

**THE CIVIL SERVIC
OF CANADA**

OXFORD UNIVERSITY PRESS
AMEN HOUSE, E.C. 4
LONDON EDINBURGH GLASGOW
LEIPZIG NEW YORK TORONTO
MELBOURNE CAPE TOWN BOMBAY
CALCUTTA MADRAS SHANGHAI
HUMPHREY MILFORD
PUBLISHER TO THE

8388

**THE CIVIL SERVICE
OF CANADA**

BY

ROBERT MACGREGOR DAWSON

M.A., D.Sc. (Econ.)

**PROFESSOR OF POLITICAL SCIENCE, UNIVERSITY
OF SASKATCHEWAN**

**OXFORD UNIVERSITY PRESS
LONDON : HUMPHREY MILFORD**

1929

V72, 8.112

F9

8388

PREFACE

I WISH to thank many friends who have assisted me in the production of this book. My greatest indebtedness is to Professor Graham Wallas who first aroused my interest in the subject and whose lectures, discussion, and criticism have been of incalculable benefit to me. I have received further help from numerous suggestions made by Professor A. Berriedale Keith, and from conversations which I have held with members of the Canadian Civil Service. I desire also to express my appreciation of the courteous assistance rendered by Mr. M. C. McCormac, Mr. F. A. Hardy, and other members of the staff of the Parliamentary Library, Ottawa.

The editors of the *Canadian Historical Review* have kindly given their permission to reprint large parts of Chapters I and II, and the editors of the *Dalhousie Review* have done the same in respect to parts of Chapter VII.

R. MACG. D.

UNIVERSITY OF SASKATCHEWAN,

January 1929.

CONTENTS

PART I. THE HISTORY OF THE CANADIAN CIVIL SERVICE

I. Canadian Civil Services before Confederation	3
II. The Spoils System and Proposals for Reform: 1867-80	19
III. The First Gesture towards Reform: 1880-2	44
IV. The Period of Stagnation: 1882-1908	56
V. The Reform of the Inside Service: 1908-17	78
VI. The Flow and Ebb of Reform: 1917-28	90

PART II. PRINCIPLES OF CIVIL SERVICE ORGANIZATION

VII. The Place of the Civil Service in Government	109
VIII. Selection	128
IX. Gradation: Promotion: Salary	154
X. Tenure: Removal: Retirement: Women	179
XI. The Civil Service Commission: Parliamentary Responsibility	195
XII. The Civil Service as a Large Scale Organization	220
XIII. Conclusion	252

