

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER No.	CONTENT	PAGE
1	Introductory	1
2	The Regional and the National Language	5
3	The Aims of University Education	7
4	Importance of the Maintenance of Standards in University Education.	9
5	Function of the Medium of Instruction	11
6	The Medium of Instruction and the All-India Services	15
7	The Necessity of Inter-State and International Contacts.	19
8	Provision for Linguistic Minorities	23
9	The Three-Language Formula	25
10	The Study of a Language as contrasted with the Study of its Literature.	29
11	The Problem of the Medium of Instruction — its Origin, Nature and Solution.	31
12	The Problem before us	39
13	Books and Teachers	51
14	Summary and Recommendations	57

APPENDICES

APPENDIX

A	Questionnaire	63
B	List of persons and institutions who sent replies to the Questionnaire.	70
C	List of persons who gave oral evidence before the Com- mittee.	75
D	A brief analysis of views expressed on some important points posed in the Questionnaire.	78
E	Bibliography	90

REPORT OF THE MEDIUM OF INSTRUCTION (UNIVERSITIES) COMMITTEE

CHAPTER

INTRODUCTORY

Appointment of the Committee and Terms of Reference :

1.1. On 27th December, 1960, the following Government Resolution, Education and Social Welfare Department No. USG-4260-U, was issued by the Government of Maharashtra :—

“Whereas the Government is of the view that the Medium of Instruction in the University and in technical and in other institutions of higher learning should be regional and/or the national language : and

Whereas it has become necessary to take steps for progressive substitution of the regional and national language as the medium of instruction in the University and in these institutions ; Government hereby appoints a Committee consisting of the following members :

Chairman :

Shri S. R. Dongerkery, Vice-Chancellor, Marathwada University ;

Members :

1. Shri G. D. Parikh, Rector, University of Bombay.
2. Shri D. D. Karve, Poona.
3. Shri S. L. Pandharipande, Nagpur.
4. Shri E. R. Dhongde, Joint Director of Education (Member-Secretary),

to suggest for the said purpose—

(i) steps necessary for the progressive substitution of the regional and national language as the medium of instruction in the University and technical and other institutions of higher learning ;

(ii) legislation, if any, necessary for the purpose,

(iii) the action to be taken :

(a) for the preparation of the necessary books for higher education, in all branches of knowledge in the regional and national languages ;

(b) for equipping teachers and professors with a view to enable them to impart instruction through the regional and national languages.

The Committee should be requested to submit its report to Government within a period of three months."

Procedure

1.2. The Committee commenced its work in January 1961. The first meeting of the Committee was held in Bombay on 8th January 1961. It was decided to draft and issue a Questionnaire on the various problems referred to the Committee with the object of ascertaining public and enlightened educational opinion. It was also felt necessary to interview and record the oral evidence of prominent educationists and representatives of educational organisations in the various universities and other centres of higher learning in the State of Maharashtra and also representatives of certain commercial and industrial organisations in the City of Bombay. A draft questionnaire was accordingly circulated to the members for their consideration.

1.3. The Second meeting of the Committee took place in Bombay on 29th January 1961. While finalising the questionnaire, the committee was faced with the difficulty arising from the wording of the preamble of the Government Resolution appointing the committee which stated "Whereas Government is of the view that the medium of instruction in the University and in technical and in other institutions of higher learning should be regional and/or the national language". The preamble could be taken to mean either that the Government consider it desirable to switch over from English to the regional and/or the national language as the medium of instruction, or that the Government are definitely of the view that a switch over has to be effected, and only require the committee to recommend the steps necessary for doing so. The Committee felt that a clarification on this point was necessary before it could finalise its questionnaire and examine witnesses. In reply to its request for such clarification, the committee was informed by Government letter No. USG-2260-U-14840, dated 20th February 1961, that "Government is definitely of the view that switch-over to the regional/or national language as the medium of instruction has to be effected and calls upon the committee to recommend steps to do so."

1.4. In the light of the clarification of the scope of the terms of reference, the draft questionnaire (*vide* Appendix A), was finalised by the Committee in the middle of March 1961. A list of the persons and institutions to whom the questionnaire was to

be sent, was drawn up and copies of the questionnaire were issued to 527 persons and institutions by the end of March, 1961, with a request to send their replies by 20th April, 1961. As the replies to the questionnaire had to be received and scrutinised before the committee could start recording the oral evidence of witnesses and as, owing to the intervention of the summer vacation, visits to University centres for the recording of oral evidence were not possible during the summer vacation Government were approached with a request to extend the tenure of the committee by six months beyond 26th March 1961. By Government Resolution, Education and Social Welfare Department, No. USG-2261-U of 18th April 1961, the Government were accordingly pleased to extend the period of appointment of the Committee till 30th September 1961.

1.5. As several requests had been received for extending the time-limit for sending replies to the questionnaire, a Press Note was issued through the Director of Publicity, Government of Maharashtra, extending the time-limit for replies up to 15th May 1961. A total of 151 replies were received by 15th May 1961, which were scrutinised and classified. The list of persons who sent replies to the questionnaire is printed as Appendix 'B' and a brief analysis of the views expressed on some important points posed in the questionnaire is given in Appendix 'D'.

Oral Evidence

1.6. The third meeting of the committee was held in Nagpur on the 8th and 9th July 1961. Dr. D. D. Karve, who could not attend the first two meetings of the committee on account of his visit to the United States of America, was able to join the deliberations of the committee in Nagpur. The Committee recorded the oral evidence of 13 prominent educationists at Nagpur, and also met some teachers from one of the local colleges. It was proposed to visit Poona soon after the work in Nagpur was over. In view, however, of the dislocation in Poona caused by the unfortunate floods of 12th July 1961, the Committee's visit to Poona had to be postponed.

1.7. The fourth meeting of the Committee was held in Aurangabad on 31st August and 1st September 1961, when the Committee recorded the oral evidence of 15 witnesses from the Marathwada Region.

1.8. The fifth meeting of the Committee was held in Poona from 16th September to 19th September, 1961. As many as 26 educationists from Poona and from the area at present under the jurisdiction of the University of Poona appeared before the Committee for giving oral evidence.

1.9. As the work of recording the oral evidence of educationists from Bombay had still to be taken up, the Government was again approached with a request to extend the tenure of the Committee by a further period of three months. By Government Resolution, Education and Social Welfare Department No. USG-2261-U of 4th October 1961, the Government were pleased to extend the period of appointment of the Committee up to 31st December 1961.

1.10. The sixth meeting of the Committee was held in Bombay from 9th October to 13th October 1961, when the Committee recorded the oral evidence of 40 witnesses including representatives of employers such as Millowners' Association, Bombay, Indian Merchants Chamber, Bombay, and the Maharashtra Chamber of Commerce, Bombay. The members of the Committee also paid a visit to the S. N. D. T. University and held discussions with the Vice-Chancellor and other authorities of the University. As the work of recording oral evidence was now over, the Committee arrived at certain broad conclusions and decided to proceed with the work of drafting the report on the basis of the agreed conclusions.

1.11. At the seventh meeting of the Committee held in Bombay on 7th and 8th December, 1961, the Committee proceeded to finalise the report to be submitted to Government.

Acknowledgements

1.12. The Committee thanks the authorities of all the Universities in Maharashtra for offering accommodation and other facilities to the Committee in connection with its meetings. The Committee is also grateful to the various bodies and persons who sent replies to the questionnaire and gave oral evidence. The Committee acknowledges with thanks the help received from the office staff of the Director of Education, Maharashtra State, Poona in the conduct of its work. The Committee's special thanks are due to Shri E. R. Dhongde, the Member-Secretary, for the readiness and willingness with which he bore the brunt of the Committee's work, in spite of his own heavy official duties as Joint Director of Education.

CHAPTER 2

THE REGIONAL AND THE NATIONAL LANGUAGES

2.1. The Government Resolution containing the terms of reference to our Committee speaks of the progressive substitution of the regional and the national languages as media of instruction in the universities and in the technical and other institutions of higher learning in Maharashtra. While there can be no doubt whatever that the term 'regional' language, so far as the State of Maharashtra is concerned, means Marathi, the expression 'national' language is not free from controversy. Being fully aware of this situation, in the questionnaire issued by us, we advisedly added a *nota bene* to the effect that the reference was to the 'National' Language and not to "Hindi". We did so with a view to avoiding unnecessary correspondence with those who might wish to answer the questionnaire, and we, perhaps, did well in taking this precaution, because, in the course of our examination of witnesses, we found that a good few of them were unwilling to accord to Hindi, the status of a 'national' language.

2.2. In the statement issued by the meeting of Chief Ministers of States and Central Ministers, held on August 10, 11 and 12, 1961 (hereinafter for brevity referred to as the 'Chief Ministers' Statement), both English and Hindi have been described as all-India languages, as contrasted with regional languages (*see* paragraph 18 of the Chief Ministers' Statement). They have also been described as the 'Union Official' languages (*see* paragraph 15 of the Chief Ministers' Statement). Referring to the Presidential Order, dated April 27, 1960, issued in regard to the Union Official Language, the Chief Ministers' Statement has welcomed the declaration made on behalf of the Central Government that English would continue to be used as an 'associate' language (*see* paragraph 20). Turning to Article 343 (1) in Chapter I, Part XVII of the Constitution of India, we find that Hindi in Devnagari script is declared to be the 'Official Language of the Union'. Article 351 in Chapter IV of Part XVII, headed "Special Directives," lays down certain directives for the development of the Hindi language.

2.3. The Eighth Schedule of the Constitution, referred to in Article 351, gives a list of fourteen languages, spoken in different parts of India, which include both Hindi and Marathi. We deem it unnecessary for the purposes of this report to discuss at length whether, in view of the abovementioned provisions in the Constitution, the Hindi language mentioned in the Eighth Schedule along with thirteen other Indian languages

enjoys a higher status than any of the other languages mentioned therein, or whether the status conferred on Hindi in Devnagari script by Article 343 (i) as the 'Official language of the Union' is applicable only to the Hindi language specified in Article 351, which the Union is directed to develop, "so that it may serve as a medium of expression for all the elements of the composite culture of India, and to secure its enrichment by assimilating, without interfering with its genius, the forms, styles and expressions used in Hindustani and in the other languages of India specified in the Eighth Schedule and by drawing for its vocabulary primarily on Sanskrit and secondarily on other languages." Evidently, Article 351 contemplates a language to be developed as indicated therein, which obviously cannot be equated with the 'Hindi' referred to in the Eighth Schedule as one of the fourteen languages of India that presumably enjoy an equal status *inter-se* as Indian languages.

2.4. The term 'national' language finds no place in any of the provisions of the Constitution of India. There is, however, a mention of it in the heading of paragraph 1 of Chapter IX on page 305 of the Radhakrishnan Report which speaks of "The Problem of the National Language". Reading Chapter IX of the Report on Medium of Instruction, as a whole, and paragraph 7 on page 307, in particular, it is clear that by 'national' language, the Commission meant the official Language of the Indian Federation or Union or the Federal language contemplated by Article 351 of the Constitution of India, which was then on the anvil. The Commission further surmised that some form of Western Hindi might ultimately be chosen as the official language of the Indian Federation, to be developed as a "fitting instrument of elevated discourse, capable of expressing the widest range of thought" and of becoming "the language of business, of philosophy and science, of the highest teaching and research." We have accordingly interpreted the expression 'national language' contained in the terms of reference as meaning the official language of the Union. In order to avoid vagueness of expression, we think we should speak in this report of Marathi rather than of the 'regional language' and of Hindi rather than of the 'national' language, notwithstanding the nomenclature employed in the Government Resolution.

CHAPTER 3

THE AIMS OF UNIVERSITY EDUCATION

3.1. It is necessary to make a clear distinction between the aims of university education and those of secondary education. While secondary education, as a necessary stage leading to university education, is expected to develop the knowledge, skill and habits of mind necessary for the student who wishes to proceed to the university for his further studies, it would not be proper to look upon it as mainly a stepping stone to the university. "For a large majority of students it marks the completion of their formal education and therefore, it should be viewed primarily as a stage complete in itself, with its own ends and special purposes". [See Report of the Secondary Education Commission (1952-53) p. 28]. The aims of secondary education have been so well formulated in the Mudaliar Commission's Report that we cannot do better than quote from it here. These aims are "the training of character to fit the students to participate creatively as citizens in the emerging democratic social order, the improvement of their practical and vocational efficiency so that they may play their part in building up the economic prosperity of their country; and the development of their literary, artistic and cultural interests, which are necessary for self-expression and for the full development of the human personality without which a living national culture cannot come into being". (See page 23 of the Report). The report proceeds to observe that students who, on passing out of the secondary schools do not join a university or a technical institution, should be able to fill the role of leadership at the intermediate level in the different walks of life, while leadership at the highest level will be recruited from the universities.

3.2. The universities, thus, have much greater and wider responsibilities than the secondary schools. In addition to being sanctuaries of learning and repositories of culture, they are powerful instruments of social transition and progress which help to stimulate the intellectual, cultural and material progress of the nation. They, too, like the secondary schools, mould the character of their students, train them for enlightened citizenship and prepare them for life, but they have also to "provide leadership in politics and administration, the professions, industry and commerce". They have to meet the increasing demand for every type of higher education, literary and scientific, technical and professional (See the Radhakrishnan Report, p. 33). The chief qualities required of leaders are effective thinking, ability to communicate thought, making relevant judgements and discriminating among values, which

are fostered by the right type of university education. The functions of modern universities are no longer restricted to the building of the character of their alumni and to the transmission and dissemination of knowledge and culture. They include advancement of the frontiers of knowledge in the various fields of study, including arts, science, technology, medicine and agriculture by promoting research and scholarship. It is important to bear in mind this wider conception of the functions of a university when we come to consider the kind of education we have to provide for our students at the university stage and, in particular, when we have to decide what medium of instruction should be employed for the purpose. It becomes most relevant from this point of view that, whatever the medium may be, it will have to be such as can give the students easy access not only to the vast treasures of accumulated knowledge in the several branches of study in the shape of existing literature but also to the unending stream of research publications in the form of scientific and other learned journals that keep flooding the libraries of universities and other institutions of higher learning.

CHAPTER 4

IMPORTANCE OF THE MAINTENANCE OF STANDARDS IN UNIVERSITY EDUCATION

4.1. The importance of maintaining high standards of teaching and examinations in university education is self-evident, since universities are institutions providing the highest type of education. They train students to become enlightened citizens and potential leaders of thought and action in the learned professions, in public administration and politics, in the social field, in scholarship and scientific research, in industry and commerce, and practically in every important walk of life. They also conserve and disseminate knowledge and culture, they mould the character and lives of the young men and women who go to them, and actively assist in extending the frontiers of knowledge in the humanities, the social and natural sciences and in technology. Unless, therefore, the universities maintain the highest levels of teaching, training and research, they cannot be expected to turn out individuals with integrated personalities, disciplined intellects, scholarly and scientific pursuits and qualities of leadership, who can be depended upon to carry the country forward in its intellectual, social, economic, industrial and political progress.

4.2. As has been observed by the Radhakrishnan Report (*See* page 84), "unless high standards of teaching and examinations are maintained, research will suffer, since research can continue uninterrupted only if there is a regular supply of graduates well prepared by general education for specialised research work. On the other hand, if research is neglected by teachers, their teaching will lack vitality and will rapidly become stale". Teaching and research always go hand in hand, and universities will fail of their purpose, if they do not maintain the highest standards in both.

4.3. We nowadays hear a great deal about falling standards in our universities. These are attributable to a variety of causes, among which may be mentioned the low level of our secondary education, the unsuitability for university studies of many of the entrants, the overcrowding of classrooms and laboratories, the shortage of qualified teachers, their low salary scales and unsatisfactory conditions of service, the lack of contacts between teacher and student, the absence of library facilities in many of our colleges, the insufficient number of working days, the undue importance given to lectures as contrasted with tutorials and seminars and, last but not least, the inability of the majority of students to follow the lectures which are delivered by their

teachers in English. Thanks to the financial assistance received by the colleges from the University Grants Commission in the shape of subsidies for upgrading the salary scales, and grants for improving the library and laboratory facilities, and the simultaneous attempts made by the universities themselves to introduce the tutorial system and curricular and other reforms, some of the causes mentioned above are being eliminated. One of the biggest hurdles, however, that still lies in the path of the students is the use of English as the medium of instruction.

4.4. The question of substituting the regional and/or the national language for English, which has been referred to us, and which is also being actively considered by some of the Indian universities, poses a problem bristling with difficulties, not the least formidable of which is the danger of lowering the standard of university education, arising from the absence of the necessary literature in these languages, the lack of a suitable technical terminology in the regional and national languages in the physical and biological sciences and the inexperience of teachers in teaching through these languages. An even more difficult problem is to ensure that, even after such substitution the students will continue to study English sufficiently well to have access to the over-swelling stream of knowledge flowing through that language.

4.5. In making our recommendations with regard to the medium of instruction to be adopted in the universities and technical and other institutions of higher education in Maharashtra, we shall, therefore, have to see that, both in the transitional period and in the long run, the teaching of English as a subject of study is maintained at a high level throughout the undergraduate stage, so that the students will not be cut off from the living stream of modern knowledge, which is indispensable for the progress of our country in attaining the goals of self-sufficiency in material resources and industrial output, and high standards of living for its people. It will also be necessary for the State Government to improve the teaching of English in the secondary schools by providing better qualified teachers, adopting improved methods of teaching and devoting more time to the teaching of the subject in the weekly timetable because otherwise the foundation will prove too weak to enable the universities to raise the standard of teaching the language at the higher stages.

CHAPTER 5

FUNCTION OF THE MEDIUM OF INSTRUCTION

5.1. Language, spoken or written, is a means of communicating one's ideas, thoughts and feelings to others. Man being a social animal, such communication is essential for the satisfaction of his needs, whether they arise in relation to his emotional, intellectual, social, economic or political life or to his other activities, involving co-operation with his fellowmen. There is much truth in the statement that "without language, ninety-nine per cent. of human activity would cease". (Mario Pei : *Language for Everybody*, Pocket Books-Inc. N. Y., p. vi). We are primarily concerned here with language as the symbol of thought and, even more, as the medium by which thought is transferred or communicated by one person to another. Language is, undoubtedly, the most important tool for the acquisition of knowledge in a civilised and cultured society, and the more so for the transmission and dissemination of knowledge in the sphere of education.

