERTAIN SPECIAL FORMS OF PUBLIC ACCOUNTS.	81
(a) Special Funds	81
(b) Autonomous Establishments	81
(c) Subsidies to Private Armament Firms	81
<i>Industrial mobilisation</i>	82
(d) Expenditure out of the Proceeds of Loans	82
(e) Gross and Net Accounts	82
E. CONCLUSION	83

Part IV. — Is it possible to separate for purposes of Limitation and Publicity: (a) Expenditure on the Three Forces? (b) Expenditure on Land and Naval Material? (c) Expenditure of All Kinds between the Various Headings of the Model Statement?

	Page
INTRODUCTION	84

CHAPTER IX. — POSSIBILITY OF SEPARATING EXPENDITURE ON THE THREE FORCES.

Conclusions of the Committee of Budgetary Experts	85
Examination of these Conclusions by the Technical Committee	85
1. EXTENT TO WHICH STATES HAVE SHOWN EXPENDITURE ON THE THREE FORCES SEPARATELY	85
2. DIFFICULTIES OF SEPARATING EXPENDITURE BETWEEN THE THREE FORCES:	
States with Separate Ministries and Accounts	86
(a) <i>Coast defence</i>	86
(b) <i>Expenditure by civil ministries on behalf of the Army, Navy and Air Forces</i>	87
States without Separate Ministries and Accounts	87
Methods adopted to meet the Difficulties indicated above	87
(a) <i>Internal cash accounts</i>	88
(b) <i>Administrative information</i>	88
(c) <i>Estimation</i>	88
Possibility of producing Authenticated Figures for the Expenditure of the Respective Forces	89
Possible Methods in separating Expenditure	89
(a) <i>Distribution of expenditure based on the number of effectives</i>	90
(b) <i>Annual cost per man</i>	90
Possibility of Derogations as regards the Particulars to be included in the Tables for the Land, Naval and Air Forces respectively	90
(<i>Percentage of Air Force Expenditure shown in Separate Items in the Closed Accounts</i>)	92
Conclusions	93

CHAPTER X. — POSSIBILITY OF SEPARATING EXPENDITURE ON MATERIAL FOR THE LAND AND SEA FORCES.

(Articles 10 and 24 of the Draft Convention.)

1. Definition of Expenditure on Land and Naval War Material	94
2. Possibility of separating Expenditure on Material of Each of the Three Forces	94
3. Special Difficulties arising out of the Definition of Expenditure on War Material	95
4. Inclusion of All Relevant Items	95
5. Exclusion of Irrelevant Expenditure	96
6. Degree of Controllability of the Expenditure under Head IV	97
(<i>Percentage of Head IV Expenditure shown in Separate Items in the Closed Accounts</i>)	97
7. Possible Solutions	98
8. Conclusions	99

CHAPTER XI. — CLASSIFICATION OF EXPENDITURE FOR PURPOSES OF PUBLICITY.

(Articles 38 and 33 of the Draft Convention.)

A. ARTICLE 38: PUBLICITY OF TOTAL EXPENDITURE:		
		Page
1.	Structure of the Model Statement drawn up by the Committee of Budgetary Experts	100
2.	Difficulties encountered by States in filling up the Model Statement	101
3.	Special Difficulties	101
	<i>Pay of Effectives</i>	101
	<i>Pay of Civilians</i>	102
	<i>Maintenance of Personnel</i>	102
	<i>Fuel, Transport and Upkeep of Buildings</i>	102
4.	War Material	102
	<i>Head IV for the Army</i>	102
	<i>Head IV for the Navy</i>	102
5.	Optional Columns	106
	<i>Optional columns relating to the armed forces: (a) at home, (b) abroad</i>	106
	<i>Optional column relating to formations organised on a military basis</i>	106
6.	Number of Items of the Model Statement	106
7.	General Considerations regarding Publicity, with Special Reference to the Model Statement	107
8.	Conclusions	108
B. ARTICLE 33 OF THE DRAFT CONVENTION: PUBLICITY BY CATEGORIES OF EXPENDITURE ON MATERIAL FOR THE LAND AND SEA FORCES:		
1.	Object of Article 33	109
2.	Summary of the Work of the Committee of Experts on Budgetary Questions	109
3.	Discussion of the Question in the Expenditure Commission	110
4.	Examination of the Question by the Technical Committee. Expenditure covered by Article 33	110
5.	Difficulties encountered in isolating Expenditure on Material	111
6.	Expenditure on Purchase	111
7.	Expenditure on Manufacture and Repair in Non-autonomous State Establishments	111
8.	Repairs in Units	112
9.	Expenditure on Upkeep.	112
10.	Conclusion	112
11.	Examination of the Japanese Proposal	112
12.	Examination of the Soviet Proposals	112

Part V. — Technical Recommendations with a View to Limitation.

