

**MEDIUM OF INSTRUCTION**

**REPORT**

**~~STUDY~~ GRANTS COMMISSION**

**NEW DELHI**

**1961**

## **MEDIUM OF INSTRUCTION**

**Report of the Working Group appointed by the  
University Grants Commission to consider all  
aspects of the question pertaining to the  
change of the medium of instruction  
from English to an Indian Language**

By their letter dated 25th September, 1959, the University Grants Commission invited the persons mentioned below to join a Working Group to examine the problems relating to the change-over in the medium of instruction in universities. The Commission stated that they were interested in assisting universities in bringing about an orderly change, whenever a change was necessary, consistently with the maintenance of standards. The Working Group was invited to study this question in all its aspects. The Working Group consisted of the following :

1. Shri Niranjan Singh, Principal, Mata Gujri College, Fatohgarh Sahib (Sirhind), Distt. Ambala.
2. Shri T.M. Narayanaswamy Pillai, Vice-Chancellor, Annamalai University, Annamalainagar.
3. Shri K.M. George, Offg. Secretary, Sahitya Akademi, New Delhi.
4. Shri Budhadeva Bose, Head of the Dept. of Comparative Literature, Jadavapur University, Jadavpur.
5. Shri Dharendra Verma, Chief Editor, Nagri Pracharani Sabha, Varanasi.
6. Shri Maganbhai P. Desai, Vice-Chancellor, Gujarat University, Ahmedabad.
7. Shri S. Govindarajulu, Vice-Chancellor, Sri Venkateswara University, Tirupati.
8. Shri J.N. Bhan, Head of the Dept. of Economics, Jammu & Kashmir University, Jammu (Tavi).

9. Shri S. Misra, Principal, Ravenshaw College, **Cuttack.**
10. Shri C.K. Venkata Ramiah, Retd. Govt. Translator (Mysore Govt.), **Bangalore.**
11. Shri G.D. Parikh, Rector, University of **Bombay, Bombay.**
12. Shri S.H. Rasul, Department of Geology, **Aligarh Muslim University, Aligarh.**
13. Prof. B.K. Barua, Secy., **University Classes, Gauhati University, Gauhati.**
14. Shri K.N. Sundaram, representing the Ministry of Scientific Research and Cultural Affairs, **New Delhi.**
15. A representative of the Ministry of Education.

The Working Group had its first sitting on the 15th of February 1960 at Delhi. Dr. C.D. Deshmukh, Chairman of the University Grants Commission inaugurated the Group and explained the problems that the Working Group was to consider. He was with the Group for more than an hour. (See Appendix I for extracts from his remarks). After Dr. Deshmukh left, the Group chose Shri S. Govindarajulu to be its Chairman.

To start with, the Group considered carefully the terms of reference and decided that it was not part of the reference to the Group to express an opinion about the desirability or otherwise of the change of medium. They therefore decided to confine their report to the steps to be taken for an orderly change-over of the medium, whenever a university decided to change the medium from English to one of the Indian languages.

Discussions have been going on all over the country about the medium of instruction in universities and the problems connected with a change from English to an Indian language. There would have been no need for these prolonged discussions or difference of view unless there was something in favour of each of the opposite views. Opinions on opposite sides have been hardening and discussions at an objective level seem to be becoming difficult. This Group happily does not have to join the discussion about the desirability of changing over from English medium to either (a) Hindi or (b) to different languages in different

regions of India. It seems, however, to be of the facts that have emerged during an examination of the question.

- (1) Some universities have already started changing the medium of instruction to the local language or even without such change permit students to answer examination questions in the local language.
- (2) No university except one or two has even considered changing over to Hindi in cases where it is not the regional language.
- (3) The change of the medium has in some cases been implemented with only a short previous preparation for it in the expectation that the necessary steps could be taken concurrently with the change.
- (4) There is a growing feeling that the change-over should not be hastened ; this comes largely from the academic section which sometimes is even resistant to the change.
- (5) In many cases the standard of English has been allowed to fall so badly that the younger members of the staff are unable to lecture using correct English and the junior students who cannot understand simple spoken English are somewhat bewildered.
- (6) The desire for hastening the change of the medium has the support of some State Governments and has been strengthened by the division of the States on a linguistic basis.
- (7) In all cases where the medium is being changed or is proposed to be changed it is being stated that English should not only be retained as a subject of study but that special steps should be taken to improve the knowledge of English and in at least one or two States such special steps have been taken already.

It is also necessary to enumerate the main factors urged by those holding opposite views on this question even though the Group will not discuss them. The following are some of the well-known ones :

- (1) The effect of change in the medium on the unity of the country.
- (2) The safety of the country to the extent to which it depends on the possession of scientific and technological knowledge which the rest of the world has.

- (3) The possibility of danger to the country arising out of the technological knowledge which even some small countries may possess if our own country does not possess it too.
- (4) The satisfaction of the individual arising from the sharing of the continuous new thinking of the rest of the world.
- (5) The mother-tongue being the natural and indisputably the best medium for learning.
- (6) The impediments to understanding arising out of the handicap of learning a language which is not locally spoken and the difficulty of securing knowledge through an imperfectly understood medium.
- (7) It is only a small number of people that have to know several languages for All-India and International purposes, while every one need know only his mother tongue besides the regional language if it should happen to be different from the mother tongue.
- (8) The capacity of an individual to learn more than one language when they are not spoken locally ; the correctness of the information claimed by persons who assert that it is easy for young persons to learn three or even four languages and the validity of the analogy of countries where an unknown percentage of people learn three or more languages which may or may not be locally spoken.
- (9) The large number of languages that are recognised by our Constitution which on account of their antiquity and wide prevalence rouse strong emotions which have recently been further reinforced by the organisation of the States on a language basis.
- (10) The unavoidable need for at least two languages in India—whether for all or some people only—one for local purposes and another for other than local purposes.
- (11) The need for an All-India language ; the advantage which Hindi-speaking people may acquire if the All-India language for official purposes is Hindi and the disadvantages arising thereby to non-Hindi speaking people.

- (12) The advantage of amending the Constitution to enable English being used both for All-India purposes and international purposes not withstanding some valid objections.

As already stated on each of these questions there are strong differences of opinion, but the need for dealing with these objectively is very urgent. Several people in addition to those in academic circles also hold the view that there should be no hastening of the process of changing-over. If a university desires to change its medium no one can or ought to interfere with the desire of the university—not even the State Government which by legislation has established the university, and therefore, has the theoretical power to regulate by legislation various matters connected with the university. But the well established convention is that it is for universities to prescribe the medium and not for legislatures to compel them to change against their better judgment. Academic bodies are best able to judge how the change can be brought about without impairing the quality of teaching and lowering the standards.

The University Grants Commission have asked the Working Group to offer advice in order that the Commission might assist universities in bringing about an orderly change wherever a change was necessary consistently with the maintenance of standards. It appears to the Working Group that while universities can exercise their right of adopting whatever medium they like or feel obliged to use the medium which State Governments may by legislation impose on universities, it does not follow that other universities will recognise the degrees of such universities unless care is taken to maintain standards notwithstanding the change in the medium. Some universities fear that a kind of Gresham's Law may operate with regard to university standards. If for All-India purposes or for any other competitions a degree or a class is material or is the minimum qualification, the pressure is strong for imitating those universities which progressively lower the standards to secure eligibility or qualification for appointments. Local public opinion is vociferous if the acquiring of a degree or the securing of a class is more difficult in the local university than in a neighbouring one. So the race proceeds : It becomes necessary to make it easier to secure a Ph.D. or an M.Sc. or a first class because of such conditions in a neighbouring university. Similarly, where examination marks are confused with merit and admissions to professional colleges are made by State Governments from

students coming out of different universities in the State, there may be a tendency to inflate marks by one university in order that its students may compete on more favourable terms than those of a neighbouring university. This variation in standards might become much greater, more rapid and even incapable of being estimated if the medium of instruction is changed and that too with varying degrees of preparation or no preparation at all.

It is perhaps in these circumstances that the University Grants Commission should come in for the maintenance of standards of higher education. It has powers given for this purpose ; its persuasive powers are even stronger than the statutory ones. Universities which seek to maintain high standards naturally look up to the University Grants Commission to protect them in the maintenance of those standards. It would, therefore, be necessary for the University Grants Commission to come into the picture prominently whenever any university is seeking to change its medium of instruction, not for the purpose of preventing that university from doing so but in order to assist it to change in an orderly manner without loss of academic standards.

In an appropriate case the University Grants Commission should appoint expert committees to consider what the effect on the standards of the change-over has been. Where the changes have been made so as to impair standards, the University Grants Commission should use its powers, persuasive as well as legal, to prevent a fall in the standards. This should not operate so as to interfere with the undoubted freedom which a university has, to change its medium. What is more, it is the university's responsibility which it cannot share with Governments or any one else to decide whether the preparation made for effecting a change in the medium is such as to justify its implementation without damage to the standards. The intervention of the University Grants Commission will be appropriate only when a university has not performed its duty or was not free to do so.

The Working Group at its first meeting on the 15th February 1960 formulated certain questions with reference to which they could proceed with their work. These questions were also circulated to all the universities in order to ascertain their view. The University Grants Commission had already obtained for the Working Group a statement of the steps that any of our universities may have taken with regard to

the change of medium of instruction. (See Appendix II for a summary of this.) The views of such of the universities or their Vice-Chancellors as have replied to the circular letter sent to them are included in Appendix III.

The second meeting of Working Group was held on 18th and 19th April 1960 at Delhi. At this meeting the Group indicated its answers to the various questions formulated at the previous sitting. The Group also considered a scheme put up to the University Grants Commission by the University of Delhi for changing the medium of instruction in that university from English to Hindi, for taking special steps to improve the knowledge of English, and for training teachers to teach through Hindi and for giving an intensive course in Hindi to all those students who do not know Hindi. The views of the Working Group on these proposals of the Delhi University are given in Appendix IV.

On the basis of these decisions taken at the second meeting, the Chairman drafted a report. This report was examined at the last sitting of the committee at Poona on 9th and 10th June, 1960. The Chairman of the University Grants Commission was again good enough to join the Working Group here. In addition to the members of the Working Group, Shri S. Mathai, Secretary, University Grants Commission was also present by invitation. The draft report was subjected to very careful examination particularly by the then Vice-Chancellor of Gujarat University. His view was that "It is not only futile but also highly wasteful and even self-deceptive to wait for the preparation of text-books for introducing this much needed reform in our education." He stated that the principle of free enterprise yielded sizable and competitive crop of text-books particularly upto the Intermediate level. But so far as the Post-Intermediate stage was concerned, it was felt that free enterprise might not yield equally fruitful results. By the means adopted a stage had been reached when the regional language, Gujarati, was being progressively used as the medium of instruction and examination of the Gujarat University and would shortly replace English. It is to be noted, however, that subsequent to this statement, the University of Gujarat decided to continue English medium for five more years. All the other members of the Group, however, were in favour of a more extensive preparation before a university could change the medium,



The following are the decisions of the Group on the questions formulated for examination.

- I. Books :** (a) Should a university wait before changing its medium till a sufficient number of books are available ?
- (b) What should be the policy with regard to technical terms in Science as well as in Arts subjects ?
- (c) Standard books and reference books.
- (d) The machinery for production of these books.

That books should be available in the language which is to be the medium of instruction is not disputed by any one. The question posed is whether a fair number of books of different kinds relating to the subject for which the medium is desired to be changed should be available before the change is effected. That such a question should be posed and answered in the negative by some people indicates the amazing conception they have of university education. University education as distinguished from earlier school stages predominantly consists in a student acquiring knowledge for himself through the study of books assisted by lectures and guidance with regard to the books to be read. The view that the medium can be changed as soon as teachers are said to be available to lecture on a subject through an Indian language coupled with the admission that books of a suitable standard are not available in that language and that the students are incapable of reading for themselves and understanding books written in English is an indication of what might happen to collegiate education in some places if we do not take precautions in time. University education may then consist in oral repetition by lecturers of tabloid statements on topics covered by a syllabus followed by dictation of short notes designed to be answers to stereotyped questions which alone according to both lecturers and students would be fair for external examiners to set. Students of some ability may take additional notes while the lecturer is lecturing, take down with reasonable accuracy what is dictated, memorise the dictated version and be usually in a position to answer the bulk of the questions of this stereotyped variety. Most of the other students, however, may make no attempt to listen to the lectures and even if they take down the dictated notes they may lack the ability to do so correctly ; they may, therefore, a few months before the examination, start cramming what are described as "bazaar notes" which may or may not be worse than the notes dictated in the class. If

they are able to reproduce fragments of sentences from these notes, they may secure the 35 percent of the marks needed for a pass. One thing that is clear about this type of education, if it becomes common, is that the students who have passed an examination in a subject may have very little understanding of that subject. This is the disaster from which in various ways we are seeking to protect our university education. There is no question, therefore, of our organizing university education without books ; we have to make students by every possible means to read for themselves, to understand more than to memorise and to this end we have to change the system, provide for day to day supervision of the work of the students and also alter our examination methods. It will be a disaster of the first magnitude for standards of university education and for all those advantages for the individual and the nation arising out of good university education, if we go in for a method of instruction without adequate books, which will result in the kind of collegiate education described above.

Reference has already been made to the view that to wait till a reasonable number of books are available delays the change unnecessarily. It is said further that until we change the medium, books will not be produced by private agencies and that when once the change is made they will come in large numbers because demand produces supply. But it is not clear how soon under this laissez-faire system an adequate number of books will become available to the teachers and the taught. Meanwhile what would be the standard reached by those who are supposed to have completed university education? The theory that demand produces supply is true but subject to large variations with regard to time factor and efficiency : there should be adequate commercial enterprise and adequate recognition of the merit of a good book for such books to be produced by private agencies and put into circulation. So long as English was the medium of instruction in high schools it was possible to secure progressively improving books for use in high schools. These books were produced in countries that were commercially enterprising and had a tremendous market the world over in all English speaking and English using countries. The theory of demand and supply is valid enough ; but it does not preclude the correctness of the view that in some cases uneconomic supply has to be provided in advance of demand. Over a quarter of a century ago we changed the medium of instruction to the local language in high school but text-books of the proper standard are not always available. It is not only with regard to readers and

general reading material in Indian languages, but also on subjects like Indian History, Geography, Physical Science, etc., that the quality of books available in some Indian languages for high school use is still poor.

Without entering into the controversial question—discussion of which is affected to some extent at least by vested interests—regarding the relative advantages in the present circumstances of our country, of producing books by free private enterprise and by public bodies like Governments, Universities, and Boards of Education, the Working Group is quite definite that if a university desires to change the medium of instruction it should assume primary responsibility for a continuous production of books whether by itself or with the assistance of other public bodies, Provincial and Central Governments, as well as commercial organisations.

It is insufficient if one single book covering the syllabus of a paper is produced. The University of Delhi says "As far as this University is concerned it has got its programme of having one standard text-book written for each paper in each subject, this text-book to be written by an eminent authority in the field concerned ; if he is not able to write in Hindi himself, he will be assisted by a Hindi collaborator. Until our own text-books are ready we do not propose to effect the change-over from English to the Hindi medium of instruction". The Working Group cannot state too strongly that the programme of the Delhi University in the matter of text-books is wholly inadequate and it would be perilous to change the medium with one text-book however eminent may be the authority writing it. Knowing as we do the quality of the persons available for appointment as college lecturers we must have in the language concerned a fair number of books for the lecturers to read. It requires abilities far in excess of that of several lecturers to invent the vocabulary needed for expounding in an Indian language subjects that they have read through English books and from which they now repeat in the lecture hall. It is not merely the technical terms, but the sum total of all expressions relating to the exposition of a subject that an average person borrows from his books and his teachers. It is the expert that writes a standard book ; different text-books have different emphasis and clarity of expression. A teacher, therefore, if he is diligent and has some ability, reads several text-books before he is able to express himself with sufficient clarity. It is possible that students do not have the patience or the ability to read more than one text-book,

if at all they read any. That however is not sufficient justification for only one text-book being available.

For the students and more so for the teachers there must be several other books in addition to the text-books. It is necessary to have also general reading material whether in Science or in Arts subjects. That is why the heading of this section is "Books" and not text-books only.

Since it is not possible to change the medium for the pre-university or the junior Intermediate or the first year of the three-year degree course only without having to continue the change of medium right up to the end of the under-graduate course, it is necessary to have all the books that are needed for the entire degree course in a subject before a university changes the medium for that subject. Otherwise it may be an unwise speculation to change the medium for the pre-university, hoping that by the following year suitable books would be available for the first year of the degree class and in the year following that for the second year and in the further year following for the third year. Students who have been permitted to have their instruction for the pre-university course through an Indian language and then proceed to a degree course—Arts, Science or professional with English medium will be in a worse position than those taking the degree courses at present.

Since the views with regard to the adequacy of the number and quality of books available in a subject are likely to vary genuinely and some cases may be determined by the desire or opposition to change quickly, the responsibility for deciding this will be primarily that of the university concerned. It is necessary as already stated that the University Grants Commission should come into the picture where circumstances justify this course ; but this intervention will arise only after the university has decided to change the medium. This will be one of the ways in which the University Grants Commission will perform its functions of maintaining standards in higher education. This is particularly necessary because after having stated that one book as visualized by the University of Delhi is clearly inadequate, it will be difficult to state how many books and of what kind would be adequate. The arguments on this question are incapable of being terminated save by the decision of a body like the University Grants Commission.

(b) **Technical terms** : There is a growing body of opinion that the change of medium is more easily done if we adopt the international terms now being used with English as the medium of instruction, than if

these terms have to be newly invented. It is not necessary to decide whether these terms should be called international or English. Many countries adopt them in their entirety but not all countries and for this reason perhaps they should not be called international. Just for the sake of avoiding an argument we may refer to these terms which are now being used with English medium in this country as International-English terms. While there is reason to be optimistic that on this matter, at any rate, there is likely to be a substantial majority view, it should not be forgotten that there is strong resistance from a minority. Also to some extent we may have to retrace the steps taken by translating or inventing technical terms now used by some schools. It is, therefore, necessary to remind ourselves of the arguments in favour of using International-English technical terms and against translating or inventing new terms in Indian languages. The first reason for adopting international terms should appeal to every one who is keen on changing the medium. Adopting these terms would be one obstacle less in the way of changing the medium. Not only will it take a long time for technical terms in Indian languages to be even suggested, but also the probability of securing agreement among scholars in this matter is small. Those who think that a new set of terms in Hindi will be accepted by other languages are probably unaware of opposition to them in some parts of the country. While they may be quite willing in those parts to accept International-English terms notwithstanding some injury to sentiment they will not in their present mood accept under any compulsion Hindi versions. The second advantage of retaining International-English terms is that even if different Indian languages are used as media, the technical terms will be the same for the whole country ; the difficulties of a student whose mother tongue is one Indian language but who has to receive instruction through another Indian language, are thus lessened. This will also improve the chances of Hindi being one of the alternative media in universities in non-Hindi areas.

Thirdly to the extent to which the inadequacy of books in Indian languages has to be made up by resorting to books in English, the additional impediment of learning a new set of technical terms should be avoided. Fourthly, however proud we may be of our achievement in some directions we have to concede that there is still a very great deal that we have to learn from other countries ; a great deal of this knowledge is available to us through English and English books. English journals are needed for every kind of post-graduate and research work.

It would be difficult to know in advance which of our under-graduates would reach the standard needed for post-graduate work and also have the inclination and opportunity for doing it. So all under-graduates must be familiar with these International-English terms. Fifthly, whatever may be the merits of newly coined Indian words their use in many combinations needed for scientific purposes is extremely difficult. Our advanced students can also have access with a comparatively elementary knowledge of French and German, to scientific journals in those languages if they are familiar with the International-English technical terms.

As was stated earlier the technical terms in Indian languages that were invented or translated for use in high schools have resulted in producing special difficulties to students when they come over to colleges. According to the instructions issued by the Education departments of some State Governments high school students have to know not only the invented or translated technical terms in the locally approved Indian form, but also in the International-English form. But these instructions have in general been forgotten; students joining colleges with English medium do not understand what the lecturer is talking partly because the technical terms are wholly new to them. Students should be familiar not only with the transliterated form of International-English terms but also in Roman script. There is more than one reason for this; it is being suggested later in this report that sometimes it may be necessary to set questions in English even though the medium of instruction may be in an Indian language and the candidates are allowed to answer through that medium. For this purpose and for greater ease in reading books in English it is necessary for students to know these International-English technical terms in Roman script. For even stronger reasons the numerals employed should be international ones.

This Group need not go into details relating to technical terms. The Union Government as well as some State Governments have had the advice of expert committees with regard to categories of technical terms which should be borrowed and other categories which ought to be translated because the meaning of the words should be understood.

In view of the President's recent directive it was perhaps not necessary to have devoted so much space to this topic. In paragraph 3 of the President's Order contained in the Ministry of Home Affairs' Notification 2/860-OF, dated 27th April, 1960, the President states "In the

field of Science and Technology the terms in international use should be adopted with the minimum change, i. e., the base words should be those at present in use in international terminology although the derivatives may be Indianised to the extent necessary". It is hoped that at least after this, controversy over this question will cease and the International-English terms will be used both in schools and colleges.

(c & d) **Production of books, text-books, reference books and general reading material, journals :** In the light of what has been stated earlier it is not necessary to devote much space to this. As already stated each university or groups of universities together interested in the same language should assume primary responsibility for securing the production of the books needed in adequate numbers. The Government of India, the University Grants Commission, the State Governments and voluntary organisations interested in this kind of work can help ; among other kinds of assistance financial assistance is quite important. There need be no fear of duplication of efforts by so many agencies because as already stated what is wanted is not a single book but many books. If more than one of these bodies or universities simultaneously produce books on the same subject for the same standard, it is a matter for gratification rather than regret. But the primary responsibility for the effort should be that of the university or universities concerned.

