

Dhananjayrao Gadgil Library



GIPE-PUNE-069493

**SCIENTIFIC MANAGEMENT
AND LABOR**

SCIENTIFIC MANAGEMENT AND LABOR

BY

ROBERT FRANKLIN HOXIE

ASSOCIATE PROFESSOR OF POLITICAL ECONOMY, UNIVERSITY OF CHICAGO;
SPECIAL INVESTIGATOR OF SCIENTIFIC MANAGEMENT FOR THE
UNITED STATES COMMISSION ON INDUSTRIAL RELATIONS



D. APPLETON AND COMPANY
NEW YORK AND LONDON

1918

X:981.73
E8;
69493

COPYRIGHT, 1918, BY
D. APPLETON AND COMPANY

Printed in the United States of America

PREFACE

The book here presented is based upon an investigation of scientific management in its relations to labor, made by the writer for the United States Commission on Industrial Relations. The investigation involved a study of scientific management shops designated, in the main, by Mr. Frederick W. Taylor, Mr. H. L. Gantt and Mr. Harrington Emerson, leaders of the movement. In this shop study, the investigator was assisted by Mr. Robert G. Valentine, Industrial Counselor, appointed by the Commission to represent employing management, and Mr. John P. Frey, Editor of the "International Molders' Journal," similarly appointed to represent labor. Both Mr. Valentine and Mr. Frey were in close touch with the writer during the course of the investigation and the preparation of the report to the Commission, and both attached their signatures to that document as well as to the conclusions which were presented with it.¹ This monograph has also received their unqualified approval.

The discussion which follows is for the most part an attempt to test Mr. Taylor's claims respecting scientific management in its relations to labor, the claims of Mr. Gantt and Mr. Emerson being considered only in so far as they differ from those of Mr. Taylor. Justification for this mode of procedure is clearly set forth in the text.² It was found impossible, however, in comparing the claims with the facts revealed by the investigation, to make any consistent attempt to differentiate the conditions found in so-called Taylor, Gantt and Emerson shops, partly because of

¹ See Appendix I.

² See p. 8.

the limited time allowed for the work, but also because of the overlapping of influences and systems in practice. The writer, however, has been careful to exclude evidence from the unsystematized portions of shops, and from those in which the process of systematization has not had time as yet to produce characteristic results.

In making this study the writer has had no desire to uphold or to condemn scientific management or either party to the controversy concerning it. He has tried simply to discover and to set forth the facts and the truth, in the hope of dispelling misconceptions and misunderstandings, that a basis may be found for constructive effort in the interests of all concerned. He has endeavored thus to emphasize in turn the possible benefits of scientific management, its actual results thus far in practice, together with their causes, and its fundamental relations to labor welfare. This mode of treatment may give to particular portions of the study an air of partisanship. Fair conclusions, therefore, are to be based only on the study as a whole, and the unbiased reader will reserve judgments to the end.

The present need has seemed to be for a clear-cut and concise treatment of the main points at issue between scientific managers and organized labor. What is here presented, therefore, is by no means a complete consideration of all the important phases of the subject. Some vital matters have been discussed very briefly and one very important topic—unfounded and unproved trade union charges against scientific management—has been omitted altogether. In a later study the writer hopes to discuss all aspects of the subject fully and to present the specific evidence which is necessarily omitted here as well as to differentiate as far as possible the results found in Taylor, Gantt and Emerson shops. It is to be noted, however, that the appendices to this volume contain a full statement of the vital points at issue between scientific managers and organized labor, as well as an analysis of the fundamental and specific information necessary for an examination and test of labor condi-

tions, tendencies and effects in scientific management shops. Most cordial thanks are due to Mr. Frederick W. Taylor, Mr. H. L. Gantt, Mr. Harrington Emerson, Mr. Carl G. Barth, and many other scientific management leaders, experts and shop officials, for willing and unstinted assistance in the prosecution of the investigation. The investigators were almost everywhere received with uniform courtesy, every opportunity for direct and thorough study was afforded, and all possible assistance was given them throughout. In addition, the managements of many shops devoted weeks and sometimes months to the careful preparation of answers to the printed questionnaire on which the investigation was primarily based.

The writer is under special obligations to Mr. H. K. Hathaway and Mr. A. E. Barter, who personally assisted in the study of some of the most important shops; to Professor L. C. Marshall, who thoroughly criticized the report to the Commission, and has collaborated in its revision, and to E. Andrews Swift on whose indefatigable coöperation and counsel the writer has depended throughout the investigation. Acknowledgment is made elsewhere of the obligations under which the writer rests to the official experts appointed by the Commission.

CHICAGO,
September 1, 1915.

CONTENTS

PART I

VIEWPOINT AND METHOD

	PAGE
1. THE GENESIS AND NATURE OF THE INVESTIGATION	I
2. THE CLAIMS OF SCIENTIFIC MANAGEMENT RELATIVE TO LABOR	7
3. THE TRADE UNION OBJECTIONS TO SCIENTIFIC MANAGEMENT	13

PART II

CRITICAL EXAMINATION OF SCIENTIFIC MANAGEMENT IN ITS RELATIONS TO LABOR

A. POSSIBLE BENEFITS OF SCIENTIFIC MANAGEMENT TO LABOR AND TO SOCIETY	20
B. SCIENTIFIC MANAGEMENT IN PRACTICE	
1. Introduction	25
2. The General Order and Completeness of Installation	27
3. Functional Foremanship	31
4. The Methods Employed in the Selection and Hiring of Workmen	31
5. The Character, Extent and Results of Attempts at Adaptation, Instruction and Training of the Workers	34
6. Time Study and Task Setting: Their Purposes, Methods and Results	39

CONTENTS

	PAGE
7. Rate Making, Modes of Payment and the Maintenance of Rates	61
8. The Protection of Workers from Over-exertion and Exhaustion	87
9. Opportunities for Advancement and Promotion .	92
10. The Modes of Discipline	95
11. Methods of Discharge and the Length of Service	96
12. Scientific Management and Industrial Democracy	98
13. Causes of the Shortcomings of Scientific Management in Practice	113
C. SCIENTIFIC MANAGEMENT AND LABOR WELFARE . .	123
Modern Industry and Craft Skill.	

APPENDICES

I. CONCLUSIONS RESULTING FROM THE INVESTIGATION	137
II. THE LABOR CLAIMS OF SCIENTIFIC MANAGEMENT ACCORDING TO MR. FREDERICK W. TAYLOR .	140
III. THE LABOR CLAIMS OF SCIENTIFIC MANAGEMENT ACCORDING TO MR. H. L. GANTT	150
IV. THE LABOR CLAIMS OF SCIENTIFIC MANAGEMENT ACCORDING TO MR. HARRINGTON EMERSON .	152
V. THE TRADE UNION OBJECTIONS TO SCIENTIFIC MANAGEMENT	169
VI. VITAL POINTS AT ISSUE BETWEEN SCIENTIFIC MANAGEMENT AND LABOR BASED UPON THE LABOR CLAIMS OF SCIENTIFIC MANAGERS .	178
VII. VITAL POINTS AT ISSUE BETWEEN SCIENTIFIC MANAGEMENT AND LABOR BASED UPON THE TRADE UNION OBJECTIONS TO SCIENTIFIC MANAGEMENT	187
VIII. QUESTIONNAIRE: SCIENTIFIC MANAGEMENT AND LABOR	196