

Dhananjayrao Gadgil Library

विद्यया ऽमृतमश्नुते

GIPE-PUNE-023736

WRITTEN ANSWERS TO QUESTIONS

NAMED BY

THE COMMITTEE APPOINTED BY THE GOVERNMENT OF BOMBAY

TO CONSIDER AND REPORT

ON THE QUESTION OF

THE EXTENSION OF THE PRINCIPLES OF

LOCAL SELF-GOVERNMENT

IN REGARD TO

LOCAL BOARDS



VOLUME III.
BOMBAY PRESIDENCY.

23167 NIE
E5-3

23736

PUNA:

PRINTED AT THE YERAVDA PRISON PRESS.

1916.

VOLUME III.

Annexure to the Report of the Committee appointed by the Government of Bombay to inquire into and report on the question of the extension of the principles of Local Self-Government in regard to Local Boards.

WRITTEN ANSWERS.

INDEX.

List of Questions	Page.
...	1

REPLIES RECEIVED FROM

Bombay City.

Mr. D. G. Padhye, M. A., Principal, Morarji Gokuldas High School	3
Sir Narayan G. Chandavarkar, Kt. B. A., LL. B., J. P.	4
Mr. K. R. Daphtary, B. A., Solicitor	6
„ D. A. Khare, B. A., LL. B., J. P.	7
The President, Bombay Presidency Association	8
Mr. N. V. Gokhale, B. A., LL. B.	10
The Hon. Mr. Manmohandas Ramji, J. P.	10
Rao Bahadur N. T. Vaidya, J. P.	10
The Hon. Mr. C. H. Setulvad, LL. B., Advocate	14

NORTHERN DIVISION.

Ahmedabad District.

Mr. H. L. Painter, I. C. S., Collector	15
„ L. J. Sedgwick, I. C. S., Assistant Collector	15
Rao Saheb M. Joshi, Mamlatdar of Dholka	16
Mr. Mulchand Asharam Shah, B. A., LL. B., Pleader	17
Rao Saheb Harilal Desai bhai Desai	18
Mr. Manilal Maganlal Vakil	20
„ Jivanlal Varajrai Desai, B. A., Barrister-at-law	21
„ Govindrao Apaji Patil, B. A., LL. B., Pleader	23
„ Shivabhai Motibhai Patel	25
„ Maganbhai C. Patel, B. A., LL. B., Barrister-at-law	26
„ Jivanlal P. Lakhia	29
„ G. V. Bhachech, Retired Deputy Collector	30
The Thakore Saheb of Utelia	31

Kaira District.

Mr. J. Ghosal, I. C. S., Collector	33
„ S. N. Ziman, I. C. S., Assistant Collector	34
„ N. M. Parekhaji, District Deputy Collector	35
Rao Bahadur Bulakhidas Bapuji Trivedi, Huzur Deputy Collector	36
Mr. M. M. Gandhi, Mamlatdar of Anand	37
„ R. P. Kagalwala, Mamlatdar of Thesra	37
„ O. N. Joshi, Mamlatdar of Nadhad	38
„ Sevaklal R. Desai, High Court Pleader	40
„ Gopaldas V. Desai	41
„ Chhmanlal K. Dave	42
„ Giridhardas M. Desai	43
„ Dolatram K. Pandya	45
„ Jeshungbhai B. Patel, Barrister-at-law	46
„ Manecklal H. Vakil, B. A., LL. B., President of the Municipality of Kapadvanj	47

Panchmahals District.

Mr. C. W. M. Hudson, I. C. S., Collector	49
„ Hamid A. Ali, I. C. S., Assistant Collector	49
Rao Bahadur Bhau Rai Desai	50
Mr. I. A. Shahrwala	51
„ Dwarkadas Motilal Desai	52

Broach District.

