

**THE BUDGET IN GOVERNMENTS
OF TODAY**



THE MACMILLAN COMPANY
NEW YORK · BOSTON · CHICAGO · DALLAS
ATLANTA · SAN FRANCISCO

MACMILLAN & CO., LIMITED
LONDON · BOMBAY · CALCUTTA
MELBOURNE

THE MACMILLAN COMPANY
OF CANADA, LIMITED
TORONTO

THE BUDGET
IN GOVERNMENTS
OF TODAY

BY

A. E. BUCK

INSTITUTE OF PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION
COLUMBIA UNIVERSITY

NEW YORK
THE MACMILLAN COMPANY
1934

X71
G4
10786

Copyright, 1934, by
THE MACMILLAN COMPANY.

All rights reserved—no part of this book may be reproduced in any form without permission in writing from the publisher, except by a reviewer who wishes to quote brief passages in connection with a review written for inclusion in magazine or newspaper.

Set up and printed.
Published October, 1934.

SET UP BY BROWN BROTHERS LINOTYPERS
PRINTED IN THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
BY THE FERRIS PRINTING COMPANY

PREFACE

A GENERATION or more ago, Leroy-Beaulieu, the French economist, observed that "there are some sciences so lofty and serene that they leave in peace those who are not concerned with them, but finance," he said, "is not one of these; it has a way of taking a terrible revenge upon nations and upon individuals who neglect or despise it." This telling statement carries today a more ominous note, if anything, than it did when first penned. Because of the continuing severity of the world-wide economic depression which began in 1929, governments, no less than individuals, now find that many of their most vexing problems arise from their efforts to finance themselves. These problems have stimulated a renewed interest in the budget—the technique of making both ends meet in financing government—and in the forms and procedures which have been evolved in the budgetary process.

Hence the time may be deemed opportune for a comprehensive study of the budget in the leading governments of the world. In endeavoring to make such a study, I have constantly kept in mind the budgetary usages and needs of the United States. Incidentally, I have discarded some of the American theories of recent years and also the phrases "executive budget," and "legislative budget," as inadequate and often misleading, inasmuch as the budgetary process involves certain definite responsibilities on the part of both the executive and the legislature.

In gathering the raw materials for this book, I have had the coöperation and assistance of many persons, both at home and abroad. While it is possible to mention only a few of them, the services of the others are no less appreciated. I am particularly indebted to Sir Henry Bunbury, comptroller of the

British Post Office, who enabled me to meet many of the important financial officers of the British government; to Mr. Arthur Collins, financial adviser, who introduced me to the leading local finance officers of England and Scotland; to Miss G. Kemball of the Institute of Public Administration of London, who gave me letters of introduction to several officials on the continent; to Dr. jur. Hubertus Grochtmann of Berlin, who assisted me in interpreting German budgetary forms and practices; and to Dr. Aage Sachs of Copenhagen, who supplied me with Danish budgetary materials and gave me introductions to certain Swedish and Norwegian officials. In Canada and in the United States, I have had the help of numerous officials and friends whom I cannot begin to name. I have also had the opportunity of talking with certain Australian economists, when visiting in the United States, about the budgetary methods of their country.

In the actual preparation of this book, I have several debts to acknowledge. I am grateful to Dr. Charles A. Beard and to Professor Arthur W. Macmahon for reading the manuscript and offering many helpful suggestions. My thanks are also due to my associates at the Institute for their assistance and encouragement, especially to Dr. Luther Gulick, who has greatly facilitated my writing of the manuscript by freeing me of many trivialities and who has offered sound advice from time to time; to Mr. Philip H. Cornick, who has read and criticised the manuscript page by page, contributing greatly to its improvement; to Miss Sarah Greer for her unfailing library services; and to Miss Audrey Davies for collecting certain materials and for reading the manuscript before it went to the publishers. Finally a word of appreciation is due to my wife, who has borne with me good-naturedly during the travail of composition and has given valuable help in checking the manuscript and in reading the proofs.

A. E. BUCK.

New York City,
July, 1934.

CONTENTS

	PAGE
PREFACE	v
CHAPTER	
I. THE BUDGET—A SKETCH OF ITS ORIGIN AND DEVELOPMENT	i
II. GENERAL ASPECTS OF THE BUDGET	46
III. THE RÔLE OF THE EXECUTIVE IN BUDGETING	79
IV. THE RÔLE OF THE LEGISLATURE IN BUDGETING	100
V. THE BUDGET AS A FINANCIAL PLAN	114
VI. FORMULATION OF THE BUDGET	164
VII. AUTHORIZATION OF THE BUDGET	185
VIII. EXECUTION OF THE BUDGET	225
IX. ACCOUNTABILITY FOR THE BUDGET AS EXECUTED	268
X. THE OUTLOOK FOR THE BUDGET IN THE UNITED STATES	297
SELECTED BIBLIOGRAPHY	313
INDEX	333

SELECTED BIBLIOGRAPHY

I. GENERAL WORKS

- ADARKAR, BHALCHANDRA P., *The Principles and Problems of Federal Finance*. London: P. S. King & Son, Ltd., 1933. Pp. xviii, 301.
A comprehensive and readable study of federal finance.
- BUELL, RAYMOND L., Editor, *New Governments in Europe*. New York: Thomas Nelson and Sons, 1934. Pp. xiv, 440.
The trend toward dictatorship in the central European countries.
- COLE, G. D. H., *Modern Theories and Forms of Political Organization*. London: Victor Gollancz, Ltd., 1932. p. 160.
An excellent résumé of political theories and forms.
- and COLE, MARGARET, *The Intelligent Man's Review of Europe Today*. New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1933. Pp. xvii, 624, xxiv.
A general survey of European politics and government, compressed into one volume.
- DALTON, HUGH, and Others, *Unbalanced Budgets*. A Study of the Financial Crisis in Fifteen Countries. London: George Rutledge & Son, Ltd., 1934. Pp. xi, 468.
An important treatment of unbalanced budgets as one of the chief effects of the economic depression.
- LASKI, HAROLD J., *Democracy in Crisis*. London: Allen & Unwin, 1933, P. 267.
A brilliant analysis of the critical position of democratic government in the Western World and the causes of its decline.
- LEAGUE OF NATIONS, *Memorandum on Public Finance*. Published in English in three successive volumes. First vol., 1922; 2d vol., 1922-1926; 3d vol., 1926-1928. Geneva. Pp. 202; 482; 274.
These volumes give brief résumés of the budget and accounting systems of nearly all the European governments, some of the British dominions, a few of the Latin American countries, Japan, and the United States.
- LEES-SMITH, H. B., *Second Chambers in Theory and Practice*. London: George Allen & Unwin, Ltd., 1923. P. 256.
The best treatment of this subject.
- MARRIOTT, JOHN A. R., *Second Chambers*. An Inductive Study in Political Science. Oxford: The Clarendon Press, new edition, 1927. Pp. vii, 250.
Historical discussion of the composition and functions of second chambers.

II. GREAT BRITAIN

A. ENGLAND, SCOTLAND AND WALES

BASTABLE, C. F., *Public Finance*. London: Macmillan and Co., Ltd., 3d ed., 1903, reprinted, 1922. Pp. xxiv, 780.

The English classic on public finance, now out of date in many respects because of recent developments both in theory and practice. Book VI, "Financial Administration and Control," deals generally with the budget.

BUNBURY, HENRY N., "The State Budget as Compared with the Business Budget," *Final Report*, Vol. III, International Discussion Conference on Budgetary Control, Geneva, July 10-12, 1930.

A discussion of the object and technique of public budgeting by the Comptroller and Accountant General of the Post Office of Great Britain.

BURNS, C. D., *Government and Industry*. London: George Allen & Unwin, Ltd., 1921. P. 315.

An analysis and criticism of the economic elements in the government of Great Britain.

BUXTON, SYDNEY, *Finance and Politics: An Historical Study, 1783-1885*. London: John Murray, 1888. 2 vols. Pp. xxiv, 366; xv, 394.

In these volumes, Lord Buxton has presented the history and workings of the British budget prior to the time Sir Barnard Mallet took up the same task in his three volumes.

— *Gladstone as Chancellor of the Exchequer*. London: John Murray, 1901. Pp. viii, 197.

An excellent account of Gladstone's career as a budgeteer.

CLARK, COLIN, *The National Income*. London: Macmillan and Co., Ltd., 1932. Pp. x, 167.

An analysis of the national income of Great Britain from 1924 to 1931.

COLE, G. D. H., *The Next Ten Years in British Social and Economic Policy*. London: Macmillan and Co., Ltd., 1929. Pp. xxi, 459.

Proposals by a member of the Economic Advisory Council to the British government.

DALTON, HUGH, *Principles of Public Finance*. London: George Routledge & Sons, Ltd., 7th ed., 1932. Pp. xv, 297.

This book is regarded by English critics as being "by far the best outline of the subject available." Interesting for its treatment of public finance according to the usual budgetary set-up.

DAVENPORT, E. H., *Parliament and the Taxpayer*. With an Introduc-

- tion by the Right Hon. Herbert Samuel, M.P. London: Skeffington & Son, Ltd., 1918. Pp. xviii, 256.
Mainly a discussion and elaboration of the findings in the report of the Select Committee on National Expenditure of 1917-18.
- DIMOCK, MARSHALL E.**, *British Public Utilities and National Development*. London: George Allen & Unwin, Ltd., 1933. P. 349.
An up-to-date treatment of British public undertakings by an American.
- DURELL, A. J. V.**, *The Principles and Practices of the System of Control over Parliamentary Grants*. Portsmouth: Gieves Publishing Company, 1917. Pp. xxvii, 519.
A penetrating examination of the English financial system from the standpoint of parliamentary control.
- HAWTREY, R. G.**, *The Exchequer and the Control of Expenditure*. London: Humphrey Milford, 1921. P. 72.
A brief and popular treatment of parliamentary control of the budget.
- "The Finance of Publicly Owned Utilities," *Public Administration*, October, 1926. Pp. 352-359.
The financing of public enterprises in relation to the national government.
- HEATH, THOMAS L.**, *The Treasury*. London: G. P. Putnam's Sons, Ltd., 1927. P. 238.
A description of the English Treasury, its functions and relation to the operating departments of the government.
- HIGGS, HENRY**, *The Financial System of the United Kingdom*. London: Macmillan and Company, 1914. Pp. vii, 218.
An authoritative treatment of the English budget system; now somewhat out of date.
- *Financial Reform*. London: Macmillan and Co., Ltd., 1924. P. 91.
Four popular lectures on reforming the English financial system.
- HILLS, JOHN WALLER**, *The Finance of Government*. London: Philip Allan and Company, rev. ed., 1932. P. 218.
First published in 1925; revised with the aid of E. A. Fellowes in 1932. A readable and up-to-date description of the English financial system, with emphasis on the budget.
- HIRST, F. W.**, and **ALLEN, J. E.**, *British War Budgets*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1926. P. 495.
An analysis of twelve war budgets from 1914 to 1924.
- HURCOMB, C. W.**, "The Finance of Publicly Owned Utilities," *Public Administration*, October, 1926. Pp. 360-376.
A brief discussion of the financing of government-owned railways.

316 THE BUDGET IN GOVERNMENTS OF TODAY

HURST, A. W., "The Place of Finance Departments, Committees, and Officers in Administrative Control—National Administration," *Public Administration*, October, 1927. Pp. 418-430.

MAITLAND, F. W., *The Constitutional History of England*. Cambridge: University Press, 1920. Pp. xxviii, 548.

Pages 387-447 are of special interest in connection with the development of the English budget system.

MALLET, SIR BARNARD, *British Budgets, 1887-88 to 1912-13*. London: Macmillan and Co., Ltd., 1913. Pp. xxiv, 511.

A history of twenty-six budgets.

— and GEORGE, C. OSWALD, *British Budgets, Second Series, 1913-14 to 1920-21*. London: Macmillan and Co., Ltd., 1929. Pp. xxii, 415.

A history of ten budgets, with comments on financial policy.

— — *British Budgets, Third Series, 1921-22 to 1932-33*. London: Macmillan and Co., Ltd., 1933. Pp. xxviii, 575.

A history of thirteen budgets, with some observations on financial policy.

Ministers' Powers, Committee on, *Report*. Presented by the Lord High Chancellor to Parliament, April, 1932. London: His Majesty's Stationery Office. P. 138.

