

The Indian Posts & Telegraphs Union

MADRAS PROVINCIAL BRANCH

MADRAS

FEDERATION'S ANSWERS TO THE QUESTIONNAIRE ISSUED BY THE CENTRAL PAY COMMISSION

PUBLISHED BY

I. P. T. UNION

MADRAS PROVINCIAL BRANCH

December 1946.

FOREWORD.

It is with some satisfaction that these few pages containing the Federation's answers to the Questionnaire issued by the Central Pay Commission is placed in the hands of General membership. The cases of the P. and T. Staff will come before the Commission during the first week of December when some witnesses are likely to give oral evidence. The Federation's answers are not the final say in the matter regarding every detail. The Federation's aim is to find a satisfactory solution based upon rationalisation, simplification to the very many problems connected with wages, pensionary systems, improvement of working conditions like leave, etc. and to suggest suitable methods of rectifying maladjustments in the relation between the employees and the employer and his agents—the superior officers. The whole scheme is based upon an objective analysis of basic human needs—social security.

It is hoped that witnesses will bear in mind the general line of approach made by the Federation.

Much as the Union would like to distribute this pamphlet gratis to the members, the financial position does not warrant the same. Hence each copy is priced at As. 10 post free.

P. S. RAJARAM RAO,
Secretary,

Dated,
1—12—46. }

I. P. T. Union,
Madras Provincial Branch.

CONTENTS.

	PAGE.	PARAGRAPH.
" A " CLASSIFICATION OF SERVICES ...	1	1
" B " STANDARDS OF REMUNERATION ...	2	9
" C " RATIONALISATION, SIMPLIFICATION AND UNIFORMITY IN PAY TERMS ...	41	81
" D " LEAVE ...	51	115
" E " RETIREMENT BENEFITS ...	54	125
" F " CONCILIATION MACHINERY ...	58	140

" A " CLASSIFICATION OF SERVICES.

Q. I. Civilian posts under the Central Government, whether paid from Civil Estimates (including Posts and Telegraphs and Railways) are chargeable to Defence Estimates are classified Class I, Class II, Subordinate and Inferior services. Do you consider that this classification requires any modification generally or in respect of any particular department or class or classes of employees? If so, what modifications in the present classification and nomenclature do you suggest?

The division of Civilian posts under the Central Government into Class I, Class II, Subordinate and Inferior categories is the result of the interplay of two main factors. The first is the fact that human labour falls naturally into three broad divisions—labour that is mainly manual, labour that demands manual and mental output in more or less equal proportions and labour that is predominantly mental and calls for qualities of leadership.

2. The second source of the existing classification is the historical fact of the imposition of an alien Government upon a country the majority of whose inhabitants have been socially segregated for centuries in four main castes. To this historical fact can be traced the division of the gazetted cadre into classes I and II, and the appellations 'subordinate' and 'inferior' applied to groups of employees drawn from the lower middle and the labouring classes, respectively.

3. In so far as the existing classification derives from India's political subjection and the caste system, it is obviously repugnant to the ideals and the philosophy of the democratic and independent State towards which our country is rapidly moving. At the same time, there is no escaping the fact that real, objective differences do exist between labour which is predominantly physical at one end and which demands predominantly mental and executive ability at the other.

4. In view of these facts we believe that the four existing classes of Government service should be reduced to three, termed classes I, II and III and that all designations connoting superiority and inferiority should be rigidly eschewed in this new classification.

Q. II. If you propose any alternative classification, what broad criteria would you suggest for the differentiation of duties and responsibility of posts to be included in each category?

5. Government posts should fall into one or other of the three categories proposed, accordingly as they involve labour which is mainly mental

and executive ; labour which demands the exercise of mental and manual talents in more or less equal measure and in which the typical employee is an operative working with both hands and brain ; and labour which is mainly manual in character.

6. On this criterion, employees of class I will be drawn from the existing class I and class II cadres. The distinction which obtains between the two groups is due not so much to their different levels of responsibility and talent, as to the fact that the class I officer was originally a European, as distinct from the class II officer who was an Indian, and latterly to the fact that the Indian permitted to occupy class I post himself, was required to qualify himself for it by training in England and by more or less complete identification of himself with the alien ruling class. To the extent that the existing classes I and II correspond to actual difference in levels of executive responsibility, provision for a distinction should be made by the introduction of a junior and a senior scale within the one class.

7. Class II posts should include all appointments which demand the expenditure of mental and manual labour in more or less equal measure, as well as supervisory appointments over small groups of men. Distinctions between posts which are mainly operative and posts which are mainly supervisory may be provided for by introduction of a junior and a senior scale. The typical employee in the junior scale will be the clerk, the telegraphist or the telephone operator and the typical employee in the senior scale will be the telegraph master and the engineering or wireless supervisor. Nearly all these employees are drawn to-day from the ranks of society referred broadly as the lower middle class.

8. Class III posts should include the appointments of postmen, Munshi markers and allied categories, and all the existing posts held by so-called "inferior" staff whose duties demand the expenditure of physical energy in appreciably greater measure than mental output. Here, again, the distinction between the man who gives the orders and the man who carries them out should be provided for in the introduction of a senior and a junior scale. Class III posts are manned generally by employees drawn from the working class. At the present time, the educational attainments of these employees are generally below the Matriculation standard, and they are not able usually to read or write English fluently.

" B " STANDARDS OF REMUNERATION.

Q. III. What tests and standards would you suggest as appropriate bases to be adopted in fixing the salary or remuneration of the various grades of employees above referred to, when Indians recruited in India are appointed to those posts ? Please illustrate your views by working

out scales of pay on that basis for any of the services with which you are familiar.

9. The entire pyramid of salaries paid by the State should rest on the base of the minimum living wage. By the minimum living wage, we mean the total remuneration — whether paid in money or in services which an employee must receive to maintain himself and his family at the marginal level below which body and mind suffer deterioration, having regard to the needs of mind and body as constituted by Nature, and having regard also to such needs as are inseparable from the social standard, or reasonable pattern of life, to which the employee is habituated.

10. The decision as to what constitutes a minimum living wage in everyday life can only be arrived at in the light of answers to a number of questions, the most important of which are the following:—

- (a) What commodities and services does a man require to prevent body and mind from deteriorating, having regard to the nature of the human constitution and to the reasonable standard or pattern of life to which he is accustomed?
- (b) Should the individual or the family be considered as the unit in deciding the amount of remuneration which constitutes a living wage?
- (c) Should the totality of a family's essential needs be provided for in a wage paid in money, or would it be more equitable if certain common needs were supplied in services cost free to the individual?
- (d) How is the minimum wage to be fixed to provide for a stable base and for fluctuations in the general price level?

Basic Human Needs.

11. The essential needs of every human being fall into the broad divisions: food, clothing, shelter, recreation and leisure, education, medical attendance, security against the hazards of the future. Besides these, there are other basic requirements which may conveniently be grouped together under the term "Miscellaneous". Authoritative standards have not yet been laid down for measuring minimum needs in India under most of these headings. Such investigations as have been made have been carried farthest in the sphere of food requirements.

1. Food.

12. The two analyses of a well-balanced diet given below are of particular interest to this enquiry in that they were suggested by the

Federation of Post and Telegraph Unions, and by the P. and T. administration, as reasonable bases on which to construct minimum wage budgets with regard to the food requirements of middle class and working class employees respectively, during the adjudication of the Postal dispute in Simla in May—June 1946.

13. The diet for a middle class adult is reproduced from Nutrition Bulletin No. 1 published by the Food Rationing Adviser to the Government of India; and the diet for a working class adult is based on the diagram printed on page 15 of the 1943 Edition of Dr. W. R. Aykroyd's monograph entitled "The nutritive value of Indian Foods and the planning of Satisfactory Diets" (Health Bulletin No. 23.)

MINIMUM FOOD REQUIREMENTS OF AN ADULT MALE.

		Nutrition Bulletin Middle class.	Dr. Aykroyd Working class.
(a) ANIMAL PRODUCTS.			
	Milk	8 oz.	8 oz.
	Eggs	Two	...
	Meat	2 oz.	...
	Ghee	1 oz.	...
	Fat or oil	1 oz.	2 oz.
(b) PULSES	...	2½ oz.	3 oz.
(c) CEREALS	...	Wheat 10 oz.	
		or	
	{ Wheat	6 oz.	Rice 10 oz. }
	{ Rice	6 oz.	Millet 5 oz. }
		or	
	{ Rice	10 oz.	
	{ Jawar, Bajra		
	{ or Ragi	5 oz.	
(d) VEGETABLES	...	Leafy 3½ oz.	Leafy 4 oz.
		Non-leafy 5½ oz.	Non-leafy 6 oz.
(e) FRUITS	...	One Orange or Banana or Apple. }	2 oz.

14. These standard diets have been compiled for the adult male. They do not furnish adequate guidance for calculating the minimum requirements of children at successive ages of development, or of women, especially during

pregnancy and nursing periods. Dr. Aykroyd, in his monograph, states that the calorific requirements of women and children may be set down as fractions of the requirements of the average male. Dr. Aykroyd gives various co-efficients for different ages, but as he himself points out, the system of co-efficients does not furnish a key to the cost of a woman's or a child's food requirements. A child needs a larger amount of certain food elements than does an adult, and these food elements often constitute the most expensive items in the food budget. Similarly though a woman's calorific requirements may be regarded as $\frac{3}{4}$ that of a man, they increase beyond a man's, during her child-bearing and nursing periods. The standards furnish nevertheless, a valuable starting point for calculating the cost of food requirements which form the most important single factor in the minimum wage budget.

15. What does it cost a lower middle class family and a working class family, consisting of husband and wife, to obtain their minimum food requirements to-day? It is difficult to answer this question, except with reference to particular localities and times of the year, since the prices of the non-controlled items of food vary from area to area, and from season to season. We submit below costs as worked out for Madras City in July 1946, the month of the year in which the prices of all the items in the diet taken together may be considered midway between high and low. The price marked against each item has been taken from the Fort St. George Gazette for July 1946, when the cost of living index was stated to be 240. Madras City may be regarded as a typical "B" area. The working class cost of living index number for the year 1945 averaged 223, which places it in the lowest group of the 33 cities listed in Appendix XX to the Report of the Adjudicator in the Postal dispute.

COST OF MINIMUM FOOD REQUIREMENTS.

Middle class Family of 2 consumption units.

Particulars.	Quantity per day per con. unit.	Quantity per month for two con. units.	Rate.	Cost.
			RS. A. P.	RS. A. P.
ANIMAL PRODUCTS.				
Milk	... 8 oz.	15 seers	0 8 0	7 8 0
Eggs	... 2	120	0 2 0	15 0 0
Meat	... 2 oz.	3.75 seers	1 8 0	5 10 0
Ghee	... 1 oz.	1.9 "	4 0 0	7 8 0
Fat or oil	... 1 oz.	1.9 "	1 12 0	3 5 0
				38 15 0
PULSES.				
Dhall	... 2½ oz.	46 " or 2½ measures	0 14 0 per measure	2 6 6
CEREALS.				
Rice	... 6 oz.			
Wheat	... 6 oz.	22.5 seers	0 4 6 per seer.	6 5 0
VEGETABLES.				
Non-leafy	... 5 oz.	9.4 "	0 6 0 per seer.	3 8 0
Leafy	... 3½ oz.	6.5 "	0 6 0 per seer.	2 7 0
				5 15 0
FRUITS.				
Orange or	...	20	0 1 3	1 9 0
Banana or	...	20	0 0 6	0 10 0
Apple	...	20	0 2 0	2 8 0
				4 11 0

COST OF MINIMUM FOOD REQUIREMENTS.

Working class family of 2 consumption units.

Particulars.	Quantity per day per con. unit.	Quantity per month for two con. units.	Rate.		Cost.	
			RS.	A. P.	RS.	A. P.
ANIMAL PRODUCTS.						
Milk	... 8 oz.	15 seers	0	8 0	7	8 0
Eggs, Meat, Ghee	... NIL					
Fat or Oil	... 2 oz.	3.6 seers	1	12 0	6	9 0
PULSES.						
Dhall	... 3 oz.	5.6 seers (or 3.5 msrs.)	0	14 0 per msr.	3	1 0
CEREALS.						
Rice	... 10 oz.	18.75 srs.	0	4 6 sr.	5	4 6
Millet (wheat)	... 5 oz.	9.4 srs.	0	4 6 ,,	2	10 3
					7	14 9
VEGETABLES.						
Non-leafy	... 6 oz.	11.25 srs.	0	6 0 sr.	4	3 6
Leafy	... 4 oz.	7.50 srs.	0	6 0 ,,	2	13 0
					7	0 6
FRUITS.						
Orange	... 30		0	1 3	2	5 6
Banana	... 30		0	1 6	0	15 0
					3	4 6
CONDIMENTS.						
Chillies	... 3/8th viss		2	8 6 va.	0	15 0
Tamarind	... 1½ visses		0	6 0 ,,	0	9 0
Salt	... 1½ msrs.		0	2 0	0	3 0
				per measure		
Coriander	... 1¼ viss		1	12 0 va.	0	7 0
Turmeric	... 1/16 viss		3	5 6 ,,	0	3 3
Mustard	... ¼ viss		1	0 0 ,,	0	4 0
					2	9 3

Working class family of 2 consumption units—(Contd.)

Particulars.	Quantity per day per con. unit.	Quantity per month for two con. units.	Rate.		Cost.	
			Rs.	A. P.	Rs.	A. P.
MISCELLANEOUS FOOD AND BEVERAGES.						
Sugar	...	2 visses	0	12 6 vs.	1	9 0
Jaggery	...	$\frac{1}{2}$ viss	0	14 0 ..	0	7 0
Tea	...	$\frac{1}{2}$ lb.	1	8 0 lb.	0	12 0
Cocoanuts	...	4	0	4 0 each	1	0 0
Coffee	...	1 lb.	1	14 0 lb.	1	14 0
					<hr/>	
					5 10 0	
					<hr/>	
FUEL.						
Firewood	...	2 cwt.	0	10 6 per cwt.	1	5 0
Charcoal	...	$\frac{1}{2}$..	3	12 6 per cwt.	1	14 3
Cow-Dung cakes	0	12 0
Matches	...	5 boxes	0	0 6 per box	0	2 6
					<hr/>	
					4 1 9	
					<hr/>	
Allowance for adul- teration of food spoilage in prepara- at 5%					2 6 3	
					<hr/>	
Total cost of budget					...	50 1 0
					<hr/>	

16. In constructing these tables we have assumed that the cost of a woman's requirements is the same as those of a man. Though her calorific needs, as stated by Dr. Aykroyd are .8 of a man's, they increase much beyond a man's during her child-bearing and nursing years. From the cost angle, therefore, it is reasonable to assume that a woman's needs, on the average, at least equal to a man's.