Mr. W. O. Alcock, I. C. S., Collector	53
„ H. K. Kirpalani, I. C. S., Assistant Collector	55
„ N. A. Farnaik, B. A., Huzur Deputy Collector	57

	Pages.
Mr. N. M. Joshi, B. A., District Deputy Collector	... 53
„ Keshavlal Chhotalal, Mamlatdar of Broach	... 59
„ Darlabhbhai Raghunathji, Mamlatdar of Jambusar	... 62
Rao Saheb Ambashankar U. Malji	... 63
Sardar Rao Bahadur Motilal Choonilal	... 64
Mr. H. J. Amin, Member, District Local Board	... 65
„ Jivanji Limjibhai, Member, District Local Board	... 67
Sardar Naharsingji Esharsingji, Thakor of Amod	... 68
The Hon'ble Sardar Bha Saheb alias Doolabawa Raysangji, Thakor of Kerwada	... 69
Mr. Fulabhai N. Patel, Pleader	... 70

Surat District.

Mr. W. F. Hudson, I. C. S., Collector	... 73
„ C. G. Henderson, I. C. S., Assistant Collector	... 75
„ D. N. Trivedi, Huzur Deputy Collector	... 76
„ E. J. Talyarkhan, District Deputy Collector	... 77
„ Naranji K. Metha, Mamlatdar of Mandvi	... 78
„ H. Fleming, Mamlatdar of Chorasi	... 79
„ Rustomji J. Garda	... 81
„ Ambelal Khandubhai of Eru	... 82
„ Chhotalal Dhirajram of Olpad	... 83
„ Janardan V. Pathekji	... 84
Rev. Robert Henderson, I. P. Mission School	... 85
Mr. Ishwardas J. Store	... 87
„ Thakorror Kapilram	... 87
„ Burjorji N. Vakil	... 87
Rao Bahadur Khandubhai G. Desai	... 87
Mr. Chhotubhai A. Vakil	... 90
The Honorary Secretaries, Surat District Association	... 91
Mr. D. K. Desai, President of a meeting of land-holders	... 92
Rao Bahadur N. L. Desai, Retired District Deputy Collector	... 92

Thana District.

Mr. S. M. Bharucha, B. A., Collector	... 95
„ G. H. Cowan, I. C. S., Assistant Collector	... 96
„ J. B. Vachha, B. A., B. Sc., District Deputy Collector	... 97
Rao Bahadur Appaji Ganesh Dandekar	... 98
Mr. S. G. Phadke	... 100
„ Rajaram Tukaram of Bandra	... 100

CENTRAL DIVISION.

East Khandesh District.

Mr. Otto Rothfeld, I. C. S., Collector	... 105
„ J. H. Sanders, I. C. S., Assistant Collector	... 109
„ R. S. Hiremath, District Deputy Collector	... 110
„ N. O. Kelkar, District Deputy Collector	... 112
„ B. V. Gadgil, Huzur Deputy Collector	... 115
„ D. G. Juvekar, President, Jalgaon Municipality	... 117
Rao Saheb Rupchand Motiram, Member, District Local Board	... 118
Mr. V. C. Vad, Pleader	... 119
Sardar K. J. Dixit, Member, District Local Board	... 121

West Khandesh District.

Mr. E. G. Turner, I. C. S., Collector	... 123
„ G. A. Hiremath, District Deputy Collector	... 125
„ N. N. Sathe, District Deputy Collector	... 126
Rao Bahadur K. N. Bhangaonkar, Retired do.	... 127
Mr. V. N. Behere, Pleader	... 128
„ S. W. Joshi, Pleader, President, Shirpur Municipality	... 131
The Secretaries, Khandesh Zilla Sabba, Dhulia	... 133

