

JOINT COMMITTEE ON
INDIAN CONSTITUTIONAL
REFORM

[SESSION 1933-34]

VOLUME I
(PART II)
PROCEEDINGS

[The REPORT of the Joint Committee [*Session 1933-34*] will be found in Volume I (Part I).]

[The RECORDS of the Joint Committee [*Session 1933-34*] will be found in Volume II.]

[*The PROCEEDINGS, EVIDENCE, and RECORDS of the Joint Committee [Session 1932-33] will be found in the following Parliamentary Papers of 1933: H.L. 79 (I), (IIA, B, C, and D), and (III); or H.C. 112 (I), (IIA, B, C, and D), and (III).*]

*Ordered by The House of Lords to be Printed
31st October, 1934*

*Ordered by The House of Commons to be Printed
31st October, 1934*

LONDON

PRINTED BY HIS MAJESTY'S STATIONERY OFFICE

1934

Price 12 annas

6 (1 Part II)

5 (1 Part II)

JOINT COMMITTEE ON
INDIAN CONSTITUTIONAL
REFORM

[SESSION 1933-34]

VOLUME I
(PART II)
PROCEEDINGS

[The REPORT of the Joint Committee [Session 1933-34] will be found in Volume I (Part I).]

[The RECORDS of the Joint Committee [Session 1933-34] will be found in Volume II.]

[The PROCEEDINGS, EVIDENCE, and RECORDS of the Joint Committee [Session 1932-33] will be found in the following Parliamentary Papers of 1933: H.L. 79 (I), (II A, B, C, and D), and (III); or H.C. 112 (I), (II A, B, C, and D), and (III).]

*Ordered by The House of Lords to be Printed
31st October, 1934*

*Ordered by The House of Commons to be Printed
31st October, 1934*

LONDON

PRINTED BY HIS MAJESTY'S STATIONERY OFFICE

1934

Price 12 annas

H.L. 6 (1 Part II)

H.C. 5 (1 Part II)

SESSION 1932-33

[The *PROCEEDINGS, EVIDENCE, and RECORDS* of the Joint Committee [Session 1932-33] will be found in the following Parliamentary papers of 1933: H.L. 79 (I), (II A, B, C, and D), and (III); or H.C. 112 (I), (II A, B, C, and D), and (III).]

SESSION 1933-34

VOLUME I

PART I

REPORT

	<i>Page</i>
Preface	v
List of Contents	viii
Section I. The Principles of a Constitutional Settlement ..	1
Section II. Provincial Autonomy	28
Section III. The Federation	85
Section IV. The Federal Centre	91
Section V. Special Subjects	142
Section VI. Burma	245
First Appendix. Reprint of Proposals for Indian Constitutional Reform. (Cmd. 4268)	282
Second Appendix. Reprint of Proposals for Burma Constitutional Reform. (From Records of Joint Committee. Session 1932-33)	381
Index to Report. Sections I to V	409
" " " Section VI	425

PART II

PROCEEDINGS

Orders of Reference. (House of Lords)	v
(House of Commons)	viii
Preliminary discussions on Burma .. (29.11.33 to 1.12.33)	1
Discussions with Delegates from Burma† (5.12.33 to 20.12.33)	3
Discussions on White Papers (30.1.34 to 5.6.34)	13

† These discussions were held in private and the transcripts of them have been destroyed by order of the Joint Committee, with the exception of the preliminary discussion between the Joint Committee and the Delegates from Burma on the 6th and 7th December 1933, which was published in Record B1, (*vide* page 115, Vol. II, Records of the Joint Committee (Session 1933-34).)

	<i>Page</i>
Draft Report* laid before the Joint Committee by the Lord in the Chair (<i>Printed in extenso</i>) (18.6.34)	33
Draft Report* laid before the Joint Committee by Mr. Attlee (<i>Printed in extenso</i>) (18.6.34)	253
Amendments moved to Chairman's Draft Report (19.6.34 to 24.7.34)	289
Alternative Part I† (Introduction, Paras. 1 to 42B) laid before the Joint Committee by the Lord in the Chair (<i>Printed in extenso</i>) (24.7.34)	470
Amendments moved to the Chairman's Draft Report (25.7.34 to 1.8.34 and 8.10.34 to 11.10.34).. .. .	492
Key to Amendments moved to the Chairman's Draft Report	627

VOLUME II

RECORDS

A1.

