

**DYARCHY IN PRACTICE**

# DYARCHY IN PRACTICE

BY

A. APPADORAI, M.A., PH.D.

LOYOLA COLLEGE, MADRAS

MEMBER, INSTITUTE OF PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION

WITH A FOREWORD BY

PROF. A. B. KEITH, D.C.L., D.LITT., F.B.A.

LONGMANS, GREEN AND CO., LTD.

39, PATERNOSTER ROW, LONDON, E. C. 4

MADRAS, BOMBAY, CALCUTTA

NEW YORK AND TORONTO

1937

*First Published 1937*

*All rights reserved*

PRINTED IN INDIA AT G. S. PRESS, MADRAS.

TO THE MEMORY OF  
M. A. CANDETH

## FOREWORD

Only the progress of events under the new constitution of the provinces of India will enable the making of a just estimate of the value to India of the system of dyarchy. Those of us who criticised the scheme as suggested by Mr. Montagu and Lord Chelmsford, on the score that its safeguards must prevent the effective evolution of ministerial responsibility even within the sphere assigned to ministers, are probably inclined to hold that events have justified our doubts. But it is essential to remember that the idea of relaxing control of Indian affairs was strange to the House of Commons in 1919, and it may well be that nothing more revolutionary than the Act of 1919 could have received acceptance. Certainly in England at that time the prevailing feeling in political circles was not that too little was being conceded, but that grave risks were involved in the extent of the grant.

In any case the history of dyarchy presents the highest interest for all students of politics and history. The materials are abundant and indeed almost embarrassing in their copiousness. To master the evidence and to make effective use of it is a task demanding not merely great industry, but soundness of judgment and the power to discriminate between essentials and minor details. Dr. Appadorai in this study shows these qualities in a marked degree. He has included all that is necessary for a full understanding of the genesis of the system and of its operation. His judgments are sober and well balanced, and it is improbable that anything

can be adduced seriously to affect his summing up of the merits and demerits of the system. The University of Madras deserves warm congratulations on so successful a study in the difficult field of contemporary history by a former Research Fellow in its Department of Indian History.

UNIVERSITY OF EDINBURGH,  
14-11-36.

A. BERRIEDALE KEITH

## PREFACE

Every new scheme of government is a valuable addition to the political experience of mankind. Dyarchy is a novel experiment in government on a large scale. It was introduced in the Indian provinces in 1921. The system has been at work for well-nigh sixteen years, and is now passing into history. This Essay is an attempt to study the working of dyarchy and estimate its value as a political system. The writer hopes that it may be of some use to students of government and in particular of Indian constitutional history.

The material on which the study is based falls into two well-defined classes. We have, first, the theoretical discussions beginning with 'The Duke Memorandum' which led up to the Government of India Act, 1919. These discussions enable the student to trace the genesis of the system and explain its theoretical foundations. Secondly, there are the records of the practical working of dyarchy in the several provinces—the memoranda of provincial governments, the proceedings of legislative councils and the evidence given by ministers and Executive Councillors before the Reforms Enquiry Committee (1924) and the Indian Statutory Commission (1927). These documents give us some insight into the many complex problems which arose in the working of dyarchy—the relations between the Reserved Half and the Transferred Half of government, the place of joint deliberation and a joint purse, the attitude of the legislature to the two sides of government and the position of the Governor in the constitution.

A list of the relevant documents is given in the appendix.

The writer desires to express his gratitude to Prof. K. A. Nilakanta Sastri, M.A., and Dr. P. S. Lokanathan, M.A., D.Sc., (London), of the University of Madras for willing help rendered in the preparation and publication of the thesis. Prof. Sastri not only suggested the subject of the thesis, but helped in the elucidation of various points that arose in the course of the work and helped in arranging for its publication. Dr. Lokanathan likewise was always ready to discuss the points referred to him; he also kindly read the proofs and offered valuable suggestions.

The writer is deeply grateful to Prof. Arthur Berriedale Keith, D.C.L., D.LITT., F.B.A., who so kindly read the manuscript and wrote the Foreword.