It is not proposed to describe at length the way in which the production of these books can be secured as they are well-known. The university interested can establish a bureau or a committee to organise systematically the production of these books. They can commission specially chosen persons to translate or write text-books and books for general reading. An original book by an expert with experience of teaching is of far greater value than any translation or book written to satisfy the requirements of a syllabus. Books should be written in order to enable readers to understand the subject and not merely to collect scrappy information on topics stated in a syllabus. Whether a book covers the syllabus is a wrong way of assessing its value for collegiate education. What is wanted by a syllabus ought not to be obtained from any one handbook. It should be necessary for the students to consult more than one book.

There are the well-known methods of offering prizes to discover new talent ; manuscripts or translations chosen through a prize competition can be published directly by universities or offered to private publishers. Usually senior faculty members are shy of submitting manuscripts for a prize ; they should therefore be commissioned to write books. If in course of time private publishers produce original or translated books of merit, they should receive fair consideration and should not be excluded on account of the financial interest that a university may have in books published by itself. It is obvious that there can be no termination to this effort of producing books. Even after a fair number of books have been published the bureau or the committees set up by universities should not be dissolved : publication should be a continuous process. From time to time, in fact every year, new books should be produced, any of the older books which have received appreciation should be revised and republished and poor ones discarded without any hesitation. Whatever may be the demerits of translations, certain well-known standard books must be translated or adapted. Since these translations will be done in several languages by different universities, it will be necessary to have some central machinery for securing translation rights and for assisting in the production of books economically by supplying the blocks needed for printing illustrations and in other ways. A science book is expensive largely because of the number of illustrations and diagrams. If the printing blocks for these can be secured from the original publishers for all or at any rate for more than one language, there will be considerable economy in production. It is also necessary to have some good reference books both by translation and original production.

Students must get into the habit of reading journals. Here again the fact that under-graduates are not now trained to do this, is not an adequate reason for not providing journals in the language which is the medium of instruction. Analogy of countries which have a single language and use that language as a medium of instruction does not apply to us. If for the entire country we are able to use a single Indian language there will be some hope that we can produce journals in that one Indian language incorporating, at any rate, the more important current discoveries of the world. But with fourteen languages it is not possible for the present to have that hope and every student doing anything more than the most elementary type of work must continue to depend for a long time on journals published in English. It is rarely realised how large is



the number of such journals dealing with a large variety of specialised topics of a subject. According to an American researcher 50,000 scientific technical journals are published each year. There are also 1,200,000 significant articles, 60,000 new scientific books and 1,000,000 research reports annually. English journals contain not only the original writings of English speaking scientists but also translations of every thing important written in any language in the world. This single fact should convince us that it will be many many years before post-graduate and research work can be done by people who know only one of our fourteen languages. Nevertheless, a beginning must be made for publishing learned journals in the language which is the medium of instruction. For each subject which is being taught through the new medium, the university must have at least one journal. This will contain whatever is possible for the university to translate from current journals for the benefit of the lecturers and the students. The university may also publish in the journal in the new medium, a summary of research papers produced in the university and thus help to develop the language. If there is some organisation to produce a digest of the research work done in all the Indian universities, a translation of this should be made and published in journals by universities which have adopted an Indian language as a medium.

## II. Central Universities and Linguistic Minorities in a University Area.

The Central Universities have a special position. They are presumably called 'Central' because the citizens of India to whatever State they may belong should have equal chance of admission to these Central universities. It is now recognised that it will not be 'discrimination' according to the Constitution if State Governments and universities either restrict to or give preference to persons resident in their area in the matter of admissions though it is not wise to do so. The Central Universities and now what are called 'Regional Colleges' and 'Institutions' are supposed to be different from the other universities and colleges in this respect. In a recent advertisement for admission to the Regional Engineering College, Warangal, Andhra Pradesh, the following is found: "Seats are open to persons of either sex and of whatever race, creed, caste or class. Students are selected strictly by merit from all States in the Indian Union". This announcement shows that institutions of this type are different from those run by State Governments or by universities established and supported by funds given by State Governments. If this emphatically proclaimed equal opportunity to persons

they are able to reproduce fragments of sentences from these notes, they may secure the 35 percent of the marks needed for a pass. One thing that is clear about this type of education, if it becomes common, is that the students who have passed an examination in a subject may have very little understanding of that subject. This is the disaster from which in various ways we are seeking to protect our university education. There is no question, therefore, of our organizing university education without books; we have to make students by every possible means to read for themselves, to understand more than to memorise and to this end we have to change the system, provide for day to day supervision of the work of the students and also alter our examination methods. It will be a disaster of the first magnitude for standards of university education and for all those advantages for the individual and the nation arising out of good university education, if we go in for a method of instruction without adequate books, which will result in the kind of collegiate education described above.

Reference has already been made to the view that to wait till a reasonable number of books are available delays the change unnecessarily. It is said further that until we change the medium, books will not be produced by private agencies and that when once the change is made they will come in large numbers because demand produces supply. But it is not clear how soon under this laissez-faire system an adequate number of books will become available to the teachers and the taught. Meanwhile what would be the standard reached by those who are supposed to have completed university education? The theory that demand produces supply is true but subject to large variations with regard to time factor and efficiency: there should be adequate commercial enterprise and adequate recognition of the merit of a good book for such books to be produced by private agencies and put into circulation. So long as English was the medium of instruction in high schools it was possible to secure progressively improving books for use in high schools. These books were produced in countries that were commercially enterprising and had a tremendous market the world over in all English speaking and English using countries. The theory of demand and supply is valid enough; but it does not preclude the correctness of the view that in some cases uneconomic supply has to be provided in advance of demand. Over a quarter of a century ago we changed the medium of instruction to the local language in high school but text-books of the proper standard are not always available. It is not only with regard to readers and

general reading material in Indian languages, but also on subjects like Indian History, Geography, Physical Science, etc., that the quality of books available in some Indian languages for high school use is still poor.

Without entering into the controversial question—discussion of which is affected to some extent at least by vested interests—regarding the relative advantages in the present circumstances of our country, of producing books by free private enterprise and by public bodies like Governments, Universities, and Boards of Education, the Working Group is quite definite that if a university desires to change the medium of instruction it should assume primary responsibility for a continuous production of books whether by itself or with the assistance of other public bodies, Provincial and Central Governments, as well as commercial organisations.

It is insufficient if one single book covering the syllabus of a paper is produced. The University of Delhi says "As far as this University is concerned it has got its programme of having one standard text-book written for each paper in each subject, this text-book to be written by an eminent authority in the field concerned; if he is not able to write in Hindi himself, he will be assisted by a Hindi collaborator. Until our own text-books are ready we do not propose to effect the change-over from English to the Hindi medium of instruction". The Working Group cannot state too strongly that the programme of the Delhi University in the matter of text-books is wholly inadequate and it would be perilous to change the medium with one text-book however eminent may be the authority writing it. Knowing as we do the quality of the persons available for appointment as college lecturers we must have in the language concerned a fair number of books for the lecturers to read. It requires abilities far in excess of that of several lecturers to invent the vocabulary needed for expounding in an Indian language subjects that they have read through English books and from which they now repeat in the lecture hall. It is not merely the technical terms, but the sum total of all expressions relating to the exposition of a subject that an average person borrows from his books and his teachers. It is the expert that writes a standard book; different text-books have different emphasis and clarity of expression. A teacher, therefore, if he is diligent and has some ability, reads several text-books before he is able to express himself with sufficient clarity. It is possible that students do not have the patience or the ability to read more than one text-book,

if at all they read any. That however is not sufficient justification for only one text-book being available.

For the students and more so for the teachers there must be several other books in addition to the text-books. It is necessary to have also general reading material whether in Science or in Arts subjects. That is why the heading of this section is "Books" and not text-books only.

Since it is not possible to change the medium for the pre-university or the junior Intermediate or the first year of the three-year degree course only without having to continue the change of medium right up to the end of the under-graduate course, it is necessary to have all the books that are needed for the entire degree course in a subject before a university changes the medium for that subject. Otherwise it may be an unwise speculation to change the medium for the pre-university, hoping that by the following year suitable books would be available for the first year of the degree class and in the year following that for the second year and in the further year following for the third year. Students who have been permitted to have their instruction for the pre-university course through an Indian language and then proceed to a degree course—Arts, Science or professional with English medium will be in a worse position than those taking the degree courses at present.

Since the views with regard to the adequacy of the number and quality of books available in a subject are likely to vary genuinely and some cases may be determined by the desire or opposition to change quickly, the responsibility for deciding this will be primarily that of the university concerned. It is necessary as already stated that the University Grants Commission should come into the picture where circumstances justify this course; but this intervention will arise only after the university has decided to change the medium. This will be one of the ways in which the University Grants Commission will perform its functions of maintaining standards in higher education. This is particularly necessary because after having stated that one book as visualized by the University of Delhi is clearly inadequate, it will be difficult to state how many books and of what kind would be adequate. The arguments on this question are incapable of being terminated save by the decision of a body like the University Grants Commission.

(b) **Technical terms**: There is a growing body of opinion that the change of medium is more easily done if we adopt the international terms now being used with English as the medium of instruction, than if

these terms have to be newly invented. It is not necessary to decide whether these terms should be called international or English. Many countries adopt them in their entirety but not all countries and for this reason perhaps they should not be called international. Just for the sake of avoiding an argument we may refer to these terms which are now being used with English medium in this country as International-English terms. While there is reason to be optimistic that on this matter, at any rate, there is likely to be a substantial majority view, it should not be forgotten that there is strong resistance from a minority. Also to some extent we may have to retrace the steps taken by translating or inventing technical terms now used by some schools. It is, therefore, necessary to remind ourselves of the arguments in favour of using International-English technical terms and against translating or inventing new terms in Indian languages. The first reason for adopting international terms should appeal to every one who is keen on changing the medium. Adopting these terms would be one obstacle less in the way of changing the medium. Not only will it take a long time for technical terms in Indian languages to be even suggested, but also the probability of securing agreement among scholars in this matter is small. Those who think that a new set of terms in Hindi will be accepted by other languages are probably unaware of opposition to them in some parts of the country. While they may be quite willing in those parts to accept International-English terms notwithstanding some injury to sentiment they will not in their present mood accept under any compulsion Hindi versions. The second advantage of retaining International-English terms is that even if different Indian languages are used as media, the technical terms will be the same for the whole country ; the difficulties of a student whose mother tongue is one Indian language but who has to receive instruction through another Indian language, are thus lessened. This will also improve the chances of Hindi being one of the alternative media in universities in non-Hindi areas.

Thirdly to the extent to which the inadequacy of books in Indian languages has to be made up by resorting to books in English, the additional impediment of learning a new set of technical terms should be avoided. Fourthly, however proud we may be of our achievement in some directions we have to concede that there is still a very great deal that we have to learn from other countries ; a great deal of this knowledge is available to us through English and English books. English journals are needed for every kind of post-graduate and research work.

It would be difficult to know in advance which of our under-graduates would reach the standard needed for post-graduate work and also have the inclination and opportunity for doing it. So all under-graduates must be familiar with these International-English terms. Fifthly, whatever may be the merits of newly coined Indian words their use in many combinations needed for scientific purposes is extremely difficult. Our advanced students can also have access with a comparatively elementary knowledge of French and German, to scientific journals in those languages if they are familiar with the International-English technical terms.

As was stated earlier the technical terms in Indian languages that were invented or translated for use in high schools have resulted in producing special difficulties to students when they come over to colleges. According to the instructions issued by the Education departments of some State Governments high school students have to know not only the invented or translated technical terms in the locally approved Indian form, but also in the International-English form. But these instructions have in general been forgotten; students joining colleges with English medium do not understand what the lecturer is talking partly because the technical terms are wholly new to them. Students should be familiar not only with the transliterated form of International-English terms but also in Roman script. There is more than one reason for this; it is being suggested later in this report that sometimes it may be necessary to set questions in English even though the medium of instruction may be in an Indian language and the candidates are allowed to answer through that medium. For this purpose and for greater ease in reading books in English it is necessary for students to know these International-English technical terms in Roman script. For even stronger reasons the numerals employed should be international ones.

This Group need not go into details relating to technical terms. The Union Government as well as some State Governments have had the advice of expert committees with regard to categories of technical terms which should be borrowed and other categories which ought to be translated because the meaning of the words should be understood.

In view of the President's recent directive it was perhaps not necessary to have devoted so much space to this topic. In paragraph 3 of the President's Order contained in the Ministry of Home Affairs' Notification 2/860-OF, dated 27th April, 1960, the President states "In the

field of Science and Technology the terms in international use should be adopted with the minimum change, i. e., the base words should be those at present in use in international terminology although the derivatives may be Indianised to the extent necessary". It is hoped that at least after this, controversy over this question will cease and the International-English terms will be used both in schools and colleges.

**(c & d) Production of books, text-books, reference books and general reading material, journals :** In the light of what has been stated earlier it is not necessary to devote much space to this. As already stated each university or groups of universities together interested in the same language should assume primary responsibility for securing the production of the books needed in adequate numbers. The Government of India, the University Grants Commission, the State Governments and voluntary organisations interested in this kind of work can help ; among other kinds of assistance financial assistance is quite important. There need be no fear of duplication of efforts by so many agencies because as already stated what is wanted is not a single book but many books. If more than one of these bodies or universities simultaneously produce books on the same subject for the same standard, it is a matter for gratification rather than regret. But the primary responsibility for the effort should be that of the university or universities concerned.

It is not proposed to describe at length the way in which the production of these books can be secured as they are well-known. The university interested can establish a bureau or a committee to organise systematically the production of these books. They can commission specially chosen persons to translate or write text-books and books for general reading. An original book by an expert with experience of teaching is of far greater value than any translation or book written to satisfy the requirements of a syllabus. Books should be written in order to enable readers to understand the subject and not merely to collect scrappy information on topics stated in a syllabus. Whether a book covers the syllabus is a wrong way of assessing its value for collegiate education. What is wanted by a syllabus ought not to be obtained from any one handbook. It should be necessary for the students to consult more than one book.

There are the well-known methods of offering prizes to discover new talent ; manuscripts or translations chosen through a prize competition can be published directly by universities or offered to private publishers. Usually senior faculty members are shy of submitting manuscripts for a prize ; they should therefore be commissioned to write books. If in course of time private publishers produce original or translated books of merit, they should receive fair consideration and should not be excluded on account of the financial interest that a university may have in books published by itself. It is obvious that there can be no termination to this effort of producing books. Even after a fair number of books have been published the bureau or the committees set up by universities should not be dissolved : publication should be a continuous process. From time to time, in fact every year, new books should be produced, any of the older books which have received appreciation should be revised and republished and poor ones discarded without any hesitation. Whatever may be the demerits of translations, certain well-known standard books must be translated or adapted. Since these translations will be done in several languages by different universities, it will be necessary to have some central machinery for securing translation rights and for assisting in the production of books economically by supplying the blocks needed for printing illustrations and in other ways. A science book is expensive largely because of the number of illustrations and diagrams. If the printing blocks for these can be secured from the original publishers for all or at any rate for more than one language, there will be considerable economy in production. It is also necessary to have some good reference books both by translation and original production.

Students must get into the habit of reading journals. Here again the fact that under-graduates are not now trained to do this, is not an adequate reason for not providing journals in the language which is the medium of instruction. Analogy of countries which have a single language and use that language as a medium of instruction does not apply to us. If for the entire country we are able to use a single Indian language there will be some hope that we can produce journals in that one Indian language incorporating, at any rate, the more important current discoveries of the world. But with fourteen languages it is not possible for the present to have that hope and every student doing anything more than the most elementary type of work must continue to depend for a long time on journals published in English. It is rarely realised how large is



the number of such journals dealing with a large variety of specialised topics of a subject. According to an American researcher 50,000 scientific technical journals are published each year. There are also 1,200,000 significant articles, 60,000 new scientific books and 1,000,000 research reports annually. English journals contain not only the original writings of English speaking scientists but also translations of every thing important written in any language in the world. This single fact should convince us that it will be many many years before post-graduate and research work can be done by people who know only one of our fourteen languages. Nevertheless, a beginning must be made for publishing learned journals in the language which is the medium of instruction. For each subject which is being taught through the new medium, the university must have at least one journal. This will contain whatever is possible for the university to translate from current journals for the benefit of the lecturers and the students. The university may also publish in the journal in the new medium, a summary of research papers produced in the university and thus help to develop the language. If there is some organisation to produce a digest of the research work done in all the Indian universities, a translation of this should be made and published in journals by universities which have adopted an Indian language as a medium.

## II. Central Universities and Linguistic Minorities in a University Area.

The Central Universities have a special position. They are presumably called 'Central' because the citizens of India to whatever State they may belong should have equal chance of admission to these Central universities. It is now recognised that it will not be 'discrimination' according to the Constitution if State Governments and universities either restrict to or give preference to persons resident in their area in the matter of admissions though it is not wise to do so. The Central Universities and now what are called 'Regional Colleges' and 'Institutions' are supposed to be different from the other universities and colleges in this respect. In a recent advertisement for admission to the Regional Engineering College, Warangal, Andhra Pradesh, the following is found: "Seats are open to persons of either sex and of whatever race, creed, caste or class. Students are selected strictly by merit from all States in the Indian Union". This announcement shows that institutions of this type are different from those run by State Governments or by universities established and supported by funds given by State Governments. If this emphatically proclaimed equal opportunity to persons

from all States is to be real, there should be no indirect barrier arising on account of language. But on the other hand Central universities etc. have to have some local area to exist in. Two of these, namely, Aligarh and Banaras, are in a Hindi-speaking area. Aligarh also has special claims for the use of Urdu. Santiniketan is in a class apart because of its international ties established by its founder. Delhi, it is hoped, is truly a capital of the whole of India not tied down to any linguistic area. In some of these Central universities, therefore, particularly in Banaras and Aligarh, the use of an Indian language as one of the media may be justified in the same manner as in any other university. But in other cases because of the special position of these Central universities and regional colleges and institutions of the Central Government, it is necessary to continue side by side with an Indian medium, English medium also as an alternative. In any case in no university can the medium be changed in all subjects and in all grades simultaneously. It is expected that even after an Indian language is brought in as medium, English will continue to be one of the media. In the Central universities in particular, it should be laid down as a necessary condition of change-over that in most faculties and subjects there should be parallel classes with English medium. It is no doubt more expensive to have instruction in two languages than in one. But the cost is not likely to be exactly double. In most places under-graduate students are so large in numbers that they are divided into sections. If there are atleast two sections the cost of having English medium along with an Indian language medium will not ordinarily be any greater than having two sections with the same medium. Since it is not proposed to recommend that there should be any change in the medium of instruction for the post-graduate courses, it is not likely to be an unbearably expensive proposition if it is suggested that in Central universities where an Indian language is proposed to be used as one of the media of instruction there should also be parallel classes with English medium.

In universities other than the Central ones also, the question of continuance of English medium becomes important with regard to permanently resident linguistic minorities. In addition to these, for reasons of business, Government service, etc., there are temporary residents whose mother-tongue is not that of the region. This position continues

notwithstanding the recent redistribution of State boundaries and establishment of new States on a linguistic basis. It is also true that with the new linguistic fervour public men of a certain school are anxious to use a steam roller for stamping out all languages other than the regional one. It is precisely in situations like these that some pressure should be exercised by those who believe in the oneness of India and in the need for people to move from one State to another without feeling that they are aliens in their own country merely because they have moved out of the area where their mother-tongue is spoken. The Working Group, therefore, is strongly of the view that even after a university has adopted an Indian language as the medium of instruction, it should continue to allow English as the medium for a fair number of subjects, if not for all. In universities and colleges other than Central, it is not possible to demand that for every subject there should be parallel instruction through English medium. On the other hand, no one who is a permanent resident in a State or a person who is for a while staying there on account of his parent's or guardian's business or employment in the civil or military service of the Central Government, should feel that he is not having a reasonable opportunity for education in spite of being a citizen of India.

There is a strong body of opinion which is opposed to permitting English to continue as an alternative medium even for a few subjects when once an Indian language has been adopted as medium. While they claim the right to use an Indian language as a medium of instruction they will not concede to others this freedom to have English as a medium of instruction. Some want English medium either because they consider the English medium to be advantageous or because it is impossible for them to have University education through any other medium. This is a question which requires to be considered with broadmindedness and at the same time unwavering firmness. Freedom of action should be conceded to all persons so long as it is not harmful. We cannot claim freedom to choose the language we want as the medium and deny to others the same choice. Those that are opposed to permitting English to continue as an alternative medium suggest that Hindi may be allowed as an alternative medium for the benefit of those students whose mother-tongue is not the local language. So far as the expense or difficulties to the universities by having two languages as media are concerned, it is not going to be any less if the local language and Hindi are both used as

media. On the other hand for people affected by the difficulty of not knowing the local language it is no solution of their difficulty if Hindi is to be the only alternative medium. For a Bengali coming to Poona and finding it difficult to cope with Marathi, it is no consolation to be told that he can have Hindi. Ordinarily if Bengali is not available for him as a medium, the alternative he needs is English. One reason why English is opposed as an alternative may be because it is a foreign language. Another reason why the continuance of English is opposed is stated in the remarks of the Vice-Chancellor of Karnatak University who, however, is in favour of allowing English as an alternative medium. In para 9 of the views of the Karnatak University, it is stated "There is no objection to English being used as an alternative medium but this will result in more students going in for English medium".

The estimate that more students will choose the English medium than the medium of the regional language may have been true some twenty or thirty years ago and may continue to be true to some extent in cosmopolitan towns like Bombay, Calcutta and Delhi which have a number of English medium high schools. But in other places the chances are that the number of the students choosing English medium may be no greater than those choosing an Indian language medium. One of the main reasons urged for changing the medium in universities is that in most places the medium in high schools is the local language; the knowledge of English on the part of high school students is extremely poor and they are unable to understand what the college lecturer is saying during the greater part of the first year of the college course. In one university where additional papers in the literature of the local language can be offered in the pre-university course as an alternative to subjects like History and Logic which have to be taken through the English medium, it has been noted that a very high percentage of students choose the additional local language literature paper presumably to avoid the difficulty of studying History or Logic through English medium. The fear, therefore, that English if permitted will be a dangerous rival to the local language medium is unfounded.

