



V3-8:q8:2.N19t

E9

046965

CIVIL SERVICE.

46965

S

RECRUITMENT AFTER WAR.

FINAL REPORT

(DATED 22ND APRIL 1919)

V3, 8:28:2-N12
OF THE

E9

COMMITTEE

6

APPOINTED BY THE

LORDS COMMISSIONERS OF HIS MAJESTY'S TREASURY

to consider and make Recommendations upon certain Questions with regard to Recruitment for the Civil Service after the War.

Presented to Parliament by Command of His Majesty.



V3, 8:28:2-N12
E9
46965

656

LONDON:
PUBLISHED BY HIS MAJESTY'S STATIONERY OFFICE

To be purchased through any Bookseller or directly from
H.M. STATIONERY OFFICE at the following addresses:
IMPERIAL HOUSE, KINGSWAY, LONDON, W.C. 2, and 28, ABINGDON STREET, LONDON, S.W. 1;
37, PETER STREET, MANCHESTER; 1, ST. ANDREW'S CRESCENT, CARDIFF;
23, FORTH STREET, EDINBURGH;
or from E. PONSONBY, LTD., 116, GRAFTON STREET, DUBLIN.

1919.

[Cmd. 164.]

Price 2d. Net.

COMMITTEE ON RECRUITMENT FOR THE CIVIL SERVICE AFTER THE WAR.

The Right Hon. VISCOUNT GLADSTONE, G.C.B., G.C.M.G. (Chairman);
Sir THOMAS HEATH, K.C.B., K.C.V.O., representing the Treasury;
Mr. STANLEY LEATHES, C.B., representing the Civil Service Commission;
Mr. G. E. P. MURRAY, C.B., representing the Post Office;
Mr. H. B. BUTLER, C.B., representing the Ministry of Labour;
Mr. R. H. CARR, of the Board of Education;
Mr. W. R. FRASER, of the Treasury (Secretary).

TERMS OF REFERENCE.

“To consider and make recommendations upon the following questions with regard to Recruitment for the Civil Service after the War :—

- “(1) The interim method or methods to be adopted for filling vacancies in Class I. until it becomes possible to resume Open Competitions under the ordinary Regulations.
 - “(2) The possibility (as a temporary alternative to Open Competition) of making appointments to the Intermediate Class or corresponding grades by selection from eligible demobilised officers and men who had completed their school education before joining.
 - “(3) The extent to which it may be desirable to modify the normal rules governing competitions for other situations in the Public Service (including the age limits prescribed for such competitions) in order to provide men discharged from the Forces so far as possible with the same opportunities both for entering the Public Service and for obtaining promotion within the Service as they would have had but for the War.
 - “(4) The conditions under which Civil Service certificates should be issued to persons whose health has been impaired by War Service (a) when entering the permanent Service for the first time, (b) when a certificate of qualification for a new appointment has to be issued to a person who was already serving in, or had been certificated for, a permanent appointment before or during the War.
 - “(5) The steps to be taken to utilise, in suitable clerical or administrative employments, the services of officers and men discharged from the Navy and Army on account of ill-health.
 - “(6) The possibility of retaining in the Service a proportion of the best qualified of the women who have been temporarily employed in the place of men released for Naval or Military Service, subject to the prior claim to re-installation of the men returning to their Departments on demobilisation; and the particular directions in which the experience gained by the several Departments in the employment of women during the War suggests that the employment of women could be extended, with advantage to the Service, after the War.
 - “(7) The best method of providing for the inferior clerical work in Public Departments now assigned to Boy Clerks and junior members of the classes of Assistant Clerks and Second Division Clerks, having regard to the recommendations contained in the Fourth Report of the Royal Commission on the Civil Service.”
-

FINAL REPORT

To the Lords Commissioners of His Majesty's Treasury.

MAY IT PLEASE YOUR LORDSHIPS,

In our Third Interim Report we submitted recommendations for adapting to the conditions created by military service the regulations governing situations normally filled by open competition among men. In this Final Report we deal with the subjects under heads 6 and 7 of our terms of reference. We think it desirable to complete consideration of the male classes before dealing with the case of the women, and we therefore begin with reference 7: "The best method of providing for the inferior clerical work in Public Departments now assigned to Boy Clerks and junior members of the classes of Assistant Clerks and Second Division Clerks, having regard to the recommendations contained in the Fourth Report of the Royal Commission on the Civil Service."

We are aware that our reference is limited to "inferior clerical work," but we find it impossible to consider this entirely apart from the higher classes of work.

It should be understood throughout that where any salaries are mentioned they are on a pre-war basis.

PART I.

THE MALE CLERICAL CLASSES.

Analysis of Royal Commission Recommendations.

2. There will be ready acceptance of the general principle of the Report of the Royal Commission, that the educational tests used by the Government for recruiting its clerical service should correspond, so far as possible, to the actual stages of education set up in the country for the time being, and that the different kinds of clerical work which have to be done require, in different numbers, men possessing the sort of capacity and training represented by each of these educational stages. There has hitherto been no sufficient correspondence between the age-limits and schemes of examination at present prescribed for the several clerical services, and the ages at which the education of the candidates is normally concluded or enters upon a fresh stage; that being so, there is imperfect adjustment of examination to normal curriculum. We have assumed that the recommendations of the Royal Commission (Chapter III., §§ 5-6, pp. 28-9, §§ 26-7, pp. 34-5), which will establish a better correspondence, will be adopted.

