HARVARD ECONOMIC STUDIES

- I. The English Patents of Monopoly. By Wil-liam H. Price. By Robert G. Albion.
- II. The Lodging House Problem in Boston. By Albert B. Wolfe.
- III. The Stannaries: A Study of the English Tin Miner. By George R. Lewis.
- IV. Railroad Reorganization. By S. Daggett.
- V. Wool-Growing and the Tariff. By Chester W. Wright.
- VI. Public Ownership of Telephones on the Continent of Europe. By A. N. Holcombe.
- VII. The History of the British Post Office. By J. C. Hemmeon.
- VIII. The Cotton Manufacturing Industry of the United States. By M. T. Copeland.
- IX. The History of the Grain Trade in France. By Abbott Payson Usher.
- X. Corporate Promotions and Reorganizations. By A. S. Dewing.
- XI. The Anthracite Coal Combination in the United States. By Eliot Jones.
- XII. Some Aspects of the Tariff Question. By F. W. Taussig.
- XIII. The Evolution of the English Corn Market from the Twelfth to the Eighteenth Century. By N. S. B. Gras.
- XIV. Social Adaptation: A Study in the Development of the Doctrine of Adapta-tion as a Theory of Social Progress. By L. M. Bristol.
- XV. The Financial History of Boston, from May 1, 1822, to January 31, 1909. By C. P. Huse.
- XVI. Essays in the Earlier History of American Corporations. By J. S. Davis. 2 vols. XVII. The State Tax Commission. By H. L.
- Lutz. XVIII. The Early English Customs System. By N. S. B. Gras.
- XIX. Trade and Navigation between Spain and the Indies in the Time of the Hapsburgs.
- By C. H. Haring.

- By C. H. Haring.
 XX. The Italian Emigration of Our Times.
 By R. F. Foerster.
 XXI. The Mesta: A Study in Spanish Economic History, 1273-1836. By Julius Klein.
 XXII. Argentine International Trade under Inconvertible Paper Money: 1880-1900.
 By J. H. Williams.
 XXIII. The Organization of the Boot and Shoe Industry in Massachusetts before 1875.
 By Blanche E. Hazard.
 XXVI Feronomic Motives. By Z. C. Dickinson.
- XXIV. Economic Motives. By Z. C. Dickinson. XXV. Monetary Theory before Adam Smith. By Arthur E. Monroe.
- XXVI. Canada's Balance of International Indebtedness, 1900-1913. By Jacob Viner
- VII. The History of the United States Post Office to the Year 1829. By W. E. Rich. XXVII.
- XXVIII. The Theory of International Prices. By James W. Angell.

- XXX. Banking Theories in the United States before 1860. By Harry E. Miller.
- XXXI. Karl Marx's Interpretation of History, By Mandell Morton Bober.
- XXXII. Grain Growers' Coöperation in West-ern Canada. By Harald S. Patton.
- XXXIII. The Assignats. By S. E. Harris.
- XXXIV. The Economic and Social History of an English Village. By N. S. B. Gras and E. C. Gras.
- XXXV. Direct Taxation in Austria. By John V. Van Sickle.
- XXXVI. The Greenbacks and Resumption of Specie Payments, 1862-1879. By Don C. Barrett.
- XXXVII. The Street Railway in Massa-chusetts, By Edward S. Mason.
- XXXVIII. The Theory of Monopolistic Com-petition. By Edward Chamberlin,
- XXXIX. Interregional and International Trade. By Bertil Ohlin.
- XL. The French International Accounts, 1880-1913. By Harry D. White.
- XLI. Twenty Years of Federal Reserve Policy. By S. E. Harris. 2 vols.
- XLII. The Illinois Central Railroad and Its Colonization Work. By Paul W. Gates.
- XLIII. American Treasure and the Price Revolution in Spain, 1501-1650. By Earl J. Hamilton.
- XLIV. German Monetary Theory, 1905-1933. By Howard S. Ellis.
- XLV. Wages in Eighteenth Century England. By Elizabeth W. Gilboy.
- XLV1. The Theory of Economic Development. By J. A. Schumpeter.
- XLVII. The Supply and Control of Money in the United States. By L. Currie.
- XLVIII, British International Gold Movements and Banking Policy, 1881-1913. By W. Edwards Beach.
- XLIX. LIX. State Control of Local Finance in Mas-sachusetts. By Royal S. Van de Woestyne.
- Fluctuations in American Business, 1700-1860. By Walter B. Smith and Arthur H. Cole. L.
- Money, Prices, and Wages in Valencia, Aragon, and Navarre, 1351-1500. By Earl J. Hamilton.
- .II. The Development of the Business Cor-poration in England, 1800-1867. By Bishop Carleton Hunt.
- LIII. Exchange Depreciation. By S. E. Harris. LIV. A Study of Fluid Milk Prices. By John M. Cassels.
- LV. Location Theory and the Shoe and Leather Industries. Edgar M. Hoover, Jr.
- LVI. Federal Subsidies to the Provincial Gov-ernments in Canada. J. A. Maxwell,

HARVARD UNIVERSITY PRESS CAMBRIDGE, MASS., U.S.A.

HARVARD ECONOMIC STUDIES VOLUME LVI

1

THE STUDIES IN THIS SERIES ARE PUBLISHED BY THE DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMICS OF HARVARD UNIVERSITY, WHICH, HOWEVER, ASSUMES NO RESPONSIBILITY FOR THE VIEWS EXPRESSED

LONDON : HUMPHREY MILFORD OXFORD UNIVERSITY PRESS

FEDERAL SUBSIDIES TO THE PROVINCIAL GOVERNMENTS IN CANADA

BY

J. A. MAXWELL ASSOCIATE PROPESSOR OF ECONOMICS, CLARK UNIVERSITY



CAMBRIDGE HARVARD UNIVERSITY PRESS 1937 COPYRIGHT, 1937 BY THE PRESIDENT AND FELLOWS OF HARVARD COLLEGE

•

X791.72.N4 G7 68854

PRINTED AT THE HARVARD UNIVERSITY PRESS CAMBRIDGE, MASS., U. S. A. То

MY FATHER AND MOTHER

PREFACE

MODERN federalism is essentially a compromise. It grows out of an attempt to reconcile the views of those who prefer a unitary government and those who prefer provincial or state independence. Between these two groups stand the trimmers, who frame a scheme which strikes a balance and enables union to take place. Some functions are handed over to the new federal government; some are kept under provincial control. But agreement about the division of functions is not enough, because sources of revenue have also to be divided so as to meet the needs both of the federal government and of the provincial governments as a whole, and so as to satisfy the diverse requirements of the different provincial governments. This is a difficult task. In order to provide the provincial governments with adequate revenues, a further adjustment is often necessary.

The Canadian federation has had to face these problems, and the aim of this monograph is to show how they were handled. The main device used in Canada has been payment of unconditional subsidies by the federal government to the provinces. This device infringes what has been called by Professor Adarkar the "principle of independence and responsibility" --that "the responsibility of raising revenue and the freedom of spending it ought to go hand in hand"; and it has seldom been regarded as more than a necessary compromise. The framers of the Canadian scheme of union were certainly of this opinion. and they therefore attempted to restrict these subsidies within narrow limits. But the constitutional barrier which they set up was broken through almost immediately, and all subsequent attempts to repair it have failed. The unconditional subsidies have been altered on numerous occasions, and quarrels about them have affected almost every phase of federal-provincial relations.

It is, of course, desirable that the terms of a federal union

PREFACE .

should have some flexibility, and there has been a growing feeling in Canada that some redistribution of functions and revenues is due. There are many obstacles in the way, but progress might be made by utilizing the system of conditional subsidies which has developed in recent years. This development has been haphazard, and achievement has fallen far short of reasonable expectation. But the system has possibilities for good which have not been utilized, and through it federal-provincial financial relations may yet be readjusted on a satisfactory basis.

Much of the research for this monograph was made possible through the generosity of the Social Science Research Council, which granted me a research fellowship for 1930-31. I am under obligation to numerous people to whom I can make only a general acknowledgment, but a few names should be mentioned. Professor C. J. Bullock as a teacher first stimulated my interest in federal finance. My debt to him I gratefully acknowledge. I benefited greatly from discussions with the Honorable N. McL. Rogers, although he bears no responsibility for the views stated here. I wish also to express my appreciation of the courteous assistance given me by officials of the Library of Parliament, particularly the Honorable Martin Burrell, Mr. F. A. Hardy, and Mr. M. C. MacCormac, and by Dr. J. F. Kenney of the Dominion Archives.

The editors of the Canadian Bar Review, the Canadian Historical Review, the Canadian Journal of Economics and Political Science, the Dalhousie Review, the Journal of Political Economy, and Queen's Quarterly have kindly allowed me to reproduce portions of my articles which have appeared in their pages.