5.2. Different degrees of skill are called for in the use of the 'tool' of language for different purposes. Thus, the knowledge required for expression is of a much higher standard than that required for mere comprehension. Again, the knowledge necessary for the purpose of ordinary conversation, or for putting through normal business transactions, is of a distinctly lower standard than that needed for literary expression. Language as the medium of instruction at the university stage is employed for communication between the teacher and the taught of the content of knowledge in the various subjects of study in the fields of humanities, the social sciences or the physical and biological sciences through lectures, tutorials, discussions, question and answer and other methods of discourse. Instruction at this stage also implies expert guidance in the use of books, prescribed or recommended for study or reference, for the stabilisation of the knowledge conveyed by the teacher. For the purpose of following the teaching through lectures or tutorials and for comprehending the books read, the students' knowledge of the language need not be as thorough as that which would be necessary to enable him to express himself in that language in his written work, whether in class or in examination. An even higher standard of attainment in the language would be essential for the student who has the ambition of expressing himself in creative writing.

5.3. Few would contest the proposition that the mother-tongue is the most natural, and therefore, the most effective medium of instruction at the primary stage of education. It is

on this principle that linguistic minorities are entitled to receive instruction in their mother-tongue at that stage (*See Article 350-A of the Constitution of India*). The mother-tongue formula is not, however, fully applicable in the secondary stage of education, as this stage provides a more advanced education to enable pupils to follow a vocation after the school leaving age, and also prepares them for higher education in the universities. The instruction in secondary schools is, therefore, generally given in the regional language or in any other language mentioned in the Eighth Schedule of the Constitution [*See paragraph 4 of the Chief Ministers' Statement and paragraph 9 of the Statement issued by the National Integration Conference (September-October), 1961*]. The immense practical advantage of acquiring knowledge, particularly at the school stage in one's own language, "cannot be gainsaid" says Otto Jespersen : *Language, its Nature, Development and Origin*, Allen and Unwin, 1922. At the university stage, too, it is generally agreed that the regional language, if not the mother-tongue, would be the most natural medium of instruction. Hence, the noticeable tendency of regional languages to become the media of university education in our country.

5-4. Some witnesses who appeared before us maintained that unless Marathi is made the sole medium of instruction in the Universities of Maharashtra in all faculties and at all stages of education, it would not be possible to promote the development of that language. While we appreciate their feelings, we are of the view that such general statements as "the mother-tongue is the natural medium of instruction" or "the regional language is the most suitable medium of instruction" at a particular level must however, necessarily be qualified in relation to the social and political setting in which they are to be implemented. The love that every Indian feels for his mother-tongue is natural. It has, however, to be reconciled with all-India needs because we realise that all-India unity is of overriding importance. The purpose of enriching the regional language and raising its status can be achieved by various means like making it the language of administration of the State, encouraging the publication of books on different subjects in it, etc., etc. Again, it may be noted that there are millions of people who speak languages not mentioned in the Eighth Schedule, who have to realise that their languages cannot be used for certain purposes, e.g., for communication with the majority of people in their region or as a medium of instruction at any stage in their education. Similarly, there are certain inherent limitations placed on the regional languages on account of the fact that the regions where they are spoken are federating units in the Indian Union.

Obviously no regional language could be used at the all-India level. For any sphere which can be called an all-India sphere of activity only an all-India language can and should be used. Intellectual activity as is carried on in universities, scholarly research and publication, communication between academic and professional men, free migration of teachers and students from university to university are all national, i.e., all-India activities which should be carried on in an all-India language. If universities in India begin to do all teaching up to the highest level and publication of research in the regional languages the inevitable result will be to make communication between intellectuals extremely difficult, if not impossible. It should be emphasised that the mere knowledge by all university trained men of a common means of communication, a 'link' as it is often called, will not suffice, because that may merely mean that they can talk to each other or write to each other. But if there is not that continuous contact with new work being done at different Indian Universities and research centres, academic life is bound to suffer. This can only be avoided if all Universities in the country agree to carry on at least post-graduate teaching and research in a common all-India medium. The same will apply to scientific, technical and professional education because in these modern times when the need for rapid industrialisation and modernisation is so urgently felt, the use of the regional languages in these fields is likely to affect our progress adversely.

5.5. It must be recognised that, for providing an effective medium of instruction at the stage of university education, it is not enough to prescribe the regional language as such medium. It is further essential that there should be qualified and experienced teachers who can teach through that language as well as adequate literature, including reference books no less than text-books, in that language for the use of both the students and the teachers. Elsewhere in this Report we have dealt at some length with the question of providing such teachers and such literature.

5.6. This naturally leads us to consider what is meant by saying that the medium of instruction must be effective. To make the medium effective, the teachers must be capable of handling the language adopted as the medium with comparative ease, and of teaching the subject through it so that the students are able to assimilate the teaching, both in its form and subject-matter. The students must further be able to answer reasonable questions set on the subject matter, whether they choose to do so in the language of the medium or in any other permitted language.

5.7. We think it necessary to point out here that the teaching of any language as a subject of study and the use of the same language as a medium of instruction are two different things, and that they produce two entirely different effects. This becomes obvious if we carefully evaluate the attainment of a student who has studied, say, a modern European language like French or German, as a second language through the medium of English. Such a student would, no doubt, be able to comprehend the meaning of a passage, seen or unseen, in French or German, as the case may be, and to translate it into English, or even to translate an English passage into the language studied by him, but he would not ordinarily be capable of writing an essay or answering a question in French or German without considerable practice and without a special effort. On the other hand, a student who has studied French or German through the medium of French or German, as the case may be, would be able to write an essay or answer a question in that language with comparative ease.

5.8. Today, the students in our colleges who are unable to follow the lectures delivered in English by their teachers because their instruction at the secondary stage was through a regional language and because they have not acquired an adequate proficiency in English, are in an even worse position. The assimilation by them of the content of their subject through an unfamiliar language is at best imperfect, and to add to this handicap, they are further to write their answers in their examinations in the same unfamiliar language. The situation can be remedied either by permitting them to answer the questions in Marathi or Hindi in which they can express themselves with greater facility or by arranging to give them instruction through these languages. A third remedy is also possible. The method of instruction in English could be modified, and intensive coaching given to them in English to enable them to follow the lectures delivered in English and also to express themselves in tolerably good English. When they answer the examination papers, the examiners could be specially instructed, in evaluating their performance, to pay greater attention to the contents of their answer than to the correctness of the language in which they are examined. With the adoption of new methods of instruction such as those recommended by the Central Institute of English, Hyderabad, and with special coaching, it would further be possible to improve the ability of the students to assimilate the contents of the books in English recommended for the study of the subject concerned.

CHAPTER 6

THE MEDIUM OF INSTRUCTION AND THE 'ALL-INDIA' SERVICES

6.1. The medium of competitive examinations for recruitment to the all-India services is English, at present, and as long as it continues to be English, those students who receive their instruction at the University stage through the medium of English are bound to have an advantage over those who are instructed through an Indian Language, whatever it may be. A change in the medium of instruction from English to Marathi or Hindi, is therefore, certain to affect adversely those students who may want to compete for places in the all-India services.

6.2. In India, for certain historical reasons, the all-India services were linked with universities, and although, with some changes in the system of recruitment this situation may undergo some alteration in the direction of providing a broader base for recruitment, the universities will, for a long time to come, continue to provide the most important recruiting ground for manning the various public services at the higher levels. This is especially true of the universities in Maharashtra other than that of Bombay where, in the matter of choosing a career, there has always been a relatively greater value attached to entry into the services than entry into commerce, or industry, or the professions.

6.3. It would, therefore, appear that, in their interest the medium of examination and, therefore, of instruction at the University should be identical with the medium of examination for recruitment to services. A number of witnesses who appeared before us laid considerable stress on the need of a common all-India policy in the matter of the medium of instruction in the universities. They pointed out that, if the universities in Maharashtra changed over to Marathi or Hindi as the medium of instruction, while other universities in India continued to retain the English medium the candidates from Maharashtra would be at a serious disadvantage in competing with the products of other Universities in the all-India competitive examinations so long as they are held in English. Even at present, when English continues to be the chief medium of instruction in most of the universities in Maharashtra, the candidates from this State do not somehow fare well in the all-India competitive tests. Their position would become still worse if the medium of instruction at the University, differed from the medium to be used at the competitive tests.

6.4. Our questionnaire included two questions having a direct bearing on this subject, namely, whether the abolition of English

as a medium at the undergraduate stage would prejudice the chances of intending competitors, especially of those who wished to enter the Foreign Service (*See* Q. No. 7), and whether the introduction of Hindi, as an optional medium would benefit intending competitors, assuming that Hindi would be introduced as an optional medium for the Union Public Service examinations (*See* Q. No. 8). The answer of a large majority (76 out of 98) to Question No. 7 was that the abolition of English as a medium would prejudice the chances of competitors. The replies to Question No. 8 disclosed that 59 persons were of the view that the students would be positively benefited, while 38 thought that they would be benefited to a certain extent.

6.5. We do not know what policy the Government of India, in consultation with the Union Public Service Commission, will finally adopt with regard to the medium of examinations for the all-India Services. The President's Order on the subject is far from clear. It merely recommends that necessary action be taken by the Ministry of Home Affairs in consultation with the Commission for the introduction of Hindi as an alternative medium after some time. It also points out that the introduction of the various regional languages as alternative media is likely to lead to serious difficulties. It, however, gives no indication as to how long English will continue to be a medium of examination after Hindi is introduced as an optional medium. If and when Hindi is permitted as an optional medium, it is doubtful whether the equality of opportunity, such as exists to-day will continue, as the students whose mother-tongue is Hindi or whose medium of instruction at the university stage is Hindi will necessarily have an advantage over those whose mother-tongue is not Hindi and who have received their instruction through some other Indian language. It has been suggested that the only fair solution in such circumstances would be to continue English as the sole medium of examination, or to permit all the Indian languages specified in the Eighth Schedule of the Constitution as optional media. It should be borne in mind, in this context that, although the posts to be filled by competition in the all-India services are few, comparatively speaking, the number of candidates aspiring for them is quite large and includes the most talented among university students. This is obviously due to the fact that these posts enjoy a high status and importance in the administrative set up of the country.

6.6. Some of our witnesses attached such great importance to the all-India Services that they went to the length of suggesting that, for ensuring a fair competition among candidates coming from different universities or States, if for no other reason, English should continue to be the sole, or at least an

optional medium of instruction in the universities, for all time and the sole medium of examination for admission to the all-India Services.

6-7. One or two other witnesses suggested the adoption of a quota system, as they called it, to equalise opportunities among the residents of the different States. We are opposed to the introduction of a quota system, involving a Statewise reservation of places, because it would prevent the selection of the best in order of merit from among *all* the candidates appearing for the examination from all parts of India. The competition would cease to be an all-India competition in the real sense of the term.

6-8. All-India Services, such as the Indian Administrative Service or the Indian Police Service are, in our opinion, essential for the integration and strength of the Union from the point of view of the administration of the country as a whole. They play an important part in securing the political unity of the country and by helping to strengthen the feeling of a common citizenship for the entire Indian people, enjoying equal rights and opportunities. For greater inter-State co-ordination, and the more efficient implementation of All-India policies, the States Reorganisation Commission recommended the free intermingling of the personnel of the existing all-India services, as between State and State by the recruitment of a fair proportion of the members of such services from outside each State and also the expansion of the all-India services to include new cadres, and the constitution of new services, such as the Indian Service of Engineers, the Indian Forest Service and the Indian Medical and Health Service. The principle of expanding the all-India services on the lines suggested by the Commission was accepted by the Chief Ministers of States and Central Ministers who met at Delhi in August 1961 (See paragraph 4 of their statement), and it is understood that the State Governments have already started looking into the matter. The Rajya Sabha has already passed a resolution calling for legislation to create the three new services mentioned above on the ground that it is necessary and expedient to create them in the national interest.

6-9. In the competitive examinations for admission to the all-India services some reduction of inequalities will be achieved, if the candidates from the Hindi speaking areas are required to pass a qualifying examination in a language other than Hindi, preferably a South Indian language, as such a requirement would counterbalance the disadvantage which weighs as a burden on candidates from non-Hindi speaking areas who have to pass a qualifying examination in Hindi. Such

a rule may be extended with advantage to Central Services like those connected with the Income-Tax or the Customs Department, as it would then facilitate the transfer of service personnel from State to State.

6.10. We are against making the change in the medium of instruction in the universities depend upon the medium employed for the competitive examinations. To do so would be to give undue importance to competitive examinations, that no doubt serve their own special purpose, but should not be allowed to dominate educational policies which affect large student populations. The universities should be free to decide on the medium of instruction on the basis of purely academic grounds uninfluenced by the consideration of its utility for a specific purpose such as that of testing the relative merit of candidates competing for administrative posts. It will be for the Government of India and the Union Public Service Commission to devise methods for ensuring a fair and just evaluation of comparative merit among the candidates competing for such posts.

CHAPTER 7

THE NECESSITY OF INTER-STATE AND INTER-NATIONAL CONTACTS

7.1. Article 1 (1) of the Constitution of India declares that India shall be a Union of States. It is a Federal Union with the important qualification that none of its States represents a pre-existing sovereign unit in the sense in which the American colonies were such units before they decided to form a federal union. As pointed out in the Report of the States Reorganisation Commission, 1955, "under the constitution, the States constitute cornerstones of the political and administrative structure of the country with a real measure of autonomy", but a number of provisions are contained therein for safeguarding the unity of India, which are primarily remedial in character and intended to prevent a break down in the States and to safeguard the powers of the Union within its own sphere (*See* page 42).

7.2. The unity of India is essential for the progress of the country as a whole and also of the individual States which constitute the Union. We should like to draw attention here to the two basic facts emphasised by the States Reorganisation Commission on page 229 of its Report, namely (1) that "the States are, and will continue to be, integral parts of a Union which is far and away the more real political entity and the basis of our nationhood" and (2) that "the Constitution of India recognises only one citizenship, a common citizenship of the entire Indian people, with equal rights and opportunities throughout the Union". Since our universities are an integral part of the life of the Indian nation, whatever reforms may be brought about in their functioning or work, they will be moving in the right direction so long as they recognise these basic facts, and bear them in mind, whether the reforms relate to their curricula or their media of instruction.

7.3. Except for the Central Universities, university education is a subject falling within the State list (*see* Seventh Schedule of the Constitution, List II, item 11), although the co-ordination and determination of standards in institutions for higher education or research and scientific and technical institutions are specifically included in the powers of the Union Legislature (*see* Seventh Schedule List I, item 66). In paragraph 17 of the Statement issued by the National Integration Conference (September-October, 1961), it is mentioned that views were strongly expressed at the Conference that, in the interest of greater uniformity and cohesion of policy, education should be made a concurrent subject, or at least for administrative purposes an all-India Educational Service should be constituted. It would

appear that these views were given expression to in connection with the question of the medium of instruction for university education referred to in the immediately preceding paragraphs 15 and 16. The subject had also been discussed at length in the Chief Ministers' Conference, held in August 1961, which pointedly drew attention to the "*tendency of regional languages to become the medium for university education*" as being likely to "*lead to the isolation of such universities from the rest of India*", and to prevent the migration of teachers and students from one university to another.

7.4. The free movement of teachers and students from university to university is obviously essential. This can only take place, if there is at least one language used in all the Indian Universities as the common medium of instruction, if necessary in addition to one or more other languages. Such a common language would also help the recruitment to the all-India services from outside a State and to facilitate the pooling of technical and specially trained personnel for the implementation of all-India policies with regard to the planned development and progress of the country as a whole. It would also solve many problems which arise for both parents and children in consequence of transfers made from one State to another of personnel in all-India services such as the Police and the Posts and Telegraphs. The growth of industry and commerce is another factor responsible for the free and frequent movement of persons from one State to another which creates similar problems about their children's education.

7.5. The need for universities to maintain international contacts cannot be over-emphasised. The world is rapidly shrinking as a result of the great progress made from day to day by science and technology and, unless the universities keep abreast of such progress, they will soon become outmoded and useless. Their teachers and students, their scholars and research workers cannot afford to lag behind the rest of the world. International contacts through travel, learned conferences, and seminars and other meetings of scholars, scientists and teachers, which are held from time to time in different parts of the world to exchange ideas, discuss common problems and formulate programmes in educational, social, economic, industrial and political spheres, have to be maintained and promoted by those who work in the universities, if they want to keep in step with their counterparts in other parts of the world. In this connection it must be borne in mind that the acquisition and progress of knowledge, especially in the fields of science and technology, is becoming more and more a matter of co-operative and team work, and no country or nation can hope to move forward, or

even survive, if it gets out of step either through an isolated existence or through indolence. The knowledge of the English language and the facility in handling it as a means of communication with international organisations is a valuable asset. They have enabled us to maintain international contacts, as English both as a written and as a spoken language is well known to be one of the leading languages of international intercourse. Such contacts will continue to be ever more necessary in the future.

7-6. It would be pertinent here to quote paragraph 12 of the statement issued by the National Integration Conference (September-October, 1961), which reads as under :—

“The Conference accepted the proposition that the study of English is important from the point of international communication and the growth of modern knowledge generally, and more especially in science, industry and technology. This would be necessary at all stages of higher education, particularly so at the level of post-graduate study and advanced research”.

