

Dhananjayrao Gadgil Library



GIPE-PUNE-071238

---

REPORT  
OF THE  
BOMBAY DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE,  
1914.

---

Y35:81.2311-N13

-N1231CB-3-N1E

E4

71238

71238

## CONTENTS.

### REPORT.

	PAGE
CHAPTER I.—INTRODUCTORY ... ..	i
CHAPTER II.—MEASURES ADVOCATED BY GOVERNMENT IN 1909 AND PROGRESS MADE ... ..	ib
CHAPTER III.—CHANGES AND ADDITIONS, IF ANY, ADVISABLE IN THE LIGHT OF THE EXPERIENCE OF THE LAST FOUR YEARS ... ..	iv
CHAPTER IV.—INDUSTRIAL AND COMMERCIAL DEVELOPMENT ... ..	ib
CHAPTER V.—TREND OF DEVELOPMENT IN RESPECT OF RESIDENTIAL AREAS ... ..	vii
CHAPTER VI.—RELIEF OF CONGESTION ... ..	viii
CHAPTER VII.—DEVELOPMENT OF PUBLIC INSTITUTIONS ... ..	xi
CHAPTER VIII.—ADDITIONAL COMMUNICATIONS AND METHODS OF TRANSPORT ... ..	xvi
CHAPTER IX.—MILITARY AND OTHER AREAS ... ..	xx
CHAPTER X.—SALSETTE ... ..	xxii
CHAPTER XI.—CO-ORDINATION OF EFFORT ... ..	xxiv

### APPENDICES.

A.—GOVERNMENT RESOLUTION No. 3022 OF JUNE 14TH, 1909, GENERAL DEPARTMENT, ON THE DEVELOPMENT OF BOMBAY ... ..	1
B.—GOVERNMENT RESOLUTIONS APPOINTING THE COMMITTEE ... ..	23
C.—WRITTEN STATEMENTS RECEIVED BY THE COMMITTEE ... ..	27
Alphabetical list of statements ... ..	27
P. R. Cadell, Esq., C.I.E., I. C. S. ... ..	29
Dr. J. A. Turner ... ..	33
W. R. Philpot-Brookes, Esq., A.M.I.C.E., A.K.C., C.E. ... ..	37
J. P. Orr, Esq., C.S.I., I. C. S. ... ..	38
E. L. Sale, Esq., I. C. S. ... ..	40
Tribhovandas Mangaldas Nathooobhoy, Esq., J. P. ... ..	41
M. M. S. Gubbay, Esq., I. C. S. ... ..	43
The Honourable Sir Fazulbhoy Currimbhoy ... ..	44
Moreshwar Chintaman Javle, Esq. ... ..	50
R. Whately, Esq. ... ..	53
Cassamally Jairazbhoy Peerbhoy, Esq. ... ..	54
Sir Jagmohandas Varjeevandas, Kt. ... ..	56
The Honourable Mr. James P. Chrystal ... ..	57
M. S. Bharucha, Esquire, L.C.E. ... ..	58
Major H. A. L. Hepper ... ..	62
Sir Vithaldas D. Thackersey, Kt. ... ..	64
The Honourable Mr. Munmohandas Ramji ... ..	65
The Chairman, The Indian Merchants' Chamber and Bureau, Bombay ... ..	66
The Honourable Mr. J. J. Heaton ... ..	69
Purshotandas Thackurdas, Esq. ... ..	69
R. E. A. Elliott, Esq., I. C. S. ... ..	71
The Honourable Mr. W. H. Sharp, M.A. ... ..	71
Rev. R. Scott ... ..	72
Lieut.-Col. A. Street, F.R.C.S., I.M.S. ... ..	73

	PAGE
R. D. Hughes, Esq. ...	74
Sir Sassoon David ...	76
Hussonally Abdoolally, Esq., J.P.	77
R. H. A. Delves, Esq. ...	78
Major A. D. G. Shelley ...	79
D. E. Wacha, Esq. ...	81
Phirozé C. Sethna, Esq. ...	82
Ardeshir Nowroji Guzder, Esq. ...	84
A. C. L. Wilkinson, Esq. ...	85
The Honourable Mr. Abdul Hoosein Adamji Peerbhoy ...	86
J. L. Britto, Esq. ...	89
Jamsetji Ardesir Wadia, Esq. ...	91
J. F. Watson, Esq., A.M.I.C.E.	92
Cowasjee Jehangir, Esq. ...	94
Sir Cowasjee Jehangir, Bart. ...	97
Sunderrao D. Nawalkar, Esq., M.R.A.S.E.	98
Dr. Nadirshaw H. E. Sukhia ...	99
The Honourable Colonel R. W. S. Lyons ...	105
W. S. Millard, Esq....	105
Vasantrao Anandrao Dabholkar, Esq.	106
Chunilal V. Mehta, Esq. ...	110
Hormasji Adarji Kanga, Esq., L.C.E.	111
The Chamber of Commerce ...	115
Ardeshir C. Powalla, Esq. ...	117
Hooseinbhoj Abdoolabhoy Lallji	118
W. A. Chambers, Esq. ...	119
A. G. Viegas, Esq....	120
Sir Jamsetjee Jejeebhoy, Bart. ...	121
Lieut.-Col. M. Collie, I. M. S. (Retired)	123
H. P. Mody, Esq. ...	125
Sir Dinshaw Maneckji Petit, Bart.	128
Jehangir Bomanji Petit, Esq. ..	129
Major W. G. Liston ...	132
H. A. Wadya, Esq. ...	133
R. E. Gregor-Pearse, Esq. ...	136
R. J. Kent, Esq., A.M.I.C.E.	137
Dr. J. A. Turner ...	142
A. J. Bilimoria, Esq. ...	143
J. L. Britto, Esq. ...	145
Peter A. Baptista, Esq. ...	146
Joseph Baptista, Esq. ...	147
Jamsetji Edulji Saklatvala, Esq.	151
G. L. Narasimham, Esq. ...	157
J. W. Mackison, Esq., B.Sc., M.I.C.E.	158
Narotam Gokuldas, Esq. ...	172
F. C. Rimington, Esq. ...	173
A. J. Bilimoria, Esq. ...	181
<b>D.—ORAL EVIDENCE—</b>	
Chairman's opening speech ...	213
Parshotamdas Thakurdas, Esq. ...	214
E. L. Sale, Esq., I. C. S. ...	220
Manmohandas Ramji, Esq. ...	226
W. R. Philpot-Brookes, Esq. ...	231
The Honourable Mr. Justice Heaton ...	236
The Honourable Sir Fazulbhoj Currimbhoy ...	238

CONTENTS.

iii

	PAGE
Major H. A. L. Hepper ... ..	250
M. S. Bharucha, Esq. ... ..	256
The Honourable Mr. J. P. Chrystal ... ..	266
S. M. Edwardes, Esq. ... ..	272
J. F. Watson, Esq. ... ..	279
The Honourable Mr. J. P. Orr, C.S.I., I. C. S. ... ..	285
Sir Vithaldas D. Thackersy ... ..	300
Dr. J. A. Turner ... ..	301
J. W. Mackison, Esq. ... ..	306
A. J. Bilimoria, Esq. ... ..	316
Chunilal V. Mehta, Esq. ... ..	329
Major A. D. G. Shelley ... ..	334
W. A. Chambers, Esq. ... ..	335
E.—NOTE ON THE EXCLUSION OF THE MAHIM WOODS PORTION FROM IMPROVEMENT TRUST SCHEME V. ... ..	337
F.—SIR ALFRED HOPKINSON'S REPORTS ON THE BOMBAY UNIVERSITY ... ..	341
G.—SUPPLEMENTARY WRITTEN STATEMENTS—	
P. E. Ghamat, Esq.... ..	345
Major H. A. L. Hepper, R. E. ... ..	352
Colonel R. W. S. Lyons, M.D., I. M. S. ... ..	355
The Honourable Mr. J. P. Orr, C.S.I., I. C. S. ... ..	360

MAPS.

MAP SHOWING PUBLIC BUILDINGS OF BOMBAY ... ..	<i>To face page xii</i>
MAP OF BOMBAY SHOWING PROPOSED TRAMWAY EXTENSIONS ... ..	<i>To face page 176</i>
MAP OF BOMBAY SHOWING SOME PROPOSED DEVELOPMENTS ... ..	<i>In pocket at end of book.</i>

*CORRIGENDUM.*

*Page 180. At the bottom of the third column of the Statement, for "1,01,586" read "1,13,695," and for "71,327" read "79,619".*

# REPORT.

## CHAPTER I.

### INTRODUCTORY.

We, as forming the Committee appointed by Government Resolutions\* No. 7440, dated the 16th October 1913, and No. 8005, dated November 7th, 1913, have the honour to submit the following report on the subject of the Development of the Town of Bombay. The second representative nominated by the Bombay Municipal Corporation in accordance with the second paragraph of the latter Resolution was Sir Bhalchandra Krishna.

2. The Committee met informally on November 10th and 14th, 1913, and commenced its formal sittings for the taking of the evidence on the 20th idem. The hearing of witnesses was concluded on the March 17th, 1914.

Appended are copies† of the written statements received by the Committee, mainly in response to its invitation; we append also copies‡ of the oral evidence recorded by us.

3. In reporting on the subject under consideration we have determined as the most convenient method briefly to follow, so far as is possible, the order of headings cited by Government in paragraph 4 of Government Resolution\* No. 7440 of October 16th, 1913; but, as will be observed from a perusal of the report, it has been found necessary to interpolate consideration of, and our recommendations on, the wider questions adverted to by Government in paragraph 5 and to take into account considerations of importance which have not been specifically referred to in the Resolution.

## CHAPTER II.

### MEASURES ADVOCATED BY GOVERNMENT IN 1909 AND PROGRESS MADE.

4. In Government Resolution§ No. 3022 of 14th June 1909 the following measures were noted for immediate adoption, *viz.* :—

(a) The erection of a large number of chawls for the accommodation of the poorer classes in the east, north-east, and central portions of the Island, in the vicinity of the docks, factories, and workshops.

(b) The widening of Abdul Rahman Street.

(c) The linking up of Frere and Reay Roads.

(d) The removal of St. George's Hospital.

(e) The recovery from the Improvement Trust, after negotiation, of their rights of reclamation in Back Bay south of Charni Road.

(f) The drafting and adoption of a Town Planning Act.

The following matters were put down for subsequent treatment, *viz.* :—

(g) The removal of Love Grove Pumping Station from Worli,

and the provision of three broad arterial lines of communication running north and south, to be developed from the following existing thoroughfares, *viz.* :—

(h) Frere and Reay Roads to Sion.

(i) Abdul Rahman Street and Parel Road to Sion.

(j) Chunam Kiln Road and Gilder Street to Bandra Causeway through the Mahim Woods.

\* Appendix B.

