

GOVERNMENT OF INDIA
MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS



**COMMITTEE
ON
DEFECTIONS**

PART II

**PROCEEDINGS OF THE COMMITTEE
AND
PAPERS CIRCULATED TO THE MEMBERS**

**GOVERNMENT OF INDIA
MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS**



COMMITTEE ON DEFECTIONS

**REPORT OF THE COMMITTEE, REPORT OF THE
LAWYERS-GROUP AND EXPLANATORY
DISSENTING NOTES BY MEMBERS**

**GOVERNMENT OF INDIA
MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS**

**REPORT
OF
THE COMMITTEE ON DEFECTIONS**

CONTENTS

1. Introduction	1
2. Resolution in Parliament	1—2
3. Constitution of the Committee	2—3
4. Meetings of the Committee	3
5. Reference of the legal and constitutional issues to the Lawyers Group	3—4
6. Meeting of the Lawyer Members	4
7. Considerations placed before itself by the Committee in drawing up this report.	4—5
8. Recommendations	5—11
I. Ethical	
A code of conduct for political parties	5—6
II. Political	
Inculcation of a clear understanding of the nature and character of representation and the duties of an elected representative	6
III. Constitutional	
(1) Barring appointment as Prime Minister/Chief Minister of a person who was not a member of the Lower House	6—7
(2) Barring the appointment as Minister of a defecting legislator for a prescribed period or until he goes back to the electorate and gets re-elected.	7—8
(3) Limiting the size of the Council of Ministers	7—8
(4) Right of dissolution being accorded to the Council of Ministers	8—9
(5) Provision for recall	9
IV. Legislative	
(1) Disqualifying a defector from continuing to be a Member of Parliament/State Legislature, and, additionally, on proof of acceptance of gratification, office of profit, etc., disqualifying him from being chosen as a member for six years.	9—10
(2) Registration of political parties	10—11
Notes and Minutes of dissent received from Members	
(1) Shri K. Anbazhagan	15—16
(2) Prof. Bal Raj Madhok	16—17
(3) Shri Bhupesh Gupta	17—26
(i) Definition	21
(ii) Recall	22
(iii) Right of dissolution of the Assembly	24
(iv) Size of the Council of Ministers	26

(i)

	PAGES
(4) Shri S. N. Dwivedy	26—28
(5) Shri H. N. Kunzru	28—29
(6) Shri Madhu Laimaye	29—32
(7) Shri P. Ramamurti	32—35
(8) Shri P. Venkatasubbaiah	35—37
APPENDIX I Composition of the Committee on Defections	38
APPENDIX II Composition of the Committee on Defections and the attendance by Members of its meetings	39—40
APPENDIX III Papers and notes circulated to the Members	41
APPENDIX IV Report of the Lawyer-Members of the Committee on Defections on the various measures discussed in the Committee to curb defections.	42—54
I. Introduction	42
II. Need of political morality and observance of a code of ethics by political parties	42—43
III. Possible legal and constitutional remedies	43—48
(i) Rendering a defector liable to incurring a disqualification	43—45
(ii) Limiting the size of the Council of Ministers	45—46
(iii) Right of dissolution being accorded to the Council of Ministers	47—48
(iv) Registration of political parties	48
(v) Recall	48
ANNEXURE I Copy of D.O. letter NO. 1351-HM (G)/68 dated 18/20th May, 1968 from the Union Home Minister to the members of the Group	49
ANNEXURE II Copy of D.O. letter No. 1351-HM(G)/68, dated 18/20th May, 1968 from the Union Home Minister to the Minister of Law	50
ANNEXURE III(A) Amendments to the Representation of the People Act, 1951 or by a special legislation	51
ANNEXURE III (B) Amendment to the Representation of the People Act, 1951 or by a special legislation	52
ANNEXURE IV(A) Amendment to the Constitution	53
ANNEXURE IV(B) Amendment to the Constitution	54

(iii)

NAME INDEX

PAGES

1. Anbazhagan, K.	2, 8, 15, 38, 39
2. Chatterjee, N. C.	2, 3, 4, 8, 38, 39, 42
3. Chavan, Y. B.	2, 3, 4, 5, 8, 38, 39, 42
4. Daphtary, C. K.	2, 3, 4, 38, 40, 42
5. Dwivedi, S. N.	2, 26, 38, 39, 41
6. Gupta, Bhupesh	2, 8, 17, 38, 39
7. Jaya Prakash Narayan	2, 8, 38, 39
8. Kumaramangalam, Moha.	2, 3, 4, 38, 40, 42
9. Kunzru, H. N.	2, 28, 38, 40
10. Limaye, Madhu	2, 7, 8, 29, 38, 39
11. Madhok, Balraj	2, 8, 16, 38, 39, 41
12. Menon, P. Govinda	2, 3, 4, 8, 38, 39, 42
13. Ramamurti, P.	2, 8, 32, 38, 39
14. Ranga, N. G.	2, 8, 38, 39
15. Seervai, H. M.	2, 8, 38, 39
16. Setalvad, M. C.	2, 3, 4, 8, 38, 40, 42
17. Shastri, Raghuvir Singh	2, 8, 38, 39
18. Singh, Karni	2, 38, 39, 41
19. Singh, Ram Subhag	2, 8, 38, 39
20. Venkatasubbiah, P.	1, 2, 8, 35, 38, 39