7-7. The Radhakrishnan Commission, too, has stressed the importance of continuing the study of English as a language rich in literature, humanistic, scientific and technical, which is necessary for maintaining standards of scholarship. It says, “English is the only means of preventing our isolation from the world, and we will act unwisely if we allow ourselves to be enveloped in the folds of a dark curtain of ignorance. In the universities no student should be allowed to take a degree who does not acquire the ability to read with facility and understand works of English authors. A sense of the oneness of the world is in the making and control over a medium of expression which is more widespread and has a larger reach than any of our languages to-day, will be of immense benefit to us. (See the Radhakrishnan Report, Chapter IX, p. 325).” The English language, to use a picturesque phrase which has now become common, is becoming more and more a “window on the world”

CHAPTER 8

PROVISION FOR LINGUISTIC MINORITIES

8.1. We are concerned in our report with linguistic minorities in the State of Maharashtra. Articles 29, 30, 347 and 350-A and 350-B of the Constitution of India contain provisions for safeguarding the rights of linguistic minorities. Article 29 provides that any section of citizens which has a distinct language, script or culture of its own shall have the right to conserve the same, and prohibits discrimination in making admission to educational institutions maintained or aided by the State. Article 30 gives the right to all minorities, whether based on religion or language, to establish and administer educational institutions of their choice, and further provides that, in giving aid to educational institutions, the State shall not discriminate against institutions managed by such minorities. Article 347 authorises the President to direct the use of minority languages for such purposes as he may specify in appropriate cases. Article 350-A provides for facilities for instruction in the mother-tongue at the primary stage to children belonging to linguistic minority groups, and Article 350-B makes provision for the appointment of a special officer by the President for safeguarding the interests of linguistic minorities. The two last-mentioned articles were inserted in the Constitution in consequence of the reorganisation of States in 1956. These safeguards follow as a corollary to the right to freedom of movement throughout India and the right to reside and settle in any part of India, conferred on all Indian citizens by Article 19 (1) (d) and (e).

8.2. The States Reorganisation Commission rightly observed that the language of instruction in educational institutions and the language of administration, affecting as they do many vital aspects of the life of every individual, constitute the core of the problem of linguistic minorities. (See page 209 of the Report.) Whatever recommendations we may make in our report with regard to the facilities to be given to linguistic minorities in the State of Maharashtra for obtaining instruction at the university stage when English is replaced by Marathi and/or Hindi, have necessarily to be consistent with the constitutional provisions referred to above. We cannot, therefore, accept the suggestion, seriously made by a few of the witnesses examined by us, that Marathi should be adopted as the sole medium of instruction in the universities of Maharashtra, since it is the language adopted by the State as the language of administration. If this suggestion were to be accepted, it would, in our opinion, be tantamount to denying admission to a number of linguistic minority groups who would find it extremely difficult, if not impossible, to follow

the teaching imparted through the medium of Marathi alone. At the same time, it must be realised that the universities in Maharashtra would be under no obligation to provide instruction to their students through the media of the languages of all or some of the minority language groups, so long as they continue to provide for their benefit an optional medium such as English or Hindi, both of which are subjects of study at the secondary stage of education in all the schools in the State of Maharashtra. In making these observations, we have in mind not only the linguistic minority groups permanently residing in Maharashtra but also those who have migrated, or may hereafter migrate, temporarily to Maharashtra for service, business or education, or for any other purpose.

CHAPTER 9

THE THREE LANGUAGE FORMULA

9.1. Speaking about the teaching of languages at the secondary stage in our country, the late Maulana Abul Kalam Azad, addressing the Twenty-fourth meeting of the Central Advisory Board of Education in January 1957, said, "I am convinced that national interests demand that every pupil in the secondary stage should study three languages compulsorily. He must study first his State language, second Hindi, if it is not the State language, and third English. If Hindi is the State language, he must study another modern Indian language. I consider it necessary that every pupil in the secondary stage should study two modern Indian languages in order to get an insight into the richness and complexity of our composite Indian culture. Similarly, he must study English, if we are not to lose our contacts with the currents of modern thought and with the great scientific progress of the Western world. It would, in my opinion, be shutting our eyes to reality, if we refuse to recognise that, in the context of our modern needs, English, Hindi and another Indian language must be studied by every Indian citizen who goes beyond the elementary stage. I am happy to say that all the State Governments have agreed with this view and measures are now in hand for giving effect to it."

9.2. The three-language formula, referred to by the Education Minister in his abovementioned address, which was accepted by all the State Governments, was as follows :—

(a) (i) Mother-tongue or (ii) regional language or (iii) a composite course of the mother-tongue and a regional language or (iv) a composite course of the mother-tongue and a classical language or (v) a composite course of the regional language and a classical language.

(b) English or another modern European language, and

(c) Hindi (for non-Hindi speaking areas) or another modern Indian language (for Hindi speaking areas).

9.3. The formula was discussed by the Chief Ministers at the Conference held in August, 1961, and they agreed to modify it as under :—

(a) the regional language and mother-tongue when the latter is different from the regional language ;

(b) Hindi or in Hindi speaking areas another Indian language, and

(c) English or any other modern European language, (see paragraph 9 of the Statement issued by the Conference).

9.4. The National Integration Conference which met later accepted the formula, and added that the study of Hindi and English should be commenced at an early stage (See paragraph 13 of the Statement issued by the Conference).

9.5. The situation today in the State of Maharashtra is that except in Marathwada in all secondary schools Hindi and English are taught from Standard V, while in the schools in Marathwada Hindi is taught from Standard III and English from Standard V. We think that in order that the child may not be burdened with the study of two new languages all at once in Standard V, Hindi which is nearer to Marathi than English may be introduced as a subject of study in Standard III and English in Standard V in the whole of Maharashtra. This would also result in uniformity, facilitating the migration of pupils whose parents are transferred from one part of the State to another.

9.6. All the witnesses examined by us agreed to the formula as applied to the secondary stage of education in Maharashtra. The majority of them also opined that, at the university stage, English as a subject of compulsory study be taught up to the first degree stage. With regard to Marathi and Hindi, opinions were divided, some witnesses being in favour of both these languages being taught compulsorily for the first two years of the collegiate course (including the pre-degree course), while others were definitely against Hindi being made a subject of compulsory study in the degree course.

9.7. Having considered the divergent opinions referred to in the preceding paragraph, we are of the opinion that both Marathi and Hindi should be made subjects of compulsory study up to and inclusive of the second year, i.e., the first year of the three-year degree course or the Intermediate class in arts, and science, as the case may be, and English up to the end of the first degree course in arts and science. In other words the three language formula should be applied in a modified form at the University level. They need not be retained in the professional courses which are already overcrowded. The advantage of teaching all the three languages up to the second year of the degree course in arts, commerce and science will be that those students who branch off after the second year to the professional courses such as medicine or engineering will know all the three languages sufficiently well to be able to follow lectures delivered through them either in the professional courses or in the post-graduate courses. The continuation of English as a subject of study up to the end of the first degree stage in arts and science will enable those students who wish to do post-graduate and research work for their master's degrees or doctorates in arts or

science to have an adequate knowledge of English to read books and journals in English relating to their specialities and also to follow lectures delivered in English at the post-graduate stage. We should like to make it clear that in teaching all three languages as subjects of compulsory study, the emphasis should be on the study of the language for the purpose of developing the powers of comprehension rather than on its literature. The literature need only be studied by those students who want to specialise in it, or to acquire literary skill.

CHAPTER 10

THE STUDY OF A LANGUAGE AS CONTRASTED WITH THE STUDY OF ITS LITERATURE

10.1. In the preceding Chapter we have stated that, in teaching all the three languages, viz., Marathi, Hindi and English, as subjects of compulsory study, the emphasis should be on the study of the language for the purpose of developing the powers of comprehension rather than on its literature, and that the literature need only be studied by those who want to specialise in it or to acquire literary skill. We should like to add here that these remarks apply with special reference to the study of English.

10.2. While an emphasis on the study of its literature may be unavoidable for a student who wants to specialise in English Language and Literature, it should not be necessary for a student who wants to acquire an adequate command over English to spend his time and energy on understanding and mastering the finer literary nuances of the English language. In this connection, attention may be invited to the following suggestion of the Kunzru Committee on the courses of study in English :—

“It may be desirable to have the question of courses of study in English and methods of teaching English at the University stage examined by an expert body and the recommendations of such a body adopted by all the Universities. Where English is not the medium of instruction at any University course it would be necessary to adopt special methods to secure an adequate knowledge of English as a second language.”

10.3. It has been observed by experienced professors of English that the curricula, as they exist in our universities today, are heavily loaded on the side of literature, especially in the courses in compulsory English. It is usual to prescribe a couple of Shakespeare's Plays, Milton's Paradise Lost, Browning's poems and other English literary classics for the first degree examination. Whatever propriety there might have been in prescribing such a course in the past, when English enjoyed a high priority in the school curriculum, with a large number of periods devoted to it, with the changed conditions in our country today, under which pupils in secondary schools have, of necessity, to study two Indian languages, namely, the regional language and Hindi, and many new subjects have been introduced, and the teaching of English is restricted to a shorter period of time and occupies fewer periods in the weekly time-table, it is too much to expect them, when they proceed to the University, to understand, much less to appreciate, the English classics. The result is that they resort to cramming notes and guides on the texts, and do not study the texts at all.

10.4. It is high time, therefore, that these courses were reorganised so as to be within the capacity of those students who have no intention to specialise in English literature. The study of literary classics is, no doubt, necessary for those who aim at acquiring a mastery over the English language, such as Dr. Samuel Johnson had in mind when he wrote that "Whoever wishes to attain an English style, familiar but not coarse, and elegant but not ostentatious, must give his days and nights to the volumes of Addison". The main object of including English as a compulsory subject of study in the degree courses in arts, commerce and science is to familiarise the student with the structure and vocabulary of the language in common use and its pronunciation in order that he may be able to read and understand standard books published in English on the subjects he intends to study, and to follow the lectures delivered in English on those subjects. We must, therefore, see that in the teaching of English greater emphasis is placed on the structure, vocabulary and contemporary usage of the language so that the student can develop his language skills. This will require a complete reorientation of the methods of teaching. Fortunately, such new methods are practised and taught in the Central Institute of English Studies to teachers of secondary schools and lecturers of English in the colleges in special programmes organised by the Institute. The Institute is also engaged in carrying on research on the problem of teaching English in the pre-university courses. Some of our universities have been taking advantage of the training offered by the Institute to college teachers. It is yet too early to pronounce any judgment on the efficacy of these methods, but they are certainly worth a trial as they are based on the assumption that English needs to be taught to our students as a second language, which is the correct approach.

10.5. We would point out that the study of a modern language cannot be regarded as satisfactory, if the student is unable to express himself in that language sufficiently well to communicate his thoughts without making serious errors of syntax or grammar, although his expression may not be elegant. If he has a fair command of the vocabulary in common use and has some familiarity with the structures of the English language, he should be able, with a little practice, to express himself tolerably well for ordinary purposes. It is, therefore, necessary that he should be given exercises in composition, précis writing and the writing of simple essays from time to time. This was the normal routine in earlier times, but it appears to have been discontinued in many of our colleges today, with disastrous consequences.

CHAPTER 11.

THE PROBLEM OF THE MEDIUM OF INSTRUCTION IN
UNIVERSITIES—ITS ORIGIN, NATURE AND SOLUTION.

11.1. The Problem of the medium of instruction in Universities has been a subject of controversy. As observed by the Radhakrishnan Commission, "it is so wrapped up in sentiment that it is difficult to consider it in a calm and detached manner". It came into prominence during the Independence movement and has not yet been fully tackled by the Universities. Not a little of the difficulty in finding a satisfactory solution to the problem is due to the diversity of languages in the country on the one hand, and to the need of maintaining the unity of the country.

11.2. The question of adopting an Indian language as a medium of instruction in place of English in the Universities, came up for consideration before the Central Advisory Board of Education, as long ago as in January, 1948. The Prime Minister, while inaugurating the 14th meeting of the Board in January 1948, referred to it in the following words :

"There is another problem on which you have to take a final decision now. What is to be the medium of instruction in our educational institutions? I am sure there are two things with which you will agree. First that in future English cannot remain the medium of instruction. Secondly whatever the change may be in this direction, it should not be sudden but gradual. In my opinion so far as higher education is concerned, we should come to the decision that the *status quo* may be preserved for five years. But along with it provision may be made by the Universities for the coming change. I should like you to make your suggestions to the Government after due deliberation".

"But in this connection a fundamental question arises with regard to Indian languages. How is the change to be brought about? Is university education to be imparted through a common Indian language or provinces may be given an opportunity to have their own regional languages for university teaching? English was a foreign language. We were greatly handicapped by having it as our medium of instruction. But we were also greatly benefited in one way that all the educated people in the country thought and expressed themselves in the same language. It cemented the national unity. It was such a great boon to us that I should have advocated its retention as the medium of instruction had it not been fundamentally wrong to impart education through a foreign language.

But obviously I should desist from offering this advice. I put it to you if only till recently a Madrasi or a Punjabi or a Bengali felt no difficulty in receiving education through a foreign language, why should he be handicapped if he were to be educated through one of the Indian languages. We shall certainly be able to retain the same intellectual unity which was created for us by the English language. But if we fail to substitute an Indian language for English, our intellectual unity will certainly be affected”.

“The alternative course before us is to have regional languages for university teaching and one common compulsory language for Central Government and for inter-provincial communication. Any how it is but necessary that you should come to a final decision on this point after discussion and deliberation”.

11.3. At the same meeting, the Central Advisory Board, recommended to the Government of India that a representative committee be appointed to consider, (i) the medium of instruction and examination at the university stage, (ii) the place of the national language in secondary and higher education, (iii) the place of English as a language in university education, (iv) the stages by which English should be replaced as the medium of instruction by the national or the regional language, and (v) the steps required for the preparation of text books and other requisites for implementing its recommendations. When the report of the Committee came up before the next meeting of the Board, held in the following year, it was resolved that no final decision be taken on the report, in view of the appointment of the Radhakrishnan Commission which was expected to submit its report before the next following meeting of the Board. The Board, however, further resolved that the aim of all universities should be the replacement of English by an Indian language as the medium of instruction in the shortest possible time, consistent with the maintenance of standards of teaching and efficiency of training, particularly in scientific and technical subjects, and also the preparation of books required for the purpose.

11.4. The Radhakrishnan Report, which devotes an entire chapter to the medium of instruction (*See Chapter IX, pages 305 to 326*), after a very careful consideration of the problem in all its aspects, came to the conclusion that Hindi was the only alternative to English as the federal language, and that in order to enable every region to take its proper share in the federal activities, as well as to promote inter-provincial understanding and solidarity, educated India would have to be bilingual, and pupils at the higher secondary and university stages would need to

know even three languages ; the regional language, the federal language and English. The final recommendation made by the Commission was, that the universities should have the option to use the federal language as the medium of instruction, either for some or for all subjects as an alternative to the regional language.

11.5. The Inter-University Board, at a special meeting held in August 1950, to consider the Radhakrishnan Report passed a resolution on the subject of the medium of instruction in the following terms :—

“The subject of the medium of instruction is beset with difficulties. There is need for the universities to have a common language to enable migration of students and teachers and to continue inter-university contacts. Educational standards and methods must not be seriously interfered with. Even where regional languages are considered suitable for adoption as media of instruction, there is the difficulty of finding suitable *text-books and teachers* capable of teaching in the language. The difficulties are enhanced in multi-lingual areas. English will have to be retained until the national language can be substituted. The universities should be financed by the Indian Government and State Governments to enable students to learn the language of the Union at a higher level. The universities which are willing to impart education in the national language should be allowed to do so”.

11.6. At its meeting held in Nagpur, the Board further considered the subject of the medium of instruction and, *inter alia*, resolved as follows :—

“The Board realises that the subject of medium of instruction is beset with many difficult problems and therefore, requires very careful consideration. Whatever method be adopted, it must be a process of evolution leading to a gradual development of sufficient material to utilise the language concerned as a suitable medium of instruction at the university stage.

The Board feels that, if fissiparous tendencies are not to develop and extreme provincialism to spread, there is need for the universities to have a common language. A common language is also necessary to enable students and teachers to migrate from one university to another, and generally for inter-university contacts.

While an Indian language has to be substituted for English, at the same time, at present the approach may have to be cautious so that educational standards and methods may not be seriously interfered with”.

11.7. At the Seventh Quinquennial Conference of Indian Universities held in Mysore in December 1953, the question of the medium of instruction was discussed at great length, and the following resolution was passed :—

“ This Conference, while reiterating the resolution passed at Nagpur, on this subject, is of the opinion that it is necessary to encourage the study of Hindi and English at the university stage to enable the products of the university to have contact with all Indian universities, and also to have an opportunity of contact with the international universities ”.

11.8. The different Indian universities have, from time to time, discussed the problem and made attempts to solve it in their own manner. As a result of the decisions taken by them, the present situation is as follows :—

“ English still continues to be the medium of instruction in 21 universities out of 40. Hindi has been adopted as the medium of instruction in place of English in 12 universities. English continues as a medium in a few courses of subjects in these universities. At least three universities have adopted the regional language as a medium of instruction in place of English. In two of these universities, Hindi is a parallel medium so that students at their option may receive instruction either in the regional language or in Hindi (Nagpur University and Sardar Vallabhbhai Vidyapeeth). It may be mentioned here that no university, except one or two, have adopted Hindi as a medium of instruction, although it is not the regional language, the other universities which have adopted Hindi being mostly situated in Uttar Pradesh or Madhya Pradesh, where Hindi is the regional language. There are also a few universities which do not have English as their medium of instruction, i.e., the Sanskrit University, where the media of instruction are Sanskrit and Hindi and the S. N. D. T. Women's University, where the media are Marathi and Gujarati.”.

The above information is based on Appendix 2 to the Report on Medium of Instruction, issued by the University Grants Commission in 1961.

11.9. The University Grants Commission appointed a Working Group in September 1959, which included representatives of different universities, and of the Ministry of Education and the Ministry of Scientific Research to consider all aspects of the question pertaining to the change of the medium of instruction from English to an Indian language so that it might offer advice to the universities to enable them to bring about a change, if considered necessary, in the medium of instruction, consistently

with the maintenance of standards. This Working Group of 14 members prepared a list of items on topics relevant to the question of change of medium of instruction and circulated it to various universities with a view to ascertaining their views. The replies received from the different universities were considered and discussed by the Working Group, and the result of its deliberations is contained in the report, dated the 21st November 1960, signed by its Chairman, and issued by the University Grants Commission in 1961. In his report, the Chairman points out that the group has attempted to avoid expression of opinion on the desirability and feasibility of changing the medium of instruction in colleges.

11.10. We give below some of the important conclusions arrived by the Working Group which indicate the complexity of the problem and the caution which needs to be taken by any university, which contemplates a change in the medium of instruction from English to a modern Indian language—

(1) The change over of the medium of instruction from English to Indian modern language, should not be made in haste.

(2) Where the medium is changed, English should be retained as a subject of study, and special steps should be taken to improve the knowledge of English.

(3) The universities should prescribe the medium, and not the Legislature, since academic bodies are best able to judge how the change can be brought about without impairing the quality of teaching and lowering standards.