I. Notes by the Secretary of State for India on the Points of Difference between the Proposals for Constitutional Reform in Burma and in India	1
II. Memorandum by the Secretary of State for India on the Franchise, Composition of the Legislature, and Representation of Minorities and Special Interests in Burma	9
III. Memorandum by the Secretary of State for India on Excluded Areas in Burma	95

A2.

I. Memorandum by the Secretary of State for India on Discrimination in Burma	103
II. Memorandum by the Secretary of State for India giving Proposals for the future administration of the Burma railways	109

B1.

Record of a General Discussion between the Joint Committee and the Delegates from Burma on the 6th and 7th December, 1933	115
---	-----

* The Joint Committee decided to consider the Draft Report laid before them by the Lord in the Chair.

† The Joint Committee decided to consider this alternative Part I (Paras. 1 to 42B), in lieu of the Introduction in the original Draft Report laid before them by the Lord in the Chair on 18.6.34.

B2.		<i>Page</i>
Memoranda submitted by the Delegates from Burma after the termination of their discussions with the Joint Committee		177

B3.

Supplementary Memoranda submitted by Delegates from Burma commenting on Memoranda submitted by Mr. K. B. Harper on Trade Relations between India and Burma and on commercial discrimination (<i>vide</i> Record B2, p. 221)	275
--	-----

C1.

Papers submitted by the Secretary of State for India :—

I. Memorandum by the Secretary of State for India on the Action contemplated in relation to Family Pension Funds	309
II. Government of India, Home Department, Resolution, dated 4th July, 1934	315
III. A Note by the Secretary of State for India on Terrorism in India	319
IV. Questions asked by the Marquess of Salisbury on the position of the States in the Federal Finance Scheme of the White Paper, and replies thereto by the Secretary of State for India	361
V. Memorandum by the Secretary of State for India on the Federal Legislature	367
VI. Letter from the Secretary of State for India to the Chairman on the proposed boundaries for Orissa ..	369

C2.

Papers submitted by Members of the Committee :—

I. Memorandum by the Earl of Derby, the Marquess of Zetland and Sir Austen Chamberlain, on direct <i>versus</i> indirect election	371
II. Memoranda by the Lord Rankeillour—	
(a) On the relations of the two Houses of the Federal Legislature in regard to supply	373
(b) On the Courts in India	374
(c) On special powers in relation to Defence	375
III. Memorandum by the Earl of Derby and Sir Joseph Nall on Commercial Discrimination	377
IV. Memorandum by Mr. C. R. Attlee on Responsibility at the Centre	381
V. Memorandum by the Lord Hardinge of Penshurst on the Anglo-Indian Community	385

C3.

Consultation on Irrigation and Forestry.

	<i>Page</i>
(1) Irrigation—	
I. Memorandum by Sir Raymond Hadow, C.I.E., A.M.Inst.C.E.	387
II. Notes for Consultation with the Committee, by Mr. (now Sir) C. T. Mullings, C.S.I.	391
III. Consultation between the Committee and Sir Raymond Hadow and Mr. (now Sir) C. T. Mullings	393
(2) Forestry—	
I. Memorandum by Sir Alexander Rodger, O.B.E. ..	415
II. Consultation between the Committee and Sir Alexander Rodger	417
 Index to Records	 435

	<i>£</i>	<i>s.</i>	<i>d.</i>
The approximate cost of the Joint Committee during the session 1932–33 was	24,869	1	0
The approximate cost of the Joint Committee during the session 1933–34 was as follows :—			
The cost of printing, indexing and publishing the volumes is estimated by the Stationery Office at :—			
Vol. I, Part I	1,250	0	0
Vol. I, Part II	835	0	0
Vol. II	490	0	0
The cost of repayment of the expenses of the Delegates from Burma was	1,178	0	0
The cost of printing draft reports and marshalled list of amendments was	425	0	0
The cost of the shorthand notes of the Discussions was	246	17	7
The cost of duplicating Confidential Memoranda, Circulars, etc.	115	4	9
	£29,409	3	4

ORDERS OF REFERENCE

HOUSE OF LORDS

Die Jovis 23° Novembris 1933

Message from the Commons that they have come to the following Resolution to which they desire the concurrence of this House, viz. : That, before Parliament is asked to take a decision upon the proposals contained in Command Paper 4268, it is expedient that a Joint Committee of Lords and Commons, with power to call into consultation representatives of the Indian States and of British India, be appointed to consider the future government of India and, in particular, to examine and report upon the proposals in the said Command Paper : The said message *considered* (on motion) : Then it was *moved*, That this House do concur in the said Resolution communicated by the Commons (The Lord Chancellor) ; *agreed to* ; and a message ordered to be sent to the Commons to acquaint them therewith.