<i>Ahmednagar District.</i>		Page.
Mr. P. J. Mead, I. C. S., Collector	...	135
„ G. B. Takalkar, B. A., LL. B., Vice-President, Taluka Local Board, Newasa	...	141
„ P. B. Bhalerao, Pleader	...	142
Rao Bahadur G. V. Joglekar, B. A., Huzur Deputy Collector	...	143
Mr. G. K. Chitale, B. A., LL. B., Member, District Local Board	...	145
<i>Poona District.</i>		
Mr. G. W. Hatch, I. C. S., Collector	...	147
„ E. J. Bolus, B. A., I. C. S., Assistant Collector	...	148
„ Joseph Rodgers, District Deputy Collector	...	150
Rao Bahadur G. H. Anjangaonkar, Huzur Deputy Collector	...	151
Rao Bahadur Ichharani Bhagwandas, Retired Huzur Deputy Collector	...	152
Mr. N. C. Kelkar, B. A., LL. B., Editor "Kesari" and "Maharatta"	...	156
The Hon. Mr. V. S. Shrinivas Shastri	...	158
Mr. Mahomed Salahuddin, Member, District Local Board	...	159
The Secretary, Sarvajanic Sabha, Poona	...	160
The Honorary Secretaries, Deccan Sabha, Poona	...	161
The Hon. Dewan Bahadur K. B. Godbole, B. A., M. C. E., L. C. E.	...	162
Mr. M. R. Tarkonde, Pleader	...	164
„ L. M. Deshpande, Retired Huzur Deputy Collector	...	164
The Hon. Mr. W. H. Sharp, M. A., Director of Public Instruction	...	171
Mr. H. N. Apte, President, Poona City Municipality	...	172
<i>Nasik District.</i>		
Mr. C. M. Baker, B. A., I. C. S., Collector	...	175
„ R. G. Pradhan, B. A., LL. B., Member, District Local Board	...	175
Rao Bahadur V. G. Gupte, District Deputy Collector	...	178
Rao Saheb L. N. Joglekar, Huzur Deputy Collector	...	180
Mr. C. G. Marathe, Mamlatdar of Malegaon	...	181
Sardar G. M. Vinchurkar, Vice-President, District Local Board	...	183
Mr. H. F. Knight, I. C. S., Assistant Collector	...	184
<i>Satara District.</i>		
Mr. B. A. Brendon, I. C. S., Collector	...	187
„ J. B. Hood, I. C. S., Assistant Collector	...	189
„ N. C. Pethe, Huzur Deputy Collector	...	190
„ R. G. Apte, B. A., Deputy Educational Inspector	...	193
„ V. D. Kelkar, Mamlatdar of Patan	...	194
„ T. C. Ghaisas, Mamlatdar of Karad	...	195
Rao Bahadur V. N. Pathak, M. A., Vice-President, District Local Board	...	196
Mr. R. P. Karandikar, Pleader	...	198
Rao Saheb R. R. Kale, B. A., LL. B., Public Prosecutor	...	206
Mr. Dossabhoy Maneckji, Pleader	...	207
„ Ganpatdas Hirachand Devi	...	208
Syed Muniruddin Surajudin Moulvi	...	209
Mr. A. M. Kuber, B. A., LL. B., Member, District Local Board	...	209
Member of a Committee appointed at a Public Meeting at Satara	...	210
<i>Sholapur District.</i>		
Mr. J. H. E. Tupper, B. A., I. C. S., Collector	...	215
„ H. V. Braham, I. C. S., Assistant Collector	...	216
„ C. Nulkar, District Deputy Collector	...	216
„ E. Mirikar, Mamlatdar of Sholapur	...	220
„ R. D. Indolikar, Mamlatdar of Barseil	...	221
„ Laxman Balaji Jagalpure, Mamlatdar of Madha	...	222
„ G. M. Bhalerao, Mamlatdar of Karnala	...	224
„ G. M. Shah, President, Sholapur Municipality	...	225
Rao Saheb R. H. Singi	...	225
Mr. A. N. Kaulgekar, Pleader	...	226
„ C. S. Madki	...	227
„ S. S. Poredi, Huzur Deputy Collector	...	228
„ R. M. Sane, Pleader	...	229

	Page.
Mr. N. G. Majumdar, Manager, Sholapur Mills	... 230
„ Govind Balkrishna Vakil	... 232
Khan Bahadur Moulvie Peermahomed Daffedar	... 233
Mr. G. B. Jagade, Mamlatdar of Pandharpur	... 233
„ Sundar Malhar Patel of Surdi	... 234
The Secretary, District Congress Committee, Sholapur	... 234

SOUTHERN DIVISION.

Belgaum District.

