

THE PURCHASING POWER OF MONEY



THE MACMILLAN COMPANY
NEW YORK · BOSTON · CHICAGO
SAN FRANCISCO

MACMILLAN & CO., LIMITED
LONDON · BOMBAY · CALCUTTA
MELBOURNE

THE MACMILLAN CO. OF CANADA, LTD.
TORONTO

THE PURCHASING POWER OF MONEY

ITS DETERMINATION
AND RELATION TO CREDIT
INTEREST AND CRISES

BY

IRVING FISHER

PROFESSOR OF POLITICAL ECONOMY IN YALE UNIVERSITY

ASSISTED BY

HARRY G. BROWN

INSTRUCTOR IN POLITICAL ECONOMY IN YALE UNIVERSITY

New York
THE MACMILLAN COMPANY
1912

All rights reserved

COPYRIGHT, 1911,

BY THE MACMILLAN COMPANY.

Set up and electrotyped. Published March, 1911. Reprinted
February, 1912.

Norwood Press
J. S. Cushing Co. — Berwick & Smith Co.
Norwood, Mass., U.S.A.

To
THE MEMORY OF
SIMON NEWCOMB
GREAT SCIENTIST, INSPIRING FRIEND,
PIONEER IN THE STUDY
OF
"SOCIETARY CIRCULATION"

PREFACE

THE purpose of this book is to set forth the principles determining the purchasing power of money and to apply those principles to the study of historical changes in that purchasing power, including in particular the recent change in "the cost of living," which has aroused world-wide discussion.

If the principles here advocated are correct, the purchasing power of money — or its reciprocal, the level of prices — depends exclusively on five definite factors: (1) the volume of money in circulation; (2) its velocity of circulation; (3) the volume of bank deposits subject to check; (4) its velocity; and (5) the volume of trade. Each of these five magnitudes is extremely definite, and their relation to the purchasing power of money is definitely expressed by an "equation of exchange." In my opinion, the branch of economics which treats of these five regulators of purchasing power ought to be recognized and ultimately will be recognized as an exact science, capable of precise formulation, demonstration, and statistical verification.

The main contentions of this book are at bottom simply a restatement and amplification of the old "quantity theory" of money. With certain corrections in the usual statements of that theory, it may still be called fundamentally sound. What has long been needed is a candid reëxamination and revision of that venerable theory rather than its repudiation.

Yet in the voluminous literature on money, there seems to be very little that approaches accurate formulation and

rigorous demonstration, — whether theoretical or statistical.

In making this attempt at reconstruction, I have the satisfaction of finding myself for once a conservative rather than a radical in economic theory. It has seemed to me a scandal that academic economists have, through outside clamor, been led into disagreements over the fundamental propositions concerning money. This is due to the confusion in which the subject has been thrown by reason of the political controversies with which it has become entangled.

As some one has said, it would seem that even the theorems of Euclid would be challenged and doubted if they should be appealed to by one political party as against another. At any rate, since the "quantity theory" has become the subject of political dispute, it has lost prestige and has even come to be regarded by many as an exploded fallacy. The attempts by promoters of unsound money to make an improper use of the quantity theory — as in the first Bryan campaign — led many sound money men to the utter repudiation of the quantity theory. The consequence has been that, especially in America, the quantity theory needs to be reintroduced into general knowledge.

Besides aiming to set forth the principles affecting the purchasing power of money, this book aims to illustrate and verify those principles by historical facts and statistics. In particular, the recent rise in prices is examined in detail and traced to its several causes.

The study of the principles and facts concerning the purchasing power of money is of far more than academic interest. Such questions affect the welfare of every inhabitant of the civilized world. At each turn of the tide of prices, millions of persons are benefited and other millions are injured.

For a hundred years the world has been suffering from periodic changes in the level of prices, producing alternate crises and depressions of trade. Only by knowledge, both of the principles and of the facts involved, can such fluctuations in future be prevented or mitigated, and only by such knowledge can the losses which they entail be avoided or reduced. It is not too much to say that the evils of a variable monetary standard are among the most serious economic evils with which civilization has to deal; and the practical problem of finding a solution of the difficulty is of international extent and importance. I have proposed, very tentatively, a remedy for the evils of monetary instability. But the time is not yet ripe for the acceptance of any working plan. What is at present most needed is a clear and general public understanding of principles and facts.