3. We agree with the conclusion of the Commission (§§ 11-17, pp. 32-33) that for the future it would be well to abandon altogether the system of recruiting temporary Boy Clerks, and to recruit only for permanent service. The suggestion of the Commission, that the lowest age at which clerks should be recruited is about 16 years, is in conformity with recent educational legislation.

4. At the present time Government employs (in addition to the class of Boy Clerks, which will disappear) three male clerical classes, viz. :—

- (1) Assistant Clerks.
- (2) Second Division Clerks.
- (3) Intermediate Clerks.

The Royal Commission recommends, instead of the three or (if Boy Clerks are included) the four which exist at present, two clerical classes only, viz. :—

A Junior Clerical Class (or "Second Grade Clerks") to be recruited about the age of 16, and

A Senior Clerical Class (or "First Grade Clerks") to be recruited about the age of 18, representing the products of a shorter and of a longer course of secondary education respectively (§§ 18-20, p. 33; § 30, p. 36).

5. We agree with the Royal Commission in preferring a two-fold to the existing three-fold classification, but there remains the difficulty of determining the relations between the two classes and the functions to be assigned to each.

It may be convenient to recall that the grade of Assistant Clerks (present scale 50*l.* to 200*l.*)* was formed in 1897 to meet the need for a less expensive form of labour than Second Division Clerks (present scale 70*l.* to 300*l.*)* for the discharge of simple clerical duties. It was intended that the two grades should be employed in the same Departments, and in the same branches of them, the more difficult duties being assigned to the Second Division and the less difficult to the Assistant Clerks.

But in practice the line of demarcation has become indefinite, and we agree with the conclusion of the Royal Commission that in many instances there is no clear distinction of

* Salaries are throughout stated on a pre-war basis.

function corresponding to the distinction of class. The result of the employment on similar duties of two classes of similar educational qualifications, but with widely different prospects, must inevitably be chronic discontent.

But while both the majority and minority of the Royal Commission agree in the diagnosis of the disease, they differ as to the remedy to be applied to it.

6. The majority contemplate that the Intermediate class and part of the Second Division will be merged in the new Senior Clerical Class, and that the field now covered by Boy Clerks, Assistant Clerks, and the remainder of the Second Division, will be assigned to the Junior Clerical Class, with certain superior posts which are not precisely defined. They recommend that a careful regrading of the work in each Department should be undertaken with a view to establishing a line of demarcation between the two classes, and they contemplate that in certain Departments, at any rate, the two classes will be employed concurrently.

7. The minority, on the other hand, consider the differentiation between the ordinary clerical and routine (or mechanical) work to be impracticable, and the combination of Second Division and Assistant Clerks in the same Department to be a mistake, more especially when, on the abolition of the class of Boy Clerks, the Assistant Clerk will be recruited from outside candidates of a more advanced age and of superior educational attainments (para. 33g). They propose accordingly that the Senior Clerical Class should replace the Intermediate Class only, and that the justification for its employment should be that "the work of an office is of the same character throughout, and usually of a technical character; that the differences in it are differences of degree only and not of kind, and that the performance of it demands throughout qualifications superior to those that will be possessed by the (Junior Clerical) Class."

Under this scheme the Junior Clerical Class would undertake the whole of the duties now performed by the Second Division, Assistant Clerks, and Boy Clerks, except those which may be transferred to women.

8. We have come to the conclusion that, in so far as the scheme of the majority involves the concurrent employment of the Senior Clerical and the Junior Clerical Classes in the same branches of the same Departments upon work similar in character though differing in quality, it will reproduce in an aggravated form the difficulties which have resulted from the concurrent employment of Second Division and Assistant Clerks.

The Junior Clerical Class will be a large body recruited at a later age and possessing higher educational qualifications than Assistant Clerks, with a better scale of salary and superior prospects. We believe that this class should be able to undertake the whole of the duties at present discharged by the Second Division and to produce a sufficient supply of capable men to fill the supervisory and higher posts.

9. We therefore recommend that the scheme of the minority be adopted, that the Senior Clerical Class (or First Grade Clerks) be substituted for the Intermediate Class in those Departments where it already exists, and be introduced only in those Departments in which the conditions specified above are satisfied, and that to the Junior Clerical Class (or Second Grade Clerks) be assigned the work now performed by the Second Division, Assistant Clerks, and Boy Clerks, except in so far as the employment of women upon these duties is extended.

We also recommend that the designations "First Grade Clerks" and "Second Grade Clerks" be adopted for "Senior Clerical Class" and "Junior Clerical Class," and we have used these designations throughout our Report from this point.

10. We think it is a fair criticism of the Second Division organisation that it provides unnecessarily good material for many of the duties imposed on the class, with the result that the State is paying an excessive price for much of its clerical work. Taken as a whole, the Second Division are well worth the salaries which they receive, but with a scale rising from 70*l.* to a maximum of 300*l.* per annum the less capable members of the class progress to a higher salary* than can be justified either by their merits or by the work upon which they are engaged.

We believe that the scheme of the Minority Report will give adequate remuneration for the bulk of the work thrown upon the Second Grade, while the Upper Section (*see* paragraph 17) will facilitate the selection for the more important duties. We hope also that promotions to the First Grade and to other special posts mentioned below, in addition to the existing supervisory appointments, will give an outlet to a considerable number of the more capable men which is much needed.

11. The decision as to whether a particular Department should be staffed by First Grade or Second Grade Clerks should be governed solely by the character and quality of the work, judged by the criteria laid down in the Minority Report. It is important that the decisions should be equitable and consistent, and, in order to establish and maintain a uniform standard, we think it would be well that a detailed investigation of the work should be made by the Establishment Division of the Treasury whenever a *prima facie* case for the introduction of First Grade Clerks is presented.