J. A. M.

Worcester, Mass. July, 1936

viii

CONTENTS

•

•

PART I

UNCONDITIONAL SUBSIDIES

INTROD	UCTION	3
I	THE FINANCIAL TERMS OF THE BRITISH NORTH AMERICA ACT Difficulties in the allotment of functions and revenues, 6.—Subsidies and debt allowances provide a solution, 7.—Factious reception of the Quebec resolutions, 15.— Compromise at London, 19.	5
п	THE BETTER TERMS OF 1869	23
111	THE ADMISSION OF MANITOBA, BRITISH COLUMBIA, AND PRINCE EDWARD ISLAND	33
IV	THE ADJUSTMENT OF DEBT ALLOWANCES IN 1873 AND 1884 Better terms through debt allowances, 51. — Quebec secures a retroactive adjustment, 56.	51
v	MINOR CONCESSIONS TO THE MARITIMES TO 1887 New Brunswick sells a railway, 64. — Nova Scotia threatens secession, 68. — Prince Edward Island discovers new claims, 70.	64
VI	DISCORD AND RECONCILIATION IN MANITOBA AND BRITISH COLUMBIA Manitoba gets petty concessions, 77. — The natural re- sources question emerges, 80. — Ottawa exacts a "final" settlement, 82. — Pacification of British Columbia, 90.	77

CONTENTS

- VII THE PROVINCIAL CONFERENCE OF 1887....94 The setting, 94 — Mercier, Mowat, and the conference, 95. — The response of Sir John A. Macdonald, 99.
- VIII LIBERAL POLICY ABOUT BETTER TERMS 101 Introduction, 101. — Minor grants of better terms, Nova Scotia, 102; New Brunswick, 104; Prince Edward Island, 105; British Columbia, 106; Manitoba, 107. — The conference of 1906 revises subsidies, 108. — A new finality clause, 114.
 - IX THE ADMISSION OF SASKATCHEWAN AND ALBERTA. 118 Agitation for provincial status, 118. — The financial terms given to Saskatchewan and Alberta, 119. — The bargain approved, 124.

- XIV A PROPOSAL ABOUT UNCONDITIONAL SUBSIDIES . . 186 Recent experience of Australia, 186. — Fiscal need and compensating advantage impracticable, 190. — Capitalization of subsidies, 192.

X

CONTENTS

xi

PART II

CONDITIONAL SUBSIDIES

xv	AGRICULTURAL INSTRUCTION; TECHNICAL EDUCATION 199																	
XVI	Нісн	way Com															•	214
XVII	Old-/	Age	Pe	NSI	ONS	5			•		•	•						228
XVIII	FISCA Readj 239 of con subsid of disuncon	ustm – Son ditic lies, tribu	ne jonal 248. tion	oi proj sul	f fe posa osidi The 50. –	ede ils ies, p	eral- exa 24 erc The	-pro imii 14 ent suj	ovin ned — 1 age	vev pr	l f 2 / us ovis	inar — U ses sion	icia Jse for ar	an co id f	rela d n ndi he	tion nisu tion bas	ns, ise nal sis	239
BIBLIOG	RAPHY	•	•	•	•	•	•		•	•	•	•	•	•		•	•	257
Index							•											267

PART I

UNCONDITIONAL SUBSIDIES

INTRODUCTION

HISTORIANS in recent years have made clear that before 1864 many men had toyed in their minds with the idea of federation of British North America.¹ Most of these schemes did not face the difficulties inherent in the proposal. They were inspired sometimes by an acute realization of the ills of the existing situation, and sometimes by the natural desire of statesmen to be nation-builders. Not until the Quebec Conference was a scheme of union formulated which really took account of the complexity of the task. Then a practical plan was drawn up, which, with modifications, was to provide a constitution for the Dominion of Canada.

But a constitution, no matter how carefully it may be devised, is only a framework. No complicated piece of legislation works out exactly according to expectations, and the British North America Act was no exception. It was the task and the test of Canadian statesmen after 1867 to make their new constitution work, to reconcile the divergent elements which had been brought together under a federal government, and to forge organic bonds of union which would supplement and even replace the legal bonds of a man-made statute.

Both in framing a constitution for Canada and still more in making that constitution work, questions of federal-provincial finance were of vital importance. At Quebec in 1864 a dispute over finance almost wrecked the conference. After 1864 the opponents of confederation directed their most telling attack against the financial clauses of the Quebec resolutions; and when in 1866 the delegates from Upper and Lower Canada, Nova Scotia, and New Brunswick met at London, the most important changes made by them in the Quebec resolutions had to do with finance. After the Dominion had been created, the first

¹ W. M. Whitelaw, *The Maritimes and Canada before Confederation* (Toronto, 1934).

INTRODUCTION

serious dispute between a province — Nova Scotia — and the federal government was settled by an adjustment of financial terms. When in 1871 and 1873 British Columbia and Prince Edward Island asked to be admitted to the union, the decision hung upon questions of finance. On numerous later occasions disputes between a province and the federal government have been settled by a financial readjustment. There is nothing surprising about this. A federal union brings together communities which have conflicting interests, and very frequently it is through the touchstone of finance that reconciliation is effected.

The most important aspect of federal-provincial finance in Canada has been the system of unconditional subsidies introduced in 1867 and since greatly extended. This system has not worked well. The need for subsidies at the outset can hardly be disputed, but with the passage of time defects have multiplied. In recent years a set of conditional subsidies has been added, with mixed results. A candid review may serve both to disclose mistakes and to suggest remedies.

4

BIBLIOGRAPHY

BIBLIOGRAPHY

The following list includes only works referred to in footnotes, together with a few others of immediate value in preparing the monograph. Special abbreviations used in footnotes are:

C.A.R., Canadian Annual Review.

C.D., Debates of the Dominion House of Commons.

C.H.R., Canadian Historical Review.

D. of A., Debates of Provincial Assemblies.

J.H.C., Journals of the Dominion House of Commons.

J. of A., Journals of Provincial Assemblies.

S.D., Debates of the Dominion Senate.

S.P., Sessional Papers.

GENERAL WORKS

- Adarkar, B. P., The Principles and Problems of Federal Finance (London, 1933).
- Begg, Alexander, The Creation of Manitoba (Toronto, 1871).
- Begg, Alexander, History of British Columbia from Its Earliest Discovery to the Present Time (Toronto, 1894).
- Begg, Alexander, History of the North-West, 3 vols. (Toronto, 1894-1895).

Biggar, C. R. W., Sir Oliver Mowat: A Biographical Sketch, 2 vols. (Toronto, 1905).

- Black, N. F., History of Saskatchewan and the North-West Territories, 2 vols. (Regina, 1913).
- Boos, A. W., The Financial Arrangements between the Provinces and the Dominion (Toronto, 1930).
- Buckingham, William and Ross, G. W., The Honourable Alexander Mackenzie, His Life and Times (Toronto, 1892).
- Burpee, L. J., Sandford Fleming, Empire Builder (London, 1915).

Canada and Its Provinces, 23 vols. (Toronto, 1914).

Canadian Annual Review, 1906, 1908, 1909, 1912, 1919.

Cauchon, Joseph, The Union of the Provinces of British North America (Quebec, 1865), translated from the French by G. H. Macaulay.

Chand, Gyan, The Essentials of Federal Finance (London, 1930).

- Clark, A. B., An Outline of Provincial and Municipal Taxation in British Columbia, Alberta, Saskatchewan and Manitoba (Winnipeg, 1920).
- Dafoe, J. W., Laurier: A Study in Canadian Politics (Toronto, 1922).

Fleming, Sandford, The Intercolonial: A Historical Sketch (Montreal, 1876).

- Forsey, Eugene, Economic and Social Aspects of the Nova Scotia Coal Industry (Toronto, 1926).
- Galt, A. T., Speech on the Proposed Union of the British North American Provinces (Montreal, 1864).
- Gosnell, R. E., Sixty Years of Progress: British Columbia (n.p., n.d.).
- Gosnell, R. E., Year Book of British Columbia and Manual of Provincial Information (Victoria, 1897).

Gray, J. H., Confederation (Toronto, 1872).

- Gunn, Donald and Tuttle, C. R., History of Manitoba (Ottawa, 1880).
- Hannay, James, History of New Brunswick, 2 vols. (St. John, 1909).

Harvey, Arthur, A Statistical Account of British Columbia (Ottawa, 1867).

Hopkin's Encyclopedia, vol. V (Toronto, 1898-99).

- Howe, Joseph, Speeches and Public Letters of (Halifax, 1909), edited by J. A. Chisholm.
- Industrial Relations Counselors, Inc., Administration of Public Employment Offices and Unemployment Insurance (New York, 1935).
- Innis, H. A., A History of the Canadian Pacific Railway (Toronto, 1923).
- Innis, H. A. and Plumptre, A. F. W., eds., *The Canadian Economy and Its Problems* (Toronto, 1934).
- Keith, A. B., Responsible Government in the Dominions, 2 vols. (Oxford, 1928).
- League for the Economic Independence of Nova Scotia, The Position of Nova Scotia (Kentville, 1926).
- Macdonald, A. F., Federal Aid (New York, 1928).
- Mackintosh, W. A., Clark, A. B., Elliott, G. A., Swanson, W. W., Economic Problems of the Prairie Provinces (Toronto, 1935).
- Martin, Chester, The Natural Resources Question (Winnipeg, 1920).
- Mavor, James, Government Telephones, the Experience of Manitoba, Canada (New York, 1916).
- McCurdy, F. B., Nova Scotia's Right to Live (privately printed, 1924).
- McCurdy, F. B., A Statement of Nova Scotia's Position (privately printed, 1925).
- Pope, Sir Joseph, Memoirs of the Right Honourable Sir John Alexander Macdonald (Ottawa, 1894).
- Pope, Sir Joseph, ed., Confederation: Being a Series of Hitherto Unpublished Documents (Toronto, 1895).
- Pope, Sir Joseph, ed., Correspondence of Sir John Macdonald (Toronto, 1921).
- Pope, W. H., The Confederation Question (Charlottetown, 1866).
- Robbins, J. E. and Jacoby, Neil, "The Problem of Securing Additional Sources of Revenue for Provincial Purposes," Essays on Canadian Economic Problems, vol. III (Montreal, 1929-30).