Mr. E. L. Sale, I. C. S., Collector	... 237
The Hon. Mr. D. V. Belvi, B. A., LL. B.	... 238
Mr. V. D. Parulekar, Mamlatdar of Khanapur	... 240
„ G. L. Gajendragadkar, Mamlatdar of Sampgaon	... 242
„ Abdullakhan I. Attar, Deputy Educational Inspector	... 243
„ It. S. Katgiri, Mamlatdar of Athni	... 243
Khan Saheb Ardeshir Nowroji, President, Belgaum Municipality	... 244
Mr. G. A. Hebbal, B. A., LL. B., Pleader	... 246
Rao Saheb Shivmurti Swami	... 248
Mr. V. M. Gadgil, Vice-President, District Local Board	... 249
Rao Saheb S. B. Mahantsbetty	... 252
Mr. S. A. Chhatre, Pleader	... 253
The Secretary, Peoples' Association, Belgaum	... 254
Rao Saheb G. R. Kalyanpurkar, Huzur Deputy Collector	... 259
Mr. V. T. Naik	... 261
„ M. Webb, B. A., I. C. S., Assistant Collector	... 264
„ Y. B. Borkar, B. A., District Deputy Collector	... 265
The Chairman, District Congress Committee, Belgaum	... 267

Bijapur District.

Mr. J. K. N. Kabraji, Collector	... 269
„ V. N. Sathye, B. A., Huzur Deputy Collector	... 269
„ S. K. Sahe, B. A., District Deputy Collector	... 270
Rao Saheb S. J. Deshmukh, Member, District Local Board	... 271
Mr. V. S. Kulolgi, B. A., District Deputy Collector	... 271
„ P. G. Halkatti, LL. B., Pleader	... 272
District Congress Committee, Bijapur	... 273
Mr. G. R. Tilak, Retired Executive Engineer	... 274
„ A. R. Jalihal, Retired Deputy Educational Inspector	... 275
„ G. C. Shannon, I. C. S., Assistant Collector	... 276
„ P. A. Dessai, B. A., LL. B.	... 277
Rao Saheb Raghavendra Krishna, Pleader	... 277

Dharwar District.

Mr. A. E. L. Emanuel, M. A., I. C. S., Collector	... 279
The Hon. Rao Saheb V. S. Naik	... 279
Mr. E. I. Moysey, I. C. S., Assistant Collector	... 283
Messrs. V. M. Herlekar, B. A., LL. B., and H. R. Desai, B. A., LL. B.	... 284
Mr. D. R. Mobedji, District Deputy Collector	... 285
„ C. Balikundri, District Deputy Collector	... 286
„ R. R. Kulkarni, B. A., Mamlatdar of Ranibennur	... 288
Messrs. R. V. Paddidri, B. A., Mamlatdar of Gadag, and S. Vinekar, B. A., LL. B., Pleader	... 290
Mr. D. V. Dhume, L. C. E., Huzur Deputy Collector, and Chairman, Managing Committee, District Local Board	... 292
„ M. S. Kumpita, Mamlatdar of Hubli	... 293
„ N. S. Chitgupi, Honorary Magistrate	... 295
Rao Bahadur B. Y. Jathar, B. A., Chairman, District Congress Committee, Dharwar	... 296
Mr. V. M. Herlekar, President, Dharwar District Association	... 297
The Hon. Rao Bahadur S. K. Rodda	... 299

Ratnagiri District.

Mr. W. W. Smart, I. C. S., Collector	... 301
„ J. A. Madan, I. C. S., Assistant Collector	... 301
„ S. S. Deshpande, B. A., District Deputy Collector	... 304
„ A. R. Gulwadi, B. A., District Deputy Collector	... 307

	Page.
Mr. J. M. Karnik, Member, District Local Board	... 310
„ R. K. Karandikar, Member, District Local Board	... 311
„ L. V. Parulekar, Government Pleader	... 312
„ V. B. Sakalkar, B.A., Huzur Deputy Collector	... 313
Substances of two Vernacular petitions from the residents of the villages of Varveli, Falset, Pomandi, Patpanhali and others of the Guhagar Petha, District Ratnagiri	... 315

Kolaba District.

Mr. G. A. Thomas, B. A., I. C. S., Collector	... 316
„ A. R. Dalal, B. A., I. C. S., Assistant Collector	... 318
„ G. G. Desai, District Deputy Collector	... 319
„ R. A. Nadkarni, Huzur Deputy Collector	... 321
„ Jamshedji Bomanji, Pleader	... 323
„ Mahomed Enus, Vice-President, Taluka Local Board, Alibag	... 324
„ Rao Saheb G. H. Sugvekar	... 325

Kanara District.

