

## TABLE OF CONTENTS.

	Page
1. Letter from the Government of India to the Secretary of State for India, No. 1, Home (Reforms), dated March 5, 1919.	
PRELIMINARY.	
1. Introductory ... ..	1
2. Reception of the Report ... ..	1
3. Indian opinion ... ..	1
4. Non-official European opinion ... ..	2
5. Official opinion ... ..	2
6. Local Governments' opinions ... ..	3
7. Position of the Government of India ... ..	3
8. Scope of this despatch ... ..	4
TYPES OF GOVERNMENT.	
9. Case for a dual executive ... ..	4
10. The aim and the conditions ... ..	4
11. Essential features of the Report ... ..	5
12. Division accepted in principle ... ..	5
13. Alternative methods of division ... ..	5
UNIFIED GOVERNMENT.	
14. Typical unified Government ... ..	6
15. Criticism of such a plan ... ..	6
16. Conference with Local Governments ... ..	6
17. Majority minute by Heads of Provinces ... ..	7
18. Unified Government proposed therein ... ..	7
19. Its suggested working ... ..	7
20. Our criticisms—	
(1) of principle ... ..	7
(2) of working—	
(a) not really unified government ... ..	8
(b) excessive dependence on certificate power ... ..	8
(c) progress not secured... ..	8
24. Minority minute ... ..	9
DUALISED GOVERNMENT.	
25. Dualism definitely accepted ... ..	9
26. Its limitations need examination ... ..	9
27. Typically dual government ... ..	10
28. Tested by suggested criteria ... ..	10
29. Dualism—	
(1) in legislature ... ..	10
(2) in executive ... ..	11
(3) in administration ... ..	11
(4) in finance ... ..	11
33. Summary of the arguments ... ..	11
THE PROVINCIAL GOVERNMENTS.	
34. Questions of demarcation reserved ... ..	11
35. Appointment of Governors ... ..	12
36. Their pay and status ... ..	12
37. Composition of executive: <i>advisi</i> dropped ... ..	12
38. Council to be strengthened if Governor lacks Indian experience ... ..	13
39. Qualifications for council ... ..	13
40. Appointment of ministers ... ..	13
41. Their number and pay ... ..	14
42. Working of the new Governments: three common elements ... ..	14
THE PUBLIC SERVICES.	
43. General considerations ... ..	15
44. Need for legislation ... ..	15
45. The All-India services ... ..	16
46. No option as to service under Ministers ... ..	16
47. Possible difficulties ... ..	16
48. Their mitigation or settlement ... ..	17
49. Modifications in the Report ... ..	17
50. All-India services: proposals summarised ... ..	18
51. Officers serving with both parts of Government ... ..	18
52. Provincial services: organization ... ..	18
53. Provincial services: administration ... ..	19
54. Subordinate services ... ..	19
55. Public service commission ... ..	19