17. A comparison of the two budgets reveals that the main difference in the standards of a middle and a working class family arises from the exclusion of eggs, meat and ghee from the latter's diet. In many parts of India meat, and in certain sections meat and eggs are excluded from the middle class diet also, because of religious considerations. However, additional quantities of milk, ghee and other foods with high protein content are consumed in place of meat and eggs. According to the tables above, the cost of obtaining minimum food requirements in Madras at the present time comes to approximately Rs. 37 for an adult belonging to the lower middle class and to Rs. 24/8/- for an adult of the working class.

18. It will be interesting to compare these figures with the data furnished by the witnesses in the P. and T. Adjudication. Nineteen witnesses represented the middle class employee. The smallest amount spent by any of them on food was Rs. 15/15/- and the largest amount Rs. 65 per consumption unit; the cost of preparing food (Rs. 2 per unit) being omitted in both cases. The average per unit came to Rs. 30. Among the 18 working class witnesses, the lowest amount spent on food was Rs. 10/5/- and the largest Rs. 31/6/- per consumption unit; the cost of preparing food (Rs. 2/- per unit) being again excluded. The average expenditure was Rs. 17/5/- per consumption unit.

19. The average expenditure on food in the case of typical middle class and typical working class employees is considerably below the *minimum* cost of the diets considered essential to maintain health and efficiency by the Food Advisor to the Government of India and by Dr. Aykroyd. It is not calumny but the truth, therefore, when the lower paid employees of the department cry out to-day that the salaries they receive do not allow them enough to eat.

2. Clothing.

20. What are the minimum needs of a working class and a lower middle class family with regard to clothing? The answer to this question will depend mainly on the standards which we deem to be reasonable minima for the two groups, having regard to their different patterns of life, and to such varied factors as the number and ages of their children, and the parts of the country in which they live. However difficult it may be to formulate

a minimum standard or standards, some objective analysis of minimum requirements in clothing must be arrived at, if the minimum wage is to be linked to minimum human wear.

21. The witnesses produced by the Federation in the P. and T. Adjudication exhibited a wide range of difference in the average monthly amount they spent on clothing, the figure ranging from Rs. 1/15/- to Rs. 12/14/- per consumption unit. The average expenditure of middle class witnesses worked out to Rs. 6/14/- per individual—men, women and children being taken together. The range of difference for working class witnesses was between Rs. 1/8/- and Rs. 6/7/- and the average was Rs. 3/7/-. These averages have little more than illustrative value partly because each and every witness testified that he had been forced to effect a reduction in his standard of clothing below the point which he considered a reasonable minimum and partly because an average which takes no account of the relatively lesser need of children with regard to clothing has to be raised, when family wants are measured in terms of adults. The evidence was useful, nevertheless, in so far as it indicated a minimum line below which it is not possible to go.

22. We submit below clothing budgets for Madras calculated in terms of the prices prevailing in July 1946 which we regard as the very minimum for middle and working class families respectively. The figure for the middle class family tends to corroborate the average brought out in the evidence in the adjudication. The figure for the working class families is considerably higher than the average expended by the working class witnesses most of whom, however, presented themselves in uniform supplied by Government and appeared to rely on them to make up for their lack of personal clothing outside office hours.

COST OF MINIMUM CLOTHING REQUIREMENT.

Middle class family of 2 consumption units.

Particulars.	Number.	Cost per yard or unit.		Total cost.		Duration.	Cost per month.	
		Rs.	A. P.	Rs.	A. P.		Rs.	A. P.
Underwear ...	4 2½ yards stitching	0 13 6	0 6 0	6 9 0	1 year	0 8 9		
Dhoties ...	6 pairs	5 4 0		15 12 0	1 "	1 5 0		
Upper cloth ...	1	3 6 0		3 6 0	1 "	0 4 6		
Shirts ...	4. 2½ yards stitching	1 2 0	0 12 0	16 12 0	1 "	1 6 3		
Coats ...	2. 3¾ yards stitching	1 2 0	5 0 0	18 7 0	2 years	0 12 3		
Trousers ...	2. 3 yards stitching	1 1 9	1 12 0	10 2 6	2 "	0 6 9		
Handkerchiefs	8. each	0 4 0		2 0 0	1 year	0 2 9		
Ties ...	1. "	1 8 0		1 8 0	2 years	0 1 0		
Socks ...	4. "	1 2 0		4 8 0	1 year	0 6 0		
Hat ...	1. "	3 8 0		3 8 0	2 years	0 2 3		
Towels ...	6. "	1 2 0		6 12 0	1 year	0 9 0		
Sarees ...	4. 1 pair	13 0 0	33 0 0	46 0 0	1 "	3 13 0		
Petticoats ...	3. 1 yard stitching	0 13 0	0 8 0	3 15 0	1 "	0 5 3		
Jackets ...	6. each stitching	8 6 0	0 10 0	12 0 0	1 "	1 0 0		
Bodice ...	6. each stitching	0 13 0	0 6 0	6 3 0	1 "	0 8 3		
Underwear ...	2. 1½ yards stitching	0 13 6	0 6 0	3 4 0	1 "	0 4 6		
Umbrella ...	1. each	0 8 0		4 8 0	3 years	0 2 0		
Waterproof ...	1. "	20 0 0		20 0 0	5 "	0 5 3		
Sandals ...	3. "	4 12 0		14 4 0	1 year	1 3 0		
Shoes ...	1 pair	15 0 0		15 0 0	2 years	0 10 0		

BEDDING

Bedsheets	2. each	4 8 0		9 0 0	5 years	0 2 6		
Rugs ...	2. "	3 0 0		6 0 0	5 "	0 1 6		
Pillows...	8	0 12 6		8 12 0	1½ "	0 7 9		

 Total ... 14 15 6

COST OF MINIMUM CLOTHING REQUIREMENT.

Working class family of 2 consumption units.

Particulars.	Number.	Cost per	Total	Duration.	Cost per
		yard or unit.			
		RS. A. P.	RS. A. P.	RS. A. P.	
Underwear ...	4. 2½ yards stitching	0 13 6 } 0 6 0 }	6 9 0	1 year	0 8 9
Dhoties ...	6. pair	5 4 0	15 12 0	1 "	1 5 0
Upper cloth ..	1	3 6 0	3 6 0	1 "	0 4 6
Shirts ...	4. 2½ yards stitching	1 6 0 } 0 12 0 }	16 12 0	1 "	1 5 3
Handkerchiefs	8	0 4 0	2 0 0	1 "	0 2 9
Towels ...	6	1 2 0	6 12 0	1 "	0 9 0
Sarees ...	4	6 8 0	26 0 0	1 "	2 2 9
Petticoats ...	3. 1 yard stitching	0 13 0 } 0 8 0 }	3 15 0	1 "	0 5 3
Jackets ...	6. 1 yard stitching	1 6 0 } 0 10 0 }	12 0 0	1 "	1 0 0
Bodice ...	6 stitching	0 13 0 } 0 3 0 }	6 0 0	1 "	0 8 0
Underwear ...	2. 1½ yards stitching	0 13 0 } 0 6 0 }	3 3 0	1 "	0 4 3
Umbrella ...	1	4 8 0	4 8 0	3 years	0 2 0
Sandals ...	3	4 12 0	14 4 0	1 year	1 3 0
BEDDING.					
Bed sheets ...	2	4 8 0	9 0 0	5 years	0 2 6
Pillows ...	8 stitching	0 12 6 } 0 4 0 }	8 4 0		0 5 6
Total ...					10 4 6

3. Shelter.

23. The majority of middle class Government employees are quite unable to provide themselves with accommodation comparable to that which Government itself considers a reasonable minimum for those employees to whom it allows free furnished accommodation. In the Engineering and Wireless branches of the P. and T. department to take one example, house rent allowances for married men with under 10 years' service range from Rs. 20 to Rs. 50 and for married men with over ten years' service from Rs. 25 to Rs. 60. The maximum is granted to employees in Bombay and Calcutta. All other stations in India are divided into four groups, in which house rent allowances are Rs. 35, Rs. 30, Rs. 25 and Rs. 20 for married men with under 10 years' service and Rs. 40, Rs. 35, Rs. 30 and Rs. 25 for family men with over ten years' service.

24. The evidence tendered at the adjudication proved that the typical middle class witness who is not granted free quarters or house rent allowance is unable to pay more than Rs. 18 a month for a house, furniture and lighting for himself and his wife. The expenditure on bare rent of all middle class witnesses averaged Rs. 10/14/- for a family of two and in no case did the accommodation available within this amount approach this standard set down by Government.

25. What is the minimum accommodation a man needs for himself and his family to prevent deterioration in health and efficiency and having regard to the elementary decencies? The answer will vary according to the social class of the employee and the number of his dependents. We invite the attention of the members of the Pay Commission to the report issued by the Housing Sub-Committee of the Labour Ministers' conference. It is interesting to note in this connection that large industrial concerns like Tata's and semi-Government organisations such as the Port Commissioners of Calcutta have adopted housing programmes which anticipate the housing Sub-Committee's report. The Port Commissioner's scheme allows a manual labourer at the beginning of his service and for ten years thereafter a house consisting of 2 living rooms, a verandah, a kitchen, a bath room, a latrine and a plot of ground on which to grow a garden. Once children reach the age of adolescence, a third room becomes necessary if separate sleeping accommodation is to be provided for boys and girls.

26. The higher standard of the middle class would seem to justify one room more than is necessary for a working class family at parallel stages of family growth.

27. It is our conviction that all Government servants without exception should be provided with rent-free accommodation in which two living

rooms would be the minimum for a working class and three for a middle class family. Government should embark without delay upon a housing programme based on standards such as those laid down by the Housing Committee. The execution of such a programme will provide far better accommodation for Government servants than they can now afford at costs which will be less than they now pay. Until such time as this programme is completed the equitable course will be to grant every employee the house rent he actually pays, assuming that the accommodation he rents does not exceed the standard prescribed for the class of the service to which he belongs. If this course is not considered practicable, the figures in Appendix VIII of the Manual of Appointments and Allowances should be revised, and a reallocation made among the stations in the five groups on the basis of a factual survey of present housing conditions. An upgrading of the house rent allowance for each group by 20%, subject to a minimum increase of Rs. 5, will, we believe, meet the needs of the situation for the interim period.

28. A rapid house-building programme is even more necessary for urban working class employees, most of whom live under conditions which would be regarded as unsuitable for cattle in more advanced countries. For the interim period, we recommended a house rent allowance of Rs. 10 and Rs. 15 for working class employees with under and over ten years' service respectively, living in group V stations ; and additions of Rs. 5 each to the basic figures for employees in stations listed under groups 4, 3, 2 and 1. We recognise that this recommendation may at first sight appear to be unduly liberal. On the other hand, until it is put into effect the working class employees of Government, who constitute the vast majority, will be condemned to a continuance of degrading housing conditions.

4. Recreation and Leisure.

29. The twentieth century accepts as a truism that recreation and leisure are basic human needs. The provision to be made in the minimum wage budget for recreation and leisure will be determined to a large extent by the policy of the State. The post-war plans of the P. and T. Department envisage the creation of recreation centres and departmental playing grounds in all large stations and the provision of club rooms and compounds in the smallest stations where, incidentally, out-door space is easily available. The provision of recreation and playground facilities by the department should, in our opinion, form an integral part of the Pay Commission's recommendations and provision should be made not only for the recreational needs of the employee but also for his wife and children. The department ought to meet both initial expenditure and reasonable cost of maintenance. Under existing conditions, provision for recreation and leisure expenditure is

presumably made in compiling scales of pay. If the amounts presumably allotted to each employee for the satisfaction of these needs in his individual wage bill were pooled, it would be possible to give all employees opportunities for recreation and leisure beyond those the average employee can afford on an individual basis, and the cost in the long run would prove less expensive to the State.

30. Individual needs in the sphere of recreation and leisure vary so widely, however, that a small financial provision should be made for these activities in the minimum wage budget. As will be seen later, we have allotted only Rs. 3 per month for a man and his wife under this head.

5. Education.

31. Provision for education does not have to be made in the minimum wage budget until the seventh or eighth year of an employee's service, assuming that he does not marry till he has a job. It is sometimes contended that the annual increments an employee receives suffice to provide for the education of his children. Even if this were true, and the provision were adequate it would be a wasteful and inequitable means of providing for a basic human need. The principle to be followed here is that of granting "to each according to his needs", and this cannot be effected on the basis of averages. The proper education of the young is of such supreme importance both to the individual and to the State that provision should not be made for it in annual incremental additions to pay but by the direct grant of an educational allowance, sufficient to cover the cost of tuition and books in a recognised school, for all the children of school-going age of every employee. These grants should continue for a period of eight years, that is between the ages of 6 and 14, for every child capable of profiting from elementary education.

6. Medical Attendance.

32. Provision for medical attendance in the minimum wage of an employee at every stage of service must obviously include not only the employee but all the members of his family. Here again the provision of medical service on a group basis will cost less to the employer in the long run, and will be more equitable to the employees, on the principle of granting "to each according to his needs". The P. and T. department already makes provision to a limited extent, for free medical attendance and hospitalisation charges for its employees, but these services are not usually extended to employee's families. In all cases where the number of employees justify it, adequately staffed and equipped dispensaries should be set up. Provision for medical care must be as adequate on the preventive, as on the curative side; and every employee and his family should be

entitled to a free medical examination including special attention to eyes and teeth once a year. We need hardly add that pre-natal, maternity and post-natal attendance should be a cardinal provision of the free medical attendance scheme in a country, where infant and maternal mortality stand among the highest in the world.