Toward such an end this book aims to contribute: —

1. A reconstruction of the quantity theory.
2. A discussion of the best form of index number.
3. Some mechanical methods of representing visually the determination of the level of prices.
4. A practical method of estimating the velocity of circulation of money.
5. The ascertainment statistically of the bank deposits in the United States which are *subject to check*, as distinct from "individual deposits," as usually published.
6. An improved statistical evaluation of the volume of trade, as well as of the remaining elements in the equation of exchange.
7. A thorough statistical verification of the (reconstructed) quantity theory of money.

As it is quite impossible to do justice to some of these subjects without the use of mathematics, these have been freely introduced, but have been relegated, so far as

possible, to Appendices. This plan, which is in accordance with that previously adopted in *The Nature of Capital and Income* and *The Rate of Interest*, leaves the text almost wholly nonmathematical.

Most of the statistical results review and confirm the conclusions of Professor Kemmerer in his valuable *Money and Credit Instruments in their Relation to General Prices*, which appeared while the present book was in course of construction. I am greatly indebted to Professor Kemmerer for reading the entire manuscript and for much valuable criticism throughout.

My thanks are due to Professor F. Y. Edgeworth of All Souls' College, Oxford, and to Professor A. W. Flux of Manchester for kindly looking through the manuscript of the Appendix on index numbers and for suggestions and criticisms.

To Dr. A. Piatt Andrew, now Assistant Secretary of the Treasury, my thanks are due for his kindness, as Special Assistant to the National Monetary Commission, in putting the resources of that Commission at my disposal, and in working out, from the records of the office of the Comptroller of the Currency, the volume of deposits subject to check at various dates in the past. For coöperation in carrying out these same calculations, I am likewise indebted to Mr. Lawrence O. Murray, Comptroller of the Currency. These valuable figures are the first of their kind.

To Mr. Gilpin of the New York Clearing House, my thanks are due for his kindness in furnishing various figures asked for and cited specifically in the text.

To Mr. Richard M. Hurd, President of the Lawyers Mortgage Co., I am indebted for reading parts of the manuscript and for valuable criticism.

To Mr. John O. Perrin, President of the American National Bank of Indianapolis, I am indebted for statistics

of the "activity" of bank accounts in his bank, and for similar figures I am indebted to the officers of the National New Haven Bank and the City Bank of New Haven.

My thanks are due to the *Economic Journal* for permission to use unaltered some parts of my article on "The Mechanics of Bimetallism," which first appeared in that journal in 1894.

My thanks are due to the *Journal of the Royal Statistical Society* for similar permission with reference to my article on "A Practical Method for estimating the Velocity of Circulation of Money," which appeared in December, 1909.

A number of my students have rendered valuable service in gathering and coördinating statistics. I would especially mention Mr. Seimin Inaoka, Mr. Morgan Porter, Mr. N. S. Fineberg, Mr. W. E. Lagerquist, now instructor at Cornell University, Messrs. G. S. and L. A. Dole, Dr. John Bauer, now assistant professor at Cornell University, Dr. John Kerr Towles, now instructor at the University of Illinois, Dr. A. S. Field, now instructor at Dartmouth College, Mr. A. G. Boesel, Mr. W. F. Hicker-nell, Mr. Yasuyiro Hayakawa, Mr. Chester A. Phillips, and Mr. R. N. Griswold. Mr. Griswold performed the lengthy calculations involved in ascertaining an index of the volume of trade.

There are two persons to whom I am more indebted than to any others. These are my brother, Mr. Herbert W. Fisher, and my colleague, Dr. Harry G. Brown.

To my brother my thanks are due for a most searching criticism of the whole book from the standpoint of pedagogical exposition, and to Mr. Brown for general criticism and suggestions as well as for detailed work throughout. In recognition of Mr. Brown's assistance, I have placed his name on the title-page.

IRVING FISHER.

YALE UNIVERSITY, February, 1911.

