

REPORT

OF THE

COMMISSION FOR RESERVATION

OF SEATS IN EDUCATIONAL

INSTITUTIONS

KERALA

1965

Pr

CHAPTER I

Page N

1. Constitution of the Commission .. 1
2. Plan of work .. 2
 - (i) Questionnaire
 - (ii) Written memoranda
 - (iii) Oral evidence
 - (iv) Sample Survey
 - (v) Statistics collected from Schools, Colleges and Government Departments
3. Historical background leading to the appointment of the Commission .. 3
 - (i) Gist of the relevant Government orders upto 1963
 - (ii) Writ petitions challenging the validity of Government orders directing reservation of seats in the Medical and Engineering Colleges
 - (iii) Decision of the High Court allowing the Writ Petition
 - (iv) Writ appeal 164/1963 from the Government
 - (v) Decision of the Division Bench on the Writ Appeal
 - (vi) Direction of the High Court for a fact-finding enquiry
 - (vii) Appointment of the Commission
4. Object of Article 15(4) .. 10
 - (i) Art. 15(4) is not mandatory but only an enabling provision
 - (ii) Circumstances leading to the incorporation of Clause (4) to Art. 15 of the Constitution
 - (iii) Object of Art. 15(4) is the object of the Preamble to the Constitution and Art. 46 thereof
 - (iv) Various forms of the special provision in Art. 15(4)
 - (v) Special provision to be within reasonable limits
 - (vi) Special sanction to Government servants to answer questionnaire, etc,

	<i>Page No.</i>
CHAPTER II	
5. Nature of Backwardness under Art. 15(4). ..	15
6. General principles indicated by the Supreme Court for ascertainment of social backwardness. ..	16
(i) Caste in the Hindu fold—Only a relevant circumstance to consider in determining social backwardness	
(ii) Test of caste and sections of Indian Society other than Hindus	
(iii) Relevance of both “Caste” and “poverty”	
(iv) Test of poverty	
(v) Test of occupation	
(vi) Test of habitation	
(vii) Nature of caste disabilities to be taken into account	
7. Caste disabilities ..	20
(i) Caste—Not the sole or dominant test	
(ii) Caste and economic cross-sections of the people	
(iii) No inflexible or hard and fast rule for ascertaining social backwardness	
(iv) Classification not vitiated if caste is excluded in a given situation, provided other tests are satisfied	
8. General principles regarding educational backwardness ..	22
(i) No hard and fast rule	
(ii) The State Government to decide it in a manner consistent with the requirement of Art. 15(4)	
9. Basis of investigations by the Commission ..	23
CHAPTER III	
10. Gist of the existing orders regarding reservation of seats	24
(i) Engineering Colleges and Polytechnics	
(ii) Medical Colleges	
(iii) Five classes of citizens	
(iv) List of Other Backward Communities/Classes maintained by the Department of Harijan Welfare (D.H.W. list)	
(v) P.S.C. list	
(vi) Practice of following D.H.W. list for purposes of admissions to the Medical and Agricultural Colleges—Not warranted by Government Memorandum D.Dis. 14141/57/EHD dated 5-7-1957	

- (vii) Saiva Vellala community—How they happened to be included in the list for purposes of admissions to the Engineering Colleges
- (viii) Listed communities and non-listed communities
- (ix) Difference between evidence given by members belonging to listed communities and non-listed communities
11. Social Backwardness .. 29
- (i) Tests adopted by the Commission—Neither just nor practical in the conditions existing in Kerala to make a classification under Art. 15(4) eschewing all considerations of caste or community.
- (ii) Blended approach based on “economic factors” and “caste or community”
- (iii) Upper or wealthier sections and caste disabilities
- (iv) Evidence from members of non-listed communities
- (v) Evidence from members of listed communities
- (vi) Prosecutions under the Untouchability (Offences) Act, 1955.
12. Nature of caste/community disabilities to be taken into account .. 34
- (i) Vestiges of caste/community disabilities
13. Means-cum-caste/community test for classifications .. 34
- (i) Lower income group alone to be taken in
- (ii) The wealthier sections to be excluded
14. The Income level for means-cum-caste/community test.. 35
- (i) Lower income group defined
- (ii) Higher income group of all castes/communities—Not socially backward
15. Social backwardness and communities outside the Hindu fold .. 36
16. Test occupation .. 37
- (i) Traditional occupation and social stigma
- (ii) Social stigma of persons not at present following the traditional occupation of their community
- (iii) Persons in a community following the traditional occupation of another community—Seldom affected by social stigma