(4) It must be realised that, at the university stage, as contrasted with the secondary stage of education, a student acquires knowledge for himself through the study of books, with the assistance and guidance of teachers.

(5) A change in the medium of instruction should not be undertaken without adequate books. It would be perilous to change the medium in any subject on the strength of one text book, no matter how eminent the writer of it. There must be several other books in addition to the text books and also general reading material, both in science and arts subjects. All the books needed for the entire degree course in a subject should be available before a university changes the medium of instruction in any subject.

(6) There are special advantages in adopting international English terms when changing the medium, e.g.—

(a) considerable labour and time would be saved,

(b) the technical terms would be the same for the whole country,

(c) students would be saved the additional trouble of learning a new set of technical terms,

(d) the use of newly coined Indian words in the many combinations needed for scientific purposes would be extremely difficult, and

(e) familiarity with the international technical terms will make it comparatively easy for students to read scientific journals in English, French or German (See paragraph 3 of the President's order in the Ministry of Home Affairs Notification, dated 27th April, 1960).

(7) Universities should establish bureaus and committees to organise the production of books by specially chosen persons appointed to translate or write text books and books for general reading. Original books by experts with teaching experience are more valuable than mere translations or books specially written to satisfy the requirements of syllabus.

(8) Universities must publish journals in different subjects in the new medium and summaries of research papers produced in the university.

(9) The change of medium should not be made in all subjects and in all grades simultaneously. English should continue to be one of the media. This is important for permanently resident linguistic minorities, and for temporary residents whose mother-tongue is different from the regional language. Hindi may also be adopted as a parallel medium for the benefit of such minorities.

✓(10) The affiliated colleges should be free to choose the medium or media of instruction through which to teach.

(11) Steps should be taken to prepare teachers to teach through the new medium. They should be given at least one year for such preparation after sufficient books in the medium have become available.

(12) For inter-university communication, English should be retained.

(13) Bilingualism should be permitted, i.e., some subjects may be taught in the new medium of instruction and some in English.

(14) In the beginning, the change of medium should be limited to undergraduate and non-professional courses.

(15) The teaching of English as a subject of study should be improved by teaching it for a longer period of years, introducing better methods of teaching and providing more qualified teachers, in the high schools.

(16) The study of languages in the undergraduate courses should be reorganised.

(17) For professional and post-graduate examinations, the medium of instruction should continue to be English to enable external examiners to be appointed for the maintenance of standards.

(18) The Indian Medical Council and the All India Bar Council will need to be consulted before any change is attempted in teaching medical and legal subjects.

CHAPTER 12

THE PROBLEM BEFORE US

12.1. The preamble to the Government Resolution which contains the terms of reference to the Committee states that the Government is of the view that the medium of instruction in the University and in technical and other institutions of higher learning should be the regional and/or the national language and that it has, therefore, become necessary to take steps for the progressive substitution of the regional and national languages for English as the medium of instruction in the university and in these institutions. In answer to the clarification sought by us, we were informed that Government was definitely of the view that the switch over to the regional and/or national language had to be effected, and that the Committee was called upon to recommend the steps to do so. It is, therefore, abundantly clear that the question of considering the desirability or otherwise of such a switch over is beyond the purview of this Committee. We are, therefore, only concerned with suggesting the steps necessary for the progressive substitution of the regional and/or the national language as media for English and the action to be taken by way of preparation of the necessary books for higher education in all branches of education in these two languages and the equipping of teachers with a view to enabling them to impart information through these languages. We have also been asked to suggest if legislation is necessary for this purpose.

12.2. We should like, in the first place, to deal with the question whether legislation is necessary for giving effect to the proposed substitution of the regional and/or the national language for English as the medium of instruction. As indicated by us earlier in this report (*See Chapter 2*), we shall hereafter refer to these languages by name as 'Marathi' and 'Hindi' respectively. We may state at once that among those who replied to the questionnaire opinion was equally divided with regard to the need or otherwise of legislation for hastening the process of substitution. (Question No. 30). Of the witnesses orally examined by us, however, a very large majority were definitely against legislation being resorted to for this purpose.

12.3. In his address to the Central Advisory Board of Education at its meeting held in 1948, the Prime Minister himself, speaking of the substitution of an Indian language for English as the medium of instruction in University education had warned against haste in the process of substitution. The Radhakrishnan Commission also has urged the need for caution and pointed out

that some time would elapse before the consummation can be reached, and that, it is neither feasible nor desirable to create a void by immediately abandoning the language which is in use, and that English will have to continue as the medium for federal business till the provinces (States) are ready for the change and their educational institutions have spread the federal language (Hindi) adequately, although ultimately English will disappear from the scene as the language of the State, Central or Provincial (*See* page 325 of the Report). The working group appointed by the University Grants Commission states that several people, in addition to those in academic circles, hold the view that there should be no hastening of the process of changing over. It adds that, if a university desires to change its medium, no one can or ought to interfere with the desire of the University — not even the State Government which by legislation has established the university, and, therefore, has the theoretical power to regulate by legislation various matters connected with the university. It proceeds to observe that “the well-established convention is that it is for universities to prescribe the medium, and not for legislature to compel them to change the medium against their better judgement”, since academic bodies are best able to judge how the change can be brought about without impairing the quality of teaching and lowering the standards. That legislation seeking to prescribe a specific date for changing a medium of instruction does not work satisfactorily in practice has been amply revealed by the recent experience of the Gujarat University.

12.4. We are emphatically of the opinion that legislation in the matter of the change in the medium of instruction is neither necessary nor desirable for all the reasons mentioned in the preceding paragraphs.

12.5. We may here incidentally mention that there is no statutory provision with regard to the medium of instruction in the Nagpur University Act (1923), the Poona University Act (1948) or the Bombay University Act (1953). Only the Marathwada University Act (1958) lays down that “the University shall endeavour to promote the development of the study of Marathi and the use of Marathi as a medium of instruction and examination”. There is, however, a proviso to the section stating that English or Hindi may be the medium of instruction and examination in such subjects and for such period, as may from time to time be prescribed by the Statutes. (*See* Section 41). It will thus be seen that, while the Act contemplates that the goal of the University should be the adoption of Marathi as a medium of instruction, the University itself is free to decide the steps to be taken for attaining the goal. The

S. N. D. T. Women's University having been established with the professed object of giving instruction through Marathi and Gujarati, there was no occasion for the legislature to make any specific statutory provision with regard to the medium of instruction.

12.6. Before we proceed to consider the question of substituting of Marathi and/or Hindi for English as the medium of instruction in the universities in the State of Maharashtra, we think we should indicate the existing situation with regard to the medium or media in these universities. In two of the five universities in Maharashtra, viz., Bombay and Marathwada, the medium of instruction at present is English in all branches of study and at all stages. In Bombay University the medium of examination also in all branches and at all stages, except in the Indian languages, at the under-graduate and post-graduate stages is English. It may also be mentioned that the case of the Bombay University is in a sense a special case as is clear from the statement of Government policy made on the floor of the Bombay Legislative Assembly when the State of Maharashtra was established. The statement appears in a booklet named 'Guiding Principles of Maharashtra State' prepared by the Director of Publicity, Government of Maharashtra, Bombay. It is there stated :—

“Government on behalf of the residual State of Bombay (Maharashtra) has, therefore, decided upon the following steps :—

Bombay City

- (1) The cosmopolitan character of Bombay City will be preserved.
- (2) The medium of instruction in the University of Bombay will continue to be English to be replaced by Hindi.
- (3) Special attention will be paid to the proper development of Bombay City.”

In the Marathwada University, however, candidates are permitted in Arts and in some Commerce subjects at the under-graduate stage to answer examination papers in Marathi or Hindi, although at the post-graduate stage, except in the modern Indian languages they have to answer them in English. The situation in the other three universities, viz., Poona, Nagpur and S. N. D. T. Women's Universities is different. In Poona University English is the normal medium of instruction, but Marathi is an optional medium of instruction, and also of examination for the B.A. and

B.Com. degree and for the non-Science subjects for the B.Sc., three year degree course. Marathi was also an optional medium of instruction for the Intermediate Arts, Commerce and Science examinations under the old four-year degree courses, including science subjects. English continues to be the only medium for the post-graduate courses, except in Marathi. In Nagpur University English, Hindi and Marathi are optional media of instruction for the pre-University Arts and Science courses and the B.A. courses, Marathi and Hindi are optional media of instruction for the Pre-University Commerce, the B.Com. and B.T. courses, English alone is the medium of instruction for courses of study in Agriculture, Law, Medicine, Engineering and Technology and Post-Graduate courses in the faculties of Arts, Science, Commerce and Education. Marathi and Hindi are also optional media of examination for the M.A. and M.Com. courses. In the S. N. D. T. Women's University, Marathi and Gujarati are the media of instruction at all stages, inclusive of even post-graduate classes for the M.A. and M.Ed. examinations. English, however, is the medium of instruction for the courses in Nursing, and may also be used for the M.A. examination with special permission of the Vice-Chancellor. Hindi also is permitted as a medium of examination. It will thus be seen that in three out of the five universities in Maharashtra Marathi has already been adopted as an optional medium of instruction for under-graduate teaching in some branches of study and at certain levels.

12-7. In their enthusiasm for the regional language, some of the witnesses urged before us that Marathi should eventually be the sole medium of instruction in the Poona and Marathwada Universities. They were not prepared to make any special provision for linguistic minority groups who might be either residing in the areas under the jurisdiction of these Universities, or who might migrate to those areas temporarily on the transfer of their parents or guardians for service, business or other reasons. It was even suggested by one or two of these witnesses that, if they were not able or willing to receive instruction through the Marathi medium the children should be left behind in the States where they could receive instruction through their own mother-tongue. They were not prepared even to concede that such students might be provided with an optional medium of instruction, such as Hindi. Such an attitude is obviously unreasonable, in view of the fundamental rights to freedom of movement and residence in any part of the territory of India, conferred by the Constitution on all Indian citizens [See articles 19 (1) (d) and (e)]. It would be the surest way of encouraging the fissiparous tendencies which have recently been causing grave concern to all those who believe in the unity of

India and are sincerely working for the development of a feeling of "solidarity and cohesion in the hearts of the people, a sense of common citizenship, and a feeling of loyalty to the nation". To persist in such an attitude would be to render all talk of national integration futile, apart from its leading to the intellectual isolation of the universities from the rest of India. While, therefore, we wholly endorse the opinion that Marathi, by virtue of its being the regional language, should eventually become a medium of instruction in all the universities of Maharashtra, we strongly hold the view that there should be at least one other medium which can provide facilities for the instruction of the minority linguistic groups in Maharashtra. At present, owing to historical reasons, this medium happens to be English. In the long run English will be replaced by a modern Indian language for post-graduate studies and research and as far as we can see, it can only be Hindi when it is sufficiently developed to take the place of English as an efficient channel of communication for all modern knowledge, especially in science, technology and industry.

12.8. In addition, therefore, to the need of providing for the study of Hindi as a compulsory subject, up to and inclusive of the first two years of the undergraduate courses in Arts, Commerce and Science, provision will have to be made by all the universities in the State of Maharashtra for the progressive substitution of Hindi for English as a medium of instruction parallel to Marathi at the undergraduate stage.

12.9. What will be the position of English during the transitional period, while it is being progressively dislodged from its present position as the medium of instruction in most of the Indian universities, and also later on when it completely ceases to be such a medium? Speaking of the inevitability of the change in the medium of instruction from English to an Indian language, the Prime Minister had pointed out to the Central Advisory Board of Education in 1948 that, whatever the change might be, it should not be sudden, but gradual. The Government Resolution to which our Committee owes its existence has taken the same view, even after the lapse of twelve years, evidently because Government fully realizes that the change, if brought about by a jolt, might upset the educational apple-cart. We have accordingly been asked to suggest steps needed for the "progressive substitution" of the regional and/or national language for English. The Resolution also implies that Government is aware that before the substitution can take place the necessary books in all branches of knowledge must be available and the teachers must be adequately equipped, to impart instruction in the substituted languages. We have to proceed with

the greatest caution in arriving at our conclusions and in making our recommendations, as the change in the medium of instruction is a momentous change, which may be fraught with harmful consequences, if the steps taken in bringing it about are not carefully graded. We have, therefore, sought the opinions of experienced educationists, both teachers and administrators, in the different universities which will be affected by the change and also of business and other organisations who ordinarily recruit their personnel from the universities. We are anxious that we should be guided by reason, and not by sentiment, however, valuable, in making our recommendations, especially when an eminent body of educationists like those who constituted the Radhakrishnan Commission was constrained to comment on the difficulty of considering the problem of the medium of instruction in universities in a calm and detached manner.

12.10. We must, however, regard ourselves as fortunate in that we have the guidance of leading personalities, including Union Ministers, Chief Ministers of States and leaders of various parties in Parliament, who are concerned with the framing of important government policies both at the Centre and in the States, Vice-Chancellors and other educationists, scientists and industrialists in the shape of the considered Statement issued by the National Integration Conference, which devoted careful thought and attention to the medium for university education along with other problems of great national importance. The Statement, issued by the meeting of Chief Ministers of States and Central Ministers held in August 1961, is an equally valuable document which was referred to us by Government and to which we can resort for similar guidance in making our recommendations with regard to the more restricted problem before us.

12.11. The Chief Ministers' Statement referred to in the preceding paragraph contains very valuable guidance with regard to the continuance of English as the medium of instruction in university education. In paragraph 18 it says "The change-over to Hindi, and generally to a regional language as a medium of education will only be effective when such language has adequately developed for the purpose of modern education, and more especially for scientific and technical subjects. Every effort should be made to develop Hindi and the other languages for this purpose. Till such time as this happens English may be continued."

12.12. Every word of the passage quoted above from the Chief Ministers' Statement applies with cogency and force to the situation of the Universities in Maharashtra with which we are concerned in this report, where English is at present the medium of instruction for all or some subjects. Where a Univer-

sity in Maharashtra has already adopted Marathi and/or Hindi as the medium of instruction in certain branches of study or for certain subjects we do not see any reason for their making any change. We would certainly not suggest that they should retrace their steps. The experiment they have made deserves to be commended, inasmuch as it has indicated the possibility of substituting Marathi and/or Hindi for English as a medium, although for raising the standard of teaching more literature and literature of higher quality in Marathi and Hindi both by way of original writing and translation of standard English books, may be required. These universities will, therefore, have to concentrate their efforts in this direction, so far as the subjects now taught through these Indian languages are concerned. These remarks are applicable both to the Nagpur and Poona Universities and with a slight difference, to the S. N. D. T. University which ever since its inception has been teaching through Marathi and Gujarati.

12-13. Here, we should like to refer to the suggestion made to us by three of the witnesses whom we examined in Bombay that Gujarati should be permitted as a medium of instruction in Bombay as there is a large number of college students in Bombay with Gujarati as their mother-tongue. A similar plea was advanced by one witness on behalf of the Sindhi language. We are, however, precluded by our terms of reference from recommending the substitution of any language other than Marathi and Hindi for English.

12-14. The Registrars of the several universities were good enough to furnish us with statements showing the total number of students in their universities in 1960-61 and the number of those who did not know Marathi. According to these statements, 31,646 out of 49,285 or 64.2 per cent. students in Bombay University did not know Marathi. The figures for Poona and Marathwada were 2,996 out of 27,444 or 10.9 per cent. and 297 out of 6,168 or 4.8 per cent. The figures for Nagpur and S. N. D. T. Women's university are not given because of the bilingual character of the student population Marathi and Hindi and Marathi and Gujarati respectively. We have quoted these figures in support of the view that parallel media of instruction will have to be provided for the non-Marathi speaking students.

12-15. One of the questions included in our questionnaire was whether, in addition to the three-language formula, the prescription of a classical or a foreign language as a compulsory subject for students of the humanities would be an additional burden. The answers received showed that 51 persons were of the opinion that it would be an unnecessary burden while 35 did not think so. Since of the five Universities in Mahara-

shtra only two, namely, Bombay and Poona prescribed a classical or a foreign language other than English as a compulsory subject in the first two years of the Arts course and we are recommending a more thorough study of the English language, we do not think we should burden the students with the study of a fourth language.

12.16. The Chief Ministers of the States and the Central Ministers in the Statement issued by them after their meeting in August, 1961, indicated that it may be possible and desirable for the change-over from English to Hindi or a regional language to be phased or divided up into subject and that scientific and technical subjects may be taught for as long as necessary in English while other subjects may be taught with Hindi or the regional language as the medium (See paragraph 18 of the Statement). The National Integration Conference on the other hand was of the view that such phasing may not be necessary if all technical and scientific common words including well-known international terms are included in the technical terminology based in international usage, and are common to most of the Indian languages (See paragraph 16 of the Statement). The need of some kind of phasing is not, however, free from controversy, especially as various other considerations have to be taken into account when we come to the teaching of medicine and, particularly, law. Humanists and scientists are not agreed among themselves which would be easier: to teach a subject like philosophy or a subject like chemistry or physics through the medium of Marathi or Hindi. As pointed out by Dr. D. S. Kothari, "the essential ingredient of scientific thinking and communication is the use of a precisely defined scientific terminology, more or less special to each branch of science, and though the form of a technical term, that is, the word describing it, varies generally from one language to another, the content is precisely identical by definition. For a scientific term the meaning is completely conserved in passing from one language to another no matter how different the languages are. Outside science, the meaning of a word is not sharply defined, but carries a 'penumbra or cloud' around it which does not remain the same on translation" (See Problem of Scientific and Technical Terminology in Indian languages, By Dr. D. S. Kothari, Ministry of Education, Government of India, 1961, Publication No. 549, page 2).