MUIR, RAMSAY, *How Britain Is Governed. A Critical Analysis of Modern Developments in the British System of Government*. London: Constable & Co., Ltd., 3d rev. ed., 1933. Pp. xii, 335.

An illuminating and readable examination of British government. Part II, "The Control on Behalf of the People," is of special interest in connection with the budget, especially pages 220-237.

National Expenditure, Committee on, *Report*. Presented to Parliament by Command of His Majesty, July, 1931. London: His Majesty's Stationery Office, P. 282.

NORTHCOTE, STAFFORD HENRY (Earl Iddesleigh), *Twenty Years of Financial Policy*. London: Saunders, Otley & Co., 1862. Pp. xvi, 399.

A summary of the chief financial measures passed between 1842 and 1861, with a table of budgets.

ROBERTS, G. B., *The Functions of an English Second Chamber*. London: George Allen & Unwin, Ltd., 1926. P. 254.

An examination of the need for a second chamber in England.

WARREN, JOHN H., *Municipal Trading*. London: The Labor Publishing Co., Ltd., 1923. P. 95.

WILLOUGHBY, W. F., WILLOUGHBY, W. W., and LINDSAY, S. McC., *The System of Financial Administration of Great Britain*. New York: D. Appleton and Company, published for the Institute for Government Research, Washington, D. C., 1917. Pp. xv, 362.

A study of the English budgetary system by an unofficial American commission, composed of the three authors.

YOUNG, E. HILTON, *The System of National Finance*. London: John Murray, rev. ed., 1924. Pp. xi, 319.

A new edition of the standard work on English budgeting and finance, prepared with the help of N. E. Young. First edition published in 1915.

B. THE BRITISH DOMINIONS

KEITH, ARTHUR BERRIEDALE, *The Constitutional Law of the British Dominions*. London: Macmillan and Co., Ltd., 1933. Pp. xxvi, 522.

An admirable treatment in compact form of the structure and functions of government in the British Dominions.

— *Dominion Autonomy in Practice*. Oxford University Press, 1929. Pp. vii, 92.

A monograph on dominion status in the United Kingdom.

I. Australia

BLAND, F. A., *Budget Control*. Sydney: Angus & Robertson, 1931. Pp. vi, 157.

An illuminating discussion of the financial system of New South Wales, Australia.

— "The Problem of the Budget," *The Economic Record*, November, 1930. Pp. 205-220.

A comparison of American and Australian budgetary practice.

— and MILLS, R. C., "Financial Reconstruction," *The Economic Record*, November, 1931. Pp. 161-176.

An examination of the plan adopted at the Premiers' Conference, June, 1931.

Commonwealth of Australia, *Report from the Joint Select Committee on Public Accounts*, together with minutes of the proceedings of the Committee. Canberra: Commonwealth Government Printer, May, 1932. P. 64.

In three parts: I—"Parliamentary Control over the Public Finances"; II—"Form in which Estimates, Budget Papers and Other Financial Statements are Presented to Parliament"; III—"Uniform Accounts for the Commonwealth and the States."

318 THE BUDGET IN GOVERNMENTS OF TODAY

COPLAND, D. B., *Australia in the World Crisis, 1929-1933*. New York: The Macmillan Company, 1934. Pp. xii, 212.

An authoritative discussion of how Australian finances have weathered the economic storms to the end of 1933.

— editor, "An Economic Survey of Australia," *The Annals*. American Academy of Political and Social Science, November, 1931.

Part V of this issue is devoted to public finance and state expenditure in Australia.

— and WELLER, G. A., *The Australian Economy*. Sydney: Angus & Robertson, 3d ed., 1933. Pp. xi, 171.

A lucid discussion of Australian finance is contained in Chs. XV to XIX. Ch. XVII deals with the balancing of budgets under the Premiers' plan; Ch. XII, with government-owned transport.

EGGLESTON, F. W., *State Socialism in Victoria*. London: P. S. King & Co., 1932. Pp. xv, 354.

A discussion of public undertakings in connection with the state government of Victoria, Australia.

LEES-SMITH, H. B., "The Australian Senate," being Ch. V of *Second Chambers in Theory and Practice*. Pp. 89-118.

The powers of the Australian Senate in relation to the House of Representatives and the Cabinet.

MAYTON, JOSEPH, *Australian Public Finance*. Trade Promotion Series, No. 67, Bureau of Foreign and Domestic Commerce. Washington: Government Printing Office, 1928. P. 108.

Pages 14-20 on the fiscal system of the Commonwealth and states.

PRICE, A. GRENFELL, "Australia Faces Its Debts," *The Yale Review*, Spring, 1933. Pp. 465-473.

A review of the accomplishments of the Premiers' plan for financial reconstruction to the end of 1932.

SHANN, E. O. G., and COPLAND, D. B., *The Crisis in Australian Finance, 1929 to 1931*. Sydney: Angus & Robertson, 1931. Pp. xix, 201.

A collection of important documents on the budgetary policy of Australia, which were prepared prior to the development of the Premiers' plan.

— *The Battle of the Plans*. Sydney: Angus & Robertson, 1931. P. 169.

The struggle between the advocates of budgetary stability and those of currency manipulation.

2. *Canada*

- BOOS, A. W., *The Financial Arrangements between the Provinces and the Dominion*. McGill University Economic Studies, No. 12. Toronto: The Macmillan Co. of Canada, Ltd., 1930. P. 99.
A brief and comprehensive treatment of the relation between Dominion and provincial finances.
- FRASER, THOMAS M., "The Budget System in Canada," *Political Science Quarterly*. Academy of Political Science, Columbia University, December, 1920. Pp. 621-636.
The working of the Canadian budget system.
- LEES-SMITH, H. B., "The Canadian Senate," being Chs. III and IV of *Second Chambers in Theory and Practice*. Pp. 46-88.
The character and shortcomings of the Canadian Senate.
- MAXWELL, J. A., "The Distinction between Ordinary and Capital Expenditure in Canada," *The Bulletin of the National Tax Association*, February, 1934. Pp. 146-148.
A brief account of capital budgeting and its shortcomings as practiced in Canada.
- ROBERTS, B. J., "Canada's Budgetary System," *The Annals*. American Academy of Political and Social Science, May, 1923. Pp. 204-208.
A good summary by an official of the Canadian Department of Finance.
- VILLARD, H. G., "Canadian Provincial Budget Systems and Financial History," *Municipal Research*, No. 87, July, 1917. P. 60.
- and WILLOUGHBY, W. W., *The Canadian Budgetary System*. New York. D. Appleton and Company, 1918. Pp. xiii, 379.
A description of Canadian budgetary methods, prepared under the auspices of the Institute for Government Research. Now very much out of date.

3. *India*

- CHAND, GYAN, *The Financial System of India*. With a Foreword by E. Hilton Young. London: Kegan Paul, Trench, Trubner & Co., Ltd., 1926. Pp. xix, 444.
A comprehensive study of Indian budgeting and finance, as compared with English practices.
- GHOSE, AKSHAYA K., *Public Administration in India*. Published by the University of Calcutta, 1930. Pp. xxi, 743.
Ch. VII, "Finance and Revenue," treats Indian budgeting.

SHIRRAS, G. FINDLAY, *The Science of Public Finance*. London: Macmillan and Co., Ltd., 1924. Pp. xxii, 677.

Described by an American reviewer as "Bastable served with Indian curry." Book V, "Financial Administration," deals mainly with the budget, referring now and then to the practices in India.

4. Newfoundland

Newfoundland Royal Commission, *Report*, 1933. Presented by the Secretary of State for Dominion Affairs to Parliament, November, 1933. London: His Majesty's Stationery Office. Pp. vi, 283. An elaborate study of the future of Newfoundland, and its financial situation and machinery. The findings of this report resulted in the temporary suspension of dominion status.

5. New Zealand

COPLAND, D. B., *New Zealand in the Crisis*. Auckland: Whitcombe and Tombs, Ltd., 1932. P. 23.

Effect of deflation and exchange on the New Zealand budget.

HOLT, L. W., *The New Zealand Budgetary Problem*. Melbourne: Melbourne University Press, 1932. P. 39.

A discussion of recent New Zealand budgets and the important problems in connection with them.

LEES-SMITH, H. B., "The Legislative Council of New Zealand," being Ch. VI of *Second Chambers in Theory and Practice*. Pp. 119-134.

A discussion of New Zealand's second chamber.

6. South Africa

KEITH, ARTHUR BERRIEDALE, "The Union of South Africa," being Ch. XIV of *The Constitutional Law of the British Dominions*. Pp. 358-378.

The constitutional framework of the South African Union.

KOCK, MICHEL H. DE, *An Analysis of the Finances of the Union of South Africa*. Capetown: Juta, 1922. P. 238.

This book is an outgrowth of an American doctoral dissertation.

LEES-SMITH, H. B., "The Senate of South Africa," being Ch. VIII of *Second Chambers in Theory and Practice*. Pp. 160-178.

The relation of the two houses in the South African Union.

ROOS, J. DE VILLIERS, "Some Aspects of Financial Administration [in South Africa]," *Public Administration*, October, 1929. Pp. 352-364.

III. FRANCE

- ALLIX, EDGARD, *Traité élémentaire de Science des Finances et de Législation financière française*. Paris: Rousseau, sixième édition, 1931. Pp. xxviii, 1172.

The most comprehensive, readable, and up-to-date survey of French fiscal problems. The first 436 pages deal exhaustively with the budget, covering its formulation, authorization, execution, and control.

- BESSON, E., *Le Contrôle des Budgets en France et à l'Étranger*. Paris: A Chevalier Marescq. & Cie., 1899. Pp. x, 628.

A history of financial control in the principal countries of the world up to 1899.

- DELAPORTE, JEAN, *Le Budget départemental*. Paris: Recueil Sirey, 1930. P. 126.

A description of budgeting in the departments of France.

- HAIG, ROBERT MURRAY, *The Public Finances of Post-War France*. New York: Columbia University Press, 1929. Pp. xxviii, 463.

The author's preface and Part I on the development of French financial policy since the World War are of special interest in connection with the budget; likewise, Ch. XX on expenditures.

- JÈZE, GASTON, *Théorie Générale du Budget*. (Cours de Science des Finances et de Législation Financière Française.) Paris: Marcel Giard, 1922. Sixième édition. Pp. xx, 286.

The standard French treatise on the theory of the budget.

- and TRUCHY, HENRI, *The War Finance of France: The War Expenditure of France; How France Met Her War Expenditure*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1927. P. 344.

- JOLLY, PIERRE, "Public Utilities in France," *Harvard Business Review*, July, 1931. Pp. 409-416.

Brief discussion of French public undertakings and their financing.

- LAINVILLE, ROBERT, *Qu'est ce que le Budget Communal?* Paris: Recueil Sirey, 2. éd., 1933. P. 239.

An up-to-date discussion of communal budgeting in France.

- MARCÉ, VICTOR DE, *Le Contrôle des Finances en France et à l'Étranger*. Tome I. Paris: Félix Alcan, 1928. Pp. xvii, 559.

The first 136 pages of this volume contain a general discussion of financial control in the leading governments of the world. The remainder of the volume is devoted to France, and is largely historical. This work is projected in four volumes, the first and third (listed under Germany) having appeared.

322 THE BUDGET IN GOVERNMENTS OF TODAY

MARTIN, GERMAIN, *Les Problèmes Actuels des Finances Publiques en France*. Paris: Payot, 1933. P. 142.

A discussion of budgetary balancing by a former Minister of Finance.

MERLY, C.-M. et SOL, BERNARD, *Le Régime Financier des Colonies*. Paris: Larose, 1932. P. 432.

A discussion of French colonial budgeting and finance.

MIDDLETON, W. L., *The French Political System*. New York: E. P. Dutton & Co., 1933. P. 296.

A lucid and well-balanced discussion of the French parliamentary system in its actual working. Chs. VII, VIII, and IX deal with problems related to the budget.

SOL, CHARLES, *Le Budget Municipal*. Paris: Crete, 1925. Pp. vii, 595.

A description of communal budgeting in France.

STOURM, RENÉ, *The Budget*. (American edition, translated by Thaddeus Plazinski from the 7th edition of *Le Budget*, Paris, 1913.) New York: D. Appleton and Company, published for the Institute for Government Research, Washington, D. C., 1917. Pp. xxvii, 619.

