



सत्यमेव जयते

GOVERNMENT OF MAHARASHTRA

REPORT
OF THE
COMMISSION OF INQUIRY

BYCULLA
FLYOVER BRIDGE
BOMBAY

1987

GOVERNMENT CENTRAL PRESS, BOMBAY

Price : Rs. 4.80

R E P O R T
OF THE
COMMISSION OF INQUIRY APPOINTED
TO INQUIRE INTO THE COLLAPSE OF
TWO PRESTRESSED GIRDERS OF THE
FLYOVER BRIDGE UNDER CONSTRUCTION
NEAR GLORIA CHURCH, BYCULLA
BOMBAY

CONTENTS

PART I

I. INTRODUCTORY—	Paragraphs	Page Nos.
(i) Scope of the Inquiry	1-3	1
(ii) Commencement of Work	4-7	1-2
(iii) Staff of the Commission	8-10	2-3
(iv) Public Notification	11-12	3
(v) Affidavits	13	3
(vi) Panel of Experts	14-15	4-6
(vii) Mr. M. P. Gajapathy Rao	16	6
(viii) Counsel	17-18	6-7
(ix) Codes	19	7
(x) Appendices	20	7
(xi) Visits to the Site	21	8
(xii) A word of Gratitude	22	8
(xiii) Witnesses	23	8

PART II

I. THE PROJECT—CONSTRUCTION OF GIRDERS—COLLAPSE—

(i) The Project	24-26	9
(ii) Delay in Execution of Work	27-30	10-12
(iii) Engineers in charge of the Work	31	12-14
(a) Mr. V. S. Nawathe	31(a)	
(b) Mr. Shankar Umadi	31(b)	
(c) Mr. J. N. Sanghadia	31(c)	
(d) Mr. K. M. Desai	31(d)	
(e) Mr. Y. V. Palshetkar	31(e)	
(f) Mr. M. S. Diwan	31(f)	
(g) Mr. G. D. Joshi	31(g)	
(h) Mr. G. V. Paranjape	31(h)	
(iv) The Centering or Supporting System	32-33	14-16
(v) Prestressing	34-35	16-17
(vi) Concrete Mix	36	17
(vii) Girders 1 and 2 are cast	37-38	17-18
(viii) Prestressing Girder No. 1—First Stage	39-40	18-19
(ix) Girder No. 1 tilts along its Axis—26th September 1980..	41-44	19-21
(x) The two girders collapse—30th September 1980 ..	45	21
(xi) The Earthquakes	46	21-22

CONTENTS

PART III

SEARCH FOR THE CAUSE OF COLLAPSE

	Paragraphs	Page Nos.
I. SCHEME OF THIS PART	47	23
II. CENTERING OR SUPPORTING SYSTEM OF THE GIRDER—		
(i) General Principles	48	23-24
(ii) Design of Centering.. .. .	49-54	24-27
(iii) Material used—		
(a) Bamboo bracings	55-59	27-30
(b) Timber ballies.. .. .	60-62	30-32
(c) Timber sleepers	63-64	32-33
(d) Steel Cribs	65	33
(iv) Temporary Crib Stool System	66-68	33
(v) Conclusions on Centering System	69-71	34
III. CONCRETE	72	34-35
IV. PRESTRESSING—		
(i) General Principles	73-82	35-36
(ii) Design of Prestressed Work	83-89	36-39
(a) Drawings	83	
(b) Extension Chart	84	
(c) Omissions	85	
(d) Unapproved change	86	
(e) Unsatisfactory Design	87-89	
(iii) Extension of Cables	90-97	39-43
(a) Standard of Supervision	90-91	
(b) Inexperienced Personnel	92	
(c) Consulting Engineer—Mr. Diwan (Con. W-1)— Value of his Evidence	93-95	
(d) Mr. Diwan (Con. W-1)	96	
(e) Supervision	97	
(iv) Cable Stressing Book	98-102	43-48
(a) Manner of keeping record	98	
(b) Extension of Wires	99-100	
(c) Variations in Extensions	101	
(d) Cable Stressing Register	102	
(v) Conclusions on Prestressing	103	48

