

REPORT
ON
**Indian Constitutional
Reforms**



CALCUTTA
INDEPENDENT GOVERNMENT PRINTING, INDIA
1918

Price One Rupee or One Shilling and Six Pence

REPORT
ON
**Indian Constitutional
Reforms**



CALCUTTA
SUPERINTENDENT GOVERNMENT PRINTING, INDIA
1918

Agents for the Sale of Books published by the Superintendent of Government Printing, India, Calcutta

IN EUROPE.

Constable & Co., 10, Orange Street, Leicester Square, London, W.C.
 Kegan Paul, Trench, Trübner & Co., 68-74, Carter Lane, E.C., and 25, Museum Street, London, W.C.
 Bernard Quaritch, 11, Grafton Street, New Bond Street, London, W.
 P. S. King & Sons, 2 & 4, Great Smith Street, Westminster, London, S.W.
 H. S. King & Co., 65, Cornhill, E.C., and 9, Pall Mall, London, W.
 Grindlay & Co., 54, Parliament Street, London, S.W.

Luzac & Co., 46, Great Russell Street, London, W.C.
 W. Thacker & Co., 2, Creed Lane, London, E.C.
 T. Fisher Unwin, Ltd., 1, Adelphi Terrace, London, W.C.
 Wm. Wesley & Son, 28, Essex Street, Strand, London.
 B. H. Blackwell, 50 & 51, Broad Street, Oxford.
 Deighton Bell & Co., Ltd., Cambridge.
 Olver and Boyd, Tweeddale Court, Edinburgh.
 E. Ponsonby, Ltd., 116, Grafton Street, Dublin.
 Ernest Leroux, 23, Rue Bonaparte, Paris.
 Martinus Nijhoff, The Hague, Holland.

IN INDIA AND CEYLON.

Thacker, Spink & Co., Calcutta and Simla.
 Newman & Co., Calcutta.
 R. Cambay & Co., Calcutta.
 S. K. Lahiri & Co., Calcutta.
 B. Banerjee & Co., Calcutta.
 The Indian School Supply Depot, 309, Bow Bazar Street, Calcutta, and 226, Nawabpur, Dacca.
 Butterworth & Co. (India), Ltd., Calcutta.
 Rai M. C. Sarcar Bahadur & Sons, 90-2A, Harrison Road, Calcutta.
 The Weldon Library, 18-5, Chowringhee Road, Calcutta.
 Standard Literature Company, Ltd., Calcutta.
 Lal Chand & Sons, Calcutta.
 Higginbotham & Co., Madras.
 V. Kalyanarama Iyer & Co., Madras.
 G. A. Natesan & Co., Madras.
 S. Murthy & Co., Madras.
 Thompson & Co., Madras.
 Temple & Co., Madras.
 P. B. Rama Iyer & Co., Madras.
 Vas & Co., Madras.
 E. M. Gopalakrishna Kone, Madras.
 Thacker & Co., Ltd., Bombay.
 A. J. Combridge & Co., Bombay.
 D. B. Taraporevala, Sons & Co., Bombay.
 Mrs. Radhabai Atmaram Sagoon, Bombay.

Sunder Pandurang, Bombay.
 Gopal Narayan & Co., Bombay.
 Ram Chandra Govind & Son, Kalbadevi, Bombay.
 A. H. Wheeler, & Co., Allahabad, Calcutta and Bombay.
 N. B. Mathur, Supt., Nazir Kanun Hind Press, Allahabad.
 Rai Sahib M. Gulab Singh & Sons, Mufid-i-Am Press, Lahore and Allahabad.
 Rama Krishna & Sons, Lahore.
 Supt., American Baptist Mission Press, Rangoon.
 Manager, the "Hitavada," Nagpur.
 S. C. Talukdar, Proprietor, Students and Company, Cooch Behar.
 A. M. & J. Ferguson, Ceylon.
 Manager, Educational Book Depôts, Nagpur and Jubbulpore.*
 Manager of the Imperial Book Depot, 63, Chandney Chauk Street, Delhi.*
 Manager, "The Agra Medical Hall and Co-operative Association, Ltd." (Successors to A. John & Co., Agra).*
 Supt., Basel Mission Book and Tract Depository, Mangalore.*
 P. Varadachary & Co., Madras.*
 H. Liddell, Printer, etc., 7, South Road, Allahabad.*
 Ram Dayal Agarwala, 184, Katra, Allahabad.*
 D. C. Anand & Sons, Peshawar.*
 Manager, Newal Kishore Press, Lucknow.*