CHAPTER XII. — INFLUENCE OF FLUCTUATIONS IN THE PURCHASING POWER OF THE VARIOUS CURRENCIES ON THE CONTRACTUAL EXPENDITURE LIMITS.

A.	STUDIES OF PREVIOUS PROPOSALS	114
	Limitation and Publicity Figures should be stated in the National Currencies	115

	Page
B. ANALYSIS OF THE FACTS:	
(a) Fluctuations in Purchasing Power since 1929	115
Diagrams:	
1. <i>Exchange Rates</i>	116
2. <i>Index Numbers of Wholesale Prices.</i>	117
3. <i>Index Numbers of Cost of Living</i>	118
(b) Countries which abandoned the Gold Standard in the Autumn of 1931	119
(c) Countries which retained the Gold Standard	119
C. SCOPE OF THE COMMITTEE'S ACTIVITIES:	
(a) When must Limits be adjusted ?	120
(b) Changes in the Cost of Armaments due to Other Causes than Fluctuations in Purchasing Power	120
(c) Must All Changes in Purchasing Power be taken into Account	120
D. MACHINERY FOR THE ADJUSTMENT OF LIMITS:	
(a) The Automatic System	121
(b) Lump-Sum System	121
(c) The Living Organisation	122
<i>Article 59</i>	122
<i>Article 50</i>	122
<i>Adjustment of limits</i>	122
<i>Examination of requests by a sub-committee of the Permanent Commission.</i>	123
<i>Co-operation with the Financial Committee of the League of Nations</i>	123
E. PROCEDURE:	
(a) By whom may Applications for Readjustment be submitted ?	123
(b) Utility of a Preliminary Procedure	124
(c) Criteria required	124
(d) On whom will lie the Obligation to furnish Proof ?	125
(e) Nature of Proof	125
(f) The Powers of the Permanent Commission in respect of Procedure	126
(g) Local Investigations	126
F. CONCLUSIONS	127

CHAPTER XIII. — FIXING OF LIMITS SO AS TO ALLOW
FOR VARIATIONS IN EXPENDITURE FROM ONE YEAR TO ANOTHER.

1. Principle of the Limitation of ANNUAL Expenditure	128
2. Deliberations of the Committee of Experts on Budgetary Questions:	
(a) <i>Possible variations in expenditure from one year to another</i>	128
(b) <i>Necessity of allowing a certain elasticity in fixing the limits</i>	129
3. Proposal of the Budgetary Experts with regard to an Average Limit for a Period of Several Years	130
4. Impossibility for the Technical Committee to make Definite Recommendations at the Present Stage of the Conference's Work	130
5. Considerations which should be taken into Account	130
APPENDIX TO CHAPTER XIII. — Proposal by M. Jacomet	131
1. <i>Average Annual Limit</i>	131
2. <i>Fixing of a Percentage</i>	132

CHAPTER XIV. — TRANSFERS BETWEEN THE LIMITS OF THE THREE FORCES.

	Page
A. SHOULD THE POSSIBILITY OF TRANSFERS BETWEEN THE LIMITS FIXED BE ADMITTED OR NOT ?	133
B. HOW SHOULD TRANSFERS BE EFFECTED ?	134
C. BETWEEN WHAT LIMITS COULD TRANSFERS BE ALLOWED ?	135
NOTE BY MR. LYON	136

CHAPTER XV. — SPECIAL PROCEDURE REGARDING CERTAIN UNFORE-SEEABLE AND EXCEPTIONAL EXPENDITURE NOT INVOLVING AN INCREASE IN THE ARMAMENTS OF THE COUNTRY INCURRING IT	138
---	-----

Part VI. — Instruments of the Machinery of Limitation and Publicity.

CHAPTER XVI. — THE MODEL STATEMENT.

A. FORM OF THE MODEL STATEMENT	140
1. The Model Statement proposed by the Committee of Budgetary Experts	140
2. Results of the First Efforts of the States to complete the Model Statement	141
3. Commentary on the Model Statement proposed by the Technical Committee	141
4. Information given as an Annex to the Model Statement	142
B. DATE OF SENDING IN THE MODEL STATEMENT PROVIDING EVIDENCE OF LIMITATION BASED ON THE PAYMENTS EFFECTED	142
1. The Existence of Additional Periods	143
2. Methods adopted by the Administrations in preparing Final Accounts for Audit by the Higher Auditing Authorities	144
3. Audit of the Final Accounts by the Higher Auditing Authorities	144
4. Approval of the Final Accounts by the Competent Legislative Authorities	146

CHAPTER XVII. — SPECIAL PARTICULARS ADDED TO THE MODEL STATEMENT WITH A VIEW TO LIMITATION AND PUBLICITY.