† Appendix C.

‡ Appendix D.

§ Appendix A.



5. The following decisions also were arrived at by Government in 1909, *viz.* :—

(k) Reclamation in Back Bay is necessary and desirable.

(l) No sufficient grounds exist for the preparation of a scheme of overhead or underground railways outside Port Trust limits.

(m) The B. B. & C. I. Railway will be required in its entirety, *i. e.*, to Colaba Station.

(n) The running of long-distance B. B. & C. I. trains into the Victoria Terminus will not be necessary.

(o) Labourers and factory operatives must be housed close to the docks and factories.

(p) Government was not prepared to take any action in regard to the provision of cheap workmen's trains or tramways.

6. We are asked to report what progress has been made in the execution of this scheme of 1909 and what modifications have actually occurred in that scheme as so far carried out.

(a) Government brought to notice in 1909 the fact that whereas at the time of the formation of the City Improvement Trust it was estimated that a sum of 75 lakhs would be required for erecting sanitary dwellings for the poorer classes during the first ten years of the Trust's existence the sums expended did not exceed 11 lakhs. Since 1909 the Trust has erected new chawls at Imamwada, Nagpada, Agripada, Mandvi and Soparibaug Road containing 1,290 living rooms. There is now a total of 4,251 living rooms provided by the Trust and the total cost of these chawls, including value of land but exclusive of the cost of management and establishment, amounts to about Rs. 34,32,000. In addition there are semi-permanent camps at Phaltan Road and Chowpatty containing 510 rooms in all. The average population of these chawls and camps in 1912-13 was 17,266. In addition to these chawls and camps the Board has sanctioned the erection of chawls at Chinch Bunder and Agripada containing together 708 rooms and semi-permanent camps at Agripada and Soparibaug Road having 241 rooms.

An attempt to secure further facilities for providing accommodation for the poorer classes is the passing of the amendment of the City of Bombay Improvement Act last year. The Trust can now under sections 32B to 32I of the Act materially assist employers of labour to provide housing accommodation for their workmen. (It is impossible as yet to judge what degree of success will attend these measures.)

(b) The widening of Abdul Rahman Street to form part of a main arterial road has been abandoned. It is, however, planned to be widened under the set-back clauses of the Municipal Act to a breadth of 60 feet, and during the last 4 years more than 1½ lakhs has been expended in taking up setbacks. Sydenham Road is being substituted as a main thoroughfare (*vide* (i) below).

(c) Frere and Reay Roads have been connected by a 90-foot road.

(d) No steps have been taken to remove St. George's Hospital.

(e) An agreement has been arrived at between Government and the Improvement Trust by which, when Government reclaims in Back Bay, the Improvement Trust is to share the profits due to the exercise on the part of Government of the rights of reclamation vested in the Trust in accordance with Schedule E of the City of Bombay Improvement Act, and section 61 of the Act was amended last year so that Government might itself carry out reclamation by arrangement with the Trust.

(f) A Town Planning Bill has been introduced and passed its first reading at the March Session of the Legislative Council.

(g) Of the alternatives before the Municipality the idea of removing the Love Grove Pumping Station has been for the present given up by the Municipality, and new and powerful up-to-date engines and pumps of large capacity are being installed. It has been decided to construct a new outfall sewer at Love Grove extending about  $\frac{3}{4}$  mile into the sea, the sewer being designed with the intention of removing the nuisance which is now caused in the bay by the sewage being thrown back on the shore.

(h) The Corporation has sanctioned the widening of Reay Road up to 90 feet as far as its junction with Gunpowder Road, and the widening of the further portion up to the Municipal limit northwards is under the consideration of the Corporation. The Port Trust has given an undertaking to extend the widening from their southern limit as far as the north approach of the proposed Victoria Bridge and will await development of trade to widen the rest of the road up to Kalachowki Road. There is no scheme to extend the road further towards Sion. But the Municipality has under consideration the desirability of an extension to join the proposed new cross-road between Sewri New Road and the Eastern Avenue at Currey Road. Also Sewri Old Road is proposed to be widened to 60 feet and a portion of it is to be diverted and the gradient improved up to where it joins Sewri-Koliwada Road. From the south end of Sewri-Koliwada Road the road is proposed partly to be diverted and partly widened up to Bombay Cotton Mill and thence extended northwards through Wadala village until it emerges and joins the Matunga Road at the Salt Customs Office, from which point the existing road is to be widened by the Improvement Trust under Scheme VI.

(i) As is stated under (b) above, the proposed southern portion of this main thoroughfare has been diverted from Abdul Rahman Street to Sydenham Road, which will be a 100-foot road in continuation of Phaltan Road up to the junction of Parel and Sandhurst Roads. Some of the preliminary acquisition work for this road has been completed. The widening of the portion from Sandhurst Road to Lalbagh is under consideration and the question whether the width should be 100 feet or 120 feet is under discussion. Between Lalbagh and Sion the construction of the road is in hand.

(j) The length from Queen's Road to Arthur Road is now known as Lamington Road. The old Chunam Kiln Road has been widened to 80 feet up to Grant Road. From Grant Road to Bellasis Road the width is 80 feet. From Bellasis Road northwards the road is 60 feet wide, and the Municipal Commissioner has suggested a line to widen it to 80 feet up to the toe of the south approach of Arthur Road Bridge. To secure this width a portion of the Byculla Club compound has already been taken up by the Municipality. Then the Improvement Trust is to provide the extra 20 feet up to Jacob's Circle, whence most of the land belongs to the Municipality and the road up to DeLisle Road can without much difficulty be widened to 80 feet. North of this, a 100-foot road has been laid down along DeLisle Road and across Mahim Woods through the tank opposite the Portuguese Church to Lady Jamsetji Causeway and along the latter road to the Mahim Causeway. It is proposed to widen DeLisle Road from Haines Road to the toe of the south approach of the proposed DeLisle Road overbridge and from the toe of the north approach of the DeLisle Road overbridge to the north end of DeLisle Road. It is stated, however, that the authority of the Municipal Commissioner to do this is now under discussion. The sanction of the Corporation has been applied for to lay down a fresh line for widening to 145 feet the portion of DeLisle Road from the toe of the north approach. This latter width is considered necessary in order to accommodate the DeLisle Road overbridge, the proposal to widen which to 80 feet is under consideration, a 40-foot low level road being intended on the west and a 20-foot low level road on the east.

## CHAPTER III.

## CHANGES AND ADDITIONS, IF ANY, ADVISABLE IN THE LIGHT OF THE EXPERIENCE OF THE PAST FOUR YEARS.

7. We consider that the scheme as outlined by Government in 1909 is calculated to meet the necessities of Bombay for some years to come. It has been suggested that a third causeway should be constructed between the Máhim and Sion Causeways. We consider however that when these two Causeways are widened the needs of the situation will be met.

We shall deal with some matters relating to communications which constitute an addition to the schemes advocated by Government in 1909. But before discussing these and other subsidiary matters, it will be convenient to indicate, for the information of Government, the point of view from which we have approached the question of development in its wider expression.

8. We have aimed, in the method of investigation adopted, at eliciting information under the following main heads:—

- (i) What is the existing natural trend of development in respect of
  - (a) industry;
  - (b) commerce, and the resultant demand for office accommodation;
  - (c) residential accommodation?
- (ii) What are the most pressing needs of Bombay in respect of sanitation, light and air?
- (iii) In regard to the future development of institutions of an educational, scientific, public or medical character, what are the methods which will tend to secure the best results consistently with the general growth of the city?
- (iv) In respect of (i) (a) should any definite policy be enunciated and if so what?
- (v) How can the natural town-planning development under (i) (b) and (c) best be served?
- (vi) What additional means of communications will be necessary as a consequence of (i)?

We shall now discuss these points *seriatim* and communicate our conclusions and recommendations under each head.

## CHAPTER IV.

## INDUSTRIAL AND COMMERCIAL DEVELOPMENT.

9. At the outset here we desire to place on record our dissent from the generally accepted condemnation of the so-called "haphazard" manner in which factories, etc., have been allowed to grow up in the City of Bombay. Viewing the situation as it exists at present, it is, of course, patent that mills, dyeing works and tanneries have been established in places which, in the light of subsequent growth, are undesirable. It is, however, to be remembered that this subsequent growth is an indirect result of fostering the development of these industries. In the days when the mill industry was in its infancy and when means of communication and transport were inadequate it would not only have been regarded as shortsighted to banish the factory from the Island of Bombay, but such a policy would, not improbably, have strangled, or at all events impeded, the growth of the industry and have retarded indefinitely the development and prosperity of the City. With this made clear, however, it is evident from the map which has been prepared by Mr. Mackison and which is

attached to this report that the mill industry, though spread all over the Island, has tended chiefly to develop in the central portions (Tardeo and Parel) and latterly towards the north of the Island, but usually in close proximity to the G. I. P. Railway, while there are two mills at Kurla in Salsette. With the construction of the Mahim loop, and the initiation of the Harbour Branch of the railway system, it is possible, now that the mill industry has long become firmly and securely established, to consider, with an eye to the future development of the City in other directions, whether the further expansion of industrial enterprise should not be located in particular areas. The majority of the witnesses who were examined on this point suggested that, provided facilities of communication existed, all mills, factories, etc., projected in the future should be erected only in the north-eastern corner of the Island of Bombay or in Eastern Salsette. We examined several witnesses closely on the question whether such a restriction would unduly hamper future industrial development, but it was preponderatingly held that, provided that suitable and adequate railway facilities were made available (which it would be to the interests of the Railways to ensure), the requirement would be no deterrent to industrial enterprise.

10. In considering this matter we have borne in mind other important considerations. On general grounds it is clearly an advantage to have a large industry, such as that of the cotton mills, situated away from the residential area of a large town. Factory employes must live near their work or have easy, rapid and cheap means of access to it; with the result that the neighbourhood of a factory, if situated within a closely populated residential area, is almost certain to be overcrowded. The location of a factory outside the City automatically removes from the densely populated area a proportion of the population. It has been suggested that a decision to require the segregation of future factories in a particular area might lead to difficulties connected with the supply of labour. We consider that this difficulty has been exaggerated. Two mills exist already at Kurla and we have no reason to believe that the labour question presents more difficulties there than in the Island of Bombay. One witness did, indeed, state that there were some difficulties at first in Kurla; but we consider that they are less likely to be acute now than they were then.

In a city situated as Bombay is, with an attractive western frontage and a very uniform direction of air current from the west, it is of obvious importance, so far as possible, not only to preserve the western area for residential purposes, but to avoid the location, along the western belt, of industries or trades of an offensive or defacing character.

Finally the whole of the business and commerce of the City of Bombay is directed towards and along the eastern shore of the Island where are the Harbour, the Docks, the shipping offices, the Harbour Railways, and the export and import yards and wharves, and where the Cotton Green will shortly be established.