* Agents for the sale of Legislative Department publications only.

TABLE OF CONTENTS.

	PAGE
TRODUCTION—	
1. The Report	i
2. The inquiry has not affected war effort	i
3. Method of inquiry	i
4. Scope of the Report and meaning of terms employed	ii
5. Gravity of the task	iii
 PART I.—THE MATERIAL. 	
CHAPTER I.—RECENT EVENTS IN INDIA—	
6. The announcement in Parliament	1
7. A new policy	1
8. Morley-Minto reforms	2
9. Their character and reception	2
10. Decentralization Commission	3
11. The Imperial visit	4
12. Public Services Commission	5
13. Local self-government Resolution, 1915	5
14. Activities of political leaders	7
15. Opposition to executive measures	7
16. Resentment of racial discrimination	8
17. Zeal for social reform	9
18. Demand for more liberal institutions	9
19. Imperial aspirations	10
20. The outbreak of war. India's loyalty	10
21. Disaffected groups	11
22. Attitude of the politicians	13
23. Effects of the war. New sense of self-esteem	13
24. Emphasis on self-determination	14
25. The Home Rule movement	14
26. Position of the Muslims	14
27. Hindu-Muslim <i>entente</i>	15
28. Need for a new policy	16
 CHAPTER II.—GROWTH OF THE ADMINISTRATIVE SYSTEM— 	
29. Beginnings of British control	17
30. First intervention by Parliament	17
31. The Board of Control	17
32. The Secretary of State for India	18
33. Nature of Parliamentary control	19
34. Establishment of Parliamentary supremacy	21
35. Influence of Parliament on the Secretary of State and his Council	24
36. Powers of the Secretary of State	24
37. Development of British dominion	25
38. The Executive Council of the Governor General	26
39. Growth of the provincial system	27
40. The Presidencies	28
41. The Lieutenant-Governorships	28
42. The Central Provinces and Assam	29
43. Baluchistan and the N. W. F. Province	29
44. Minor administrations	30
45. Functions of government in India	30

PART I.—THE MATERIAL—*contd.*CHAPTER II.—GROWTH OF THE ADMINISTRATIVE SYSTEM—*contd.*

43. Sphere of the Government of India	31
47. Relations with the provincial Governments	31
48. Development of the existing system	32
49. Supervision by the Government of India	33
50. Extent of interference in provincial affairs	33

CHAPTER III.—GROWTH OF THE LEGISLATIVE COUNCILS—

51. Introductory	35
52. Beginnings of legislative power	35
53. Results of the <i>Diwani</i>	35
54. The Regulating Act, 1773	35
55. The Declaratory Act, 1780	36
56. Growing confusion of the legislative system	36
57. Its simplification and correction	37
58. Beginning of the Indian Legislative Council	37
59. Defects of its early form	38
60. Admission of Indians proposed	38
61. Establishment of provincial legislatures	38
62. Events leading up to changes	39
63. The Indian Councils Act, 1861	39
64. Character of the councils thereby established	40
65. Retrospect	41
66. The Indian Councils Act, 1892	41
67. Lord Dufferin's Committee	42
68. Lord Dufferin's views	43
69. Introduction of elections for provincial councils	44
70. Working of provincial regulations	46
71. Elections for the Indian Legislative Council	46
72. Reasons for further advance	46
73. Statement of the problem in 1907	47
74. Dissatisfaction with the solution	48
75. Salient features of the 1909 reforms. System of representation	49
76. Abandonment of official majority in the provincial councils	49
77. Legal recognition of the elective principle	50
78. Right to move resolutions	50
79. Nature of the advance made	51
80. A legislative convention	51
81. Conclusions	52