SUGGESTIONS TO READERS

1. The *general reader* will be chiefly interested in Chapters I–VIII.

2. The *cursory reader* will find the gist of the book in Chapter II.

3. *Objectors to the quantity theory* will find their theoretical and statistical objections discussed in Chapters VIII and XII respectively.

4. *Students of financial history* should read Chapter XII.

5. *Currency reformers* should read Chapter XIII.

6. The appendices are addressed mainly (though not exclusively) to *mathematical economists*, for whom the chief interest will probably lie with the Appendix to Chapter X, on Index Numbers, (which should be read as a whole,) and § 6 of the Appendix to Chapter XII, on the Method of Determining Velocity of Circulation.

7. The remainder of the Appendix to Chapter XII is supplied chiefly in order that *statistical critics* may be enabled to verify the processes described in the text.

8. Chapter X and its Appendix are of chief interest to *students of index numbers*, a subject as fascinating to some as it is dry to others.

9. The analytical table of contents, the index, and the running page headings have been constructed with especial reference to the varying needs of different classes of readers.

The book is, however, designed to constitute a complete whole, and it is hoped that as many as possible of those who approach it from special viewpoints may, in the end, read it all.

SUMMARY OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER	PAGE
I. PRIMARY DEFINITIONS	1
II. PURCHASING POWER OF MONEY AS RELATED TO THE "EQUATION OF EXCHANGE"	8
III. INFLUENCE OF DEPOSIT CURRENCY ON THE EQUATION AND THEREFORE ON PURCHASING POWER	33
IV. DISTURBANCE OF EQUATION AND OF PURCHASING POWER DURING TRANSITION PERIODS	55
V. INDIRECT INFLUENCES ON PURCHASING POWER	74
VI. INDIRECT INFLUENCES (<i>Continued</i>)	90
VII. INFLUENCE OF MONETARY SYSTEMS ON PURCHASING POWER	112
VIII. INFLUENCE OF QUANTITY OF MONEY AND OTHER FACTORS ON PURCHASING POWER AND ON EACH OTHER	149
IX. THE DISPERSION OF PRICES MAKES NECESSARY AN INDEX OF PURCHASING POWER	184
X. THE BEST INDEX NUMBERS OF PURCHASING POWER	198
XI. STATISTICAL VERIFICATION. GENERAL HISTORICAL REVIEW	234
XII. STATISTICAL VERIFICATION. RECENT YEARS	276
XIII. THE PROBLEM OF MAKING PURCHASING POWER MORE STABLE	319
APPENDIX TO CHAPTER II	349
APPENDIX TO CHAPTER III	367
APPENDIX TO CHAPTER V	370
APPENDIX TO CHAPTER VI	372
APPENDIX TO CHAPTER VII	376
APPENDIX TO CHAPTER VIII	379
APPENDIX TO CHAPTER X	385
APPENDIX TO CHAPTER XII	430

ANALYTICAL TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER I

PRIMARY DEFINITIONS

	PAGE
§ 1. Wealth and exchange	1
§ 2. Exchangeable goods	4
§ 3. Circulation of money against goods	6

CHAPTER II

PURCHASING POWER OF MONEY AS RELATED TO THE EQUATION OF EXCHANGE

§ 1. The various circulating media	8
§ 2. The equation of exchange arithmetically expressed	14
§ 3. The equation of exchange mechanically expressed	21
§ 4. The equation of exchange algebraically expressed	24
§ 5. Conclusion and illustrations	28

CHAPTER III

INFLUENCE OF DEPOSIT CURRENCY ON THE EQUATION AND THEREFORE ON PURCHASING POWER

§ 1. The mystery of circulating credit	33
§ 2. The basis of circulating credit	40
§ 3. Banking limitations	42
§ 4. The revised equation of exchange	47
§ 5. Deposit currency normally proportioned to money	49
§ 6. Summary	58

CHAPTER IV

DISTURBANCE OF EQUATION AND OF PURCHASING POWER DURING TRANSITION PERIODS

§ 1. Tardiness of interest adjustment to price movements	55
§ 2. How a rise of prices generates a further rise	58
§ 3. Extent of disturbances in equation	61
§ 4. How a rise of prices culminates in a crisis	64