On a consideration of the whole aspect of the case, therefore, we agree in the view expressed by witnesses that in future the industrial development of Bombay in its manifestations of mills, factories and works of an offensive character, such as dyeing works and tanneries, tends naturally towards the area in the north-eastern corner of the Island and extending into Salsette. We consider that all offensive trades, whatever the number of employes, and other factories and large industries employing more than a certain number of employes, should be restricted, in future, to that area. What the maximum number should be is, we suggest, a matter for special enquiry.

11. In regard to the natural trend of development of commerce as indicated in the demand for office accommodation (paragraph 8 (i) (a)), we found greater difficulty in coming to a determination. At present the area within which all the larger commercial offices are situated is between Carnac Road in the north and Esplanade Road (Museum) in the south, the more important being situated along Hornby Road and the roads leading off it to the west and in the area to the north of Church Gate Street and Elphinstone Circle. Since the

construction of the large blocks of offices along and to the west side of Hornby Road, there has been a not inconsiderable fall in rent for offices in and to the southward of Church Gate Street and in Elphinstone Circle. This is said to be due in part to the very antiquated accommodation in the older buildings in the narrow streets along and off Apollo Street which caused their vacation as soon as better and more convenient quarters were created. It further appears that the office accommodation in the depreciated areas is not as fully occupied as formerly, though, so far as can be ascertained, this is due to the antiquated nature of the buildings and the inconveniently narrow road communications rather than to the space available having outstripped the demand. The actual trend of migration of offices appears, then, to follow the provision of suitable accommodation in easily accessible localities rather than to centre round any given pivot of business activity. Witnesses competent to express opinions deserving weight have held the view that the tendency will be for office accommodation to be demanded in the north-east area of Fort North, while others, where opinions are entitled to respect, have suggested that business houses would, if they were able to, establish their places of business to the south of the Museum, thus ousting residents from the flats which are at present used as residential quarters.

12. We incline to the conclusion that the trend of development in the demand for business houses and office accommodation will naturally be in the direction of the north-east of the Fort area, and even north of that area altogether. Holding that view it becomes necessary here to advert to the question of providing a thoroughfare between Hornby Road and Ballard Road parallel to and to the northward of Church Gate Street. It may perhaps at first sight appear that this project, which has been warmly advocated by many witnesses, should properly have been discussed under the head of additional communications (paragraph 7 *ante*), but we regard this scheme as being far more intimately associated with the internal convenience and healthfulness of the centre of business activity than with the general development of communications.

13. In view of the conclusions suggested in the preceding paragraphs we regard an Improvement Scheme for Fort North, including a communication from east to west, as very desirable and important for the following reasons:—

(a) There is an increasing demand for office accommodation in this neighbourhood and the demand will be progressive.

(b) Residential accommodation of the kind incidental to office accommodation of this class is also in growing demand.

(c) The north-east portion of the Fort area is highly congested and insanitary.

(d) The construction of an east and west thoroughfare in itself is desirable; but chiefly because it must incidentally subserve the above more important needs.

14. The road itself will be a great convenience, and we are disposed to the belief that the improvement scheme suggested above, if undertaken with foresight and care in reference to prospective values, need not prove very costly. We advise that very early consideration be given to this matter, which we believe will result in a vast improvement in the amenities, convenience, and healthfulness of the whole of the Fort and neighbouring areas. We are disposed to agree with Mr. Mackison that such a scheme is quite feasible.

15. The demand for this road has, however, an important bearing on the question under discussion in this section of the report. It shows that there is a pressing and urgent demand for more office accommodation of the better class; and—what is of greater moment as giving the answer to the question of the natural trend of that demand—it indicates, in our opinion, that the growth of this demand will tend towards the east and north of Hornby Road and Church Gate Street up towards Frere Road, and not, though the contrary opinion is held by such competent observers as Sir Fazulbhoy Currimbhoy and Mr. Edwardes, to the southward of the Crescent.

That this is the correct estimate is, in our view, rendered more probable by the developments in progress northward of the Docks, and will perhaps be further assured if the views expressed and the recommendation which we made in paragraph 10 prove correct and are accepted. In all these circumstances it is with a fair approach to confidence that we estimate that the future trend of demand for business premises, etc., will be northward and eastward of the present hub of activity and that, though it will probably not extend north of Carnac Road, it may ultimately trench upon the frontages of Frere Road.

## CHAPTER V.

### TREND OF DEVELOPMENT IN RESPECT OF RESIDENTIAL AREAS.

16. The question formulated in paragraph 8 (i) (c) is at the very root of any constructive suggestions for the development of Bombay, and is the one to which we have devoted most anxious attention. So many conditions have to be presupposed and discussed in any general review of probabilities that it has been a matter of peculiar difficulty to formulate a confident and complete reply to the question.

Two propositions have, however, been so consistently stated by witnesses that we feel it is as well to record them, and our own acceptance of them, at the outset of a discussion of this matter.

*Firstly.*—The whole of the foreshore from the Hornby Vellard northward up to Bandra Creek affords suitable sites for residences of the best class.\*

*Secondly.*—The whole of this area, south of Mahim Bay foreshore, is useless for such a purpose so long as the nuisance due to the defective nature of the arrangements for sewage discharge continues.

Therefore we find it necessary to recommend that—

(i) the improvements at Love Grove now in process of construction by the Municipality should be pushed on as rapidly as possible to completion;

(ii) their results should be closely and critically watched for a period covering one monsoon; and

(iii) if they prove a failure, that is to say, if the nuisance is only mitigated and not so wholly removed as to make the foreshore north and south attractive for residences, the matter should be forthwith referred to an expert Committee for consideration as to the measures then to be taken.

17. If and when this foreshore is, either by the measures in hand or hereafter to be resorted to, made available for residential purposes, we are convinced, on the evidence recorded before us, that the natural tendency of the wealthy classes will be to take up their residences there, and that the process will commence, though it will not develop rapidly, as soon as the nuisance is removed, provided that† communications are improved and that the locality is made available and laid out for the purpose on a properly thought out plan. This aspect of the case will be reverted to when dealing with sub-paragraph (v) of paragraph 8.

18. In respect of the less well-to-do classes varying opinions have been expressed by witnesses; but we think that, subject to the existence of improved methods of communication, the balance of the evidence is to the effect that—

(a) the upper middle classes would naturally tend to migrate towards either Salsette (Santa Cruz and Andheri) or to the better blocks of scheme V of the Improvement Trust at Matunga; but perhaps chiefly to the latter until the amenities in Salsette are improved;

\* Mr. Mackison expresses doubt as to the suitability of the Worlee shore on account of its rocky formation, but in this view he stands alone.

† The question of traction will be dealt with further on.

(b) the lower middle classes would go to Matunga, and perhaps also to the area landwards of the Mahim Woods area when the latter are developed into a high class residential area ; and

(c) the still poorer classes will spread out from the more crowded areas in the city into the quarters vacated by (b).

When discussing the location, in future, of factories, etc., in the north-east of the island, and their restriction to that area and to Salsette, it was observed that, since the mill employes follow the mills in which they are employed, such restriction will automatically prevent increased congestion in the south as a consequence of the development of industrial enterprise. But, as will be indicated later, we recommend that the provision of quarters for their employes, or a percentage of them, in the neighbourhood of their mills should be made obligatory on employers.

## CHAPTER VI.

### RELIEF OF CONGESTION.

19. The problem of devising suitable methods for improving the overcrowded slums of Bombay is one of great difficulty and complexity. This is especially so because measures adopted on sanitary grounds may produce unexpected economic consequences. Care must be taken that attempts to effect improvement in one part of the City do not result in aggravating the overcrowding other parts. Such undesirable results might be due either to contraction of available space or to a disparity between wages and rents which might be occasioned by the changes.

20. We will first glance at the history of the course of building operations in general in Bombay. Down to a comparatively late period, the great object was to attract population to the City. Facilities were freely given to people who were permitted to come and build houses in any manner that suited them, and although references are found in instructions issued to them from time to time from the end of the eighteenth century onwards, it does not appear that the different bodies appointed by Government to help in carrying out the Municipal administration of the City actually paid any special regard to measures for securing sanitary building. The result was that in 1864 the City was found to be suffering from a very high rate of mortality, and public feeling was so much aroused that Government brought in a Bill in 1865 through the agency of a private citizen, Mr. Cassels, who was a Member of Council at that time. In the Act of 1865 some building regulations were introduced for the first time, being probably copied from Bengal Acts.

In 1872 a new Act for reorganizing the Municipal administration was passed, and the present constitution was then introduced. This Act was extended by a subsequent Act of 1878. In 1888 the Act was remodelled, Lord Reay being at that time Governor of Bombay. Some building regulations were then included in the Act and larger powers of framing by-laws were given. Building By-Laws under this Act were sanctioned by Government in 1892. These By-Laws were amended in 1897. After this, the necessity for various amendments was discussed, and in 1901 Mr. Harvey made an exhaustive report on the subject. The Municipal Solicitors advised that the suggestions made by Mr. Harvey were such as could not be dealt with by By-laws until the Act had been amended. An amendment of the Act was consequently effected in 1905. In 1906 Government enquired what progress had been made in revising the Building By-laws. By-laws were then drafted and were referred in 1908 to a Committee which reported in the following year. Certain modifications suggested by Government were accepted and the existing By-Laws were passed in 1910.

Meanwhile, on the outbreak of plague the Epidemic Diseases Act was passed in 1897. By a Notification under that Act, dated February 10th, 1897, the Municipal Commissioner was empowered to prohibit by a written order the further use as a dwelling of any residential building which appeared to him to be unfit for human habitation. By the same Notification he was empowered, if he thought that any building thus vacated could not be adapted to the sanitary requirements of a dwelling or was otherwise permanently unfit for human habitation, to demolish the building or any part thereof. When a building or part of a building was thus demolished, the owner was entitled to receive the amount of the then actual market value of the structure, no allowance being made or compensation paid on account of compulsory demolition. By another Notification, dated May 10th, 1898, under the Act, the Commissioner was empowered, when he considered the ventilation of a building to be defective, to require the owner to carry out specified structural or other work for the improvement of the ventilation of the building. If the owner did not comply, the Commissioner could do the work and recover the expense from the owner. In 1900, the Corporation asked that the policy followed in respect of proceedings taken under the Act for the improvement of houses might be reconsidered. Government in reply stated that they were prepared to direct that expenses incurred by the Municipal Commissioner in giving effect to the sanitary alteration of houses under the Act should be defrayed in the same manner as improvement expenses under section 495 of the Municipal Act. In 1903 the Corporation again addressed Government, asking for reconsideration on the ground that the operations under the Epidemic Diseases Act inflicted very severe hardship on the poorer class of house-owners. Correspondence ensued and in 1912 the powers of the Plague Commissioner vested in the Municipal Commissioner, and on Government being satisfied that the conditions prescribed by them had been fulfilled the powers vested in that officer under the Epidemic Diseases Act were revoked. Under that Act, over 14,000 houses were inspected, over 9,000 improvement notices were issued, and over 4,000 certificates were granted after completion of the improvement demanded.