* Salaries are throughout stated on a pre-war basis.

First Grade Clerks.

12. We have carefully considered whether it is desirable to continue separate recruitment for the First Grade, or whether it would not be better, while keeping it as a distinct grade, to fill it solely by promotion from below. We have taken a good deal of evidence on the question, and, on the whole, we think a final decision should be deferred until the Second Grade has been in existence for some time, vacancies in the meantime being filled by the appointment of candidates who have served with the forces (under the scheme recommended in our Third Interim Report) and of Second Division Clerks. The resumption of open competition can be considered on its merits, if and when the need arises.

13. The Second Division Clerks' Association have urged "the immediate introduction of the Senior Clerical Class recommended by the Royal Commission, and the incorporation therein of the present Second Division."

We are not prepared to recommend the acceptance of this proposition. It is made without due regard to the very limited amount of work in the Departments, old and new, which requires the services of the First Grade. Its effect would merely be to raise the scale of pay for the whole Division without alteration of the duties of the great majority, and as a variation of the essential basis of their contract. On the other hand, we agree with the Royal Commission that promotions of the Second Division to the First Grade (Intermediate Class) on grounds of merit should be encouraged. Such promotions in the case of younger men may properly be made to the lower section of the Grade (100*l.*-350*l.*)*; but older men of special merit may properly be promoted to the higher sections of the Grade, especially where new Departments or branches of Departments are being formed and are to be staffed with First Grade Clerks. Experience has proved that selected members of the Second Division are fit for the duties of the old Intermediate Class, not only in the lower but in the higher ranks; but this does not warrant the conclusion that every member of the Second Division, regardless of age or personal qualities, is fit for the duties hitherto appropriated to the Intermediate Class. In fact, the evidence that we have taken indicates a general though not an universal superiority of the officers selected by the Intermediate Competition over the Second Division as a whole. It is necessary, however, that when the number of promotions from the Second Division to the First Grade is substantially increased, they should be distributed as evenly and fairly as possible on a Service basis, and not confined to those few Departments which happen to have both Second Division and Intermediate posts on their establishment.

14. We recommend therefore that such promotions should be made by a Selection Board, sitting at the Civil Service Commission, from candidates recommended by Departments; and we trust that it will be regarded as obligatory on Departments to recommend only the very best of their junior staff, and also not to withhold any names on grounds of departmental convenience.

It must be remembered that new entrants to the lower section of the Intermediate Class (First Grade Clerks) must begin at the bottom and accustom themselves to a wholly new type of work, and it is therefore essential that such promotions should be made at a relatively early age. We doubt whether it will be found expedient to promote men over 30, though for the next two years the limit might be higher. In order to permit of promotions being made at an early age, it will be necessary to modify or omit the requirement of eight years' service in clause 36 of the Order in Council of the 10th January 1910. The natural avenue of promotion for senior Second Division Clerks will continue to be to Staff Clerkships and other supervisory posts.

The promotion of Second Division Clerks should continue, concurrently with open competition if and when resumed, so long as there are candidates who are thoroughly fit for the posts and not disqualified by age.

15. We recommend for this class the scale of pay at present in force for the Intermediate Class. We submit for consideration that some system of special advances, such as we recommend below for the Second Grade Clerks, should also be applied to this class.

The titles of the classes in the several Departments need not be altered, but the class *as a whole* might be known as First Grade Clerks.

Second Grade Clerks.

16. This class should have entrusted to it all the routine clerical work of the service (save that which may be assigned to women).

The class would take the place of Boy Clerks, of Assistant Clerks, and of the Second Division as at present employed, and should be recruited by open competition at the age of 16-17.

17. The scale of salary should, on a pre-war basis, be as in effect proposed by the majority Commissioners, 50*l.* by 5*l.* to 85*l.*, then by 7*l.* 10*s.* to 130*l.*, then by 10*l.* to 200*l.*, with an efficiency bar at 130*l.**

There should also be an Upper Section on the scale 200*l.* by 10*l.* to 300*l.**

* Salaries are throughout stated on a pre-war basis.

18. The class of Second Grade Clerks thus constituted will form ultimately a body of many thousand men proceeding by regular increments to a salary of 200l.* a year and reaching this maximum at about the age of 37.

We think that with so numerous a class, on so long a scale of pay, it is desirable to devise some means for its more efficient members to rise more rapidly up the scale than the less efficient, and to introduce some system of progressive incentives as a reward for those who prove fit to undertake work decidedly superior to the normal work of their class and standing. We recommend therefore that power should be taken to promote a clerk after four years' service to the scale of 85l.-130l. and, after four years' service on the scale 85l.-130l. or eight years in all, to the scale 130l.-200l.,* promotion not being granted merely for meritorious service but for the successful performance of unusually difficult and responsible work. In practice it will no doubt be necessary to place restrictions upon these awards, in order that the number of advances may be kept within moderate limits, and that equitable treatment may be secured as between one Department and another.

Every encouragement should be given to the men to qualify for such advancement, by employing them upon work above ordinary routine to test their capabilities as early as possible in their career and giving them all possible opportunities of showing their ability and of widening their range of knowledge and experience by employment in various branches of the office.

19. There should be open to the class (a) in the ordinary course of promotion supervising and specialist posts of the kind generally known as Staff Posts of the Second Division; (b) any other special posts which it might be considered desirable to fill from the class; (c) officerships of Customs and Excise, which, subject to the concurrence of the Board of Customs and Excise, should be so filled in future.