PROVINCIAL FINANCE.		Page.
56. Vital importance of financial system	... ..	19
57. Three leading principles	... ..	20
RELAXATION OF EXTERNAL CONTROL.		
58. Resulting position	... ..	21
59. Provincial expenditure	... ..	21
60. Provincial revenues	... ..	22
61. Committee on financial relations	... ..	23
62. Provincial taxation and borrowing	... ..	23
63. Provincial balances	... ..	24
PROVISION OF SUPPLY.		
64. Allocation of resources	... ..	25
65. Our difficulties	... ..	25
66. In the matter of balances	... ..	26
67. In the matter of taxation	... ..	26
68. In the matter of borrowing	... ..	27
69. Report scheme abandoned	... ..	27
70. Our proposals: separate purse	... ..	28
71. Periodic adjustments	... ..	29
72. Arrangements for taxation and borrowing	... ..	30
73. Provincial budget	... ..	30
TREASURY CONTROL.		
74. Joint treasury	... ..	31
75. Its working	... ..	32
CONTROL BY LEGISLATURE.		
76. Public accounts committee	... ..	33
THE AUDIT.		
77. Audit system	... ..	33
78. Audit reports	... ..	34
LEGISLATIVE ARRANGEMENTS.		
79. Grand Committee plan approved	... ..	35
80. Modification proposed of composition	... ..	35
81. Certificate in reserved subjects	... ..	35
82. Proposed appeal set aside	... ..	36
83. Mixed legislation	... ..	36
84. Assent, dissolution, etc.	... ..	37
85. Upper houses	... ..	37
86. Presidency of the legislative councils	... ..	37
87. Rules of business	... ..	38
88. Use of the vernacular	... ..	38
89. Questions, resolutions and privilege	... ..	38
90. Official members' vote	... ..	39
91. Effect of resolutions	... ..	39
92. Standing committees	... ..	39
93. Council under-secretaries	... ..	40
THE GOVERNOR IN COUNCIL.		
94. The Governor in Council: administration	... ..	40
95. Legislation	... ..	41
96. Supply	... ..	41
THE GOVERNOR AND MINISTERS.		
97. Rules of business	... ..	41
98. Relations with legislation	... ..	42
99. Legislation	... ..	42
100. Supply	... ..	42
101. Governor in relation to ministers	... ..	42
102. Settlement of differences	... ..	43
JOINT WORKING OF THE TWO PARTS OF GOVERNMENT.		
103. Cases concerning both parts	... ..	44
104. Cases of doubtful jurisdiction	... ..	44
105. Consequential orders	... ..	44
106. Clearer definition of responsibilities	... ..	44

	Page.
107. Limitations on "united front" ... ..	45
108. Review of these proposals ... ..	45
109. Summary ... ..	45
110. Future consequences ... ..	46

## FUTURE CHANGES.

111. Changes after five years deprecated ... ..	46
112. Periodic commissions... ..	47

## THE GOVERNMENT OF INDIA.

113. The executive ... ..	47
114. Composition of Assembly ... ..	48
115. Official members, etc. ... ..	48
116. Composition of Council of State ... ..	49
117. Legislative arrangements ... ..	50
118. Assent, dissolution, etc. ... ..	50
119. Privy Council ... ..	51
120. Standing Committees ... ..	51
121. Council under-secretaries ... ..	51

## THE SECRETARY OF STATE.

122. Changes in control ... ..	52
123. India Office ... ..	53
124. Princes and Chiefs ... ..	53
125. Miscellaneous ... ..	53
126. Conclusion ... ..	54
127. Postscript ... ..	54

## ANNEXURES TO No. 1.

1. Minute by His Excellency the Viceroy, dated March 5, 1919 ... ..	54
2. Minute of Dissent by Sir C. Sankaran Nair, dated March 5, 1919 ... ..	58
1. Criticism of the scope of the policy examined ... ..	58
2. Criticism that the policy with the scheme thereunder should not be introduced in India, being foreign to the genius of the people, examined ... ..	58
3-5. Democratic Governments in India ... ..	59
6. The scheme concerning the Government in the Provinces explained ... ..	60
7. The reasons for the modifications now suggested by my Colleagues ... ..	61
8-9. The Indian National Congress, its <i>raison d'être</i> , the reforms advocated by it ... ..	61
10-11. The demand for Reform general ... ..	62
12. The necessity for Reform ... ..	63
13-20. Criticisms of the proposals of my Colleagues regarding "Transferred" Departments ... ..	64
21-28. Criticisms of the proposals of my Colleagues concerning "Reserved" Subjects ... ..	67
29. Grand Committees ... ..	71
30. Governors ... ..	72
31. Member of the Executive Council ... ..	73
32. Rules of Business ... ..	73
33. The Government of India ... ..	73
34. The Council of State ... ..	74
35. Budget ... ..	75
36. Parliamentary Under-Secretaries or the Standing Committees ... ..	75
37. Viceroy's Executive Council ... ..	75
Appendix—Champan Ryots Case. The Kaira Case ... ..	76

