



Dhananjayrao Gadgil Library



GIPE-PUNE-010755



REPORT

ON

THE PRESENT STATE OF ROAD AND RAILWAY COMPETITION AND THE POSSIBILITIES OF THEIR FUTURE CO-ORDINATION AND DEVELOPMENT, AND COGNATE MATTERS, IN GOVERNORS' PROVINCES

K. G. MITCHELL, A.C.G.I., M.Inst.C.E., A.M.Inst.T.,

Road Engineer with the Government of India.

AND

L. H. KIRKNESS, M.A., M.Inst.T.,

Officer on Special Duty with the Railway Board.

CALCUTTA: GOVERNMENT OF INDIA
CENTRAL PUBLICATION BRANCH

1933

Government of India Publications are obtainable from the Government of India Central
 cation Branch, 3, Government Place, West, Calcutta, and from the following Agent

EUROPE.

OFFICE OF THE HIGH COMMISSIONER FOR INDIA,
 INDIA HOUSE, ALDWYCH, LONDON, W. C. 2.

And at all Booksellers.

INDIA AND CEYLON : Provincial Book Depôts.

MADRAS—Superintendent, Government Press, Mount Road, Madras.
BOMBAY—Superintendent, Government Printing and Stationery, Queen's Road, Bombay.
BIFP—Library attached to the Office of the Commissioner in Sind, Karachi.
BENGAL—Bengal Secretariat Book Depôt, Writers' Buildings, Room No. 1, Ground Floor, Calcutta.
UNITED PROVINCES OF AGRA AND OUDH—Superintendent of Government Press, United Provinces of Agra and Oudh,
PUNJAB—Superintendent, Government Printing, Punjab, Lahore.
BURMA—Superintendent, Government Printing, Burma, Rangoon.
CENTRAL PROVINCES AND BIKANER—Superintendent of Government Printing, Central Provinces, Nagpur.
ASSAM—Superintendent, Assam Secretariat Press, Shillong.
BIHAR AND ORISSA—Superintendent, Government Printing, Bihar and Orissa, P. O. Gulzarbagh, Patna.
NORTH-WEST FRONTIER PROVINCE—Manager, Government Printing and Stationery, Peshawar.

Timbaker Spink & Co., Ltd., Calcutta and Simla.
 W. Newman & Co., Ltd. Calcutta
 S. K. Lahiri & Co., Calcutta.
 The Indian School Supply Depôt, 209, Bow-Bazar Street,
 Calcutta
 Buserworth & Co (India), Ltd., Calcutta
 M. C. Barcar & Sons, 16, College Square, Calcutta
 Standard Literature Company, Limited, Calcutta.
 Association Press, Calcutta.
 Chatterjee, Chatterjee & Co., Ltd., 18, College Square,
 Calcutta
 The Book Company, Calcutta.
 James Murray & Co, 12, Government Place, Calcutta. (For
 Meteorological Publications only.)
 Ray Chaudhury & Co., 68-5, Ashutosh Mukherji Road, Calcutta
 Scientific Publishing Co., 9, Taltola Lane, Calcutta.
 Chatterjee & Co., 2-1, Bacharam Chatterjee Lane, Calcutta.
 Standard Law Book Society, 5, Hastings Street, Calcutta.
 The Hindu Library, 3, Nandalal Mullick Lane, Calcutta.
 Kamala Book Depôt, Ltd., 15, College Square, Calcutta.
 The Pioneer Book Supply Co., 30, Shiv Narain Das Lane, Cal-
 cutta.
 P. C. Sarkar & Co., 2, Shama Charan De Street, Calcutta.
 Bengal Flying Club, Dum Dum Cantt.
 Kail Charan & Co., Municipal Market, Calcutta.
 N. M. Roy Chowdhury & Co., 11, College Sq., Calcutta.
 Grantha Mandir, Cuttack.
 B. C. Basak, Esq., Proprietor, Albert Library, Dacca.
 Riggimbathams, Madras
 Rochouse & Sons, Madras.
 G. A. Nateson & Co., Publishers, George Town, Madras.
 P. Varadachary & Co., Madras.
 City Book Co., Madras.
 Law Publishing Co., Mylapore, Madras.
 The Booklover's Resort, Talukad, Trivandrum, South India.
 E. M. Gopalakrishna Kona, Pudukmandapam, Madras.
 Central Book Depôt, Madras.
 Visapur & Co., Visaspattam.
 Thacker & Co., Ltd., Bombay.
 D. B. Taraporewala Sons & Co., Bombay.
 Ram Chandra Govind & Sons, Kalbadevi Road, Bombay.
 N. M. Tipkesh & Co., Booksellers, Princes Street, Kalbadevi
 Road, Bombay.
 New and Secondhand Bookshop, Kalbadevi Road, Bombay.
 J. M. Pandia & Co., Bombay.
 B. H. Wheeler & Co., Alahabad, Calcutta and Bombay.
 Bombay Book Depôt, Girgaon, Bombay.
 Bennett, Coleman & Co., Ltd., The Times of India Press,
 Bombay.
 The Popular Book Depôt, Bombay.
 Lawrence & Mayo, Ltd., Bombay.
 The Manager, Oriental Book Supplying Agency, 15, Shukrawar,
 Pooná City.
 Rama Krishna Bros., Opposite Bihrambég, Pooná City.
 S. F. Bookstall, 21, Baridwar, Pooná
 The International Book Service, Pooná &
 Mangaldas & Sons, Booksellers and Publishers, Bhaga Talao,
 Surat.
 The Standard Book and Stationery Co., 22-23, Arab Road,
 Peshawar
 The Students Own Book Depôt, Dharwar.
 Sri Shankar Karnataka Postaka Bhandars, Malameddi,
 Dharwar
 The English Book Depôt, Ferozapore.