21. In spite of all this there is no doubt that slums exist and there is a risk that, unless careful measures are adopted, they may become worse. Two kinds of slum-owners may be distinguished. The first kind consists of the well-to-do owners of chawls; and the second consists of individual owners, hereditary or otherwise, of single small houses, upon the rent from which they depend for their livelihood. Care should be taken that the application of the rules does not fall too oppressively on the latter class of owners.

22. But that some remedy should be applied there is no doubt. The first measure to be adopted is to encourage migration as much as possible, by developing open land, which still exists largely, for residential purposes. Scheme V of the City Improvement Trust, which contemplates the opening up and laying out of Mátunga as a residential area is well designed to help forward this purpose. Again, Máhim could be usefully developed by a process of town-planning. It is not, in our view, likely that migration would extend further north than Andheri. Overcrowding can also be reduced to some extent, as pointed out in a previous chapter, by requiring the Railway Companies to house their work-people outside the City and other employers of labour to provide housing accommodation as there pointed out for their employés.

Every scheme of development should also make provision for the reservation of land to remain permanently open for recreative purposes. We agree with, and wish to endorse, in connection with this question the following remarks which occur in the Final Report of the Delhi Town Planning Committee: "When dealing with the detailed lay-out of the area intended to be devoted to minor officials, etc., care should be taken to see that ample air space and playing grounds for children are provided in the vicinity of these residences. It is now customary elsewhere in well laid out neighbourhoods where the houses are small in character to provide areas of at least as much as one acre for every 10 acres of gross land developed, and open spaces of this character should invariably be provided in the vicinity."



The second necessity is that the Building By-laws should be further strengthened as much as possible. A Committee of the Corporation has approved of authorizing the Municipality to declare single rooms unfit for human habitation, and with this recommendation we agree. It is found that additions and alterations take place in buildings which, though in consonance with possible interpretations of the Building By-laws, render buildings insanitary. Power should be given to the Municipality to require that there should be no subsequent alterations or additions to buildings which would not have been allowed if the whole building had been reconstructed afresh. Power should also be given to prohibit such subsequent partitioning of rooms as would not be allowed in the first instance when building plans were approved. It is further desirable to have more stringent Building By-laws than at present for the outlying portions of the City. Such a proposal as Mr. Orr's to lay down a  $63\frac{1}{2}^{\circ}$  rule is good. It is said that in Calcutta this rule is applied throughout the whole City, but it is not enforced at the side of buildings.

The principle which we should recommend for adoption here is, in brief, that, while, in regard to existing buildings, erected in accordance with the spirit and letter of the by-laws of the time, it is not possible to enforce compliance at present with a  $63\frac{1}{2}^{\circ}$  rule, that rule should be applied in the case of all future additions to or alterations of such buildings; and that, in regard to these the test of fitness for human habitation should be applicable to all dwelling houses, the necessity or otherwise of operations thereunder being at the discretion of the Municipality on receipt of reports by their Health Engineering Departments.

23. Even after all this has been carried out a great deal will remain to be done to render the City sanitary, and we cannot help thinking that it is not advisable indefinitely to suspend the process of carrying out Improvement Schemes through the agency of the Improvement Trust. As shown in an earlier chapter, ample progress has been and is being made in the work of providing wide channels of traffic; and it is our opinion that the time has come to consider whether, side by side with the gradual completion of the extension scheme at present in hand, the City Improvement Trust should not also devote itself to undertaking small Improvement Schemes within the City. The Trust has been in existence since 1899, and the burden of improving portions of the City has fallen upon the general ratepayer. Therefore, side by side with the alteration of the by-laws with a view to emphasize the individual responsibility of house-owners for the habitable condition of their dwellings, there should, in our opinion, proceed general schemes for betterment of congested areas through the agency of the City Improvement Trust.

24. Lastly we feel justified in referring to the obligations of millowners and other large employers of labour. Reference has already been made to the tendency of mill-employés to live close to their work. The same is the case with all workshops, such as those of the B. B. & C. I. and G. I. P. Railways, employing numerous hands. At present these operatives do in fact live in close proximity to their work, whether in tenements provided by the employers or in neighbouring portions of the city.

In the case of millhands it is inevitable that the operatives should continue to reside within easy distance of their work. Recognition of this necessity, coupled with a realization of the need for securing that their quarters should be sanitary, has led to an amendment of the City of Bombay Improvement Act by which millowners are enabled to provide chawls, on easy terms, for a proportion of their operatives. Advantage of these new provisions of the law has not yet been taken; and opinion is divided as to how far it is possible to expect that the provisions will be acted upon. Evidence is, however, to the effect that millowners would not suffer by acting upon them; and the view has been expressed that a further step should be taken and that millowners should in future be required by law to provide chawl accommodation for their operatives on the terms which are permitted at present.

It is relevant, also, to this question to cite the view expressed by Major Heppelwhite stated, in reply to a direct question, that he considered that a

demand that the Railway Companies should provide accommodation outside Bombay for the employes of their workshops would be a perfectly reasonable demand. It is of course important to remember that the case of millhands is not entirely analogous. The Railway Companies can convey their employes to and from their work in special workmen's trains free of charge to the employe. The millowners cannot. The principle is, however, the same and we desire to record our opinion that the principle is right. In its application it will mean that all large employers of labour must provide house accommodation for its operatives in localities which can be specified in relation to their employment, *viz.*, either adjacent to the factory or workshop, or within easy reach of it. The effect is that the restriction of future industrial development to certain areas will automatically also carry with it the provision of the necessary house accommodation within those areas. In our opinion legislation should now be undertaken requiring millowners to proceed under the amended Act and we also recommend strongly for the consideration of Government that the necessary steps be taken to require provision of quarters outside the Island of Bombay for the operatives in the railway workshops.

25. To sum up this portion of the report, we desire to record the following hopes :—

(i) That the City Improvement Trust will continue to devote special attention to the provision of sanitary chawl accommodation for the poor evicted from tenements demolished in process of Improvement Schemes.

(ii) That the Municipality will treat as a matter of the greatest urgency the question, now before a Committee, of the revision of its building bye-laws, so as to bring the requirements up to date, and to make them have effect within the limits specified in respect of existing buildings as is done in England.

(iii) That the City Improvement Trust should undertake Improvement Schemes within the congested area of the City.

(iv) That the law be amended so as to require millowners to take advantage of the amended City of Bombay Improvement Act.

(v) That the Railway Companies will be required to provide accommodation for a large proportion of their workshop operatives outside the Island of Bombay.

26. It has been necessary, in this section of the report, for us to dwell at length upon the position of the Municipality. In expressing the hopes formulated in the preceding paragraph, clauses (ii) and (iii), we believe that it is only echoing the aspiration of the Bombay Corporation whose task of bringing the by-laws into conformity with the latest requirements has been one of great complexity and difficulty. It is in no spirit of criticism that the case has been examined. It is only with a view, in the light of opinions recorded, to assist Government and the Municipality with suggestions that we have thought it to be our duty to examine the matter in such detail. The conclusion forced itself upon us that, while our main task was to record and submit suggestions for the development of Bombay, we should be neglecting our clear duty if we left untouched the ancillary and equally vital problem of improving and relieving the congestion of some of the overcrowded areas.

## CHAPTER VII.

### DEVELOPMENT OF PUBLIC INSTITUTIONS.

27. We now turn to a consideration of plans in regard to the location of certain institutions of a public character whose expansion is necessary. In paragraph 8 (iii) these have been classified as being chiefly of an educational, scientific or medical character, but it is more convenient to consider them all, in the first instance, as institutions of a public or quasi-public character.

It may be said that all the main institutions, save the chief Hospital of the city, have grown up within the area bounded on the north by the Carnac Road, Dhobi Talao, and Marine Lines Station, and on the south by the road leading from the Apollo Bunder to the Bandstand. Within this area,\* bounded on the east and west by the sea, are comprised the following important buildings.†

- |  |                                     |
|--|-------------------------------------|
| (1) The Secretariats.  | (13) The Town Hall.                 |
| (2) The University.  | (14) The Municipal Offices.         |
| (3) The High Court.  | (15) The Victoria Terminus.         |
| (4) The General Post Office.   | (16) The B. B. & C. I. Ry. Offices. |
| (5) Elphinstone College.   | (17) The Police Court.              |
| (6) The Museum.  | (18) The Police Head-quarters.      |
| (7) The Royal Institute of Science.  | (19) The Cathedral.                 |
| (8) The Telegraph Office.  | (20) The Anjuman-i-Islam.           |
| (9) The Mint.  | (21) Elphinstone High School.       |
| (10) The Custom House.   | (22) The J. J. School of Art.       |
| (11) The Government Central Press.   | (23) St. Xavier's College.          |
| (12) St. George's, the Goculdas Tejpal<br>and the Cama and Albles Hospitals. |                                     |

Within the area in question there are the open spaces known as the "Maidan", the "Marine Lines Maidan", the "Oval", the "Cooperage" and the "Kennedy Sea Face", but, apart from these, there is no room for the expansion of any of the above institutions. No defined area in any capital could more truly be described as the heart of the city.

28. In paragraph 5 (a) of the Resolution appointing the Committee we have been asked to report whether it is possible to entertain the idea of uprooting long established institutions, such as the University buildings and the Colleges grouped in their neighbourhood, the Secretariat and the High Court, with a view to provide for the City's growing needs and for their own need for expansion. We have questioned nearly every witness upon this point, and, with few exceptions, the answer has been emphatically in the negative. We have elicited the view, which may be said to be universal, and which was expressed in most emphatic and convincing terms, that neither in respect of the chief Government offices, nor in regard to the University buildings and connected institutions, could the idea of removal be seriously contemplated. So emphatic, and so unexpectedly unanimous, has been this view that we do not regard it as necessary to discuss at length the arguments and reasons adduced. In regard to the University we have ascertained‡ that there has grown up a sentiment in connection with the beautiful building facing the Oval which in itself is an asset of no mean value to education if not to civic development. Only necessity of the most convincing character would justify the removal of a University, housed as is the Bombay University, which has succeeded in giving birth to such feeling. As regards the Secretariat buildings the case is widely different, though the arguments against removal to an area out of touch with the centre of the City's life are of almost equal cogency. It has been stated by many witnesses that such removal would be a real inconvenience to the business section of the City, while in its relation to public life the loss would be even more serious.

With these conclusions we are in accord, and we desire in the most emphatic manner to report our opinion that it is wholly out of the question to contemplate the removal of these institutions to another part of the Island.

