

Production and Distribution Theories



THE MACMILLAN COMPANY
NEW YORK • BOSTON • CHICAGO • DALLAS
ATLANTA • SAN FRANCISCO

MACMILLAN AND CO., LIMITED
LONDON • BOMBAY • CALCUTTA • MADRAS
MELBOURNE

THE MACMILLAN COMPANY
OF CANADA, LIMITED
TORONTO

PRODUCTION AND
DISTRIBUTION
THEORIES

The Formative Period

GEORGE J. STIGLER

New York · 1946

THE MACMILLAN COMPANY

**COPYRIGHT, 1941,
By THE MACMILLAN COMPANY**

**ALL RIGHTS RESERVED—NO PART OF THIS BOOK MAY BE
REPRODUCED IN ANY FORM WITHOUT PERMISSION IN WRITING
FROM THE PUBLISHER, EXCEPT BY A REVIEWER WHO WISHES
TO QUOTE BRIEF PASSAGES IN CONNECTION WITH A REVIEW
WRITTEN FOR INCLUSION IN MAGAZINE OR NEWSPAPER**

PRINTED IN THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

Published March, 1941. Reprinted October, 1946

Preface

THESE studies are designed to fill in part an evident and important gap in the literature of economics: the development of the modern theory of production and distribution. The existence of a need for studies of this development is demonstrated in the introductory chapter; the importance of the subject matter and period will be obvious to the professional students of economics to whom this volume is addressed.

The scope and frame of reference of these studies is also discussed in the introductory chapter. I would, however, anticipate one point which is there made. The present studies are critical,—I am resigned to having some readers characterize them as hypercritical. But I hope no one will make the gratuitous inference either that these essays are comprehensive enough to serve as an adequate basis for a complete appraisal of the work of any economist here studied, or that it is any reflection on an economist of the last generation not to have known all of the technical economic analysis which is now at our disposal. For the general critical attitude, however, I rest my case on the fact that (in the words of Max Weber), "Lack of conviction has no inner connection with scientific objectivity."

This work was first completed in 1937 as a doctoral dissertation, which was submitted early in 1938 to the University of Chicago. It has since been revised and a chapter on John Bates Clark has been added.

The dissertation topic was first suggested to me by Professor Frank H. Knight, and it was subsequently written under his supervision. My debt to him cannot possibly be expressed in adequate terms: his advice and

criticism have been offered with the greatest generosity at every stage in the writing of this volume, and they have been indispensable in bringing the analysis up to whatever level it has attained.

I wish also to express appreciation for very material assistance received from Professor Jacob Viner and from Professor J. M. Clark of Columbia University. I am indebted to Professor William Jaffé of Northwestern University and to the late Professor Henry Schultz of the University of Chicago for access to the unpublished correspondence of Walras. Professor Gerhard Tintner of Iowa State College has caught several slips, and Mr. Alexander Hart of the University of Minnesota has called numerous others to my attention.

It seems always necessary to add, however, that I alone am responsible for the errors of commission and omission which (like death and taxes) insist on making their unwelcome appearance.

GEORGE J. STIGLER

MINNEAPOLIS, MINN.
February, 1941

Table of Contents

CHAPTER	PAGE
I. INTRODUCTION	1
II. WILLIAM STANLEY JEVONS	13 ✓
III. PHILIP H. WICKSTEED . <i>capital</i>	38
✓ IV. ALFRED MARSHALL ✓ <i>56 relation</i>	61 ✓
V. FRANCIS Y. EDGEWORTH	108
✓ VI. CARL MENGER <i>56</i>	134 ✓
VII. FRIEDERICH VON WIESER	158 ✓
✓ VIII. EUGEN VON BÖHM-BAWERK ✓ <i>57</i>	179 ✓
✓ IX. LEON WALRAS <i>57</i>	228
X. KNUT WICKSELL <i>54 capital</i>	261
XI. JOHN BATES CLARK	296
✓ XII. EULER'S THEOREM AND THE MARGINAL PRO- ✓ DUCTIVITY THEORY ✓	320
INDEX	389