- Robertson, J. W., "The Work of Two Commissions," Addresses Delivered before the Canadian Club of Ottawa, 1911-12 (Ottawa, 1912).
- Ross, Sir George W., Getting into Parliament and After (Toronto, 1913).
- Saunders, E. M., Life and Letters of Sir Charles Tupper, 2 vols. (London, 1916).
- Scholefield, E. O. S. and Howay, F. W., British Columbia, 4 vols. (Vancouver, 1914).
- Skelton, O. D., The Life and Times of Sir Alexander Tilloch Galt (Toronto, 1920).
- Skelton, O. D., Life and Letters of Sir Wilfrid Laurier, 2 vols. (Toronto, 1921).
- Smith, Goldwin, Canada and the Canadian Question (London, 1891).
- Strong, M. K., Public Welfare Administration in Canada (Chicago, 1930).
- Trotter, R. G., Canadian Federation, Its Origins and Achievement (London, 1924).
- Tupper, Sir Charles, Recollections of Sixty Years (London, 1914).
- Tupper, Sir C. H., ed., Supplement to the Life and Letters of Sir Charles Tupper (Toronto, 1926).
- Vaughan, Walter, The Life and Work of Sir William Van Horne (New York, 1920).
- Villard, H. G. and Willoughby, W. W., The Canadian Budgetary System (New York, 1918).
- Vineberg, Solomon, Provincial and Local Taxation in Canada (New York, 1912).
- Whelan, Edward, The Union of the British Provinces (Gardenvale, 1927).

White, Sir Thomas, The Story of Canada's War Finance (Montreal, 1921).

- Whitelaw, W. M., The Maritimes and Canada before Confederation (Toronto, 1934).
- Wolfenden, H. H., The Real Meaning of Social Insurance (Toronto, 1932).

ARTICLES

- Carrothers, W. A., "Problems of the Canadian Federation," Canadian Journal of Economics and Political Science, February 1935.
- Department of Political and Economic Science, Queen's University, "Financial Problems of our Federal System," Queen's Quarterly, Winter, 1933.
- Doughty, A. G., ed., "Notes on the Quebec Conference," Canadian Historical Review, March 1920.
- Maxwell, J. A., "The Adjustment of Federal-Provincial Financial Relations," Canadian Journal of Economics and Political Science, August 1936.

Maxwell, J. A., "Better Terms," Queen's Quarterly, Winter, 1933.

- Maxwell, J. A., "The Dispute over the Federal Domain in Canada," Journal of Political Economy, December 1933.
- Maxwell, J. A., "Financial Relations between Manitoba and the Dominion, 1870-86," Canadian Historical Review, December 1934.
- Maxwell, J. A., "A Flexible Portion of the British North America Act," Canadian Bar Review, March 1933.
- Maxwell, J. A., "Lord Dufferin and the Difficulties with British Columbia, 1874-77," Canadian Historical Review, December 1931.
- Maxwell, J. A., "Prince Edward Island and Confederation," Dalhousie Review, April 1933.
- Maxwell, J. A., "Provincial Conferences and Better Terms," Papers and Proceedings of the Canadian Political Science Association, May 1934.
- Oliver, E. H., "The Contest between Lieutenant-Governor Royal and the Legislative Assembly of the Northwest Territories, 1888-1893," *Transactions of the Royal Society of Canada*, 1923.
- Papers and Proceedings of the Canadian Political Science Association, vols. I-VI (Kingston, 1913-1934).
- Wilson, George, "New Brunswick's Entrance into Confederation," Canadian Historical Review, March 1928.

NEWSPAPERS

Edmonton Bulletin, 1929-1930.

Halifax Morning Chronicle, 1864-1870, 1884-1887, 1925-1927.

Montreal Gazette, 1911.

Ottawa Times, 1873.

Prince Edward Island Monitor, 1864.

St. John Daily News, 1873.

St. John Freeman, 1864-1865.

Toronto Globe, 1866-1868, 1884-1887, 1906-1907.

Winnipeg Free Press, 1880-1890, 1928.

Winnipeg Times, 1885.

PUBLIC DOCUMENTS, FEDERAL

Brief of the Dominion of Canada, Royal Commission on Financial Arrangements between the Dominion and the Maritime Provinces (Ottawa, 1935).

Appendix I, Exhibits (Ottawa, 1935).

Appendix II, Memoranda (Ottawa, 1935).

Canada Gazette, 1918-1934.

Canada Year Book, 1905-1934.

Debates of the Dominion House of Commons, 1870-1872; 1875-1934.

Debates of the Dominion Senate, 1875-1934.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Dominion-Provincial Conference, Précis of Discussion (Ottawa, 1927).

- Dominion-Provincial Conference, 1935, Record of Proceedings (Ottawa, 1936).
- Federal Aid to Provinces under Technical Education Act for 10-Year Period, 1919-29 (Ottawa, 1930).
- Financial Statistics of the Provincial Governments, 1921-1933 (Ottawa). Journals of the Dominion House of Commons, 1868-1934.

Labour Gazette, 1915-1934.

Law Reports, Dominion, 1912, 1934.

The Maritime Provinces, 1867-1934 (Ottawa, 1934).

Old Age Pensions in Canada (Ottawa, 1929).

Parliamentary Debates, Great Britain, 4 ser., 1907.

Provincial Conferences, 1887-1913 (Parliamentary Library, Ottawa).

Report of the Auditor-General, 1933-34.

Reports of the Department of Labour, 1918-1934.

- Report of the Royal Commission on Financial Arrangements between the Dominion and the Maritime Provinces (Ottawa, 1935).
- Report of the Royal Commission on Maritime Claims (Ottawa, 1926).
- Report of the Royal Commission on the Natural Resources of Alberta (Ottawa, 1935).
- Report of the Royal Commission on the Natural Resources of Saskatchewan (Ottawa, 1935).
- Report of the Royal Commission on Reconveyance of Land to British Columbia (Ottawa, 1928).
- Report of the Royal Commission on the Transfer of the Natural Resources of Manitoba (Ottawa, 1929).
- Report on the Applications Made in 1933 by the States of South Australia, Western Australia, and Tasmania, for Financial Assistance from the Commonwealth under Section 96 of the Constitution, Commonwealth Grants Commission, First Report (Canberra, 1934-1935); Second Report (Canberra, 1935).

Sessional Papers, Dominion, 1867-1934.

- Statutes, Dominion, 1867-1934.
- Supreme Court Reports, 1878-1911.

PUBLIC DOCUMENTS, PROVINCIAL

- Brief for New Brunswick for Readjustment of Financial Arrangements with Dominion Government, and Further Implementation of the Recommendations of the Royal Commission on Maritime Claims (n.p., 1934). Addenda and Corrigenda (n.p., 1934).
- Brief for the Province of Prince Edward Island for Readjustment of Financial Relations with the Dominion Government and Full Implementa-

tion of the Report of the Royal Commission on Maritime Claims (n.p., 1934).

- British Columbia's Claim for Readjustment of the Terms of Union (Victoria, 1934), submitted by T. D. Pattullo, G. McG. Sloan, John Hart.
- Budget Speeches, Quebec, 1868-1934; Ontario, 1868-1934; Manitoba, 1874-1934; Saskatchewan, 1919-1934; Alberta, 1919-1934; British Columbia, 1906-1934.
- Debates on Confederation (Quebec, 1865).
- Debates of the Provincial Assemblies, Prince Edward Island, 1855-1914; Nova Scotia, 1856-1916; New Brunswick, 1865-1932.
- Journals of the Provincial Assemblies, 1867-1934.
- Memorandum Respecting the Claims of British Columbia for a Reconveyance by the Government of Canada of the Lands Conveyed by the Province to the Dominion (Victoria, 1926), submitted by John Oliver.
- Province of Nova Scotia, A Submission of Its Claims with Respect to Maritime Disabilities within Confederation as Presented to the Royal Commission (Halifax, 1926).
- Province of Nova Scotia, Royal Commission, Provincial Economic Inquiry, Appendices (Halifax, 1934).
- Quebec and Confederation A Record of the Debate of the Legislative Assembly of Quebec on the Motion of J. N. Francoeur (1918), translated by A. Savard and W. E. Playfair.
- Report of the Royal Commission, Provincial Economic Inquiry (Halifax, 1934).
- Sessional Papers, Canada, 1863-1867.
- Sessional Papers, Provincial, 1867-1934. (In the Maritime provinces this type of material is printed as an appendix to the *Journals*.)

Social Insurance Commission, Fifth Report (Quebec, 1933).

Statutes, Provincial, 1864-1934.

A Submission on Dominion-Provincial Relations and the Fiscal Disabilities of Nova Scotia within the Canadian Federation (Halifax, 1934), presented by N. McL. Rogers.

MANUSCRIPT SOURCES

- Baring Papers, Relating to Canada, New Brunswick, etc., 1856-1870 (Public Archives of Canada).
- Bowell Papers, 1870-1905 (Public Archives of Canada).
- Howe Papers, 1835-1873 (Public Archives of Canada).
- Hyde, D. C., "The War Finance of the Dominion of Canada" (doctoral thesis, unpublished, Harvard, 1922).

Macdonald Papers and Letter-Books (Public Archives of Canada).

Mackenzie Letter-Books, 1872-1877 (Public Archives of Canada).