SUBJECT INDEX

	Paras	Pages
1. Conduct of Election Rules, 1961		
report	31	10
Appendix IV	7	44
2. Constitution of India		
—amendment of, to the effect that PM/CM-designate should be a member of Lower House		
Report	16-18	6-7
Notes & Minutes of Dissent		15, 16, 21, 28, 29, 33, 36, 37
—amendment to articles 75 and 164 for limiting the size of Council of Ministers		
Report	21-26	7-8
Appendix IV	11, 14	45, 46, 53, 54
Annexure IV (A) & (B)		
Notes & Minutes of Dissent		21, 29, 28, 29-31, 36
—Inclusion of a provision for recall		
report	30	9
Appendix IV	22	48
Notes & Minutes of Dissent		21, 22-24, 28
—interpretation of provisions of, in regard to dissolution of the Legislature		
Report	28	8, 9
Appendix IV	15-20	47, 48
Notes & Minutes of Dissent		21, 24, 25, 32, 34, 35
—Article 19(1) (c) of		
Report	32	10
Appendix IV	10	45
—Article 74 of		
Appendix IV	15	47
—Article 85 of		
Appendix IV	15, 20	47, 48
—Article 102 of		
Report	32	10
Appendix IV	4	43, 44
—Article 103 of		
Appendix IV	5	4
—Article 163 of		
Appendix IV	15	47
—Article 174 of		
Appendix IV	15, 20	47, 48

	Paras	Pages
—Article 191 of the Constitution of India		
Report	32	10-11
Appendix IV	4	43, 44
3. Council of Ministers		
—right of dissolution being accorded to		
Report	28-29	8, 9
Appendix IV	15-20	47, 48
Notes and Minutes of Dissent		21, 24, 25, 32, 34, 35
—size of		
Report	21-27	7-8
Appendix IV	11-14	45-46
Notes and Minutes of Dissent		21, 26, 28, 29—31, 36
—size of, in U.K.		
Appendix IV		46
4. Defections —		
—definition of		
Appendix IV	7-8	44, 45
Notes and Minutes of Dissent		21, 22, 24
—factors behind		
Report		25
Notes and Minutes of Dissent		20
—legislation to ban		
Report	31	9, 10
Appendix IV	4-10	43-45
Annexure III(A) & (B)		51, 52
Notes & Minutes of Dissent		27, 33, 34
—number of, before & after the IV General Election		
Report		18-20
Notes and Minutes of Dissent		18-20
—proposal to make them a penal offence—		
Appendix IV	10	45
—their origin		
Notes and Minutes of Dissent		17-18
5. Defector		
—definition of		
Report	19	7
Notes and Minutes of Dissent		27, 28
—barring appointment of, as a Minister		
Report	19	7
Notes and Minutes of Dissent		23, 27, 29, 31, 34

	Paras	Pages
—disqualification of, from continuing to be an MLA/MP		
Report	31-33	9-10
Appendix IV	4-9	43-45
Notes and Minutes of Dissent		27, 33, 34
—disqualification of, from being chosen as an MLA/MP for a prescribed period		
Report	31-33	9, 10
Appendix IV	4-9	43-45
6. Government		
—stability of		
Report	15	7
Notes and Minutes of Dissent		18
7. Governor		
—his position in regard to dissolution of the Assembly		
Notes and Minutes of Dissent		25
—his right to judge the strength of majority party		
Notes and Minutes of Dissent		31
8. Independents		
Report	1	1
Appendix IV	6	14
Notes and Minutes of Dissent		22, 27, 37
9. Law relating to Salaries & Allowances of the Ministers		
Appendix IV	13	16
10. Lok Sabha		
—its resolution on defections		
Report	2	1-2
11. Observance of political morality		
Report	11(c)	1-5
Appendix IV	3	12-43
12. Parliament		
—suggestion for its directions to President/Governor regarding formation of alternative government, prorogation and dissolution of legislatures etc.		
Notes and Minutes of Dissent		32
13. Political Parties		
—code of conduct for		
Report	12-14	5, 6
Appendix IV	3	42, 43
Notes and Minutes of Dissent		29, 33

	Paras	Pages
—penalty to, for admitting detector(s)		
Report	20	7
Notes and Minutes of Dissent		28, 31, 32
—polarisation of		
Report	11(b) (ii) &(iii)	4
Notes and Minutes of Dissent		18
—reducing their number		
Appendix IV	21	48
Notes and Minutes of Dissent		16
—registration of		
Report	34	10-11
Appendix IV	21	48
—role of, in Indian parliamentary system		
Report	15	6
—Standing Committee or Board of		
Report	13	5
14. Prime Minister/Chief Minister		
—barring appointment as, of a person other than a member of the Lower House		
Report	16-18	6, 7
Notes and Minutes of Dissent		15, 16, 21, 28, 29, 33 36, 37
15. Recall		
—provision for, in our Constitution		
Report	30	9
Appendix IV	22	48
Notes and Minutes of Dissent		21, 22—24, 28
—provision for in other Democracies		
Report	30	9
Notes and Minutes of Dissent		23
16. Representation of the People Act, 1951		
Report	31	9
Appendix IV	9	45
Annexure III(A) & (B)		51, 52
Notes and Minutes of Dissent		32