12.17. We do not think it would be possible for us, or for any one for that matter, to indicate the length of time it would take for a complete switch over from English to Marathi and/or Hindi as the medium of instruction, as that would depend upon a variety of uncertain factors such as the production of suitable literature, the fixing of the scientific terminology, in the Indian

languages and the determination of the languages of the Supreme Court and the High Courts under the provisions of the Constitution of India so far as legal studies are concerned. In answer to query No. 25 in our questionnaire, the majority of the replies received by us placed the time limit for the purpose anywhere between 3 and 25 years. In this connection, we can only indicate the conditions necessary for a satisfactory switch-over, which may vary with the branches of study and tempo of progress which, again, must necessarily depend on the effectiveness of the collaboration between the universities, Government, the writers and translators of books and the teachers. The question will also, to a large extent, be one of adequate finance. While we do not consider it feasible to lay down a time-table for the substitution of Marathi and/or Hindi for English as the medium of instruction, we deem it extremely important that a review of the progress made in the production of literature in Marathi and Hindi in the shape of books for study, general literature, books of reference and journals should be made at regular intervals of five years in order that the universities may find out how far they have moved in the direction of such substitution, and if there has been any slackness, the necessary steps may be taken to speed up progress. This would be a very useful check for ensuring that they move forward and do not stand still after the first flush of enthusiasm is over. In any event, this would be more realistic than to prepare an arbitrary time-table which would need constant chopping and changing on account of unforeseen and uncertain factors.

12-18. The terms of reference to our Committee speak of "progressive substitution of the regional and national languages as media of instruction" implying thereby that substitution should be a phased one, which is no doubt a counsel of caution very necessary to be observed in such an important matter. The phasing can be of two kinds, namely, (1) with regard to the stage of study in the different branches, undergraduate or post-graduate and (2) with regard to the branches of study. The Working Group appointed by the University Grants Commission has suggested that the change should be orderly and by stages so that students will not be obliged to retrace their steps by shifting back to the old medium. In other words, if an Indian language medium is permitted in a particular subject in the Pre-University or Intermediate course, there should be provision for the student to continue to receive his instruction through the same medium till he obtains his first degree. The pace of the change would naturally be determined by the availability of suitable books and qualified teachers in the new medium. It would, therefore, be wise to limit the change to undergraduate courses, in the first instance.

12-19. In professional subjects such as medicine and law, where statutory bodies like the Medical Council of India and the Bar Council have been invested with powers to control standards of examination which the universities cannot set at naught, the latter have to be even more cautious and they can only change the medium of instruction in consultation with these bodies even at the undergraduate stage. In the faculties of Engineering, Technology and Agriculture also, for another reason, namely, the absence of literature in either Marathi or Hindi, the switch over to either of those languages from English as the medium of instruction has necessarily to be postponed to a later date. It would be comparatively easy to effect a change in the medium in Arts and the Social Sciences and Commerce at an earlier date, as experiments made in that direction in one of the Universities, viz., Nagpur have held out hopes of success. We would, therefore, definitely recommend that the change to Marathi and Hindi as optional and parallel media of instruction be phased as follows :—

- (1) arts,
- (2) the social sciences and commerce,
- (3) the natural sciences,
- (4) agriculture,
- (5) medicine,
- (6) engineering and other branches of technology,

the change to be made only after the university concerned satisfies itself that there is a sufficient body of literature in the language concerned (Marathi or Hindi, as the case may be), for teaching up to the first degree level.

12-20. While steps are being taken for preparing the necessary books in Marathi and Hindi and for equipping the teachers to impart instruction through those languages, no efforts should be spared in helping the students in the university to overcome the hurdles which at present prevent them from getting the full benefit of university education. We suggest four ways of doing so, one of which is already being followed in some universities, viz., the freedom allowed to the students to answer their examination papers in Marathi or Hindi as the case may be. Although the ideal practice would be to answer question papers in the same medium in which instruction is given, many students who find it difficult to express themselves in English are able to express themselves better in their own mother-tongue (Marathi or Hindi), even though they may have learnt the subject through English. This privilege should be extended to as many subjects as possible, and introduced in those universities where it is not at present available.

12.21. There are three other ways in which the students can be helped to overcome their difficulties. These are (1) bilingualism in teaching, (2) improving the method of teaching English, (3) giving special coaching in English by holding small tutorial classes. Bilingualism again is of two kinds. One is the teaching of suitable subjects through the medium of Marathi or Hindi and other subjects through English. This is in vogue in the University of Natal where both English and Afrikans are employed as media of instruction. According to the opinion expressed by Dr. E. G. Malharbe, Vice-Chancellor of that University, bilingualism has no disadvantages: it does not affect progress in the mother-tongue (i.e., Africaans) nor does it show any loss in the knowledge conveyed through English. Bilingualism has also been known not to affect the intelligence of the students. Bilingualism can also be adopted in the teaching of one and the same subject, by explaining in the mother-tongue what the students have not been able to understand when taught through English. Bilingualism is even now being adopted in practice by several teachers, although it has not received formal recognition as a method of instruction. We recommend bilingual teaching. The Central Institute of English at Hyderabad is training college teachers in the new methods of teaching English as a foreign language which are said to be more effective and take much less time. These methods should be adopted, especially in the pre-university and junior degree classes. Special coaching in English by holding small tutorial classes, especially for those who are weak in English has been a feature of collegiate instruction since the time that the Government of Bombay adopted the teaching of English from the 8th standard. This feature should be continued. Such classes known as classes in 'remedial' English are being held in some of the leading American universities where too the standard of English has fallen.

12.22. We have devoted a separate chapter to the preparation of books and teachers as, in our opinion, the subject is of the utmost importance for effecting a change in the medium of instruction.

CHAPTER 13

BOOKS AND TEACHERS

13.1. The University and the College library together constitute the workshop which provides the university student and the teacher with the tools necessary for the acquisition and advancement of knowledge. Carlyle described the university as a collection of books. The late Sir Charles Grant Robertson, Vice-Chancellor of Birmingham University, emphasized the importance of the use of the library by saying that, if he were a dictator, he would reduce university lectures to a third of their number and insist on the students attending the library for three hours every day. In other words, he wanted to emphasize that at the stage of university education, books are more important than lectures. The teachers of the university and the colleges, unlike the teachers in school, are there to help the students and guide them in acquiring knowledge for themselves through the study of books, and not merely to provide them with pre-digested knowledge culled from books in the form of notes or summaries.

13.2. We are, therefore, unable to accept the view seriously put forward before us by some teachers whom we examined as witnesses that, if there are teachers available who can lecture on a subject in Marathi or Hindi, the absence of books on the subject need not worry us, even if the students are unable to read and comprehend English books on the subject, and that books in Marathi or Hindi would follow in due course. In our opinion, this would be putting the cart before the horse. We can, at best, regard it as a distorted view of university education. We should not even be satisfied with the existence of so-called "text-books", however, well written they may be. University teaching requires the help of standard books, not merely books which purport to cover a prescribed syllabus. The university student, if he is to benefit by this education, must read around his subject, acquaint himself with its background, its ramifications, its neighbouring territory, as it were. It would be wrong to talk of "text-books" at the university stage or of "prescribing" them rather than of recommending standard books for study, although one, no doubt, studies the text of a play of Shakespeare or of Milton's Paradise Lost. The problem of providing the right type of books in the Marathi language for the students is very much more important, and also more difficult, than that of providing qualified teachers.

13.3. How are these books to be produced? Can their production be left to commercial publishers? Would they have

sufficient incentive to produce books of the right quality and in the required quantity? The demand would be comparatively restricted, as compared to the demand for books in English, which naturally have a far wider circle of readers. We fear that books of the right type will not be forthcoming, unless they are subsidized, and an organized effort is made for their production by universities and governments with the help of scholars and teachers who are experts in the subject and can write original books or make efficient translations. There is so much to do by way of production that it must be continuous.

13.4. The Working Group of the University Grants Commission was, therefore, perfectly right when it rejected outright the project of the Delhi University of getting one standard textbook written for each paper in each subject by an eminent authority in the field concerned. Books are required for the teachers in the colleges even more than for the students. A constant flow of books must be ensured, if the standard of teaching is not to deteriorate when the medium is changed from English to Marathi. As we have pointed out in an earlier Chapter, books needed for the entire degree course must be available before the medium of instruction is changed even for the pre-university or the pre-degree course.

13.5. The books we contemplate as essential will comprise original works as well as translations. Some translations are excellent of their kind and have the merit of original work, especially when they are skilful adaptations. *Plutarch's Lives* by North is an outstanding example of a translation which has become an English classic.

13.6. The difficulty of making an accurate translation has been very well epitomized in the Italian saying: "Traduttore Traditore", which means "translators are traitors." The treachery is due to the nature of language itself and not to any lack of sincerity in the translator (See J. C. Weightman, *On Language and Writing*. Sylvan Press, London, 1957, page 56). The same author has further pointed out that "it is just as impossible to express with absolute accuracy in English what has been first conceived in French, as it is to make two human beings have an exactly identical appearance", and yet we cannot altogether dispense with translations, and would be much the poorer without them in any language. For making a successful translation the translator must know both languages perfectly well. In the fields of science and technology, in particular, where knowledge advances with leaps and bounds, it would be a superhuman task for any university, government or other organisation to keep pace with new discoveries and inventions and new theories,

which are rendering the old ones obsolete, by translating the journals in which such discoveries, inventions and theories first see the light of day. Knowledge of a language like English, sufficient to read and understand the abstracts of scientific papers published in English from learned journals appearing in French, German and other European languages, appears to be the easiest way in which a scientist, worthy of his reputation, can keep himself abreast of his time. This is so because more than 50 per cent. of scientific literature today is published in English.

13-7. The Chief Ministers of States and Central Ministers who met in August 1961, recommended that, as already decided by the Central Government, all technical and scientific terminology should be based on international usage and should be common to all the Indian languages. The President, too, in paragraph 3 of his Order, in the Ministry of Home Affairs' Notification, 2/860-OF, dated the 27th April, 1960, directed that in the field of Science and Technology the terms in international use should be adopted with the minimum change, i.e., the basic words should be those at present in use in international terminology, although the derivatives may be indianised to the extent necessary. The controversy over the question of terminology has thus been satisfactorily ended. One great obstacle in the way of changing the medium has thus been removed, with the consequence that there will be considerable economy of labour and time, students will be saved the additional trouble of learning a new set of technical terms, the technical terms would be the same for the whole country and familiarity with international technical terms will make it comparatively easy for students to read scientific journals in English, French and German (*See* also pages 12-13 of the Report of the Working Group appointed by the University Grants Commission, 1961). For the sake of uniformity it is desirable that when text-books on science subjects are written for use in Secondary Schools the authors of those text-books should use the same international technical terms as those adopted in books intended for use by college students.

13-8. The production of books and general reading material, including journals, in Marathi will primarily be the responsibility of the universities in the State of Maharashtra, which can pool their resources in men, money and materials for this purpose. The State of Maharashtra should provide the necessary finance for meeting the cost of, or at least subsidising, the production of such literature. The Universities in the State of Maharashtra can appoint representative Committees of teachers of Marathi and other subjects, who could entrust the work of writing original books in Marathi or translating standard books in the various arts and commerce subjects, to begin with, or

invite others whom they consider competent to do the work. The committees could also offer money awards for the best books on any subject submitted in competition. Senior teachers, in particular, would have to be commissioned to write books, as they are not likely to compete for awards. If all the universities agree, by convention, to prescribe or recommend for study a book written or selected in this manner, for a minimum period of two or three years, this would provide a sufficient incentive for the production of good books to both authors and publishers. The State Government has already launched a scheme under which they are prepared to make an interest-free loan to each university, subject to a maximum of Rs. 1 lakh, repayable in ten years, for subsidizing the writing of text-books in regional languages. This scheme can be made both economical and successful, if it is worked out in collaboration between the universities. It may also be possible to get further financial aid, if a planned programme is submitted to the Government. This is one way in which the change-over of the medium from English to Marathi could be speeded up (*See* paper read by S. R. Dongerkery at the Seminar on Problems of the New State of Maharashtra, arranged by the Indian Committee for Cultural Freedom in Bombay in May 1960). So far as the Hindi medium is concerned, the collaboration would have to be, on a wider scale, among the universities in Hindi speaking areas, with financial help from the Central Government.

13.9. It would considerably help to develop the Marathi language as a medium for the publication of scientific articles and research papers, if a journal in Marathi in each branch of the natural and the social sciences was published periodically. Summaries or abstracts of research papers could with advantage be included in these journals. The Universities may also publish, or give grants for the publication of, Marathi translations of theses in science subjects accepted for doctors' degrees, in order to encourage the development of the language for the expression of scientific concepts.

13.10. We strongly hold the view that, even after the switch-over to the Marathi or Hindi medium is completed, teachers should constantly impress upon their students that, in order to derive the full benefit from their university education, they will have to read English books and journals side by side with Marathi or Hindi books and journals, so that they can keep in touch with the most-up-to-date knowledge in their subjects of study. Since by that time they will have fewer occasions to hear English in their lecture-periods, they will have to depend more and more than they do now, on the knowledge acquired by them from their study of English as a compulsory subject. They will also

have to depend on their own unaided efforts to comprehend English books, as these will no longer be taught to them in class. The less and less English ceases to be used as a medium of instruction, the more and more intensive should be its teaching as a subject of study so that the students' powers of comprehending English books may not be weakened, and they may continue to be attracted to English books.

13-11. The problem of equipping teachers with a view to enabling them to impart instruction through the medium of Marathi is a much less difficult problem than that of producing the necessary literature. The majority of teachers in the universities and colleges of Maharashtra either speak Marathi as their mother-tongue or know the language well. They are also presumed to know well the subjects which they are expected to teach, assuming that they are duly qualified. Once books become available in Marathi, they should not find it too difficult, with a little practice, to teach the same subjects through Marathi. According to many witnesses who appeared before us, a year's time should ordinarily be sufficient for them to familiarize themselves with the Marathi vocabulary connected with the subject to be taught. For this purpose seminars and discussion groups should be organised by the universities and colleges during vacations and, if possible, also in term-time. The teachers should also be encouraged to write articles in Marathi or Hindi on the subjects they will be called upon to teach, in university journals and college magazines, and also popular articles in newspapers. In a university which has a scheme of extension lectures, the teachers should be given opportunities not only to give such lectures in Marathi but also to write them out later for publication. This is at present being done both in the Poona and Marathwada universities. As the process of substitution of the new medium is to be a progressive one, those teachers who prove their capacity to teach in Marathi or Hindi at an early date, should be given an early chance to teach through that language, while others who require more time for preparing themselves may wait a little longer.

13-12. Since we have recommended that bilingual instruction may be permitted in the pre-university classes, the teachers can take advantage of such a provision to acquire the necessary practice. If teachers in the Allahabad, Lucknow, Saugar and Patna Universities have succeeded in switching-over to Hindi as the medium of instruction in arts, commerce and science examinations at the undergraduate stage, we see no reason why in the universities and colleges in the State of Maharashtra teachers whose mother-tongue is Marathi, or who otherwise know the language well, cannot do so, when the necessary books in

Marathi become available. The experiment has already been made with a fair amount of success in Nagpur and Poona, as attested by some witnesses, and is being tried at present in subjects like Social Science in the colleges in Marathwada, where the official medium of instruction is still English. The problem of teachers who do not know Marathi is something quite different. For as long as English and Hindi continue as parallel media of instruction along with Marathi, these teachers will necessarily have to be entrusted with the teaching of classes in those languages which they know and speak. They will have enough time to learn Marathi or Hindi if they are prepared to make the effort, or if they cannot make any headway, to seek employment in universities or colleges in other States, where they can continue to teach through the language they know.

CHAPTER 14

SUMMARY AND RECOMMENDATIONS.

14.1. In the Introductory Chapter of our report we have reproduced the Government Resolution of the 27th December, 1960, which set up our Committee and given a short account of the procedure adopted by us in carrying on our work, including the preparation of the Questionnaire, the oral examination of witnesses in Nagpur, Aurangabad, Poona and Bombay and the meetings held by us to discuss the several problems arising out of the terms of reference to our Committee and to finalise our report.

14.2. We have divided our report into a number of Chapters dealing with the various matters germane to the main problem of the medium of instruction to be substituted for English in the university and technical and other institutions of higher learning in the State of Maharashtra and the steps necessary for the purpose. Before approaching the main problem, we thought it desirable to make an attempt to clear the ambiguity of the expression 'national language' occurring in our terms of reference and have accordingly devoted a short Chapter to clarify the position as we understand it (*See Chapter 2*).

14.3. We have also devoted special Chapters to such topics as the aims of university education, the importance of the maintenance of standards in university education, the function of the medium of instruction, the medium of instruction and recruitment to the All India Services, the necessity of inter-State and international contacts and the provision to be made for linguistic minorities as these topics formed the subject of a number of questions included in our questionnaire and also of the answers given by the witnesses orally, examined by us. Needless to say, they have a very important bearing on the proposed change in the medium of instruction. We have also added a Chapter on the three-language formula and the study of a language as contrasted with the study of its literature, because these subjects, though they may not be directly connected with the medium of instruction, require special attention in the educational set-up envisaged by us.

14.4. The main substance of our recommendations will be found in the three immediately preceding chapters, entitled "The problem of the Medium of Instruction in Universities—its origin, nature and solution", "The Problem before us" and "Books and Teachers". It will be obvious to those who read our report that we have derived great assistance from earlier

discussions of the problems involved in a change of the medium from English to an Indian language, contained in the Radhakrishnan Report, the Report of the Working Group appointed by the University Grants Commission on the medium of instruction and the statements issued by the Meeting of Chief Ministers of States and Central Ministers and the National Integration Conference which were held in New Delhi, earlier this year. We are, indeed, grateful to the authors of the reports and statements. We must also acknowledge our debt of gratitude to those who took the trouble to answer our questionnaire in detail and to the several witnesses who appeared before us to give oral evidence for placing their points of view before us in a candid and forthright manner. Our conclusions and recommendations are as under :-

Recommendations

(1) Legislation is neither necessary nor desirable for effecting a change in the medium of instruction (Paragraph 12.4). It should be left to the Universities themselves to decide :

(a) the progressive steps to be taken for bringing about the change,

(b) the phasing of the change according to the branches and stages (under-graduate and post-graduate) of study and subjects, and

(c) the conditions precedent for such change-over, e.g. availability of the necessary literature and qualified teachers and whether they have been fulfilled.

(2) At the under-graduate stage, i.e., up to the first degree Marathi should be an optional medium of instruction and/or examination in universities in the State of Maharashtra. All such universities should have Hindi also as an optional medium. English should continue as a parallel medium until both Marathi and Hindi are sufficiently developed to take the place of English without lowering academic standards. This change should be phased as follows :-

- (1) Arts,
- (2) Social Sciences and Commerce,
- (3) Natural Sciences.
- (4) Agriculture.