I. INTRODUCTION	147
II. EXPENDITURE ON RESERVES	148
III. SPECIAL INFORMATION RELATING TO NAVAL MATERIAL	151
IV. BLOCK CREDITS	151
V. DEFERRED PAYMENTS AND CREDIT PURCHASES:	
1. General Considerations. Work of the Committee of Experts on Budgetary Questions	154
2. Results of the Examination of the Documentation by the Technical Committee	155
3. Purchases from Private Firms	156
4. Services rendered by Personnel	156
5. Transfers from One Government to Another	157
6. Transfers of Material from One Department to Another	157
7. Transfers made by Autonomous Establishments	157
8. Case in which the Supplier transfers his Claim against the State to a Bank	158
9. Payment in Treasury Bonds	158
10. Solution proposed	158
11. Credits opened by One Government in favour of Another. Contractual Clause	159
12. Instructions to be drawn up subsequently	159
13. Conclusion	160

	Page
VI. SUBSIDIES, LOANS AND PARTICIPATIONS	161
VII. EXPENDITURE ON PENSIONS:	
1. General Observations	162
2. War Pensions	163
3. Ordinary Pensions	164
4. Various Systems of financing Pensions	164
5. Should Ordinary Pensions be shown in a Special Publicity Table ?	165
6. Personnel in receipt of Pensions	166
7. Conclusions	166
VIII. SERVICES AND GOODS NOT PAID FOR IN CASH.	167
SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS	168

CHAPTER XVIII. — POSSIBILITY OF ASCERTAINING THAT EXPENDITURE
APPEARING IN THE ACCOUNTS HAS BEEN CORRECTLY
TRANSFERRED TO THE MODEL STATEMENT.

A. RECONCILIATION TABLES:	
1. Introduction	170
2. Necessity for a Reconciliation Table	170
3. Object of the Reconciliation Table	171
(a) <i>Indication of various accounts concerned</i>	171
(b) <i>Indication of the method followed in transferring the figures from the accounts into the Model Statement</i>	171
(c) <i>Indication of expenditure not included in the Model Statement</i>	172
(d) <i>Application of rules to be laid down for drawing up the Model Statement</i>	173
4. Form of the Reconciliation Table	173
5. Conclusions	173
B. DEROGATIONS:	
1. Budgetary Experts' Views on Derogations	174
2. Examination of the Question by the Technical Committee. Classification of Possible Derogations	174
3. Derogations of Content	175
4. Derogations as regards Accuracy of Figures	175
(a) <i>Defence expenditure incurred by civil departments</i>	175
(b) <i>Defence expenditure provided by local authorities, private associations and individuals</i>	175
5. Derogations of Classification	176
6. Conclusion	176

APPENDIX I TO PART VI. — MODEL STATEMENT:

Table I. Land Forces	177
Table II. Naval Forces.	178
Table III. Air Forces	179
Table IV. Total Expenditure for the Three Forces	180
Table V. Special Information, added to the Model Statement, in particular as regards National Defence Pensions	180

APPENDIX II TO PART VI. — MODEL RECONCILIATION TABLES:

A. Summary:	
I. Total Expenditure inserted in Table I of the Model Statement (Land Forces)	181
II. Total Expenditure inserted in Table II of the Model Statement (Naval Forces)	181
III. Total Expenditure inserted in Table III of the Model Statement (Air Forces)	182

	Page
B. Analytical Table: Distribution of Expenditure between the Tables of the Model Statement and their Subheads	182
C. Synthetic Tables:	
I. Table relating to Table I of the Model Statement (Land Forces)	183
II. Table relating to Table II of the Model Statement (Naval Forces).	184
III. Table relating to Table III of the Model Statement (Air Forces)	185

Part VII. — Supervision and the Publicity requisite to enforce it.

INTRODUCTION	186
------------------------	-----

CHAPTER XIX. — PUBLICITY OF CREDITS AND PROOF OF THE OBSERVANCE OF LIMITATIONS.