It is the view of the Working Group that in Central universities and institutions run by the Central Government English should continue to be an alternative medium even when an Indian language is adopted as a

medium. All the other universities should also set an example in institutions directly run by them by providing instruction in a fair number of subjects through English. The bulk of instruction at the university stage is given by affiliated colleges. It should be open to an affiliated college to offer instruction through an Indian language or English or both. This freedom of choice should not be in any manner impeded or restricted or controlled or influenced except for the purpose of maintenance of standards.

### III Teachers.

Next to books, teachers capable of teaching through Indian languages are needed for effecting a change in the medium of instruction. It is likely that in most places the vast majority of teachers know the local language. During the last two decades in many places and in others for a much longer period, linguistic and provincial exclusiveness has, in addition to normal factors, resulted in only persons belonging to the area being appointed to teaching posts. It is also known that the prospect of change-over to regional languages has led to some movement of teachers who feared termination of their services at short notice. It may, therefore, be assumed that the bulk of the teachers in any university which might wish to change the medium to the local language, know the local language. If there are, however, any that do not know the local language or knowing the local language find it impossible to adapt themselves to a new medium they can be put on to teach in the English language sections which as suggested above all university colleges and the bigger affiliated colleges should continue to have ; it is possible that a few colleges might want to continue exclusively with English medium. These institutions will absorb all those who are unable to teach through the new medium.

It is well known that even if a language is one's mother-tongue it takes considerable time to acquire facility in using it for a purpose for which one has not been trained to use it. The normal training of an individual in expounding anything is through what he has heard from others with regard to both substance and the actual words used. Most teachers start by repeating wholesale from text-books or from their own professor's notes taken down by them when they were students. It is therefore necessary that even if a person knows a language he should have sufficient time to pick up the entire vocabulary connected with and the modes of expression appropriate to a particular subject. Most men

can converse freely among friends on many matters in their mother-tongue. But they lose that ease if they have to speak in some detail on matters connected with their profession. Lawyers and teachers accustomed to speak in English want the vocabulary and the set phrases of English for speaking about legal matters or on subjects they teach.

In the matter of securing teachers for an orderly change-over of the medium the following procedure is suggested :

First of all each educational institution proposing to make the change should ascertain from the teachers of each subject whether they can, after a little while, teach in the local language ; the replies of teachers should not be based on fear of losing employment. Steps should next be taken to prepare these teachers for this new effort. As soon as some books are available they should be required to read these several times not so much for acquiring new knowledge as for familiarizing themselves with the modes of expression. Since reading by oneself does not give practice in talking, systematic discussion groups and seminars should be arranged. These should be counted as part of the obligatory teaching time ; that is, because of these discussions and seminars teachers should not be expected to work longer hours than before. These seminars and discussion groups will largely be for the purpose of giving practice to the teachers concerned in using the mother-tongue for expounding subjects at collegiate level. These discussions might reveal that one or more teachers in a given institution have greater talent than the others and in such cases the special ability of such persons should be utilised by making them take a leading part in practice talks. There should be at periodic intervals some assessment of the achievement of each lecturer. Ordinarily one year at least should be allowed for this period of preparation by the teachers after a fair number of books have become available. Concurrently the teachers also may acquire some practice in writing on the subjects with which they are concerned. They may produce a journal in the language or they may themselves try and write additional books or write out lectures which the college authorities may get printed. One of the most valuable kinds of publications will be written lectures. It is sometimes difficult to choose between a good textbook and good written lectures. The teachers can also acquire valuable experience through extension lectures. It may be ultimately worthwhile to have something akin to a training college for training teachers in using an Indian language as a medium of instruction. An indication by the teachers of a college after practice in the manner indicated above

or in any other manner, that they are ready to undertake teaching through an Indian language should be a condition precedent to taking further steps for a change.

One of the things that the University Grants Commission should urge universities to observe is that no teacher should be in danger of losing his appointment or prospects of promotion or other privileges because of the change-over in the medium of instruction.

#### **IV. Inter-University Communication and Contact.**

Inter-university communication over the entire country is clearly not possible through the regional languages. It can only be through English unless Hindi has a brighter future than can be foreseen at present. If the suggestions made by the Working Group are acceptable every college student should acquire fair proficiency in English; there will be parallel sections in English; the post-graduate and professional courses will continue to be done through English medium. These will therefore, give sufficient strength to English to be a medium for inter-university communication. Some persons hope that the All-India official language, namely, Hindi, will develop sufficiently and will be adopted by everybody as the medium of communication. Under Article 351 of the Constitution of India, the Government of India is to develop Hindi as an All-India vehicle for cultural exchange at all levels. The universities may watch the development of Hindi on these lines. This, however, is a matter of speculation for the future. But now, placed as we are with strong bias towards regional languages, we may lose our ability to use English and yet not acquire sufficient Hindi for inter-university communication. It is also difficult for everyone to learn two new languages, English and Hindi, when Hindi is not locally spoken. Even assuming everybody acquires adequate knowledge of Hindi the ability to speak and expound would vary in general from State to State subject to individual exceptions. If Hindi is to be the only medium for inter-university communication, several people may well avoid going to inter-university conferences or gatherings because of their inability to speak Hindi fluently.

Even assuming that Hindi will take the place that English now occupies in inter-university communications, we know that in universities, at any rate, there is need for very considerable international contact. For this purpose we undoubtedly need an advanced foreign language and the most convenient one for us is English. When we consider

the hundreds of collegiate teachers and thousands of students of various grades going abroad it would seem that so far as inter-university communication is concerned we shall be unduly handicapping ourselves if we choose a medium which may someday be only *national* but will never be *international*. Every effort should be made to keep English as the medium for inter-university communications because it will also serve for international ; and for this purpose university publications, syllabi, summaries of research work and every other thing which a university would like to know about the sister universities in India should be available in English.

#### **V. Books of Collegiate Standard in University Libraries.**

A necessary preliminary work before we can go much farther is to ascertain what books are now available in Indian language which are likely to be useful to students of colleges. It is not likely that this can be ascertained quickly because at the present time colleges rarely buy even such text-books as are available in Indian languages. Some kind of an organization must, therefore, be set up to obtain this information. When this information is obtained someone should evaluate these books ; the bulk of them are likely to be school text-books of a very inferior type. A few books of some merit on knowledge subjects intended for the general reader are coming out ; these have however only a limited use for college students. It may also be beneficial to arrange exhibitions of books in Indian languages suitable for use by college students.

#### **VI. Official Publications.**

Many official publications are needed for various purposes and in particular for research. So it is imperative that these publications should be in languages known to college students. It would be asking for something fantastically unnecessary to demand that all the publications of the Central Government should be translated into all the fourteen languages. Since the President's order has now made it clear that even after 1965 when Hindi becomes the principal official language, English will continue to be for an indefinite period an additional official languages, it should satisfy all the requirements of universities if all Central and State Government publications are available through English. This is another reason why every student should have adequate proficiency in English.



### VII. Multi-Lingual Areas.

Most States have one predominant group who speak one language and also minorities speaking other languages permanently or temporarily resident there. How these minorities can be given adequate opportunities for university education has already been suggested. The difficulties that linguistic minorities can have has unfortunately been seen in Assam.

### VIII. Stages of Change.

An orderly change in this matter cannot be a sudden one. A change in the medium should come by steps without completely giving up the old medium. There should be considerable latitude regarding the stages by which the change may be implemented. When once, however, a set of students are permitted to have a new medium when they join a university they should be able to complete the course and take a degree through that medium. If, in a particular subject, an Indian language medium is permitted in the Pre-University or Intermediate course, there should be provision for the student to continue to have that medium till he obtains his first degree. Subject to this colleges should have ample freedom to decide the stages of the change. Even in the same stage there should be no objection if the medium is changed for some subjects while the English medium is retained for others. This type of bilingualism according to the views of some people will be the best method of satisfying the urge to change the medium and also of promoting the interests of the country. It is felt by some people that for obtaining proficiency in a language to the extent of being able to use it both for freely acquiring knowledge from books and for communicating it to others, one should receive instruction through that medium. However good may be the improved methods of teaching English, real ability to understand and expound is easier if some subjects are learnt through the English medium. A number of people also hold the view that if it is proposed to change the medium it is best to begin with social sciences like History, Economics and Politics, and certain of the humanities whereas in the case of Philosophy old Indian learning is of considerable importance. The pace at which an institution would change should be regulated by the considerations mentioned earlier, namely, the availability of books and the training of teachers. It should not be forgotten that in scientific knowledge and in technology we are far behind several nations of the West. It will, therefore, be an act of prudence if the change in the

medium is limited in the first instance to social sciences and Humanities in the undergraduate stage. The new medium need not be prohibited for science subjects but students taking that medium should be warned that the prospect of their being admitted to post-graduate courses will be limited. There have been instances of M.Sc's from certain universities in India going to the U.S.A. and their professors discovering that these M.Sc's are unable to follow the lectures in English. Indian students even of the professional standard are required to take an examination in the States for testing their knowledge of English. We shall have to retain the English medium for science subjects at the present time. Even when a student is doing his science subjects through English medium he may be permitted to do any non-science subject that he is offering as part of his course through the medium of an Indian language. It will probably be a counsel of perfection to suggest that an Indian medium should first be tried out in one or two institutions in each language area with students who volunteer for the purpose and its extension to other institutions should depend on an objective assessment of the success of the pilot scheme. For the present there should definitely be two safeguards—first that English should continue to be an alternative medium and second that the change in the medium should be limited to the undergraduate and non-professional courses.

Bilingualism in the shape of teaching suitable subjects through the medium of an Indian language and others through English, has some attractive features. According to Dr. E.G. Malharbe, Vice-Chancellor of the University of Natal, bilinguism shows no disadvantages, both languages can be usefully employed for instruction. There is no loss in knowledge given by the other language or in progress made in the mother tongue when the second language was also used as a medium. There was no evidence that bilinguism affected intelligence. Experience has shown that the system could lead to an increase in the degree of bilinguism in communication.

#### **IX. English as an Alternative Medium.**

This has been already answered in the affirmative.

**X. Can English and another Language be used simultaneously as *Media* in the same class.**

It has been assumed that there is general agreement for the use of international English technical terms. These terms will be used not only in their substantive form but also verbal form. This itself will somewhat spoil what some people call "purity of languages" but it should not be necessary to proceed farther than this. Every language has an art-form of its own. It is true that a person who studied his subject through English, who as a student listened to lectures in English and who has been himself lecturing only through English, is not likely suddenly to be able to lecture through his mother tongue in a manner that will bring out the graces of the language. Nevertheless every effort should be made to avoid bad mixed-language. Borrowing of words however does not spoil the grace of a language. The history of every language outside or inside our country proves this.

At the same time it should be the responsibility of universities to remove all that is perplexing and unnecessary in the grammatical form of several of our Indian languages. The main reason why many of our educated people hesitate to write in our mother tongue is because our purists find fault with them for errors of spelling and grammar. If local languages are to be used as *media* of instruction a reform of these impediments and elimination of rules that have become really obsolete in actual speech and functional writing, should be undertaken by universities; if the universities fail to do this the changes that have already come into use for many purposes will acquire increasing momentum without any control. Another question to be considered in this connection is using a common script for all the Indian language; if a common script is not possible the script of each language should be improved to make printing and typewriting easier and cheaper.

**XI. Standards in English.**

The number of people who know English in our country and the high standard that was reached by a considerable number of people in that language is something unique. There is no other non-English speaking country with the exception of the Phillipines where this has happened. It is true that it was under the rule of English-speaking foreigners that this took place. It is unnecessary for the Working Group now to deal with the question of the motives with which the knowledge of English was spread in this country or whether

there was any intentional deprivation of status for the languages of this country. Whatever may have happened in the past, this knowledge of English which we now have is one of the assets of the country, politically, socially, intellectually and economically. We should not now consciously throw this away. It is however, a happy feature that those who are strongest for changing the medium of instruction into one of the Indian languages are loudly proclaiming that every college student should not only continue to learn English but his standard in English should be improved considerably. It is one of the arguments of the protagonists for a quick change of medium that even though there are hardly any worth while books on modern subjects in Indian languages and our way to all kinds of advancement is through increased knowledge developed in other countries, we can still acquire this knowledge by improving the ability of our college students to read English books and English journals even though the medium of instruction is an Indian language. There does not appear to be any reason to doubt the sincerity of these statements. In more than one State the assistance of foreign bodies has been sought to improve the methods of teaching English. Some States have also increased the number of years during which English may be taught or should be compulsorily taught in the school courses. This is a happy symptom because one reason for the acute problem that has arisen in some places is that the period of study of English in school was reduced to just two years or is even optional. It is not necessary for the Working Group therefore to argue further in favour of the proposition that the standard of English in colleges should be improved considerably, and particularly so if the medium of instruction is changed to one of the Indian languages. For this purpose it would be necessary to have longer number of years of instruction, better methods of teaching and more qualified teachers in high schools. No one should be eligible to join a college without securing a fairly high percentage of marks in English at the end of the school stage.

The methods of learning in the college itself have to be altered very considerably. We have continued from the past the tradition of having compulsorily the study of English literature and the literature of one of our languages. This part of the collegiate curriculum needs radical revision. At one time this study was intended to provide "liberal education" to the student through the study of great literature. He was also supposed to acquire the joy that is possible to an individual who can appreciate good literature. Incidentally this approach was also supposed to enable him to read and understand almost any book and to write grammatically.

It was possible that years ago, when the number of students joining colleges was smaller and the average ability greater than at present these objectives were achieved in some measure but in recent years both with regard to English and the Indian language chosen, the old curriculum ceased to produce these beneficial results. So far as the Indian language is concerned the study consists largely of extracts from two or three of our older classics besides one or two modern novels. The student is left without any addition to his intellectual equipment or appreciation of art and beauty. But the position is very much worse in the case of English. Even by the time students qualify for the degree they are unable to understand simple narrative in English without the assistance of a teacher. To take them during the under-graduate stage through courses which include Shakespeare, Milton and Meredith can only be described as farcical. Considering the crowding in colleges and the inability to provide tutorial assistance, this curriculum gives us under-graduates who are unable to write simple letters in English intelligibly and without mistakes.

Considerable thought must therefore be devoted to the reorganisation of the study of languages in the undergraduate courses. It is necessary to test every student on admission to a college with regard to his ability to write, speak and read these languages. Those who are deficient must be put through a systematic course of what in some countries in the West they call "communication". Those few, however, who are reasonably good need not be handicapped by taking a course of this type which is unnecessary for them. The Working Group, however, does not wish to enter into a field which is that of specialists, namely, reorganisation of courses in the languages in order to make them suitable for the kind of students we are getting and to serve adequately whatever is the object of these courses.

## **XII. Teaching Through English Medium and Giving Option to Candidates to Answer Through the Medium of Another Language and vice-versa.**

It is not desirable to permit students to answer in a language other than that through which they have read books and listened to lectures. For every subject it is not merely the technical words but the appropriate modes of expression that form almost an integral part of the understanding of the subject. The relationship between the words used and understanding is well known. Where it is not possible or desirable to change

the medium for all subjects bilingualism suggested earlier (see VIII) meets the situation. Ordinarily, therefore, students should answer in the language in which they have heard lectures. But if there are unavoidable circumstances during a short transitional period when a university has changed its medium for some subject satisfying the conditions suggested in this report, it may be permissible to allow a student to take his lectures through English and answer through regional language or *vice versa*; bilingualism of this kind can be only a very temporary expedient. It may also happen that visiting professors will be coming to our universities and lecturing in English. What the students have heard during these lectures should also be used by them even if the local language is the medium. A certain amount of flexibility, therefore, may be necessary in this matter for a short time.

### **XIII. Difficulties of Migration and Recognition; Difficulties of Teachers to Move from one Place to Another.**

This has already been discussed under other headings and the solution suggested is that in some cases there should be parallel classes with English medium and the regional language medium and in no case should there be impediments direct or indirect in the way of any institution continuing English medium with or without parallel classes through the medium of a regional language.

### **XIV. External Examiners.**

In most Western countries examinations are predominantly internal though in several cases they also invite external examiners. But in our country in many places the paper-setting is done by people not teaching to students in the university area; in some cases as in professional examinations, one of the two persons valuing the scripts has to be an external examiner. For the same reasons as those which justify this practice, the University Grants Commission has recently required all universities to amend their regulations relating to the Ph. D. Degree to provide for a majority of external examiners. It is possible that the plans now pending for reform of examinations may alter the position. But it is difficult to be optimistic. Even the very moderate suggestion coming down from the days of Radhakrishnan Commission that some credit should be given for class work could not be implemented. It is noted that the Karnatak University which had made rules permitting 20 percent of the

make for class work had recently to abrogate it as the marking for class work was inadequately trustworthy. It is, therefore, necessary for universities to appoint external examiners for maintaining standards. This is one of the reasons why for professional and post-graduate examinations the Working Group is of the view that there should not be a change in the medium of instruction from English. If the standard of professional and postgraduate examinations should fall still further the fate of the country would be in real peril.

For undergraduate examinations there are two alternative ways of securing external examiners after a change in the medium—(a) where there are two or more universities dealing with the same language they can draw external examiners from one another and (b) if the suggestion made earlier that from the high school stage onwards students should be familiar with the technical terms in International-English, they can easily be trained to understand questions framed in English. This will be a really safe way of securing external examiners. As an alternative to the second suggestion made above, some consider that external examiners can set questions in English and then they can be translated by internal examiners. This has the disadvantage of letting internal people have advance knowledge of the questions and this has sometimes led to difficulties. Also unless the technical terms and the language appropriate to the subject have become systematised, the translations may not be fully intelligible to students in different colleges. Questions can be set in English as well as in the local language. Some years ago when Logic was being taught through the medium of Tamil in two different colleges it was found that the Tamil Logic of one college was not intelligible to students of another college. One reason for this was the translation in different ways of the technical terms. While the difficulties of translation are reduced if international technical terms are used the difficulties will not however be completely eliminated. For many reasons it will be good if students are trained to answer questions set in English even after a change in the medium of instruction.

#### **XV. Journals.**

This has been already discussed.

#### **XVI. Nature of Preparatory Work to be done.**

This has been also discussed elsewhere.

### **XVII. Need to obtain the views of statutory professional bodies.**

There is at the present time only one statutory professional Body which has some control over the education for a profession ; this is the Indian Medical Council. It is likely that legislation now pending will give the All-India Bar Council some or considerable control over legal education. When the time is ripe it will be necessary to consult these bodies also as they have a control over the admissions to the professions and the educational attainments needed to qualify for such admission.

The President's recent order does not lay down anything definite for immediate change in the language of the courts. The President has accepted in principle that eventually Hindi will be the language of the Supreme court and that in the high courts legislation may permit optionally the use of Hindi and other official languages of States for purposes of judgments etc. It is somewhat difficult in these circumstances to know through which language those intending to become lawyers should be taught.

### **XVIII. The Medium for All India Competitive Examinations.**

Even more important than equal chance for admission to Central universities, regional colleges and institutions, is the equal chance for every citizen of India to compete for All-India Services. It is necessary that this equal opportunity should be not merely notional as it was when the Indian Civil Service Examination was held in London through English medium. It was asserted that every person from the British Empire had equal chance without any discrimination of race or religion to compete for these examinations and come out successful. It is unnecessary to comment upon the reality of this equal opportunity. It is only after starting to hold the competitive examinations in India continuing the English medium that every graduate in India obtained an equal chance. If in the near future, some one Indian language is chosen as the medium for these examinations we shall be reverting to notional and not real equal opportunities for every one in the country.

The significance of the President's order on this subject has not been adequately noted. It says "that necessary action may be taken by the Ministry of Home Affairs in consultation with the Union Public Service Commission for the introduction of Hindi as an alternative medium after some time. The introduction of various regional languages also



as alternative media is likely to lead to serious difficulties and it is not, therefore, necessary to appoint an Expert Committee to examine the feasibility of introducing regional languages as alternative media". The President has not been pleased to say anything specific about the recommendation that English may continue to be the medium of examinations but in the context it is to be assumed that English will continue to be a medium. The only alternative language, however, that may be permitted will be Hindi. Those universities, therefore, which change the medium from English to Hindi will still give their graduates a reasonable chance of successfully competing for these examinations because Hindi will be a medium for the competitive examination. In addition those candidates whose mother-tongue is Hindi may have the same special advantages which English men had at the London competition. But in universities where the change from English is to some regional language other than Hindi, the students will have very little chance of doing well in the competitive examinations. This is a matter of very serious disadvantage to the students and those responsible for changing the medium of instruction should ponder over the predicament of their students. It should either be provided that all the regional languages and English should be permitted media for competitive examinations or English should continue to be the sole medium. The President has stated that the introduction of various regional languages also as alternative media is likely to lead to serious difficulties and will not, therefore, be considered for implementation. In fairness to students in non-Hindi-speaking areas it is necessary to give them the right of studying for the competition through their mother-tongue even as Hindi students have. Fairness demands that all languages of India and English or only English should be used for the purpose. It may be considered that in relation to the number of students who receive collegiate instruction those actually entering All-India Services and higher Central Services are very few. But at the same time the number of people aspiring for them are many. This aspiration is held by the best of our students. There are, no doubt, many ways of giving equal opportunity to students from different areas, such as the quota system, which, however, has disadvantages of its own. It will in any case be an extremely sad arrangement if our best students are handicapped by the change in the medium of instruction in colleges without taking note of the medium for competitive examinations or if the media for competitive examinations are determined without regard to educational requirements. This one factor alone necessitates careful rethinking on the part of those who wish to change the medium of instruction in universities.

## **XIX. Preparation of Teachers.**

This has already been discussed.

### **Summary.**

The main factors urged by those holding opposite views on the question of the change of medium should be noted, even though this Working Group is not dealing with them. The advice of this Group has been sought in order that the University Grants Commission might assist universities in bringing about an orderly change in the medium of instruction, wherever a change was necessary consistently with the maintenance of standards.

It is for universities to prescribe the medium of instruction. It is the university's responsibility which it cannot share with Governments or anyone else, to decide whether the preparation made for a change in the medium is such as to justify the change without damage to the standards. The intervention of the University Grants Commission in this matter will be appropriate and even necessary if any university fails to perform its duty or is not free to do so.