7. Security against the future.

33. Security of the family in the case of accident, ill-health, invalidity and death have to be provided for in the compilation of the minimum wage budget if it is to have reality. Such security should be sufficient to afford minimum living wage to the widow and the children of the employee as long as the widow remains unmarried and the children continue to be dependent. This security is obviously beyond the reach of the overwhelming majority of employees, and can be provided for only by group insurance. Group Insurance on an annuity basis, sufficient to cover the minimum needs of the widow and children of every employee, can only be undertaken by the employer; savings on individual initiative for needs above the minimum being left to the individual.

8. Miscellaneous.

34. A questionnaire issued by the Government of India in 1945 to discover middle class costs of living contained a sample family budget which included the following items under the heading 'Miscellaneous':—

“ Servants, washerman, barber, shaving requisites, cobbler, gardening and its upkeep, sweeper, religious ceremonies, washing soap, toilet soap and soda, other toilet requisites, tooth brush, tooth powder, newspaper, entertainment, club subscription, postage, holiday expenses, travelling from and to place of work, maintenance of own conveyance, cycles, perambulator, radio, taxes, remittance to dependents, interest on loans if any, marriage, pansupari, cigarettes, etc., tobacco, opium, flowers, charity, maintenance of milch cattle, other miscellaneous expenses ”.

35. The variety of this list is a pointer to the difficulty of setting up a formula for a reasonable minimum standard of expenditure on Miscellaneous items. Nor is much evidence available as to the average expenditure of middle and working class families under this head.

36. The expenditure of the middle class witnesses in the P. and T. Adjudication on Miscellaneous items ranged from Rs. 8-1-0 to Rs. 17-8-0 per consumption unit, excluding insurance premiums, savings and abnormal cases. About 18% of the entire budget of the typical witness was allocated to this head. The range of expenditure for the working class witnesses

was between Rs. 1-8-9 and Rs. 9-11-0 per consumption unit, excluding abnormal cases, and the average worked out to Rs. 5-6-0 per head.

37. We submit below budgets which we consider the absolute minimum for a middle class and working class family of 2 consumption units, compiled on prices prevailing in Madras in July 1946. The closest scrutiny of these budgets will fail we believe to disclose any margin for reduction.

COST OF MINIMUM MISCELLANEOUS REQUIREMENTS.

Family of 2 consumption units.

Particulars.	Monthly cost.					
	Middle class.			Working class.		
	RS.	A.	P.	RS.	A.	P.
Dhobi 75 pieces	5	4	0	...		
Do. 25 do.				1	12	0
Barber and shaving	1	4	0	1	4	0
Soap and Soap-nuts	1	12	6	1	0	0
Oil for bathing	0	9	0	0	9	0
Sweeping and scavenging	3	0	0	1	0	0
Cooly hire... ..	0	6	0	...		
Conveyance	5	0	0	2	8	0
Tinning vessels and repairs	0	14	0	0	14	0
Religious observances	2	0	0	1	0	0
Recreation	3	0	0	3	0	0
Total	23	1	6	12	15	0

The minimum Living Wage—a Family Wage.

38. In view of the fact that the family and not the individual is the unit of society and as early marriage tends to be the universal practice in India, the minimum living wage in India at the commencement of an employee's service should provide for a family of two, namely husband and wife. As a corollary, any minimum living wage scheme based on equity and reality must provide for the children of every employee as and when they arrive. Pay scales, as they exist at present, are supposed to be compiled with an eye upon the needs of growing families. Actually authoritative statistics have not been compiled on a basis wide enough to enable anybody to state with certainty that the typical middle class or working class family in the P. and T. department will have so many living children

at such and such a period of married life. Even if statistics become available, provision for the growth of the family through uniform annual increments paid to all employees in a particular cadre would not meet the needs of the situation since a large number would have less than the average number of children, and a large number more than the average. The former group would derive an unearned advantage and the latter would be unduly penalised. The sensible solution would be to provide for children as and when they arrive by the introduction of family allowance, the amount of allowances to be determined, as far as possible, by an objective analysis of the needs of the normal child in infancy, early childhood, pre-adolescence and adolescence and of the cost of satisfying these needs.

39. In this connection, it will be pertinent to draw attention to the fact that the principle of family allowances has recently been accepted in one Government Service in India, *viz.*, the Reserve Bank. In August 1946, the Reserve Bank introduced family allowances for their clerical and working class employees; the former are to receive Rs. 10/- for each child up to a maximum of Rs. 30/- and the latter Rs. 5/- per child up to a maximum of Rs. 15/-. While we do not advocate that family allowances should be set at these figures, which appear to be arbitrary, and which are subject to maxima that are equally arbitrary, it is noteworthy that the principle has been accepted in this country. We may mention in passing that the introduction of family allowances, far from increasing the birth-rate, is likely to decrease it, if the experience of other countries with a rising standard of living is taken as a guide.

Payment in money and in services.

40. Among the basic needs of the family to be provided within the framework of the minimum living wage, some can be met by payments in money and others, in our opinion, should be provided in the form of services, cost-free to the individual employee.

41. We suggest a three-fold mode of payment:

(a) A basic money wage, common to all employees of a class, to provide for the needs of a family of two with regard to food, clothing and miscellaneous items of expenditure.

(b) Integral additions to the basic money wage in the form of family allowances, including provision for the education of children and of house rent allowance wherever free-furnished quarters are unavailable. These integral additions to the basic wage will vary from employee to employee according to the size of his family.

(c) Direct services, cost free to the individual employee, with regard to the medical attendance and facilities for recreation and leisure.

42. The satisfaction of an employee's basic needs through the three channels of a stable money wage common to all, based on the needs of a family of two with regard to food, clothing and miscellaneous items; fluctuating additions to this basic wage varying according to the number of children, and the provision of medical and recreational facilities on a group basis will, we believe, prove, in the long run less expensive to the State and will be greatly advantageous to the employee. In the matter of medical attendance, for instance, it is obvious that each employee will be relieved in large measure of fear and insecurity and assured of a high standard of medical skill if the State, in lieu of allotting a certain part of the minimum wage budget to the anticipated average medical expenditure of each family unit, pools the individual allotments and provides medical service and supplies on a group basis. Similarly, if the greater percentage of the individual allotments for recreation and leisure now theoretically provided for in the pay scales are pooled, all families will have opportunities for outdoor and indoor recreation and for creative leisure activities far beyond those they can provide for themselves on an individual family basis. Under the existing system of salary payments, provision for educational needs stands in inverse ratio to the size of the family which is contrary both to reason and equity. The provision for such items of expenditure in pay scales on the basis of average means in practice that employees with the fewest children receive the most per child, and those with the most children receive the least.

43. As we move nearer and nearer towards a planned society in which the co-operative mainspring of action tends increasingly to displace the competitive urge, the correctness of the principle of giving to each according to his needs becomes increasingly apparent. We do not put forward this principle in an attempt to promote any political or social theory; it is advanced as a principle of commonsense and social decency.

The real minimum wage and the price level.

44. The history of the past two decades bears witness to the reality of the distinction made by economists between a money and a real wage. Nominal or money wages lose the larger part of their meaning during periods of rapidly rising and violently fluctuating prices. Nevertheless, the average individual would probably be averse to any system of wage payments linked wholly to fluctuations in the cost of living. What the individual appears to want is a basic salary and pay scale of some degree of permanence, together with special safeguards in the form of dearness allowance, to cover significant rises above the norm. The interests of the State and of the general tax-payer likewise demand that a revised salary structure for all classes of Government servants should have an element of stability which can be arrived at if the real minimum wage is equated to the price level at

which Government proposes to stabilise the market; and if a provision is made for significant deviations from the stability level by the introduction of a sliding scale of dearness allowance linked directly to such fluctuations. The same principle can be employed to solve the problem of variations in the price index from area to area.

45. From statements which have been made in the Central Legislative Assembly it appears that the Government of India's financial policy is directed towards stabilising the price level at the index number of 180, which means a reduction of 25% below the prevailing index number of 240. Our recommendation, therefore, is that the revised scales of pay should be based on the assumption that the cost of living index will be stabilised at 180. Significant fluctuations above this figure should be provided for by the grant of dearness allowance linked directly to the cost of living.

Constituents of the Minimum Wage.

46. What will a family belonging to the lower middle class and to the working class receive under the scheme of payments we have advocated in the preceding paragraphs?

47. The answer is given below:—

MINIMUM WAGE CHART.

Mode of payment.	Particulars.	Middle Class Family.			Working Class Family.		
		RS.	A.	P.	RS.	A.	P.
I. Uniform money wage calculated for 2 consumption units.	1. Food	74	1	6	50	1	0
	2. Clothing	14	15	6	10	4	6
	3. Miscellaneous	23	1	6	12	15	0
	Total	112	2	6	73	4	6
		Cost of living index 240					
		or					
		* 84 0 0			* 55 0 0		
		Cost of living index 180					

* Note.—If the basic wage be equated to a cost of living index of 180 dearness allowance at Rs. 4-8-0 and Rs. 3 will have to be granted to middle and working class employees respectively, for every rise of 10 points above 180.

II. Integral additions to basic wages.	1. Family allowance. 2. Educational allowance. 3. Free furnished accommodation.	At rates to be prescribed on an objective analysis of minimum needs.	At rates to be prescribed on an objective analysis of minimum needs.
III. Direct Services.	1. Medical attendance. 2. Recreation and leisure facilities.	According to standards to be prescribed and appropriate to the class.	According to standards to be prescribed and appropriate to the class.

Increments and Promotions.

48. Thus far we have confined ourselves to an examination of the minimum wage an employee should receive at all stages of his service. Assuming that the principles we have advocated are accepted, a number of factors generally taken into account in fixing increments, such as the average growth in the family, the average need for providing against the hazards of life, the average incidence of the cost of medical attendance and the like, will no longer have to be considered. The necessity and the desirability of annual increments, and of increases in salary as an employee passes from one level of the service to the next, may be measured solely by the yardsticks of his increasing value to the service resulting from experience and growth in ability, the bearing of periodical increments on his efficiency and contentment and his assumption of higher levels of responsibility.

49. With these considerations in mind, we contend that the following principles should be applied in fixing increments and deciding upon increases in salary on promotion:—

(a) The minimum wage, as we have defined it above, should be paid to employees in classes III and II whose qualifications are deemed to be just sufficient to gain them entry into the service at these levels. Similarly, the posts held will demand a measure of ability and responsibility just sufficient to warrant their inclusion in class III or class II.

(b) Increments should be uniform throughout the length of an employee's service in the cadre.

(c) Increments should continue till the age of retirement.

(d) Differences in qualifications and responsibilities within a scale should be provided for at the point of entry within the scale and not by variations in the amount of the annual increment granted to different categories of employees in the one scale.

(e) Increase in salary on promotion from a junior to a senior scale, or from one class to the next above it, should be uniform for all employees in the scale and in the class.

(f) The amount of the annual increment while being the same at each level of service, should increase on promotion from a junior to a senior scale or from one class to another.

50. We attach at this point six charts which show graphically how the scheme we advocate will function in practice.

CLASS III—(JUNIOR SCALE).

Section in Man. of Appts. and Allowances.	Posts in the section.	Number.		Old scales of pay.	No. of scales.	Revised scales of pay.	No. of scales.	Federation's proposals.
		Old scales.	New scales.	Range of varia- tion.		Range of varia- tion.		
				RS.		RS.		
XXV	Runners ...	7,170	4,622	17-4 as.-22 to 13-4 as.-18	4	12-4 as.-17 ...	1	First point of entry Rs. 55.
XXVIII	(a) Packers, porters, watchmen, office peons, telephone Dist. cable guards, coolies.	7,042	12,899	25-8 as.-30 to 14-8 as.-19	8	16-1/5-18 to 14-1/5-16.	4	Do.
	(b) Task work mes- sengers.	610	741	12-4 as.-17 to 8-4 as.-13 <i>plus</i> task work earn- ings.	5	8-1/5-10 to 6-1/5-8 <i>plus</i> task work earnings.	3	Do.
XXVI	a. Jamadars, etc. ...			a. 30-1-35 to 19-1-24	8	} 20-1/2-23 to 16-1/2-24	3	Do.
	b. Ferrotypers, mar- kers, duftries, etc.	409	228	b. 30-1-40 to 20-8 as.-25.	3			
	c. Record suppliers ...			c. 60-4-100 to 28-1-40	6			
XV	a. Linemen ...			a. 20-1-40 to 18-1-38	4	} 24-1/2-34 to 18-1/2-28	3	Second point of entry; Rs. 65. Do.
	b. Postmen, village Postmen.	20,240	18,075	b. 30-1-50 to 18-1-38	6			
	c. Shroff, bill sircars.			c. 60-4-100 to 35-4-75.	6			
XXIII	1. Assistant mistries. 2. Carpenters, pain- ters, bicycle mis- tries.	11	154	30-2-50 30-1-50 to 18-1-38	1 5	} 25-1-45 to 16-1-36	3	Do.

Note:—Increment of Rs. 2 for all till retirement.

CLASS III—(SENIOR SCALE.)

Section in Man. of Appla. and Allowances.	Posts in the section.	Number.		Old scales of pay.	No. of scales.	Revised scales of pay.	No. of scales.	Federation's proposals.
		Old Scales.	New Scales.	Range of varia- tion.		Range of variation.		
				Rs.		Rs.		
XIV	a. Head postmen, Dep. Branch post- masters, Mail overseers and reader postmen etc.	2,077	552	60—4—100 to 35—4—75	6	35—2—55	1	Increase of Rs. 10/- on promotion and increment of Rs. 3/- per annum till retirement.
	b. Inspectors of peons.	60—5—160 to 40—6—100— 5—150	4	Do.		
XXIV	Conservancy Inspec- tors, caretakers, sanitary inspec- tors, commission- aires.	4	20	100 fixed to 30—1/5—35	5	40—40—2—70		
XXII	Sub-Inspectors	...	965	145	40—5—110 to 35—5—105	2	35—5—85	1

Notes—(i) The statistics above are taken from the Manual of Appointments and Allowances and the report of the Adjudicator of the Postal Disputes.