## ENCLOSURES IN No. 1.

1. His Excellency the Viceroy's address to Heads of Provinces, dated January 13, 1919 ... ..	78
2. Minute by the Lieutenant-Governors of the United Provinces, Punjab and Burma, and the Chief Commissioners of the Central Provinces and Assam, dated January 15, 1919. ... ..	80
3. Minute by the Governor of Bengal and the Lieutenant-Governor of Bihar and Orissa, dated January 16, 1919 ... ..	84
4. Minute by the Governor of Bombay, dated February, 1919 ... ..	85
5. Extract from a speech by His Excellency the Viceroy in the Indian Legislative Council, February 6, 1919 ... ..	86
6. Report by non-official members of the Indian Legislative Council, dated September, 1918 ... ..	88
Members present at meetings of the Committee ... ..	91
Extracts from Resolutions of the Indian National Congress at Lucknow, in December, 1916, regarding the representation of Muhammadans ... ..	92
Minutes of Dissent ... ..	92
7. Resolutions of the 33rd Indian National Congress held at Delhi, December, 1918... ..	96
8. Memorandum by the Bombay Branch of the Home Rule League ... ..	100
9. Resolutions and Memorandum by the All-India Landholders' Association, dated September, 1918 ... ..	115
10. Memorial addressed to His Excellency the Viceroy by certain members of the Indian Legislative Council, dated September 23, 1918 ... ..	121

Enclosures in No. 1.—(cont.)

	Page.
11. Memorandum by the All-India Muslim Association, dated November 25, 1918	123
12. Memorandum by the Hon. Sir D. E. Wacha and others	128
13. Resolutions of the Special Congress held in Bombay, August-September, 1918	138
14. Resolutions of the Moderate Conference held in Bombay, November, 1918	142
15. Manifesto issued by the Moderate Party, January, 1919	146
16. European Association's final statement on the reforms scheme	147
17 and 17a. Circular letters to Local Governments, Nos. 950 and 951, dated July 15, 1918	157, 158

OPINIONS OF LOCAL GOVERNMENTS.

Replies to Nos. 17 and 17a :—

18.	Madras, Government of.	Letter No. 948, dated October 19, 1918	158
18a.	Do.	do. Letter No. 1104—A, dated December 10, 1918	166
18b.	Do.	do. Letter No. 1145, dated December 3, 1918, with annexures.	173
18c.	Do.	do. Letter No. 11—A, dated January 13, 1919	187
19.	Bombay, Government of.	Letter No. 9745, dated November 11, 1918, with annexure :—	188
		1. Minute of Dissent recorded by the Hon. Sir Ibrahim Rahimtoola, dated December 16, 1918.	196
20.	Bengal, Government of.	Letter No. 2304/A.D., dated October 15, 1918	199
21.	United Provinces of Agra and Oudh, Government of.	Letter No. 2272, dated October 26, 1918, with annexure :—	213
		1. Report of an informal Committee appointed to examine and advise on certain points.	216
22.	Punjab, Government of.	Letter No. 19351 (Home-Judl.), dated November 5, 1918, with annexure :—	223
		Memorandum by Sir M. F. O'Dwyer, Lieut.-Governor of the Punjab, dated 10th January, 1918.	238
23.	Burma, Government of.	Letter dated October 17, 1918, with annexure :—	250
		1. Extract from speech by Sir R. Craddock, Lieutenant-Governor of Burma, dated August 14, 1918.	251
24.	Burma, Government of.	Letter dated November 30, 1918, with annexure :—	252
		1. Minute by Sir R. Craddock, Lieutenant-Governor of Burma, dated November 29, 1918.	252
25.	Bihar and Orissa, Government of.	Letter No. 4110 P., dated November 10, 1918, with annexure :—	263
		Letter from the Government of Bihar and Orissa to the Government of India, No. 3368 C., dated 31st October, 1917.	277
26.	Central Provinces, Government of.	Letter No. C. 105, dated October 30, 1918, with annexure :—	280
		1. Note by the Chief Commissioner of the Central Provinces.	281
27.	Assam, Government of.	Letter No. 1429 W., dated October 28, 1918, with annexures :—	289
		1. Note by Sir Nicholas Dodd Beatson Bell, the Chief Commissioner of Assam, dated October 24, 1918.	289
		Map of Assam. <i>to face page</i>	291
		2. Statement of Income and Expenditure of the Hill Districts in Assam, 1917-18.	307
		3. Additional Note by Sir Nicholas Dodd Beatson Bell on the electorate proposed for Assam.	307
28.	Delhi, Letter from the Chief Commissioner of,	dated October 14, 1918	311
INDEX ...			315