Die Martis 28° Novembris 1933

Message from the Commons that they have appointed a Committee to consist of Sixteen Members to join with a Committee of this House, with power to call into consultation representatives of the Indian States and of British India, to consider the future Government of India and, in particular, to examine and report upon the proposals contained in Command Paper 4268 ; that they have made the following Orders :—

That the Committee have power to send for persons, papers, and records, and to sit notwithstanding any Adjournment of the House.

That the Committee have power to report from time to time.

That the Committee have power to report from day to day or otherwise the Minutes of Evidence taken before them and such other records as they may think fit.

That the Committee have power, if the House be not sitting, to send such Minutes and records to the Clerk of the House, who shall thereupon give directions for the printing and circulation thereof, and shall lay the same upon the Table of the House at its next meeting.

That the Committee have power, if they so determine, to appoint one or more sub-committees to take evidence or to consider any matters that may be referred to them.

That any sub-committees so appointed shall have power to send for persons, papers, and records and to sit notwithstanding any Adjournment of the House.

That any evidence taken by such sub-committees shall be reported by them to the main Committee.

That the Minutes of Evidence taken before, and Records reported from, the Joint Committee appointed in Session 1932-33 to consider Indian Constitutional Reform be referred to the Committee.

That Eight be the quorum.

And to request this House to appoint an equal number of Lords to be joined with the Members of their House: The said Message *considered* (on motion).

Then it was *moved*, That a Committee of Sixteen Lords be appointed to join with the Committee of the Commons, as mentioned in the said Message, and that the Lords following be named of the Committee:—

Lord Archbishop of Canterbury.	Earl Peel.
Lord Chancellor.	Lord Middleton.
Marquess of Salisbury.	Lord Ker (M. Lothian).
Marquess of Zetland.	Lord Hardinge of Penshurst.
Marquess of Linlithgow.	Lord Irwin.
Marquess of Reading.	Lord Snell.
Earl of Derby.	Lord Rankeillour.
Earl of Lytton.	Lord Hutchison of Montrose.

That leave be given to the Committee to lay upon the Table from day to day or otherwise the Minutes of Evidence taken before them and also such other records as they may think fit; that such Minutes of Evidence and records be printed, and delivered out; That, if the House be not sitting, such Evidence and records shall be deemed to have been laid upon the Table of the House when delivered to the Clerk of the Parliaments.

That the Committee have power, if they so determine, to appoint one or more sub-committees to take evidence or to consider any matters that may be referred to them; that any evidence taken by any such sub-committee shall be deemed to be evidence taken before the Joint Committee.

That leave be give to the Committee to report from time to time.

That the Minutes of Evidence and Records of the Joint Committee on Indian Constitutional Reform laid upon the Table in the last Session be referred to the Committee (The Lord Chancellor); *agreed to* :

Ordered, That such Committee have power to agree with the Committee of the Commons in the appointment of a Chairman: Then a Message was ordered to be sent to the Commons to inform them of the appointment of the said Committee by this House, to acquaint them with the above resolutions, and to propose that the Joint Committee do meet in Grand Committee Room No. 10, *To-morrow, at Five o'clock.*

Die Mercurii 29° Novembris 1933

Message from the Commons, that they have ordered that the Committee appointed by them to join with the Committee of this House as a Joint Committee on Indian Constitutional Reform do meet the Lords Committee in Grand Committee Room No. 10 this day at Five o'clock as proposed by their Lordships.

HOUSE OF COMMONS

Wednesday, 22nd November, 1933

Resolved, That, before Parliament is asked to take a decision upon the proposals contained in Command Paper 4268, it is expedient that a Joint Committee of Lords and Commons, with power to call into consultation representatives of the Indian States and of British India, be appointed to consider the future government of India and, in particular, to examine and report upon the proposals in the said Command Paper.—(*Secretary Sir Samuel Hoare.*)

Message to the Lords to acquaint them therewith.