INDEX

- Abbott, Sir J. J. C., 61-2.
 — Government, 61-2, 67.
 American Telephone and Telegraph Co., 131 n.
 Appointment of civil servant, *see* Selection.
 — of Civil Service Commission, 79, 199.
 Assembly, Legislative, 4, 7, 8, 9, 13, 17.
 Auditor-General, 61, 67, 68.
- Bagehot, Walter, 112, 114, 117.
 Bagot, Sir C., 14.
 Baldwin, Robert, 13-14.
 — La Fontaine Government, 6-8.
 Bennett, Arnold, 115-16.
 Beveridge, Sir W., 227, 249.
 Blake, Edward, 53 n., 60 n.
 Board, Advisory to the Civil Service Commission, 104, 148-51.
 —, Advisory to the Ministry, 226-8.
 — of Civil Service Examiners (1857-67), 195.
 — (1882-1907), 51, 53, 56-9, 62, 67-71, 86, 196-7.
 — of Hearing and Recommendation, 96.
 Borden, Sir Robert L., 209-10.
 — Government, 82-3, 90.
British North America Act, 1867, 3, 19, 24.
 Bryce, Viscount, 25, 28.
 Bureaucracy, evils of, 112-14, 221-2.
 —, checks on, 114-17, 232-51, 261.
 Burke, Edmund, 205.
- Cabinet, *see* Ministry.
 Calder Act, *see* *Public Service Revivment Act*.
 Cartwright, Sir Richard, 216-17.
 Casey, George E., 38, 42-3, 47, 48, 57, 196-7, 206, 216.
 Chandler, E. B., 16.
 Christie, R., 8.
 Civil Service, compared to private corporations, 220-4.
 —, faults of, 112-14.
 —, function of, 117-24.
 —, importance of, 124-6.
 —, place in future government, 256-62.
- Civil Service Act (1868)*, 19, 21, 23, 24, 28, 30, 38.
 — (1882 and 1885), 24, 50-1, 59, 64-6, 71-2, 74-6.
 — (1908), 79-81, 88-9, 142, 197, 210.
 — (1918), 92, 96-7, 142, 149, 162, 168, 178, 180-1, 198, 210.
 — (1919), 96-7, 102, 162, 172, 175, 184, 198, 212-15, 245.
 Civil Service Board (*see also* Board of Civil Service Examiners), 20, 40, 44, 66-7, 195-6.
 — Commission, *see* Commission, Civil Service.
 — Federation, 96.
 Classification, 92, 95-6, 104, 143, 149, 159, 162-8, 174, 253.
Classification of the Civil Service of Canada, 95-6, 159-62, 165-7, 171, 176.
 Commission, Civil Service (Canada), 46-7, 79-81, 84-9, 91-2, 94-5, 97-9, 101-4, 144, 148-53, 161-4, 167-72, 174-5, 180, 190, 192, 195-206, 208-15, 223, 246, 249, 252-4, 260.
 — (Great Britain), 24, 36-7.
 —, Coal Industry (Great Britain), 176-7, 250 n., 251.
 Commission, Royal, on the Civil Service (Canada).
 — (1868), 21-4, 190.
 — (1880), 24, 43, 44-51, 52, 136, 183, 190-1.
 — (1891), 62-7, 152, 191, 208, 218, 242.
 — (1907), 74-7, 78, 152, 191-2.
 — (1911), 83.
 — (1912), 83-5, 157.
 Commission, Royal, on the Civil Service (Great Britain) (1914), 132, 181-2, 193 n., 220 n., 222 n.
 Committee, Advisory to Ministry, 226-8.
 — on Class I Examination (Great Britain), 134 n., 135, 138 n.
 — of Deputy Ministers (1922), 105, 150.
 —, Select, of House of Commons (1877), 38-41, 47.
 —, Special, of House of Commons (1919), 105, 183.

It is clear that the problem of the political control of the administration, while not new, has been greatly altered by the emergence of new conditions. The difficulties which have thus arisen are still largely unsolved and can be worked out through experience alone. The Government must grant a large amount of influence and power to its technical and administrative experts, though retaining ultimate control; it must be willing to mark out important areas of administrative activity and free them from external meddling, while reserving to itself the right to meddle in rare emergencies; it must obviously depend to an enormous degree on the advice of its employees, yet for a while, at least, it must accept a nominal responsibility in Parliament for all acts of the administration. The Minister will be compelled to consult his assistants at every step, he will try to develop their initiative and encourage them to come to him with plans of their own for bettering the condition of the country and the department, he will continually bow to their judgement on technical and administrative matters, he will have to be content to relinquish some policies while retaining only the most essential for his own decision. Both Minister and civil servant must frankly recognize the delicacy of the relationship, they must cautiously feel their way, they must show a willingness to experiment and to try out the possibilities of each situation as it arises, they must show a mutual respect and confidence, each considering the rights and province of the other. The result will be, perhaps, a new science of public administration, a new method whereby a democracy can carry on its work without losing its ultimate control or diminishing the skill and effectiveness of its servants.