- (5) Medicine,
- (6) Engineering and other branches of Technology,
- (7) Law. (Paragraph 12·19).

(3) Bilingualism may also be permitted, i.e., the teaching of some subject or parts of a subject through Marathi or Hindi and some through English. The teaching could be done through the free use of English and Marathi and of English and Hindi, so that the communication of modern knowledge rather than the use of a particular medium of instruction is emphasised. The students should be at liberty to answer questions in the examinations either in English and/or Marathi and in English and/or Hindi, at their option. The same procedure should be adopted for teaching and examinations in Technical Diploma Institutes (Paragraph 12·21).

(4) Post-graduate teaching will have to continue in English for a much longer time until Hindi is sufficiently developed for conveying modern knowledge at the level of post-graduate studies (Paragraph 12·7).

(5) The medium of instruction in legal studies will have to be the same as the authorised language of the High Court of Maharashtra and the Supreme Court. The All India Bar Council should also be consulted before a change is effected in the medium of instruction for courses of study in law. Similarly, the Medical Council of India or similar statutory bodies concerned with standards of professional education should be consulted for courses of study concerned (Paragraph 12·19).

(6) Those Universities which have already adopted Marathi and Hindi as optional media of instruction in the undergraduate courses need not go back on the decisions already taken by them for the substitution of Marathi and/or Hindi for English. This recommendation holds good *mutatis mutandis* for the S. N. D. T. Women's University which has Gujarati as one of its media of instruction (Paragraph 12·12).

(7) No time schedule can be fixed for the substitution of Marathi and Hindi for English as the medium of instruction in the universities and technical and other institutions of higher learning. It is, however, essential that the progress made in the production of literature in Marathi and Hindi that can be made available for teaching degree and post-graduate classes as indicated in Recommendation No. 10, below should

be reviewed by the University concerned at intervals of every five years, with a view to deciding the extent to which the process of substitution can be carried out from time to time (Paragraph 12·17).

(8) In the teaching of subjects in science and technology the terms "in international use", should be adopted with the minimum change, i.e., the basic words employed should be those at present in use in international terminology, although the derivatives may be indianised to the extent necessary. The Indian terms should be common to both Marathi and Hindi (Paragraph 13·7).

(9) While we think that Marathi and Hindi may be introduced as optional media of instruction their efficient use as such will improve only when there is sufficient and growing literature of a high standard including not merely text-books (both translations and original works), but also books which can be recommended for study as reference books in the different branches of study in these languages. We are of the opinion that even when ample literature is produced in these languages, standard books and reference books in English should continue to be recommended for reading side by side with the books in Marathi and Hindi (Paragraph 13·10).

(10) Literature in Hindi could be expected to appear in growing measure as a result of efforts made by the Union Government and the Universities in the Hindi speaking areas. Its production in Maharashtra may involve difficulties for the Universities in Maharashtra. Attempts should continuously be made—

(a) to enrich Marathi literature by giving incentives to able teachers and other experts to produce text-books and original standard works dealing with the subjects of study in the several branches of knowledge by means of subsidies, monetary awards or academic recognition,

(b) to entrust the work of translation from English standard books to those who know both English and Marathi very well,

(c) to publish bilingual journals in different branches of study and include summaries of research papers and successful doctorate theses, especially in scientific subjects in such journals,

(d) to encourage by subsidies or publication grants, the translation into Marathi of doctorate theses in the natural and social sciences submitted by their students in English, and

(e) to pool the resources of the Universities in Maharashtra in men, money and materials for the production of books and general reading material including high class journals in Marathi (Paragraph 13·8).

(11) The training of teachers need not be taken up as a separate activity, as they will acquire the ability and facility to teach in Marathi and Hindi if they freely use Marathi and Hindi along with English when they teach any subject. They should be encouraged to take part in activities such as (a) delivering extension lectures and writing articles in Marathi and Hindi in university journals and (b) seminars and discussion groups organised by the Universities in Maharashtra, either individually or in collaboration for encouraging the use of Marathi and Hindi as the language of discussion in vacations and if possible even in term-time (Paragraph 13·11).

(12) As subjects of compulsory study, both Marathi and Hindi should be taught to arts, commerce and science students up to and inclusive of the second year of the collegiate course, i.e., the first year of the Three-Year Degree course, or the intermediate class, as the case may be. English should be taught as a compulsory subject up to the first degree. The teaching of these languages in the undergraduate courses should be reorganised by shifting, the emphasis from literature to language, with a view to developing the students' powers of comprehension and expression rather than their acquisition of the knowledge of the literature in the language concerned (Paragraph 9·7).

(13) The teaching of English language and literature should be improved both at the collegiate stage and the stage of secondary education by—

- (a) devoting more time to it,
- (b) adopting improved methods of teaching, and
- (c) engaging well qualified teachers. (Paragraph 12·21).

Each university in Maharashtra should have a Department of English which can provide post-graduate instruction for those who desire to specialise in English with a view to becoming teachers of English in the colleges and secondary schools and conduct and guide research in the teaching of English.

(14) What we have said above about the medium of instruction in the Universities is also applicable to teaching in the technical and other institutions of higher learning. We have

not, therefore, referred to these institutions in express terms under each of our recommendations.

S. R. DONGERKERY,
Chairman.

G. D. PARIKH,
Member.

D. D. KARVE,
Member.

S. L. PANDHARIPANDE,
Member.

E. R. DHONGDE,
Member-Secretary.

Bombay, December 26, 1961.

APPENDIX A

Medium of Instruction (Universities) Committee

QUESTIONNAIRE

NOTE.—*In answering this questionnaire you will be so good as to pay particular attention to those questions which are relevant to your activities or in which you are specially interested.*

1. Should the medium of instruction in all the Universities in Maharashtra be the same or would you allow them to have different media, provided that the regional or the national language is one of the media ?

2. Should the regional language be necessarily a medium of instruction in each University, now that Maharashtra State is a unilingual State which has adopted Marathi as the language of administration ?

3. Should the regional language be eventually the sole medium of instruction in one or more of the Universities ? If so, please name them.

4. Should the national language be an optional medium of instruction, for some time or for all time, in any of the Universities ? If so, please name them.

5. Should the national language be gradually substituted for English as an optional medium of instruction in all branches of knowledge, at all stages ? If not, please indicate the branches and stages and the gradualness of the substitution.

Additional space for replies

6. Should the national language *alone* be the medium of instruction, in preference to the regional language ?

7. Would the abolition of English altogether or at the under-graduate stage, prejudice the chances of students who may want to compete in All India Competitive Examinations, specially for admission to the Foreign Service ?

8. Do you think that the introduction of the national language as an optional medium of instruction in place of English would benefit students wanting to compete for the All India Services ?

9. Do you think it desirable to have at least one medium of instruction (English or the national language) common to all the Indian Universities in order to facilitate the migration of students and teachers alike ?

10. Whatever be the medium or media of instruction finally adopted, do you think it necessary that the regional language, the national language and English should be prescribed as *obligatory subjects of study* throughout the degree course or for any part of it ?

11. If the answer to the last preceding question is in the affirmative, would the prescription of a classical or a foreign language as a compulsory subject for students of the humanities be an unnecessary burden ?

12. Do you think it feasible to abolish English as a medium of instruction at the post-graduate stage?

13. Do you think that Science and/or technological subjects and the Western systems of medicine and surgery can be taught efficiently through the regional or the national language both at the undergraduate and the post-graduate stages?

14. Are you in favour of replacing English by the regional and/or the national language as a medium of instruction in all the different branches of knowledge in (a) the humanities, (b) the sciences, (c) technology (Engineering and Agriculture), (d) medicine and (e) law or in any of them?

15. Would you fix a time-limit for the completion of the process of substitution of the regional and/or the national language for English as a medium of instruction in the fields of knowledge mentioned in the last preceding question?

16. What transitory provisions would you suggest for a smooth change over from English to the regional and/or the national language as a medium of instruction?

17. In case two or three media of instruction are allowed to exist side by side in the Universities, what steps do you suggest for the maintenance of uniformly high standards in both teaching and examinations?

Additional space for replies

18. Do you consider that the medium of instruction should necessarily be the medium of examination ?

 19. Would you consider it desirable to allow students to answer their examination papers in a language which is different from the medium of instruction ?

 20. Where a University permits more than one language to be the medium of instruction –
 - (a) Would it be desirable to insist on an affiliated college selecting only one language as its medium of instruction ?
 - (b) Would it be desirable to insist that an affiliated College should provide facilities for the use of all the permissible media of instruction ?
 - (c) Should the choice of the medium of instruction be left entirely to the College authorities ?

 21. Are you in favour of some of the affiliated colleges being made to use the national language as the only medium of instruction ?

 22. In case no college is prepared to provide facilities for the national language to be the medium of instruction, would it be desirable for the University/State Government to make such provision ?
-

23. Where a University permits more than one medium of instruction, would you permit the students to change the medium at any stage?

24. Is there sufficient literature in (a) the regional and (b) the national language to enable the Universities to switch over from English to those languages, or any of them, at all or some stages of the degree course, with immediate effect, or after the lapse of some years; and if the latter, how many approximately?

25. How long would it take, according to you, to equip teachers to impart instruction satisfactorily through the regional and/or the national language? What steps would you suggest for the purpose?

26. Is sufficient literature of the required standard available in the regional and/or the national language to enable the Universities to switch over to these languages or either of them in all or in some branches of knowledge? If not, will you please indicate the branches in which such literature is inadequate, and the steps which in your opinion are necessary for remedying the deficiencies?

27. Will you please suggest a tentative programme for remedying the deficiencies referred to in the last preceding question?

28. Can you suggest any steps, such as the co-ordination of efforts and the pooling of talent and resources of the Universities in Maharashtra for providing the necessary text-books and other literature in the regional language in subjects in which the available books and literature are inadequate?

29. Do you think it possible or advisable to replace the international scientific terminology by a specially prepared terminology in the regional and/or the national language?

30. Do you think that legislation is necessary, or desirable for hastening the process of substitution of the regional and/or the national language as the medium of instruction? If so, do you suggest the amendment of the constitutions of all the Universities of Maharashtra?
31. What provision, if any, would you make for the benefit of the linguistic minorities in Bombay City and in other parts of Maharashtra?
32. Do you think that the abolition of English as a medium of instruction and/or the restriction of the medium to one language only (the regional or the national) would tend to affect adversely (a) the unity of India, (b) free and easy intercourse, academic, cultural, social or political, with the world at large, (c) the world community of scholarship, or (d) the prospects of students wanting to pursue their higher studies abroad?
33. Do you suggest the necessity of reviewing the situation from time to time? If so, what intervals do you suggest for such review?
34. In answering the above queries or any of them, please indicate whether your answers also hold good for technical and other institutions of higher education which are not Universities, in so far as they are relevant.
35. Please give your views on any points with regard to the medium of instruction not covered by this questionnaire.

N.B.—Unless otherwise stated, the ‘Universities’ mentioned in this Questionnaire are those in Maharashtra State and the “Regional Language” means Marathi. We have referred to the “National Language” and not to ‘Hindi’ as that name is not free from controversy.

Additional space for replies

(Space for additional remarks)

Questionnaire replied by :-

.....
.....
.....

Date

Signature.

APPENDIX B

List of persons and institutions who have sent replies to the Questionnaire.

1. Agashe, Shri D. S., "Devdha" Manzil, Engineers' Colony, Bombay-28.
2. Airan, Shri J. W., Principal, Wilson College, Bombay.
3. Ajwani, Shri L. H., Principal, D. & H. National College, Bombay.
4. Amdekar, Shri U. C., Proprietor, Amdekar Institute of Commerce, Bombay.
5. Bal, Dr. D. V., Director, Institute of Science, Bombay.
6. Bal, Smt. Sharayu, Principal, S. N. D. T. College for Women, Poona.
7. Balaguer, Rev. Fr. M. M., Principal, St. Francis De Sales College, Nagpur.
8. Balsara, Smt. T., Principal, College of Nursing, Bombay.
9. Bambawale, Shri M. A., Deputy Director of Education, Vidarbha, Nagpur.
10. Bavadekar, Shri V. K., Principal, R. P. Gogate College, Ratnagiri.
11. Bhagwati, Shri N. H., Banaras Hindu University, Banaras.
12. Bhanage, Shri B. S., Principal, College of Commerce, Kolhapur.
13. Bhandarkar, Shri P. M., Dean, Medical College and Civil Hospital, Aurangabad.
14. Bhopatkar, Shri A. G., Principal, Deccan Institute of Commerce, Poona.
15. Bhat, Shri M. N., Principal, M. E. S. College of Arts and Sciences, Poona.
16. Bhavnani, Prof. J. K., Professor of Law, Law College, Bombay.
17. Bhir, Dr. B. S., Chairman of the Board of Studies in Commerce, Bombay University, Bombay.
18. Borkar, Shri V. V., Head of University Department of Economics, Marathwada University, Aurangabad.
19. Chapekar, Shri R. N., Professor, Modern European Languages Department, Poona University, Poona.
20. Chickermane, Dr. D. V., Director, G. K. Institute of Rural Education, Kolhapur.
21. Colaco, Prof. M. F., Chairman of the Board of Studies in English Literature, University of Bombay, Bombay.
22. Dabholkar, Shri D. A., Principal, Chintamanrao College of Commerce, Sangli.
23. Damle, Prof. P. R., Principal, N. Wadia College, Poona.
24. Dass, Shri Bhagwan, Principal, Dayanand College, Sholapur.
25. Daru, Kum. Swati, Senior Library Assistant, S. N. D. T. University, Bombay.
26. Deshpande, Shri N. R., Head of the Department of Political Science, Nagpur University, Nagpur.
27. Dhekney, Shri B. R., Principal, Rajaram College, Kolhapur.
28. Dhekney, Shri M. R., Dean, Faculty of Commerce, Poona University, Poona.

29. Dhur, Rev. Father J., Chairman, Board of Studies in Latin, Greek and Modern European Languages, Bombay University, Bombay.
30. Diwan, Shri G. S., Hindu Colony, Dadar, Bombay.
31. Diwan, Smt. Sharada, Dean, Faculty of Arts, S. N. D. T. University, Bombay.
32. Doctor, Shri A. J., Honorary Secretary, The Indian Institute of Bankers, Bombay.
33. Gajendragad, Shri N. G., Principal, Shri Mouni Vidyapeeth, Gargoti, Kolhapur.
34. Gananathan, Prof. V. S., Head of the Geography Department, Poona University, Poona.
35. Ghatalia, Shri S. V., Chairman, Board of Studies in Accountancy, Bombay University, Bombay.
36. Ghate, Shri V. D., Ganesh Wadi, Poona.
37. Chatge, Shri A. M., Deccan College Post-graduate Research Institute, Poona.
38. Goel, Shri K. P., Laxmi Colony, Chembur, Bombay.
39. Gokhale, Justice B. N., Girgaum, Bombay.
40. Golay, Shri W. H., Registrar, University of Poona, Poona.
41. Gopaldas, Shri Khanchand, Principal, Law College, Bombay.
42. Gorekar, Prof. S. N., Chairman, Board of Studies in Persian, Arabic and Islamic Culture, Bombay University, Bombay.
43. Gramopadhye, Prof. G. P., Chairman, Board of Studies in Marathi, Bombay University, Bombay.
44. Guha, Shri N. N., Superintendent, Tanning Institute, Bandra, Bombay.
45. Gurjar, Shri L. V., Dean, Faculty of Science, Bombay University, Bombay.
46. Head Master, Rajaram High School, Kolhapur.
47. Jain, Prof. J. C., Head of the Department of Hindi, R. R. College, Bombay.
48. Jaindani, Prof. A. K., Chairman, Board of Studies in Psychology, Jai Hind College, Bombay.
49. Jejurikar, Dr. K. N., Member, Poona University Court, Poona.
50. Jha, Shri S. K., Principal, Janata College of Education, Chanda.
51. Joag, Shri V. K., Fellow and Syndic, Bombay University, Bombay.
52. Joglekar, Shri S. V., Dean, Seth G. S. Medical College, Bombay.
53. Joglekar, Shri V. D., Principal, Government Polytechnic, Jalgaon.
54. Joshi, Shri Balshastri, Principal, Sanskrit Mahavidyalaya, Nanded.
55. Joshi, Shri C. B., Principal, Parle Arts and Science College, Bombay.
56. Joshi, Shri J. R., Chairman, Board of Studies in Actuarial Science, Bombay University, Bombay.
57. Joshi, Shri R. D., Principal, Sir Cusrow Wadia Institute of Electrical Technology, Poona.
58. Joshi, Shri Shripad, Poona.
59. Kalapesi, Dr. A. S., Chairman, Board of Studies in Geography, S. N. D. T. University, Bombay.

60. Kamat, Shri A. R., Gokhale Institute of Politics and Economics, Poona.
61. Kamat, Prof. V. B., Bombay Labour Institute, Bombay.
62. Kane, Shri J. G., Department of Chemical Technology, Bombay University, Bombay.
63. Kapila, Maj. Gen. C. C., Principal, Armed Forces Medical College, Poona.
64. Karmarkar, Prof. R. D., Bhandarkar Oriental Research Institute, Poona.
65. Karve, Shri B. D., Hingne Budruk, Poona.
66. Kelkar, Shri S. V., Principal, Government Post-Graduate Basic Training College, Amravati.
67. Kelkar, Shri V. K., Principal, Walchand College of Engineering, Sangli.
68. Keskar, Shri P. D.
69. Khair, Dr. G. S., Professor of Education, Anath Vidyarthi Griha, Poona.
70. Kirtane, Shri H. A., Principal, The Bombay Education Institute, Bombay.
71. Kshatriya, Shri Dharmadas, Head Master, Sind Model High School, Bombay.
72. Kulkarni, Shri B. R., Principal, Amolakchand Mahavidyalaya, Yeotmal.
73. Kulkarni, Prof. N. R., Dean, Faculty of Science, Poona University, Poona.
74. Kundnani, Shri K. M., Principal, Kishinchand Chellaram College, Bombay.
75. Lagu, Dr. B. C., Rama Niwas, Poona.
76. Limaye, Shri M. D., Principal, Parle College of Commerce, Bombay.
77. Mahajan, Shri G. H., Principal, Janata Mahavidyalaya, Chanda.
78. Maniar, Shri U. M., Chairman, Board of Studies in English, S. N. D. T. University, Bombay.
79. Masani, Smt. P. F., President, Women Graduates' Union, Bombay.
80. Mehta, Kumari Usha H., Head of the Department of Civics and Politics, Bombay University, Bombay.
81. Memon, Shri A. A., Principal, Agriculture College, Poona.
82. Merchant, Dr. H. D., Dean, N. H. Dental College, Bombay.
83. Merchant, Shri K. T., Principal, Sydenham College of Commerce and Economics, Bombay.
84. Mishra, Shri Bhagirath, Head of the Department of Hindi, Poona University, Poona.
85. Modi, Dr. C. L., Dean, B. J. Medical College, Poona.
86. Mody, Shri R. K., Principal, V. J. T. I., Bombay.
87. Mugali, Shri R. S., Principal, Willingdon College, Sangli.
88. Muley, Shri R. S., Co-ordinator, Extension Services Department, Nagpur.
89. Nagarkar, Shri G. P., Principal, College of Engineering, Aurangabad.