CHAPTER IV.—THE MORLEY-MINTO COUNCILS—

82. Introductory	53
83. Defects of the existing electoral system. Restricted nature of the franchise	53
84. Large proportion of lawyers returned	54
85. The official <i>bloc</i> . Its working	55
86. Its effect on officials	55
87. Effect on Indian members	56
88. Effect on council proceedings	56
89. Position of official members	56
90. Position of provincial Governments	57
91. Work of the councils	58
92. The Indian Legislative Council. Influence of non-official members on legislation	58
93. Private members' legislation	60

	PAGE
PART I.—THE MATERIAL—<i>contd.</i>	
CHAPTER IV.—THE MORLEY-MINTO COUNCILS—<i>contd.</i>	
94. Influences of the council on administration	60
95. Attitude of the non-official members	61
96. The provincial legislative councils	62
97. Use of the right of interrogation	63
98. Use of resolutions	63
99. Mr. Gokhale's expectations from the reforms	64
100. Reasons for their non-fulfilment	65
101. The present position	66
CHAPTER V.—THE EXISTING STRUCTURE—	
102. Relations between the Indian and the provincial Governments	68
103. Their general character	68
104. Financial devolution	68
105. Financial system up to 1861	69
106. Evolution of the settlement system	69
107. Settlements made <i>quasi</i> -permanent	70
108. Famine expenditure. Settlements made permanent	71
109. Defects of the system. Provincial expenditure	71
110. Provincial taxation	72
111. Provincial borrowing	73
112. Codes of instructions	73
113. Their justification	74
114. Legislative control. Statutory restrictions on the powers of provincial councils	74
115. Restrictions resulting from previous occupation of the legislative field	75
116. Restrictions imposed by executive directions	75
117. Administrative control. The need for uniformity	76
118. Initiation of new policies	77
119. Effect of responsibility to Parliament	77
120. The Indian constitution not federal	78
121. Provincial organization	78
122. The administrative machine	79
123. The district	79
124. Local self-government	80
125. Strength and weakness of the official system	81
126. The place of the Indian Civil Service	81
127. Effect of our proposals. In the district	82
128. And on the services	83
CHAPTER VI.—THE CONDITIONS OF THE PROBLEM—	
129. Effects of British rule	84
130. Purpose of present chapter	84
131. Basis of a system of responsibility	85
132. Conditions in India	85
133. Immensity of the problem	85
134. Extent of education	86
135. Distribution of wealth	87
136. Extent of interest in political questions	87
137. Political capacity of the rural population	88
138. Interests of the ryot	88
139. The politically-minded class	89
140. Their relations to the masses	90
141. Divisions of Indian society	91

PART I.—THE MATERIAL—*concl'd.*

PAGE.

CHAPTER VI.—THE CONDITIONS OF THE PROBLEM—*concl'd.*

142. Variety of local conditions	92
143. Reasons for emphasizing the difficulties	92
144. The justification of an advance	93
145. Conditions of success	93
146. Political education of the ryot	93
147. Obligations of the landed aristocracy	94
148. And of the smaller gentry	95
149. Duty of the educated classes towards the ryot	95
150. And towards agitation	96
151. Duty of discouraging religious animosities	96
152. Possible effect of the reforms	97
153. Advance must be gradual	98
154. Provision against religious dissension	98
155. And for the protection of the ryot and other interests	99
156. And for the services	99
157. Position of the Native States	100
158. Responsibility for foreign relations	101

CHAPTER VII.—THE CONGRESS-LEAGUE SCHEME—

159. Introductory	102
160. Provincial autonomy	102
161. Composition of provincial executives	102
162. The provincial legislative councils	104
163. Minority representation	105
164. Further safeguards for Muslim interests	105
165. Financial powers	106
166. Legislative powers	107
167. Relations between executive and legislature	107
168. Effect of resolutions	108
169. Proposals without a precedent	109
170. And fatal to good government	110
171. The veto an illusory safeguard	110
172. Proposals affecting the Government of India	111
173. Criticism of the scheme as a whole	111
174. Of its theory	112
175. As a means of education	112*
176. Unworkability in practice	113
177. The negation of responsible government	113

PART II.—THE PROPOSALS.