INDEX

- Abbott, Sir J. J. C., 61-2.
 — Government, 61-2, 67.
 American Telephone and Telegraph Co., 131 n.
 Appointment of civil servant, *see* Selection.
 — of Civil Service Commission, 79, 199.
 Assembly, Legislative, 4, 7, 8, 9, 13, 17.
 Auditor-General, 61, 67, 68.
- Bagehot, Walter, 112, 114, 117.
 Bagot, Sir C., 14.
 Baldwin, Robert, 13-14.
 — La Fontaine Government, 6-8.
 Bennett, Arnold, 115-16.
 Beveridge, Sir W., 227, 249.
 Blake, Edward, 53 n., 60 n.
 Board, Advisory to the Civil Service Commission, 104, 148-51.
 —, Advisory to the Ministry, 226-8.
 — of Civil Service Examiners (1857-67), 195.
 — (1882-1907), 51, 53, 56-9, 62, 67-71, 86, 196-7.
 — of Hearing and Recommendation, 96.
 Borden, Sir Robert L., 209-10.
 — Government, 82-3, 90.
British North America Act, 1867, 3, 19, 24.
 Bryce, Viscount, 25, 28.
 Bureaucracy, evils of, 112-14, 221-2.
 —, checks on, 114-17, 232-51, 261.
 Burke, Edmund, 205.
- Cabinet, *see* Ministry.
Calder Act, see Public Service Retirement Act.
 Cartwright, Sir Richard, 216-17.
 Casey, George E., 38, 42-3, 47, 48, 57, 196-7, 206, 216.
 Chandler, E. B., 16.
 Christie, R., 8.
 Civil Service, compared to private corporations, 220-4.
 —, faults of, 112-14.
 —, function of, 117-24.
 —, importance of, 124-6.
 —, place in future government, 256-62.
- Civil Service Act (1868)*, 19, 21, 23, 24, 28, 30, 38.
 — (1882 and 1885), 24, 50-1, 59, 64-6, 71-2, 74-6.
 — (1908), 79-81, 88-9, 142, 197, 210.
 — (1918), 92, 96-7, 142, 149, 162, 168, 178, 180-1, 198, 210.
 — (1919), 96-7, 102, 162, 172, 175, 184, 198, 212-15, 245.
 Civil Service Board (*see also* Board of Civil Service Examiners), 20, 40, 44, 66-7, 195-6.
 — Commission, *see* Commission, Civil Service.
 — Federation, 96.
 Classification, 92, 95-6, 104, 143, 149, 159, 162-8, 174, 253.
Classification of the Civil Service of Canada, 95-6, 159-62, 165-7, 171, 176.
 Commission, Civil Service (Canada), 46-7, 79-81, 84-9, 91-2, 94-5, 97-9, 101-4, 144, 148-53, 161-4, 167-72, 174-5, 180, 190, 192, 195-206, 208-15, 223, 246, 249, 252-4, 260.
 — (Great Britain), 24, 36-7.
 —, Coal Industry (Great Britain), 176-7, 250 n., 251.
 Commission, Royal, on the Civil Service (Canada).
 — (1868), 21-4, 190.
 — (1880), 24, 43, 44-51, 52, 136, 183, 190-1.
 — (1891), 62-7, 152, 191, 208, 218, 242.
 — (1907), 74-7, 78, 152, 191-2.
 — (1911), 83.
 — (1912), 83-5, 157.
 Commission, Royal, on the Civil Service (Great Britain) (1914), 132, 181-2, 193 n., 220 n., 222 n.
 Committee, Advisory to Ministry, 226-8.
 — on Class I Examination (Great Britain), 134 n., 135, 138 n.
 — of Deputy Ministers (1922), 105, 150.
 —, Select, of House of Commons (1877), 38-41, 47.
 —, Special, of House of Commons (1919), 105, 183.