(ii) The employees recommended for inclusion in Class III number 75,964 of whom 38,528 are on the old scales of pay and 37,436 on the revised scales. Employees recruited before 1931 receive 73, and those recruited after 1931 receive 20 different scales of pay making a total of 93.

(iii) Against this our proposed pay structure envisages one Junior scale with two points of entry and uniform annual increments of Rs. 2 for all and one senior scale, entry into which carries an increase of Rs. 10 with uniform annual increment of Rs. 3, thereafter.

CLASS II—(JUNIOR SCALE).

Section
in Man.
Apts. and
Allowances.

Posts in the section.

Number.
Old scale. New scale.

Old scales of pay
Range in variation.

No. of scales.

New scales
of pay.
Range of variation.

No. of scales.

Federation's proposals.

Section in Man. Apts. and Allowances.	Posts in the section.	Number.		Old scales of pay		No. of scales.	New scales of pay.		No. of scales.	Federation's proposals.
		Old scale.	New scale.	Range in variation.			Range of variation.			
				RS.			RS.			
XXIII a	1. Mistries of Engineering in Simla, Delhi, Lahore, Cawnpore.			1.	120—5—145 to 110—5—140	2				First point of entry Rs. 85/-
	2. Electric Mistry, Lahore.			2.	45—5—140 ...	1				
	3. Mistries, Cable Jointers Engineering and Engine drivers.			3.	60—5—130 to 35—5—105	7	45—3—96—100 30—3—81—85	3		All cadres in column 2 except Telephone Inspectors and Operators, Exchange Inspectors in Telephone district.
	4. Wireless mistries, head carpenters, Assistant jointers, Assistant Engine drivers.	325	1,285	4.	60—4—100 to 35—4—75	7				
b	Clerks, sorters, sub-inspectors, Town Inspectors of P.Os. Accountants, Telephone operators and Inspectors, etc.	17,947	23,820		60—5—160 to 35—5—135	8	45—45—3—90 —5—120 to 35—35—3— 80—5—110.	3		

XI	Clerks in circle office, Telephone Revenue offices, etc.	641	1,565	60-5-160 to 40-4-80	12	50-5-150 to 40-2-60- 3-90.	6	
XX	Telegraphists	...	1,280	2,082	G.S. 80-5-100 -10-250	1		} Second point of entry Telegraphists, Tele- phone operators, Accountants, Rs. 100/-.
					L.S. 55-5-120 -10-180	1	45-45-3-50 4-120 (mini-	
					S.S. 80-5-170 to 55-5-145	5	mum pay Rs. 55/-.)	
XVIII	Wireless operators, carrier attendants (new).	34	537	80-5-100-10- 250.	1	60-5-150 ...	1	Third point of Entry Wireless operators and Carrier attendants Rs. 125/-
XXI	Line Inspectors	...	63	10 115-5-140 110-5-135	to 2	90-5-115 ...	1	Do.

Note:—Increment of Rs. 5 for all.

CLASS II—(SENIOR SCALE).

Section in
Man. of
Appts. and
Allowances.

Section in Man. of Appts. and Allowances.	Posts in section.	Number.		Old scales of pay.	No. of scales.	Revised scales.	No. of scales.	Federation's proposed scale.
		Old scale.	New scale.	Range in varia- tion.		Range in varia- tion.		
				RS.		RS.		
XIX	Engineering, Tele- phone, Wireless, Electrical and Cable Supervisors.	181	575	120—5—140—10 290—20—350	1	80—5—120—10 —240	1	Recruitment through promotion from the junior scale with an increase of Rs. 30 on salary previously drawn for all cadres except Engineering Supervisors, Assistant Foremen. Engineering Supervisors Entry, Rs. 150. Assistant Foreman, Rs. 175. Annual increment of Rs. 10 for all.
XVI	Assistant Foreman, Assistant Exami- ners, etc.	...	20	150—10—350 ...	1	100—10—5— 120—10— 200	1	
XVII	Telegraph Masters ...	354	...	G.S. 275—10—325 L.S. 200—10—250 S.S. (a) 200—10— 250 (b) 180—10— 230	4	130—10—250...	1	
XIII	1. Junior Selection grade clerks in Post and Tele- graph offices, in- cluding Postmas- ters and Dy. Post-	1,633	313	160—10—250 ...	1	130—6—190 ...	1	Do.
				160—10—250 ...	1	160—6—190 ...	1	Do.
				120—10—270 ...		80—8—200 — 25/5—22.5		Do.

masters listed in paragraph 50 of Man. of Appts. and Allowances.

	2. Senior Selection grade including Postmasters, Grade 'B.'	250-20-350 ...	1	200-10-250...	1	Do.
IX & XI	Head Assistants, Circle offices, and Office Superintendents.	250-20-350 ...	1	200-10-250 <i>plus</i> S.P. 50.	2	Do.
		350-20-450 to 250-20-350	1	200-10-250 <i>plus</i> S.P. 25.	2	Do.
	Telephone districts Supervisors, Exchange Inspectors, Line and Installation Inspectors, Selection grade clerks.	Variation from district to district.				

Section in
Man. of
Appts.
and Allow-
ances.

CLASS I (JUNIOR SCALE).

Posts.	Old scales of pay.		New scales of pay.		Federation's proposed scale.
	Range of variation.		Range of variation.		
	RS.		RS.		
Chap. VIII. Telegraph Traffic ...	A.	500—25—600 (special pay Rs. 50 to P.As. T. Calcutta and Bombay.)	240—20—480—15—600		Class I posts to be filled exclusively by promotion from the Senior scale of Class II with an increase of Rs. 40 on salary previously drawn. Annual increments for all in the junior scale Rs. 15.
Chap. V. Telegraph Engineering and Wireless Service :	B.	350—20—470			
Class II :—		350—20—550—30—700	240—20—480—15—600		
Dy. Assistant Engineers	A.	500—20—600.			
Deputy Assistant Engineers.	B.	350—20—450.			
Telephone Districts :—					
Superintendents of Exchanges, Chief Exchange Inspectors, Test Clerk, Chief Line Inspectors Superintendent, Chief Store-keeper.		Variation from district to district and from exchange to exchange within district.		
Chap. VII. Postal Superintendent Service.		300—20—600—25—750	240—20—480—15—600		
Chap. VI. Postmasters Service, Class II, Grade "A."		350—30—650			
Chap. IX. Foreman, Telegraph Store-yard.	Class I :	300—20—700			
	II :	200—10—300—20—500.	220—15—340		

CLASS I (SENIOR SCALE).

Posts.	Old scale of pay.	New scales pay.	Federation's proposed scale.	
			RS.	
1. Telegraph Traffic Service Class I Chief Superintendents.	1,000—50—1,500	Grade I ...	950	Recruitment through promotion from the Junior scale with an increase of Rs. 50/- in salary and increments of Rs. 20/- thereafter.
		II ...	850	
		III ...	750	
2. Postal Service class I: Presidency Postmasters, Dy. Postmaster-General.	1,000—50—1,500	Do.	Do.	
3. Telegraph Engineering and Wireless.				
1. Assistant Divisional Engineer.	375—50—525/2—575—625/2 50—975.	Do.	Do.	
	Junior scales: 250—275—350 —25—450/2—500.			
2. Divisional Engineer (Senior scale).	625/2—675—725/2—50—1,025/ 2—50—1,275/2—1,325/2 —1,375.			

POSTS ABOVE THE TIME SCALE.

i. Deputy Director General.	2,000—100—2,500 ...	1,600	
ii. Postmaster-General of some circles.			
iii. Senior Deputy Director-General and P.M.G. Bombay, Bengal and Assam, Punjab.	2,250—100—2,750 and S.P. Rs. 250.	2,000	
iv. Directors, Telegraphs, Engineering, Electrical Engineer in chief, Deputy Chief Engineer.	1,750—100—2,150	1,300	Two grades: (i, ii & iv) fixed salary Rs. 1,000. (iii) fixed salary of Rs. 1,100.
v. Chief Engineer	... 2,750—125—3,000	2,250	Rs. 1,250.
vi. Director-General	... 3,500—100—4,000	2,250	Rs. 1,450.

51. From the standpoint of emoluments and status, the scheme in our chart envisages a reorganisation of the numerous existing pay scales and groupings of employees into three classes, with a junior and a senior scale in each. Employees in each scale of each class may begin their service at different points of entry in the pay scale, but they are all granted the same increment. Similarly increases in salary on promotion from the junior to the senior scale in any class are the same for all. The rate of increment, though uniform within each scale increases as the employee ascends from scale to scale. Similarly the increase in salary that goes with promotion is the same for all at each promotional stage but becomes larger for all as they ascend from one level to the next. The rate of annual increment is Rs. 2/- in the Junior and Rs. 3/- in the Senior scale of class III. In class II it is Rs. 5/- in the Junior scale and Rs. 10/- in the Senior scale. Additional increases of Rs. 5/- bring the rate of increment to Rs. 15/- and Rs. 20/- in the junior and senior scale of class I respectively.

52. The increases we recommend when the employee is promoted from one level to another exemplify the same principle :- Rupees ten on promotion from the junior to the senior scale in class III, Rupees twenty on promotion from class III to class II; Rupees thirty on promotion from the junior to the senior scale of class II; Rupees forty from class II to class I, and Rupees fifty on promotion from the junior to the senior scale, class I.

53. Our scheme, viewed as a whole, contemplates the establishment of a single time scale, with only seven points of entry. In this single time scale, increments remain uniform for all employees at the same level, and increase uniformly from level to level. Similarly increases in salary on promotion are the same for all within the same scale, and become larger uniformly as employees ascend from one level to another. Compare this with the 93 pay scales which now exist for employees included in our Class III only.

54. *Class III.* Let us trace the financial career of an employee in Class III. He enters the service at the minimum wage of Rs. 55/- when the cost of living index figures stands at 180. He draws increments at Rs. 2/- per annum as long as he remains in the Junior scale. If his qualifications are above the minimum he may secure an appointment as a lineman or a postman, in which case he enters the service with a salary of Rs. 65/-. Whether he has begun at the first or the second point of entry, he is given opportunities for promotion on the results of a suitable examination and incentive is furnished him to try for promotion, by the prospect of an increase of Rs. 10/- and increments of Rs. 3/- thereafter. Once he is in the senior scale, he is again invited to try to enter the next class of the

service by the prospect of an increase in salary of Rs. 20/- and of increments of Rs. 5/- thereafter. If failure dogs his footsteps he continues to have incentive at his own level by the prospects of annual increments, which continues till the end of his service.

55. *Class II.* The minimum wage for a middle class employee works out to Rs. 84/- which may be rounded off to Rs. 85/- at which point we start the least skilled employees on the clerical and the engineering sides, namely the clerk assigned to routine duties and the mistry. Two other points of entry are provided for employees with higher qualifications than the minimum, who will have duties of a more responsible nature to perform. Telegraphists, telephone operators and accountants enter the junior scale of Class II at the Rs. 100/- point and wireless operators and carrier attendants begin at Rs. 125/-. Whatever the point of entry may be the increment of Rs. 5/- per annum is the same for all.

56. There exist at present a large number of Class II posts which call for special efficiency, demand special qualifications or exact labour above the normal and which yet do not warrant the elevation of these posts to the senior scale. We recommend a uniform allowance of Rs. 20/- for incumbents of these posts. Among the employees entitled to this allowance, we would include Baudot and Teleprinter supervisor-operators, Telephone monitors and inspectors, record clerks, observation and meter clerks test and P.B.X. operators, line inspectors, clerks in the 1st division in circle offices, the telephone revenue accounts office, the office of the Controller of Telegraph Stores and of the Superintendent of Telegraph Workshops. Another group to be included are wireless operators who have passed the proficiency examination.

57. Under the existing pay structure, employees included in the junior scale of Class II number 49,049 of whom 20,290 are on the pre-1931 scales of pay and 28,759 on the revised scales. Employees recruited before 1931 receive 47 different scales of pay and those recruited since 1931 receive 15 scales of pay, making a total of 62. As against this, the Junior scale we propose for Class II has three points of entry and a uniform increment of Rs. 5/- for all.

58. We recommend that promotion from the Junior to the Senior scale in Class II should be made on the results of an examination success in which leads, on promotion, to an increase in salary of Rs. 30/- with uniform increments of Rs. 10/- thereafter. The needs of the P. and T. service demand the direct recruitment of two groups of employees in the Senior scale, namely Engineering Supervisors and Assistant Foremen, for whom we recommend beginning salaries of Rs. 150/- and Rs. 175/- respectively.

Employees who would come under Class II now receive eleven scales of pay, if they were recruited before 1931 and ten scales of pay, if they were recruited after 1931. As against this, we have a single time scale, entrance into which is made either through promotions from the junior scale or by direct recruitment in the case of two groups only, with uniform increments for all.

59. *Class I.* Promotion to Class I should be made exclusively from Class II, the suitability of each employee for promotion being tested by an examination of high standard to determine not only his knowledge of the work he will be called upon to do, but his executive abilities. Success in this examination should be followed on promotion by an increase of Rs. 40/- and by uniform increments of Rs. 15/- thereafter.

60. Promotion from the Junior to the Senior scale of Class I should carry with it an increase of Rs. 50/- in salary and increments of Rs. 20/- thereafter. Suitability for promotion from the junior to senior scale in Class I, cannot be tested easily by examinations and should be determined by the previous record of the employees.

61. There remain a few top ranking posts above the time scale to be considered. The responsibility attached to them and the degree of executive acumen required to fill them successfully, together with the necessity of maintaining the status of Government service, justify a salary which will not be below Rs. 1,000/-. All these posts, except those of the Chief Engineer and the Director-General may be graded into two groups carrying salaries of Rs. 1,000/- and Rs. 1,100/- respectively. We have recommended Rs. 1,250/- for the Chief Engineer and Rs. 1,450/- for the Director-General on the assumption that the salary of the minister in charge the P. and T. department is to be fixed at Rs. 1,500/-. If this figure is raised, we would recommend proportionate increases in the salaries of the two chief officers of the Department.