The French classic on the budget.

TERRIER, CLAUDIUS, *Le Bilan d'État*. Lausanne: Payot & Cie., 1928. P. 166.

A dissertation on French finance and accounting.

IV. GERMANY

BLACHLY, F. F., and OATMAN, M. E., *The Government and Administration of Germany*. Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins Press, 1928. Pp. xiv, 770.

A discussion, from the American viewpoint, of the organization and administration of the second Reich. Ch. VIII deals with the budget, and Ch. XVI with public enterprises.

BONJOUR, HENRY, *Le Budget du Reich*. Préface du Fritz Neumark. Paris: Marcel Giard, 1931. Pp. vii, 189.

A discussion, from the French viewpoint, of the preparation, voting, execution, and control of the budget under the second German Reich.

HECKEL, MAX VON, *Das Budget*. Leipzig: C. L. Hirschfeld, 1898. Pp. xvi, 354.

One of the early German works of note on the budget.

- JÈZE, GASTON, *Allgemeine Theorie des Budgets*. Deutsche Ausgabe von Dr. Fritz Neumark. Tübingen: J. C. B. Mohr (Paul Siebeck), 1927. Pp. xvi, 377.
A German translation of the notable French work, to which the translator has added considerable material on budgeting in Germany.
- KUEHNEMANN, MAX E. F., *Haushaltsrecht und Reichsetat*. Berlin, 1930. P. 173.
Budgetary legislation and accounting in the second Reich.
- LANG, HANS, *Der Haushaltsplan im Deutschen Reich und im Freistaat Bayern*. Paderborn: F. Schöningh, 1930. P. 276.
A treatment of the budget in the second Reich and in the state of Bavaria.
- MARCÉ, VICTOR DE, *Le Contrôle des Finances en France et à l'Étranger*. Tome III, l'Allemagne. Paris: Félix Alcan, 1931. Pp. x, 576.
A French discussion of budgetary legislation, accounting, and financial control in the second German Reich.
- NEUMARK, FRITZ, *Der Reichshaushaltplan*. (Ein Beitrag zur Lehre vom öffentlichen Haushalt.) Jena: G. Fischer, 1929. Pp. xviii, 406.
The best and most comprehensive treatment of public budgeting under the second Reich.
- ROESSING, HEINRICH, *Die Parlamentarische Budgetinitiative im Reich*. Berlin: P. Funk, 1930. P. 101.
A study of the relation of Parliament to the budget in the second Reich.

V. ITALY

- CHICOŞ, STEFAN, *Le Contrôle Budgétaire en Italie*. Paris: Recueil Sirey, 1929. P. 103.
A French view of budgetary control in Italy.
- DEAN, VERA MICHELES, "Fascist Rule in Italy," contained in *New Governments in Europe*, 1934. Pp. 36-125.
A concise account of the Fascist system of government.
- EINZIG, PAUL, *The Economic Foundations of Fascism*. London: Macmillan and Co., Ltd., 1933. Pp. xii, 156.
A roseate picture of the "corporative" state and its economics.
- GANGEMI, LELLO, *La Politica Economica e Finanziaria del Governo Fascista*. Bologna: Zanichelli, 1924. P. 507.
A treatment of the first phase of Fascist economic and fiscal policy.

324 THE BUDGET IN GOVERNMENTS OF TODAY

NITTI, FRANCESCO, *Principes de Science des Finances*. Traduits de l'italien par Stefan Freund. Paris: Marcel Giard, 1928. 2 vols. Pp. xix, 438; 470.

The French translation is from the fifth edition of this notable Italian work, *Principi di Scienza delle Finanze* (Naples, 1922). Pages 393-430 contain a brief discussion of the budget, referring to Italian practices prior to the Fascist régime.

PITIGLIANI, FAUSTO, *The Italian Corporative State*. London: P. S. King & Son., Ltd., 1933. Pp. xxv, 293.

The structure and workings of the Fascist state, mainly on the economic side.

SPENCER, HENRY RUSSELL, *Government and Politics of Italy*. New York: World Book Company, 1932. Pp. xii, 307.

A critical and rather cold discussion of the Fascist state.

VALOIS, GEORGES, *Finances Italiennes*. Paris: Valois, 1930. Pp. xxiii, 172.

A French view of Fascist economy and finance.

VI. BELGIUM, THE NETHERLANDS, THE SCANDINAVIAN STATES, AND SWITZERLAND

BROOKS, ROBERT C., *Government and Politics of Switzerland*. New York: World Book Company, 1927. Pp. xv, 430.

Ch. V on the executive, VI on the legislature, and VIII on Swiss federal finance are worthy of note.

"Contrôle et responsabilité en matière budgétaire en Belgique," et "Le régime légal du budget en Belgique," *Revue Internationale des Sciences Administratives*, Avril, 1934. Pp. 270-278.

FEENSTRA, A., *De Gronden der Staatsinrichting van Nederland*. Gorinchem: J. Noorduyn & Zoon, 1931. Twintigste, herziene druk. P. 303.

Ch. VIII, pages 151-168, gives a brief account of the financial system of the Netherlands.

GARGAS, S., *Les Finances Municipales aux Pays-Bas*. Paris: Marcel Giard, 1930. P. 74.

A brief French account of municipal finance in the Netherlands.

HALLENDORFF, CARL, and SCHÜCK, ADOLF, *History of Sweden*. London: Cassell and Company, Ltd., 1929. Pp. xxiv, 466.

An excellent short history, containing illuminating sections on parliamentary development and authority in Sweden.

- KOFOED, K. H., "Control of Public Finance in Denmark," *Public Administration*, October, 1927. Pp. 457-460.
- LEES-SMITH, H. B., "The Norwegian Second Chamber," being Ch. IX of *Second Chambers in Theory and Practice*. Pp. 179-203.
An excellent summary of the Norwegian system of government.
- MEIER, ERNST, *Der eidgenoessische Voranschlag und seine rechtliche Bedeutung*. Glarus: R. Tschudy, 1931. P. 120.
A discussion of the Swiss budget.
- MILLER, RAYMOND C., *Budgets of Western European Countries*. Bureau of Foreign and Domestic Commerce, Department of Commerce. Trade Information Bulletin, No. 222. Washington: Government Printing Office, 1924. Pp. ii, 31.
A summary of budgetary legislation and conditions in the governments of Europe.
- REED, THOMAS H., *Government and Politics of Belgium*. New York: World Book Company, 1924. Pp. xv, 197.
Chs. V and VI on the legislature and the executive.

VII. THE POST-WAR STATES OF EUROPE

- GORDON, EZEKIEL, *Les Nouvelles Constitutions européennes et le Rôle du Chef de l'État*. Paris: Recueil Sirey, 1931. P. 436.
A discussion from the French viewpoint, of the authority and position of the executive in the post-war governments of Europe.
- GREAVES, H. R. G., *The Spanish Constitution*. Day to day pamphlets, No. 15. London: The Hogarth Press, 1933. P. 47.
Informative treatment of the Spanish Republic's constitution adopted in 1931.
- HEADLAM-MORLEY, AGNES, *The New Democratic Constitutions of Europe*. Oxford University Press, 1928. P. 298.
A comparative study of post-war European constitutions with special references to Germany, Poland, Czechoslovakia, Finland, Yugoslavia, and the Baltic states.
- MAGYARY, ZOLTÁN, *Das ungarische Budgetrecht*. Berlin: W. de Gruyter & Co., 1924. P. 24.
A discussion of the Hungarian Budget Law.
- MILLER, DOUGLAS P., *Budgets of Western European Countries*. Bureau of Foreign and Domestic Commerce, Department of

326 THE BUDGET IN GOVERNMENTS OF TODAY

Commerce. Washington: Government Printing Office, 1922. P. 26.

A summary of budgetary legislation and conditions in the principal countries of Europe.

NEIDL, WILHELM, *Das österreichische Budget und Budgetrecht*. Vienna: Manz, 1927. Pp. vi, 206.

A description of the Austrian budget system prior to the dictatorship.

ZURCHER, ARNOLD J., *The Experiment with Democracy in Central Europe*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1933. Pp. xii, 328.

A readable treatment of the post-war governments. Of special interest are Chs. III, "Federalism"; VIII, "Parliament"; IX, "Second Chambers"; X, "The Cabinet"; and XIV, "Functional Representation."

VIII. SOVIET RUSSIA

BATSELL, WALTER R., *Soviet Rule in Russia*. New York: The Macmillan Company, 1929. Pp. xi, 857.

A critical analysis of governmental organization and administration in Soviet Russia, completed early in 1929. Of value chiefly for the extensive translations of constitutional and legal provisions.

CHAMBERLIN, WILLIAM HENRY, *Soviet Russia, a Living Record and a History*. Boston: Little, Brown, and Company, rev. ed., 1933. Pp. ix, 486.

This book, by the Russian correspondent of the *Christian Science Monitor*, presents an excellent and unbiased account of the Soviet State.

— *The Soviet Planned Economic Order*. Boston: World Peace Foundation, 1931. P. 258.

A discussion of the First Five-Year Plan and its working.

DEAN, VERA MICHELES, "The Political Structure of the Soviet State," contained in *New Governments in Europe*. Pp. 315-395.

A brief and up-to-date account of Soviet machinery.

DOBBERT, GERHARD, editor, *Red Economics*. A symposium with an Introduction by Walter Duranty. Boston: Houghton Mifflin Company, 1932. Pp. xxiv, 327.

Of special interest in relation to the Soviet budget is Ch. I, "The Planned Economy," by W. H. Chamberlin, and Ch. VII, "State Finance," by Gerhard Dobbert.

— and WITT, OSCAR, *Das Einheitliche Staatsbudget der U.d.S.S.R.* (Haushaltplan, Budgetgesetzgebung und etatrechliche Kom-

- petenzen in der Finanzwirtschaft Sowjetrusslands.) Jena: G. Fischer, 1930. Pp. ix, 156.
The best treatment of the Soviet budget system outside the Russian language.
- FISCHER, LOUIS, "The Second Five-Year Plan," *The Nation*, February 14, 1934. Pp. 182-184.
A brief and readable account of the second Piatiletka by a Moscow correspondent.
- GRINKO, G. F., *The Five-Year Plan of the Soviet Union*. New York: International Publishers, 1930. Pp. 340.
A comprehensive statement of the first Five-Year Plan, written by the vice-chairman of the Soviet planning commission.
- HAENSEL, PAUL, *Die Finanz- und Steuerverfassung der Union der Sozialistischen Sowjet-Republiken*. Jena: G. Fischer, 1928. Pp. xviii, 285, 40.
A general treatment of finance and taxation in Soviet Russia.
- HESSEN, VLADIMIR, *Das Staatsbudget Sovetrusslands*. Berlin: Sack, 1925. P. 114.
A German monograph on the Soviet budget.
- SOKOLNIKOV, GREGORY Y., and Associates, *Soviet Policy in Public Finance, 1917-1928*. Stanford University Press, California, 1931. Pp. xiv, 470.
An American translation of materials prepared by a former Commissar for Finance and his associates. Deals more with history and statistics than with organization and procedure.
- STALIN, J., and Others, *From the First to the Second Five-Year Plan*. New York: International Publishers, 1933. P. 490.
An English translation of discussions of current problems by Soviet political leaders. Of special interest in relation to the budget are: "The Results of the Five-Year Plan," by Stalin, pp. 1-59; "Tasks of the First Year of the Second Five-Year Plan," by Molotov, pp. 83-132; and "The Financial Programme of the U.S.S.R. for 1933," by Grinko, pp. 363-423.
- WEBB, SIDNEY, "The Steel Frame of Soviet Society," *The Political Quarterly*, January-March, 1933; also *The Yale Review*, Winter, 1933. Pp. 303-317.

IX. JAPAN AND THE ORIENT

- ANDREADÈS, A. M., *Les Finances de l'Empire Japonais et Leur Évolution*. Paris: Alcan, 1932. P. 302.
An account of Japanese finances since 1868, by a competent French authority.