## INDEX.

	PAGE		PAGE
All-India Landholders' Association, Resolutions by ... ..	115	Gait, Sir Edward, Lieutenant-Governor of Bihar and Orissa. <i>See</i> Bihar and Orissa.	
All-India Muslim Association, Memorandum by ... ..	123	Gokhale, N. V., Memorandum signed by Hogg, The Hon. Mr. M., Minute of Dissent by ... ..	128 93
Assam, Chief Commissioner of :		Home Rule for India League, Bombay Branch, Memorandum ... ..	100
Letter from ... ..	289	Hopkins, Mr. H. M. R., Report signed by India, Government of :	223
Minute by ... ..	80	Circular Letter to Local Governments and Administrations ...	157
Note by ... ..	289	Letter to Secretary of State ...	1
Assam, Map of ... ..	291	Indian National Congress :	
Barnes, Sir George, Member of the Governor-General's Executive Council, Reference to Opinions of ... ..	54(127)	Resolutions, December 1918 ...	96
Bell, Sir Nicholas Dodd Beatson, Chief Commissioner of Assam. <i>See</i> Assam, Chief Commissioner of.		Resolutions, December 1916, Extracts from ... ..	92
Bengal, Government of :		Resolutions, August—September, 1918 ... ..	138
Joint Minute signed by Governor of Letter from ... ..	84 199	Ironside, The Hon. W. A., Minute of Dissent by ... ..	93
Bihar and Orissa, Government of :		Jinnah, The Hon. Mr. M. A., Reservation to Report signed by ... ..	92
Letter from ... ..	263	Kaira Case, Sir S. Nair on ... ..	77
Joint Minute signed by Lieutenant-Governor of ... ..	84	Khaparde, The Hon. Mr. G. S. :	
Bombay, Government of :		Memorial signed by ... ..	121-122
Letter from ... ..	188	Note by ... ..	95
Minute by Governor of ... ..	85	Krishna, Bhalchandra. Memorandum signed by ... ..	128
Bombay Branch of the Home Rule for India League, Memorandum ... ..	100	Lambert, Mr. G. B., Report signed by Landholders :	223
Burma, Government of :		Association, All-India, Resolutions of ... ..	115
Letters from ... ..	250, 252	Memorial by certain members of the Indian Legislative Council ...	121
Minutes by Lieutenant-Governor of Speech by Lieutenant-Governor ...	80, 252	Legislative Council, Indian :	
Butler, Sir Harcourt. <i>See</i> United Provinces, Lieutenant-Governor of.	251	Certain Members of, Memorial of ...	121
Central Provinces, Chief Commissioner of :		Non-Official Members, Report of Committee of ... ..	88
Letter from ... ..	280	Viceroy's Speech in ... ..	86
Minutes by ... ..	80, 84	Lloyd, Sir George, Governor of Bombay. <i>See</i> Bombay.	
Note by ... ..	281	Local Governments :	
Chambers, W. A., Memorandum signed by ... ..	128	Opinions of ... ..	158
Champaran Ryots Case, Note by Sir S. Nair on ... ..	76	Minutes by Heads of certain ...	80
Chanda, The Hon. Mr. K., Minute of Dissent by ... ..	92	Lowndes, Sir George, Member of the Governor-General's Executive Council, Reference to Opinions of ...	13 (38)
Chandavarkar, N. G., Memorandum signed by ... ..	128	Mactaggart, Mr. C., Report signed by ...	223
Chatterjee, The Hon. Mr. A. C., Report signed by ... ..	223	Madras Government, Letters from ...	158
Chitnavis, The Hon. Sir G. M., Memorial signed by ... ..	121-122	Malaviya, The Hon. Pandit Madan Mohan, Note by ... ..	94
Committee appointed by the Government of the United Provinces, Report of ... Congress. <i>See</i> Indian National Congress, Council of the Bombay Branch of the Home Rule for India League, Memorandum by ... ..	216 100	Minutes, Minutes of Dissent and Notes : Bell, Sir N. D. Beatson ... ..	289
Craddock, Sir Reginald, Lieutenant-Governor of Burma. <i>See</i> Burma.		Heads of Local Governments ...	80, 84, 85
Delhi, Chief Commissioner of, Letter from ... ..	311	Nair, Sir S. ... ..	58
Deo, The Hon. R. N. Bhanja, of Kanika, Memorial signed by ... ..	121-122	Non-Officials of the Indian Legislative Council ... ..	92
Dharbanja, Maharajah Sir Rameshwara Singh Bahadur of, Letter from ...	115	O'Dwyer, Sir M. F. ... ..	238
Dissents. <i>See</i> Minutes of Dissent		Rahimtoola, Sir I. ... ..	196
European Associations' Final Statement Ferard, Mr. H. C., Report signed by ...	147 223	Robertson, Sir B. ... ..	281
		Viceroy ... ..	54
		"Moderates" :	
		Manifesto by ... ..	146
		Memorandum by ... ..	128
		Resolutions by ... ..	142
		Muhammad Shafi, The Hon. Khan Bahadur Mian, Memorial signed by ...	121-122