Frontier Book & Stationery Co, Rawalpindi.
 *Hossebby Karimji & Sons Karachi.
 The English Bookstall, Karachi.
 *Roe & Co., Karachi
 *Kwaja & Co., Karachi.
 Ram Chander & Sons, Umbals, Kamul.
 The Standard Bookstall, Quetta and Lahore
 U. P. Mahotra & Co., Quetta.
 J. Ray & Sons, 43, K. & L. Edward Road, Rawalpindi
 and Lahore.
 The Standard Book Depôt, Lahore, Fainital,
 Dalhousie, Ambala Cantonment and Delhi.
 The North India Christian Tract and Book Society,
 Road, Allahabad.
 Ram Narain Lal, Katra, Allahabad.
 "The Leader", Allahabad.
 The Indian Army Book Depôt, Dayalbagh, Agra.
 The English Book Depôt, Taj Road, Agra.
 Guna Prasad & Sons, Agra.
 Narayan & Co., Weston Road, Cawnpore.
 The Indian Army Book Depôt Jullundur City—Daryaga
 Manager, Newal Kishore Press, Lucknow.
 The Upper India Publishing House Ltd., Literature
 Ammudaula Park, Lucknow.
 Rai Sahib M. Gulab Singh & Sons, Mudd-4m Press
 and Calcutta
 Rama Krishna & Sons Bookellers, Anarkali, Lahore.
 Students' Popular Depôt, Anarkali, Lahore.
 The Proprietor, Punjab Sanskrit Book Depôt, Saidmudi
 Lahore.
 The Insurance Publicity Co. Ltd., Lahore.
 The Punjab Religious Book Society, Lahore.
 The Commercial Book Co., Lahore.
 The University Book Agency, Chakri Road, Lahore.
 Manager of the Imperial Book Depôt, 69, Chandni
 Street, Delhi
 J. M. 'aina and Bro., Delhi.
 Pomo Book Agency, New Delhi and Simla.
 Oxford Book and Stationery Company, Delhi, Lahore
 Meerut and Calcutta.
 *M. Anand Dossabhat Shah, Rajkot.
 *Supdt., American Baptist Mission Press, Rangoon.
 Burma Book Club, Ltd., Rangoon.
 S. C. Talukdar, Proprietor, Students & Co. Cooch Beha
 The Manager, The Indian Book Shop, Benares City,
 Nandlalbazar & Bazar, Chowk, Benares City.
 The Srivilliputtur Co-operative Trading Union, Ltd.,
 puttur (S. I. E.).
 Raghunath Prasad & Sons, Patna City.
 The Students' Emporium, Patna.
 K. L. Mather & Bros. Guzri, Patna City.
 Kamala Book Stores, Bankipore, Patna.
 G. Banerjee & Bros., Ranchi.
 M. C. Kothari, Raipura Road, Baroda.
 B. Parikh & Co., Baroda
 The Hyderabad Book Depôt, Chudergat, Hyderabad (I
 & Krishnaawami & Co., Teppakulam P. O., Trichinopoly
 Standard Book and Map Agency, Book-sellers and Ful
 Ballywango.
 Karnataka Publishing House, Bangalore City.
 Bheema Sons, Fort, Bangalore City.
 Superintendent, Bangalore Press, Lake View, Mysore
 Bangalore City.

AGENT IN PALMISTON—Steinmetzky, Jerusalem.

*Agents for publications on aviation only.

PREFACE.

We have endeavoured in this summary to collect and bring into focus the information and opinions we have gathered during our investigations. Our aim has been to review the position as a preliminary to a general discussion in a conference, and to summarise ascertainable facts and opinions. We are not a committee charged with making recommendations and we have endeavoured throughout to avoid imparting any bias of our own opinions to what we have recorded.