### **Decisions :**

#### **I. Books.**

(a) A change in the medium should not be effected until a fair number of books of a suitable standard for students and teachers, covering the whole degree course, are available. The responsibility for judging the adequacy of the number and quality of books will be primarily that of the university concerned. The University Grants Commission should intervene where it is necessary to do so for maintaining standards.

(b) *Technical Terms* : The President's directive is that "in the field of Science and Technology, the terms in international use should be adopted with the minimum change, i.e. the base words should be those at present in use in international terminology although the derivative may be Indianised to the extent necessary.

(c & d) *Production of Books* : The responsibility for producing a minimum number of translations and original books should be that of

the university or group of universities concerned. There can be no termination to this effort. New publications should appear every year.

## **II. Central Universities and Linguistic Minorities in a University Area.**

In the Central Universities and regional colleges and institutions, it should be laid down as a necessary condition of change-over, that in most faculties, there should be parallel classes with English medium. University colleges and large affiliated colleges should also follow the same policy.

## **III. Teachers.**

After a fair number of books have become available in the language concerned, arrangements must be made for a period extending over at least one year to train teachers in the use of the new medium.

No teacher should be in danger of losing his appointment or prospects of promotion because of the change in the medium.

## **IV. Inter-University Communication and Contact.**

English should continue to be the medium of Inter-University Communication.

## **V. Books of Collegiate Standards in College Libraries.**

A list should be prepared of books of collegiate standard in Indian languages available at the present time.

## **VI. Official Publications.**

All Central and State Government publications should be available in English.

## **VII. Multi-lingual Areas.**

Parallel sections with English medium should be provided.

## **VIII. Stages of Change.**

The medium should not be changed at present for post-graduate and professional courses. Even in the under-graduate course it is desirable not to change the medium now for science subjects. When the medium is changed for a subject, a student should have the opportunity to adopt that medium for that subject to the end of his under-graduate

course. Subject to these conditions, there should be considerable freedom for individual colleges to decide the stages of the change. The same student can have one medium for some subjects and another medium for others. Bilingualism of this type has some advantages.

#### **IX. English as an Alternative Medium**

Colleges should have complete freedom to choose English as the sole medium or as one of the alternative media ; this choice should not be restricted or influenced in any manner.

#### **X. Use of English and another Language Simultaneously as Media in the same Class.**

Save for the borrowing of technical words, bad mixed-language should be avoided.

#### **XI. Standard of English.**

The standard of English in colleges should be improved, particularly if the medium of instruction is changed to one of the Indian languages.

#### **XII. Teaching through English medium and giving option to candidates to answer through the medium of another language and vice-versa.**

Ordinarily candidates should answer in the language that is the medium of instruction. A certain amount of flexibility, however, may be permissible during a short transitional period.

#### **XIII. Difficulties of Recognition and Migration ; difficulties of teachers to move from one place to another.**

The University Grants Commission will watch the maintenance of standards and save universities from the inconvenience of other universities not recognising their examinations. The availability of parallel English sections will provide reasonable scope for the migration of students and teachers from one university to another.

#### **XIV. External Examiners.**

External examiners can be found from other universities using the same language. It will be necessary to train students to understand questions set in English even after effecting a change in the medium.

**XV. Journals.**

Every university or a group of universities using the same medium must have a journal in the new medium for each subject for which the medium has been changed. The research papers of the university may be translated into the local language and published.

**XVI. Nature of preparatory work to be done.**

Universities must set up bodies charged with the responsibility for the different kinds of work to be done, such as production of books and journals, training of teachers, improvement of the standard of English etc. They must for this purpose obtain the assistance of Governments and other public bodies as well as private agencies.

**XVII. Need to obtain the views of standard professional bodies.**

A change in the medium of instruction for professional courses is not recommended at present.

**XVIII. The medium for All-India Competitive Examinations.**

Equality of opportunity to sit for these examinations should be real. Either English alone should be the medium for these examinations or all the languages of India and English should be permitted media. Universities which change the medium of instruction to a language which is not a permitted medium for All-India competitions must be made aware of the handicap to which they are subjecting their students.

**XIX. Preparation of Teachers.**

In addition to temporary arrangements, as a long range policy it will be necessary to work out a scheme for establishing collegiate teacher-training colleges, particularly for using Indian languages as media of instruction.

The Working Group concludes its report by repeating that it has attempted to avoid expression of opinion on the desirability or feasibility of changing the medium of instruction in colleges. The Group and its Chairman offer their thanks to the Chairman of the University Grants Commission for the time he found to sit with the Group and offer his valuable guidance. The Chairman offers his thanks to Sarvashri N. N. Iengar and R. K. Chhabra officers of the University Grants Commission who helped in the preparation of this report.

Tirupati,  
November 21, 1960.

S. GOVINDRAJULU  
Chairman

## APPENDIX I

The proceedings began with the following introductory remarks by Dr. C. D. Deshmukh Chairman University Grants Commission.

**DR. DESHMUKH :**

This Working Group is rather a large one. On the other hand the problem that we are remitting to you for detailed consideration is also a very complicated one, for the solution of which we thought we should have a comprehensive and representative Working Group. I am glad to find that you have accepted our invitation and made it convenient to attend this inaugural meeting of the Working Group. I regard this as an earnest of your intention to continue to assist us with the same alacrity, provided convenient dates are fixed for the further deliberations that are bound to take place on this important problem that we have assigned to you.

The idea of constituting a Working Group occurred to the University Grants Commission, because, increasingly it became clear that the question of the medium of instruction was no longer in the area of theory or general principles. That stage is somewhat behind us now, and practical problems of increasing immediacy are before us and are gradually confronting the State Governments, who are generally responsible for the universities and colleges in their own jurisdiction as well as the universities themselves. It occurred to us therefore that it is time now that we make a start with some detailed consideration of this problem, which in essence means, in varying degrees, the replacing of English as the medium of instruction in the universities by some other language or languages, all of which would be described either as regional or local. Now in discussing this problem, one would have to take note of what has already been done in solving difficulties of this character, viz : (1) by way of a peripheral study in other countries in the past, that is to say the history of higher education, shall we say, in other countries where such or similar problems have been encountered and (2) what has been or is being done in our own country. It is not as if we are writing on a clean slate and it is for this purpose that we collected some information.

I cannot say in regard to the general problem so much ; it requires a great deal more time in doing that kind of study, but we have information in regard to what is happening in our own universities and I think copies have been made available of whatever information we have been able to collect. You will observe that there is no kind of uniform situation in regard to this matter. The range of variation is quite wide. All kinds of changes have been made or are being made, but you will not fail to notice that in many cases the arrangements made are described with reference to subjects, that is to say it is rarely perhaps that a total change has been made at any particular level of education in the field of higher education or in whole faculties, e.g. arts. I think perhaps that will suffice to indicate that these cannot be in the nature of things a solution which will apply simultaneously and with equal force to everything in the nature of medium of instruction in colleges and universities. This, I think, to the extent to which it is correct, or you will agree it is correct and I hope is an important indication that these decisions have to be taken with reference to academic considerations and that they are not to be thought of as decisions that could very safely be imposed on universities by decisions of the State. It is not my intention in stating this to say that the State has no power. Even with my very limited acquaintance with politics, I am very well aware of the sovereign power of the State in regard to universities. If a State Legislature just makes up its mind that a certain thing shall be done by way of medium of instruction, why, then, it is in its power to do so. No court can question, but to us, on whose shoulders will be placed the responsibility of implementing such a decision, I imagine, it still leaves scope for some kind of academic conscientiousness, that is to say, we should be in a position to say "I am sorry, if you want this to be done by next year it cannot be done" ; a teacher might say "I cannot teach this, I am not quite familiar with the words, I cannot take up a glossary and teach subjects ; I shall take some time, say five years time, on a phased programme", "If you say I must do this, I will carry out your orders as far as I can, but the results might be quite serious from the point of view of the very public whose representatives in the Parliament or the local Legislature have enjoined that there shall be a change in the medium of instruction".

In any case it is not for us to consider what Legislatures will do in their wisdom. We have to consider what we as academic people or educationists or teachers or managers—shall we say managements—of higher education institutions consider is first desirable and next feasible. I imagine that the diversity of the various situations that is evident from the statement will prove to you that academic bodies have made an honest attempt to find out how far they will go. It is against this that I would, again, before I leave this particular issue, like you to consider whether it is justifiable for a State Government—I am sorry Madras is not represented—as in Madras to say; “We are going to start a pilot experiment in a Government college at Madurai, Trichinopoly or Coimbatore it does not matter where, and that in 1962 any college that does not introduce Tamil as the medium will have to do without Government grants”. On the one hand you refer to a pilot experiment; according to semantics a pilot experiment is something which will lead you to the result of your experiment. On the other hand you already assume that it will be successful uniformly to the extent of our inferring that any one who does not follow the result of this experiment will be unnecessarily irrational and must be penalised for his own judgment. This has been debated upon in the Legislature as indicating the will of the nation, the will of State or the will of the people. There is no agreement of the University that this shall be so. The Vice-Chancellor has stated that he was only consulted in regard to the practicability or the desirability of starting the experiment in one college,—to which I agree—and it does not follow from that that the university is of the view that that experiment is bound to be successful. In other words, the Government’s position is that no experiment is necessary and after a three-year period of experimentation only in the sense of making the necessary preparations, every college must be able to replace the English medium by Tamil. The State must be arbiter in these matters and if the State desires that a thing be done, well then the people must agree and it shall be done and it must be done.

We will come back to our own thesis, to solve this question. I doubt whether there is anyone in India who says that English shall indefinitely be the medium of instruction in our institutions of higher learning. The University Grants Commission appointed a



committee which recognised that this change has to take place gradually—"gradually" having a reference not to shilly-shallying or dilly-dallying but "gradually" so as to make out a fruitful kind of change, or in other words without any loss in the academic sense in the shape of deterioration of standards in the process of imparting instruction—the whole process of university teaching and learning. Change should be gradual though the pace of gradualness may be a matter of opinion which deserves respect. Unless one sets out consciously for deliberate preparations for change and indeed unless there is a kind of propulsive force towards what you are aiming at things will not happen of themselves.

In realisation of all this, the University Grants Commission too resolved that they should constitute a Working Group to consider this problem with a view finally to evolving some practical means of translating sooner rather than later what is conceived to be the general aim according to a consensus of opinion. Our languages should replace English as the media of instruction. In considering this, one has to take care clearly to define one's attitude to English. The Madras Government, in spite of the views I have referred to, have stated that it does not follow that they attach insufficient importance to English. They have also said that they are taking steps to train teachers for the better teaching of English in the university, and they hope that even if the change to Tamil is carried out—it might be by 1962—English will continue to be learned by the teachers and the students, or the students, and the teachers because the students of today will be the teachers of tomorrow. The teachers already know it.

Now, that is a point of view which will call for our main consideration in two ways. It is usual for universities, especially for science and technology, to teach more than one language no matter how advanced a country might be. Take the English Speaking countries, for instance—universities encourage their students in all fields, and not only in science and technology to learn German or French, perhaps a little Italian; and that indicates a real academic need, as felt by the scientists or the technologists at any rate. That is to say, it indicates an attitude which recognises that on this front there are no national frontiers. Any single nation cannot by itself achieve everything as has been proved by recent events. It is therefore recognised that for the higher courses of study, shall we say postgraduate or doctoral stages—it is very desirable, and almost

essential, that a professor should know at least one language, outside his own, and if this applies to a person knowing English, German, French or Russian or Japanese (to give examples within our field), it applies to us also.

The other consideration is that our languages are yet to be developed. It is desirable to define fairly precisely what is meant by undeveloped languages. The word does not denote the grammatical structure of the language. It could only apply to the diction : that is to say only the vocabulary or the stock of words available for expressing all kinds of ideas that are necessary in the modern world. Our languages may meet all the requirements of the current situation if our pre-occupations are with culture, philosophy and religion. In that sense our languages are well developed, although for expressing many new concepts we have not yet in these fields been able to find out equivalent ; and in science and technology, of course, one need not labour to point out that many more fresh words are needed. So it is in that sense that our languages are undeveloped. The other point to make is that no one language has a demonstrable advantage over any other language in India and I am now talking of science and technology. Of course in regard to arts and culture or philosophy or economics I do not know ; but I would question that claim certainly in science and technology. In this sense we would say that our languages have to be developed. That applies also to Hindi which is our national language. It is not a national language for the purpose and to the extent to which it should be and one hopes that it will also be the lingua franca in the market place, more over Hindi is going to be the official language. It has not advantages today over any other Indian language. Our situation is not the same as in Russia. In Russia, Russian is the national language. In Central Russia everyone knows Russian, and therefore this particular problem does not arise. They are bilingual. The time will come when for inter-state exchange, migration of students, conferences, seminars etc. etc. we will have to develop similarly. I think that this process will continue for ten years or fifteen years and I do not see why, when we are politically united, we should be straining to be emotionally disintegrated.

So I say that this problem which we have to solve is for other generations. I have come to the conclusion after the considerable

touring that I have done that we shall have to rely on some common medium of inter-communication and I say for another generation the medium of inter-communication will have to be English. It just happens that it is an asset which most of us possess in varying degrees, in a degree perhaps far from superior. One would not make that claim for literary purposes ; may be we have not produced work of that rank as in the USA and UK. It is for gentlemen who are experts in literature to pronounce on this. But for our purposes it is sufficient if we make ourselves clear in what we say.

Now, the question of English is not a small or easy one. It is not enough to be able to have a book in the library and open it and get the gist of it in your mind. It is also necessary for the purpose which I mentioned to be able to use that language and use it as a means of expression. Therefore English must continue to be a language not only for comprehension, but also for expression. Then if we have some agreement in regard to this point, we should have to begin with this question of what English actually we need. We know that at the moment, there are some kind of decisions in regard to a 'three language formula' a decision which has already been departed from by States through some options given to a foreign language or an Indian language. By and large, barring one or two exceptions in all schools English is taught. All one can say is that as a matter of practice almost everyone in schools learns English. We are finding that even school English at its best is not sufficient for university purposes ; the new Institute of English that has been started at Hyderabad for the improvement of the teaching of English does not aim at producing young men who are fit to listen to lectures in the college. They confine themselves to the teaching of English at the secondary level. Therefore it would be right to infer that there would be a hiatus in the attainment of English between the higher secondary student and the university student. English is the medium of instruction in many cases and boys who are weak would not get admission to college in one or two universities in the South unless they had secured 40 percent as minimum in English. In Andhra Pradesh also a boy cannot go to college unless he has 40 percent in English and Mathematics also ?

**Dr. GOVINDARAJULU :**

No, only in another language.

DR. DESHMUKH :

Any way that is one kind of expedient that is used in order to ensure that a boy is able to follow. Then one has to remember that because of the momentum of the past anything worthwhile in the library is in English. We have spent Rs. 3 crores altogether, Rs. 2 crores on buildings and Rs. 1 crore on books and these Rs. 3 crores for 30 universities work out at the rate of Rs. 10 lakhs each. Universities are having libraries of about 1,50,000 books each and the college libraries are having books of 25,000 and 50,000 each. The university libraries are expected to stock between 1 lakh and 3 lakhs of books in the libraries when we spend Rs. 1 crore. Besides, the universities themselves have been in the practice of spending annual amounts. One of our conditions that is they should not reduce their own expenditure when we help them.

Now in these three lakhs of volumes, I should say that about eighty per cent must be in English in all subjects, and to replace all this by books in the Indian languages will take a lot of time in printing, paper or in reading even, so that whether we like it or not the side reading has necessarily to be done in English. As all are educationists here, we shall easily agree that lectures are the least part of university education. They are necessary but that is about all. They are not supposed to be lectures which one should take down in the form of notes for the mastery of the subject. The teacher uses lectures as a means for qualifying, commenting on, adding to, explaining, modifying whatever it is that the standard books contain. A student has to be prepared for the lectures and then follow it up by general reading and make these studies his own responsibility rather than the business of a teacher to teach him. Instead, a student now finds it possible to give his attendance by proxy and to participate a great deal in extra-curricular activities and still manage to take an examination by relying on made-easy notes or cheap guide books. We Indians happen to have our own share of a good memory, I suppose, as a nation and this serve us well at the time of the examination and makes it easy. But the theory is that we have to supplement the lectures and tutorials by reading. Suitable steps will have to be taken to ensure that this is done. There are many places where a young person is as good in English as was the case in the old days and the books had a good circulation. But

I have also known one library in which 75 percent of the books were in some other language and not English ; in another case I have found that the reading per boy was one book per year which is very poor-side-reading. These are the instances I have come across in the course of my tours, and from time to time it strikes me that the resources we shall simultaneously be pouring into the improvement of university & college libraries are not very effectively used, That is the situation in regard to English.

It is my view that, the faster we wish to develop our own languages, the better should be our grasp of either English or, shall we say, Russian, French, or even Japanese. (I refer to Japanese because I am going to find out that what I have been told is a fact that much valuable research work has been done there. Of course the world does not know much of this. It is only recently that I am told, that the Japanese are giving summaries of research work in German or English). But it seems to be preferable to have a valuable-asset shall we say 66⅔ percent of which we still possess rather than to start to equip ourselves with a new one in which we shall never progress as rapidly as in English. Because English was the medium of everything in our school days there is a danger of arguing that it should continue to be used. It has brought freedom to the new generations and they should be given the choice, but even if the choice is made we may have to keep English as a desirable and practical measure.

We have received concrete proposals, such as those from the Delhi University, according to which this change from English to Hindi can be put across in ten years' time. Then there is the question of a local medium and a practical medium that is to say e.g. while lectures should be in the regional languages, answers may be in other languages. I attended in the Allahabad University lectures on the Humanities side and also on the Science side. In the Humanities side I found that there was no English used because it happened to be a lecture on Philosophy with all the beautiful words with which we are well acquainted. Then I looked at the note-books of some of their scholars. They were also taking down notes in Hindi and it was quite coherent. It happened to be quite correct too and I was generally satisfied that at least in that subject it is possible to teach

for that limited purpose. Then I went to the Chemistry class. The little grammatical links were in Hindi but the rest of it the teacher could not deal with because of the lack of technical terms. You will have to give a little thought as to what sort of technical terms we want. There are two views : *one*-if we take oxygen, nitric acid and other things and use these terms because they are international ; that view is strongly resisted by people like Dr. Raghuvir who say that there is no such thing as international terms. The Germans have their own terms, the Japanese have their own terms. There is therefore no reason why we should adopt them. On the other hand, there is nothing that cannot be translated properly into our own language. For Railway the tendency is to use the word 'Loha Marg'. Every body knows the word Railway. Well then we must distinguish between the cultural and the common use of the word. If you are discussing at a high cultural level then you may use the proper technical word because the world has not stood still only with the Railway, now we have the roadway, the ropeway and the aerial way. If we adopt all these also then what happens to your own language. It becomes a kind of Urdu. Therefore, says Dr. Raghuvir, why not confront this difficulty from the beginning ?

What is going to happen in this respect ultimately I do not know ; but I say all this to point out that we should be precise about what we are going to do and the stages at which we are going to do it. That means we may plan on the assumption now that our English will not be lost although statutorily the case will be like two Ranis, the Maharani will be the regional language but the Junior Rani should also have some rights. Occasionally it should be permissible to use English or to give it in brackets. If that is permitted to us of the older generation, whether it is in the Legislatures or elsewhere ; even Mr. Kamalapati Tripathi, Education Minister of Uttar Pradesh used a lot of English in a meeting the other day ; there was protest from Mr. Pattabhai Rama Rao the Education Minister, Andhra Pradesh who protested ; but finally when the Chairman asked him whether he had followed Mr. Kamalapati Tripathi, he said "yes, I followed all his English". Ordinarily, with everyone of us, one or two sentences suddenly come out in English to give force, not that it has any particular semantic meaning. My view is that we should permit teachers and students also the same freedom and I would go to the length of saying that it should be

possible for us to use English wherever we want to and that students should be given the option to answer their papers in English or their regional language, in the alternative, as they please. We are not guardians of the purity of any language. That is the business of other people. I imagine for ten years both languages could be used, so that the main purpose, which is the transmission of our instruction will be carried out and the testing of what has been passed on to the students can also be carried on properly.

I am sorry I have taken a lot of your time. I have one or two other matters to discuss but these are the sort of questions we should first have to resolve. Then the question of high school text books. Text books are not absolutely essential, they are necessary in many cases. How soon text-books, can be prepared, what place one should give to text books, how to ensure that text books are not ten or twenty years behind the time are the serious questions to be answered. Translation is a time-consuming process unless we have an electronic method of translation. Possibly now it can be done-people claim that anything can be done electronically. In any case it means a lot of money. In Japan tremendous sums have been spent on continuous translation into English from Japanese and from English into Japanese and yet the grip of the Japanese over English is not too good or too sure. In their Primary Schools from Vth Class they teach Japanese in Roman alphabet in order to accustom their children at least with the sight of that alphabet. I suppose that is all the purpose of it. In any case without it you can never keep in touch with what is happening in the world. You will have to consider all these problems. I cannot say I have surveyed the whole field of this vast subject. These are some of the matters that were at the back of my mind. I have now encroached on your time for nearly an hour in inaugurating this working group. I have an appointment at 11.30. Before I go, if you want to make any observations, I shall be glad to sit for some time. Who will set the ball rolling ?

SHRI BOSE :

I have one or two observations to make. The Kunzru Committee report says that we have to wait till text books have been made available.

That is making it very indefinite. We must begin some time. I suggest that technical terms in science and technology be taken over.

**DR. DESHMUKH :**

Therefore we have called this meeting.

**SHRI BOSE :**

To arrange committees and sub-committees and to make the excuses every time.

**DR. DESHMUKH :**

I feel that in certain subjects the change can be immediately brought about. In science and technology we shall have to be more cautious than in other subjects. I agree with what you say that we could take over the entire stock of words i.e. terminology. On the literary side you say this is the wisdom of all the ages. The words which are in the nature of proper nouns can be taken over, and also those in the nature of symbols.