PRELIMINARY—

178. Reasons for a new policy	117
179. The logical outcome of the past	117
180. Hopes for the future	118
181. The education problem	118
182. Retrospect of education	119
183. Defects of the system	120
184. Social factors	120
185. Attitude of the ryot	120
186. Chief needs at present	121
187. Political importance of education	122
188. Extent of the advance proposed in local bodies	122
189. In provincial Governments	123

PART II.—THE PROPOSALS—*contd.*

PAGE

PRELIMINARY—*contd.*

190. In the Government of India	124
191. In England	124
192. Local self-government	125
193. The Government of India's proposals	126
194. Constitution of local boards	126
195. Powers of local boards	126
196. Panchayats	127
197. Comments on this programme	128
198. Scope of following proposals	128
199. Treatment of backward tracts	129

CHAPTER VIII.—THE PROVINCES—

Devolution to Provincial Governments—

200. Financial devolution	130
201. A new basis	130
202. Complete separation of revenues	130
203. Abolition of divided heads	131
204. Famine expenditure	132
205. Need for meeting the resultant deficit in the Indian budget	133
206. The means of so doing	133
207. The possible need for revision	135
208. Provincial budgets and balances	136
209. Code restrictions	136
210. Provincial taxation	136
211. Provincial borrowing	137
212. Legislative devolution	138
213. Administrative devolution	138

Provincial Executives—

214. Council government	139
215. The structure of the executive	140
216. Dualism set aside	140
217. An alternative plan	140
218. Our own proposals	142
219. Relation of the Governor to ministers	142
220. Additional members without portfolio	143
221. Working of the executive	143
222. Advantages and disadvantages of this plan	144
223. Its justification	145
224. A further proposal	145

Provincial Legislatures—

225. Composition of the councils	146
226. The system of election and the franchise	147
227. Communal electorates	147
228. They are opposed to the teaching of history	148
229. They perpetuate class division	148
230. They stereotype existing relation	149
231. The case of the Muhammadans	149
232. Other minority representation	150
233. Official members	151
234. Designation of members	151
235. Standing committees	152

PART II.—THE PROPOSALS—*contd.*

PAGE.

CHAPTER VIII.—THE PROVINCES—*contd.**Provincial Legislatures—contd.*

236. Control of business	152
237. Effect of resolutions	153
238. Division of the functions of government	153
239. Settlement of disputes	155
240. Powers of intervention	155
241. The justification of this division	155
242. Alternative methods of division	156
243. Plan of divisional councils	156
244. Reasons for rejecting it	157
245. Plan of provincial States	157
246. Reasons for rejecting it generally	158
247. Means of securing the affirmative power of legislation	159
248. By Government of India legislation	160
249. By ordinances	160
250. Other proposals	161
251. Advisory ordinance committees	161
252. Our proposals. Grand committees	161
253. Procedure after reference to grand committee	162
254. Treatment of mixed legislation	163
255. Budget procedure	164
256. Its difficulties and their solution	164
257. Safeguards against difficulties	165
258. Upper houses	166
259. Relations of the services to the Government	167

Future Development—

260. Modification by the Government of India	167
261. Periodic commission	168
262. Other matters for consideration by the commission	169
263. The importance of an electorate	169
264. Matter for special consideration	170

