



**REPORT**

**OF**

**DECISIONS**

By  
**N. M. Miabhoy,**  
*(Retired Chief Justice, High Court of Gujarat)*  
Chairman,  
**KAILWAY LABOUR TRIBUNAL**  
1969



**REPORT**  
**OF**  
**DECISIONS**

By

**N. M. Miabhoy,**

*(Retired Chief Justice, High Court of Gujarat)*

Chairman,

**RAILWAY LABOUR TRIBUNAL**  
1969

# CONTENTS

		PAGE
CHAPTER I	Introduction . . . . .	1—5
CHAPTER II	Term of Reference No. 1—Night Duty Allowance	
	Preliminary . . . . .	6
	History of Night Duty Allowance . . . . .	7
	Principle of continuous application . . . . .	8
	Controversy regarding basis of Night Duty Allowance . . . . .	9
	Handicaps in night work . . . . .	10
	Industrial law . . . . .	11
	Foreign railways and non-railway industries . . . . .	12
	Claim for Night Duty Allowance for Essentially Intermittent and Excluded Categories . . . . .	12
	Night differentials . . . . .	12
	Actual performance of Night Duty . . . . .	13
	Rate of Night Duty Allowance . . . . .	14
	Summary of Decisions . . . . .	15
CHAPTER III	Term of Reference No. 2 :—Workshop Staff	
	Preliminary . . . . .	16
	Avenues of promotion for artisan staff . . . . .	17
	Broad features of Incentive Scheme . . . . .	18
	Formula of man-power ratio . . . . .	20
	Non-filling up of artisans' vacancies . . . . .	20
	Implementation of man-power ratio . . . . .	26
	Offloading and private purchases . . . . .	26
	Periodical trade tests . . . . .	26
	Training facilities for unskilled workers . . . . .	26
	Promotional prospects of Basic Tradesmen . . . . .	27
	Stagnation of semi-skilled and unskilled workers . . . . .	27
	Pooling of unskilled cadres . . . . .	28
	Ban on recruitment of Trade Apprentices . . . . .	28
	Upgradation of Mistries' posts . . . . .	28
	Equation of Chargemen D and Chargehands . . . . .	30
	Quota of promotion of rankers to Chargemen C . . . . .	30
	Percentage distribution of grades for Chargemen . . . . .	30
	Percentage distribution of grades for Foremen . . . . .	34
	Grant of special pay to Foremen . . . . .	35
	Application of decisions to workshops other than Mechanical . . . . .	37
	Promotional prospects to Class II cadre . . . . .	38
	Summary of Decisions . . . . .	38

	PAGE
<b>CHAPTER IV</b>	
<b>Term of Reference No. 3—Payment of Wages to Casual Labour</b>	
Preliminary . . . . .	40
Different categories of casual labour . . . . .	41
Rival contentions of parties . . . . .	42
Concepts of casual labour . . . . .	42
Is payment of local rate justified . . . . .	43
Machinery for determination of local rates . . . . .	44
Additional evidence led by parties . . . . .	44
Precise Determination of local rates . . . . .	46
Artificial breaks in service . . . . .	47
Discrimination between scheduled and non-scheduled casual labour . . . . .	47
Differences between project and non-project labour . . . . .	49
Recommendations of Dearness Allowance Commission . . . . .	50
Comparison with rate of daily travelling allowance . . . . .	51
Summary of Decisions . . . . .	51
<b>CHAPTER V</b>	
<b>Term of Reference No. 4—Hours of work and Gazetted Holidays for Clerical Staff</b>	
Preliminary . . . . .	53
Comparison of entitlements of Field and Non-field staff . . . . .	54
Federation's argument in support of the Demand . . . . .	54
History of hours of work and holidays in offices . . . . .	55
Board's argument against the Demand . . . . .	56
Assessment of rival arguments . . . . .	56
Main criticisms against grounds supporting existing disparities . . . . .	57
Traditional factors . . . . .	59
Latest policy of the Board . . . . .	59
Lacunae in the existing system . . . . .	60
Alternative demand for compensatory relief . . . . .	61
Summary of Decisions . . . . .	61
<b>CHAPTER VI</b>	
<b>Term of Reference No. 5—Hours of Employment Regulations</b>	
Preliminary . . . . .	63
Demands ultimately pressed . . . . .	66
History of HER . . . . .	66
Broad features of HER . . . . .	67
Broad features of parallel legislation . . . . .	69
Washington Convention . . . . .	70
Conclusions on Washington Convention . . . . .	74
Geneva Convention No. 14 . . . . .	74
General principles governing hours of work . . . . .	75
Special features of railway working . . . . .	75
Principles governing hours of work on railways . . . . .	76
Examination of reasons for higher ceiling of weekly hours . . . . .	77
Distinction between hours of work and hours of employment . . . . .	80