- (iv) Only the lower income groups are affected by social stigma
 - (v) Change of occupation and difficulty of identification of persons occupation-wise
 - (vi) Posts of last grade Government servants, factory workers—Not social depressants
 - (vii) Manual labourers—An extremely fluctuating group
17. Test of habitation .. 39
- (i) Mere residence in Malabar area—Not cause for social backwardness, eventhough Malabar area is educationally backward
18. Test for educational backwardness ... 40
- (i) Number of graduates in a community—A highly unrealistic test
 - (ii) Lower and upper primary stages—Too low a test
 - (iii) Literacy test—Inadequate
 - (iv) A Composite test—Necessity for.
 - (v) State average of the students in standard X—First element of the Composite test
 - (vi) Number of persons per thousand in a community who have not completed primary education—Second element of the composite test
 - (vii) Criteria for the first two elements of the composite test—Fixed
 - (viii) Fall-out between the number of students in Standard I and Standard X—Third element of the composite test
 - (ix) Total absence of any student in the community—Fourth element of the composite test
19. Tests for social and educational backwardness—Summed up .. 44
- CHAPTER IV
20. Socially and educationally backward classes—Specified .. 45
- (i) Lower income groups of castes/communities mentioned in App. VIII—Socially and Educationally backward.
 - (ii) Statistics relating to admission in the Medical and Engineering Colleges and Polytechnics

- (iii) Lower income group—Defined
- (iv) Approximate estimate of population of lower income groups
21. Ezhavas .. 46
- (i) Population
- (ii) Caste disability in the past.
- (iii) Present disability due to caste.
- (iv) Statistics regarding prosecution under the Untouchability (Offences) Act, 1955
- (v) Economic position of Ezhavas compared with that of Nayars
- (vi) Social and educational backwardness of lower income groups of Ezhavas
22. Muslims .. 50
- (i) Population
- (ii) Lower income group of Muslims
- (iii) Muslims as one community
- (iv) Social backwardness
- (v) Educational backwardness
- (vi) Social & educational backwardness of the lower income group
23. Latin Catholics .. 52
- (i) Population
- (ii) Lower income group of Latin Catholics (other than Anglo-Indians)
- (iii) Social backwardness of Latin Catholics (other than Anglo-Indians)
- (iv) Educational backwardness
- (v) Social and educational backwardness of the lower income group of Latin Catholics other than Anglo-Indians
24. Anglo-Indians .. 52
- (i) Population
- (ii) Educational attainment
- (iii) Economic position
- (iv) No caste/communal disabilities
- (v) Not socially and educationally backward.

25. Other Backward Christians .. 53
- (i) S.I.U.C. and Converts to Christianity from Scheduled castes
 - (ii) Converts to Christianity—Term—Defined
 - (iii) Social backwardness
 - (iv) Educational backwardness
 - (v) Population
 - (vi) Social and educational backwardness of the lower income group
26. Memorandum from the B.C.C.F. Kottayam .. 54
- (i) Population of Backward Classes Christians
 - (ii) Demand for separate reservation of 10%
27. Other Backward Hindus .. 55
- (i) Other Backward Hindus—Specified
 - (ii) Social backwardness
 - (iii) Educational backwardness
28. Differences between Appendix VIII and the P.S.C. and D.H.W. Lists .. 57
- (i) Communities named in the existing P.S.C. and D.H.W. lists but not found in Kerala
 - (ii) Twelve communities in the two lists—Not socially and educationally backward
 - (iii) Fifteen communities at present treated as, or as eligible for educational concessions normally allowed to, Scheduled Castes/Scheduled Tribes in certain parts of the State
29. Groups of persons other than those specified in App. VIII—Need not be treated as socially and educationally backward classes .. 60