A. GENERAL OBSERVATIONS:	
1. Usefulness of Publicity	187
2. Technical Conditions for Publicity	187
3. Aims of Publicity	188
4. Publicity unconnected with the Proof of the Observance of Limitations	188
B. PUBLICITY OF CREDITS BASED ON THE BUDGETS:	
1. Summary of Previous Efforts	189
2. Could Estimates be used for Publicity apart from furnishing Juridical Proof of the Observance of the Limitation of Expenditure ?	190
(a) <i>Generally, State expenditure and revenue form the subject of annual estimates and authorisations by the public authorities</i>	190
(b) <i>Credits are in general voted for one year</i>	190
(c) <i>The moment at which estimates are drawn up varies in the different countries.</i>	191
(d) <i>Estimates of expenditure are in general sufficiently detailed for publicity purposes</i>	192
(e) <i>The credits granted by the public authorities in the original budget do not cover all expenditure, supplementary credits being passed in the course of the year or credits being cancelled on account of unforeseen expenditure or economies</i>	192
3. Utility of the Publicity of Estimates of Expenditure in view of the Length of Time required for the Publicity of Payments effected	193
4. Methods of Publicity for Estimates of Expenditure	193
5. Publicity of Other Documents concerning Estimates of Expenditure	195
C. SPECIAL PUBLICITY WITH REGARD TO ANNUAL DISBURSEMENTS	195
D. PUBLICITY OF FINANCIAL DOCUMENTS:	
1. General Remarks.	196
2. Purposes for which the Various Particulars to be supplied by States are required	197
3. Conclusion	198
E. STANDARDISATION OF NATIONAL DEFENCE BUDGETS AND ACCOUNTS	198
F. CONCLUSIONS	199

CHAPTER XX. — TECHNICAL OBSERVATIONS REGARDING THE SUPERVISION BY THE PERMANENT DISARMAMENT COMMISSION OF THE APPLICATION OF PROVISIONS RELATING TO THE LIMITATION AND PUBLICITY OF EXPENDITURE.

Basis of Supervision over the Limitation and Publicity of Expenditure	201
Other Tasks of the Permanent Commission in this Sphere	201

	Page
A. VERIFICATION OF THE PAYMENT FIGURES ENTERED IN THE MODEL STATEMENT:	
1. Object of the Verification	201
2. Documentation at the Permanent Commission's Disposal	202
3. Further Particulars	202
4. Local Investigations	204
B. STUDY OF THE EXPENDITURE DEVOTED BY STATES TO NATIONAL DEFENCE	204
C. ADMINISTRATIVE QUESTIONS	204

Part VIII.

**CHAPTER XXI. — THE EXPENDITURE ON ARMAMENTS OF THE
VARIOUS COUNTRIES DOES NOT PROVIDE A CRITERION
FOR COMPARING THEIR ARMAMENTS.**

1. Introduction	206
2. There is no Common Measure for the Comparison of Armaments Expenditure	206
3. The Level of Expenditure varies with the Type of Army Organisation	207
4. Differences in the Rates of Pay for Personnel and in the Maintenance Costs of Effectives	207
5. Various Factors which may affect the Cost Prices of Materials	208
6. Difficulty of finding Comparable Factors.	209
7. Differences between the Contents of the Model Statements of the Various States	209
8. Comparison of the Expenditure of the Same Country from One Year to Another.	210

CHAPTER XXII. — SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS.

I (Points 1 to 4). — Introduction: The Circumstances in which the Committee has examined the Budgetary Data supplied by the States represented at the Conference	212
II (Points 5 to 10). — What is to be understood by National Defence Expenditure ?	212
III (Points 11 and 12). — Need for the Uniform Presentation of the Figures of National Defence Expenditure	213
IV (Points 13 to 18). — Payments made in the Course of the Financial Year must be taken as the Juridical Basis for either the Publicity or Limitation of Expenditure	214
V-VI (Points 19 to 26). — Budgets and Accounts	215
VII (Points 27 to 32). — To what Extent is it possible for Each State to draw up Complete Accounts of its National Defence Expenditure ?	217
VIII (Points 33 to 37). — With what Degree of Accuracy can the Total National Defence Expenditure returned by Each State be verified ?	217
IX (Points 38 to 41). — Possibility of ascertaining separately the Total Expenditure for Each of the Three Forces (Army, Navy and Air)	218
X (Points 42 to 44). — Possibility of separating Expenditure in respect of Land and Naval War Material (<i>Articles 10 and 24 of the Draft Convention</i>)	219
XI (Points 45 to 48 bis). — Classification of Expenditure for Publicity Purposes:	
A. <i>Article 38 of the Draft Convention</i>	221
B. <i>Article 33. Publicity by Categories of Expenditure in respect of Land and Naval Material</i>	221
XII (Points 49 to 59). — Fluctuations in the Purchasing Power of Currencies	222
XIII (Points 60 to 63). — Influence of Variations of Expenditure from One Year to Another on the Fixing of Limits	223