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Maxwell, J. A., "A Financial History of Nova Scotia, 1838-99" (doctoral thesis, unpublished, Harvard, 1926).
- Proceedings of the Royal Commission on Maritime Claims (typewritten copies, Ottawa, 1926).
- Proceedings of Royal Commissions on the Transfer of the Natural Resources of Manitoba, Saskatchewan, and Alberta (typewritten copies, Ottawa, 1928-1929; 1934).
- Proceedings of the Royal Commission on the Financial Arrangements between the Dominion and the Maritime Provinces (typewritten copies, Ottawa, 1935).

265

INDEX

INDEX

- Abolition of unconditional subsidies, a scheme for, 192–95; advantages of, 194–95
- Adarkar, B.P., quoted, 187 n.; on dangers of centralization, quoted, 249-50 n.; 253 n.
- Age distribution of population, by provinces, 231, 234
- Agricultural Gazette, 201
- Agricultural schools, 202
- Agricultural instruction, early agitation for Dominion aid to, 199; terms of the Dominion act, 200-1; Dominion administration of, 201-3; the act not extended, 203; evaluation of, 203-5, 246-47
- Aikens, Lieutenant-Governor, advised by Sir John A. Macdonald, 84 n.; explains position of Norquay, quoted, 83-84, 84 n.
- Alberta, creation of, 110, 119; financial terms given in 1905, 119-22, 124; elects Liberal governments, 124-25; subsidies in 1907, 113
 - grants to, for agricultural education, 200 n., 202, 204; for highway construction, 216 n., 217-18; for technical education, 209-11; for employment offices, 223; for old-age pensions, 230, 234, 236
 - natural resources question in, origin of, 121; early attitude toward, 124-25; change in attitude, 148-49, 152; willingness to settle, 152-53; agreement with Dominion about, 163; appointment of commission for, 166; task of commission, 167-68; an accounting, 167-72; award of commission, 173
- Anderson, J. T. M., elected, 163
- Angers, A. R., 102 n.
- Arrears, of subsidies in lieu of land, given to Manitoba, 130-31, 161-62

- Assets and liabilities of Upper and Lower Canada, division of, 51-53
- Auditor-General, report on old-age pensions, 236–37 n.
- Australia, recent experience with subsidies, 186-90
- Balances, unexpended, under technical education act, 209-10, 210 n.
- Baring, T. C., on Maritime opposition to union, 17
- Basis of conditional subsidies, 251-53
- Begg, Alexander, 36 n.; opinion about Manitoba-Ontario quarrel, quoted, 82 n.
- Bennett, R. B., 125, 209 n.; attitude to old-age pensions, 232, quoted, 232 n.; favors extension of highways act, quoted, 219
- Better terms, early objection to, 30-31, 69, 94-95; as a constitutional issue, 29-32; in relation to welfare expenditures, 254; existing situation about, 186; advantages of eliminating agitation for, 194-95
- Better terms, to Nova Scotia in 1869, 28; early demands of New Brunswick for, 64-65; to Prince Edward Island, 76, 105-6, 132-33; to Manitoba in 1882-85, 78-80, 82-85; proposal for in 1887, 97-99; proposals for in 1902-08, 109-10, 112-13; given by amendment of constitution, 114-15; to Manitoba in 1912, 130-32; proposal for in 1913, 134-35; in relation to Maritime rights, 139-43; to Maritimes in 1927-35, 144-45, 147, 184; to prairie provinces, 161-63, 172; to British Columbia, 176-78; connection between grants to Maritimes and the west, 184-85. See also Subsidies

- Bigelow, H. V., appointed commissioner, 166; writes a dissenting opinion, 167 n., 173-74, 178 n., 185 Plack W. J. ecc.
- Black, W. J., 202
- Blair, A. C., attends conference of 1887, 68, 96; becomes premier of New Brunswick, 67; minister of railways, 104
- Blake, Edward, 74 n., 126 n.; his Ontario bias, 95; objects to better terms of 1869, 30-32; recommends exceptional grant for Manitoba, 78 n.; resolutions of 1887 not endorsed by, 100
- Bodwell, E. N., appointed commissioner, 128
- Borden, Sir Robert L., 131 n., 205 n., 228; agrees to royal commission for British Columbia, 127; favors provincial status for Saskatchewan and Alberta, 119 n.; favors return of western domain, 148; gives better terms to Manitoba, 130-32; gives better terms to Prince Edward Island, 133; refuses request of Scott and Sifton, 150, 152; supports a Maritime claim, 143 n., 149 n.; welcomes provincial delegates in 1913, 135; approves of revision of subsidies, 110, 135-36
- Boundary extension, of Manitoba, 129-30, 131 n.; of Ontario and Quebec, 143, 183
- Bourassa, Henri, 153 n.
- Bowell, Sir Mackenzie, 192 n.; an opponent of better terms, quoted, 117 n.
- Bowman, C. M., 173 n.; appointed commissioner, 154
- Bracken, John, 153, 163
- Bright, John, 25
- British Columbia, its condition in 1870, 38; its subsidy demands in 1870, 38–39; financial terms of 1870, 39–40; cession of railway belt in, 40; its debt allowance increased in 1884, 62; financial

position in 1870's, 91; its objection to delay in construction of the Pacific Railway, 90–91; makes settlement with Dominion in 1884. 92-93; emergence of party lines in, 106–7; its claims at 1907 conference, 110-11; its subsidies in 1907, 113; its financial position, 1906-11, 126; cites geographical difficulties, 127-28; complains about the settlement of 1884, 175; secures a royal commission, 176; cession of Dominion domain to, 176; continuance of land subsidies to, 176-77; alienations of domain in, 177-78; additional subsidies to, 178

- grants to, for agricultural education, 200 n., 202; for technical education, 210-11; for highway construction, 216 n., 216-18, 220; for employment offices, 221, 224 n.; for old-age pensions, 230, 236
- British North America Act, see Constitution
- Brown, George, 12 n., 96; objections to subsidies, 13, 14 n.; attacks London resolutions, 21
- Bulletin, Edmonton, quoted, 164
- Burrell, Martin, minister of agriculture, 199
- Butler, General B. F., 50 n.
- Canada Central Railway, Dominion subsidy to, 57

Canada Gozette, 214 n.

- Canada, Upper and Lower, attitude to confederation, 15; division of joint assets and liabilities, 51-53. See also Ontario and Quebec
- Canadian Council of Agriculture, 222
- Canadian Manufacturer's Association, 222
- Canadian Pacific Railway, early attitude of Manitoba toward, 81; objects to Red River Valley Railway, 88-89; grants of Manitoba

land to, 157; completion of, 91; effect on British Columbia, 106, 176; its tax-exempt property, 118; its purchase of Quebec railways, 57; Dominion loan to in 1884, 59; Dominion subsidies to in Quebec, 60. See also Pacific Railway.

- Capitalization of subsidies, as a step toward abolition, 192; basis of, 192-93
- Cardwell, Edward, attitude to Prince Edward Island, 42
- Carnarvon, Lord, 90
- Carrothers, W. A., 248 n.
- Cartier, Sir George, 96; negotiates with Manitoba, 39; negotiates with British Columbia, 39-40; negotiates with Prince Edward Island, 44; attitude about surplus debt of Ontario and Quebec, 54
- Cartwright, Sir Richard, quoted, 214 n.; criticism of Sir John A. Macdonald, quoted, 95, 95 n.; repulses New Brunswick, 66
- Centralization, dangers of, 243, 249, 249 n., 255-56
- Chapleau, J. A., sells Quebec railways, 57; resigns premiership, 59
- Churchill, Winston, leaves out finality clause, 115
- Coles, George, 41, 43
- Commercial employment agencies, 222-23
- Commonwealth Grants Commission, Australia, its reports, 186-87; the basis of its grants, 187-88; its examination of state policies, 189-90; applies principle of financial responsibility, 190; on dangers of centralization, 243
- Comparison of conditional and unconditional subsidies, 253-54
- Compensating advantage as a basis for subsidies, 187-91
- Conditional subsidies, for agricultural instruction, 199-205, 246-47; for

technical education, 205-13, 246-47; for highway construction, 214-21, 246; for employment offices, 221-25; for combating venereal diseases, 225-27; for oldage pensions, 228-38, 252; use and misuse, 244-48; new uses for, 248-49; basis for the distribution of, 250-53; their superiority to unconditional subsidies, 253-55; dangers of, 255-56; appropriate for federal countries, 255-56

- Confederation, early attitude of Upper and Lower Canada toward, 15; early attitude of New Brunswick toward, 15-17; early attitude of Nova Scotia toward, 17, 23-25; early attitude of Prince Edward Island toward, 42-44; dissatisfaction with in 1880's, 94-95; complaint about in Maritimes, 133, 137, 140-41; effect on Maritimes, 141, 182; the Turgeon Commission on, 155
- Conferences, see Provincial conferences
- Conservatives, support grants for agricultural education, 199; attitude toward old-age pensions, 230; favor extension of technical education act, 209, 212; favor Dominion aid for highways, 214; increase Dominion grants for oldage pensions, 232
- Constitution, amendment of, 29; flexible about subsidies, 29-32; alterations proposed in 1887, 97; alterations proposed in 1902, 109; amendment in 1907, 114-16; agriculture subject to concurrent jurisdiction under, 200 n.; technical education and, 205 n.; highway grants and, 214 n.; old-age pensions and, 228-29, 230 n., 237; readjustment of Dominion-provincial functions and, 242-43, 249; obstacles raised by, to conditional subsidies, 246-47; inflexibility of, 249, 255