- BRATTER, HERBERT M., *Public Finances of Far Eastern Countries*. (Fourth Survey, 1929.) Trade Promotion Series, No. 83. Bureau of Foreign and Domestic Commerce, United States Department of Commerce, 1929. P. 99.
- COLEGROVE, KENNETH, "Powers and Functions of the Japanese Diet," *The American Political Science Review*, December, 1933, pp. 885-898, and February, 1934, pp. 23-39.
The second half of this article gives an excellent summary of the budgetary powers of the Japanese Diet.
- GROSCLOSE, ELGIN E., *Budgets in the Far Eastern Countries*. Trade Information Bulletin, No. 400. Bureau of Foreign and Domestic Commerce, United States Department of Commerce, 1926. P. 48.
- MAYTON, JOSEPH GREGORY, *Budgets of Far Eastern Countries*. (Third Annual Survey.) Trade Promotion Series, No. 51. Bureau of Foreign and Domestic Commerce, United States Department of Commerce, 1927. P. 72.
- MOULTON, HAROLD G., *Japan: An Economic and Financial Appraisal*. Written with the collaboration of Junichi Ko. Washington: The Brookings Institution, 1931. Pp. xix, 645.
Ch. XI sketches the system of Japanese public finance.
- OUCHI, HYOYE, "The Japanese Financial Department," *Municipal Research*, No. 83, March, 1917. Pp. 45-56.
A description of the organization and personnel.
- QUIGLEY, HAROLD S., *Japanese Government and Politics*. New York: The Century Co., 1932. Pp. xii, 442.
Chs. VI, VII, and VIII on the executive, and Chs. X and XI on the Diet are of interest in connection with the working of the Japanese budget.
- UCHIKE, R., and SAKAMOTO, Y., "Budget System of Japan," *Municipal Research*, No. 83, March, 1917. Pp. 1-44.
A discussion by experienced Japanese, appearing in a bulletin of the New York Bureau of Municipal Research under the general title of "Japanese Administration and Finance."

X. THE UNITED STATES

- ADAMS, H. C., *The Science of Finance*. New York: Henry Holt and Company, 1898. Pp. xxiii, 573.
- Pages 104-218 treat the budgetary practices of European governments in the light of American needs; now mainly of historical interest.

SELECTED BIBLIOGRAPHY

- BEARD, CHAS. A., and SMITH, GEO. H. E., *The Future Comes: A Study of the New Deal*. New York: The Macmillan Company, 1933. Pp. xii, 178.
An analysis of the Roosevelt recovery program after it had been under way a few months.
- BENSON, GEO. C. S., *Financial Control and Integration*. New York: Harper & Brothers, 1934. Pp. vii, 68.
A comparative study of the functions of the Comptroller General of the United States.
- BROGAN, D. W., *Government of the People*. Foreword by H. J. Laski. New York: Harper & Brothers, 1933. P. 415.
A penetrating and critical appraisal of the American political system by an Englishman.
- BUCK, A. E., *Public Budgeting*. New York: Harper and Brothers, 1929. Pp. x, 612.
A comprehensive discussion of budgetary practice in the national, state and local governments of the United States.
- "The National Budget," *The American Year Book*, annually, 1927-1934.
An annual summary of the working of the national budget system.
- CHICOŞ, STEFAN, *La Préparation du Budget et le Contrôle Budgétaire aux États-Unis d'Amérique*. Paris: J. Gamber, 1930. P. 130.
A French view of the national budget system of the United States.
- CLEVELAND, F. A., "National Budget System," *The American Year Book*, 1925, pp. 317-321; "National Budget," *The American Year Book*, 1926, pp. 310-315.
The first article deals with the history of the national budget, and the second raises some questions with respect to budgetary organization and procedure.
- and BUCK, A. E., *The Budget and Responsible Government*. With an Introduction by William Howard Taft. New York: The Macmillan Company, 1920. Pp. xxxiii, 406.
An account of the efforts for administrative and budgetary reform in the United States.
- COLLINS, CHARLES W., *The National Budget System and American Finance*. New York: The Macmillan Company, 1917, P. 151.
A brief survey of fiscal conditions in the United States in 1917 and a plea for the adoption of a national budget system.

THE BUDGET IN GOVERNMENTS OF TODAY

Commission on Economy and Efficiency, *The Need for a National Budget*. Washington: Government Printing Office, 1912. P. 568.

A notable American document on the budget, prepared by President Taft's Commission on Economy and Efficiency; now chiefly of historical interest.

— *A Budget for the Fiscal Year 1914*. Washington: Government Printing Office, 1913. P. 433.

A budget for the national government of the United States, prepared by the staff of the Commission at the direction of President Taft, and submitted to Congress on February 26, 1913. Only of historical interest; Congress disregarded it.

DAWES, CHARLES G., *The First Year of the Budget in the United States*. New York: Harper & Brothers, 1923. Pp. xi, 437.

The first director of the Bureau of the Budget tells his experience in getting the national budget system established.

FITZPATRICK, EDWARD A., *Budget Making in a Democracy*. New York: The Macmillan Company, 1918. Pp. x, 317.

An argument for legislative supremacy in budget making and a defense of continuing appropriations in the state governments of the United States.

HAIG, ROBERT MURRAY, "The State of the Federal Finances," *The Yale Review*, Winter, 1933. Pp. 234-251.

A review of the condition of the national treasury at the end of the Hoover administration.

HATTON, A. R., editor, "Public Budgets," *The Annals*, American Academy of Political and Social Science, November, 1915.

This issue of 324 pages treats the early development of the budget in the United States; now mainly of historical interest.

KING, CLYDE L., editor, "Competency and Economy in Public Expenditures," *The Annals*, American Academy of Political and Social Science, May, 1924.

This issue of 366 pages is devoted to various aspects of the budget in the national, state and local governments of the United States.

LELAND, S. E., and Associates, *Balancing the Budget*. Public Policy Pamphlets, No. 1, Harry D. Gideonse, editor. The University of Chicago Press, 1933. P. 30.

A proposal by a University of Chicago round table for balancing the federal budget by economic cycles.

POWELL, FRED W., "The Recent Movement for State Budget Reform: 1911-1917," *Municipal Research*, No. 91, November, 1917. P. 155.

An account of the early development of the budget in the state governments of the United States.

SELECTED BIBLIOGRAPHY

- ROGERS, LINDSAY, *The American Senate*. New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1926. P. 285.
A defense of the United States Senate, principally as an investigating body and as a critic of the executive.
- SELIGMAN, EDWIN R. A., "The Fiscal Outlook and Coördination of Public Revenues," *Political Science Quarterly*, March, 1933. Pp. 1-22.
A proposal for integration of federal and state revenues in the United States.
- SMITH, DARRELL H., *The General Accounting Office*. Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins Press, 1927. Pp. xii, 215.
The background and activities of the Comptroller General's office, created in 1921.
- STUDENSKY, PAUL, *Public Borrowing*. New York: National Municipal League, 1930. Pp. vii, 137.
Among other things, this monograph treats the use of public credit in financing the budget.
- SUNDELSON, J. WILNER, "The Emergency Budget of the Federal Government," *The American Economic Review*, March, 1934. Pp. 53-67.
A defense of the emergency budget.
- VAN DORN, HAROLD ARCHER, *Government Owned Corporations*. New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1926. P. 311.
The history, financing, and operation of government-owned corporations in the United States to 1926.
- WILLOUGHBY, W. F., *The Problem of the National Budget*. New York: D. Appleton and Company, 1918. Pp. xiii, 220.
Arguments for the establishment of a national budget system in the United States, published three years before the passage of the budget and accounting act.
- *The Movement for Budgetary Reform in the States*. New York: D. Appleton and Company, 1918. Pp. xi, 254.
A digest of state budgetary legislation in the United States to 1918; now superseded by new laws in nearly every state.
- *The National Budget System*. Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins Press, 1927. Pp. xvi, 343.
A study of the operation of the national budget system of the United States during the first five years of its existence.
- *The Legal Status and Functions of the General Accounting*

THE BUDGET IN GOVERNMENTS OF TODAY

Office of the National Government. Baltimore, The Johns Hopkins Press, 1927. Pp. xi, 193.

An analysis of the work of the Comptroller General's office, established in 1921.

— *Principles of Public Administration.* Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins Press, 1927. Pp. xxii, 720.

Part IV, on financial administration in the United States, is of particular interest in this connection.

— *Financial Condition and Operations of the National Government, 1921-1930.* Institute for Government Research, Studies in Administration, No. 25. Washington: The Brookings Institution, 1931. Pp. xii, 234.

A critical examination of the national accounting and reporting system, with suggestions for improvements.

WITT, OSCAR, *Vorgeschichte und Gestaltung des Haushaltplanes der Vereinigten Staaten von Amerika.* Jena: G. Fischer, 1926. Pp. xii, 109.

A German view of the United States budget.

XI. THE LATIN AMERICAN STATES

CORLISS, JAMES C., *Latin American Budgets.* Washington: Bureau of Foreign and Domestic Commerce, United States Department of Commerce, Trade Information Bulletins Nos. 497, 517, 524, and 564, published July, 1927 to June, 1928. Pp. 72, 59, 45, and 55.

Part I describes the budgets and finances of Argentina, Uruguay, Paraguay and Brazil; Part II, Chile, Peru, Bolivia and Ecuador; Part III, Colombia and Venezuela, and Part IV, Central America and Panama.

MCQUEEN, CHARLES A., *Peruvian Public Finance.* Trade Promotion Series, No. 30, Bureau of Foreign and Domestic Commerce. Washington: Government Printing Office, 1926. P. 126.

Ch. I on revenues and expenditures of Peru.

• SHERWELL, G. BUTLER, *Budgets of Latin American Countries.* Washington: Bureau of Foreign and Domestic Commerce, United States Department of Commerce, Trade Information Bulletin, No. 281, October, 1924. P. 75.

A brief summary of budgetary legislation and conditions in the Latin American governments.

INDEX

- Accountability for the budget as executed, 268-296.
- Accounting, accrual, 253-254.
cost, 148, 259.
general, 253-258.
- Acworth Committee, study of Indian railway system, 161.
- Adams, H. C., executive formulation of budget, 80.
- Adarkar, B. P., central fiscal agency for federal supervision, 300.
weaknesses of federal financial system in United States, 299.
- Administration, executive's position and authority in, 95-97.
need for centralized authority in, 94-95.
reorganization of, in state governments of United States, 97.
- Alabama, quadrennial budget, 128.
- Albania, status of budget in, 24-25.
unicameral legislature, 188.
- Allix, Edgard, annexed budgets, 143.
automatic method of estimating revenues, 176.
budgetary authority of Finance Committee of Chamber, 195.
creation of Ministry of the Budget, 82, 231.
critical of British net budget, 136.
criticizes use of *crédits additionnels*, 221.
disadvantages of *budget rectificatif*, 223.
douzièmes provisoires result of outworn legislative methods, 218-219.
extraordinary budgets in France, 140-141.
opposed to "preventive control" for French Cour, 278.
parliamentary control of fiscal administration inappropriate, 234.
railway budgeting, 160.
shortening the *exercice*, 256.
stages of budgetary procedure, 47.
universality and unity of budget, 126.
usurpation of executive authority, 109.
- All-Union Central Soviet Committee (TsIK), approval of budget, 88.
how constituted, 31-32.
- All-Union Soviet Congress, budget not submitted to, 88.
how constituted, 31.
- Annexed budgets, 142-144.
- Appropriation bills, 149-151.
- Appropriations, additional, 220-222.
contingent, 251-252.
continuing, 130.
deficiency, 220-222.
executive, 251.
interim, 217.
itemization of, 150-151.
mandatory character in United States, 246-247.
percentage reserves of, 252-253.
permanent, 130, 133.
supplementary, 220-222.
- Argentina, federal form of government, 58.
status of budget in, 42-45.
- Audit, 258-259, 268-296.
governmental operations, 55-57.
judicial type of, 276-283.
legislative type of, 269-276.
political type of, 283-285.
- Auditing system, essential features of, 290-292.
- Australia, assumption of state debts by Commonwealth, 61, 64.
balancing budget, plan for, adopted, 121-123.
Commonwealth Loan Council, 64, 122.
Commonwealth Parliament, 28.
federal subsidies to states, 61.
federal system of government, 58-64.
finances under federal system, 60-64.
general governmental structure, 28.
indebtedness of New South Wales, 64.
method of resolving deadlocks between chambers, 193.
railway system, financing of, 161-162.
Senate, financial powers, 190.