- Committee, Special, of House of Commons (1921), 98, 105.
 — (1923), 105, 163-4, 209.
 —, of Senate (1919), 104.
 — (1924), 105.
 —, Standing, on Public Accounts (1891), 61.
 —, Permanent, 228-9.
 Council, Consumers', 226-7.
 —, Executive, 5, 7, 9-13, 16, 17.
 —, Legislative, 7, 13.
 —, Whitley, 231, 248.
 Customs and Excise, Department of, 22-3, 40, 200.
- Daly, D., 6.
 Davidson, J., 6.
 De Celles, A. D., 56.
 Decentralization, 229-32.
 Department of (Canada), Customs and Excise, 22-3, 40, 200.
 —, Finance, 85.
 —, Inland Revenue, 40, 46-7, 94, 152.
 —, Interior, 163, 191-2.
 —, Labour, 69.
 —, Marine and Fisheries, 39-40.
 —, Post Office, 40, 69, 191, 220.
 —, Public Works, 45.
 —, Soldiers' Civil Re-establishment, 94.
 — (Great Britain) Agriculture and Fisheries, 144-5.
 — (Great Britain), Food, 226-7.
 Departmental co-ordination, 224-5.
 Deputy Ministers, 20, 51, 53, 95, 98, 150, 151, 162-3, 169-72, 174-5, 187, 238-40, 245-6.
 —, Committee of, 105, 150.
 Disfranchisement, 60-1.
 Dismissal, *see* Removal.
 Draper Government, 6.
 Drayton, Sir Henry, 212.
 Dufferin, Lord, 42.
 Durham, Lord, 4, 5, 7.
- East India Company, 36.
Electoral Franchise Act, 1885, 60-1.
 Examination for entrance, academic, 20, 36-7, 51-5, 84, 130-41, 146, 234.
 —, competitive, 36-7, 46, 49, 71, 74, 77, 79, 91, 129-30, 195, 197.
 —, pass, 20, 22-3, 37, 40-1, 51-5, 59-60, 63-4, 67, 70-1, 87.
 —, professional or technical, 79, 81, 86, 91-2, 104, 146-51.
- Examination for entrance, special, 77-9, 103-4, 141-6, 147.
 — for promotion, 46-7, 49-51, 64, 68, 70, 74, 85, 172-4.
 Executive Council, *see* Council, Executive.
 Experts, 110-11, 178-9.
 —, relation to non-experts, 111-12, 114-16, 117-24, 231-2, 258-62.
- Family Compact, 4, 7, 11, 17, 126.
 Federalist party in United States, 25.
 Finance, Department of, 85.
 Fish, C. R., 26 n., 27, 28 n.
 Floud, Sir F. L. C., 119-20, 144-5.
 Foster, Sir G. E., 82-3.
- Glennelg, Lord, 4, 9-10, 13.
 Government, parliamentary, 109-10.
 Governor, colonial, 4, 7.
 Governor-General in Council, 19, 20, 51, 56, 66, 68, 79, 91-2, 97, 105, 149, 151, 174, 179, 185, 189, 196-7.
 Gradation in Canada, 20-1, 46, 49-50, 65, 72, 79-80, 84-5, 92, 154-68.
 — in Great Britain, 37, 49, 156-8, 235.
 — in United States, 158.
 Graham, G. P., 215.
 Great Britain, civil service in, 34-7, 189, 195, 209.
 —, influence of, 9, 11-12, 18, 34, 38, 44, 47-50.
 Grey, Lord, 9, 11-12, 13, 15, 16, 112, 178.
- Haldane, Lord, 122-3, 132-3, 176-7, 242-3, 249-51.
 Hamilton, Alexander, 201.
 —, P., 16.
 Harris, Sir C., 231, 240 n.
 Harvey, Sir J., 11.
 Head, Sir F. B., 9-10.
 Heath, Sir T., 239.
 Huntington, L. S., 31.
- Independence of civil servant, 42, 48, 215-19, 229-32, 258-62.
 — of Civil Service Commission, 36, 47-8, 57-8, 80, 198-206.
 Inertia in civil service, 113-14.
 Initiative, encouragement of, 232-51.
 Inland Revenue, Department of, 40, 46-7, 94, 152.
 Inspector-General, 61-2.