	PAGE		PAGE
Muslim Association, All-India, Memorandum by ... ..	123	Sahay, The Hon. Rai Bahadur K., Memorial signed by ... ..	121-122
Nair, Sir S., Minute of Dissent ... ..	58	Samarth, N. M., Memorandum signed by ... ..	128
Nandy, The Hon. Sir Manindra Chandra, Memorial signed by ... ..	121	Sarma, The Hon. Rao Bahadur B. N., Note by ... ..	94
Non-Official Members of the Indian Legislative Council, Report of Committee of O'Donnell Mr. S. P., Report signed by O'Dwyer, Sir M. F., Lieutenant-Governor of the Punjab. <i>See</i> Punjab.	88	Setalvad, C. H. Memorandum signed by ... ..	128
Parekh, G. K., Memorandum signed by Patel, The Hon. V. J., Note by ... ..	128	Shukul, The Hon. Rai Bahadur B. D.: Memorial signed by ... ..	121-122
Porter, Mr. L. C., Report signed by ... ..	95	Note by ... ..	94
Punjab, Government of: Letter from ... ..	223	Sim, Mr. G. G., Report signed by ... ..	223
Minutes by the Lieutenant-Governor of ... ..	80, 238	Sundar Singh, Majithia, The Hon. Sardar Bahadur: Memorial signed by... ..	121-122
Rahimtoola, Sir I., Minute of Dissent by Rampal Singh, The Hon. Raja Sir, Memorial signed by ... ..	196	Note by ... ..	93-94
Rangaswami Ayyanger, The Hon. Mr. K. V.: Memorial signed by ... ..	121-122	United Provinces of Agra and Oudh, Government of: Letter from ... ..	213
Note by ... ..	92	Minute by Lieutenant-Governor ... ..	80
Robertson, Sir B., Chief Commissioner of the Central Provinces. <i>See</i> Central Provinces.		Report of Committee appointed by ... ..	216
Ronaldshay, Earl of, Governor of Bengal. <i>See</i> Bengal.		Viceroy: Address to Heads of Provinces ... ..	78
Roy, The Hon. Sita Nath: Memorial signed by ... ..	121-122	Minute by ... ..	54
Note by ... ..	92	Speech in the Indian Legislative Council ... ..	86
		Vincent, Sir W., Member of the Governor-General's Executive Council, Opinions of ... ..	36 (83)
		Wacha, Sir D. and others, Memorandum ... ..	128
		Wadya, H. A., Memorandum signed by ... ..	128
		Zulfiqar Ali Khan, Khan, The Hon., Memorial signed by ... ..	121-122