- Austria, federal system changed to unitary, 58.
- Authorization of budget, 185-224.
- Balanced budget, maintenance of, 244-253.
- Baldwin, Stanley, 69.
- Bastable, C. F., budgetary estimating, 173-174, 176.
- executive formulation of budget, 80.
- French accounting system, 255.
- gross budgets, 136.
- legal basis of English budget, 74-75.
- relation of financial year to budget, 128.
- Beard, Charles A., 59.
- Belgium, Cour des Comptes, "preventive control" of, 278-279.
- development of budget in, 20-21.
- douzièmes provisoires*, 218-219.
- extraordinary budgets, use of, 141.
- finance committees, 195.
- financial administration, 226, 234.
- general governmental structure, 20-21.
- Senate, fiscal powers of, 191.
- Bicameral system, 186-193.
- effect on budgeting in United States, 303-304.
- relative authority of houses, 189-193.
- undermined by parliamentary government, 186-187.
- Bismarck, 14.
- Bland, F. A., public utility control in Australia, 158-159.
- Bolivia, status of budget in, 42-45.
- Brazil, federal form of government, 58.
- status of budget in, 42-45.
- British dominions, budget speeches in, 199.
- duties of governor generals, 26.
- English system of audit, 276.
- financial powers of upper houses, 189-190.
- growth of budget in, 26-30.
- Brogan, D. W., American judicial review, 301.
- weaknesses of American system of government, 297.
- Bryce, James, 48.
- Budget, ability and honesty required in estimating for, 173-174.
- accountability for, as executed, 268-296.
- Budget, adaptation of word in public finance, 4-6.
- annexed, 142-144.
- annuality of, 127-130.
- as a financial plan, 47, 114-163.
- as a procedure, 47.
- authorization of, 185-224.
- executive's part in, 87-94.
- rôle of legislature in, 102-107.
- balanced plan, 114-125.
- bills, appropriation and revenue, 149-152.
- capital, 138-140.
- classification of expenditures, 169, 170-171.
- classification of income, 168-170.
- comprehensiveness of, 125-127.
- conference committees in handling of, 211-212.
- consideration of, by legislature, 200-209.
- constitutional bulwark of popular government, 46.
- control through current planning, 247-250.
- coöperation between legislature and executive on, 106-107.
- corrective, 222-223.
- counterpoise on governmental forces indispensable to, 55-57, 268-269.
- current and capital, 138-140.
- "cyclic" balancing of, 118-120.
- date of submission to Congress in United States, 181.
- defined, 46-47.
- detailed estimates and supporting data, 146-149.
- development of, in governments, 6-45.
- document, form and contents of, 131-152.
- economic and social significance of, 70-74.
- effect of congressional system on, 51-52.
- effect of Fascist system on, 52-53.
- effect of parliamentary system on, 50.
- effect of Soviet system on, 53-54.
- enforcing accountability for, rôle of legislature in, 110-113.
- equilibrium—balanced plan, 114-125.
- maintenance of, 244-253.
- ways of attaining, 117-123.
- essential features of financial plan, 114-130.
- essential stages, 46-47.

- Budget, estimate blanks or forms, 173.
 estimates, preparation and assembling of, 179-181.
 review and revision of, 182-184.
 estimating expenditures and revenues, 171-179.
 execution of, 225-267.
 legislative attempts at control over, 108-110.
 rôle of executive in, 94-99.
 extent of legislative authority in determining, 102-104.
 extraordinary, 140-142.
 federal form of government, effect on, 57-65.
 flexibility of, in adaptation to government, 3-4, 48.
 formulation of, 164-184.
 dictatorial powers in, 86.
 ministerial powers in, 81-83.
 participation of legislature in, 100-102.
 presidential powers in, 84-86.
 rôle of executive in, 79-86.
 general accounting and reporting for, 253-258.
 general aspects of, under congressional governments, 51-52.
 dictatorships, 52-53.
 parliamentary governments, 48-51.
 general summary, 133-135.
 gross versus net, 135-138.
 handicaps to development under American government, 298-305.
 independent, 144-146.
 indispensable to government, 4.
 information for, its nature and classification, 167-171.
 interim appropriations, 217.
 Italian and English systems compared, 52-53.
 legal groundwork of, 74-76.
 legislative discussion of, 205-209.
 legislative organization in relation to, 186-198.
 message, 198, 199-200.
 message, contents, 132-133.
 methods of balancing, 117-123.
 methods of estimating expenditures, 174-175.
 methods of estimating revenues, 175-179.
 methods of meeting governmental expenditures in absence of budgetary authorization, 217.
 necessary under dictatorships, 46.
 net, 135-138.
 operating and improvement, 138.
- Budget, ordinary and extraordinary, 140-142.
 origin of the term, 4-6.
 outlook for, in United States, 297-311.
 party systems, effect on, 65-67.
 political ideas and patterns, how affected by, 48-57.
 political parties, effect on, 65-70.
 postal services, financing in relation to, 143, 145-146, 156.
 productive and unproductive expenditures, 73-74.
 public enterprises in relation to, 152-163.
 publicity concerning, as adopted, 215-216.
 refusal or failure of legislature to vote, 219-220.
 relation of party changes to, 68-70.
 relation to fiscal year, 128-129.
 research and investigation as aid to, 265-267.
 restrictions on legislative action with respect to, 212-215.
 separation of powers in relation to, 54-57.
 effect of, in United States, 91, 96.
 speech, 198-199.
 staff agencies for the preparation of, 165-167.
 status of in post-war states of Europe, 24-25.
 submission of, to legislature, 198-200.
 subsidiary, 142-144.
 suggestions for improving, in United States, 305-311.
 supplementary, 223-224.
 technical aspects of, 76-77.
 technical instruments for exercising control over, 253-267.
 trained staff agencies for technical work, 77.
 unbalanced, political and economic consequences of, 115.
 unitary form of government, effect on, 57-58.
 unity of, 125-127.
 voting of, 185, 209-216.
 after fiscal year begins, 216-219.
 work program, relation to, 248.
 Budget system, defined, 46.
 Budgetary procedure, stages in, 47.
 Budgetary process, defined, 46.
 Budgeting, defined, 46.
 rôle of executive in, 79-99.
 rôle of legislature in, 100-113.

- Bulgaria, status of budget in, 24-25.
unicameral legislature, 188.
- Bureau of the Budget, United States, created, 42.
investigation by, 266.
organization of, 237-238.
staff agency, 166.
- Buxton, Sydney, on Gladstone's budget speeches, 198.
- California, general budget summary, 134-135.
restrictions on special appropriation bills, 214.
- Canada, budgetary development in, 26-28.
capital budget, 139.
Dominion Bureau of Statistics, 63.
executive grants, 251.
federal subsidies to provinces, 61.
federal system of government, 58-63.
finances under federal system, 59-61.
general governmental structure, 26-28.
House of Commons, 27, 187, 189-190.
provincial governments, 27-28.
railway system, budgeting of, 161-162.
Senate, 27, 187.
financial powers, 189-190.
unicameral legislatures in provinces, 188.
- Capital budget, 138-140.
- Cash accounting, 253-254.
- Central Committee of Russian Communist Party, 33-34, 53, 226, 235-236, 283-285.
- Chamberlain, Neville, budgetary equilibrium, 115.
rejected scheme for balancing budget over period of years, 120-121.
- Chamberlin, W. H., 35.
- Chancellor of the Exchequer, England, budget speech, 198-199.
budgetary execution, 226, 227-228.
budgetary formulation, 81-82, 165.
- Check on governmental operations, 55-57.
- Chile, executive authorization of budget, 88.
executive budgetary proposals, weight of, 90.
failure to vote budget, provision against, 219-220.
- Chile, restrictions on budgetary action of legislature, 213.
status of budget in, 42-45.
- China, status of budget in, 36-37.
- Churchill, Winston, net budget instituted, 136.
- Clark, Colin, study of British national income, 71.
- Classification of income and expenditures, 168-171.
- Cleveland, F. A., executive formulation of budget, 80.
executive-legislative cooperation, 107.
failure of General Accounting Office to function as planned, 292-293.
handicap of itemized appropriations, 151.
- Colbert, comptroller general of Louis XIV, 12.
- Cole, G. D. H., control of public enterprises, 159.
functional representation, 67-68.
- Colombia, executive budgetary proposals, weight of, 90.
restrictions on budgetary action of legislature, 213.
status of budget in, 42-45.
- Commissariat for Finance of Soviet Russia, 34, 235-236.
- Commissariat for Workers' and Peasants' Inspection (Rabkrin) of Soviet Russia, 33, 57, 235, 283-285.
- Commission on Economy and Efficiency of United States, 40, 41, 106, 169.
- Commodities, central supervision of, 264-265.
- Comptroller and Auditor General of Great Britain, 10, 108, 110, 229-230, 269-274.
- Comptroller General of the United States, 41-42, 238-241, 285-290.
- Conference committees, arbitrary authority on budget, 212.
- Congressional governments, powers of chambers, 192.
- Contingent funds, 251-252.
- Coolidge, Calvin, budgetary "policy," 172.
- Copland, D. B., plan for balancing Australian budget, 121-123.
relation of government finance to economic situation, 123.
- Cost accounting, 148, 259.
- Costa Rica, status of budget in, 42-45.
- Council of Labor and Defense (STO) of Soviet Russia, 33, 86.

- Council of People's Commissars (Sov-narkum) of Soviet Russia, 32, 235.
- Cour des Comptes of France, 12-13, 234, 276-279.
- Crédits additionnels*, 220, 221.
- Cuba, status of budget in, 42-45.
- Current budget, 138-140.
- Current planning of budgeted income and outgo, 247-250.
- Czechoslovakia, Advisory Board on Economic Questions, 68.
- democratic upper house, 186.
- fiscal powers of upper house, 191.
- status of budget in, 24-25.
- Dalton, Hugh, political changes and the budget, 69.
- public income defined by, 169-170.
- Davenport, E. H., antiquated parliamentary procedure, 203-204.
- Deadlocks in legislatures, remedies for, 192-193.
- Denmark, capital budget, 139-140.
- equal authority of chambers, 191.
- general budget summary, 134.
- general governmental structure, 22-23.
- "temporary bill of appropriations," 217-218.
- Dictatorial powers in budget making, 86.
- Dictatorship, China, 37.
- Germany, 15-18.
- Italy, 18-20.
- Latin American states, 42-43.
- one-party system aid to, 65.
- post-war European states, 25.
- Dimock, M. E., public utility development and control, 158.
- Director of the Budget, United States, 42, 165, 166, 237-238.
- Dobbert, Gerhard, Soviet system, 53-54.
- Dollfuss, Engelbert, 25.
- Dominican Republic, status of budget in, 42-45.
- Douzièmes provisoires*, 218-219.
- Durell, A. J. V., audit of revenues, 273.
- basis of parliamentary control, 108, 276.
- Comptroller and Auditor General of Great Britain a nonpolitical office, 270.
- status of Comptroller and Auditor General, 230.
- Durham, Lord, proposal for Canadian consolidation, 27.
- East India Company, 29.
- Economic significance of the budget, 70-74.
- Ecuador, status of budget in, 42-45.
- Eggleston, F. W., state undertakings and parliamentary bodies, 157-158.
- Einzig, Paul, Fascism in Italy, 20.
- England, annuality of budget, 130.
- appropriation accounts, 254.
- appropriation and revenue bills, 149, 150-151.
- appropriations contingent upon executive approval, 246.
- appropriations in aid, 147, 220, 262.
- attempted control over expenditures by House of Commons, 108.
- audit system, 56, 268, 269-276.
- beginning and growth of budget in, 6-10.
- budget speech, 131, 132, 198-199.
- budgetary estimates, preparation of, 170-171.
- budgetary responsibility of Chancellor of the Exchequer, 81-82.
- cabinet, 9.
- authority in authorization of budget, 89-90.
- budgetary initiative, 81-82.
- financial powers, 9-10.
- Chancellor of the Exchequer, 5, 9.
- budget speech, 198-199.
- budgetary preparation, 165.
- Treasury head, 227.
- civil contingencies fund, 251-252.
- Committee of Supply, 194.
- procedure, 203-206.
- Committee of Ways and Means, 194.
- procedure, 203.
- Comptroller and Auditor General, audit of expenditures, 272-273.
- audit of revenues, 273.
- functions, 110, 270-274.
- office established, 10, 108.
- power to release funds, 229-230.
- staff, 271.
- test audits, 272.
- verification of accounts, 271-272.
- consolidated fund bill, 218.
- consolidated fund services, 133.
- Controller of Establishments, 227-228, 266.
- Controller of Finance and Supply Services, 227, 266.
- corrective budget of September 1931, 223.
- departmental accounting officers, 228-229.