- "Continuous communication," 133; agitation over, 72-74; definition of, 72, 73n.; offer of 1869, 44; settlement of claim about, 105-6
- Conversion of provincial debt, a method for, 192–93
- Courtney, J. M., criticizes demands for better terms, quoted, 69
- Crawford, A. W., director of technical education, 209, quoted, 209 n., 212
- Crerar, T. A., appointed commissioner, 154
- Customs and excise collections, as basis for subsidies, 134; objections to, 135
- Dafoe, J. W., 119 n.
- Daily News, St. John, 15, 65 n.
- Davie, A. E. B., non-attendance at conference of 1887; 96, quoted, 99-100
- Davies, L. H., 105; passes assessment act, 71; defeated, 71
- Davis, R. A., economies of his government, 77-78
- Day, C. D., arbitrator for Quebec, 51-52
- Debt, Dominion, post-war situation of, 240, 242 n.
- Debt allowances, at Quebec, 8; basis of, q-10; deviation from per capita basis, 10-11; increased for Nova Scotia in 1869, 28-30; original, for Manitoba, 34; original, for British Columbia, 39; original, for Prince Edward Island, 47, 49; surplus debt over, of Ontario and Ouebec, 52-54; increased in 1873, 55-56; calculation for Nova Scotia in 1873, 55–56; increased in 1884, 61-63; Nova Scotia draws upon excess, 68n.; Prince Edward Island draws upon excess. 71, 75; increased for Manitoba, 1884-85, 82-83, 85, 87n.; increased for New Brunswick, 104-5; original, to Saskatchewan and Alberta, 120-21, 121 n., 124, 143; increased for

Manitoba in 1912, 130, 132; Duncan Commission endorses adjustment of, 142-43; opinion of White Commission on, 182-83, 182 n.

- Debts, provincial, Dominion assumption of, at Quebec, 9-10; amounts in 1864, 10; assets against, at Quebec, 11-12, 12 n.; Duncan Commission on, 142-43; White Commission on, 182-83; a method for Dominion assumption of, 192-94; heavy burden of, 186; postwar growth of, 240-42, 242 n.
- Demobilization, employment offices assist in, 223-24
- Disallowance, Dominion, of Manitoba railway bills, 81; defended by Norquay, 86; abolition of proposed, 97
- District representatives, 201, 204
- Dominion Council of Health, 225
- Dufferin, Lord, on the admission of Prince Edward Island, 47–49, 49 n.; difficulties with Mackenzie, 90
- Duncan, Sir Andrew Rae, chairman of royal commission, 138
- Duncan Commission, see Royal commission
- Dundas, Lieutenant-Governor, 42; letter to Lord Monck in 1867, 43
- Dunkin, Christopher, 22 n.; criticism of Quebec resolutions, 15 n.
- Dunsmuir, Premier, asks better terms, 107
- Dysart, A. K., chairman of Saskatchewan and Alberta Commissions, 166; his criticism of H. V. Bigelow, 173
- Eastern Extension Railway, New Brunswick, construction of, 66-67; purchase of by the Dominion, 67; refund of interest on provincial expenditure for, 104-5
 - Nova Scotia, sold to Dominion, 102; arbitration over, 103.

Economic protectionism, philosophy of, 191, 191 n.

- Employment, seasonal character of in Canada, 221, 224; statistics of, 223-24; service council for, 222, 224; social insurance act and, 225 n.
- Employment offices, Dominion grants for, 221; basis of the grants, 221, 224-25, 253 n.; work done by the, 222-24
- "Equality," provincial demand for, 64; demand of Manitoba for, 86, 129, 131-32, 167, 167 n.; Sir Thomas White on, 132; Dominion agrees to provide for, 153-55, 167; definition of by Turgeon Commission, 155 n.; for Saskatchewan and Alberta, 167, 167 n., 173; western demand for, 179
- Esquimault dock, Dominion guarantee of loan for construction of, 91; Dominion grant for, 91; taken over by Dominion, 92; Sir John A. Macdonald on, 93n.
- Exceptional grant, to Nova Scotia in 1869, 28; to New Brunswick for abolition of lumber duty, 65; to Nova Scotia lapses, 68; to Prince Edward Island in 1887, 76; to Manitoba, 78, 79 n.; to Prince Edward Island in 1907, 105-6; to British Columbia by 1906 conference, 111; to Prince Edward Island in 1912, 133; to British Columbia in 1934, 178; to the Maritime provinces by the White Commission, 184
- Exceptional grants at Quebec, for New Brunswick, 12; for Newfoundland, 13; for Prince Edward Island, 13
- Expenditure on and revenue from Dominion public domain in Saskatchewan and Alberta, 171
- Export duty, abolition of, on New Brunswick lumber, 65

- Federalism, 243, 248–49, 249 n., 255–56 Federation, principle of financial responsibility modified in, 187
- Ferguson, D., a delegate to London, 74
- Fielding, W. S., 105, 205 n.; premier of Nova Scotia, 69; moves secession resolutions, 70; attends conference of 1887, 70, 96; minister of finance, 102-3; attitude toward finality clause, quoted, 106, quoted 114-15; alters Saskatchewan and Alberta bills, 123
- Finality clause, at Quebec, 14; at London, 21; in constitution, 30, 94, 114; in Nova Scotia terms of 1869, 31; in settlement of Prince Edward Island piers claim, 75; in Manitoba terms of 1885-86, 83-88, 108 n.; opinion of Chester Martin about, 88 n.; in British Columbia settlement of 1884, 92; in Prince Edward Island settlement of 1901, 105; not in 1902 resolutions, 109; in 1907 revision, 114-16, 135; modified by British parliament, 115; in report of White Commission, 184; ineffectiveness of, 87-88, 114-15
- Financial position of Dominion, prewar, 239; post-war, 240
- Financial position of provinces, prewar, 239; post-war, 240-43; use of conditional subsidies to improve, 244, 250
- Financial responsibility, principle of, defined, 187, 187 n., 188-90
- Fiscal need, as a basis for unconditional subsidies in Australia, 188; as a basis for unconditional subsidies in Canada, 190-97, 242; as a basis for conditional subsidies, 250-53; urged by the Maritime provinces, 180-82
- Fisheries award of 1877, amount of, 71; share demanded by Prince Edward Island, 71-72
- Fleming, Sandford, opposes purchase of Eastern Extension, 66

- Flexibility of conditional subsidies, 248-49, 255-56
- Free Press, Manitoba, 37 n., 86 n., 89 n.; attitude to Canadian Pacific Railway, 82 n.; its opinion about homestead alienations, 158 n.
- Freeman, St. John, 16 n.
- Functions, provincial, 239; in Maritimes, 7, 64 n., 66, 216, 234 n.; in British Columbia, 127-28, 234 n.; in Upper and Lower Canada, 7; in Ontario, 128, 234 n.; in prairie provinces, 234 n.; expansion of, 239-42; transfer of, to Dominion, 242-44, 250, 255-56
- Galt, Alexander, 7 n., 11; proposal of 1858, 5; proposal at Quebec, 5; objections to subsidies, 13, 14 n.; favors fixity of subsidies, 14, 30; expects economy from federation, 22; suggests method for dividing assets and liabilities of Canada, 51n.
- Gazette, Montreal, 199 n.
- Gill, L. W., director of technical education, quoted, 208, 212
- Globe, Toronto, attitude toward demands of New Brunswick in 1871, 64.n.; criticism of subsidies, 93, quoted, 98, 116 n.
- Gordon, Lieutenant-Governor, 16
- Gouin, Lomer, becomes premier, 109; asks for better terms, 110; refuses request of McBride, 111 n.; at conference of 1913, 134
- Grants-in-aid, see Conditional subsidies
- Grants for buildings, Manitoba, 79, 79 n., 108, 120, 131 n.; Saskatchewan and Alberta, 120, 134, 131 n.
- Grants for government, origin of, 20-21; to British Columbia in 1870, 39; to Prince Edward Island in 1873, 48; increased for Manitoba in 1882, 79; proposal of 1887, 98; increased 1906-07, 112-13; to

Saskatchewan and Alberta, 120, 124; at conference of 1913, 134-35

- Granville, Lord, dispatch about better terms of 1869, 30-31; refuses guarantee to Prince Edward Island, 43; refuses to intervene for Prince Edward Island, 74
- Gray, J. H., 6 n., 8 n., 13 n., 15, quoted, 41, 41 n., 44; chairman of board of arbitration, 51-52; his proposal as arbitrator, quoted, 53
- Grazing leases, in Saskatchewan and Alberta, 171
- Greenway, Thomas, becomes premier, 89; opponent of Sir John A. Macdonald, 107; defeated, 108
- Gosnell, R. E., 107 b.

Guthrie, Hugh, 250 n.

- Half-breed lands, alienations in Saskatchewan and Alberta, 169
- Hart, John, 177 n.
- Haultain, Frederick, demands provincial status for Northwest, 118-19; opposes autonomy bills, 120, 124-25, 124 n.
- Haviland, T. H., 41, 44, 49
- Haythorne, Premier, his policy in 1869, 44; builds hranch railways, 45– 46; negotiates terms in 1873, 47– 49
- Health, Dominion Council of, 225

Heaps, A. A., 229 D.