CHAPTER IX.—THE GOVERNMENT OF INDIA AND THE INDIA OFFICE—

(i)—The Government of India—

265. The need for change	171
266. The burden of work	171
267. Present causes of delay	172
268. References to the India Office	173
269. Insufficiency of staff	173
270. Inherent tendencies of an official Government	174
271. The Governor General's Executive Council	174
272. Increase in Indian element	174
273. The Indian Legislative Assembly	175
274. Representation of the provinces	176
275. Nominated members	176
276. Means of securing the affirmative power of legislation	177
277. The Council of State	178
278. Qualifications for membership	179
279. Legislative procedure. Government Bills	179
280. Private members' Bills	180
281. Advantages of this procedure	180
282. A possible objection	181

PART II.—THE PROPOSALS—*contd.*CHAPTER IX.—THE GOVERNMENT OF INDIA AND THE INDIA OFFICE—*contd.*(i)—*The Government of India—contd.*

283. Powers of dissolution, assent, etc.	181
284. Fiscal legislation. Effect of resolutions	182
285. Standing committees	182
286. Questions and rules of procedure	183
287. An Indian Privy Council	183
288. Periodic commission	183
289. Summary	184

(ii)—*The India Office—*

290. Powers of the Secretary of State	184
291. Delegation to the Government of India. In transferred matters	185
292. And in reserved matters	186
293. Organization of the India Office	187
294. Relations of the Secretary of State with Parliament	187
295. A select committee on Indian affairs	188

CHAPTER X.—THE NATIVE STATES—

296. Introductory	190
297. Position of the States	190
298. Effects of the war	190
299. Points of contact	191
300. Modern influences	192
301. Evolution of the Chiefs' Conference	192
302. Effect of British policy. The term "Native States"	193
303. Government intervention	193
304. Interpretation of treaties	194
305. Need for re-examination of the position	194
306. A Council of Princes	194
307. Standing committee of the council	195
308. Commissions of inquiry into disputes	196
309. And into cases of misconduct	196
310. Relations with the Government of India	196
311. Joint deliberation on matters of common interest	198
312. Future position of the States	198

CHAPTER XI.—MISCELLANEOUS—

(i)—*The Public Services—*

313. The case for increasing the Indian element	199
314. Limitations to this process	200
315. Removal of racial distinctions	201
316. Institution of recruitment in India	201
317. Percentage of appointments to be made in India	201
318. Improvement in the conditions of the European services	202
319. Pay	202
320. Pensions	203
321. Leave	203
322. Expatriation allowances	203
323. Future position of the European services	204
324. Work awaiting the English official	205
325. Protection of service interests	205
326. The Indian Civil Service	206
327. Its future opportunity	206

	PAGE.
PART II.—THE PROPOSALS—concl'd.	
CHAPTER XI.—MISCELLANEOUS—cont'd.	
<i>(ii)—The Army—</i>	
328. Indian wishes	207
329. Recognition of the services of the Indian Army	208
330. British commissions for Indians	209
<i>(iii)—Industries and Tariffs—</i>	
331. Political importance of the economic situation	210
332. Weakness of India's economic position	210
333. Indian suspicions	210
334. Need for Government action	211
335. The 'swadeshi' movement and the boycott	211
336. Reasons for a forward policy	212
337. Military value of economic development	212
338. Difficulties and potentialities	213
339. Need for technical development	214
340. Proposals of the Industrial Commission	214
341. Fiscal policy	215
342. Desire for a protective tariff	215
343. Method of deciding the question	216
<i>(iv)—The non-official community—</i>	
344. The European commercial community	216
345. Mission work	217
346. The Anglo-Indian community	217
<i>(v)—Social Relations—</i>	
347. Social relations of Europeans and Indians	218
348. Mutual obligations	219
CONCLUSION—	
349. Conception of India's future	219
350. Changes in the control by the Government of India	220
351. And by the India Office	220
352. And by Parliament	221
353. Review of proposals	221
354. Need for criticism	222
355. Acknowledgments	222
356. Conclusion	223
APPENDIX I	225
APPENDIX II	232
SUPPLEMENTARY PAPERS	239