29. It has been stated in paragraph 25 that, apart from the open spaces there detailed, there is no room for the expansion of the institutions some of which have been detailed there; and we therefore questioned several witnesses on the point whether some of those spaces might not be utilized for

\* See map facing this page.

† All Military buildings are here left out of account.

‡ See especially the evidence of the Vice-Chancellor.



the expanding needs of some of the public institutions. It was ascertained that the needs of Government comprised *inter alia* the following :—

- (1) A new Legislative Council Hall.
- (2) A new site for St. George's Hospital.
- (3) A site for the College of Commerce.
- (4) A site for a Ladies' College.
- (5) A site for the Elphinstone Middle School.
- (6) A Law School and Hostel.
- (7) An extension for Elphinstone College.
- (8) University expansion needs.
- (9) An extension of the Government Secretariat.

It was pointed out that, apart from the spaces already referred to, the only extensive site available was the Cotton Green at Colaba; and that, though the precise area which would eventually become available there was uncertain, it could not exceed 170,000 square yards.

The evidence recorded may be summarized as follows :—

The Cotton Green site might be suitable for St. George's Hospital which at present occupies about 72,000 square yards. It would be comparatively unsuitable for the purposes of the educational institutions cited, especially of those immediately connected with the University and (though in a less degree) for the head-quarter offices of Government. No witness could suggest any alternative site for educational institutions, though the Hon'ble Mr. Manmohandas Ramji proposed sites on the Sandhurst Road for one or two of these. He, however, withdrew the suggestion after enquiry. Every witness, without exception, was averse from any scheme involving trespass upon the Maidan or Oval. The Cooperage site, and the site occupied by the Wellington Mews, were suggested as perhaps suitable for one or two of the smaller institutions.

30. We have no hesitation in endorsing the unanimous objection taken to the idea of encroaching on the Maidan or Oval, in the case of the latter unless it should in conjunction with the suggestions for reclamation which will follow be found preferable to transfer these open spaces elsewhere in the vicinity. We agree that a portion of the Cotton Green would be suitable for building purposes but do not agree that it would be quite suitable for any of the institutions recited in the preceding paragraph. Moreover, in regard to St. George's Hospital there is a separate proposal which we shall discuss further on. Having regard, further, to the uncertainty as to how much space will be available, ultimately, on the Cotton Green, we regard it as preferable to leave that area entirely out of account, since, in our opinion, the space then set free may perhaps prove more suitable as a residential area than as a site to set apart for public purposes. In such circumstances the only available spaces are—

- (a) The Wellington Mews,
- and (b) The Cooperage,

and these are too small for serious consideration in connection with a comprehensive settlement of the question put by Government.

31. It will thus be seen that, while recognizing that existing public institutions must remain where they are, and that there is urgent need for expansion, we are confronted with the physical fact that there is no room for expansion: and it would thus seem clear that the answer to Government's question (b) in paragraph 5\* must be in the affirmative. There is, indeed, only one alternative, namely, for Government to acquire existing buildings or existing sites whether built on or not, other than the Maidan and Oval. We have, however, no hesitation in discarding this alternative. In the first place the cost per yard, within almost any part of the area in discussion, would be

\* Appendix B, page 24.

excessive; secondly, the process of acquisition would dislocate business and accentuate congestion within the Fort area; thirdly, it would be essentially a makeshift arrangement unworthy of consideration. We are therefore driven to advise that, for Government's needs as detailed above, Government should reclaim. Having regard to the preponderance of educational buildings in the list already cited, we consider further that reclamation should be undertaken with primary regard to the needs of education. This means *prima facie* that the site to be reclaimed should be conveniently situated with regard to the University, and should take into account certain other considerations some of which will be set forth in the next following paragraph of this report. It may, however, prove convenient if we state here that, after taking into account all the considerations (to be stated hereafter) which point to the conclusion which will duly be set forth, we have estimated that the reclamation undertaken should comprise some 100 acres, the bulk of which will face the Oval, and which shall be so designed as to improve the alignment of the sea frontage of Back Bay from Marine Lines to the southern extremity of the reclaimed site.

32. The recommendation under this head of our report is, thus, that the requirements of Government, in respect of the public institutions named, should be provided for by the reclamation, by Government, of an area, approximately on the site specified in the preceding paragraph, sufficient to meet Government's needs (estimated by us to amount to about 100 acres). Government's reference, however, has been understood to authorize us to advise as regards the precise "location" of the new, or additions to the existing, institutions named. In considering this portion of our task, we have had the great advantage of perusing certain reports\* which Sir Alfred Hopkinson has recently submitted to the University, and have also attached considerable weight to the thoughtful evidence given before us by the Vice-Chancellor of the University. We have also taken into account the notorious inadequacy of the existing arrangements for the sessions of the Legislative Council of the Government of Bombay. We have not felt ourselves to be restricted to the specific suggestion of new sites for new buildings, but have conceived that the magnitude of the interests involved in the subjects referred to us have warranted the assumption that we were at liberty to take into our consideration the possibility of effecting a redistribution of the various institutions among buildings existing and projected. It is in virtue of this conception of our function that we now suggest for the consideration of Government certain radical changes.

33. The information placed at our disposal has made it clear that additions to the Secretariat such as would fit it not only to house, with suitable dignity and comfort, the Legislative Council, but also to provide for further needs of Government, cannot be effected *in situ* without trenching further either upon the space intervening between the University on the north and the Elphinstone College and Science Institute on the south, or upon the Oval. It has also been brought home to us that the structures lying between the road to the north of University Gardens, and the Science Institute, if they could all be made available for University and College purposes, would make a group of University buildings as fine as exists anywhere. This University area might comprise—

- (a) the University buildings,
- (b) the site of Watson's Hotel,
- (c) the Secretariat buildings,
- (d) the Elphinstone College, and
- (e) the Royal Institute of Science.

The only intervening structures (which would eventually, perhaps, be absorbed) would be the Army and Navy Stores, and the David Sassoon Mechanics' Institute buildings.

---

\* Appendix F.

If, as we believe to be the case, the present Secretariat would provide scope for—

- (a) The Law School,
- (b) The Collège of Commerce,
- (c) The necessary extension to Elphinstone College, and
- (d) Some of the urgently needed additional space for the Bombay University,

then the suggestion which we desire to formulate is that, instead of contemplating reclamation as a means for providing space for the specific additional institutions and buildings scheduled by Government and detailed above, it would be wise to take stock of the buildings in existence in conjunction with those required, and, on the assumption that space can be provided, as proposed, facing the Oval, to plan out the whole space thus made available west of the present Secretariat on a comprehensive scheme. The great desirability of providing for the needs of the University immediately in the neighbourhood of the present structures; the urgent necessity for additional accommodation for the Secretariat and the Council Hall; the paramount need for expansion of the Elphinstone College, and (in our view) the great advantages that would accrue from the provision of more suitable accommodation than is afforded in the existing Elphinstone College Hostel: these considerations, coupled with the impossibility of arriving at a satisfactory scheme for enlargement of the Secretariat *in situ* without perpetuating and accentuating a most undesirable distribution of the educational institutions connected with the University, not only convince us that reclamation *ad hoc* is a pressing necessity but that the opportunity for visualising the general scheme of locating the various institutions to the best possible advantage should not be lost.

34. The terms of inquiry under this head, devised by us, postulate that recommendations in respect to the location of public institutions should be calculated to secure the best results consistently with the general growth of the City: in other words that any recommendation made should be such as to consult the convenience and amenities of residence and should be calculated to subserve the growth of the City in general. We believe that the scheme formulated secures the best results in regard to educational interests and to the convenience of the public concerned with the Government Departments. We believe, further, that, unless the estimates of the cost of Government's scheme for the reclamation of Back Bay prove to be gravely at fault, the suggested scheme, even though the cost of carrying out a partial one will be relatively higher than that of the whole, will be the most economical way of providing for the necessary expansion. But it will also subserve a further purpose. Although we are disposed to believe that, in present circumstances, the natural trend of development of residential quarters will be towards Worli and Mahim (paragraph 16 *ante*), we have heard a good deal of evidence tending to show that, if reclaimed land were procurable at reasonable rates nearer to the Fort than those areas are, many of the well-to-do class of residents would prefer to build their houses and reside on such areas. Without desiring to express a definite opinion upon this aspect of the question we feel that the reclamation of a small area for their own needs by Government will have the very desirable result of demonstrating the correctness or otherwise of the estimates upon which their wider scheme was based. When that is definitely known it is conceivable that further reclamation for the provision of space for residences might be regarded as practicable and even desirable. The matter is here adverted to because it is a consideration which may well weigh with Government in coming to a decision as to the scheme upon which the reclamation recommended in this report may most suitably be carried into operation.

## CHAPTER VIII.

## ADDITIONAL COMMUNICATIONS AND METHODS OF TRANSPORT.

35. Headings (iv), (v) and (vi) can be conveniently grouped together for consideration. Our conclusions in regard to industrial, commercial and residential development have been recorded in paragraphs 9 to 18 *ante*. They may be summarized as follows:—

(a) Industrial development to be confined to the north-eastern corner of the Island of Bombay and the eastern side of Salsette.

(b) Office accommodation in business centres will probably expand towards the north-east of the Fort North area.

(c) Subject to the removal of the nuisance at Worli, the expansion of the Bombay residential areas will be along the Mahim and Worli foreshores, into Salsette, and to Matunga (City Improvement Trust Schemes V and VI).

We have (paragraph 9) expressed the view that Railway communications to meet the development of industrial enterprise in the north-east corner of the Island already exist or will shortly be developed in sufficient completeness. In any case, for present purposes, it is assumed that arrangements will be made to secure the necessary development. It does not therefore appear to us necessary further to discuss communications in connection with the policy we advocate in respect of industrial development.

In connection with (b) above, advertence has already been had to the question of developing the area known as Fort North (paragraphs 11—15) and we do not desire here to do more than reiterate our conclusion that this development must come and that it will be a very great improvement. Its advent will be facilitated and accelerated by the revision and bringing up to date of the building bye-laws, and (if necessary and demanded) by legislation to enable the Municipality to deal effectively with the owners of insanitary dwellings.

There remains the question of additional means or improved methods of communication to subserve the development of Worli, Mahim and Salsette generally as residential areas.

36. This subject was incidentally dealt with by Government in 1909; but at that period there was a tendency only to look to Salsette and reclamation for the sites for future development. Consequently, while great stress was (quite rightly) laid upon the urgent need for providing the three north and south arteries, the subsidiary communications escaped the attention they deserved, while the development of methods of transport within the Island was almost overlooked. We have had our attention drawn to the subject by several witnesses and have given the matter our most careful attention. We do not propose to attempt to elaborate in detail our conclusions, but to indicate generally our convictions as to the best lines upon which the local authority should proceed—

(a) towards development of the prospective areas for residences,

(b) to organize communications between those areas and the heart of Bombay City.