- England, division of governmental powers, 54-56.
 equilibrium through corrective budget, 123-124.
 estimates, 146-147.
 preparation of, 179-180.
 review and revision of, 182.
 "estimates circular," 171.
 Estimates Committee, 194.
 exchequer account, 254.
 Exchequer and Audit Department, establishment and functions, 270.
 executive authority, growth of, 9.
 executive control over execution of budget, 96.
 executive grants, 251.
 expenditure, procedure for, 263, 264.
 finance bill, 210.
 Financial Secretary to the Treasury, 165, 227.
 "financial statement," 131, 133.
 financial year, 128-129.
 fiscal organization and methods, 226, 227-231.
 form and contents of budget, 131.
 general aspects of budget under parliamentary system, 48-49.
 general governmental structure, 6-10.
 "grievance before supply," 111.
 "grievances," 206.
 "guillotine," 206.
 House of Commons, financial powers, 8-11, 89-90, 103, 108, 189-190.
 self-imposed restrictions on budgetary actions, 89-90, 104-105, 212-213.
 House of Lords, financial powers, 8-9, 189.
 itemization of appropriations, 150-151.
 legal groundwork of budget, 74-75.
 legislative committees concerned with budget, 194.
 legislative veto, 215.
 national accounting system, 254-255.
 Parliament, early rivalry between houses, 8-9.
 parliamentary approval of expenditures, growth of, 7-8.
 parliamentary approval of taxation, growth of, 6-7.
 parliamentary control over expenditures, 269-276.
 party changes and the budget, 69.
- England, Paymaster General, functions of, 261, 263-264.
 Permanent Secretary to the Treasury, 227.
 personnel supervision, 264-265.
 preaudit, 258.
 Public Accounts Committee, 10, 108, 110, 194, 270, 274.
 functions of, 274-276.
 "question hour," 112.
 relation of national income to expenditure, 71.
 restrictions of legislative authority to vote budget, 103, 104-105, 212-213.
 revenue estimating, 177-178.
 revenue measures, 152.
 revenues, assessment and collection of, 260.
 scheme for balancing budget over period of years rejected, 120-121.
 Select Committee on National Expenditure of 1917-1918, 204.
 speaker of House, 193-194.
 "supplementary estimates," 220-221.
 "supply resolutions," 218.
 "supply services," 133.
 system of check on financial operations, 56.
 technical aspects of budget, 77.
 Treasury, as budget staff agency, 165.
 Controller of Establishments, investigation by, 266.
 Controller of Supply Services, investigation by, 266.
 current control of, 249.
 financial control of, 228-229.
 investigation by, 266.
 organization of, 227-228.
 two-party system, 65-66.
 unitary system of government, 58.
 unity of budget, 126.
 virements, use of, 250.
 vote of credit, 221.
 "votes," defined, 146-147.
 "votes on account," 181, 218.
 voting of budget, 209-210.
 "withholding supply," 111-112.
 Estimate blanks, 173.
 Estimates, preparation and assembling of, 179-181.
 review and revision of, 182-184.
 supporting data, 146-149.
 Estimating, ability and integrity required for, 173-174.
 expenditures, 171-175.

- Estimating, revenues, automatic method, 176.
- method of average increases, 176-177.
- method of direct valuation, 177-178.
- Estonia, status of budget in, 24-25.
- unicameral legislature, 188.
- Execution of budget, 225-267.
- Executive, authorization of budget, 87-94.
- complete authority in, 87-89.
- limited authority in, 89-91.
- coöperation with the legislature in budgeting, 106-107.
- improper legislative restrictions on, 244-245.
- needless restrictions on powers of, 97-99.
- position and authority in administration, 95-97.
- rôle in budgeting, 79-99.
- rôle in execution of budget, 94-99.
- rôle in formulation of budget, 79-86.
- status of, in United States with respect to budget making, 84-86.
- veto power in United States over financial measures, 93-94.
- Executive grants, 251.
- Exercise*, 255.
- Expenditures, devices for adjusting actual to authorized, 250-253.
- methods of estimating, 174-175.
- productive and unproductive, 73-74.
- Extraordinary budget, 140-142.
- Fascist Grand Council in budget making, 86, 87.
- Federal finance, 59-65.
- difficulties of, in United States, 60-64, 298-300.
- Federal governments, distribution of financial powers, 58-60.
- relation of national and state budgets, 62-64.
- Federal jurisdiction in financial matters, 59-60.
- Federal subsidies to states, 60-61.
- Financial administration, machinery and methods, 226-244.
- personnel, 225.
- Finland, effect of governmental system on budget, 50.
- status of budget in, 24-25.
- unicameral legislature, 188.
- Fiscal systems, compared, 226-227.
- Fiscal year, 128-129.
- Five-Year Plan of Soviet Russia, 30, 33, 35, 71, 119, 285.
- Flora, F., executive formulation of budget, 80.
- Formulation of budget, 164-184.
- France, accounting system, 255-256.
- annuality of budget, 129.
- appropriations, itemization of, 150.
- audit system, 56, 268-269, 276-279.
- budget annexes*, 142-143.
- budget message, 131, 132.
- budget rectificatif*, 222.
- budgetary development in, 10-13.
- budgetary staff, 165-166.
- Chamber of Deputies, budgetary discussion in, 206-208.
- financial powers, 13, 190-191.
- Committee for the Verification of Accounts of Ministers, 232.
- committee action on budget, 201.
- Compte Général*, 255.
- Conseil d'État, financial functions of, 278.
- contrôleur des dépenses engagées*, 232.
- Cour des Comptes, 12-13, 276-277.
- functions of, 277-279.
- "preventive control" for, 234, 278.
- staff of, 277.
- crédits*, 108, 149.
- crédits additionnels*, 220, 221.
- de Villèle's financial ordinances, 12, 75.
- difficulties in executing budget, 96.
- douzièmes provisoires*, 218-219.
- executive grants, 251.
- exercice*, 255.
- extraordinary budgets, experience with, 140-141.
- failure to vote budget, effect of, 219.
- Finance Committee of Chamber, control over budgetary debate, 207.
- finance committees, 194-195.
- financial year, 128-129.
- form and contents of budget, 131.
- general effect of parliamentary system on budget, 49.
- general governmental structure, 10-13.
- gestion*, 255.
- interpellation, use of, 49, 112.
- legal groundwork of budget, 75.
- legislative action unrestrained on budget, 105.
- legislature, committees handling budget, 194-195.
- formulation of budget in, 100.

- France, *loi de finances*, 149, 150.
 Minister of Finance, 13.
 administrative functions, 231-233.
 budgetary debate by, 207.
 budgetary formulation, 82-83, 165-166.
 current financial control by, 249.
 Minister of the Budget, 13, 82, 231.
 budgetary debate by, 207.
 budgetary preparation, 165-166.
 Ministry's responsibility in budget making, 82-83.
 multi-party system, 66-67.
ordonnateurs, 231.
 Parliament, rivalry between houses, 13.
 party changes and the budget, 69.
 proposals for reform of fiscal administration, 233-234.
 railway system, financing of, 160.
rapporteur général, 108, 194-195.
 administrative duties assigned to, 234.
 handling budget bill, 207.
 relative fiscal authority of chambers, 190-191.
 revenue measures, 152.
 revenues, automatic method of estimating, 176.
 estimating by method of average increases, 176-177.
 Senate, budgetary discussion in, 207-208.
 financial powers of, 13, 190-191.
 political status of, 187.
 system of check on financial operations, 56.
 system of financial administration, 226, 231-234.
 transfers abandoned, 250.
 unitary system of government, 58.
 unlimited budgetary powers of chambers, 92-93.
 Functional classification, 169-171.
- "Gag rule," 203.
 Gambetta, Léon, 13.
 General accounting, 253-258.
 accrual basis, 253-254.
 cash basis, 253-254.
 General Accounting Office of United States, 41-42, 238, 240-241, 257, 285-288.
 Germany, budgetary initiative in, 83.
 Bundesrat, financial powers of, 15.
 Cabinet, financial powers, 16-18, 235.
 Chancellor, budgetary authority, 15-16, 235.
- Germany, corrective budget used during inflationary period, 223.
 evolution of budget in, 13-18.
 executive authorization of budget, 88.
 extraordinary budgets, 141.
 federal system changed to unitary, 58.
 finance committees, 195.
 financial administration, 226, 235.
 general budget summary, 134.
 general governmental structure, 13-18.
 Minister of Finance, authority of, 235.
 current control by, 249.
 National Economic Council, 17, 68, 189.
 National Railway Company, financing of, 159-160.
 one-party system, 65.
 Rechnungshof, 15, 18.
 functions of, 280-281.
 organization of, 279-280.
 Reichsrat, financial powers, 16-17, 191.
 Reichstag, financial powers, 16-18, 191-192.
 transfers permitted, 250.
- Gestion*, 255.
 Gladstone, William E., budget speeches, 198.
 established Comptroller and Auditor General's office, 10, 108.
 established Public Accounts Committee, 10, 108.
 favored gross budgets, 135, 136.
 formula for executive accountability on budget, 110.
 parliamentary control of expenditures, 269-270.
 social significance of budget, 70.
 Gosplan (State Planning Commission) of Soviet Russia, 33, 86.
 Government, common methods of financing, 3.
 development of the budget in, 6-45.
 federal form, 58-61.
 general structure in various countries, 6-45.
 monetary needs of, 1-2.
 monopolies, 155.
 process of raising and spending money, 2-3.
 unitary form, 57-58.
 Government-owned corporations, 156-157.
 Government-owned railways, financing of, 145, 159-162.

- Grand Council of the Fascist Party, Italy, 18-19, 57.
- Great Britain (*see* England).
- Greece, status of budget in, 24-25.
- "Grievance before supply," 111.
- Gross budget, 135-138.
- Guatemala, status of budget in, 42-45.
- "Guillotine," 206.
- Haig, Robert M., French accounts disorganized, 255-256.
- Haiti, status of budget in, 42-45.
- Hamilton, Alexander, financial procedure indicated by, 37-38.
- money indispensable to government, 1.
- organizer of Treasury Department, 237.
- work as first Secretary of the Treasury, 38.
- Harding, Warren G., approved national budget and accounting act, 41.
- Hawtrey, R. G., critical of independent budgets, 145.
- legislative veto, 215.
- Heckel, Max von, executive formulation of budget, 80.
- Higgs, Henry, cabinet prestige in budget making, 105.
- executive formulation of budget, 80.
- Hills, John Waller, account of budget speech, 198-199.
- condemns extraordinary budgets, 140.
- departmental accounting officers, 229.
- estimates, 180.
- Estimates Committee, 194.
- investigation by English Treasury, 266.
- lack of capital account in Great Britain, 139.
- Public Accounts Committee, value of, 275-276.
- revision of estimates, 182.
- special funds and appropriations ought to be abolished, 262.
- Treasury agencies, 228.
- value of administrative audit, 274.
- Hindenburg, Paul von, 16 n., 88.
- Hitler, Adolf, 15-18.
- reorganized National Economic Council of Germany, 17, 189.
- Holcombe, A. N., 65.
- Holland (*see* Netherlands).
- Honduras, status of budget in, 42-45.
- Hoover, Herbert, accounting and auditing work, proposed reorganization of, 292.
- administration criticized, 70.
- discontinued preliminary estimates, 172-173.
- economy clubs forgotten, 267.
- fiscal reorganization proposed, 242.
- Hungary, budgetary status, 25.
- general budget summary, 134.
- Improvement budget, 138.
- Independent budgets, 144-146.
- India, East India Company, 29.
- general governmental structure, 29-30.
- railway system, financing of, 161-162.
- Interpellation, 112.
- Irish Free State, financial powers of chambers, 190.
- general governmental structure, 29.
- Italy, check on governmental operations, 57.
- "corporative state," 20.
- corrective budget discontinued, 223.
- Council of Corporations, 189.
- Court of Accounts, 279.
- executive authorization of budget, 87-88.
- extraordinary budgets, 141.
- Fascist Grand Council, 18-19, 57.
- in budget making, 86, 87.
- Fascist system, effect of, on budget, 52-53.
- financial administration, 234.
- formulation of budget, 86.
- general governmental structure, 18-20.
- one-party system, 65.
- Parliament, financial powers of, 18-19.
- relation of national income to expenditure, 71.
- unitary system of government, 58.
- Voluntary Militia for National Security, 57, 279.
- Ito, Hirobumi, author of Japanese constitution, 36, 281.
- Japan, Board of Audit, 36, 281-283.
- budget speech, 199.
- budgetary initiative in, 83.
- Cabinet responsibility in budgetary matters, 51.
- conference committees, 211.
- contingent fund, 252.
- development of budget in, 35-36.
- Diet, fiscal powers of, 191.