- Institute of Public Administration, 247-8.
- Insurance Act*, 72.
- Intercolonial Railway, 28-9.
- Interior, Department of, 163, 191-2.
- Jackson, Andrew, 25, 26.
- Jacksonian democracy, 25, 33, 256.
- Jenkyns, Sir H., 218-19.
- Jowett, Benjamin, 138-9, 201.
- King, W. L. Mackenzie, 102-3, 200, 213-14.
- Government, 102.
- Labour, Department of, 69.
- La Fontaine, *see* Baldwin-La Fontaine.
- Langevin, Sir H., 52, 55 n.
- Laski, H. J., 228, 249 n.
- Laurier, Sir Wilfrid, 73, 200, 211.
- Government, 74-5, 81-2.
- Leathes, Sir S., 173.
- Legislative Assembly, *see* Assembly, Legislative.
- Council, *see* Council, Legislative.
- Le Sueur, P., 56.
- Lewis, Sir G. C., 124.
- Lippman, W., 112-13.
- Lowell, A. L., 230.
- Macaulay, T. B., 130-1.
- Macdonald, Sir John A., 29-31, 39, 60 n., 73.
- Government, 31, 42-3.
- Sandfield, 32.
- Machinery of Government Committee (Canada), 104.
- — (Great Britain), 193 n., 224 n., 226, 229 n.
- Mackenzie, Alexander, 32, 33.
- Government, 31, 216-17.
- MacLean, A. K., 96.
- Marcy, Senator, 27.
- Marine and Fisheries, Department of, 39-40.
- Meighen, Arthur, 213.
- Metcalfe, Sir C. (Lord), 6, 7-8.
- Milner, Lord, 121-2, 244.
- Minister, Cabinet, faults of, 117-19.
- —, function of, 114-16.
- Ministerial responsibility, *see* Responsibility, parliamentary.
- Ministry, early, in Canada, 5, 6.
- , relation to civil service, 5, 6, 84, 114-16, 206, 258-62.
- , Abbott, 61-2, 67.
- , Baldwin-La Fontaine, 6, 7, 8.
- Ministry, Borden, 82-3, 90.
- , Draper, 6.
- , Laurier, 74-5, 81-2.
- , Macdonald, 31, 42-3.
- , Mackenzie, 31, 216-17.
- , Tupper, 72.
- Minute, Treasury (1879), 63.
- Moses, R., 37 n., 209 n.
- Muir, R., 35 n., 112 n., 123, 137, 229 n., 235 n.
- Mulgrave, Lord, 16.
- Mulock, Sir W., 73-4.
- Murdock, J., 212-13.
- Murney, E., 13-14.
- Murray, Sir George, 83-5, 157.
- Newcastle, Duke of, 16-17.
- Northcote, Sir Stafford, 36.
- Northcote-Trevelyan Report, 24, 36-7, 39, 49, 156 n., 255-6.
- Ogden, C. R., 6.
- Order in Council (Canada) (1904), 69.
- — (1907), 74.
- — (1914), 88.
- — (1918), 90-2, 102, 104, 180, 210.
- — (1919), 97, 99, 104, 151.
- — (1921), 99, 151.
- — (1922), 99, 151.
- (Great Britain) (1870), 37.
- Organization of government work, 224-5.
- Overseas service and entrance, 91-2.
- Parliament, control over civil service, 116-17.
- Parliamentary government, 109-10.
- responsibility, *see* Responsibility, Parliamentary.
- Party activity of civil servants, 31-2, 63, 80.
- Party influence in civil service, in Canada, history of, 3, 6-9, 23-4, 25, 29-34, 38-41, 54-5, 58, 60, 73-7, 86-9, 92-3, 99-102, 168.
- , inefficiency of, 34, 45-6, 63, 120-1, 128-9.
- , present results of, 252-6.
- in Great Britain, 34-6.
- in United States, 25-8.
- Patronage, *see* Party influence.
- Committee, 99-101.
- Pensions, *see* Retirement.
- Post Office, Department of, 40, 69, 191, 220.
- Printing Bureau, 93-4, 104.
- Probation, 79, 152-3.