**SHRI GOVINDARAJULU :**

Do you take that as a starting point? Is it not possible that we do not have to begin? Have we come to the conclusion that we must begin throughout the country or is it still open to people if they feel that they do not have to begin now?

**SHRI VENKATARAMIAH :**

I am referring to the Kannada speaking area. Terms have to be standardised before we take up this question. If each district or area makes use of these words as it understands them and if there are no definite standardised equivalents, there will be utter confusion and chaos.

**SHRI MATHAI :**

We are not here to consider detailed problems of this kind. We are primarily seeking to achieve something. This would involve I think an understanding about the function of a university in a country. What is the University's main business? Now if it is to provide certain assistance to States, you may come to certain conclusions; if you say the primary concern of the university is



promoting learning, you would come to a different conclusion regarding the methods you adopt. We are concerned with university education and we are anxious that university education in this country should not fall below a certain standards. I think we should discuss what the universities are supposed to do in this matter.

**SHRI BARUA :**

Are you thinking about any time-limit ?

**DR. DESHMUKH :**

Time limit is not the factor. There cannot be a uniform time limit. Some universities, or all universities I think, will be faced with the problem whether more than one medium should be allowed. Say the Punjab, obviously it cannot be one language ; teachers will have to know Hindi and if they know both Hindi and Punjabi, that is good. Then in other States too, there is always a fringe. Take Madras, where the Telugu population is about 12 per cent. Take Madras city itself where there are 15 per cent Telugus. For the medium of instruction in colleges in Bihar, there is a problem for Bengali speaking boys and the colleges therefore have postponed their decision to introduce Hindi by two years recently.

Dr. Pavate of Karnnatak University told me that when they introduce Kannada they will have to introduce Marathi also in North Karnatak. Therefore one has to be rational. Of course it is also rational to say that in a particular area all people should learn to speak the regional language, say Tamil, although they speak Telugu at home ; and similarly with Kannada and Marathi.

**SHRI BHAN:**

Jammu & Kashmir has more complex linguistic problems. Can Urdu be a medium of instruction ? It is upto Higher Secondary in both Hindi and Persian which is called simple Urdu.

**DR. DESHMUKH :**

Some principles may be drawn up, perhaps by a sub-committee and you may indicate the order in which the scheme should be discussed. Therefore you should have an agenda committee which will determine, in the light of the total problem, the order in which the matters can be discussed. I do think that a small committee should be constituted.

**SHRI BARUA :**

There should be no sub-committees.

**DR. DESHMUKH :**

First you should select a Chairman. Then have a general discussion which would bring out the various aspects of this problem.

**Summary of replies received from the Universities in connection with the adoption of  
Indian Languages as medium of instruction in the Universities.**

S. No.	Name of the University	Medium of Instruction in the University. If the medium is an Indian language, the classes for which it has been adopted.  (a)	If the medium of instruction is English, has the University any programme to adopt an Indian Language as medium of instructions?  (b)	If reply to (b) is in affirmative, the names of such languages and the classes for which the medium of Indian Languages is proposed to be adopted.  (c)
1.	2.	3.	4.	5.

**1. Aligarh Muslim University.**

The medium of instruction is English. Indian languages are usually taught in the language concerned or Hindi or English. (Urdu, Hindi, Telugu and Sanskrit). For Persian, Arabic, French, German and Russian the medium of instructions is Urdu in the case of first two languages and English for the other three. For Islamic Studies and Muslim theology the medium is English or Urdu. In the case B. U. M. D. course the medium is Urdu.

The Academic Council of the University has appointed a Committee to examine the whole question of the medium of instruction and examination in all its aspects. The report of the committee has not so far been received.

2. Banaras Hindu University.	The medium of instruction is as under :— (i) B. Sc., M. Sc., M. Com., L L. M., I. Ed. and all other technical courses/ Diplomas (ii) I. A., B. A., M. A., I. Sc., I. Com., B. Com., LL. B., B. Ed., A. B. M. S. (iii) Admission certificate in Music, Diploma in Music, B.Mus.. M.Mus, B. T. M., etc. (iv) Madhyama, Shastri, Kurmakand, Shastri, Acharaya, Diploma in Paurohitya Ratna.	English. Hindi & English. Hindi Hindi & Sanskrit.	The University has furnished no information under these heads.
------------------------------	--	--	--

3. Delhi University.

Medium of instruction is English.

Yes—To make Hindi the medium of instruction and examinations for the B. A. (Pass) w e f. July 1962.

The Academic and the Executive Councils have accepted the programme.

B.A. (Pass) July 1962-1965  
 B.Sc. (Pass) July 1964-1967  
 B A. (Hons) July 1965-1966  
 B.Sc.(Hons) July 1965-1968  
 M.A. July 1966-1968  
 M.Sc. July 1970-1972  
 Technical & Professional subjects. } July 1970 to 1972-75

Yes.

	(a)	(b)	(c)
1.	2.	3.	4.
4. Visva-Bharati.	The medium of instruction at present is English except in Patha-Bhavana (School)—where the medium is Bengali.	The Court of the University accepted and approved the recommendations made by the Executive Council that :— “The medium of instruction in Patha-Bhavana and Siksha Bhavana be Hindi or Bengali as far as practicable (except in language and symposium discussions). Bengali may be adopted as universal medium of studies after 5 years.”	
5. Agra University.	Medium of instruction is English but the teachers have the option to give lectures in Hindi. (Sic)	Hindi has been adopted as the optional medium for instruction and examination for the following degrees :— B.A., B.T., B.Com., M.A., M.Com., B.Sc. (Agri).	
6. Andhra University.	The medium of instruction is at present English.	The policy of the University is to have Telegu (regional language) as the medium of instruction.	Telegu will be introduced when suitable books are prepared first at the Pre-University level and later at the degree level B.A., B.Sc., B.Com. (Pass) and (Hons) as well as for the Medical, Agricultural and Engineering courses. For Law courses the medium of instruction will be the same as the language of the Courts. Teaching in Hindi will be optional at Pre-University and Pass Degree levels.

- |                                |  |  |   |
|--------------------------------|--|--|---|
| 7. Annamalai University.       | The medium of instruction is English.  | No.  | Does not arise.   |
| 8. M. S. University of Baroda. | The medium of instruction at present is English.   | Yes.   | Hindi will be introduced from June 1960 from the Preparatory Classes in the Faculties of Arts, Science and Commerce, 1st Year Degree classes in the Faculty of Fine Arts and the Diploma Course in the Faculty of Technology and Engineering. Later English will be replaced by Rashtrabhasha (Hindi) upto graduate standard. |
| 9. Bihar University.           | Medium of instruction in all the non-language subjects for I.A., I.Sc., I.Com., B.A., B.Sc., and B.Com. is Hindi. For all other examinations, the medium for non-language subjects is English. | No programme under contemplation as yet.   | Does not arise.   |
| 10. Bombay University.         | Medium of instruction at present is English.   | Hindi has been introduced since June 1955 and June 1956 as a compulsory subject at the 1st Year of Intermediate Arts/Science and Commerce examinations. The question of extending the study of Hindi as a compulsory subject at the B.A. and B.Com. examinations is under consideration of the university authorities. |   |
| 11. Calcutta University.       | Medium of instruction is English.  | There is no programme at present to adopt an Indian language as medium of instructions.  |   |

		(a)	(b)	(c)
1	2	3	4	5
12.	Gauhati University.	Medium of instruction is English at the University stage.	Not yet.	Does not arise.
13.	Gorakhpur University.	Medium of instruction in graduate and Post-graduate classes in all subjects excepting languages is English and Hindi both. Candidates have the option to answer question papers in subjects other than languages through the medium of Hindi and English.	—	Hindi (Probably the University means for all levels).
14.	Jammu & Kashmir University.	Medium of instruction in all subjects other than the languages viz. Urdu, Hindi, Punjabi, Arabic, Persian and Sanskrit in Matric, Higher Secondary course, Intermediate, B.A., M.A. & M.Sc. is English. In the case of Languages it is the language itself at the Matriculation and Higher Secondary stages the candidates have the choice to answer the questions in History and Geography, Domestic arithmetic and household Accounts and Social Studies either in English or in Hindi, Urdu and Panjabi.	Not yet.	Question does not arise.

15. Jabalpur University. M.A , Post-graduate Diploma in Economic Planning, M Sc., M.Com , M.Ed., M.A. in Applied Psychology, LL.B., M.B.B.S., B.V.Sc., Faculty of Engineering and Agriculture. } English.
- Intermediate Arts, B.A. (Pass), Intermediate Science. } Hindi.
- B.Sc., B.T. } Hindi & English.

The University has furnished no information under these heads.

16. Jadavpur University. Pending the adoption of Bengali as medium, English has been adopted as the medium of instruction.

Bengali as an optional medium has, however, been prescribed for the Preparatory (Arts) and B.A. Part I examinations (except for English).

17. Karnatak University. English.

The language that will be adopted by Kannada, Marathi and Urdu as the medium of instructions for the first two years of the College Course" (Sic.).

Text Books in the various subjects are being written in the local languages. After about five years the University may be in a position to introduce the regional language as a medium of instruction.

18. Kerala University. English.

No proposal at present to adopt an Indian language as medium of instruction. Does not arise.



		(a)	(b)	(c)
1.	2.	3.	4.	5.
19.	Lucknow University.	Hindi w. e. f. 1946-47 for B.A., B.Sc., B.Com.—but with an option to answer question papers in English. LL.B. students have also the latter option. For Post-graduate classes medium is English with permission to answer papers in Hindi.	—	—
20.	Madras University.	English.	The Government of Madras propose to utilise Tamil as the medium of instruction for the Humanities in the degree classes in one college from 1960-61 as a pilot project.	
21.	Nagpur University.	(i) English, Hindi and Marathi for Pre-University (Arts and Science and B.A.). (ii) Hindi and Marathi for Pre-University (Commerce)—B.Com., & B.T. (iii) English for all others e.g. Agriculture, Law, Medicine, Engineering and Technology and Post-graduate Courses in the faculties of Arts, Science, Commerce & Education.	No programme at present to adopt an Indian Language as medium of instruction.	
22.	Mysore University.	In the Pre-University B.A. and B.Com. classes, English or Kannada optional as medium of instruction for all other courses—English.	Kannada as an optional medium of instruction for Pre-University, B.A. & B.Com. Classes.	

23. Osmania University.	English, though the Charter prescribes Hindustani also.	No proposal at present.	
24. Poona University.	English and Marathi. English is the normal medium of instruction, but Marathi is an optional medium of instruction and examinations for the B.A. and B.Com. degree examinations and upto Intermediate Science.	None as yet	
25. Panjab University.	English for all subjects except classical or modern Indian languages. Candidates have option to answer the papers in Arts subject either in English, Hindi, Panjabi or Urdu.	No proposal as yet.	Does not arise.
26. Rajasthan University.	English. The candidates in the Faculties of Arts and Commerce have the option to answer the question papers either in English or Hindi.	—	—
27. Roorkee University.	English.	Under consideration	
28. S.N.D.T. Women's University.	Gujarati and Marathi are the medium of instruction at all stages inclusive of even the Post-graduate classes for M.A. B.Ed., and M.Ed.	—	—
29. Sri Venkateswara University.	English.	No.	Does not arise.

1.	2.	(a)	(b)	(c)
30.	Sardar Vallabhbhai Vidyapeeth.	<p>(a) For courses of study leading upto degree examinations.</p> <p>(i) Hindi or Gujarati at the convenience of the teachers and students for the Preparatory examination, with the option for teachers and students to use English.</p> <p>(ii) English beyond the Preparatory course, with the option for the teachers and students to use Hindi or Gujarati ;</p> <p>(b) For Diploma courses, Hindi or Gujarati at the convenience of the teachers and students, except in the Faculty of Technology including Engineering in which it shall be English with the option for the teachers and students to use Hindi or Gujarati.</p>	No reply.	
31.	Marathwada University.	English.	No programme as yet.	
32.	Sanskrit University.	Sanskrit and Hindi for all Classes.	—	—
33.	Indian Institute of Science, Bangalore.	English.	No.	Does not arise.

34. Indian Agriculture Research Institute, New Delhi.	English.	No.	Does not arise.
35. Utkal University.	English.	Not yet.	Does not arise.
36. Vikram University.	English and Hindi. Students and teachers are allowed to use the medium of Hindi in the Faculties of Arts and Commerce and Education.	No programme for adoption of Hindi or any other Indian language as medium of instruction where English medium is in force.	Does not arise.
37. Gujarat University.	The Statutory provisions are rather confusing and complicated and so a copy is reproduced below :—		

**Statute**

(Under S. 4 (27) of the Gujarat University Act.)

**General Statute**

(Regarding the medium of Instruction and Examination for the University).

- S. 207—(1) Gujarati shall be the medium of instruction and examination.
- (2) Notwithstanding anything in Cl. (1) above, English shall continue to be the medium of instruction and examination for a period not exceeding ten years from the date on which Sec. 3 of the Gujarat University Act comes into force, except as prescribed from time to time by Statutes.
- (3) Notwithstanding anything in Cl. (1) above, it is hereby provided that non-Gujarati students and teachers will have the option, the former for their examination and the latter for their teaching work, to use Hindi as the medium, if they so desire. The Syndicate will regulate this by making suitable ordinances in this behalf, if, as and when necessary.

Gujarat  
University,  
Contd.

(4) Notwithstanding anything in (1) (2) (3) above, the medium of examination and instruction for modern Indian languages and English may be the respective languages.

S. 208—(1) The medium of instruction and examination in all subjects from June 1955 in (i) F.Y. Arts, (ii) F.Y. Science and (iii) F.Y. Com. and in all subjects from June 1956 in (i) Inter Arts, (ii) Inter Science, (iii) Inter Commerce and (iv) F.Y.Sc. (Agri.) shall cease to be English and it shall be as laid down in [(S. 207) (1)] above.

(2) Notwithstanding anything in Cl. (1) above.

(i) A student or a teacher who feels he cannot use tolerably well Gujarati or Hindi will be permitted to use English for examination and instruction respectively upto November 1960, which as academic year would mean June, 1961 in one or more subjects ; and

(ii) Students will be permitted to choose Gujarati as the medium of examination in one or more subjects, as under :—

<i>For</i>	<i>From Year</i>
F.Y. Arts. ...	1954
Inter Arts. ...	1955
F.Y. Sc. ...	1955
F.Y. Com. ...	1955
Inter Science. ...	1956
Inter Commerce. ...	1956
F.Y. Sc. (Agri.) ...	1956

S. 209 : III (1) The medium of instruction and examination in all subjects in the following examinations shall cease to be English and it shall be as laid down in Statute I (i e. S. 207) passed by the Senate in its meeting dated 26-4-1954, with effect from the years mentioned against them :

<i>For</i>	<i>Medium of instruction from the year.</i>	<i>Medium of examination from the year</i>
B.A.	June 1957	... 1959
B.Sc.	June 1957	B.Sc. (Sub.) ... 1958
		B.Sc. (Prin) ... 1959
Com.	June 1957	... 1959
B. Second Year Agriculture (S.Sc. (Agri.))	June 1957	... 1958
B.Sc. (Agri.)	June 1958	... 1959
First Year Engineering (Civil, Mech. & Elect.)	June 1957	... 1958
Second Year Engineering (Civil, Mech. & Elect.)	June 1959	... 1959
B.E. (Civil, Mech. & Elect.)	June 1959	... 1960
First M.B., B.S.	June 1957	... 1959
Second M.B., B.S.	June 1959	... 1960
Third M.B., B.S.	Oct. 1960	... 1962
Law Preliminary	June 1957	... 1958
First LL.B.	June 1958	... 1959
Second LL.B.	June 1959	... 1960
T.D.	June 1956	... 1957
M.Ed.	June 1957	... 1958
B. Pharm.	June 1957	... 1959
M.A.	June 1959	... 1961

(2) Notwithstanding anything in clause (1) above,

- (i) A student or a teacher who feels he cannot use tolerably well Gujarati or Hindi will be permitted to use English for examination and instruction respectively upto November 1960, which as academic year would mean June, 1961, in one or more subjects, and

1.	2.	3.	4.	5.
----	----	----	----	----

Gujarat  
University.  
Contd.

(ii) the students will be permitted to choose Gujarati as medium of examination in one or more subjects as under :—

<i>For</i>	<i>From the Year</i>
B.A.	1957
B.Sc. (Subsidiary)	1957
B.Sc. (Principal)	1958
B.Com.	1958
S.Sc. (Agri.)	1957
B.Sc. (Agri.)	1958
F.E. (Civil, Mech. & Elect.)	1957
S.E. (-do-)	1958
B.E. (-do-)	1959
First M.B., B.S.	1958
Second M.B., B.S.	October 1959
Third M.B., B.S.	1961
Law Preliminary	1956
First LL.B.	1957
Second LL.B.	1958
T.D.	1956
B.Ed.	1956
M.Ed.	1957
B. Pharm.	1958

(3) Students who desire to choose Gujarati or Hindi as the medium of examination at the M.A. (by papers or by thesis) or Ph. D. Examination shall be permitted to do so with effect from the year 1958.

38. Patna  
University.

A copy of the statutory provision is reproduced below :

17. (1) Hindi shall be the medium of instruction and examination in every subject other than languages for examinations mentioned below with effect from the dates noted against each :

1. The Intermediate examinations in Arts, Science and Commerce of 1959.
2. The Degree examinations in Arts, Science and Commerce of 1961.
3. The Master's examinations in Arts, Science and Commerce of 1963.
4. The Diploma in Education examination of 1962.
5. The M.Ed. examination of 1963.
6. The examinations for the degree of Bachelor of Law Part I of 1962 and Part II of 1963.
7. The I.Sc. (Engineering) examination of 1961.
8. The B.Sc. (Engineering) examination of 1962.
9. The B.Sc. (Engineering) examination Part II of 1963.
10. The Intermediate M.B., B.S. examination of 1961.
11. The Final M.B., B.S. examination Part II of 1964, provided :
  - (a) "That candidates may, if they so desire, write their answers in English at any of the above examinations upto and inclusive of the examination of 1963.
  - (b) That candidates may, if they so desire, write their answers in Hindi, Bengali and Urdu.
    - (i) At the Intermediate examination in Arts, Science and Commerce upto and inclusive of the examinations of 1960.



1.

2.

3

4.

5.

Patna  
University.  
Contd.

(ii) At the Bachelor examinations in Arts, Science and Commerce upto and inclusive of the examinations of 1960.

(c) That for the examinations in the Faculties of Engineering and Medicine, the medium of instruction and examination shall be English until the dates specified above for these examinations when the medium shall change into Hindi.

Note :—Save as otherwise provided in this regulation, for the Intermediate and Degree examinations in the Faculties of Arts, Science and Commerce the medium of instructions in all non-language subjects shall be Hindi written in Devanagari script.

(2) The medium of examination for the following language subjects in respect of all examinations shall be as follows :—

1. English to be answered in English.
2. Hindi, Urdu, Bengali, Oriya and Maithili to be answered in the language concerned.
3. French, German and Italian to be answered in English or the language concerned.
4. Sanskrit to be answered in Sanskrit or Hindi or Bengali or Oriya or Maithili. Arabic to be answered in Arabic or Urdu, or Hindi. Persian to be answered in Persian or Urdu or Hindi. Nepali to be answered in Nepali or Hindi.
5. Greek and Latin to be answered in English or in the language concerned.

39. Saugar  
University.

The statutory provisions are as follows :  
First Degree Examination.

“That the medium of instruction and examination for all courses of studies leading to the first degree in the Faculty of Arts shall be Hindi. No teaching shall be provided through English. In the study of language the medium shall be as follows :—

- (1) In the case of English, French, German and Russian the medium shall be either English or the language taught.

39. Saugar  
University  
Contd.

- (2) In the case of Sanskrit the medium shall be Persian or Hindi.
- (3) In the case of Persian the medium shall be Persian or Urdu.
- (4) In the case of Urdu the medium shall be Urdu.
- (5) In the case of Marathi the medium shall be Marathi or Hindi.
- (6) In the case of Telugu the medium shall be Hindi or Telugu.
- (7) In the case of Hindi the medium shall be Hindi.

**Post-graduate Examinations.**

For the Post-graduate studies and examinations, the teachers be allowed to use either English or Hindi as they deem fit in the interest of the students as the medium of instruction and the students be given the option of answering their question papers either in Hindi or English.

**Ph.D.**

Same as for M.A., provided that the candidates for the Doctor's degree shall write their thesis in English.

Provided further that in the case of languages the medium may be the languages on which the research is being conducted or Hindi.

Provided also that the Research Degree Committee may, in exceptional cases, and for sufficient reasons, permit a candidate to write his thesis in Hindi even though the thesis is on the subject other than a language.

**Faculty of Science.**

**First Degree Examination.**

The medium of instruction and examination for all courses of studies leading to the First Degree Examination in the Faculty of Science shall be Hindi from 1960 and onwards. No teaching shall be provided through the English medium provided that the teachers or students may use English or International Scientific and Technical terms and symbols until a uniform standard terminology in Hindi is evolved.

1. 2.

3

4,

5.

39. Saugar  
University.  
Contd.

Provided also that the Final Year students for the First Degree Examination in the Faculty of Science appearing at the 1959 examination may use English or Hindi at their option as the medium of examination.

**Post-graduate Examination.**

For the Post-graduate studies and examinations the teachers be allowed to use either English or Hindi as they deem fit in the interest of students as the medium of instruction and the students be given the option of answering question papers either in Hindi or English.

**Ph. D.**

The present position will continue for a period of 4 years, i.e. the research work and the formulation of the thesis shall be done through the English medium.

**Faculty of Law and Other Professional and Technical Courses.**

**Professional Examination.**

The medium of instruction and examination for professional and technical courses like Engineering, Medical, Law and Pharmacy shall be English. The medium of instruction and examination for the Dip. T. examination shall be Hindi and for B.T. it shall be English or Hindi.

The medium of instruction and examination for Ayurved shall be Hindi.

For M Ed. studies and examination the teachers be allowed to use either English or Hindi as they deem fit in the interest of students as the medium of instruction and the students be given the option of answering question papers in Hindi or English.