Thursday, 23rd November, 1933

Message from the Lords that they concur with the Commons in their Resolution communicated to them this day, viz.: "That, before Parliament is asked to take a decision upon the proposals contained in Command Paper 4268, it is expedient that a Joint Committee of Lords and Commons, with power to call into consultation representatives of the Indian States and of British India, be appointed to consider the future government of India and, in particular, to examine and report upon the proposals in the said Command Paper."

Friday, 24th November, 1933

Resolution of the House [22nd November] relative to the appointment of a Joint Committee on Indian Constitutional Reform, which was ordered to be communicated to the Lords, and the Lords Message [23rd November] signifying their concurrence in the Resolution, read:

Ordered, That a Select Committee of Sixteen Members be appointed to join with a Committee to be appointed by the Lords, with power to call into consultation representatives of the Indian States and of British India, to consider the future government of India and, in particular, to examine and report on the proposals contained in Command Paper 4268.

Ordered, That the Committee have power to send for persons, papers, and records, and to sit notwithstanding any Adjournment of the House.

Ordered, That the Committee have power to report from time to time.

Ordered, That the Committee have power to report from day to day or otherwise the Minutes of Evidence taken before them and such other records as they may think fit.

Ordered, That the Committee have power, if the House be not sitting, to send such Minutes and records to the Clerk of the House,

who shall thereupon give directions for the printing and circulation thereof, and shall lay the same upon the Table of the House at its next meeting.

Ordered, That the Committee have power, if they so determine, to appoint one or more Sub-Committees to take evidence or to consider any matters that may be referred to them.

Ordered, That any Sub-Committees so appointed shall have power to send for persons, papers, and records and to sit notwithstanding any Adjournment of the House.

Ordered, That any evidence taken by such sub-committee shall be reported by them to the main Committee.

Ordered, That the Minutes of Evidence taken before, and Records reported from, the Joint Committee appointed in Session 1932-33 to consider Indian Constitutional Reform be referred to the Committee.

Ordered, That Eight be the quorum.—(*Captain Margesson*.)

Message to the Lords to acquaint them therewith, and to request them to appoint an equal number of Lords to join with the Committee appointed by this House.

Committee *nominated* of,—Major Attlee, Mr. Butler, Mr. Cadogan, Sir Austen Chamberlain, Mr. Cocks, Sir Reginald Craddock, Mr. Davidson, Mr. Isaac Foot, Secretary Sir Samuel Hoare, Mr. Morgan Jones, Sir Joseph Nall, Lord Eustace Percy, Miss Pickford, Secretary Sir John Simon, Sir John Wardlaw-Milne, and Earl Winterton.—(*Captain Margesson*.)

Tuesday, 28th November, 1933

Message from the Lords that they have appointed a Committee consisting of sixteen Lords to join with a Committee of the Commons as a Joint Committee on Indian Constitutional Reform, pursuant to the Commons Message of this day.

They communicate that they have come to the following Resolutions, viz. : That leave be given to the Committee to lay upon the Table from day to day, or otherwise, the Minutes of Evidence taken before them, and also such other Records as they may think fit ; that such Minutes of Evidence and Records be printed, and delivered out ; that, if the House be not sitting, such Evidence and Records shall be deemed to have been laid upon the Table of the House when delivered to the Clerk of the Parliaments.

That the Committee have power, if they so determine, to appoint one or more sub-committees to take Evidence or to consider any matters that may be referred to them ; that any Evidence taken by any such sub-committee shall be deemed to be Evidence taken before the Joint Committee.

That leave be given to the Committee to report from time to time.

That the Minutes of Evidence and Records of the Joint Committee on Indian Constitutional Reform laid upon the Table in the last Session be referred to the Committee.

They propose that the Joint Committee do meet in Committee Room No. 10, To-morrow, at Five o'clock.

So much of the Lords Message as relates to Indian Constitutional Reform *considered.*

Ordered, That the Committee appointed by this House do meet the Lords Committee as proposed by their Lordships.—(*Captain Margesson.*)

Message to the Lords to acquaint them therewith.