The Second Grade Clerks should also have every encouragement to seek and qualify themselves for posts of the First Grade. Appointments to that Grade would be by selection for ability and merit alone on the lines already recommended for similar promotions from the Second Division.

Incorporation of Existing Classes.

20. If our recommendations in paragraph 14 above are approved, a considerable number of Second Division Clerks would be selected for First Grade Clerkships. No change should be made in the title or conditions of service of the remainder, but it will not be necessary to keep them on work separate from that of Second Grade Clerks. Recruitment for the Second Division, which has been suspended during the War, should not be resumed, but promotions to the Second Division should continue to be made, for a year or two, of exceptionally able Assistant Clerks, the requirement of six years' service in Clause 45 of the Order in Council being modified for this purpose, after which such promotions will cease and the clause itself be repealed. Existing Assistant Clerks should be incorporated in the new Second Grade, and this will more than counterbalance the stoppage of promotion to the Second Division.

The recruiting of Boy Clerks should cease at once; examinations for the Second Grade cannot begin until due provision has been made for absorbing Second Division Clerks on temporary duty who have not yet received permanent billets, and Boy Clerks who have qualified for Assistant Clerkships, but have not yet been assigned.

21. It will be necessary to provide members of the Second Grade for temporary as well as for permanent service. Departments applying for Second Grade Clerks on temporary service should be required to retain the clerks assigned to them until the Civil Service Commissioners are able to find them permanent or other temporary places, so as to obviate breaks in service such as frequently occurred in the case of Second Division Clerks.

PART II.

EXTENSION OF THE EMPLOYMENT OF WOMEN IN THE CIVIL SERVICE.

22. We are asked to consider (Reference 6) "the possibility of retaining in the Service a proportion of the best qualified of the women who have been temporarily employed in the place of men released for Naval or Military Service, subject to the prior claim to reinstallation of the men returning to their Departments on demobilisation; and the particular directions in which the experience gained by the several Departments in the employment of women during the War suggests that the employment of women could be extended, with advantage to the Service, after the War."

23. We begin by summarising the views expressed by the Royal Commission in order to show the state of considered opinion on this subject shortly before the outbreak of War.

The Royal Commission, after reviewing the extent to which, and manner in which, women were then (*i.e.*, in April 1914) employed in the Civil Service, recorded their unanimous opinion that the object in approaching the problem should be, not to provide employment for

* Salaries are throughout stated on a pre-war basis.

women as such, but to secure for the State the advantages of the services of women wherever those services will best promote its interests; and they were unable to accept the contention that "justice requires that in recruiting the public service the difference of sex should be ignored." This contention pre-supposed the complete interchangeability of women with men in the Civil Service, whereas the evidence satisfied the Commission that in powers of sustained work, in continuity of service, and in adaptability to varying service conditions, the advantage lay with men.

Their general conclusion, therefore, was that the recruitment of women should be extended, but that it should remain on separate lines. Specially qualified women should be eligible for appointment to particular administrative situations in certain Departments, and should be selected by the method used for recruitment of professional officers, but women should not be admitted to the Class I. examination. Similarly, the educational tests for selecting women clerks should be restricted to women only, and women clerks should, where employed, be accommodated separately from male clerks, and work under female supervision.

24. In the course of our study of the matters submitted to us we have obtained evidence from experienced witnesses of both sexes from the temporary and from the permanent Departments, as well as from outside persons interested in the subject. Four members of our Committee have had direct experience of the work of large numbers of women in six of the largest Departments during the war. We have taken evidence from the Service Associations, and have conferred with three representative members of a Sub-Committee of the Women's Advisory Committee of the Ministry of Reconstruction, who informed us that they were appointed to place on record the women's view of this question. Fifteen of our witnesses in this particular matter were women, and nineteen were men: the latter being mostly Heads or other official representatives of Departments. We have also considered the Reports of the Sub-Committee of the Women's Advisory Committee, and of the Machinery of Government Committee (Cd. 9230 of 1918).

25. In the consideration of the evidence our views have taken shape, and we present them in the hope that they may be of assistance in the solution of a problem, the full difficulty of which only appears on close examination.

It is easy and natural to formulate principles based on the equality or interchangeability of the sexes, but we are required to base our conclusions on the experience of Departments during the War. The evidence we have taken on the subject convinces us that, having regard to the existing differences in the opportunities of education and in the general mental equipment of young men and women, it would be unsafe to introduce women forthwith, as interchangeable with men, throughout the various Departments, and that a readjustment of this kind needs to be worked out by gradual processes and carefully tested stage by stage.

Other bodies have considered the question of the extended employment of women on general grounds, but for our purpose it must not be dealt with as an isolated problem apart from the general question of recruitment. His Majesty's Government has accepted in principle the recommendation in our Third Interim Report that in the years immediately succeeding the war ex-Service men should receive priority in Civil Service appointments open to men of military age. The Women's Advisory Committee have urged that this decision should be reversed and that the claims of women who have done public work during the war, but owing to their sex have been unable to "serve" in the technical sense, should be considered equally with those of men from the Forces. We see no reason to modify our previous recommendation. The sacrifices of active service are so great as to justify the priority we have recommended, and we cannot regard the claim of women as being on the same level. Nor, of course, have open competitions for women been suspended during the war.

It will be understood that throughout this Report we have kept priority for ex-Service men in mind.

Summary of Evidence on the General Question.