But this is not merely a summary of our provincial reports. During our investigation, we have found certain outstanding features, such as the want of balance in road development; short-comings of railways as compared with motor transport in meeting the needs of the public; complaints of excessive taxation from the motor transport industry; the railway point of view that the burden of railways is greater; and various suggestions for co-ordination; to which we feel we must refer and regarding which we venture certain conclusions which appear to emerge. Owing to the hurried nature of our tour and to the wide field covered by our enquiry, we have not been able, in our provincial reports, to deal in every case with all the questions discussed, and while in this summary we have supported most of our statements by references to provincial reports, it must not be assumed that where such references are not given we have no support for our statements.

We feel that this general picture may be useful and we venture to hope that the whole will contribute something to a satisfactory solution of the important matters we have been asked to examine.

CONTENTS.

GENERAL REPORT.

PARA.	PAGE.
CHAPTER I.—SKELETON REVIEW OF THE EXISTING COMMUNICATIONS. BEGINNING OF ROAD COMPETITION WITH RAILWAYS. THE MOTOR TRANSPORT CASE.	
1. Need for a general review	1
2. Outline of past development	1
3. Provincial Maps	2
4. Statistical examination—	4
(a) Parallel metalled roads and railways	4
(b) Areas commanded by railways	4
(c) Roads and railways in relation to area	5
(d) Roads and railways in relation to population	6
5. Village connection with the road system	6
6. Recent expenditure on roads	7
7. Lack of balance in existing road system	7
8. Possible causes of lack of balance	8
9. A possible remedy	9
10. The effect of the expansion of commercial transport	9
11. Representation of the case of the motor industry	9
CHAPTER II.—EXISTING STATE OF MOTOR COMPETITION WITH RAILWAYS.	
12. Terms of reference	11
13. Difficulties in framing accurate estimates of losses	11
14. Losses estimated by railways	11
15. Carriage of merchandise by motor transport	13
16. Range of motor transport activity	14
17. Effect of competition on light railways *	15
CHAPTER III.—CONTROL AND REGULATION OF PUBLIC TRANSPORT.	
18. Case for co-ordinated control of all forms of public transport	16
19. Control of transport in India	17
20. Unfairness of competition alleged by railways—	17
(a) Inspection of vehicles	17
(b) Overcrowding	17
(c) Restrictions imposed on Railways by the Railway Act	18
(d) Hours of Employment	18
(e) Examination of Staff	18
(f) Enquiries into accidents	18
21. Suggestions for the stricter control of public motor vehicles	18
22. Public complaints regarding motor transport—	19
(i) Overcrowding	19
(ii) Irregularity in starting	19

**CHAPTER III.—CONTROL AND REGULATION OF PUBLIC
TRANSPORT—contd.**

PARA.	PAGE.
(iii) Irregularity in arrival	19
(iv) Accidents	19
(v) Rudeness and indifference of drivers	20
23. Reasons for unsatisfactory position	20
24. Limitation of number of vehicles on any route	20
25. Time-Tables	21
26. Publication of schedules of fares	21
27. Compulsory insurance	21
28. Effect of above proposals	22
29. Probable economic fare for a motor bus	22
30. Steps to be taken for the direct protection of railways against further competition	23
31. "Zoning"	24
32. Need for accurate statistics regarding motor transport	25
33. Traffic control authority	25

**CHAPTER IV.—FUTURE POLICY OF RAILWAYS IN REGARD
TO MOTOR COMPETITION.**

34. Possible development of motor competition	28
35. Attitude of railways towards future competition	28

(1) INACTION IN VIEW OF THE ADOPTION OF ZONING.

36. Zoning of road motor transport	28
37. Zoning as it affects railways	28
38. Effect of zoning on the light railways	29
39. Opinions on zoning held by motor transport and other interests	30

(2) "COUNTER COMPETITION."

40. The <i>laissez faire</i> policy	30
41. Railway measures to meet competition—	30
(a) Cheaper tickets and cheap return tickets	31
(b) Running of more trains	31
(c) Speeding up of trains	32
(d) Self propelled units	32
42. Counter competition from public funds	34

(3) OPERATION OF ROAD MOTOR TRANSPORT BY RAILWAYS

43. Opinion in regard to railways operating road motor transport	34
44. Present legal restrictions and their effects—	35
(a) State-managed railways	35
(b) Company-managed railways	35
(c) Domiciled Railway companies	36
45. Effect of statutory provisions	36
46. Amending legislation	36
47. Objections to railways operating road motor services	36
48. Need for protecting road services operated by railways	37
49. Raising of fares	37
50. Interference with private enterprise	38

CHAPTER IV.—FUTURE POLICY OF RAILWAYS IN REGARD
TO MOTOR COMPETITION—*contd.*

(B) OPERATION OF ROAD MOTOR TRANSPORT BY RAILWAYS—*contd.*

PARA	PAGE
51. Difficulties from the railway point of view	39
52. Certain further advantages arising from railways operating road transport	40
53. Conclusion	40

CHAPTER V.—THE TAXATION OF MOTOR TRANSPORT,
AND OBLIGATIONS PECULIAR TO RAILWAYS.