	PAGE
§ 5. Completion of the credit cycle	67
§ 6. Summary	72

CHAPTER V

INDIRECT INFLUENCES ON PURCHASING POWER

§ 1. Influence of conditions of production and consumption on trade and therefore on prices	74
§ 2. Influence of conditions connecting producers and consumers on trade and therefore on prices	77
§ 3. Influence of individual habits on velocities of circulation and therefore on prices	79
§ 4. Influence of systems of payment on velocities of circulation and therefore on prices	83
§ 5. Influence of general causes on velocities of circulation and therefore on prices	87
§ 6. Influences on the volume of deposits subject to check and therefore on prices	88

CHAPTER VI

INDIRECT INFLUENCES (*Continued*)

§ 1. Influence of foreign trade on the quantity of money and therefore on prices	90
§ 2. Influence of melting and minting on the quantity of money and therefore on prices	96
§ 3. Influence of the production and consumption of money metals on the quantity of money and therefore on prices	99
§ 4. Mechanical illustration of these influences	104

CHAPTER VII

INFLUENCE OF MONETARY SYSTEMS ON PURCHASING POWER

§ 1. Gresham's Law	112
§ 2. Cases when bimetalism fails immediately	115
§ 3. Cases when bimetalism fails after production overtakes consumption	121
§ 4. The limping standard ; the gold-exchange standard	127
§ 5. Bimetalism in France	132

	PAGE
§ 6. Lessons of French experiment	135
§ 7. The limping standard in India	138
§ 8. The limping standard in the United States	140
§ 9. General description of system in the United States.	143

CHAPTER VIII

INFLUENCE OF QUANTITY OF MONEY AND OTHER FACTORS ON
PURCHASING POWER AND ON EACH OTHER

§ 1. The equation of exchange implies no causal sequence	149
§ 2. Effects of a change in money (M). Quantity theory in causal sense	151
§ 3. Quantity theory not strictly true during transition periods	159
§ 4. Effects of a change in deposits (M') relatively to money (M)	162
§ 5. Effects of changes in velocities of circulation (V and V')	164
§ 6. Effects of changes in volume of trade (the Q 's)	165
§ 7. Can the price level be regarded as cause as well as effect?	169
§ 8. Distinction between causation of individual prices and the price level	174
§ 9. Summary	181

CHAPTER IX

THE DISPERSION OF PRICES MAKES NECESSARY AN INDEX OF
PURCHASING POWER

§ 1. Some prices cannot respond readily to price movements	184
§ 2. Consequently other prices must over-respond	190
§ 3. Transformation of the right side of the equation of exchange from ΣpQ to PT	194
§ 4. Summary	196

CHAPTER X

THE BEST INDEX NUMBERS OF PURCHASING POWER

§ 1. Forms of index numbers	198
§ 2. Various purposes of index numbers	204
§ 3. An index number as a standard of deferred payments	208
§ 4. Deferred payments based on total exchanges	217
§ 5. Practical restrictions	225
§ 6. Summary	231

CHAPTER XI

STATISTICAL VERIFICATION. GENERAL HISTORICAL REVIEW

	PAGE
§ 1. The last thousand years	234
§ 2. The last four centuries	237
§ 3. The nineteenth century	238
§ 4. Its five price movements	240
§ 5. Retrospect	246
§ 6. Outlook	248
§ 7. Paper money	250
§ 8. Paper money in France	252
§ 9. Paper money in England	253
§ 10. Paper money in Austria	255
§ 11. Early American paper money	256
§ 12. The "greenbacks"	258
§ 13. Confidence in the greenback	261
§ 14. Confederate paper money	263
§ 15. Deposit currency and crises	265
§ 16. Particular crises	267
§ 17. Velocity of deposits and crises	270
§ 18. Summary	274