62. Let us now see what four selected employees will receive at the end of their career under our scheme. First we take the plodding runner who starts at Rs. 55/- the lower point in the time scale, and does not go beyond his scale. After a service of 35 years he will retire on Rs. 125/-. At the other extreme his colleague who jumps from scale to scale every five years will be in receipt of a salary of Rs. 555/- at the age of 55. At the highest point of entry in the service we have the foreman who starts at Rs. 175/-. Foreman A remains a foreman all his life. He will rarely be able to enter the service before the age of 24 and after 30 years he will retire on Rs. 475/-. His brilliant colleague who is promoted at five year intervals will be in receipt of Rs. 790/- on his 55th birthday.

Summary.

63. We have now arrived at a point at which it will be useful to summarise our answer to Question III. We hold that the grant of a minimum wage should form the corner-stone of the pay structure of all employees recruited to Classes III and II. We define the minimum wage as wage which enables a man and his family whatever the size of the family may be—to maintain bodily and mental health unimpaired. In computing the minimum wage, regard must also be paid to the satisfaction of those wants which become genuinely essential as the result of birth and up-bringing in a particular social group. The wide differences in the standards of life of the working and the middle classes demand the establishment of a separate minimum wage level for each ; the lower being applied to employees in class III the bulk of whom are drawn from the working class ; and the higher, to employees in class II who are recruited from the middle class.

64. The minimum wage should as far as possible, be constructed on an objective analysis of a man's essential needs with regard to food, clothing, shelter, recreation and leisure, education for his children, medical attendance, security for the future, and the unclassifiable wants, which multiply as material civilisation advances, and which may conveniently be grouped together under the heading ' Miscellaneous.' That portion of the minimum living wage which is paid in the form of a uniform monthly salary to all employees in a single cadre, should be based on a family of two consumption units.

65. The minimum wage should be paid through three channels. It should consist, first, of a basic money wage common to all employees of a—cadre, sufficient to meet the minimum needs of husband and wife with regard to food, clothing and miscellaneous items of expenditure. Secondly, family allowance, including provision for the education of children from the ages of 6 to 14 and rent free, furnished accommodation should be granted to all employees, at rates appropriate to the class of the service to which they belong. Thirdly every employee should be guaranteed free medical attendance including hospitalisation and maternity care and facilities for recreation and leisure appropriate to the class of the service to which he belongs.

66. The basic money wage should be equated to the cost of living index number 180, or to any other index number at which the state intends to stabilise prices. Provision for rises in the index figure above the normal should be made through the grant of dearness allowance. Assuming that the cost of living index will be stabilised at 180, the minimum wage paid in money to employees in Class III should be Rs. 55/- and to employees in

Class II Rs. 85/-. Dearness allowance at the rate of Rs. 3/- and Rs. 4/8- should be paid to working and middle class employees respectively for every rise of 10 points above the base figure of 180.

67. The family allowance granted for each child should be determined on an analysis of the cost of providing for the basic needs of children with regard to food, clothing and miscellaneous items of expenditure. Educational needs may conveniently be met through the employer's payment of school fees until such time as free, compulsory education is universally established. The necessity of accommodation adopted to the size of the family is provided for in the different standards of housing we have advocated for families of different sizes. The essential medical and recreational needs of the family should be furnished directly by the State on a group basis. .

68. The construction of the minimum wage budget on the lines suggested above will have many advantages. It will assure to the employee freedom from fear and want, at all stages of his service. It will safeguard him against the hazards of sickness, accident, invalidity and death, through the scheme of insurance we shall refer to later. It will meet the criterion of giving 'to each according to his needs' more adequately than can be achieved by any other method. It will safeguard the employees from the adverse effects of fluctuation in the cost of living over a large area of his expenditure. It will assure the state of a contented, efficient and loyal body of workers. .

69. Once the grant of a minimum living wage, as we have explained it, is accepted, the necessity and desirability of annual increments and of increases in salaries on promotion, need to be measured solely by the yardstick of the increasing value of the employee to the service, resulting from experience and growth in ability, the bearing of increments on efficiency, and the assumption of higher levels of responsibility. The three classes of the service should each be divided into a junior and a senior scale, the minimum wage being paid to the least skilled employee in Classes III and II. Employees in each scale of each class should be granted uniform increments ; compensation for higher responsibility or attainments within a class being provided for at the point of entry. Exception to this rule should be made only in those cases in which an employee after entering the service acquires special qualifications or undertakes special duties held to be necessary in the interest of the service but not important enough to warrant his promotion.

70. Increases in salaries should be uniform for all employees when they were promoted from the same lower scale or class to the one above it.

While the rate of increment should be the same for all at the same level, it should increase progressively from level to level. Similarly the increase in salary attached to promotion should be greater, the higher the stage of promotion.

71. Among the advantages which may be claimed for the scheme of increments and promotions we have recommended, are the following :—

- (a) It opens the door to the highest post in the department to the employee at the lowest level.
- (b) It reduces the existing inequalities of income within the P. and T. service, which stood at 1 : 286 in the year 1939 to 1 : 25.
- (c) It reduces the inequality in increments which ranged from annas four to Rs. 125/- or 1 : 600 in 1939 to 1 : 10.
- (d) It eliminates the meticulous differences in salaries and increments which characterise the present pay structure for the greater number of which no valid reason can be discovered.
- (e) It provides raises in salary at each promotional level within the time scale, which give an adequate return for the higher responsibilities assumed and are sufficient to prompt the employees to undertake the voluntary labour involved in equipping himself for these responsibilities.
- (f) It allows each employee to rise from level to level at his own gait, provides uniform incentive for all to do their best, and safeguards each and every employee against stagnation at any point of his career.
- (g) It provides freedom from fear and want at all stages of his career to the employee plodding alone in the scale to which he was recruited ; and prospects of status, dignity and financial return at the top sufficient to attract to the service, men of the highest ability.

72. The scheme we advocate, resting as it does on the base of two minimum wage levels demanded by the different standard of the working and lower middle class ; responsive to the various needs of employees arising from the different sizes of families and the hazards of existence ; prescribing uniform increments and uniform increases on promotion for all employees in a particular scale and uniform additions to increases in increments and to increases in salaries as they ascend from level to level, will tend to eliminate the sense of superiority wherever it exists at the top and the feeling of inadequacy and frustration which prevail at the bottom, and to democratise the P. and T. service as no other system can.

Q. IV. If in any circumstances recruitment has to be made of non-Indians from outside India for any posts or services, how should the remuneration be fixed in such cases *vis-a-vis* the rates prescribed for Indians?

73. We are opposed to the recruitment of non-Indians to posts for which Indians are available and so the question of fixing their remuneration *vis-a-vis* the rate prescribed for Indians should not arise. When foreign specialists have to be recruited they must be given (1) the rates of pay which they can obtain in their own country and (2) whatever additional remuneration is necessary to induce them to leave their homeland. No hard and fast rules can be laid down. The total emoluments in each case will have to be decided by the circumstances of the case.

Q. V. What is your opinion as to the fairness of the present standards of remuneration for different grades and categories of Government employees? If you are not satisfied about it, on what lines and to what extent would you suggest revision of the existing scales of remuneration, in respect of the different departments of Central Government employees?

74. The present standards of remuneration do not conform to the standards laid down in our answer to Question III and, to that extent, they are unfair. They should be revised in accordance with the principles we have advocated.

Q. VI. It has been said that Indians holding posts in the Public Service in India should not be paid more than the public servants doing comparable work in England. Do you consider this a valid criterion to apply in judging standards of remuneration for posts in India?

75. We agree that Indians employed in the Public Services should not be paid more than public servants doing comparable work in England, because the rate of payment of public servants must bear some relation to the per capita income of a country. As the per capita income in England is much higher than it is in India, it follows that payment should be lower in this country. They are much lower except for class I officers directly recruited. The question seems, however, to be somewhat irrelevant as the payment of the public services of a country has to be decided within the framework of its own political and economic systems.

Q. VII. Do you consider that the only test which should be supplied to judge of the adequacy of remuneration for posts under

Government is the criterion whether Government is paying the market value for the class of recruit and no more ?

76. The criterion of market value cannot override the right of the individual to a living wage, which is a right based on the law of Nature and of equity. The production of wealth, in the economic sense of the term is rarely, if ever, the result of the efforts of a single individual or a single social class, but the result of the partnership of capital, management and labour. Generally speaking no wealth can be produced without the combination of these three factors. It is therefore morally wrong for any partner in the combination to exploit the others, owing to a temporary advantage which he may possess. When the supply of labour exceeds the demand, it is always possible to push wages below the minimum level, but capital and management defraud labour of its just dues when they resort to this procedure, since the just dues of one partner can never fall below the minimum he requires to maintain himself and his family in bodily and mental health, and to keep up with the reasonable standard of his class, while the other partners enjoy a surplus.

77. The first principle to be applied in remunerating labour is, therefore, the principle of the minimum living wage. After this is guaranteed considerations of market values may enter in deciding upon questions of increments and increases of salary on promotion as well as of the wage to be attached initially to posts which warrant a wage above the minimum. Even here, however, market values have to be applied with discernment. The value of labour cannot be as easily assessed in the market place as can be the value of commodities especially those produced on a mass basis. No two human beings are alike, whereas it is impossible for the ordinary eye to detect any difference between commodities manufactured by mass production. We can walk into a shop and buy any tin of biscuits of a particular brand without having to make a choice between one tin and another of the same brand. But in selecting individuals for employment we do not take it for granted that all holding the same qualifications will do a particular job equally well. In seeking to appraise the market value of labour, therefore, we are in some measure pursuing a myth. Now, for instance, can one appraise the market value of a clerk or engineer, when we find on the same street of the same town clerks and engineers doing the same work but remunerated differently ? Market values, in other words cannot be ascertained with precision but only within broad limits.

78. Government in its role of supreme protector of the social and economic order should set an example to private employers in setting up the best scales of pay and conditions of service, which are possible under

any given set of circumstances, having regard to not only to the interests of the employee but to the public weal. The importance of the efficient conduct of public administration warrants deliberate effort to attract the best talents available to the service of the State. The appointment of the Central Pay Commission is in itself proof that the attempt to apply market value as the yardstick for determining the pay of the great mass of public servants has failed.

Q. VIII. In case you agree with the view referred to in the last question in respect of what categories of Government employment do you consider the application of this principle practicable and how far in your opinion does the present standard of remuneration for these categories diverge from that prevailing in comparable outside employments?

79. After each and every employee is guaranteed a minimum living wage as we have defined it, some consideration must be given to the practices obtaining in reputable business circles in determining the fixation of initial pay above the minimum level for specially qualified categories of employees, and in deciding the adequacy or otherwise of increments and of increases on promotion. As explained in our answer to Question VII, however, business practice should be taken into account as only one of the guides. Government should also take the lead in improving existing wage practices and in view of the importance of Government service, should offer wages sufficient to attract the best talent available at each level.

Q. IX. As it may not be possible to recommend any long-term arrangement in respect of the pay of public servants except with reference to a tolerably stable level of prices of foodstuffs, clothing and other essential commodities, would you venture any suggestion, as to when during the next few years the level of prices in India may be expected to attain a reasonable measure of stability and at what level they are likely to stabilise taking the prices prevailing in 1932 to furnish the datum line?

80. We venture no prediction as to when the level of prices will attain a reasonable measure of stability, because this depends mainly on the trend of international affairs and on the political future of India, both of which seem at present to be unpredictable. We have recommended an index figure of 180 as the base line in view of the Finance Member's statement in the Central Legislative Assembly some months ago. The Finance Member's statement of policy contemplated the acceptance of 1939 as a norm, and we consider this a better base than 1932 because the figures for 1939 have been compiled on more adequate and reliable statistics than were available in 1932.

**"C" RATIONALISATION, SIMPLIFICATION AND
UNIFORMITY IN PAY TERMS.**

Q. X. Do you consider it proper that there should be uniformity of payment for similar kinds of work as between different sections of the same department and as between the Centre, and the Provinces and in all the Provinces? So far as you are aware is there any dissatisfaction on the score of disparity in earnings in regard to any specific grades or posts in any department under the Central Government?

81. Uniformity of payment should be introduced for similar kinds of work in different departments and in different sections of the same department. Payment at the Centre should be slightly higher than in the Provinces because the greater importance of the Central Administration necessitates the attraction to Central Government service of the most efficient labour available.

82. Dissatisfaction is a mild word to describe the bitterness which prevails among the younger Government employees at the existence of two scales of pay for the performance of identical duties. Apart from this general grievance, particular sections of the P. and T. department are chronically disaffected by the disparity between their earnings and those obtaining for similar work in other departments of Government, and in the business world. As examples, we would cite the invidious distinction in the pay scales of wireless operators in the P. and T. service and of their counterparts known as Technical Assistants, in All-India Radio; the differences between the pay of foreman in the Storeyard and of Foreman in the Ordnance Department, the existence of three and more grades of exchanges Inspectors in the Telephone District though most of them do the same work and the extraordinary situation which has arisen in the Traffic service by the fact that station service Telegraph Masters even on the old scales of pay receive a smaller salary than is paid to many of the telegraphists when they supervise. Examples could be multiplied indefinitely to prove that the time has passed for patchwork remedies that the entire pay structure of Government service has to be radically reorganized.

Q. XI. If you think that uniform scales should be prescribed on an All-India basis for all similar categories of posts under the Central Government, whether the cost is met from the Civil, Railway or Defence Estimates what would, in your opinion be the proper method of allowing for variations in local conditions?

83. Uniform pay scales should be prescribed on All-India basis for all similar categories of posts under the Central Government. Variations in

local conditions should be provided for by the grant of local allowances. To ensure that these allowances will bear a proper relation to local conditions, we recommend the setting up of Central Wages Board whose job it will be to make continuous investigation of fluctuation in prices, and to provide proper formulae for equating allowances to deviations from the average.

Q. XII. To what extent should the pay scales allow or make special provision for a liability to serve in all parts of the country or a liability to overseas service ?