90. Nath, Shri R. P., Principal, Dr. Ambedkar College of Commerce, Aurangabad.
91. Nene, Shri G. P., Secretary, Maharashtra Rashtrabhasha Sabha, Poona.
92. Ogale, Shri G. K., Dean, Faculty of Engineering, Poona University, Poona.
93. Oke, Shri B. Y., R. R. College, Bombay.
94. Panandikar, Kumari S., 8, Garden Homes, Khar, Bombay.
95. Pandharipande, Shri S. L., Principal, S. B. City College, Nagpur.
96. Paranjpe, Prof. G. R., 'Sudarshan', Sadashiv Peth, Poona.
97. Parasnis, Shri N. R., Principal, S. M. T. T. College, Kolhapur.
98. Pathakji, Shri M. J., Principal, Matunga Gujarati Seva Mandal's Women's College, Bombay.
99. Patil, Dr. G. M., Chairman, Board of Studies in Sanskrit, Marathwada University, Aurangabad.
100. Patke, Shri S. S., Superintendent, Mahilashram High School, Hingne, Poona.
101. Patwardhan, Shri R. P., Erandwana, Poona.
102. Potdar, M. M., D. V., Vice-Chancellor, University of Poona, Poona.
103. Principal, Commercial Training Institute, Nagpur.
104. Pundalik, Shri D. V., Principal, Public Health Institute, Nagpur.
105. Puranik, Shri P. D., 299, Sadashiv Peth, Poona.
106. Rao, Shri Setu Madhav, Gazetters' Revision Board, Old Secretariat, Bombay.
107. Rao, Shri S. N. Narayanan, Chairman, Board of Studies in Bio-Chemistry, Bombay University, Bombay.
108. Rajdarekar, Shri N. R., Principal, Balbhim Arts and Science College, Bhir.
109. Rauf, Shri S. A., Principal, S. T. College, Bombay.
110. Rustomjee, Kumari Amy B. H. J., Somerset House, 169, Kolaba Road, Bombay.
111. Rege, Shri P. S., Principal, I. Y. College, Jogeshwari, Bombay.
112. Samtani, Kumari S. C., Principal, Kamla High School, Khar, Bombay.
113. Sankholkar, Shri C. K., 20-K, Hansrajwadi, Kennedy Bridge, Bombay.
114. Seervai, Shri H. M., Advocate General, Maharashtra State, Bombay.
115. Shah, Shri J. G., Chairman, Board of Studies in Logic, Ethics and Philosophy, S. N. D. T. University, Bombay.
116. Shejwalkar, Shri P. C., Gopal Gayan Samaj Road, Sadashiv Peth, Poona.
117. Shriraman, Shri T., Principal, Shri M. S. Jain Vidyalaya, Jalna.
118. Shrivastav, Shri R. C., Principal, College of Agriculture, Nagpur.
119. Shrivastav, Shri Sampatrai, Chairman, Board of Studies in Chemistry, Marathwada University, Aurangabad.
120. Siddiqui, Shri Saifuddin, Head of the Department of Psychology, Government College of Arts and Science, Aurangabad.

121. Siva, Shri N. S., Director, Tata Institute of Fundamental Research, Bombay.
122. Solagran, Father A., Principal, St. Xavier's Institute of Education, Bombay.
123. Sreenivasan, Shri L., Principal, College of Agriculture, Akola.
124. Tawde, Shri S. R., Chairman, Board of Secondary Education of Maharashtra, Kolhapur.
125. Thackersey, Smt. Premlila, Vice-Chancellor, S. N. D. T. Women's University, Bombay.
126. Thatte, Dr. V. N., Retired Professor, Dharampeth Extension, Nagpur.
127. Thatte, Shri Yadunath, 'Sadhna' Weekly. 430. Shanwar Peth, Poona.
128. Tirtha, Shri Swami Ramanand, 'Seva Niketan', Begampeth, Hyderabad.
129. Tokhi, Shri M. R., Principal, and Dean, Faculty of Commerce, Nagpur University, Nagpur.
130. Tope, Shri T. K., Principal, Government Law College, Bombay.
131. Trivedi, Smt. Jyoti, Chairman, Advisory Committee for Nursing, S. N. D. T. University, Bombay.
132. Vad, Dr. B. G., Peerbhoy Mansion, Sandhurst Road, Bombay.
133. Vaidya, Shri C. G., Vice-Principal, B. M. College of Commerce, Poona.
134. Vaidya, Shri M. P., Tilak Road, Chatkopar, Bombay.
135. Vaidya, Shri N. V., Principal, Willingdon College, Sangli.
136. Vakil, Shri R. N., Principal, Modern School, Bombay.
137. Virkar, Dr. D. V., Dean, Grant Medical College, Bombay.
138. Vora, Shri R. G., Principal, R. A. V. High School, Ghatkopar, Bombay.
139. Wadia, Prof. A. R., Director, Tata Institute of Social Sciences, Bombay.
140. Wadia, Shri P. A., Thakur Niwas, J. Tata Road, Bombay.
141. Wadhvani, Shri T. T., B/44, Peer Mohmed Manzil, Colaba Road, Bombay.
142. Wani, Shri B. M.
143. Wankhede, Shri M. N., Principal, Milind Mahavidyalaya, Aurangabad.
144. Ward, Smt. W., Principal, Sophia College for Women, Bombay.
145. Welingkar, Shri L. N., Principal, R. A. Podar College of Commerce and Economics, Bombay.
146. Yagnik, Shri A. B., Chairman, Board of Studies in Gujarati, Bombay University, Bombay.
147. Yodh, Shri B. B., Member of the Faculty of Medicine, Bombay University, Bombay.
148. Secretary, Indian Merchants Chamber, Bombay.
149. Secretary, Maharashtra Chamber of Commerce, Bombay.
150. Secretary, Millowners' Association, Bombay.
151. Executive Secretary, Women Graduates' Union, Bombay.

APPENDIX C.

1. Advani, Shri T. M., Principal, Jai Hind College, Bombay.
2. Aiman, Smt. Dr., Dean, B. J. Medical College, Poona.
3. Airan, Shri J. W., Principal, Wilson College, Bombay.
4. Apte, Dr. B. P., Member, Executive Council, University of Poona, Poona.
5. Badkas, Justice G. B., Vice-Chancellor, Nagpur University, Nagpur.
6. Bal, Dr. D. V., Director, Institute of Science, Bombay.
7. Bal, Dr. Smt. S., Principal, S. N. D. T. College for Women, Poona.
8. Bannerjee, Shri G. C., Principal, Elphinstone College, Bombay.
9. Barve, Dr. G. V., Principal, Nagpur Medical College, Nagpur.
10. Bavdekar, Shri V. K., Principal, R. P. Gogate College, Ratnagiri.
11. Bhandarkar, Dr. P. M., Dean, Medical College, Aurangabad.
12. Bhansali, Smt. K., Registrar, S. N. D. T. Women's University, Bombay.
13. Bhingare, Shri L. M., G. K. Gokhale College, Kolhapur.
14. Borale, Shri P. T., Principal, Siddharth College of Law, Bombay.
15. Borkar, Dr. V. V., Professor of Economics, Marathwada University, Aurangabad.
16. Chidambaran, Shri T. V., Registrar, University of Bombay, Bombay.
17. Chikhlikar, Shri A. N., Principal, Deogiri College, Aurangabad.
18. Chitnis, Shri M. B., Registrar, Marathwada University, Aurangabad.
19. Damle, Shri P. R., Principal, N. Wadia College, Poona.
20. Dantwala, Shri M. L., Director, School of Economics, University of Bombay, Bombay.
21. D'Cruz, Rev. Fr. E., Principal, St. Xavier's College, Bombay.
22. Deshmukh, Shri M. G., Principal, Government College of Arts and Science, Aurangabad.
23. Deshpande, Shri N. R., Professor of Politics, Nagpur University, Nagpur.
24. Dharap, Shri P. W., Professor of Electrical Engineering, V. J. T. Institute, Bombay.
25. Dhekney, Shri B. R., Principal, Rajaram College, Kolhapur.
26. Divan, Smt. Sharda, Dean, Faculty of Arts, S. N. D. T. Women's University, Bombay.
27. Cadgil, Shri D. R., Director, Gokhale Institute of Economics and Politics, Poona.
28. Ghatge, Shri V. D., Poona.
29. Ghatge, Dr. A. M., Deccan College Post-graduate Research Institute, Poona.
30. Ghorpade, Shri R. B., Member, Executive Council, University of Poona, Poona.
31. Ghurye, Dr. G. S., University of Bombay, Bombay.
32. Godambe, Dr. V. P., Professor of Statistics, College of Science, Nagpur.

33. Gokhale, Justice B. N., Bombay.
34. Golay, Shri W. H., Registrar, University of Poona, Poona.
35. Gokhale, Shri V. P., Principal, College of Agriculture, Parbhani.
36. Joag, Shri V. K., Poona.
37. Joglekar, Dr. S. V., Dean, Seth G. S. Medical College, Bombay.
38. Joshi, Tarkateerth L. S., Prajnya Pathshala, Wai.
39. Kajale, Dr. L. B., Principal, College of Science, Nagpur.
40. Kamat, Dr. A. R., Gokhale Institute of Politics and Economics, Poona.
41. Khair, Dr. G. S., Poona.
42. Khanolkar, Dr. V. R., Vice-Chancellor, University of Bombay, Bombay.
43. Kogekar, Shri S. V., Principal, Fergusson College, Poona.
44. Kolte, Dr. V. B., Principal, Nagpur Mahavidyalaya, Nagpur.
45. Kothare, Dr. A. N., St. Xavier's College, Bombay.
46. Kulkarni, Shri N. R., Dean, Faculty of Science, University of Poona, Poona.
47. Kulkarni, Shri W. L., Professor of Marathi, Marathwada University, Aurangabad.
48. Lagu, Dr. B. C., Poona.
49. Lele, Dr. R. B., Medical College, Aurangabad.
50. Malkani, Shri H. C., Principal, K. C. College of Commerce, Bombay.
51. Marshall, Shri D. N., Librarian, Bombay University Library, Bombay.
52. Mene, Dr. P. S., Director, Laxmi Narayan Institute of Technology, Nagpur University, Nagpur.
53. Merchant, Dr. H. D., Principal, N. H. Dental College, Bombay.
54. Merchant, Shri K. T., Principal, Sydenham College of Commerce and Economics, Bombay.
55. Mirashi, M. M., Dr. Shri V. V., Nagpur University, Nagpur.
56. Mishra, Shri B., Head of the Department of Hindi, University of Poona, Poona.
57. Modak, Dr. M. S., Registrar, Nagpur University, Nagpur.
58. Mody, Shri R. K., V. J. T. Institute, Matunga, Bombay.
59. Muley, Shri R. S., Co-ordinator, Extension Service Department, Nagpur University, Nagpur.
60. Munje, Dr. R. H., Principal, B. T. College, Akola.
61. Nagarkar, Shri G. P., Principal, College of Engineering, Aurangabad.
62. Nath, Shri R. P., Principal, Dr. Ambedkar College of Commerce, Aurangabad.
63. Ogale, Shri G. K., Dean, Faculty of Engineering, University of Poona, Poona.
64. Padhye, Shri M. D., Principal, Yogeshwari College of Arts and Science, Mominabad.
65. Panandikar, Kum. S., Bombay.

66. Paranjpe, Shri G. R., Poona.
67. Patwardhan, Shri R. P., Poona.
68. Potdar, M. M., Shri D. V., Vice-Chancellor, University of Poona, Poona.
69. Rustomji, Kum. A. B. H. J., Bombay.
70. Seervai, Shri H. M., Advocate General, Government of Maharashtra, Bombay.
71. Shah, Shri A. B., Principal, S. I. E. S. College of Arts and Science, Bombay.
72. Shirwadkar, Shri K. R., Principal, People's College, Nanded.
73. Shrivastava, Shri Sampat Rai, Government College of Arts and Science, Aurangabad.
74. Siddiqui, Shri Saifuddin, Government College of Arts and Science, Aurangabad.
75. Solagran, Rev. Fr. A., Principal, St. Xavier's Institute of Education, Bombay.
76. Suru, Shri N. G., Principal, Ruparel College, Bombay.
77. Tawde, Shri S. R., Kolhapur.
78. Thackersey, Lady P., Vice-Chancellor, S. N. D. T. Women's University, Bombay.
79. Thatte, Dr. Shri V. N., Nagpur.
80. Tokhi, Shri M. R., Principal, G. S. College of Commerce, Nagpur.
81. Tope, Shri T. K., Principal, Government Law College, Bombay.
82. Vad, Dr. B. G., Bombay.
83. Wadekar, Shri D. D., Poona.
84. Wankhade, Shri M. N., Principal, Milind Mahavidyalaya, Aurangabad.
85. Welingkar, Shri L. N., Principal, R. A. Podar College of Commerce, Bombay.

List of Associations who sent their representatives to give oral evidence before the Committee:—

- (1) Millowners' Association, Bombay.
- (2) Indian Merchants Chamber, Bombay.
- (3) Maharashtra Chamber of Commerce, Bombay.
- (4) Women Graduates Association, Bombay (Branch).

APPENDIX D

A brief analysis of the views expressed on some important points posed in Questionnaire.

Point of View	Number of persons holding the view
1	2

Question No. (1)

Should the medium of instruction in all the Universities in Maharashtra be the same or would you allow them to have different media, provided that the regional or the national language is one of the media ?

Views relating to Question No. 1

- | | |
|--|----|
| 1. The medium of instruction in all the Universities should be the same. | 54 |
| 2. The medium of instruction in all Universities may not be the same. | 48 |

Question No. (2).

Should the regional language be necessarily a medium of instruction in each University, now that Maharashtra State is a unilingual State which has adopted Marathi as the language of administration ?

Views relating to Question No. 2

- | | |
|--|----|
| 1. The Regional language should necessarily be a medium of instruction in each University, now that the Maharashtra State is a unilingual State which has adopted Marathi as a language of administration. | 57 |
| 2. The regional language should not necessarily be the medium of instruction. | 37 |

Question No. (3)

Should the regional language be eventually the sole medium of instruction in one or more of the Universities? If so, please name them.

Views relating to Question No. 3

- | | |
|---|----|
| 1. The regional language be eventually the sole medium of instruction in one or the more of the Universities. | 19 |
| 2. The regional language only may not be the sole medium of instruction, if sufficient number of students demand for another. | 44 |
| 3. The University should have freedom to follow the alternative medium of instruction. | 6 |

Point of view	Number of persons holding the view
1	2

Question No. (4)

Should the national language be an optional medium of instruction for some time or for all time, in any of the Universities? If so, please name them.

Views relating to Question No. 4

- | | |
|---|----|
| 1. The national language should be an optional medium of instruction for some time in the following Universities :— | |
| (1) Poona University | 6 |
| (2) Bombay University | 13 |
| (3) Nagpur University | 12 |
| (4) S. N. D. T. University | 1 |
| (5) Marathwada University | 4 |
| 2. The national language should be an optional medium of instruction for all the time in all the Universities in Maharashtra State. | 36 |
| 3. The national language should not be an optional medium of instruction. | 12 |

Question No. (5)

Should the national language be gradually substituted for English as an optional medium of instruction in all branches of knowledge, at all stages? If not, please indicate the branches and stages and the gradualness of the substitution.

Views relating to Question No. 5

- | | |
|---|----|
| 1. The national language should be substituted gradually for English as an optional medium of instruction in all the branches of the knowledge at all stages. | 60 |
| 2. The national language should not be substituted for English as an optional medium of instruction in all branches of knowledge at all stages. | 23 |
| 3. English should be compulsory at post-graduate stage .. | 6 |

Question No. (6)

Should the national language alone be the medium of instruction in preference to the regional language?

Views relating to Question No. 6

- | | |
|--|----|
| 1. The national language should alone be the medium of instruction in preference to the regional language. | 31 |
| 2. The national language should not alone be the medium of instruction in preference to the regional language. | 67 |

Point of view	Number of persons holding the view
1	2

Question No. (7)

Would the abolition of English altogether or at the undergraduate stage, prejudice the chances of students who may want to compete in the All-India Competitive Examinations, specially for admission to the Foreign Service ?

Views relating to Question No. 7

- | | |
|--|-------|
| 1. The abolition of English altogether or at the undergraduate stage, would prejudice the chances of students wanting to compete in All-India competitive examinations especially for admission to Foreign Services. | 76 |
| 2. It would not prejudice the chances of students | .. 22 |

Question No. (8)

Do you think the introduction of the national language as an optional medium of instruction in place of English, would benefit students wanting to complete for the All-India Services ?

Views relating to Question No. 8

- | | |
|---|----------|
| 1. The introduction of national language as an optional medium of instruction in place of English would benefit students wanting to compete for the All-India Services. | 57 |
| 2. It would not benefit students | 38 |

Question No. (9)

Do you think it desirable to have at least one medium of instruction (English or the national language) common to all the Indian Universities in order to facilitate the migration of students and teachers alike ?

Views relating to Question No. 9

- | | |
|--|----------|
| 1. It is desirable to have at least one medium of instruction (English or national language) common to all the Indian Universities in order to facilitate the migration of students. | 85 |
| 2. It is not desirable | 17 |
| 3. English must remain as a sole medium of instruction as far as legal education is concerned. | 1 |

Question No. (10)

Whatever be the medium or media of instruction finally adopted, do you think it necessary that the regional language, the national language and English should be prescribed as obligatory subjects of study throughout the degree course or any part of it ?