In order to avoid misconception we deem it to be desirable, in the forefront of this section of our report, to emphasize the assumption underlying all our conclusions and suggestions in regard to Mahim and Worli, *viz.*, that the nuisance of Love Grove is abated.

37. Taking Salsette first we believe we may assume that the Town Planning Bill, now before the Legislative Council, will take Salsette. final shape and pass into law this year. In regard to detailed development, therefore, we do not venture to make any suggestions. But we consider that it may be of assistance to the local authority under that Bill to know that in our view the time has come when the two Railway systems should be required to arrange for additional communication between them.



In regard to communications between Salsette and Bombay, we believe that, when the B. B. & C. I. Railway is electrified, and (if necessary) quadrupled as far as Grant Road, the needs of residents in Salsette will be satisfied for very many years to come, especially if our recommendations further on in respect of the Mahim area are carried into effect. But it is here, and in connection with the local passenger traffic into Bombay by the B. B. & C. I. Railway, that we can, most conveniently, deal with the important question of the Railway to Colaba.

38. It is probably unnecessary to go, in great detail, into the considerations which led to the conclusion, cited in 1909,\* that the B. B. & C. I. Railway and Queen's Road. B. B. & C. I. Railway must continue to run to Colaba; especially since we are at one with that conclusion. If only on the basis of local passenger traffic returns (of which figures are given in Appendix C, pages 177 to 180), we consider that the abolition of the Railway south of Church Gate would be a retrograde measure; but in coming to this conclusion, we have also been actuated by the possibility of further schemes of reclamation towards Colaba. So long as there is any chance of this it would be shortsighted policy to remove the only means of railway communication easily accessible to an area which might develop a large residential population. We place this conclusion in the forefront of our consideration of this question, because, if this conclusion be accepted and acted upon, it disposes of the suggestion made by Major Hepper, in his interesting evidence, that the B. B. & C. I. local traffic should be diverted so as to terminate on the Marine Lines Maidan in an overhead terminus, between the old General Post Office and the B. B. & C. I. Railway Office. This suggestion is disapproved of by us on other grounds. Even as an overhead railway, diverted, south of Marine Lines Station, to the eastwards and aligned along the eastern side of the Marine Lines Maidan, it would, despite any efforts to screen it, be an unsightly encroachment upon one of the most important of the open spaces, an encroachment which all other witnesses examined on the point strongly deprecate. In our view it would be worse than a continuance of the B. B. & C. I. Railway as an overhead line along its present alignment.

Being thus of opinion that Colaba must be retained as the terminal station of the B. B. & C. I. Railway we have carefully deliberated upon the question whether some alleviation of the nuisance to Queen's Road is not possible. We invite a perusal of the evidence of Major Shelley on the point. We have considered the alternatives of (a) an overhead Railway and (b) an underground: and have come to the conclusion that the latter is far preferable. An overhead Railway is not only unsightly, but is noisier than a surface line. Although, from the point of view of the comfort of passengers, there may be advantages in the overhead system, we are not convinced that the discomfort of an underground scheme would be serious, or that, over a journey (between Grant Road and Colaba) of fifteen minutes, the difference to the passengers is of such importance that it should weigh against the comfort and amenities of the far larger number of persons who would benefit by the removal below the surface of the western foreshore railway line.

We accordingly recommend that the B. B. & C. I. Railway be required to sink its line below the surface from south of Grant Road as far as Wodehouse Bridge and cover it in. While it will not be absolutely necessary that the upper surface of the roof of the cutting shall be flush with the ground it should not be of an elevation above ground level which will obstruct the view to passengers along the present Queen's Road. Should it however for any reason be impracticable to sink the line as recommended, it will then be for consideration whether the B. B. & C. I. Railway should not terminate at Church Gate Station.

39. From Colaba, then, to Grant Road the local passenger traffic should be by electrified underground. It was considered whether, with the development

of local traffic on the scale contemplated, it would not be necessary either to terminate long distance traffic at Grant Road or else (as suggested by Major Hepper\*) to divert the B. B. & C. I. long distance traffic from Dadar into Victoria Terminus, which should be enlarged for the purpose. Major Shelley is emphatically of opinion that the traffic could not all be handled at Victoria Terminus, even when enlarged as is contemplated. On this technical question we do not feel ourselves called upon to express a definite view; but on general grounds we should regard it as preferable—so long as this is possible without quadrupling between Grant Road and Colaba—to continue to start the long distance B. B. & C. I. traffic at Colaba. Major Shelley is of opinion that this is practicable and preferable.

North of Grant Road we assume that the whole of the local passenger traffic will be electrified up to Borivli or even Palghar; at all events up to the northern limit of Salsette residential development.

40. In paragraph 6 *supra* mention has been made of roads into Mahim woods north of the Love Grove Pumping Station. Mahim and Worli. If Worli becomes a residential area for residents (a) Roads. of the wealthy class this will form the chief avenue of communication; and we consider that while the 60-foot road at present contemplated will suffice for the purpose for many years to come, it will eventually require to be supplemented, north of Love Grove, by a road branching off at the northern end of the Vellard to the west and following the foreshore up to Worli village and there joining the existing road. With these two roads the whole Worli area will be adequately served so far as road communication is concerned.

41. A reference to Mr. Mackison's map will show that, in addition to the above main road *via* the Vellard into Mahim Woods, there will be an avenue of approach, 100 feet wide, along DeLisle Road, to the south-eastern corner of Mahim woods. This should, in our opinion, be continued, along the projected red line, to its junction with Lady Jamshedji Road; the whole forming the main eastern avenue through the woods from south to north. On the western side as a continuation of the Worli Road dealt with in the last paragraph it is in contemplation to widen to 60 feet, and where necessary modify and improve the alignment of, the existing road as shown in the map. Already, as also shown in the map, one wide road from east to west, is under construction. There are thus already projected, in the Mahim Woods area, two broad lines of communication from the Bandra Causeway southwards, affording direct and good road connection with the City of Bombay, and one avenue from east to west. The locality may thus be said to be undergoing, though slowly, a process of development on satisfactory lines, so far as they go.

42. This area of the Mahim Woods was, in the first instance, excluded from the operations of the City Improvement Trust in circumstances described in the note (Appendix E) attached to this report. Neither the reasons which at that time led to its exclusion, nor the existing vested interests within the area, can, in our opinion, any longer be held to justify postponing the development on a systematic plan of this attractive locality. Although, already, there are many residences scattered along the foreshore and within the palm woods themselves, they are distributed entirely without system and are, for the most part, devoid of adequate road communication. We are of opinion that it is no longer tolerable that one of the (potentially) most attractive residential areas within the jurisdiction of the Bombay Municipality should be permitted to develop itself haphazard without regard either to the amenities of the Island at large or the convenience and hygiene of the residents. It is recommended that the attention of the Municipality may be directed to this area as one which it is of the greatest

importance to develop early and on sound lines. We understand that already, in connection with the Municipal road schemes, prices have commenced to rise; and that it may be anticipated, with confidence, that before long the development of this area may become an exceedingly costly undertaking. In view of this probability it is perhaps permissible to suggest that the Bombay Town Planning Act should be applied to this area, in order to ensure its economical development.

43. It does not suffice, however, in our opinion, to rely for the development of this area on roads alone. Although, as

(b) Railways. already indicated in the earlier Chapters of this report, it is our view that Mahim Woods (at all events the western half) and Worli will be taken up by the well-to-do classes, many of whom will travel between their homes and the City by road in motor cars, there will be many for whom cheaper means of transit will be essential. These can best be secured, for this area, by a loop line addition to the B. B. & C. I. electric railway system. It has been suggested by competent witnesses that this loop should take off, in the north, from Mahim Station and traverse the Mahim Woods, crossing Lady Jamshedji Road to the westwards and, passing close to the eastwards of Worli village, pass again eastwards of the 60-foot road connecting the Vellard with the woods; thence, continuing between the Vellard and Race course, it should cross Clerk Road, and, skirting the projected Park, join the main line again at Grant Road Station. We consider that this suggestion is a sound one.

44. As regards tramway extension, we find ourselves generally in accord with the projects laid down in the interesting statement\* received from Mr. Rimington, Managing Director of the Bombay Electric Supply and Tramways Company, Limited. Mr. Rimington has looked far ahead in making his proposals, some of which could not be carried out for many years to come. They presuppose:—

- (1) the widening of the Elphinstone Bridge,
  - (2) the construction of the DeLisle Road Overbridge,
  - (3) the removal, or at any rate the disuse during the day time, of the Great Indian Peninsula Railway level crossing at Wadi Bunder,
  - (4) the widening of Victoria Road,
  - (5) the widening of the Mahalakshmi, Love Grove, and Worli Roads,
- and
- (6) the widening and strengthening of the Kennedy Bridge.

In addition to the extensions contemplated by Mr. Rimington we wish to point out two other lines which will also need consideration. These are:—

- (i) From the northern end of the DeLisle Road along the projected 100-foot road to the Bandra Causeway.
- (ii) From Sewree Station on the G. I. P. Harbour Branch Railway along the proposed road past Parel Tank, the old Government House, the Parel Tramway Terminus, and over the new Elphinstone Road Bridge to link up with the Bandra Causeway extension.

45. We invite attention to the results of Mr. Rimington's study in England of the possibilities of motor omnibuses, and realize that the conditions under which these vehicles work successfully in London are not completely reproduced in Bombay. At the same time it must be borne in mind that the motor omnibus is a very modern means of locomotion and is in London the subject of constant experiments which may eventually result in such important improvements as to change the aspect of the question of motor omnibuses in Bombay. We think, however, that for the present Mr. Rimington's proposals for tramway extension are, with the additions indicated above, on the whole adequate and are sufficient to meet the needs of the City.

46. The substance of this Chapter may be summarized as follows :—

(a) There should be additional communication between the B. B. & C. I. Railway and the G. I. P. Railway in Bombay.

(b) The electrified B. B. & C. I. Railway from Grant Road to Wodehouse Bridge should be below ground level and covered in.

(c) A road along the Worli foreshore will eventually be necessary.

(d) It is desirable that Mahim should be developed, with the help of town-planning powers.

(e) A loop railway line from Mahim *via* Worli to Grant Road will be needed for the development of the north-western part of the Island.

(f) Some lines are indicated for tramway extension.

## CHAPTER IX.

### MILITARY AND OTHER AREAS.

47. Though not specifically referred to us for our consideration, there are certain other areas within the City which require notice in any survey of the needs of the Island which pretends to be at all comprehensive. Some of the more important of these are :—

(a) The Cotton Green, to which brief reference has been made in Chapter VII.

(b) The site of St. George's Hospital.

(c) The site occupied by the troops in Marine Lines.

(d) The Kennedy Sea Face, and

(e) The Saluting Battery site.