Mr. G. Monteath, B. A., I. C. S., Collector	... 326
„ H. B. Gould, B. A., I. C. S., Assistant Collector	... 327
„ G. F. S. Collins, B. A., I. C. S., Assistant Collector	... 328
„ K. V. Joshi, Huzur Deputy Collector	... 330
„ J. B. Garde, B. A., Mamlatdar, Karwar	... 331
„ R. N. Pandit, B. A., Mamlatdar, Kumta	... 333
„ G. K. Kumble, B. A., Mamlatdar of Sirai	... 334
„ N. A. Nadkarni, Mamlatdar of Yellapur	... 335
Rao Bahadur D. V. Yenhamadi, Retired Deputy Collector	... 336
Mr. D. K. Upponi, Pleader	... 337
„ J. S. Pandit, Pleader	... 338
Rao Saheb G. K. Masur, Member, District Local Board	... 339

SIND DIVISION,

Karachi District.

Mr. J. W. Smyth, I. C. S., Collector	... }
„ G. E. L. Carter, I. C. S., Assistant Collector	... }
„ Menghraj H. Kalwani, District Deputy Collector	... }
„ M. Hosketh, Educational Inspector in Sind	... }
„ F. C. D'Abreo, Huzur Deputy Collector	... }
„ W. N. Richardson, City Magistrate	... } 341
Khan Saheb G. S. Haji, Deputy Superintendent, Civil Veterinary Department in Sind	... }
Mr. Dipchand T. Ojha	... }
„ Shewaram Dewanmal	... }
Saiyed Najafalishah, Zamindar of Tatta	... }
Mr. Walimahomed Hassanali	... }

Hyderabad District.

Khan Bahadar Mirza Kalich Beg Fardun Beg, Retired Deputy Collector	... 356
Rao Bahadur Bulchand Dayaram	... 357
Rao Bahadur Teekchand Udhavdas	... 353

Thar and Parkar District.

Mr. G. E. Chatfield, I. C. S., Collector	... 359
„ H. Dow, Assistant Collector	... 360
„ N. B. Mahomed Husain, Deputy Collector, Nara Valley	... 61
„ Narainsing, Huzur Deputy Collector	... 362
„ N. B. Mahomed Hussain, Deputy Collector, Nara Valley for Deputy Collector, Thar and Parkar	... 364
The Hon. Mr. G. M. Bhurgri, Barrister-at-Law	... 365

Upper Sind Frontier.

Mr. Chirai Bulchand, Deputy Collector	... 367
„ Dialmal Doulatram, Zamindar	... 368
Wadero Chakarkhan Subriani	... 369
Wadero Dilmurad Khan, Seth Assardas, Seth Nanghamal, Wadero Abdullakhan Osto, Members of the Taluka Local Board, Jaobabad	... 370

<i>awabshah District.</i>	Page.
Mr. A. W. W. Mackie, I. C. S., Collector	... 371
„ D. MacLachlan, I. C. S., Assistant Collector	... 372
„ Y. W. M. Sheikh, B. A., Deputy Collector	... 373
Rao Rahadur Diwan Kauramal C,	... 374
Seth Perozshah Merwanji, Zamindar	... 375
Mr. Kirpaldas Lakhmal, Zamindar	... 376
„ Tekchand Hassasing, Zamindar	... 377
„ Gurmukhsingh Parumal, Local Board Member	... 378
„ Jiwatram, Mukhtyarkar	... 379
„ Atmaram Mukhtyarkar	... 380
Diwan Chandmal Gopaldas, Retired Deputy Collector	... 381
Mir Ghulamshah, Jagirdhar and Member, District Local Board	... 382

Larkana District.

Mr. C. H. Blathwayt, I. C. S., Collector	... 384
„ A. S. R. Macklin, I. C. S., Assistant Collector	... 385
„ Jagatsingh Jetimal, Deputy Collector	... 386
Sahebzada Sardar Mahomed Khan, Deputy Collector	... 388
Mr. G. M. Isani, Deputy Collector	... 388
„ Gausbandas, Mukhtyarkar	... 390
„ Gokaldas, Mukhtyarkar	... 390
„ Dingomal	... 392
Sirai Shah Mahomed Lahori	... 393
Mr. Hardasmal Kimatrai, Zamindar	... 393
„ Lalchand Navalrai, Pleader	... 394
„ Bhojraj Parumal, Member, District Local Board	... 395

Sukkur District.