**Review :**

The position regarding medium of instruction and examination shall be reviewed after a period of four years.

**Powers of the Vice-Chancellor.**

Notwithstanding anything contained in the aforesaid recommendations, the Vice-Chancellor shall have the powers to permit any candidate or candidates to offer English medium for even the First Degree Examination in those cases in which he is satisfied that offering of Hindi medium would involve exceptional hardship.

40. Allahabad  
University

Medium of instruction for under-graduates is Hindi as an optional measure from July 1951. The students are given the option to answer their questions in Hindi.

N.A.

N.A.

Each Head of the Department has the option to decide whether the teaching should be done in Hindi or English.

Hindi has also been accepted as an optional medium for answering the question papers of the M.A. examinations except in subjects of Urdu, Arabic, Persian, English & Mathematics, from 1959.

**University Grants Commission  
Old Mill Road, New Delhi.**

No. F. 33-43/60 (CUP)

Dated 25th March, 1960  
Chaitra 5, 1882

To

The Vice Chancellor,  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

Dear Sir,

As you are perhaps aware the University Grants Commission has set up a Working Group of 14 members to consider the question of change of medium of instruction in universities from English to Hindi or the relevant regional language. This Group met for the first time on 15th February 1960 and drew up a list of items as comprehensive topics for discussion covering the entire question of change of medium of instruction. A copy of the list is enclosed and before the Working Group meets again on the 18th April, 1960, we should be grateful if you could kindly let us have your comments in respect of these points for the reference and help of the Working Group in the course of their deliberations.

Yours faithfully,

(N. N. IENGAR)  
Assistant Secretary.

**Items for discussion.**

1. **Text Books.**
  - (a) Should we wait to start till they are available.
  - (b) Technical terms.
  - (c) Production of standard books and reference books.
  - (d) Machinery for production.
2. **Minority languages and Central Universities.**
3. **Teachers.**  
Difficulty of present teachers (information as to how many can now teach).
4. **Inter University communication and contact.**
5. **Estimate of books of collegiate standard in university libraries.**
6. **Official publications—languages.**
7. **Multi-lingual areas.**
8. **Stages of Change.**
  - (a) Different levels.
  - (b) Different subjects and areas.
9. **English as an alternative medium.**
10. **Can English and another language be used simultaneously as media in the same class.**
11. **Standards in English.**
12. **Teaching through English medium and option given to candidates to answer through the medium of another language and vice-versa.**
13. (a) **Difficulties of migration and recognition.**  
(b) **Difficulties of teachers to move from one place to another.**
14. **External Examiners.**
15. **Journals.**
16. **Nature of preparatory work.**
17. **Need to obtain views of Statutory Professional Organisations.**
18. **All India Competitive Examinations—Medium.**

**Views of the Calcutta University on the question of change  
of medium of instruction with reference to University  
Grants Commission letter No. F. 33-43/60 (CUP)  
dated 25th March, 1960.**

“With reference to your letter No F. 33-43/60/CUP dated 25.3.60, I am desired to inform you that the Academic Council of this University unanimously accepted the proposal that regional language should be the medium of instruction and examinations in the university education in the Sciences, Humanities Commerce and Law at all stages and a committee was set up to devise ways and means for the introduction of the regional languages as the medium of instruction and examination at different stages in the university. The committee made the following recommendations which have been accepted by the Academic Council.

That the committee recommended that the colleges should be given the option of using Bengali as the medium of instruction in I A., B.A. (Pass), B. Com. and B T. classes, wherever possible.

That the Boards of Undergraduate Studies in different subjects be requested to suggest names of experts who may be entrusted with the work of compiling suitable ‘Paribhasha’ for different scientific and technical terms.

Each committee of experts, as suggested by the different Boards of Undergraduate Studies, be requested to admit to the respective Boards the Paribhasha of different terms after consultation of the available literature in Bengali or other Indian languages. The work of compiling such a ‘Paribhasha’ is to be completed within one year.

A Co-ordinate Committee consisting of five members, at least one of whom should be a specialist, in linguistics and a Sanskrit scholar be constituted to review the ‘Paribhasha’ compiled by the committee of experts.

After review by the Co ordinate Committee, the reports are to be considered by the respective Boards of Studies or group of Boards of Studies before submission to the relevant faculties and the Academic Council.

Standard text-books should be made available in Bengali in all the branches of study, there being very few such books available at present. The work of preparing standard text-books in different branches of study will be sponsored and subsidised by the university. As the first steps in this regard, attempt should be made during the next year to complete five standard books—two in Arts subjects and three in Science subjects. The work of preparation of these books will be entrusted by the respective Boards of Studies to competent scholars who before the completion of the work may have the benefit of the draft report of the Paribhasha committee. The details of practical steps which must be taken for preparation and publication of the standard text-books will have to be worked out by the syndicate.

Translation of standard works should also be undertaken and enquiries be made of the Central and State Governments as to the implication of the present copyright laws and ways and means are to be devised for getting permission to have the standard text-books translated”.



**Views of the Roorkee University on the question of change  
of medium of instruction with reference to University  
Grants Commission letter No. F. 33-43/60 (CUP)  
dated 25th March, 1960.**

- “1. (a) It is absolutely essential that there should exist some text books before the change in the medium of instruction is under-taken. It is suggested that to start with translation of standard text-books in English may be taken in hand and carried on as far as possible within a time limit of three years. The change in the medium of instruction should then gradually start after the lapse of the three years period.
- (b) It is very desirable that one technical terminology be developed for the country as a whole even if the instruction in State colleges is given in the regional languages. For the transition period English terminology as well as Hindi terminology should be used side by side. The Institution of Engineers (India) are attempting to develop the technical terminology in sanskritised Hindi. It may be expected that in the next one year or so the work may be completed and it may be possible to start the change in the medium of instruction at the end of three years period.
- (c) A start should be made with translation of good books in English and at the same time incentives in the form of substantial royalties and subsidised printing may be provided in the meantime to encourage writing of books in Indian languages.
- (d) It will be necessary to establish a central co-ordinating authority which should undertake the task of selecting suitable authors and selection of suitable books for translation in order to give an impetus to the task of producing text books in Indian languages. It should also be ensured that whatever may be the language of the book the terminology used is the same. This University is anxious to contribute its share in the national effort.

2. The medium of instruction in Central Universities should be Hindi, in State Universities the regional languages may be used. In a State where there is a minority of people speaking different language such minority should be given facilities for education, in the adjoining State where their language is in use. This would cover practically all the cases in the country. In any one university the use of more than one language as a medium of instruction will cause confusion.
3. There is a large body of students at the diploma level and some students even at the undergraduate level who do not understand the lectures in English fully. At the same time the standard of English spoken by some of the new members of staff is also not good. Therefore, we are going to face difficulties very soon that the teachers cannot speak English properly nor can the students understand it. Therefore, even though there is going to be considerable difficulty in the change, yet it seems to be essential that this difficulty should be faced rather than trying to retain English as the medium of instruction for ever. In the transition period it may be useful to use mixed language (Basic language being Hindi but technical terms and stray words may be in English). At the same time it may be mentioned that this type of change will increase the burden of the staff. Therefore, some increase in staff may be necessary to accelerate the process in the transition period.

We should ensure that standard of teaching of Hindi & English remains good right from the school.

In universities where there is no Hindi faculty some Hindi teachers may be provided.

4. Inter-University communication and contact may remain in English for the next three years. Then there may be a transition period of two to three years. Ultimately, it should only be in Hindi.
5. There are at present practically no technical books of collegiate standard in Indian languages in university libraries.

6. The official publication will be published in English as well as in Hindi for a few years and this may change over to Hindi only after five years or so.
7. In multilingual areas Hindi should be used unless there is a majority language different from Hindi.
8. (a) The start should be made from diploma level proceeding to under-graduate level and ultimately to post-graduate level but the total period of change to reach post-graduate level may be five to ten years.  
(b) The descriptive subjects should be taken up first and analytical subjects should be taken afterwards. The change in all areas should be undertaken simultaneously.
9. After a period of transition English should not remain as an alternative medium. But it may continue to be taken as an additional language so that foreign literature may be consulted. Standard of proficiency should be such that the technical literature in English could be understood and one should be able to fairly express himself in English.
10. More than one language will confuse a teacher but a mixed language in the first few years in which technical terms are used in English and the explanatory matter in the regional language could be used.
11. See question 9.
12. Giving the option to students to adopt English or other languages will create confusion and this should not be permissible. For a few years in the transition period, the language used may be mixed with English. Depending upon the books available, some papers may have to be in English, others in Hindi or local language. There should, however, be no option.
13. (a) Whenever a student wishes to migrate from one place to another he should learn the language that may be in the university where he intends to join.  
(b) Same as above.

14. Only such persons should be obtained as examiners who understand the language unless it were possible to have the national language as the medium of instruction in all technical universities and colleges which would solve the problems raised by questions 13 and 14.
15. Journals should be published in Hindi as far as possible but also in other languages if there is sufficient demand. This change may be brought about in about five years' time. During this period they may be published both in English and Hindi.
16. The University Grants Commission in conjunction with universities may start translation from English to Hindi.
17. Yes.
18. It will be absolutely necessary that we have only one medium of All India Competitive Examinations and after the period of transition it will have to be the national language, but in order to eliminate disadvantages that the candidates from non-Hindi regions may suffer from, the proficiency in Hindi should not be the criterion for awarding marks. The candidate should be able to translate his ideas and that should be quite enough. It will not be possible to properly co-ordinate and maintain same standard of marking if different languages are used. Therefore, Hindi should be the only medium of examination after the transition period."

**Views of the Osmania University on the question of change  
of medium of instruction with reference to University  
Grants Commission letter No. F. 33-43/60 ( CUP )  
dated 25th March, 1960.**

**“In the meantime, since you require a reply by the 18th of this month, I wish to inform you that the consensus of opinion in this regard seems to be that it is premature to think of changing the medium of instruction either to Hindi or to the regional language, particularly in the South”.**

**Views of the S.N.D.T. Women's University on the question of change of medium of instruction with reference to University Grants Commission letter No. F. 33-43/60 (CUP) dated 25th March, 1960.**

**1. Text-Books**

(a) Should we wait to start till they are available.

(b) Technical terms.

(c) Production of standard books and reference books.

(d) Machinery for production

**2. Minority languages and Central Universities.**

**1. Answer**

(a) The process of introducing regional or Hindi medium should proceed simultaneously with text-books, and publication of necessary books should be expedited.

(b) Important technical terms should not be translated but the same be kept and understood—the terms to be written in a common script. By coining terms for ordinary words which have come in usage we make it difficult to be understood. (Technical Term—or word—Tennis etc.)

(c) They should be immediately translated.

(d) Government should and the universities should also undertake. All universities should co-operate so as not to duplicate the work.

2. It is a complex question. This depends on the principle accepted—whether Hindi or mother-tongue be kept at universities. It involves great financial burden to cater for all minority languages.

3. Teachers.  
Difficulty of present teachers.  
(Information as to how many can now teach).
4. Inter-University communication and contact.
5. Estimate of books of collegiate standard in university libraries.
6. Official publications—languages
7. Multi-lingual areas.
8. Stages of Change.  
(a) Different Levels.  
(b) Different subjects and areas.
3. S.N.D.T. has teachers who can teach in mother-tongue. But unless teachers are forced to do this and trained, the goal will not be achieved. For change over of teaching a period of 3 to 4 years be given. 50-55 be allowed to teach in English.
4. There must be one common language for this purpose—Either Hindi or English.
5. nil
6. If the Union Government is going to split up the country on linguistic basis, it will be necessary to have one common language for official purpose. It should be Hindi or English for some time. This means all students must be taught that language—common throughout the country.
7. S.N.D.T. imparts instructions through two main languages of the students - Gujarati and Marathi. But financially it is not possible to cater to all language groups, though arrangements could be made to examine private students in their own language.
8. In Humanities, change could be effected immediately upto graduate level.

9. English as an alternative medium.
9. The students may be allowed at higher examinations the option of answering in English for some time.
10. Can English and other language be used simultaneously as media in the same class.
10. Ideally it is not desirable—but as we stand today, certain aid of English has to be taken. Even in future as publications in regional language may not be able to keep pace with new inventions and new scientific books—the teachers will have to refer to English books. As such English will creep in, so knowledge of English is essential for aid in teaching.
11. Standards in English.
11. The standard is very poor. It needs to be raised—English as a language should be known by students for comprehension.
12. Teaching through English medium and option given to candidates to answer through the medium of another language and vice-versa.
12. Most of the universities have changed over to mother-tongue medium and there is no doubt that a person if taught throughout in mother-tongue would automatically answer better in that language. Yet, there can be no harm in giving them option to answer in English. medical & technical subjects could be taught in English.
13. (a) Difficulties of migration and recognition.
13. Great difficulty will have to be faced—migration will be nearly



- (b) Difficulties of teachers to move from one place to another. Impossible with regional languages at university level. Reciprocating and exchange of teachers will be very difficult. This would lead to disintegration. Lectures in Hindi be given.
14. External Examiners. 14. Would be difficult to have external examiners.
15. Journals. 15. Journals will not be read by all.
16. Nature of preparatory work. 16. Suitable text-books, suitable teachers with necessary languages.
17. Need to obtain views of Statutory Professional Organisations. 17.
18. All India Competitive Examinations—Medium. 18. Any one common language—Hindi to maintain standard or any other.

**Views of the Sardar Vallabhbhai Vidyapeeth on the question of change of medium of instruction with reference to University Grants Commission letter No. F. 33-43/60- (CUP) dated 25th March, 1960.**

- “1. (a) It is impossible to start a change in the medium of instruction and examination without suitable text books being made available; but one need not wait till all the text books are ready. It is possible to start year after year progressively and also facultywise as and when text books get ready. We should immediately start the work of preparation of text-books. I believe they are already available in some of the subjects in Hindi and some other languages also.
- (b) We should not attempt to translate all technical terms. It would be advisable to employ common technical terminology, which may at present continue to be English.
- (c) Standard books and reference books could be both translated as also prepared by those who have mastered the subjects.
- (d) The machinery for production could be the Government of India, the University Grants Commission, the State Government, the Universities, the Colleges as also the individuals. There may not be any hard and fast rule regarding the machinery. It should be dependent upon the convenience and circumstances in each case.
2. For the minority languages and Central Universities, the same principles should apply. I should personally prefer Hindi as the medium of instruction at the collegiate stage and also for post-graduate work. That might help a free flow of students and the teachers as also provide a good opportunity for preparation of text books without making the number of copies too small on account of a limited number of students using them.

3. The present teachers might find it difficult to switch over to Hindi or the regional language; but if they seriously try to take up the matter, looking to the comparatively higher calibre of post-graduate and collegiate teachers, it may not be so difficult for them to switch over to languages other than English after a few years' efforts.
4. Inter-University communication and contact could be through Hindi, which in all the cases should be developed to a degree comparable with English.
5. At present the number of such books would be limited; but the libraries could be gradually built up when a decision to switch over to languages other than English is taken and seriously followed up.
6. Official publications should be in Hindi and regional languages.
7. Multi-lingual areas may have institutions conducting their courses in the various languages, where each language-group justifies the running of a separate institution or institutions. The other alternative for them is to accept Hindi, which may bind them all.
8. The stages will depend upon the possibility of getting text books and teachers in the language and subjects decided upon. The priority and stages will have to be determined in each case looking to the conditions of the university and the area of the colleges.
9. English language, if it continues to be an alternative medium, will work as a brake on switching over to Hindi or to regional language. A beginning in that case will never be made. But it could be provided that English might continue as an alternative medium for the first five years or so, during which period, the necessary preparations are completed.
10. Simultaneous use of English and other language in the same class in the initial stages might be permitted; but it will depend upon the availability of staff and funds for conducting two parallel streams.

11. Standards in English could be maintained only if the attention to English both at the secondary stage and the collegiate stage is paid to a much higher degree than is done at present. It may be possible to make arrangements for an intensive course in English for those students, who would like to master the language. This could be begun from the higher standards in the secondary schools.
12. Such an option might be made available as a stop-gap arrangement; but subsequently, there should be only one definite medium.
13. If Hindi is made compulsory for all universities, and all States start providing for instruction in Hindi right from the beginning of the secondary school, it may not be very difficult for students or teachers to work elsewhere also if they are permitted to use Hindi as the medium.
14. External examiners would be possible for Hindi in all cases and for the regional languages to a certain extent, where the other universities also have teachers knowing the particular regional language.
15. Journals will have mainly to be in Hindi. The necessary reproductions of useful articles from these journals in the regional languages and vice versa should also be possible.
16. This is covered by the previous comments.
17. The opinions of the statutory professional organisations could be invited and an attempt might be made to meet their difficulties and objections in the actual work of switching over to languages other than English.
18. All India competitive examinations should provide both Hindi and the regional languages as media of examinations."

**Views of the Poona University on the question of change of  
medium of instruction with reference to University  
Grants Commission letter No F. 33-43/60 (CUP)  
dated 25th March, 1960.**

"In this connection I am directed to say that the Vice-Chancellor is unable to offer any comments in respect of the points mentioned in the accompaniment to your letter under reference. However, the factual position regarding the medium of instruction as far as this University is concerned, is as follows :—

As an optional medium of instruction for all University examinations leading to and including the B.A. and B. Com. examinations the use of Marathi is permitted. Marathi is also allowed as an optional medium of instruction for non-science subjects at the B.Sc. Examination to be taken under the revised three-year degree course. For the old course, Marathi used to be allowed as an optional medium of instruction for science as well as non-science subjects up to Intermediate Science examination. The medium of instruction continues to be English for all post-graduate examinations and instruction."

Views of the Mysore University on the question of change  
of medium of instruction with reference to University  
Grants Commission letter No. F. 33-43/60 (CUP)  
dated 25th March, 1960.

Comments

1. Text Books.

(a) Should we wait till  
they are available.

The change over of the medium of instruction from English to the regional language, need not wait for the availability of text-books in the market. The production and publication of books of utility is dependent upon the availability of the market. Instead of waiting for the arrival of text books it is the duty of every university to establish Ad-Hoc Boards for the preparation and publication of books in the language of the region where it is situated and for which it caters.

A considerable number of books, scientific and technical, have been published in Kannada which is the regional language of Mysore State. Similar books might have been published in other Indian languages, also. With the help, encouragement and patronage of universities books are sure to be written and published in large numbers.

Since the change-over is gradual, the problem of non-availability of text-books is not at all a problem if adequate measures are taken by the universities.

**(b) Technical terms.**

International technical and scientific terms, symbols, signs and numerals, etc. should be retained as such. Translation of these terms out of sentimental feeling should be avoided. This is because any student who knows English or Hindi or any other language could understand the subject with least difficulty. This is very essential in India which has many regional languages.

**(c) Production of standard books and reference books machinery for production.**

Standard books and reference books in regional languages are quite essential for successful change-over of the medium of instruction. This could be achieved in two ways :

- (i) By constituting editorial boards in each subject consisting of experts and experienced teachers in the respective subjects to be in charge of writing, editing and publishing standard books in regional languages.
- (ii) By establishing on a permanent basis a Translation Bureau comprising of trained personnel in the respective fields for each language to translate books, journals, research papers, etc. on scientific, technical and other subjects in other languages into the regional language.

**2. Minority languages and Central Universities.**

Minorities in a State carry on their transactions in daily life mostly in the regional language and are thus conversant with it. Moreover the regional language is taught in schools even for

minorities from the third year of primary education. Students belonging to minority languages in a State will have therefore studied the regional language before they enter the university. So there would be no difficulty for them to follow instruction in the university classes in the regional language.

Regarding Central Universities the question is not clear. There appears to be no need for Central Universities as there are universities established by the State Governments in all the States.

**3. Teachers—Difficulty of present teacher.**

As part of the extension work of the Mysore University a number of extension lectures in the regional language have been arranged for the last fifteen years every year by the University in which the University teachers take part. The teachers deliver lectures on subtle and scientific subjects in the regional languages to the rural population.

**4. Inter-University Communication and Contact.**

It is expected that even after the replacement of English by the regional languages as media of instruction, English will continue to be taught as a language in the universities. For purposes of Inter-University communication and contact in future either English or Hindi may be adopted.

With the retention of international technical terms as such in all regional languages, there is no difficulty for Inter-University contacts.



5. Estimate of books of Collegiate standard in University Libraries.

The University has published a number of books on scientific subjects, Humanities and Social Sciences by entrusting the writing of these books to experienced teachers in the University. Reference books need not necessarily be in the regional languages. As English continues to be taught in the universities, it should not be difficult for students to study reference books in English.

6. Official Publication—Languages.

Official publications of the Government of India are to be published in all languages recognised under the Constitution.

7. Multi-Lingual areas.

Since the States are practically reorganised on linguistic basis the question of multi-lingual areas does not arise.

8. Stages of changes.

(a) Different levels.

The change of medium of instruction from English to a regional language should be by gradual stages beginning with the lowest classes of the university. To start with, the change may be effected at the pre-university and extended in successive years to the degree classes. English medium sections should be continued side by side with the regional language medium sections.

(b) Different subjects and areas.

The question is not clear. If the intention is to know whether the change of medium could be introduced in different subjects simultaneously, the answer is that the change of medium could be introduced in all subjects provided the international scientific terms, symbols etc., are retained as such.

9. English as an alternative medium.

Vide reply to point (8).

10. Can English and another language be used simultaneously as media in the same class.

It is not desirable to employ English and another language simultaneously as media of instruction in the same class. Separate sections for students selecting different medium might be opened in the same institution. Students may be allowed the option to select English as medium of instruction provided they have secured at least 50 per cent marks in English in the qualifying examination.

11. Standards in English.

The study of English at the primary stage is unnecessary as majority of students drop off at the end of primary education. It is a waste of energy and finance to make students study English at the primary level. The time and energy that would be wasted in learning a language which they are soon going to forget may be usefully utilised in learning their language and knowing more contents of it. English may be introduced as a subject of study at the secondary stage on an optional basis.