- Hensley, Albert, attempts a loan, 46
- Highways, Dominion grants for, given in 1919, 214; Dominion administration of, 214-15; mileage constructed through, 217; type of construction under, 217-18; evaluation of, 219-21, 246; provincial debt and, 241
- Holman vs. Green, 74
- Holmes, S. J., premier of Nova Scotia, 69
- Homesteads, alienation for, in Saskatchewan and Alberta, 168-69

274

alienations for in Manitoba, 156; treatment by Turgeon Commission, 157-58; attitude of west to, 158, 168; Dominion policy about, 36, 85, 118, 156, 168

- Howay, F. W., and Scholefield, E. O. S., 39 n., 40 n.; quoted about promise of Pacific railway, 41, 90 n.
- Howe, Joseph, opposes confederation, 23, 25; leads delegations to London, 1866–67, 25; negotiates with Rose and Langton, 26–28; enters Dominion cabinet, 28
- Howlan, G. W., 49, 74 n.
- Hudson's Bay Company, land given to, in Saskatchewan and Alberta, 169 n.
- Imperial government, attitude about New Brunswick election of 1866, 16; rejects protests of Nova Scotia about union, 1866–68, 25; supports admission of British Columbia, 38; encourages the admission of Prince Edward Island, 42–44; appeal to by Prince Edward Island, 73–74; appeal to by Mc-Bride, 115; its policy toward public domain, 150–51
- Industrial Relations Counselors, 221 n.
- Inequality of debt allowances, 142-43 Inspection, Dominion, of agricultural education, 201, 203-4; of technical education act, 211-12; of the highways act, 215, 219-21; of oldage pensions, 233, 237-38
- Inspection, provincial, of old-age pensions, 233-36, 233 n., 236 n.
- Intercolonial Railway, 94, 101; promise of, 16; Eastern Extension purchase for, 66; Eastern Extension of Nova Scotia added to, 102; complaint of Maritimes about, 138, 139 n.
- Interest, provincial expenditures for, 240-41, 240 n.

- Interest arrears, on surplus debt of Quebec and Ontario, 60–61; on railway supplies of Nova Scotia, 69 n.; on Eastern Extension expenditure, 104–5; on grant of Manitoba for buildings, 108
- Island Railway, Dominion subsidy for, 92 n.
- James, C. C., appointed agricultural commissioner, 199; his scheme of administration, 200-1

Keith, A. B., 151 n.

King, W. L. Mackenzie, 184, 205 n.; political position of his government in 1925, 137-38; appoints Duncan Commission, 138; increases Maritime subsidies, 146; calls conferences in 1927, 146; his policy toward claims of the west and Maritimes, quoted, 147 n.; early attitude to natural resources question, 152; appoints Turgeon Commission, 153; makes agreement with Saskatchewan and Alberta, 163; endorses settlements of 1930, quoted, 164; opposes extension of agricultural education act, 203; opposes extension of technical education act, 219; opposes extension of highways act, quoted, 210; attitude toward old-age pension legislation, 229, 229 n., quoted, 232 n.; opposition to subsidies, quoted, 247 n.

Labour Gozette, 223, 223 n., 224, 233 n. Laird, David, 47

- Land question in Prince Edward Island, 13; proposal of 1866, 43; offer of 1869, 44; offer of 1873, 48; purchases from absentee proprietors, 71
- Lands, see Public domain
- Langton, John, 26-27
- Lash, Z. A., appointed commissioner, 128

- Laurier, Sir Wilfred, 107, 123, 126, 192 n.; explanation of concession of 1884, 60 n.; attitude to conference of 1902, 109; gives consideration to subsidies, quoted, 110; condemns subsidies, 110 n.; calls conference in 1906, 110; his proposals about British Columbia in 1906, 111; desires finality clause, 114; gives better terms by amendment of constitution, 114; opposes claims of Roblin, 129; attitude to better terms, 136; attitude to natural resources question, 149, quoted, 149 n.
- League for the Economic Independence of Nova Scotia, quoted, 140 n.
- Liberals, early attitude to subsidies, 94-95, 101; early domination by Ontario men, 95; their provincial victories in 1880's, 101; dominance of in 1902, 109; attitude toward better terms after 1896, 116-17; defend Dominion retention of domain in Saskatchewan and Alberta, 125; not favorable to extension of agricultural and technical education acts, 203, 209; oppose Dominion grants for highways, 214; favor old-age pensions, 228 Loans, Dominion, to provincial gov-
- ernments, 241 n.
- London conference, Dominion functions enlarged at, 19-21; per capita subsidies increased at, 20; grants for government added at, 20-21; resolutions not submitted to provincial legislatures, 23; resolutions opposed in Nova Scotia, 23
- McBride, Richard, becomes premier, 107; his agitation for better terms, 107, 126; asks for special concessions in 1906, 110-11; withdraws from conference, 111; attacks finality clause, 115-16; secures royal commission, 127
- Macdonald, A. A., 6n., 41

- Macdonald, A. F., quoted, 251, 251 n. Macdonald, G. C., appointed commissioner, 166, quoted, 172
- Macdonald, Sir John A., 66, 72, 91, 100, 106, 176 n.; policy about Ouebec resolutions, 17-19; attempts to win Howe, 26, 29 n.; defense of better terms of 1869, 30-31; tactics about British Columbia terms, 40-41; letter to Musgrave, 41; attitude to Prince Edward Island in 1869, quoted, 44; repulses Haythorne in 1872, 47-48; attitude toward surplus debt of Ontario and Quebec, 55; advises Premier Mousseau, 57; revolt of Quebec supporters in 1884, 58-60; opposed by Blair, 67; his stand about fisheries award, 72, 72 n.; attitude toward "metallic subway," 74 n.; advice to Blake, 74 n.; helps Premier Sullivan, 75-76; opinion about Manitoba concessions of 1882, 80 n.; quarrel with Mowat, 82; urges Manitoba resistance to Ontario, quoted, 82 n.; rebukes Norquay in 1884, quoted, 84, quoted, 84 n.; attitude toward finality clause, quoted, 84, 88n.; policy toward Manitoba, 89; approves Dominion grant for Esquimault dock, 91; criticizes Smithe, 92 n., quoted, 93 n.; Liberal criticism of, 94-95; his hold on Quebec, 95-96; his hold on British Columbia, 106; on British Columbia lands, quoted 175 n.; disapproves of conference of 1887, 96, 99-100; his attitude to better terms, 101, 117, 136; death of, 101
- Mackenzie, Alexander, 77, 95, 176 n.; objects to better terms of 1869, 30; repulses New Brunswick, 65– 66; repulses Nova Scotia, 68; difficulties over Pacific railway, 90– 91; friend of Brown, 96
- McLelan, A. W., 12 n.; negotiates with Rose and Langton, 26-28

McLeod, N., Premier, 105

- MacPherson, D. L., arbitrator for Ontario, 51-53
- Manitoba, its condition in 1870, 33; financial terms of 1870, 34; adequacy of early subsidies, 34-35, 37-38, 89, 89n.; Cinderella sobriquet, 36 n., 89; debt allowance increased in 1884, 62; financial position in 1870's, 77–78; early agitation about public domain, 81; attitude to Canadian Pacific Railway, 81; its economic condition in 1880's, 82, 84 n., 87; its subsidies in 1907, 113; extension of boundaries, 129, 160, 160 n.; financial position in 1911, 129-30; secures better terms in 1912, 130-32; its demands about natural resources question, 150-52; secures the Turgeon Commission, 153-54; its argument before commission, 154; examination of its claims by commission, 154-63; award of the commission, 159-62; alienations of domain in, 156-57; grants of its land to Canadian Pacific Railway, 157
 - grants to, for agricultural education, 200 n., 202; for technical education, 210; for highway construction, 216 n., 217; for employment offices, 223-24; for old-age pensions, 230, 234 n., 236
- Maritimes, government functions in 1864 more extensive than in Canada, 7; demand share of fisheries award, 71; frugality of governments in, 141-42; post-war depression in, 137; losses of King government in, 138; their case before Duncan Commission, 139-43; their proprietary interest in the public domain, 143, 183; award of Duncan Commission to, 144; attitude of delegates at conference of 1927, 146-47; their case before the White Commission, 180-81;

award of White Commission to, 184; their criticism of award of Turgeon Commission, 183. See also Nova Scotia, New Brunswick, and Prince Edward Island

- Maritime rights, genesis of agitation for, 137–38; Duncan Commission examines, 139–47; attitude of Mr. King toward, quoted, 147 n.
- Marshall, Duncan, his report on the agricultural instruction act, 204 n.
- Martin, Chester, 34 n., quoted, 36 n.; opinion of finality clause, quoted, 88 n.; prepares case of Manitoba about natural resources question, 150; his constitutional argument, 150-51
- Martin, W. M., appointed commissioner, 176
- Mathieson, D. A., secures an exceptional grant, 133; appointed commissioner, 180; his dissenting opinion, 184
- Meighen, Arthur, 138, 229 n.; attitude to natural resources question, 150-51, 172
- Mercier, Honoré, becomes premier, 96; calls provincial conference, 96; his proposals at conference, 97; repulsed by Sir John A. Macdonald, 99-100; end of career, 100
- "Metallic subway," proposal of, 74 n. Mill, J. S., 25
- Minister of agriculture, his powers under the agricultural instruction act, 200, 204
- Minister of labour, his powers under the technical education act, 207, 212
- Monitor, Prince Edward Island, 15 n.
- Mother's allowances, 245
- Mousseau, J. A., becomes premier, 57; resigns as secretary of state, 59
- Mowat, Oliver, 109, 129; opponent of Macdonald, 82, 96-97; his proposals at conference of 1887, 97-.98