Mr. C. S. Campbell, I. C. S., Collector	... 397
Rao Bahadur Assardas Motaram, Deputy Collector	... 397
Khan Bahadur Mian Peerbux Mian Mahomed, Retired Deputy Collector	... 399
Khan Saheb Shah Nawaz Khan, Member, District Local Board	... 400
Diwan Naraindas Motaram, Retired Deputy Collector	... 401
Mr. Murlidhar Jeramdas, Pleader	... 402

**Annexure to the Report of the Local Boards Committee appointed
by Government Resolution, General Department,
No. 6444, dated 18th August 1915.**

*Questions set by the Committee to which written answers were invited
through the Local District Officers.*

1. Should District and Taluka Boards have elected majorities?
2. Should election be by communities? or, if not wholly so, should any provision be made to secure the due representation of any special communities or interests?

In the case of election by communities can you suggest the constitution of your District and of one of your Taluka Boards? Do you think the present number of members sufficient or should it be increased?
3. Is it advisable that the Presidents of your District Board and Taluka Boards should be non-officials, and if so, elected or nominated?
4. To what extent do you think the present limitation on the preparation of plans and the execution of public works can be removed or modified? Please see sections 57 and 61 of the Act and the orders thereunder.
5. Do you think the Taluka Local Board could be freed to any extent from District Local Board's control in such matters as the following:- engagement and payment of Taluka Local Board servants by the District Local Board (section 38); sanction and revision of the Taluka Local Board budgets (section 55).
6. In regard to education do you consider the time has come when the management of Primary Schools can be entrusted to the District Local Board? Please see paragraph 751-754 of the report of the Decentralization Commission.
7. In what ways, if any, do you consider that the rules under section 48(b) of the Act should be altered or modified? (see page 177 of Cumming's Local Boards Manual).
8. Has the Taluka Local Board ever been consulted as to the appropriation of revenues raised by the taluka to be spent on education in other areas? Please see section 48 (a).
9. If the suggestions made above are carried out, there will be need for certain additional Local Board establishments entailing extra expenditure on the boards. Do you think that in order to meet this increased expenditure
 - (1) Local Boards should be empowered to raise the Local Fund Cess up to a maximum of 2 annas in the rupee?
 - (2) Local Boards should be relieved of a part of the expenditure on Educational, Medical, Sanitary and other matters in important villages by extending the scope of Chapter XIV of the District Municipal Act so as to include a larger number of such villages with a view to establishing 'notified areas' in them?

(3) Local Boards should be permitted to levy a cess on:

(a) Income Tax,

(b) Abkari Revenue,

(c) Forest Revenue?

(4) Provincial subventions should be increased?

10. It is said that the failure of the District and Taluka Boards is due to lack of interest and the absence of active co-operation on the part of the non-official members. Is this true? If so, what are the causes and remedies?
11. Can any additions be made to the qualifications of voters (*vide* section 10)?
12. Can any means be suggested for forming separate groups of electors with a view to secure at least some men from classes 2 to 6 given in section 10?
13. In the event of Presidents of Taluka Local Boards continuing to be official, is it not desirable that the Vice-Presidents should invariably be non-official?
14. In view of the recent introduction of the Record of Rights and consequent divisions of holdings, what statutory minimum of assessment should be adopted in place of the present figure of "Rs. 48-0-0"?
15. What is your opinion as to the desirability of making the provincial share of land revenue and income tax divisible between the Provincial Government and Local Boards? If you are in favour of such division, what should be the Local Boards' share?
16. Under section 45 (a) (5) of the Local Boards Act it is left to the discretion of a District Local Board in what proportion the proceeds from one anna cess after deducting its "Educational" portion should be divided between a Taluka Board and a District Board. Are you of opinion that this proportion should be fixed by law? If so, in what ratio?
17. Under the existing law it is provided that at least half of the nominated members on a Local Board should be non-officials. Do you think that the administrative efficiency of a board is likely to suffer if this provision for the appointment of non-officials by nomination is abolished and a board is constituted of elected members and nominated officials? If you are of opinion that the administrative efficiency will in no way suffer, what should be the proportion of such nominated officials to elected members?
18. Are you in favour of reducing the qualifying limits prescribed in clauses 1, 2, 3 and 4 of section 10 of the Local Boards Act? If so, what reduced limits you propose under each head?