	Page
XIV (Points 64 to 66). — Transfers between the Limits of the Three Forces . . .	224
XV (Points 67 to 70). — Special Procedure regarding Certain Unforeseeable and Exceptional Expenditure not involving an Increase in the Armaments of the Country incurring it	225
XVI (Points 71 to 75). — The Model Statement	225
XVII (Points 76 to 82). — Special Information annexed to the Model Statement for Limitation and Publicity Purposes	226
XVIII (Points 83 to 85). — Reconciliation Table — Derogations	227
XIX (Points 86 to 90). — Publicity of Credits and Evidence of Limitation . . .	228
XX (Points 91 to 98). — Technical Observations concerning the Supervision by the Permanent Disarmament Commission of the Provisions relating to the Limitation and Publicity of Expenditure	229
XXI (Points 99 to 106). — The Expenditure on Armaments of the Various Countries does not provide a Criterion for comparing their Armaments	230
General Reservation submitted by M. Ando, Major-General Barberis and M. Worbs . . .	231
Reservation by Lieut.-Colonel G. V. Strong (United States of America)	232

LIST OF ANNEXES.

1. Information requested by the Technical Committee — Note by the Secretary-General	234
2. Questionnaire concerning Budget Systems drafted by the Technical Committee . .	235
3. Rules of Procedure for the Examination of Information supplied by the Governments, adopted by the Technical Committee on April 14th, 1932	236
4. Statement relating to Budgetary Documents supplied by Various Governments — Memorandum by Sub-Committee A	237
5. Table showing who is responsible for National Defence Expenditure	240
6. Table showing that Part of the Expenditure in Respect of the Chief Mixed Chapters in Certain Civil Budgets which has been regarded as National Defence Expenditure on the Basis of Estimates or Internal Accounts	241
7. Table relating to the Possibility of checking Head IV (War Material)	242
8. Information referring to the Problem of the Changes in the Purchasing Power of the Currency of Various Countries, furnished by the Financial Section and Economic Intelligence Service of the Secretariat	244
<i>Table I.</i> — Synoptic View of Position of Various Countries with regard to Gold Standard	245
<i>Table II.</i> — Indices of the Dollar Exchange and of Wholesale Prices and Cost of Living in Various Countries	246
9. Fluctuations in the Purchasing Power of Currencies of Different Countries: Documentation and Graphs attached to the German Expert's Reservation	253
<i>Table 1.</i> — Cost-of-Living Index Figures	256
<i>Table 2.</i> — Wholesale Prices Index Figures.	257
<i>Table 3.</i> — Combined Average of Wholesale Prices Index Figures and Cost-of-Living Index Figures	258
<i>Table 4.</i> — Variations in Internal Purchasing Power according to the Cost-of-Living Index Figures	259
<i>Table 5.</i> — Variations in Internal Purchasing Power according to the Wholesale Price Index	260
<i>Table 6.</i> — Variations in Internal Purchasing Power according to the Combined Average of the Wholesale Price Index and Cost-of-Living Index Figures . .	261
10. Comparative Table of Total Expenditures of the Ministries of Military Affairs of Various Countries based on Estimates and Closed Accounts.	262
11. Tables showing the Expenditure under each of the Main Headings of the Model Statement expressed as a Percentage of the Total Expenditure: (1) on Each Force; (2) on All Forces taken together	263

	Page
12. Miscellaneous Statistical Information given as Annex to Chapter XXI (The Expenditure on Armaments of the Various Countries does not provide a Criterion for comparing their Armaments):	
<i>Table I.</i> — Total Annual Pay	266
<i>Table II.</i> — Wholesale Prices of Certain Commodities	267
<i>Table III.</i> — Average Wages of Various Categories of Adult Male Workmen in Certain Towns	268
Remarks regarding Table III	269
<i>Table IV.</i> — United States:	
(a) Average Earnings of Fitters and Labourers in Machine Shops during a Representative Wage Period between June and August 1931 in the State of Illinois and in the Whole Country	269
(b) Movement of Average Earnings of All Workers in Machines and Machine Tools from 1931 to 1932	269
<i>Table V.</i> — Japan. Average Earnings of Various Categories of Workers at Tokio in June 1932	270
<i>Table VI.</i> — Switzerland. Rate of Wages in Building and Engineering at Geneva in January 1933	270
<i>Table VII.</i> — Union of Soviet Socialist Republics. Average Earnings of All Workers in the Building and Engineering Industries in the Country as a whole	270
Remarks on Tables IV to VII	271