MADRAS, }  
31-3-1937. }

A. A.



# CONTENTS

	PAGE
FOREWORD	.. vii
PREFACE	.. ix

## PART I

### THE INTRODUCTION OF DYARCHY

#### CHAPTER I.

THE BACKGROUND	.. 3
(1) The Term 'Dyarchy'	.. 3
(2) Origin and Development of The Idea	.. 9
(3) Alternative Schemes	.. 20
(4) Hopes and Fears	.. 30
(5) Final Adoption	.. 35

#### CHAPTER II.

THE ESSENTIALS OF DYARCHY	.. 37
(1) The Basic Principle	.. 37
(2) The Transfer of Subjects	.. 38
(3) Dualism in the Executive	.. 42
(4) Mutual Co-operation	.. 50
(5) Progress by Stages	.. 52
(6) Checks and Balances	.. 54

#### CHAPTER III.

SOME CONSIDERATIONS	.. 56
(1) Social Foundations	.. 56
(2) Communalism	.. 57
(3) Financial Stringency	.. 60

	PAGE
(4) The Political Factor	.. 65
(5) A Bird's-eye View	.. 69

## PART II

### THE WORKING OF DYARCHY

#### CHAPTER IV.

THE RESERVED HALF	.. 77
(1) The Governor	.. 77
(2) The Reserved Side of Government	.. 78
(3) Attitude of the Legislature	.. 80
(4) How the Executive Reacts	.. 95
(5) Some Conclusions	.. 112

#### CHAPTER V.

THE RESERVED HALF VIS-A-VIS THE TRANSFERRED HALF	.. 117
(1) Points of Contact	.. 117
(2) Joint Deliberation	.. 127
(3) In The Legislature	.. 151

#### CHAPTER VI

FINANCE UNDER DYARCHY	.. 161
(1) Joint Purse vs. Separate Purse	.. 161
(2) Financial Arrangements	.. 173
(3) The Practice	.. 183

#### CHAPTER VII.

THE TRANSFERRED SIDE OF GOVERNMENT	.. 204
(1) Appointment of Ministers	.. 204
(2) Joint Responsibility	.. 208

## CONTENTS

xiii

	PAGE
(3) Governor vis-a-vis Ministers	.. 223
(4) The Services	.. 240

### CHAPTER VIII.

ATTITUDE OF THE LEGISLATURE TOWARDS THE TRANSFERRED HALF	.. 258
(1) Two Factors	.. 258
(2) Parties	.. 266
(3) General Attitude	.. 283
(4) Enforcing Responsibility	.. 294
(5) Wrecking the Constitution	.. 305
(6) Temporary Administration	.. 315
(7) The Council and the Governor	.. 318

### CHAPTER IX.

CONTROL FROM ABOVE	.. 320
(1) The General Principle	.. 320
(2) Reserved Subjects	.. 321
(3) Transferred Subjects	.. 334

## PART III

### SOME CONCLUSIONS

#### CHAPTER X

AN ESTIMATE	.. 347
(1) Introductory	.. 347
(2) Defects	.. 349
(3) Training in Responsibility	.. 365
(4) Achievements	.. 375

	PAGE
<b>CHAPTER XI</b>	
<b>THE LESSON OF EXPERIENCE</b>	.. 377
<b>APPENDICES</b>	
A. Statutory Provisions Relating to Dyarchy in the Government of India Act, 1919	.. 385
B. List of Transferred Subjects	.. 391
<b>NOTES AND REFERENCES</b>	.. 399
<b>BIBLIOGRAPHY</b>	.. 419
<b>INDEX</b>	.. 427