In regard to the first of these, to be vacated when the operations of the Port Trust are completed, we have already considered and rejected a proposal to utilize it for some of the public institutions. It was also referred to as being a possible site for the St. George's Hospital. For reasons which will appear in the next paragraph this project has also been discarded. One of the difficulties under which we labour in making suggestions of a positive character for the disposal of this area is that it is quite uncertain to what extent it will be available. The demands of the Railway may be greater than is at present anticipated. Again, it must be borne in mind that further Dock extension may become necessary in the course of time, and, although the construction of docks so far south as the Sassoon Basin may be undesirable, we are advised that there are only two other alternative sites for such extension. Indeed, we consider that it may be worth while drawing the attention of Government to the question whether the future area of Dock extension should not form the subject of special investigation now. In such circumstances it would be a short-sighted policy to assume that Dock construction on the eastern shore of Colába is out of the question. We therefore, while holding that the Cotton Green, on a proper development plan, could, under existing circumstances, most fittingly be reserved for a residential area, are disposed to advise that its destiny should not be too hastily decided upon. It will be easier after the Cotton Green has been abandoned and the situation has become clearer and the capacity of the site more determinate, to make useful suggestions for its utilization; and our suggestion is, therefore, that this area should for the present be held in reserve.

48. The necessity for removing St. George's Hospital appears to be a very

(b) St. George's Hospital. urgent one, especially in view of the certainty that the Railway Companies must, within a very short time, require at least a portion of its compound. The question of its location, therefore, though not specifically referred to us, has engaged our attention and has formed the subject of questions to witnesses. The Cotton Green and Gamdevi among

others were suggested. Meanwhile we have received a suggestion\* from Major Glen Liston. Viewing the matter purely from the point of view of the development of the City, we should have had no hesitation in recommending Major Glen Liston's proposal that the Hospital be located at Parel to the favourable consideration of Government. Many advantages are indicated by Major Glen Liston, while the drawbacks incidental to location either on the Cotton Green site or in the neighbourhood of Chowpatty or on any of the other sites mentioned are at once apparent. The first named is not much nearer to the Docks than Parel, which will also be as easily accessible when the communications are improved. In the event either of Railway or Dock developments in Colába, a second removal might become necessary. Chowpatty is nearer to the Docks than either. A proportion of the European population who take advantage of the Hospital live in the neighbourhood of mills, and the tendency of this class will be to move northward with the development of the City. At the same time we are advised that if the Hospital is removed to any of the suggested sites, it will be necessary to have an emergency ward near the Docks for the benefit of cases among sailors. The question is however one affecting only a portion of the community and depending upon technical considerations into which we have been unable to enquire exhaustively. We therefore recommend that Government should appoint a strong and representative Committee to go into the question in the light of such of our recommendations as may be approved.

49. We are unable to advise as to exchanges which might be practicable in respect of military lands; but we find ourselves constrained to indicate certain *desiderata* from the point of view of the general public and of town development. In particular we desire to record our sense of the impropriety of the location of the Military Hospital on the Queen's Road opposite Marine Lines Station. The location of this institution there, and of the Marine Lines barracks in their present site, dates from many years back, when this area was not so greatly in demand. We are, of course, unable to judge of the Military considerations governing the case; but we desire to place on record our view of the very great advantage that would accrue to the City if these areas—or at least the western half—could be surrendered to the Civil authority. We are at a disadvantage in making suggestions as to the land that might be made available in exchange, but we desire to point to (a) the St. George's Hospital site, of which a portion, if it is not required in its entirety for railway purposes, might be made available for Military offices and details, and (b) the Cotton Green site, of which it would be safe to reserve a portion.

Valuable sites are in possession of the Military authorities near the Town Hall and near the Crawford Market; but, desirable as these sites are for purposes of City improvement, we are not in a position to discuss the best methods of re-distribution. We believe that the matter is under discussion between His Excellency in Council and the Government of India, and we only desire here to urge that it is a matter which might with advantage be disposed of early in connection with the course of action that may be determined on as a result of this Report.

50. The Kennedy Sea Face belongs to Government. It is utilized, in its northern portion, for Gymkhana Clubs, and is faced by a promenade along its whole length, and a ride inside the promenade. If and when reclamation is undertaken by Government, as recommended in Chapter VII of the Report, the sea-face will be widened considerably from Marine Lines Station southward.

We are of opinion that hitherto but very inadequate advantage has been taken of what is probably one of the finest sea frontages of any city in the world. We are constrained to express our great regret that, owing perhaps to divided counsels as to the best method of utilizing this magnificent promenade, little use should have been made of it. We consider that, whatever decisions come to as to the precise formation and structure of the reclamation, it should be so designed as to include, within its retaining sea wall, the Marine

\* Appendix C, p. 132.

drive of at least 80 feet along the whole length of the sea face; and we have no doubt whatever that this view will meet with universal acceptance.

That, however, is a matter which relates to the future; and we desire to urge that something should be done immediately to add to the amenities connected with the Back Bay frontage. We have ascertained that there is already space, along the whole length from Chowpatty to Wodehouse Bridge with the exception of about 50 yards north of Church Gate Station, without infringing on the ride or the footpath, for a 40-foot roadway to be constructed on the landward side of the ride. All that will be necessary, in addition to the actual work of road construction, will be the removal of some of the Railway telegraph posts and a hut. Such a road, only 40 feet wide, would be, of course, only a temporary alleviation, and we think that its use should be restricted, for the present, to horse-drawn vehicles only. We believe that if the Railway Company were required to substitute—for its obsolete gates at Church Gate Station—automatic gates worked from the signal box, so as to minimize the delays incidental to the crossing, then much of the horse-drawn traffic between Colába and Church Gate and Chowpatty would resort to such a road, relieving, *pro tanto*, Queen's Road.

On a 40-foot road it would be necessary to prevent obstruction by stationary carriages except at certain points, such as where the road widens at Marine Lines. These are matters of detail which will doubtless be considered by the proper authorities; but what we are concerned with is to point out that this is an improvement which can be carried out at little cost without waiting for a decision upon such matters as the question of an overbridge at Marine Lines or at Church Gate; and we venture to urge very strongly upon Government the desirability of giving effect to this very small proposal at once.

51. The Saluting Battery site in its present state constitutes a defacing feature of one of the City's most important *places*. We have not proposed that any building should be erected on this site, because it is at present unsettled what part this land will play in any future comprehensive treatment of this district. But there would appear to be no reason why in the meantime this plot should be allowed to continue to be an eyesore. We suggest that the land should forthwith be levelled and planted out as a garden, and that the unsightly railings which now disfigure the site should be replaced by something more artistic.

## CHAPTER X.

### SALSETTE.

52. Sálsette development is so closely connected with the development of Bombay that we should like to call attention to certain matters affecting Sálsette, since that island will after all be part of the Bombay of the future. Bombay consists for the most part of land reclaimed from the sea, and the process of reclamation, though still in progress, cannot go on for ever. Unless one has no faith in the future expansion of Bombay as the capital of Western India, it will be admitted that there must come a time when sheer lack of space will lead to the rapid growth of the population of Sálsette.

53. The rate of progress of the urban development of the Táluka is indicated by the fact that the total number of new dwelling-houses erected from the years 1908-09 to 1912-13 inclusive within the Municipal districts of Thána, Bándra and Kurla, and the twelve Notified Areas surrounding the other Railway stations is returned as 430.

Development since 1909. In 1909, the Report of Mr. P. J. Mead, I. C. S., on "The Possibilities of Development of Sálsette as a Residential Area" was issued. The urgent necessity of a Town Planning Act was then brought to light, and the general lines on which an Act would be drafted were laid down by Government. Buildings had sprung up in the early days of plague without any orderly plan, means of communication were in an extremely backward condition, and great difficulty

was experienced by would-be settlers in obtaining suitable land for building. A Revenue Officer (known as the Special Officer, Sálsette Building Sites) and an Engineer were specially deputed to the charge of the development work, and these appointments have been maintained ever since. The first work to be undertaken was a contour survey and was finished in 1911. This was followed by a survey of holdings. It was found that the material supplied by the survey records was not accurate enough for the plotting of roads and town-planning schemes. A fresh survey had thus to be made and has been completed for various areas likely to be built on, amounting in all to 4,662 acres. The question of an adequate water-supply has received much attention, and various possible catchment areas have been examined. Schemes have also been submitted to the Sanitary Engineer to Government. A complete drainage scheme for the disposal of sewage has been prepared for Bándra, and various schemes for storm water drainage are ready. In addition to these preliminary operations, original works such as roads, markets and storm-water drains have been constructed out of special grants or loans made by Government which have amounted altogether to Rs. 1,00,000 during the last three years.

54. Major J. L. Marjoribanks, I. M. S., was in 1912 deputed to investigate the malarial conditions prevailing in the Island of Sálsette with a view to his indicating the direction in which and the limits within which residential development should proceed. The investigation was carried out during the latter part of the year 1912, and was concerned with an examination of the vital statistics of Sálsette, the collection and identification of larvæ and adult anopheline mosquitos throughout the island, and a spleen census of children. Major Marjoribanks' report has been recently issued. He condemns Trombay and the northern portion of the island generally as malarious. But the part south of a line drawn from Ghatkopar to Andheri he thinks singularly suitable for development. Other areas regarded favourably by Major Marjoribanks are the village lands of Malavni and the islets of the west coast, which latter constitute "the most ideal of all sites for a garden city."

55. As regards the future of Sálsette, we consider that, to ensure a more rapid development than is taking place at present, the chief requisite is quick communication with Bombay. Except in the case of a few fast trains southwards in the morning and northwards in the evening, it takes 38 minutes to get from Church Gate to Bándra, 54 minutes to Andheri, and 75 minutes to Borivli. Also, for a suburban service, the trains cannot be said to be frequent. Ghátkopar and Thána are even less well served than Bándra and Borivli. The expected electrification of the suburban lines will probably greatly increase the resident population of Sálsette.

56. Next in importance is the question of water supply. The charge made by the Bombay Municipality for the water which they supply is so high that it is necessary to charge Re. 1 per 1,000 gallons for it in Bándra and Andheri and Rs. 1-2-0 in Sánta Cruz and the amount of water which Bombay can spare is inadequate. There will be a great improvement when Sálsette has a cheaper supply, whether from the Bombay Municipality when the Tansa main is duplicated or in accordance with schemes which have been considered by the Sanitary Engineer to Government.