CHAPTER XII

STATISTICAL VERIFICATION. RECENT YEARS

§ 1. Professor Kemmerer's statistics, 1879-1908	276
§ 2. New estimates for M and M' , 1896-1909	280
§ 3. New estimates for $M'V'$ and V' , 1896-1909	282
§ 4. New estimates for MV and V , 1896-1909	285
§ 5. Estimates for T and P , 1896-1909	290
§ 6. P directly and indirectly calculated	292
§ 7. Correcting discrepancies	298
§ 8. The final results	304
§ 9. The comparative importance of price-raising causes	307
§ 10. Influence of antecedent causes such as tariffs, etc.	311
§ 11. Results and by-products of Chapter XII	315

CHAPTER XIII

THE PROBLEM OF MAKING PURCHASING POWER MORE STABLE

§ 1. The problem of monetary reform	319
§ 2. Bimetallism as a solution	323
§ 3. Other proposed solutions	328
§ 4. The tabular standard	332
§ 5. The writer's proposal	337
§ 6. Summary and conclusion	348

APPENDICES

APPENDIX TO CHAPTER II

	PAGE
§ 1 (to Ch. II, § 3). The concept of an average	349
§ 2 (to Ch. II, § 5). The concept of velocity of circulation	352
§ 3 (to Ch. II, § 5). "Arrays" of p 's, Q 's, and pQ 's	355
§ 4 (to Ch. II, § 5). "Arrays" of e 's, m 's, and V 's	358
§ 5 (to Ch. II, § 5). The coin-transfer concept of velocity and the concept of time of turnover	362
§ 6 (to Ch. II, § 5). Algebraic demonstration of equation of exchange	364
§ 7 (to Ch. II, § 5). P must be a specific form of average in order to vary directly as M and V and inversely as the Q 's,	364

APPENDIX TO CHAPTER III

§ 1 (to Ch. III, § 2). "Arrays" of k 's and r 's	367
§ 2 (to Ch. III, § 4). Algebraic demonstration of equation of exchange including deposit currency	368

APPENDIX TO CHAPTER V

§ 1 (to Ch. V, § 5). Effect of time credit on equation of exchange	370
--	-----

APPENDIX TO CHAPTER VI

§ 1 (to Ch. VI, § 1). Modification of equation of exchange required by international trade	372
--	-----

APPENDIX TO CHAPTER VII

§ 1 (to Ch. VII, § 2). Money substitutes unlike other substitutes	376
§ 2 (to Ch. VII, § 2). Limits for ratios within which bimetallism is possible	378

APPENDIX TO CHAPTER VIII

§ 1 (to Ch. VIII, § 6). Statistics of turnover at Yale University	379
§ 2 (to Ch. VIII, § 8). Four types of commodities contrasted	382

APPENDIX TO CHAPTER X

	PAGE
§ 1. Each form of index number for prices implies a correlative index number for quantities	385
§ 2. Index numbers for prices occur in arithmetical pairs as also do index numbers for quantities	390
§ 3. General meanings of p 's and Q 's	392
§ 4. Review of 44 formulæ, heading table columns	393
§ 5. Review of 8 tests, heading table rows	400
§ 6. The interior of the table; column 11 in particular	408
§ 7. The 44 formulæ compared	418
§ 8. Reasons for preferring the median practically	425
§ 9. Summary	428

APPENDIX TO CHAPTER XII

§ 1 (to Ch. XII, § 1). Professor Kemmerer's calculations	430
§ 2 (to Ch. XII, § 2). Method of calculating M	432
§ 3 (to Ch. XII, § 2). Method of calculating M'	434
§ 4 (to Ch. XII, § 3). Method of calculating $M'V'$ for 1896 and 1909	441
§ 5 (to Ch. XII, § 3). Method of calculating $M'V'$ for 1897-1908	446
§ 6 (to Ch. XII, § 4). General practical formula for calculating V	448
§ 7 (to Ch. XII, § 4). Application of formula to calculations of V for 1896 and 1909	460
§ 8 (to Ch. XII, § 4). Interpolating Values of V for 1897-1908	477
§ 9 (to Ch. XII, § 5). Method of calculating T	478
§ 10 (to Ch. XII, § 5). Method of calculating P	486
§ 11 (to Ch. XII, § 7). Mutual adjustments of calculated values of M , M' , V , V' , P , T	488
§ 12 (to Ch. XII, § 8). Credit and cash transactions. Comparison with Kinley's estimates	491