

# **MARXISM IS DEAD**

**ERIJ NARAIN**

111.63



FOR FAVOUR OF REVIEW.

Kindly send a copy of the  
Review to the author at  
Nicholson Road, Lahore.

**MARXISM IS DEAD**

*BY THE SAME AUTHOR*

\*

**TENDENCIES IN RECENT ECONOMIC  
THOUGHT**

(University of Delhi, 1935)

**INDIAN SOCIALISM**

(Atma Ram & Sons, Lahore, 1937)

**INDIA BEFORE AND SINCE THE CRISIS**

(Indian Press, Allahabad, 1939)

# **MARXISM IS DEAD**

*by*

**BRIJ NARAIN**

*Professor of Economics*

*Sanatana Dharma College, Lahore*

**LAHORE :**

**RAMA KRISHNA & SONS**

**1939**

*Published by the Author*  
At Nicholson Road, Lajpat Street,  
Lahore.

X N 1726 /  
G 3

*Copyright by the Author. All Rights reserved*

~~1163~~  
11663

*Printed by*  
Chas. Wollen, Managing Proprietor,  
Northern India Printing and Publishing Co.  
11-B, Lawrence Road, Lahore.

## CONTENTS

I.	A FORE-RUNNER OF MARX: SAINT AMAND BAZARD	...	1
II.	DIALECTICAL MATERIALISM: QUANTITY AND QUALITY	...	24
III.	DIALECTICAL MATERIALISM: NEGATION OF THE NEGATION	...	58
IV.	A 'SCIENTIFIC' UTOPIA	...	95
V.	RUSSIA: THE GRAVE-DIGGER OF MARXISM	133	
VI.	THE STRUGGLE FOR EXISTENCE	...	188
VII.	CONCLUSIONS	...	223
	APPENDIX: QUESTIONS FOR CRITICS	...	238

## PREFACE

"THE book will bring me little credit in socialist circles"—I said in introducing *Indian Socialism* to the reader at the end of 1936..

I can speak with greater confidence about the present volume. *Marxism is Dead* is certain to bring me much discredit in socialist circles.

The patient investigation of economic facts, when it suggests disagreeable conclusions, elicits no praise but much abuse in India, even vulgar abuse. This is not surprising, considering the ignorance of the general public on economic questions, which is profound.

That is how we have come to believe that the economic regeneration of India will be brought about by *gur, charkha* and *khaddar*, and that *charkha* and the technique of 'fasting unto death' may be trusted to defend India against foreign aggression.

And that is also how we have been led to think that the U. S. S. R. is a Marxist country, that it is the greatest democracy in the world, that exploitation of man by man is at an end there, that soon Russian socialism will be transformed into communism, and, last but not least, that Russia is 'the base of the world revolution'—Russia which is ready to guarantee imperialist territory if only imperialism will guarantee socialist territory !

I am indebted to the Editor, *Tribune*, for permission to use my articles in the *Tribune* on Marxism and other subjects. And I cannot thank Mrs. Indumati Roop Krishna enough for the artistic jacket, which expresses the main thesis of the book better than all the words I have employed.

LAHORE :

1st June, 1939.

B. N.

## INDEX

(Names and Works cited)

Adoratsky, 70	<i>Civil War in France</i> , 89-90 n.
<i>Affairs of China</i> , 228 n.	<i>Clamour for Colonies</i> , 221 n.
<i>After-Thoughts on the U.S.S.R.</i> , 249	Coates, W. P. and Zelda K., 161 n.,
<i>Against Aggression</i> , 189 n.	165 n.
<i>Anarcho-Syndicalism</i> , 252	Cohn, A. W., 109 n.
Andrew Smith, 172 n.	Cole, G. D. H., 25
Angell, Sir Norman, 219	<i>Communist International</i> , 129 n.
<i>    as    as    as    as</i>	<i>Communist Manifesto</i> , 2 and n. etc.