57. There are certain considerations relating to the land which affect the development of Sálsette. In the first place, the 50 years' term for which agreements regarding the assessment on land appropriated to building are concluded is popularly regarded as too short. An extension of the term to 99 years in the case of land which pays a contribution under a town-planning scheme would attract an increased number of residents. It is to town-planning schemes also that we must look for help in respect of the unfavourable manner in which the land is divided up into plots. The agricultural holdings are irregularly shaped and therefore cannot be converted into compounds without considerable waste. Some plots are even altogether too small for building purposes. Yet again, the methods of the Town Planning Bill would facilitate the construction of roads, the lack of which seriously hinders development. The local authorities cannot at present afford to lay out money on such roads, but under the proposed methods they will be able to obtain contributions towards the cost of road

access from owners the value of whose plots is enhanced by the roads. The only other point we should like to bring forward in connection with land questions is the necessity of preventing the repetition in Sálsette of the extravagant rise in land values which has taken place in Bombay. It might be well to prescribe by legislation the maximum proportion of a site which it is permissible to cover with buildings of specified heights, at any rate when values have not already greatly risen.

58. We should like to invite the attention of Government to the fact that people are sometimes reluctant to invest in land in Sálsette because of the lack of legal facilities in connection with mortgages in Sálsette as compared with Bombay. Under section 59 of the Transfer of Property Act a mortgage may be effected in Bombay by delivery of documents of title to immoveable property with intent to create a security thereon. In Sálsette, if the principal money secured is Rs. 100 or more, a registered instrument is necessary. Also, under section 69 of the Act, a mortgagee's power to sell in default of payment of the mortgage-money is valid without the intervention of the Court where the mortgaged property is situated in Bombay. If the property is in Sálsette an order of the Court must (except in certain special circumstances) be obtained before the property can be sold, and complaints are made of the comparative inaccessibility of Thána, and of delay which is said to occur in the Thána Court. We are not in a position to say what judicial considerations may affect the question, but at present the lack of these facilities in Sálsette constitutes an obstacle in the way of development.

59. Finally, the existence of the Slaughter House at Bándra hinders development. It prevents high caste Hindus from taking up suburban residences on the west side of Sálsette. The Bhattias in particular have settled in Ghátkopar instead. The Slaughter House is an unpleasant sight for all who pass it by train. It is undoubtedly a serious obstacle in the way of the growth of Bándra. Many weighty reasons were once adduced in favour of its removal to Vikhroli. While not wishing at this stage definitely to recommend a place condemned, as Vikhroli is, by Major Marjoribanks, we are of opinion that the consideration of the removal of the Slaughter House to the west of the Island should be taken up afresh.

## CHAPTER XI.

### CO-ORDINATION OF EFFORT.

60. We are asked to advise as to the best means of securing co-ordination and expedition in the carrying out of the measures which will be adopted. We are of opinion that the need of devising some such form of co-ordination is clearly established, and we should like to mention a few illustrations of this necessity.

To begin with, we find that the Government of India in 1904 decided on the acquisition of an extensive area of land at Matunga for the purposes of the G. I. P. Railway without the knowledge of the Municipal Corporation or the Improvement Trust although this decision was likely to control the development of that quarter in a very vital way. Again, the Executive Engineer of the Corporation has been lately at work on planning a widening of the Byculla Bridge while the Improvement Trust has not yet finally decided on the exact boundaries of the road approaching the bridge at either end. Government recently decided to abandon a proposal to spend Rs. 45,000 on acquiring land for a spacious Botanical Garden at Vile Parla on the ground that the cost was too heavy, and though Bombay would of course be greatly interested in such a Garden the Corporation was not consulted.

61. It is not our object, in quoting these instances, to criticize directly any particular actions of the authorities concerned. The intention is to direct attention to the lack of an adequate system of coordination between the various bodies which frame measures affecting the development of Bombay. It will be clear from the instances mentioned how desirable it is that there should exist



some kind of regular symposium between the executives of the Railways, the Corporation, the Improvement Trust, the Port Trust, and Government, so that no one authority could promote or carry out any measures bearing on the development of the City as a whole without the knowledge of the other authorities.

62. We therefore suggest that Government and the five bodies mentioned above should each depute one of its executive officers to a periodical conference which might be held either once or twice a year. These executive officers would at these meetings acquaint each other of all important measures which might be under consideration. The result would be that each of the authorities concerned would be made fully aware through their executive officers of what the other authorities were proposing, and all danger of clashing in the preparation of projects would be averted. The Special Officer, Salsette Building Sites, should also be a member of the conference, in view of the importance of Salsette and Bombay to each other in respect of development.

63. We should like also to invite attention to the need of devoting attention to the æsthetic side of development. There is in Bombay nothing of the nature of a Ministry of Fine Arts, and though the City has the advantage of unrivalled natural beauty, and though the lay out of roads and the construction of public buildings in the Esplanade area evinces a really noble conception on the part of a past generation, there is no certainty that the question of the beauty of the City is receiving systematic consideration. We believe that the periodical conferences of the character proposed in this Chapter will result in greater attention to this aspect of the case, and that mutual consultation regarding the architectural treatment of development will ensue from them as a matter of course.

*April 29th, 1914.*

(SIGNED) CLAUDE H. HILL.

( „ ) PHEROZESHAH M. MEHTA.

( „ ) IBRAHIM RAHIMTOOLA.

*(Subject to a minute of dissent.)*

( „ ) F. L. SPROTT.

( „ ) BHALCHANDRA KRISHNA.

( „ ) G. WITTET.

( „ ) B. W. KISSAN.

*The Honourable Sir Ibrahim Rahimtoola's Minute of Dissent.*

There can be little doubt that the various suggestions which have been made by the Committee, if carried out, would effect great improvements. It remains to be considered however whether the many schemes of communications recommended are either necessary or financially desirable. During recent years practically the whole of the attention of the Improvement Trust has been directed to the making of roads and the improvement of communications. The Municipality has also devoted a great deal of attention to this subject and many schemes are at present under consideration. To give the public an idea of the enormous expenditure incurred during recent years on communications by the two public bodies, it may be mentioned that out of about  $3\frac{1}{2}$  crores spent by the Trust  $1\frac{3}{4}$  crores have gone towards this object and only  $\frac{2}{4}$  crore towards Improvement Schemes. About 65 lacs have been spent on what are called expansion Schemes such as the Gamdevi Scheme. This scheme is estimated to cost I believe about 25 lacs, which sum has had to be provided by the City for

making available building sites for the well-to-do classes and the provision of the Hughes Road. The Trust has under contemplation another scheme, *viz.*; widening of the Parel Road from Sandhurst Road to Lal Baug to a width of 120 feet which is estimated to cost about 80 lacs of rupees more. This expenditure will bring up the total on communications to 2½ crores out of about 4 crores and this figure does not include the cost of Hughes Road and that portion of the Eastern avenue which is comprised in Scheme No.

The Municipality has not been idle in the meantime. During the same period they have incurred a liability of over a crore of rupees towards improvement of communications and have still several schemes under consideration.

As if such a huge expenditure on communications during so short a period was not enough the Committee has recommended some more schemes. A broad road connecting Ballard Pier with Hornby Road has been persistently pressed by the Port Trust for several years. When Government issued their Resolution No. 3022 of 14th June 1909 this question was before them. The programme laid down in this Resolution was declared to be amply sufficient for the next 20 years. In laying down this programme they came deliberately to the conclusion that such a road was not a matter of urgency and cannot be included within works to be undertaken within the next 20 years. Less than five years have elapsed since then and we find that the Committee has thought fit to include this scheme in the programme. The reasons advanced are that the Fort North area requires to be improved sanitarily as an improvement scheme and that sites are required for offices for business firms.

As regards the first reason I should like to invite attention to the fact that during the 25 years for which I examined the mortality returns of the Fort North area, there was not a single year during which the total mortality of that district was *not under the average for the whole city*. Amongst the several areas which Mr. Harvey represented for the carrying out of improvement schemes about seven or eight years ago, there are many which show a mortality of from 25 to 50 per cent. *over the average for the whole city*. Except the Nowroji Hill area, none of these have been taken in hand during all these years. The whole attention has been concentrated on making roads. When such represented areas remain unimproved, is it right that a heap of money should be spent in improving an area which cannot be called relatively insanitary in view of its mortality returns?

After the admittedly insanitary areas in the crowded parts of the city have been improved and the mortality therein appreciably reduced, I would have no objection to spend public funds on the improvement of Fort North. Until that is done and the worst slums are uprooted any expenditure of public money on this area to allow of a fashionable road required by the Port Trust being carried out is wholly unjustifiable.

The second reason does not require any comments. I cannot think that the consideration of providing suitable sites for the offices of business firms should weigh in the slightest degree in the matter of undertaking a scheme, the estimated loss upon which is over a crore of rupees. In view of the remarks made in the report I should like to call attention to the replies which were given to me in cross-examination by the advocates of this road. A mere perusal of such replies will show that there is no case for public expenditure upon it.

Nearly 3 crores of rupees have already been spent on roads and communications by the Trust and the Municipality during recent years, while schemes costing over a crore of rupees are under consideration. As if this was not sufficient expenditure under this one head, several more are recommended, one of which alone, *viz.*, the Ballard Pier and Hornby Road connection, will cost a huge sum. No one can dispute the fact that these improvements are desirable, but the real questions for investigation are (1) whether they are necessary, (2) whether the benefits to be obtained are commensurate with the cost involved and (3) whether available public funds could not be better utilized in carrying out schemes which will have an immediate effect upon the public health of the city.

An important light is thrown on the whole question by the following quotation from the Committee's report. In clause (h) of paragraph 6 it is stated : "The Corporation has sanctioned the widening of Reay Road up to 90 feet as far as its junction with Gunpowder Road and the widening of the further portion up to the Municipal limit Northwards is under the consideration of the Corporation. The Port Trust has given an undertaking to extend the widening from their Southern limit as far as the north approach of the proposed Victoria Bridge and *will await development of trade to widen the rest of the road up to Kalachowki Road.*" As a business body the Port Trust are perfectly justified in adopting this policy before undertaking expenditure. I only wish that other public bodies would adopt this wholesome principle in the expenditure of public funds entrusted to their charge.

With reference to the sanitary improvements in the City which are urgently called for, I agree with the Committee that improvement schemes should be carried out. I also agree that the building bye-laws require revision. In the consideration of this question, I venture to submit that the economic aspect should not be lost sight of. The cost of living in the City has largely risen. Rents have gone up very high. These factors must react on the cost of labour. The prosperity of the City largely depends upon its harbour and its industries. Any undue strain upon them may divert trade and impair the success of our industries. In bearing prominently in mind the great necessity of sanitary surroundings, especially for the poor, the economic results should not be ignored. The City of Bombay already pays 30 lacs of rupees per annum more in the shape of Municipal taxation than Calcutta with approximately the same population. I do not wish to dilate upon this point as I quite realize it is full of difficulties and complexities. I will, therefore, submit for the consideration of Government the desirability of appointing a Committee to consider and report upon the economic effects of the various schemes and measures undertaken and contemplated, and generally to investigate the probable economic results on the future prosperity of this great City.

(Signed) IBRAHIM RAHIMTOOLA.

May 10th, 1914.