For students who wish to learn English in order to read, enjoy and benefit from the literature which it contains, ability to speak and write that language faultlessly is not necessary. It is enough if they get as much knowledge of it as will enable them to read books in it. Such students should be allowed to learn English through the medium of the regional language. If this is done English can be absorbed more easily and

quickly. It is only natural that a foreign language should be learnt through the medium of native tongue and this practice is prevalent in many countries.

Students who learn English either for the sake of literature or for the sake of taking assignments abroad must acquire mastery of the language so that they may be able to write and speak in it effectively. Provision should be made for teaching English to such students employing new methods of teaching English. For them, English should be the medium of teaching especially in the higher rungs as their very aim is to obtain command over the language. To impart special training to such aspirants, Central Institute may be established.

12. Teaching through English medium and option given to candidates to answer through the medium of another language and vice-versa.

This suggestion does not appear to be satisfactory and is academically unsound. The media of instruction and examination should be the same. Where the regional language and English are both provided as media of instruction, students taught through the English medium may be allowed the option to answer the papers in the regional language at their own risk.

13. (a) Difficulties of migration and recognition.

As the percentage of students migrating from one university to another is comparatively very small, the difficulties in the way of migration of students are not many. Such students who are likely to migrate from one university to another are expected to learn the language of the region to which they migrate.

Even in the matter of recognition of courses of studies of one University by another no serious difficulties are likely to arise because it is on the basis of the contents of a course that recognition is given and not on the basis of the language in which it is taught.

13. (b) Difficulties of teachers to move from one place to another.

As teachers in the university will have knowledge of Hindi and English, the migration of teachers from one university to another may not be difficult and the number of such cases is numerically small.

14. External Examiners.

With regard to the setting of question papers by external examiners, there is no difficulty because the questions could be got translated from one language to another. The problem however arises in regard to the valuation of answer books of post-graduate examinations. This can be solved by selecting examiners of the neighbouring universities who know the language of the region.

15. Journals.

It is desirable that journals and articles on research work done are published both in the regional language and the national language.

16. Nature of Preparatory work.

For every regional language a committee of experts in several subjects has to be constituted to review the existing literature, take necessary measures to get standard books and reference books written in different subjects and institute seminars and refresher courses for teachers who have to lecture in the regional language. The committee should be provided with adequate finance

by the universities, the State Governments, the Government of India and the University Grants Commission to carry out the project of implementing regional languages as media of instruction in universities.

In addition there should be a central committee consisting of representatives chosen from the regional committees, educationists and nominees of University Grants Commission, Government of India etc. The central committee may co-ordinate the work of all regional committees and give guidance.

17. Need to obtain views of statutory Professional Organisations.

The question is not clear.

18. All India Competitive Examinations—Medium.

The selection to All India services like I.A.S., I.P.S. etc. may be done on the regional basis by fixing a regionwise quota of the posts available. Examination for the selection of candidates for such posts may be conducted at different regions, the medium of examination being respective regional language.

After the candidates are finally selected they may be required to pass a proficiency examination in the federal language within a stipulated period.

**Views of the Patna University on the question of change of medium of instruction with reference to University Grants Commission letter No. F. 33-43/60 (CUP) dated 25th March, 1960.**

- "1. (a) We should wait till text books are available in regional languages because if we do not do that then the entire teaching will become a farce. Students will depend on the notes taken in the class. No student's reading in a University is worth the name if his knowledge rests only on the lecture notes which are given in the class.
- (b) So far as technical terms are concerned, we should have the English terms. These days German, French, English and Russians are using the same terminology for scientific purposes. For instance, one may not be able to read a paper in Russian but so far as tabulated data are concerned they can easily be followed on account of the terminology being generally the same.
- (c) Production of standard text books may be taken up. So far as reference books are concerned, we should not make any attempt to translate them at this stage. Reference books may continue to be in English. If we try to produce the standard books also at a great speed, the text books will not be of good quality. Most of the text books written are the result of urge on authors to write a book and the author has to compete with many other authors. If the book is not of proper standard, the author may not find publishers and even if he can find one somehow, it may not have any sale. If we get a large number of books produced to order, then whatever be their quality, these text books are bound to be used. The experience of getting text books written at the high school and primary stages has not been happy.
2. So far as the Central Universities are concerned, it will be difficult for them to teach in different languages. In one way they will cease to be the Central Universities. For instance,

If, Banaras and Aligarh Universities start teaching through the medium of Hindi, students coming from non-Hindi speaking regions who have read through a medium other than Hindi cannot study in these universities. So, for all practical purposes Banaras and Aligarh will become universities for the Hindi speaking people only.

3. For a number of years the teachers belonging to the region are being preferred in the various colleges and universities. So far as colleges are concerned, there will hardly be any difficulty in teaching in the regional language due to lack of knowledge of language. So far as universities are concerned, some of the very good professors may be rendered useless if we insist on their teaching through the regional language.
4. If we start teaching through the regional language in universities, we should not think seriously about communication and contact between the various universities. Even the proceedings of the meeting of the Senate coming from Kerala, Mysore, Hyderabad, Madras, etc. will not be intelligible to us in Patna and vice-versa. The courses of studies will not be intelligible. Hence if we do decide to have the regional language in the universities slowly but surely, the communication and contact between the universities will disappear in the long run.
5. There are not many books of collegiate standard in the regional languages in the university libraries. The number of books in any subject will hardly exceed a few dozens and some of these books are definitely of low standard.
6. The official publications of the universities will be in the regional languages as stated in item 5 and they will be generally meant for the members of that university alone except where there are two or three universities teaching in the same regional language, as in Andhra.
7. So far as multi-lingual areas are concerned, it will not be possible to teach through the languages of all concerned. The teaching has to be in the regional language, i. e. the language spoken by the vast majority of the State concerned. Any departure in this at the university stage will land the universities in utter confusion.

9. & 10. So far as I am concerned, I am for retaining English as an alternative language to be used in the class. This alone can secure some inter-university communication and contact. In Patna University I am of opinion that a teacher may lecture in English and/or Hindi according to his choice, and a student also may be able to answer his questions in English or Hindi as he likes and there should be no time limit for the continuation of such a state of affairs. I am not sure whether I will be able to carry my university with me in this matter.
11. The standard of English has gone down to some extent but with more tutorials in the pre-university and higher secondary classes we may be able to improve it to some extent.
12. Even if the candidates are taught through the medium of English, they may be allowed to answer in the medium of regional language and vice versa so far as under-graduate classes are concerned. But so far as post-graduate classes are concerned, we have to be very very careful in adopting the regional language as it will not only lower the standard but will create a barrier between one language group and another, a barrier which may get stronger with time and may result in division of India into various language States.
13. (a) When teaching is done through regional language, migration will become very difficult and recognition may be all right in theory but will be of no practical use.
- (b) Teachers cannot move from one place to another when regional language is prescribed as freely as they are doing now.
14. If regional languages become the media of instruction, the external examiners shall have to be confined to the regional universities having the same medium of instruction. For instance, in Bihar we may be able to draw examiners from various universities of Bihar, U.P. and Madhya Pradesh. In Bengal, Orissa, Kerala, Madras and Mysore, there may be difficulty in getting external examiners unless each of these regions gets more than one university.



15. So far as Journals are concerned, they will be the worst sufferers. The high standard which the Indian Journals in science subjects are slowly attaining, will get a set back. In some of the regions there will not be enough material for such a journal. The knowledge gained in the various universities may be available only through English Abstracts. For instance, a paper published in chemistry in Tamil in Madras University will not be intelligible to a chemist of Patna University and vice versa and since a Patna man is not likely to learn Tamil, he shall have to depend on British or American Abstracts or German Chemische Zentral Blatt.
16. It is not clear what is meant by preparatory work. If the preparatory work is only to have a regional language in all the universities then the various universities or the State Government concerned have to go ahead with translation work. If the preparatory work also means setting of machinery for inter-university communication and contact, nothing can be done because we are breaking the communication and contact which we are having today unless we retain English as an alternative language. We can not destroy a thing and go on talking about its necessity.
17. It is necessary to obtain the views of Statutory Professional Organisations. Appeals from all the High Courts will go to Supreme Courts. Persons who have become Judges in the High Courts after studying in regional language will have to go to Supreme Courts.
18. When regional languages are introduced in the universities, we will have to bid good-bye to All India Competitive Examinations. The students will not be able to write in English and to make all of them write in Hindi will be unfair to the students coming from non-Hindi speaking areas. Appointments to All India Services shall have to be confined to promotion for the various States. If Hindi will be the language for carrying on business at the Centre, then all the persons who belong to non-Hindi States will have to spend from six months to one year in learning Hindi in order to be able to carry on the work."

**Views of the Saugar University on the question of change of  
medium of instruction with reference to University  
Grants Commission letter No. F. 33-43/60 (CUP)  
dated 25th March, 1960.**

1. (a) In the light of experience of Saugar University where the Hindi medium has already been adopted for the undergraduate classes in Arts subjects, I can say that there is no difficulty about text books in Hindi. They are available in fairly large numbers. Since demand creates supply, I feel that we need not wait in the matter and adopt Hindi medium forthwith for Arts subjects.
- (b) At present technical terms are being coined by the Hindi Directorate of Government of India and they are already ready for most of the subjects. Many others are also current and authors can and do pick and choose from them.
- (c) It is desirable.
- (d) Union and State Governments in co-operation with the universities.

2. Minority languages may find place at primary and secondary level but not at the university level as medium of instruction. They may, however, be taught as languages.

3. In Hindi areas, fairly large number of teachers can teach in Hindi. Where they find difficulty, they use English technical terms.

4. Inter-University contact is bound to remain in English for some years to come. Letters may be replied in Hindi or English.

5. In Saugar University Library, roughly the number of Hindi books would be 100 to 400 in each subject.

6. At this University they are at present in English.

7. English and Hindi both.

8. (a) Upto under-graduate level.

(b) A beginning may be made with Arts subjects. In scientific and technical subjects English may be retained till such time as may be necessary.

9. English as alternative medium may be continued during the transitional period, but not permanently.

10. No.

11. Standards in English are falling

12. This may be done at the post-graduate level. We are doing something like this at Saugar in Arts subjects.

13. These difficulties are genuine and the solution lies in retaining English for post-graduate classes during transitional period and in a gradual change-over to Hindi so that every educated person of the next generation may know Hindi.

14. Where the external examinee is non-Hindi knowing he may be requested to return the answer books written in Hindi and alternative arrangements may be made. Some universities have this practice already.

15. Journals should be in transitional period in Hindi and English both. Later only in Hindi.

16. Coining technical terms, getting standard books written and translations of standard books made in Hindi, introducing Hindi as alternative medium of instruction or examination of both.

17. Yes they should be obtained.

18. They should continue to be in English for the present."

**Views of the Rajasthan University on the question of change  
of medium of instruction with reference to University  
Grants Commission letter No. F. 33-43/60 (CUP)  
dated 25th March, 1960.**

1.(a) The University feels that change-over to Hindi or regional language may be introduced gradually. As a first step it would be well to introduce teaching in Hindi or regional language upto the graduate standard only in non-professional courses. This will bring about increased use of books in Hindi and encourage publishers and writers to undertake similar projects in regard to books for post-graduate courses. If good quality of books become available on the subjects in Hindi change-over may be implemented in case of post-graduate classes also. The demand and supply will be mutual, once the medium of Hindi is introduced at graduate level because ultimately it will be these graduates who will undertake post-graduate studies.

(b) All India Body to give suitable technical terms for science subjects in Hindi be set up. The popular technical terms in English may be used.

(c) & (d) Since in the beginning the project may involve financial loss and the authors of high calibre and publishers of high repute may not be agreeable to take the risk, it will be necessary for the Government to come forward with suitable encouragement and offer of liberal financial aid to universities, and such other non-Government organisations of production as may come forward with definite proposals. There must be efficient co-ordination between the agencies of production and translation so as to prevent over-lapping. The work of translating the standard works in Hindi should be undertaken. The universities should take active interest in the project and if need be embark upon bold experimentation.

2. Adequate encouragement be given to minority languages where such a problem exists. Central Universities may keep up the medium of English.

3. The present medium of instruction as prevalent in different parts may be continued for a temporary period say a year or two. During this period of transition the teachers may be asked to familiarise themselves with Hindi.

4. It may be done in English and Hindi till 1965 and be switched over to Hindi thereafter.

5. The books in Hindi are not of a high order.

6. It should be English, Hindi, the regional language during the transitory period upto 1965 and should thereafter be changed to Hindi and the regional language.

7. The languages spoken by the majority.

8. The change-over to Hindi/regional language upto the degree level in non-professional courses may be introduced at once.

In case of professional courses after five years during which suitable books may be produced in Hindi.

9. English may be maintained as an alternate language but not indefinitely which may otherwise involve lack of originality on part of Indians.

10. Simultaneous usage of English and Hindi both will make the confusion worse confounded. It could only be partially implemented during the period of transition say till 1965 and then change-over to exclusive use of Hindi should take place.

11. Standard in English should be maintained at a high level. It should be treated as most important of all foreign languages in view of its widespread usage.

12. Teaching through medium of English and giving the students option to answer through medium of another language does not appear to be sound proposal. Though it may be continued for sometime during the period of the change-over.

13. As far as recognition is concerned prescribing at least a more or less uniform standard will obviate the difficulty. Migration could be made possible by letting the student offer the additional language for which proficiency courses of short duration may be run at the universities, and the student may be permitted migration only after he has passed the proficiency test. Similar arrangements may be made for teachers willing to migrate from one university to another.

14. External Examiners : Only those conversant with the language may be appointed as examiners.

15. Journals : The journals in English will have to be studied in English. The State Government agencies may undertake multilingual translations.

16. Nature of Preparatory Work : Production of good text books in Hindi and regional language is a prime necessity. Greater stress should be given on regional/Hindi language right from the start and more so at high school stage to prepare good foundation for higher studies.

17. The views of statutory professional organisations should be obtained. It will greatly help in the examinations of this question of change of language of instruction, in all its bearings.

18. The language for All India Competitive examination should be English and Hindi but those offering Hindi should be asked to answer a paper in English so as to know that the candidate possesses a good working knowledge of the language and vice-versa."

Views of the Bihar University on the question of change of medium of instruction with reference to University Grants Commission letter No. F. 33-43/60 (CUP) dated 25th March, 1960.

1. **Text Books :**

- (a) We need not wait for change over from English to Hindi or any other regional language till the text books are available. The change over should take place immediately but efforts should also be made to get the books very soon.
- (b) Technical terms of international usage should be adopted.
- (c) A scheme should be formulated under the supervision of the University Grants Commission with the aid of the Government for the production of standard books and reference books.
- (d) The University Grants Commission should get the books compiled through the universities by allotting particular subjects and books to particular universities. For certain subjects in which already some books have appeared the University Grants Commission may obtain books on an open competitive basis.

2. In the central universities the medium of teaching should be Hindi.

3. More than 90 per cent of the teachers in non-language subjects in this State can teach easily through the medium of Hindi, excepting in the technical faculties where no experiment has been made so far.

4. Inter-University communication may continue through the medium of English for the present which should gradually give place to Hindi. Between universities situated in Hindi speaking areas there may be an immediate switch on to Hindi.

5. Estimate is not available immediately.

6. Official publications should come out in Hindi on a progressively increasing basis.

7. There is no such problem here.

8 (a) An immediate start can be made with the higher secondary and pre-university examinations. As the students passing the examinations move up the medium of teaching and examination should progressively become Hindi so that these students may be able to appear at the highest examination through the medium of Hindi.

(b) During the transition period for a few years there will be quite a number of students who would have undergone teaching through the medium of English. It would be, therefore, desirable to keep English as an alternative medium of examination (not of teaching) for a few years.

9. English may be retained as an alternative medium of examination (not of teaching) during the transition period as stated above.

10. If a teacher finds difficulty in expressing himself fully in Hindi he may be permitted to take recourse to English also. Though a mixture of languages is not desirable, perhaps it cannot be helped during the transition period.

11. It is admitted that the old standards of proficiency in English cannot be maintained by all the students. For the general run of student it should be considered enough if he is able to read and correctly understand what is written in English and to express himself tolerably well in that language. A subject like English literature should be permitted to be offered as an optional subject (apart from General English) for those students who have a special aptitude for English and who may like to have more proficiency in English.

12. Teaching should as soon as possible be done through the medium of Hindi though permission to candidates should be given to write their answers through the medium of English if they so desire for a longer period of time so that no hardship is caused to the students whose mother-tongue is not Hindi.

13 (a) Since the teaching has been proposed to be done through the medium of Hindi only there should be no difficulty about the migration of students and recognition of their degrees.

(b) Teachers must learn to teach through the medium of Hindi.



14. Since all the teachers are expected to know Hindi and teach through the medium of Hindi there should be no difficulty regarding the appointment of external examiners.

15. Journals which are expected to be used throughout the whole of India should be published in Hindi.

16.

17. The views of the statutory professional organisations should be taken, in the implementation of this scheme. They should, however, be clearly told that they cannot hold up the introduction of Hindi for an indefinite period nor even for a long time.

18. The medium at the All India competitive examinations should be both English and Hindi during the transition period. Gradually some portions should be made compulsory to be answered in Hindi only. Progressively the use of English should be decreased and its place should be taken up by Hindi.

**Views of the Karnatak University on the question of change  
of medium of instruction with reference to University  
Grants Commission letter No. F. 33-43/60 (CUP)  
dated 25th March, 1960.**

**1. Text Books.**

It would be rash to change the medium of instruction without having suitable text-books in Hindi or the regional language. Some of the books produced in Indian languages, especially for the 1st year and the 2nd year courses of the colleges now are fairly good, but on the whole they leave much to be desired. In many subjects they are not modern or up-to-date. They are merely translations of some of the old books of the English language. A committee should be appointed for each subject to produce good text-books in English first and then efforts may be made to translate them. This committee may also recommend some modern books in English language, for being translated into the regional language. This means that the Committee must go very carefully into the question, so that it will make for certain amount of uniformity in all the universities.

**2. Minority languages and Central Universities.**

If there are more languages than one in any of the universities, their difficulties will be very great, but if we provide for instruction in the language of the majority of the people, we have also to cater for the needs of the minorities. Since Muslims are spread all over India, it will result in producing books in Urdu alongside of books in the main language of the area. The Central Universities may arrange to have instruction only in Hindi. The Aligarh University would perhaps insist on teaching through Urdu and Hindi both and this may be allowed as a special case. Delhi may be asked to provide for instruction in Hindi as well as English. Banaras may provide instruction only through Hindi.

**3. Teachers.**

The difficulty of securing good teachers to teach through the regional language or Hindi will be very great. That is why it is desirable not to rush things through but to go by stages. If the universities are asked to prepare themselves for providing instruction through the local language upto B.A. and B.Sc. in 10 or 15 years, it may be possible to

provide teachers as well as books by that time. Most of the experienced teachers may be allowed to explain in English as well as the regional language. There should be no restriction on the teachers to speak only in the regional language at least for the first 10 or 15 years, but I admit that the problem of teachers will have to be tackled and it will take several years to have able teachers to teach upto B.A. or B.Sc. My own view is that post-graduate work should be all done in English for at least 50 years more. At least let there be uniformity in so far as post-graduate instruction is concerned. I am assuming all along that English will be a compulsory subject both in schools and colleges.

#### **4. Inter-University communication and contact.**

There will be Inter-university communication and contact only in so far as post-graduate instruction is concerned, but the under-graduate colleges will have to be staffed by persons speaking the regional language.

#### **5. Estimate of books of collegiate standard in University Libraries: and**

#### **6. Official publications—languages.**

Some universities are making efforts to produce books in the regional language, but it seems to me desirable that these efforts may be co-ordinated by the Centre or by the University Grants Commission to see that right kind of books are produced. Each year, each university may be required to spend about Rs. 25,000 on the production of suitable text-books in the various subjects in the language concerned.

#### **8. Stages of change.**

The first stage should be to educate students through the regional language upto B.A. and B.Sc. This may take about 15 years from now. Engineering and Medical Science should continue to be taught in English for at least 20 years more, but efforts may be made to produce books in these subjects as well.

#### **9. English as an alternative medium.**

There is no objection to English being used as an alternative medium, but this will result in more students going in for English medium.

**10. Can English and another local language be used simultaneously as media in the same class.**

Yes, English and another local language should be used simultaneously in the same class in the 1st stage at any rate.

**11. Standards in English.**

English should be taught at least for 6 years in the secondary schools and two years in the colleges. It is desirable to teach English right upto B.A. and B.Sc. A good working knowledge of English should be obtained by every graduate.

**12. Teaching through English medium—vice versa.**

It is wrong to teach through English and give option to candidates to answer questions in the examination through the medium of their mother-tongue. My own experience is that this will result in the lowering of the standard. If there are no teachers to examine them, there will be no examiners for examining the candidates in the local language. The best thing to do is to ask the institutions to make provision for the teaching of the various subjects in the local language first and then give the option to the students to answer their questions in their language.

**13 (a) & (b). Difficulties of migration and recognition. Difficulties of teachers to move from one place to another.**

Yes these difficulties are real. There will be difficulties of migration of students. The parents in such cases should take care to teach their sons only through the local language then they must arrange for their stay in the hostel in the university.

**14. External Examiner.**

There are several universities in one State which will be teaching through the same local language. Now that the States have been reorganised on the basis of languages, it should not be difficult to get external examiners from the other universities in the same State.

**15. Journals.**

All learned journals will have to be produced in English and/or Hindi. This should not be very difficult for the writers as they have

sufficient knowledge of English. In Japan, for instance, although instruction through Japanese is given, all learned articles are produced either in French or English.

**16. Nature of preparatory work.**

Preparatory work :

- (a) Producing text-books, and
- (b) Encouraging teachers to explain the subject matter both in English and the regional language.

**18. All India Competitive Examinations-Medium.**

All India Competitive Examinations have already become unwieldy. The Union Public Service Commission should restrict itself to the selection of candidates for the Government of India. The I.A.S. and the Indian Police Service should be abolished altogether and the State Governments should be asked to hold these examinations in their local language. The best among them may be selected by the Govt. of India for certain key posts. This will work much better than present system of recruitment at the Centre and allotting candidates for the various States. There will be objection from the States if the examinations are held only through the medium of Hindi. There will be no uniformity of standards and the Hindi students are bound to be in more advantageous position than the non-Hindi candidates. In the circumstances, the best thing to do is that such examinations should be held by the State Public Service Commission, if necessary, under the supervision of the Union Public Service Commission.