Point of view	Number of persons holding the view
1	2
<i>Views relating to Question No. 10</i>	
1. Whatever be the medium/media of instruction finally adopted, it is necessary that regional language, national language and English should be prescribed as obligatory subjects of study throughout the degree course or any part of it.	42
2. It is not necessary to prescribe them as obligatory ..	8
<i>Question No. (11)</i>	
If the answer to the last preceding question is in the affirmative would the prescription of a classical or a foreign language as a compulsory subject for students of the humanities be an unnecessary burden ?	
<i>Views relating to Question No. 11</i>	
1. The prescription of a classical or foreign language as a compulsory subject would be an unnecessary burden to the students of Humanities.	51
2. It would not be an unnecessary burden to students ..	35
<i>Question No. (12)</i>	
Do you think it feasible to abolish English as a medium of instruction at the post-graduate stage ?	
<i>Views relating to Question No. 12</i>	
1. It is feasible to abolish English as medium of instruction at the post-graduate stage.	40
2. It is not feasible to abolish English as medium of instruction at the post-graduate level.	51
3. It is not feasible for sometime to abolish English as medium of instruction at the post-graduate level.	10
<i>Question No. (13)</i>	
Do you think that Science and/or technological subjects and the Western systems of medicine and surgery can be taught efficiently through the regional or the national language both at the under-graduate and the post-graduate stages ?	
<i>Views relating to Question No. 13</i>	
1. Science and/or Technical subjects and the Western systems of Medicine and Surgery can be taught efficiently through the regional or national language both at the under-graduate and post-graduate levels.	31
2. They cannot be taught efficiently through the regional or national language.	63

Point of view	Number of persons holding the view
1	2

Question No. (14)

Are you in favour of replacing English by the regional and/or the national language as a medium of instruction in all the different branches of knowledge in (a) the Humanities, (b) the Sciences, (c) Technology (Engineering and Agriculture), (d) Medicine and (e) Law or in any of them?

Views relating to Question No. 14

- | | |
|---|----|
| 1. English can be replaced by the regional and/or the national language as a medium of instruction in all the branches of knowledge as indicated against each branch. | |
| 1. Humanities | 37 |
| 2. Sciences | 17 |
| 3. Technology | 12 |
| 4. Medicine | 13 |
| 5. Law | 21 |
| 6. All Branches | 32 |
| 2. English cannot be replaced by the regional and/or the national language as a medium of instruction in all the branches of knowledge. | 9 |

Question No. (15)

Would you fix a time-limit for the completion of the process of substitution of the regional and/or the national language for English as a medium of instruction in the fields of knowledge mentioned in the last preceding question?

Views relating to Question No. 15

- | | |
|---|----|
| 1. It is not feasible to prescribe a time-limit | 20 |
| 2. It is feasible to prescribe a definite time-limit (which varies from 5 to 25 years). | 78 |

Question No. (16)

What transitory provisions would you suggest for a smooth change over from English to the regional and/or the national language as a medium of instruction?

Views relating to Question No. 16

The transitory provisions are as indicated below :-

- | | |
|--|---|
| 1. English should be allowed as an optional language for medium of instruction for Science and Technology. | 8 |
|--|---|

Point of view	Number of persons holding the view	
	1	2
2. Translation of English books into national language ..	14	
3. Proper selection and training of teachers ..	6	
4. Free use of both languages	8	
5. Production of original literature in different branches of knowledge for students and teachers.	25	
6. English should gradually be replaced	4	
7. Lecturers should be allowed to deliver lectures in regional languages.	6	

Question No. (17)

In case two or three media of instruction are allowed to exist side by side in the Universities, what steps do you suggest for the maintenance of uniformly high standards in both teaching and examinations?

Views relating to Question No. 17

Steps suggested are as under :-

- | | |
|--|----|
| 1. To set up a Body or Committee of Experts for guidance. | 23 |
| 2. To adopt more exact new type methods of examinations. | 5 |
| 3. Persons knowing both the media should be appointed as teachers and examiners. | 11 |
| 4. Common question papers in all media | 7 |
| 5. Good teaching, sound books and proper examinations. | 7 |
| 6. Common board of paper-setters and examiners .. . | 7 |

Question No. (18)

Do you consider that the medium of instruction should necessarily be the medium of examination?

Views relating to Question No. 18.

- | | |
|---|----|
| 1. The medium of instruction should necessarily be the medium of examination. | 74 |
| 2. The medium of instruction should not necessarily be the medium of examination. | 29 |

Question No. (19)

Would you consider it desirable to allow students to answer their examination papers in a language which is different from the medium of instruction?

Point of view.	Number of persons holding the view
1	2

Views relating to Question No. 19

1. It is desirable to allow students to answer their examination papers in a language which is different from the medium of instruction.	32
2. It is not desirable to allow students to do so ..	31
3. It would not necessarily be undesirable to allow students to answer their examination papers in a language which is different from the medium of instruction.	28

Question No. (20)

Where a University permits more than one language to be the medium of instruction :-

- (a) Would it be desirable to insist on an affiliated College selecting only one language as its medium of instruction ?
- (b) Would it be desirable to insist that an affiliated College should provide facilities for the use of all the permissible media of instruction ?
- (c) Should the choice of the medium of instruction be left entirely to the college authorities ?

Views relating to Question No. 20

Where a University permits more than one language to be the medium of instruction :-

- | | |
|--|----|
| 1. It is desirable to insist on an affiliated College selecting only one language as its medium of instruction. | 29 |
| 2. It would be desirable to insist that an affiliated college should provide facilities for the use of all the permissible media of instruction. | 23 |
| 3. The choice of the medium of instruction should be left entirely to the college authorities. | 38 |

Question No. (21)

Are you in favour of some of the affiliated colleges being made to use the national language as the only medium of instruction ?

Views relating to Question No. 21

- | | |
|--|----|
| 1. Some affiliated colleges may be allowed to use the national language as the only medium of instruction. | 35 |
| 2. Not in favour of the suggestion | 54 |

Point of view	Number of persons holding the view
1	2

Question No. (22)

In case, no college is prepared to provide facilities for the national language to be the medium of instruction, would it be desirable for the University/State Government to make such provision ?

Views relating to Question No. 22

The desirabilities pointed out are :—

- | | |
|--|----|
| 1. The University should make such provision | 34 |
| 2. The Government should make such provision. . . . | 14 |
| 3. Neither the State Government nor the University should make such provision. | 12 |
| 4. Either the Government or the University should make such provision. | 29 |

Question No. (23)

Where a University permits more than one medium of instruction, would you permit the students to change the medium at any stage ?

Views relating to Question No. 23

- | | |
|---|----|
| 1. The students may be permitted to change the medium at any stage. | 49 |
| 2. The students may not be permitted to change the medium at any stage. | 30 |

Question No. (24)

Is there sufficient literature in the regional/national language to enable the Universities to switch over from English to those languages, or any of them, at all or some stages of the degree course, with immediate effect, or after the lapse of some years ; and if the latter, how many approximately ?

Views relating to Question No. 24

- | | |
|--|----|
| 1. There is sufficient literature in regional and national languages to enable the Universities to switch over from English to these languages or any of them, at one or some stages of the degree course with immediate effect. | 10 |
| 2. There is no sufficient literature in regional or national language. | 56 |
| 3. Time for replacing English (varying from 5 to 20 years). | 14 |

Point of view	Number of persons holding the view
1	2

Question No. (25)

How long would it take, according to you, to equip teachers to impart instruction satisfactorily through the regional and/or the national language? What steps would you suggest for the purpose?

Views relating to Question No. 25

1. Time required to equip teachers to impart instruction satisfactorily through the regional and/or the national language (varying between 3 to 25 years).	49
2. No specific time required to equip teachers, etc. ..	7
3. Various steps proposed are :-	
(i) Universities should give special recognition to the teachers who have written standard books in regional languages.	3
(ii) The services of these teachers may be utilised for extension lectures, seminars, discussions in different colleges.	10
(iii) Reference text-books should be made available ..	10
(iv) Training Centres for teachers to be opened ..	4

Question No. (26)

Is sufficient literature of the required standard available in the regional and/or the national language to enable the Universities to switch over to these languages or either of them in all or in some branches of knowledge? If not, will you please indicate the branches in which such literature is inadequate, and the steps which in your opinion are necessary for remedying the deficiencies?

Views relating to Question No. 26

1. Availability of required literature to enable the Universities to switch over to these languages or either of them or some of the branches of knowledge :-	
(i) Adequate	10
(ii) Inadequate	29
2. The branches in which the literature is inadequate—	
(i) Science subjects	20
(ii) Humanities.	6

Point of view	Number of persons holding the view
1	2

3. Steps for remedying the deficiencies :—

- | | |
|--|---|
| (i) Generous financial help from State Government .. | 4 |
| (ii) Senior teachers and scholars, even retired members of the profession should be brought to prepare adequate literature even by compulsion. | 3 |
| (iii) Universities may appoint a Text-Books Production Board. | 9 |

Question No. (27)

Will you please suggest a tentative programme for remedying the deficiencies referred to in the last preceding question ?

Views relating to Question No. 27

Remedies proposed for removing the deficiencies in question No. 26, are as under :—

- | | |
|---|----|
| 1. Competent authorities should be decided upon and they be requested to write books on the subject allotted to them. | 22 |
| 2. Facilities for doing the work peacefully should be provided. | 17 |
| 3. Publication and Translation of standard books and the award of prizes for the best books in the subject. | 3 |

Question No. (28)

Can you suggest any steps, such as the co-ordination of efforts and the pooling of talent and resources of the Universities in Maharashtra for providing the necessary text-books and other literature in the regional language in subjects in which the available books and literature are inadequate ?

Views relating to Question No. 28

- | | |
|---|----|
| 1. Co-ordination of efforts. | 33 |
| 2. Pooling of talent and resources of Universities in the State of Maharashtra. | 36 |
| 3. Common Board for each subject with chairman to be appointed by Government. | 7 |

Question No. (29)

Do you think it possible or advisable to replace the international scientific terminology by a specially prepared terminology in the regional and/or the national language ?

Point of view	Number of persons holding the view
1	2

Views relating to Question No. 29

- | | |
|---|----|
| 1. It is possible to replace the international terminology .. | 29 |
| 2. It is not possible to do so | 44 |

Question No. (30)

Do you think that legislation is necessary, or desirable for hastening the process of substitution of the regional and/or the national language as the medium of instruction? If so, do you suggest the amendment of the constitutions of all the Universities of Maharashtra?

Views relating to Question No. 30

- | | |
|---|----|
| 1. Legislation is necessary for substitution of regional or national language as the medium of instruction. | 39 |
| 2. Legislation is not necessary | 39 |

Question No. (31)

What provision, if any, would you make for the benefit of the linguistic minorities in Bombay City and in other parts of Maharashtra?

Views relating to Question No. 31.

- | | |
|--|----|
| 1. Provisions for linguistic minorities in Bombay City :— | |
| (i) Bombay University should have Marathi, Hindi, Gujrati and English as media of instruction. | 5 |
| 2. Provisions for linguistic minorities for other parts of the Maharashtra State :— | |
| (i) Alternative medium should be provided .. | 29 |
| (ii) Provision of national language in some colleges may be made. | 27 |
| 3. No provision should be made | 15 |
| 4. English should remain as optional medium of instruction for all those who want it. | 1 |

Question No. (32)

Do you think that the abolition of English as a medium of instruction and/or the restriction of the medium to one language only (the regional or the national), would tend to affect adversely (a) the Unity of India, (b) free and easy intercourse, academic, cultural, social or political, with the world at large, (c) the world community of scholarship or (d) the prospects of students wanting to pursue their higher studies abroad?

Point of view	Number of persons holding the view
1	2

Views relating to Question No. 32

1. The abolition of English would tend to affect adversely :—
 - (a) Yes (21) No. (18).
 - (b) Yes (19) No. (16).
 - (c) Yes (31) No. (16).
 - (d) Yes (30) No. (10)..
2. The abolition of English would not tend to affect .. 26

Question No. (33)

Do you suggest the necessity of reviewing the situation from time to time? If so, what intervals do you suggest for such review?

Views relating to Question No. 33

Necessity of reviewing the situation from time to time.

1. Time intervals suggested varying from 2 to 15 years .. 73
2. No necessity of reviewing the situation from time to time. 3

Question No. (34)

In answering the above queries or any of them, please indicate whether your answers also hold good for technical and other institutions of higher education which are not Universities in so far as they are relevant?

Views relating to Question No. 34

1. The answers hold good for technical and other institutions. 63
2. The answers are not applicable to technical and other higher education. 5

APPENDIX E

Bibliography.

A — BOOKS.

- Medium of Instruction* — S. N. AGARWAL — Kitabistan, 1942.
- Teaching the Mother-Tongue* — P. B. BALLARD — University of London Press, 1921.
- Teaching and Testing English* — P. B. BALLARD — University of London Press, 1939.
- English in Education* — H. BLAMIRE — G. Bles, 1951.
- Language, Universities and Nationalism in India* — S. N. CHIB, — Oxford University Press, 1936.
- Medium of Instruction* — M. K. GANDHI — Navajivan Publishing House, Ahmedabad, 1954.
- The Teaching of English* — I. A. GORDON — New-Zealand Council for Educational Research, 1947.
- The Teaching of Reading and Writing* — W. S. GRAY — U. N. E. S. C. O. Monographs on Fundamental Education, No. X, 1956.
- The Teaching of Written English* — P. GURREY — Longmans, 1954.
- Words in Action* — Sir PHILIP HARTOG — University of London Press, 1947.
- Language in Thought and Action* — S. I. HAYAKAWA — George Allen and Unwin, 1952.
- The Uses of Literacy* — RICHARD HOGGART — A Pelican book, first published by Chatto and Windus, 1957.
- Clear Thinking* — R. W. JEPSON — Longmans — 1954.
- Problem of Scientific and Technical Terminology in Indian Languages* — Dr. D. S. KOTHARI — Ministry of Education, Government of India, 1961, Publication No. 549.
- Language in School* — M. M. LEWIS — University of London Press, 1942.
- Language, its Nature, Development and Origin* — OTTO JESPERSEN — Allen and Unwin, 1922.
- English Teaching in the World Today* — BRUCE PATTISON — No. 4 in Studies in Education (London Institute of Education).
- Language for Everybody* — MARIO PEI — Pocket Books Inc., N. Y.
- Free Writing* — DORA PYM — University of Bristol, Institute of Education, No. 10, University of London Press, 1956.
- Speculative Instruments* — I. A. RICHARDS — Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1955.
- English for the English* — G. SAMPSON — Cambridge University Press, 1925.

Thinking to Some Purpose—S. STEBBING—First published, 1939
Reprinted as a Pelican book, 1959.

Straight and Crooked Thinking—R. H. THOULESS—First published
1930. Revised and enlarged, 1953. Pan Books Ltd.

Language and Writing—J. C. WEIGHTMAN—Sylvan Press, London,
1957.

B — PERIODICALS.

The Difficulties of Training College Students in Understanding What They Read—British Journal of Educational Psychology, Vol. XXIV,
Pt. 1, 1954.

Mother-Tongue Theory—M. K. DESAI—Journal of Education and
Psychology, Vol. 7, 1949.

Problems of Universities in Maharashtra—S. R. DONGERKERY—Marath-
wada University Journal, Vol. 1, No. 1, 1960-61.

*The medium of instruction: the place of Hindi, English and the classical
language*—S. D. INCHAL—Christian Education, 34, No. 1, 1957.

School and College Education—R. S. IYENGAR—Educational Review,
Vol. 63, 1957.

Our regional language as medium of instruction in colleges—S. T.
IYENGAR—South Indian Teacher, Vol. 23, 1950.

National and Regional Language.—K. N. KINI—Educational India,
Vol. 15, 1949.

*Regional Language as teaching medium—Views of Education Minister
and Dr. A. L. Mudaliar*—New Education, Madras, September, 1955.

Experimental Enquiries into the use of Essay Type English Papers—
D. A. PIDGEON AND YATES—British Journal of Educational Psychology,
Vol. XXVII, Part 1, 1957.

Language Controversy—RAJENDRA PRASAD—Educational India, Vol. 15,
1949.

The Language Problem in Indian Education—Indian Education
Abstracts, Vol. 4, No. 4, Abstract No. 290.

Language Scheme for School and College—ACHARYA VYAS—Educa-
tion Vol. 29, No. 22, 1950.

Teaching medium in Colleges—(Editorial), Educational India, Vol. 24,
1957.

C — REPORTS.

Board of Education—Report on the *Teaching of English in England*,
H. M. S. O. 1921.

Bombay University Committee on the *Medium of Instruction*—Report—
1955.

Bombay University Reorganisation Committee—Report—1950.

- Incorporated Association of Assistant Masters in Secondary Schools—
Report on *The Teaching of English*, Cambridge University Press,
1952.
- Indian Institute of Public Administration—Report of a Seminar on
Recruitment and Training of Public Services, 1957.
- Karnatak University Committee—Report—1948.
- Maharashtra University Committee—Report—1943.
- Marathwada University Committee—Report—1957.
- Ministry of Education Report on *Language : Some Suggestions*—
H. M. S. O. 1954.
- Official Language Commission, Government of India—Report—1955.
- Official Language Committee (Government of Maharashtra), Report,
1960.
- Secondary Education Commission—Report, Government of India,
Ministry of Education, 1952-53.
- States Reorganisation Commission Report, 1956.
- University Grants Commission—Report of Working Group on Medium
of Instruction, 1961.
- University Grants Commission—Report of the English Committee, 1957.
- University of Poona—Report regarding The Indian Languages Deve-
lopment Conference (1953).

BOMBAY

PRINTED AT THE GOVERNMENT CENTRAL PRESS

Obtainable from the Maharashtra Government Publications, Sales Branch, Majestic Hotel, Opp. Regal Cinema, Colaba Causeway, Bombay-1 (Sale on Counter only) ; from the Government Book Depot, Charni Road Gardens, Bombay-4 (for orders from the mofussil) or through the High Commissioner for India. India House, Aldwych, London, W.C.2 or through any recognised Bookseller.