## ERRATA

Page	Line	For	Read
40	16	not fixed	not a fixed
57	6	the mill	the cotton mill
98	18	progress	progresses
130	31	See, or example, <i>The</i>	See, for example, <i>The</i>
133	14	colum	column
134	3	or	for
148	8	Potato	Potatoes
187	3	12 1/4	12 1/2

Caland, Prof., 102	<i>tion</i> , 161 n.
<i>Cambridge Ancient History</i> , 206 n.	Foss, William and Gerhaty, 231 n.
<i>C. and M. Gazette</i> , Lahore, 52	
<i>Case of Leon Trotsky</i> , 120 n.	Gandhi, Mahatma, 95 et seq.,
<i>Case of the Anti-Soviet Block of</i> ‘Rights and Trotzkyites’, 82	113 n., 116
<i>Ce qu'est devenue la Revolution Russe</i> , 135	Garbe, Richard, 30 and n., 31, 32 and n.
Citrine, Sir Walter, 143 et seq., 246 n., 247	Gelesnoff, Prof. A. W., 44 and n. <i>Geldverkehr in Sowjet Russland</i> , Der, 109 n., 162

## INDEX

(Names and Works cited)

- |   |  |
|---|--|
| <p>Adoratsky, 70</p> <p><i>Affairs of China</i>, 228 n.</p> <p><i>After-Thoughts on the U.S.S.R.</i>, 249</p> <p><i>Against Aggression</i>, 189 n.</p> <p><i>Anarcho-Syndicalism</i>, 252</p> <p>Andrew Smith, 172 n.</p> <p>Angell, Sir Norman, 219</p> <p><i>Anti-Duehring</i>, 28 n., 36, 59 n., 62</p> <p><i>Archiv fuer Rechts und Sozialphilosophie</i>, 124 n.</p> <p>Ashton, H. S., 221</p> <p><i>Assignment in Utopia</i>, 252</p> <p>Basily, De, 142 n., 168 n., 170-71, 251</p> <p>Batsell, 124 n.</p> <p>Bazard, St. Amand, Chapter I</p> <p>Beal, Fred. E., 256</p> <p><i>Beitraege z. deut. Kolonialfrage</i>, 215 n.</p> <p>Birchall, F. E., 118 n.</p> <p>Borkenau, 120-30 n.</p> <p><i>Brit. Col. Empire and the German Claim</i>, 217 et seq.</p> <p>Brockway, Fenner, 127 n., 128 n., 139, 251</p> <p>Bukharin, N. I., 82, 108-09, 188, 233</p> <p>Eury, J. B., 205 n.</p> <p>Caland, Prof., 102</p> <p><i>Cambridge Ancient History</i>, 206 n.</p> <p><i>C. and M. Gazette</i>, Lahore, 52</p> <p><i>Case of Leon Trotsky</i>, 120 n.</p> <p><i>Case of the Anti-Soviet Block of 'Rights and Trotzkyites'</i>, 82</p> <p><i>Ce qu'est devenu la Revolution Russe</i>, 135</p> <p>Citrine, Sir Walter, 143 et seq., 246 n., 247</p> | <p><i>Civil War in France</i>, 89-90 n.</p> <p><i>Clamour for Colonies</i>, 221 n.</p> <p>Coates, W. P. and Zelda K., 161 n., 165 n.</p> <p>Cohn, A. W., 109 n.</p> <p>Cole, G. D. H., 25</p> <p><i>Communist International</i>, 129 n.</p> <p><i>Communist Manifesto</i>, 2 and n., etc.</p> <p><i>Conception of Matter according to Nyaya Vaisheshika</i>, 31 n.</p> <p><i>Condition of the Working Class in England</i>, 138 n.</p> <p><i>Coup d'oil sur l'Economie Russe</i>, 250</p> <p><i>Critique of the Gotha Programme</i>, 88, 183, etc.</p> <p>Diehl, Karl, 21</p> <p><i>Doctrine de Saint Simon</i>, Chapter I</p> <p><i>Economic Recovery of Germany</i>, 175</p> <p><i>Encyclopaedia of Labour</i>, 21.</p> <p>Engels, F., on : Condition of the Brit. working class, 138; negation of the negation, 59 et seq.; quantity and quality, 27 et seq.; socialism in one country, 71; the State, 85.</p> <p><i>For Peace and Friendship</i>, 127</p> <p><i>From Tsardom to the Stalin Constitution</i>, 161 n.</p> <p>Foss, William and Gerhaty, 231 n.</p> <p>Gandhi, Mahatma, 95 et seq., 113 n., 115</p> <p>Garbe, Richard, 30 and n., 31, 32 and n.</p> <p>Gelesnoff, Prof. A. W., 44 and n.</p> <p><i>Geldverkehr in Soujet Russland</i>, Der, 109 n., 162</p> |
|---|--|