## INDEX

- Abdur Rahim, Sir, 214  
Adjournment motions, 82  
Aristotle, 229  
Asquith, 273  
Assam, joint deliberation in, 133-4
- Balfour, Lord, 56  
Basu, the Hon. Babu Bhupendranath, 3, 15
- Bengal—  
  deadlocks in, 67  
  Diwan in, 4-5  
  joint deliberation in, 135-42  
  joint responsibility in, 214-5  
  reduction of grants in, 83-6  
  standing committees in, 97  
  working of the Constitution in, 310-8
- Bihar—  
  joint deliberation in, 135-42  
  the Reserved Half and the legislature in, 81
- Bombay—  
  attitude of the legislature to the Reserved Half in, 88-90  
  parties in, 267  
  standing committees in, 97
- Burma—  
  attitude of the legislature to the Reserved Half in, 88-90  
  joint deliberation in, 133-4  
  parties in, 267
- Butler, Sir Harcourt, 101
- Carmichael, Lord, 103-4, 248  
Central Provinces, the—  
  deadlocks in, 67  
  joint deliberation in, 133-4  
  joint responsibility in, 215  
  reduction of grants in, 83-6  
  standing committees in, 97  
  the legislature and ministers in, 286  
  working of the Constitution in, 310-8
- Certification, 44, 107, 109  
Chakravarti, Mr., 214, 222  
Checks and balances, see dyarchy  
Chelmsford, Lord, 11, 15  
Chintamani, Mr., 214, 232  
Civil disobedience, 67-8  
Committee on Division of Functions, the, 39, 41, 329  
Communalism, 57-60  
Congress—League scheme, the 25  
Council Secretaries, 293-4  
Cromer, the Earl of, 7, 113  
Curtis, Mr. Lionel, 3, 6, 9, 13, 15, 17, 166, 209, 379  
Curzon, Lord, 349
- Das, Mr. C. R., 66, 269, 307  
Democracy, 229  
Devolution rules, 130-1, 177, 211, 237  
Division of subjects, 38-42, 126-7  
Duke Memorandum, the, 14-5  
Duke, Sir William, 13, 14  
Dyarchy—  
  a bird's-eye view of, 69, 73  
  achievements of, 375-6  
  adoption of, 35-6  
  basic principle, 37-8  
  checks and balances, 54-5  
  communalism and, 57-60  
  control from above, 320-44  
  defects of, 349-75  
  difficult to work, 364-5  
  dualism in the Executive, 42-9

- essentials of, 37-5  
 forms of, 20-9  
 friction under, 363-4  
 hopes and fears, 30-5  
 introduction of, 1-73  
 lesson of experience, the,  
 377-82  
 meaning of the term, 2-8  
 mutual co-operation, 50-2  
 origin and development of  
 the idea, 9-20  
 progress by stages, 52-4  
 responsibility under, 265-75  
 suspension and revocation of  
 transfer, 317-8  
 transfer of subjects, 38-42  
 working of, the, 75-344  
 wrecking the constitution,  
 305-15  
*see also* finance  
 parties
- Electorate, 276-9, 373-5  
 Executive Council, the—  
 appointment of, 78  
 meetings of, 45-6, 78-9  
 ministers and, 152-60  
 tenure of office of, 78  
*see also* Reserved Half
- Feetham, Mr., 41  
 Feroz Khan Noon, Mr., 221
- Finance—  
 financial arrangements, 173-  
 83  
 financial stringency, 60-5  
 funds for the Reserved Half,  
 83-8  
 Joint Financial Secretary,  
 201-3  
 joint purse *vs.* separate purse,  
 161-73  
 Meston settlement, the, 62-4,  
 334  
 working of joint budget,  
 the, 183-8  
*see also* Finance department
- Finance department, the—  
 a reserved one, 198-9  
 a spending department,  
 199-200  
 constitutional position of,  
 175-81  
 examination of schemes of  
 expenditure, 190-6  
 functions of, 176-81  
 ministers' relations with,  
 188-201  
 part of the Reserved Half,  
 181-3
- Gandhi, Mahatma, 66, 67, 68,  
 307  
 Ghuznavi, Mr. A. K., 214  
 Goschen, Lord, 365
- Governor, the—  
 attitude to joint responsi-  
 bility, 215-21  
 a unifying agency, 50-1, 123-5  
 powers in respect of reserv-  
 ed subjects, 43-4  
 powers in respect of trans-  
 ferred subjects, 44-6  
 sources of his strength,  
 235-40  
 special powers of, 107-12  
 the legislature and, 43-5,  
 318-9  
*vis-a-vis* ministers, 223-40  
*see also* legislature  
 Reserved Half  
 Services
- Governor-General, 324, 329-32  
 Governor-General in Council  
*see* reserved subjects  
 transferred subjects
- Government of India Act of  
 1919, clauses relating to  
 dyarchy, 385-90
- Governor in Council, *see* Re-  
 served Half
- Hardinge, Lord, 11