CHAPTER V

30. Existing position regarding reservation in the Medical, Engineering (including Polytechnics), Agricultural, Veterinary and Arts & Science Colleges .. 61

31. Arts & Science Colleges .. 61
- (i) Undergraduate course—Reservation not necessary for the socially and educationally backward classes specified in App. VIII
 - (ii) Post-graduate courses—5% reservation may be made for 10 years in favour of the socially and educationally backward classes specified in App. VIII
32. Professional Institutions .. 62
- (i) Statistics regarding the M.B.B.S. course
 - (ii) Statistics regarding the Pre-medical course
 - (iii) Statistics regarding the Agricultural & Veterinary Colleges
 - (iv) Statistics regarding the Engineering Colleges & Polytechnics
 - (v) Reservation with some reduction to continue for 10 years in the case of the Medical, Engineering, Agricultural and Veterinary Colleges and Polytechnics
 - (vi) Quantum of reservation
 - i. General principle suggested by Supreme Court
 - ii. Commission's recommendations regarding the quantum of reservation in Medical, Engineering, Agricultural and Veterinary Colleges and Polytechnics
 - iii. The minimum of 50% marks—To be made applicable to the socially and educationally backward classes other than Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes
 - iv. Seats in the reserved pool, if left unavailed of—To go to the open merit pool.
 - v. Seats reserved for each of the Classes IV and V—To be filled up by qualified candidates belonging to the respective class as a whole without further distribution among the groups under each class

CHAPTER VI

33. Allocation of seats between Malabar and Travancore-Cochin areas .. 71
- (i) Existing position regarding allocation

- (ii) A reasonable allocation of seats between Malabar and Travancore-Cochin areas based on educational backwardness and residence—Not contrary to or violative of the provisions of the Constitution
- (iii) Malabar area is educationally backward compared to Travancore-Cochin area—Statistics regarding
- (iv) A reasonable allocation of seats between Malabar and Travancore-Cochin area to continue for some years more
- (v) 20% of the general seats to be allocated between Malabar area and Travancore-Cochin area in the ratio 5:8 for a period of 10 years
- (vi) Conditions governing eligibility of candidates for seats allotted for Malabar area
- (vii) The result of the Commission's recommendations

CHAPTER VII

Conclusion

- | | | |
|--|----|----|
| 34. Summary of Principal Recommendations | .. | 77 |
| 35. Acknowledgment | .. | 79 |

APPENDICES

	<i>Pages</i>
I. Questionnaire	83
II. List of persons and organisations who have given memoranda to the Commission	89
III. List of persons who have given oral evidence before the Commission	94
IV. P.S.C. List	112
V. D.H.W. List	113
VI. List of prosecutions under the Untouchability (Offences) Act, 1955	117
VII. Statement of number of students in different standards in Schools during 1964-65	118
VIII. List of socially and educationally backward classes of citizens in Kerala for purposes of Art. 15(4)	126
IX. Table showing the percentage of candidates (community-wise) selected for the M.B.B.S. and the percentage that would have been selected had there been no reservation of seats	134
X. Table showing the percentage of candidates (community-wise) selected for the Pre-Medical and the percentage that would have been selected had there been no reservation of seats	135
XI. Statement showing the number of qualified applications, the percentage, etc. in respect of Medical College (M.B.B.S. Course) for the periods 1962-63 and 1963-64	136
XII. Statement showing the number of seats which each community would have secured had there been no reservation percentage etc. in respect of Engineering Colleges from 1962-63 to 1964-65	137
XIII. Statement showing the number of seats which each community would have secured had there been no reservation, percentage etc. in respect of Polytechnics from 1962-63 to 1964-65	138
XIV. Community-wise population of Kerala as in 1961	139-142