## MARXISM IS DEAD

- |   |  |
|---|--|
| <p>Gide, André, 249<br/>     Gini, Dr. Corrado, 214<br/> <i>Grundfrage deut. Wirtschaftspolitik</i>,<br/>     213 n.<br/> <i>Grundzüge d. Volkswirtschaftslehre</i>,<br/>     45 n.<br/>     Guillebaud, C. W., 175 n., 176-77<br/> <br/>     Haldane, J. B. S., 24 et seq.<br/> <i>Handwörterbuch d. Staatswissenschaften</i>,<br/>     21, 206 n.<br/>     Haslett, A. W., 195 n.<br/> <i>Hiller's Official Programme</i>, 211 n.,<br/>     216<br/> <i>Historian's History of the World</i>,<br/>     207 n.<br/> <i>History of the Communist Party of the<br/>     Soviet Union (Bolshevik)</i>, 92 and<br/>     n., 130 n., 162, 163 n., 234<br/> <i>History of Greece</i>, 205 n.<br/>     Hoevel, Dr. Paul, 213<br/> <i>Holy Family</i>, 65<br/>     Howard, Roy, 125 n., 134 n.<br/>     Hubbard, 145, 166, 169<br/> <br/> <i>Il Sentimento dello Stato</i>, 131 n.<br/> <i>Indian Philosophy</i>, 26 n.<br/> <i>Indian Socialism</i>, 40, 45<br/> <i>I Search for the Truth in Russia</i>, 144<br/>     et seq.<br/>     Ishimaru, Lt. Tota, 131 n.<br/> <i>I Was a Soviet Worker</i>, 172 n.<br/> <br/>     Jacob, Dr. E. G., 212<br/> <i>Japan Must Fight Britain</i>, 131 n.<br/>     Jawahar Lal Nehru, Pandit, 174<br/>     Jongh, W. G. De, 100<br/> <br/>     Kaganovitch, 181<br/>     Kanada, Sage, 30<br/> <i>Kann das Geld abgeschafft werden</i>,<br/>     109 n.<br/>     Kapila, Sage, 29<br/>     Kautsky, 201<br/>     Keith, A. Berriedale, 30<br/>     Khodjayev, Faizulla, 203 n.</p> | <p><i>Kieler Vorträge</i>, 214<br/>     Kingsmill, Hugh and Muggridge,<br/>     Malcolm, 82<br/> <i>Kolonialpolitischs Quellenheft</i>, 212 n.<br/>     Krestinsky, 109<br/> <br/>     Lapidus and Ostrovityanov, 185,<br/>     187, 256<br/>     Larin, 108<br/>     Lavrov, 193 n.<br/>     Laurat, Lucien, 250<br/>     Lenin on : absolute impoverish-<br/>     ment of the worker, 67 ; demo-<br/>     cracy, 97 ; experts' salaries,<br/>     143 ; inevitability of social<br/>     revolution, 67 ; Imperialism,<br/>     197 et seq. ; non-violence, 98 ;<br/>     relativity, 29 ; the State, 86-7<br/>     n. ; law of uneven develop-<br/>     ment 73<br/> <i>Leninism</i>, 73 n., 198 n.<br/>     Leontiev, A., 47 and n., 67 n.,<br/>     74 n., 186<br/>     Litvinov, Maxim. 188-89 n., 190 n.<br/>     Lunn, Arnold, 225 n.<br/>     Lyons, Eugene, 252.<br/> <br/>     Maisky, M., 127<br/> <i>Marx-Engels Marxism</i>, 42 n., 100 n.<br/>     Manoleso, Mihalil, 48 et seq.<br/>     Marx on : conversion of money<br/>     into capital, 33 et seq. ; exploi-<br/>     tation, 40 et seq. ; interna-<br/>     tionalism, 121 ; negation of<br/>     the negation, 63, 65 ; over-<br/>     population, 193-94 ; Paris<br/>     Commune, 89 ; piece-wages,<br/>     182 et seq. ; profits in agricul-<br/>     ture, 46<br/> <i>Marx-Engels, Selected Correspondence</i>,<br/>     40, 42 n., 46 n., 72<br/> <i>Marxist Philosophy and the Sciences</i>,<br/>     24 et seq.<br/>     Mercier, E., 146 n., 172 and n.. .<br/>     Mezhiauk, V. I., 110, 135, 181<br/>     Molotov, 185, 179</p> |
|---|--|