84. Provision should not be made with the uniform pay scales for a liability to transfer. Experience shows that the liability though shared equally in theory, affects employees very differently in practice. It would be more equitable to the individual employee and less expensive to Government if employees liable to transfer as a condition of their service are given a transfer allowance when ordered out of their home station, to compensate them for the disabilities to which they are put. In addition a double establishment allowance should be granted during temporary transfers whatever the duration of the temporary period may be, so long as the employee continues to live separately from his family.

Q. XIII. (a) Do you consider the structure of the present pay scales of service convenient, adequate and satisfactory ?

(b) In particular, are they calculated to secure a proper differentiation between grades of responsibility and to secure that Government get a fair return for the scale of remuneration paid to its employees ? Would you suggest any and if so, what modifications ?

85. These queries have been covered in our answer to Question III.

Q. XIV. What is your experience of the results of the working of time scales in Indian services ?

86. The time scales of pay are regarded generally with favour. The most serious objection to them is that the increments stop too soon and leave employees to stagnate at a fixed salary during the very period when family responsibilities and burdens tend to reach their peak. The individual employee often stagnates at the maximum point of the scale for no fault of his own, and merely because avenues of promotion are either not existent or are blocked by a long waiting-list. The employee in such circumstances has no incentive to continue working efficiently other than the fear of punishment. His fixation at a particular salary level tends to

lower his morale and has adverse effects on his efficiency. Our recommendations with regard to time scale have been set down in detail in the answer to Question III to which a reference is invited.

Q. XV. In particular, does the working of the progressive time scale secure adequate reward for merit and afford an incentive for efficiency; to what extent should the principle of merit and of seniority be respectively adopted in the matter of promotion; and how far is the present system of promotions between grades satisfactory (a) as between the basic scale and selection grade of a service and (b) as from a lower to a higher service?

87. The progressive time scale serves as a reward for merit and affords an incentive to efficiency as long as it progresses, but the majority of employees are condemned to stagnation long before they reach the end of their service.

88. The system of promotion is unsatisfactory. Different principles are applied not only at different levels, but to different branches of the service at the same level. Confusion and vacillation have been marked features of the Department's policy with regard to promotions for decades. In the past six years especially, standards have fluctuated astonishingly. In the examination for promotion to the grade of Telegraph Master, the rules have been changed at every examination held since 1941 often after the examination has been held. In the wireless branch the Administration has been unable as yet to fix the seniority of candidates who qualified 18 months ago.

89. Promotions are made according to one or other of the following tests, or combinations of them, an examination of the employees' record, an interview, and a written examination of a qualifying or a competitive nature. Outstanding weaknesses of the system are the lack of uniformity, the change in standards from year to year proved by the wide differences in the percentages of successful candidates and the change in standards of marking in the course of a single examination, attested to, by the publication of successive supplementary lists of successful candidates.

90. The employees of the Department are generally in favour of the qualifying examination and of assessing seniority among those who qualify according to the length of their service. The objection to this method however, is that it affords little opportunity for the gifted to rise rapidly to the top.

91. How are we to devise a method which will give due consideration to experience while not neglecting its claims of merit? The question is

difficult of solution. To begin with, experience and seniority do not necessarily go together; as can be seen from the answer given by the President of a University to an irate colleague who protested that his 20 years' experience had gone for nought in the promotion of a junior instructor over his head. "No, my friend," replied the President, "You have not 20 years' experience, but only one year's experience repeated 20 times." On the other hand, written and oral examinations are not *ipso facto* reliable tests of relative merit. There is such faith in India in the fetish of examinations that this point needs elaboration.

92. In the educationally-advanced countries of the West, experiments have been in progress over long period which indicate that examinations do not always, or even in the majority of cases bring the best men to the top, especially in the order of their relative superiority. Professors Starch and Elliott, well known American educationists, conducted an experiment which has had far reaching effects. They sent a copy of a high school student's examination papers in geometry to the teachers of Mathematics (all of them trained) of the high schools included in one strongest associations of colleges and secondary schools in the United States. One hundred and sixteen teachers corrected the one paper and the marks they assigned to this one paper ranged all the way from 28 to 92 out of maximum of 100. This started the ball rolling, and shortly afterwards Professor Edgeworth, conducting a similar experiment on an examination paper in Latin Prose found that 28 different examiners assigned to the same paper marks varying from 45 to 100 per cent. Similar experiments were carried out in France with similar results.

93. This experiment caused considerable disquiet among educational authorities, and an 'International Conference on Examination' was held in May 1931 in England. As a result of that Conference, Committees were set up in several European countries. The English Committee consisted among others, of two men whose names are well-known in Indian education, namely Sir Philip Hartog, author of the "Review on the Growth of Education in British India," made at the request of the Simon Commission and Sir Michael Sadler, whose Calcutta University Report of 1903 is still a standard work. These two officers together with other leading educational authorities in England conducted a series of experiments at the behest of the 'International Conference' and they found that not only was the system of marks unsatisfactory as an accurate test of ability but that even the system of dividing papers into three groups namely; 'Failed, Passed and Credit' was also unreliable.

94. In one of their reports entitled 'An Examination of Examinations' the Committee report that the results of tests in England and France were

'equally disquieting.' "It is clear that the part played by chance in the verdicts given at the different examinations on which careers depend must even at the present moment be a great one." As an example of the kind of thing discovered by the Committee, we cite the results of their investigation in the marking of school history examination papers—'It was found that when fourteen experienced examiners re-marked independently fifteen papers which had all received the same moderate mark from the (original) examining authority by which they were furnished, these examiners between themselves allotted over forty different marks to the several scripts. It was further found that when these examiners re-marked once more the same paper after intervals of from twelve to nineteen months, they changed their minds as to the verdict of passed, failed and credit in 92 cases out of a total of 210. Clearly a test of this kind cannot inspire confidence.' It may be noted that the examiners were not called upon in this instance to issue marks on a basis of 90, 91 and 92 and so on, but merely to divide the candidates into three broad groups, and that they changed their mind as to this simple decision after an interval of a year in three cases out of every seven. Yet the entire career of a P. and T. employee is often made to depend on a single mark, granted by examiners who have no training whatever in the setting or marking of examination papers.

95. No substitutes for seniority and examinations have yet been discovered for assessing an employee's fitness for promotion. All that can be done, therefore is to ensure that an employee's worth under these heads will be more carefully assessed in future than heretofore. We suggest the following modifications of the existing system :—

- (a) The creation of an Examination Board manned by officials who have a thorough knowledge in the field of educational tests and adequate practice in applying them. All examinations for promotion should be entrusted to this Board.
- (b) Uniform principles should be laid down with regard to the methods of testing the fitness of employees.
- (c) Promotion from the Junior scale of Class III up to and including the junior scale of Class I should be made on the result of an examination consisting of three parts :—
 - (1) written papers carefully devised to test the candidate's knowledge of departmental rules and procedure of the technical elements in the post to which he aspires,
 - (2) an oral examination designed to test the qualities of personality and leadership which the candidate will require at the level to which he is aspiring. These oral

examinations must be conducted only by experienced men thoroughly trained in the theory and practice of applying personality tests.

- (3) A careful survey of the previous record of the examinees. Fifty per cent of the total marks should be assigned to examination; twenty-five per cent to the candidate's record, and the remaining 25 per cent to the oral examinations. In addition, one grace mark for each year of service should be granted to give weight to seniority.

96. Examinations should be held at intervals of three years and only that number of candidates should be declared passed as are sufficient to fill the anticipated vacancies over the ensuing period. In addition to the list of passed candidates all others who have qualified should be placed on a waiting list to fill unforeseen vacancies. Those still on the waiting list when the next examination comes around should be required to take the examination but may be granted grace marks of 5 per cent to compensate them for the fact of previous qualification.

97. All employees should be required to put in five years of service in a scale before being permitted to enter the examination for promotion to the next scale or class. On other hand no limits with regard to age or to the number of attempts at an examination should be imposed as bars to the candidate who believes in the adage 'Try, Try again.'

98. Employees of the department should be allowed free opportunity to compete with outside recruits in the examinations held for appointment at the several points of entry to the service indicated in our charts. No academic qualifications should be prescribed for departmental candidates. On the other hand we cannot, in the interest of efficiency, advocate at examination of lower standard for departmental candidates than for outside recruits. To compensate for the advantage an outside recruit is likely to have because of his recent graduating from school or University, the departmental candidate may be given grace marks to the extent of 5 per cent of the total number in recognition of his experience.

99. Finally, we advocate the creation of a much larger number of appointments than exist at present in the higher cadres of the service; the creation of uniform prospects of promotions for the different branches of the service and the establishment of class I clerical posts which are practically non-existent on the Telegraph side at the present time.

Q. XVI. Do you favour the abolition of the distinction between the old and new scales of pay and the prescription of a uniform scale for each category of posts ?

100. The distinction between the old and the new scales of pay is perhaps the main cause of disaffection which prevails in the ranks of younger Government employees to-day. The abolition of the distinction is a major plank in the policy of the Federation of Posts and Telegraph Unions.

Q. XVII. Do you consider reduction in the number of time-scales or a reduction in the length of existing time scales desirable for ensuring a better grading of duties or responsibilities of posts of a like or similar character with a view to rationalisation ?

101. Our recommendations under question III envisage the reduction of the numerous time-scales which exist to-day to one with the opportunity of free movement from the lowest to the highest point. We also advocate the extension of the time-scale at each level of the service to the year of the employee's retirement.

Q. XVIII. Is the present practice of granting dearness allowance and war allowance to meet the temporary steep increases in the cost of living due to conditions created by the war quite satisfactory ? Would you recommend that the whole or any part of the dearness allowance might be absorbed in future pay scales in the event of a decision to revise them in an upward direction ?

102. We consider the present system of regulating dearness and war allowances as unsatisfactory. We submit, in particular that the award of the allowance on a flat percentage basis to employees drawing between Rs. 120 and Rs. 1,500 a month is wrong in principle because those standing in relatively least need receive the most. We submit below the formula on which dearness and war allowance should be based.

- (a) Salaries should be immediately revised, as advocated by us under question III so that each employee receive a minimum living wage.
- (b) This minimum wage should be equated to a price index of 180 which will give to employees in Classes II and III a basic money wage of Rs. 85 and Rs. 55 respectively;
- (c) Allowances of Rs. 4-8-0 and Rs. 3 should be sanctioned to employees in Classes I and II and III respectively for every increase of 10 points in the cost of living index above the base figure of 180.
- (d) The allowance should be granted to all employees in the time-scale irrespective of the Class to which they belong.

- (e) The allowance should be revised every six months, and linked to the average price index of the preceding six months.
- (f) The allowance should be granted uniformly to employees throughout India an additional allowance being granted to employees in areas where the price index stands higher than the average, on the same principles of a fixed addition for every increase of 10 points above the All-India mean.
- (g) That portion of the dearness allowance which is granted to all should count for pension and should form an addition to pension as it does to pay for employees in active service.

Q. XIX. If a new scale of remuneration were fixed now how would you provide for its adjustment to meet future variations in prices of cost of living ; alternatively, is a sliding scale of remuneration which would provide automatically for increase in the cost of living preferable and practicable, if so, would you allow this method of remuneration to all grades of public servants or only to some ; in the latter case to what grades would you allow the benefit of such a provision ?

103. Our answers to questions III and XVIII contain our views on the reorganization of scales of pay. The appointment of a Central Wage Board to maintain continuous touch with the movement of prices in all parts of the country is indispensable to the proper functioning of our scheme of family and dearness allowance. The recommendation of the Central Wage Board should be made applicable to all employees in the time-scale.

Q. XX. Apart from the endeavour to neutralize the effect of the rise in prices by a corresponding increase in pay, do you consider it necessary or proper that in the case of some classes of public servants the existing scales of pay should in any event be increased on the ground that even at the time they were fixed they were inadequate to enable the Government servant to maintain himself and his family at a reasonable level of health, comfort and efficiency. If so, to what classes of public servants would you allow this increase and at what rates and on what principles would you fix the increase to be allowed on that ground ?

104. At the P. and T. Adjudication much evidence was adduced from official sources and from the reports of various Committees of Enquiry to prove that the scales of pay of employees in Classes III and II were inadequate at the time they were fixed, even for men on pre-1931 scales of pay. We invite a reference to our answer to question III for suggested remedies.

Q. XXI. Do you favour equal pay for equal work irrespective of difference of sex, or would you allow special rates of pay for women employees working in categories to which they are eligible along with men ?

105. We favour the principle of equal pay for equal work irrespective of difference of sex. In the case of women, the minimum basic wage should be computed as for men on two consumption units. Women usually work under the compulsion of necessity to support a widowed mother or to supplement family resources.

Q. XXII. What principles should, in your opinion be observed in regard to fixation of basic rates of pay of unskilled labour ? What would you consider a proper basis of differentiation between unskilled, semi-skilled and skilled labour ? Having regard to your replies on these points what do you consider should be the principles to be followed in respect of the remuneration of daily rated employees of Government ?

106. The principles of the minimum wage must be observed in regard to the fixation of basic rates of pay of all kinds of labour. In answering Question III, we have stipulated that there should be two minimum wage levels for working class and middle class employees respectively, and we have made provision for additional remuneration to those employees who have qualifications and are vested with responsibilities, above the minimum. Our recommendations provide for a differentiation between unskilled, semi-skilled and skilled labour in Class III by two points of entry in the Junior scale, and opportunities for promotion to the senior scale, as unskilled and semi-skilled workers acquire the qualifications necessary for advancement to the skilled, senior scale. All workers in Class II should be considered skilled workers. Here again, we have provided for qualifications above the minimum deemed necessary by the opening of different points of entry in the time scale.

107. We are opposed in principle to the employment of daily-paid workers. Where exceptional circumstances demand their engagement they should be paid an amount which will give them a minimum living wage on the assumption that a daily rated month consists of 24 days. We are also against the use of the piece rate system in Government service.

Q. XXIII. In regard to terms of remuneration would you make any difference between employees of Industrial or commercial departments of Government and employees on the non-industrial or non-commercial side ?