- Japan, Diet, restrictions on budgetary action of, 213.
 executive authority in authorization of budget, 90.
 failure to vote budget, provision against, 219-220.
 finance committees, 195.
 financial administration, 226, 236-237.
 Financial Department, organization of, 236.
 general governmental structure, 35-36.
 Minister of Finance, current control by, 249.
 functions, 236.
 "preliminary" estimates, 180.
 supplementary budget used, 223-224.
 transfers permitted, 250.
 unitary system of government, 58.
- Jéze, Gaston, annexed budgets, 143.
 budget a political program, 70.
 budgetary powers of French chambers, 92.
 control of expenditures in France ineffective, 232-233.
 development of the French budget, 11-12.
 evolution of German budget, 14.
 executive grants reduce parliamentary control, 251.
 formulation of budget by executive, 80.
 legislative formulation of budget in France, 100.
 legislative irresponsibility, 101.
 "minister of budgetary balance," 164.
 Minister of the Budget, a political office, 231.
 proposes extending powers of Minister of Finance, 233.
 universality and unity of budget, 126.
 verification of accounts by Cour ineffective, 278.
- Keith, A. B., Australian Senate, 188.
- Kentucky, failure to vote budget, provision against, 220.
- Laski, H. J., 4.
- Latin America, budgetary initiative in, 86.
 financial investigations of governments, 44.
 general structure of governments, 42-45.
- Latin America, status of budget in, 42-45.
- Latvia, status of budget in, 24-25.
 unicameral legislature, 188.
- League of Nations, capital budget, 140.
 supervision of Roumanian budget, 25.
- Lees-Smith, H. B., Canadian Senate, 187.
 English party system, 66.
- Legal groundwork of the budget, 74-76.
- Legislature, and authorization of budget, 102-107.
 bicameral system, 186-193.
 committee of the whole on budget, 203-205.
 committee systems, 194-198.
 conference committees and the budget, 211-212.
 consideration of budget, 200-209.
 coöperation with the executive in budgeting, 106-107.
 deadlocks, 192-193.
 effect on budget, 219-220.
 discussion of budget in, 205-209.
 execution of budget, attempts at control over, 108-110.
 extent of authority in determining the budget, 102-104.
 formulation of budget, participation in, 100-102.
 functional representation proposed, 188-189.
 internal organization, 193-198.
 organization in relation to budgeting, 186-198.
 refusal or failure to vote budget, 219-220.
 relative authority of chambers, 189-193.
 restrictions on budgetary action, 212-215.
 rôle in enforcing accountability for budget, 110-113.
 rôle of, in budgeting, 100-113.
 speaker, choice of, 193-194.
 special appropriation bills, restrictions on, 213-214.
 submission of budget to, 198-200.
 unicameral system, 188-189.
 voting of budget, 209-216.
- Leland, S. E., needs of federal fiscal system, 300.
 proposal for balancing budget by economic cycles, 118-120.
- Lenin, leadership in organization of Soviet Russia, 30-31.

- Lippmann, Walter, American government in crisis, how to make it work, 301-302.
- Lithuania, status of budget in, 24-25. unicameral legislature, 188.
- Lloyd George, David, 69.
- "Logrolling," 39, 203.
- Long-term financial planning, 119-120, 139.
- MacDonald, Ramsay, 69.
- Madden, Martin B., need for congressional committee on audit of expenditures, 289.
- Magna Carta, 6-7.
- Maitland, F. W., origin of English Cabinet, 9.
- Marriott, John A. R., 50.
- Marx, Karl, 30.
- Maryland, budget amendment, 90-91. provision in, for legislative-executive cooperation, 107.
- budget speech, proposed procedure for, 199-200.
- executive budgetary proposals, weight of, 90-91.
- general budget summary, 135.
- legal provisions for budget system, 75.
- legislative veto, 215.
- limitations on legislative authority to vote budget, 103-104.
- restrictions on budgetary action of legislature, 213-214.
- special appropriation bills, restrictions on, 214.
- supplementary budget, provision for, 224.
- Massachusetts, general budget summary, 135.
- special appropriation bills, restrictions on, 214.
- supplementary budget, provision for, 224.
- Mexico, federal form of government, 58. status of budget in, 42-45.
- Middleton, W. L., fiscal powers of French Senate, 190-191.
- non-party statesmen in France, 67.
- powers of Finance Committee of French Chamber, 195.
- Ministerial powers in budget making, 81-83.
- "Mixed" enterprises, 157.
- Money, indispensable to government, 1. process by which raised for government, 2-3.
- required for the support of government, 1-2.
- Money bills, 149.
- Montesquieu doctrine of separation of powers, 54.
- as applied in Sweden, 22.
- Muir, Ramsay, Cabinet responsibility, 204-205.
- Committee of Ways and Means, 203.
- Municipally owned utilities, financing of, 162-163.
- Mussolini, Benito, 18-20, 71.
- powers in formulating Italian budget, 86.
- National budget and accounting act, United States, 75.
- National Economic Council, Germany, 17.
- National Recovery Administration (NRA), United States, 60, 68.
- Necker, *compte rendu*, 12.
- Net budget, 135-138.
- Netherlands, development of budget in, 21.
- financial administration, 234.
- weak upper house, 191.
- Neumark, Fritz, evolution of German budget, 14.
- New Deal, 60, 65.
- extraordinary budgets under, 141.
- New South Wales, Australia, indebtedness, 64.
- public utility control, 158-159.
- New York, budget amendment, 90-91.
- budget speech, proposed procedure for, 199-200.
- executive budgetary proposals, weight of, 90-91.
- general budget summary, 135.
- legal provisions for budget system, 76.
- legislative veto, 215.
- limitations on legislative authority to vote budget, 103-104.
- provision in budget amendment for legislative-executive cooperation, 107.
- restrictions on budgetary action of legislature, 213-214.
- special appropriation bills, restrictions on, 214.
- New York Bureau of Municipal Research, 107, 169.
- New Zealand, general governmental structure, 28.
- Nicaragua, status of budget in, 42-45.
- Nitti, Francesco, executive formulation of budget, 80.

- North Carolina, general budget summary, 135.
- Norway, capital budget, 139, 140.
 general budget summary, 134.
 general governmental structure, 23.
 unicameral legislature in effect, 188.
- Ohio, general budget summary, 135.
 Operating budget, 138.
 Ordinary budget, 140-142.
- Panama, status of budget in, 42-45.
- Paraguay, status of budget in, 42-45.
- Party systems, effect on budget, 65-67.
- Pennsylvania, general budget summary, 135.
- Peru, status of budget in, 42-45.
- Philippines, failure to vote budget, provisions against, 220.
- Pilsudski, Marshal, 25.
- Pitt, William, budget speech, 198.
- Poland, executive authorization of budget by decree, 88.
 failure to vote budget, provision against, 219.
 status of budget in, 24-25.
- Political ideas and patterns, how they affect the budget, 48-57.
- Political parties and the budget, 65-70.
- "Pork barrel" in United States Congress, 39.
- Porto Rico, failure to vote budget, provision against, 220.
- Portugal, status of budget in, 25-26.
- Postal services, financing in relation to budget, 143, 145-146, 156.
- Postaudit, 259, 268-285.
- Preaudit, 258-259.
- Presidential powers in framing the budget, 84-86.
- Prussia, early budgeting in, 14.
 Landtag, financial powers of, 14.
- Public Accounts Committee of Great Britain, 10, 108, 110, 194, 270, 274-276.
- Public economy, research and investigation looking toward, 265-267.
- Public enterprises, methods of budgeting, 152-154.
 variety, organization, and financing of, 154-163.
- Public funds, methodical handling of, 259-264.
- Public undertakings, budgetary autonomy of, 143-146.
- "Question hour," 112.
- Rabkrin (Commissariat for Workers' and Peasants' Inspection) of Soviet Russia, 33, 57, 283-285.
- Rechnungshof, Germany, 15, 18, 279-281.
- Reconstruction Finance Corporation (RFC), United States, 60, 157.
- Revenue bills, 149, 151-152.
- Revenues, methods of estimating, 175-179.
- Rhode Island, executive authorization of budget, 88-89.
 failure to vote budget, provision against, 220.
- Rogers, Lindsay, senatorial investigations, 113.
- Roosevelt, Franklin D., administration relative to depression, 59-60, 64-65.
 budgetary proposals to Congress, 52.
 centralization of disbursement in Treasury division, 264.
 efforts to balance budget, 124-125.
 "emergency" budget, 141-142.
 financial reorganization, 242-243.
 national program, 72-73.
 personnel and procurement regulations, 265.
 proposals for balanced budget, 70.
 revived preliminary estimates, 173.
- Roumania, status of budget in, 24-25.
- Salvador, status of budget in, 42-45.
- Scandinavian states, auditing systems, 276.
- Seidler, G., executive formulation of the budget, 80.
- Seligman, E. R. A., proposal for integrating national and state tax systems, 62-63.
- Separation of powers, application in United States, result of, 91, 96, 300-302.
 relative to budget, 54-57.
- Services, personal and contractual, central supervision of, 264-265.
- Shann, E. O. G., plan for balancing Australian budget, 121-123.
- Shirras, G. Findlay, executive formulation of budget, 80.
- Smith, Alfred E., report to people of New York State on budget, 216.
- Snowden, Philip, budgetary equilibrium, 115.
 corrective budget of 1931, 123-124.
- Social significance of the budget, 70-74.

- South Africa, financial powers of chambers, 190.
 general governmental structure, 28-29.
 railway system, financing of, 161-162.
- Soviet Russia, All-Union Central Soviet Committee (TsIK), 31-32, 88.
 All-Union Soviet Congress, 31.
 budget not submitted to, 88.
 audit system, 269, 283-285.
 Central Committee of Communist Party, 34, 53, 56.
 auditing supervision, 283-285.
 check on governmental operations, 56-57.
 Commissar for Finance, functions, 86, 235-236.
 Commissariat for Finance, 34, 235-236.
 Commissariat for Workers' and Peasants' Inspection (Rabkrin), 33, 57, 235, 283-285.
 Council of Labor and Defense (STO), 33, 86.
 Council of People's Commissars (Sovnarkum), 32, 235.
 effect of governmental system on budget, 53-54.
 executive authorization of budget, 88.
 financial administration, 226, 235-236.
 Five-Year Plan, 30, 33, 35, 71, 119, 285.
 formulation of budget in, 86.
 general governmental structure, 30-35.
 Gosplan (State Planning Commission), 33, 86.
 Lenin's leadership, 30-31.
 no separation of governmental powers, 55.
 one-party system, 65.
 Piatiletka (Five-Year Plan), 285.
 Political Bureau of the Communist Party, 34, 86.
 Presidium, 32, 88.
 Rabkrin (Commissariat for Workers' and Peasants' Inspection), 33, 57, 235, 283-285.
 relation of national income to expenditure, 71-72.
 Sovnarkum (Council of People's Commissars), 32, 235.
 State Planning Commission (Gosplan), 33, 86.
- Soviet Russia, STO (Council of Labor and Defense), 33, 86.
 Supreme Economic Council, 32-33.
 TsIK (All-Union Central Soviet Committee), 31-32, 88.
 unitary system of government, 58.
 Spain, status of budget in, 25-26.
 unicameral legislature, 188.
 Special appropriation bills, restrictions on, 213-214.
 Special legislative investigation, 112-113.
 Staff agencies for preparation of budget, 165-167.
 Stalin, general secretary of Communist Party's Central Committee, 34.
 successor of Lenin, 30.
 State Planning Commission (Gosplan) of Soviet Russia, 33, 86.
 Stein, L. von, executive formulation of budget, 80.
 STO (Council of Labor and Defense) of Soviet Russia, 33, 86.
 Story, Joseph, executive compromise, 39.
 Stourm, René, annexed budgets, 142.
 automatic method of estimating revenues, 176, 177.
 "budget prerogative," 46.
 budgetary estimating, 174.
 condemns extraordinary budgets, 140, 141.
crédits additionnels, 221.
 development of the French budget, 10-11.
douzièmes provisoires result of parliamentary disorder, 218.
 duties of Minister of Finance, 231-232.
 execution of budget, 94.
 financial year and budget, 128-129.
 formulation of budget by executive, 80.
 opposed to legislative control of fiscal administration, 233-234.
 proposed "preventive control" for French Cour, 274.
 result of failure to vote budget, 220.
 stages of budgetary procedure, 47.
 universality and unity of budget, 126.
- Stubbs, William, 7.
 Subsidiary budgets, 142-144.
 Sully, *état du roi*, 12.
 Supreme Economic Council of Soviet Russia, 32-33.
 Sweden, capital budget, 139-140.