## INDEX

- My Experiences in China*, 229 n.
- Nature of the Capitalist Crisis, The*, 235
- New Data for Lenin's Imperialism*, 188 n.
- Outline of Political Economy* (Lapidus and Ostrovityanov), 43 n.
- Panunzio, Sergio, 83, 84
- People's Paper*, 72
- Political Economy* (Leontiev), 43 n., 47 n.
- Planck, Max, 23 n.
- Poverty of Philosophy*, 84, 85 n.
- Principles of Communism* (Engels), 71
- Radhakrishnan, Sir, 26 n.
- Red Star Over China*, 229 n.
- Reports* : Family Budgets of Ahmedabad workers, 167; wage census, engineering industry, 160 n., 164 n.; textile industries, 156
- Remonstrantie*, Dc (W. G. De Jongh), 103-04
- Rocker, Rudolf, 252.
- Rohstofffragen d. deut. Volksnahrung*, 213 n.
- Roy, Mr. M. N., 75, 229 n.
- Russian Revolution, The* (Roy) 75 n.
- Russia Under Soviet Rule*, 142.
- Russische Währungsreform des Jahres, 1924*, 110 n.
- Russia Without Illusions*, 134 n.
- Samkhya Karika*, 32 n.
- Samkhya Philosophie, Die*, 30 n.
- Science of Public Finance*, 51 n.
- Selected Works* (Lenin), 82, 85, etc.
- Sismondi, 9.
- Sloan, Pat, 134 n., 164.
- Smith, Adam, 205-06.
- Snow, Edgar, 229-30 n.
- Socialism, Utopian and Scientific*, 86 n.
- Soviet Communism*, 164.
- Soviet Comes of Age, The*, 165 and n.
- Soviet Rule in Russia*, 123 n.
- Soviet Trade and Distribution*, 145 n.
- Soviet Union, 1936*, 19, etc.
- Spanish Arena, The*, 231 n.
- Stalin, J., 73 n.
- State and Revolution*, 85.
- Statesman, The* (Calcutta), 132 n.
- Strachey, John, 235.
- Tatva Kaumudi*, 27 n., 29 n.
- Teichman, Sir Eric, 228 n.
- Theorie du Protectionisme*, 48.
- This Have and Have-Not Business*, 219-20 n.
- Trotzky, Leon, 120 n., 126 n., 139 n., 141 n., 182 n.
- Ueber Sozialismus Kommunismus und Anarchismus*, 21.
- Umesh Misra, 29.
- Unsolved Problems of Science*, 195 n.
- U.S.S.R. Rèflexions*, 146, 172.
- Value, Price and Profit*, 67, 235 n.
- Varga and Mendelsohn, 188 n.
- Vyshinsky, 82.
- Wealth of Nations*, 205 n.
- Weltwirtschaftliches Archiv*, 51 n.
- Westermann, D., 215 n.
- What Marx Really Meant*, 25 n.
- Where is Science Going?* 33 n.
- Word from Nowhere*, 256.
- Workers' Front*, 127 n., 139, 251, 226 n., 231 n.
- Yvon, Comrade, 133 et seq.
- Ziegelmayer, Dr. W., 213 n.

2003-04