**Views of the Gujarat University on the question of change  
of medium of instruction with reference to University  
Grants Commission letter No. F. 33-43/60 (CUP)  
dated 25th March, 1960.**

**1. Text Books :**

(a) Should we wait to start till they are available ?

The argument that the text-books in the regional language in the Indian universities, should be made available as a condition precedent, to its being adopted as a medium of instruction and examination is being all along advanced by those who are interested in continuing English as the medium of instruction, with vehemence and frequency that have made it stale and platitudinous. Indeed, the question whether such text-books should precede the adoption of an Indian language as the medium of instruction or vice-versa, is on a par with the question whether the hen came from the egg or the egg came from the hen. It is an imperative need for the Indian universities, and indeed, for the Indian nation as a whole, to mobilise all our resources to implement what has been enjoined on us by our Constitution, namely, replacement of English by the Indian languages in all the spheres of life, including education, and perhaps with a particular sense of priority in education.

The experience of the Gujarat University in this matter may be briefly noted here. There is a statutory obligation contained in the Gujarat University Act, which lays down that Gujarati or Hindi in Devanagari script or both shall be the medium of instruction and examination, provided that English may continue to be the medium of instruction and examination in such subjects and for such period not exceeding ten years from November, 1960. Accordingly in 1954 the authorities of the University prescribed a time-table for the progressive introduction the change in the medium of instruction, beginning with the First Year Arts Examination in 1954, so that the stipulated changeover of the medium may be smoothly negotiated. The University firmly pursued this policy and a stage has been reached when the regional language, viz. Gujarati, of being progressively used as the medium of instruction and examination of the University.

So far as the text-books are concerned, the principle of free enterprise has yielded a sizable and competitive crop of text-books, particularly upto the intermediate level in the faculties of Arts, Science and

Commerce. As in life, so also in the world of text-books, the law of the survival of the fittest does operate ; and while a large number of good, bad and indifferent books may be published, the university world can well be assured of good quality books also.

So far as the post-intermediate stage is concerned, it is felt that the principle of free enterprise may not yield as fruitful results as it has done upto the intermediate stage, obviously, on account of a limited demand for such books. The Gujarat University has, therefore, devised a scheme under which the publication of approved books is being undertaken either by the University itself, or alternatively, being subsidised, each proposal being considered individually on its own merits.

I have dealt with this position at some length with a view to giving an idea of what has transpired in my University so far the advancement of the policy regarding the regional language as the medium of instruction and examination is concerned.

It is not only futile, but also highly wasteful and even self-deceptive to wait for the preparation of the text-books for introducing this much-needed reform in our education. This statement gains added significance if one realises the fact that even when the regional language becomes the medium of instruction, the doors to the English language are not closed. Indeed, the teachers and the students in the Indian universities where English will be retained as a compulsory language at least upto the intermediate stage for many years, will not find it difficult, provided they have the necessary will and academic zest to have access to literature published in English, or for that matter in any language in the world.

#### (b) Technical Terms :

Evolving of a suitable terminology in the language of the medium for the various subjects taught by the University is a very important task and deserves top priority. It must, however, always be remembered that like Rome, terminology cannot be built in a day. As a matter of fact, terminology has got to be given sufficient scope and freedom to grow and evolve. This, however, does not mean that no efforts should be made to frame equivalents of technical terms in the various Indian languages. Here also, the work done by the Gujarat University may prove of some help and guidance. The Gujarat University has, through various committees and sub-committees consisting of experts in different

subjects got prepared scientific technology in Gujarati in as many as 17 important subjects. While booklets of technology on 13 of these subjects have already been published, the rest are at various stages of progress in compilation and printing.

In the matter of terminology, it will not be profitable to be very rigid and conservative. It will be worthwhile here to reproduce the principle adopted by the Gujarat University, which will give a clue to its approach to the problems :

1. The terminology at present in use in the secondary schools and in the text-books for the secondary schools for teaching different subjects in the Gujarati should be retained as basis for teaching respective subjects in the colleges and the further vocabulary for college studies be based thereon and on those lines.
2. International symbols, signs and formulae be retained for use as they are in use at present.
3. English scientific terms may be retained, if suitable Gujarati equivalents cannot be immediately framed or are not available.
4. The committee envisages that in order to see that the terminology may not be rigid and it may be elastic, it is desirable that for the time being English equivalents should be shown in brackets along with the Hindi or Gujarati equivalents that may be used.

It will thus be seen that the framing of suitable equivalents in a regional language calls for co-operation of technical as well as linguistic experts, borrowing internationally acknowledged terminology and nomenclature on a liberal scale is bound to become a helpful order of the day. It is also suggested that co-ordination on an all-India level in the pursuit of this activity will be extremely useful and the University Grants Commission can perhaps give a profitable lead in this behalf.

- (c) Production of standard books and reference books, and
- (d) Machinery for production.

It is necessary to consider (c) and (d) together



Standard books and reference books should be made available in as large a number as possible. To think of the translation of all or even the most important of the standard books and reference books is indeed asking for the moon. It is neither possible or necessary to get all the standard books and reference books translated into an Indian language. However, it will be helpful for every university in India to draw up a list of such standard books as have become classics in various subjects and get them either translated or suitably adopted or abridged and edited. It is also suggested that a coordinated scheme in this behalf framed with the help of a central body like the Inter-University Board of India or the University Grants Commission may be drawn up for phased implementation. This will necessitate financial and technical help from the Government both Central and State. The details can be worked out in consultation with the Government, the Universities, and the University Grants Commission and experts and publishers.

## 2. Minority Languages and Central Universities :

The title of this item for discussion is not quite clear. All therefore, that can be said about the minority languages is that due consideration to them may be given as ordained under the Constitution of India. If, however, anyone suggests that the introduction of a regional language as a medium of instruction can be thwarted on the ground that it will result in the so called injustice to minorities, it must be clearly pointed out that while the minorities are entitled to certain preferential treatment as enjoined by the Constitution, they have no right to thwart the educational and cultural aspirations of an entire region.

It must, however, be conceded that where the minority languages occupy a prominent place as in the city of Bombay, arrangements should be made for meeting the requirements of both the majority community as well as the important minority community.

The question of Central Universities, it is felt, is being unnecessarily mixed up with the question of the development of a regional language as the medium of instruction. That certain universities are under the jurisdiction of the State Government and certain others are directly administered by the Government of India, is not germane to this issue. Every Central University in India has a well defined university area which falls within the purview of a particular linguistic region. What, therefore, is true of other universities, can be equally medium of instruction for a student in other universities, there is no reason why

there should be a deviation from this principle in respect of Central Universities.

### 3. Teachers.

Difficulties of present teachers (Information as to how many can now teach).

The difficulty of the present teachers is, I am afraid, exaggerated out of all proportions. The nature of the question envisages that fresh recruitment to the teaching posts will be made in accordance with the requirements of the medium of instruction. I shall, therefore, confine my remarks only to the so-called difficulties of the present teachers.

The question of higher education in India, is, in a large measure, the question of affiliated colleges, and it is common knowledge that the teaching staff in the affiliated colleges of the Indian universities comprises to a very large extent, of the persons who are residents of the region to which the university caters, and almost all the persons who comprise of the microscopic minority, coming from other regions can read, write and speak or can learn to do so without much difficulty, other language of the region where they work. This difficulty, therefore, is, if at all, of an extremely transitional nature and can be overcome without much inconvenience. It is, in no sense of the term, a cause not to change the medium.

### 4. Inter-University Communication and contact.

The problem of inter-provincial communication and contact is nothing peculiar to the field of education. Indeed, it is a question inherent in the linguistic framework of the body politic of India. The framers of the Constitution have very prudently foreseen and provided that inter-state communication shall be done in Hindi and English till such time as Hindi can replace it. This position can, with equal ease, be applied to the problem of Inter-University communication and contact. It must also be remembered that Hindi will be a compulsory language at least upto the Intermediate stage in all the Universities in India, and that English will continue to be a compulsory language at least in the foreseeable future. There need, therefore, be no apprehension on this account. All that we in India should strive to do is to create suitable conditions in which replacement of English by Hindi can be negotiated with ease and expedition.

**5. Estimate of books of collegiate standard in University Libraries :**

I understand that the University Grants Commission is separately collecting information in this behalf. I am enclosing as appendix 'A' the information in respect of my University.

It must also be noted that this question is vitally connected with the question No. 1 (a), above, and that once the universities go ahead with the policy of adopting the regional language as the medium of instruction, a plethora of books will be available on the simple principle of supply and demand. It is, however, not ruled out that where the demand is not of a sufficient magnitude, special attention and liberal subsidies may be called for. This did happen in the secondary stage of education and without the kind of fuss and fury which is unhappily to be seen in the higher stage.

**6. Official Publications—languages :**

So far as the official publications of a university are concerned, they have got to be in the language of the region where the university is situated. It is, however, thinkable that certain important research journals may have to be published both in the regional language and in Hindi. Also a suitable machinery will have to be devised, perhaps through the agency of an All-India co-ordinating body for making available extracts from important research articles.

**7. Multi-lingual areas :**

This question is vitally connected with the question of minority languages in No. 2, above, please see there.

**8. Stages of Change :**

- (a) Different levels : There used to be three stages for effecting the change in the medium of instruction and examination at the university level before the introduction of the Three-Year Degree Courses, viz. the Intermediate stage, the Degree stage and the post-graduate stage, and the change in the medium of instruction and examination can only be progressively implemented. When, therefore, a particular university has started negotiating a change in the medium, it should not be allowed to languish for want of efforts or resources.

**(b) Different subjects and areas.**

It is possible that a particular university may not find it easy or convenient to change the medium of instruction in all the faculties and in all the subjects simultaneously.

Each university, therefore, will have to consider the question in the light of its own circumstances, its own needs and its own resources, and chalk out a suitable programme for a phased implementation of the change in the medium.

So far as the question of areas is concerned, it is felt that this question will not, in effect, arise in respect of most of the universities in India, as hardly any university, except the universities like the University of Bombay, catering to multi-lingual areas, serves areas widely divergent from the language point of view. This question, therefore, is purely of an academic nature so far as a majority of the universities are concerned. In the other universities where this problem causes some concern, suitable ways and means for its solution can be found.

**9. English as an alternative medium :**

The title of the query is not clear. It is, however, presumed that the word 'alternative' here is used in the sense of the word 'optional'. If that is so, it has to be reluctantly pointed out that provision of English as an optional medium, whenever, has in practice hindered the pace of progress in the use of an Indian language as a medium of instruction and examination in the Indian universities. Instances are not wanting where such a provision has resulted in self-complacency and even inaction. Even when, therefore, it is necessary to retain English as an optional medium during the transitional period, such period must be as brief as possible and precisely defined in terms of time as well as the branches of learning. Indeed, in no case should the change-over of the medium be delayed beyond this period of transition.

10. Can English and another language be used simultaneously as media in the same class? Only during a well-defined and brief transitional period and by those only who cannot even begin to use the regional language.

**11. Standards in English :**

In these changed circumstances in India our concept regarding standards of English must of necessity be reoriented. It must be remembered that English is an alien language and does no more continue as the

State language that it used to be during the British regime. The requirements, therefore, of a large majority of our college-going students must be reassessed inasmuch as the knowledge of English will only be required for the purposes of comprehension only and not for the purposes of expression. Let us, therefore, keep this fundamental change in view while discussing standards in English. Let us by all means profit ourselves by the use of audiovisual aids of instruction in English; but the period of instruction in English can be and must be substantially shortened without adversely affecting our interests.

**12. Teaching through English medium and option given to answer through the medium of another language and vice-versa !**

Teaching through the medium of English and providing option to answer through the medium of another language and vice-versa will not be a happy state of affairs in any educational set-up. As far as possible the medium of instruction and examination should be the same in order to enable the teachers to impart and the students to imbibe their very best.

It may, however, be envisaged that during the transitional period, some sort of make-shift arrangement is perhaps inevitable in the case of some universities. Such a make-shift arrangement should, however, be as short as possible.

This University has had some experience in this behalf. It commenced the introduction of Gujarati as the medium of instruction progressively from 1954 to 1960. Before actually introducing the regional language as the medium of instruction, an option to use it as the medium of examination was given to the students of the University. A copy of the relevant Statutes 207, 208 and 209 (enclosed as appendix A) will give a clear picture in this behalf.

**13. (a) Difficulties of migration and recognition.**

The question of migration of students and recognition of examinations is essentially a question of equivalence of examinations, and equivalence is judged on the quantum of courses and standards of passing, and not on considerations as to the medium in which instruction is

imparted or examinations held. If the Indian universities have not found it difficult to recognise the examinations held in the foreign universities, and to admit students from those Universities, there is no reason why this difficulty should crop up so far as indigenous inter-university relations are concerned. If all the universities in India adopt a uniform policy in this behalf, the difficulties regarding migration and recognition will not arise.

(b) Difficulties of teachers to move from one place to another.

What has been said about migration of students in (a) above, is equally true of the migration of teachers from one place to another. In this age of international cooperation when exchange of teachers from one country to another takes place on an ever-increasing scale, this question seems to be an anachronism. If our teachers know English, —as indeed, they do, and will continue to do so in the foreseeable future, — and if our teachers also know Hindi or make efforts to know Hindi, which they can do without much difficulty, the question of the difficulties of migration of teachers will not arise at all.

**14. External Examiners :**

The difficulties regarding external examiners will not arise for reasons mentioned in 13 (b) above. Besides, it has been observed that more than one university is established in the same linguistic region. There are, for example, three Universities in the State of Gujarat, not to mention a large number of Gujarati-knowing teachers working in the University of Bombay and its colleges and even elsewhere, so that one university can draw upon another university for its supply of external examiners. Indeed, the Gujarat University has been doing so for the last several years without experiencing much difficulty.

**15. Journals :**

Please see No. 6 above.

**16. Preparatory work :**

The title of this item for discussion is not clear. It is, however, presumed that preparatory work here means preparation of scientific terminology, efforts and co-operation of teachers and other experts to

supply the reading material in Indian languages, etc. Its nature is obvious to all connected with education. Only its pace must be accelerated.

#### 17. Need to obtain views of Statutory Professional Organisations

It may perhaps be found advisable to consult the experts in the various professional fields before working out the details of the change-over of the medium. Such consultations, however, should be restricted only to the manner in which the change-over can best be negotiated and not be held on the question as to whether the change-over of the medium should be made. In other words, the statutory professional organisations should not be permitted to use a sort of a virtual veto in this fundamental matter.

#### 18. All India Competitive Examinations—Medium :

The question of the medium of Public Services Examinations assumes peculiar significance in Indian conditions in as much as it is necessary to give due regard to the just claims and interests of persons belonging to various linguistic regions in the country. It will be worthwhile, in this connection, to quote a relevant extract from a separate note by Shri Maganbhai P. Desai, (the present Vice-Chancellor of this University) appended to the report of the Official Language Commission.

19. The official Language Commission report notes that as the Hindi-speaking area universities have changed the medium, therefore they must be accommodated in regard to "the alternative medium of Hindi in addition to the existing English medium, to be introduced after due notice." It does not care to note why non-Hindi speaking area universities are not changing the English medium, even though most of them have decided to adopt their regional languages instead. The reason is obvious : they cannot take to Hindi as it is still not known to their regions; hence they sit on the fence and maintain the status-quo waiting for conditions favourable for changing their medium according to their wishes. If, as all agree and desire, the regional language as well as Hindi must be given every encouragement and opportunity to develop, it is very clear—nay, I think it is incumbent upon the Official Language Commission that it should recommend to the President, that conditions must be so created that non-Hindi speaking area universities may feel free to reform themselves by instituting the regional

languages as media of instructions. The obvious way to do so is to institute P.S. Examination also through these languages. Thus only can the just claims and interest of non-Hindi speaking persons be safe guarded.

20. The Official Language Commission Report has suggested optional Hindi medium Institutions in its chapter dealing with the problem of the medium of instruction. If Hindi becomes the medium of examinations for the such coveted prize of public services, it will have a tactical advantage over the regional language medium institutions. This would then set in a process of pushing on Hindi in the same unnatural way as happened in the case of the English medium. Thus History would repeat itself in the case of Hindi, if it had to be so adopted as a medium in non-Hindi speaking areas. Obviously, such a way if adopted would be felt coercive and will only breed aversion to Hindi, and result into retention of English. If we are to replace English, the surest and quickest way is to begin to work through regional languages and to teach Hindi in non-Hindi speaking areas, as we saw earlier in this note.

21. The working committee of the Indian National Congress acknowledging the inevitability of our situation wherein such a law of the linguistic transition was immediately necessary passed two resolutions in 1954 on this most controversial issue of the medium, one regarding the medium of Education and the other regarding that of the P.S. examinations.

22. The Government of India accepted them and declared its policy that :—

1. it will not make the medium of instruction in universities an issue of Government policy. It has virtually declared thereby that regional languages will be the media there; and that,
2. “progressively examinations for All-India services should be held in Hindi, English and the principal regional languages and candidates may be given the option to use any of these languages for the purpose of examination.”

23. This decision of the Government of India is the most outstanding and immediately necessary contribution it made during the period 1950-51, in the implementation of its constitutional duty to work for the



replacement of English and for the introduction of the progressive use of Hindi, at the same time encouraging all the Indian languages to develop and prosper. The declaration heartened non-Hindi speaking area universities to change the English medium to regional languages, This is bound to help not only the overdue reform of our universities but also to strengthen our onward march to democracy. It would be in tune with the two safeguards laid down in the Official Language Commission's terms of reference.

24. It would be naturally expected therefore that the Official Language Commission Report would welcome these two decisions declared by Government on the floor of the Parliament on an important matter of such high policy. But it is surprising that rather than this the Official Language Commission Report almost appears to show its aversion to it by basing its argument on the U.P.S.C's opinion regarding a technical matter of moderation in multi-medium examinations. I hold that an opinion of experts on a comparatively small matter of a technical nature cannot be allowed to be the determining consideration on the subject of fundamental importance like the one being discussed here. It should rather be that experts should feel that they are set a problem in the matter of the examination technique, necessitated by our special needs of a multi-lingual people. The best technique under the circumstances should be found out to start with, perfecting it in light of experience gained later on. I am sorry the Official Language Commission Report did not, take this view and as I feel made much of the opinion of the U.P.S.C. Queerly enough, the letter begs the very question of moderation even for a uni-medium examination.

25. Of course, where more than one language media are concerned, the task of assessment and evaluation becomes rather complex. But it would not do to say that it is impossible. In this regard it is interesting to note the opinion of the Radhakrishnan Commission report. Discussing bilingualism about which I quoted it in the previous chapter, the Report says (P. 322, para 49)—

"In selecting Officers for the federal services it should not be beyond the ingenuity of the Public Services Commission to devise their examinations so as to give the same chance of selection to candidates belonging to different linguistic region."

That is, in its view, the question is not beyond the realm of practicability.

26. The Bengal Government in its reply to Q 5 and 6 of the Official Language Commission questionnaire, which are in this regard, said :—

“It is considered necessary, desirable and possible to have as media for P S. examinations all the major languages in use in the Union.”

And it added regarding moderation—

“It is not difficult for a Public Service Commission to lay down definite standards for the examination of answer papers and to enforce those standards through their examiners. This has gone on very well in the universities which teach languages. It is very rarely that in any particular language a large number of candidates obtain first class honours and in another hardly one obtains it for successive years. Without relying upon the good sense of examiners, P.S. Commissions may set up Boards of moderators each expert in particular language so that answer papers may be discussed and verified to ensure a uniform standard, and marks can be revised accordingly.”

27. If the U.P.S.C. seriously goes into this matter, I am sure it can find a very suitable solution to this problem of moderation. In its reply to the Official Language Commission it reports that excessive number of examinees is a difficulty in this matter it is not beyond ingenuity to find out a way of screening it out by devising a suitable scheme for it.

28. Again a multilingual medium examination is not quite a new thing. For example, the S.S.C.E. Board of Bombay State holds its examinations in about seven languages. My point is that a practical way for meeting the difficulty is not impossible.

**Recommendations of the Working Group on the proposals of  
Delhi University (meeting held on 18/19th April, 1960)**

**1. Books :**

Before changing over, it is necessary to have for the discipline concerned a fair number of standard books in that discipline in the new medium of instruction. Some of these should be translations of standard books well-known all over India. Concurrently efforts should be made to secure original books suitable for students of that standard. There can be no stopping of this effort. Translations and securing of original books should be regarded as a permanent feature for many years to come. The same will apply to each new discipline or each new standard for which the medium is proposed to be changed.

The university, should change its medium only when, in consultation with an advisory body appointed by the University Grants Commission, the university is satisfied that the number and quality of books produced are adequate for making a start.

2. Teachers knowing the language should concurrently with the production of books receive training in using the new language as medium of instruction. This may be a vacation course of 3 months or a part time course for an academic year. To start with, this training may be limited to a few subjects.

3. Seminars of teachers in a discipline who are likely to help in formulating the problems involved in the changeover and suggesting suitable ways of meeting them should also be called. Co-operation of two or more universities concerned with the same language is likely to be helpful.

4. With regard to other functions proposed for the Directorate in Hindi, there does not seem to be any need.

5. In a capital city like Delhi and other areas where there are multi-lingual populations and also in Central Universities, English should be retained as an alternative medium.

6. Steps such as those suggested by the Delhi University or any others are necessary to improve standard of English irrespective of the change of medium of instruction.

7. If English remains as an alternative medium, it will satisfy the needs of linguistic minorities of the area also.

8. **Teachers :** Teachers who do not know the regional language should be temporarily used for teaching through the English medium for the transitional period as \*suggested in another connection. They should also be given reasonable time and facilities for learning the regional language.

---

\*"During the transitional period, it should be permissible to teach the same student some subjects through English and other subjects through the new medium". (Vide item 7 of the above meeting).