Index

- Adaptability of fixed factors, 96f., 303f., 312, 348ff.
- Aftalion, A., 306n.
- Alternative cost theory
Böhm-Bawerk, 182ff.
Clark, 299f.
Edgeworth, 111f.
Jevons, 15f.
Marshall, 92ff.
Menger, 145, 147f.
Walras, 229ff., 237 and n.
Wicksell, 263f.
Wicksteed, 40, 43f.
Wieser, 159ff.
- Amoroso, L., 21n.
- Antonelli, E., 228n.
- Aupetit, A., 365 and n.
- Average period of production, 205.
- Barone, E., 128, 253f., 262n., 357ff., 370ff., 386f.
- Bedarf, 140ff.
- Berry, A., 321f.
- Böhm-Bawerk, Eugen von, 11, 28 and n., 130f., Chap. viii, 261, 269ff., 283 and n., 289, 313f.
- Bortkiewicz, L., 213, 214n., 215n., 231n.
- Cairnes, J. E., 14n.
- Capital concept
Barone, 358ff.
Böhm-Bawerk, 196ff.
Clark, 308ff.
Jevons, 13f., 22ff.
Marshall, 101ff.
Menger, 156f.
Walras, 232ff., 246ff.
Wicksell, 272ff.
Wicksteed, 41f., 55ff.
Wieser, 173ff.
- Chamberlin, E. H., 80.
- Chapman, S. J., 337ff.
- Clark, John Bates, 11, 205n., 206, Chap. xi.
- Classical theory of distribution, 2f., 15 and n., 154 ff., 320.
- Constant returns to scale of plant, 40 and n., 49f., 301f., Chap. xii.
- Consumption loans, 57ff., 175f., 226.
- Cournot, A., 76n.
- Demand for capital
Barone, 359
Böhm-Bawerk, 201ff.
Clark, 311ff.
Edgeworth, 130f.
Jevons, 23ff.
Marshall, 104ff.
Menger, 156.
Walras, 249ff.
Wicksell, 276ff.
Wicksteed, 42f., 57ff.
Wieser, 174ff.
- Diminishing returns: proof of law, 49f., 207n., 258, 265f.
- Diminishing returns: statement of law, 49, 357n., 358.
- Böhm-Bawerk, 207.
Clark, 300f.
Edgeworth, 112ff., 342f.
Jevons, 19f., 36.
Marshall, 66ff., 87f.
Menger, 151.
Walras, 232, 258, 368ff.
Wicksell, 265ff.
Wicksteed, 48ff., 327n.
Wieser, 161, 165f., 171.
- Durable capital goods, 208f., 289.
- Edelberg, V., 22n.
- Edgeworth, Francis Y., 11, 13, 102n., Chap. v, 147, 169n., 185, 187n., 228, 231n., 245, 332, 336n., 341ff., 361, 367n.

