

THE CHAMBER OF PRINCES

Government of India Act (1935)

and

Instruments of Accession

OPINION

OF

MR. J. H. MORGAN, K. C.;

COUNSEL TO THE CHAMBER OF PRINCES.

CONTENTS

SECTION I.

Introductory.

- (1) Scope and object of the Opinion.
- (2) Application of leading cases decided by the Privy Council.
- (3) Duty of counsel advising the Chamber.
- (4) Instructions to counsel.

SECTION II.

The "Explanatory Memorandum" on "Safeguards" laid before the Constitution Committee.

- (5) Examination of certain statements in the Memorandum.
- (6) Examination of the statement that the "unimpaired" sovereignty of the States is "adequately safeguarded" in the Act — the legislative sphere.
- (7) Examination of the statement in relation to the executive sphere.
- (8) Examination of the statement in relation to Secession.
- (9) Examination of the statement in relation to the possibilities of amendment of the Constitution on the request of the States.
- (10) The same.
- (11) Amendment of the Constitution at the expense of the States.
- (12) The Instrument of Accession and the sovereignty of Parliament.
- (13) Conclusion.

SECTION III.

The Interpretation of Federal Constitutions in the Empire.

- (14) Objective of the present negotiations with the Government of India.
- (15) Consideration of the effect of judicial construction on State rights in the Federal Constitution of Australia.
- (16) Consideration of the effect of judicial construction on "State" rights (the rights of the "Provinces") in the Federal Constitution of Canada.
- (17) Consideration of the effect of Federal taxation on "State" rights in Australia and Canada and their application to India.
- (18) Effect of the operation of "constitutional principles" on the maintenance of State rights.

(ii)

- (19) Explanation of the divergence between the intentions of the Legislature and the construction placed upon its legislation by the Courts.

SECTION IV.

The Interpretation of the Government of India Act by the Courts.

- (20) The exclusion by the Courts of "pledges" as to the intention and operation of the Act.
- (21) The exclusion by the Courts of the Round Table Conference resolutions and the Joint Parliamentary Committee's recommendations—the Privy Council's decision in the case of *Assam Railways vs. Inland Revenue Commissioners*.
- (22) Sir Akbar Hydari's proposal.

SECTION V.

The Instruments of Accession and their Interpretation by the Courts.

- (23) General rules governing the interpretation of "Instruments".
- (24) Difficulty of attempting to control interpretation of the Act by words in the Instruments.
- (25) The difficulty as to protection of "extra-territorial" rights of the States.
- (26) The recitals in the draft Instrument of Accession.
- (27) Impossibility of giving effect to Sir Akbar Hydari's proposals otherwise than by way of amendment of the Act.
- (28) Misconception of the character of the Federal Union.
- (29) Distinction between the Instruments and Treaties—legal consequences of the distinction.
- (30) Views of the Political Officers as to the scope of the Instrument of Accession.

SECTION VI.

The Instrument of Instructions and its efficacy. -

- (31) Transitory character of the Instrument as a "safeguard".
- (32) Examination of the statutory provisions as to the Instrument.
- (33) Examination of the recitals of the Instrument.
- (34) Inefficacy in law of the Instrument.
- (35) The "sanction" of Impeachment.
- (36) Conclusion.

(iii)

SECTION VII.

The Legislative Powers of the Federation.

SUB-SECTION A -- The Act and its implications.

- (37) Section 100 (4) of the Act and the Hyderabad Memorandum.
- (38) Section 104 of the Act.
- (39) Section 99 of the Act.
- (40) Section 101 of the Act.
- (41) Section 106 of the Act.
- (42) Section 106 and "External Affairs".
- (43) Section 107.
- (44) The fiscal and financial Sections of the Act.
- (45) Taxation Items in the Legislative List.
- (46) The doctrine of "implied powers" in relation to the Act and the Legislative Items.

SUB-SECTION B — The Federal Legislative List.

- (47) Application to the List of leading cases.
- (48) Difficulties presented by the draftmanship of the List.
- (49) Item 1 and the views of the Hyderabad Memorandum.
- (50) Criticism of limitations proposed.

SECTION VIII.

The Executive Powers of the Federation.

- (51) The relation of the executive power to the legislative.
- (52) Distinction between executive power and delegation of administration.
- (53) "Sanctions" for the enforcement of executive and administrative duties.
- (54) Impossibility of complete "reservation" of executive powers — criticism of the Hyderabad Memorandum.

SECTION IX.

The Judicial Power in the Federation.

- (55) Section 204 and its meaning.
- (56) The same.

(iv).

SECTION X.

"Discrimination".

- (57) Confusion as to the terms of the Act and the nature of the problem.
- (58) Problem peculiar to the Indian Federation.
- (59) Section 297 of the Act.

SECTION XI.

Paramountcy as a Federal Sanction.

- (60) Paradoxical character of the proposals of the States.

SECTION XII.

The Implications of Section 45 of the Act.

- (61) Examination of the Section.

CONCLUSION.