- Professional Institute of Civil Service, 151.
 — positions, 51, 79, 81, 86, 91-2, 98-9, 104, 146-51.
 Promotion, 20, 40-1, 46, 49-51, 63-5, 68-70, 74-5, 80, 165-74, 234, 253.
 — examination, *see* Examination, promotion.
 Public opinion, 53-5, 66, 78-9.
Public Service Retirement Act, 105.
 Public Works, Department of, 45.
- Railways, Canadian National, 182-3, 223.
 Reade, A., 8.
 Reform of civil service (Canada), 19-21, 38-9, 41-2, 46-53, 61-2, 66-7, 77-80, 84-5, 90-3.
 — (Great Britain), 36-7.
 Removal of civil servants, early difficulties, 9, 13-17.
 — for inefficiency, 183-6.
 — for party activity, 31-4, 72-3, 82-3, 90-2, 102-3, 179-83.
 — of Civil Service Commissioners, 79, 199-200.
 Reorganization of departments, 104.
Report of Transmission, 141, 143, 165, 171, 175, 183-5, 192, 248.
 Republican party in United States, 25.
 Responsibility, parliamentary, 47-8, 121, 206-15, 229.
 Responsible government, effect on civil service, 3, 6-17.
 —, paradoxical features, 109-11.
 Retirement, 47, 71, 76-7, 105, 186-90.
Retirement Act (1898), 71, 186, 188.
Retirement Act, Public Service (1920), 105.
 Roosevelt, Theodore, 142.
 Rotation in office, 25-6, 33.
 Royal Commission, *see* Commission, Royal.
 Russell, Lord John, 10, 14, 209.
- Salary of civil servants, 21, 64, 76, 174-77, 213, 253.
 — of Civil Service Commission, 201.
 Secretaries, private, 20, 152.
 Select Committee, *see* Committee, Select.
 Selection, 6-9, 29-31, 46-9, 51-2, 58, 73-5, 79, 81, 82-3, 86, 91, 97-104, 128-52, 206-11.
 Smith, Goldwin, 30-1, 60.
 Soldiers' Civil Re-establishment, Department of, 94.
 Spinney Bill, 97-8, 105.
 Spoils system, in Canada, 28-34, 42.
 —, in United States, 25-8.
 Stanley, Lord, 9.
 Superannuation, *see* Retirement.
Superannuation Act (1870), 47, 71, 186.
 — (1924), 186-90.
 Sydenham, Lord, 6, 14.
- Technical positions, *see* Professional positions.
 'Temporary' employees, 22, 65-6, 76, 84, 86-9.
 Tenure of office, civil servant, 3, 9-13, 32-3, 178-9, 234-5.
 —, Civil Service Commission, 79, 199, 205.
 Thorburn, John, 56.
 Transfers, 51, 63, 245-7, 253.
 Treasury Board, 68, 189.
 — Minute (1879), 63.
 Trevelyan, Sir Charles, 36, 139 n., 201.
 Tupper, Sir Charles, 31.
- Union Government, 90.
 United States, influence on civil service, 4, 18, 25-8, 34, 38, 44, 158-9.
- Veterans, *see* War Veterans.
- Wallas, Graham, 236, 237 n., 241 n., 258 n.
 War, effect of, on civil service, 88-9.
War Measures Act (1914), 88.
 War Veterans, 91-2.
 — Association, Great, 100.
 Webb, Sidney, 185.
 White, L. D., 224 n., 241.
 Whitley Council, *see* Council, Whitley.
 Willison, Sir J., 73.
 Wise, E. F., 226-7.
 Women in civil service, 76, 190-4.
- Young, Arthur, and Company, 95, 104.

PRINTED IN GREAT BRITAIN AT THE UNIVERSITY PRESS, OXFORD
BY JOHN JOHNSON, PRINTER TO THE UNIVERSITY