- Entrepreneur, 78ff., 99ff., 125ff.,
 235f., 305f., 359f., 381ff.
 Equations and unknowns, 241,
 242ff.
 Euler's theorem, see Constant re-
 turns to scale of plant
 Exhaustion-of-product, 12, 166, 171,
 293ff., 305f., Chap. xii.
 External economies, 68ff., 123f.,
 267f., 338n., 339ff., 343.
 Factors of production, 52ff., 88ff.,
 151, 171, 192ff., 232ff., 268,
 330f., 335f.
 Fetter, F. W., 203n.
 Fisher, I., 196n., 202n., 205n., 215n.,
 321n.
 Fixed coefficients of production, 84,
 153, 165ff., 188ff., 238ff., 248,
 364ff.
 Fixed costs, 94ff., 121.
 Flux, A. W., 262n., 326n., 328, 335f.
 Free goods, 139f., 242f.
 General equilibrium, 18, 228f.,
 237ff., 358, 365n.
 General productive organization,
 235f.
 George, H., 302.
 Goods of higher and lower order, 4,
 137ff.
 Gossen, H., 33n., 188n.
Güterqualität, 136ff.
 Haberler, G., 73n., 216n.
 Haydt, E., 6n.
 Hayek, F. A., 134n.
 Hefendehl, H., 5n.
 Hicks, J. R., 169, 228n., 356, 365n.
 Higgins, B., 21n.
 Historical costs, 47f., 51, 148f.
 Holland, M. T., 87n.
 Imputation (see also Marginal pro-
 ductivity), 139, 151ff., 163ff.
 Increasing returns to scale, 50f., 68,
 119f., 267, 301n., 350, 377f.
 Instantaneous rate of interest, 27f.,
 287.
- Interest theory
 Barone, 359ff.
 Böhm-Bawerk, 219ff.
 Clark, 311f.
 Edgeworth, 132.
 Jevons, 13f., 26ff.
 Marshall, 101ff.
 Walras, 247ff.
 Wicksell, 143ff.
 Wicksteed, 41ff., 55ff.
 Wieser, 173ff.
 Internal economies, 76ff.
 Inventories, 251.
 Jaffé, W., 10, 228n., 229n., 233n.
 Jevons, William Stanley, 3, 11,
 Chap. ii, 98, 134ff., 141n., 229.
 Johnson, W. S., 323n.
 Joint cost, 86, 121ff.
 Joint demand, 83ff., 351.
 Kaldor, N., 245n., 381n.
 Knight, F. H., 3n., 20n., 71n., 75,
 141n., 167, 231n., 319, 385.
 Land, nature of, 51f., 88ff., 129f.,
 155, 193, 233f., 273, 316ff.
 Landauer, C., 5n.
 Lexis, W., 262n.
 Lindberg, J. K., 224n.
 Localization of industry, 69f.
 MacGregor, D. H., 71n.
 Marget, A. W., 251n., 296n.
 Marginal disutility, see Real costs
 Marginal pairs, 130, 221n.
 Marginal productivity theory, 4,
 Chap. xii.
 Barone, 357ff., 370ff., 386f.
 Böhm-Bawerk, 192n.
 Clark, 296f., 302ff.
 Edgeworth, 126, 131ff., 341ff.
 Jevons, 21 and n.
 Marshall, 83, 344ff.
 Menger, 151ff.
 Pareto, 364ff., 371.
 Walras, 255, 260, 321, 368ff.,
 374ff.
 Wicksell, 264, 289ff., 321, 373ff.