26. Our witnesses all agreed that the conditions under which women have served temporarily in Government Departments, during the War, have been neither satisfactory in themselves nor sufficiently stabilised to warrant any positive conclusions. In the first place, the staffs were not selected either medically or educationally, but recruited hastily from persons of varying suitability for clerical work. Secondly, it was impossible to secure after entry either adequate training or supervision. The evidence showed that women are capable of performing the routine clerical work of the Service, but that as a general rule the output of the staffs of women actually employed on clerical work during the War has not been equal, either in volume or in quality, to that of trained male clerks or that of women recruited on systematic and discriminating lines. Any comparison as to output, powers of work, endurance, &c., based on the performance of temporary women clerks must therefore be received with caution.

27. We enquired with particular care into the extent to which women have been successfully employed on work of a Class I. standard, and we learn that, although women with

high educational qualifications have been employed to a considerable extent in Departments old and new, the great majority of them have not been engaged on general administrative work. Where the work has been of a really high standard it has usually been of a specialised type (e.g., statistical work), or inspection work. In fact, several of our women witnesses, who had worked in Government Departments, felt it as a grievance that educated women had so rarely been able to secure administrative work.

28. This may be partly due to the fact that the largest temporary Departments have been predominantly "business" Departments. One witness, who has been in charge of both a permanent and a temporary Department, told us that, in the latter, it was found impracticable to give women any responsible share in the directing or administrative work, because of the objection generally entertained by business men to discussing their affairs with women as representing the Department. The tradition of administrative work had also to be developed among women, and this would take time. He believed that in the future women would demand a larger share in administration and that this desire must be given an outlet. The best way of making a beginning would be to set aside whole sections of work exclusively for women with their own line of promotion. They should not be put into competition with men, who under present circumstances would have a great advantage. Women, he thought, adapted themselves more readily to routine work than men. As a permanent arrangement it was preferable to have men and women in separate Departments.

29. There appears to be a somewhat general impression that women have in fact been interchangeable with men in the administrative work of the temporary Departments. That this is not so was admitted by most of our women witnesses; but nevertheless most of them urged that, while certain posts peculiarly needing to be filled by women should be reserved for women, so far as general work was concerned women should be appointed as interchangeable with men to all grades of the Service, and should receive equal pay, and equal opportunities of promotion, with men. If women were in fact not so capable as men of qualifying for the higher posts, this fact would be reflected in the relative number of promotions from either sex, but so long as opportunities of promotion were equal they felt that this risk, if it was one, should be faced.

30. Other women witnesses, however, felt that it would be a long time before women, if introduced along with men into the lowest grades of Class I., could become qualified by training and tradition to exercise any real influence over the decisions of Departments. In these circumstances the witnesses thought that the employment of women in administrative posts should be experimental in the first instance, and that the experiment should take the form of earmarking for them certain posts, in higher as well as lower grades, and recruiting candidates for them, not by open competition (which, as things are, would not be likely to produce the most suitable candidates) but by a system of special selection.

31. It was, indeed, suggested to us that women should be appointed forthwith as Assistant Secretaries in ordinary Departments. This, however, was not the view of other women witnesses, who considered that women ought to start at the bottom of the ladder and prove their fitness for the higher posts.

Evidence as to Output.

32. As regards relative output of actual work, evidence varied considerably. Some witnesses put the ratio of men's output to women's so high as two to one; but others pointed out that any comparison was fallacious in view of the difference of conditions under which a male staff and an emergency staff of women worked, and one or two heads of Departments were of the opinion that on purely routine work, under normal conditions and on equal terms, output would be equal. Women were apt, however, to fall behind as the work became more responsible or complex. It was generally agreed that women do not stand either a sudden or a prolonged strain so well as men.

In view of the lack of knowledge on this question it would be desirable that a systematic comparison of relative output should be made in any Departments where women are employed on the same work as men, and where conditions of service render such an enquiry practicable.

Sick Leave.

33. Women require on an average more sick leave than men, as is shown by the following figures supplied by the Post Office, which at the outbreak of the war employed six-sevenths of the permanent women clerks in Government service, and an even larger proportion if all kinds of women employees are included. Evidence to the same effect has been furnished by representatives of the temporary Departments.

Established Staff, Post Office, London.

Year.	Total Staff.		Percentage of Sick Absentees.		Average Absence per Sick Officer in Days.		Average Absence per Officer Employed.	
	Men.	Women.	Men.	Women.	Men.	Women.	Men.	Women.
1913 - - - - -	29,963	9,074	59	86	14.2	16.3	8.3	14.1
1914 - - - - -	28,790	9,941	58	85	14.1	15.4	8.2	12.9
1915 - - - - -	22,650	10,498	61	89	15.3	15.5	9.4	13.7
Average yearly figures for period 1913-15.	27,134	9,837	59	86	14.5	15.7	8.5	13.6

Retirements.

34. For various causes, of which marriage is the chief, the wastage among women staffs by retirement is very much greater than among men, and for this reason several witnesses thought that it would be unnecessary to provide opportunities of promotion for a staff of women in as great a proportion as for a corresponding number of men. The following figures of departures from the Post Office service for 1911-14 show that the average age of departure was in the case of men 42 and of women 29, and the average is practically constant for each of the four years. The figures include wastage among established staff due to deaths, retirements on account of ill-health, age, resignations and marriage (women).

Year	Total Established Staff.		Total Number of Departures.				Average Age on Departure.		Average Length of Service on Departure.	
	Men.	Women.	Men.		Women.		Men.	Women.	Men.	Women.
			No.	Per cent.	No.	Per cent.				
*1911 - - - - -	83,983	14,768	1,590	1.8	744	5	43	29	21	10
*1912 - - - - -	92,218	20,575	1,686	1.8	987	4.8	42	28	19	9
1913 - - - - -	96,272	22,081	1,841	1.9	1,196	5.4	42	29	20	10
1914 - - - - -	95,018	23,394	1,674	1.7	1,070	4.5	44	29	22	10
Average yearly figure for the four years 1911-14.	91,873	20,204	1,698	1.8	999†	4.9	42	29	21	10

* Figures for resignations, other than those of women for marriage, are estimated for these years.