	PAGE
Conclusions on fixation of hours of work . . . . .	82
Preparatory and complementary work . . . . .	82
Essentially Intermittent work . . . . .	83
Ceiling of additional hours for preparatory and complementary work . . . . .	83
Is preparatory and/or complementary work overtime . . . . .	85
Principle of averaging . . . . .	86
Rate of overtime payment . . . . .	89
Creation of an intermediary classification between Intensive and Continuous . . . . .	92
Classification of railway workers comparable to workers in other Government Departments . . . . .	93
Travelling spare on duty . . . . .	94
Excluded employment . . . . .	96
Characteristics of a supervisory post . . . . .	97
Excluded classification : its basis and justification . . . . .	99
Gatemen 'C' . . . . .	100
Saloon Attendants . . . . .	101
Bungalow Peons . . . . .	101
Care-takers . . . . .	101
Essentially Intermittent classification . . . . .	102
Mr. Kulkarni's objections to EI classification . . . . .	103
Definition of Essentially Intermittent employment and Mr. Kulkarni's objections thereto . . . . .	104
Necessity of Machinery for timely determination of classification . . . . .	107
Methods of job analysis . . . . .	108
Objections against existing practices regarding method of job analysis . . . . .	109
Consideration of some more arguments for and against EI classification . . . . .	116
Some more aspects of EI classification . . . . .	118
Fixation of hours of work for EI employments . . . . .	118
Fixation of maximum additional hours of work for EI employment . . . . .	119
Maximum additional hours for preparatory and complementary work for EI workers . . . . .	121
Averaging period and periodic rest for Gatemen 'C' etc. . . . .	121
Intensive classification . . . . .	122
Some important groups of Intensive workers . . . . .	125
Wireless Operators . . . . .	126
Section Controllers . . . . .	130
Staff of Marshalling Yards . . . . .	132
Telegraph Signallers on heavy circuits . . . . .	134
Certain staff engaged in line clear work . . . . .	135
Station Masters/Assistant Station Masters . . . . .	136
Cabinmen . . . . .	137
Platform Porters . . . . .	138
Staff at stations where 16 trains pass . . . . .	138
Certain junctions and other stations . . . . .	138
Station Masters/Assistant Station Masters . . . . .	138
Claim for Intensive classification of station staff at big stations . . . . .	139
Other staff at above types of stations . . . . .	141
Yard staff at above types of stations . . . . .	141
Duty at a stretch of running staff . . . . .	141

Time for handing and taking over charges . . . . .	144
Demands for changes in periodic rest and ratio of rest-givers . . . . .	148
Specimen rosters . . . . .	152
Certain split rosters . . . . .	154
Financial Implications . . . . .	154
Summary of main Decisions . . . . .	162

## CHAPTER VII

## Terms of Reference No. 6 and 7—Scales of Pay etc. of Gangmen, Keymen, Gangmates and Head Trolleyman of Civil Engineering Department

Preliminary . . . . .	167
History of pay-scales . . . . .	168
Origin of demand for Arduous Duty Allowance . . . . .	169
Connotation of Arduousness . . . . .	169
Nature of work of a gang . . . . .	169
Arduousness or otherwise of a gangman's work . . . . .	177
Gangmate and evaluation of his duties . . . . .	182
Keyman and evaluation of his duties . . . . .	187
Head Trolleyman . . . . .	188
Summary of Decisions . . . . .	189

## CHAPTER VIII

## Term of Reference No. 8—Scales of Pay of Running Staff

Preliminary . . . . .	190
Bases of present demands . . . . .	191
Mode of recruitment and avenues of promotion . . . . .	192
Duties of Guards . . . . .	193
Duties of Loco running staff . . . . .	193
Hours of duties and rest periods . . . . .	193
Methods for remunerating running staff . . . . .	194
Extraordinary duties of running staff . . . . .	197
Alleged increase in duties in recent times . . . . .	197
True character of running allowance . . . . .	201
Whether the existing pay compensates for certain special service features . . . . .	204
Relativity between pay-scales of ASM and Guard C . . . . .	204
Similarity or otherwise between the posts of ASM and Guard C . . . . .	205
Merits of the demand . . . . .	208
Modernisation of railway system and its effect . . . . .	209
Pay-scales of particular categories of running staff . . . . .	210
Summary of Decisions . . . . .	212