- Indian Civil Service, the, 241, 247, 253
- Indian Statutory Commission, the, 63, 67, 71, 334
- Innes, Sir C., 249
- Instrument of Instructions to the Governor, the, 45, 46, 50, 130, 156, 227, 229-30, 232, 236, 245, 299-300.
- Instrument of Instructions to the Governor-General, the, 327
- Irwin, Lord, 360
- Islington, Lord, 29, 128
- Jagat Narain, Pandit, 214
- Jallianwala Bagh, the, 65
- Joint Address, the, 16-7
- Joint deliberation—  
 merits of, 149-51  
 pitfalls, 142-8  
 scope of, 130-2  
 texts bearing on, 127-9  
 theory of, 51-2  
 the practice of local Governments, 132-42
- Joint responsibility, *see* ministers
- Joint Select Committee of 1919, the, 49, 54, 85, 99, 108, 129, 151, 158, 172, 205, 207-8, 210, 225-7, 232, 261, 300, 312, 323
- Jones Law, the, 8
- Justice party, the, 272
- Keith, Prof., 304
- Kelkar, Mr., 220
- Kerr, Sir John, 234
- Khilafat movement, the, 66, 307
- Layton, 184
- Lee Commission, *see* Services
- Legislature, the—  
 and the Governor, 318-9  
 attitude of, to ministers, 155-60, 283-303  
 attitude to taxation, 287-8  
 attitude to the Reserved Half, 80-95  
 criticism by, 288-9  
 enforces responsibility, 294-303  
 no-confidence motions in, 295-6, 297-303  
 provision of funds for reserved subjects, 83-8  
 reduction of grants, 83-8  
 sense of responsibility of, 370-3  
 standing committees of, 96-8  
 the Services and, 255  
*see also* nominated members.
- Lytton, Lord, 137, 350
- Madras—  
 council secretaries in, 293-4  
 joint deliberation in, 135-42  
 joint responsibility in, 214  
 the legislature and ministers in, 286
- Marr, Mr., 192
- Marris, Sir William, 138, 147
- Maynard, Sir John, 143
- Meston settlement *see* finance
- Meston, Sir James, 27
- Meyer, Sir William, 3, 209, 248
- Ministers—  
 appointed as Executive Councillors, 240  
 appointment of, 43  
 attitude to reserved subjects, 151-60  
 joint responsibility of, 208-22  
 legal responsibility of, 303-5  
 no confidence motions against, 297-303  
 number of, the, 206  
 refusal of salary of, 312-5  
 responsibility of, 294-305, 365-70  
 salary of, 206-8  
 status of, 206-8  
 tenure of office, 43  
 the Reserved Half and, 97-8, 117-60