† Of this total an average of 60% represents retirements on account of marriage and with marriage gratuity.

Most of our witnesses, men as well as women, were of the opinion that the optional age of retirement for women (optional, *i.e.*, for either side) should be, not 60 as in the case of men, but 55 or 50, or even 45. If this suggestion be justified, it has an obvious bearing on the relative value of women's work.

Competition between Girls and Boys.

35. In view of the suggestion that persons should be recruited for the Civil Service by open competition without regard to sex, we heard evidence from the Board of Education, which showed that from the age of 15 to 18 a girl was some 6-9 months educationally in arrear of a boy but caught up from 18 to 19. Our witnesses did not contend that the strain on girls of 15-18 of preparing for an examination in which they would have to compete against boys of the same age would be prejudicial to the health of the girls, but agreed that between those ages the studies at girls' schools had to be slowed down on physical grounds. It was suggested that the examination age limit might be raised by one year in the case of the girls, but this, it was felt, would hardly be accepted as fair by the boys.

We also gathered that, whatever are the merits of competitive examination as a test of fitness, its drawbacks were considered to be much increased in the case of competition between persons of different sexes.

Segregation.

36. We find that some of our witnesses are in favour of segregation and others of "mixed" staffs. A mixed staff may lead to difficulties with regard to promotion. If promotion were restricted to men, the women would have a legitimate grievance; on the other hand, if women were promoted, they would be placed in direct charge of large blocks of men. Neither the experience of temporary Departments nor the experience of business houses is sufficient to decide whether it would be conducive to efficiency, in permanent Departments, to place men under the control of women.

Supervising Posts.

37. The Federation of Women Civil Servants were of the opinion that in staffing the temporary Departments too little use had been made of the trained permanent Women Clerks. They considered that the appointment of such women to supervisory positions in new Departments would have secured economy of staff and better work in those Departments and would provide an outlet for the Women Clerks in the Post Office, where the work is not of a sufficiently high character to justify a high proportion of superior posts. They also reminded us that on past occasions when new Departments have been partially staffed by transfers of permanent Women Clerks, it has usually been stipulated by the new Department that only clerks of short service would be accepted.

CONCLUSIONS.

General.

38. We accept the general principle advanced by the Royal Commission that the end in view should be, not to provide employment for women as such, but to secure for the State the advantages of the services of women wherever those services will best promote its interests.

On the evidence before us we further agree with the general conclusion of the Commissioners that the recruitment of women should be extended, but that it should remain on separate lines, at least until further experience has been obtained.

39. It is not part of our reference to deal with the relative salaries of men and women, and the general question involved has been referred to a Committee under the Chairmanship of Mr. (now Lord) Justice Atkin which has not yet reported. At the same time, it appears to us to be necessary, in making a definite recommendation for the establishment of a class of Civil Servants, to include specific proposals as to rates of pay, and we have based these substantially upon existing standards. The only observation which we feel called upon to make is that equal pay does not necessarily mean paying the men's rate to the women; it might mean paying the women's rate to the men, in which case women would probably tend to oust the men.

Women in Administrative Posts.

40. Class I. examinations cannot be resumed for some years to come, and the question of opening Class I. competitions to men and women on equal terms does not at present arise. Moreover, the State is under an obligation to give ex-Service men the first opportunity of competing for the vacant posts, and consistently with this obligation they cannot be offered to women unless the supply of qualified service candidates is insufficient. Present indications are that there is a larger supply of qualified ex-Army candidates than can be absorbed in the relatively small number of posts of this kind available. Even when the supply of ex-Service men has been exhausted and recruitment for Class I. under normal conditions can be resumed, it will not be practicable to admit women generally to junior administrative posts throughout the service as interchangeable with men until experience has demonstrated not only that they can fill these posts satisfactorily, but that in the same proportion as men they will be competent to carry out the higher administrative duties for which junior administrative work constitutes the regular and necessary training.

41. Meanwhile the experiment should be tried on a liberal scale of employing women in administrative posts of the Class I. type where the work is especially appropriate to women. We consider that these would best be recruited, in the experimental stage, from women with University or other high qualifications, chosen by a Selection Board on which women are included. Women who have not obtained high University honours should be required to have had special experience fitting them for administrative work. Preference should be given by the Board to candidates who have already served temporarily in Government Departments and demonstrated their capacity for administrative work. While no rigid age limits need be fixed at present, candidates should as a rule be not under 22 nor over 30. Deduction from age could be allowed in respect of approved service in a Department. We think it of importance that in future there should be only one method of selection for all posts suitable for women with University or other high qualifications. Departments should be called upon to notify to the Civil Service Commissioners all such vacancies, with such particulars as to the nature of their duties as may be required. Entry to this class should be through a common selection, a general list being issued, from which all vacancies would be filled, as required. Specialist work should be similarly reported, and the Selection Board could form a sub-committee out of a panel of its own members and of the employing Department.

42. We recommend for junior posts a scale of 150*l.*—15*l.*—400*l.*,* one increment (subject to a maximum initial salary of 200*l.*) being allowed for each year of age over 24 at entry.

* Salaries are throughout stated on a pre-war basis.