- Murray, George H., attitude toward natural resources question, 150 n.
- Musgrave, Governor, opinion of British Columbia terms, 40-41
- National Policy, 81, 94, 97
- Natural resources question, see Public domain
- Nesbitt, E. W., appointed commissioner, 180
- New Brunswick, its subsidies at Quebec, 9-10; exceptional grant at Quebec, 12; attitude to Quebec resolutions, 15-16; its subsidies at London, 20-21; debt allowance increased in 1884, 62; demands better terms in 1871-72, 64; exceptional grant for abolition of export duty, 65; sells Eastern Extension to Dominion, 66-67; its subsidies in 1907, 113. See also Maritimes
 - grants to, for agricultural education, 200 n., 202; for technical education, 209-10; for highway construction, 216 n., 217; for employment offices, 223-24; for old-age pensions, 230, 234 n., 236. See also Maritimes

Newfoundland, 9 n., 9-10, 13, 156

- Norquay, John, his financial policy, quoted, 78; attitude to 1882 concessions, 80; his support of Macdonald, 82; rejects 1884 better terms, 83; cool reception at Ottawa, 85; his defense of 1885 terms, 86; attends conference of 1887, 96; resigns, 88-89
- Norris, T. C., attitude to natural resources question, quoted, 150
- North Shore Railway, 56-57
- Northwest territories, development of, after 1896, 118; territorial government asks for larger grants, 118-19; demand for provincial status, 119; old-age pensions in, 234, 236

Nova Scotia, its subsidies at Quebec,

9-10; attitude to Quebec resolutions, 15; its subsidies at London, 20-21; opposes confederation, 23-25; anti-confederate victory in, 25; disproportionate burden of tariff on, 26-27; objects to calculation of debt allowance, 27; better terms of 1869, 28; debt allowance increased in 1884, 62; financial position in 1870's, 68-69; threatens secession, 70, 102, 140 n.; government of W. S. Fielding, 69-70; its subsidies in 1907, 113; its case before Duncan Commission, 140 n.

- grants to, for agricultural education, 200 n., 202; for technical education, 209-10; for highway construction, 216 n., 217; for employment offices, 223-24; for old-age pensions, 230, 234 n., 236. See also Maritimes
- Old-age pensions, Dominion grants for, early agitation about, 228-29; provision of, 230; provincial acceptance of, 230-32; increase of, 232; administration of, 233-36; evaluation of, 237-38
- Oliver, Frank, 123 n.; states basis of subsidies in lieu of land to Saskatchewan and Alberta, quoted, 121 n.
- Oliver, John, 175 n.
- Ontario, its subsidies at Quebec, 9-10; its subsidies at London, 20-21; attitude about division of assets and liabilities of Canada, 51-52; debt allowance increased in 1884, 62; quarrel with Manitoba at Rat Portage, 82; its attitude at 1906 conference, 111 n.; gains by 1906-07 revision, 112-13; political organization different from that of British Columbia, 128; extension of its boundaries, 143, 183; National Transcontinental and, 157; its attitude toward better terms, 194

grants to, for agricultural education, 200 n., 204; for technical education, 209-10; for highway construction, 216 n., 217; for employment offices, 223-24; for old-age pensions, 230, 234 n., 236 n.

Pacific Great Eastern, 174 n.

- Pacific Railway, 92; domain retained for in Manitoba, 36; promise of construction, 40, 90; early difficulties over, 90-91
- Palmer, Charles, his desire for confederation, quoted, 47
- Palmer, Edward, attitude to Quebec resolutions, 42
- Parent, S. N., calls conference of 1902, 109; resigns, 109-10
- Pattullo, T. D., 177 n.
- Peace River block, 92, 175, 177, 178 n.
- Penitentiary prisoners, refund of Prince Edward Island expenditure on, 74; refund of British Columbia expenditure on, 74 n.
- Piers, Dominion refund of provincial expenditure on, 74-75, 102 n.
- Pipes, W. T., sells Eastern Extension, 103
- Pope, Joseph, 6 n., 10 n., 11 n., 14 n., 17 n., 20 n., 23 n., 43, 50 n.
- Pope, J. C., opposes Haythorne terms, 48-49; negotiates terms in 1873, 49
- Pope, W. H., 42 n.; quoted, 42, 44
- Population, the basis of subsidies in 1864, 8; modifications at London, 20-21; modifications for Manitoba, 34, 79; modifications for British Columbia, 39; modifications for Saskatchewan and Alberta, 112, 120; modifications for Prince Edward Island, 116 n.; the basis altered in 1907, 112; as a basis for conditional subsidies, 251
- Prince Edward Island, its subsidies at Quebec, 9-10; land question in, 13, 43; early attitude to confederation, 41-43; terms offered it in

1869, 44; railway construction begun in, 45; financial position in 1872-73, 45-47; terms offered it in 1873, 47-49; reasons for Dominion generosity to, 49-50; debt allowance in 1884, 62; financial position in 1877, 70-71; demands share of fisheries award, 71-72; Dominion makes refunds to, 74-75; financial position in 1887, 75; given additional subsidy in 1887, 76; its subsidies in 1907, 113, 116 n.; secures better terms in 1912, 133. See also Maritimes and "Continuous communication"

- grants to, for agricultural education, 200 n., 202; for technical education, 209-10; for highway construction, 216 n., 217; for employment offices, 223; for old-age pensions, 232, 234 n., 236
- Progressive taxation and the basis of grants, 251-52
- "Project statement," required under highways act, 215
- Provincial conference, of 1887, its setting, 94–96; its resolutions, 97; subsidy provisions of, 97–99; opposed by Sir John A. Macdonald, 99–100
 - of 1902, attendance at, 109; its resolutions, 109
 - of 1906, copies resolutions of 1887, 110; considers claims of British Columbia, 111; its subsidy resolutions, 112-13; its finality clause, 114-15
 - of 1913, has Dominion approval, 134; asks for better terms, 134-35; addressed by Sir Robert Borden, 135-36
 - of 1927, aim of Mr. King at, 146; its attitude to the claims of the west and the Maritimes, 146-47; generosity of Dominion at, 147; attitude to Dominion grants for old-age pensions, 230 n.

of 1935, 186

- Provincial expenditures and revenues, lack of comparability of, 189 n.
- Provincial status, premature grant of, to Manitoba, 33, 35, 37; demanded by Northwest, 118-19
- Public buildings, grant for, to Manitoba, 79, 79 n., 108; to Saskatchewan and Alberta, 120, 124, 131 n.; construction of by agricultural grants, 201, 204; expenditures for under technical education act, 208, 211
- Public domain, Dominion retention of in Manitoba, 35-37; reasons for Dominion retention of, 81, 85-86; provincial revenue from, 1885-86, 80 n.; in the Northwest, 118; in Saskatchewan and Alberta, 120-23, 125; Maritime criticism of policy toward, 143; attitude of Mr. King to return of, quoted, 147 n.; western agitation about revived in 1911, 148; shift in Liberal position toward, 148-49; attitude of Mr. Meighen toward, 150-52; the argument of Professor Martin about, 150-51; early negotiations by King government, 152-53; **Turgeon Commission investigates** and reports for Manitoba, 153-63; agreements with Saskatchewan and Alberta about, 163-64; alienations for provincial and Dominion purposes, Manitoba, 156-59, 163 n.; constitutional right of the Dominion to hold, 163; Dominion expenditures and revenues, 165 n., 171; the Dysart Commission makes an accounting of, 167-72; alienations for homesteads, 156, 168-60, 160 n.; miscellaneous alienations, 169-70; Dominion administration of, 170-71; recommendations of the Dysart Commission, 172-73; acreage of alienations of in British Columbia, 177, 177 n.; Maritime objection to Dominion policy about, 183

- Pugsley, William, comment on Eastern Extension award, 105
- Quebec, its subsidies at Ouebec conference, 9-10; its subsidies at London conference, 20-21; its attitude toward division of assets and liabilities of Canada, 51-52: proposes division of surplus debt, 52-53; financial position in 1871. 54; urges Dominion assumption of surplus debt, 55; expenditure on railways, 1874-82, 56; Dominion refund of railway subsidies to, 58, 60; retroactive refund of interest to, 58; revolt of its Conservative members in 1884, 59; debt allowance increased in 1884, 60-61; Conservative domination of, 95; Mercier government in, 96-97, 100; Gouin asks better terms for, 110; gains by 1906-07 revision, 112-13; extension of its boundaries, 143, 183; its attitude toward better terms, 194
 - grants to, for agricultural education, 200 n., 202; for technical education, 209-10; for highway construction, 216 n., 217; for employment offices, 223-24; for old-age pensions, 230, 234 n.
- Quebec conference, difficulty in apportioning functions and revenues, 6-7; types of subsidies at, 7-13; Galt's proposals at, 5-6; objections to subsidies at, 13, 14 n.; finality clause at, 14; reception to its resolutions, 15-19
- Railways, assets of Nova Scotia and New Brunswick in 1864, 11-12, 142-43, 182; their construction in Prince Edward Island, 45, 73 n.; expenditure of Quebec on, 1874-82, 56; sale of by Quebec, 57; Dominion refund of Quebec subsidies for, 58, 60; their construc-

tion in Nova Scotia, 1874-84, 68, 68 n.; Eastern Extension of New Brunswick, 66-67, 104-5; Eastern Extension of Nova Scotia, 102-3; land belt for in British Columbia, 40, 92, 175-78; early projects for in Manitoba, 86 n.; the Red River Valley line, 88-89; progress of the Pacific railway, 90-91; Manitoba land given to, 157; Saskatchewan and Alberta lands given to, 169, 169 n.; the Na-Transcontinental, tional 157: change in Dominion policy toward in twentieth century, 157