- Sweden, effect of parliamentary system on budget, 50.
 equal powers of chambers, 191.
 general budget summary, 134.
 general governmental structure, 22.
 growth of budget in, 21-22.
 method of resolving disagreements between chambers, 191, 193.
- Switzerland, auditing system, 276.
 budgetary initiative in, 83.
 conference committees, 211.
 effect of governmental system on budget, 50-51.
 equal powers of chambers, 191.
 federal system of government, 58-62.
 finances under federal system, 60-62.
 financial administration, 234.
 general governmental structure, 23-24.
 railway system, budgeting of, 160-161.
 unicameral legislatures in cantons, 188.
- Taft, William Howard, budget sent to Congress in 1913, 40.
 Commission on Economy and Efficiency, 40, 41, 169.
 executive-legislative cooperation, 106-107.
- Tardieu, André, parliamentary reform in France, 105.
- Technical aspects of the budget, 76-77.
- Tennessee Valley Authority (TVA), budgeting of, 144, 157.
- Transfers, 250-251.
- Treasury functions, 261-264.
- Turkey, status of budget in, 24-25.
 unicameral legislature, 188.
- Unbalanced budget, political and economic consequences of, 115.
- Unicameral system, 188-189.
- United States, accounting statements, use of, in budget, 148-149.
 Alaskan Railway, budgeting of, 144.
 annuality of budget, 127-128.
 anti-deficiency act, 75, 221-222.
 appropriation bills, 150-151.
 balancing budget, formula for, 117.
 bicameral legislative system, effect on budgeting, 303-304.
 budget, form and contents of, 131-132.
 budget message, 132-133.
 budget speech, suggested procedure for, 200.
- United States, budgetary estimates, preparation of, 172-173.
 budgetary initiative in, 84-86.
 budgetary methods, suggestions for improving, 305-311.
 budgetary staffs, 166-167.
 Bureau of the Budget, 42.
 investigation by, 266.
 organization of, 237-238.
 staff agency, 166.
 Bureau of the Census, 63.
 Bureau of Efficiency abolished, 243.
 capital budget, 139.
 classification of expenditures, 170-171.
 classification of income, 169-170.
 Commission on Economy and Efficiency, 40, 41, 106, 169.
 committee action on budget, 201-202.
 committee of the whole, use of, 205.
 comprehensiveness of budget, lack of, 126-127.
 Comptroller General, auditing functions of, 286-288.
 authority of, 238-241.
 inconsistent position of, 239.
 investigation for Congress, 288.
 nature of audit by, 238-239.
 office created, 41-42.
 conference committees in handling budget, 211-212.
 Congress, attempt at financial control, 245.
 beginning of committee system, 38-39.
 budgetary debate, 208-209.
 introduction of budget in, 200-201.
 "logrolling," 39.
 "pork barrel," 39.
 provided for national budget system, 41.
 congressional committee system for handling the budget, 195-197.
 congressional committee to review audit, desirability of, 292-294.
 contingent funds, 252.
 continuing appropriations, 130.
 cost accounting an aid to budgeting, 148, 259.
 deficiency appropriations, 220-222.
 departmental accounting offices, 241-242.
 development of budget in, 37-42.
 "Digest of Appropriations," 216.
 Director of the Budget, duties, 237-238.
 responsibility, 165, 166.

- United States, disbursement procedure, 263-264.
- effective auditing system for, 290-296.
- estimates, 147-148.
 - review and revision, 182-183.
- executive budgetary proposals, weight of, 90-93.
- executive grants not used, 251.
- executive-legislative relationship, 39-40.
- executive veto, effect on legislative action, 214-215.
- expenditure procedure, 263, 264.
- extraordinary budget under New Deal, 141-142.
- failure of Congress to establish accountability for budget, 111.
- Federal Coordinating Service eliminated, 243.
- federal subsidies to states, 60-61.
- federal system of government, 58-65.
- finance committees in state legislatures, 197-198, 202-203.
- finances under federal system, 59-65.
- financial administration, 226-227, 237-243.
- fiscal year, 128-129.
- flexible sources of revenue, 152.
- formulation of budget, status of executive with respect to, 84-86.
- "gag rule," 203.
- general accounting emphasis, 148.
- General Accounting Office, account keeping, 240, 288.
 - created, 41-42.
 - failure to develop system of accounting, 257.
 - functions of, 286-288.
 - organization and staff, 285-286.
 - settlement of claims due the government, 287-288.
 - settlement of expenditure claims, 287.
 - status of, 238, 241.
- general governmental structure, 37-42.
- Government Printing Office, budgeting of, 144.
- gross budgets, 137-138.
- growth of budget in state governments, 40-41.
- handicaps to budgetary development in, 298-305.
- Hoover's proposed reorganization of accounting and auditing work, 292.
- United States, House Committee on Accounts, 197, 295.
 - House Committee on Appropriations, organization of, 195-196.
 - working of, 201-202, 208-209.
 - House Committee on Expenditures in the Executive Departments, 197, 295.
 - House Committee on Ways and Means, organization of, 196.
 - working of, 202.
 - House "five-minute rule," 208.
 - improper legislative restrictions on executive, 244-245.
 - itemization of appropriations, 150, 151.
 - lack of adequate audit system, 57.
 - lack of adequate system of check on financial operations, 57.
 - lack of cooperation between Congress and President on budgetary matters, 51-52.
 - lack of party responsibility a handicap to budgeting, 304-305.
 - legal groundwork of budget, 75-76.
 - legislative attempts to control budgetary execution, 109.
 - legislative-executive cooperation in budgeting, 302.
 - legislative formulation of budget in, 100.
 - legislative veto, 215.
 - limitations on legislative authority to vote budget, 103-104.
 - "logrolling," 203.
 - long-term financial planning, 119, 139.
 - national accounting system, 256-258.
 - national and state tax systems, integration of, 62-63.
 - national audit scheme a makeshift, 285-290.
 - national budget, general summary statement, 134.
 - national budget and accounting act, 75.
 - national expenditures, 73-74.
 - National Recovery Administration (NRA), 60, 68.
 - net budgets, 137-138.
 - New Deal, 60, 65.
 - ordinary and extraordinary budgets, 125.
 - outlook for budget in, 297-311.
 - outlook for unicameral legislatures in the states, 303.

- United States, Panama Canal and Railway, budgeting of, 144.
- party changes and the budget, 69-70.
- party control, 301.
- permanent appropriations, 130.
- personnel supervision as emergency measure, 265.
- "pork barrel," 104.
- Post Office Department, budgeting of, 144, 156.
- practice of mandatory appropriations, 246-247.
- preaudit, 258-259.
- "preliminary" estimates, 180.
- productive and unproductive expenditures, 73-74.
- proposal for a General Auditing Office, 294-295.
- proposal for a Joint Congressional Committee on Public Accounts, 295-296.
- public enterprises, annexed budgets preferable for, 153-154.
- public undertakings, lack of policy in budgeting, 146.
- publicity concerning budget as adopted, 215-216.
- Reconstruction Finance Corporation (RFC), 60, 157. •
- borrowing power extended, 124.
- relation of national and state budgets, 62-64.
- relation of national income to expenditure, 70-71.
- restrictions on budgetary action of state legislatures, 213-215.
- revenue estimates, preparation of, 175, 177-179.
- revenue measures, 152.
- revenues, assessment and collection of, 260-261.
- rigid federal structure a handicap to budgeting, 298-300.
- Secretary of the Treasury, status of, 237.
- Senate, fiscal powers of, 192.
- handling appropriation bills, 209.
- status of, 187.
- Senate Committee on Appropriations, organization of, 196.
- working of, 202.
- Senate Committee on Expenditures in the Executive Departments, 197, 295.
- Senate Committee on Finance, organization of, 196.
- working of, 202.
- United States, senatorial investigations, 112-113.
- separation of governmental powers, 54-57.
- effect on budgeting, 300-302.
- result of application, 91, 96.
- speaker of House, choice of, 193-194.
- special appropriation bills, restrictions on, in Congress, 214.
- special funds created, 262.
- standing committee system, shortcomings of, 203.
- state and local expenditures, 74.
- state finance departments, 243-244.
- state supervision of local finances, 64-65.
- supplementary budget, provision for, 224.
- technical aspects of budget, 76-77.
- Tennessee Valley Authority (TVA), budgeting of, 144, 157.
- transfers, use limited, 250-251.
- Treasury Department, Division of Bookkeeping and Warrants, 258.
- Division of Disbursement created, 242-243, 264.
- general accounting system, 257-258.
- organization and functions, 237, 241-244.
- Procurement Division created, 242-243, 265.
- "treasury warrants," 261.
- 20th amendment, so-called "lame duck," 181.
- two-party system, 66.
- unbalanced budgets, 124-125.
- veto power of executive over financial measures, 93-94.
- voting of appropriation and revenue proposals, 209-210.
- Uruguay, status of budget in, 42-45.
- Venezuela, federal form of government, 58.
- status of budget in, 42-45.
- Veto power of executive over budgetary measures, 93-94.
- Villèle, de, financial ordinances for France, 12, 75.
- rules of universality and unity, 126.
- Virements, 250-251.
- Votes on account, 218.
- Wagner, A., executive formulation of budget, 80.

- Walpole, Robert, first prime minister of England, 5, 9.
- Webb, Sidney, anarchy of local autonomy, 64.
- Soviet system, 34, 35.
- White, L. D., growth of executive leadership in the United States, 306.
- Willoughby, W. F., annexed budgets applied in United States, 144.
- balanced budget, 114.
- congressional finance committees, 197.
- defense of Comptroller General's rôle, 239-240.
- defense of functions of Comptroller General, 291-292.
- desirability of a congressional committee on public accounts, 293-294.
- executive formulation of budget, 80.
- national accounting system, criticism of, 257.
- presenting estimates in budget, 148.
- proposal for department of general administration, 243.
- purpose of General Accounting Office, 286.
- revenue-collecting organization, 260.
- stages of budgetary procedure, 47.
- status of Budget Director, 166.
- Wilson, Woodrow, veto of national budget and accounting act, 41, 195.
- "Withholding supply," 111-112.
- Work program, 248.
- Young, E. Milton, annuity of budget, 130.
- budgetary functions of Chancellor of the Exchequer, 82.
- budgetary initiative by Cabinet, 81.
- check on spending officers, 110-111.
- checking of accounts, 272.
- continental accounting system, criticism of, 256.
- epitome of British fiscal system, 230-231.
- "estimates circular," 171-172.
- Estimates Committee, 194.
- executive formulation of budget, 80.
- executive responsibility for determination of budget, 89.
- "grievance before supply," 111-112.
- parliamentary control of expenditures, 269.
- parliamentary discussion of budget, 206.
- personnel of financial administration, 225.
- Public Accounts Committee, weight of authority of, 275.
- revenue estimating, 177-178.
- review of estimate, 182.
- supplementary estimates, 220, 221.
- transfers approved, 250.
- unity of English budget, 126.
- value of internal administrative audit, 274.
- votes on account, 218.
- voting tax measures, 210.
- Yugoslavia, abolished unicameral legislature, 188.
- status of budget in, 24-25.

CHECKED
A000-04

**SERVANTS OF INDIA SOCIETY'S LIBRARY
POONA 4.**

1. Books taken from the Library may not be retained for more than a fortnight.
2. Borrowers will be held strictly responsible for any damage done to books while the books are in their possession.