- Marginal productivity theory,
Wicksteed, 51f., 321, 323ff., 368f.,
374f., 381, 386f.
Wieser, 164ff.
- Marshall, Alfred, 9, 10, 11, 13, 14n.,
16n., 35n., Chap. iv, 109, 129,
131, 185n., 196n., 322, 336n.,
344ff.
- Maximum satisfaction, 246.
- Mayer, H., 187n., 190, 354n.
- McCulloch, J. R., 19.
- Menger, Carl, 4, 11, Chap. vi, 158f.,
164, 187 and n., 193n., 229.
- Menger, Karl, 49n., 135n.
- Meriam, R. S., 96n.
- Methodology, 6ff., 180ff., 368.
- Mill, J. S., 13, 15, 21n., 22n., 125,
275n., 333n.
- Minimum sensible, 147.
- Mohrmann, W., 5n.
- Monopolistic competition, 80.
- Montemartini, G., 362f.
- Multiple equilibria, 224, 243.
- Numéraire*, 237n., 239n.
- Ogilvie, F. W., 87n.
- Opie, R., 94n., 95n.
- Padan, R. S., 306.
- Pareto, V., 128, 229, 267, 332, 357f.,
362, 364ff., 372f., 380.
- Parsons, T., 9n., 62.
- Period of construction, 23f., 208.
- Period of investment, 142, 208ff.,
277ff., 360ff.
- Period of production
Barone, 359ff.
Böhm-Bawerk, 201ff.
Clark, 313ff.
Edgeworth, 130f.
Jevons, 23ff.
Menger, 156.
Wicksell, 276ff.
- Period of utilization, 24, 208f., 289.
- Perpetual net income, 249f.
- Pigou, A. C., 124 and n., 340n.,
341n.
- Productive contribution, 166ff.
- Productivity ethics, 297.
- Profits, 99f., 125ff., 171n., 230, 236,
263, 305f., 318f., 322f.
- Quasi-rents, 94ff.
- Real costs, 16ff., 29ff., 63ff., 97ff.,
110f., 183ff., 230f., 243 and n.,
299, 307f., 318.
- Recontract, 245.
- Relative distributive shares, 285ff.
- Rent, theory of, 336.
Clark, 315ff.
Edgeworth, 129f.
Jevons, 16, 19ff., 36f.
Marshall, 87ff.
Menger, 155.
Walras, 255ff.
Wicksell, 292ff.
Wicksteed, 52ff., 326ff.
Wieser, 162, 172.
- Rentengüter*, 272ff.
- Representative firm, 62, 68.
- Ricardo, D., 284f.
- Robbins, L., 62, 71n., 141n., 255n.,
333n.
- Sargant, W. L., 103n.
- Savings, 56f., 101ff., 199, 218f.,
249ff., 311.
- Schlesinger, K., 243.
- Schlussstück*, 188ff.
- Schultz, H., 321, 371n.
- Schumpeter, J., 134n., 179 and n.,
183n., 217 and n.
- Sidgwick, H., 125, 131.
- Size of increments, 60n., 130, 146f.,
306f.
- Smart, W., 38.
- Smith, Adam, 2n.
- Sommarin, E., 261n.
- Sraffa, P., 71n., 72, 73.
- Stability of competition, 382ff.
- Stationary state, 6f., 141 and n.,
263, 300f., 311, 384ff.
- Stephans, K., 5n.
- Stigler, G. J., 97n.
- Subjective value, theory of, 2f.,
136ff., 158n., 296n.

- Subsistence theory of wages, 36, 155f., 173.
- Substitution (see also Diminishing returns), 48, 66f., 149ff., 258f., 264f., 301n., 303, 331, 333f., 346.
- Tâtonnements*, 244f., 373.
- Taylor, F. M., 168f.
- Technical superiority of present goods, 214ff., 270, 271f.
- Thompson, H. M., 53n.
- Thünen, H., 153.
- Time preference, 58f., 101ff., 156, 177n., 212ff., 270f.
- Ultimate factors of production, 83n., 157, 197ff., 205n., 234n., 268f.
- Valk, W. L., 6n.
- Viner, J., 73, 74n., 75, 321n., 323n.
- Vleugels, W., 169 and n.
-
- Wages, theory of
 Böhm-Bawerk, 221ff.
 Clark, 318
 Edgeworth, 130
 Jevons, 31f.
- Wages, theory of, Marshall, 97ff.
 Menger, 155f.
 Walras, 230.
 Wicksell, 292ff.
 Wicksteed, 54f.
 Wieser, 173.
- Wages-fund theory, 15n., 29, 219f., 283ff.
- Wald, A., 243.
- Walker, F. W., 125, 198n., 300.
- Walras, Leon, 3f., 10, 11, 21n., 127, 140n., 141n., Chap. ix, 326n., 361f., 368ff., 374ff.
- Waterstradt, 265.
- Wicksell, Knut, 11, 28n., 168 and n., 194n., 202n., 219, 225 and n., 226n., 228, 246, 252f., 255, Chap. x, 296n., 357, 373ff., 381.
- Wicksteed, Philip H., 11, Chap. iii, 255, 323ff., 341f., 352f., 361, 366n., 368f., 374f., 381f., 386f.
- Wieser, Friedrich von, 11, 147, Chap. vii, 182.
- Wood, S., 296n.
- Young, A., 35n.
- Zawadski, W., 365n.