The number of higher posts would be determined by the requirements of the work. We are not now in a position to make any recommendations as to the pay or number of such posts. There should however be room in due course for a number of higher appointments for women, particularly where special knowledge and experience in matters relating to women and girls are required.

But the time is not yet ripe for the appointment of women indifferently with men to non-specialised higher administrative posts such as those of Assistant Secretary in ordinary Departments. In most cases the duties of an Assistant Secretary, ranging over a wide field of administration, require for their proper discharge an amount of knowledge and experience of the work of the Department which can only be accumulated by means of thorough training acquired in the course of working up through the various grades from the junior classes upwards. There is not sufficient proof that women are at present capable of performing with equal efficiency the most responsible duties assigned to men except in certain branches for which they are specially qualified.

Women Clerks.

43. We recommend that the class of Women Clerks, now employed in a few Departments only, should be made common to the Service. They should be recruited by an examination similar to that for the men Clerks of the Second Grade (account being taken of important variations as between the curricula of boys' and of girls' schools), but at a slightly higher age, say, 17-18.

44. Here, as elsewhere, we adopt for convenience pre-war standards of salaries. We recommend that the grading should be in two classes, the lower class rising from 60*l.* to 140*l.* by increments of 5*l.* and the higher class being on the scale 150*l.*—10*l.*—200*l.* in order to provide the minor supervisory posts required.*

There should be higher supervising and specialist posts above the ordinary maximum of 200*l.* according to the requirements of the Departments.

The question of providing opportunities for promotion to administrative and other superior posts will need to be considered in due course.

45. Departments should be invited to consider whether Assistant Clerks and Second Division Clerks should be replaced by Women Clerks, and if so to what extent.

It seems possible that eventually a great part of the routine clerical work will be transferred to women. For this kind of work the greater relative wastage among women staff is of less importance. The experience of the Post Office, the Insurance Commissioners and other Departments shows that they are fully competent to perform the duties required.

It is also for consideration whether the employment of the class of Women "Writing Assistants," which already exists in the General Post Office and Insurance Commission, should not be extended for the most elementary routine duties.

In Departments employing the Intermediate Class (First Grade Clerks) the routine clerical work should be assigned to women.

New Departments should also be invited to employ Women Clerks where suitable.

46. Whether men and women should be employed in the same sections of Departments on the same work is a difficult question, as will be seen from paragraph 36 above. Separation has the advantage of preserving a definite line of promotion to the women, and we have no doubt that it would, in practice, secure to them a larger proportion of superior posts. We therefore consider segregation to be preferable, at least where the staff is numerically large, but we do not think the evidence sufficiently conclusive for a uniform rule to be imposed on all Departments.

47. We have been greatly impressed by the high testimony borne to the ability and value of permanent Women Clerks trained in the Post Office, Ministry of Labour, Board of Education, and other Departments. We are satisfied that great advantage would have been derived by the War Departments if they could have utilised these women to a far larger extent as trainers and supervisors of their temporary Women Clerks. We recommend that preference be given to the best members of this class in the filling of staff and other supervisory posts in Departments where Women Clerks are introduced as the result of this report, although we recognise that their present Departments will necessarily suffer to some extent by the loss of their services.

Typists and Shorthand Typists.

48. The position of Typists and Shorthand Typists in the Service is not expressly included in the terms of our reference, although typing and shorthand writing are forms of inferior clerical work. Typing at any rate has often been assigned to Boy Clerks in some Departments, and typing and shorthand writing are likely to devolve more and more upon women in

* Salaries are throughout stated on a pre-war basis.

the future. Our survey of the general questions would not be complete without some reference to this important kind of work and this important class of workers.

The present scales are 20s.—2s.—32s.* for Typists and 26s.—2s.—42s.* for Shorthand Typists, plus war bonus in each case. These two grades form a combined class, the proportion of Shorthand Typists in any Department being restricted (save with special Treasury sanction) to one-half the total staff; Typists pass into this grade as vacancies occur and subject to a qualifying examination.

We consider that the lack of opportunities for promotion of the Typist grades into a class employed on less mechanical work should be remedied. Typing and shorthand writing are monotonous and trying to the eyes and offer very little scope for initiative, and we think, therefore, that definite steps should be taken to provide an opportunity of promotion to the Woman Clerk Grade for Typists who are recommended as specially fitted for clerical duties and can pass a suitable qualifying examination. We also agree with the Royal Commission that the educational test at entrance should be higher in standard.

Some of us are of the opinion that sooner or later it will be expedient to assign typing and shorthand writing to members of the new class of Women Clerks during the early stages of their clerical career. Others of us, however, think that such an amalgamation of the clerical and typing classes (which was considered but not recommended by the Royal Commission) would be uneconomical and impracticable, though the question might be considered whether in addition to the normal classes of Women Clerks and Typists an intermediate grade might not be introduced combining typewriting and subordinate clerical duties such as are performed by Writing Assistants.

We therefore make no definite recommendation on this point, but suggest that the whole question should be considered at an early date by the Treasury.

Treatment of Existing Temporary Staff.

49. Our reference directs us to consider the possibility of the retention in the service of a proportion of the best-qualified of the women who have been temporarily employed in Departments during the War.

We have already dealt with the vacancies which will arise in the administrative ranks.

A very large number of women have been engaged temporarily on clerical duties during the War. A number of these were not in employment before the War, and will wish to revert to private life when it is over; others have been temporarily withdrawn from other occupations, and will return to them. A considerable number will desire to remain in Government employment. We consider that preference should be given to such of these as are suitable for permanent employment, but it is obvious that after allowing for men whom the State is under an obligation to re-instate, and for reduction of war establishments, the number which can be absorbed in the permanent service is relatively small. We recommend that, concurrently with open competition, a proportion of the appointments to posts of Women Clerks and Writing Assistants should be reserved for competition among temporary clerks.