- the Services and, 249-55  
 see also Executive Council  
 Governor  
 Transferred Half
- Minto-Morley reforms, the, 10
- Misra, Mr., 215
- Mommsen, 3
- Montagu-Chelmsford Report,  
 the, 17-20, 99, 161, 204,  
 209, 225-7, 260, 337, 338,
- Montagu, Mr., 16, 17, 52, 88,  
 128, 132, 338
- Morley, Lord, 249
- Motilal Nehru, Pandit, 307
- Nationalist Unionist party, the,  
 273
- Nation-building departments,  
 95, 291
- No-confidence motions, see  
 legislature
- Nominated members—  
 importance of, the, 258-60  
 non-official, 98, 99-100, 103-5,  
 263-4
- number of, 98  
 official, 98-103, 260-3  
 position in regard to trans-  
 ferred subjects, 259-65
- Non-co-operation, 66, 307-8
- Panagal, the Raja of, 140
- Parties—  
 absence of organized parties,  
 281-3  
 communal, 272-3  
 dyarchy and, 275-80  
 importance of, 266  
 in Bombay, 267  
 in Burma, 267  
 in the Punjab, 267  
 organization of, 267-9, 272-80  
 party loyalty, 274-5  
 political, 272-3  
 Swarajya party, the, 66-7,  
 69-70, 240, 269, 269-71,  
 305-15
- Philippines, the, 7-8
- Pitt's India Act, 5
- Plural control, 126
- Provincial Audit Resolution,  
 323
- Provincial States, the plan of,  
 22-5
- Punjab—  
 attitude of legislature to the  
 Reserved Half in, 88-90  
 joint deliberation in, 133-4  
 joint responsibility in, 214  
 parties in, 267
- Questions, 82-3
- Rahimtoola, Sir Ibrahim, 25
- Reappropriation, 178, 197-8, 199
- Reddy, Mr. C. R., 411
- Reduction of salary, 295-6
- Rees, Sir John, 351
- Reforms Enquiry Committee,  
 the, 71, 138, 184, 200, 202,  
 218, 221, 228, 232, 295,  
 313
- Reserved Half, the—  
 appointment of, 43  
 control by the Government  
 of India over, 320-34  
 control by the Secretary of  
 State over, 320-34  
 Governor, the, 77-9  
 meets the opposition of the  
 legislature, 95-112  
 tenure of office, 43  
 the legislature and, 43-4  
*vis-a-vis* the Transferred  
 Half, 117-60  
 see also joint deliberation  
 legislature
- Reserved subjects  
 allocation of funds for, 188  
 control by the Governor-  
 General in Council, 46-8,  
 320-34  
 control by the Secretary of  
 State, 46-8, 320-34
- Resolutions, 82



- Responsible government, 59, 366
- Restoration of grants, 44-5, 107-8, 109-11
- Rieu, Sir Louis, 93
- Ronaldshay, the Earl of, 84, 137
- Rosebery, 273-4
- Round Table Conference, the first, 67
- Rowlatt Act, the, 307
- Rules of executive business, 121-5, 217-9, 246
- Secretary of State, the—  
*see* reserved subjects  
 transferred subjects
- Secretary of State in Council, the right of appeal of the Services to, 245
- Selborne, the Earl of, 38
- Services, the—  
 All-India, 241  
 Governor and, 236, 245-6  
 Lee Commission's recommendations, 241-3  
 overlapping of, 255-7  
 problems of, under dyarchy, 240-1  
 protection of the rights of, 339, 341-2  
 rights of, the, 241-7  
*see also* legislature  
 ministers
- Sinha, Sir Satyendra (later Lord), 11, 22, 304
- Sly, Sir Frank, 167
- Standing Committees, *see* legislature
- Supplementary questions, 83
- Surendranath Banerjea, 221
- Swarajya party, *see* parties
- Thirlwall, 3
- Times*, the, 304
- Transferred Half—  
 appointment of ministers, 204-6  
 control by the Government of India, 334-44  
 control by the Secretary of State, 334-55  
 the legislature and, 44-5, 258-319  
*see also* joint deliberation  
 ministers  
 Reserved Half  
 transferred subjects
- Transferred subjects—  
 allocation of funds for, 188  
 control by the Governor-General in Council, 46-8, 334-44  
 control by the Secretary of State, 46-8, 334-44  
 list of, 39-40, 391-7  
 temporary administration of, 315-7
- Triarchy, 29
- United Bihar party, the, 273
- United Provinces, the—  
 attitude of legislature to the Reserved Half, 88-90  
 joint deliberation in, 135-40  
 joint responsibility in, 214  
 parties in, 266-7
- Veto, 107, 318-9
- Wheeler, Sir Henry, 298
- Wrecking the constitution, 305-15
- Yate, Colonel, 3, 9