54. Criticisms of existing taxation of road transport	42
55. Difficulties of estimating total sum of taxes contributed by motor transport	42
56. Provincial and local taxes—	42
(a) Private cars	42
(b) Commercial vehicles and cycles	43
57. Estimate of total number of vehicles and contribution in taxes	43
58. Comparison of taxation receipts and the road bill	44
59. Taxation of and contribution by commercial transport in different provinces	45
60. Tax element in working expenses of motor transport	46
61. Commercial motor transport and the road bill	47
62. Expenditure on "original works"	47
63. Interest on road investment	47
64. Calculations for the future	48
65. Unsatisfactory position of taxation of transport	48
66. Appropriate basis of co-ordinated taxation	49
67. Adjustment of taxation in India	51
68. Contributions to the road bill from other sources	51
69. Taxation of bullock carts	53
70. Obligations of railways to provide their own track	54
71. Further miscellaneous obligations of railways	54

CHAPTER VI.—RAILWAY PROJECTS.

72. Future development of railways	56
73. Summary of railway projects and provisional recommendations	56
74. Comments on the appendices	57

CHAPTER VII.—PROVINCIAL ROAD PROGRAMMES.

75. Existing programmes	59
76. Application of road development account. Description of programmes of	59
77. Madras	61
78. Bombay—	61
(a) Presidency	61
(b) Sind	62
79. Programme for development in connection with the Sukkur Barrage	69
80. Bengal	63
81. United Provinces	63
82. Punjab	63

CHAPTER VII.—PROVINCIAL ROAD PROGRAMMES—*contd.*

PARA.	PAGE.
83. Bihar and Orissa	61
84. Central Provinces	64
85. Assam	64
86. North-West Frontier Province	65
87. Total expenditure involved in a ten year programme and the question of development from loan funds	65
88. The legitimate uses of loan funds	67
89. Other advantages of loan development	68
90. Conclusion regarding future road development.. . . .	68

CHAPTER VIII.—CO-ORDINATION.

91. Need for co-ordination in many respects	70
92. Constitutional difficulties	70
93. Co-ordinating authority within constitutional compartments—	70
(a) At the Centre	70
(b) Within the provinces	71
94. Procedure in the case of difference of opinion in the provincial Boards of Communications	71
95. Divisional Committees	72
96. Conclusion	72

CHAPTER IX.—SUMMARY OF CONCLUSIONS AND ACKNOWLEDGMENTS.

97. Summary	73
98. Acknowledgments	78

APPENDICES.

A.—Milage of Railways, Metalled and Motorable Unmetalled Roads and Metalled Roads and Railways parallel and within 10 miles, and percentage of Metalled Road and Railway milage so paralleled	79
B.—Particulars of wealth of communications on the basis of population and area, in areas having a population density of 100 per square mile and over	80
C.—Expenditure on road construction and maintenance from revenue in Governors' Provinces (except Burma and North-West Frontier Province)	81
D.—Representation from the Indian Roads and Transport Development Association	82
E.—Extract from the Bombay Government Gazette, dated 9th September 1932, containing Home Department Resolution, dated 26th August 1932 relating to an amendment of the rules regulating the use of motor vehicles	91
F.—Taxation of private motor cars in various Provinces	92
G.—Commercial motor vehicle taxation in various Provinces	94
H.—Approximate calculation of number of motor vehicles in India	100
I.—Analysis of cost of operating motor buses under varying conditions showing tax element	101
J.—Commercial vehicle taxation and the road bill in certain Provinces	104
K.—Note showing how the railway figures used in the Diagram facing page 46 are arrived at	109

APPENDICES—*contd.*

	PAGE.
L.—Summary of Railway projects and provisional recommendations	111
M.—Extract of paragraph 90 from the Report of the Indian Road Development Committee	115
N.—Extract of paragraph 87 from the Report of the Indian Road Development Committee	116
O.—Questionnaire on points for discussion with district officials	117

PROVINCIAL REPORTS.

(1) Madras	1-60
(2) Bombay—	
(a) Presidency	1-57
(b) Sind	1-22
(3) Bengal	1-56
(4) United Provinces	1-49
(5) Punjab	1-67
(6) Bihar and Orissa	1-43
(7) Central Provinces	1-51
(8) Assam	1-25
(9) North-West Frontier Province	1-14