108. We do not advocate the imposition of different scales of pay for employees merely because they are engaged in an industrial or commercial as distinct from a non-industrial or non-commercial branch, of Government service.

Q. XXIV. Have you any suggestion to make in regard to :—

- (i) Holidays for public servants ;
- (ii) Hours of work of public servants ;
- (iii) Payments of overtime and other allowances ;
- (iv) The working of the daily rate system in regard to Government employees ?

109. (i) *Holidays*.—The existing difference in the grant of holidays to employees working in different Departments, in different branches of one Department, and in different sections of one office should cease. The absurdity of the present position becomes clear when it is realised that in the P. and T. department, staff employed in regular day-time administrative duties are treated the most liberally with regard to weekly full and half holidays, and public holidays, whereas the staff doing the most arduous and irregular duties are allowed not even one full day off in a week. Some sections of the staff, such as Linemen are required to be always "on call."

110. The fact that a particular branch of the service is required in the public interest to be on duty day and night at all times of the year is no excuse for the denial of a weekly holiday or for discrimination with regard to the number of public holidays allowed to different sections of the service. We recommend that one full working and one half holiday in the week be allowed to every Government servant. If such an arrangement is possible in highly industrialised countries in the West, we cannot see why it should not be introduced in India. It can, in fact be more easily introduced because of the existence of three different communities whose religious tenets enjoin the observation of a different day of weekly rest. The number of public holidays in the year should also be uniform. We suggest the grant of 19 public holidays including the three greatest religious festivals of the Hindu, Muslim and Christian communities.

111. (ii) *Hours of work*.—We advocate the immediate introduction of the standard working week of 40 hours of day duty endorsed by the International Labour Convention with a proportionate reduction for irregular evening and night duties, on the formula already in force in the traffic branch. Duties "on Call" should be abolished. In cases where the place of employment is located at a considerable distance from residential localities, as in the Wireless branch, a proportion of the time

consumed in getting to and from work should be included in the duty period.

112. (iii) *Overtime and other allowances.*—The performance of overtime duty should be discouraged by the employment of adequate staff. Where overtime duty becomes necessary, a uniform allowance should be paid to all employees in Classes III and II respectively. Allowances granted to cover actual expenditure incurred, such as conveyance allowance, coolie hire, R.M.S. outstation allowances, and the like should be revised to meet present-day price levels.

113. (iv) and (v). *Daily rate and piece work system.* These systems should be abolished.

Q. XXV. Have you any other proposals to make in regard to the conditions of salary not covered by answers to the above questions?

114. We have answered the questions in this section from the view point of the staff as a whole. There are sections of staff who have long been labouring under special, and major disabilities owing to the neglect of their cases when the revised rates of pay were introduced, to changes in the system of promotions, to changes made in the rules and given retrospective effect, etc. These major disabilities should be remedied before the time arrives to ask the employees concerned to exercise an option in regard to the matter of remaining on the existing scales, or accepting the revision which will follow the Pay Commission's report. If this is not done, their disabilities are likely to continue under the new scheme. We suggest therefore that opportunity be given to the Federation, as the most representative organisation of the Post and Telegraph staff to select representatives who will present oral evidence with regard to these major, sectional disabilities.

"D" LEAVE.

Q. XXVI. Is the present practice under which widely different sets of rules govern the grant of leave to different classes of Government employees working satisfactory?

115. The existence of widely different sets of leave rules causes dissatisfaction among employees. Broadly speaking, the differentiation operates in favour of gazetted as against non-gazetted staff, and in favour of subordinate as against inferior employees. The leave rules for employees recruited after July 1931 compare unfavourably with the Fundamental Rules governing employees in service before that date. Temporary staff enjoy less advantageous leave terms than permanent employees and daily rated labour is not entitled to leave with pay at all.

116. The variation in conditions of employment and in the nature of the duties of different grades is compensated for by different rates of salary and of increments, and additional compensation in the matter of special leave privileges is not justified. Leave is granted for purposes of rest and recuperation and as this is a common need the satisfaction of it should be uniform. We have advocated a standard working week of 40 hours for all employees; we advocate, similarly, a uniform set of leave rules applicable to all. As between the Fundamental and the Revised leave rules, we favour the abolition of the latter and the abolition of all discriminatory features in the former.

117. In connection with the salary scheme we have advocated for the future it is essential that family allowances and free accommodation or house rent allowance should continue during all periods of leaves and that leave on half pay should be subject to the proviso that it should not fall below the minimum wage level.

Q. XXVII. Under existing leave rules, to what extent do public servants or particular classes of public servants normally take :—

(a) all the full-pay-leave due to them;

(b) all the leave-on-half-pay that may be admissible to them.

118. We have no statistics on the subject. From general observation we venture the opinion that employees usually attempt to take all the full-pay-leave due to them. Employees take leave on half pay only when compelled to do so by ill-health or the necessity of attending to urgent private affairs. The greater part of half pay leave lapses because employees cannot afford the loss involved.

XXVIII. Do you consider any changes necessary in the existing rules and limitations relating to remuneration during leave other than leave on full pay? If so, what changes, do you recommend?

119. We have already stated that all employees should be brought under Fundamental Leave Rules and that discriminatory provisions in those rules, particularly with regard to so-called inferior staff should be abolished. One further change we suggest is that an employee who has exhausted his earned leave and falls ill, should be allowed full pay during his illness which may be counted against the full-pay-leave he will normally accumulate in the future.

Q. XXIX. Do any of the present leave rules applicable to different classes of public servants cause administrative inconvenience or hardship to employees and if so what remedies or modification would you suggest?

120. The complexities of the leave rules naturally cause administrative inconvenience. It frequently happens also that heads of offices find it inconvenient to grant leave to their staff because of an adequate leave reserve, which in turn causes hardship to employees. A leave reserve of at least 25 per cent should be sanctioned for all categories of staff in classes III and II, and should be maintained at full strength throughout the year.

Q. XXX. Do you consider the present leave terms adequate:

- (a) for affording sufficient recuperation to staff and
- (b) for affording facilities for those desirous of doing so to improve their professional qualifications?

121. That the present leave terms are inadequate would appear to be proved by the recent sanction of rest and recreation allowances to employees drawing Rs. 200/- and above. Though this concession does not affect the leave rules as such, it indicates an awareness on the part of Government that the recuperative power of leave is greatly enhanced by a change of scene. No valid justification exists for denying the same concession to employees drawing below Rs. 200/- a month. In fact, their relatively straitened circumstances make a change of scene more necessary for them than for better paid officials.

122. The present leave rules do not afford adequate facilities for the improvement of professional qualifications. In this connection a reference needs to be made to the difficulty of securing study leave for ordinary departmental examinations. It is, of course, difficult to grant leave, at the same time to a number of employees in the one office. Better arrangements for the grant of study leave would be possible if an adequate leave reserve were maintained.

Q. XXXI. In regard to terms of leave, would you make any difference between employees of industrial or commercial departments of Government and employees on the non-industrial or non-commercial side?

123. No.

Q. XXXII. Have you any other proposals to make in regard to conditions of leave not covered by answers to the above questions?

124. Though casual leave cannot be claimed as a matter of right, provision for its sanction exists in the Rules and employees find it of great assistance in the minor emergencies that arise from time to time. Owing

to the inadequacy of the leave reserve in all cadres, it is becoming increasingly difficult for employees to obtain casual leave on application. This suggests another reason for increasing the leave reserve.

“ E ” RETIREMENT BENEFITS.

Q. XXXIII. What, in your opinion will be the best method to secure adequate provision for a Government servant and his family against the two eventualities of retirement and death ?

125. The extension of the principle of the minimum living wage to the sphere of death benefits demands that the family of an employee will continue to receive benefits equivalent to the minimum wage of the class to which they belong after his death whatever may be the length of his service at death. These benefits will continue until such time as the widow re-marries or dies and the children attain their majority.

126. *Example.*—An employee in Class III dies in the second year of his service. His family under our proposals will receive the following benefits :—

- (i) A monthly stipend of Rs. 27-8-0 for the widow, which is half the minimum wage for a family of two consumption units in Class III; together with half the dearness allowance which the employee would have received had he continued in service.
- (ii) House rent allowance, adjusted to the decreasing size of the family as the children attain their majority.
- (iii) Medical attendance and facilities for recreation and leisure activities for the widow until her re-marriage or death and for the children until they attain their majority.

127. *Example.*—A telegraphist in the junior scale of class II dies in his sixth year of service. His widow will receive Rs. 44-8-0 which is half the minimum living wage of a Class II employee together with half the dearness allowance which the employee would have received had he continued in service. House rent, family and other allowances will continue to be granted at the rates prescribed for employees in active service in Class II and will cease when the widow re-marries or dies, and the children attain their majority.

128. The benefits of such a scheme would apply only when the husband predeceases the wife and leaves minor children to be cared for at the time of his death. Statistics are not available to enable us to venture a prediction as the number of families in every thousand who would become eligible for the benefits of such a scheme.

129. The benefits above represent the minimum and should therefore be provided for by the employer as an integral element in the pay structure; the entire cost of providing these benefits on a group basis being borne by the State.

130. An employee acquires a right to death benefits above the minimum and to retirement benefits as his length of service increases. To meet these claims we recommend the following payments:—

- (i) A gratuity of one month's pay for the family of an employee for every year of his service, with an additional month's pay at the end of every quinquennial period, the gratuity being calculated on the basis of the pay drawn at the time of the employee's death, in all cases in which an employee dies before completing 15 years of service.
- (ii) A monthly pension, at the rate of 1/3rd of the salary drawn by an employee during the last three years of his service to families of all employees who die after completing more than 15 and less than 25 years of service, such pension to be granted for a period of years equal to one-third of the employee's actual term of service. During this period, the widow and children will continue to receive the same allowances as under the minimum benefit scheme. At the end of the pension period the minimum benefit scheme will come into operation,
- (iii) A monthly pension at the rate of one-third of the salary drawn during the last three years of employment to every employee who has completed 25 years of service, for the duration of his life subject to a minimum payment of ten years. If the employee dies during the ten year period his widow will continue to draw his pension till the end of the ten year period, coming under the minimum benefit scheme thereafter. Family and other allowances will be drawn during the ten year period and thereafter.

131. *Example.*—An employee in class I dies in his 27th year of service. His average salary for the three years prior to his death is Rs. 480/- a month. His widow will receive Rs. 160/- a month for ten years together with the usual allowances. After the tenth year, the allowances will continue but the pension of Rs. 160/- a month will be reduced to Rs. 42-8-0 a month, which is half the minimum wage for a family of two consumption units in Class II.

Q. XXXIV. Have the present rules regarding retirement from Government service and the grant of pensionary benefits or gratuities

including the alternative of contributing to a Provident Fund been found inconvenient or inappropriate? If so what change do you consider desirable in respect of

- (a) the age of retirement ;
- (b) the minimum service qualifying for retirement;
- (c) the scale of pensions, additional pensions and gratuities and
- (d) the basis with reference to which average emoluments are calculated ?

132. The present rules governing the grant of pensions to P. and T. employees are inadequate and unjust. They condemn the majority of employees to the perpetual bondage of fear and insecurity inasmuch as the grant of pension is made wholly dependent upon the life span of the employee. The present pension system is fundamentally unfair as it makes the award of pension, which is essentially deferred pay, wholly dependent upon the employee's attainment of 30 years of service and on the span of his life after his retirement. The drawal of pension under the existing system is a gamble in which Government benefits by the premature death of the employee and benefits the more, the greater the misery and need of the families of its employees, occasioned by the premature death of the bread-winners.

133. The change we consider desirable are outlined in our answer to Question XXXIII. All employees should be compelled to retire on attaining the age of 55. With regard to the Provident Fund scheme already established in the P. and T. department, it is merely another name for a savings bank.

Q. XXXV. Do you consider that the existing pension rules for pensionable employees afford the same net advantages as the Provident Fund Rules applicable to Railway employees? Do you consider any change in the existing system of pensionary benefits justified so as to provide for a measure of family provision especially in the case of persons dying in harness without pension or a pensioner dying soon after retirement? What sort of scheme would you prefer:—

- (a) surrender of a given amount of pension so as to obtain capital sum to be paid to dependent beneficiaries; or
- (b) a reduction in the existing scale of pension with an alternative supplementary benefit in the shape of a contribution to a Provident Fund or a family pension Fund or a special contribution or gratuity based on the public servant's length of

service and assessed at a given proportion of pay, for example half or one-third of a month's pay for each year of service;

- (c) compulsory State insurance ;
- (d) revision in the terms of commutation of pension ?

134. We do not have the statistics which would enable us to give an unqualified answer to the first part of this question. When the Government of India made an investigation of the Pension and Provident Fund systems in the 1920's however, Mr. J. E. C. Jukes who was appointed to collect the necessary data, stated that the commuted value of a pension for a routine clerk on the grade of 35-140, after 30 years of service, amounted to Rs. 8,720 and that the corresponding benefits under the Provident Fund-cum-gratuity scheme of the Railway came to Rs 8,550/-. On the basis of these figures, Government concluded that the Railway scheme cost from 68% to 92% of the commuted value of the P. and T. pensionary scheme. In any individual case, the Provident Fund scheme becomes advantageous if the employee dies in harness, since his family receives the full amount to his credit in the Fund. Whenever an employee lives to a ripe old age the pensionary system proves of much greater benefit to him and his family. We have replied to the latter part of the question in our answer to Question XXXIII.

Q. XXXVI. Do you consider the existing Provident Fund Rules applicable to different classes of Government employees so adequate to secure a proper provision for the family of an employee or an appropriate benefit to the employee himself on retirement which will be fairly equivalent to the pensionary benefit. Would you recommend a surrender of any Provident Fund benefits and substitution therefor of pensionary benefits ?

135. We recommend the replacement of the existing Provident Fund and Pension Rules by the system outlined in our answer to Question XXXIII.

Q. XXVII. Do the rules governing Provident Fund benefits to non-pensionable public servants, other than Railway employees, afford an equal benefit to the employee and his family as the rules applicable to Railway Employees ? Would you suggest any changes in the former rules ?