CONTENTS

PART IV

CAUSE OF THE COLLAPSE

	Paragraphs	Page Nos
I. EXPERT WITNESSES—PRINCIPLES OF EVALUATION OF EVIDENCE ..	104-107	49-50
II. EVALUATION OF EVIDENCE—		
(A) Need to Evaluate	108	51
(B) General Credibility—		
(i) Mr. Diwan (Con. W-1)	109-123	51-55
(a) Bias	109-111	
(b) Rational and Scientific Approach ..	112-116	
(c) Knowledge of the Subject	117-123	
(ii) Dr. Gupchup (C. W-1)	124-133	55-58
(a) Background	124	
(b) Bias	125-128	
(c) Rational-Scientific Approach ..	129-133	
(iii) Conclusions	134	58-59
III. CAUSE OF COLLAPSE—DIVERGENT THEORIES—		
(i) Mr. Diwan's Opinion	135	59
(a) Cause of the tilt	136	59-60
(b) Cause of the Collapse	137	60
(ii) The Opinion of the Panel—Dr. Gupchup (C. W-1)—		
(a) Cause of the Tilt	138	61
(b) Cause of the Collapse	138	61
(iii) Validity of Mr. Diwan's Opinion—		
(a) The Tilt	139-146	62-66
(a1) Effect of the Earthquake	139-140	
(a2) Circumstantial Evidence	141-142	
(a3) Fallacies	143-145	
(a4) " May be "s	146	
(b) Collapse of the Girders	147-149	66-67
(c) Conclusion—Mr. Diwan's Opinion ..	150	68
(iv) Validity of the Opinion of the Panel—Dr. Gupchup ..	151-166	68-73
(a) The Tilt—Cracks in the Sleepers ..	151-161	
(b) The Collapse of the Girders	162-166	
IV. CONCLUSIONS ON PART IV	167	73

CONTENTS

PART V

THE ENGINEERS—WERE THEY NEGLIGENT

	Paragraphs	Page Nos.
I. THE LAW	168-179	75-77
(i) Ingredients	168-169	
(ii) Duty of Care	170-172	
(iii) Standard of Care	173-174	
(iv) Degree of Care—Professional Men	175-176	
(v) Illustrative Cases	177	
(vi) The Principal and Agent	178	
(vii) Error of Judgement.. .. .	179	
II. PERSONS CONCERNED—THEIR DUTIES—		
(i) The Engineers of the Corporation	180	78
(a) The relationship	181-182	78
(b) The Contract	183	78-79
(c) Duties of the Engineers	184	79
(ii) Mr. Diwan and the Contractors	185-189	79-80
(a) Principal and Agent	185-186	
(b) Consulting Engineer	187-189	
(c) The Contractors	190	81
(iii) The Duty to take Care	191-194	81
III. IS NEGLIGENCE PROVED—		
(i) Proved Facts	195	82-83
(ii) Standard of Care	196	83-84
(iii) The Standard not observed	197-198	84-85
(iv) Degree of Care	199-200	85-86
IV. CONCLUSIONS ON PART V—		
(i) Engineers of the Corporation	201-209	86-88
(ii) The Contractors and Mr. Diwan	210-214	88-90

PART VI

RESPONSIBILITY—WHERE DOES IT LIE

(i) The Terms of Reference	215	91
(ii) General Principles	216	91
(iii) Application of the Principles—Conclusions	217	91-92

CONTENTS

PART VII

	Paragraphs	Page Nos.
THE SUMMING UP	218-227	93-95
(i) Centering—Prestressing—Crib Stool System ..	219	
(ii) Corporation's Engineers—Action adequate ..	220-221	
(iii) Mr. Paranjape—Contractors' Site Engineer ..	222	
(iv) The Cause of the Collapse	223	
(v) Negligence—No action to avoid Collapse ..	224-225	
(vi) Consequences of the Collapse—Mitigation ..	226-227	
APPENDICES		
APPENDIX 'A' .. Rules of Procedure		97-100
APPENDIX 'B' .. Staff of the Commission		101
APPENDIX 'C' .. Copy of Notification		102-105
APPENDIX 'D' .. Statements of qualifications and experience of Dr. V. N. Gupchup, Dr. N. G. Bondre, Mr. R. G. Gandhi and Mr. M. P. Gajapathy Rao		106-115
APPENDIX 'E' .. List of Counsel		116
APPENDIX 'F' .. List of documents produced by the Corporation and exhibited in the proceedings ..		117-119
APPENDIX 'G' .. List of documents produced by the Contractors and exhibited in the proceedings ..		120
APPENDIX 'H' .. List of documents produced and exhibited by the Commission		121-122
APPENDIX 'I' .. List of Drawings		123-124