50. It is undesirable to make appointments to the ordinary Civil Service grades of persons considerably above the usual age of entry, especially as officers appointed under this scheme will rank below those at present serving; and we therefore recommend a maximum age limit of 25.

We have considered whether such appointments would be best made on a Service or Departmental basis. On the one hand, the staff of Departments which are being closed down will consider it a hardship if they have no chance of permanent employment; on the other hand, the main reason for making any temporary officer permanent is that he or she has gained valuable experience in a Department, and most Departments which have proposed an extension of the employment of women have assumed that they will be free to fill permanent appointments with their temporary employees.

51. It is not at present possible to ascertain either how many permanent vacancies will need to be filled, or how many of the temporary clerks will be discharged or at what time. We think, however, that some form of competition will be necessary, and apart from this we can only suggest that a small Committee be appointed to collect the facts as they become certain, and to recommend from time to time such action as seems best to suit the circumstances. It might be possible to hold a competition for permanent posts, confined to temporary clerks, in a few months' time.

SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS.

Part I. (The Male Clerical Classes).

52.—(1) Recruitment of Boy Clerks should cease, and the Government should recruit only for permanent service at a minimum age of 16 (§ 3).

* Salaries are throughout stated on a pre-war basis.

- (2) The three existing Clerical Classes should be replaced by two (§ 5).
- (3) The Senior Clerical Class (or First Grade Clerks) should replace the Intermediate Class, and the Junior Clerical Class (or Second Grade Clerks) should be assigned the work now performed by the Second Division, Assistant Clerks, and Boy Clerks, except so far as the employment of women is extended (§ 9).
- The titles of First and Second Grade Clerks should be adopted instead of Senior and Junior Clerical Class.
- (4) Recruitment for the Intermediate Class (First Grade Clerks) need not be resumed for the present, vacancies in the meantime being filled by the appointment of ex-service candidates and by promotions from the Second Division (§ 12).
- (5) Such promotions should be made on a service basis through a Selection Board. Promotions to the lower section of the First Grade should be made at a relatively early age, and clause 36 of the Order in Council should be modified (§ 14).
- (6) The scale of pay should be the scale at present in force* for Intermediates, but a system of special advances might be worked out (§ 15).
- (7) Second Grade Clerks should be recruited at 16-17 by open competition and should replace Boy Clerks, Assistant Clerks, and the Second Division (§ 16).
- (8) The scale of salary* should on a pre-war basis be 50*l.*—5*l.*—85*l.*—7*l.* 10*s.*—130*l.*—10*l.*—200*l.*, with an efficiency bar at 130*l.* There should be an Upper Section on the scale 200*l.*—300*l.* (§ 17).
- (9) A system of special rises in the scale is recommended (§ 18), and a wide field of promotion should be open to the class.
- In particular, officerships of Customs and Excise should be filled from this class, subject to the concurrence of the Board of Customs and Excise (§ 19).
- (10) Recruitment for the Second Division should cease, but promotions of Assistant Clerks should continue for a year or two, Clause 45 being modified and subsequently repealed. Assistant Clerks should be merged in the new Second Grade (§ 20).
- (11) Second Grade Clerks assigned for temporary service should be retained until the Civil Service Commission find them permanent or other temporary places (§ 21).

Part II. (Extension of Employment of Women in the Civil Service).

- (12) The employment of women should be extended, but should remain on special lines, at least until further experience has been gained (§ 38).
- (13) The time has not come for throwing open Class I. to women (for the reasons stated), but the experiment should be tried on a liberal scale of employing women in posts of a Class I. type where the work is specially suited to them (§§ 40-41).
- (14) They should be recruited by one method of selection; the age limits should be 22-30, and the scale* for Junior posts 150*l.*—400*l.* (with increments for years over 24 up to 200*l.*). It is premature to make any definite recommendations as to higher posts generally, but there should be room for a number of such posts (§§ 41-42).
- (15) The class of Women Clerks should be made common to the Service. They should be recruited at (say) 17-18 and the scale of pay* should be 60*l.*—5*l.*—140*l.* and 150*l.*—10*l.*—200*l.*, with higher posts as required (§§ 43-44).
- (16) Departments should consider the replacing of men by Women Clerks and Writing Assistants. In particular, the routine clerical work of Departments employing Intermediates should be assigned to women. New Departments should be invited to employ Women Clerks where suitable (§ 45).
- (17) Established Women Clerks should be given preference in the filling of higher posts in Departments where women clerks are introduced (§ 47).
- (18) Typists should be given opportunities of promotion to Women Clerkships, and the Treasury should take into early consideration the whole question of typing and shorthand work (§ 48).

* Salaries are throughout stated on a pre-war basis.

(19) A number of posts as Women Clerks and Writing Assistants should be reserved for women who have served as temporary clerks in Government Departments, subject to a maximum age limit of 25. A small Committee should be appointed to work out a scheme (§§ 49-51).

53. We wish to express our indebtedness to our Secretary, Mr. W. R. Fraser. In the technical and complicated matters with which we have had to deal Mr. Fraser's intimate and accurate knowledge of Civil Service organisation and practice has been of very great assistance.

GLADSTONE (Chairman).
T. L. HEATH.
STANLEY LEATHES.
G. E. P. MURRAY.
H. B. BUTLER.
R. H. CARR.

W. R. FRASER (Secretary),
22nd April 1919.