136. All public servants should be entitled to the benefits recommended in our answer to Question XXXIII.

Q. XXXVIII. In regard to retirement benefits, would you make any difference between employees of industrial or commercial

departments of Government and employees of the non-industrial or non-commercial side ?

137. No difference should exist between employees of industrial or commercial departments and others with regard to death and retirement benefits because the needs of all are the same.

Q. XXXIX. Have you any other proposals to make in regard to retirement benefits not covered by answers to the above question ?

138. Upon the birth of the first child in a family Government should make the father take out an insurance policy in the Post Office or any other insurance company to the amount purchasable by a premium equivalent to a year's increment in the scale to which the employee belongs. This insurance should be at the employee's expenses.

Q. XL. To what extent has effect been given to the recommendations of the (Whitley) Royal Commission on Labour in India, so far as they related to wage standards, pay system and rules governing leave, provident fund and gratuity for the benefit of railway employees ?

139. We understand that the Railwaymen's Federation which is in the best position to answer this question is of the opinion that the Whitley recommendations have little relation to present-day realities.

" F " CONCILIATION MACHINERY.

Q. XLI. Do you consider the existing rules—

- (i) providing for grant of recognition by Government to employees' associations;
- (ii) permitting representation to the authorities by employees, individuals or otherwise;
- (iii) authorising authorities to pass orders of fine, suspension, demotion, discharge or dismissal;
- (iv) giving the employees a right to appeal or seek redress against such orders, adequate to protect the interest of the employees ? If not, what additions or modifications would you suggest ?

1. Recognition Rules.

140. The Recognition Rules reflect an autocratic Government's conception of the proper relation which should obtain between an employee and his employer; that it is the function of the employee to supplicate and of the employer to lend a ear to that supplication but not to permit his decision to be challenged. Formulated under executive fiat many years

ago, the Rules have been changed from time to time without previous consultation with representatives of employees on any occasion.

141. The recognition rules contain the following outstanding defects:—

- (a) They restrict the rights of unions to the making of representations, no guarantee being given that any representation will be replied to by a particular date or that the reply will touch upon the arguments in the case.
- (b) They prohibit associations from revealing grievances of the staff, or weaknesses in the Administration of the department to the Legislature or the Press. Though the public are the masters of the service, and the Directorate the managing agency, the agent has effectively prevented for years an appeal beyond him to the people.
- (c) Unions are not permitted to handle the cases of individual employees.
- (d) The right of interpretation of any or all the Rules is reserved to the Directorate. As lately as February 1946, the P. and T. authorities denied the right of recognised unions to declare a strike under the recognition Rules though the Trade Disputes Act explicitly allows this right and lays down the conditions under which it may be exercised.
- (e) Temporary employees and pensioners are not permitted to represent their grievances through departmental service organisations though there are 8,000 temporary employees now in the department and though pension rights are a vital concern to employees in active service.
- (f) The rules make no provision for any appeal beyond Government channels to legal or outside authority. The recent Post and Telegraph Adjudication is the first instance of its kind in the history of employer—employee relations in the Department.

142. In practice, the restrictions of Recognition Rules are ignored in many instances by employers and employees. Questions in the Assembly have for instance become a standard device for the ventilation of grievances and no action is taken to prevent them. This testifies to authority's awareness that they are out of date. Nevertheless the rules remain as a potential threat to self-assertive unionism.

143. No genuine Labour movement can grow and thrive within the framework of the existing recognition system. To make assurance on this

point doubly sure, Government policy has been directed for years at fostering the growth of more and more unions within a single department. No regulations have been published as to the qualifications necessary to enable any group of employees to secure recognition for a new union. Some unions are allowed a much larger field for recruitment than others and several compete for membership in the same field. The policy of "divide and rule" has had the same pernicious effect on service organisations as it has had upon the body politic. Union leaders tend to expatiate on their differences rather than unite on a common platform. Although the greater number of unions in existence have been established for over a decade and there has been talk for years about the need for unity it was not till 1946 that the Federation of Post and Telegraph Unions was created.

144. Contrasting this with the ideal of trade union organisation a single union for an entire industry or public utility service representing each and every wing of that service through its different branches, meeting the employer across the table on terms of equality, empowered by statute to negotiate wage contracts, hours of duty and other conditions of employment, authorised to represent the grievances of individuals and prepared to cease work on behalf of an individual—one obtains a glimpse of the long road to be travelled before skilled labour in India catches up with the back-wash of the progress attained by the organised working men in Britain, France, the U.S.A. and the Scandinavian countries.

145. How is genuine progress in labour organisation within Government service to be achieved?

- (a) The existing rules of recognition which reduce service organisations to the position of petitioning bodies must be scraped and replaced by a genuine labour charter guaranteeing representatives of employees the right to negotiate with the employer all issues bearing on the welfare of the employee.
- (b) To ensure that this right shall be effective, revision must be made for reference of disputes which cannot be settled across the table to an impartial "Central Services Tribunal," the Chairman of which may be selected by the Labour Department, subject to confirmation by the Central Legislative Assembly, and on which employer and employees should have equality of representation. As the largest groups of employees are those of the Railway and of the Posts and Telegraphs one representative from each of these services should have a permanent seat on the Tribunal. In view of the existence of large number of unions in both the services, representatives of the Railway and of the Posts and Telegraphs employees should

be nominated by the All-India Railwaymen's Federation and the Federation of Posts and Telegraphs Unions respectively.

- (c) Of the many unions that exist, each is weaker for the existence of the others. No new unions should be recognised. All existing unions should be required to have their membership figures audited by a registered accountant and to publish them annually. As all existing unions have equal legal rights they should have equal votes in the Federation of Posts and Telegraphs unions.
- (d) Unions should be permitted the right of free access to the Press and to the Legislature. This right is not to be confined to matter directly concerning the welfare of the staff but to the exposure of maladministration and corruption. The law of libel safeguards the Administration against abuses of this right.

2. Representation by Employees.

146. The rules permitting representation by individuals are unsatisfactory from the view point of unions and of individual employees. Representations from individuals and from groups on matters of common concern are permitted and on occasions encouraged when a union has already been recognised as the channel through which such representations should be made. This militates against the growth of healthy and active trade unionism. On the other hand individual employees in personal difficulties of their own are not permitted to represent their cases through their union or to have a representative of their union present in the role of defence counsel, when they appear for personal examination before the authority to answer charge sheets. Existing practice should be reversed. No representation from individuals or unrecognised groups should be permitted when the representation concerns matters of general welfare for the advancement of which unions exist. But an individual charged with an offence should be allowed the amplest assistance of his union at every stage of defence.

3. Powers of Punishment.

147. Authority to pass orders of fine, suspension, demotion, discharge or dismissal should be restricted to officers of the senior scale in Class I when the employee concerned is in Class II and to officers in the junior scale of class I when the accused belongs to Class III. None of those orders should take effect until they have been approved by a Class I officer above the time scale.

4. Rights of Appeal.

148. The appeal rules are cumbersome and illiberal. The officer ordering a punishment is granted the right under certain circumstances of withholding an appeal against his verdict. No time limit is prescribed for the settlement of an appeal. Appeals are frequently delayed in transit and at the appellate level and employees have to wait long periods before they receive the verdict. The appellate authority is required merely to record his verdict without being obliged to state his reasons. As the original punishing and the appellate authorities are frequently fellow-officers one rank removed, the employee has grounds for suspicion that the appellate authority is influenced consciously or sub-consciously by considerations of class solidarity and executive prestige.

149. The remedy lies in investing the "Central Services Tribunal" with powers to function as a final court of appeal. In such cases the members of the Tribunal should be charged on oath to deliver a finding according to the evidence.

Q. XLII. What do you consider to be the best machinery for resolving differences between the Government and its employees ?

150. The best machinery for resolving differences would be a Central Services Tribunal of five permanent members : a Chairman nominated by the Labour Department, the appointment being subject to the approval of the Central Legislature ; one representative each nominated by the Railwaymen's Federation and the Federation of P. and T. unions and one representative each nominated by the Railway and Posts and Telegraphs authorities.

151. When disputes arise between Government and recognised unions in any other department the nominees of the employer and the employees in that department may be co-opted to the Tribunal. "Central Services Tribunal" should be established not only at the seat of the Central Government but at the Head-quarters of each circle. These Tribunals should be called upon to function at their respective levels only after all efforts to reach settlement in the ordinary course have been exhausted. We recommend in this connection the appointment of a "Personal Relations" officer in the Directorate and at the head-quarters of each circle whose duty it will be to handle representations from unions and appeals from individuals in consultation with the branch of the department concerned. At the present time, such representations are handled by a large number of officers as matters of routine. They usually act on the file notes prepared by their clerks.

Q. XLIII. Is the introduction of a Whitley Council system in regard to Government services desirable?

152. Our recommendations in this section with regard to the constitution of "Central Services Tribunals" are an adaptation of the Whitley Councils to Indian conditions. We desire to make it clear however that these Tribunals should serve as agencies for the settlement of disputes and not as substitutes for the realisation of organised labour's final goal: namely a genuine and active share in the management of the service with which the worker's fortunes are intertwined. Ultimately, representatives of P. and T. employees must be given a place on the Director-General's Board of Advisers, to the end that P. and T. labour may have its due share in the shaping of policies which directly or indirectly must affect its welfare.

153. In this connection it will be pertinent to quote from the concluding paragraph to the "History of Trade Unionism" by Sydney and Beatrice Webb, "The journey of the Labour Party towards its goal must necessarily be a long and arduous one. In the painful "Pilgrim's Progress" of Democracy the workers will be perpetually tempted into bypaths that led only to the Slough of Despond. It is not so much the enticing away of individuals in the open pursuit of wealth that is to be feared as the temptation of particular Trade Unions, or particular sections of the workers to enter into alliances with Associations of Capitalist Employers for the exploitation of the consumer. "Co-partnership" or profit sharing with individual capitalists has been seen through and rejected. But the "Co-partnership of Trade Unions with Associations of Capitalists—whether as a development of "Whitley Councils" or otherwise—which far sighted capitalists will presently offer in specious forms (with a view particularly to protective Customs Tariffs and other devices for maintaining unnecessary high prices or to governmental favours of remissions of taxation) is we fear, hankered after some Trade Union leaders and might be made seductive to particular grades or sections of workers. Any such policy however plausible would in our judgment be a disastrous undermining of the solidarity of the whole working class and a formidable obstacle to any genuine democratic Control of industry as well as to any general progress in personal freedom and in the more equal sharing of the National Product."

Q. XLIV. As regards the conciliation machinery would you make any difference between industrial and commercial departments of Government activities and the non-industrial or non-commercial side.

154. We can conceive no valid reason for making a difference.

Q. XLV. Have you any other suggestion to make in regard to the conditions of service of public servants ?

155. We recommend :—

- (a) The appointment of "Employees' Welfare Officers" in the P. and T. Directorate and at the headquarters of each circle, whose duty it will be to introduce in the department the various schemes which have been tried and found effective in other countries for improving working conditions, including a spirit of co-operation between officers and men, and in general humanising day-to-day administration. These officers should work in close conjunction with recognised service associations in improving the cultural and recreational facilities which we have suggested elsewhere. Their functions may be closely associated or even combined with those of the "Personnel Relations Officers" whose appointment we have suggested elsewhere the more effective handling of representations from service organisations and of appeals from individual employees.
- (b) The opening of Co-operative stores for the sale and in due time the production or manufacture of essential commodities such as food, clothing and miscellaneous items in common use. The opening of such stores which should be managed jointly by unions and the department will serve more than one useful purpose. They will encourage a spirit of self-help, they will safeguard employees against the deprivations of the black market and they will be of assistance to the Central Wages Board in its statistical enquiries.
- (c) The establishment of training schools and adult educational centres which will furnish the employees with opportunities for improving their knowledge of the field in which they work and of the world in which they live.
- (d) The establishment of a home-building loan agency to assist employees with loans at low interest rates for the purpose of building homes of their own. The agency may also advise prospective home owners on the selection of sites, the planning of houses, the choice of materials and the estimation of costs.
- (e) The extension of the Payment of Wages Act to the P. and T. Service which is likely to do more than any other single factor to put an end to the inordinate delays which frequently

occur in the payment of travelling bills and leave salaries especially in the case of employees in Class III of the service. As an alternative it may be laid down by statute that an employee whose legitimate dues are not paid within thirty days of presentation should be granted interest on the amount outstanding at three per cent per annum.

- (5) The payment of extra-departmental agents according to the following formula: The allowance granted to them should bear the same relation to the minimum wage of the class of the service to which they belong, that their hours of duty bear to the full working day.

156. In concluding we would make an earnest request to the members of the Central Pay Commission to consider the case of the "forgotten men" of the department—the pensioners—whose standard of life has been pitifully reduced through the six years of rising prices and who in the twilight of their lives, have been placed under the intolerable burden of privation and anxiety. We urge their inclusion on an equal footing with employees in active service in any scheme of pensions equated to a minimum living wage which may be, and we are confident will be, introduced by the Central Pay Commission.

(Signed) G. E. NORONHA,
General Secretary.

THE INDIAN POSTS AND TELEGRAPHS UNION MADRAS PROVINCIAL BRANCH.

A correction to the answers submitted by the Federation of Posts and Telegraphs Union to the Central Pay Commission's Questionnaire.

1. In the charts appearing at page 27 of the Federation's answers, in class II (Junior scale) under Federation's proposed scale, *delete* the word "Accountants" occurring after the word 'Telephone operators' under the second point of entry and *insert* the words 'Accountants' (referred to in para. 276, P. and T. Manual, Vol. IV) after the word 'Attendants' under third point of entry.

2. In the charts (*vide* page 28), in class II (Senior scale) under Federation's proposed scale *insert* the words P. and T. Accountants (Appendix 24, P. and T. Manual, Vol. IV) I. P. Os. and I. R. Ms. after the words 'Assistant Foreman.'

Reclassify the proposed scales as under :—

Engineering Supervisors, P. and T. Accountants,	
I. P. Os. and I. R. Ms.	... entry Rs. 150/-
Assistant Foreman	... entry Rs. 175/-
Annual increment Rs. 10/- for all.	