- Red River Valley Railway, 88-89
- Riel, Louis, 33, 96
- Ritchot, Father, his letter about public buildings for Manitoba, 79 n.
- Robertson, G. D., 212 n.
- Robertson, J. C., explanation of increase of debt allowances in 1873, 58 n.; estimates of railway cost, 56 n.
- Robertson, J. W., 205 n.
- Roblin, R. P., elected premier, 108; asks for better terms, 126, 129-30; at conference of 1906, 128; demands "equality" for Manitoba, 129; attitude to natural resources question, 149 n.
- Robson, John, 99-100
- Roche, W. J., 130
- Rogers, Robert, 130
- Rose, John, 12 n.; negotiates with Howe and McLelan, 26-28; learns of financial difficulties of Prince Edward Island, 46-47
- Royal Commission for Alberta, in 1934, 166; attempts an accounting, 167-72; examines Dominion administration, 170-71; the Dominion credits, 171; its award, 172-73
- Royal Commission for British Columbia, in 1912, 127-28; in 1927, its report, 176

- Royal Commission for Manitoba, in 1928-29, appointment of, 154; its definitions, 154-55; its classification of alienations, 156-59; its calculation of arrears of land subsidy, 159-61; recommends continuance of subsidies, 162; Maritime criticism of its award, 183
- Royal Commission for Maritimes, in 1926, 138; evidence presented to, 139-40; its report, 140-45; its subsidy recommendations, 144-45; policy of King government toward report of, 146-47; in 1934, 166; appointment of, 180; argument presented to, 180-81; its report, 181-84
- Royal Commission for Saskatchewan, in 1934, 166; attempts an accounting, 167-72; examines Dominion administration, 170-71; the Dominion credits, 171; its award, 172-73; the dissenting opinion, 173-74
- Royal Commission on technical education, appointed, 205; its report, 206–7
- Royal Commissions, difficulties of, 179, 179 n.
- Rutherford, A. C., elected premier of Alberta, 125
- Sales of public domain in Saskatchewan and Alberta, 169 n.
- Saskatchewan, creation of, 110, 119-20; its subsidies in 1907, 113; financial terms given in 1905, 120-22, 124; Dominion retention of its domain, 121; elects Liberal governments, 125; early attitude to natural resources question, 125; change in attitude to natural resources question, 148-49, 152-53; makes agreement with Dominion, 163; appointment of Natural Resources Commission for, 166; Natural Resources Commission makes an accounting, 167-72; the

award of the Natural Resources Commission, 172-73

grants to, for agricultural education, 204 n.; for technical education, 209-10; for highway construction, 216 n., 217; for employment offices, 223-24; for old-age pensions, 230, 234 n., 236

Scholefield, E. O. S., see Howay, F. W.

- School lands, 124; Dominion administration of in Saskatchewan and Alberta, 170-71, 171 n.
- School question, Manitoba, 107; in Northwest territories, 119 n.; in Saskatchewan and Alberta, 120, 153
- Scott, Walter, elected premier of Saskatchewan, 124; attitude toward natural resources question, 148-50
- Secession, advocated in Nova Scotia, 70, 96, 102, 137, 140, 140 n.
- Senate, defeats grants to highways, 214; rejects old-age pensions act, 229
- Settlement of 1884, British Columbia, 91-93; recent complaint about, 175-76
- Sifton, A. L., 148–50, 149 n.
- Sifton, Clifford, 118 n.; criticizes basis of subsidies in lieu of land, quoted, 123
- Skelton, O. D., 5 n.
- Sloan, G. McG., 177 n.
- Smith, A. J., 16
- Smithe, W. P., criticized by Sir John A. Macdonald, 92 n., 93 n.
- Social Hygiene Council, 225 n.
- Social Insurance Commission, Quebec, 230 n.
- Soldiers, land bounties for, 169, 178
- Stairs, John F., writes about secession, 70 n.
- Stewart, B. M., director of employment service, 222
- Subsidies, conditional, see Grants-inaid

- in lieu of land, for Newfoundland 13, 156; for British Columbia, 40 176-77; for Prince Edward Island, 13, 44, 48, 71, 156, 183 n. for Manitoba, 36-37, 80; increased for Manitoba in 1885 and 1912, 85-86, 87 n., 130-31; foi Saskatchewan and Alberta, 120-24, 159-61; the prairie province: demand continuance of, 149, 152 continuance conceded, 162-63 calculated by the Turgeon Commission, 159-61; amounts paid to Saskatchewan and Alberta, 171 continuance for British Columbia 176
- objections to at Quebec, 8, 13; later objections to, 94-95, 98, 101, 117 140; basis of at Quebec, 8; tota at Quebec, 13; fixity of at Quebec, 14, 141; increase in 1906-07 113; total to Saskatchewan and Alberta in 1905, 124; proposal tc base on customs and excise collections, 134-35; complete revision recommended by Duncar Commission, quoted, 145; capitalization of, 192-95
- Subsidies per capita, amounts proposed at Quebec, 8-9; increased at London, 20; original to Manitoba 34; to British Columbia in 1870 39; to Prince Edward Island in 1873, 48; increased for Manitoba 79 n., 80, 87 n.; calculated on two and one-half year basis for Manitoba, Saskatchewan, and Alberta 87 n.; comparison of by provinces, 1871-86, 89 n.; proposal of 1887 oo; increased in 1906-07, 112-13; calculated upon maximum population of Prince Edward Island, 116 n.; to Saskatchewan and Alberta, 120, 124
- Sullivan, W. W., elected premier, 71; wants share of fisheries award, 71-72; his agitation about "continuous communication," 72-74;

appeals to London, 74; letter to Sir John A. Macdonald about piers, 75 n.; becomes a judge, 76; non-attendance at conference of 1887, 96, 99

- Surplus debt of Ontario and Quebec, in 1867, 51-52; assumed by Dominion in 1873, 54-55; retroactive refund of interest on, 58, 60-61
- Swamp lands, Manitoba, 88 n., 130-31, 131 n., 148; given to, 83
- Tariff, fear of in New Brunswick, 16, 97; complaint of Nova Scotia about, 24-27, 140, 180 n., 191; objection to by Manitoba, 81; poor results from in 1880's, 94; burden of on British Columbia, 127, 178; its incidence not a ground for subsidies, 187, 191
- Technical education, investigation of by royal commission, 205; recommendations of the commission, 206; Dominion grants for, 206-7; uses of the grants, 207-8; the effect of the depression upon, 208-9; grants for not continued, 209; provincial expenditure of the grants, 209-10; evaluation of, 211-13, 246-47
- Terminable grants of conditional subsidies, 244-46
- Thompson, Sir J. S. D., 69
- Tilley, Sir Leonard, 13-14; mentions assets of New Brunswick in 1864, 11; his difficulties over Quebec resolutions, 15; defeated in 1865, 16; victorious in 1866, 16; visits Prince Edward Island in 1869, 44, quoted, 44 n.; explains new debt allowances of 1873, 55 n.; explains new debt allowances of 1884, 63 n.; minister of finance, 66; favors refund of railway subsidies to New Brunswick, 67; explains better terms to Manitoba, 80, 80 n.

- Timber sales and rentals in Saskatchewan and Alberta, 170
- Times, Winnipeg, 86 n.; its advice to Manitoba, quoted, 86-87
- Trades and Labor Congress, 222
- Trotter, R. G., 19 n.
- Trutch, Joseph, quoted, 106, 175 n.
- Tupper, Sir Charles, 13-14, 108 n.; mentions assets of Nova Scotia in 1864, 11; his policy about Quebec resolutions, 17-19, 24; attempts to win Howe, 23, 26; his influence in Nova Scotia elections of 1887, 70 n.
- Turgeon, W. F. A., quoted, 152 n., 173 n.; chairman of royal commission, 154
- Tweedie, T. M., appointed commissioner, 166
- Under-rights, alienations of in Saskatchewan and Alberta, 169-70; in British Columbia, 175 n.
- Unemployment relief provincial expenditure on, 241, 241 n.
- University lands, given to Manitoba, 83
- Van Horne, Sir William, fights Red River Valley line, 89
- Venereal disease, origin of Dominion grants for combating, 225; amount of the grants, 226, 226 n.; results from the grants, 226–27
- Veterinary colleges, grants-in-aid of, 200 n.
- Vocational education, 207, 209, 212-13
- War, checks claims of British Columbia, 128; its effect on agricultural instruction act, 202; report of royal commission on technical education shelved by, 206; and work of employment offices, 222-23

INDEX

Washington treaty, abolition of export duty on lumber arranged by, 65; provides for fisheries commission, 71; ratified by Prince Edward Island, 72

Whelan, Edward, 41

,

284

White, Sir Thomas, defends Manitoba terms of 1912, quoted, 132; defends better terms to Prince Edward Island, 133; chairman of Maritimes Commission, 180

Whitelaw, W. M., 3

Whitney, Sir James, at conference of 1913, 134, 134 n.

• '

Wilson, George, 16n.

Witness, Montreal, 116 n.

Woodsworth, J. S., quoted, 229 n.